

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

November 21, 2018
Start: 10:06 a.m.
Recess: 11:58 a.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway-Committee Rm, 14th Fl.

B E F O R E: HELEN K. ROSENTHAL
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

DIANA AYALA
LAURIE A. CUMBO
BEN KALLOS
BRAD S. LANDER

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jacqueline Ebanks
Executive Director of New York City's Commission
On Gender Equity, CGE

Mary Luke
President of the Metropolitan New York Chapter of
The US National Committee for UN Women, Partner
And Member of CEDAW Act Steering Committee

Sheila Katzman
President of the International Association of
Women in Radio and Television-USA, Chair of New
York City 4 CEDAW Act

Howard Katzman
Member of New York City 4 CEDAW Act Steering
Committee

Cidra sebastien
Associate Executive Director at the Brotherhood/
Sister Sol

Elizabeth Cohen
Member of Voices of Women, VOW

Judith Cutchin
Registered Nurse at Woodhull Hospital, New York
City Nurses Association President for Heath and
Hospitals Executive Mayorals Hospitals

Sharaya Tindal Wiesendanger
Representing Black Women's Blueprint, BWB

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Hello, good morning everyone. I'm Council Member Helen Rosenthal, Chair of the Committee on Women. My pronouns are she, her and hers. Welcome to our oversight hearing on the City's Commission on Gender Equity. Today we will discuss... that's alright, hey there. Today we will discuss the City's work to empower New Yorkers that have been historically marginalized; women, girls, transgender, gender non-conforming and intersex individuals. With an intersectional lens, the Committee is interested in the interplay of power structures that exacerbate and perpetuate gender disparities especially with regard to age, sexual orientation, race and employment status. Nearly a year into the current legislative session this Committee has examined several fundamental challenges of gender equity and justice including gender based harassment and discrimination in the workplace, inadequacies in the way the NYPD's special victims division is addressing sexual assault, unacceptably high rates of maternal mortality and morbidity particularly among black women, failures in preventing sexual abuse in city jails, restrictions

1
2 on reproductive choices and the persistence of
3 domestic and gender based violence. That's not where
4 I thought we'd be in 2018 but we're moving forward.
5 Through legislation the Council has made strides
6 toward progress from passing anti sexual harassment
7 in the workplace laws to increasing access to doulas
8 for pregnant people and lactation spaces for new
9 mothers. More recently the Council passed
10 groundbreaking victim centric legislation to make
11 sure detectives and police officers have the tools
12 necessary to make victims of sexual assault feel
13 heard and safe. While these are significant
14 accomplishments, critical challenges remain including
15 resources necessary to make sure that the NYPD can do
16 its job well. The Commission on Gender Equity plays
17 an essential role in facing those challenges. After
18 thoughtful consideration the Commission established
19 three primary areas on which to focus; economic
20 mobility, safety, and health and reproductive
21 justice. The Commission's agenda on these areas is
22 rightfully ambitious. We will soon hear about CGE's
23 recently announced strategic plan to carry out it's
24 mission and advance the city toward greater equity in
25 these areas. We will also hear from stakeholders and

1
2 service providers in the field advancing gender
3 equity every day. My hope for this hearing is that we
4 will gain a greater understanding of the current
5 landscape of gender-based initiatives that are being
6 undertaken across the city. To achieve this, we will
7 discuss the work of gender equity liaisons that
8 currently exist in five agencies as well as the newly
9 launched New York City Gender Equity Interagency
10 partnership with 57 agencies. We will review what
11 indicators will help us know where the city is
12 succeeding in its efforts to increase gender equity
13 and the gaps that remain. Our work is not complete as
14 long as trans individuals lack access to adequate and
15 appropriate healthcare, as long as female identifying
16 or presenting students are not afforded equal access
17 to STEM opportunities, as long as equal work does not
18 result in equal pay, as long as women justifiably
19 fear harassment and assault while riding our subway
20 system after working the night shift, as long as
21 sexual assault survivors are received in substandard,
22 under resourced facilities or told there aren't
23 enough resources to meet with them, as long as these
24 and other barriers to gender equity persist we must
25 also persist in breaking them down. Our work is

1
2 taking place in a moment of tremendous cultural and
3 social upheaval. To achieve success requires
4 leadership that can respond to the movement and see
5 how it fits in the long arc towards justice. Success
6 requires creative collaboration across sectors and
7 intersections of identities to arrive at holistic
8 solutions that lift all boats. The city is fortunate
9 that such leadership and collaboration exist in the
10 Commission on Gender Equity. Executive Director
11 Jacqueline Ebanks and her team carry out their
12 mandate to address issues of inequity and
13 discrimination facing girls, women and transgender
14 and gender non-conforming individuals with enthusiasm
15 and pride. Before we hear from Executive Director
16 Ebanks I'd like to thank Ned Terrace, my Legislative
17 Director as well as Committee staff for their work in
18 preparing for this hearing; Brenda McKinney, Counsel;
19 Chloe Rivera, Legislative Policy Analyst; Dan Kroop,
20 Financial Analyst and Monica Pepple, our brand-new
21 Financial Analyst. I want to acknowledge Brad Lander
22 from Brooklyn who's on our Committee and who is
23 present, and I also want to recognize my General
24 Counsel, on not only passing the bar but successfully
25

1
2 being accepted into the New York City... New York State
3 bar and we...

4 [applause]

5 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...really
6 appreciate everything that you're doing,
7 congratulations.

8 [applause]

9 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: And with that she
10 will swear you in.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you so much.
12 Please raise your right hands. Do you affirm to tell
13 the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth
14 before this Committee and to respond honestly to
15 Council Member questions?

16 JACQUELINE EBANKS: I do.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

18 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Good morning Chair
19 Rosenthal and good morning Council Member Lander.
20 Thank you so much for your opening and inspirational
21 remarks Chair Rosenthal. As you said I'm Jacqueline
22 Ebanks, my pronouns are she, her and hers. I am the
23 Executive Director of New York City's Commission on
24 Gender Equity and in this capacity, I also serve as
25 an advisor to the Mayor and First Lady on policies

1
2 and issues impacting gender equity in New York City.
3 Thank you for this opportunity to update you on the
4 activities of the Commission since it's creation in
5 2015. As you know the council codified this
6 Commission into law in 2016 and the Commissioner is
7 required to do a few things. One is to study the
8 nature and extent of inequities facing women and
9 girls in the city. Two, to study the impact of these
10 inequities on the economic, civic and social
11 wellbeing of women and girls. Also, the Commission is
12 asked to advise on ways to analyze the function and
13 commission of city... composition of city agencies
14 through a gender-based lens and recommend ways to
15 develop equitable recruitment strategies. We are also
16 required to make recommendations to the Mayor and to
17 the Council for the reduction of gender-based
18 inequalities. As a part of our requirements we submit
19 an annual report to the Mayor and City Council and we
20 meet at least once every four months with one of our
21 meetings open to the public. I am pleased to report
22 that the Commission is now carrying out its
23 responsibilities guided by its recently released 2018
24 through 2021 strategic plan. A copy of this strategic
25 plan is provided for you along with this testimony.

1
2 The plan presents the goals and strategies that we
3 hope to deploy in order to advance gender equity
4 within three focus areas; economic mobility and
5 opportunity, health and reproductive justice, and
6 safety. I want to take a few moments now to go
7 through the goals and the strategies in each of the
8 focus areas and to note that our goals are goals that
9 span the entire duration of the strategic plan as
10 well as the strategies, so they are four-year goals
11 and four-year strategies. In our first focus area,
12 economic mobility and opportunity, the goal is to
13 create a city where people of all gender identities
14 and gender expressions live economically secure lives
15 and have opportunities to thrive. Our strategies for
16 achieving this goal are one, closing the gender
17 leadership gap in all sectors and at all levels. Two,
18 closing the gender pay gap for all workers in all
19 sectors and three, defining and closing the gender
20 asset and wealth gaps. Our second focus area is
21 health and reproductive justice. In this area we have
22 a goal of creating a city free from gender and race-
23 based health disparities and our strategies are; one,
24 to ensure a... ensure access and affordability of
25 comprehensive, culturally competent reproductive

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 health care services again for New Yorkers regardless
3 of their gender identity or gender expression. Two,
4 we also seek to ensure access to an affordability of
5 comprehensive culturally competent medical care for
6 all New Yorkers and finally we'd like to increase
7 access to sexual health education for New York City
8 youth. In our third and final focus area, safety, our
9 goal is a New York City free from gender and race-
10 based violence and our strategies are, one, ensuring
11 short- and long-term safety and stability for key
12 populations; domestic violence survivors, transgender
13 and gender non-conforming people and people in the
14 LGBTQ community. Secondly, we want a city where we
15 can ensure safe environments for persons of all
16 gender identities and gender expressions in public
17 and private spaces. And third and critically
18 important, we would like to be able to end human
19 trafficking whether it starts in New York City,
20 passes through New York City or ends in New York
21 City, wherever we find it we want to be able to
22 eliminate it. to successfully carry out those plans,
23 CG... CGE operates within three guiding principles.
24 First, we recognize the diversity of gender. Second,
25 we use an intersectional lens, this means that the

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 Commission's populations are... of focus are girls,
3 women, transgender and gender non-conforming
4 individuals regardless of ability, age, ethnicity or
5 race, faith, gender expression, immigrant status,
6 sexual orientation and socioeconomic status. And
7 finally, the city leads by example, we want to be a
8 city that leads in the development and implementation
9 of best practices for gender equitable policies and
10 programs for our workforce and for our residents. As
11 you mentioned the combination of the Commission's
12 strategic plan is the creation of the New York City
13 Gender Equity Interagency partnership which held its
14 kickoff meeting on November 13th. The interagency
15 partnership is comprised of senior level
16 representatives from across all city agencies who
17 will work together to develop, advocate for and
18 implement an integrated and sustainable approach to
19 achieving gender equity in New York City. This
20 partnership and this approach will ensure that the
21 commission's work goes beyond the creation of
22 singular initiatives or programs towards building
23 broader systemic and culture change. In closing I'd
24 like to thank you again for this opportunity to share
25 the Commission's progress and plans and we look

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 forward to working with the City Council to
3 continuing to advance gender equity in New York City.
4 Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Thank you so
6 much. I'm just going to ask a couple of quick
7 overview questions and then I'll... I know my colleague
8 has some questions as well. Could you describe the,
9 the staffing you have and the area in the budget
10 where you're staffing lines show up.

11 JACQUELINE EBANKS: So, the staffing we
12 have is a total of five full time staff as of
13 December 31st, we are in the process of hiring two.
14 We actually have two full time... three full time staff
15 on board, pleased to indicate that's a Senior
16 Director for Policy and Programs Chanci Powell is in
17 the room today and we have our Special Assistant and
18 myself, so these are the three on board, we have
19 interviewed and hired a Senior Director for
20 Communications and Outreach and a Policy and Program
21 Analyst. The... we are supported thankfully with five
22 undergraduate and graduate interns one of whom is
23 able to be here today, Carson Fischer... [cross-talk]

24 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Uh-huh... [cross-
25 talk]

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

JACQUELINE EBANKS: ...and this is her first hearing and so that... the staff is being built out and the city funding, total city funding is just under 600K for, for this work.

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay, I... your sentence was what I was looking for. The enactment of Local Law 67 of 2016 indicated two staffers... [cross-talk]

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Right... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Has that 600,000 been baselined in the city's budget?

JACQUELINE EBANKS: The 600... let me say it this way, the current staffing structure was built based on the strategic plan so... and the strategic plan was just completed this year so, we're in a process I think of beginning the baselining because we're in the mid... middle of a term of a fiscal year. I, I think what we wanted to be sure about is that we were conscious in building this staff out and that we had rationale for increasing our team so at this point, you know this becomes our new budget and when the new fiscal year starts I think that's the point at which we talk about baselining it.

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: So, you're saying that you're not... you have not been given an assurance that the staffing model that you've established so thoughtfully will be funded in the next... [cross-talk]

6

JACQUELINE EBANKS: I expect... [cross-talk]

7

8

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...fiscal year... [cross-talk]

9

10

JACQUELINE EBANKS: ...that it will be, to completely transparent I expect that it will be. I don't expect that we will see any reduction in staff.

11

12

13

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: In the November plan the Mayor actually makes any modifications that he thinks will be necessary to the budget... [cross-talk]

14

15

16

17

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

18

19

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...do you know if that additional six... 400,000 dollars is included in the November modification?

20

21

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Yes, it is.

22

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Oh...

23

JACQUELINE EBANKS: That it is.

24

25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: So, there you go, congratulations. Can you please send over that... those details?

5

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Sure, we will...

6

[cross-talk]

7

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Great, thank you very much. Could you talk about your working relationship with the Commissioners and what I'm getting at here because I am a Commissioner, so I don't... I'm not starting from zero here but where the, the question I'm really trying to get at is, is there a sort of binding pledge that the work that you come up with, the findings, your findings will be implemented?

16

JACQUELINE EBANKS: From the CGE

17

Commissioners when you refer to... [cross-talk]

18

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yeah, only

19

because that's your tie to... [cross-talk]

20

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

21

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...City Government

22

is the membership.

23

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Right, right, so, so

24

the strategic plan was developed with the City... with

25

the Commissioners at the table, the, the CGE

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 Commissioners so, the, the 32 member panel and as you
3 know we had several sessions and came to this, this
4 plan so I do know that we have solid buy in from all
5 our CGE Commissioners, Commissioners to the... to the
6 plan including the new ones that we just appointed,
7 that were just appointed by the Mayor and the Speaker
8 for Council as the plan was discussed with them
9 before the opportunity was offered and I also know
10 that throughout city government this... the
11 Commissioners of agencies are in full support of, of
12 this plan and this work. Yes.

13 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Full support
14 means that... well here let's use an example... [cross-
15 talk]

16 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Sure... [cross-talk]

17 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...exact example,
18 the gender liaisons, maybe... [cross-talk]

19 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

20 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...you could start
21 by talking about their role and I know there are five
22 who... [cross-talk]

23 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Yes... [cross-talk]

24 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...have been
25 budgeted, what is your sense about... possibility or

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 thoughts about funding gender liaisons at... gender
3 equity liaisons at more of the departments?

4 JACQUELINE EBANKS: So, as you know the,
5 the gender equity liaison position was established
6 through the City Council's young women's initiative,
7 leadership initiative and they're in five city
8 agencies, I'll just repeat for the record; Department
9 of Education, Department of Health and Mental
10 Hygiene, Department of Housing Preservation and
11 Development, Department of Social Services, and
12 Department of Youth and Community Development. Since
13 2007... I'm sorry, since July 2017, CGE has been
14 working with the Gender Equity Liaisons to develop a
15 process to integrate gender equity as a framework
16 into the work of city agencies. This work has
17 informed the creation of the Gender Equity
18 Interagency partnership. What we, we at... and as I
19 mentioned we held our kickoff meeting on November
20 13th so what we are learning from the gender equity
21 liaisons we are beginning to extend to city agencies
22 and senior level individuals, chiefs of staff,
23 assistant commissioners, deputy commissioners have
24 been appointed by Commissioners of 57 agencies to be
25 on this interagency task force partnership group so

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 that work is in, in play... at play and we're looking
3 organically at a structure that can work across city
4 agencies to advance gender equity in the city.

5 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: You mentioned the
6 YWI... [cross-talk]

7 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

8 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...which was an
9 amazing initiative [off mic dialogue] and its very
10 exciting that one of the recommendations has been
11 implemented... [cross-talk]

12 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Yes... [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...through CGE, you
14 know I'm wondering in, in terms of your relationships
15 with your Commissioners what the sense you have is on
16 implementing the full young women's initiative, there
17 are many more parts to it and you know the
18 administration really has rightly so stepped up youth
19 as it has to do with the young men's initiative but
20 do you think that there's room for the administration
21 to consider taking on the young women's initiative as
22 well?

23 JACQUELINE EBANKS: There's absolutely
24 room and we are in the process of shaping out a lead...
25 a youth leadership council, the First Lady has always

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2

been concerned that our Commission does not include a

3

youth voice and so we're building a youth leadership

4

council that will work with the same elements of the

5

strategic plan to look at how these areas impact

6

young women, young girls, transgender and gender non-

7

conforming youth, it's that and based on that we're

8

hoping also to pull into the mix the work of the

9

young women's initiative.

10

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yeah, I mean that

11

just sounds... [cross-talk]

12

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Yeah... [cross-talk]

13

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...a little

14

concerning in the sense of not wanting to... [cross-

15

talk]

16

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Exactly... [cross-talk]

17

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...tremendous

18

amount of work that went into that already... [cross-

19

talk]

20

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Yeah... Yes, we know

21

and I... when I was in the advocacy world I was on one

22

of the working groups, we are in, in conversation

23

with girls for gender equity, which is a leading

24

partner, off that effort what... we see this work... our...

25

what I call probably young women's initiative 2.0 is

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2 how do we build on the progress and success of the
3 first effort to create a deeper citywide investment,
4 I think that has to include not only the efforts of
5 young women's initiative but the work of the
6 Commissioner in gender equity so that we build a
7 space for the youth voice that it's solidly
8 integrated, yeah.

9 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: The findings were
10 quite a bit...

11 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Yes... [cross-talk]

12 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...I mean you were...
13 2.0 always sounds good... [cross-talk]

14 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Yeah... [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...you know I'm...
16 [off mic dialogue] 2.0 but we got to 2.0 after we did
17 everything with 1.0 and I'm just wondering there's a
18 lot in the young women's initiative that hasn't been
19 touched on... [cross-talk]

20 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Yes... [cross-talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...yet... [cross-
22 talk]

23 JACQUELINE EBANKS: And so, we will bring
24 that to the table as we build out this initiative so,
25 what, what I'm actually saying it's not in isolation

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 that we'll be doing both and, and you're absolutely
3 right, we have to build on the work and the progress
4 made before and that's our intent.

5 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Great, Council
6 Member Lander did you want to..

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Madame
8 Chair and thank you Director Ebanks for this good
9 testimony and for all your work. I guess I have a
10 couple of questions about the relationship of this
11 work to other things going on in the administration..
12 [cross-talk]

13 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...so, one of them
15 is I know established by Council Law last term also
16 and in partnership with City Hall there are several
17 agencies, three to begin with undergoing these equity
18 audits... [cross-talk]

19 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Right... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...which is an
21 exciting new process and tool and its getting
22 underway and I just wonder if you could talk a little
23 about how you, you and your team are related to that
24 auditing... equity auditing work which is not
25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 exclusively about gender equity, there's race and
3 other... [cross-talk]

4 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Racial... [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...categories as
6 well but gender equity is certainly a critical and
7 central lens, I think that work is starting at HRA,
8 at DOHMH and at ACS... [cross-talk]

9 JACQUELINE EBANKS: ACS, DSS and DOHMH,
10 yes. So, I started August 2017 and I had the great
11 pleasure of sitting next to the Mayor when he signed
12 the... those bills into law. The, the work has begun, I
13 was a part of initial discussions with... and in
14 partnership with the Mayor's Office of Operations.
15 The agencies have been developing those plans, those
16 assessments, they've conducted them and I'm looking
17 here I see that we expect that a report will be
18 available come July 2019 but the work has been
19 ongoing and guided by and supported by the Mayor's
20 Office of Operations and so we expect reporting out.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: So, staff from
22 the Mayor's Office of Operations are the ones who
23 have lead responsibility for... or the agency... [cross-
24 talk]

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2

JACQUELINE EBANKS: The agency... [cross-talk]

3

4

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...staff with support... who... [cross-talk]]

5

6

JACQUELINE EBANKS: The agency... [cross-talk]

7

8

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...have support... [cross-talk]

9

10

JACQUELINE EBANKS: ...staff with support.

11

12

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Staff from each of those agencies get consulting and support and assistance from the Mayor's Office of Operations but the report is being done by their staff... [cross-talk]

13

14

15

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Yes... [cross-talk]

16

17

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...and will come in the form of three separate reports, each report issued by the agency itself?

18

19

20

JACQUELINE EBANKS: We are not yet clear

21

on what that reporting will be like. One of the

22

things we want to make sure is that we give the

23

autonomy if you will of each agency to work in their

24

unique construct and space and so I think that has

25

been assured while... you know going towards equity

assessments and so that the uniqueness of each space,

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2 each agency is better able to, to manage that work
3 and then supported by the Mayor's Office of
4 Operation.

5

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Okay, so that
6 sounds to me like maybe an equity self-assessment.

7

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Yeah, I think that
8 that's fair.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Okay but like
10 when I... you know when employees do their annual
11 performance reviews like usually you have them do a
12 self-review and then also someone else reviews them
13 but it's... so, what's happening... [cross-talk]

14

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Yes... [cross-talk]

15

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...here is we are
16 supporting and I haven't look at Local Law 174 of
17 whichever year it was in a little while but it sounds
18 like what has evolved and I guess I understood it, I,
19 I have in my head kind of from the work that Garren
20 and others have done something that you would call
21 like an equity audit... [cross-talk]

22

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Right... [cross-talk]

23

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...where external
24 actor, obviously in partnership with the agency kind
25 of audits or assesses but instead... and I can see the

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2 benefits of having people internally internalize
3 those tools and use them, but you can also imagine
4 the ways in which self-assessment sometimes has
5 weaknesses compared to external assessments... [cross-
6 talk]

7 JACQUELINE EBANKS: And I think you, you
8 make an excellent point. I, I... as this I would say is
9 our first foray into this work. We wanted to ensure
10 that the... that the agencies had opportunity guided by
11 consultants to understand the process and to... and,
12 and quite frankly they work with the state on a
13 regular basis. The, the process has always involved
14 ongoing touch point meetings so that it... and I'm
15 aware of this although I have not been able to be a
16 part of them, I do think there is oversight and full...
17 I expect full transparency in this process.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Alright and that...
19 I guess that billage I'm looking at now also requires
20 the creation of an equity committee to, to review the
21 reports, is that... are you, you know can... do you... has
22 that committee been stood up and what is it?

23 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Not, not at this time
24 but, but I do know that I will be a member of such a
25 committee.

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Okay, so there,
there will be when the agencies complete their self-
assessments which you anticipate will be in June...

5

[cross-talk]

6

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Yes... [cross-talk]

7

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...they will be
submitted to... I mean I assume the Council will get
them, but they will also go to this committee which
hasn't yet been stood up although since the reports
aren't ready, yet it's got a couple of... [cross-talk]

12

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Right, right... [cross-
talk]

14

15

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...months and
you'll be a member of it to review those annual
reports?

17

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Absolutely, yes.

18

19

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Okay and, and I
guess this might not be a fair question since it
hasn't been stood up yet, but you know obviously what
would be very valuable is if that committee did more
than say thank you for these reports but, you know
did something with them like... [cross-talk]

24

JACQUELINE EBANKS: We... [cross-talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...reflect... yes...

3

[cross-talk]

4

5

JACQUELINE EBANKS: ...fully agree with you
and I, I do expect that that would be our approach.

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Okay and the hope
is that in addition to reviewing the reports, making
sure that they're thorough, that the action plans are
real and that the agencies follow up on their action
plans also that we reflect as a city more broadly on
a plan presumably for having all agencies over time
go through such a process.

13

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Agreed.

14

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Okay.

15

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Agreed.

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Alright, well
okay so that's a helpful set of reminders and Madame
Chair it sounds like we'll have some good work to do
when those reports come in to review the reports
themselves but also to speak with this committee and
think about what the process is for, for moving
forward more... [cross-talk]

23

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Yes... [cross-talk]

24

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...broadly to make...

25

[cross-talk]]

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Yes, and... [cross-talk]]

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...that a, a, a... [cross-talk]

JACQUELINE EBANKS: ...and you know as I... [cross-talk]]

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...standardized... [cross-talk]

JACQUELINE EBANKS: ...and in my... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...in the process... [cross-talk]

JACQUELINE EBANKS: ...remarks Council Member the goal is broad systemic and culture change and those equity assessments and equity plans are key to making that happen.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Got... [cross-talk]

JACQUELINE EBANKS: So, we, we want to make sure that this is not something that's being treated lightly... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Yeah... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2

JACQUELINE EBANKS: ...and we also want to
3 make sure that we have a participatory approach to
4 this work.

5

6

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: And I think it's
7 a really interesting question, I look forward to
8 doing some more drilling down on because I, I think
9 two things are both true and they're in some tension
with each... [cross-talk]

10

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

11

12

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...other. The work
of getting the agencies to internalize, embrace and...
13 this work is critical... [cross-talk]]

14

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Yes... [cross-talk]

15

16

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...as opposed to
17 them thinking like external auditors come in... [cross-
talk]

18

19

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Come in, right...
[cross-talk]

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...so that's true
and I think it's valuable. It's also true that like
if the approach we took to MWBE compliance was agency
self-assessment we would be woefully... that would be a
woefully inadequate approach to achieving compliance
with an equity... set of equity goals... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Right, right... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...so, what the right balance is between supporting and encouraging internal compliance and self-reflect... you know reflective behavior and, and self-improvement and external something that's more like an audit on which someone is holding you to goals and not just those that you said... [cross-talk]

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Absolutely... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...well we're going to do better here... [cross-talk]

JACQUELINE EBANKS: No and, and I agree... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...is also valuable... [cross-talk]

JACQUELINE EBANKS: ...with you... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...and I think we're going to have some things to learn...

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Absolutely... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...so that, that
sounds like a valuable set of, of processes that will
come out after the first reports are in... [cross-talk]

5

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Agreed... [cross-talk]

6

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...in June and I
look forward... you know I guess we'll want to include
probably the, the Civil Rights Committee since those
are racial and gender equity audits but that sounds
like some, some very valuable hearings to get to do
in 2019. There's now several... [cross-talk]

12

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Yes, thank you...

13

[cross-talk]

14

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...other members
here so even though I had a couple other questions I
was going to ask I'm going to... I'm going to leave my
questioning at this and hand it off to colleagues and
look forward... [cross-talk]

19

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yeah... [cross-
talk]

21

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...to working with
you... [cross-talk]

23

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yeah... [cross-
talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...on that process
in the future.

4

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Thank you.

5

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you.

6

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Thank you Council
Member.

8

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Thank you so much
Council Member Lander, we've been joined by Council
Members Kallos and Ayala, I know they both have
questions but I'm, I'm just going to come back to one
very quickly about the budget, we went back and
checked and actually there is no funding for
additional staff in the November modification...

15

[cross-talk]

16

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Okay... [cross-talk]

17

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...there is 70,000
dollars in the OTPS line but no adjustment for PS at
all. So, I... [cross-talk]

20

JACQUELINE EBANKS: So, we will follow
up, yes...

22

[off mic dialogue]

23

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay, well I mean
so far, we're not and so either you've going to send
over a new November preliminary which will include

25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 the staffing or you're going to say to the public
3 that it may or may not be in the preliminary budget
4 and that's a little disconcerting. Similarly
5 disconcerting is the question of the gender equity
6 liaisons where as part of our budget negotiations in
7 adoption there was an agreement that those positions
8 in the agencies would be baselined and yet in the
9 adopted budget those lines were not reflected nor are
10 they in the preliminary budget baseline so I'm very
11 concerned that you are... that the administration may
12 very well be asking agencies to self-fund these
13 positions which if that's true that should be made
14 public that that's what you're asking agencies to do
15 then I would ask what of the positions that are not
16 being filled in order to fill the gender equity
17 liaisons that is concerning to me. I'm going to leave
18 to... sorry? Oh, I'm going to leave to Council Member
19 Ayala questions about NGBV because I'm going to
20 assume that she's asking those questions, but I want
21 to ask a little bit more about working with other
22 parts of government. I'm wondering about how the
23 Commission interacts with the Deputy Mayor, Deputy
24 Mayor Glen who started women dot NYC and there's this
25 wonderful, I think... I think this is in women dot NYC,

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 she builds NYC, yeah, that's a part of that. It may
3 be a different part, there may be two separate
4 things, but she builds NYC has to do with monuments
5 and I'm wondering whether or the Commission had any
6 connection to those initiatives, you know one could
7 definitely see that both of those things are part of
8 women's empowerment...

9 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Absolutely...

10 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yeah, thank you.

11 JACQUELINE EBANKS: I would... we, we are...
12 one of the tensions we have when we look at the work
13 of the Commission is when are we an operational
14 vehicle and when is the Commission this 30,000 foot
15 oversight ensuring that the city builds an
16 infrastructure of gender equity, equitable practices
17 and policies and so within that tension very often
18 there are things we realize that its best for a
19 Deputy Mayor or an agency to develop and implement
20 but then we ought to be able to connecting to... with
21 that the CGE then amplifies that work as a part of
22 the broader work that New York City does so that was...
23 those efforts were led and managed within the Deputy
24 Mayor's portfolio, women dot NYC and she build, she
25 build is, is out of Department of Cultural Affairs I

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 think and, and women dot NYC is out of... I forget the..
3 economic, Economic Development Corporation. So, it,
4 it... what then we want to happen especially through
5 the Gender Equity Interagency partnership is first to
6 begin to capture this... all this... you know this myriad
7 work happening and be able to use through CGE and
8 amplifying voice to say this is how New York City is
9 addressing issues of gender equity whether they
10 impact women, girls, transgender or gender non-
11 conforming individuals. We are not going to be an
12 operational entity but sometimes we can be so you
13 know we have launched this 16 days of activism and
14 our campaign which we're entering November 25th
15 through December 10th that's been something
16 spearheaded by the Commission of Gender Equity, we've
17 pulled together city agencies and community based
18 agencies to do this but I will tell you with the
19 expanded role of the Mayor's Office to End Domestic
20 and Gender Based Violence we're already in
21 discussions in... for 2019 that this campaign gets
22 managed through the Mayor's Office to End Domestic
23 and Gender Based Violence. So, I, I think... and so
24 we're supportive of those efforts and we'll continue
25 to use our platforms to amplify the work.

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: That'd be great,
I mean one way to do that is to have the information
on your website.

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Absolutely, yep.

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: I just didn't see
any... [cross-talk]

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Its, it's not...
[cross-talk]]

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...links... [cross-
talk]

JACQUELINE EBANKS: ...there at this time,
uh-huh.

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Great. Let's see,
really quickly I just want to ask about your work on
data collection and to try to understand whether or
not you're collecting data specifically related to
non, non-binary individuals and I'm referring to your
testimony where you mentioned ensuring access to
affordability... and affordability of comprehensive
culturally competent medical care... [cross-talk]

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...for New Yorkers
regardless of gender identity or gender expression,

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

is that anything that you are collecting or plan to collect data around?

JACQUELINE EBANKS: We... I'll just take a step back, as we did the, the strategic plan we recognized a dearth of information for transgender and gender non-conforming individuals, so we will be looking at mechanisms to begin to collect that data. Again, probably through city agencies, the Unity Project is a key partner in this work and they are... will be helping and doing work in, in this space as well.

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: I literally just missed your last sentence. The... which agency?

JACQUELINE EBANKS: The Unity Project for... the Unity Project that focuses on LGBTQ youth...

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay...

JACQUELINE EBANKS: ...that's a key partner in, in our work and so we'll be using... working with them to really build out this approach around data collection but I'm seeing this work... the question is what's already being collected in agencies... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yeah, exactly... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2

JACQUELINE EBANKS: ...you know the... it...

3

the goal is not to duplicate... [cross-talk]

4

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yeah... [cross-

5

talk]

6

JACQUELINE EBANKS: ...as you would expect,

7

the goal is to synthesize and to, you know share the

8

information again using CGE as a centralizing hub for

9

the work that's happening in agencies and to really

10

say to the city of New York this is what's happening,

11

this is how your represented regardless of gender

12

identity or gender expression and this is how you're

13

served.

14

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Thank you, would

15

you consider reaching out to Health and Hospitals

16

Corporation... [cross-talk]

17

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Absolutely... [cross-

18

talk]

19

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...or Department of

20

Health, you hadn't mentioned that... [cross-talk]

21

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Absolute... no, even

22

though I didn't but... [cross-talk]

23

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: That's okay...

24

[cross-talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2

JACQUELINE EBANKS: ...all city agencies,
3 yes... [cross-talk]

4

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Do you know if
5 they collect that data?

6

JACQUELINE EBANKS: I don't know at this
7 point, I would... my assumption is they do for more
8 reasons than... [cross-talk]

9

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay... [cross-
10 talk]

11

JACQUELINE EBANKS: My interaction...
12 [cross-talk]

13

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: They're having a...
14 [cross-talk]

15

JACQUELINE EBANKS: ...with them... [cross-
16 talk]

17

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...hearing I think
18 related to this issue next week and so perhaps that
19 information about whether or not the data is
20 collected, what data you have could be presented at
21 that hearing. I'm going to turn it over to my
22 colleagues, Council Member... who's ready? Council
23 Member Kallos.

24

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you to
25 Chair Helen Rosenthal and her leadership on women's

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2 issues even before she took on this Committee, it is
3 good to have another man join me on the Women's
4 Committee and we will continue to do our best as
5 allies. As we talk about gender equity... well, well
6 first, its good to see you...

7

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Thank you...

8

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I want to thank
10 you for all the great work you did at the women's
11 city club particularly our work... [cross-talk]

11

12 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Thank you Council
13 Member... [cross-talk]

13

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: ...together on
15 campaign finance... [cross-talk]

15

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Thank you.

16

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: What did you...
18 what did you think about question one now after,
19 after the fact?

19

JACQUELINE EBANKS: It passed, right?

20

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: More people voted
22 on ballot question one than voted for Mayor in 2017
23 in favor and... [cross-talk]

23

24 JACQUELINE EBANKS: It was a banner year
25 for a turnout so congratulations Council Member.

25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2

3

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: No, thank you
for... [cross-talk]]

4

5

JACQUELINE EBANKS: For a great... [cross-
talk]

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: ...all the great
work you've done before, now what you're doing in
this Commission. I guess one issue I... guess question
I have about equity is... I, I, I have a newborn, I
hope I can still say it she's nine months old and so
I, I took paternity leave and actually got criticized
for it because it, it turns out that I do not
lactate, I, I was not breastfeeding though I was
feeding my daughter what had been breastfed and, and
expressed as it were and as I've spoken to other men
it varies between people who work in places that have
a culture that... and, and, and even... I would... I would
even just say beyond just men but people who are in
relationships where they are not the child bearing
partner, what... and, and so some people are in
environments where everyone takes family leave and
some people are in environments where it's only
socially acceptable for folks to take maternity
leave, is family leave an important issue for gender
equity and is it important that regardless of gender

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 that where there is a family unit with two parents
3 that we... that we are focused on ensuring that
4 actually all parents are involved in family leave?

5 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Absolutely, I mean I...
6 and I, I'd just say yes to that, you know what... I do
7 want to add that the work we try to do and you, you
8 said this is not just about policies and practices,
9 it's about the culture and so we have heard and its
10 been reported that many for profit companies have
11 paternity leave, leave but they have to encourage and
12 if not urge the, the men to take it because of this
13 stigma so we're at a period in time where we have
14 fairly strong... we have strong family leave policies
15 in this state and in this city and that we need to
16 ensure that parents who take it and parents whether
17 it be maternity or paternity leave are encouraged to
18 do so and supported to do so. So, I think that's been
19 a critical piece of work and I just want to also
20 mention that earlier this year we passed the diaper
21 changing station bill, which also extends to... and
22 that in every new building we in the city we now have
23 to have a diaper changing station in every single
24 restroom. The thing that's also very important move
25 to this cultural shape where we normalize the non-

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2 birthing parent if you will as having an active role
3 in raising children and so it's a critical piece of
4 gender equity, it effects how women access the
5 workforce as well and it really effects women's
6 earnings when... and unfortunately that's sort of the
7 bulk of the data we have now. We know that women take
8 a lot of time out of the workforce for caregiving
9 whether it's for a newborn or adopted infant or a, a
10 caring parent so it's really wonderful that we're
11 creating ways to have both parents share equally in,
12 in this role so...

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: And, and just on
14 the focus of the economy and, and jobs I think one of
15 the other pieces that our Chair was discussing was
16 the she build NYC I, I, I... as a person with a tech
17 background I'm focused on women dot NYC so now that
18 we've passed somewhat landmark legislation about not
19 having folks disclose what their prior pay rate is,
20 the other issue is making sure that we provide access
21 to high paying jobs particularly for women so that
22 they can get past these previous inequities and...

23 [cross-talk]

24 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Absolutely... [cross-
25 talk]

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: ...I would argue that these inequities do still continue despite some of our best efforts, can you tell us a little bit about women dot NYC and how folks at home where more than 50 percent are likely to be women can take advantage of this resource and what is there and how we are measuring the success of women dot NYC?

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Unfortunately, at this time I, I don't have that data and we'll, we'll have to be able to get that... get back to you.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you, I look forward to working with you.

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Council Member Ayala.

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Good morning, sorry I was late. I really wanted to... I had a question, I was recently appointed to the Commission, I'm really excited, I'm looking forward... [cross-talk]

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: ...to learning more and, and becoming more involved but my question this morning was really around the Commission's relationship with the Mayor's Office to End Domestic

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2

Violence and Gender Based Violence... Domestic and
Gender Based, Based Violence and so beyond the 16
days of activism what, what other types of work or
initiatives are, are you jointly, you know working
on?

6

7

JACQUELINE EBANKS: We have an incredible
relationship with the Mayor's Office to End Domestic
and Gender Based Violence, it's a partnership where
one of the agencies that we are literally joined at
the hip. The Commissioner Cecile Noel was a part of
the development of our strategic plan and an integral
player and informed the plan because of the expanded
role of the, the Mayor's Office to End Domestic and
Gender Based Violence we know that the safety
portfolio that we have identified in our strategic
plan will be shared in the implementation so we're
discussing at the moment what that looks like, what
roles we, we play but we, we work together on the
ground and we work together strategically and we work
together in the policy space, that's an agency that
is a key partner for our work and we a key partner
for their work.

24

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I love

25

Commissioner Noel I just want to put that on the

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2 record but I think if we could find a way to localize
3 some of those policy related initiatives that that
4 would be great because I think often times, you know
5 through different commissions the work is really
6 spread across the city and sometimes doesn't really
7 make it to smaller communities and.. [cross-talk]

8 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Okay.. [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: ...I, I think we..
10 you know we, we saw a lot of that sort of like the
11 young women's leadership initiative which was great
12 but a lot of it was really centered around policy and
13 a lot of those ideas were really great and could have
14 been implemented on a community-based model. The
15 second question that I had was around the, the
16 ending... human trafficking work and understanding that
17 January is human trafficking month, wondering what
18 the Commission... if... you know had in mind to really
19 bring awareness?

20 JACQUELINE EBANKS: So, January anti
21 human trafficking month... what we will be doing is
22 we'll be in partnership with the Mayor's Office to
23 End Domestic and Gender Based Violence. As you know
24 because we're in this 16-day period it's... that's one
25 of the elements of gender-based violence so we'll be

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2 shining a spotlight now and then building out to an
3 opportunity in January but we haven't decided what
4 that work will be at this time.

5

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I can appreciate
6 that, please keep us posted I would love to be able
7 to be helpful.

8

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Will do.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Thank you.

10

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Can I go back to
11 correct something for the record, I was just... this
12 was brought... [cross-talk]

13

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Please.

14

JACQUELINE EBANKS: The, the budget I
15 misspoke, it will show in the January budget not in
16 November.

17

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Thank you... here
18 so I just want to check where I am. Is this one
19 working, I can't... there's no red light?

20

COMMITTEE CLERK: I hear you.

21

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: I...

22

COMMITTEE CLERK: Yeah.

23

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Is this one
24 working fine? Okay, I'm just going to sort of slide
25 over a little bit here. Thank you very much. So, will

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 there be an announcement, any formal announcement of
3 the money going into the budget, does... how, how will
4 the public know, it... will there be specific lines put
5 in? Let me just say it a different way, I don't mean
6 to put you on the spot. Here's, here's how I would
7 say it, you know with all due respect to the
8 administration this was an agreement made at
9 adoption, it should have gone in the budget in
10 adoption, its very disheartening that it wasn't put
11 in the first modification which is the
12 administration's opportunity to say here are the
13 changes we've made since adoption and this is... this
14 is... what we're doing this year another words it
15 acknowledges the current year and it's such a
16 deminimus [phonetic] amount of money, I just... I, I
17 cannot with all due respect express more strongly
18 although I may, how deeply disappointing it is that
19 it was not included in November and there's... I, I
20 don't even... I can't wrap my head around it yet but
21 I'm going to move on. I want to switch gears a little
22 bit to talk about the work the commission is doing
23 and what the commission thinks are the main issues
24 facing cisgender and transgender women and girls in
25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 the city today and facing LGBTQ intersex and non...
3 gender non-conforming individuals?

4 JACQUELINE EBANKS: And the question is
5 what do we think are the main issues?

6 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yeah or where are
7 you focusing, focusing your efforts around?

8 JACQUELINE EBANKS: So, within the
9 strategic plan that's, that's the idea of them, we
10 have what we consider lead initiatives, okay, which
11 is... if... efforts that will get underway within this
12 first year. What's key to us is how do we ensure that
13 cisgender, transgender, gender non-conforming
14 individuals are full beneficiaries of the wealth and
15 resources of New York City within the three focus
16 areas. Again, economic mobility and opportunity,
17 health and reproductive justice and safety. So, we
18 therefore will be looking at within those areas and
19 within those eight initiatives where are these
20 moments of opportunity for leadership and not just in
21 the city... not in the city's workforce but across all
22 sectors, right. I think that requires for us
23 communication through our city agencies, data
24 collection, analysis of that information and then
25 partnership with domestic nonprofits, international

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 nonprofits where we get to... and with the for profit
3 sector where we get to shape new program initiatives
4 if necessary or we get to expand ones that we
5 consider working so I think employment is one space,
6 clearly when you think across the H spectrum we want
7 to think of youth and education and the opportunities
8 that we're opening up so that all avenues of society
9 is open to every individual regardless of gender or
10 gender, gender identity or expression. I think, you
11 know the health care space with reproductive justice
12 is key regard... the regrettable DeVos ruling, we have
13 to look at our colleges and see what we can do to
14 reinforce the good work we have in New York State and
15 New York City and... to ensure that we continue the
16 protections that we have for our college students and
17 the safety space is critical, we know that.
18 Unfortunately, as crime has declined in New York City
19 the one area in which we see increase is around
20 gender-based violence. We need to have strategies
21 that are multilevel and I want to go a bit to the
22 public engagement strategy for... is key is that we are
23 involving the community at every level and so when we
24 have a public, public meeting as we will in December
25 its really how do we get the voice of the Commission

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2 outside of City Hall, additionally how do we get the
3 voices of the people connecting us and informing our
4 work so that we can deliver a product that's more
5 appropriate to the use of, of our general public. So,
6 I think that's the landscape of our work.

7

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: And that's great.
8 Do you have a component part in your budget for
9 public education?

10

JACQUELINE EBANKS: We... yes and the
11 initiative that we'll be launching is the gender
12 equity summit so yes, we have resources to apply and,
13 and... against that.

14

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay and again I
15 would just want confirmation of that from the
16 administration, yeah. Great and you picked up on my
17 next question which does have to do with the current
18 president and all of his threats to women or the LGBT
19 community, gender non-conforming, trans and I'm
20 wondering whether or not the Commission plans to or
21 if somebody else in government is... [cross-talk]

22

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

23

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...already
24 addressing the issue of the Department of Health and
25 Human Services consideration of establishing a legal

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2 definition of sex under Title IX and also regarding
3 the Department of Education's Title IX compliance?

4 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Yeah, we are in
5 discussion across the city and will be responding to,
6 to both and creating our response for both but we're
7 in discussion at the moment.

8 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Do you have a
9 sense of timing on that?

10 JACQUELINE EBANKS: So... [cross-talk]

11 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Is there
12 anything... [cross-talk]

13 JACQUELINE EBANKS: I don't have
14 anything... [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...that the Council
16 could... [cross-talk]

17 JACQUELINE EBANKS: ...more specific...
18 [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...could do to be
20 helpful... [cross-talk]

21 JACQUELINE EBANKS: ...at this time...
22 [cross-talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...I mean that was
24 something that I issued a statement on the day that
25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 the Title IX, the DOE Title IX I issued a statement...

3 [cross-talk]

4 JACQUELINE EBANKS: And, and... [cross-
5 talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...that day
7 there's... I have an albeit in the Daily News about it.

8 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Yes, and, and we will
9 be doing that, you know we've been in communication
10 and... via email as well, I, I've just been working on
11 this last night so it's an active discussion, you
12 know for us and certainly I... you know somebody will,
13 either myself or... I am shaping a piece but what I'm
14 looking for is a sustained response and I, I think
15 that's the thing that concerns us not just wanting to
16 be reactionary to this president and his actions but
17 how do we look at something that's sustained and, and
18 that takes a little bit more shaping which for us
19 clearly is making sure that we protect New York City
20 residents and that that can extend to New York State
21 that's critical during this time of rollbacks but
22 then how do we lend what we learned to the broader
23 advocacy nationwide so that's the strategy and that,
24 that's what we're wrestling with. We know we are... I
25 just don't want to say a progressive city, but we

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2 have done some remarkable work over the past for six
3 years, we went to ensure that those are safe and
4 cannot be unmoored and then we want to make sure we
5 offer our lessons learned to other localities.

6 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Director Ebanks I
7 again will say as I think I said to you the first day
8 we talked when you started this job, they are lucky
9 to have you.

10 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: And I think they
12 are lucky, lucky to have you. I think you are a
13 thoughtful leader and somebody who will be talking
14 about critical issues with the administration, my
15 concern is with the ability and the nimbleness..
16 [cross-talk]

17 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...of the
19 administration to hear and to act on the very
20 important work that you're doing and at a time when
21 women are under attack, when minorities are under
22 attack by the federal government, my hope would be
23 that the... this administration would be hungry for any
24 opportunity to prove that New York City is the leader
25 in these areas and I, I say this out of frustration

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 about the special victims division where, you know
3 the administration was gifted the opportunity to have
4 a world class special victims division and, and be
5 very proud about that work, there was a real
6 opportunity there that was missed. I, I am baffled by
7 it so it's, it's very much... again I think the
8 administration is very lucky to have you. I'm going
9 to go on to the sex health education task force and
10 am just wondering if you could talk a little bit
11 about the outcomes of the task force, the findings
12 and, and the action plans?

13 JACQUELINE EBANKS: The, the task force
14 released its report in, in July and we are now
15 looking at our second phase. I want to say portions
16 of our recommendations were, were included in the 24
17 million health and works initiative... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yep... [cross-talk]

19 JACQUELINE EBANKS: ...and the... we are
20 about to reconvene the sexual health education task
21 force to look at those portions that were not..
22 [cross-talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay... [cross-
24 talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

JACQUELINE EBANKS: ...we are in discussion with DOE and they are strong partners in this work and actually serve as vice chair for the task force as well. So, beginning in the spring we will reconvene the task force to look at next steps. As you know the task force has a five year last... lifespan so four more years are remaining on this work.

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay, let's see... Council Member do you have any additional questions? Well again I just want to reiterate that the administration has made a great choice in having you be its Executive Director and I know that you're going to lead them in helping them find their way to address the issues of 51 percent of the population in, in particular women of color who as I say, you know when we talk about the special victims division and economic empowerment which primarily affects women of color, so far we, we, we have not been impressed so I look forward to continuing our work together and I thank you for your public service.

JACQUELINE EBANKS: Thank you so much. I just want to say that we at the Commission of the staff appreciate your partnership, we appreciate and

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 value your leadership and that of Commission... City
3 Council Member Ayala, we take these words as
4 motivation to really reengage and to do a job
5 deserving of the, the public and New Yorkers, thank
6 you so much.

7 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Thank you. I'm
8 going to call up the next panel, thank you again for
9 your time. This panel of experts are international
10 and CEDAW focused experts, Mary Luke from UN Women
11 Metro New York; Sheila Katzman for... from New York
12 City for CEDAW and also Howard Katzman from New York
13 City for CEDAW, thank you. Thank you... Mary, yeah
14 please start. Mary hang on one second, can you make
15 sure the red light is on?

16 MARY LUKE: Okay, is it on now?

17 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Oh, yeah, there
18 you go...

19 MARY LUKE: Sorry. Anyhow, thank you very
20 much for having us here at this oversight hearing. We
21 really appreciate this opportunity to really speak
22 about the progress of CGE as well as some of the
23 pending challenges. I'm the Executive Director... no,
24 I'm the President of the Metro New York Chapter of
25 the US National Committee for UN Women and as a

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 partner and a member of the steering committee of New
3 York City For CEDAW Act I want to recognize the
4 achievements of CGE thus far and especially some of
5 the achievements that were already stated about the
6 gender equity liaisons, the, the fact that they
7 published the leveling the play... the paying field to
8 draw attention to the best practices of gender pay
9 equity, leadership on the sex education, education
10 task force. So, all of these are really commendable,
11 and we are especially proud of the... your efforts
12 towards the 16 days of activism which is just about
13 to start but which the CGE has really demonstrated
14 leadership for over six months in gaining the
15 attention and support of communities. So, today's
16 presentation I really wanted to focus on CEDAW, the
17 Convention on the Elimination of all forms of
18 Discrimination Against Women. Our goal is the same as
19 CGEs which is to ensure that women especially
20 marginalized women will have access to gender
21 sensitive policies, programs and services based on
22 human rights principles. We recommend that New York
23 City with the leadership of CGE incorporates CEDAW as
24 a human rights framework to prevent discrimination
25 and ensure equal rights and opportunities for all

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 women. CEDAW will help CGE achieve its strategic
3 goals of economic empowerment, health and
4 reproductive justice and safety for all and that is
5 through access and participation, through money and
6 through power. The participation of women, LGBTQ,
7 transgender, gender non-conforming, cisgender people
8 as required in the planning and evaluation of all
9 programs and policies and the importance of sex and
10 race disaggregated data has already been mentioned
11 but its critical to understand the, the population
12 that we're trying to serve especially marginalized
13 populations. It's so important to have the civic
14 engagements through a participatory gender budgeting
15 process. Again, money is important, money and how
16 money is being spent and CEDAW framework would help
17 to ensure and review how money is allocated to all
18 these marginalized populations and I think the third
19 point is about power. Women must have power and equal
20 access to and representation in all levels of
21 management as well as on boards and commissions and
22 in that way, women will be at the table and will be
23 able to ensure that these policies and programs meet
24 their needs. So, as the Mayor has stated on the
25 release of a report to the UN on social goals, New,

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2

New York is on track to become one of the more

3

equitable, healthier and safer cities in the world.

4

By having CEDAW formally as a fundamental framework,

5

New York our international city and home to the

6

United Nations will establish itself as a premiere

7

city in the United States, which affirms that gender

8

discrimination holds no place in New York City. Thank

9

you very much.

10

SHEILA KATZMAN: Hello if its morning

11

still, good morning everyone. My name is Sheila

12

Katzman and I'm the President of the International

13

Association for Woman in Radio and Television, USA

14

and Chair for New York City for CEDAW Act. I want to

15

thank you the Committee on Women for inviting New

16

York City CEDAW team here to participate in this

17

important hearing of the oversight of the New York

18

City Commission on Gender Equity. I ditto all the

19

accolades that Mary already put up on this, this

20

Commission. I happy to read in the report published

21

for this hearing of the tremendous amount of action

22

taking place around gender equity... gender equity in

23

this city. So much has been achieved and we want to

24

really say how appreciative we are of the Committee

25

and of the CGE. I read with great interest a synopsis

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 of the CGE 2018-21 strategic plan of September 2018.
3 The three areas I liked highlighted from the guiding
4 principles which includes the recognition of
5 diversity of gender, ensuring the development and
6 implementation of best practices, etcetera. I'm
7 quoting from the, the report put out on the... on the...
8 for this... for this hearing. Also, the intersection of
9 race is critical because women of color may not have
10 the same experiences as white women which means this
11 has to be worked out as CGE works to define gender.
12 And, and I just want to add that we just need to know
13 how CGE intends to operationalize gender given the
14 fluidity of gender. CEDAW offers a human rights
15 framework to institute, institutionalize new ways of
16 thinking across city government about equitable
17 distribution of government resources, taking into
18 account how gender identifies and if... gender
19 identities and expressions intersect with identities
20 such as race, disability, immigration status, sexual
21 orientation and age. In our view, every city agency
22 should have the capabilities to report disaggregated
23 data about these findings. This proposal envisions
24 extending permanent positions to exceed the current
25 one-year commitment for gender equity liaisons in

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 city agencies that will be accountable for targeted
3 and ongoing gender analyses and associated efforts.
4 On the matter of gender equity liaisons also and
5 their responsibility to develop a definition for
6 gender equity, developing goals and indicators of
7 measuring gender equity in defining, collecting and
8 analyzing, etcetera. I would like to recommend they
9 look to CEDAW articles and the general
10 recommendations in the SDGs, the sustainable
11 development goals and for the first time in the
12 history of the city, all city departments are coming
13 together with a common goal for a city of gender
14 equity. I would like to recommend that the Commission
15 refers to the exceptional work being done in the
16 global vision/urban department in the Mayor's Office
17 on the SDGs that was shared at the German Mission to
18 the United Nations recently. CEDAW is an
19 international human rights treaty that represents an
20 international consensus on what constitutes
21 discrimination against women. It was relevant when it
22 was adopted at the UN in 1979 and is even more
23 relevant today with its numerous general
24 recommendations keeping up with the times and the
25 fluidity of gender. While the United States assigned

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 the CEDAW treaty, it has not ratified it, making the
3 US the only democracy not to do so. The first 17
4 articles of CEDAW, its attached for your benefit,
5 form a framework or gender lens through which
6 government actions can be viewed. This initiative
7 represents a belief in public participation as a
8 vehicle for change. All analyses, whether it be
9 gender or legal, must be available for public
10 scrutiny, input, and feedback. Some of the questions
11 I heard thrown at our Executive Director and, and I,
12 I must say that I appreciate the responses. There are
13 many activities of the government of which members of
14 the public especially program recipients, have a
15 unique perspective. There is also much expertise in
16 the community to independently identify both problems
17 and solutions. Implementation was mentioned twice on
18 page six and nine of what was put out on legislature,
19 is that what it's called? What, what... yeah, yeah,
20 yeah legister [phonetic], yeah. And that was very
21 welcoming to see the word implementation because you
22 don't often see that. Funds and resources will be
23 needed to staff the implementing commission and
24 training for agency staff to understand using a
25 gender lens and a human rights framework in assessing

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 agency's programs, budgets and employment practices,
3 report writing and publication. The rest of this
4 about my organization and, and what it is. We are a...
5 do I have time? Yeah, okay. So, first of all I want
6 to... I want to borrow the quote from the First Lady
7 cited in this committee's report of the meet... this
8 meeting, we... quote, "we will accept nothing less than
9 the full inclusion of women and girls of all
10 ethnicities in our city; economically, socially, and
11 politically". CEDAW has a very wide ambit which
12 includes guiding principles of basic fundamental
13 rights of economic, social, political, cultural and
14 civic. My organization, International Association for
15 Women in Radio and Television-USA is a chapter of the
16 IAWRT global organization formed by professional
17 women working in electronic and, and allied media
18 with a mission to strengthen initiatives towards
19 ensuring women's views and values are an integral
20 part of programming and to advance the impact of
21 women in media. We organize conferences, implement
22 projects, undertake activities and collaborate with
23 media organizations. It is a non-governmental
24 organization, in consultative status with the United
25 Nations Economic and Social Council and is accredited

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 to the UN Department of Public Information. IAWRT-USA
3 is a 501© 3 charitable organization that is managed
4 by a board, which oversees funding initiatives for
5 member activities. Our vision is to provide
6 opportunities, share strategies and contribute to the
7 development of women in broadcasting by sharing
8 professional and technical knowledge, in order to
9 advance the impact of women in media and the rights
10 of women in general. I thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Thank you, thank
12 you very much.

13 HOWARD KATZMAN: He, him... oh... He, him,
14 his. Chair Rosenthal, Council Member Ayala. I welcome
15 the opportunity to testify to the Committee on Women
16 on the oversight of the Commission of Gender Equity.
17 My name is Howard Katzman and I represent New York
18 City for CEDAW Act, a coalition of over 300 community
19 organizations advocating for an initiative to
20 incorporate a women's Bill of Rights into New York
21 City law. I have been a... been a member of the
22 steering committee since 2014 and am responsible for
23 policy and strategy. Nationwide we're part of an
24 organization Cities for CEDAW which is advocating
25 round the nation. We've been working with the

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 Commission on Gender Equity since its formation in
3 2015 under the previous Executive Director and now
4 with her successor. We believe the Commission on
5 Gender Equity is an important component of our
6 strategy for New York City woman's Bill of Rights.
7 The briefing paper for this hearing does a great
8 service in outlining the history and attempts at
9 achieving equity for women and girls of New York
10 City. A women's commission has been a part of New
11 York City government since 1975. The present
12 administration has broadened the mandate to
13 incorporate our greater recognition that gender is
14 not just a binary and expanding women and girls to
15 women, girls, transgender, and intersex residents. We
16 also applaud the recognition of... that other forms of
17 discrimination layer upon gender discrimination as
18 intersectionality. In my presentation, there are
19 three areas I would like to pursue. The first is
20 defining a framework for a gender-based analysis of
21 city agencies, second highlighting a procedure to
22 facilitate analysis of agencies and third involving
23 the... engaging the public for more complete gender
24 analysis. According to the briefing paper, the CGE,
25 working with the Gender Equity Liaisons, GEL, are

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 tasked with defining and developing a gender equity
3 framework in the work of city agencies. We advocate
4 for basing the framework on the convention of the
5 elimination of all forms of discrimination against
6 women or CEDAW, the only human rights instrument that
7 focuses on... the only international, international
8 human rights instrument that focuses on women and in
9 being drafted by... and in being ratified by 189
10 countries, represent an international consensus on
11 the definition of gender equity. We recommend using
12 the articles and general recommendation... and general
13 recommendations of CEDAW to develop a framework for a
14 gender analysis of city agencies which is included in
15 colleagues' papers. This framework would help
16 accomplish the three major tasks listed in the
17 briefing; one, developing a definition of gender
18 equity; two, developing a set of goals and indicators
19 for measurement and three, gathering and analyzing
20 the data. Doing a gender analysis would be too
21 complicated for a centralized body not based within
22 the city agencies. Instead, each agency could become
23 responsible for their own gender analysis. They would
24 use the ensuing framework and include the analysis
25 when performing other project assessments. GELs would

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 be trained to oversee the process, assisting their
3 agencies in carrying out analysis. The public is
4 important and should not be overlooked but be
5 involved in the process. Oftentimes, the perceptions
6 of implementors of programs differ from those of
7 recipients. The public will be able to point out any
8 missing issues from the reports. To this end, we are
9 advocating that the yearly reports being made to the
10 public... be made available to the public. the report
11 could be available on the web. Community
12 organizations can use it as outreach to their
13 clients. Agencies could also distribute their section
14 of the report to their clients and their workers.
15 Responses from the public could be submitted to the
16 CGE. We are grateful for the attention the New York
17 City for CEDAW Act initiative has received from
18 Council Members, particularly the Chair of the
19 Committee on Women and the Commission on Gender
20 Equity, particularly the Executive Director. We look
21 forward to an ongoing relationship, thank you for
22 this opportunity to submit our ideas.

23 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay, we're going
24 to take all of your ideas. That was... no, no, no quick
25 question. Thank you very much for your testimony, we

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 really learned quite a bit and we've been whispering
3 about a couple of them in particular so thank you for
4 your thoughtful testimony. I'm wondering in
5 particular about the city's... the Mayor's Office on
6 International Relations and I'm wondering if you've
7 met with them, whether or not they've committed to
8 the SDGs...

9 MARY LUKE: You can answer, yeah...

10 SHEILA KATZMAN: Yeah. Thank you for the
11 question. At the initial state being set up of the
12 New York City 4 CEDAW initiative we were invited to
13 brief the, the Mayor's Senior staff, leader staff and
14 the Commissioners, head of departments on, on CEDAW
15 was and what it was about at that time, we were
16 instrumental actually in getting the First Lady to UN
17 Women in of us having the safe city agreement signed
18 and all of that and the rest is history of what's
19 going on. Yes, the international affairs sector and
20 us we did a lot of work with them initially and I, I
21 think right now the SDGs is something that the
22 Mayor's Office has taken on. I referred to and I
23 think it's Miss Hiniker of the... of that department of
24 global vision/urban department, Jackie may know...
25 about that more than I do gave an astounding

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2 presentation at the... at the German Mission three
3 weeks ago at one of our events and I was amazed at
4 how she clustered the, the, the SDGs across city
5 departments and across the things... [cross-talk]

6 HOWARD KATZMAN: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

7 SHEILA KATZMAN: ...that are happening so
8 yes, because every country, every... its unlike CEDAW,
9 every country has signed onto, to the SDGs so this is
10 very important. Did I answer your question?

11 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Well... [cross-
12 talk]

13 SHEILA KATZMAN: Jackie... [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Sure, come on
15 back, is that alright? Yeah.

16 JACQUELINE EBANKS: I'd like to add that
17 the Mayor's Office of International Affairs led by
18 Commissioner Penny Abeywardena is the first... made New
19 York City the first city to submit a local voluntary
20 review within the SDGs... [cross-talk]

21 SHEILA KATZMAN: Right... [cross-talk]

22 JACQUELINE EBANKS: ...so I think they're
23 doing a phenomenal job and they are a critical
24 partner with us CGE in connecting us to the
25 international space.

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Great, thank you.

SHEILA KATZMAN: Yeah... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Very helpful.

SHEILA KATZMAN: Forget about that but this is... this is just really great what's happening in the city at this time, I'm so elated, really elated.

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: And... great, we look forward to following up with you, thank you all for your time, really appreciate you... [cross-talk]

SHEILA KATZMAN: Thank you.

MARY LUKE: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: I'm going to call up the last panel. Oh, sure... so, we're going to hear from Cidra Sebastien from the Brotherhood Sister Sol and Crystal, Crystal Jennings Rogers from the New York State Nurses Association and also Elizabeth Cohen if she could come up.

[off mic dialogue]

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yeah and welcome back to both of you. Cidra do you want to start?

CIDRA SEBASTIEN: Well thank you.

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Beautiful.

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 CIDRA SEBASTIEN: Good morning. Thank you
3 for holding this morning's hearing and so I'm glad to
4 be here to speak on behalf of the Brotherhood/Sister
5 Sol. My name is Cidra Sebastien, the pronouns I use
6 are she, her and hers. We're a youth organization
7 based in Harlem, New York that works with young
8 people of all genders throughout New York City. As
9 the Commissioner on Gender Equity is an advisory
10 board that supports city agencies in dismantling
11 institutional barriers for women and girls and New
12 Yorkers of all gender identities and expressions, its
13 aligned with the recommendations that have come out
14 of the Young Women's Initiative which was already
15 spoken about earlier today but also the youth
16 organizing efforts at The Brotherhood/Sister Sol. For
17 20 years, Bro/Sis has provided long term investment
18 in girls and young women in Harlem and throughout the
19 city. Our work with YWI was an opportunity to deepen
20 that work on a city level and also create an
21 opportunity for our youth members to have a direct
22 impact in city engagement to ensure that girls are
23 heard and centered in policy and funding decisions.
24 There were many key recommendations including some of
25 the ones that we heard of today such as appointing

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 gender equity liaisons to ensure that LGBTQ and trans
3 and gender non-conforming inclusion at agencies were
4 consistently keeping girls and young women and gender
5 non-conforming youth at the center of policies coming
6 out of the city. There were also several
7 recommendations related to cultural relevant and
8 gender affirming curricula as well as school climate
9 and the school climate piece is what has specifically
10 brought me here today. As we know from research by
11 folks such as Dr. Monique Morris and the African
12 American Policy Forum, black and Latino girls are
13 more disproportionately disciplined, including
14 suspensions and arrests, than other groups of girls
15 in schools. We also know that from Manhattan Borough
16 President Gale Brewer's 2017 report entitled Who's
17 Caring, where she looks at mental health care in New
18 York City public schools that it points... all the
19 information points to better outcomes for students
20 and teachers when there is greater access to mental
21 health care providers on site. And yet with this
22 information in Manhattan alone for school year 2016,
23 there were approximately 177,000 students with only
24 221 school based social workers in just 164 schools.
25 That breaks down to roughly one social workers for

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 every 800 students, that's a huge issue and this is
3 an issue that young people of our organization are
4 addressing specifically our young women for our, our
5 liberation program for youth activist and organizers
6 who have personal accounts of what happens to them in
7 schools when there are more security officers and
8 NYPD than there are guidance counselors and
9 therapists. They have shared their stories in many
10 spaces including most recently at NYCLU's Museum of
11 Broken Windows in September of this year. For this
12 reason, our youth members have launched an organizing
13 campaign seeking the following demands to be... to take
14 place by 2020. An increase by 20 percent or more of
15 student support staff including guidance counselors,
16 therapists, social workers, college and career
17 advisors; appropriate increase to New York City
18 public school budgets specifically for these
19 positions and a freeze on hiring additional school
20 safety agencies... agents basically security officers
21 trained by NYPD or NYPD themselves. We believe that
22 brining these demands to fruition will greatly
23 improve school climate and the total wellness of
24 girls as well as all students of New York City public
25 schools and we want to make sure that the New York

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 City's City Council Committee on Women as well as the
3 Commission is aware of the young people's work in
4 this youth led campaign. Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Thank you very
6 much and thanks for your participation in all of
7 these groups.

8 CIDRA SEBASTIEN: Thank you.

9 ELIZABETH COHEN: Thank you. The two
10 largest groups of people living in poverty in this
11 city are families headed by single parents... [cross-
12 talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Oh, sorry, could
14 you just say your name for the record... [cross-talk]

15 ELIZABETH COHEN: I'm sorry. Certainly,
16 Elizabeth Cohen, I'm a member of Voices of Women, of
17 VOW. The two largest groups of people living in
18 poverty in this city are families headed by single
19 parents followed by older women living alone. The
20 impact of this is felt by society at large. Single
21 women head the majority of households, they raise and
22 support children and in many cases care for their
23 aging parents. When women are not treated equitably
24 their families suffer as well and society is deprived
25 of their contributions. Yet as a woman, as a member

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 of this group, my cultural training is to consider
3 the needs of others first and put them ahead of my
4 own needs. While I am glad the Commission has
5 broadened the scope to be more inclusive, I feel it
6 is important to make conscious this largely unspoken
7 assumption and not lose sight of the fact that women
8 comprise the two... the largest two groups impacted by
9 inequitable treatment. As Abigail Adams wrote to her
10 husband, John 150 years before women got the right to
11 vote quote, "I long to hear that you have declared an
12 independency and that by the way in the code of laws
13 which I suppose it will be necessary for you to make,
14 I desire you remember the ladies and be more generous
15 and favorable to them than your ancestors, do not put
16 such unlimited power in the hands of the husbands,
17 remember all men would be tyrants if they could. If
18 particular care and attention is not paid to the
19 ladies, we are determined to foment a rebellion and
20 will not hold ourselves bound by any laws in which we
21 have no voice or representation." The work of women
22 is largely taken for granted and devalued. There is
23 still the largely unspoken idea that a woman who is
24 taking care of her children does not have a job and
25 is not engaged in meaningful. Nowhere is this more

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 apparent than in the way social security treats
3 divorced women in terms of retirements benefits and
4 helps ensure that older divorced women who have been
5 married for at least ten years and probably worked as
6 caregivers of their children get significantly less
7 than their husbands and likely help explain why the
8 second largest group living in poverty is older
9 women. In effect women who have worked at a wage
10 paying job and then worked at a non-wage paying job
11 of caring for children are penalized for it and worse
12 off, especially in light of the fact that women earn
13 less than men do on the dollar. Keep in mind that
14 women as a group hold lower paying jobs than men and
15 may not be able to afford to continue to work for pay
16 because they cannot afford childcare. The social
17 security website says the following: if your ex-
18 spouse is eligible for retirement benefits on their
19 own record, we will pay that amount first. If the
20 benefit to you on your record is higher, they will
21 get an additional amount on your record so that the
22 combination of benefits equals that higher amount. It
23 is important to recognize that the additional amount
24 on your record refers only to the years during which
25 the couple was married. The husband gets the benefit

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 of the wife's free child care and 100 percent of his
3 earnings for the entire work history. The end result
4 is older women who are poor. This is not the only way
5 in which collaterally women are hurt by their
6 invisibility and unspoken role as selfless
7 supporters. Women who are mothers fall through the
8 cracks in programs like the Senior Citizen Rent
9 Increase Exemption or SCRIE program and again in the
10 Disability Rent Increase Exemption or DRIE program.
11 Divorced and single women who are heads of household
12 earn less than men and struggle to house and feed
13 themselves and their children but are not eligible to
14 apply for the SCRIE program until they are 62 years
15 old although they may qualify financially for it. It
16 would be beneficial to many women to lower the age
17 requirement for eligibility substantially and would
18 help them stay housed and make ends meet. Please keep
19 in mind that women younger than 62 who are heads of
20 household may be shouldering the burden of putting
21 their children through school. The DRIE program also
22 only benefits households where the primary tenant is
23 disabled but not families which include a disabled
24 child as many women headed households do. The
25 eligibility for this program should include families

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 that have a disabled member in them. There is also a
3 need to provide training opportunities for women who
4 are middle aged and programs providing entry into
5 good paying jobs. When women who have been single
6 heads of household have raised their children, they
7 become older women who need to provide for
8 themselves. They are older and having given to others
9 their skills and training need to be brought current
10 to be able to find a job that pays well enough for
11 them to live. Women who are middle aged are often
12 pressed with the needs of others and yet limited as
13 to the opportunities for themselves employers often
14 do not recognize that their life experience brings
15 added value to their work. Colleges and training
16 programs often see older women as a waste of their
17 time because they have less time left to practice in
18 the field. The reality is that middle aged women have
19 made some amazing contributions to society. We are
20 old but not senior citizens and we need support to
21 help us and our families survive economically and
22 credit for the unpaid work we do. These are just a
23 few examples of the ways in which programs designed
24 to help unconsciously utilize criteria that make
25 women who are heads of households and older middle-

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 aged women ineligible for assistance, marginalizes
3 them and puts them in poverty.

4 JUDITH CUTCHIN: Good morning, my name is
5 Crystal Jennings Rogers, I'm going to be reading the
6 testimony of Judith Cutchin, New York State Nurses
7 Association, President of Health and Hospitals
8 Executive Council and Mayorals. The New York State
9 Nurses Association represents over 42,000 nurses
10 working in the state of New York working in the state
11 of New York. We'd like to thank the Committee and
12 Commission for taking time to hear testimony this
13 morning. New York State nurses support the Convention
14 on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women
15 also known as New York City 4 CEDAW. CEDAW is an
16 international treaty that defines various types of
17 discrimination against girls and women and
18 establishes guidelines governments can follow to end
19 this discrimination. To date, 189 countries have
20 ratified CEDAW, while 99 have signed. US
21 representatives at the UN have only signed CEDAW and
22 the treaty has no binding effect on US laws and
23 policies. Cities for CEDAW is attempting to propel
24 CEDAW compliance nationwide at the local levels. So
25 far, nine cities have adopted the CEDAW framework and

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 over 25 cities have passed resolutions leading to
3 full ordinance. CEDAW's core objective is to propel
4 governments to eliminate all forms of discrimination
5 against all women and girls in New York City. New
6 York City 4 CEDAW proposes investigating city
7 agencies to identify city laws and policies where
8 discrimination against girls and women can be found,
9 work with the public and government to perform
10 community need assessments and to create a plan of
11 implementations and accountability to improve
12 practices. Article one defines discrimination against
13 women as any distinction, exclusion or restriction
14 made on the basis of sex which has the effect or
15 purpose of impairing or nullifying the recognition,
16 recognition, enjoyment or exercise by women,
17 irrespective of marital status on the basis of
18 equality between men and women, of human rights or
19 fundamental freedom in the political, economic,
20 social, cultural, civil or any other field. Article
21 five recognizes the role of culture and tradition and
22 calls for the elimination of sex role stereotyping.
23 Article 11 mandates the end of discrimination in the
24 field of employment. Article 12 requires steps to
25 eliminate discrimination from the field of health

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 care, including access to family planning, these
3 services must be free of charge. We believe
4 implementing the CEDAW framework we can improve
5 individual and population health while advancing
6 health equity. Including the New York City 4 CEDAW
7 framework in the city's charter is the best way for
8 New York City to demonstrate their commitment to
9 eliminating discrimination against girls and women,
10 adding transparency and compliance to existing
11 nondiscrimination laws and helps New York take active
12 steps toward preventing discrimination. Thank you to
13 the Committee and Commission for considering this
14 proposal and incorporating a human rights framework
15 in New York City's charter guided by the principles
16 of New York City 4 CEDAW. New York City can and
17 should lead the country in declaring the end of
18 discrimination against women and girls.

19 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Well I want to
20 thank you all for this very smart testimony. I have
21 one quick follow up question although... hang on...
22 Elizabeth I just want to say that I'm looking for a
23 T-shirt that has Abigail Adam's quote on it, that is
24 wonderful. I'm, I'm not saying that I'm looking for a
25 T-shirt, I mean I will find myself a T-shirt to be

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 very clear about that, but you know really gives,
3 gives your, your testimony is so thoughtful in that
4 it gives us the historic perspective that women are,
5 are facing. So, I appreciate that. Cidra I just noted
6 that you were on the young women's initiative and a
7 member of the task force and it is fantastic that
8 we've moved forward with the gender equity liaisons.
9 If you were looking down the list of sorts of the
10 next priority what would it be in your minds eye and
11 we can follow up on this off... [cross-talk]

12 CIDRA SEBASTIEN: The next priority...
13 [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: ...after the
15 hearing... [cross-talk]

16 CIDRA SEBASTIEN: ...for... to... as far as
17 recommendations from YWI... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yeah.

19 CIDRA SEBASTIEN: I think the next major
20 set of priorities to take a look at from YWI have to
21 do around education as well as kind of the post-
22 secondary opportunities for girls and young women and
23 I'm saying girls and young women as a really bad
24 shorthand for cisgender and transgender girls as
25 well...

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yep..

CIDRA SEBASTIEN: And so, a lot of the recommendations that came out of the education for example didn't just address school climate but also addressed curricula so what are ways in which we're presenting curricula to young people and not just in a girl specific class but across DOE curricula, across the grades K through 12 that is culturally relevant in gender affirming. I think some folks have wrapped their minds around the culturally relevant part, there's definitely work to do in that area but not necessarily the gender affirming piece and so I think that will be a next set of priorities and.. also in the education space around the training that is done for educators and faculty in schools to address issues that come up with girls and gender non-conforming youth specifically. As far as issues that come up around not meeting the mark with Title IX around dress codes that are often used as a way to have kind of anti-sexual harassment policies but it's not an anti-sexual harassment policy, it's about penalizing young people because of their dress code and that's not a way to, to, to diminish bullying or to address harassment that takes place in schools.

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 So, ones that really get to that issue. And then I
3 think the other piece around post-secondary supports
4 for young people kind of speaks to what you were
5 talking about, right, so if we want to make sure that
6 when young people become adults they have all that
7 that they need to be productive in the city, we need
8 to make sure that that's matching the education that
9 they're getting in public schools as well as the
10 opportunities that's leading out. So, in addition to
11 improvements to SYEP I would also say that there
12 needs to be improvements for opportunities for young
13 adults between like 18 to 24 to continue to receive
14 supports around developing unique skills so that they
15 can be ready for the workforce and really be engaged
16 in whatever career that they choose whether that's
17 starting their own business or joining an established
18 company so for me those two things would be
19 immediate... [cross-talk]

20 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Uh-huh... [cross-
21 talk]

22 CIDRA SEBASTIEN: ...priorities around
23 education and then post-secondary opportunities for
24 young people.

25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: What would be the
measures of success?

4

5

6

CIDRA SEBASTIEN: I think before we get
to that there's a lot of data that folks don't have
access to... [cross-talk]

7

8

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Uh-huh... [cross-
talk]

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

CIDRA SEBASTIEN: ...to even get a full
picture of what's happening now so there's not data
that you can easily pull out. For example, of the
experiences of young people who are young people of
color who identify as trans or gender non-conforming
in schools, there's no data that you can pull out
from that, right, they're either lumped together or
not included at all... [cross-talk]

17

18

19

20

21

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yep... [cross-talk]

CIDRA SEBASTIEN: There's not a whole lot
of clear data that really looks at the breakdown, a
disciplinary hearing or disciplinary actions... [cross-
talk]

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Yep... [cross-talk]

CIDRA SEBASTIEN: There's not a whole lot
of data that you can clearly pull out around young
people who have different immigration status so

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2 that's another area where we will want to be able to
3 pull out that data first before then drawing the line
4 to like a measure of success but I think some of the
5 key measures of success wouldn't just include
6 graduation rates but it would also include access
7 that young people have to basically go into a city
8 college and not have to take remedial classes..

9 [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Uh-huh... [cross-
11 talk]

12 CIDRA SEBASTIEN: ...being able to get jobs
13 out of graduation whether that's with an associate or
14 a... degrees, a way to track that information I think
15 could be some measures of success.

16 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Uh-huh, that's
17 very helpful. I was smiling with the Commissioner
18 while you were talking because I know she's working
19 on exactly that type of data collection and just..
20 you're on the right track clearly. Does anyone else
21 want to add to the notion of what would the measures
22 of success be or, or data indicators we should be
23 looking at? And you can also contact the Committee
24 afterwards and that goes for everyone whose testify,
25 testified today if there are other things we should

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

be looking at or other measures of success that would be very helpful. So, thank you all. I actually have one last person who's come in who I'd like to hear from, from the Black Women's Blueprint, Sharaya, oh there you are. Hi, Sharaya Tindal Wiesendanger, Wiesendanger.

SHARAYA TINDAL WIESENDANGER: Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Thank you.

SHARAYA TINDAL WIESENDANGER: Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Thank you for coming today and coming to testify...

SHARAYA TINDAL WIESENDANGER: Sure...

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: I'm getting a feeling looking at your phone that you don't have written testimony.

SHARAYA TINDAL WIESENDANGER: I do have written testimony but... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: We'll use... on your phone.

SHARAYA TINDAL WIESENDANGER: Yeah, right...

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: So, will you please send it in after this hearing and... so we can have it be part of the transcript?

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SHARAYA TINDAL WIESENDANGER: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Great, thank you.

SHARAYA TINDAL WIESENDANGER: Definitely.

So, I'm here representing Black Women's Blueprint or
BWB and we're here because... I'm here because the
organization was... thought that it was really
important for our voices to be heard and particularly
our members voices. The... their own testimonies on
their own... on their own experiences, traumatic
experiences with gender-based violence. I have a
myriad of testimonies and I will read just one of
those. I was sexually molested by my biological
father for years during family sleepovers and other
vulnerable times such as luring me to play video
games with him, he would expose my bottom and rub his
penis against me until he ejaculated. This continued
in secret until my parents divorced when I was 11.
His final attempt happened when I was 12 but by then
I understood what he was doing and kicked him away
from me, he never tried again and to this day he
denies his actions. I finally told my mother when I
was 20 years old. So, just on behalf of BWB members
and staff, we feel it's really important really to
echo all the sentiments that were said today about

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1
2 the importance of CEDAW and the initiatives that the
3 city will take on to support survivors and to ensure
4 that women, women's stories end here that there are
5 no more testimonies to be given in this way. Thank
6 you.

7 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Wait, whoa come
8 back... [cross-talk]

9 SHARAYA TINDAL WIESENDANGER: Oh, yeah
10 okay...

11 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: That was so
12 powerful, I'm just speechless. Thank you for coming
13 and testifying. I agree with you 100 percent, I mean
14 I share your goal. My goal is to shut down the work
15 of this Committee so that in the next City Council
16 there is no Committee on Women because men's behavior
17 has changed. I, I'd like to follow up with you about
18 your testimony because what I'd ask you to think
19 about is of course we have our work with survivors
20 but also how do we get at prevention in the case that
21 you just mentioned, how do we get at educating young
22 girls as early as pre-K and K about what they could
23 notice happening and, and their... the importance of
24 reporting and the importance of acknowledging knowing
25 that it really... there... that something violent is

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

1

2 happening to them that has nothing to do with them as
3 a person and yet, you know it changes people?

4 SHARAYA TINDAL WIESENDANGER: Definitely,
5 I think the best person at BWB to meet with is Farah
6 Tanis she's our ED.. [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: Okay.. [cross-
8 talk]

9 SHARAYA TINDAL WIESENDANGER: ...or Sevonna
10 Brown who's our Associate ED. I just started like the
11 first so I'm probably not the best person to discuss
12 that with, but they are well versed, they've been
13 doing this work since 2008. This is very personal
14 work for, for them and so they're good at what they
15 do, and they are the experts on, on this.

16 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: And they clearly
17 had good decision-making skills in hiring you.

18 SHARAYA TINDAL WIESENDANGER: Well thank
19 you.

20 CHAIRPERSON ROSENTHAL: So, thank you so
21 much and with that I'm going to call the hearing to a
22 close.

23 [gavel]

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

November 30, 2018