

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

-----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

STATED MEETING

-----X

March 24, 2009  
Start: 01:30pm  
Recess: 02:35pm

HELD AT: Council Chambers  
City Hall

B E F O R E: SPEAKER QUINN  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:  
Maria del Carmen Arroyo  
Tony Avella  
Maria Baez  
Charles Barron  
Gale A. Brewer  
Leroy G. Comrie, Jr.  
Elizabeth Crowley  
Bill de Blasio  
Inez E. Dickens  
Erik Martin Dilan  
Mathieu Eugene  
Simcha Felder

## A P P E A R A N C E S

## COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Julissa Ferreras  
Lewis A. Fidler  
Helen D. Foster  
Daniel R. Garodnick  
James F. Gennaro  
Vincent J. Gentile  
Alan J. Gerson  
Eric N. Gioia  
Sara M. Gonzalez  
Vincent Ignizio  
Robert Jackson  
Letitia James  
Melinda R. Katz  
G. Oliver Koppell  
Jessica S. Lappin  
John C. Liu  
Miguel Martinez  
Darley Mealy  
Rosie Mendez  
Kenneth Mitchell  
Michael C. Nelson  
James S. Oddo  
Annabel Palma  
Domenic M. Recchia, Jr.  
Diana Reyna  
Joel Rivera  
James Sanders, Jr.  
Larry B. Seabrook  
Helen Sears  
Kendal Stewart  
Eric Ulrich  
James Vacca  
Peter F. Vallone, Jr.  
Albert Vann  
David I. Weprin  
Thomas White, Jr.  
David Yassky

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Public Advocate Betsy Gotbaum

1  
2                   SPEAKER QUINN: He deserves a round  
3 of applause. [applause] And folks may have read  
4 about this in the paper, but last week, is that  
5 right? Last week on Monday, Chad was at the 34<sup>th</sup>  
6 Street subway station, and one of his fellow  
7 straphangers fell onto the subway tracks. And hit  
8 his head and was unconscious and was bleeding.  
9 And Chad did what we would all like to think we  
10 would do, was that he without thinking, jumped  
11 onto the subway tracks, grabbed the individual,  
12 hoisted him back up onto the platform, got  
13 himself, thank God, back up onto the platform,  
14 with really probably about 15 or 20 seconds to  
15 spare, before the train came rushing by the  
16 station. Now that is, you know, a level of  
17 heroism that quite frankly is really, honestly  
18 hard to imagine or fully grasp. We'd all like to  
19 think we would do that, but the truth is not  
20 everybody would do that. What I find, though, I  
21 have to say, really heartwarming about Chad, and  
22 so nice in getting to meet him today, is he  
23 doesn't really want any attention. I think he's  
24 only here today because he's being nice to my  
25 office when we called. He sought no press. In

1  
2 fact, when he got the gentleman back on the subway  
3 platform and other people were helping him, he got  
4 onto the train and went on to his next  
5 appointment, as if it was an average thing in  
6 every New Yorker's day to jump on to the train  
7 track, pull a bleeding man up and save their life.  
8 so, I want to thank you for being such a great New  
9 Yorker. I also want to thank you for being so  
10 completely selfless and humble that you don't  
11 think this deserves any attention. And you know,  
12 people ask me a lot, "Will New York City get  
13 through these tough times?" and I always say  
14 "Yes," and they say, "Why?" and I say "'Cause of  
15 New Yorkers." Now, Chad's only been with us a  
16 couple of years, right? In Woodside. But you're  
17 exactly the kind of person who, who makes me feel  
18 so confident, that there is no crisis too big for  
19 New York City, because we have New Yorkers like  
20 you who are so selfless and put their city first.  
21 So thank you very much for giving us the  
22 opportunity to honor you, because in doing so, you  
23 help us recommit to our city and to other people  
24 like yourself. So thank you very, very much.  
25 [applause, cheers]

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GIOIA: I, I am so  
3 pleased to be standing here with Chad, a  
4 Woodsider, he's credited partly the water and food  
5 in Woodside for his heroism. The flowers.  
6 Really, the truth is, is that we were downstairs  
7 earlier and there's an alarm that started to go  
8 off, and, and everyone said, "Well, we're okay,  
9 'cause Chad is here." [laughter]. He really is,  
10 he deserves not only our accolades, but our  
11 incredible thanks. And if anybody out there is  
12 making a movie or a television commercial or a TV  
13 show or a play, give this guy a call. [cheers,  
14 applause] You know, let's, let's show we know how  
15 to take care of people who take care of us. Thank  
16 you, Chad, for all you've done, you're a real  
17 hero.

18 SPEAKER QUINN: And if I could ask  
19 the Clerk to read the proclamation. And then we  
20 get the hear from Chad.

21 CLERK: Council, City of New York  
22 Proclamation: The Council of the City of New York  
23 is extremely proud to honor Chad Lindsey for a  
24 courageous rescue on March 16<sup>th</sup> 2009. And whereas,  
25 that Monday afternoon, Mr. Lindsey was waiting for

1  
2 the uptown C train at 34<sup>th</sup> Street Penn Station,  
3 when he witnessed an older gentleman teeter and  
4 fall onto the tracks, where he immediately hit his  
5 head and began bleeding severely as he passed out.  
6 And whereas, with everyone else on the crowded  
7 platform watching, Mr. Lindsey jumped down onto  
8 the subway track bed, to awaken the man, but there  
9 was no response. Mr. Lindsey yelled for someone  
10 to call for help. But as the subway tunnel began  
11 to glow, he quickly grabbed the man under his arms  
12 and struggled to hoist him onto the platform,  
13 roughly five feet above. Less than 15 seconds  
14 before the train sped into the station, someone on  
15 the platform helped pull the unconscious man up,  
16 and Mr. Lindsey followed. And whereas, the man  
17 lay bleeding on the platform when the police  
18 arrived, and Mr. Lindsey gave them a brief  
19 account. With the victim now receiving aid from  
20 the officers, Mr. Lindsey, covered in dirt and  
21 blood, quietly hopped the next train to go off to  
22 his reading. And whereas, although straphangers  
23 who witnessed Mr. Lindsey's heroic act thanked him  
24 that day, for preventing a tragic scene, he has  
25 been remarkably self-deprecating about his own

1  
2 performance. Despite this humble valor, he truly  
3 risked his own life to saving the life of a fellow  
4 New Yorker, a complete stranger, who was treated  
5 at a hospital and released. And whereas, Mr.  
6 Lindsey moved from, moved from Harbor Springs,  
7 Michigan, to New York City three years ago to  
8 further his acting career. Today, he is a  
9 resident of Woodside, Queens, and is currently  
10 appearing in the off-Broadway show, "Caspar  
11 Houser," at the Flea Theater in Tribeca.

12 SPEAKER QUINN: - -

13 [applause, cheers]

14 CLERK: He has said that this role  
15 prepared him well for the emergency because he's  
16 required in the play to repeatedly lift another  
17 character who cannot walk. And whereas, beyond  
18 show business, heroic performances rarely have  
19 auditions or understudies, but we are profoundly  
20 grateful to Chad Lindsey for taking on this  
21 unexpected role. We are confident that anyone  
22 with such a dedication to act when needed, will  
23 have remarkable success whether it's onstage, on  
24 film, and in life. Now, therefore, be it known,  
25 that the Council of the City of New York is

1  
2 extremely proud to honor Chad Lindsey. Christine  
3 C. Quinn, Speaker for the entire Council; Eric N.  
4 Gioia, Councilmember, 26<sup>th</sup> District, Queens.

5 SPEAKER QUINN: Yay! And, in true  
6 hero fashion, when I just asked Chad if he wanted  
7 to say a few words, he said, "No, I'm good."  
8 [laughter] So, just again, thank you very, very  
9 much for being such a great inspiration to  
10 everybody. Thank you. And that concludes our  
11 ceremonials for this Stated Meeting. [applause]  
12 [pause, background noise]

13 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Ladies and  
14 gentlemen, can I have your attentions, please? At  
15 this time, can you please turn all cell phones and  
16 pagers to vibrate. And will all lobbyists and  
17 non-Council employees, please leave the main floor  
18 of the chambers? Thank you.

19 [pause, background noise]

20 SPEAKER QUINN: [gavel] All rise.

21 [pledge of allegiance]

22 SPEAKER QUINN: Roll call.

23 CLERK: Arroyo.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Here.

25 CLERK: Avella.

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER AVELLA: Here.

3

CLERK: Baez.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER BAEZ: Here.

5

CLERK: Barron. Brewer.

6

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Aye.

7

CLERK: Comrie. Crowley. De

8

Blasio. Dickens.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Here.

10

CLERK: Dilan.

11

COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: Here.

12

CLERK: Eugene.

13

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Here.

14

CLERK: Felder.

15

COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: Yes.

16

CLERK: Fidler. Foster.

17

COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: Here.

18

CLERK: Garodnick.

19

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.

20

CLERK: Gennaro.

21

COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Here.

22

CLERK: Gentile.

23

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: - -

24

CLERK: Gerson. Gioia.

25

COUNCIL MEMBER GIOIA: Here.

1  
2 CLERK: Gonzalez.  
3 COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Here.  
4 CLERK: Ignizio.  
5 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Here.  
6 CLERK: Jackson.  
7 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Here.  
8 CLERK: James.  
9 COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Here.  
10 CLERK: Katz.  
11 COUNCIL MEMBER KATZ: Here.  
12 CLERK: Koppell.  
13 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Here.  
14 CLERK: Lappin. Liu.  
15 COUNCIL MEMBER LIU: Here.  
16 CLERK: Mark-Viverito. Martinez.  
17 Mealy. Mendez.  
18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.  
19 CLERK: Nelson.  
20 COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Here.  
21 CLERK: Palma.  
22 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Here.  
23 CLERK: Recchia.  
24 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Here.  
25 CLERK: Reyna. Sanders. Seabrook.

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: Here.

3

CLERK: Sears.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER SEARS: Here.

5

CLERK: Stewart. Vacca.

6

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.

7

CLERK: Vallone.

8

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

9

CLERK: Vann.

10

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Present.

11

CLERK: Weprin. White.

12

COUNCIL MEMBER WHITE: Present.

13

CLERK: Yassky. Oddo.

14

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Here.

15

CLERK: Rivera.

16

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Here.

17

CLERK: Speaker Quinn.

18

SPEAKER QUINN: Here.

19

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: We have a

20

quorum. All rise for the invocation by Archbishop

21

Angelo Rosario.

22

ANGELO ROSARIO: In the beginning,

23

God created the heavens and the earth, made man

24

inform them with love and care, gave him a free

25

mind to be a free thinker. And as we come before

1

2 his holy presence, we ask him to unite our minds,  
3 our hearts, our souls, so that we may be a healing  
4 blessing to all the world. That God may give us  
5 the knowledge, the understanding, that we need, to  
6 be a blessing to our self and to those that we  
7 meet, in our journey through life. We ask this in  
8 the name of Emmanuel, God with us. And if he is  
9 with us, who can be against us? Peace and love to  
10 each and every one of us, in the name of the lord.  
11 Thank you.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Motion to  
13 spread the invocation, Council Member Seabrook.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: Yes, on  
15 behalf of the entire Council, I'd like the, to  
16 spread the word of the invocation certainly by one  
17 of my constituents here, Bishop Rosario, who is  
18 here today, and welcome him. And thanks to all.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Adoption  
20 of the minutes, Council Member De Blasio.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DE BLASIO: Chris,  
22 will you the adopt the minutes.

23 SPEAKER QUINN: Of course, I'm  
24 sorry, I apologize. Motion to adopt the minutes  
25 of February 11<sup>th</sup> 2009, please.

1  
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Thank  
3 you, so ordered. Messages and papers from the  
4 mayor.

5 CLERK: M1353, submitting Betty Y.  
6 Chen for reappointment, City Planning Commission.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Quiet,  
8 please.

9 SPEAKER QUINN: Rules, privileges  
10 and elections.

11 CLERK: M1354, submitting Nancy G.  
12 Chavitz [phonetic] for appointment to the New York  
13 City Civil Service Commission.

14 SPEAKER QUINN: Rules, privileges  
15 and elections.

16 CLERK: M1355, submitting Steven F.  
17 Byrnes for reappointment to the Landmarks  
18 Preservation Commission.

19 SPEAKER QUINN: Rules, privileges  
20 and elections. Communication for City, County and  
21 Borough offices, please.

22 CLERK: M1356 through M1358,  
23 submitting the certification of election for  
24 Julissa Ferreras, Council Member 21<sup>st</sup> District;  
25 Kenneth C. Mitchell, Council Member 49<sup>th</sup> District,

1

2 and Eric A. Ulrich, Council Member 32<sup>nd</sup> District.

3 SPEAKER QUINN: Received, ordered,  
4 printed and filed.

5 CLERK: M1359 through M1361, the  
6 swearing in of Julissa Ferreras, Kenneth C.  
7 Mitchell and Eric A. Ulrich.

8 SPEAKER QUINN: Received, ordered,  
9 printed and filed.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: The City  
11 Clerk will now perform the--

12 SPEAKER QUINN: Just, yeah, and if  
13 I could ask, excuse me, I apologize, our honor  
14 guard of Majority Leader Rivera, Minority Leader  
15 Jimmy Oddo, Deputy Majority Leader Leroy Comrie,  
16 to welc--to escort in our three new council  
17 members, and the clerk, Mike McSweeney, will swear  
18 them, and then we will get down to work.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: So  
20 ordered.

21 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you, Madam  
22 Public Advocate.

23 [applause] [pause]

24 CLERK: --the Constitution of the  
25 State of New York--

1

2

JULISSA FERRERAS: [off mic] --the

3

Constitution of the State of New York--

4

CLERK: --and the Charter of the

5

City of New York--

6

JULISSA FERRERAS: --and the

7

Charter of the City of New York--

8

CLERK: --and that I will

9

faithfully discharge--

10

JULISSA FERRERAS: --and that I

11

will faithfully discharge--

12

CLERK: --the duties of the office

13

of--

14

JULISSA FERRERAS: --the duties of

15

the office of--

16

CLERK: --Council Member--

17

JULISSA FERRERAS: --Council

18

Member--

19

CLERK: --for the 21<sup>st</sup> District--

20

JULISSA FERRERAS: --for the 21<sup>st</sup>

21

District--

22

CLERK: --- in the City of New

23

York--

24

JULISSA FERRERAS: --in the City of

25

New York--

1  
2 CLERK: --according to the best of  
3 my ability.

4 JULISSA FERRERAS: --according to  
5 the best of my ability.

6 CLERK: Congratulations, Council  
7 Member.

8 [applause, cheers]

9 CLERK: I--

10 ERIC ULRICH: I--

11 CLERK: --Eric Ulrich--

12 ERIC ULRICH: --Eric Ulrich--

13 CLERK: --do solemnly swear--

14 ERIC ULRICH: --do solemnly swear--

15 CLERK: --that I will support the  
16 Constitution of the United States of America--

17 ERIC ULRICH: --that I will support  
18 the Constitution of the United States of America--

19 CLERK: --the Constitution of the  
20 State of New York--

21 ERIC ULRICH: --the Constitution of  
22 the State of New York--

23 CLERK: --- and the Charter of the  
24 City of New York--

25 ERIC ULRICH: --and the Charter of

1

2 the City of New York--

3 CLERK: --and that I will

4 faithfully discharge the duties of--

5 ERIC ULRICH: --and that I will

6 faithfully discharge the duties of--

7 CLERK: -- Council Member--

8 ERIC ULRICH: --Council Member--

9 CLERK: --from the 32<sup>nd</sup> District--10 ERIC ULRICH: --from the 32<sup>nd</sup>

11 District--

12 CLERK: --in the State, in the City

13 of New York--

14 ERIC ULRICH: --in the City of New

15 York--

16 CLERK: --to the best of my

17 ability.

18 ERIC ULRICH: --to the best of my

19 ability.

20 CLERK: Council Member,

21 congratulations.

22 [applause, cheers]

23 CLERK: I--

24 KENNETH C. MITCHELL: I--

25 CLERK: --Kenneth C. Mitchell--

1

2

KENNETH C. MITCHELL: --Kenneth C.

3

Mitchell--

4

CLERK: --do solemnly swear--

5

KENNETH C. MITCHELL: -do solemnly

6

swear--

7

CLERK: --that I will support the

8

Constitution of the United States of America--

9

KENNETH C. MITCHELL: --that I will

10

support the Constitution of the United States of

11

America--

12

CLERK: --and the Constitution of

13

the State of New York--

14

KENNETH C. MITCHELL: --and the

15

Constitution of the State of New York--

16

CLERK: --and the Charter of the

17

City of New York--

18

KENNETH C. MITCHELL: --and the

19

Charter of the City of New York--

20

CLERK: --and that I will

21

faithfully discharge--

22

KENNETH C. MITCHELL: --and that I

23

will faithfully discharge--

24

CLERK: --the duties of--

25

KENNETH C. MITCHELL: --the duties

1

2 of--

3 CLERK: --Council Member--

4 KENNETH C. MITCHELL: --Council

5 Member--

6 CLERK: --in the 49<sup>th</sup> District--7 KENNETH C. MITCHELL: --in the 49<sup>th</sup>

8 District--

9 CLERK: -in the City of New York--

10 KENNETH C. MITCHELL: --in the City

11 of New York--

12 CLERK: --according to the best of

13 my ability.

14 KENNETH C. MITCHELL: --according

15 to the best of my ability.

16 CLERK: Council Member,

17 congratulations.

18 [applause, cheers]

19 [pause, background noise]

20 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very

21 much, Madam Public Advocate.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Petitions

23 and communications.

24 CLERK: None.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Sorry.

1

2 Land use call ups.

3 CLERK: M1362 through M1366.

4 SPEAKER QUINN: I'd like to couple  
5 these on a land--[crosstalk]

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Quiet.

7 SPEAKER QUINN: I'd like to couple  
8 these on a land use call up vote, and if we could  
9 please have a roll call on the land use call up  
10 vote. Thank you.

11 CLERK: Arroyo.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye.

13 CLERK: Avella.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER AVELLA: Aye.

15 CLERK: Baez.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BAEZ: Aye.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Quiet,  
18 please.

19 CLERK: Barron. Brewer.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Aye.

21 CLERK: Comrie.

22 [pause, background noise]

23 CLERK: Dickens. Dickens.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye.

25 CLERK: Dilan.

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: Aye on all.

3

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Quiet,

4

please.

5

CLERK: Eugene.

6

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

7

CLERK: Felder.

8

COUNCIL MEMBER FELDER: Yes.

9

CLERK: Ferreras.

10

COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Aye.

11

CLERK: Fidler.

12

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Aye.

13

CLERK: Foster.

14

COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: Aye.

15

[pause, background noise]

16

CLERK: Foster.

17

[pause, background noise]

18

CLERK: Garodnick.

19

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

20

CLERK: Gennaro.

21

COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Yes.

22

CLERK: Gentile.

23

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: I'm here,

24

and I vote aye.

25

CLERK: Gerson. Gioia.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GIOIA: Yes.  
3 CLERK: Gonzalez. Gonzalez.  
4 COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Aye.  
5 CLERK: Ignizio.  
6 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Yes.  
7 CLERK: Jackson.  
8 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Aye.  
9 CLERK: James.  
10 COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: Aye.  
11 CLERK: Katz.  
12 COUNCIL MEMBER KATZ: Aye.  
13 CLERK: Koppell.  
14 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Aye.  
15 CLERK: Lappin. Liu.  
16 COUNCIL MEMBER LIU: Yes.  
17 CLERK: Mark-Viverito. [pause]  
18 Mealy. Mendez.  
19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.  
20 CLERK: Mitchell.  
21 COUNCIL MEMBER MITCHELL: Aye.  
22 CLERK: Nelson.  
23 COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Aye.  
24 CLERK: Palma.  
25 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

1  
2 CLERK: Recchia.  
3 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Aye.  
4 CLERK: Reyna. Sanders. Seabrook.  
5 COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: Aye.  
6 CLERK: Sears.  
7 COUNCIL MEMBER SEARS: Aye.  
8 CLERK: Stewart. [pause] Stewart.  
9 COUNCIL MEMBER STEWART: Aye.  
10 CLERK: Ulrich.  
11 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Aye.  
12 CLERK: Vacca.  
13 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye.  
14 CLERK: Vallone.  
15 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye.  
16 CLERK: Vann.  
17 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Aye.  
18 CLERK: Weprin.  
19 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Aye.  
20 CLERK: White.  
21 COUNCIL MEMBER WHITE: Aye.  
22 CLERK: Yassky.  
23 COUNCIL MEMBER YASSKY: Aye.  
24 CLERK: De Blasio.  
25 COUNCIL MEMBER DE BLASIO: Aye.

1

[pause]

2

CLERK: Oddo.

3

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Yes.

4

CLERK: Rivera.

5

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I vote aye.

6

[pause]

7

CLERK: Barron.

8

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Here.

9

[pause] Aye, here, aye.

10

CLERK: Speaker Quinn.

11

SPEAKER QUINN: Yes.

12

CLERK: Mealy.

13

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Present.

14

Aye on all general couple orders.

15

[pause, background noise]

16

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Thank

17

you. Today's land use call ups were adopted by a

18

vote of 43 in the affirmative, zero negative.

19

Communication from the Speaker.

20

SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you. Before-

21

-

22

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Quiet,

23

please.

24

SPEAKER QUINN: Before I speak of,

25

1  
2 about the legislation we're voting on today, I  
3 wanted to start by welcoming our three new council  
4 colleagues. The minority leader, myself and Mike  
5 Nelson all got sworn in as a trio, on a special  
6 election in 1999. So think of the great heights  
7 you can raise to by getting elected in a trio,  
8 with one Republican in a special election. So,  
9 best of luck to all of you, and we look forward to  
10 working with you. Exactly, Jimmy, been my good  
11 luck charm. Let me, before I talk about  
12 legislation, just recognize an honored, honored  
13 guest who's with us today, and then note the  
14 passing of a former council colleague. We have  
15 with us today Council Member Maria del Carmen  
16 Arroyo's daughter, which is her most important  
17 rank to us. Well, actually, your probably more  
18 important rank is that you're Diego and Octavio's  
19 mother, that is your highest rank in our book.  
20 But, Maria's daughter is here, Sergeant Ami Devina  
21 Agerre, and I want to thank you very much for  
22 being with us, if we could have a round of  
23 applauses for the Sergeant. And [applause] just  
24 so everybody knows, she's home from a nine month  
25 training in communications technology control.

1  
2 She graduated second in her class of 15, and she  
3 was the only female in her class. So [applause,  
4 cheers] you know, following in her mother and her  
5 grandmother's footsteps, having been the first  
6 Puerto Rican woman elected to the State Assembly.  
7 She earned the rank of Sergeant, which is no small  
8 feat for anyone, nonetheless a woman in January  
9 2009. If we could get quiet for a sec. She's  
10 already served eight years, and is a home, home  
11 awaiting her reenlistment. She'll reenlist for an  
12 additional four years and expected to serve out  
13 her full 20 years, your mother tells us. And as I  
14 said is mom to two beautiful young boys. And I  
15 just want to say, just quickly, your mom talks  
16 about you all the time, when you're not here.  
17 She, her face lights up when she tells us about  
18 your accomplishments. She is so proud of you.  
19 And we are all tremendously in your debt for  
20 serving your country so bravely, for committing to  
21 do it for such an extended period of time. So, as  
22 an American I thank you. And as a woman, I thank  
23 you for being such a leader and a trailblazer in a  
24 man's field for women, and continuing to never  
25 stop and always reach for a higher goal for

1

2

yourself and your fellow females in the military.

3

So thank you very much and may God keep you safe

4

and in the palm of your hand. Take care,

5

Sergeant. [applause] And you can tell the

6

Sergeant and Chad are real heroes, 'cause they

7

don't want any attention at all. So thank you,

8

Sergeant. If I could ask my colleagues to stand

9

for a moment.

10

CLERK: All rise.

11

SPEAKER QUINN: On March 20<sup>th</sup> 2009,

12

former Council Member and Supreme Court Justice

13

Jerry Crispino died at the age of 78. Council

14

Member Crispino was first elected to the Council

15

on October 9<sup>th</sup> 1975, and served until December 31<sup>st</sup>

16

1991. Upon his retirement from the Council, he

17

was appointed to the Supreme Court from his home

18

borough of the Bronx. He served in that capacity

19

until he retired in 2003. As a Council Member

20

Jerry Crispino served on many committees,

21

including Public Safety, Finance, Health,

22

Education and State and Federal Legislation. He

23

also chaired the Health Committee, and after the

24

United States Supreme Court ruled that the Board,

25

the Board of Estimate unconstitutional, and the

1  
2 Council was given land use powers, Jerry was  
3 selected by his fellow council members to serve as  
4 the first land use committee chair in the City  
5 Council's history. Former Council Member Jerry  
6 Crispino is survived by his wife, his children and  
7 his grandchildren. And before we take a moment of  
8 silence in the Council Member's memory, let me  
9 call on Council Member Larry Seabrook.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: Thank you  
11 very much, Madam Speaker. And it is a real sad  
12 tragedy that Jerry has left us at an early age.  
13 And I was at the funeral today. And Jerry was a,  
14 a fantastic individual, and we started out, Jerry  
15 and I, fighting each other, Oliver. And we became  
16 the best of friends. And Jerry would always say,  
17 "I'm supporting you because I don't want you  
18 running against me." [laughter] And Jerry was,  
19 was a guy who was as loyal as you could have a  
20 person to be, and dedicated to his family. And  
21 certainly to his, his wife that, they were married  
22 for 57 years.

23 SPEAKER QUINN: Wow.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: And his  
25 two children, that he loved dearly, but most of

1  
2 all he loved his granddaughter even more than  
3 anybody else in the world. He was truly a guy who  
4 gave his all, and we elevated him to the Supreme  
5 Court. But he was a very class act. And he  
6 always told me, he says, "You know, Larry, I came  
7 out of East Harlem, I came out of the ghetto, but  
8 I lived in The Bronx." And so, Jerry is  
9 certainly, will be missed, and he loved this City  
10 Council, he loved the City Council, in terms of  
11 being here. And he really, his greatest  
12 afterwards was going to the Supreme Court. And he  
13 was always there, the consummate, consummate Jerry  
14 Crispino, consistent. Thank you very much.

15 [applause]

16 [moment of silence]

17 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you, Madam  
18 Public Advocate. We discussed some of the  
19 legislation we'll be voting on today. We'll be  
20 voting on Intro 960. Want to thank Council Member  
21 Weprin, the Chair of our Finance Committee, all of  
22 the Finance staff, particularly our chief counsel  
23 in Finance, Tanisha for her--

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Quiet,  
25 please.

1  
2                   SPEAKER QUINN:  --for her work on  
3 this piece of legislation.  Intro 960 creates the  
4 Bedford-Stuyvesant Gateway Business Improvement  
5 District.  I want to congratulate Council Member  
6 Vann and his community.  They've worked very, very  
7 long and hard on getting this bid put together.  I  
8 think it's a great accomplishment, and I wanted to  
9 call on Council Member Vann to speak, please.  And  
10 if we could just get--

11                   PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM:  Quiet,  
12 please, you're making much too much noise, I can  
13 barely hear Chris.  Please be quiet.

14                   SPEAKER QUINN:  What Betsy said,  
15 exactly.  Thank you.

16                   COUNCIL MEMBER VANN:  Yeah, thank  
17 you, thank you, Madam Speaker.  Good afternoon  
18 everyone.  This is a very important day for us in  
19 Bed-Stuy.  Thank you for the opportunity to speak  
20 enthusiastically in support of the Bed-Stuy  
21 Gateway Business Improvement District, which will  
22 be located in the heart of the commercial area of  
23 my district, the 36<sup>th</sup> Council District.  The Bed-  
24 Stuy BID is one of the business hubs of commercial  
25 activity outside of downtown Brooklyn.  With the

1  
2 intersection of Fulton Street and Nostrand Avenue  
3 receiving the highest levels of pedestrian  
4 activity, again, outside of downtown Brooklyn.  
5 The BIDs formation is really quite timely, it  
6 comes at a time that--

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Quiet,  
8 please.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: --comes at  
10 this economically hard time in our city, when  
11 businesses are relying on government to really  
12 help them to continue to thrive. This has been in  
13 the making for quite some time. As early as 1989,  
14 there was concerted effort to get a BID, but  
15 timing was not correct, consensus was not built;  
16 it did, did not occur at that time. I have to  
17 give credit to the leadership and focus efforts of  
18 the Bedford-Stuyvesant Restoration Corporation,  
19 and their work towards supporting and structuring  
20 a bridge with the Fulton Nostrand Merchants  
21 Association--

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Quiet.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: --and over  
24 the past four years, Restoration has worked to  
25 build relationships to gain a solid understanding

1  
2 of the needs of the merchants in the area. Their  
3 efforts have led to a successful strategic  
4 partnership between the city, restoration and the  
5 Fulton Nostrand Merchants. In the past two years,  
6 Merchant Association Steering Committee Chair, Mr.  
7 Edmund Braithwaite and Mr. Noah Katz, have taken  
8 the lead in going door to door amongst their  
9 neighbors to gain support for this bid. For this,  
10 I thank them very much. Because I know that their  
11 hard work has paid off and will undoubtedly result  
12 in an economic boon for the area, either now or  
13 later--

14 SPEAKER QUINN: If we could get a  
15 little quiet, please.

16 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Thank you.  
18 Great things underway in the district. The BID's  
19 creation dovetails with the economic development  
20 that is now occurring in Bed-Stuy from the  
21 reconstruction of Nostrand Avenue, to the recent  
22 rezoning in the district, to the EPA Smart Growth  
23 Planning Grant for urban sustainability that we  
24 just received. We welcome the bid, we, we invite  
25 people from all over the City to come to, to our

1  
2 area to shop, and to learn more about this  
3 thriving community. I'd like to thank  
4 Commissioner Bob Walsh and his staff for all of  
5 their hard work and sound management in helping to  
6 get the bid started. I also want to congratulate  
7 and thank the staff of the Bedford-Stuyvesant  
8 Restoration Corporation for their leadership in  
9 bringing a bid to Bed-Stuy. And of course, last  
10 but not least, I'd like to thank the Fulton  
11 Nostrand Merchants Association, especially Mr. Joe  
12 Long, for their leadership and hard work on behalf  
13 of all of us in Bed-Stuy. Thank you, I  
14 enthusiastically support it and implore my  
15 colleagues to do the same. Madam Speaker.

16 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very  
17 much, Council Member Vann. We're also voting  
18 today on Intro 923, and Resolution 8, I'm sorry,  
19 Resolution 1815.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Could you  
21 all be quiet, back there. Come on, we're, I'm  
22 asking you please to be quiet. It's very  
23 difficult to hear and you're all talking.

24 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you. I want  
25 to thank Jeff Haberman, Barbara Hom and Ben

1  
2 Goodman who worked on these two very important  
3 pieces of legislation. Resolution 815 is a  
4 resolution that determines that we are still in  
5 what the law defines a public emergency regarding  
6 rent protected apartments in the City of New York.  
7 What this does is confirm that the vacancy rate is  
8 below five percent. And in fact, it's very  
9 important to note that in this vacancy survey, it  
10 finds that there are fewer vacant apartments now  
11 than there was the last time there was this  
12 vacancy survey conducted. Based on the fact that  
13 the emergency of housing is still continuing in  
14 the City of New York, and how important rent  
15 protections are, and how critical they are to  
16 keeping and preserving affordable housing in the  
17 City--

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Quiet.

19 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Kept it down,  
20 please, keep it down.

21 SPEAKER QUINN: --in addition to  
22 passing Reso 1815, we will also pass Introduction  
23 923 today. That Introduction will renew until  
24 2012 the rent protection and rent stabilization  
25 laws of the City of New York. These are the

1  
2 critical laws in our five boroughs that govern  
3 rent stabilization and rent protection. In my  
4 opinion, they are the laws that keep housing  
5 livable and affordable for working and middle  
6 class families in our City. We send a clear  
7 message today by passing and renewing our rent  
8 laws in full that New York is a city for renters  
9 and a place where we want to make sure that  
10 renters of all incomes have access to homes and  
11 apartments that they can rent after they get out  
12 of school [applause] that they can live with their  
13 families. Homes where they can raise their  
14 families and put roots down in their community.  
15 In my opinion, this law is at its heart and soul a  
16 law about protecting the future of New York City  
17 as an affordable place to live, where people of  
18 mixed incomes can live. I want to thank Council  
19 Member, Chairperson Dilan, who chairs our Housing  
20 and Buildings Committee, for shepherding this  
21 important piece of legislation through. And I  
22 want to thank Council Member Sara Gonzalez for  
23 being the lead sponsor of our resolution to make  
24 sure that today in the City Council, we send a  
25 message in support of renters, in every

1  
2 neighborhood in our city. [applause, cheers] Let  
3 me now call on the Chair of Housing and Buildings  
4 Committee, Council Member Eric Dilan, and then  
5 Council Member Sara Gonzalez.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ERIC DILAN: Well,  
7 thank you Madam Speaker. I think everybody in  
8 this chamber knows that these two items are no  
9 brainers on behalf of the people who rent homes in  
10 the City of New York. My particular concern, as I  
11 said in the Speaker's pre-Stated press conference,  
12 was the minimal amount of apartments in the range  
13 of the \$500-800 range in the housing and vacancy  
14 survey. In neighborhoods like mine and  
15 neighborhoods like the South Bronx, neighborhoods  
16 like Bed-Stuy, Bedford-Stuyvesant, these are the,  
17 the ranges that are truly affordable to most of  
18 the people that live in those areas. So clearly  
19 the City has more work to do in regard to creating  
20 affordability at that level. And I intend to work  
21 with the Speaker to do so. Just very simply,  
22 these laws need to be extended to keep certain  
23 protections in place on behalf of people so that  
24 their rents don't escalate dramatically. And as I  
25 said in the pre-Stated press conference, I think

1  
2 that this current economic climate provides  
3 opportunity for homeowners and renters alike. I  
4 think homeowners can do a better job in signing  
5 better agreements with the banks so that they  
6 don't have to charge their tenants \$1,500 to  
7 \$1,700 a month just to meet their monthly  
8 mortgage. I think that the banks have been  
9 overcharging homeowners for a long time. So I'd  
10 like to see the homeowners, one, sign better deals  
11 with the banks; and then two, pass on those  
12 savings to tenants throughout the City so that we  
13 can truly see, in the private sector, much more  
14 affordable housing than we currently have today.  
15 And I'd like to thank the Speaker for the  
16 opportunity to discuss these two bills, and to  
17 thank Council Member Gonzalez and Viverito for  
18 bringing the two items before the Committee.  
19 Thank you, Madam Speaker.

20 [applause, cheers]

21 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very  
22 much, Chairperson Dilan. Let me next call on, and  
23 again thanks, Council Member Sara Gonzalez for her  
24 tremendous work and leadership on this very, very  
25 important issue.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Thank  
3 you, Speaker. For our great city to thrive, we  
4 must have good, affordable housing in decent  
5 neighborhoods. So hardworking, everyday people,  
6 who are the backbone of our city can continue to  
7 live here. Our troubled economic economy depends  
8 today that we do all we can to assist our  
9 families, friends and neighbors. This legislation  
10 will extend the protections they need to stay in  
11 their homes. I urge you to swiftly pass this bill  
12 on behalf of our working class. [Spanish version]  
13 I ask my colleagues to please vote yes. Thank  
14 you, Speaker, and thank you to the staff.

15 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very  
16 much, Council Member Gonzalez. And let me just  
17 conclude the Speaker's time today by asking folks  
18 to stand for one more moment. We lost two very  
19 important members of New York City's journalism  
20 community since our last Stated Meeting. I think  
21 we all heard reports of the tragic murder of  
22 George Weber, a very important radio reporter and  
23 commentator, and we want to stand in memory of him  
24 today, and send our support for all who are trying  
25 to apprehend who committed this, whoever committed

1  
2 this horrible murder. We also, and I want to  
3 thank Council Member James for focusing on,  
4 focusing us on it so we would mention it today,  
5 lost since our last Stated Meeting: Joyce Shelby,  
6 who was a pioneer for women and African-American  
7 women in journalism. She was with the Daily News,  
8 and if we could just take a moment to remember  
9 both of them and their contributions to the City.

10 [moment of silence]

11 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you, Madam  
12 Public Advocate, and that concludes communications  
13 from the Speaker.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM:  
15 Discussion of general orders? I don't see  
16 anybody. Okay, report of special committees?

17 CLERK: None.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Reports  
19 of standing committees.

20 CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
21 Finance, Intro 906, Bed-Stuy Gateway Business  
22 Improvement District--

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Quiet,  
24 please.

25 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on general

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

orders.

CLERK: Report of the Committee on Housing and Buildings, Intro 923, extending the rent stabilization Laws.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on general orders.

CLERK: Reso 1569a, affordable housing developments.

SPEAKER QUINN: Mandated and coupled on general orders.

CLERK: Reso 1815, public emergency requiring rent control.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on general orders.

CLERK: Report of the Committee on Land Use, LU 930 and Reso 1876, UDAP Manhattan.

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on general orders.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Quiet!

CLERK: LU 93--993 and 994.

SPEAKER QUINN: Approved with modifications and referred to the City Planning Commission, pursuant to Rule 11.70(b) of the rules of the counsel and Section 197(d) of the New York

1

2 City Charter.

3 CLERK: LU 1014 and Reso 1877.

4 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on general  
5 orders.

6 CLERK: LU 1015 and Reso 1878.

7 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled to be filed  
8 pursuant to a letter of withdrawal.

9 CLERK: LU 1017 and Reso 1879.

10 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on general  
11 orders.12 CLERK: LU 1018 and Reso 1880  
13 through preconsidered LU 1030 and Reso 1855,  
14 various applications.15 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on general  
16 orders.17 CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
18 Rules, Privileges and Elections, preconsidered  
19 Reso 1886 approving changes to certain committees.20 SPEAKER QUINN: Couple on general  
21 orders.22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Sorry.  
23 General order calendar.24 CLERK: Land Use, LU 991 and Reso  
25 1887, and LU 992 and Reso 1888.

1

2

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on general orders.

3

4

CLERK: Resolution appointing various persons Commissioner of Deeds.

5

6

SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on general orders and at this point, Madam Public Advocate, I ask for a roll call on all items that are coupled on the general order calendar, please.

7

8

9

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: So ordered.

10

11

CLERK: Arroyo.

12

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye.

13

CLERK: Avella.

14

COUNCIL MEMBER AVELLA: Aye.

15

CLERK: Baez.

16

COUNCIL MEMBER BAEZ: Aye.

17

CLERK: Barron.

18

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.

19

CLERK: Brewer.

20

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Aye.

21

CLERK: Comrie.

22

COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Permission

23

to vote on Land Use call ups?

24

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: So

25

1

2 ordered.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Aye on all.

4 CLERK: Crowley.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I vote aye  
6 on all, but general orders, with the permission to  
7 vote aye on all the Land Use call ups.8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: So  
9 ordered.

10 CLERK: De Blasio.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DE BLASIO: Aye on  
12 all.

13 CLERK: Dickens.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye on  
15 all.

16 CLERK: Dilan.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: I want to  
18 vote aye on all, and I want to just welcome all my  
19 new colleagues who have recently been elected to  
20 this chamber. I look forward to working with each  
21 and everyone of you. I want to congratulate  
22 Council Member Vann on his bid. And I'd like to  
23 officially welcome Council Members Brewer and  
24 Crowley to the Housing and Buildings Committee.

25 CLERK: Eugene.

1

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

2

3

CLERK: Felder. Ferreras.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: Aye.

5

CLERK: Fidler.

6

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Even though

7

I told Council Member Crowley nobody asks off of

8

my committee and gets away with it, I'll vote aye

9

on all.

10

CLERK: Foster.

11

COUNCIL MEMBER FOSTER: Aye.

12

CLERK: Garodnick.

13

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

14

CLERK: Gennaro.

15

COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Yes.

16

CLERK: Gentile.

17

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye on

18

all.

19

CLERK: Gerson.

20

COUNCIL MEMBER GERSON: Aye. And

21

aye on all land use call ups.

22

CLERK: Gioia.

23

COUNCIL MEMBER GIOIA: I vote yes,

24

thank you.

25

CLERK: Gonzalez.

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Aye.

3

CLERK: Ignizio. Jackson.

4

CLERK: Jackson.

5

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Aye on

6

all.

7

CLERK: James.

8

COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES:

9

Congratulations Al Vann on the Bed-Stuy BID and I

10

vote aye on all.

11

CLERK: Katz. Koppell.

12

COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Aye.

13

CLERK: Lappin.

14

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: With a

15

hearty welcome to our three new colleagues, I

16

would like to vote aye on the general order

17

calendar and also request consent to vote on the

18

land use call ups.

19

CLERK: Liu.

20

COUNCIL MEMBER LIU: Yes.

21

CLERK: Martinez.

22

COUNCIL MEMBER MARTINEZ: I vote

23

and I, may I be allowed to vote on all land use

24

items. Yes.

25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: So

1

2 ordered.

3

COUNCIL MEMBER MARTINEZ: I vote

4

aye on all.

5

CLERK: Ignizio.

6

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: No on

7

Intro 923, companion Resolution 18, and Resolution

8

1815; aye on all others.

9

CLERK: Mealy.

10

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye.

11

CLERK: Mendez.

12

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

13

CLERK: Mitchell.

14

COUNCIL MEMBER MITCHELL: Aye on

15

all.

16

CLERK: Nelson. Palma.

17

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

18

CLERK: Recchia.

19

COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA:

20

Congratulations to our three new members and aye

21

on all.

22

CLERK: Katz.

23

COUNCIL MEMBER KATZ: Madam Public

24

Advocate, to explain my vote.

25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: So

1

2 ordered.

3

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KATZ: On the agenda  
5 today is the Forest Hills Rezoning, Special  
6 District. It is the result of many years work in  
7 making sure that Forest Hills is not overdeveloped  
8 on Queens Boulevard, or on Austin Street. There  
9 are several organizations that came to me--There  
10 are many organizations that came to me for a  
11 special BSA variance. Working with City Planning,  
12 we came up, I believe, with an appropriate special  
13 district for the area.

13

14

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Quiet,  
please.

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER KATZ: So, I want to  
thank City Planning, thank the community groups,  
the community board. I just ran up the stairs,  
excuse me. Thank everyone who was involved in  
this. I think it is appropriate thing for the  
area of Forest Hills. I also want to disclose  
that I am a member of the Forest Hills Jewish  
Center, which is part of this. I also shop at the  
stores, go to the restaurants, everything in my  
district. So it has been a long haul to get here,  
it is an appropriate rezoning for my area. And I

1

2 urge my colleagues to vote yes. Thank you.

3

CLERK: Nelson.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Aye.

5

CLERK: Reyna. Sanders.

6

COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: Permission

7

to vote on previous land use items.

8

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: So

9

ordered.

10

COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: I vote yes

11

to those and aye to all.

12

CLERK: Seabrook.

13

COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: Aye to

14

all.

15

CLERK: Sears.

16

COUNCIL MEMBER SEARS: Aye.

17

CLERK: Stewart.

18

COUNCIL MEMBER STEWART: Aye on

19

all.

20

CLERK: Ulrich.

21

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Aye on all.

22

CLERK: Vacca.

23

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye on all.

24

CLERK: Vallone.

25

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on

1

2 all.

3

CLERK: Vann.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: I would like

5

to explain my vote.

6

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: So

7

ordered.

8

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: In my

9

enthusiasm around the achievement of the BID, I

10

failed--

11

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Quiet,

12

please.

13

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: --failed to

14

mention that President of Restoration, Mr. Colvin

15

Grannum [phonetic], had hired or selected a Mr.

16

Joel Dabue [phonetic], who actually led the

17

program that led to the development of this BID.

18

He worked very hard, you can imagine what it's

19

like bringing all of the small businesses together

20

and so forth. And I just found out recently that

21

he won a, a prize that is a fellowship to study

22

abroad for a year. So, he completed his task, and

23

in a few weeks he'll be traveling to London,

24

England to study for a year. And we wish him well

25

and hope that, I know he will do exceptionally

1

2 well, I hope he will return to us when he has  
3 completed his studies there. I withdraw my  
4 request and vote aye on all.

5 CLERK: Reyna.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: I'd like to  
7 be--permission to explain my vote.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: So  
9 ordered.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: I'd like to  
11 be marked present and vote on all land use call  
12 ups and all general calendar, all general order  
13 calendared. I vote aye on both.

14 CLERK: Weprin.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Aye on all.

16 CLERK: White.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WHITE: Aye on all.

18 CLERK: Yassky.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER YASSKY: Aye.

20 CLERK: Oddo.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: I vote no on  
22 Intro 923 and Reso 1815, vote yes on all others,  
23 and just like to welcome our three new colleagues,  
24 particularly my colleague from Staten Island, Ken  
25 Mitchell. And my new Republican colleague, and to

1  
2 let the rest of the body know we are a mighty band  
3 of three now, so do not mess with us. Thank you.

4 CLERK: Rivera.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I vote aye  
6 on all.

7 CLERK: Speaker Quinn.

8 SPEAKER QUINN: Aye on all.

9 [pause, background noise]

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Thank  
11 you. All items on today's general order calendar  
12 were adopted by a vote of 50 in the affirmative,  
13 zero negative, zero abstentions, with the  
14 exception of Intro 923, which was adopted by a  
15 vote of 48 in the affirmative, two negative and  
16 zero abstentions; and Reso 1815 which was adopted  
17 by a vote of 48 in the affirmative, two negative,  
18 zero abstentions. Revised land use call ups were  
19 adopted by a vote of 50 in the affirmative and  
20 zero negative. Introduction reading of bills.

21 SPEAKER QUINN: All bills are  
22 referred to committees as indicated on the agenda.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM:  
24 Discussion of resolutions? Oh, sorry. Excuse me.  
25 General discussion. Council Member Crowley.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you,  
3 Public Advocate. Fellow Council Members, today I  
4 am introducing legislation--

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Quiet,  
6 please.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: --to raise  
8 the fine for anybody who leaves a vehicle running  
9 and unattended. A few weeks ago, a seemingly  
10 avoidable tragedy struck my district. Two young  
11 men, Robert Ogle age 16 of Queens, and Alex Paul  
12 age 20 of Brooklyn, were killed by a drunken thief  
13 who minutes before had stolen a car that was left  
14 running and unattended. Another similar tragedy  
15 occurred weeks before in Chinatown when an  
16 unoccupied van was left in reverse and mounted a  
17 sidewalk, ramming into a group of pre-school  
18 students, killing two of the children and injuring  
19 at least eleven other people. The current fine  
20 leaving your car ignition on and unattended is \$5.  
21 With this new legislation I am proposing, the fine  
22 will, will be raised to \$250, to deter anyone from  
23 being careless with their vehicles. Leaving your  
24 car running and unattended seems like a minor,  
25 carless mistake, but all New Yorkers must

1  
2 understand that it is irresponsible, dangerous,  
3 and could be potentially deadly. The parents of  
4 Robert Ogle were here earlier today for a press  
5 conference, and with the hope that this  
6 legislation will pass. I will continue to work  
7 with the Ogles and my community on awareness, to  
8 prevent people from leaving their cars running  
9 while unattended. Thank you all for your time,  
10 and I look forward to working with the Speaker and  
11 Council Member Liu to move this legislation  
12 forward.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Council  
14 Member James.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: First let me  
16 thank all of the housing advocates for their work  
17 on, in protecting tenants all throughout the City  
18 of New York. And let me just go on to say a few  
19 words about my friend Joyce Shelby. This past  
20 Thursday, Joyce Shelby went on to the glory at the  
21 age of 62. Joyce worked at the Daily News in the  
22 Brooklyn office for 22 years. She wrote hard  
23 news, award winning exposé and funny feature  
24 stories, with a certain signature and sensitivity.  
25 She was one of a few women of color in the

1  
2 journalism world, and her unique voice will be  
3 sorely missed. Joyce Shelby's wake and funeral  
4 will be held this Thursday, March 26<sup>th</sup>, at the  
5 Calvary Baptist Church on West 57<sup>th</sup> Street, and  
6 between 6<sup>th</sup> and 7<sup>th</sup>. Her funer--her viewing is from  
7 5:00 to 6:00 and the funeral at 7:00. Thank you.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Council  
9 Member White.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER WHITE: Thank you  
11 very much. I would like to, I'm introducing  
12 proposed bill on rent notification, Intro 956. As  
13 we all know, the foreclosure crisis has been  
14 affecting homeowners and neighborhoods throughout  
15 Queens, Brooklyn, The Bronx, and parts of Staten  
16 Island. But many are unaware of the impact the  
17 crisis has had on renters and tenants that are  
18 living in homes that have been foreclosed. Data  
19 from the Furman Center of Real Estate and Urban  
20 Policy Studies from 2007 has a conservative  
21 estimate that list at least 15,000 renter, rented  
22 households being impacted by a foreclosure crisis.  
23 Most tenants living in buildings that go through  
24 foreclosure face eviction if the property is sold  
25 at auction. Currently, there are two main types

1  
2 of foreclosures: judicial foreclosure and non-  
3 judicial foreclosure. In a judicial foreclosure,  
4 the lender serves the owner with notice that the  
5 lender has begun a legal action to force a sale of  
6 the property. The lender then files a notice of  
7 pendency with the County Clerk, who provides  
8 constructive notice to the general public of the  
9 suit. In a non-judicial foreclosure, the lender  
10 must publish a notice of sale in a local newspaper  
11 and serve a copy on the mortgager. In neither  
12 types of foreclosure is the lender required to  
13 specifically notify the tenants. Frequently,  
14 tenants are unaware if their, their landlords have  
15 been entered into the foreclosure process, and do  
16 not realize they are at risk of being evicted  
17 until a notice of vacant the property appears on  
18 their door. The tenant can then be given a little  
19 as three days notice to vacate the apartment. In  
20 addition to being evicted with little or no  
21 notice, tenants face negative marks on their  
22 credit histories and can be marked as problem  
23 tenants, which maybe make it harder to acquire a  
24 lease in the future. In order to prevent--

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Time,

1

2 Council Members.

3

COUNCIL MEMBER WHITE: --or

4

medicate these issues, Intro 956 would, would

5

require the entity that is in, commencing the

6

foreclosure action will be required to notify all

7

tenants residing in such property of the

8

foreclosure proceedings within ten days of the

9

action.

10

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Council

11

Member, time please.

12

COUNCIL MEMBER WHITE: Failure to

13

do so would lead to a fine up to \$1000 dollars per

14

day. I urge all of my colleagues to sign onto

15

this bill.

16

PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Council

17

Member Gerson.

18

COUNCIL MEMBER GERSON: Madam

19

Public Advocate, my colleagues, tomorrow marks a

20

sad anniversary our city must never forget. It

21

will be the 98<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the infamous

22

Triangle Shirtwaist Fire, which occurred at the

23

northeast corner of Washington Square Park, in one

24

of the sweatshops which then existed. We all know

25

the story, 146 women and men lost their lives due

1  
2 to unsafe, substandard work conditions; locked  
3 doors to keep employees in their place; fire  
4 escapes which buckled or fell apart. But for the  
5 grace of God, I would not be there, for my  
6 grandfather, my mother's father, worked in a  
7 similar sweatshop directly across the street. And  
8 I will never forget the tears in his eyes as he  
9 described witnessing the bodies which fell to  
10 their death as they were trying to escape the  
11 flames. That fire spawned much improvement in  
12 fire code and work conditions and much of the  
13 modern labor movement. But sadly, sweatshops  
14 still exist, including just a few blocks from  
15 these chambers. And sadly, sweatshops abound  
16 throughout the world, including in factories which  
17 sell goods to this city, indeed to the city  
18 government. And so let us resolve that by the  
19 time the 100<sup>th</sup> anniversary comes around, sweatshops  
20 should be no more, in this city, and around the  
21 world, and certainly we should not support  
22 sweatshops any place in the world. I will be  
23 drafting resolutions and legislation to make sure  
24 that this city government does everything it can  
25 to meet that goal. And I invite all and each of

1  
2 you to join together in memory of those women and  
3 men who lost their lives needlessly 98 years ago.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Council  
5 Member Barron.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Oh, thank  
7 you. Thank you very much, Madam Chair. I just  
8 wanted to take a moment out, along with Letitia  
9 James, Council Member James, to honor Joyce  
10 Shelby. I consider her a journalist of  
11 conscience. I will miss her phone calls. It  
12 seems that once in a while when I'm embroiled in  
13 controversy, here and there, once in a while, I  
14 would always get this call from Joyce Shelby,  
15 telling me to keep the faith, to stay strong, and  
16 she would always encourage us to continue our  
17 struggle for justice. Joyce was just a precious  
18 soul, not just a journalist, but she was a great  
19 member of the human family and wherever Joyce is  
20 now, I know she's looking down upon us. We will  
21 continue the work. We had a running joke every  
22 time she would call. She would ask me was her  
23 check in the mail. And she was talking about  
24 reparations, an issue in the black community that  
25 we're fighting for our debt owed to us from

1  
2 slavery. Joyce, the check is not in the mail yet,  
3 but we promise you it is coming. Rest in peace,  
4 my sister, for a job well done.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Council  
6 Member Sears.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER SEARS: Oh, thank  
8 you, Madam Public Advocate. I just wish to draw  
9 my colleagues attention to Intro 952. This is a  
10 local law to amend the New York City charter in  
11 relation, requiring the City record, here me, the  
12 City record, to be published online and available  
13 to the public at no charge. And this is a very  
14 big thing that's happening, and I hope all of you  
15 will sign on to that. Thank you.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE GOTBAUM: Thank  
17 you. Seeing nobody else--nobody else. Extension  
18 of remarks? Yes, we are finished. [gavel] Whew,  
19 it's hot up here.

20 [background noise]

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, JOHN DAVID TONG certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "John David Tong". The signature is written in a dark ink and is positioned centrally on the page.

Signature

---

Date APRIL 6, 2009