CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

STATED MEETING

----X

April 2, 2009 Start: 2:25 pm Recess: 3:37 pm

HELD AT: Council Chambers

City Hall

B E F O R E: CHRISTINE C. QUINN

SPEAKER

### COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Council Member Maria del Carmen Arroyo

Council Member Tony Avella
Council Member Maria Baez

Council Member Charles Barron

Council Member Gale A. Brewer

Council Member Leroy G. Comrie, Jr.

Council Member Elizabeth Crowley

Council Member Bill de Blasio

Council Member Inez E. Dickens

Council Member Erik Martin Dilan

Council Member Mathieu Eugene

Council Member Simcha Felder

Council Member Julissa Ferreras

Council Member Lewis A. Fidler

Council Member Helen D. Foster

Council Member Daniel R. Garodnick

Council Member James F. Gennaro

Council Member Alan J. Gerson

#### APPEARANCES

#### COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Council Member Eric N. Gioia Council Member Vincent Ignizio Council Member Robert Jackson Council Member Letitia James Council Member Melina R. Katz Council Member G. Oliver Koppell Council Member John C. Liu Council Member Melissa Mark-Viverito Council Member Miguel Martinez Council Member Darlene Mealy Council Member Rosie Mendez Council Member Kenneth Mitchell Council Member Michael C. Nelson Council Member James S. Oddo Council Member Annabel Palma Council Member Domenic M. Recchia, Jr. Council Member Diana Reyna Council Member Joel Rivera Council Member James Sanders, Jr. Council Member Larry B. Seabrook Council Member Helen Sears Council Member Kendall Stewart Council Member Eric Ulrich Council Member James Vacca Council Member Peter F. Vallone, Jr. Council Member Albert Vann Council Member David I. Weprin Council Member Thomas White, Jr. Council Member David Yassky

## A P P E A R A N C E S [CONTINUED]

Christine C. Quinn Speaker

Sophomore Class Brooklyn Generation School

Reverend Charles Lewis Invocation

Alix Pustilnik Governmental Affairs Division

Adira Siman Human Services Division

Julene Beckford Counsel Governmental Affairs Division

Jim Caras
Office of the General Counsel

Damien Butvick Counsel Governmental Affairs Division

Danielle Castaldi-Micca, Community Outreach

Lyle Frank Committee Counsel Infrastructure Division

Patrick Mulvihill
Infrastructure Division

Nicole Ramsey
Infrastructure Division

Danielle Avetto Council Staff

# A P P E A R A N C E S [CONTINUED]

Phillip Hom Committee Counsel

All Council Staff not otherwise mentioned

Elizabeth Crowley Council Member

Charles Barron Council Member

Joyce Simmons Chief of Staff Council Member Barron

Monique Washington Councilmatic Aide Council Member Barron

Viola Plummer Chief of Staff Assemblywoman Inez Barron

Man Up, Inc. Developer of Gateway Estates II

Robert Jackson Council Member

Miguel Martinez Council Member

Family of Alex Felix

Melissa Mark-Viverito Council Member

Inez Dickens Council Member

Daniel R. Garodnick Council Member

# A P P E A R A N C E S [CONTINUED]

Reverend Doctor Johnny Ray Youngblood Supporter of Gateway Estates II

Reverend Brawley Supporter of Gateway Estates II

Sarah Brannon Policy Unit Council Staff Helen D. Foster Council Member

Robert Jackson Council Member

Darlene Mealy Council Member

Gale A. Brewer Council Member

Erik Martin Dilan Council Member

Inez E. Dickens Council Member

1	STATED MEETING 6
2	SPEAKER QUINN: Before we start,
3	I'd like to recognize the Brooklyn Generation
4	School, Public School from Brooklyn
5	[Applause]
6	SPEAKER QUINN:in the balcony,
7	sophomores, hi. All rise please.
8	SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.
9	SPEAKER QUINN AND AUDIENCE: I
10	pledge allegiance of the United States of America
11	and to the Republic, for which it stands, one
12	Nation, under God, with liberty and justice for
13	all. Thank you. Roll call.
14	COMMITTEE CLERK: Arroyo
15	COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Here.
16	COMMITTEE CLERK: Avella.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER AVELLA: Here.
18	COMMITTEE CLERK: Baez.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER BAEZ: Here.
20	COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Here.
22	COMMITTEE CLERK: Brewer.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Aye.
24	COMMITTEE CLERK: Comrie.
25	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Here.

1		STATED MEETING	7
2		COMMITTEE CLERK: Crowley.	
3		COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Here.	
4		COMMITTEE CLERK: deBlasio.	
5		COUNCIL MEMBER DEBLASIO: Here.	
6		COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens.	
7		COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Here.	
8		COMMITTEE CLERK: Dilan.	
9		COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: Here.	
10		COMMITTEE CLERK: Eugene.	
11		COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Here.	
12		COMMITTEE CLERK: Felder.	
13		COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: Here.	
14		COMMITTEE CLERK: Ferreras.	
15		COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Here.	
16		COMMITTEE CLERK: Fidler.	
17		COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: [No	
18	response]		
19		COMMITTEE CLERK: Foster.	
20		COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: [No	
21	response]		
22		COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick.	
23		COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.	
24		COMMITTEE CLERK: Gennaro.	
25		COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: [No	

1		STATED MEETING	8
2	response]		
3		COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile.	
4		COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: [No	
5	response]		
6		COMMITTEE CLERK: Gerson.	
7		COUNCIL MEMBER GERSON: Here.	
8		COMMITTEE CLERK: Gioia.	
9		COUNCIL MEMBER GIOIA: [No	
10	response]		
11		COMMITTEE CLERK: Gonzalez:	
12		COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: [No	
13	response]		
14		COMMITTEE CLERK: Ignizio.	
15		COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Here.	
16		COMMITTEE CLERK: Jackson.	
17		COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Here.	
18		COMMITTEE CLERK: James.	
19		COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Here.	
20		COMMITTEE CLERK: Katz.	
21		COUNCIL MEMBER KATZ: Here.	
22		COMMITTEE CLERK: Koppell.	
23		COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Here.	
24		COMMITTEE CLERK: Lappin.	
25		COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: [No	

	STATED MEETING 9
response]	
	COMMITTEE CLERK: Liu.
	COUNCIL MEMBER LIU: [No response]
	COMMITTEE CLERK: Mark-Viverito.
	COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO: Yes.
Here.	
	COMMITTEE CLERK: Martinez.
	COUNCIL MEMBER MARTINEZ: [No
response]	
	COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy.
	COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Here.
	COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez.
	COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.
	COMMITTEE CLERK: Mitchell.
	COUNCIL MEMBER MITCHELL: Here.
	COMMITTEE CLERK: Nelson.
	COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Here.
	COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma.
	COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Here.
	COMMITTEE CLERK: Recchia.
	COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Here.
	COMMITTEE CLERK: Reyna.
	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Here.
	COMMITTEE CLERK: Sanders.
	Here.

1		STATED MEETING 10
2		COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: Present.
3		COMMITTEE CLERK: Seabrook.
4		COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: [No
5	response]	
6		COMMITTEE CLERK: Sears.
7		COUNCIL MEMBER SEARS: Here.
8		COMMITTEE CLERK: Stewart.
9		COUNCIL MEMBER STEWART: Here.
10		COMMITTEE CLERK: Ulrich.
11		COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Here.
12		COMMITTEE CLERK: Vacca.
13		COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.
14		COMMITTEE CLERK: Vallone.
15		COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.
16		COMMITTEE CLERK: Vann.
17		COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: [No response]
18		COMMITTEE CLERK: Weprin.
19		COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Here.
20		COMMITTEE CLERK: White.
21		COUNCIL MEMBER WHITE: Here.
22		COMMITTEE CLERK: Yassky.
23		COUNCIL MEMBER YASSKY: Here.
24		COMMITTEE CLERK: Oddo.
25		COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Here.

1	1
L	ㅗ

1	STATED MEETING 1
2	COMMITTEE CLERK: Rivera.
3	COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Here.
4	COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Quinn.
5	SPEAKER QUINN: We have a quorum.
6	All rise please for the invocation by Reverend
7	Charles Lewis.
8	SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise. Quiet
9	please.
10	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Quiet
11	please.
12	REVEREND CHARLES LEWIS: Eternal
13	Father, we come now to say thank you for the many
14	blessings that thou has already bestowed upon us.
15	We thank you Lord for bringing us together in
16	unity. We ask you Lord to just touch our hearts,
17	look down upon your leaders, Lord, bless this
18	country that we are living in, bless the whole
19	world, and humanity. And we'll be careful to
20	praise your name. We ask these blessings in our
21	Lord and Savior. Amen.
22	AUDIENCE: Amen.
23	SPEAKER QUINN: Madam Public
24	Advocate if I could just ask my colleagues to
25	remain standing for a moment.

2.0

2.3

2			PUBLIC	ADVOCATE	GOTBAUM:	So
3	ordered,	quiet	please			

SPEAKER QUINN: I just wanted to ask for a moment of silence. On March 25<sup>th</sup>, 2009 Theresa Gentile the mother of our colleague Council Member Vinnie Gentile passed away at the age of 84. Mrs. Gentile was born in 1924 in the region of Collabria, Italy. She was the oldest child of Giuseppe and Marianna Camoso.

In 1934 at the age of 10 her family came to the United States where they settled near Pittsburg where her father worked in the steel mills. In 1939 the family moved to Brooklyn where Theresa helped raise her four younger brothers. After graduating public school, she became a seamstress and sewed elegant wedding gowns until she married in 1950 and started a family. Mrs. Gentile raised 4 boys and was a proud mother, grandmother and proud keeper of Italian customs, cooking and Italian traditions in her home.

I also wanted to let my colleagues know that Margaret Titone the mother of Assembly Member Matt Titone of Staten Island also passed away a few days ago and was buried today. And if

1	STATED MEETING 13
2	we could have a moment of silence in memory of
3	both of them.
4	[Moment of silence]
5	SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you Madam
6	Public Advocate.
7	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Motion to
8	spread the invocation by Council Member Arroyo.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Thank you
10	Madam Public Advocate. I'd like to motion to
11	spread the invocation in full upon the record and
12	want to thank Reverend Lewis for joining us here
13	today. A man of always few words but
14	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM:
15	[Interposing] Quiet please.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO:very
17	profound. And I want to thank you for his work in
18	the new Washington Heights Baptist Church in
19	Council Member Martinez', and this is in my
20	District in the Bronx, okay. Fine.
21	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: So
22	ordered. Adoption of the minutes.
23	COMMITTEE CLERK: None.
24	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Messages
25	and papers from the Mayor.

1	STATED MEETING 14
2	COMMITTEE CLERK: None.
3	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM:
4	Communication from City, County and Borough
5	Offices.
6	COMMITTEE CLERK: M1367 through
7	M1379, base station license applications.
8	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM:
9	Transportation. Petitions and communications.
10	COMMITTEE CLERK: None.
11	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Thank
12	you. Land Use call-ups.
13	COMMITTEE CLERK: M 1380 and M1381.
14	SPEAKER QUINN: We could Madam
15	Advocate have a coupled vote on the Land Use call-
16	ups, please.
17	COMMITTEE CLERK: Arroyo.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye.
19	COMMITTEE CLERK: Avella.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER AVELLA: Aye.
21	COMMITTEE CLERK: Baez.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER BAEZ: Vote aye on
23	all call-ups and requesting permission to vote aye
24	on all coupled general orders.
25	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: So

1		STATED MEETING 1	5
2	ordered		
3		COUNCIL MEMBER BAEZ: Thank you.	
4	Aye.		
5		COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.	
6		COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.	
7		COMMITTEE CLERK: Brewer.	
8		COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Aye.	
9		COMMITTEE CLERK: Comrie.	
10		COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Aye.	
11		COMMITTEE CLERK: Crowley.	
12		COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye on	
13	all.		
14		COMMITTEE CLERK: deBlasio.	
15		COUNCIL MEMBER DEBLASIO: Aye.	
16		COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens.	
17		COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye.	
18		COMMITTEE CLERK: Dilan.	
19		COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: [No	
20	response]		
21		COMMITTEE CLERK: Dilan.	
22		COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: I vote aye.	
23		COMMITTEE CLERK: Eugene.	
24		COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.	
25		COMMITTEE CLERK: Felder.	

1		STATED MEETING	16
2		COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: [No	
3	response]		
4		COMMITTEE CLERK: Ferreras.	
5		COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Aye.	
6		COMMITTEE CLERK: Fidler.	
7		COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Aye.	
8		COMMITTEE CLERK: Foster.	
9		COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: [No	
10	response]		
11		COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick.	
12		COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.	
13		COMMITTEE CLERK: Gennaro.	
14		COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Yes.	
15		COMMITTEE CLERK: Gerson.	
16		COUNCIL MEMBER GERSON: Aye.	
17		COMMITTEE CLERK: Gioia.	
18		COUNCIL MEMBER GIOIA: [No	
19	response]		
20		COMMITTEE CLERK: Gonzalez.	
21		COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: [No	
22	response]		
23		COMMITTEE CLERK: Ignizio.	
24		COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Yes.	
25		COMMITTEE CLERK: Jackson.	

1		STATED MEETING 17
2		COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Aye on
3	all.	
4		COMMITTEE CLERK: James.
5		COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Aye.
6		COMMITTEE CLERK: Katz.
7		COUNCIL MEMBER KATZ: Aye.
8		COMMITTEE CLERK: Koppell.
9		COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Aye.
10		COMMITTEE CLERK: Liu.
11		COUNCIL MEMBER LIU: Yes.
12		COMMITTEE CLERK: Mark-Viverito.
13		COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO: Yes.
14	Here.	
15		COMMITTEE CLERK: Martinez.
16		COUNCIL MEMBER MARTINEZ: [No
17	response]	
18		COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy.
19		COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Here.
20		COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez.
21		COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.
22		COMMITTEE CLERK: Mitchell.
23		SERGEANT AT ARMS: Quiet please.
24		COUNCIL MEMBER MITCHELL: [Off mic]
25		COMMITTEE CLERK: Nelson.

1		STATED MEETING 18
2		COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Aye.
3		COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma.
4		COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: I vote aye
5	and request per	mission to vote on to the general
6	calendar order.	
7		PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: So
8	ordered.	
9		COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: I vote aye.
10		COMMITTEE CLERK: Recchia.
11		COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Aye.
12		PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Quiet
13	please.	
14		SERGEANT AT ARMS: Keep it down.
15	Quiet please.	
16		COMMITTEE CLERK: Reyna.
17		COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Aye.
18		COMMITTEE CLERK: Sanders.
19		COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: Aye.
20		COMMITTEE CLERK: Seabrook.
21		COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: [No
22	response]	
23		COMMITTEE CLERK: Sears.
24		COUNCIL MEMBER SEARS: Aye.
25		COMMITTEE CLERK: Stewart.

1	STATED MEETING 19
2	COUNCIL MEMBER STEWART: Aye.
3	COMMITTEE CLERK: Ulrich.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Aye.
5	COMMITTEE CLERK: Vacca.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye.
7	COMMITTEE CLERK: Vallone.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye.
9	COMMITTEE CLERK: Vann.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: [No response]
11	COMMITTEE CLERK: Weprin.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Aye.
13	COMMITTEE CLERK: White.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER WHITE: Aye.
15	COMMITTEE CLERK: Yassky.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER YASSKY: Aye.
17	COMMITTEE CLERK: Felder.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: Yes.
19	COMMITTEE CLERK: Foster.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: Yes.
21	COMMITTEE CLERK: Oddo.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Yes.
23	COMMITTEE CLERK: Rivera.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: [off mic]
25	[Pause]

2	COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Quinn.
3	SPEAKER QUINN: Yes.
4	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Today's
5	Land Use call-ups were adopted by a vote of 43 in
6	the affirmative, 0 negative. Communication from
7	the Speaker.
8	SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you. We're
9	voting on Intro 826A today, Clinic Access
10	legislation. Let me start by thanking the former
11	Chair of our Women's Issues Committee, Helen Sears
12	who oversaw countless hours of hearing on this
13	legislation. Let me thank the Chair of our Civil
14	Rights Committee, the Committee this piece of
15	legislation was shepherded through Council Member
16	Larry Seabrook. I also really want to so
17	profoundly thank our staff who worked so long and
18	hard on this legislation, Alix Pustilnik, Adira
19	Siman, Julene Beckford, Jim Caras, Damien Butvick
20	and Danielle Castaldi-Micca, if we can give them a
21	round of applause please.
22	[Applause]
23	SPEAKER QUINN: In 1994 this City
24	Council passed important legislation designed to
25	protect women's access to reproductive health

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

2.0

21

22

23

24

25

clinics in the City and to make sure that doctors and nurses and health care professionals could come in and out of those women's health clinics to make sure women could access their legally right to reproductive health care.

Now a lot of us would like to think that the situations that caused the need for that bill in 1994 are gone and that there are no longer protestors outside of women's health clinics in our five Boroughs. But the sad truth is they are not gone. And on many streets, in front of many clinics, on many days of the week, protestors stand on the streets outside clinics; stand in front of the doors of those clinics; oftentimes making it impossible for those clinics to serve their patients. Protestors harass and intimidate women, sometimes scaring them away from going in and getting reproductive health care that they and their families have decided is the right course for their action for them and their families.

What we found is that the 1994 law, although well intentioned, after 15 years of experience with it has loopholes in it. This action today will close those loopholes and put a

2.0

2.3

law on the books in our five Boroughs that is
actually usable and enforceable, that will allow
women to access their legal right to reproductive
health care.

So now once we pass this law, a clinic will be able to press charges and have someone arrested if they are disrupting access to their clinic--

[Applause]

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Quiet please,

settle down.

SPEAKER QUINN: If Madam--if you could just hold the outbursts. Now after we pass our law, it will no longer be only the patient who can cause, call for people to be arrested or charges to be filed. Right now the law says only the woman who is going to be an abortion can have someone arrested or have charges filed against them. Think of that burden.

Someone who has decided to make this decision, which is a very difficult decision, they may not have shared that with others in their lives. They now are the only one who can press charges. They're going to have to go back to

court countless times. What this means is that before—up until now when we change this law, even if a police officer saw an individual breaking the law they couldn't take action unless the patient had asked them too.

allow our police officers to be police officers in front of reproductive health clinics and take action when they see people breaking the law.

This is the least that women deserve in our five Boroughs and the least that the doctors and nurses and professionals who run our clinics deserve in our five Boroughs. This is an important day to send a message that we will not allow people to threaten, harass or intimidate women or health care professionals.

Let me also say this bill allows anyone who wants to legally protest in a peaceful way, it allows them to express and use their First Amendment rights. We have taken great pains working with civil liberties groups and other-civil liberties groups and even some who oppose this bill, to make sure that no one's First Amendment rights are taken away. You can legally

protest.

3	But you cannot harass or
4	intimidate. That is something that we will not
5	allow. So I again want to thank everyone who has
6	put such effort into this bill. I also want to
7	thank the Council Members who have expressed
8	opposition to this bill 'cause they have brought
9	opponents in to see us who have sat with us, made
10	their positions clear in a respectful manner and
11	in ways helped us improve the bill so it could be
12	as clear as possible on the distinction between
13	what is legal and what is illegal.

I think this is a great example of the legislative process in action. Let me call on the Chair of our Civil Rights Committee, someone who has always been a hero as it relates to women's access to civil rights, Council Member Larry Seabrook.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Quiet please.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Sit down please.

SPEAKER QUINN: He's off helping a woman, I'm absolutely sure of it. Continuing his heroism on women's issues. Just tell people I

2.0

21

22

23

24

25

		1 .	1 1	1	7		7
said nice	things	about	nım	wnen	ne	wasn't	nere.

3 Let me also thank our Finance 4 Committee who is passing a number of items today. 5 I also want to thank Council Member Helen Diane Foster who chairs our Parks, Recreation Committee, 6 7 Lyle Frank and Patrick Mulvihill for their work on 8 the street co-naming bill. If people want to know who the 18 individuals for whom thoroughfares and 9 10 streets are being renamed please go to the City Council's website. I want to thank Nicole and the 11 12 rest of the staff for creating a brief biography 13 chart on our webpage that you can go to. 14 I also want to make note today that 15 we're passing three important--16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Settle down 17 please--18 SPEAKER OUINN: Home Rule Messages 19

out of our State and Federal Legislation

Committee. I want to thank, again, Danielle

Avetto, Jim Caras and Phil Hom for their work. I really want to thank Council Member Maria Baez the Chair of our State and Federal Legislation

Committee.

We have one Home Rule Message today

2.0

urging the State to allow the City to have 50 more red light cameras. We have another Home Rule

Message today, once again, making a statement that the City of New York believes that the State legislature should repeal the Urstadt Law and allow--

[Applause]

SPEAKER QUINN: --the City Council to be the legislative body that decides the rent laws for our City. We also have a Home Rule Message urging Albany to repeal Vacancy Decontrol. That erosion of tenant protections has caused the loss of countless tens of thousands of apartments in the City of New York. By repealing Vacancy Decontrol we will have the opportunity to recapture many of those apartments as affordable apartments in the City of New York.

I want to finally thank our Rules

Committee Chair for moving an appointment through

today to the Equal Employment Practices

commission. And also Chairperson Diana Reyna.

And also Chairperson Melinda Katz and the Land Use

staff for the numerous items that they have worked

on that we'll be voting on today. And that

the District that I represent, 1,100 seat high school in Maspeth. I believe that the high school proposal, the one that we're voting on today still needs work. As a Council Member it's been very difficult accepting and agreeing with the Department of Education. I'd like to thank the Speaker for her help during the past couple of weeks as I've worked on these difficulties with the Department of Education.

And while I do not agree with the Deputy Mayor Dennis Walcott, and the Department and their policies, moreover, their reluctance to give priority zoning to those who live closest to the school, I do thank the Deputy Mayor for his time and focus over the past couple of weeks. I'd like to also thank my colleagues in this body whose knowledge and support I'm so grateful for over the past couple of weeks.

I want to let you know that today
I'm going to vote no on this proposal. Let me be
clear. I want a school in Maspeth but I cannot
agree with this plan. In an effort to alleviate
traffic and transit concerns raised by the
community I've asked the Department of Education

2.0

2.3

to com	promise (	on a	plan	to al	llow	this	scho	ool	to
better	address	the	needs	and	the	conce	erns	of	the
commun	itv.								

They have given a plan where there would be a preference for District 24. But that plan as it stands right now does not have the approval of the Community Education Council. It does not have the approval of the Community Board. It does not have the approval of many of the parents within the Council District that I represent. And it does not either have the support of many of the other local officials, including State representatives.

So I want you to consider this today as you vote for Maspeth High School. Thank you for your time.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Thank you Council Member. Council Member Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you very much Madam Chair. I rise, first before you start the clock I just wanted to introduce everybody to new staff. This doesn't count as discussion.

25 [Laughter]

3	0	

2	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you
3	very much. And now what I rise for today, this is
4	a great day for the people in East New York
5	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM:
6	[Interposing] Quiet please.
7	SERGEANT AT ARMS: Quiet please.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Could you
9	hit the gavel please 'cause I can't hear myself.
10	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: They
11	won't be quiet, they listen to me sometimes.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I rise
13	because of Gateway Estates II. This is a housing
14	development and extension of the mall for retail
15	in our District. And I want to thank a whole team
16	of people for bringing to East New York, one of
17	the most affordable projects. We're talking 80%
18	affordable. Unheard of. And some people say 100%
19	but I'll settle for 80%.
20	But I want to say that this is an
21	affordable project that has come to our District,
22	7,000 temporary construction jobs which will
23	guarantee our people some jobs. And also 1,700
24	permanent jobs, 3 new parks, a new school, a new
25	supermarket, daycare center, and it's just one of

Island's on its way so calm down.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON:

I'm going

24

25

Heights which it's called is building a health

career school and a community center for the

24

25

people of Southern Washington Heights.

Homer Young Kennedy was an individual that hundreds of park goers knew Homer by his sight. A big man with a dark moustache which hovered over a frisky smile. And basically he was the keeper of Inwood Hill Park which is the last standing park in the City of New York.

Alex Felix, a young man, taken away too early at the age of 31, was killed by a drunk driver in Washington Heights on July 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2007.

Mother and father, 7 brothers and sisters, nieces and nephews, a fiancé and now he has a young daughter Jaden Alexander Felix who's left behind without a father.

So we're naming streets after all these individuals along with Thurgood Marshall.

And I don't need to tell you about Thurgood Marshall. And if you don't know, please Google Thurgood Marshall and you will see the legacy he has left, not only as far as this country but around the world, and as an associate justice of the U.S. Supreme Court he speaks and stands for himself. There are four street co-names and I thank Helen Marshall the Chair of the Parks

2.0

Committee	for	movina	i+	forward	Thank	VO11
COMMITTURE	TOT	IIIOVIIIG	上し	lorward.	IIIalik	you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Council

4 Member Martinez.

Madam Public Advocate. I also rise to join in Council Member Robert Jackson's street naming. Particularly to speak of three individuals that are going to be honored and forever their names are going to be in our streets and future generations in Washington Heights are going to know these individuals as model, as example, in our community.

a New York City Police Officer who was tragically killed by a drunk driver as Council Member Jackson described. But his spirit and his family are always with us in ensuring that our young people in Washington Heights and throughout the City of New York understand that in New York City you must take a hold of opportunities and make the best of them. And he always believed in law and order and became a police officer.

I also want to speak about Homer
Young Kennedy, a man who believed in our parks and

2.0

2.3

believed that the best is to come from our
community and organized the first dog run in
Washington Heights and Inwood, in the Inwood Hill
Park.

And Lucille, her work and commitment to ensure that everyone in our community had access to health care is exemplary. And today we're honoring them and making sure that the City of New York never forgets. And that in our community when people look at these signs they will question who these individuals are and they'll know by their biographies—

## PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM:

[Interposing] quiet please. It's very hard to hear and there's much too much noise.

COUNCIL MEMBER MARTINEZ: And when they question the names they see in the street, they will know that these were role models and these were individuals that serve example for our communities and our young people.

And I would just ask my colleague if Council Member Robert Jackson would join me in asking our colleagues if we could recognize the family of Alex Felix who's here with us in the

STATED MEETING 37
balcony.
[Applause]
COUNCIL MEMBER MARTINEZ: Thank you
Madam Public Advocate.
PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Council
Member Yassky.
COUNCIL MEMBER YASSKY: Yes I just
would like to vote aye on all coupled general
orders.
PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: So
ordered. Council Member Mark-Viverito.
COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO:
Thank you. I wanted toI rise to speak on behalf
of an item that we'll be voting on today. It's an
item that is occurring in my District. Basically
it's Land Use item 1061, Resolution 1909. This is
an old landmarked public school in East Harlem
that had been abandoned by the Department of
Education for over ten years. There was
discussions of possibly demolishing the building

The property will now be disposed

1	STATED MEETING 3
2	balcony.
3	[Applause]
4	COUNCIL MEMBER MARTINEZ: Thank you
5	Madam Public Advocate.
6	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Council
7	Member Yassky.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER YASSKY: Yes I just
9	would like to vote aye on all coupled general
10	orders.
11	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: So
12	ordered. Council Member Mark-Viverito.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO:
14	Thank you. I wanted toI rise to speak on behalf
15	of an item that we'll be voting on today. It's an
16	item that is occurring in my District. Basically
17	it's Land Use item 1061, Resolution 1909. This is
18	an old landmarked public school in East Harlem

which is a beautiful building.

over to HPD and we're voting on it today.

will be happening with this building is that we

19

2.0

21

22

23

24

are going to be creating 74 units of affordable housing, particularly live-work space for artists from New York City and hopefully mostly from East Harlem and from the District. This is going to be a very innovative project. It's going to be really a model project here in New York City where we're very excited. It's been a project in the works for about four years now.

So we're very happy that we've arrive at this day which we'll be voting on. It's gotten a lot of community support, a lot of community approval. And with that, we're going to be, again, a true partnership between an organization that has national importance in terms of art space and a local organization that has a history of preservation and a history of creating affordable units of housing.

The units will be no more--all of them actually are affordable in that they're up to 80% of AMI with 20% of the units for people earning no more than 60% of AMI. So it truly is an affordable project. It's preserving this beautiful landmark building. And again it is a model project that New York City will be very

2.0

2.3

proud of to have an artist community residing
within East Harlem and building partnerships with
the surrounding neighborhoods.

So I really encourage all of my colleagues to vote in favor. And I really want to thank everyone that helped make this project possible. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Seeing nobody else? Oh sorry. Oh. Council Member Dickens. Sorry.

## COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS:

[Chuckling] Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Dominic's too tall.

[chucking] Thank you Madam Public Advocate. I am thanking my Chair of Planning, Council Member Dan Garodnick and the Chair of Land Use, Melinda Katz for the support that they both gave me for getting through Committee, and I'm asking for the full body to support 1801, Adam Clayton Powell Boulevard at the corner of 110<sup>th</sup> Street, which is at the forefront of the Harlem Gateway, 25 units of home ownership. And at a time when New York

2.0

City is so unaffordable to so many of the
indigenous population and to people choosing to
move in to New York City, this is critical for my
community.

The owners will be able to purchase, the future owners will be able to purchase the units which are mostly two to four bedrooms with many of them having two bathrooms, each per dwelling unit, at \$250 per unit. And that's what I call affordable for the Harlem community.

So I want to thank the Speaker for her help, the Council Members Garodnick and Katz for all of your assistance in getting this through, and to the residents of that building for working so hard and diligent and to HPD for seeing this through. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Council Member Garodnick. Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank

you Madam Public Advocate. I rise today in

support of access to reproductive health services

and Intro 826A, the Clinic Access Bill. And I

stand also in support of the First Amendment. I

2.0

don't believe that those are mutually exclusive principles. Vigorous debate and passionate discourse are fundamental to our democracy but harassment, threats and physical confrontations are not protected forms of speech and indeed they undermine those cherished democratic values.

We cannot stand here in 2009 in New York City and allow individuals or groups to exceed the boundaries of lawful expression by physically blocking access to clinics or by intimidating those who seek their services. It makes it impossible for a clinic to function and impedes a legal right of the citizens of New York City.

Unfortunately current law does not adequately protect our reproductive health care facilities and those who work for or seek services from those facilities. So this law, 826A, in my view, is critically important to strengthen the prohibitions on interference with these important services. I want to thank the Speaker for her leadership on this as well as Planned Parenthood, the other advocacy groups and I encourage my colleagues to vote yes. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Coupled

1	2
4	2

1	STATED MEETING 43
2	on general orders.
3	COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered LU
4	1044 and Reso 1899 through Preconsidered LU 1046
5	and Reso 1901.
6	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Coupled
7	on general orders.
8	COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the
9	Committee on Land Use: LU 938 and Reso 1902
10	through LU 1013 and Reso 1907, various
11	applications.
12	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Coupled
13	on general orders.
14	COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 1016 and Reso
15	1909 through LU 1027 and Reso 1911, various
16	ULURPs.
17	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Coupled
18	on general orders.
19	
20	COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 1028 and Reso
21	1912 UDAP Manhattan.
22	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Coupled
23	on general orders.
24	COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 1031 and Reso
25	1913, 1,100 seat high school facility, Queens.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: May I be

excused to explain my vote?

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: So

25 ordered.

2	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I just
3	wanted to also mention in the Gateway Estate
4	project the 2,208 housing units that's going to be
5	developed mostly by the East Brooklyn
6	Congregations. And I want to thank Reverend
7	Doctor Johnny Ray Youngblood and Reverend Brawley-
8	_
9	[Applause]
LO	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON:for their
11	work on this project in our community. And I
12	enthusiastically vote aye on all items.
13	COMMITTEE CLERK: Brewer.
L4	COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I vote aye.
15	And I want to congratulate the Speaker and her
L6	staff and others who worked so hard on 826. I
L7	have walked women into abortion clinics and we
18	know what it's like to be subjugated to the
19	harassment. And I think last night having
20	participated in a speak-out on women's health care
21	in this is just one example. The doctors and
22	health professionals who are providing these
23	services are far and few between.
24	And I think that anything that
2.5	gives opportunities for clinics to provide these

2	kinds of services is important. So this bill has
3	far-reaching implications, even further I think
4	than what it does just as discussed in prohibiting
5	activities to prevent access.
6	So I vote aye. And I also want to
7	thank those who worked so hard on the housing
8	legislation. I hope it passes in Albany. And
9	congratulations to all the work of our new
LO	colleague Councilwoman Crowley. Thank you. I
11	vote aye.
L2	COMMITTEE CLERK: White.
L3	COUNCIL MEMBER WHITE: I vote aye
L4	on all.
L5	COMMITTEE CLERK: Comrie.
L6	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Permission
L7	to explain my vote?
18	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: So
L9	ordered.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: I want to
21	congratulate Speaker Quinn and her staff and all
22	of the people who worked on the Intro 826, the
23	Clinic Access Bill. I want to congratulate
24	Council Member Crowley for taking on a situation
25	as she just arrived in office, dealing with a

2.0

siting of a school in her District.

I do want to encourage my members though to vote for this school. Queens, right now, has all of the schools in the northeast corridor are over 150% crowded and growing. We need to site this building as soon as possible to deal with the issues of zoning and local zoning for a school is a very difficult issue.

I want to congratulate Council

Member Crowley on achieving an opportunity to make sure that community residents in her District do attend this school. I do want to caution that that can be--create a major problem for the people that need to attend schools outside of their District because of the desire to get into programs or desire to actually get out of schools that are in their community that are subsufficient.

I think that we need to make sure that as we deal with the public siting of schools in the future, one thing that we will be doing is sending a letter from the Queens Delegation to the Department of Education because they have severely underestimated the amount of seats needed in the

2.0

2 next Capital Plan.

Queens is growing. We predict in the census that we will grow by at least another 200,000 to 450,000 people. We need to be better prepared and we need to make sure that the Department of Education siting is prepared to deal with the influx of people that are coming to the best Borough in the City.

So I want to congratulate again

Council Member Crowley for everything that she did

to try to make sure that her community got the

best deal possible in the siting of the school. I

vote age on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Crowley.

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Madam

Public Advocate if I can have a minute to explain

my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: So ordered.

council Member Crowley: I vote aye on all except for Land Use 1031, Reso 913, or is it 1913? 1913. As I stated earlier, I do not believe that this is the best plan for the community that I represent. So I vote no on that.

This legislation was needed because the reality is women are still being harassed and intimidated for trying to exercise their freedoms and their rights. So we had to take this step.

22

23

24

level. I remember growing up in East Flatbush being very proud of having gone to Tilden

23

24

2	High School. My neighbors were proud of it. Wher
3	there was a problem with Tilden High School or an
4	issue with Tilden High School, an entire community
5	was there to surround the high school and to
6	insist that it be improved and made better.
7	That doesn't happen anymore. Now
8	one child will go to Tilden, the next child will
9	go to Erasmus. They can be next door neighbors.
LO	It is just a concept that I don't agree with.
L1	And for that reason I am voting no
L2	on LU 1031 and Resolution 1913 to send a message
L3	to the Department of Education that I disagree
L4	with that policy. And I vote aye on all others.
15	COMMITTEE CLERK: Foster.
L6	COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: Aye.
L7	COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.
L9	COMMITTEE CLERK: Gennaro.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Yes.
21	COMMITTEE CLERK: Gerson.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER GERSON: Madam,
23	Madam Public Advocate, the repeal of Vacancy
24	Decontrol to which we take a first step today is
25	absolutely essential to the enactment of any

1	STATED MEETING 56
2	meaningful strategy to preserve and expand
3	affordable housing so I therefore vote aye on all.
4	Thank you.
5	COMMITTEE CLERK: Ignizio.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Yes. I
7	vote no in 826A, SLR 1, SLR 2, SLR 3 and Land Use
8	1031 and companion Resolution 1913. And yes on
9	all others.
10	COMMITTEE CLERK: Jackson.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: May I be
12	excused to explain my vote?
13	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: So
14	ordered.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you.
16	I rise in order to say to my colleagues that
17	considering the whole issue of rent control, rent
18	stabilization and emergency for affordable housing
19	in New York, I urge you to vote Yo, Yes
20	[Audience laughing, people
21	repeating Yo]
22	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Quiet
23	please.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: I urge you
25	to vote aye, yes on the issues dealing with

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

housing	in	Mosar	Vork	Ci+xz
nousing	TII	MGM	YOLK	CILY.

me thank you for your leadership as a brand new member of the City Council representing Queens and for standing up for your community. I was at the Land Use Subcommittee hearing where many of your residents spoke about the issues and concerns in your area.

And even though I'm voting yes on that particular matter, I wanted to compliment you for the work that you did on behalf o the constituents that you represent. So congratulations to you as a brand new member of the City Council. And with that I vote age on all items.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: James.

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Aye on all.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Koppell.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Madam

21 Public Advocate, I'd like to vote no on

22 Preconsidered Resolution 1896 and aye on the

23 remaining matters on the calendar.

24 [Pause]

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Liu.

2	COUNCIL MEMBER LIU: Yes.
3	COMMITTEE CLERK: Mark-Viverito.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO: May
5	I please be excused to explain my vote?
6	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: So
7	ordered.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO:
9	Thank you. I just want to really commend Speaker
10	Quinn on the Clinic Access Bill, something that
11	I'm very proudly going to be, obviously supporting
12	and voting in favor of.
13	And just a point of clarification
14	with regards again to the project that's happening
15	in my District which I'm very proud that we're
16	voting on today, when we talked about affordable
17	housing in the City, we're always discussing AMI,
18	but I made a mistake in terms of the determining
19	the bands.
20	But actually theall units, the 74
21	live-work space units for artists that are going
22	to be developed are actually no more than 60% of
23	AMI, so actually, even something to be more proud
24	of. And 20% of those units will be for artists
25	not earning or making no more than 40% of AMI. So

1	STATED MEETING 59
2	having
3	SERGEANT AT ARMS: [Interposing]
4	Quiet please.
5	COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO:
6	said all that, and again, I'm really proud of
7	today, that the fact that we're voting
8	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM:
9	[Interposing] Quiet please.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO:
11	this Clinic Access bill, that we still have to
12	continue to fight for women's rights to choose and
13	to make a choice and to exercise their rights, I
14	think is something that is unfortunately today.
15	But very proudly I vote aye on all.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Happy
17	birthday Melissa.
18	COMMITTEE CLERK: Martinez.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER MARTINEZ: May I be
20	excused to explain my vote?
21	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: So
22	ordered.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER MARTINEZ: Thank you

Madam Public Advocate. I just also want to

congratulate Council Member Crowley, but also want

24

2.0

2.3

to highlight the severity of what's happening, particularly in the Department of Education when it comes to school siting.

The lack of communication with communities, the lack of communication with parents and the lack of communication with elected officials of a particular area when the Department decides to site a school, it leads to these type of results where virtually sometimes communities are divided. Where all the information's are not being provided. And yet decisions are made by the Department before they're even brought to the communities.

And this is what happens when this type of system continues to operate. There needs to be more transparency. There needs to be more parental involvement, not only from the curriculum perspective but on the school siting aspect in our communities. I know that the Council Member worked diligently and hard to ensure she delivered for her community. However, on that particular item, I must vote--

SERGEANT AT ARMS: [Interposing]
Quiet please.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: May I

explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: So

25 ordered.

2	COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I want to
3	speak on the Clinic Access bill, being the Chair
4	of the Women's Issues, I want to thank our
5	Chairman Larry Seabrook that put it out of Civil
6	Rights, and I want to speakthank our Speaker
7	Christine Quinn for this legislation.
8	A woman's body is sacred and the
9	decision she makes regarding her well being are
10	ones that are of her own. The passing of this
11	bill will ensure that all women in this great City
12	can exercise their right to access to safe
13	reproduction health care.
14	I want to thank our Speaker again,
15	Madam Speaker Quinn, for her aggressive approach
16	to limit unlawful harassment an intimidation of
17	women who seek to utilize our health care
18	resources. And I'm looking forward to address
19	these issues in our Women's Issue Committee.
20	Thank you. And I vote aye. And I vote no on Reso
21	1913. Thank you.
22	COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote aye
24	on all.
25	COMMITTEE CLERK: Mitchell.

1	STATED MEETING 63
2	COUNCIL MEMBER MITCHELL: Aye on
3	all except Intro 826A, I vote no.
4	COMMITTEE CLERK: Nelson.
5	COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Aye on all.
6	[Pause]
7	COMMITTEE CLERK: Recchia.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: I abstain
9	on SLR 2, vote aye on everything else.
10	COMMITTEE CLERK: Reyna.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: I vote aye
12	on all.
13	COMMITTEE CLERK: Sanders.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: Aye on
15	all.
16	COMMITTEE CLERK: Sears.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER SEARS: Oh.
18	Permission to explain my vote please? The
19	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM:
20	[Interposing] So ordered.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER SEARS: Thank you.
22	On Resoon Intro 826A I wish to first thank our
23	Speaker and to thank all her staff for this but I

chaired that hearing of almost seven hours.

can tell you we heard from everyone, from every

24

2.0

side. And this bill protects everyone's rights to peacefully demonstrate. Whether you are for the clinic and its services or you are against it, it gives you the right to stand out there and to peacefully express and demonstrate how you feel.

This does not take away anyone's

Constitutional rights. And I also would like to

state that these clinics are women's issues and to

gynecological treatments and they also diagnose

and we must not forget that. So I want to thank,

because this bill is extraordinary, and it was

really an honor for me to chair that hearing.

On Reso 1913 and 1031 I am voting yes but I need to make a statement. One to thank Councilwoman Crowley for her efforts on behalf of her District, but no school, and I have three of them in my District that are vibrant commercial areas, and no school should be built in a very dynamic commercial area. It does take away when there are holidays. It's a darkened area. It's darkened in the summer.

However, because we do need schools in Queens, I am voting yes, but I also urge that as we look at these sitings, that we look more and

1	STATED MEETING 65
2	more deeply into where they are and to consider
3	the commercial areas. Thank you. I vote aye on
4	all.
5	COMMITTEE CLERK: Stewart.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER STEWART: I want to
7	abstain on SLR 2 but yes, I vote yes on all the
8	others. Thank you.
9	COMMITTEE CLERK: Ulrich.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: No on 826A,
11	no on all thee SLRs, no on Land Use 1031 and its
12	companion resolution 1913, aye on all others.
13	COMMITTEE CLERK: Vacca.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Ito
15	explain my vote. I vote no on 826A, I abstain on
16	SLR 2 and I want to support my colleague Elizabeth
17	Crowley. All of us keep complaining about DOE and
18	everybody says we have to do something about DOE
19	not consulting. Well I'm doing something. I'm
20	voting no when a colleague says that DOE has not
21	met the wishes of her community. I vote no on
22	1031 and on Resolution 1913.
23	[Pause]
24	COMMITTEE CLERK: Vallone.
25	COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Madam

1	STATED MEETING 66
2	Public Advocate may I explain my vote?
3	SERGEANT AT ARMS: Keep it down.
4	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: So
5	ordered. Quiet please.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: The
7	current Clinic Access Bill passed by the City
8	Council in 1994 which I support works. It
9	protects access to clinics. It protects parties
10	from harassment. And it protects clinics from
11	interference.
12	This new law removes the element of
13	intent from harassment and also removes the
14	definition of interference which I believe makes
15	the new law unconstitutionally vague and open to
16	abuse.
17	I happen to think some of the prior
18	remarks were telling too. One of these speakers
19	said despite the 1994 law, the protestors are

remarks were telling too. One of these speakers said despite the 1994 law, the protestors are still there. And I think that is what this is about. Not stopping harassment but stopping protestors from actually being there. And that's something we can't do in America.

So I'm going to vote no on 826 A.

Regarding SLR 2, I vote no. I believe repealing

1	STATED MEETING 67
2	Vacancy Decontrol amounts to taxpayer subsidized
3	housing for the wealthy and will cost the City at
4	least \$40 million by the City Council's own
5	numbers. I vote no on Land Use 1031 and
6	Resolution 1913. I also support neighborhood high
7	schools, I support my colleague.
8	Daily News article this week said
9	that high school students were not getting any of
10	the choices that they picked. And that is
11	unacceptable. They need to be able to go to the
12	school near their home should they wish to. So if
13	there's anything left I vote aye on the rest.
14	Thank you.
15	COMMITTEE CLERK: Vann.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Briefly
17	explain my vote?
18	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: So
19	ordered.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Yeah actually
21	I wanted to wish a Happy Birthday to my seatmate
22	who's not in her seat. Nonetheless
23	[Applause]
24	COUNCIL MEMBER VANN:I wish you a
25	Happy Birthday anyway, Melissa.

2	I also would like to be recorded in
3	affirmative on all the Land Use call-ups, in
4	particular there are two that are in my District
5	that I'm very proud of and they're mixed use
6	projects, that is commerce on the street level and
7	affordable housing above. It's excellent project.
8	It's part of the Business Improvement District
9	also that we voted on last week. Bit by bit Bed-
10	Stuy's coming back strong.
11	And I'd like to be recorded aye on
12	all of the other issues. Thank you. Aye on all.
13	COMMITTEE CLERK: Oddo.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: May I be
15	temporarily excused to explain my vote?
16	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: So
17	ordered.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: I vote no on
19	Intro 826A, no on SLR 1, no on SLR 2, no on SLR 3
20	and no on LU 1031 with accompanying Resolution
21	1013. And just very briefly, for those of you
22	keeping track at home, that's Quinn leading the
23	Council with yes votes, that's Barron, Avella and
24	Ignizio leading the Council in no votes, and
25	that's Jackson leading the Council in yo votes.

2.0

2	[Laughter]

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Just for the record. Let Gotham Gazette report that.

And then on a serious note, very, very briefly, you know, we--on Intro 826A we had a pretty animated hearing a few months ago but it was a substantive hearing. And I'm very appreciative to the Speaker and to her staff in listening to our concerns and attempting to tighten the language of this bill, particularly taking the phrase willfully interfere and making it in my mind or attempting to make it less vague.

I just want to say for the record I do not want to protect or enable people who break the law and harass women seeking these services.

But I also do not want to pass a bill that might have the unintended consequences of having a chilling effect on other Constitutionally protected speech. And that's why I am voting no on that item. Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rivera.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Madam

Public Advocate I'd like to vote yes on all Land

Use items on today's agenda. And yes on all items

2.0

legislation. I also, before I vote, I want to add
my voice to those of my colleagues for saluting
the work of Council Member Crowley. It is
difficult to have a complicated Land Use siting at
any point, nonetheless, you know, very, very
quickly to first getting elected, it's difficult
when you first get elected to have to vote no when
many of your other colleagues are voting ves.

So I just want to congratulate you for being a voice for your community and for doing it in a way that was constructive and respectful to all of your colleagues. So thank you very much Council Member Crowley. And I vote age on all.

[Pause]

public advocate Gotbaum: All items on today's general order calendar were adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative, 0 negative, 0 abstentions with the exception of LU 1031 and Reso 1913 which was adopted by a vote of 37 in the affirmative, 10 negative, 9 abstentions; and Intro 826A which was adopted by a vote of 39 in the affirmative, 8 negative, 0 abstentions; and SLR 1 adopted by a vote of 43 in the affirmative, 4 negative, 0 abstentions; and SLR 3, 37

24

25

2	affirmative, 5 negative, 5 abstentions; and SL
3	excuse me, SLR 3, adopted by a vote of 44 in the
4	affirmative, 3 negative and 0 abstentions; and
5	Preconsidered Reso 1896 adopted by 46 in the
6	affirmative, 1 in the negative. Revised use call-
7	ups are 47 in the affirmative, 0 in the negatives.
8	Sorry. Introduction and reading of
9	bills.
10	SPEAKER QUINN: All bills are
11	referred to committees as indicated on the agenda.
12	I just want to remind folks that the Committee
13	Room is out of commission for, we're not sure how
14	long, so please be mindful that committee hearings
15	may be moved around, particularly when the
16	Committee Room reopens. So we apologize for any
17	inconvenience but please be mindful of that. And
18	all bills are referred to committees as indicated
19	on the agenda.
20	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: There are
21	no resolutions so no discussion of resolutions.
22	General discussion. Council Member Foster.

COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: Thank you.

Thank you Madam Public Advocate. I think it would

be remiss if I didn't take a moment for this body

2.0

2.3

to recognize on March 25 <sup>th</sup> this country lost the
four most historian in our lifetime, not a black
historian, but a historian, John Hope Franklin at
the age of 94.

He was the first black Chair of a History Department at a major white institution, Brooklyn College. And though he was chair, he wasn't allowed to buy a house in the neighborhood surrounding Brooklyn College. He went on to write a number of books, those that are still being used today. His father was an attorney in Tulsa, Oklahoma whose law practice was burned to the ground during the Tulsa Riots.

John Hope Franklin made a point of noting that you cannot look at history in this country without noting the presence of Africans from the Diaspora. So I would hope that we will take a moment of silence to honor and recognize John Hope Franklin, the most preeminent historian that this country has produced in our lifetime. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: All rise please. So ordered.

[Applause]

1	STATED MEETING 74
2	SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.
3	[Moment of silence]
4	SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you Council
5	Member Foster. Thank you Madam Public Advocate
6	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Council
7	Member Jackson.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you
9	Madam Public Advocate. My colleagues, you should
LO	know that this coming Monday, April the $6^{th}$ at 1:00
11	P.M., the Education Committee will be holding a
L2	hearing on the issue of charter schools in New
L3	York City's public schools. So that's April $1^{\rm st}$ at
L4	1:00 P.M. We're probably going to go all
15	afternoon. UhApril 6 <sup>th</sup> . And this chamber will
L6	probably be crowded with hundreds and hundreds of
L7	people, in favor and against charter schools. So
18	that issue is going to be discussed thoroughly on
19	this coming Monday, April 6 <sup>th</sup> .
20	And also I believe on April 30 <sup>th</sup> ,
21	the issue ofwe'll be holding a hearing on
22	Mayoral control of our public schools. So if
23	you're interested in knowing what agenda items are
24	scheduled for the Education Committee, you can go

to the City Council's website or you can give my

2.0

_					
C C '				788-7007.	
0 + + 1 00	ລ <del>+</del>	$\alpha$	⊃ <del>+</del>	722 - 711117	
()       ()	a .	Call	a .	100 - 1001	

So this Monday, charter schools, and then on April 30<sup>th</sup>, Mayoral control and hopefully we will be voting out or voting on the issue of the proposed Five Year Capital Plan sometime in May, trying to move it away from the vote on the normal budget which has happened previously on—at the end of June.

As you know we're supposed to pass the proposed Five Year Capital Budget from 2010 to 2014 which is about \$2 billion less than the current Five Year Capital Plan of the Department of Education. So please communicate that information to all of the groups in your community. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Council

Member Seabrook would you like to vote?

COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: Yes Madam President, I'd like to vote age on all Land Use call-ups and all general and coupled orders.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: So ordered. Council Member Mealy.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Thank you Public Advocate. And I want to thank my colleague

Ms. Helen Foster about John Franklin, thank you for brining that to our attention.

But on a sad note I want to just tell you on March 27 a father, a son, who were pursuing the American Dream, were murdered in their grocery store and deli. And I want to send my condolences to the family. I am happy to announce today that last night they did catch a perpetrator from the 71<sup>st</sup> Precinct. So we still looking for the next perpetrator. To me we cannot take one without the other.

And I want you to know that I knew this young man and his children. He was a family man. I brought my chips, my soda, my coffee, the people from the community played with his children. And I want you to know that the whole Crown Heights community have been mourning the loss of these two beloved individuals.

And I want the members of our community to know that we're having a meeting on Tuesday at 1:00 o'clock at my office with all the community and organizations, the Police Department and others, we will get to the bottom of this.

And thank you.

2	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Council
3	Member Brewer.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you.
5	I just wanted to mention that, also, on the April
6	7 <sup>th</sup> , we have a Committee of Technology, Consumer
7	Affairs and Land Use to talk about the cable
8	franchise, but more importantly customer service.
9	So that if you have constituents who have cable
10	service customer issues, I urge them to attend and
11	participate. Or of you think there are specifics
12	that we should address. Thank you very much.
13	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Council
14	Member Dilan.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: Just very
16	briefly Madam Public Advocate. I would like to
17	ask my colleagues to support me on a Resolution I
18	introduced today, Resolution number 1898. It's a
19	resolution calling upon the New York State
20	legislature to amend the State Education Law in
21	relation to the siting of charter schools within
22	the City of New York or to alternatively pass
23	legislation that would allow this legislature to
24	enact such law.
25	A little bit of background, a

2.0

couple of years ago, the Cypress Hills portion of
my District was awarded a nice new \$50 million
school for the area that PS 65 will move into in
September. The building that they're currently in
which is a DOE facility, we hear now will be
inhabited by a charter school in September.

And they get around the siting laws because the charter school is not--it its own entity in and of itself. With that, the charter school brings in their own children and they are going to being in approximately 300 children that are not from the Cypress Hills area.

So the result of the new school means a net loss or only a net gain of 300 seats as opposed to the 600 plus net gain in seats that the Cypress Hill Community was expecting. I'm outraged. My constituents are outraged. And I want to ask the Chair of the Education Committee to work with me on this and the appropriate members of the State legislature to pass the bills up in Albany. Thank you Madam Public Advocate.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Council Member Dickens.

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Thank you

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Madam Public Advocate. I join with my colleague

Council Member Dilan in supporting him on Reso

1898 because the State legislature needs to review

and look at and make changes to the existing law

as it relates to how charter schools are mandated.

So I want to thank Council Member Dilan for

bringing this to light and bringing this

resolution out. And I wholeheartedly support him

in this.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: nobody else--oh wait a minute. I've got to read this. [chuckling] Sorry. All items on today's general order calendar were adopted by a vote of 48 in the affirmative, 0 negative, 0 abstentions with the exception of LU 1031 and Reso 1913 which was adopted by a vote of 38 in the affirmative, 10 negative, 0 abstentions; and Intro 826A which was adopted by a vote of 40 in the affirmative, 8 negative, 0 abstentions; and SLR 1, 44 in the affirmative, 4 negative, 0 abstentions; and SLR 2, 38 affirmative, 5 negative, 5 abstentions; and SL 3, 45 affirmative, 3 negative and 0 abstentions; and Preconsidered Reso 1896, 47 in the affirmative, 1 negative, 0 abstentions. Revised

1	CEARD MEDITAL	80
1	STATED MEETING	80
2	Land Use call-up vote is 48 in the affirmative,	0
3	negative. Today's City Council meeting is	
4	[Gavel banging]	
5	PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM:over.	
6	[END TAPE 1002]	

## CERTIFICATE

I, Laura L. Springate certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

Lama L. Springate

Signature \_\_Laura L. Springate\_\_\_\_\_

Date \_\_\_\_\_April 16, 2009\_\_\_\_\_