

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES

----- X

November 15, 2018
Start: 12:16 p.m.
Recess: 1:02 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Rm.
16th Fl.

B E F O R E: ADRIENNE E. ADAMS
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Inez D. Barron
Peter A. Koo
I. Daneek Miller
Mark Treyger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Lisa Kersavage, Director of Special Projects and Strategic Planning, Landmarks Preservation Commission

Michael Pesci, Resident 238 President Street, Carroll Gardens, Brooklyn, Assemblymember, 52nd Assembly District and former Judge

Jim Protos, Resident of 238 President Street, Carroll Gardens, Brooklyn

John Hathaway, Carroll Gardens Resident, Architect and Director of Carroll Gardens Neighborhood

Glenn Kelly, of Carroll Gardens Resident and Land Use Committee Co-Chair for Carroll Gardens Neighborhood Association

Simeon Bankoff, Executive Director, Historic Districts Council

Phillip Mendling Resident, 238 President Street Carroll Gardens, Brooklyn

Jessica Wurwarg, Director of Strategic Planning and Sustainability, Facilities Management, New York City Department of Transportation

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
2 MARITIME USES

4

2 [sound check] [gavel]

3 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Good afternoon.

4 Welcome to this meeting of the Subcommittee on
5 Landmarks, Public Siting and Maritime Uses. I'm
6 Council Member Adrienne Adams, the Chair of this
7 Subcommittee. We are currently joined today by
8 Council Member Peter Koo. Today we will be voting on
9 LU 2018 and holding hearings on two landmark
10 designations, and a site selection by the Department
11 of Transportation. We will begin with our first two
12 public hearings on LU 238, the 238 President Street
13 House, and LU 239 the Hans S. Christian Memorial
14 Kindergarten, two historic landmark designations by
15 the Landmarks Preservation Commission. The buildings
16 stand next to—stand next to each other in the Carroll
17 Gardens neighborhood in Brooklyn represented by
18 Council Member Lander. I now open the public hearing
19 and call on LPC to present the designations. [pause]
20 Lisa Kersavage. Good morning. Before you begin,
21 Counsel will swear you in.

22 LEGAL COUNSEL: Please state your name.

23 LISA KERSAVAGE: Lisa Kersavage.

24 LEGAL COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell the
25 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES

2 your testimony before this Subcommittee in response
3 to all Council Member questions.

4 LISA KERSAVAGE: I do

5 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Sorry for butchering
6 your last name.

7 LISA KERSAVAGE: That's okay. [laughter]

8 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Good morning. It's
9 just the say, Lisa, [laughter] you may begin.

10 LISA KERSAVAGE: Great. Thank you and
11 good afternoon Chair Adams and subcommittee members.

12 I am Lisa Kersavage, Director of Special Projects and
13 Strategic Planning at the Landmarks Preservation

14 Commission. Thank you for the opportunity to present
15 LPC's September 18th designation of the Hans S.

16 Christian Memorial Kindergarten at 236 President

17 Street, and the 238 President Street House. These

18 are architecturally significant touch stones in the

19 development of Carroll Gardens, and represents social

20 improvements in education and immigrant welfare in

21 Brooklyn, and expanded opportunities for women in the

22 late 19th Century. These buildings were identified

23 as potential landmarks in an LPC survey of Carroll

24 Gardens—of the Carroll Gardens neighborhood. At the

25 public hearing on June 26, 2018, 21 people spoke in

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
2 MARITIME USES

3 support of designating both buildings including a
4 representative of U.S.—of the United States
5 Congresswoman Nydia Velazquez, Council Member Brad
6 Lander, New York State Assembly Member Jo Anne Simon,
7 representatives of the Carroll Gardens Neighborhood
8 Association, Saint Paul's Episcopal Church of
9 Brooklyn, and Historic District-- Excuse me, and
10 Historic Districts Council. In addition to 15
11 individuals, a representative of the Norwegian
12 Immigrant Association and the American Scandinavian
13 Society spoke in favor of designating the Hans S.
14 Christian Memorial Kindergarten. One person, a
15 representative of the owner of 236 President Street
16 spoke in opposition of to the proposed designation of
17 the Kindergarten, and those objections will be
18 addressed in this presentation. First, I'd like to
19 summarize the shared history of the two buildings.
20 In 1897, bought the pre-Civil War residence at 238
21 President Street shown covered in ivy in the photo on
22 the right renovated as the Brooklyn Deacon's Home of
23 the Methodist Episcopal Church, and built the Hans S.
24 Christian Memorial Kindergarten on the adjacent site.
25 The Christians were long-time residents of President
Street. Hans S. Christian was a Norwegian immigrant,

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
2 MARITIME USES

3 and both the Deacon's Home and kindergarten
4 established in his memory, served the Scandinavian
5 immigrant enclaves then living in this section of
6 Brooklyn. These remarkable structures stand out in
7 the streetscape of Carroll Gardens, and represents
8 significant cultural and architectural contributions
9 to the area's history. The 238 President Street
10 House is a pre-Civil War Anglo Italianate house
11 notable for its generous proportions, elaborate cast
12 iron ornament and the legacy of its residents'
13 commitment to serving their community. It's located
14 on the south side of President Street, shown here.
15 The 238 President Street House has built Circuit 1853
16 by a economist, merchant and real estate speculator
17 Edward Kellogg, as one of the pair of semi-attached
18 houses, and when its twin was demolished in 1897, it
19 asymmetrical façade reflects its origin as one of the
20 married (sic) pair. The house's unusual width,
21 Anglo-Italianate ornament and setback, distinguish it
22 as an elite residence with few peers in Carroll
23 Gardens at the time of construction still stand out
24 among the brownstone row houses and later apartment
25 buildings of the neighborhood. First its first four
decades, the 238 President Street House was home to a

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
2 MARITIME USES

3 succession of prosperous families. In 1897, Almira
4 Christian bought the property, and renovated the
5 building into Brooklyn's first permanent resident and
6 training center for the Methodist deaconesses. The
7 late 19th Center Deaconess Movement educated women in
8 religious and secular subjects to prepare them for
9 urban field work, and went a step forward for women
10 in the church. As the 238 President Street House,
11 deaconesses lived communally, and provided social
12 services to their community. As part of Almira
13 Christian's renovation, the attic was expanded into a
14 full fourth floor by the architect Woodruff Leeming
15 with detailing that matched the existing floors
16 below. In 1939, the building became the long-time
17 home of two pillar of Brooklyn's Hispanic Community,
18 the Reverend Alberto B. Baez, and his wife Valia. A
19 pioneering Hispanic Methodist minister, Baez began
20 leading Spanish language services in Brooklyn in
21 1920, and in their former kindergarten next door from
22 1949 through the 1960s. Alberto and Valia Baez are
23 also notable as the parents of this physicist Albert-
24 Albert Baez and grandparents of the musician and
25 social activists Mimi Farina and Joanne Baez, or
excuse me, Joan Baez. Now private apartments, the

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
2 MARITIME USES

3 238 President Street house remains an impressive
4 Anglo-Italianate building, and its resident—and its
5 renovation to the Brooklyn Deaconess Home of the
6 Methodist Episcopal Church represents a rich history
7 of service to the Helgren's (sic) community.
8 Designed in 1897, by architects Hoff and Glulam, the
9 Hans S. Christian Memorial Kindergarten is a notable
10 Beaux-Art structure that was the first purpose built
11 free kindergarten in Brooklyn. The building is
12 located on the south side of President Street and
13 Carroll Gardens, which was a Norwegian immigrant
14 enclave at the time of the its construction. It was
15 commissioned by Almira E. Christian in memory of her
16 late husband. Over a decade before its construction,
17 she was instrumental in establishing the first free
18 kindergarten in Brooklyn in a Brooklyn church
19 basement with the concept was somewhat new to
20 Brooklyn. The term kindergarten was coined in 1840
21 by German philosopher and educator Frederich Frobel,
22 whose child-centric methods centered around play.
23 The first kindergartens were established in the
24 United States in the 1830s to 50s and appeared in New
25 York City by 1866. In the mid to late 19th Century,
kindergartens came to be seen as social and moral

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
2 MARITIME USES

3 imperative to ensure that children learned basic
4 skills, enabled immigrant children to learn English,
5 and to instill in them the values of citizenship and
6 this is a Jacob Reese photo in a tenement
7 kindergarten. At the same time the kindergarten
8 movement gave female educators training in innovative
9 teaching methods, and unique opportunities outside of
10 the home, and represented the expanding spirit of
11 women's influence in the 19th Century. Earlier
12 kindergartens in Brooklyn operated from a adopted
13 homes and houses, churches and other institutions. In
14 contrast, the Brooklyn Daily Eagle wrote that the
15 purpose-built Hans S. Christian Memorial Kindergarten
16 was the only building of the kind in Brooklyn so far
17 as known, and one of the very few in existence in any
18 city, and continuing the quote: So far as known, the
19 only one expressly and solely for the use of a
20 kindergarten. Its elegant Beaux-Art exterior-
21 exterior and thoughtful design drew attention to the
22 civic-its civic role and earned its numerous mentions
23 as the model Carroll Garden. Built on the cusp of
24 the Board of Election's adoption of kindergarten
25 departments in its own entry schools, it is a rare
example of a stand-alone kindergarten structure. The

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
2 MARITIME USES

3 building served the community in other ways in the
4 20th Century. By 1901, classes and church services
5 were held in the building outside of class time.

6 From 1949 to the 1960s while the resident of the
7 adjacent 238 President Street house, the Reverend
8 Alberto Baez used the building for services of
9 Brooklyn's oldest Spanish language Protestant church.
10 It has been a private residence since 1974.

11 Testimony presented to the Commission by a
12 representative of the property owner opposing
13 designation, questions the significance and integrity
14 of the building. LPC's Research Department address
15 these concerns for the Commission's vote, and I'd
16 like to address them here as well. The owner's
17 representative asserted that the kindergarten program
18 housed in this building did not originate here, and
19 that the structure had uses other than kindergarten
20 classes over the course of history, and these
21 assertions are true. However, LPC does not believe
22 that these factors diminished the building's
23 significance as a purpose built kindergarten. As she
24 saw it an appropriate site to build a kindergarten
25 building, Almira Christian began an interim
kindergarten program in the basement of her church.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
2 MARITIME USES

3 Then in the first floor of 238 President Street in
4 the months before construction. The structure was a
5 custom design meant for use of the kindergarten.

6 Later uses did not diminish the significance of the
7 design. Because—and the second assertion is that

8 because the interior was not under consideration for

9 designation, the historic use was irrelevant, and our

10 use of the term “purpose built” is unclear. And it’s

11 true that chair (sic) was not designated. However,

12 the elegant Beaux-Art façade was a public expression

13 of the kindergarten innovative program. Its custom

14 design made the Hans S. Christian Memorial

15 Kindergarten and idiosyncratic statement building

16 that was exemplary of the kindergarten movement. Our

17 use of the term purpose built highlights the fact

18 that this structure was designed to house

19 kindergarten classes rather than being adopted to

20 that purpose as has been done in other locations.

21 And third and finally, that alterations have been

22 made to the façade. LPC found that the buff brick

23 façade, and coins, decorative window surrounds,

24 elaborate portico, cornice and roofline details and

25 other elements remain intact and are consistent with

the Beaux-Art design meant to communicate the

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
2 MARITIME USES

3 structures' noble purpose. As such, its Beaux-Art
4 design, building form and exuberant features remain
5 legible and the alterations including the addition of
6 a garage are reversible. In addition to its
7 architecture, the Hans S. Christian Memorial
8 Kindergarten is culturally significant, representing
9 important developments in education, women's roles
10 and immigrant welfare in Brooklyn, which elevates
11 this—its architecture. In summary, the Hans S.
12 Christian Memorial Kindergarten and 238 President
13 Street are architecturally and culturally significant
14 and are a permanent feature of the Carroll Gardens'
15 streetscape and source of neighborhood pride. LPC
16 recommends that the—the Council uphold the
17 designations, and thank you, and I'm happy to answer
18 any questions you have.

18 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much,
19 Lisa. This is beautiful—a beautiful building as all
20 or our proposed landmark buildings are. I guess my
21 only question is going to be going back to the—I
22 guess the back and forth on this property with
23 individuals that are not necessarily in support of
24 this designation. The initial—the initial
25 interaction with LPC and those who are in opposition

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
2 MARITIME USES

3 to this property, can you give me a little bit of
4 background that, and not just the kindergarten aspect
5 alone, but the property that's total inquiry basis
6 with regard to the property itself, and a little bit
7 more of the acquisition?

8 LISA KERSAVAGE: Sure. Well, in terms of
9 our—thank you. In terms of our public hearing and
10 public record, we had, you know, largely almost
11 unanimously supportive testimony except for one.
12 Prior to that so we had received a request for
13 evaluation earlier this year, which actually happened
14 to coincide with some neighborhood surveying we were
15 doing in the Carroll Gardens neighborhood. So those
16 things kind of happened together and we did initial
17 outreach to both property owners in March of this
18 year, March 2018 and, you know, property owner
19 outreaches can be sometime challenging just because,
20 you know, we depend on public records just like
21 everybody else. So, it's, you know, getting through
22 to the right people sometimes is more challenging.
23 We were successful in getting through to 238
24 President Street property owners. It took us a
25 little bit longer with 236, but we did have quite a
bit of back and forth or especially quite a bit of

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES

2 output from our office, and we—let's see. I think
3 we've successfully made contact in April of this—of
4 this year, and that was after sending letters in
5 March, and we—that was right before we calendared the
6 buildings. Sometimes we prefer to have, you know,
7 sort of robust outreach and conversations prior to
8 calendaring, but sometimes that doesn't happen, and
9 then after that we have correspondence back and
10 forth, and after the public hearing, we did have a
11 meeting with the property owner's representative and
12 we—and we actually did also delay the designation of
13 vote at the request of the owner's representative.

14 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, I was only
15 trying to dig a little bit deeper because I am in
16 receipt of a letter from Susan Malwell (sp?) and just
17 wanted to get a little bit more information from you
18 personally. Did you personally have a conversation
19 with her?

20 LISA KERSAVAGE: Yes.

21 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay.

22 LISA KERSAVAGE: Yes and she testified at
23 a public hearing, and then I was at a meeting with
24 her.

25 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES

2 LISA KERSAVAGE: Subsequent to that.

3 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Alright, that—that
4 was my only inquiry on this and I'm grateful that you
5 addressed the three—the three other points in detail
6 and those questions have been answered for me. So,
7 thank you very much for your testimony with that.

8 LISA KERSAVAGE: Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: We've been joined by
10 Council Member Miller. Council Member Koo, did you
11 have any questions?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: [off mic] No.

13 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Council Member Miller?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [off mic] No.

15 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay. Okay, thank
16 you very much, Lisa.

17 LISA KERSAVAGE: Thank you. [background
18 comments, pause]

19 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, I do have a
20 letter Council Member Brad Lander. It's a Summary of
21 Statement, and I'd like to read that into the record.
22 He could not be here today. His district covers
23 Carroll Gardens in Brooklyn where these proposed
24 landmarks are located. He's been an integral part of
25 the community-led effort in support of the

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
2 MARITIME USES

3 designation of these historic buildings located at
4 236 and 238 President Street. A petition to
5 designate the two buildings as landmarks has garnered
6 over 1,000 signatures, which will be delivered to the
7 New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission. The
8 other local elected officials who support designation
9 include Congresswoman Nydia Velazquez, State Senator
10 Brian Kavanagh and Assemblymember Jo Anne Simon.
11 Council Member Lander sees the designation of these
12 buildings as New York City landmarks as an
13 opportunity to save cat—to save a Carroll Gardens
14 treasure, and the—and is especially grateful to the
15 owners and residents of 238 President Street whose—
16 whose support for landmarking their own building
17 shows true love this neighborhood and to the
18 community leaders and advocates who have been leading
19 this effort for years. That is the statement from
20 Council Member Brad Lander in support of the
21 designations. [background comments, pause] Okay,
22 we're going to pause at this time, and we're going to
23 ahead and go for our vote. We're going to vote on LU
24 218, the designation by the Landmarks Preservation
25 Commission of 550 Madison Avenue, a 37-story post-
modern style skyscraper that's served as the former

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES

2 AT&T headquarters as a landmark. The Subcommittee
3 held a public hearing on this item on November 1st.
4 Council Member Power supports the designation. I now
5 call for a vote. Counsel, please call the roll.

6 LEGAL COUNSEL: Adams.

7 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: I vote aye.

8 LEGAL COUNSEL: Koo.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

10 LEGAL COUNSEL: Miller.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye.

12 LEGAL COUNSEL: By a vote of 3 in the
13 affirmative, 0 in the negative and 0 abstentions,
14 the item is recommended for approval. We will hold
15 the vote open.

16 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you. The vote
17 will be held open. We're now going to call on the
18 next panel. Now, before we call on the next panel,
19 were there any other members of the public that wish
20 to testify on the prior item? [background comments]
21 Are they all on the panel? They're on the same.
22 Okay. Alright, we're going to call on—oh, goodness,
23 the handwriting. Is it Jake?

24 JAMES PROTOS: [off mic] James?
25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES

2 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Yes. [laughs] That
3 is you?

4 JAMES PROTOS: [off mic] Yes, it is.

5 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay. Please—pleas
6 step up. Yes. Michael Pesci. [background comment]
7 Okay, please step up. John Hathaway, please step up
8 and join the panel and James Protos. [background
9 comments, pause] Okay, sir, will you please state
10 your name for the record? Yes.

11 MICHAEL PESCI: [off mic] Michael Pesci.

12 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay. [background
13 comments]

14 MICHAEL PESCI: [on mic] Does it
15 project? That's fine.

16 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Please state your
17 name again.

18 MICHAEL PESCI: Michael Pesci.

19 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you. [pause]
20 Alright, the first gentleman whose name I had a
21 problem with pronouncing.

22 JAMES PROTOS: It's James.

23 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Yes, please state
24 your name for the record.

25 JAMES PROTOS: James Protos.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES

2 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Now, you were the
3 last gentleman that I called up on the panel. Who
4 was the first gentleman?

5 JOHN HATHAWAY: It was the first and I
6 was the last.

7 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: That was the first.

8 JOHN HATHAWAY: Oh, were you the last?

9 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Sir, please state
10 your name for the record.

11 JOHN HATHAWAY: John Hathaway.

12 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Yes, alright.
13 Somebody is missing.

14 JOHN HATHAWAY: Bill and maybe he's
15 testifying in opposition.

16 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Somebody who is
17 testifying in opposition, the first name that I
18 called. No? No? Okay.

19 JAMES PROTOS: You're testifying in
20 opposition?

21 MICHAEL PESCI: No.

22 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: We are going to go
23 ahead and start. Mr. Michael Pesci.

24 MICHAEL PESCI: Yes.

25 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: You may begin.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES

2 MICHAEL PESCI: I—I have a statement that
3 I've written just a page so I can just submit the
4 statement.

5 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: [off mic] Okay,
6 thank you. [pause] Okay, Mr. Pesci, please read
7 your statement. You can read it. Please read it.

8 MICHAEL PESCI: Oh, okay.

9 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you.

10 MICHAEL PESCI: I've resided in Carroll
11 Gardens since 1975, and at 238 President Street since
12 1970. I was the Assemblymember for the 52nd Assembly
13 District, which included Carroll Gardens since before
14 any of you were born practically. [background
15 comments] When I became a judge in 1980, I continued
16 to reside, and I've seen the landmarking of parts of
17 Carroll Gardens and Cobble Hill, and the remaking of
18 many homes into what can be described as some—I'm
19 quoting some fellow residents of Carroll Gardens as,
20 quote/unquote "Alien structures" albeit within
21 affable ordinances. Nevertheless, out of the
22 consistency and actually the fabric of the rest of
23 the neighborhood. I've always supported the
24 expansion of landmark areas block by block, cluster
25 by cluster, or individual residences. There are no

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES

2 other structures in the city like 236 and 238
3 President Street because of their unique history, and
4 particular style of construction. The landmarking of
5 236 President will save what was once a famous
6 church. Over some 30 plus years there have been five
7 conversion of churches into residential use in
8 Carroll Gardens, Cobble Hill and Boerum Hill. None
9 of those conversions involved the demolition of any
10 part of those churches. That would happen in
11 businesses unless 236 is landmarked. I repeat, it
12 didn't happen in any of the other churches, and those
13 churches as residential stand out quite well, and are
14 part of the history of Carroll Gardens. 236 would be
15 another. It would be travesty if it would not
16 landmark or preserved for history. I urge you to
17 approve the designation of 236 and 238 President
18 Street as historical landmarks.

19 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much
20 for being here today. I truly appreciate your
21 testimony. Thank you. Okay, sir.

22 JIM PROTOS: Good day. Thanks for
23 granting me the floor. My name is Jim Protos. In
24 1996 my wife Grace and I purchased the second floor
25 apartment at 238 President Street in Carroll Gardens,

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
2 MARITIME USES

3 and have lived and raised our two teen-age daughters
4 there. The two beautiful buildings at 236 and 238
5 President Street represent a shared history and a
6 diverse mix of social, religious and ethnic ties,
7 the Norwegian, Mexican and Italian immigrations, the
8 Deaconess Movement, the precursor or of Woman's
9 Suffrage, the Free Kindergarten Movement, various
10 strands of the Methodist Episcopal faith, and the
11 grand architectural expression of the mid and late
12 19th Century when they were built. Current day
13 representatives of these threads as well as some
14 2,000 friends, neighbors and supporters signed their
15 petitions earlier this year, and voiced their desire
16 to preserve these structures by landmarking them. I
17 came here today to represent them, and I want to
18 express my appreciation for the Landmarks
19 Preservation Commission's support and thank you City
20 Council Members for hearing our case, and for
21 considering our landmarking request. You perform a
22 great service for the city. I would also like to
23 thank my neighbors and friends and especial-
24 especially Councilman Lander and his staff, the
25 Historic Districts Council, our local Community Board
6 and Carroll Gardens Neighborhood Association,

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES

2 Assemblymember Simon, Senator Kavanagh and
3 Congresswoman Velazquez for supporting our effort to
4 safeguard these structures as a vital link to the
5 history of the neighborhood and New York City. I
6 hope you will help us fulfill our aim to secure
7 landmark status for these buildings. Thank you and
8 have a good afternoon.

9 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much,
10 Mr. Protos. I—I echo you in loving the idea of
11 maintaining the history of our communities across New
12 York City. Thank you so much for your testimony
13 today. John.

14 JOHN HATHAWAY: Good afternoon. My name
15 is John Hathaway. I'm a 30-year resident of Carroll
16 Gardens, which may not mean too much relatively
17 speaking, but anyway [laughs] I'm—I'm also a—a
18 Director of Carroll Good—Carroll Gardens Neighborhood
19 Association, and I'm an architect. First, I want to
20 echo Jim's thanks to Brad Lander and particularly
21 Simeon Bankoff of Historic Districts Council who
22 helped guide and support us in this effort to have
23 these building landmarked. Anyway, I as an architect
24 I've been particularly fortunate to work on a couple
25 of projects with residents of 238 President Street,

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
2 MARITIME USES

3 and I've witnessed their dedication to preserving the
4 building. In fact, one of the residents purchased
5 the building in 1974 and saved it from a developer
6 who was going to gut the whole place, and now the
7 interior of the building is well restored including
8 its grand staircase that is in addition to the
9 preservation of the exterior, and that's what's
10 beautiful about this building. It really remains so
11 intact. In fact, I didn't even realize until I did
12 some research for this whole designation that the
13 only change as LPC had noted is that the attic was
14 expanded into a fourth—a full forth floor but it was
15 done so sensitively that it—it's just a beautiful
16 example of how a building can be treated, and
17 maintain its integrity. Anyway, the—the 236
18 President Street Hans Memorial or Hans Christian
19 Memorial Kindergarten, you know, it was actually
20 constructed in the side yard of 238. The owner
21 Almira Christian, you know, just blocked off a, you
22 know, a portion of her lot to build this thing, and
23 so they're intricately tied together, their histories
24 and the land they sit on, and it's a particularly—as
25 again I'm repeating a little bit of what Landmarks
said, but it's an unusual example of Beaux-Art

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
2 MARITIME USES

3 architecture in Carroll Gardens, and particularly
4 significant in that it is a freestanding structure
5 allowing the front cornice to wrap around both sides
6 of the building, and despite the unsympathetic garage
7 addition, which appears to be easily reversible, the
8 façade is otherwise intact. As a member of Carroll
9 Gardens Neighborhood Association, I just have to say
10 we've been working on trying to get the very small 2-
11 block Historic District expanded over the past more
12 than decade. And while I don't consider these two
13 buildings as a success in our grand [laughs] picture,
14 having these two buildings preserved is so important
15 because, in fact, one of the most important—two of
16 the most important buildings in the whole
17 neighborhood, and we'll certainly continue our
18 efforts to get the Carroll Gardens District expanded
19 so that its community is well preserved. And it
20 would be great to again in designating these two
21 buildings if they can join the other individual
22 landmarks that are right within a 2-block radius
23 including Saint Paul's Episcopal Church and the John
24 Rankin Home, which is now the Guido Funeral Home.
25 So, there's a rich architectural history clustered in
this area, and I think I'm not alone just on a sort

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES

2 of a very personal thing. I'm finding myself both
3 deliberately and sometimes subconsciously walking
4 down this block because it is such a pleasant block
5 to go down because of these two buildings. They way
6 they set back, it creates a beautiful space. You can
7 appreciate the entire façade, and it's just something
8 that you don't find too often in the city, and I hope
9 you guys appreciate that, too. Thank you very much.

10 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you, Mr.
11 Hathaway. I appreciate your testimony very much for
12 digging even deeper into the history of Carroll
13 Gardens. Of course, that is one of the most
14 rewarding pieces of--of the job that I do when I take
15 this seat every month. So, thank you very much for
16 that. I know Lisa was taking notes about future
17 aspirations as well. [laughter]. So, thank--so thank
18 you--thank you very much. Thank you, panel for your
19 testimony. Thank you. We've been joined by Council
20 Member Barron, and our vote is still open on LU 218.
21 Counsel.

22 LEGAL COUNSEL: On the vote to approve LU
23 218, the AT&T Headquarters as a landmark, Council
24 Member Barron.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES

2 LEGAL COUNSEL: By a vote of 4 in the
3 affirmative, 0 in the negative and with 0
4 abstentions, the item is recommended for approval by
5 full Land Use Committee.

6 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much.
7 Thank you Council Member Barron. We have another
8 panel. Thank you. Phillip Mendling (sp?) [coughing]
9 Simeon Bankoff and Glenn Kelly please step up.
10 [pause] Okay. Please state your name for the
11 record.

12 GLENN KELLY: Sure. My name is Glenn
13 Kelly.

14 SIMEON BANKOFF: Simeon Bankoff. Do I do
15 this straight up or one at a time?

16 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: You can do it
17 together. It's fine.

18 SIMEON BANKOFF: Simeon Bankoff,
19 Executive Director of Historic Districts Council.

20 PHILLIP MENDLING: Phillip Mendling.

21 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much.
22 You may begin.

23 GLENN KELLY: Sure. I am--my name is
24 Glenn Kelly. I'm a 40-year resident of Carroll
25 Gardens, and have served with John Hathaway as Co-

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
2 MARITIME USES

3 Chair of the Land Use Committee of the Carroll
4 Gardens Neighborhood Association. I am currently a
5 member of the Community Board 6 and I want to just
6 emphasize that Community Board 6 is in support of
7 this application. I am also hopeful that we will one
8 day see an expansion of the Carroll Gardens Landmark
9 District, and until that day comes, we are presented
10 with an opportunity to protect two of only a handful
11 of buildings in Carroll Gardens that are truly
12 unique. I believe strongly that they add to the
13 architectural and historic character of the
14 neighborhood, and I encourage you strongly to support
15 them.

16 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much.

17 SIMEON BANKOFF: Good afternoon, Council
18 Member—Council Members. Simeon Bankoff, Historic
19 Districts Council. I really don't have a lot to add
20 to all the great testimony that's happened for it.
21 We're strongly in support of this designation. I'd
22 like to thank especially Council Member Lander,
23 Assemblymember Simon, Kavanagh and also Nydia
24 Velazquez for all their support. It's—really, this
25 is a story of the residents and the community coming
together to protect these wonderful, beautiful,

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
2 MARITIME USES

3 unique buildings. It's--the--the speed and also I'd be
4 remiss without saying thank you to the Landmarks
5 Commission for really responding swiftly and
6 decisively in a--in a real great fast turnaround, and
7 doing a wonderful presentation that talked
8 extensively about the cultural and architectural
9 history of these buildings. They're desperately
10 meritorious a landmark designation, and we're very
11 pleased that we've gotten this far. We urge you to
12 support them. The only thing I can add is
13 interestingly if you--if you haven't seen the
14 buildings, you might not know it if you haven't
15 visited them in person, the--what looks to be very,
16 very small buildings actually I believe 3,000 square
17 feet of space. It's--it's strange because it's next
18 to two big--bigger buildings. So, it looks really
19 diminutive, but it's about three times the size of my
20 own row house. So, it's actually quite--quite large.

21 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you.

22 Good afternoon, Chair Adams and Committee
23 members. My name is Phillip Mendling. I, too, have
24 lived in Brooklyn for many years. I've lived at 238
25 President Street for more than 30 years, and I, too,
am grateful to everyone who has helped to advance the

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
2 MARITIME USES

3 process of landmarking these buildings and in
4 particular to the Landmarks Preservation Commission,
5 which has been truly outstanding. I want to make a
6 couple of—mention a couple of items that haven't been
7 brought out because there would be no point to
8 repeating all of the correct and interesting points
9 that have really been made. Once that—this
10 neighborhood was rezoned in 2008, and 236 President
11 and 238 President almost uniquely were upzoned to
12 R6A, which creates the potential for building a much
13 taller structure than what's around them, and that
14 makes these two buildings particularly attractive to
15 developers and particularly at risk for destruction.
16 Secondly, I'd like to echo what Glenn said or Simeon
17 or both that while Carroll Gardens is a wonderful,
18 charming neighborhood, it—it doesn't have many
19 buildings that are as individually outstanding as
20 these buildings. It's—it's charming in part for its—
21 for its uniformity, for its coherent integrity, but
22 these two buildings stand out as unique and they're—
23 they're interesting as well because they—they show a
24 trend or a movement in the neighborhood. They were
25 built by a man who moved there because—because it was
a luxurious suburb, and he built this rather lavish

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
2 MARITIME USES

3 house because this was a suburb for people who lived
4 in New York City. With time, Norwegian immigrants,
5 sailors like Almira Christian's husband, Hans
6 Christian moved into the neighborhood, and became
7 prominent. Hans Christian was active in the church.
8 Almira Christian bought the house and built the
9 little kindergarten as a memorial to him. With time,
10 the neighborhood became a Latino neighborhood, and it
11 was the first Spanish speaking congregation in New
12 York and Joan Baez's grandfather lived in 238 and
13 preached in 236. Joan Baez was one of the people who
14 submitted a letter in support, not a song, but a
15 letter in support of the building. I was a little
16 depressed to hear her referred to as Joanne Baez,
17 because it reminded me of how old I am. [laughter]
18 Nobody my age would-would have-would have thought
19 calling her anything, but-but Joan, and then it also
20 illustrates an effort that continues to the day to
21 sort of integrate people who are recent arrivals to
22 our shores into the society that's here. That's what
23 the Deaconess Movement was all about, and that's what
24 236 and 238 President were there to do. It was to
25 help people become Americans, which is noteworthy
today, and actually the trajectory of the Baez

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES

2 Family illustrates that they arrived here penniless
3 from Mexico. Alberto Baez the grandfather became the
4 preacher and lived in this house. His son became a
5 very, very prominent physicist that's Joan Baez's
6 father and rolled many patents, and then, you know,
7 the granddaughter, Joan Baez and her sister Mimi
8 Farina became important cultural figures in the
9 United States. I'd last say that I think as everyone
10 else has commented, the community really did rise up
11 to support these buildings, and I'm here, but I have
12 an individual interest. I-I live in one of these
13 buildings. I adore them. I adore them both, but
14 it's not just me. There were, in fact, 2,000 people
15 who signed petitions and 1,000 people who wrote
16 letters and sent emails. So, it isn't just us. It's
17 everyone who walks by and everyone who calls out to
18 us and cars that stop and talk to us about the
19 buildings. And as noted, there were 21 people who
20 spoke at the hearing, and only one person in
21 opposition. So, with that, I I-I thank you for your
22 attention and again I thank Council Member Lander,
23 and I thank Simeon, and the Landmarks Preservation
24 Commission.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES

2 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you, Mr.
3 Mendling. It's always nice to see the owner put the
4 icing on the cake at these hearing. So, I thank you
5 very much. Council Members, did you have any
6 question for the panel at all? Okay, thank you very
7 much, panel. Thank you. [pause] Are there any more
8 members of the public who wish to testify on these
9 items? Seeing none, the public hearings on LU 238
10 and 239 are now closed, and the items will be laid
11 over. Our next put hearing is on LU 256 an
12 application submitted by the Department of
13 Transportation and the Department of Citywide
14 Administrative Services pursuant to Section 197-C of
15 the New York City Charter for the site selection and
16 acquisition of property located at 25 14th Street in
17 Brooklyn for a DOT fleet vehicle maintenance and
18 repair facility. This site is also in Council Member
19 Lander's district. I now open the public hearing.
20 Okay. We'll call on—I believe it's—is it Keith
21 Stall? [background comments] Jessica. Yes. Good.
22 [laughs] We'll get you to state your name for the
23 record, Jessica. Dale Laserson and Michael Molene--

24 MICHAEL MOLIA: [off mic] Molia.
25

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES

2 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Molia. Okay, very
3 good. Okay. Counsel, please swear in the panel.

4 LEGAL COUNSEL: Please state your names.
5 Jessica Warlord.

6 LEGAL COUNSEL: Make sure the microphone
7 is turned on.

8 JESSICA WURWARG: Jessica Wurwarg. (sic)

9 KEITH STALL: Keith Stall.

10 DALE LAZERSON: I'm Dale Lazerson with
11 DCAS.

12 MICHAEL MOYER: I'm Michael Moyer, Fleet
13 services.

14 LEGAL COUNSEL: Please raise your right
15 hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole
16 truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony
17 before this Subcommittee and in response to all
18 Council Member questions?

19 DALE LAZERSON: Yes.

20 KEITH STALL: I Do.

21 JESSICA WURWARG: Yes.

22 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: You may begin.

23 JESSICA WURWARG: Good afternoon, Council
24 Members. My name is Jessica Wurwarg. I am the
25 Director of Strategic Planning and Sustainability in

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
2 MARITIME USES

3 Facilities Management at New York City Department of
4 Transportation. I am joined by my DOT and DCAS
5 colleagues to present the ULURP application No.
6 180418 PCK for 25 14th Street in Brooklyn. This is
7 DOT's Fleet Services Repair and Maintenance Facility
8 for your consideration and approval. Thank you for
9 this opportunity. Council Members, you received a
10 PDF with some images of the site and site plan for
11 your review. It's also up on the screen. I will
12 present an overview of the facility and some of our
13 ideas for exploring sustainability improvements to
14 the site. So, oops, I'll refer to slide 2 for this
15 part. DOT has a great need for a vehicle repair and
16 maintenance facility since operations at the Brooklyn
17 Army Terminal were discontinued in 2012 when the
18 lease was terminated by the land owner to pursue
19 other uses for the site. In July 2015, DOT engaged
20 DCAS to find a new location that would support a new
21 Brooklyn Fleet Services operation. This site was
22 identified as an ideal location to service and repair
23 DOT vehicles that are part of operations throughout
24 all five boroughs. The Hamilton Asphalt Plant is
25 across the street from this facility. That's DOT
Asphalt Plant and the Gowanus Expressway is easily

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
2 MARITIME USES

3 accessible, which will improve efficiency through
4 reduced travel times and allow easy access from truck
5 routes to the site. There are also approximately
6 four other fleet repair facilities throughout the
7 city. This new facility will reduce the excessive
8 demands placed on DOT's other facilities. Since the
9 site will be able to accommodate a range of vehicle
10 types, service times will also decrease, which will
11 support DOT's citywide lane resurfacing targets and
12 other fleet services related cost reduction efforts.
13 The site is located near the FG&R trains, and three
14 bus lines giving employees public transportation
15 options to get to work. So, just I think the next
16 few slides I'll go through. The next three slides
17 are photos of the exterior of the building. Slides 3
18 and 4 are from the view of 14th Street, and Slide 5
19 was taken mid-block from Hamilton Place looking
20 toward Hamilton Avenue and 14th Street and the
21 Gowanus, and Slide 6 is our final slide. This shows
22 the interior layout of the facility, and just a
23 little bit about the sustainability and resiliency.
24 Sustainability and stormwater management is a
25 priority of the agency and the city as well as the
priority of the Council. As we discussed already

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
2 MARITIME USES

3 with Council Member Lander. Toward this, and whether
4 as a part of the proposed lease or as a sequent
5 project, DOT is exploring opportunities to
6 incorporate solar panels onto the building's roof.

7 In terms of resiliency and storm water management, we
8 are planning on incorporating—incorporating interior
9 trenching drains that will catch debris as vehicles
10 and trucks enter the facility to help address storm
11 water runoff. We are also exploring the

12 possibilities of adding other improvement as rain
13 water catch—a rain water catchment system, rain
14 gardens or bioswales. There is a parking area to be
15 used as a-- You can see some of them to the left to
16 be used as a staging yard for vehicles awaiting

17 maintenance and repair vehicles, which will
18 accommodate about 60 vehicles. The facility will
19 have 15 work stations for up to 15 large vehicles and
20 nine work stations from medium to small vehicles.

21 Given the number of spaces available in the staging
22 yard and the number of work stations inside the
23 facility, this site sufficiently accommodates DOT
24 trucks and vehicles on site. There is a blacksmith
25 shop area used to craft replacement parts in the rear
of the facility, and work desk stations towards the

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES

2 front of the facility as well. The site will have
3 approximately 100 employees working in several
4 shifts, and thank you for your time and
5 consideration, and we would be happy to address any
6 questions you have.

7 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay. I'm just going
8 to note that the Committee didn't receive any written
9 testimony. It would have been nice to follow along
10 with your narrative. It would make questions a
11 little bit easier I think for the committee so--

12 JESSICA WURWARG: [interposing] Okay.

13 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: --so just in this
14 instance for future reference.

15 JESSICA WURWARG: Okay.

16 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay. I have no
17 questions at this time. Council Member Koo,
18 questions? Okay.

19 JESSICA WURWARG: Okay.

20 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: No one else?

21 JESSICA WURWARG: Okay. Are there
22 questions, any?

23 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: I didn't have any.
24 The--the presentation was pretty straightforward, and
25 I think the photos say it all. Council Members in

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES

2 support of this item. I have no questions at this
3 time. Thank you panel.

4 JESSICA WURWARG: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Are there any more
6 members of the public who wish to testify on this
7 item? Seeing none, the public hearing LU 239 is now
8 closed, and the item is laid over. This concludes
9 today's business. I would like to thank the members
10 of the public, my colleagues, Council and Land Use
11 staff for attending today's hearing. This meeting is
12 hereby adjourned. [gavel]

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 1, 2018