

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

-----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

LAND USE SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, &
MARITIME USES

-----X

January 13, 2009
Start: 11:49 am
Recess: 11:55 am

HELD AT: Council Chambers
City Hall

B E F O R E: JESSICA S. LAPPIN
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:
Charles Barron
John C. Liu
Annabel Palma
Maria del Carmen Arroyo
Rosie Mendez
James S. Oddo

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Kate Daly
Executive Director
Landmarks Preservation Commission

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, & 3
MARITIME USES

2 [Off mic]

3 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Good morning.

4 Welcome--

5 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

6 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: --welcome to
7 the Land Use Subcommittee of Landmark, Public
8 Uses--sorry, Landmarks, Public Siting, and
9 Maritime Uses--our first back from the break
10 obviously. I'm Jessica Lappin, the Chair, joined
11 today by Councilwoman Rosie Mendez of Manhattan,
12 Councilwoman Annabel Palma from the Bronx, Council
13 Member Charles Barron of Brooklyn, Councilwoman
14 Maria del Carmen Arroyo from the Bronx.

15 We have two items on the agenda
16 today. One, which is in Councilwoman Rosie
17 Mendez's district, St. Stephen's Church and the
18 Councilwoman is in support. I wanted to invite
19 Kate Daly from the Landmarks Commission to come
20 and testify first about St. Stephen's Church and--
21 please come up. So we'll open the hearing on St.
22 Stephen's Church.

23 MS. KATE DALY: First I'd like to
24 apologize for the delay and thank you for our
25 patience--your patience--there was a mix-up in my

2 office about the time, so thank you for your
3 courtesy. And I'm sorry, we'll start with the
4 Devoe factory or St. Stephen's--

5 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: [Interposing]
6 Can we start with St. Stephen's Church?

7 MS. DALY: Absolutely.

8 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Great.

9 [Pause]

10 MS. DALY: St. Stephen's Church on
11 East 28th Street near Murray Hill and Kips Bay in
12 Manhattan is a particularly example of the
13 Romanesque Revival style--sorry, I'll start by
14 introducing myself. I'm Kate Daly, Executive
15 Director of the Landmarks Preservation Commission
16 for the record.

17 This church was designed by
18 prominent architect James Renwick, Jr. and
19 constructed in 1853. During the 1860s, this
20 church was one of the largest and most influential
21 Catholic congregations in New York.

22 The church has a lively façade with
23 round-arched entrance and window openings, all of
24 which animate the streetscape in this densely
25 developed part of Manhattan.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, & 5
2 MARITIME USES

3 The Church of St. Stephen joined
4 with Our Lady of the Scapular in 1989 and
5 continues to serve this vibrant community.

6 On October 30th, 2007, the
7 Landmarks Preservation Commission held a public
8 hearing on the proposed designation as a landmark
9 of St. Stephen's Church. The hearing had been
10 duly advertised in accordance with the provisions
11 of law. There were six speakers in favor of
12 designation, including a representative of
13 Congresswoman Carolyn Maloney and representatives
14 of Community Board 6, the Historic Districts
15 Council, the Metropolitan Chapter for the
16 Victorian Society, and the Landmarks Conservancy,
17 as well as a parishioner of the church. There
18 were no speakers in opposition. Thank you for
19 your consideration.

20 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Thank you.
21 Councilwoman Mendez, would you like to say
22 something for the record?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Yes, this is
24 a really beautiful church on the inside and the
25 outside and I know that we don't landmark the
interior, but those murals are quite incredible.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, & 6
 MARITIME USES

2 And just for the record, it doesn't
3 put me down as someone, but I actually went to the
4 hearing and testified in favor, along with like
5 four other things in my district, so maybe it got
6 missed 'cause I spoke about a lot of things that
7 day.

8 But certainly I'm in support and
9 the community is very excited about this. Thank
10 you.

11 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Any questions
12 from my colleagues? Okay. We'll close the
13 hearing on this item and open the--and I would
14 just add that Renwick designed something on
15 Roosevelt Island as well, now we call it the
16 Renwick Ruins, but once it was not so ruinous.

17 The F.W.--which is also a landmark--
18 --the F.W. Devoe & Company factory, which is in the
19 Speaker's district, we'll open the hearing on that
20 item.

21 MS. DALY: My name is Kate Daly, I'm
22 the Executive Director of the Landmarks
23 Preservation Commission.

24 Constructed in 1882 for paint
25 manufacturers F.W. Devoe & Company and designed by

3 the noted architectural firm of Kimball and
4 Wisedell, this six-story factory building at 110
5 to 112 Horatio Street is a rare surviving example
6 of the industrial structures that once occupied
7 much of the far western section of Greenwich
8 Village.

9 In 1984, this significant building
10 was converted to an annex of the adjacent
11 apartment building. This was a period of
12 substantial redevelopment in the Far West Village,
13 during which time many of the industrial buildings
14 that once dominated the neighborhood either were
15 replaced by modern apartment buildings or were
16 significantly altered during their conversion to
17 residential use. The F.W. Devoe & Company factory
18 is therefore rare and, because of its high degree
19 of physical integrity, an important reminder of
20 the Far West Village's industrial past.

21 On June 24th, 2008, the Landmarks
22 Preservation Commission held a public hearing on
23 the proposed designation of the F.W. Devoe &
24 Company factory building and the proposed
25 designation of the related landmark site. The
hearing had been duly advertised in accordance

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, & 8
 MARITIME USES

2 with the provisions of the law. Nine people spoke
3 in favor of designation, including representatives
4 of State Senator Thomas K. Duane, State Assembly
5 Member Deborah J. Glick, Manhattan Community Board
6 2, Municipal Art Society of New York, Historic
7 Districts Council, Greenwich Village Society for
8 Historic Preservation, the Greenwich Village
9 Community Task Force, the Save Gansevoort Task
10 Force, and the North Shore Waterfront Greenbelt.
11 A letter in support of designation from City
12 Council Speaker Christine Quinn was also read into
13 the record at the public hearing. Thank you for
14 your consideration.

15 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Thank you very
16 much. And any questions from my colleagues?
17 Great the item--the hearing on this item is
18 closed.

19 I would ask for counsel to call for
20 a vote on these two items and recommend a
21 favorable vote. And the counsel is Christian
22 Hilton.

23 MR. CHRISTIAN HILTON: Chair Lappin.

24 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Aye.

25 MR. HILTON: Council Member Barron.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, & 9
MARITIME USES

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.

3 MR. HILTON: Council Member Palma.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

5 MALE VOICE: Aye.

6 [Pause]

7 MR. HILTON: Council Member Arroyo.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye.

9 MR. HILTON: Council Member Mendez.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

11 MR. HILTON: By a vote of five in
12 the affirmative, none in the negative, no
13 abstentions, both items are approved and referred
14 to the full Land Use Committee.

15 [Pause]

16 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: We'll keep the
17 vote open for five minutes and this meeting is
18 adjourned.

19 [Pause]

20 MR. HILTON: Hold on.

21 [Off mic]

22 [Pause]

23 MR. HILTON: Council member Oddo.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Yes.

25 MR. HILTON: Vote stands six in the

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING, & 10
 MARITIME USES

2 affirmative, none in the negative, no abstentions.

3 MALE VOICE 1: No we don't.

4 [Pause]

5 MALE VOICE 2: Six to one?

6 MALE VOICE 1: No, no, no, no.

7 [Off mic]

8 MALE VOICE 2: Yes, sir.

9 MALE VOICE 1: Stop with [off mic]

10 [Off mic]

11 MR. HILTON: Council member Liu.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LIU: Yes.

13 MR. HILTON: By a vote of seven in
14 the affirmative, none in the negative, no
15 abstentions items are approved and referred to the
16 full land use committee.

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, Tammy Wittman, certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

Signature_____

Date January 21, 2009_____