

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

-----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS

-----X

November 19, 2008

Start: 10:31am

Recess: 10:40am

HELD AT: Council Chambers  
City Hall

B E F O R E:  
JESSICA S. LAPPIN  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:  
Maria del Carmen Arroyo  
Charles Barron  
Leroy G. Comrie, Jr.  
John C. Liu  
Rosie Mendez  
Annabel Palma

2 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Good morning.  
3 Welcome to the Land Use Sub-Committee on  
4 Landmarks, Public Siting and Maritime Uses. I'm  
5 Jessica Lappin, the Chair, joined today by members  
6 of the Committee, Council member Annabel Palma of  
7 the Bronx, Council Member Charles Barron of  
8 Brooklyn, Council member Leroy Comrie of Queens,  
9 Council member Maria del Carmen Arroyo of the  
10 Bronx, Council member John Lui of Queens and  
11 Council Member Jimmy Oddo of Staten Island. We're  
12 also joined by Council member Simcha Felder, Joel  
13 Rivera, Helen Sears and Tony Avella.

14 We have a vote today on one item  
15 that is in the Speaker's district. It is a  
16 sanitation garage, LU 921, 925 and 926. We had a  
17 lengthy hearing on this item. I can't even  
18 remember what day; they're all running together.  
19 On the 14th and since then the Speaker and her  
20 office have been working very diligently with the  
21 Sanitation Department to make some modifications  
22 to the proposal that will somewhat mitigate the  
23 impacts on the community. Although I know that  
24 it's not everything that the community wanted and  
25 certainly the community had put together an

1  
2 alternative plan that was very helpful in  
3 negotiating this item. It is, I think, she has  
4 negotiated modifications that do make this into a  
5 better proposal.

6 We don't have the final letter  
7 outlining these changes that will be entered into  
8 the record. We will be receiving it later today  
9 from the Department of Sanitation but I did want  
10 to mention for the record and for my colleagues  
11 who were at the hearing, a number of those changes  
12 we had discussion about, the number of employee  
13 parking spaces that were being provided in the  
14 facility. I think there was a consensus that  
15 there were too many. The number of propose  
16 parking employee spaces has been reduced from 74  
17 to 37, which is a very significant reaction in the  
18 number of parking spaces. I think that will, to  
19 some extent, impact positively on the traffic  
20 congestion.

21 Another issue relating to traffic  
22 congestion was the fueling facility there and  
23 whether or not other agency vehicles would be  
24 allowed to fuel there. The administration has  
25 agreed that no other agency vehicles will be

1  
2 permitted to fuel at the proposed garage with the  
3 exception of emergency situations.

4 We also had a lot of discussion  
5 about the salt shed and the design of the salt  
6 shed. I, myself, had mentioned on the record that  
7 I thought it would make more sense to have the  
8 salt shed be enclosed considering its proximity to  
9 the lawn for the tunnel. Sanitation has agreed to  
10 completely cover and enclose on all sides the salt  
11 shed so that there will be no ventilation openings  
12 on the side of the buildings.

13 A couple of other changes I wanted  
14 to mention is that there will be granite block  
15 pavers that will separate tree pits and that there  
16 will be tree shrubs and tree pits that will act as  
17 a buffer between the pedestrians on West Street  
18 and Spring Street. The city has also committed to  
19 having DOT work with state DOT in analyzing the  
20 need to locate a pedestrian crosswalk in the area  
21 over Route 9A.

22 There had been discussion about  
23 future possibility of open space at this site.  
24 The green roof that will be built as part of this  
25 green building will be built in a way that does

1  
2 not preclude the possibility of joining with a  
3 green publicly accessible space that may be  
4 proposed as part of the St. John's Center, which  
5 is located to the north of this property.

6 And lastly, the city administration  
7 and Disney have committed to consider alternative  
8 sites that would permit the relocation of the  
9 Manhattan Five Garage operation from this combined  
10 garage location. If a site is identified and  
11 approved during or after the completion of  
12 construction of this garage, then the Manhattan  
13 Five Garage can be moved to that new location.  
14 But that would be determined by discussions  
15 between the administration, Community Board Two,  
16 the City Council, etc. So there would be a public  
17 discussion about that possibility.

18 So with these changes and  
19 modifications, and I wanted to thank the  
20 Sanitation Department for working with us. I  
21 would recommend a favorable vote on the item and  
22 ask for the Council to call for a vote.

23 CLERK: Chair Lappin.

24 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Aye.

25 CLERK: Council Member Barron.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: May I be  
3 excused to explain my vote?

4 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I think  
6 those are good improvements. My concern about  
7 this project has always been environmental. I  
8 think the good thing about it is the Speaker is  
9 willing to put something in her district that she  
10 probably is not crazy about herself because  
11 there's always environmental concerns. That is a  
12 plus.

13 Certainly Black and Latino  
14 communities have an over abundance of these kinds  
15 of projects but having said that, there's still  
16 some serious, I think, environmental concerns with  
17 the increasing of the trucks that will be  
18 utilized. Even though they are going to go to  
19 more environmental friendly trucks and they're  
20 going to try to do those kind of things. So  
21 there's concern about that. I think the community  
22 did have some parts of their plans that I think  
23 needs further inclusion, some of the things that  
24 they're talking about and further discussion  
25 whether it's three districts, two districts.

1  
2 For that reason, I'm going to vote  
3 no but for the purposes of us extending some more  
4 conversation and talk with the community to make  
5 it even a more environmentally friendly project.  
6 But my no vote is not without understanding that  
7 this was a tough decision, I'm certain, for all  
8 involved. When you want to really do something  
9 about utilizing greater sanitation services but at  
10 the same time and in the area where there is poor  
11 air quality and there is some traffic congestion  
12 concerns. It has been reduced by the number of  
13 parking spaces going down to 34 from 70-something.  
14 Those are good things. But I just wanted to vote  
15 no for the purposes of extending discussion and  
16 improving things even more.

17 CLERK: Council Member Comrie.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: We're  
19 calling the roll for the vote?

20 CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Aye.

22 CLERK: Council Member Lui.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LUI: Yes.

24 CLERK: Council Member Palma.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Yes.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CLERK: Council Member Arroyo.

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Yes.

CLERK: Council Member Mendez.

[No response]

CLERK: Council Member Oddo.

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: It

disappoints me greatly to be on the other side of  
Council Member Barron, I will vote yes.

CLERK: By a vote of seven in the  
affirmative, one in the negative, no abstentions,  
the item is approved and referred to the full Land  
Use Committee.

CHAIRPERSON LAPPIN: So I'm going  
to adjourn the meeting and hold the vote open only  
until the beginning of the Land Use Committee.



C E R T I F I C A T E

I, Amber Gibson, certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

Signature Amber Gibson

Date December 12, 2008