CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

----X

September 26, 2008

Start: 10:22am Recess: 1:10pm

HELD AT: Council Chambers

City Hall

B E F O R E:

ROBERT JACKSON Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Bill DeBlasio Simcha Felder Lewis A. Fidler Helen D. Foster Melinda R. Katz

John C. Liu

Domenic M. Recchia Peter F. Vallone, Jr.

David Yassky

Maria Del Carmen Arroyo

Vincent Ignizio

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Dr. Louis Cristillo Lecturer Teachers College, Columbia University

Khin Mai Aung Staff Attorney Asian American Legal Defense and Education Fund

Zahida Parani Director New York Civic Participation Project

Rev. Wendell Foster Former City Council Member New York City

Nabiha Narusaman Student Stuyvesant High School

Najira Ahmed Student Stuyvesant High School

Bayram Mulic Imam Islamic Unity Cultural Center

Chamsi Ali Imam 96th Street Islamic Cultural Center of New York

Taleb Abdur-Rachid Imam al-Hajj The Mosque of Islamic Brotherhood

Sadiq Abdu Malik Mosque Al-Hafsan

Amina Rachman Special Assistant United Federation of Teachers Maf Misbah Uddin Municipal Union Leader Local 1407

Fadila Mrkulic Member Union 32BJ and NYCPP

Zachia Ensari Parent Member New York City Coalition for Educational Justice

Aminata Salah Sixth Grader New Settlement

Alia Ashad Representative South Asian Youth Action

Mohammed Sharif
Parent Action Committee

Massoud ibn Said Ullah Priest Episcopal Diocese of New York Chair Episcopal-Muslim Relations Committee, Diocese of NY

Rabbi Michael Feinberg Executive Director Greater New York Labor-Religion Coalition

Reverend N.J. L'Heureux, Jr. Executive Director
The Queens Federation of Churches

Kadir Dixon Principal The Renaissance Leadership Academy

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Linda Sarsaur Acting Director Arab-American Association of New York

Choua Vue Education Policy Coordinator Coalition for Asian American Children and Families

Deycy Avitia Coordinator of Education Advocacy New York Immigration Coalition

Richard Grande Shop Steward SEIU Local 32BJ

Myradi Derti Representative, 32BJ, NYCPP

Simone Johnson Member 32BJ, NYCPP

Elpidio Molina Executive Board Member Local 32BJ

Suad Abdul-Kabir Ph.D. Candidate Department of Anthropology, Princeton University

Jane Jamilla, Mother

Prince Mohammed Representative 32BJ, NYCPP

2	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Good morning,
3	and welcome to today's Education Committee hearing
4	to consider Resolution number 1281. And before I
5	begin, let me introduce my colleagues that are
6	present this morning. There are several hearings
7	going on. There's a Government Operations
8	Committee Hearing next door, and across the
9	street, there is a hearing on the New York City
10	Housing Authority concerning Section 8. But David
11	Yassky, my colleague to my left from Brooklyn is
12	here along with the staff, Regina Poreda-Ryan is
13	our Analyst, and Jan Attwell is our Analyst, and
14	we have a Director here also visiting, and we have
15	a couple of guests. This is a resolution I
16	sponsored that will call on the New York City
17	Department of Education to include the Muslim
18	Holidays of Eid Ul-Fitr and Eid Ul-Adha, as
19	observed holidays in a school calendar. It would
20	also call upon the State Legislature to pass, and
21	the Governor to sign into law an act which is
22	Assembly Bill number 6589, and Senate Bill 3142
23	that would require the New York City School
24	District to close schools on the first day of both
25	Muslim holidays. This issue first came to my

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

attention when the State Education Department scheduled a standardized test to be administered statewide in January of 2006 on Eid Ul-Adha, one of the holiest days in the Muslim calendar. Thankfully, that situation should never happen again because in response to public outcry, the State Legislature passed a law that went into effect in September of 2006 to prohibit testing on religious holidays. While this was a great step in the right direction, it's not enough to address the rights and needs of the New York City Muslim community. Muslims are one of the fastest-growing religious communities in New York City, with more than 600,000 Muslims living in the city, and I am one of them. It is estimated that 10-12% of the City's public school students are Muslims. important that we recognize the key religious holidays for such a sizeable number of our student population. Currently, New York City public schools are closed on several Jewish and Christian religions holidays, including Rosh Hashanah, Yom Kippur, Christmas, and Good Friday while there is no similar recognition of Muslim holidays. Chancellor's Regulations number A630 states that

the New York City public schools must make
reasonable accommodation for students to be able
to exercise their religious rights. Basically,
parents have to submit a written request for
permission each time they want their child to take
off from school for a religious holiday. Children
are market absent for the day, although it is
listed as an excused absence. However, many
parents don't know about these rights and
procedures under Chancellor's Regulations A630.
It is especially difficult for immigrant parents
who don't speak English well to submit a written
request for their children to observe these
holidays. Regardless of whether such absence is
excused or not, Muslim students are at a serious
disadvantage, having to choose between missing
school, which can result in falling behind their
peers and affecting their attendance record, or
participating in an important holiday. Other
localities with large Muslim populations,
including Dearborn, Michigan, and several New
Jersey communities such as Irvington, Atlantic
City, Trenton, and Patterson have already
incorporated these holidays into their school

New York is the most diverse city in 2 calendar. 3 the world, and we pride ourselves on tolerance. 4 Yet, in the wake of 9/11, many Muslims in New York City suffered from discrimination and a backlash 5 against their community. Muslim students in New 6 York City schools feel more alienated since 9/11, 7 8 and continue to experience harassment such as offensive remarks about articles of clothing like 9 10 the hijab or head scarf worn by girls. 11 Recognizing these two holidays in the school 12 calendar will go a long way towards promoting 13 respect and equal treatment of Muslim students as well as embodying New Yorkers' values of tolerance 14 15 and acceptance. I would also like to acknowledge that in addition to myself, Resolution 1281 is 16 17 supported by my colleagues Melissa Mark-Viverito of Manhattan and the Bronx, Helen Diane Foster of 18 19 the Bronx, Sara Gonzalez of Brooklyn, Maria del 20 Carmen Arroyo of the Bronx, Annabel Palma of the 21 Bronx, Leticia James of Brooklyn, Leroy Comrie of 22 Queens, Inez Dickens of Manhattan, Rosie Mendez of 23 Manhattan, Kendall Stewart of Brooklyn, Al Vann of Brooklyn, Thomas White, Jr., of Queens, Domenic 24 25 Recchia, Jr., of Brooklyn, Joel Rivera of the

2	Bronx, Charles Barron of Brooklyn, Vincent Gentile
3	of Brooklyn, Larry Seabrook of the Bronx, David
4	Yassky of Brooklyn, and John Liu of Queens. I
5	thank them for their support on this very
6	important issue. Now I would like to announce
7	that although we normally hear from testimony from
8	the Department of Education, the Department of
9	Education has declined to testify at today's
10	hearing citing their policy of not commenting on
11	Resolutions. So we will go directly to the public
12	testimony. Everyone who wishes to testify today
13	must fill out a witness slip which is located in
14	the front desk at the Sergeant of Arms in front of
15	the Chambers. So please indicate on the witness
16	slip whether you are here to testify in favor or
17	in opposition to the Resolution. I want to point
18	out, however, that we will not be voting on the
19	resolution today as this is just the first
20	hearing. And normally, we have one hearing, and
21	then we vote it out on the second hearing or the
22	third hearing. It depends on whether or not
23	changes are made. To allow as many people as
24	possible to testify today, testimony will be
25	limited to three minutes per person. And before I

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

turn to the first witness, we have been joined by our colleague John Liu of Queens, and our colleague David Yassky of Brooklyn would like to say something. Council Member Yassky, of Brooklyn.

Thank you COUNCIL MEMBER YASSKY: very much, Mr. Chairman, and I'm going to have to excuse myself in just a few minutes. I have a large group of constituents in my district office that I have to go meet with. But I just wanted to thank you for first of all introducing this resolution, and calling this hearing, and pushing this issue forward. It's not just the practical impact on the schools of children having to miss a school day for religious observance, which of course, they're entitled to do, but it does mean they've missed that day of school, and it's an impediment for them. And as you point out, having parents one by one produce written permission for this is a burden, and it means in many cases schools are left not knowing exactly what to do. But really, I think beyond that is the impact on the Muslim community at large, and I've been to, as I'm sure you have, a number of Fitr dinners in

the community in Brooklyn, and indeed in Manhattan
over this Ramadan observance. And each time I've
spoken about this and talked about this issue, and
the reaction among people is so powerful and
palpable. Because the reality is that ever since
September 11th, there has been discrimination, and
there has been bias, and there have been,
regrettably, some people in New York who have made
our Muslim-American neighbors feel like they are
not welcome here. And that is disgraceful, and it
has to be opposed and repudiated every way
possible. And I think this would be such a
powerful statement that everybody here in New York
City has a place here. I hope that we can move
speedily on this, Mr. Chairman. I just want to
thank you again for your leadership.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: We've been joined by additional colleagues Domenic Recchia, Jr., of Brooklyn, and Peter Vallone, Jr., of Queens. Our first witness is Louis Cristillo of Teachers College, Columbia University. Please come forward. Khin Mai Aung, Asian American Legal Defense Fund, and Zahida Parani [phonetic] for the New York City Coalition of NYCPP. Please come

2.0

2.3

	_ 1	
	torward	
II	Lorward	•

3 I	[Pause]

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Louis, please state your name and your affiliation for the record, and you may begin your testimony.

LOUIS CRISTILLO: My name is Louis

Cristillo. I'm a lecturer at Teachers College,

Columbia University.

10 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: You're a

11 what?

Teachers College, Columbia University. Chairman

Jackson and members of the Education Committee of

New York City Council I thank you for the

invitation to speak on behalf of the Resolution

that has been put forward to recognize the two

Muslim holidays. Based on research conducted by

Columbia University, Teachers College, and the

School for International Public Affairs between

1998 and 2008, a number of critical thresholds

have been reached that, in my view, soundly

justify the adoption of Resolution 1281. The first

threshold is population size and demographics, the

second is a crisis of identity and civic belonging

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

facing American Muslim youth in the post-9/11 climate, and third is the recurring failure of existing accommodations in the school system. First let me speak to the demographics. New York City is home to some 700,000-plus Muslim. relatively short time span of about four decades, Muslims have become one of the fastest growing and most ethnically diverse communities in the City. Of New York's U.S.-born Muslims, the largest group is African-American whose numbers may be as high as 150,000, about 20-25% of the total, followed by smaller numbers of Latinos and non-Hispanic white converts who account for about 10%. Foreign-born Muslims and their offspring make up the largest percentage, and collectively represent about 17-20% of the City's entire foreign-born population. These newcomers hail from over 40 countries across vast geographies of social, linguistic, and cultural diversity which they bring to New York City. As for the Muslim school-aged populations, today there are an estimated 120,000 Muslim children, roughly 12% of the student population attending New York City public schools. That's enough to fill up the new Yankee stadium to

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

capacity twice, and then some. This makes Muslim children one of the fastest-growing religious minorities in our public schools. The proportion of Muslim students in any one school varies from one neighborhood to another. A school administrator of a local elementary school told us in our research that at his school there are up to 20% Muslims in the enrollment. Now in terms of this crisis of civic belonging. Passage of Resolution 1281 would, in my analysis, help to reverse the growing feeling of social marginalization from mainstream society that many Muslim youth and their families have experienced since the tragic events of 9/11. Survey results and focus groups indicate that Muslim school children have a strong sense of American identity, and place as much value towards civic and political participation as do their non-Muslim peers. Yet they are very worried. They believe intolerance is becoming more pervasive in public discourse, on main street, and they fear this is a delegitimization of their American identity. the classroom they are Americans like everyone else, but in the public square, they are getting a

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

very different message. In terms of some of the consequences of the harassment that children have been facing since 9/11 in particular, the impact it has had on their self-conceptualization. A third of the Muslim students that we surveyed in our studies report that 9/11 made them feel uncomfortable about their Muslim identity, and there's a growing evidence that some Muslim youth feel stigmatized by their Islamic identity, attempt to avert feelings of exclusion by either changing their Muslim names to non-Muslim-sounding names, or passing as members of different ethnic groups in order to hide their religious identity. Despite this sense of marginalization and intolerance toward them, in our studies we find that American Muslims feel very strongly in favor of their schools They feel that they're safe there, they feel that the schools, in their own words, are pretty cool. Eighty-five percent said their schools are very cool, and they wouldn't They value the education they're getting, change. and in becoming an American through the American public education system.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Can you wrap

up, sir, please?

3 LOUIS CRISTILLO: Yes. Tn 4 conclusion then, my full report has further details. So in conclusion, by adopting Resolution 5 1281, the New York City Council can bring the 6 7 city's slate of observed school holidays, 8 unchanged since the 1960s, into the new Simply put, the religious diversity 9 millennium. 10 of New York City today no longer fits the picture of an urban America of the 1950s, as described in 11 Will Herberg's seminal study titled, "Protestant 12 Catholic, Jew: An essay in American religious 13 sociology." The passage of Resolution 1281 is not 14 15 only warranted, but urgently needed, for it would 16 initiate the reversal of what appears to be a 17 growing crisis of uncertainty in both the religious and civic identities of American Muslim 18 19 youth. Passage of the Resolution can go a long 20 way toward averting what one Muslim commentator 21 calls the psychological ghettoization of American 22 Moreover, it would begin to repair the Muslims. 23 fading confidence that Muslim youth and their families have in government and politicians, plus 24 25 it would go a long way toward educating the larger

2.0

2.3

public about the fallacy in the Islamophobic
assumption that American Muslims disdain
integration and engagement in the American public
square. In conclusion by thus passing this
resolution, the City and public schools will be
acting with due diligence, equality, and justice
toward reaffirming the rights of Muslim children,
all 120,000 of them to the free exercise of
religion that they and their families must no
longer be denied.

12 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.

Next Khin Mai Aung. Can you pronounce your name for us, please, and your position and title?

KHIN MAI AUNG: Yes. My name is
Khin Mai Aung, and I'm a Staff Attorney at the
Asian-American Legal Defense and Education Fund
where I direct the Educational Equity and Youth
Rights Project. Among other things, I represent
students who are racially profiled or harassed in
public schools simply because they are Muslim or
perceived as Muslim. I also conduct community
education to inform new immigrant parents and
students of their religious liberties under the
First Amendment of the United States Constitution.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Sadly, prejudice and profiling against Muslims persists in our public schools. AALDEF, the Asian-American Legal Defense and Education Fund endorses the campaign to close New York City public schools on Eid Ul-Fitr and Eid Ul-Adha because it would send a powerful message that Muslims are welcome and valued in New York City's diverse and vibrant student population. One of my clients, a high-school senior from Queens was suspended for several days because he said he was afraid of a terrorist attack. School officials apparently thought that he had actual information about an impending act of terrorism, just because he was Muslim. Another client, a Brooklyn middle schooler, an 11-year old, in fact, was detained and questioned by police officers for saying he was willing to die for his country. Yet another transferred schools because classmates taunted her, and tried to pull of her mother's hijab, or head scarf. Closing school on the two Eids will emphasize that Muslims are an important part of New York City's public schools, and it will discourage profiling and harassment against Muslim students and parents. Further, New York City

2.0

public schools are closed on other religious
holidays such as Christmas, Good Friday, Rosh
Hashanah and Yom Kippur. Like their Christian and
Jewish peers, Muslim students should not have to
choose between practicing their religion and
attending school on the two Eids. For all the
reasons set forth above, AALDEF endorses the
Resolution 1281, and urges the New York City City
Council to pass it, and call upon the New York
City Department of Education to incorporate the
Muslim holiday of Eid Ul-Fitr and Eid Ul-Adha into
our public school holiday calendar. Thank you.
CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.

And next Zahida Parani, the NYCPP.

ZAHIDA PARANI: Thank you. Good morning. I just want to first of all thank you, Councilmember Jackson for taking the leadership on this initiative, and to the council members who have been supporting, and for being here today. So may name is Zahida Parani, I'm the Director of the New York Civic Participation Project, NYCPP. I can see that some of you are very familiar with our organization, and some of you have attended community forums in the last couple of weeks that

we've put on with other organizations. We're
basically a community labor collaboration. Our
partners, many of them are here today, include
labor unions and community organizations, and they
include SCIU Local 32BJ; Unite Here Local 100;
AFSME DC37; the Laborer's Local 79; NELP, the
National Employment Law Project; and Make the Road
New York. NYCPP organizes in several communities
in New York City, and our goal is to empower union
and community members at the grassroots level to
strive for social justice in their communities.
The campaign for Muslim school holidays began in
January, 2006 when one of our Queens' committee
members Sujat Khan [phonetic] told other members
about his daughter having to go to school to take
a mandatory statewide test on Eid Ul-Adha. Since
then, we've built a very strong grassroots
movement that many of you are familiar with across
the city to ensure that the Eids are recognized in
the DOE's calendar as official school holidays.
We founded the Coalition for Muslim School
Holidays with other organizations including the
New Settlement Parent Action Committee, shortly
after January 2006, when many parents were upset

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

about what had happened. And we continue to lead the coalition of over about 60 organizations, labor unions, advocacy groups and civil-rights organizations, and really just institutions. union and community members along with the coalition have put on several forums raising awareness on this issue in both Muslim and non-Muslim communities. Many of you have been visited by folks from our organizations. We've been able to publish a report called "Acceptance not Exclusion, a Case for Muslim Holidays in New York City public schools." And we've been working along with you all, also with state-elected officials to introduce legislation at the state level to make this happen. The coalition continues to grow, and we're constantly organizing in our communities. As Professor Cristillo said, and I just want to summarize some of the numbers, there are over 700,000 Muslims in New York City, some folks would say it's about a million, estimated. That's the official number, 700,000, but some people say that there's actually more. Twelve percent of children in the public schools are Muslim, 95% of Muslim kids go to public

4	schools. So that s a rarge majority of the
3	population. And like we've said before,
4	constantly, this is nothing new. Our neighbor,
5	New Jersey, has this in several cities and
6	townships. And making Eid as official school
7	holidays is actually something that's been done in
8	other parts of the country like Michigan. But
9	also there are other movements. Like here in New
10	York City, there are other movements in other
11	major cities in the country. So now that there's
12	a movement here in New York City, which is
13	inevitable given the large population, it would
14	send such a positive message to all the children
15	of New York City to adopt these holidays. A
16	message of tolerance, acceptance, and respect
17	would be sent not only to Muslim school children
18	but their classmates and families. So I encourage
19	you to support and pass Resolution 1281. Thanks.
20	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.
21	We've been joined by to my right is Helen Diane
22	Foster of the Bronx. I think I did mention before
23	Maria del Carmen Arroyo of the Bronx. So
24	regarding this Resolution, let me just ask the
25	lecturer from Columbia University. How long have

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

you been doing research on this subject matter,

and with respect to Muslim holidays being

celebrated in the New York City public schools?

LOUIS CRISTILLO: It began in 1998, and continues to this day. I was with the School of International Public Affairs, the Middle-East Institute from 1998 until 2004. We conducted extensive focus groups and interviews with Muslim communities in the five boroughs with adults, youth, and other key stakeholders across the diversity of ethnicity. And one of the recurring issues that would--and this is before 9/11--one of the recurring issues was the problem of negotiating the Muslim holidays around schoolwork, and absenteeism, and so and so forth. And recent research, I just finished three years of a multimethod study, - - city-wide survey, focus groups, and ethnographic research project with Muslim on Muslim youth in the New York City public schools. And I'm in the process of publishing a lot of the documentation that I provided in my document is based on that research. So this is research that's been completed within this last three years. And I can tell you, again, that post-9/11,

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

the issue--among many issues--the problem of the recognition of Muslim holidays in the face of official recognition of Jewish and Christian holidays is not only an issue that we've heard children raise with us, but also the growing number, apparently, and this is from focus groups with adult educators, administrators, and parents, that there is a growing number of adults who are employees of the Department of Education. Educators, counselors, staff members, etc., and they feel that they are being discriminated against religiously because in order for the to take the Eid off, they have to take a sick leave or if they're off, they get docked for whatever number of days they miss. And they feel that is blatant religious discrimination. So you have a growing number of employees with the Department of Ed, and you have at least 12, maybe more percent of youth and their families whose religious commitment is compromised in facing the dilemma to choose whether to be in a school and attend, or attend their religiously-mandated prayers and culture rituals around the Muslim holidays. this is an ongoing issue.

2	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Do any one of
3	you know, I cited, and it was also cited by one of
4	your, other municipalities that have incorporated
5	the Muslim holidays into their school calendar.
6	Do you know what percentages are in Dearborn,
7	Michigan, and other New Jersey towns as far as
8	Muslim population in order for that they moved
9	forward to incorporate that into the school
10	calendar?
11	KHIN MAI AUNG: We could get that
12	information for you easily. Or maybe not easily,
13	but we can work on it.
14	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: I'm sorry.
15	Can you speak into the microphone?
16	KHIN MAI AUNG: We could get that
17	information for you in the future.
18	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Sir? Go
19	ahead, please. Just identify yourself before you
20	speak.
21	ZAHIDA PARANI: I'm Zahida with
22	NYCPP. We don't know what percentage, I think
23	that's a really good question. But the process
24	was also a little different in those cities. Just
25	so you know they do have Board of Education where

ZAHIDA PARANI: Which is another issue that our organization is also working on.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Yeah. That's a whole other issue altogether. But in essence,

24

25

2.0

do you feel that that's one of the reasons why we do not have it incorporated? I'm just asking the question since you raised the issue that those municipalities have boards of education which voted on it, versus--

ZAHIDA PARANI: Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: --this being the Chancellor and mayoral control.

ZAHIDA PARANI: I believe strongly that New York City's organizing around this in a very powerful way. And so I believe if it was up to the constituents of New York City, this would happen.

I'm Khin Mai Aung from the Asian-American Legal
Defense and Education Fund, and I echo that
statement. I think that if we had elected Board
of Education members that were accountable to our
community, then they would be accountable to all
the folks that we've gotten out of the last few
years on this issue whereas in New York City right
it's all a question of whether we can convince the
Mayor and the Chancellor who are not, in fact, as
accountable to us in the same way.

2	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Now has any
3	group or organization, the NYCPP approached the
4	Mayor or the Chancellor about incorporating the
5	two Muslim holidays into the school calendar? And
6	what was their response, if any?
7	ZAHIDA PARANI: Yes. We have
8	approached them, and their answer is a flat out
9	no.
10	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: And did they
11	give a reason why in the no answer?
12	ZAHIDA PARANI: They've cited a few
13	reasons which, yeah. They have cited a couple of
14	reasons that they're saying that they couldn't do
15	this.
16	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Can you
17	explain those? Since they cannot, their policy,
18	the City's policy is they do not come and give
19	testimony on resolutions, so I'm asking the
20	question, because my understanding was that their
21	response was, "Well, we have so many holidays
22	right now, and if we add two more holidays, then
23	we won't have enough actual school days." Is
24	that?
25	ZAHIDA PARANI: That is one of

2 their answers, yes.

3 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: And do you

4 buy that answer?

5 ZAHIDA PARANI: No. Absolutely

6 not.

7 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Then please 8 explain to us why you do not accept that answer.'

2 ZAHIDA PARANI: Well, we are asking

10 to have two holidays added to the calendar. That

does not mean taking away any days. We're simply

12 asking for holidays to be added. And we have

folks that are going to be testifying here today

14 that can also point to that question. I know the

15 UFT is here today, and they may be able to address

16 that question better than I could. But I know

17 | that for us, we're not asking to take away any

18 school days, and we do believe children should be

19 in school. And in fact, you'll hear from students

20 | right after us from Stuyvesant High School who

21 have dedicated their lives to education and

22 | educating themselves. And they're the first ones

23 that will say they do not want to miss anymore

24 school. They'd rather be in school more.

25 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Any questions

2.0

2.3

from my colleagues? We've been joined by Vincent	t
Ignizio of Staten Island. Maria del Carmen Arroy	λo
of the Bronx has a question or comment.	

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Thank you,
Mr. Chair, and thank you for holding this hearing
on an issue that I believe is of significant
importance to most of us, certainly in the
Council, and hopefully in the City. A general
questions, and I'm not sure that the panel can
answer this, and this is for us internally. I'd
like to know why the City doesn't give testimony
on Resolutions. Is it part of the City Charter?
Is this a rule they make up? How does that
happen?

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: I don't believe it's part of the City Charter. That's been their policy ever since I've been a Council Member that they do not come in and give testimony on Resolutions. I guess that's a policy decision, that's nothing that's mandated by law.

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Okay. So they make it up. Policy is made up by-CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Right.

Policies are made up by the executives who run the

agency or department, in this case the Mayor.

another general question. Do we have data that indicates the ethnic breakdown of the student body in the system, and maybe Dr. Cristillo do you have access or information that gives you the census of the student body in the New York City school system? Ethnicity.

LOUIS CRISTILLO: The ethnicity of the Muslim student population.

that? So the next question is do we have a sense of how many holidays, religious holidays we observe in the school system, and how that correlates to the student body ratio or percentages? Let me see if I can state it differently. How many religious holidays do we observe in the City that is representative of the student body in the City? And do those holidays correlate with the student body percentage?

LOUIS CRISTILLO: I don't know the specific demographics of that, but what I can infer from the research that I've conducted and my colleagues is that it will vary from neighborhood

to neighborhood. So in neighborhoods with a high density of ethnic Muslim residency, those elementary schools within that area will have a proportionately higher number of Muslim students in them, thus the one--

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Well, no. What I'm asking is we observe Christmas, several holidays that are observed in the Jewish faith. How many, or what is the percentage of in the student body that make up the students of those faiths?

question. Part of the problem is that the United States census and other official data collection agencies do not collect religious data, which is why the work that Professor Cristillo and other scholars have done in private studies on this is so very, very valuable and informative. It's easy enough to look on the Department of Education's website, and get racial breakdowns by school, by the whole school district, or by individual districts. And I think that to some extent they are proxies if you think about different racial populations that tend to be predominantly one

2.0

2.3

2	ethnicity or the other, but it's very, very
3	imprecise. For instance, the Muslim population,
4	it's a very diverse population as we've learned
5	throughout the course of this campaign. At my
6	organization, the Asian-American Legal Defense and
7	Education Fund, we work with, as you might
8	imagine, Asian Muslims, Bangladeshi-Americans,
9	Pakistani-Americans

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: I met a Puerto Rican Muslim the other night at the event.

Sure. Of course.

KHIN MAI AUNG:

Exactly. So we work with that population:
Indonesians and so forth. There's Africans,
there's converts who are white, of all different
ethnicities. So you really can't glean too much
from the ethnic background. But what I do know is
that the holidays that we do observe that are of a
religious nature were implemented a long time ago
in part because of concerns about teacher
absenteeism. At one point there was a large
percentage of the New York City public school
teachers who were Jewish, and that's what
eventually led to the Jewish holidays being
incorporated. And I think that what we're seeing

now is that there has been, as Professor Cristillo pointed out, a large increase in Muslim students, teachers, parents. And I think that preventing absenteeism for that population, and also being cognizant of the stigma that that population experiences sometimes, post-9/11, and because of the discrimination, as I pointed out in my testimony, I think that it is far preferable to have the holiday off, than to force folks to have to kind of draw attention to themselves by writing letters, which I think can be uncomfortable in some schools and some districts. And particularly difficult for parents who may not be proficient in English. Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Thank you.

This is just something that makes so much sense.

I feel very strongly that a child or their parent should not have to choose between their faith and education. It's just that simple. And for our system to adopt these two holidays is just something that makes too much sense, and we really ought not to have so much conversation about it.

Thank you, Mr. Chair.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.

2	Thank you panel members. We appreciate you coming
3	in. If you can get some responses to the
4	questions that we raised, we would appreciate it.
5	Our next panel, we're going to hear from the
6	Honorable Wendell Foster who is a former City
7	Council Member. Reverend Foster. Once a Council
8	Member, always a Council Member. And two high-
9	school students, Nabiha Narusaman [phonetic] from
10	Stuyvesant High School, and Najira Ahmed
11	[phonetic] from Stuyvesant High School. Please
12	come forward.
13	[Pause]
14	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Please
15	identify yourself, and you may begin, Reverend
16	Foster.
17	REVEREND FOSTER: Thank you. Good
18	morning. Good morning.
19	ALL: Good morning.
20	REVEREND FOSTER: Don't be afraid
21	to say good morning. Mr. Chairman, and my friends
22	on the Council, this chamber brings back many
23	present memories. More than 20 years ago, I had a
24	resolution comparable to the one we have this

morning recognizing that people of all faiths

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

should be acknowledged and recognized. I'm here in support of what I consider one of the finest legal presentations 1281. I commend our lawyers for doing this, and I'm here for a simple reason. All my life I've been fighting causes that I've felt were just and right. I marched and fought when they were trying to declare Israel as a I fought for the liberation of Africa. state. As you know, I was former Vice President of the World Peace Council. I fought the Klan in the United States. I fought a bigot by the name of J. Edgar Hoover who was head of the FBI when he protected those who would lynch folk. My whole life has been devoted to being fair, trying to be fair and honest to myself, to my God, and the people that God laid [phonetic]. Were I not supportive of this resolution, I'd contradict everything I've lived for and fought for all of my life. testimony is simple, what you have here before you is something that's right, just, past due, and should be passed - - by the City Council. really don't see the rationale for anyone opposing it. We did not oppose other religious holidays. I make no apology in saying that I'm a devout

2.0

Christian, not a part of the Christian right
because I don't believe they're Christian or
right. But as a devout Christian, and my faith in
Jesus Christ, would contradict everything that I
stand for, and I believe in my support of my faith
if I were to oppose this Resolution. In shot, I
would simply say to you, have the courage and the
guts to say, "Yes. Pass it." Fight for it, and
make sure that it is implemented so that all
children will be treated fairly and honestly in
this City. Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you Reverend Foster. Next a student from Stuyvesant High School, Nabiha Narusaman. Please pronounce your name and what grade are you in?

Nabiha Narusaman, and I'm a senior at Stuyvesant High School, so the 12th grade. And I'm grateful to have been asked to be here to speak on behalf of the many students at my school who support this resolution. As you may know, Islam is one of the most popular religions in the world, and it's rapidly growing. There are nearly two billion Muslims in the world, and 700,000 in New York City

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I'm very proud to be a part of such a alone. diverse society, and that I'm given a chance to witness every possible religion, and to celebrate with them. Yet, I feel isolated as if I were not truly a part of this great City, because you know my friends have Rosh Hashanah off or Christmas off, and they're able to celebrate with their families without worrying about what assignments they need to make up or whether or not their grades will be affected. And I want that chance, that opportunity, because I've taken the day off many times, and I try to celebrate, but in the back of my head I'd always worry about the double workload waiting for me: that History paper, the AP Biology notes that I missed. And so thank you for allowing me this opportunity to share my feelings. I'm a Citizen of the United States, and an American, but I'm also a Muslim. And as such, my identity as an American should be inclusive of my identity as a Muslim. I want America to accept me and the thousands of other Muslim kids in our public school system, and I want America to celebrate with us. In my family, we don't just celebrate with Muslims alone, but we bring in our

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

neighbors and our friends who come from all different faiths and walks of life. We celebrate as a community, and if you give me your mailing address, I'll send you food too. I'm passionate about my studies, as a member of the student body of one of the most rigorous academic schools in the New York State. I worked very hard and earned a coveted seat in this math and science technical high school. Of the 28,000 students taking the specialized high school exam, only the top 800 attend Stuyvesant each year. And I say this not to brag about myself, but so that you will understand my love of learning, and how hard I've worked thus far. Because for me this is not about getting a day off from school or shirking my educational duties. Instead, it's about being recognized by my city, my country. It's about supporting the rich diversity of New York City, and most importantly, it's about educating the New York City community about Islam. You know, some Eid Ul-Fitrs are spent with families at bazaars and festivals and fairs, and include the entire neighborhood. But it's more than that, because we visit the sick, we go to the graveyard and pray

for the souls of the deceased. In fact, the	
purpose behind the holy month of Ramadan is so w	е
can sympathize with the less fortunate, the peop	le
we pass by every day in the busy streets of New	
York who may not have a meal to go home to. And	
lastly, because I have to get back to my four AP	
classes, I'd like to leave you with a quote by	
Lyndon B. Johnson. "The American city should be	a
collection of communities where every member has	a
right to belong. It should be a place where eve	ry
man feels safe on the streets and in the house o	f
his friends. It should be a place where each	
individual's dignity and self-respect is	
strengthened by the respect and affection of his	
neighbors. It should be a place where each of u	S
can find the satisfaction and warmth which comes	
from being a member of the community of Man. Th	is
is what Man sought at the dawn of civilization,	
and it is what we seek today. Thank you very	
much.	

22 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.

And next we hear from Najira Ahmed.

NAJIRA AHMED: My name is Najira

Ahmed. I'm a current senior at Stuyvesant High

2.0

2.3

2 School.

3	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON:	You're	а

4 senior also?

NAJIRA AHMED: Yes. And I am also co-president of the Stuyvesant Muslim Students
Association. To be a student at Stuyvesant, one of the best high schools of our nation, is such an integral part of my life, and is an experience like no other. Our student body is so culturally and religiously diverse and yet so accepting and eager to learn about the different faiths and nationalities represented.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Can you pull your mic down a little closer to your mouth, please? Thank you.

Muslim community, I feel it is my responsibility to provide others with a better understanding of what Islam truly is. However, I don't believe spreading awareness should be limited to within the doors of my school. I consider myself lucky to have been born and raised in New York City, a city that is truly the crossroads of the world, a city that anyone could proudly call home no matter

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

what their background. But I think it's a pity to live in such an extraordinary city and feel like you're not being recognized for who you are, and the faith you represent. Muslim students do not attend school for Christian and Jewish holidays, and yet must feel the pressure of missing school if we wish to stay home to observe an Islamic holiday. Students should not feel pressure to attend school, and miss the special prayers that begin the morning of Eid. If we could have our holidays recognized, it would be a motivation for others to learn what these holidays are about, and to learn about Islam as a whole. Eid Ul-Fitr and Eid Ul-Adha are holidays that are meant to be spent with family, friends, and people of the Muslim community, but also with people of the non-Muslim communities so that they too can celebrate with us and learn about our faith. I want New Yorkers to learn about what Islam is, and to celebrate our holidays with us, not leave us feeling insignificant. In recognizing the Muslim community, many will benefit by gaining a better understanding of our religion, and help to make our society richer in knowledge and awareness of

23

24

25

2 the people who are a part of it.

3 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Let me thank 4 all of you for coming in and giving testimony, especially the two of you, two students, because 5 you are actually what we're talking about here 6 7 today as you're in school, you're seniors at one 8 of the most premier schools in the country, not 9 only New York State--Stuyvesant High School. 10 you are experiencing the situation as far as religious holidays in the New York public schools 11 today, meaning now, in 2008. But let me introduce 12 my other colleagues and somebody--13 REVEREND FOSTER: Mr. Chairman, may 14 15 I ask a question of the panel? 16 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: One second, 17 Reverend if you don't mind. 18 REVEREND FOSTER: Thank you. 19 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Let me 2.0 introduce our colleagues Melinda Katz of Queens, 21 and Lew Fidler of Brooklyn, and we're going to

REVEREND FOSTER: I don't recall us every holding a hearing to observe Jewish holidays

hear questions from Maria del Carmen Arroyo, but

first Reverend Foster.

2 and Christian holidays. Why a special hearing
3 just for this holiday?

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Well, I think that that's a legitimate question. I think obviously, ladies and gents, can you please hold down your applause, please. I think that these holidays, the Jewish holidays and Christian holidays have been around for decades, and so as a result that they have been around for decades, I mean, obviously there was no need to hold a hearing since I've been a City Council Member, which has been almost seven years, and probably even during your tenure—

REVEREND FOSTER: Twenty-four.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: --as a City
Council Member. But the Muslim population has
grown in New York City over the past 20, 25 years
to the point where the voices and the cultures,
and all of the things that Muslims need are being
expressed. And as a result of that, NYCPP has
communicated loud and clear based on the number of
students which is approximately 12% of the New
York City public schools, the time is now. And
the Muslim community wants to be able to celebrate

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

2.0

21

22

2.3

24

25

2	their	holidays	s just	like	other	gro	oups.	No	othing
3	more,	nothing	worse,	but	just	the	same	as	everyone
4	else.								

5 REVEREND FOSTER: Thank you, Mr.

6 Chairman.

7 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: So I think 8 the time is now.

REVEREND FOSTER: You answered my question. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: But obviously I'm not the Department of Education, I'm only giving you my assessment as a member of the City Council. Clearly, the Mayor of the City of New York, Michael Bloomberg could communicate loud and clear to the Chancellor that this is what he desires. And I believe if he communicated that loud and clear, it would happen. We are under Mayoral control, and as you heard in the previous panel, the previous municipalities that were mentioned, in Dearborn, Michigan and other parts of New Jersey, a majority of those, if not all of them, have Boards of Education, which people are there representing the community, and members have an actual vote to determine whether or not what is

2.0

2.3

2	policy and procedure in those Departments of
3	Education.
4	REVEREND FOSTER: But the Cour

REVEREND FOSTER: But the Council can say in fairness to all the citizens, we are in favor, right?

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Well, the Council, and this Resolution, as you know, is basically, if we pass this Resolution in the future, it will give a clear message that the body of New York City, the City Council is expressing that they want this to happen.

REVEREND FOSTER: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Let me turn to your daughter, Helen Diane Foster, Council Member of the Bronx.

very much. First I want to applaud the students and thank you for taking time out to speak. And of course, Dad, thank you for always being you, honest, and I appreciate that. What my comment is, is as you know, many of our Muslims are citizens and they vote, and my recommendation would be as we are coming up on an election for Mayor, make sure you have a candidate that

2	respects you, respects your holiday, and ask
3	before hand where he or she is going to stand in
4	terms of supporting this holiday. And then vote
5	accordingly. My concern has always been with DOE,
6	they put the cart before the horse, they tell us
7	what's going to happen, and then consult the
8	community. And I think we, as the community,
9	should tell them what we want, and then they
10	should implement it. So let your voice be heard
11	with your vote, and make sure you elect a mayor
12	and council members that support these holidays.
13	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.
14	Thank you very much. Thanks for coming in.
15	REVEREND FOSTER: Thank you.
16	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: And next
17	we're going to hear from our next panel is Bayram
18	Mulic, who is Imam from the Bosnia Muslim
19	Community in Queens; Imam Chamsi Ali from the
20	Queens Jamaica Muslim Center; Imam T. Abdur-Rashid
21	from the Mosque of Islamic Brotherhood, and Sadiq

Abdu Malik [phonetic] from the Mosque Al Hafsan

[phonetic] in East 198th Street, the Bronx.

24 Please come forward.

22

23

25

MALE VOICE: Gentlemen, could you

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2 slide down so we can make room for this gentleman 3 right here?

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: And just introduce yourself, your position, and your affiliation, and you may begin.

BAYRAM MULIC: Good morning, My name is Bayram Mulic. I'm the Imam, everyone. and I want to thank you, Council Members, and especially you, Council Member Jackson, for your leadership and support in putting this hearing. I'm the Imam of the Bosnian community in Queens, which is a cultural center and a Mosque for the past 16 years in district 22, Council Member Peter Vallone's district where I also reside. Thousands of Muslims from Eastern European origin, mostly from former Yugoslavia and other communities are congregants of our mosque, and are active in our cultural center. Our congregation came here in the 1970s and the 1980s, fleeing persecution in the places like Bosnia because they were Muslims. In America, they have made their lives, have become citizens, vote, and have children born and raised in this country. Every year hundreds of parents in our Mosque come to me during Eids and

24

25

2	ask me to write letters to their children's
3	principals asking to excuse them from the school.
4	Parents worry that their children will get in
5	trouble or get an unexcused absence, so they ask
6	me to write letters. I get so many requests from
7	parents that I have actually developed forms to
8	fill out for families because it's too much to
9	write individual letters. I myself have four
10	children, and I know that if we have the Eids as
11	official school holidays, Muslim youth born and
12	raised in this country will feel even more proud
13	to be New Yorkers and Americans, and more accepted
14	in the post 9/11 society that they are now growing
15	up in. There will be increased tolerance and
16	understanding among children and everyone in New
17	York City of the Eid holidays become officially
18	recognized in schools. Therefore, I urge you to
19	pass Resolution 1281. Thank you very much.
20	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.
21	Imam Chamsi Ali. Just identify yourself and your

23 CHAMSI ALI: Thank you Mr.

organization.

Chairman. My name is Chamsi Ali, and I'm the Imam of the 96th Street Islamic Cultural Center of New

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

York, probably the largest in the City, and one of the largest in the nation, and the most diverse mosque in the City. We have over 3,000 people members that attend our religious on a weekly basis. I'm also the director of Jamaica Islamic Center, one of the largest in Queens, if not the largest in Queens, and the most active center in the area. As a scholar of the Koran, and a community leader in New York, I work with thousands of Muslims, Americans, and their young children. Our congregants are a very peaceful family-oriented, and politically active community. They vote, they work hard to improve our communities, and most importantly, we instill in our children these similar values. As you many of you know, the Islamic Cultural Center of New York has a reputation for bringing diverse communities together. We have hosted many interfaith events, and we have had Mayor Bloomberg, Joel Klein, Raymond Kelly, and many of our City Council Members as our quests at the 96th Street Mosque. For many years now my members have been telling me that their families do not feel complete on Eid days. Their children must go to the school, when

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

traditionally it is the day to celebrate with our friend and families, worship, eat special food, and for the kids to learn respect by visiting the community leaders. I'm really concerned for our youth who are just trying to make it in this world. They have typical American dreams of becoming doctors, business people, baseball players, lawyers, or Councilmen like yourselves. But unfortunately, the discrimination they face regularly affects their self-esteem, and the overall quality of their lives. Adding these holidays to the school calendar will create not only a greater awareness of Muslims and Islam, but will show our young people that we truly care. believe that adding these Muslim holidays to the school calendar would also be a good way to build bridges within communities and among different Many of my Jewish and Christian faiths. counterparts also believe that this is an important way to build bridges between our communities. But I think more importantly we want to see our Muslim community to integrate faster and smoother into American society, and they will have not to feel as guests in their own home - - ,

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

the United States of America. And let me just add with this, Mr. Chairman, that America is so beautiful, so powerful. But the beauty and the strength of this country, and particularly this city is because of these two main things. Number one, because of its values. The values that respect diversity, tolerance, freedom, democracy, justice, equality for all. And I think including the Eid Ul-Fitr and Eid Ul-Adha into the calendar of the public schools' holidays, will be one of the ways to show to the Muslim communities that yes, we respect these values. Secondly, that the strength and power of this country, and in particular this city is its religiosity. American people are so religious, and so we want to see our children as so educated, so intelligent, so smart, but at the same time, they must be religious. And that's why they don't have to sacrifice their religious holidays because they want to be smart people. So at the end, I would like to say that I firmly believe you should pass this resolution 1281 to incorporate the Muslim holidays of Eid Ul-Fitr and Eid Ul-Adha as observed school holidays. And thank you, Mr. Chairman.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON:	Thank you.
---	----------------------	------------

Next, Imam T. Abdur-Rachid. Just identify yourself and your affiliation, and you may begin.

AL-HAJJ TALIB ABDUR-RACHID: al-Hajj Talib Abdur-Rachid, Mosque of Islamic Brotherhood. Ladies and Gentlemen of the City Council, peace be unto you all, Shalom Aleichem, As-salaamu-'Alaikum. On behalf of the congregation of the Mosque of Islamic Brotherhood, which is located in the Council Member Inez Dickens' Harlem district, and also on behalf of the Majlis Ash-Shura of New York, also known as the Islamic Leadership Council of this great state in which we live, I want to express my sincere thanks to the Almighty that once again the City Council of New York has been granted the opportunity to exercise leadership in a unique and critical area of human relations. Sixteen vears ago in 1992, I had the honor of speaking before those who then constituted this august body, in calling for the amendment of city legislation governing the determination of alternate side parking regulations. At that time I stated, "Now is the time for you of the City Council to make a

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

bold statement in favor of a multi-cultural pluralistic society." The Council at that time, seeing the wisdom and importance of a dramatic acknowledgement of the evolved demographic of the greatest city in this country, and one of the greatest in the world, saw fit to pass the legislative amendment. And now the suspension of alternate side parking for Eid Ul-Fitr and Eid Ul-Adha is part of New York City's way of life. critical demonstration of leadership and cultural competency had a ripple effect on other cities and states in that observance of the major Muslim holy days became publicly recognized as socially acceptable and religiously necessary in today's This recognition began to be extended to the public school systems of different states. Today in the Tri-State area, as you heard in a previous presentation, the New Jersey cities of Trenton and Patterson, and Atlantic City all have the two major Muslim days of worship on their holy day calendars. Other states such as Michigan and Massachusetts in the city of Boston have followed suit. A trend which began in New York is spreading to other parts of the country, and

appropriately so. This year for the first time, 2 3 the city of Plainfield, New Jersey is closing its 4 schools for the same reason. There, District Information Officer Eric Jones has stated 5 publicly, "We believe in celebrating the diversity 6 of our students, staff, parents, and community, 7 8 and we are excited to embrace this holiday... I think it's a testament to what the Plainfield 9 10 Public Schools is all about. We believe in 11 celebrating who we are. "Reportedly, there are 12 between 300,000 and 350,000 Muslims, nearly 4% of New Jersey's population of approximately 8.7 13 million people, whose children attend school in 14 15 that state. During the course of the day, you will hear of our own city's relevant statistics. 16 17 But it must be stated that the various sources of public information, including the New York City 18 19 Police Department, cite the number of Muslims 20 living in our city as at least 850,000. They are 21 of all ethnic groups, both indigenous and 22 immigrant in origin, and as Chancellor Joel Klein 23 stated at the Islamic Cultural Center of New York at East 96th Street and Third Avenue several years 24 25 ago, the overwhelming majority of Muslim children

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

living in New York City attend public schools. So this is a matter of great importance to Muslim children, as others have said, who stand to benefit from the achievement of a degree of what the founding Imam of the Mosque of Islamic Brotherhood, the late African-American religious leader, Sheik Ul-'Allaama Al-Hajj K. Ahmad Tawfik (May Almighty God have mercy on him), he identified it as a need for "psychological terrafirma" that is afforded by public affirmation of one's way of life. Again, as I stated to your predecessors, the moral and ethical works of such public leadership is immeasurable. And lastly, it is also important for every citizen of New York which continues to benefit from the vision and courage of leaders such as you, and those of the City Council of past years who reject the politics of Islamophobia, and do not hesitate to act in the best interests of all of us regardless of ethnicity, gender, or religion. Once again, we call upon you to act in a decisive manner, and vote for amendment of the Department of Education's calendar to include the Muslim holy days of Eid Ul-Fitr and Eid Ul-Adha. And I thank

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

you very much.

3 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.

4 And next we hear from Sadiq Abdu Malik.

SADIQ ABDU MALIK: I greet you with 5 the Islamic greeting of As-salaamu -'Alaikum.

6

MALE VOICE: Wa Alaikum wa salaam.

SADIQ ABDU MALIK: [Arabic]. And I also greet you in the term in the term in which the prophet of God, Jesus Christ, may the peace and blessings of God be upon him said, he said, "Shalom Alaikum." And this is wishing you peace upon you and your family. One of the great things that a human being an wish upon another is to wish them peace. And al hamdulillah as a Muslim I have the opportunity to wish peace on people every day. And it's one of the greatest things that we do as Muslims from one person to another. I am not an I was made and given a gift and a blessing by - - wa'Taleb by God [phonetic] when seven years ago I became a Muslim. I'm Puerto Rican, born in the Bronx. My family is from Ponce, Puerto Rico and Arecevo [phonetic]. Puerto Rico so a shout out to Ponce and Arecevo. Bon vie plena [phonetic]. And I have spent my time as a Muslim

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

then as a D'aii [phonetic] calling people to Islam with an emphasis on comparative religion. When I became Muslim, I immediately started to study extremely hard, and in my studies, it got me closer to becoming a Muslim. And all the religion that I studied, it strengthened my Islamic faith. Let me speak to you about a people who are much maligned. [Pause] Who face a lot of problems in this country right now. I as a Puerto-Rican American who grew up in this country during the civil-rights movement have grown to hate that type of thing. My father in 1951 or 1949, I forget when it was, on Southern Boulevard, they broke his They attacked him. I'm not going to say back. who it was, but they did a good thing, because because they broke his back, he didn't go to Korea, and I was born, and my brothers were born. But racism is a hard and terrible thing, and the baseball bat of racism is ignorance. What his holiday will do would be to combat ignorance. When you and I get to know each other and who we are and what we are, we begin to become closer. We begin to develop love for each other. We begin to develop an understanding. It translates to our

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

children in the schools where the children would ask, "What is this Eid Ul-Adha and Eid Ul-Fitr? What is it about?" The children explain, they get to know each other. It raises them in their social skills where they now concentrate on understanding each other and developing relationships that go on a bigger plane. To adopt this is among the most important things that we can do in the United States of America here in New York City, because it makes a statement of the American ideal, what it should be. You see, at one time these men here, they wrote great things. They wrote the Constitution, they wrote the Bill of Rights, but unfortunately what they wrote, it applied to some people, not all. While they wrote the Constitution and wrote the Bill of Independence, and these things, there were people who were held outside. The American Indians and the Africans, while these rights were written, they were held outside. So we as a people in accepting this will do a great thing. In other words, like we say in the streets, keep it real. America, keep it real to the ideals that make this country great. Acceptance of all people,

2.0

2.3

2	accepting religion, respecting religion,
3	respecting rights of others, and conquering the
4	barriers that divide us. So this is very
5	important. As-salaamu -'Alaikum. Thank you very
6	much.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Let me thank you all for coming in and giving testimony on this very important issue. I want to ask all of you whether or not you have spoken with the Mayor as religious leaders of our City, representing the Muslim community and/or the Chancellor about this Resolution, and what type of response did you receive, if any, from them? Just identify yourself before you speak, if you don't mind.

CHAMSI ALI: Imam Chamsi Ali of the 96th Cultural Center. If not mistaken, four years ago we had an Iftar event with the Mayor in his home, and I had an opportunity to say to him that is it possible to make Eid? At that time I mentioned only Eid Ul-Fitri as a holiday in New York City.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Can you distinguish for those that do not know the difference between the two holidays, if you don't

mind.

CHAMSI ALI: EIQ UI-FITTI IS TO
commemorate the end of Ramadan, and we are going
to do that this coming October 1st or September
30th. While Eid Ul-Adha is to commemorate the
sacrifice of Abraham of his child, Ishmael for us
Muslims, and for you Christians and Jewish, Isaac.
These are the two holidays that we really honor in
our religion. So the response was he said, "Let
me think about it." That's what he said. So when
Joel Klein came to the 96th Street Mosque I again
sat down with him, and the issue we raised at that
time was about the Muslim staff and Muslim
teachers and high-school students, if they may
take some one hour during Friday. And then we
came up also to the Eid Ul-Fitr and the Eid Ul-
Adha, and he said to us very nicely that, let me
talk to my staff. "Let me think about this. And
I think it's a very good thing to consider."
That's what he responded to us at the time when he
came to the 96th Street Islamic Cultural Center.
CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: But that was
a couple of years ago. What about now? Since
this resolution has only been put in no more than

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

a year ago, six months ago, has anyone approached them recently, and what type of response, if any, have you received?

TALEB ABDUR-RACHID: Imam Taleb Abdur-Rachid. I don't think that there's been a recent approach. Again, months ago, a couple of years ago a number of Muslim leaders, not just the Imams, and not just even Muslims, but a diverse group of leaders in the community, Rabbis, etc., attempted to get an appointment to speak to the Mayor about this, and ended up speaking with staff members. And that's kind of intensified our common effort to really ratchet this struggle up. Since that time, as unions and other people have come onboard, we who are religious leaders in the Muslim community, we've really been so preoccupied with moving things to this point that we haven't approached him as a body. And I think that we'll take some instruction from your question, and endeavor to do that yesterday. Would you agree, Imams?

BAYRAM MULIC: It's very hard to get access to the Mayor.

25 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Just identify

22

23

24

25

yourself for the record, please.

3 BAYRAM MULIC: Imam Bayram Mulic, 4 from Bosnian Community. It's almost impossible, because there is a public pressure that talking to 5 Muslim is talking to the terrorist. This is how 6 7 the public, how the media portrays it, 8 unfortunately. So there is a saying of our saint Ali - - , he says, "People are enemies when they 9 10 don't know each other." Martin Luther King built upon that and said, but why, it's because they 11 don't live with one another. Now we live with one 12 another. It is the reality that Muslims are one 13 million in New York City, and the Muslim 14 15 population will grow. I would like to ask my Jewish brothers and sisters here in the Council 16 17 Chambers and Christian brothers, how would you feel if your son or daughter is feeling inferior 18 19 in the school just because of their religion? would you feel? 20 21

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Appropriate question. But I want to thank you all for coming in and giving testimony, and I look forward to working with you on this matter. Thank you. Our next panel is Amina Rachman, Special Assistant for

2	the President of United Federation of Teachers;
3	Maf Misbah Uddin, the Treasurer of DC37, and the
4	President of Local 1407 of DC37, and Fadila
5	Mrkulic from 32BJ. Please come forward. We have
6	also been joined by our colleague Inez Dickens of
7	Manhattan. Just identify yourself, and you may
8	begin your testimony.
9	AMINA RACHMAN: Thank you.
10	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Pull the mic
11	up.
12	AMINA RACHMAN: Good afternoon. I
13	was going to say, well, it's still morning.
14	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Still good
15	morning.
16	AMINA RACHMAN: It's slipping away.
17	Good morning. I'm Amina Rachman, Special
18	Assistant to Randy Weingarten, the President of
19	the United Federation of Teachers here to offer
20	testimony in support of Council Resolution 1281.
21	I'll move through this quickly because I don't
22	think my testimony says anything significantly
23	different from what others have said. The United
24	Federation of Teachers respects and celebrates
25	diversity; the diversity of our student

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

population, the diversity of our own membership in our union, and the diversity reflected in the staffing of our city's public schools. mixture of cultures and ethnicities and religions so evident in our schools is one of the characteristics for which this city is famous. In the schools, that diversity can be a marvelous tool to prepare our children for future study and work in the global landscape. We're truly an international city, and our schools are a microcosm of the world. And because we respect religious diversity as represented in our schools, we recognize that students have the right to observe the special days in their religious calendars. We join in support of the students and parents and educators who are seeking a way to incorporate Muslim holidays into the existing school calendar. We understand that all parties will need to come to the table, and work together to find a common ground, and a way to do this to fit these holidays into the calendar. pleased to hear that the Department of Education values and promotes an atmosphere where religious observance can be accommodated. That's what the

Chancellor's Regulation says. The current
guidelines in Chancellor's Reg. A630 reinforce the
importance of commemorating these days, and the
UFT is asking the City Council to continue to
advocate for our children and their families. No
child, and you will hear this again and again
today, that no child should be asked to choose
between maintaining religious and family
traditions and being successful in school. Now
the UFT is willing, I'm not coming here to say
that we've mapped out a way to do this, but we are
willing to sit at the table with all of the
stakeholders and the Department of Education, and
begin this discussion, and find a reasonable
solution that supports our Muslim students and
their families, while maintaining and enabling us
to achieve the educational standards and
requirements set by the New York State Department
of Education. So as I said, my testimony doesn't
say anything earthshaking or strikingly different.
I think what's significant is that I am here from
the United Federation of Teachers making it, and
speaking out in support of this resolution.
CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Next.

MAF MISBAH UDDIN: Good morning.

4 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Good morning.

MAF MISBAH UDDIN: Chairman,

Brother Robert Jackson, because you have a union card, honorable members of the Education Committee, my name is Maf Misbah Uddin. I am the first among six to nine million Muslims to lead a municipal union in the United States of America, which is Local 1407, the Accountants and Actuaries of the City of New York. And also I am the Treasurer for 56 local unions representing 125,000 members and 60,000 active retirees who worked. I'm also a member of the steering committee as a Vice Chair of the Municipal Labor Committee representing 325,000 city employees, and a member of the International Executive Board of the Asian Pacific American Labor Alliance, known as APALA, a constituent group of the AFL-CIO. Above all, I as a Muslim American while raising five children with the last one still in public school, served the entire community of 42,000 people voluntarily for over 12 years on the Board of Directors, first as

Treasurer, and then as President of the

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Parkchester South Condominium in the South Bronx, the largest condominium complex in the United States of America. I'm thankful to this committee for holding this hearing, and feel honored as a strong supporter of Resolution number 1281, and calling upon the state legislature to pass, and the governor to sign into law Assembly 6589, State Senate 3142, and act to amend the Education law in relation to requiring that Eid Ul-Fitr and Eid Ul-Adha be school holidays in the school district of the City of New York. I will not give the description of Eid Ul-Fitr and Eid Ul-Adha because Imam Chamsi Ali tried to do so. As a whole, these two Eid holidays are the most joyous occasions, similar to Christmas in its celebration and with the same intensity of religious significance, celebrating the achievement of absolute devotion to the most important ideals of Islam and turning the aforementioned idealist principles into action. It is a day of forgiveness, moral victory, and peace of congregation, fellowship, brotherhood, and unity. In a tradition that is handed on to ensure that our children hold fast to this ever-significant ideal of helping the

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

community over the self, shouldn't we make sure that traditional values such as community, brotherhood, and taking care of the impoverished and less fortunate be among those that our children carry with them through these turbulent times, and looking forward, make the world a better place than we did? Approximately 12% of our public school population is Muslim. The children's psyche growing up in America, whose constitutional values sound more like appreciation for each religion than tolerance, is that my American education and my religion cannot and should not coincide. The values I have been taught, such as giving to the poor, and putting my community before myself are dichotomous in relation to education and science and mathematics. Why dry that line when these values are necessary for any society to flourish hand in hand, no matter the differences in creed? These factors should be of utmost consideration to whom it may concern as Islam is the fastest-growing religion from a local to a global level. Senator Hillary Rodman Clinton, the then first lady, stated a decade ago that, "Islam is the fastest-growing

2	religion in America, a guide and pillar of
3	stability for many of our people." I quote: Los
4	Angeles Times, May 31, 1996, page 34. Michael
5	Kress, graduated from the Harvard Divinity School,
6	states that considering the dramatic changes in
7	America's religious makeup, it makes sense that a
8	growing number of Muslim school children are
9	experiencing opposite emotions. They are faced to
10	choose on their holidays between school or
11	religious observance, and their parents resent it
12	with the number of Muslims in American estimated
13	to be six million. It is meant as a joyous
14	occasion in which glad tidings are to be brought
15	to anyone and everyone encountered
16	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Mr. Uddin.
17	Can you please wrap up, if you don't mind? I'm
18	sorry.
19	MAF MISBAH UDDIN: Definitely, I
20	will do so
21	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.
22	MAF MISBAH UDDIN: I just want to
23	mention that this movement has begun all across
24	the country: New Jersey, Michigan. Apart from
25	that, the unions across this country. Recently

2.0

you saw in August 6th, Steven Greenhouse reported	
in the "New York Times," the Retail, Wholesale,	
and Department Store Union (RWDSU) representing	
100,000 in the United States and Canada, and Tyson	
Foods in Shelbyville, Tennessee, has reached an	
agreement to increase the number of paid holidays	
for workers with the Muslim observance of Eid Ul-	
Fitr as one of those paid holidays. This is the	
union coming for the same issue. I brought	
185,000 union members support to you for the same	
cause.	

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.

MAF MISBAH UDDIN: One more minute. Islam has not just recently started making its mark in American society. I was surprised, and you might be too, Muslims reached North America 300 years before Christopher Columbus is credited with having discovered it. Even researchers say that Christopher Columbus logged in his diary on October 21st, 1492 that he saw the mosque in Cuba, in Mexico, in Texas, in Nevada.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you,

24 sir.

25 MAF MISBAH UDDIN: Yes. I will now

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

conclude by saying, I am ready, willing, able to
answer any questions you may have. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.

Next Fadila Mrkulic, 32BJ.

FADILA MRKULIC: Thank you, Chairman. Good morning Council Members, ladies, and gentlemen. My name is Fadila Mrkulic. been a member of this great Union 32BJ for 36 years, and I'm very active in my union. I stand here before you this morning to testify about Muslim school holidays Resolution, and encourage you to support it. I live in Astoria, Queens, and I'm a constituent of the great Councilmember Peter Vallone. There are hundreds and hundreds of my brothers and sisters members of union living in Astoria that support this campaign. I would like to tell you today about my story being as a Muslim, a 32BJ proud member, and how much the Eid holiday means to me personally and to my family. I came to this great country 37 years ago from Bosnia, was ethnic cleansing. People used to die just because they were Muslim. The Eid holiday means to us what Christmas means here. Families get together, celebrate, and worship together, so

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

when I first came to this country, I would get so excited weeks before an Eid holiday. realized very soon that celebrating Eid here would be very difficult because my husband and my children couldn't stay home for Eid. I would cry because I would stay up all night preparing my house, and cook all night, but in the morning, everybody had to leave. I could not simply be with my kids, and celebrate that day. I felt empty inside of me. I could not be with my kids on Eid. I have four children, all of whom went to public schools in New York City. My kids would come to me every holiday, "Mom, why can't we stay home like our friends? Why can't we celebrate together?" Sometimes I would let my kids stay home on Eid, but then I would hear from school who told me I had to send my kids to school. I stopped, and I gave up, and I told my children they had to go to school, and that we would wait until the weekend to celebrate. Let me tell you something though. I am very grateful for my union because in my union, we have Eid off. I remember that one day, the day before the Eid holiday, my supervisor actually came to me and shook my hand

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

and said to me, "Have a great holiday tomorrow, Fadila." That gave me tears in my eyes, because it made me feel, wow, this is America. Here I am equal, especially coming from the place where they were killing Muslims. Next week it will be an Eid again, sorry, and I can't stay home. God bless my union, and my President, Mike Fishman that gave us this opportunity. I hope dear Council members that you can see in your heart and in your soul also, and give us this holiday to our children. Even my children didn't have an opportunity to be with me on that day, I hope their children, and I hope hundreds and thousands of other Muslim parents and children in New York City don't have to be without the kids on Eid in the future. are not asking for financial assistance, we're not asking for anything that difficult to do. just asking our kids to be home with us on this holiday without being reprimanded. Even though my kids have graduated and are now older, I want other kids and their families to be able not to worry. Please pass this Resolution and make a statement, like many other cities, that we value diversity of New York City and the Muslim

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

community. Thank you, and God bless you, and Godbless America.

4 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.

5 Thank you. Councilmember John Liu of Queens.

We've been joined by Councilmember Bill DeBlasio of Brooklyn. Councilmember Liu.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LIU: Thank you, Mr.

I want to thank this panel and the Chairman. previous panels and the subsequent panels for coming today. I really want to thank everybody for joining us a City Hall today, and as you know, for a number of years, we have commemorated Eid right here in these very chambers. Councilmember Jackson and myself, Christine Quinn, and all of our colleagues, and we always say, or at least in the opening remarks, I let everybody know, everybody who comes to our Eid commemoration in this room that this is the room that the Council meets in every other week to vote on legislation that pertains to the eight million people of New York City. And it's only fitting that in this very room we commemorate Eid. But I also say that don't only come for commemorations of such special occasions. This is the place where we make the

2	laws. And so I know this is the first time for
3	many of the people here being in this chamber
4	listening to the testimony on legislation pending
5	before the City Council. And I just think that
6	it's been such a great sight to behold to see that
7	more and more New Yorkers, especially Muslim
8	American New Yorkers taking part in our
9	legislative process. This is a Resolution that I
10	have every expectation will move forth because it
11	has the full support of our Chairman, Robert
12	Jackson, and many members of the City Council.
13	And I think we all understand that this
14	Resolution, once it is passed, is just a step in
15	the progress that needs to be made to make this a
16	reality. We will go to the Department of
17	Education, we will go to the other side of City
18	Hall to really pound in the message that this is
19	important. It's important for Muslim American New
20	Yorkers, it is important for all New Yorkers. So
21	really, once again, I don't have a lot of
22	questions because I think these things that are
23	being said are pretty self-evident, and they
24	answer for themselves. But I think it's just
25	great that everybody's here. Continue to keep up

1	COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION 77
2	the activism until this is done. Thank you.
3	Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
4	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you,
5	Councilmember Liu. Let me thank the panel for
6	coming in. We appreciate your testimony. Yes?
7	FADILA MRKULIC: Can I say one more
8	thing, Chairman, please?
9	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Sure. Go
10	ahead, please.
11	FADILA MRKULIC: I just want to
12	forgive each and every one of you, if you will
13	please forgive me that I tear up because 1992 in
14	Bosnia where I came from my relatives, my friends,
15	many of them died because we were just simply
16	Muslims. And to me, this is very touching. And
17	God bless President Clinton. He's the one who
18	intervened and saved a lot of Muslims because
19	Serbs, they used to take truckloads of Muslims,
20	boys and men, and throw them in a pit. And I hope
21	you pass this resolution. It would mean a lot to
22	me. Thank you so much.

23 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you. 24 Amina Rachman? I'm sorry. Did you want to say 25 something?

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2 AMINA RACHMAN: Yes. I just wanted 3 to add one thing that's not an official statement

from the United Federation of Teachers, it's--

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Yes.

AMINA RACHMAN: --it's a statement from me, personally, since we're talking about diversity and tolerance [pause] there can be proone religious group's rights without being antianyone else's. And as we move forward in doing this, I would urge the members of the Council and all of the people from various religious groups in the audience who support this resolution, to move forward with this in a spirit of unity that is representative of the diversity an tolerance of our city. Share something personal that I don't usually say. My name is Amina Rachman, and I think there are people in the room who jump to a conclusion about that name. I'm not a Muslim, I'm a Jew. And when we start talking about having this holiday with the suggestion that, and I'm not saying anyone in the Council has done that or in this audience in speaking, but I have heard it at meetings outside. We need to move forward on this with a caution that including a new group as this

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

population has taken a bigger piece of the stage in the United States and in the City does not mean pushing anyone else off the stage. New York is a diverse city, and one of the things that we need to teach our children, and want to teach our children is to love with, and really appreciate and celebrate that diversity. And we say that a lot, but I'd really like for people to think deeply inside themselves about how we make that an actuality, and what that really means. We've seen others come into power and positions, and think that means mistreat someone else. We want to move forward with this in a real New York City spirit. My son, and Judaism, not growing as fast as Islam, maybe not growing at all, but diversity in Judaism exists. I think there are assumptions about what Jews look like. A lot of Jews look like me. Myson gets harassed in school for being an African-American and a Jew. And my son decides very cautiously which friends he tells and when he tells them. And I think we need to think about that in terms of lots of kids and families in this city, and really, really, really respect and celebrate the diversity here. Thank you.

2	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Let me thank
3	you for sharing your personal family situation,
4	and I think that that is real, and you said it.
5	Let's move forward in the spirit of unity for the
6	diversity of our great city. So thank you all for
7	coming in. Our next panel is Zachia Ensari
8	[phonetic] from the New York City Coalition for
9	Educational Justice, Muslim Coalition of Muslim
10	Holidays; Aminata Salah [phonetic], New
11	Settlement; and Alia Ashad [phonetic] from the
12	South Asian Youth Action; and Mohammed Sharif from
13	the Parent Action Committee. Please come forward.
14	[Pause]
15	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Just
16	introduce yourself, and you may begin your
17	testimony.
18	ZACHIA ENSARI: Good morning. As-
19	salaamu -'Alaikum. My name is Zachia Ensari, and
20	I'm a parent member with the New York City
21	Coalition for Educational Justice and a proud
22	member to be part of this Muslim coalition as

well. I am a parent with eight children, and have 24 been advocating as a parent leader with the New

York City Coalition for Educational Justice around 25

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

educational issues for two years. I would like to thank Councilman Jackson for sponsoring Resolution 1281, and praise all the Council members that have signed on in support of it. In the past when I've testified, I think I was probably seen as a parent who was a Muslim, but the reality is that I am a Muslim who is a parent. I speak as a representative for the over 600,000 Muslim families in New York City who stand united on this issue. We are a community who cares about our children, and who feel that recognizing Eid Ul-Fitr and Eid Ul-Adha would make a statement that the Muslim community is an important and accepted part of our city. As we approach the end of Ramadan next week, it is an exciting and important time to be with our families and communities. Some may be sewing or buying special outfits for their day, and deciding where to go for Eid prayer. In my home, my children are already planning what the menu will be for breakfast and dinner, and who will be cooking what. They are excited about who might come over, and what gifts they might receive. Unfortunately, they also have anxiety about school, and whether or not they will

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

miss important class work or a test. Year after year, my children at the different levels of their educational journey, including college, have to constantly remind their teachers that they won't be in on the day of Eid. I often have to physically take absence letters to the attendance office so that they are marked as an excused Just yesterday, my daughter, who is a absence. sophomore at NYU told me that one of her professors was cancelling class because of Rosh Hashanah. I thought that was great. But my question to her was why not for Eid? increasing number of school districts around the country, including communities in Michigan and neighbors across the bridge in New Jersey are incorporating these holidays into the school calendar as we've heard. New York City has often been the leader in this country in regards to so many different things: fashion, art, music, and even education. With about 12% of the New York City population being Muslim, more than 100,000 students, I hope that after today we'll be joining them in officially adding our school calendar. Вy recognizing Eid Ul-Fitr and Eid Ul-Adha as

2	official days, and granting all children off, will
3	bring an awareness of the importance and
4	acceptance of the Muslim community as valued and
5	respected. In closing, over the years, the school
6	calendar has evolved. It went from observing
7	Christmas and other Christian holidays,
8	recognizing Jewish holidays, Martin Luther King
9	day, and all are as they should be, recognized.
10	The wonderful thing though about New York City is
11	that it continues to evolve, and with the Muslim
12	population having grown, it is time for change
13	once again. We've definitely come a long way.
14	Alternate side of the street parking is suspended,
15	some channels wish us happy Eid, and many
16	calendars now mark the beginning and end of
17	Ramadan. Now we look to our representatives and
18	DOE to invest in our children, and make Eid Ul-
19	Fitr and Eid Ul-Adha official days off on the
20	calendar that really counts. Pass Resolution
21	1281. Thank you.
22	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.
23	Aminata Salah, New Settlement.
24	AMINATA SALAH: Please listen up.

I have something important to say.

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Okay. Can
3 you pull the mic a little closer to your mouth so
4 we can hear you a little louder, if you don't

5 mind? Thank you.

AMINATA SALAH: Please listen up. I have something important to say. My name is Aminata Salah, and I'm in the sixth grade at I'm here as member of the Parent Action MS218. Committee and New Settlement. I'm here on behalf of over 700 people who attended a community forum in the Bronx on Wednesday to say that schools should be closed on the Eids. It is a very special holiday for us, just like Christmas is special to others. It's not fair. When people see us with our traditional African clothes, I want them to know why we celebrate Eid. I want them to say, "Hey, happy Eid celebration," instead of them not knowing what is Eid, and staring at us. If the schools recognize our holiday, my classmates might ask me about my culture. That would make me feel excited, because I'll be more included in school. I don't want to have to choose between my education and my religion. want to have perfect attendance. I want to hand

18

19

2.0

21

22

23

24

25

2	in all my homeworks on time, and do well on tests
3	so I can go to college and be successful in life.
4	My religion should not interfere with that. I
5	find school not being closed on Eids kind of
6	disrespectful. It's like saying people don't care
7	about why we're celebrating. Please recognize
8	that we are here to stay because we are part of
9	this community just like you are. I'd like to
10	give thanks to my Councilmember Helen Diane Foster
11	for supporting something that I believe in.
12	Please close the schools on Muslim holidays now so
13	I can experience it before I graduate. And that's
14	why I'm here today.
15	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.
16	Thank you. Next we hear from Alia Ashad.

Thank you. Next we hear from Alia Ashad.

SPEAKER ASHAD: Good afternoon, ladies and gentlemen, and Council members. Today I'm here representing South Asian Youth Action which is a South Asian nonprofit organization in Queens. But most importantly I represent today Muslim students all over New York City. I've been born and raised in New York, I've been part of public schools my entire life from elementary school to junior high school and high school, and

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I now attend Hunter College. But I wanted to come here today, and basically give my testimony on my high-school experience with celebrating Eid. All morning, we have basically heard that students should not have to choose between their faith and their education. And in my experience throughout high school, I had to choose, and I chose going to school on every Eid for four years. I did not celebrate Eid with my family, and it's something that really has affected me, and I feel like the second I heard that there was going to be a hearing, I took the opportunity to come here and basically have my voice heard, and say that I think it's very important and very crucial for students throughout public schools in New York City to have this holiday off. Most importantly, I think it's important here to basically give the audience and Council members an idea of what it's like not to celebrate Eid because you have to choose education over it, and vice-versa; missing out a day of school because you want to celebrate Eid with your family. It's very hard because there are so many things that you miss out in one day of college. I went to Forest Hills High

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

School, and I was honored to have graduated from that school. And it was very hard for me to think, "Okay. I can't go to school today because it's Eid." But then I have to think, "No. I have to go to class, there's an exam. There's no way my teacher is going to let me make it up." And so I did take the choice of staying in class every Eid, and it did create problems at home because my family would have to then reschedule celebrations to the evening. Because then again, people do debate that, "Oh, well, a student could come home after school, 3:00 o'clock is standard time, and celebrate then." But the most crucial time on Eid, portion of the day is the morning. And that's one thing that I regret missing for four years straight, is missing my Eid prayer at my local - - in Flushing. And I think that's the most crucial part of having to choose between education and Eid. Being that I was unable to participate in the Eid prayer in the morning, I missed out in my neighborhood Muslim community along with spending time with my family on this one crucial day. And I think that I just want to come here, I want to make it very short.

2	heard amazing stories from students, and I think
3	it's very important. Being a college student as
4	well, I'm still experiencing having to choose
5	taking an exam or going to a course or missing
6	Eid. And we're fortunate this year to have Rosh
7	Hashanah come in the same time period of Eid this
8	year, and I'm so grateful for that. But it's
9	something that's sad that I can't say, "Well, we
LO	have off because it's Eid as well." So I think
11	that's something that I would be honored to say
12	that I had some part of that. So I think it's
13	really important for this holiday to become a
L4	holiday, if that makes any sense. That does.
15	Thank you.
L6	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.
L7	Mohammed Sharif, Parent Action Committee.
L8	MOHAMMED SHARIF: Good afternoon,
L9	ladies and gentlemen. Good afternoon, Chairman
20	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Good
21	afternoon.
22	MOHAMMED SHARIF:distinguished
23	guests, and all the honorable speakers that have
24	spoken.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Can you pull

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

the mic up a little closer, if you don't mind?

MOHAMMED SHARIF: I hereby

represent the Islamic Cultural Center of the Bronx and the Bronx Muslim Jamaa, and I'm a member of the Parent Action Committee. I work at the Bronx Defenders as an advocate for low-income parents. A 90% majority of my clients are people who have been denied certain privileges, and the same thing applies to what we are here for today. involvement with the Muslim holidays campaign came about a few years ago on a day of Eid Ul-Adha. When we woke up in the morning, my son had to go to school, and I wanted him, and he also wanted to be with me at the Masjid so he could be part of the congregation that day. And he didn't want to have even 99% attendance. He always wants the 100% attendance because they compete. He competes with his sister to get the 100% attendance. the question he raised up to me when we were going to the Masjid was that why don't we have a holiday on this very important day? This is a question I couldn't answer, and I still don't know the answer. And I'm posing the question to the panel here, Mr. Jackson, as the Chairman, and our

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

representative, I believe you will answer this question for my son. And I told my son one thing, a day will come when we will all sit together as Muslims, and celebrate our Eids without missing I went through that when I was in college. I went through Eids and at times if my exam fell on the Eid day, I had to go. don't want my kids to go through that. And Mr. Jackson and your panel, this is your question. When is this going to end? We need your help. It's time for us to put an end to it. We should be recognized. New York represents the world. have at least citizens of every nation of the world in New York City here today. By passing this Resolution today, Resolution 1281 means you're empowering the Muslim community all over the world. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Well, thank

you. You can tell your son that myself as the

Chair of the Education Committee, and as a Muslim,

we're working on it in order to try to communicate

loud and clear. And hopefully this body soon will

vote on the Resolution that will send a clear

message that the City Council of New York supports

the two holiest holidays in the Muslim calendar being incorporated into the school calendar. And it will be up to the Mayor and the Chancellor to do that. And so as someone said, we're focusing on this as a community, and with support from many other individuals, and many other communities that are not Muslims that believe in respect and diversity. So hopefully soon. Hopefully soon rather than later. And let me just thank Aminata for coming in as a young student.

AMINATA SALAH: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: You represent yourself and your colleagues very well. And we are all proud of you. We're all very proud of you. You spoke very well. And for the young college student, let me just say that given the example of what you had to do, and the choices that you had to make, you brought it out loud and clear for everyone to, I guess, understand that these are tough decisions that should not have to be made. So thank you all for coming in. Our next panel is the Reverend Massoud Aboud Sayadela [phonetic] from the Episcopal Diocese of New York, and Rabbi Michael Feinberg from the Greater New

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

2.0

21

22

23

24

25

	2	York	Labor-Religion	Coalition,	and Reverend N	N.J
--	---	------	----------------	------------	----------------	-----

L'Heureux, Jr.--I'm sorry if I mispronounce your

4 name--from the Queens Federation of Churches.

5 Please come forward. And Kadir Dixon, Renaissance

6 Leadership Academy. Please come forward.

7 [Pause]. Please identify yourself, and you may

begin in the order in which you were called.

9 Could you press the button.

SPEAKER ULLAH: I'm Father Massoud ibn Said Ullah [phonetic] from the Episcopal Diocese of New York, a priest of the Diocese of New York, and I am also the Chair of the Episcopal-Muslim Relations Committee of the Episcopal Diocese of New York. I hope it's not confusing for you that I have an Arabic name, and I am a Christian. Our committee began its work in 1991 long before many people thought it was necessary to begin to raise consciousness and to develop relationship between the Muslim community and the non-Muslim community. But there was a team of us way back then who thought it was vital to do. Knowing that there were more and more Muslim people within the society, we thought it was vital for relationships to be forged, and so

2	we began to do that work even at a time when it
3	was not seen as necessary by many. We saw that as
4	the case largely because of the kind of mandate
5	that we as Episcopal Christians have.
6	Periodically throughout the year, we recommit
7	ourselves to strive for justice and peace among
8	all people, and to respect the dignity of every
9	human being. And so that becomes the basis for
10	our work, and it becomes the basis for our support
11	of Resolution 1281. It's vital that in such a
12	diverse society, a city as we have as New York,
13	that there be increased education among all of us.
14	Much of the strife and negative things that we've
15	experienced come out of a lack of understanding, a
16	lack of respect, a lack of appreciation for the
17	other. And so we feel that as a part of our
18	Christian spiritual religious commitment, to
19	promote such education, to promote such
20	experiences and policies within the society that
21	will bring about a greater sense of appreciation.
22	It goes really beyond tolerance to really
23	appreciation and even celebration of the other.
24	The public school system is a very important place
25	for such principles and values to be brought

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

forth, and so we support this resolution with the hope that it will not only be beneficial for students who are Muslim, but also for non-Muslims to gain a better understanding and respect for all of the people of this City. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.

Next, Rabbi Michael Feinberg, Greater New York Labor-Religion Coalition.

SPEAKER FEINBERG: Good afternoon. I'd like to begin by thanking you, Chairperson Jackson for your leadership on this issue, and for convening these hearings, and for giving us all the opportunity to testify here today. I'm Rabbi Michael Feinberg. I'm a member of the Steering Committee of the Muslim Holiday Coalition, and I'm also Executive Director of the Greater New York Labor-Religion Coalition, an interfaith workerrights and economic-justice advocacy organization with members in all five boroughs of the City. I'm here today representing our network of more than 700 religious leaders and their congregations across the City, drawn from many diverse faith traditions: Christian, Hindu, Jewish, Muslim, and others. And I want to say that as a coalition, we

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

strongly support the full civil and religious rights of the Muslim community here in New York City, a large growing and vital community as we've heard, both immigrant and U.S.-born. As religious leaders, we believe that an essential part of this equality consists in the formal recognition of the two principal Muslim holidays, the two Eids by the Department of Education as official school holidays. Muslim students, as we've heard them testify to eloquently this morning, in the public school system should not have to choose between full participation in their own education and observance of their religious faith, holidays, and rituals. No such choice is asked of Jewish or Christian students, nor should it be of anyone. This is a matter of simple justice and equity, one that is important to religious community leaders regardless of their own faith. In New York, our single greatest asset is the diversity of our residents in our communities, both ethnically and religiously. As a city, we need to affirm and respect this diversity, and reflect it in our city laws and regulations. And as my esteem colleague, Imam Abdur-Rachid noted before, the inclusion of

the Muslim holidays in the alternate side of the
street parking calendar, our semi-official
calendar for the city, was a first important step
in this effort. The next step is for the City
Council and ultimately the Mayor's office to
extend this principle of full inclusion and
respect to the tens of thousands of Muslim
students under the umbrella of the Department of
Education. As religious community leaders, we
urge you to do so with all due promptness. And
I'd like to add from my own tradition, Judaism,
we're in a very special moment of the year. It's
the lead up to Rosh Hashanah, the Jewish New Year,
and it's a time that communally and individually
we reflect and sort of do soul searching, and
recommit ourselves to our highest ideals. So it
feels to me particularly appropriate that we
gather this morning in that period to recommit
ourselves communally to our highest ideals of
diversity, respect, full equality, and justice.
Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.

And next we hear from Reverend N.J. L'Heureux,

Jr., Queens Federation of Churches. And I hope I

2.0

2.	didn't	mispronounce	vour	name.
_	a Lan c	III D D I O I I O U I I C C	y O a L	TIGHT.

REVEREND L'HEUREUX: Second try was closer, but it is difficult to deal with an H at the beginning, an X at the end and two U's in the middle.

7 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Yeah. Help 8 us out.

REVEREND L'HEUREUX: We pronounce it "Larue."

11 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: "Larue."

match the letters either. But good afternoon. I am the Reverend N.J. L'Heureux, Jr., and for the past 30 years I've been privileged to serve as the Executive Director of the Queens Federation of Churches, the ecumenical council of Christian churches in the Borough of Queens. It counts as participants over 390 congregations affiliated with all of the Christian denominations, and many independent churches. Before being called to become the Federation's Director in 1978, I served as pastor of the Maspeth United Methodist Church, also in Queens. As a member of the Christian Clergy, and a leader of the religious community

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

here in New York City, I am here this morning to voice strong support for Council Resolution 1218 and its underlying purpose, the creation of two public school holidays for members of the Islamic faith. There are many reasons for this. One, it advances religious liberty by removing a government-created burden against religious Second, it promotes the values of our practice. American society of immigrants by welcoming and affirming the faith and culture of this growing population in our midst. Third, it provides an important teachable moment whereby those of us whose faith and culture are different may be afforded an opportunity to learn about, and to appreciate the Muslim faith of our neighbors. fourth, for those who may not be persuaded to travel the high-minded road, we must also recognize that absences on school days, even excused absences, result in a loss of state education funding to the New York City public school system. Failing to do the right thing here results in a fiscal penalty that affects adversely all of the children in our public schools. For nearly a quarter century, I've been an active

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

member of the Committee on Religious Liberty of the National Council of Churches, and I have served as the staff moderator of that committee since the year 2000. I am both keenly aware of, and passionately committed to the bedrock principles of religious liberty enshrined in our nation's charter. It is wrong, both as a matter of law and equity, to prefer some religions over others. It is especially wrong to put the adherence of any faith to the choice between obedience to the requirements of their faith on the one hand, or the receipt of government benefit on the other. Here public school children are forced to choose between their lessons and exams necessary for their education versus faithfulness to their religious commitments. The two Eid holidays are celebrations that require presence of the Muslim students in the mosque, in the morning, for communal prayer, and continue their celebration both congregationally and in family throughout the day. School children should not be forced to choose between lessons and their God. We are a society of immigrants coming over the past four centuries from many different countries,

suffused with many different cultures, and
worshiping God in many different faith traditions.
Our society has benefited as each new immigrant
takes his or her place beside the older immigrant,
and learns to break bread together in fellowship.
I celebrate the diversity that we have in Queens
in New York City, and recognize that we are truly
as a global city likely to suffer greatly, not
only in our image, but in our values by not doing
what is right here. Finally, I noted that the
official designation of these two holidays as
public school holidays would be a teachable
moment. Our schools are extraordinarily deficient
when it comes to helping any of us understand the
deep commitments of our neighbors. In a
misbegotten fear of somehow violating the
establishment clause, our public school system has
almost completely excised any reference to deity,
faith, or religion other than in a few cases where
it's either negative or in virtual caricature.
Having the holiday alongside other religious
holidays will provide a good opportunity to have a
classroom discussion of the observance and what it
means to the members of that faith. This should

2	be done with Yom Kippur, Passover, Christmas,
3	Easter, and both of the Eid celebrations. I am
4	well aware that Muslim children today can take the
5	holiday as an excused absence. Beside putting
6	them at a disadvantage educationally and
7	personally in doing so, this puts the whole public
8	school system at a disadvantage because of the
9	loss of state reimbursement. With the growing
10	number of Muslim students in our schools currently
11	estimated at 12%, this is a costly penalty. Doing
12	the right thing by creating a school calendar when
13	everyone can attend will better enable the schools
14	to do a better job for our children and for our
15	society. And I thank you for your attention.
16	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.
17	And next we hear from Kadir Dixon, the Principal
18	of The Renaissance Leadership Academy in
19	Manhattan.
20	KADIR DIXON: Good morning.
21	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Good
22	afternoon.
23	KADIR DIXON: Oh, good afternoon.
24	I'm the proud Principal of, and school leader of
25	The Renaissance Leadership Academy which this is

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

my second year as Principal. Before I took over the school, we were in the bottom three schools academically, and we were in the top-10 of schools that were most violent. And just in a year, all praise be to Allah, we have transformed that school, reformed the school, and we are one of the better to do middle schools in New York City. And with the school the way we only have 200 students, and this past year we were only to accept 60 students. We would normally get maybe 70 applicants from what I've heard in the past, and we had over 1,000 applicants for 60 seats. So I'm very proud to be leading this school in this transformation. As I was listening to all of the speakers, I thought back to my own childhood when I was a student in a New York City public school, and being torn between taking a day off for Eid or going to school. And I happened to be a struggling math student when I was coming up in the school system. And I knew that if I missed that day of mathematics, that I would be off for the rest of the month until we went onto another unit, so I would plead with my dad, "Dad, please allow me to go to school." But in the back of my

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

mind, I knew how important it was for me to celebrate with my family. And now even in the schools, I have students that will go out and celebrate, they were going for morning prayer, but then they would rush to school, because there's so much pressure on the students to perform academically. And our curriculum is extremely rigorous, so if you miss a day, it's going to be very difficult for you to catch up because our school day is from 8:00 to 5:00 o'clock, so from 3:00 to 5:00 our students are doing advanced coursework, and all of our teachers are pushing advanced coursework. So it makes it extremely, extremely difficult when you miss a day of school to tap back into what that student has missed, and then bring them along. And we do that, but then it takes up so much time. And another thing that I've noticed is that our Muslim students, they were very uncomfortable with being Muslim in the public school system. It was a great relief for them to find out that their principal was Muslim, and then we were able to bring some of that awareness to the school. I remember we did a book study on a book entitled "A Long Way Gone," by

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Ishmael Bey, and then it began to prompt questions about the Islamic religion and the belief. was able to come into the classrooms, and the students asked me all sorts of questions. And one of the questions that really stood out to me was one of our very talented leaders, he's a great debater, he said, "I have a question. If all of the things that you're saying about the religion: being humble, giving back, all of those pieces are wonderful, but if your religion is so important to you, and so important to American society or if it's supposed to be important at all, why don't we celebrate any of the holidays?" We have Christmas, we have Yom Kippur, all of those holidays, but it seems as though the Muslim holidays don't even exist because we don't know about them until now. And then even with this particular school year, we have a lot more Muslim students in the building. We took the students on a trip to Philadelphia, and when it was time for prayer, and the students mentioned to each other, "Listen, it's time for us to pray," there were so many questions and so many students saying, like, they just didn't get it, and they didn't see the

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.

25 Thank you, Panel, for coming in. We appreciate it

2.0

2.3

2	very much. Thank you. Our next panel is Linda
3	Sausur [phonetic] from the Arab-American
4	Association of New York, and Choua Vue, the
5	Coalition for Asian American Children and
6	Families, and Deycy Avitia, New York Immigration
7	Coalition. Please come forward. [Pause] Just
8	identify yourself, and you may begin your
9	testimony in the order in which you were called.
10	Thank you.

LINDA SAUSUR: Salaamu - 'Alaikum.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Wa Alaikum wa salaam. Thank you, Councilman Jackson, and the other distinguished Council members. Particularly I want to thank our own Council members that we work very closely with, Sarah Gonzalez, Domenic Recchia, and Gentile for supporting this Resolution. My name is Linda Sarsaur [phonetic], I'm the Acting Director at the Arab-American Association of New York which is a social service agency serving Arab immigrant immigrants in New York City. But actually I want to be here more as a parent. I am also a product of the New York City public school system that New York City could be very proud of, and I'm also a proud parent of a

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

fourth grader and a third grader attending the same elementary school that I went to as a child in Sunset Park. And I actually made up my testimony right now because I wanted to answer some of the questions that Councilman Jackson asked about New Jersey. Thanks to the technology of Blackberries, I searched the answers that you asked for. Actually in New Jersey, according to a New York Times article about the Muslim holidays in New Jersey, it says that New Jersey has 400,000 Muslims, and this was an article that was published on October 7, 2007. So from what we heard from our experts today that if New York City has 700,000-plus Muslims, that just makes more sense that New York City should be heading this It says also that 5% of the students in the Patterson area are Arab, which of course doesn't necessarily mean they're Muslim, but the education process in New Jersey needs to go further. And it said that 25% of the district in Prospect Park, New Jersey was Muslim as well. But I wanted to talk about New York City, and I think about the demographics that were given today. I want to say that those demographics are so under reported,

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

because I'm trying to think about when I fill out my emergency card or register my kids in school it asks what's your home language. And I always put English because I don't want them sending me notices in Arabic, although I can read Arabic. So that means that second-generation Muslims, like my children, I'm a first-generation Muslim, are getting lost in those demographics that you're speaking about. Also the demographics that are taken by the New York City public school system are only race, ethnicity, free-lunch status, gender, and home language. So if you want to put English and you want to put your races as, like my skin color is white, I'm sure somebody might put white. Or if you're from Morocco, you might want to check off African, or if you're from Palestine and you want to put Asian, so people are getting lost among the rest of the demographics in the city. And I think that to think about New Jersey or even Michigan, and for New York City being seen as, or New York State as an example of diversity all over the world, I think that we should be the one, or we should have been the one setting the example, and not waiting for the State of New

2	Jersey to be setting an example for this type of							
3	Resolution. And I wanted also to say that this							
4	morning when I was taking my kids to school, I was							
5	explaining to my son that I'm going to be here							
6	today at City Hall speaking to City Council							
7	members. And who are City Council members, are							
8	people who make decisions, that to pass a law that							
9	will make Eid Ul-Adha and Eid Ul-Fitr a holiday so							
10	he could take off of school, and everyone else							
11	would take off of school. And he said, "Really?							
12	Do you think that will happen?" And I said, "Why							
13	not?" And as he walked into school he said,							
14	"We'll see," almost with no confidence in his							
15	voice. And I want to ask the City Council to							
16	prove my son wrong, and to put some confidence							
17	back, and let him be proud of who he is as an							
18	American-born Muslim with an American-born Muslim							
19	mother. Thank you.							
20	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.							

Next Choua Vue.

21

22 CHOUA VUE: Yes.

23 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Okay. Press 24 the button, please, if you don't mind.

CHOUA VUE: Okay. It's on. Thank 25

2.0

2.3

you. Thank you chairman Jackson and City Council
Education Committee for letting us speak today.
My name is Choua Vue. I'm from the Coalition for
Asian American Children and Families. I'm the
Education Policy Coordinator t here. CACF is the
nation's only pan-Asian children's advocacy group.
We are dedicated to improving the health and
wellbeing of

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Choua, I'm sorry. You're going to have to speak a little louder or move the mic a little closer.

CHOUA VUE: Can you hear me?

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Yeah.

Only pan-Asian advocacy group for children. We are dedicated to improving the health and wellbeing of Asian-American children in New York City. CACF works with over 35 community organizations. We also run a student leadership program called the Asian-American Student Advocacy Project, and originally, we had a student from our program here to speak about her own experiences, but unfortunately due to a family emergency she couldn't make it here. But I wanted to take this

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

time to share her story, because I think it's really important. The student's name is Sharzina, and she graduated from Curtis High School in Staten Island. She's currently a college sophomore. Her experience in high school was she had a teacher who had scheduled final exams during the two Muslim holidays, and when she asked to get an excused absence, the teacher said, "Either you fail my class or you celebrate the holiday." so of course she is a clear example of how students have to choose between their faith and their education. I want to echo a lot of the messages that were made today about tolerance and diversity. CACF has always supported initiatives that promote and raise awareness about diversity in their school systems. We feel this resolution is one initiative that will encourage tolerance and respect for all students, regardless of their race, ethnicity, and religion. Tolerance and respect for diversity will ensure less bigotry, harassment and ignorance between students, and help build safe learning environments for everyone. By incorporating the Muslim holidays in the school calendar, the schools are sending an

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

2.0

21

22

2.3

24

25

important message that the Muslim community is an
accepted segment of our society. For these
reasons, and for Sharzina, we urge you to vote in
favor of the Resolution number 1281. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.

And next we hear from Deycy Avitia.

DEYCY AVITIA: Hi. Good morning. Good morning, Chairman Jackson and distinguished members of the Education Committee. Deycy Avitia, the Coordinator of Education Advocacy for the New York Immigration Coalition. We're a policy and advocacy organization for over 200 groups throughout New York State that fight for justice and opportunity for our newest New Yorkers. And we are here in support of the Muslim Holiday Coalition and the campaign because a high-quality education includes recognition and fostering of the unique contributions of different languages, cultures, and religions that make up our school The closing of New York City public system. schools on the Eids is important for providing thousands of immigrant and non-immigrant children either the opportunity to celebrate their holidays, or the opportunity for other New York

2	City school children to learn about the Muslim
3	community and its contributions to the diversity
4	of New York City. New York is officially home to
5	over 600,000 Muslims from a diversity of
6	backgrounds. Approximately 12% of our public
7	school population is Muslim. Given the
8	significant population of Muslim families in New
9	York City, it is important that our schools
10	recognize the importance of the Eids in the Muslim
11	religion. The reality is that these are important
12	holidays for Muslim families, and that many
13	children will be taking these days off from school
14	to be with their families and their communities.
15	While Muslim students are supposed to be given
16	excused absences, as we've heard over and over
17	today, many times they are not. And even if they
18	are, they are still missing important lessons, and
19	often get marked absent. We know the importance
20	of attendance for school progress, middle- and
21	high-school admissions, and even college
22	opportunities. So we look forward to working with
23	the Council in sending a very clear and loud
24	message to the Mayor and the Department of
25	Education that children and parents should not

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

2.0

21

22

23

24

25

have to choose between their religion and their education. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Let me thank you all for coming and representing your groups and organizations. And let me just hear from our colleague, Councilmember Lew Fidler of Brooklyn who has to leave shortly. Councilmember Fidler.

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Thank you, Mr. Chairman, and first I want to apologize to everyone for having come in a little bit late this morning--I had a prior meeting--and for having to leave now because I have another meeting. we can multitask, but we just can't be in different places at the same time. And I just wanted to make this comment because we've heard from a large number of very articulate and passionate speakers today. First, to the gentleman who commented that many people view all Muslims as if they were Osama bin Laden. people who have that view are bigots, and while we may all have some of those as our constituents, that doesn't mean that we represent them. And I think that it's important for this council and this committee to confront those who would express

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

bigoted views of any kind, and I'm kind of glad that none of them had, I'll use a Jewish expression, the Chutzpah to come here today, and express those views. I went to a Jewish summer camp growing up, and we had an auditorium that we had our Sabbath prayers in. And on the façade of the auditorium was the expression, "And a little child shall lead them." Everything I needed to hear today I heard from that young lady, and I apologize for not knowing her name. Outside of being adorable, she said everything that we needed to hear in an innocence and a purity that expressed this entire issue completely and totally for me. And I just hope, Mr. Chairman, I know that we're not voting on this resolution today, that we will have the opportunity to come back and vote for this Resolution so that we can make the statement that needs to be made for her. look forward to that day. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you

Councilmember Fidler for your views on this

particular matter, and expressing some of the

personal situations that you grew up with. And

myself and my family are Muslims. In fact, the

2	summer camp my kids went to was at the YM and					
3	YWHA, and so they learned about Judaism as a					
4	result of they were in the Y, and went to summer					
5	camp and preschool there. So it's about diversity					
6	and respect and understanding. Thank you very					
7	much, panel. The next panel is Agusto Piña, 32BJ,					
8	Richard Grande from 32BJ, and Mehadid Dati					
9	[phonetic] from 32BJ, NYCPP. Please come forward.					
10	Elpidio Molino from New York City Participation,					
11	Simone Johnson, and M.A. Salah, 32BJ. Please come					
12	forward. [Pause] Okay. So you may begin in the					
13	order in which you were called. Just identify					
14	yourself and your affiliation, and you may begin.					
15	Mr. Piña. That's okay. Next person can begin.					
16	[Pause]					
17	RICHARD GRANDE: Good afternoon					
18	City Council.					
19	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Good					
20	afternoon.					
21	RICHARD GRANDE: My name is Richard					
22	Grande, and I am a member of SEIU Local 32BJ. I					
23	am a proud member of my union for 20-plus years.					
24	I am a shop steward in my union, and work on					

various issues for the union and my community.

2	First of all, I want to thank Councilmember
3	Jackson for holding this hearing, and spearheading
4	this initiative in the Council. Thank you very
5	much, Mr. Jackson. I am here today testifying on
6	behalf of my union and the 100,000 members strong.
7	Our union Local 32BJ is a very diverse union
8	representing members from over 30-plus countries
9	and speak more than 20-plus languages. This
10	includes a large number of Muslim rank and file
11	members. In our union's tradition of recognizing
12	the diversity of our great city, our union
13	designates Eid as a paid holiday in our contract.
14	Muslims play an important role in many
15	institutions in our city, including participating
16	in their unions, their children's schools, in
17	political work, and organizing work. I myself am
18	a proud Catholic, but I believe that all children
19	in this city should feel that their culture and
20	tradition are recognized in a positive manner. My
21	son Richie is three and a half years old, and I
22	would like to see him grow up in a New York City
23	that represents the tolerance and diversity that I
24	teach him about at home. Making the Eids official
25	school holidays will not only benefit the over

2	100,000 Muslim school children in the public						
3	schools, but serves as an important tool in						
4	promoting understanding and education about						
5	different cultures in New York City. I grew up in						
6	a very diverse neighborhood, which is						
7	Williamsburg, Brooklyn, and still live there, and						
8	I benefitted from my interactions with all kinds						
9	of people from different countries and of						
10	different faiths. I would want other children to						
11	have the same exposure in their public schools.						
12	It is very important that children understand and						
13	know about major traditions and cultures of other						
14	children in their schools. I think it would only						
15	send a positive message to all communities to						
16	promote Muslim children being with their families						
17	on their holy day. I couldn't imagine my son						
18	having to make a choice between going to school to						
19	take a test or missing Christmas day with the						
20	family. It would only be right if the Muslim						
21	children could celebrate their holiday with their						
22	families. We hope you will consider this, and						
23	pass the Resolution.						
24	CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.						

Next, Myradia Derti [phonetic]. I'm sorry if I

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

mispronounce your name.

MYRADIA DERTI: No. It's quite okay. First, I have to say I'm sorry I drank water and I'm fasting because of my nerves. please forgive me. My name is Myradia Derti, I represent 32BJ, I'm a member of 32BJ and NYCPP. And I wasn't supposed to speak, but my sister in spirit then, my soul sister made me speak. proud Albanian Muslim, and I want to say my father, I'm sorry, but he passed away recently. My father escaped communism because they abolished religion. And my mother is from Kosovo where they persecuted Muslims. They came to this country, and I left eight months old from there, so I grew up in the New York City public school system with my siblings and my children. I just want to say when it came to the holidays, my parents, because of their background, absolutely refused us to attend school. They said, "No. You're Muslim. You stay home, and we celebrate." This was taken away from us in our country, it's not going to be taken away from us in America. I am a face of the children now that attend school. When I went back to school, "Myradia, why were you out?" "Well, it

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

was a holiday." "There's no holiday." "Yes. Ιt was a Muslim holiday." "No. There is no such thing." My parent would have to come to the school, and explain to them we had a religious holiday. My mother did not attend work that day, although she did not get paid, she did not care. Most important for my two parents was that we celebrate. We keep our tradition, we keep our religion going. Yes. I was harassed at school, but my mother would send treats the next day, and all the children would be happy, "Oh, she's out. It's one of your holidays. Wonderful. What did your mother make for us?" So I would send treats, and I knew that it was always a dream of mine. Ι knew it would never happen in my lifetime. always hoped it would happen for my children, and of course it did not. And the same with my children, I have never let them attend class on a holiday because my mother goes, "Myradia, you have to keep the traditions going." The food, the holiday, the coming from the mosque, from prayer, the rest of the family greeting you, the smells. If you don't do that, what is there left? There's nothing left. And I just want to say one other

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

thing that happened to my oldest son that was very important. When we had children, I was very firm because I did not have an English name, my parents always said, "That's your given name. You should be proud of who you are, and you keep it up." And I decided to give my children Muslim names. I had one teacher that called me up, and I thought my child was misbehaving in school. Apparently, that was not the case. She goes, "I'm sorry. I can't pronounce your son's name. I'm naming him Ben." "What? No. His name is Bashir, that's his name. "I can't pronounce your name." She goes, "Well of course, my name is Carol." "Karole?" Then I'm trying to say, "Excuse me, this is not right what you're doing to my child." I went to the principal which was a wonderful human being, and she was sent to another school. But I hope inch'allah this will pass, and we do not have to decide whether school or staying home, and that this country is great. It's founded on greatness and equality for everyone. And hopefully will pass, and the holidays, Eids will be recognized also. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.

)	Thank	VOII	Simone	Johnson.
4	THAIN	you.	DIUOIIC	O OIHIBOH.

SIMONE JOHNSON: Good morning. As salaamu -'Alaikum, or good afternoon. I'm Simone Johnson.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Could you pull the mic up close so we can hear you loud and clear, please?

9 SIMONE JOHNSON: As salaamu - 10 'Alaikum.

11 CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Wa Alaikum,
12 wa salaam.

Johnson, and I'm a member of 32BJ Union for 25 years, and NYCPP for four years. I'm here to represent the Muslim community, and I'm going to speak very plainly. I'm representing the Muslim community. We are hard-working people, we are tax-paying people. Currently we are in the month of Ramadan. I'm currently fasting, and we will celebrate our Eid Ul-Fitr next week Monday or Tuesday, and my children, when they were young, they had problems in school, but I refused to let my grandchildren [Pause]. Excuse me, this is very emotional. My grandchildren go through the same

thing. They are taking off next week, they will
be market absent, and two of them go to Harvest
Mann [phonetic], and they have very hard subjects.
They have Latin and German, and to miss a day is
really hard. I want to say the Jewish people have
Yom Kippur, Rosh Hashanah, and they celebrate
theirs without problems. Everybody's out of
school, and the Christian community has Christmas
and Easter, and schools are also closed. So why
can't we have our holidays for our children? I
understand that children, you have a certain
amount of absent days that children have to have
for the school year, but why can't they add a day
in the beginning of the school year, and add a day
at the end of the year to knock off the two
holidays for the Muslims to have two days: Eid Ul-
Fitr and Eid Ul-Adha. I just want to say that's
all I have to say. And I hope they pass this, and
thank you, Councilman Jackson for having us. And
it's really emotional to me to see the turnout.
CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.
Elpidio Molina.
ELPIDIO MOLINA: Good afternoon

City Council members, ladies and gentlemen. My

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

name is Elpidio Molina, and I'm an executive board member of Local 32BJ. I live in the Bronx, and like hundreds of other union members, am a constituent of City Council member Koppell. I am here, therefore, to speak not only on my own behalf, but also for all the other members of my union who support the Muslim School Holiday Campaign. We want to make it clear that we support the effort made by this City Council to recognize and celebrate the diversity of our great city. As a 32BJ member, I am extremely proud of the fact that our union recognizes Eid. Our union is extremely diverse, and the fact that it recognizes and celebrates this diversity only makes our organization stronger. I think that the same would apply for our city's schools and neighborhoods. Also I personally couldn't imagine having to be apart from my family during an important holiday, and it pains me that students in New York public schools must make the choice. Holidays are more than just having the day off work or school. It is about taking time to sit down with your family to celebrate your heritage, and to reconnect with your community. Forcing

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Muslim students to forego this is simply unfair. Additionally, I think that even in areas where the Muslim population is low, students and parents would benefit by seeing the City of New York recognize the importance of Eid. It will provide those communities that lack a significant Muslim population with an opportunity to learn about the Muslim community and its contributions to the diversity of New York City. Furthermore, for those who do have Muslim friends, neighbors, and co-workers, it will only serve to further their understanding and tolerance. I respectfully ask, therefore, that this committee pass the Resolution and takes an important step towards making our whole community a happier and more tolerant family. I'd like to also add, Mrs. Sherman [phonetic], this is in regards to a question that you asked earlier, in, I think, probably the first or second committee. You asked how it will affect the school system to have more holidays. And I understand, and I don't know all the details, but I understand there is an assembly, members in - are working on extending the scholastic year. there will be no excuses not to have this holiday.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

2.0

21

22

23

24

25

Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Let me thank all of you for coming in, and your union 32BJ has been part of this coalition. And your colors stand out, or purple and yellow.

ELPIDIO MOLINA: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you. And next we're going to hear from Mohammed Awa. He's representing himself, and Suad Abdul-Kabir, New York City public school graduates. come forward. And let me just say while this next panel is coming up, many of the experiences that individuals who testified as far as having to choose between sending your kids to school or celebrating your holiday, in our home, that was not a question. We celebrated our holiday, and our kids didn't go to school. And as far as having names like Sadia and Asmahan and Sumaya, those are our three children's names, and sometimes people used to say, "Okay. We're going to call you Sue." I said, "No. No. Your name is not Sue, your name is Sadia. You're named after your great grandmother, and that's your name. And so it has some history and heritage there.

2.0

name is not sue, and don't allow them to call you
outside of your name. And if they can't pronounce
it, then teach them, because it's about teaching
and learning and respecting." And so I have
difficulty in pronouncing some of the names of
individuals who have come up, but you have to try,
be willing to try. And be willing to try is
having respect and tolerance, and that's the
importance of diversity. So our next panel.

SUAD ABDUL KABIR: I'm Suad.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Okay. Is there anyone else who wishes to testify before?

This is the last panel, the last individuals. So if anyone else needs to testify, please, you can fill out a slip. Why don't you come up? Suad?

SUAD ABDUL-KABIR: Okay. Thank you for letting me speak. My comments will be brief.

My name is Suad Abdul-Kabir, and I'm a product of the New York City public schools. I graduated from Edward R. Morrow [phonetic] High School in Brooklyn New York, class of '96, after which I went on to graduate from Georgetown University, Washington D.C., class of 2000, and currently I'm a Ph.D. candidate in the Department of

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Anthropology at Princeton University. Council members, I am New York City. I'm the granddaughter of one of the first African-American firemen in the city of Caribbean descent, and a World War II vet. I'm the granddaughter of a retired New York City public school special education teacher, the daughter of a Vietnam vet, and the daughter of a newly-retired New York City public school teacher, my mother, who was recently honored by Queensboro President, Helen Marshall, for her civic duty. Council members, I am New York City. I mention these parts of my personal history in order to provide myself as an example of the type of student and citizen that this resolution or lack thereof has affected. the D train to school every day, took REGIS exams, and had a cream-cheese bagel every morning like my classmates, and for 28 years, my mother created lesson plans and graded papers, part of which I also graded with her, and needed her morning coffee, just like all of her colleagues. there was no reason then that we had to choose between our faith and an education or work, and there's no reason now. In my estimation, there is

no logical reason that the most diverse city in one of the world's largest democracies, our religious observances should be treated as less than others. So finally to conclude, if there's any doubt to the appropriateness of Resolution 1281, honoring the religious freedoms of at least 100,000 students in New York City, let my story stand as an example. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.

And clearly, you explaining who you are clearly showed that you are a New Yorker, and a Muslim New Yorker. So thank you for coming in. And next we're going to hear from Jane and Jamilla and Prince Mohammed. Ladies first.

JAMILLA: Peace to everyone. As salaamu -'Alaikum. I am from Spanish Harlem. I'm Polish, Irish, Puerto-Rican, and I became a Muslim in '91. I have two children, a son who's 12. I'm happy he's in a good middle school now, Wagner School. And I have a daughter who will be two, with God's help, inshallah October 26th. I never in my life thought I was going to talk today, but I would love to see the two Eid holidays for all the Muslims all over just so we can have the days

off, and we can worship together and spend time with our family, and be able to teach other people what it means to be Muslim, and to celebrate the Eid holidays. I cried more than once today, I didn't expect that. So many people are supporting us of every race, every religion, and that's so great to see. I'm praying that this passes, and that it becomes a law and everything as fast as possible so that my children can benefit, and al of our children. And thank you for allowing me to talk today, and I'm praying that it passes. And thank you for working on this. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Well, thank you for coming in and representing yourself and your children. And last but not least, Prince Mohammed, 32BJ and NYCPP.

PRINCE MOHAMMED: Good afternoon.

As salaamu -'Alaikum. Shalom. All the greetings to the human beings of the planet Earth. I want to send out first and foremost, and then I also must say I'm very thankful and appreciative to Mr.

Jackson and the Council members here as a whole for exhibiting such a noble human content in their expression and appreciation for trying to see that

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

this, I believe it's 1281, or this passage for the Eid holidays could go through. But it seemed like it transcended just the Eid holidays, that the staff here and Council members are trying to reach out to human beings. I am a follower of the late W.D. Mohammed, the former son of the Honorable Elijah Mohammed. And I'm just so thankful to have been a follower of Imam W. Mohammed who has been a champion of what you have been expressing; the human content. That human content is like the bridge over troubled waters to connect humanity back together, or into more of its fullness. want to thank you all for your attention, and those that were here. But as I believe Mrs. Foster said earlier, or someone here said that we should not make this our last time, and should not be the only time that we come to meet together to resolve issues or problems in the Council. that we should make that a part of our daily living. So I want to thank you, and I pray that this initiative, I definitely see as a catalyst of bridging the human relationships of people together, and to advance humanity rather than make us regress back to a time of Dark Ages.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2 you, once again.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Let me thank you all for coming in and giving testimony. We appreciate you. Thank you very much.

PRINCE MOHAMMED: You're welcome.

CHAIRPERSON JACKSON: Thank you.

Finally, as was said earlier in my opening statement, there will be no vote on this particular matter today because normally from a normal process, we hold a hearing, and then at the earliest from an average point of view, the second hearing is when it's voted out. You will be notified when the next hearing will take place. The bottom line is this: we've heard the testimony of all those that testified, and in fact, every individual who spoke today, Muslims, and non-Muslims, white, black or Latino or others, all testified in favor of the Resolution. knowledge, as the Chair, and I've looked at every slip that came in front of me, no one spoke against the resolution. And as was said earlier by so many individuals, that this is about respect, tolerance in our diverse city. And I am hoping that within the near future, that this

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Resolution will pass the City Council, and we will forward it to the Mayor and the Chancellor, and hopefully they will change their mind on this particular matter. If not, then we all must come together and decide what we must do next. hope we don't have to have meetings to decide what comes next. I hope that considering the fact that the Muslim population in New York City, depending on who you ask, is at least 600,000, more like 800,000, with the student population at approximately 12%, and that those individuals that have the authority and power to make the decision will listen to the people of New York City, and respect the wishes of the Muslim community in order to incorporate the two Muslim holidays into the school calendar. So I ask you to please continue to speak out, speak to all of your elected officials, including Mayor Bloomberg and Chancellor Joel Klein, because those are the individuals right now that can make the decision. I thank our colleagues, Helen Diane Foster of the Bronx, and Maria del Carmen Arroyo of the Bronx, and all the other colleagues that were present here today. As I indicated when I opened up,

there were three hearings going on at the same time. We had a Government Affairs hearing next door in the Committee Room, and we had a New York City Housing Authority Subcommittee meeting across the street. And so some of our colleagues came in and checked in, but they are also respectful of this particular hearing process. So I want to thank all of you for coming out in the rain, and I'll look forward to seeing you at the next hearing when we will vote this out. Now this Committee of the Education Committee considering Resolution 1281, it's now 1:12 p.m. on Friday.

I, Elizabeth Poulson certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

	41	 ···	
Signature_	,		

Lhar

Date ____January 21, 2009_____