

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

----- X

October 24, 2018
Start: 1:10 p.m.
Recess: 4:49 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Diana Ayala
Laurie A. Cumbo
Ruben Diaz, Sr.
Mark Gjonaj
Carlos Menchaca
Donovan J. Richards
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger
James G. Van Bramer

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Lucy Newman from the Legal Aid Society

Danny Barber Chair, Citywide Council of Presidents

Carmen Quinones, Douglas Houses Resident

Vito Mustaciuolo, General Manager, NYCHA

Deborah Goddard, Executive Vice President, Capital
Project, NYCHA

Cathy Pennington, Executive Vice President,
Operations, NYCHA

Javier Almodobar, Director, Heating Management
Services Department, NYCHA

Robert Marano, Executive Vice-President & Chief
Information Officer, NYCHA

David Marcenecke, Senior Deputy Director, Human
Resources, NYCHA

2 [sound check] [pause]

3 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Good afternoon
4 and thank you all for being here today. I am Council
5 Member Alicka Ampry-Samuel, and I chair the Committee
6 on Public Housing. I am joined by committee member
7 Reverend Council Member Ruben Diaz, Sr. as well as
8 committee members, Counsel Madeepa (sic) Denny, and
9 Senior Legislative Policy Analyst Jose Conde, as well
10 as other members of the Council—legal counsel. Eight
11 months ago the Public Housing Committee held a
12 hearing about the lack of heat in NYCHA apartment,
13 when NYCHA has a long history of keeping tenants in
14 the cold. Sometimes this harm was deliberate. In
15 2015, it was NYCHA's policy not to turn on the heat
16 overnight unless the outside temperature fell to 20
17 degrees of lower. Sometimes this harm was negligent.
18 In 2017 and 2018 heating season, NYCHA's
19 mismanagement resulted in 80% of residents losing
20 heat during New York's coldest winter in decades.
21 But, time and time again NYCHA has failed to
22 prioritize its residents, and the weight of these
23 failures falls on tenants' health, their safety, and
24 peace of mind, and while NYCHA has been keeping its
25 residents out in the cold, NYCHA has worked very hard

2 to try to keep the City Council in the dark. For
3 months, the Council provided NYCHA with the
4 opportunity after opportunity to explain what
5 happened last winter, and to make sure they were
6 prepared to take on the new heating season. Sadly,
7 NYCHA's response has been nothing short of
8 unacceptable, and almost pretty close to laughable. I
9 am here to look you in the eye, and say this: The
10 Council will use all the tools at our disposal, and
11 we will get answers. The purpose of today's hearing
12 is to ask: To what degree has NYCHA learned from its
13 errors? What is it doing differently so that the
14 residents will not suffer as they did during the last
15 heating season? Seeing that thousands of residents
16 have lost their heat in just the first few weeks of
17 this heating season, NYCHA has failed to learn from
18 its mistakes, and it seems like its business as
19 usual. Last winter, NYCHA testified that 143,000 out
20 of 175,000 units did not have heat and hot water and
21 that at one point the average duration of a heat
22 outage was 48 hours. This is unacceptable. There is
23 no reason why in one of the wealthiest cities in the
24 world public housing residents should have to turn to
25 homeless shelters so that they can have a warm place

2 to sleep at night as some did last winter. It should
3 not require the intervention of this council and the
4 legal system to force NYCHA to provide basic
5 intervention, basic services for the New Yorkers who
6 call NYCHA home. NYCHA claims to be working around
7 the clock to fix these issues, but residents need
8 more than empty promises. They need results. Before
9 February's hearing on January 18th, the Mayor and
10 NYCHA announced a dedicated allocation of \$13 million
11 to speed up responses to emergencies by hiring
12 temporary repair staff, securing mobile boilers and
13 sealing windows, and then on January 31st, the Mayor
14 and NYCHA announced a \$200 million replace boiler
15 system and upgrading heating systems at 20 NYCHA
16 developments. And then at a hearing the Mayor and
17 NYCHA announced measures to expedite this process by
18 up to 20 months, which was related to design phase,
19 and procurement and construction, and then just last
20 week, the Mayor and NYCHA made yet another
21 announcement about what you've been doing to improve
22 heating in the advance of the heating winter season
23 saying that you have more staff, better customer
24 service and new boilers, but it's unclear how
25 residents can trust NYCHA when there are still

2 outages today, and NYCHA's efforts to communicate
3 with residents about their living conditions are
4 muddled at best. Just over the past two weeks, we've
5 experienced temperatures in the 30s and residents
6 have complained and complained and complained about
7 outages, and over this past weekend I personally
8 called the NYCHA's Customer Contact Center, and there
9 was a glitch in the options to check for unknown
10 outages. And in my own district Sterling Rehab,
11 which includes 125 households they were without heat
12 for 57 hours, and in Grant Houses they were without
13 hot water for 73 hours, and in Glenmore Houses they
14 were without water period for 48 hours. The Public
15 Housing Committee needs more than reassurances from
16 NYCHA. It needs receipts. It is my hope that today
17 NYCHA will provide real answers about its
18 preparations for this heating season so that
19 residents can live in dignity in a place that's
20 clean, safe and warm. Thank you so much. So, with
21 that, we are going to call—excuse me. [background
22 comments] So, with that, we're going to hold and
23 we're actually going to switch to the Chamber. So,
24 bear with us for just a few minutes. Everyone from
25 this room has to go into the Chamber, and everyone

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

8

2 from the Chamber is going to come into--[background
3 comments, pause]

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Okay, folks, you can
5 exit from the second floor here please. Thank you
6 for standing up. [pause] [sound check] [background
7 comments, pause]

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay. Thank
9 you everyone. [pause] We'll be getting started in
10 about two minutes. We are just switching out the
11 recorders. [pause] And we're back. So, the first
12 panel we will hear from is the NYCHA resident panel
13 along with the Legal Aid Society. So, Mr. Danny
14 Barber, the Chair of the Citywide Council of
15 Presidents; Ms. Carmen Quinones, Douglas Houses; and
16 Ms. Lucy Newman from the Legal Aid Society.
17 [background comments, pause]

18 LUCY NEWMAN: Good afternoon. My name is
19 Lucy Newman. I'm a staff attorney at the Legal Aid
20 Society. I wanted to thank the committee and
21 especially the Chair for your commitment to public
22 housing residents in New York City and also for
23 holding this important oversight hearing. So, in New
24 York City every residential lease has what's called
25 an implied warranty of habitability, which says that

2 a tenant's obligation to pay rent is dependent on the
3 landlord providing them with safe and habitable
4 housing. In New York City the New York City
5 Administrative Code obligates a landlord to provide
6 water 24 hours a day 7 days a week, and heat between
7 October 1st and May 31st in what we call the heating
8 season. This is what is probably one of the most
9 basic fundamental obligations of the landlord, and
10 indeed the former Chairperson of NYCHA and Ms.
11 Olatoye said before this committee last year, she
12 said that providing basic services like heat and hot
13 water go to the heart of NYCHA's responsibility as a
14 landlord. In January of 2018, Legal Aid started
15 getting many, many phone calls from residents in
16 NYCHA developments who were without heat and hot
17 water, and then before this very committee in
18 February, NYCHA admitted that it had indeed violated
19 the law and violated its obligations to provide heat
20 and hot water, and failed at its most basic job as a
21 landlord. I think you mentioned they said that 80%
22 of their housing units had experienced outages, which
23 was affecting about 323,000 residents. We know from
24 hearing from other residents and also things that
25 we've read in the news about just how awful the

2 circumstances were for resident. Thousand of them
3 were forced to endure freezing conditions in their
4 apartments many during which happened during the
5 coldest spell in New York City's recent history.
6 Tenants told stories about how they had to bundle
7 layers and layers of clothing, sleep their entire
8 families in the bed in order to keep warm, use
9 blankets and then many of them resorted to using
10 their stoves to keep warm bearing in mind that
11 NYCHA's own resident handbook that they distribute to
12 residents says and warns residents to "Never use your
13 stove to heat your apartment. Poisonous carbon
14 monoxide gas has no smell, builds up and is deadly.
15 Yet, they knowingly failed to provide heat and hot
16 water and forced residents to do exactly what they
17 were warning them that they shouldn't do, putting
18 people's lives at risk. You also mentioned that in
19 response to this in January, the city announced the
20 allocation of \$230 million to provide immediate
21 fixes, and then fixes over the course of the summer,
22 and they made statements about what they were going
23 to do with that money. Notably, from January from
24 those two announcements until October 18th,
25 absolutely nothing was said publicly by NYCHA to the

2 public or to their own residents about what they were
3 doing to ensure that in this heat season and this
4 winter they were going to provide adequate and
5 reliable heat. Last week there was a press
6 conference including a tour of a new boiler at Wald
7 Houses in which they laid out some of the things that
8 they had done over the course of the summer, and then
9 astonishingly, the very next day the entire
10 development of Wald was without heat and hot water in
11 an unplanned outage. We have been reviewing every
12 single day multiple times a day the self-reported
13 outages that NYCHA has on their website, and from
14 October 18th to the 23rd they have recorded that
15 33,000 individuals have already experienced an
16 unplanned heat or hot water outage, and that is just
17 in the space of one week. So, again, we want to
18 thank the committee for having this hearing.
19 Obviously, what we do know at this point is that the
20 statements that NYCHA is making publicly have been
21 belied by the evidence that they themselves are
22 putting up on their very own website about outages.
23 Residents deserve to know what has been done with the
24 money, how NYCHA is going to ensure that they provide
25 adequate and reliable heat and hot water this season,

2 and make sure that NYCHA that NYCHA's residents are
3 safe in their very own homes and we also implore the
4 city again to provide more funding so that NYCHA can
5 upgrade their infrastructure and make the very, very
6 needed fixes to their heat and hot water systems.

7 Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you, Ms.
9 Newman. Mr. Barber.

10 DANNY BARBER: Well, good morning, Madam
11 Chair, committee members. As the Citywide Council of
12 Presidents Chairman, I am honored to—that I have been
13 given the opportunity to testify before this
14 committee regarding the heating situation at NYCHA.
15 We were here in the same position as we were last
16 year, and the only difference is the—the only
17 difference is the year, and we are still faced with
18 heating outages and closing tickets because you
19 restored the plant, but no one went to assure that
20 all the units were restored and report, that reported
21 the outages. Madam Chair, last year you stated at
22 the hearing on Oversight and Public Housing with
23 this—with this being stated how it was unacceptable
24 leaving the residents in the dark or the cold. You
25 also spoke of the basic responsibility of heat and

2 hot water being provided to the residents, but wasn't
3 being done and the residents agreed. Last year,
4 there \$320,000 residents who went without heat and
5 hot water, and now we are at the beginning of the
6 heating season this year, and we're already faced
7 with 4,000 residents of Queens-Queensbridge Houses
8 reported by the New York Post on October 19th that
9 are affected by service interruptions and they have
10 new equipment. We had the coldest days this far last
11 week, and the Call Center went down, and residents
12 couldn't put in work orders. So, I used social media
13 to get the outages reported to the NYCHA for repairs
14 for two days, or we can go up to the South Bronx to
15 Patterson Houses who for the past five years or more
16 been provided-been provided heat by mobile boiler,
17 which are old and needing replacement, but were fully
18 funded for new boilers, and there has been nothing to
19 this current date. Or we can look a Morris Senior
20 Air rights where steam Morrisania Air Rights where
21 steam repair was held up because the Yankees made the
22 Playoffs and didn't resume 'til they were eliminated.
23 All this shows that the residents of public housing
24 aren't respected and are not treated as if they are
25 people that count, and this statement presented today

2 is very similar to the statement given at the hearing
3 last year with the mentioning of the same
4 developments. NYCHA isn't ready for the heating
5 season in my opinion as well as you know and see. As
6 this tragedy and lack of service plagued us last
7 year, there were developments that were slated to
8 receive new equipment, and that has yet to happen,
9 but the Mayor stated that the heat will be fixed in
10 July, but nothing happened. So, the residents are
11 asking for better accountability with the formulating
12 of a monitoring committee along with residents and
13 Council and the City Council to provide basic
14 services and to correct the violations of basic human
15 rights. Again, thank you for the opportunity to be
16 heard by this committee. Daniel Barber.

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you so
18 much, Mr. Barber, and I know that we were on the
19 phone several times over the weekend. So, thank you
20 for your leadership, and just providing us with some
21 information that we would not have been able to
22 receive from NYCHA.

23 DANNY BARBER: Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Ms. Quinones.

2 CARMEN QUINONES: First, let me say thank
3 you again for your leadership for the people of
4 public housing. It's—it's just a shame that we're
5 here again just a year later. The only thing that's
6 changed is that Shola has new job. [laughs] When one
7 of us or any of us that committed the crimes that she
8 did would be under the jail. She has a good job
9 right now, real estate. It's exactly what they want,
10 privatization, privatization, privatization,
11 privatization. I am the President of Douglas Houses,
12 but I get calls from every other development.
13 Yesterday, Jefferson Houses, no heat, no hot water at
14 all. Corsi Houses, which is a senior center on the
15 East Side also called me. Residents there—the
16 seniors had no hot water at all. How long are we
17 going to keep going on with the same thing? And let
18 me tell you what's going to happen. It's until the
19 Resident Engagement is changed, until the people that
20 are at the home of this have changed, it's not going
21 to happen. You cannot just take people, put them in
22 different departments and think this is over. It is
23 not. You cannot just take people and replace them
24 somewhere else and think that this is not going to go
25 on. The same corporates are in NYCHA-- housing. What

2 I mean—let me tell you something. I'm—I-and I want
3 to say this publicly: I like Vito. I think Vito is
4 on the ground. I think he can make a big difference,
5 but until the people in Resident Engagement are
6 changed and everywhere else are actually, and I'm
7 talking dismissed, this is not going to change.
8 Right now because of—of my—I call it leadership.
9 Maybe somebody else calls it trouble, but I call it
10 leadership. Because I have been a leader in what is
11 happening in public housing, I am now being attacked
12 with my presidency. You know, they're—they're not
13 acknowledging my presidency now. They are saying we
14 cannot get any TPA funds. I cannot have an office.
15 All this is retaliation because we've been a voice
16 here. The first time I got elected I had to run four
17 times. Four times my residence was subject to
18 election, and each time it came out the same. I won
19 by a landslide. Okay, it's happening again. Listen,
20 I ain't got—I ain't got an issue with having another
21 election, but I do have an issue of people taking
22 advantage of my people. That—the injustice is just
23 too much already. Okay. Now, it's—it's a shame that
24 we are here a year later, a year later and we still
25 got the same outages, and nobody—I mean come on. How

2 long is this going to go on, and when are people
3 going to be held accountable, accountable for
4 criminal negligence. This is inhumane. It has to
5 stop, and until these people are out of here, out of
6 New York City Housing Authority, nothing is going to
7 change. I don't care what you do with do, it's not
8 going to change. They got to go. It's plain and
9 simple. They got to go because what they do is they
10 retaliate against the people that are defending their
11 residents that were chosen by the residents, and this
12 has got to stop. It's really—it's just overwhelming.
13 It pisses me off. You know, it really pisses me off
14 that we keep doing the same thing over and over and
15 over, and what's going to happen now is that next
16 week it's going to be freezing cold, and I'm going to
17 get 20,000 calls. I got bags under my eyes. I'm
18 tired. I'm a person that suffer from Lupus. Any
19 little thing that upsets me, my Lupus acts up. How
20 long is this going to continue to go on? And until
21 somebody goes to jail, I am not going to be
22 satisfied. I'm sorry. I'm not. You got kids with
23 lead. You got people living in conditions that are
24 inhabitable, and nobody is going to jail, but yeah,
25 they're getting million dollar contracts. They're

2 getting million dollar jobs, and we're sitting here
3 living in poor conditions. You think that's really
4 fair? How long will we have to do this? How many
5 meetings or how many hearings and many things are we
6 going to have to keep going through to get the
7 message? I'm asking Vito to check out Resident
8 Engagement, find out what's happening with them TPA
9 funds, and why they don't want to give us our money?
10 And I demand an overhaul of the TPA and my election.
11 It has to be looked into. They keep taking our money
12 like it's nothing, and it's not their money. It's
13 the residents' money. They get money for each
14 apartment. How dare they think they can do what they
15 want with that money. I'm just so sick of it. I-I-I
16 am so sick of it. I'm sick of them. I'm sick of all
17 of it, and you know what? The ones that are
18 suffering are our seniors and our children, and that
19 my dear is unacceptable, and I thank you again, and
20 I'm sorry I'm getting carried away, but this just-
21 this shit's gotta stop.

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you, Ms.
23 Quinones. Thank you so much.

24 CARMEN QUINONES: You're welcome.

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And I just
3 want to emphasize why we have the resident panel
4 before the agency is because we need to hear the
5 voices of--[applause]---

6 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] No
7 applause.

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: --of the
9 people. [gavel]

10 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Folks. No applause.
11 (sic)

12 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: We need to
13 hear of the people, and the purpose of today's
14 hearing is to make sure that NYCHA is prepared as we
15 go into the heating system, and if they're not, we
16 need to figure out how. So, as we transition, NYCHA
17 will be the next panel, and I know that there are
18 some slides or some charts that you wanted to
19 displace, and so NYCHA, you can come forward. So, the
20 first NYCHA will include the General Manager Vito
21 Mustaciuolo; Executive Vice President for Capital
22 Projects, Deborah Goddard; Cathy Pennington,
23 Executive Vice President for Operations; as well as
24 Javier Almodobar, Director for Heating, and we have
25 been joined by Council Member Perkins and Council

2 Member Van Bramer, and Council Member Ritchie Torres.

3 [background comments, pause]

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Is everyone
5 ready? Okay, would you please raise your right hand?
6 Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and
7 nothing but the truth in your testimony before this
8 committee, and to respond honestly all Council
9 Members' questions?

10 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: I do.

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you.
12 You can begin.

13 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: [coughs] Chair Alicka
14 Ampry-Samuel, members of the Committee on Public
15 Housing, and other members of the City Council, good
16 afternoon. I'm am Vito Mustaciuolo, NYCHA's General
17 Manager. I am please to be joined by Cathy
18 Pennington, NYCHA's Executive Vice President for
19 Operations; Deborah Goddard, Executive Vice President
20 for Capital Projects; and Javier Almodobar, our newly
21 appointed Director of Heating Management Services
22 Department. Delivering essential services such as
23 heat and hot water are at the heart of NYCHA's
24 responsibility as a landlord. As part of our Next
25 Generation NYCHA mission, we are changing the way we

2 do business to become better landlords for our
3 residents. We have recently brought on board a new
4 Senior Vice President for Operations Support
5 Services, Joey Koch whose responsibilities include
6 overseeing the management of heating systems at
7 NYCHA. With new leadership at the helm including
8 interim chair Stanley Brezenoff, we have undertaken
9 significant steps to improve heat and hot water
10 services for our residents. Thank you for this
11 opportunity to discuss these efforts today. Last
12 winter presented the longest stretch of below
13 freezing days the city has experienced in nearly 60
14 years. The failures in our equipment put a spot
15 light on the unfortunate reality that we have been
16 discussing for years, that NYCHA's aging
17 infrastructure has been starved of the investment and
18 resources it most desperately needs. A \$3 billion
19 reduction in federal funding since 2001 has
20 contributed to a nearly \$32 billion backlog in
21 capital improvement needs. Despite the magnitude of
22 these issues, NYCHA remains committed to doing as
23 much as we can with the resources that we have
24 including making operational improvements that enable
25 us to restore service as quickly as possible. We are

2 thankful that Mayor de Blasio has stepped up to help
3 begin to tackle the significant challenges. He
4 committed \$13 million in January and an additional
5 \$200 million shortly thereafter for our heating
6 systems, money we are putting to good use in advance
7 of this coming winter season. Here are some of the
8 actions that we have taken since last winter to
9 improve heat and hot water services at NYCHA: We
10 performed annual preventative maintenance on our
11 heating equipment including making building repairs
12 and repairs to boiler controls. We have overhauled
13 1,918 boilers citywide, over 98% of our existing
14 boilers in preparation for this heating season. The
15 remaining 48 boilers are currently undergoing repairs
16 and we fully expect to have those completed by the
17 first week of November. During the heating season,
18 as the weather gets colder, we will increase the
19 number of off-hours personnel. These roving teams
20 include supervisors, oil burning mechanics,
21 electricians and plumbers. We determined that new
22 skills were needed for our heating response in
23 addition to the positions that I have just mentioned.
24 As part of a pilot program for this winter we have
25 added stationary engineers who can better diagnose

2 and repair issues that affect service disruptions.

3 Station engineers help NYCHA to immediately make the

4 necessary repairs and thus lessen the time our

5 residents are left without services. We've invested

6 in heat related improvements that target 87,000

7 residents, 12 heating plants and received new boilers

8 with several receiving complete upgrades. Two more

9 plants will receive replacements soon, meaning this

10 heat season, new mobile boilers at six developments.

11 We will also have five new mobile boilers that will

12 be used for contingency for our vulnerable sites and

13 new window balances to help retain heat at our

14 buildings for seniors. To date, we have accomplished

15 7,600 of those repairs. As of October 1, 2018,

16 heating plants at 41 developments are being serviced

17 and repaired by third-party vendors bringing the

18 total to 46 developments and an additional

19 development is coming online later this year. When

20 freezing temperatures are expected, we will be adding

21 additional heating and emergency services staff

22 enabling faster repairs for residents. This includes

23 permanent staffing lines for 8 plumbers, 8 plumber

24 helpers 6 oilers. We've improved the way residents

25 can report heat and hot water issues, and enhanced

2 the notification process after a service interruption
3 though automated calls that allow for instant
4 feedback from residents. This provides us more
5 detailed information enabling resident complaints to
6 be identified and addressed quickly. We have
7 accelerated the design process for nine heating
8 process funded for replacement by Mayor de Blasio
9 meaning that they'll come into service six months
10 faster than is typical for such work. This past
11 spring, we worked with the FDNY to streamline the
12 notification process for staff whose certificates
13 will be expiring. 274 staff have received their
14 certifications to work in boiler plants. Long
15 overdue technology improvements are helping NYCHA
16 better connect with and serve our residents. Since
17 last heating season, we have implemented multiple new
18 measures with more coming online soon to speed our
19 responses to service interruptions. For instance, we
20 are digitizing boiler room inspections and fuel
21 requests, which will provide real time centralized
22 updates on where repairs are needed, and increase
23 accountability. We have enhanced heat related worker
24 (sic) data providing visibility into the root causes
25 of several disruptions—of service disruptions. This

2 allows staff to perform predictive and preventative
3 maintenance and proactively address problems. We
4 have improved the heating metric system by
5 integrating data into one dashboard. This provides
6 visibility into the functioning of the heating system
7 and enables us to identify trends. The data informs
8 preventative and predictive maintenance improving the
9 operation of heating systems and allowing NYCHA to
10 provide better services for the residents. Our work
11 to replace outdated boilers and modernize heat
12 systems and controls and hot water making technology—
13 I'm sorry and hot water technology continues.
14 Additionally, 32 new boilers at nine heating plants
15 serving 11 sites that were funded by Mayor de Blasio
16 earlier this year are currently on track. The bids
17 for these boilers are due back to NYCHA by November
18 5th. We hope to begin construction on these heating
19 plants this spring. To be clear, these boilers are
20 off-the-shelf purchases, but traditionally take at
21 least one year to scope and design before they are
22 able to go out for bid. There is an additional four
23 to six months included in for the procurement process
24 before we can award a contract. Finally,
25 construction takes 2 to 3-1/2 years depending on the

2 size of the boiler plant. That means historically
3 boiler plants have taken 3-1/2 to 5 years before they
4 are fully renovated. This time limit has presented
5 many issues, but the most serious is that we cannot
6 deliver a new permanent heat source to our resident
7 faster. In March we announced an expedited timeline
8 to streamline the process. We were able to cut one
9 to two years out of the total timeline depending on
10 the size of heating plant. We are keeping our
11 promise. NYCHA scoped and designed the heating
12 plants in six months, on schedule and boilers are
13 coming faster than ever before. As part of our Five-
14 Year Capital Plan, we are investing a total of \$808
15 million in heat related programs with federal, state
16 and city funding as well as investments from our
17 Energy Performance Contracts. HUD's EPC Program
18 enables us to replace boilers and modernize heating
19 systems with assistance from energy service companies
20 without spending competent--capital dollars up front.
21 The improvements in this program are funded by cost
22 savings from reduced energy consumption. It must be
23 reiterated, however, that despite our best efforts, a
24 fundamental fact remains: NYCHA needs more funding
25 to replace outdated infrastructure, and to maintain

2 our buildings in a state of good repair. Our
3 portfolio requires billions for heating plants and
4 related infrastructure alone. This includes 1,100
5 boilers that need to be replaced. These boilers at
6 this stage of their life cycle are unreliable and
7 will not deliver the level of service that our
8 residents deserve. We appreciate that the Mayor has
9 identified heating as a critical need, and provided
10 additional funding to help us make these repairs.
11 The state for the past two budgets has included funds
12 dedicated specifically to boiler replacement, but
13 these funds have not been released, and the residents
14 living at developments in the state pipeline continue
15 to depend on aging, unreliable boilers, but we are
16 not letting these financial hurdles limit us. While
17 there is not silver bullet that will ensure that
18 there will never be an outage at NYCHA, we are doing
19 everything we can making substantive changes to
20 provide residents with services that they deserve.
21 We look forward to our continued work with the City
22 Council and other partners to get the resources NYCHA
23 needs to best serve our residents, and we will
24 continue to use all of our resources wisely to
25 maximize the benefit for the residents. Thank you

2 again, and we are happy to answer any questions that
3 you may have.

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you,
5 Vito. So, we've heard from the residents about just
6 this past weekend, as well as over the past two weeks
7 or just as October 1st about the number of heat and
8 hot water outages they've experienced. So, just
9 jumping right into the questions so we can figure out
10 what is happening. As of today, your Online Tracker
11 states that the following public housing developments
12 do not have heat and hot water: 20 developments, 181
13 buildings, 13,585 units, 3,966 individuals, and we
14 saw last night it was Astoria Houses, Baruch,
15 Bushwick 2, Claremont, Coney Island, Douglas 2,
16 Gowanus, Grant, Lincoln, Marcy, Monroe, Pelham, Pink
17 and Queensbridge. This is just what we were able to
18 pull over the past 24 hours. So, can you explain to
19 us, and what's not on the list, I just want to make
20 note is Jefferson Houses, and can you give us the
21 number of current developments that is without heat
22 and hot water right now? Can you list the
23 development name? Can you list the number of units
24 and can you list the number of people that are
25 affected by that outage as of right now?

2 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Sure. So, I'm going
3 to start. So, some of the developments that you
4 mentioned were scheduled to—for us to make needed
5 repairs meaning that we intentionally brought the
6 system down so that it wasn't a defect with the—with
7 the system. Cathy and Javier can best address the
8 specifics, but this is the time of year when heating
9 plants are starting to—to really kind of fire up,
10 right? They're—they are not at their optimal use
11 during the summertime, and with temperatures that
12 have been teetering in the 50s and dropping down into
13 the 40s, this is the time where we're making those
14 necessary and needed repairs. Before actually into
15 the throes of the winters, but again, I will ask
16 Cathy and Javier to elaborate more on the outages
17 that you've mentioned. [pause]

18 CATHY PENNINGTON: Good afternoon,
19 Council Member. So, of the current outages we are—
20 and these change within every 15 minutes—we have
21 currently seven developments that are either without
22 hot water or heat, four of which were scheduled
23 outages. As the GM referred, we have them scheduled
24 because the temperatures were going to be more mild
25 today, and it was an optimal time for us to make some

2 repairs. So, when that occurs, of course, we notify
3 our residents ahead of time for scheduled outages so
4 that they have been advised. That affect--those
5 seven developments affect 52 buildings and 4,952
6 units, and 11,629 individuals.

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, I have a
8 question about the system itself. The tracking
9 database that you use when you go on the NYCHA
10 website, and I'm must going to show you this. This
11 is what we see, and the numbers that you're reading
12 is it from this?

13 CATHY PENNINGTON: Yes.

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, what you
15 just read if we log onto the website now and go to
16 the database, we will see the same exact numbers that
17 you just reported?

18 CATHY PENNINGTON: Yes, depending what
19 time you're running the report because I said it
20 changes as we close or open. So, you'll see the
21 numbers fluctuate throughout the day--

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay.

23 CATHY PENNINGTON: --or even, you know,
24 in a given hour.

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, when you
3 go on a site, you can click on the current outages--

4 CATHY PENNINGTON: Correct.

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: --and then
6 there's a tab where you can click on "Restored within
7 the last 24 hours."

8 CATHY PENNINGTON: Yes.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, when we
10 did that--when I click on the current outages, you
11 know, just from what you're saying. It could be
12 different every 15 minutes, but what should be
13 reflected in the *Restored Within the Last 24 Hours*
14 should be what we saw if we clicked on previously the
15 Current tab. Am I right or wrong?

16 CATHY PENNINGTON: Yes. So, you would
17 see if there was an outage on the current Service
18 Interruption Report that over the period of time it
19 would show up on the last 24 hours, but remember the--
20 the 24-Hour Restoration Report that's also being
21 adjusted as every 24-hour increment and there's--
22 there's developments that would drop off of that.
23 So, it only retains within the last days
24 restorations. So a restoration could have--could have
25 occurred on Monday. You won't see it on this report

2 or if it occurred on Tuesday. On Tuesday you've
3 likely depending what time it was restored, you would
4 still see it on the report. So, there should be—it
5 should correspond.

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: It should
7 correspond.

8 CATHY PENNINGTON: Uh-hm.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I mean it's—so
10 if I—if I went to the tab that said "Current
11 Yesterday" and it was restored today, then that list
12 should be on what was restored within the past 24
13 hours whether it was—I mean I get what you're saying
14 over the—like if it's a 6:00 a.m., it did not go back
15 at 6:00 a.m. the next day and it's actually 7:00 a.m.
16 24 hours has passed, and so it would not be on that
17 list, but we have developments that never made it to
18 the list. So I'm just trying to figure out—

19 CATHY PENNINGTON: [interposing] Never
20 made it to the Outage List?

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Never made it
22 to the Outage List period.

23 CATHY PENNINGTON: Okay, so that could
24 be—so an outage is when we have declared—so we have
25 gone to the plant, and the plant is offline, and—and

2 the outage is declared in our system either for a
3 building or a particular line--

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]
5 I remember this from the last hearing--

6 CATHY PENNINGTON: --or the entire
7 development.

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: --the
9 building, the line--

10 CATHY PENNINGTON: Exactly.

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: --the room. I
12 remember that.

13 CATHY PENNINGTON: Now someone and
14 individual residence can call in for their apartment,
15 but that doesn't become an outage until there's a
16 larger number. That's what's triggering--

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]
18 Okay, so let me use it as an example.

19 CATHY PENNINGTON: Okay.

20 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: We had
21 Glenmore Houses, right that we took down. I'm
22 looking at this sheet and it's heat, it's hot water,
23 it's heat and hot water and then there's no--there's
24 water, there's elevators, there's gas. So, one
25 development like no water at all right? So, let's

2 just use with that rationale, let's use Glenmore
3 Houses. Glenmore Houses was not at all listed as an
4 outage, but they had no water at all for two days
5 over the weekend. So, can you explain to me how that
6 outage did not make it to the database?

7 CATHY PENNINGTON: I don't know any
8 specifics about that particular outage. I'd have to--
9 to find out about it.

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I mean they
11 had pumps out there. They had--they had to go
12 downstairs and get water from a bucket. So, this was
13 a major outage.

14 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Okay, we will look
15 into that specifically.

16 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: No, no, no,
17 no, no, no, no, no, no, no, no, no.

18 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: If I--if I can--

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]
20 that was a major outage.

21 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: While we--

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]
23 They had no water.

24 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: While we sit here we
25 will research that, and have an answer for this.

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay. So, what
3 it seems to me--so, what I'm trying to figure out--

4 CATHY PENNINGTON: [interposing] But--but
5 this--the--the report you're referring to is hot water
6 and heat.

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Well--

8 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: [interposing] Right,
9 we--we will

10 CATHY PENNINGTON: But we'll--

11 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: --we will have an
12 answer for you before the end of the hearing.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: It says--the
14 task says heat, hot water and water.

15 CATHY PENNINGTON: Oh, you did--okay--

16 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]
17 So--

18 CATHY PENNINGTON: --you're talking about
19 the water.

20 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, are you
21 not tacking no water at all? So, you're not tracking
22 that on this data base?

23 CATHY PENNINGTON: I didn't--I don't see--
24 it is not tracked on the heat and hot water one. It'
25 tracked separately.

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, if we're
3 talking about families not having sufficient heat or
4 hot water, I would think that not having water at all
5 is a--should--is something that should be tracked as
6 well, right?

7 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Again--

8 CATHY PENNINGTON: [interposing] We'll
9 get an answer.

10 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: --we'll look into it.

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, alright.
12 So, from the developments that we did list without
13 heat and hot water that are on this tracking system--
14 that are on the database, can you explain to us if we
15 just go line by line so that we can understand what's
16 happening? Can you explain when will those services
17 be restored so we can understand what's happening at
18 the development, and what type of problem it is, and
19 what needs to be done?

20 CATHY PENNINGTON: Sure. So, thank you
21 for that question, and again, we are committed to
22 rapid response on repairs, and I would restate as the
23 GM presented in his testimony that we have 1,100
24 boilers that are outdated and require replacement.
25 So, that is why we have set up communications and

2 tracking tools so that all of our residents and
3 customers know what the statuses are. So, I'm going
4 to ask Javier Almodobar, our Heating Director to
5 speak to some of the specific outages.

6 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Good morning everyone.
7 Good morning. So, Astoria Houses is the first one on
8 your list.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, uh-hm.

10 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Astoria Houses
11 although it says that its's not planned, it's
12 actually a planned outage related to construction.
13 Baruch Houses is also a planned outage, which is
14 related to a steam line repair, a steam line that
15 we're repair-repairing right now. Bushwick Groups A
16 and--

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]
18 Go back to Baruch Houses. What did you say?

19 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: I said it's a steam
20 line, a main underground steam line that we're in the
21 process of repairing. It involves excavation. A
22 steam line that's underground supplies the building
23 with the steam that's generated from the boiler.

24 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: But Javier said that
25 was a scheduled outage.

2 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: That's a scheduled
3 outage, yes.

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, how long
5 would they be without--

6 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Well--

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: --heat and hot
8 water?

9 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: --because it's a
10 scheduled outage, we plan to have that back up before
11 the end of the day.

12 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay.

13 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Astoria as well before
14 the end of the day. Any of the planned outages, we--
15 we--we plan them so that we can have them up within
16 the 8 hours that we're there.

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And you said
18 Astoria was a planned outage.

19 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Yes.

20 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And on the
21 site it site it says it was not a planned outage. Is
22 there a reason why it says it's not a planned?

23 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: It could have been
24 entered into the system incorrectly by whoever put it
25 in.

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, okay. So,
3 who enters the information to the system? Because I
4 just—you said it could have been entered incorrectly
5 into the system.

6 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Uh-hm.

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, who enters
8 the information into the system?

9 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: It would be either my
10 heating staff or the property maintenance supervisor
11 at the development. Normally, when it's related to
12 our—a scheduled construction work like it is at
13 Astoria, Bushwick as well, by the way it's done by
14 the property maintenance supervisors, supervisors
15 that are at the development.

16 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay.
17 Continue.

18 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: And Lincoln is
19 unscheduled. It's an issue with a building, and it's
20 no hot water. Lincoln Houses has hot water
21 generating equipment that has been in place since the
22 buildings were built. Monroe was an issue with--

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]
24 Going back to Lincoln it says that Lincoln was
25 without heat and hot water for—from the time we

2 printed this it said 37 hours. So, then you said
3 it's more than 37 hours now right? [background
4 comments, pause]

5 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: And this--this is--I've
6 got to make sure I'm looking at the right report
7 within the last 24 hours. So, Lincoln Houses was a
8 hot water issue related to the hot water generator,
9 it was--which was a coil leak on the hot water
10 generator's neck piece, and that one was actually
11 started the same day later in the evening because
12 these jobs are very complex jobs, it's a large piece
13 of equipment that has to be taken apart, and then put
14 back together, and it takes a number of plumbers to
15 do this work.

16 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, Lincoln is
17 not a heat and hot water, it is just a--?

18 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: This one at Lincoln
19 was a hot water issue.

20 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Not heat?

21 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Not heat. This one
22 was hot water at Lincoln.

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, when you
24 look at the site, when you look at Lincoln, it says

2 heat and hot water. So, was that information entered
3 incorrectly?

4 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: This one is from the
5 21st on this sheet.

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: October 21st--

7 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Yeah.

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: --Lincoln not a
9 planned outage, 37 hours. The report came in at
10 11:22 p.m. Are we looking at the same thing?

11 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: That's what I'm
12 looking at yes.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And the symbol
14 that's next to Lincoln is a symbol for heat and hot
15 water. There's one for heat, there's one for hot
16 water, there's one for heat and hot water, and
17 there's one for water.

18 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: [pause] Let's see.
19 I'm sorry.

20 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, was that
21 information entered incorrectly? Is it a heating
22 issue? Is it a hot water issue? Is it a heat and
23 hot water issue? Is--have they been without heat and
24 hot water for 37 hours plus? [background comments,
25 pause]

2 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Council Member, just
3 give us a minute to-to go over those notes [coughs]
4 because we do have conflicting information on this.

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, and that's
6 the probable.

7 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Yeah.

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: The problem is
9 this is a--this is a new tracking system that we're
10 using that's supposed to be transparent so people can
11 know what's happening, so resident can know what's
12 happening, so we can know what's happening, and what
13 I'm hearing is, you know, we're not sure what's going
14 on. It could have been entered incorrectly.

15 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: It's noted--

16 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: That's right.

17 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: --and we will take a
18 closer look into this.

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: It's difficult
20 for me to go on right now because this is critical.
21 Like this is the first set of questions. We're
22 asking how many developments are without heat and hot
23 water. We're looking at the actual website that
24 we're told to go to because we're not getting
25 information from NYCHA. So, if we're using this

2 opportunity to have an oversight hearing, and we're
3 asking questions, I'm confused as to why we don't
4 have the answers.

5 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Again, it's duly
6 noted, and we will get back to you.

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I'm supposed
8 to go on. So, we're going to sit here and wait until
9 we can figure this out. Let's give you two—are you
10 ready?

11 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Yes.

12 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay.
13 [background comments, pause] I'm so confused right
14 now. [pause] Just to make sure it's not me,
15 colleagues, do you all have something that's related
16 to this?

17 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: I'm sorry.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: That's related
19 to this?

20 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: What are you asking?

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Because I want
22 to make sure that I'm not like off bases here?

23 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: So, first and
24 foremost—

25 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay.

2 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: So, back to—I'm going
3 to go back to—I'm going to go back to Lincoln for a
4 minute. So, it was solely by memory, and I looked at
5 this—

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Say that
7 again.

8 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: I was going solely by
9 memory, and I looked at this—

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]
11 Say it—

12 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: I was going by solely
13 by memory, and I looked at this incorrectly, and
14 you're right it is, it was heat and hot water and
15 that—it was due to a—to much heat conditions that had
16 to be corrected that was caused by a steam leak in
17 the tank room and, in fact, it—

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Say it one
19 more time. You need to allow me--

20 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: [interposing] It was
21 caused by too much heat complaint--

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay.

23 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: --that was caused by a
24 steam leak in the tank room, and the steam to the

2 building had to be shut off so that we can make the
3 repair--

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]
5 Okay.

6 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: --and it affected heat
7 and hot water.

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, I

9 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: I--I want to apologize
10 for being incorrect from the very beginning.

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, do they
12 currently have heat and hot water?

13 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Yes.

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: They do?

15 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Yes. This is from the
16 21st.

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: When was that
18 restored?

19 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: This was restored the
20 same day, the same evening.

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And what's
22 today?

23 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Today's the 24th.

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: --the 24th.
25 So, when we spend about five minutes--

2 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: [interposing] So--

3 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: --going over
4 the current outages versus restored outages within 24
5 hours, and how those are removed from the database
6 after 24 hours, this is from the 21st. So--

7 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: So, it was reported on
8 the 21st in the evening of the 21st. So, it was
9 restored the following day--

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]
11 which is the 22nd.

12 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: --on the same day
13 within--

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]
15 So that was 48 hours?

16 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: It went--it went--it
17 went into the evening the following day.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So,
19 technically that shouldn't be on this list, right?
20 Because that was restored within 24 hours, but
21 they're still on a list because of what? Based on
22 what Ms. Pennington said a few minutes ago?

23 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: This is a list of
24 outages that were restored within the past 24 hours.

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: No, it was the
3 24th.

4 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: It was on the 24th.
5 [background comments]

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: We're going to
7 give you all a few minutes to get it together before
8 we can move on. [pause] I'm just trying to really
9 get some clarity on this data base because we're
10 trying to figure out if we can actually look to this
11 data base and see what's happening and then the
12 purpose of this to go through line by line of the
13 different developments is to figure out what's
14 happening at each development. So we can really have
15 an understanding of what needs to be done or what
16 NYCHA is doing or how we can help. That's the
17 purpose of this, and it would be helpful to be able
18 to have this information readily available because
19 this is information that you supposedly received and
20 entered into the database. So, it would be helpful
21 to know what you're entering and who's entering it
22 and be able to report on it.

23 CATHY PENNINGTON: So, as we said, these
24 dashboards are created by staff for outages. They do
25 not represent every complaint that comes in from a

2 resident because these outages are reflecting where
3 there's a major development outage either in a
4 building or the entire development. It depends on
5 the outage. So, in a boiler plant we could have six
6 boilers. There could be two boilers down. So, the
7 outage will reflect what part and how many units in
8 that development are affected. So, these are created
9 by our heating administrative staff, and reflect
10 current information, and then as we close them, then
11 they are removed from the current outage report. We
12 don't [background comments] Excuse me one minute.
13 [background comments, pause] Okay. So, we'll—we—we
14 will—we're going to look up the status on Lincoln.
15 That's the one that's being questioned. It's still
16 showing up.

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I mean at this
18 point, the system is being questioned. Not, I mean—
19 Lincoln, yes, and—but in addition to that, the actual
20 data base itself. So, let me ask a question about
21 Sterling Rehab. Over the weekend Sterling Rehab was
22 without heat and hot water as it reported in the
23 system for 57 hours. [pause] Can you explain why it
24 took 57 plus hours in order to fix whatever the
25 problem was at Sterling Rehab?

2 CATHY PENNINGTON: So--

3 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]

4 So, you can explain what happened?

5 CATHY PENNINGTON: --we certainly can--
6 yeah, we can certainly explain that. One piece of
7 good news related to that outage is we are fortunate
8 to be at that time of year where the temperatures are
9 fluctuating. So, residents at that development were
10 in time periods when the weather was warmer. Once we
11 established the outage for repairs, we didn't go in
12 and close it when the temperature, you know, caused--
13 it went off is my point, but there were an extensive
14 amount of repairs being done at that property, and
15 then unfortunately National Grid was working in the
16 street on doing other work unrelated to NYCHA, and
17 there was gas service that was disconnected to our
18 property, and that was after we had made the repairs.
19 So it was kind of a sequence of problems that
20 occurred at that property, and I can ask--

21 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Sure.

22 CATHY PENNINGTON: --Javier to respond.

23 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: [off mic] Can you hear
24 me? [background comments] [on mic] Is that better?

25 So, at Sterling the problem actually started on--on

2 Friday. Friday there was a basement stoppage that
3 affected the equipment in the boiler room. It's
4 important to point out that the plant at Sterling is
5 a fairly new plant. It's a digital plant so it has
6 digital electrical components that help it operate
7 while they keep it running. The sewage stoppage
8 affected a digital board on the master controller of
9 the plant, and when we attempted to purchase it
10 locally, we could not locate it locally. So, because
11 we couldn't locate it locally, what we did was we
12 went to Plan B where we supplied heat from a
13 neighboring building from the plant in the
14 neighboring building, and we worked through Friday
15 and Saturday to make that connection. What's
16 important to point out is that while we were doing
17 this the temperatures were in the 60s by this time.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank God.

19 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Yes, exactly, thank
20 God. [coughs] So, Saturday when we were prepared to
21 start up the—the plant that was going to support both
22 buildings in preparation for Sunday, there was an
23 issue with gas service coming to the—the plant that
24 was going to support both sides at which—at which
25 point we contacted the utility company. The utility

2 company responded that evening, on Saturday evening,
3 and could not determine at that point what the cause
4 was for the loss of gas service to the heating plant.
5 We stood there with them until the end of their
6 shift, and we returned the very next morning, and the
7 very next morning the utility company was on site
8 again with us. They had trouble accessing a vault in
9 the street, and they quickly notified NYPD, which
10 then dispatched a tow truck to remove the vehicle,
11 and once they got into the vault, by this time it was
12 afternoon. They quickly determined what the cause
13 was, and within two hours had the gas service
14 restored to the building, which meant that by I would
15 say 5:00, the heat was restored to the residence on
16 our end.

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: At what point
18 do high level NYCHA officials become aware of heating
19 outages? Is it like after six hours, 12 hours?

20 CATHY PENNINGTON: So the reporting and-
21 and have now figured out what was going wrong when we
22 were talking. So, when we were looking at a report
23 that was the Restoration Report, not the current
24 report. Okay. So Lincoln is not-Lincoln has
25 service. Lincoln is not-not an outage at this time,

2 but when we were looking at it, we put down the
3 wrong-

4 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: [interposing] Time.

5 CATHY PENNINGTON: We put down the wrong
6 tab in our database. So that is showing that Lincoln
7 was restored and the outage was for 37 hours, and it-
8 and that it affected one building.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Can you
10 explain the restoration time? What does that mean?
11 The amount of time it took to restore it or how long
12 it's been restored?

13 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: It's the amount of
14 time that it took to restore it, and confirm that it
15 was restored from the moment that it was first
16 reported, and in this case it was first reported on
17 the--

18 CATHY PENNINGTON: 21st.

19 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: 21st at 11:22 p.m.

20 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, the amount
21 of time it took to restore it plus the time that it
22 was reported that it was restored?

23 CATHY PENNINGTON: Is that what you just
24 said?

2 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: We confirmed. We—so
3 we restore and then we confirm and we want to make
4 sure that we confirm before we close the outage out.

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, it would
6 be helpful to actually have a tab that speaks to the
7 amount of time that the service was actually out
8 because it's easy to say that it was only out for
9 three hours, but it took another 15 to actually
10 confirm that it—the outages—well--

11 CATHY PENNINGTON: [interposing] If—if—if
12 anything--

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: -- an outage.

14 CATHY PENNINGTON: --this outage
15 reporting--if I could find the ad—actually built in
16 where we're doing confirmation. So, we go into the
17 units, and we do temperature testing. Not in every
18 unit, of course, on an outage because it would be too
19 many units, but we take temperature readings, and
20 it's required to take a temperature reading to
21 confirm that heat has been restored before we close
22 the outage. If anything, the—these numbers that you
23 see include that confirmation time period. So, where
24 you see five hours outage, it may have been that they
25 were without heat for four hours, and our

2 confirmation period took another hour. But I—I just
3 want to make sure that we have answered your earlier
4 question about the stability of this data. I can
5 assure you that this is reflecting the current status
6 of eight developments that do not have services at
7 this time of which four—five of them were scheduled,
8 outages for repairs and that this is updated
9 throughout the day and is accurate. I'm sorry for
10 the earlier confusion, but we were on the wrong—we
11 were technically challenged and were on the wrong
12 tab.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: We probably
14 still have to review the transcript because it's
15 still a little confusing. Now, you mentioned a gas
16 outage with National Grid when we were talking about
17 Sterling Rehab. So, there's another tab that speaks
18 to gas outages. So, does—does—can you explain to us
19 when a gas outage actually has a directive impact on
20 no heat and no hot water? When does that happen?
21 What type of boilers or what type of heating systems?

22 CATHY PENNINGTON: So, thanks for that
23 question, and it gives us an opportunity again to
24 speak to the data. The gas outage tab you see on
25 that report is cooking gas.

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]

3 That is not--

4 CATHY PENNINGTON: That is not related to
5 heating.

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, good to
7 know.

8 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Okay, so [coughs]
9 every building has two gas service lines, one for the
10 heating equipment and the other for the cooking gas.
11 In this case, the gas to the building affected the
12 heat and the hot water because we have a hot water
13 heater. There's also supplied with gas.

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, and I
15 just want to recognize we have with us State
16 Assemblywoman Latrice Walker in the audience, and I
17 know she's on a Housing Committee in the New York
18 State Assembly. So, thank you for being here, and we
19 shared about 25 developments between my Council
20 District and her State Assembly District. Thank you
21 for being here. I am going to—I have like a million
22 questions, but I'm going to stop right here, and
23 allow Council Member Ruben Diaz.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]

3 We've also been joined by Council Member Mark Treyger
4 and Council Member Carlos Menchaca, and Council
5 Member Salamanca.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Thank you, Madam
7 Chairlady. I'm going to read, Mr. Mustaciuolo, I'm
8 going to read some of your reports.

9 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: One-one of the
10 paragraphs said: Delivery services such as heat and
11 hot water are at the heart of NYCHA's responsibility
12 as a landlord. With new leadership at the helm
13 including interim chairs Council Stanley Brezenoff we
14 have taken a significant step to improve heat and hot
15 water services for residents. Another paragraph
16 says, We perform annual preventive maintenance on our
17 heating equipment including making welding repairs
18 and repairs to boiler controls. We have overhauled
19 1,918 boilers citywide in preparation for this
20 heating section. Can you-can you tell me of those
21 boilers, those 1,980 boilers that you repaired, can
22 you-can you tell me how many in the Bronx?

23 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Yeah, we could provide
24 you with a breakdown by borough. So, we could send

2 it to the Chair. So we could send you a complete
3 list of all of the--the heating plants.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: I hate to believe
5 that you are not prepared for this meeting because--

6 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: [interposing] So, I'm
7 so sorry, sir, what--?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: [interposing] Well,
9 the questions that we--and also the questions that we
10 ask, you keep saying, we--I'll get back to you or we--
11 okay, let me ask you another question. Do you know--
12 do you know that these people are supposed to work
13 for you, do you know Wallace Dupre? (sp?)

14 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: [interposing] I'm
15 sorry, sir, I don't know that individual.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Do you know Gary
17 Watts?

18 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: No, sir.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Do you know Denise
20 Jiles(sic)? Okay, I'll tell you what on this. These
21 are two emails sent by the Director of Castle Hill
22 Senior Center to them. One of them was--was sent on
23 October 16 by Ms. Emily Pelayo who happens to be the
24 Director of Castle Hill Senior Center. Castle Hill is
25 located at 625 Castle Hill in the Bronx. Last year

2 we had the problem of no heat for senior citizens,
3 and we—most of the year we went—they went to the
4 Church. (sic) So, the—the October 16 email reads:
5 Good morning. It is that time of the year again, and
6 I hope this year can be better—a better one for—a
7 better one with heating the building—the heating in
8 the building is cold. Not sure if you have to send
9 someone to turn over the system for heat to— Oh,
10 okay. And then the second one send October 22nd. The
11 first one was the 16th. This is the 22nd. No one has
12 gotten back to me on the heating on this building.
13 Please. It is very cold. The seniors are
14 complaining and no one has come to convert the HVAC
15 system to heat. So this is the people and on this
16 point, and these are issues for seniors in the center
17 who cope with the—wear a hat for the head because
18 there is no heat in that building. So, I don't know
19 when you say that you have established a new system,
20 and—and—and doing better, I don't know where, I don't
21 know how. So, I would appreciate number 1 if you
22 take into consideration to look and to Castle Hill
23 Senior Center, and come to Bronx Village Senior
24 Housing. The whole campus in Bronx Village. I think
25 that the job that you are—have been doing there and

2 all the people that are supposed to be doing—working
3 there are making you look very bad and I know you are
4 a good guy. You are concerned with the people there.
5 The ones in charge are making you look very bad.
6 Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So me and
8 Council Member Ruben Diaz we think alike clearly
9 because we highlighted the same exact portions of
10 your testimony, and so I just want to do a quick
11 follow up. As Council Member Diaz stated, in your
12 testimony it says: We have overhauled 1,918 boilers
13 citywide, which is 98% of your boilers in preparation
14 and then it says, with the remaining 48 boilers are
15 currently undergoing repairs. So, I just wanted to
16 know what was the—just a quick—what was the outcome
17 of the overhaul that you actually did of all the
18 boilers, and the reason why I ask is because we did
19 have an opportunity to meet prior to this hearing,
20 and when I asked a question about the overhauls, I
21 was told that just because an overhaul as done, does
22 not mean that they are necessarily in decent
23 conditions, and there was like a certain level of
24 information that came out of the overhaul. So, can
25 you just give us a little information—

2 CATHY PENNINGTON: [interposing] Sure.

3 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: --about the
4 overhaul?

5 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: I'm just going to
6 start and then I'll hand it over to Cathy, but the
7 purpose of the overhaul-overhaul is really to
8 identify problems in advance of heat season. It's
9 not a perfect system. It does not identify every
10 problem. Obviously during the summertime it's
11 difficult to determine what will go wrong when the
12 heating plants are fully functional, and providing
13 heat and hot water optimally, but it's an attempt to-
14 to get out in front of it.

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay.

16 CATHY PENNINGTON: So again, we continue
17 to remain committed to rapid response, and as part of
18 being able to rapidly respond during the summer
19 months, we take, of course, the-the boiler plants
20 that are offline, and that's our opportunity to do
21 what I call in lay person's term a tune-up. So,
22 our director can describe in more detail what occurs,
23 but the first phase that was referred to us this
24 summer overhaul, and then there is during that
25 process the identification of repairs that happen in

2 a—in a second phase. So, it's not simultaneous. One
3 occurs first then the second, and as the repairs are
4 identified then we organize and deploy our staff
5 around specific repairs identified during that
6 process, and I'll ask Mr. Almodobar to speak to the
7 specificity of what we do in the summer.

8 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: So, the—any overhaul
9 process is a processing where it was actually
10 designed to preserve and restore the equipment's
11 reliability by cleaning—cleaning it and lubricating
12 it, adjusting it, replacing worn components and
13 making repairs on each individual piece of equipment.
14 What we did differently this year particularly in
15 particular with the boiler plants is we started
16 earlier. By starting earlier it allowed us to dig
17 into some of the key deficiencies within the plants,
18 and some of the things that we—that we dug into were
19 the feed water leveling devices and the associated
20 equipment and piping with it. And the reason why we
21 focus on this was because some of the issues that we
22 experienced last year were related to water leveling
23 problems in the—in the—in some of our plants. And
24 so, what we—what we then did was we didn't only make
25 repairs on the individual boilers, we also re-piped

2 the feed water lines on the boilers. We in some
3 boiler plants we re-piped the entire feed water
4 system from the pump straight to each individuals
5 boiler. In addition to that, we looked at the feed
6 water pumps and instead of just lubricating them, and
7 repairing them, in some plants we replaced them as
8 well. These are—these are some of the things that we
9 did in the plant, and again by—by starting earlier we
10 were able to identify some of these key components.

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, a
12 question. Looking at the ones that you were able to
13 identify with some issues, were those reflected you
14 think in the calls that were received with the
15 outages?

16 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: What we did was we
17 looked at what happened last year, and we looked at
18 the plants that we have problems with. For example
19 like La Guardia. La Guardia was one of the ones that
20 we re-piped the entire feed water system. We looked
21 at unique problems that we had with them, and we
22 tried to address those issues in those plants.

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: You know what
24 would be helpful, to just look at the ones that you
25 have identified as having problems, and compare those

2 with the calls that came in from the residents. That
3 would be helpful. Okay, thank you. Council Member
4 Torres and one second. We also have with us
5 Assemblywoman Linda Rosenthal in the audience. Thank
6 you so much for being here.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I actually want
8 to follow up on the Chair's questions regarding
9 summer overhaul. You said you began earlier. How
10 much earlier did you begin? What's the period of
11 time when you're overhauling boilers?

12 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: We started in April.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: In April and when
14 do you normally start?

15 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: We normally start in
16 June.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: June. Okay, and
18 is—was every boiler overhauled during the summer?

19 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: What is that?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Was every boiler
21 overhauled during that period of time before the
22 heating season?

23 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: We completed the
24 overhaul of boilers at 98% and we still have a few
25

2 that are currently we're—we're working through the
3 repair issues related to overhaul.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And how—how many
5 staff? How many boilers do you have to overhaul?

6 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: How many what?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: How many boilers
8 do you have to overhaul?

9 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: How many? I have
10 1,969.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And how much staff
12 is dedicated to overhauling 1,900 boilers?

13 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: That's all of my
14 frontline staff and supervisors.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: What's that
16 number? Do you have the number?

17 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Approximately, 425
18 people.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: 425 people. Do
20 you have staff that is dedicated to auditing the
21 summer overhauls verifying that it was done
22 correctly?

23 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: We have our quality
24 assurance process where have a special teams unit
25 that does that.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And how large is
3 that team?

4 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: That team currently is
5 four people, but what did differently--

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: The four people
7 are verifying the summer overhauls--

8 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: [interposing] That's--
9 that's the way--

10 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: --on 1,900
11 boilers?

12 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: --that's the way it
13 was last year. This year we increased that to
14 incorporate the area administrators as well.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: So, what's that
16 number?

17 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: It went up eight.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Do you eight is
19 sufficient to verify the overhaul of 1,900 boilers?

20 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: It has been working.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: How many--how many
22 boilers have eight--those eight staffers audited or
23 checked?

24 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Excuse me?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: How many boilers
3 have those eight staffers in your Quality Assurance
4 Division have checked?

5 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: We've done the quality
6 assurance on all of them.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Eight people the
8 quality assurance on 1,900 boilers?

9 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Once the overhaul
10 process is completed, they come and they perform the
11 quality assurance.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: On 1,000 over what
13 period of time?

14 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: I'm sorry.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Over what period
16 of time?

17 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Over the entire course
18 of the--of the overhaul season, which we start it in
19 April and end it in October 1st. Before October 1st.

20 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: [interposing] Council
21 Member, if I may--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Sure.

23 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: I want to add this.
24 In my testimony I talked about efforts that we've
25 made to--to digitize our information, and I believe

2 that there was a criticism that you made of our
3 process at the last hearing--

4 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [interposing]
5 Yes.

6 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: --and it was well
7 taken, and so I would actually

8 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [interposing] I
9 did not realize that, though, that it was well taken
10 but it's good.

11 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Well, it-it was, and
12 so a lot of the information that formerly was
13 captured manually is now captured in our database.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Yes.

15 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: So, even though Javier
16 is talking about actually having staff do a quality
17 control check, the information now is-is and I could
18 have Bob Marano, who is the Executive Vice President
19 for our IT Division talk about the changes that we
20 made because they're--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [interposing]
22 Yes.

23 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: --they're going to
24 help us tremendously.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [interposing] And
3 I appreciate those changes, but I'm limited for time.
4 So, I just want to—

5 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: [interposing] Okay.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: --go through my
7 questions. Are the staffers who perform the summer
8 overhauls are they required to produce reports?

9 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: We have what's called
10 a PM Report that they fill out.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And did those
12 reports identify the repair needs of those boilers?

13 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: The report identifies
14 some of the repair needs, yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And so I have a
16 question: Is NYCHA willing to make those reports
17 available to the City Council? Are you willing to
18 even post them online so that residents can know here
19 are the repair needs associated with a boiler in a
20 particular development?

21 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: I will have to look
22 into how difficult or easy it might be to make them
23 publicly available online. [coughs] We could
24 certainly provide you copies.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Okay. What are
3 the number of outages that have transpired so far in
4 the heating season?

5 CATHY PENNINGTON: I'm sorry the number
6 of--?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Of outages, the
8 total number?

9 CATHY PENNINGTON: So, averages have been
10 70, and the average hours to complete those were
11 very--

12 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [interposing] I'm
13 sorry, the averages have been--?

14 CATHY PENNINGTON: It's 14.3 and that was
15 at 22 developments.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I'm sorry. The
17 total number of outages has been 70?

18 CATHY PENNINGTON: 70.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: In the whole
20 heating--

21 CATHY PENNINGTON: [interposing] In 22--
22 in 22 developments.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Throughout the
24 whole heating season?

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 70

2 CATHY PENNINGTON: Oh, I'm sorry. I
3 thought, you're talking about just this season.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: No, not-
5 throughout this heating season?

6 CATHY PENNINGTON: Yeah, this season.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: So far only 70
8 outages?

9 CATHY PENNINGTON: Yes.

10 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Those for heat.

11 CATHY PENNINGTON: Right. 70 for heat.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: How many for hot
13 water?

14 CATHY PENNINGTON: 161. So, I-so you seem
15 pleased that there's only 70.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: So, these
17 numbers-the Legal Aid Society earlier I believe
18 testified 33,000 outages in the past few days.
19 You're telling me 70 outages for heat and 161 for hot
20 water. I mean for a portfolio of 175,000 units,
21 those numbers seem suspiciously low.

22 CATHY PENNINGTON: Well, the heating
23 season just started October 1st and the temperatures
24 have been in our favor.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Okay.

2 CATHY PENNINGTON: So, again, but there-
3 there's—the number I gave you was for heat and then
4 there's one for hot water, and these are the outages
5 that we declare when the plant is down.

6 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: And sir, if I wanted
7 to, it would be helpful if we Fleet Lane (sic) can
8 provide us with the information that they used to
9 come up with that number.

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: That's from
11 your website.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: But I just don't—
13 like last year—

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]
15 It's from your website.

16 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: The report is 33,000?

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Yes. Uh-hm.

18 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: But it—that, and this
19 is where I think [coughs] I wasn't here last winter,
20 but I think I think we'll look at the numbers.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [interposing] So,
22 the last—

23 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: [interposing] Sir, if
24 I can—if I can--

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: When-when-when
3 Chair Ampry-Samuel and I conducted an investigation,
4 we found there were 343,000 heat and hot water
5 outages in the last hearing season.

6 CATHY PENNINGTON: Those were probably
7 work order. It's just a different way to measure.
8 There's work orders and outages and they're-there are
9 just distinct types of data in our system.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: So, what are the
11 number of work orders if-

12 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: The number of work-

13 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: [interposing] If I-I'm
14 sorry, if I can.

15 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: It's okay.

16 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: It's like one of the
17 problems that we have had historically is that we-
18 we're basically are double counting and this includes
19 duplicate outages. So, so there is-these are not a
20 distinct number of residents that have been affected,
21 right. So, if we had an outage that was restored and
22 it was a repeat, we count that development twice, and
23 so we need to do a better job as to how we publicly
24 report out on how many residents were affected right,
25 because we're counting the same residents in the same

2 development multiple times, and it's a different
3 question.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I mean what--what
5 definition of outage would lead you to conclude that
6 that there only 70 heating outages so far in the
7 heating season? It's been--we're almost a month in.
8 That number is just utterly implausible to us.

9 CATHY PENNINGTON: So, so thank you for
10 your question, and let me take this an opportunity to
11 clarify. So, just for the basis of definition, an
12 outage is a major service interruption affecting an
13 entire development, buildings, stairs, halls or
14 apartment line. A work order is a resident initiated
15 complaint about a deficiency that is called into our
16 call centers about their individual unit. So, it's
17 just two different ways that we're measuring it. One
18 is unit based and the complaint--

19 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [interposing] So,
20 if you--if you have a development with a thousand
21 units, and the boilers break down there, you count
22 that as one outage?

23 CATHY PENNINGTON: If--if all the boilers
24 were down that would be counted as one outage, yes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: So, if there were
3 multiple boilers that broke down at the same time
4 affecting thousands of developments, you count that
5 as one outage?

6 CATHY PENNINGTON: Correct.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: So, what are the
8 number of work orders?

9 CATHY PENNINGTON: One. [background
10 comments]

11 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: So when a plant, when
12 the entire plant is down, it affects both heat and
13 hot water, and in that sense we create an outage one
14 for heat and one for hot water. Now, within the
15 plant there are sectional valves, and what does occur
16 from time to time is, and which drives up the number
17 of outage—drives it up a bit is that when a section
18 of the location suffers a—let's say a steam leak, we
19 shut that section off to make the repairs on that
20 steam leak, and it affects a number of buildings
21 within a development, and in that sense, we don't
22 create one single outage for the entire development.
23 We then now create two outages for each building
24 affected even though it's one outage, one for heat
25 and one for hot water, because it's not the entire

2 development and just for the purposes of being as
3 transparent as we can be, we'll make the outage work
4 order for each building effective.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Okay. I'm sure
6 we can have an endless debate about the meaning of
7 outages and work orders, but it's—I'll move on. So,
8 I understand that NYCHA has a massive capital need,
9 but here is my criticism of that Housing Authority.
10 Even if we gave you the funding that you need to
11 upgrade your heating systems, I remain skeptical that
12 you have the technical capacity to maintain those
13 systems. Right, you have boilers that date back to
14 1950 like the one in Staten Island that are
15 performing well, that are well maintained, and then
16 you have boilers that are substantially younger that
17 are breaking down. And so, that tells me it's not
18 only about funding, it's also about management. It's
19 about staffing. It's about training. Can I ask about
20 training? Is the training of your heating staff
21 different today than it was a year ago?

22 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Yes, it is. What we
23 did was with all new HPTs that come in to the
24 department, before now we had a 27-day training
25 course over the course of about 6 to 9 months. We've

2 expanded that to 38 days to include 11 days of more
3 hands-on training. There's basic electrical.
4 There's basic trouble shooting, and our pump shop as
5 well to--again to include more hands-on training.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And just very
7 quickly, you sand you have roving crews. What are
8 the number of roving crews you have?

9 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: During the heating
10 season right now we have 16 roving crews.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Sixteen roving
12 crews. What's the number of staffers in each roving
13 crew?

14 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Two per crew.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Two per crew.
16 What are the number of developments overseen by each
17 roving crew?

18 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: They--they oversee the
19 entire development--the entire city. So, all of our
20 developments.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: So, wait, you
22 don't have a development assigned to each roving
23 crew?

24

25

2 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: They're broken down by
3 cluster. So each roving crew has about 12 to 15
4 developments.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: So, how large is
6 each cluster? Is it done by unit? Is done—are there
7 five developments in each cluster? Are there—what's
8 the formula?

9 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: There are about—there
10 are about 12 to 15 developments in each cluster.
11 They are set up so that geographically they are close
12 to one another.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: So, a roving crew
14 of two people--

15 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Uh-hm.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: --is responsible
17 for responding to heat and hot water complaints in 12
18 to 15 developments?

19 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: [interposing] So, if
20 I—if I can. During my—in my testimony--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [interposing] I
22 mean I don't see how that's possible.

23 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: --I added—in my
24 testimony I submitted what we will be doing [coughs]
25 as the temperatures get colder is adding additional

2 teams, but we've also supplemented our workforce with
3 a third of the--

4 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [interposing] But
5 the temperatures are already cold and the teams you
6 have now are--are inadequate.

7 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: If I can--

8 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Sure--sure.

9 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: We've also
10 supplemented our workforce with third-party vendors
11 increasing the number of developments, heating plants
12 (that are under third-party from 5 to 46. So, we're
13 taking some additional measures to supplement that
14 workforce. I would also like to add that although I
15 agree that--that additional training is helpful,
16 right, we're--but what we're also talking about here,
17 too, is that we're replacing our heating plants,
18 right, the boilers. What we have not yet addressed,
19 and there's a--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [interposing] I'm
21 sorry. What did you--what was your last comment?

22 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: We're--we're replacing
23 the heating the heating plants, the boilers
24 themselves, right and--and what we have--

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [interposing]

3 But—but my issues is even when you replace them, it's
4 not going to be at the capacity to maintain them.

5 That's my--

6 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: [interposing] But once
7 we're finished, in addition to capacity, right, what
8 we're dealing with, too, is we're—we're installing
9 new heating plants, but the—the risers, the
10 distribution systems, but the underground
11 distribution systems are not being upgraded, right
12 and there's—there's an addition cost of doing that,
13 right. So, the heating plant is working, but it's
14 working extra hard, right, because what we have not
15 yet done is start to address the internal
16 infrastructure within the buildings.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Right, I—I guess
18 I guess here's what we do: I think even if you had
19 new--and I'll end here—even if you had new
20 distribution systems, it's not clear to me that you
21 have the staff that is—that is sufficiently trained
22 and sufficiently compensated enough to manage, you
23 know, managing a boiler should be regarded as skilled
24 trade, and it's not clear to me that NYCHA treats it
25 as a skilled trade.

2 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Well, we--

3 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: You don't
4 compensate your heating mechanics in the same manner
5 that you compensate your plumbers or your elevator
6 mechanics or your--your electricians, and so that's--
7 that's my core issue with NYCHA, but I'll end it
8 here.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you, and
10 I'll just--I think it's just important to just clear
11 up the numbers just so we can be accurate in what
12 we're saying. When--when I mentioned the 30,966 and
13 then one other reports talks about 32,000 that's
14 individuals based on the website that are affected by
15 no heat or hot water, which is different from your
16 number of reporting the actual outage. But in my
17 lens, I'm constantly thinking about the people and
18 the families that live in these units. And so, I'd
19 like to talk about the numbers of people, and so
20 there were 32,000 people just over the past couple of
21 weeks who were directly impacted who had no heat and
22 hot water, and I know during the last hearing we
23 talked about 320,000, and so just in the first two
24 weeks we're talking about 30,000. So, I just wanted
25 to just make sure that we clarify, and just, you

2 know, those are the numbers that we we're talking
3 about and so I'm talking about people because that's
4 what we're here for, the people.

5 CATHY PENNINGTON: Absolutely, and that's
6 why on our commitment to share our data, we share
7 that information at that site so that when that
8 outage is declared or that development is out, it's
9 showing how many apartments, how many buildings, how
10 many individuals because we absolutely agree that
11 restoring service rapidly is what we need to be
12 focused on, and that is why we've taken so many of
13 these steps both on sharing the information and
14 improving our communications with residents who can
15 also help us by confirming that their heat has been
16 restored and so forth.

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Than you.
18 Council Member Van Bramer.

19 VAN BRAMER: Thank you

20 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]
21 Followed by Council Member Perkins.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you
23 very much, Madam Chair. So, I represent the
24 Queensbridge Houses, and over the weekend heat went
25 out for all of Queensbridge South, which to the

2 Chair's point represents 1,600 units with clearly at
3 least 3,000 people affected. It was not listed on the
4 public system until Monday. People were not
5 contacted within 24 hours by NYCHA. My office
6 received numerous calls from cold constituents
7 including the three-mother with a 3-week-old child
8 who did not know what was happening because NYCHA did
9 not communicate with the residents or my office. We
10 asked NYCHA how this could happen. We were told that
11 there were communications breakdowns. It is entirely
12 plausible because here at this hearing I have
13 witnessed numerous communication breakdowns from you
14 all right in front of me. It has been shocking the
15 performance in this hearing. We are talking about
16 heat and hot water for human beings, not about the
17 shrubbery outside in the court yard. This is basic
18 human services basic human decency, and you have not
19 had the answers or you have been confused about your
20 own answers in numerous places in numerous instances.
21 How can we have confidence that when it does get
22 really cold you're going to be able to get people the
23 heat and hot water, and when it doesn't work, repair
24 it in an appropriate amount of time and communicate
25 with the residents who are affected. If on this

2 weekend where you talk about well the temperatures go
3 up to 60 degrees so it's no big deal, you weren't
4 able to do. Now, we know also that there's third-
5 party management system that's meant to be a solution
6 to these problems, but we were informed by your
7 office that over the weekend that communication
8 breakdown also occurred. Now, this was touted as one
9 of the success stories or one of the ways that we
10 were actually going to get a handle on this problem,
11 but it didn't help the people of Queensbridge this
12 weekend. Furthermore, you've—you've also added
13 Queensbridge South to the list on Monday, but the
14 removed it on Tuesday. We've had at least several
15 constituents come back to the office and say no, no,
16 it isn't back. So, I'm confused, and I have zero
17 confidence in your system because it was you yourself
18 here today who when you were talking about the
19 Astoria Houses, which is a great community to the
20 north of my district, you said in your own paperwork
21 right in front of you that the Astoria Houses says
22 it's not planned on the paper there, but it is
23 planned. But that's your information that you
24 yourselves are responsible for. So, you're here
25 testifying at a City Council hearing before the City

2 Council with a piece of paper in front of you that
3 you even have to say is wrong even though you are
4 responsible for entering the information. So, where
5 is our ability to be confident that you're to do
6 this, you're making the repairs and quite frankly, to
7 another Council's—Council Member's point, is the
8 management in place to make sure that all of these
9 things aren't going to continue to happen. So, I
10 know that was a lot, but maybe you can attempt to
11 address some of the things that happened this weekend
12 not just at Queensbridge South, but throughout, and
13 why there's so much miscommunication, why there's so
14 much confusion both in the system, online and here at
15 this hearing.

16 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: So, as indicated
17 before, and I'm not making excuses. We did reference
18 the wrong database, the wrong tab, right. This is
19 still a work in progress, right, and we are trying to
20 be as—as transparent and precise in our reporting,
21 and we're again looking back at over years of how
22 information like this has been reported, right, and
23 we are doing the best we can to improve on that.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: So, talk to me
25 about—so talk to me about Queensbridge Houses South

2 this weekend, right. The heat goes out for 1,600
3 units, 1,600 units, the entire Queensbridge South.
4 It's not up on the system. Why not?

5 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: I'm going to have to
6 ask Javier to talk about the specifics of
7 Queensbridge.

8 CATHY PENNINGTON: So, and I just want to
9 comment we do—we do have reports of residents that
10 were calling us. We had 320 calls from Queensbridge
11 South. We did address the outage from the point that
12 we received calls within approximately 13 hours. As
13 the GM stated, these are—some of these are new
14 systems. We have no relationships with our
15 contractors. All of this is just three weeks old.
16 Certainly there are areas that we need to improve on
17 our internal communications, and we're absolutely
18 committed to doing that. We do make human errors,
19 and that is unfortunate, but again we can correct
20 those as we're monitoring throughout the day all of
21 our data and all of our outage information, and I'll
22 let Mr. Almodobar speak to Queensbridge, and what the
23 issues were.

24 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: [coughs] So, at
25 Queensbridge the plan did go down. The third-party

2 vendor was contacted. He did come out, and there was
3 a communication issue, and that's why it didn't make
4 it to the website. The plant went down and then--

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: So, the
6 communications issues, let's just stop there. Whose
7 fault was it?

8 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: The contractor did not
9 communicate with our Heat Desk that is within our
10 Emergency Services Department that handles these heat
11 outages.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: And it's
13 clear to them that that is a part of their job that
14 they're suppose to do that?

15 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Yes, it is.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: And what
17 happens when they don't do that, and 1,600 apartments
18 are left not knowing what's happening with their
19 apartment?

20 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: If it continues to
21 happen then we have to then come to the conclusion
22 that this is not working and we'll sever ties with
23 that contractor.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Okay, but we
25 just concluded based on your testimony this is a

2 brand new system, brand new folks, rah, rah, we're
3 three weeks in, and immediately they've dropped the
4 ball right to begin with.

5 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: The vendor is coming
6 in this week to meet with us.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Say again.

8 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: The vendor, the
9 contractor is coming in to meet with us this week.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Okay. So,
11 then I assume they will be notified if this happens
12 again--

13 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: There are a number of
14 issues that we will be addressing with them.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Okay. So,
16 you were saying about Queensbridge.

17 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Okay, so, and--and then
18 it went down again on--on Monday, and on Monday when
19 the vendor responded, I sent some of my staff there
20 as well to see exactly what was going on because we
21 were getting miscommunication. When we got there,
22 the vendor was on--was in the plant restoring the
23 plant, and my staff was there making sure that they
24 did.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: You mentioned
3 miscommunication on this Monday. What was the
4 miscommunication? Between the contractor and NYCHA?
5 Is that what you're saying?

6 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: I was getting
7 miscommunication—misleading information rather, even
8 worse.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: What was the
10 misleading information?

11 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Well, I was getting
12 information that was, it was kind of conflicting
13 between what the vendor was telling me and what
14 Property Management was telling me, and what Ms.
15 April was telling me as well because I was also in
16 direct communication with Ms. Simpson, April Simpson
17 the TA President.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: That's great.
19 We love Ms. April, but—and tell me what were the
20 three different versions of the story you heard.

21 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: I—I was more focused
22 on what Ms. April was saying as opposed to what the
23 vendor was telling me, and what Property Management
24 was telling me.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: That sounds
3 correct to me because I believe April Simpson as
4 well, but what was the contractor telling you and—and
5 were you able to verify whether or not it was true or
6 not because let me just say this: I love our TA
7 Presidents and Ms. April Simpson does an amazing job
8 as the heads of our Queensbridge TA.

9 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: I agree. Absolutely.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: But you have
11 a problem if you don't believe your own contractors
12 who are responsible for fixing heat and hot water for
13 your residents.

14 CATHY PENNINGTON: So, if I could just
15 restate that these relationships with our—our new
16 contractors are three weeks old. We have some kinks
17 in communication. NYCHA has a lot of protocols
18 particularly when it comes to after hours reporting.
19 Even though we've met with our—our contractors,
20 educated them, you know, and given them this
21 information, I think where it fell short was them
22 actually following through on how we had instructed
23 them. We're addressing that. We've already worked
24 through this particular issue with them on
25 communications, and are going to move forward with

2 reinforcing what the expectations are, and so that's
3 unfortunate, but I will say it's a three-week old
4 relationship, and we're going to improve on it daily.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: It hasn't
6 started well. So, you're--do you want to finish with
7 the discrepancies and the--?

8 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: So, again, I-I-I was
9 more focused on what Ms. April was telling me, and I
10 was going by what she told me, which prompted me to
11 send one of my field supervisors there to confirm
12 that the contractor was on site and he indeed was and
13 he was working on restoring the plant. By the time
14 we go there, he already had two of the three boilers
15 back in service.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: So, let me
17 just say this before I throw it back to the Chair,
18 anybody watching this or hearing this would be
19 disturbed, and would have a severe lack of confidence
20 in this three-week-old brand new system with a
21 contractor that at least at Queensbridge South seems
22 to have failed on multiple occasions, multiple
23 occasions right off the bat, and there seems to be a
24 lack of confidence even in your own people in-in what
25 the contractor is telling me, but even we're doubting

2 whether or not they're on site. Are they on site?
3 Right, we're listening as we should to the TA
4 resident leader because Ms. April knows what's going
5 on in Queensbridge and is there to report to you, but
6 we have a severe problem if you don't trust that your
7 contractor is even on site, and you've got to verify
8 that with other people. This just isn't working, and
9 again, I just want to say that this is people's
10 lives. This is heat and hot water. If you don't
11 have heat and hot water, you almost don't have an
12 apartment, and—and this has got to be fixed because
13 this is not cold weather, right. When you consider
14 that we're getting to 30s and 20s and we're going to
15 have some really, really cold days with wind chill
16 factors in single digits, and if this is what happens
17 when we're in the 50s and the 40s--and people deserve
18 heat and hot water all the time when they need it,
19 but how can we trust you to be able to provide when
20 it gets severely cold? I just don't have it, and I
21 don't think this performance here has actually
22 instilled a lot of confidence for me in this new
23 system, third-party or otherwise. You're online,
24 your notifications, all of it is severely lacking
25 right now.

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you. I
3 actually have some follow-up to that particular round
4 of questions. Who is the vendor at Queensbridge?

5 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: George S. Hall.

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: George S.
7 Hall, and how many other contracts do they have as a
8 third-party vendor for other NYCHA developments?

9 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: This is a first for
10 them.

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So they only
12 have--

13 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: This one contract.

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: This one
15 contract. Okay. Now, you mentioned--yes.

16 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: But the--

17 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: But I just wanted to
18 point out--I'--I'm sorry.

19 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: The important
20 developments are--

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: You're saying
22 how many developments or how many contracts? There's
23 one contract with multiple developments with NYCHA.
24 This is their first contract with NYCHA.

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Yeah, how many
3 developments, though?

4 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: So, they have 15
5 developments with that—under that contract.

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Can you repeat
7 yourself?

8 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: There are 15
9 developments that are covered under that contract.

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL:

11 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Okay, and Ms.
12 Pennington, you mentioned just the actual protocol.
13 So, what are your after hour reporting protocols?

14 CATHY PENNINGTON: So, we have staff that
15 work 'til midnight, and then we have Emergency
16 Services that supplement heating services during the
17 midnight to 8:00 a.m. period, and I will let Director
18 Almodobar speak to the process of reporting in
19 through those after hours.

20 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: So we have a Heat Desk
21 at the Emergency Services Department at OIC and they
22 track the heating outages from 4:00 p.m. 'til
23 midnight. Through the roving crews they track the
24 chaz (sp?) alarms. They look at work order trends
25 and they communicate with the vendors for the third-

2 party sites after they confirm that there actually is
3 an outage, and the third-party vendors also have
4 roving crews as well during the evening. In addition
5 to our roving teams, we have also incorporated some
6 of the stationary engineers this year as well with
7 our roving crews as well.

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Did you have
9 any problems at all with the system, the CCC system
10 over the weekend?

11 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Not that I'm aware of.

12 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Were there any—
13 was there like a high volume of calls that might have
14 caused some type of problem at all?

15 CATHY PENNINGTON: So we do have some
16 data. We just turned this system on live, and we
17 have—since we turned it on, which is I believe since
18 October 1st we had 11,000 restoration calls go out of
19 which 4,198 residents confirmed that services were
20 restored. We also track abandoned. So, so some
21 folks are abandoning the call. They're, you know,
22 they're not finishing or that—they're not confirming,
23 or they're not routing back to the call center. We
24 did receive 877 requests to route back and reopen a
25 work order. So, so far this is just our first week

2 or so of data on this new system. So, we're seeing
3 it's functioning, and we need to monitor then what
4 has happened when the calls are being routed back to
5 the Call Center.

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, is there a
7 difference between how a work order gets generated
8 between a development that NYCHA manages and operates
9 and runs the boiler as opposed to a third party
10 vendor managed development like Queensbridge?

11 CATHY PENNINGTON: So, they all—residents
12 still—it's seamless to the residents. They still
13 call the Call Center, and all the creating of—of work
14 request are done through that same process.

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, the
16 resident calls, and then the work order gets
17 generated, and then a NYCHA staffer goes to the
18 development to the plant and they either meet with a
19 NYCHA worker or a NYCHA manager like some—a NYCHA
20 staff or they would connect with a third-party
21 vendor, but the NYCHA staff is the one that actually
22 goes to the development. Either it's third-party
23 managed or not, and that confirmation that is entered
24 into the system is the same because it's NYCHA
25 resident?

2 CATHY PENNINGTON: Yes.

3 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I mean the
4 NYCHA staffer.

5 CATHY PENNINGTON: You're talking about
6 from the robocalls. So, when the--when there's--
7 whenever there's an outage, the resident gets a call.
8 Then they get a--we call it a--

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]
10 I'm not talking about the robocall. I'm not there
11 yet.

12 CATHY PENNINGTON: Oh.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I'm talking
14 about the generating of a work order or a ticket
15 because of the outage.

16 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Yes. So the--the
17 answer is yes.

18 CATHY PENNINGTON: Yes.

19 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: But it's verified by a
20 NYCHA staff person. I also would like to have Bob
21 Marano answer the question that you asked about what
22 happened over the weekend on that CCC.

23 BOB MARANO: [off mic] Yes, I'm Bob
24 Marano. [on mic]

25

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Wait. Before
3 you start, the reason why I'm asking that—that
4 question is because I'm trying to figure out the
5 relationship and the—like miscommunication or
6 communication between the NYCHA staffer and the
7 third-party vendor to see if there's something there.
8 So, that's why I asked that question before it even
9 flags to a robocall situation.

10 BOB MARANO: Okay, and Mr. Marano, one
11 second.

12 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Please raise
13 your right hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth,
14 the whole truth and nothing but the truth in your
15 testimony before this committee, and respond honestly
16 Council Members' questions?

17 BOB MARANO: I do.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, thank
19 you.

20 BOB MARANO: Good afternoon. I'm Bob
21 Marano, NYCHA's Chief Information Officer. So, we
22 heard from the CCC on Sunday that there was an
23 intermittent problem with the phone system that out
24 of the 200 or so calls they would get an hour,
25 approximately 10 of them we were able to hear one

2 way. We can hear the residents, but the residents
3 couldn't hear us. But when the residents called back
4 then they were able to get through. So, there was a
5 slight glitch with the phone systems at the CCC on
6 Sunday.

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you
8 because that's what we heard all Sunday that there's
9 problem. There's a problem. We call and there's like
10 some type of static, and then I made an attempt to
11 call, and there was a problem. So, thank you.

12 BOB MARANO: Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [pause]
14 Council Member Salamanca.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you.
16 Thank you, Madam Chair. Good afternoon everyone. My
17 questions are more directed towards the temporary
18 boilers. The Melrose Houses has a-has a temporary
19 boiler and I know Vito we spoke, but I just want to
20 get this on the record. It's my understanding that
21 their temporary boiler was not working. There was no
22 heat or hot water at Melrose Houses from Thursday,
23 October 18th through Sunday, October 21st. That's
24 four full day, and Vito, I called you when I-when I-
25 when I was informed that the temporary boiler at

2 Melrose was not working, and you did respond back via
3 text communication at 10:38 that evening that the
4 repairs were made, and that the heat was restored. B
5 But in my conversation with you, you mentioned that
6 Melrose Houses was not on your list of boilers that
7 were not operating. So, my question is: Why—first,
8 why was that not on the list? Why was I guess the
9 leadership in NYCHA unaware that this temporary
10 boiler, which has been placed there because the
11 original boiler is not working. So, now you have a
12 temporary boiler that's not working either. What
13 procedures are put in place to ensure that the
14 temporary boilers are actually working?

15 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: So, we'll have Javier
16 respond to exactly what happened at Melrose.

17 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: So, at Melrose, the
18 boilers in the internal plant are operational. The
19 mobile boiler is in place. It's not fully connected
20 yet. That's why it wasn't operating. The idea is to
21 have it connected so that it can support the internal
22 plant should one of the old boilers inside the plant
23 fail like it was doing last year. I didn't get a
24 report that Melrose was down. I did get some
25 individual complaints related to specific apartments

2 in specific buildings, which I did send people out
3 to, and we did find some issues with the building's
4 zone valves (sic). There are one or two. I don't
5 know the exact number, but I can get you the exact
6 number of zone valves at Melrose that are not
7 operating on automatic, and in temperatures like
8 we're having now where it fluctuates above the
9 required point where we're—where we are required to
10 give heat, we have to send someone out manually to
11 open a valve and then close it, and that's what the
12 issues at Melrose were related to.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright. We
14 have an annex of Melrose, which is the Melrose Mott
15 Haven Senior Center. So, yeah, the senior center on
16 top of the senior center. Yeah, it's a senior
17 building. It's an annex of Melrose Houses. This
18 senior center as well, you know, just last week on
19 the 16th I was informed that the seniors who go to
20 the senior center to stay warm while the senior
21 center boiler is not—the boiler is not working inside
22 the senior center and, therefore, you have seniors
23 having lunch with their coats on, and a leaky roof,
24 which we know that that senior center, you know,
25 NYCHA does a patch job. So, imagine this: You're

2 cold at home. You go to a senior center to stay
3 warm. It's just as cold, you know, as your home.
4 You have your coat on. You're trying to have your
5 lunch. It's raining outside, and there's a big hole
6 in the ceiling tile because NYCHA has not fixed the -
7 the leaks that are falling down in their-in their
8 dining room. Do you have an update as to the-the
9 heating in the Melrose Mott Haven Senior Center?

10 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: No, sir, I do not, but
11 I will gladly--

12 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: [interposing]
13 If you can get me one, that would be helpful, and
14 then finally, Morrisania Air Rights. I know that we
15 did a tour last year with the President of Morrisania
16 Air Rights. I have one building of their portfolio,
17 3204 Park Avenue. I know that they have a temporary
18 boiler parked or sited, stationed outside in front of
19 their development. I-I see the emails between the
20 President of Morrisania Air Rights and the property
21 manager asking when is-asking an update as to the
22 temporary boiler. Has it been maintenance or
23 overhauled, and there's a lack of communication
24 there. It seems that they're not responding. Your-
25 your property manager or whoever is responsible to

2 respond back to the President at Morrisania Air
3 Rights. There is—there is not response. Can you
4 work on that in terms of ensuring that there's proper
5 communication, and for the record, can you give me an
6 update as to what's happening with that temporary
7 boiler. How—how long would it be there? When will a
8 permanent boiler be installed in Morrisania Air
9 Rights?

10 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: First, I'll—I'll say
11 that I'll gladly meet with Mr. Yellets (sp?) and
12 myself to give him an update o the mobile boiler.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: When?

14 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: As soon as possible.
15 As soon as possible. I'll—I'll give him a call, and
16 I'll make that arrangement myself. As far as the
17 mobile boiler, the mobile boiler that's on site, it's
18 important to—to understand why it's there, first, and
19 if you don't mind, I would like to explain why it's
20 there. The steam line that supplies steam to that
21 building is deteriorated to the point that it needs
22 to be replaced. The mobile boiler is there to
23 support the heat and hot water needs for that one
24 building. So, the issues with the steam line that
25 supplies steam to that—to that line, to that

2 building. That steam line the construction on it has
3 started, and the goal was to have a temporary steam
4 line in stalled before the start of the heating
5 season. But there were some delays related to
6 permits, MTA because the lines runs directly above a
7 railroad, and I'm happy to report that right now it
8 looks like we anticipate the temporary steam line
9 being completed by the end of November, and at which
10 point we will then remove that mobile boiler and the
11 building will be supplied from the main plant like it
12 should be. So, that's the update on the steam line.
13 Now, with the mobile boiler, it was overhauled about
14 a week before the start of the heating season. Once
15 it was overhauled, there was a slight smoking issue
16 that required a fuel regulator to be replaced, and
17 that was also replaced, and it's been running since.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright. I
19 appreciate if you can please reach out to the
20 President of Morrisania Air Rights. I would like to
21 get an update on the boiler issue at the Melrose Mott
22 Haven Senior Center, and would like to schedule a
23 walk-through of some of my NYCHA developments now
24 that cold weather is upon us to ensure that—just so
25 you can inform me, and we can walk with the

2 presidents of these actual developments so that we
3 are all on the same page and they are aware of
4 what's—what NYCHA is doing to address the issue.

5 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Okay.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you.

7 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: You're welcome.

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you.

9 Council Member Treyger.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you, Chair
11 Ampry-Samuel for holding this very important and very
12 timely hearing, and for your leadership and oversight
13 on this issue from day one. I truly appreciate that,
14 and our residents truly appreciate that. I want to,
15 you know, first say hello to Vito, the GM. I—I will
16 say that I find you to be incredibly responsive to me
17 and to my office even at 11:00 at night and Mr.
18 Ronnie Davis of Brooklyn Operations as well, but just
19 to be clear, being responsive to me does not mean the
20 work gets done right away as well, but I—I do
21 acknowledge that you follow up with me, and I really
22 appreciate that. Not every resident has access to
23 Vito. Not every resident has access to the highest
24 levels of NYCHA, but we have to be their voice and we
25 have to make sure that the work gets done. I'm going

2 to get kind of hyper local to big picture issues here
3 addressed at this hearing. Surfside Gardens in Coney
4 Island also one of the number of developments still
5 operating on temporary boilers now cost almost—so
6 many year now since Super Storm Sandy approaching now
7 almost six years. 2820 West 32nd Street to be
8 specific, our residents contacted NYCHA, had a ticket
9 order issued that there was no heat. Someone came up
10 a technician, checked out the apartment and the
11 resident noted that afterwards the ticket order was
12 closed, but there was still no heat being provided to
13 the apartment. It turned out it was more than just
14 her apartment. It was a number of apartments. At
15 what point can a ticket order be closed? Shouldn't
16 there be some verification that the work actually got
17 done so we have accurate numbers and figures to work
18 with so this does not happen again.

19 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Sure. So, certainly—
20 thank you. I'm going to have Cathy Pennington
21 address the work order question, and followed by
22 Deborah Goddard who can give an update on the work
23 that's happening at Surfside.

24 CATHY PENNINGTON: So, work order tickets
25 if—if a heating plant technician comes into a unit,

2 they're inspecting to see if there's a defect in a
3 valve or a radiator checking for any potential leaks,
4 and they would also be doing a temperature reading.
5 So, the basis for closing would be they have to
6 determine whether heat is on or not, and if it isn't,
7 then the ticket would stay open until they would
8 check other units and/or be going back to the plant
9 to check the plant to check the plant. So, the
10 ticket wouldn't be closed unless it was what we call
11 unfounded meaning we took a temperature reading and
12 it met the standard temperature that it should be at.
13 I don't know in this particular case what occurred.
14 We'd be more than glad to take a look at it.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Well, let's just
16 see right now. Is there a Surfside Gardens issue?

17 CATHY PENNINGTON: We—we can look it up
18 to see if there's one open.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Is there a
20 Surfside Gardens issue with regards to problems
21 delivering heat to the residents?

22 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: So Surfside, Surfside
23 is a Sandy affected location. There's a tremendous
24 amount of work going on there, not just in the boiler
25 room, but in the distribution equipment as well. At

2 Surfside, although there's some new equipment
3 installed in our tank room distribution part of the
4 building, there is still a lot more major work that's
5 needed to support that equipment. The equipment in
6 the tank room that delivers the—the heat to the
7 building works on an automatic setting, and it
8 requires the information from a panel that's in the
9 boiler room, which has not yet been installed in the
10 boiler room because of the ongoing work in the boiler
11 room. So, what happens is that although the
12 equipment may be new, it's still not working
13 automatically in some cases, and in other cases the
14 valves, which control the heat delivery to the—to the
15 building are not wired in yet because the wires--
16 [coughs] excuse me. The communication wires between
17 the boiler room and the tank room are just not there
18 yet.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: So, there is a
20 heating delivery issue remaining at Surfside.

21 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Correct.

23 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: So, during—during—

24 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: [interposing]

25 The technician should have never have closed the

2 ticket order because that's—that's my concern here as
3 well.

4 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Uh-hm.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: The residents
6 are telling us a problem. We contact NYCHA to help
7 resolve the problem. NYCHA then reports a ticket
8 order has been closed and the resident says,
9 Councilman, the problem is still ongoing. That's—
10 that's a problem. [background comments] And it
11 doesn't take \$32 billion to fix this problem either.
12 It's just a matter of getting our ducks in a row and
13 getting the right information across.

14 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: So, what we're doing
15 to ensure that we—we are supplying sufficient and
16 adequate heat is that we have a separate roving team
17 just to address the Surfside area with these
18 buildings that we require someone to manually open
19 the valve so that when the temperature does drop, and
20 it's a little bit difficult to manage simply because
21 the temperatures are fluctuating. We get complaints
22 of no heat with the temperature drops below 55 and
23 then we get complaints of too much heat when it goes
24 above 55, and we have to constantly go back and forth
25 and open and close this value manually. So, that's

2 one of the ways that we're—we're addressing it right
3 now, and once the temperature stay consistently below
4 55, the need to close these valves would not be
5 necessary.

6 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: So, so if I could
7 answer, well that's not--

8 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: [interposing] Yes.

9 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: --in all circumstances
10 until we can come up with a more permanent solution,
11 and then we will continue to provide that service. I
12 do want to just go back to—for one second about the
13 issuance of—the issue that you raised about the work
14 orders, and again, this is a modification that we've
15 made this heat season, and I—there are some numbers,
16 and I know that Cathy Pennington mentioned them
17 earlier. I think it's worth just repeating. So far
18 for this heat season a response to a heat restoration
19 and as you well know and as all of our residents
20 know, in the past a robocall would be sent out that
21 would basically just tell you it's been restored, and
22 there was not opportunity for the residents to—to
23 provide us with information back. So far for this
24 heat season, the new system has made 11,192 calls
25 that it pushed out to residents informing them that

2 heat was restored. Of those, 5,075 were actually
3 responded to by our residents. Okay, 4,198 indicated
4 to us that they agreed that service was restored.
5 877 and were then put back into the system where they
6 were transferred do CCC so we can better address the
7 specific issues. So, the data that we have on the
8 new system is at least showing at this point in time
9 that we're getting a good response from our
10 residents, and we're able to pinpoint more specific
11 concerns.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Right, but in
13 this particular case, General Manager, the resident
14 contacted me again on top of being frustrated for her
15 family not having heat or hot water to her apartment
16 to see that the technician or whoever closed the
17 ticket order after the visit knowing there was no
18 heat in her apartment, it's just wrong, and I further
19 undermines credibility. And as we heard here today,
20 there is a problem at this development. Now, when do
21 you anticipate this problem being resolved because we
22 are getting as you've—we're getting closer and closer
23 and deeper into the cold season.

24 DEBORAH GODDARD: Good afternoon.

25 Deborah Goddard. I just want to reiterate what

2 Javier said. The panels have to be—the zone panels
3 have to be opened manually as once we are in a
4 consistent heat season, they will be open period, and
5 there won't be the back and forth of needing to open
6 and close them. So, they will be consistent.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Okay, and I
8 understand with temporary boilers as I've gone
9 through them since the beginning of my tenure in the
10 city Council. You can't regulate them. They're
11 either too hot or too cold, and that's why we're
12 waiting for the permanent boilers to be installed.
13 Let me just quickly move on to a couple other items.
14 Work site safety during the construction period.
15 Some months ago I noted that at Coney Island Houses
16 as they're doing work, there are mounds of dirt that
17 are laying out. The wind is blowing. It's blowing
18 into people's apartments. I've now noticed that
19 issue at Gravesend Houses. We must make sure that
20 contractors or their subcontractors are complying
21 with safety regulations because people are
22 complaining about breathing problems, asthma, and
23 there are people already with compromised immune
24 systems, and—and have breathing issues and
25 conditions. They must cover—and there are rules

2 about this—they must cover dust. They must cover
3 dirt when they're doing work. So, I—I will follow up
4 with NYCHA about that making sure they communicate to
5 their contractors particularly now at Gravesend
6 Houses if they comply with safety rules and
7 regulations, and the last piece I'll say, and I thank
8 the Chair for—for the time. I raised this issue a
9 number of years ago, and I feel compelled to say this
10 again in light of the comments from the
11 Administration. NYCHA residents are tenants just
12 like anywhere else in my view. NYCHA is a landlord.
13 When you fail to provide mandated services to your
14 tenant, to the residents they have a right in my
15 view, in the view of also WEGO analysts to a refund.
16 There have been long periods of time of delay in not
17 providing basic heat, hot water, basic services. I
18 asked about a rent refund years ago. NYCHA was
19 silent. Now, I am hearing comments in the press, and
20 there's a lawsuit now as well that the Administration
21 is arguing that because NYCHA receives multiple
22 sources of funding, it's complicated. Well, private
23 landlords in the private industry also receive
24 multiple sources of funding to operate and to
25 maintain their housing. So, I don't really see that

2 as—as the difference. Is there anything that in HUD
3 regulations that prohibits NYCHA from providing a
4 rent refund or a rent credit to a tenant that has
5 been denied basic heat, hot water, basic services?
6 Is there anything in HUD regulations that prohibits
7 you and can you—if there is, can you give that to the
8 committee?

9 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: So, I will bring that
10 question back to our Law Department and have them
11 research that. I do not have the answer to that.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I'm sorry. Can
13 you say that again?

14 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: I said I don't have
15 the specific answer to that specific question whether
16 there is anything in HUD regulations that would
17 prohibit any type of refund. I would have to bring
18 that question back to our Law Department, and have
19 them conduct research.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Well, GM you're
21 aware that there is—there is a lawsuit that was filed
22 over this exact very topic.

23 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: I understand.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: But I—I heard
25 the Mayor's comments recently in the media that

2 because NYCHA receives multiple sources of funding,
3 it makes it complicated. There are private
4 developers who receive multiple sources of funding to
5 build housing, and they are still liable to provide
6 basic services to—to who lives in their buildings. I
7 don't—I don't see the difference, and I have not
8 found anything, I have not seen anything. That's why
9 I'm asked, that prohibits you from doing that, but
10 here's what I think—here's what I think will change,
11 I hope will change. If NYCHA was now more on the
12 hook to provide a rent refund to residents who have
13 been denied basic services, maybe NYCHA would do a
14 better job of getting its act together to make sure
15 that delivery of services was actually happening, and
16 as my colleague, Council Member Torres mentioned
17 actually having skilled licensed people do this work
18 rather than contract out to consultants and sub-
19 consultants and sub-sub-consultants, who I think have
20 no capacity to or no vested interest in seeing work
21 happen. This is a moral issue beyond a legal issue
22 in my opinion. In the year 2018, New York City \$80
23 billion budget. I'm sorry. Bigger than that. \$89
24 billion. Forgive me. Yes, the budget grows. \$89
25 billion. This should not be an issue of heat and hot

2 water. So, again, I thank the chair for the time,
3 and I'll follow up further on the Surfside Gardens
4 and on the construction safety issues. Thank you.

5 [pause]

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I'd just like
7 to be clear, and I just want to read the Mayor's
8 exact statement. The Mayor says, I just want to be
9 straightforward. We can't do that. It's a chicken
10 and egg problem. If we start taking away resources,
11 it's only going to make the situation worse. These
12 apartments are heavily subsidized. This is a way to
13 ensure that hard working New Yorkers have affordable
14 housing. No one pays more than 30% of their income
15 in rent. That's something we guarantee in public
16 housing, but we cannot lose that revenue source. Our
17 job is to make the situation better, and refunds
18 don't make it better. They just don't. So, just so
19 that everybody can know that we were talking about.
20 That was the Mayor's statement. Council Member
21 Gjonaj.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you, Chair.
23 Vito, of the 325 developments, the 2,400 buildings,
24 how many heating units do we have? [pause]

2 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Excuse me. I am going
3 to ask that someone confirm the numbers, but I show
4 1,960 boilers.

5 FEMALE SPEAKER: Sixty-six.

6 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Sixty-six?

7 FEMALE SPEAKER: Yes.

8 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: I'm sorry. 1,966.

9 Thank you.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: And NYCHA falls
11 under the same heating requirements as any private
12 landlord, heating season, temperatures?

13 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: We do.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Okay. So, the
15 heating season is now three weeks in. It began
16 October 1st.

17 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: That's correct.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Inside
19 temperature must be at a minimum of 68 degrees when
20 the temperature outside is below 55.

21 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Between the hours of
22 6:00 a.m. and 10:00 p.m.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Perfect and from
24 10:00 p.m. to 6:00 a.m. the insides--

2 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: [interposing]

3 Irrespective of the outside temperature.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: --they must be at
5 least 62 degrees.

6 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: And I thank the
7 Council for passing that legislation.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Right. For those
9 of you that are listening, please know that you're
10 supposed to have heat today. It is 54 degrees. How
11 many of the 1,966 boilers are operating today giving
12 sufficient heat to roughly 400,000 residents?

13 CATHY PENNINGTON: So the last—I can't
14 run a refresh report, but the last report was that
15 there were seven developments that didn't have
16 service of the entire—

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: When is that
18 report?

19 CATHY PENNINGTON: This was run before we
20 came over around noon sometime.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: So, and how many
22 units is that? Seven developments how many boilers
23 have we installed?

24

25

2 CATHY PENNINGTON: [interposing] That-
3 that is 3,507 units of the 175,000. This particular
4 outage report.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: How many boilers
6 are we referring to?

7 CATHY PENNINGTON: I don't have the
8 number of boilers. Would you have that number? But
9 we could get it for you. I mean we have certainly a
10 count of how many boilers we have at each location
11 that come up to this--this roughly 2,000 number, but I
12 don't have off hand how many.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: So, my question
14 is of the 1,966 boilers, how many of them have been
15 prepared for the winter season, and I'm going to hold
16 you to this. How many have been prepared by the
17 tune-ups that are needed, the tube cleaning, the
18 chimney cleaning, the preparation that's needed for
19 the boilers that either automatically go into winter
20 mode or be put manually into winter mode so that we
21 can get the heat that's needed to those apartments as
22 of three weeks ago?

23 CATHY PENNINGTON: So, thank you for that
24 question, and we have completed overhaul on 98% of

2 our boilers, and 100% of our hot water systems we've
3 completed the overhaul. The remaining two--

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: [interposing]
5 Overhaul, please because I just want to make sure
6 that we're talking the same language. When you say
7 overhaul, are you referring to the preparation that
8 is needed for the boilers to be switched to winter
9 mode?

10 CATHY PENNINGTON: So, I'm going to ask
11 our Heating Director Javier Almodobar to describe
12 what we mean by overhaul. Thank you.

13 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: So, to answer your--
14 your question, yes, we--we tune up the--the boilers, in
15 the boiler plant. As I said earlier today, we--the
16 overhaul process is designed to preserve and restore
17 the existing equipment. We do this by cleaning,
18 lubricating, adjusting, repair worn parts and many
19 any repairs associated with the boiler itself.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: So, of the 1,966
21 heating apparatuses, have they all be prepped and are
22 ready to go as of three weeks ago?

23 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: So, I'm--I'm sorry. I
24 just wanted to clarify on the total number. So, we
25 actually have 2,097.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 120

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Sorry. Say it.

3 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: 2,097 boilers within
4 our entire inventory. 131 of those are in
5 developments. 131 are in developments under private
6 management. So, the 1,966 are boilers that are still
7 under NYCHA management. So, I just wanted to be clear
8 about the total numbers.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Okay.

10 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: And so, what Javier is
11 talking about has to do with the 1,966 boilers that
12 are under NYCHA management, direct management.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: And the
14 remaining--?

15 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: So, there--all but 48
16 have--have--have--have had the overhaul performed, and
17 the 48, as I indicated in my testimony we expect to
18 have completed by the end of November.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Okay. Why
20 haven't those 48--first let me make sure. Is that the
21 correct number? 40--all by 48 boilers of the 1,966
22 that are NYCHA's responsibilities have all been
23 serviced and prepped for the winter?

24 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: That's correct.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Is that correct?

2 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: That's correct.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: And the 48 that
4 have not?

5 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Gas line issue
6 repairs.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Speak up. I'm
8 sorry.

9 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: So, every boiler has a
10 gas train on it, and what we find during the annual
11 overhaul process is that some of these things require
12 replacement because of possible leaks or the valve
13 not functioning properly. So, we can't get the
14 combustion on the boiler to be within the proper
15 range, and another issue that we're having with some
16 of these boilers is welding.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Is what?

18 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Welding, boiler
19 welding.

20 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: So if I can kind of
21 pug that I think into layman's terms. Other repairs
22 have to be made, but before we can perform that
23 overhaul.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Okay. So, I'm
25 trying to understand this. There are 48 boilers that

2 are not ready for winter. We're three weeks into the
3 heating season.

4 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: I didn't say that
5 they're not ready for winter. The question was did
6 we perform summer overhaul. Summer overhaul is
7 really designed to try to identify proactively any
8 deficiencies. It doesn't mean that these heating
9 plants are not functioning. It means that we have
10 not proactively performed the inspection to look to
11 see what deficiencies we can correct, but it does not
12 mean that they're offline or that they're not
13 working.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: So, what does it
15 actually mean? It means that--?

16 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: So, I own a home. In
17 the summertime the company that services my boiler
18 comes out this summer and they vacuum out the-the
19 chimney, they clean the boiler, they replace the-the
20 filters. That's what we have not done in these 48.
21 That doesn't mean that they're not working. It just
22 means that we have not performed an overhaul to like
23 try to identify proactively any deficiencies, any
24 problems with their function.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: There are--okay.
3 so, of the--going back to the--the question that we
4 started with, the total number of boilers, the number
5 that are down today are--

6 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: [interposing] We have
7 the number of developments. We don't have the number
8 of boilers associated with that. That's what Cathy
9 mentioned that we will get back to you on.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Okay.

11 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Your question was how
12 many boilers. We could tell you how many
13 developments.

14 CATHY PENNINGTON: And how many
15 apartments.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Okay. Maybe
17 you'll get back to me on that as well, but of the 48
18 boilers, you just indicated that some of the problems
19 are welding. That means are they operational for
20 winter mode to be able to give heat or not? It's a
21 year or a no question.

22 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: So the plant itself
23 where these boilers are have redundancy in place for
24 this type of--these types of repairs. So, while these
25 repairs are being done, that particular boiler is not

2 online, but the plant is fully functional. The
3 repairs that I mentioned they're related to the
4 overhaul process. So, a lot of overhaul where clean
5 it, we tune it up and we replace some of the
6 components. They may have been completed. There are
7 still some repair issues that were identified during
8 the overhaul process that have not been finalized for
9 those boilers.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: And that's not
11 telling if they're operational or not?

12 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: They are not online.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: So, 48--

14 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: [interposing] the
15 boilers--the boilers, the individual boiler is not
16 online, but the plant is operational.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Because we have
18 multiple boilers and it's like-

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: [interposing] And
20 no, no, no. This is a play, (sic) and I have an
21 understanding of this to some degree. Of the 1,966
22 boilers the 48 are they operating or not? I still
23 don't understand.

24 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Sir, there's a
25 difference between a heating plant and a boiler.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Okay.

3 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: A heating plant could
4 have four boilers.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Yes.

6 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: It could have six
7 boilers, but what Javier is indicating is that if we
8 have one boiler, and it's taken out of service
9 because we have to do additional repairs, it does not
10 mean that we have left the development, the heating
11 planting, right, in a non-functioning mode. Right,
12 the other five boilers are providing sufficient heat
13 and hot water to the development. Okay. Right, I
14 believe we want all six to be up and running. So, I
15 think you know the situation. You've been to our
16 boiler rooms, and so you know what we're talking
17 about and there's a difference between a heating
18 plant and a boiler.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: My--so the heating
20 plants, and I refer to them as boilers as well, but I
21 understand what you're saying.

22 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: [interposing] But
23 let's--let's--

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: I--I got it.

25 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: You just mentioned it.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: So, the heating
3 plants they're all operational with the exception of
4 the seven developments. Is that what I'm
5 understanding?

6 CATHY PENNINGTON: Correct. Yes.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Okay. So,
8 instead of using the word boiler, we'll use the word
9 heating plant.

10 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Thank you.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Okay. So, of
12 these seven, how-is this consistent over a number of
13 days that they've been down? Do we have problems
14 that are not new from these seven heating plants?

15 CATHY PENNINGTON: These plants are all
16 reported with outages as of 10/24 except for one that
17 carried over from yesterday.

18 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: It should be for this
19 heat season the duration of a heat outage, right, has
20 been 14 hours. That's the average.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: I'm sorry.

22 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: The average for
23 duration of a heat outage for this heat season has
24 been 14 hours. So, some of them have been down
25 longer than 14 hours. Others have been restored in

2 less time, but the average time for an outage for
3 this heat season to date is 14 hours.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: And as far as the
5 seven developments, would any of them be Throggs Neck
6 or Pelham? Can you give me the seven developments
7 that currently have no heat, or their heating plants
8 are not operational?

9 CATHY PENNINGTON: So-- what I can share
10 with you is as we ran this report several hours ago,
11 it may have changed, right because it changes every
12 few minutes. [background comments, pause] So,
13 currently we have Baruch, Claremont Parkway, Grant,
14 Howard Avenue, Lafayette, Patterson.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: I'm sorry. The
16 last--after Lafayette.

17 CATHY PENNINGTON: Patterson. Roosevelt
18 1, Roosevelt 2 and Wagner.

19 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: [off mic] So, the
20 answer to your question is--[on mic] The answer to
21 your question is no to the developments that you
22 mentioned.

23 CATHY PENNINGTON: To Throggs Neck.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: After Roosevelt 1
25 and 2, what was the last one?

2 CATHY PENNINGTON: It was Wagner.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Wagner. Okay, 3,
4 4, 5, 6, 7, 8—I got 9 now.

5 CATHY PENNINGTON: That's nine.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: There should have
7 been 10. Patterson at third and--

8 CATHY PENNINGTON: Yep.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: --and Patterson.
10 So, it's actually ten developments.

11 CATHY PENNINGTON: No, it's—it's nine
12 developments. This is what the report I'm look at,
13 nine developments. You might have been looking at 15
14 minutes ago as of 3:44.

15 CATHY PENNINGTON: And if I—if I may
16 just add, I think as referred to before, some of
17 these are planned. Sometimes it's Patterson. It's a
18 planned outage because you're actually tying in the
19 new boiler there ahead of the heating plant
20 replacement. So that will be a short term today.
21 Yeah, four of them were scheduled.

22 DEBORAH GODDARD: Yeah, four of them were
23 scheduled.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: I'm going back to
25 the 48 boilers that will probably be needed as the

2 temperature falls below with that. I would imagine
3 the heating plants now are sufficient to give heat
4 those developments although the 48 are not up and
5 running. As the temperatures drop and the weather
6 becomes more extreme, there's going to definitely be
7 an impact because of those 48 boilers. What is the
8 timeline that we see repairs being made, and it
9 sounds like it's various repairs from welding to gas
10 interruption.

11 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: So the expectation is
12 to have those on-back online within the first week of
13 November.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Are any of the
15 developments out of gas? Any of these heating
16 apparatuses gas related problems, or with turn-offs?

17 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: You mean to the entire
18 plant?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Yes.

20 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: No.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Or to that
22 boiler, some of the.

23 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: It may be to an
24 individuals boiler where the gas valve is not
25 operating, but it's not necessarily that it's not

2 getting gas. It's just the valve itself is not
3 operating correct to that.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Okay. It's going
5 to be a very long winter. I'm sure we're going to be
6 talking about heating requirements, and basic
7 necessities of heat and hot water. I hope you're up
8 to it. We've had a whole year, a whole season to
9 prepare for this, and I just hope that we're ready to
10 give our tenants the basic necessity of heat and hot
11 water before we venture into the other issues.

12 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you,
13 Council Member Gjonaj. Just to follow up on the
14 question about the 48 boilers. The-out of any of the
15 outages that we've seen over the past several days,
16 were any of those outages related to-or within one of
17 the boiler plants where one of the 48 boilers are
18 located?

19 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Wagner would be one of
20 those sites. Wagner, two boilers suffered water
21 damage, two of the six suffered water damage. Wagner
22 is a-is a-it has an advanced boiler management
23 system, and because of that we had to hire a vendor
24 to come in and make the repairs, and we're working
25 with that vendor to do that.

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, I
3 appreciate that. That was real quick. As soon as I
4 asked which one, you knew the—which development it
5 was located in. So, can you provide us with the list
6 of all of the developments where those boilers are,
7 and I know there was a request for a breakdown of all
8 the developments, all of the boilers so that we can
9 know within the Council Districts like for each
10 Council Member.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: The 48 we're
12 referring to, correct?

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: The 48.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Right. Thank
15 you.

16 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Since we're
17 talking about boilers, how many mobile boilers does
18 NYCHA have on hand for the heating emergencies?
19 [pause]

20 CATHY PENNINGTON: So we currently have
21 in our Contingency Plan one boiler on site, and we
22 are anticipating delivery three additional boilers,
23 mobile boilers. Excuse me.

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: What did you
25 just say? Three additional?

2 CATHY PENNINGTON: Three additional. We
3 already have one and for-for contingency, and we have
4 three additional boilers, the mobile boilers that we
5 anticipate delivery on this season.

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, how many,
7 and this might have been stated, but how many
8 developments currently are operating under a mobile
9 boiler? So, no, no, no, no. How many mobile boilers
10 are at developments currently in operation? Not how
11 many developments, but how many mobile boilers are
12 there at like already disbursed at developments.

13 CATHY PENNINGTON: I'm checking to see if
14 we have that number with us. [pause] We'll double
15 check the numbers, but the operations we call Heating
16 Operations has 23 mobile boilers, and then at our
17 Sandy sites we have another 41.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: 23 mobile
19 boilers and at Sandy how many?

20 CATHY PENNINGTON: Sandy is 41.

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay. Some of
22 us were talking about Sandy. So, 23 mobile boilers
23 are currently operating at different developments.

24 CATHY PENNINGTON: Correct.

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Or it could
3 be--

4 CATHY PENNINGTON: Today it's 23.

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: 23 and then
6 you have one boiler that is waiting to be--

7 CATHY PENNINGTON: [interposing] It's a
8 backup.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: --in the event
10 there's the system that goes down we can--

11 CATHY PENNINGTON: [interposing] It's
12 just on. Correct.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: --get that
14 mobile boiler over there, and then you have three
15 addition boilers out for delivery?

16 CATHY PENNINGTON: Correct.

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, when will
18 those boilers--?

19 CATHY PENNINGTON: We anticipate those
20 deliveries this heating season, but we're still
21 waiting for confirmation on delivery, but they--the
22 orders are placed, and it's just they have to be
23 built actually manufactured.

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: How long does
25 it usually take for delivery?

2 CATHY PENNINGTON: Approximately 8 to 12
3 weeks.

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Two to three
5 months. October, November, December, January. Okay.
6 How many mobile boilers does NYCHA have? Wait. How
7 many mobile boilers does NYCHA actually own?

8 CATHY PENNINGTON: [pause] Two.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, the one
10 that you have, and then one of the—so out of the 23,
11 NYCHA owns two of them?

12 CATHY PENNINGTON: Correct, we—we lease
13 them. The majority we lease, but we do have some
14 that we own. Two we own.

15 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: The order for the
16 additional mobile units has already been put in. So,
17 it's not as if it's two months from today. We've
18 already started the purchasing process.

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you.

20 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Okay.

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [pause] Okay,
22 does NYCHA's insurance company provide any
23 reimbursement when the boilers fail? [pause]

24

25

2 CATHY PENNINGTON: I'll have to check
3 with our insurance folks. I'm not sure about that.
4 I don't know the answer.

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]
6 Okay. So, the next question would be, if-if so, does
7 that cover the opportunity to purchase or rent an
8 actual boiler? Does the cost itself-like the-the-the
9 money that you will receive from the insurance if one
10 of the boilers actually broke down, would that cover
11 the cost for a mobile boiler?

12 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: We will certainly--

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]
14 And do you know how much?

15 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: --we will certainly
16 look into it, but it would really be reimbursement
17 because obviously we would not wait for-for the
18 insurance company to-to send us the check, but we
19 will check with them.

20 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I'm just
21 thinking of the cash flow because that's always an
22 issue. That's a---

23 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Yes. We will get back
24 to you. Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, I'll
3 hold off. [background comments] Now going back to
4 the tracking system, the database, is the MyNYCHA app
5 still functioning or operating as a tool to be able
6 to see the outages? From the public or the
7 residents, the MyNYCHA app? [pause]

8 BOB MARANO: You can see—I'll take it Bob
9 Marano. You can see tickets for your apartment. I
10 don't—I'm not sure if it shows you the outage tickets
11 themselves for—for the—for the development. I have
12 to check on that, and what about the public facing of
13 the MYNYCHA app because in the past you were able to
14 go to the—the NYCHA site, and pull up the active and
15 open outages. On the MY NYCHA app itself?

16 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Yes.

17 BOB MARANO: We haven't changed anything
18 so it's—if it was there, it's still there.

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, it's still
20 there, but it doesn't—

21 BOB MARANO: I have to validate myself,
22 but I'm—I'm not sure.

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]
24 So, the—the—the site does still work?

25 BOB MARANO: Yes.

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: The site is
3 there, and it's up and running--

4 BOB MARANO: Yes.

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: --but when you
6 click on an individual development, and you go to the
7 tab that says outages, it says there are no outages
8 to report at this--there are no out--there are no open
9 or active outages reported for each development, and
10 so it seems to-- It's a different system, and it's
11 the--it's easier to go to the NYCHA site, and click on
12 the--the individual development to look for an outage
13 as it is to go to the new database to even find it,
14 and so it's a bit of a discrepancy because when you
15 go there, it says there are no outages reported.

16 BOB MARANO: I will look into it and
17 validate it.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, will you
19 do something? I mean will--is--is there--is there a
20 plan to not use that particular--

21 BOB MARANO: No, it's--

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: --app or--?

23 BOB MARANO:

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL:

25

2 BOB MARANO: --it is not displaying it
3 then. We will look into it, and see if there's an
4 issue with-with that side. It should be displaying
5 the same outages as-as the other system.

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay.

7 BOB MARANO: I would have to validate
8 that, and get back to you.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay.

10 BOB MARANO: [interposing] I will look at
11 that.

12 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Well, I mean
13 you could take a look at it, and it's not working.

14 BOB MARANO: Okay.

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: It's-it's-it's
16 not, and that was one of the reasons why we asked
17 this question is because it's not working, and it's a
18 bit confusing for residents and just the public.
19 Okay. Council Member Torres round two.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: As few more
21 questions, and so, I know the number of boilers. How
22 many heating plants? [pause]

23 CATHY PENNINGTON: 656.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Okay, and I asked
25 you earlier about-we had a back and forth about the

2 number of outages. I'll ask the question
3 differently. What are—what are the number of people
4 who have been affected by heat and hot water outage
5 in this heating season so far? The number of people
6 affected, the number of units affected?

7 CATHY PENNINGTON: So, the number of
8 units affected is approximately 4,800.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: So, far this
10 heating season?

11 CATHY PENNINGTON: Yes

12 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And the number of
13 people?

14 CATHY PENNINGTON: [background comments,
15 pause] I do not have that in front of me, but I can
16 look for it.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Okay. Do we know
18 the number of boilers that have broken down at least
19 once out of the 1,900 that are in your control?

20 CATHY PENNINGTON: Well, we know that we
21 had outages at 22 developments. This reporting
22 doesn't get into the granular detail of how many
23 boilers that is, but we could probably look at our
24 dashboard reports to determine how many boilers, but
25 it affected 22 developments.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And I have a
3 question. I know you have roving crews, but my
4 understanding ideally is that boilers are supposed to
5 be staffed either most of the time or all the time.
6 Are—are your boilers staffed most of the time or all
7 the time? Or your heating plants, rather?

8 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: During the normal
9 course of business our heating plants are staffed.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: So, during what
11 hours?

12 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: From 8:00 to 4:30.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: From 8:00 to
14 4:30. So from 4:30--

15 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: [interposing] Through
16 Friday.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: So from 4:30 to
18 8:00, from 4:30 p.m. to 8:00 a.m. your boilers or
19 heating plants are unstaffed?

20 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: We work with the
21 roving to—crews, rather, to address any issues that
22 are our there.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And I understand
24 the roving crews, but I'm asking do you have staff
25 stationed at your heating plants? You do not?

2 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: No.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: So, for most—so
4 most of the time your—your heating plants, which
5 contain multiple boilers, not just one are unmanned,
6 unstaffed. Can I ask—I have some questions about
7 day-to-day boiler maintenance. What—what's the
8 chemical treatment? What's the value of a—of
9 treating a boiler with chemicals?

10 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Chemical treatment
11 helps preserve the metal of the boiler. It's a—
12 [coughs] excuse me.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: It preserves. So,
14 water is a corrosive, and without the chemical
15 treatment the water would corrode the metal, right?
16 So if there's no chemical treatment or if it's done
17 improperly, the water will corrode the actual
18 infrastructure. How often is chemical treatment
19 supposed to be undertaken?

20 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: The expectation is
21 that it's done every day. We do testing and we treat
22 as required.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: The expectation.
24 Do you verify whether it's done everyday or--?

2 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: I have not verified
3 that's it done everyday, but the expectation is that
4 my field supervisors are.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: What happens
6 when—if it's not done everyday, what happens?

7 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Then the field
8 supervisors are required to explain why and/or
9 discipline the employee or perhaps train them if it's
10 a training issue.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Are you supposed
12 to document whether you've chemically treated a
13 boiler?

14 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: There is a log in the
15 boiler room that's—that tracks that.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And you are
17 supposed to chemically treat it once a day?

18 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Test.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Test it.

20 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: We test at least
21 daily, and treat as required.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And is done in-
23 house or is it done by a contractor?

24 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: I'm sorry.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Is it done in-
3 house or is it done by a contractor?

4 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: It's done by our in-
5 house staff right now.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Do you have con-
7 have you ever had contractors conduct chemical
8 treatments of your boilers?

9 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: We have in the past.
10 Yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And did those
12 contractors do it properly?

13 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: To the best of my
14 knowledge, yes they did.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: So, you've met--
16 you're not aware of a single instance in which a
17 contractor did an improper chemical treatment--

18 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: There were issues--

19 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [interposing] in
20 our boilers?

21 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: There were issues with
22 the contractor related to specific staff members that
23 they employed, and when we brought those issues to
24 the contractor, the contractor took action against
25 those individuals, and made corrections.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Well, the
3 contractor—so there was a case of improper chemical
4 treatment?

5 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: There was. For about
6 a year we—we did chemical treatment with a—with a
7 vendor.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Okay and so—and
9 that vendor did improper treatment?

10 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: No, I'm not saying
11 that he did improper treatment. What I'm saying is
12 that when there were issues related to a specific
13 employee that may have been--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [interposing]
15 What were the issues?

16 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: The issues were that
17 he was either not removing the water properly or he
18 was not securing the shunt feeder properly, which is
19 one of the issues that I remember. When we brought
20 those issues to the contractor, he removed that
21 person.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And over what
23 period of time?

24 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: We did this for about
25 a year.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Did this--this
3 particular employee who was--?

4 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: No, no the employee
5 was removed immediately.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Okay. What's the
7 name of the contractor?

8 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Metro--Metro Group. I
9 want to say it was Metro Group.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And what about
11 boiler readings? What's the value of boiler
12 readings?

13 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: I'm sorry?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Boiler readings?

15 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Boiler readings, you
16 said?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Readings, yes.
18 Checking boiler readings. Yes.

19 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Boiler readings. So,
20 which reading were you referring to because there's a
21 number of readings?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I--I'm--I'm not an
23 expert so--

24 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Oh, I'm sorry. So
25 boiler readings some of the readings that we take are

2 stack temperature readings. We state—we take steam
3 pressure readings, as well. We take readings that
4 are associated with our safety tests. We make sure
5 that the safety devices are functioning when we
6 perform what's called a blowdown on each operating
7 boiler to ensure that lower—the cutoffs are operating
8 properly, and the amount of time that it takes for
9 that device to cut off the boiler is recorded. We
10 also perform what's called a flame failure test, and
11 we record the number of seconds it takes for that
12 boiler to shut off.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And how often do
14 you have to conduct that test?

15 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: This—this is done
16 daily.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Daily, the—the
18 safety test.

19 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Monday through Friday.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And the—and the
21 readings as well? The stack readings, the steam
22 readings those are done daily, or just--?

23 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: It's done daily.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: It's once a day?

2 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: It's done more than
3 once a day, once in the morning and again in the
4 afternoon.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And again in the
6 afternoon and that's what's done more than once a
7 day, which particular reading?

8 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: I'm sorry.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Which particular
10 reading is done more than once a day?

11 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: The safety reading
12 that I-that I mentioned is done first thing in the
13 morning and then the stack readings are done
14 throughout the day, and the steam--

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And all of this
16 is recorded?

17 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: On the boiler room
18 daily log sheet, which we've recently moved towards
19 automated. So, you know, it's a paper-driven report
20 right now, but through some of our enhancements, IT
21 enhancements, we're automating it so it's on the
22 handheld.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: What is the-what
24 is an air test? What's the value or purpose of an
25 air test?

2 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: An air test on a
3 boiler. We don't do an air test on a boiler. We do
4 air tests on vacuum systems.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Okay and how, and
6 what's the value? What is the air test reveal?

7 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: An air test what it
8 does it proves tightness of the system of the
9 distribution piping.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Does it check for
11 leaks or--?

12 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: It-it-it tells you
13 whether the system is tight?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: What does that
15 mean? I don't understand.

16 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: It's that-well,
17 because it's a vacuum system it's not going to have
18 any air pressure on it.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: So, if it's not
20 tight, what does that practically mean?

21 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: It means that--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [interposing]
23 That's-what does that practically mean for the
24 tenants in the apartment?

2 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: It means that there
3 may be a vacuum leak in the system that may affect
4 distribution. It may create an imbalance in the
5 system.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Yeah. So, the
7 air testing can tell you whether the heat-heating is
8 properly distributed?

9 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Potentially yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Yes. How-how
11 often do you conduct air tests?

12 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Air testing we haven't
13 conducted our testing in quite some time.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Okay, so what do
15 you mean in quite some time?

16 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: I'm sorry?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: What do you mean
18 quite some time?

19 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Well, I've-I've-I've
20 been with the Heating Department for about-almost
21 three years now, and I-I don't recall the last time
22 we performed an air test.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: So, in the three-
24 so air-the purpose of air testing is to identify the
25 proper distribution of heat whether residents are

2 receiving the proper amount of heat, and you're
3 telling me that in your three years in the heating
4 division--

5 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Uh-hm.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: --you cannot
7 recall one instance in which this system has been air
8 tested?

9 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: We have not performed
10 an air testing?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And why is that?

12 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Staffing levels.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Okay. What about
14 the traps? How often do you check the traps, the
15 float and thermostat of traps?

16 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: We do that every three
17 years. We rebuild them every three years.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: How often are you
19 supposed to check them? Like what's the best
20 practice?

21 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: The best practice is
22 to check them throughout the--throughout the year as
23 we find issues with a line, we--

24

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [interposing] So,
3 you're supposed to check them at various points in
4 the year?

5 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: I'm sorry.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: You're supposed
7 to check the traps at various points in the year, but
8 you—you—you—how often do you actually check them?

9 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: We rebuild them every
10 three years.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Every three
12 years?

13 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Uh-hm.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Okay, and how do
15 you—how do you check them? What's your method for
16 checking them? Do you open them? Do you use
17 infrared, ultrasound? What's your method?

18 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: We do what's called an
19 infrared temperature on the supply and the return on
20 it.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And how reliable
22 is infrared?

23 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: I'm sorry.

24

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: How reliable is
3 infrared for checking a trap? Is it as reliable as
4 opening the trap? Is it as reliable as ultrasound?

5 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: We don't do
6 ultrasound, but opening the trap is probably the best
7 way to determine whether the mechanism is working,
8 but doing the—the—the temperature testing it tells us
9 if there's a problem with that trap. It allows us to
10 identify that there is.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And is it
12 reliable?

13 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: It's reliable.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And how often do
15 you do the infrared? Is that the one you do every
16 three years?

17 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: I'm sorry.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Is that the
19 testing that you do every three years?

20 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: Well, every—every
21 three years we—we—we look to open and rebuild it.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Okay, and then
23 over the course of the year, you—you us infrared?

24

25

2 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: So when-if and when
3 there's an issue with the-with that riser or that
4 apartment line, we'll do the testing of the trap.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Okay. What is an
6 Orifice Schedule?

7 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: What's a what?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: An Orifice
9 Schedule? If I'm mispronouncing it, I apologize.

10 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: You're not. You're
11 pronouncing it correctly. An Orifice Schedule is a
12 schedule that's associated with the radiator traps in
13 a 2-pipe gravity system.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And so what
15 happens if-if the valves are not set according to an
16 Orifice Schedule?

17 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: It would also create
18 an imbalance.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: It would create
20 an imbalance. So, are-are you keeping--

21 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: [interposing] It
22 would create an over-heating or under-heating.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Can you assure me
24 that every valve in your system is set according to
25 the Orifice Schedule?

2 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: To the best of my
3 knowledge they—they are and when our heating staff
4 replaces a valve, they mimic the existing Orifice
5 setting on that valve. They're trained to do this.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And that's
7 something that's recorded?

8 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: I'm sorry?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Is that recorded
10 whether it's been set for it?

11 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: When—when a radiator
12 valve is replaced, there may be a work order
13 associated with it, but it's not recorded that they—
14 they made the proper adjustment. The expectation is
15 that they are making the proper adjustment because
16 that's part of their training.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: And then I guess
18 as far as you brought up earlier there was
19 insufficient resources for air testing, and there's a
20 need for boiler welding, right, that a number of
21 those 48 boilers have yet to be fully overhauled
22 because you need more resources for welding. Have
23 your brought these concerns to City Hall and say, you
24 know, we really need more resources for air testing
25 our boilers and more welders so that we can overhaul

2 them in preparation for the winter? Are those
3 requests that you've made of City Hall and--and what
4 were the responses to those requests?

5 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: So, I want to take
6 that answer while Javier just looks at some of my
7 questions. We have had unlimited resources from City
8 Hall especially with respect to its upcoming eighth
9 (sic) season. What Javier indicated is not a lack of
10 resources. We-we contract our--if we don't have
11 internal resources to address these issues. We have
12 used a variety of different tools. So, so it's not
13 as if we have not received their support.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [interposing]
15 Yeah, but clearly I mean, with respect General
16 Manager, a lack of resources has led to a delay in
17 the summer overhaul, right. If you had a sufficient
18 number of welders, you would have been able to
19 overhaul those boilers, right?

20 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: But we have outside
21 contractors that we have at our disposal--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Meaning that--

23 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: --but I think that the
24 issue is not-it's not so much--

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [interposing] I
3 guess if you had those contractors at your disposal,
4 why is the job not done yet?

5 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Well, I think we need
6 to find out exactly if that was the only issue that's
7 unresolved, which is the welding, right, and when was
8 that brought to our attention.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I mean the
10 impression I have is that that's the dominant issue,
11 the welding.

12 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: What's the question on
13 welding?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Yeah, boiler
15 welding is a leading issue or one of the leading
16 issues in causing the delay in the summer overhaul or
17 the completion of it.

18 JAVIER ALMODOBAR: In some of our older
19 plants welding is—is an issue. It is an issue, but
20 we do get through it. We work with the vendor to
21 create a schedule that—that complements our overhaul
22 schedule.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: So, I can go on
24 forever, but in the interest of time I won't.

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, we just
3 have a few more questions, and I'm going to just
4 breeze through them. I know we have some state
5 elected who were present today. There were a number
6 of developments that were slated for new boilers, and
7 that was with the state funding that we read at the
8 beginning of the year. Any of the boilers that were
9 designated for the state funding because of what's
10 happening with the Consent Decree, and the last I
11 heard, there was no release of state funding. Can
12 you just give a sense of what's happening with those
13 developments? Have you looked at the planning around
14 it and strategized to determine that those boilers
15 will be replaced by city funding at all? Have you
16 made any changes? So, can you just speak to what's
17 happening with the state funds, and the developments
18 that were slated to receive new boilers or some type
19 of heating upgrades under the state funding?

20 DEBORAH GODDARD: Sure. I'll take that
21 one. We certainly wish we had the state funding.
22 It's almost \$250 million worth of funding that's not
23 been released. That is not something that we can
24 immediately replace with funds that are otherwise
25 programmed including some federal funds for boilers,

2 but we do look at the list. So, for instance, we had
3 a problem with International Tower. We've taken that
4 off the state list. We've addressed it otherwise,
5 and we will continue to have that kind of look, but I
6 have to emphasize \$250 million is a resource that's
7 precious to us, and we simply can't create that money
8 over night out of other resources?

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: What about
10 Tilden Houses?

11 DEBORAH GODDARD: Just a minute. Tilden
12 is still slated for the state money investment.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Can you
14 provide us with a list of the developments that were
15 slated for state money that is now, well you can't
16 wait for the state money, and it's through the city?

17 DEBORAH GODDARD: Absolutely.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: That would be
19 very helpful. Thank you. I know we talked about the
20 heating plant technicians and staffing. In light of
21 what happened last year with the number of heating
22 plant technicians about a third who went on to
23 different positions, who were promoted, can you speak
24 to where you are now with that number and if there is
25 any anticipation of movement with those particular

2 individuals, and also we—I remember there was a new
3 cohort of entry level positions that were known as
4 Caretaker H, and it was a position like some kind—a
5 training position, entry level position, and there
6 was I think a cohort of about 28 new hires. So, can
7 you talk to us a little bit about the Caretaker H as
8 well?

9 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: So, I'm going to start
10 with the HPTs. So, we're—we are going into this heat
11 season with a—a 20% increase in the number of HPTs
12 that we did last heat season. So, we have 300 HPTs
13 on board as of today. Last year when we began heat
14 season, that number was approximate 250. In addition
15 to in my testimony I had also mentioned that we are—
16 that we hired additional titles, right. We're
17 bringing on staff in non-traditional titles. I said
18 non-traditional, not the HPT titles. So, we're
19 using—we're hiring additional oilers—oilers. We've
20 hired additional plumbers and plumbers helpers, and
21 for the first time we're using stationary engineers
22 to actually work with us in maintaining our heating
23 plants. Right, the agency used stationary engineers
24 after Sandy, but the use of the stationary engineer
25 title at that time was to maintain the mobile units.

2 So, we have brought 16 stationary engineers on for
3 this heat season, and their role is to work with us
4 in ensuring that the repairs be made to our heating
5 plants more timely. So, the—and the Caretaker H title
6 I'm not familiar with.

7 CATHY PENNINGTON: Yeah, I can give some
8 high level and then we can ask our—one of our HR
9 directors to speak all the various initiatives that
10 we implemented around staffing. But we also after
11 last season, you know, we analyzed what's our skill
12 set? What was our experience some of the teams that
13 came in to assist NYCHA during that terrible cold
14 spell, and that's when we decided to bring in some
15 stationary engineers. We added—we are hiring and
16 added electricians, plumbers and plumbers helpers to
17 complement our staffing, and compared--as the GM
18 mentioned, compared to last year, we have more than
19 50 additional HPTs this year than last year and I'll
20 ask David Marcenecke to speak to the various HR
21 initiatives. That also involves the Caretaker
22 Maintenance Program.

23 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: While we're waiting
24 for David, Bob would just like to respond back to
25 your question about the information on the website.

2 BOB MARANO: [off mic] Yeah, I wanted to—
3 [off mic] Sorry. I want to concur with you. I just
4 checked MY NYCHA Development site. It's the site
5 where you can go into and individual development and
6 see information about the development, when it was
7 built, and how many acres it is, and there's section
8 on there that has outages and it's not being updated
9 with—with the heating outages, and it will be
10 corrected by—by COB Friday.

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you.

12 CATHY PENNINGTON: Just while we have
13 this little intermission, I also did want to correct
14 a statistic I gave earlier. There are actually—the
15 number of unique units affected was 7,489. I looked
16 at the wrong column because my print is too small,
17 and it said it was 4,000 but it was actually 7,489,
18 and these were units affected with heat outage.

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay and
20 Marano, the—the-both sites will have the same exact
21 information, correct?

22 BOB MARANO: Yes, it will pull from the—
23 from the exact same place. Also the MyNYCHA App has
24 the information on it. So, that's why I was a little
25 hesitant in my response. So, MyNYCHA App does have

2 outages, current outages. If you go into the app
3 you'll see what you'll see on the--on the website.

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you and
5 please your right hand. Do you affirm to tell the
6 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in
7 your testimony before this committee, and respond
8 honestly Council Members' questions?

9 DAVID MARCENECKE: Yes. I do.

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay. Thank
11 you, and your name?

12 DAVID MARCENECKE: My name is name is
13 David Marcenecke. I'm Senior Deputy Director of
14 Human Resources at the Housing Authority. I'd like
15 to speak specifically about three of the initiatives
16 that we've embarked upon since last heating season.
17 The first was actually referenced by the GM and Ms.
18 Pennington, and that is specifically in regards to
19 the position classification, and the analysis of the
20 title structure within heating, and the range of
21 skills in order to deliver the heating services, and
22 specifically the diversification of the title mix.
23 So, for example, the stationary engineers, the
24 oilers, the teams of plumbers. The second approach
25 was--

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]
3 Can you pull the mic towards your mouth.

4 DAVID MARCENECKE: Sure.

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: thank you.

6 DAVID MARCENECKE: The second approach
7 was improving our recruiting both for Civil Service
8 and also for provisional hiring. Specifically with
9 respect to Civil Service, we partnered with DCAS in
10 order to petition for continuous testing for titles
11 that—that are heating related. We were successful in
12 getting a more frequent exam schedule for heating
13 plant technician. So, for example, the heating plant
14 technician exam for both promotional and open
15 competitive, was given in August of this year. DCAS
16 supplied us also with the—the names of the test
17 takers so that we can canvass those individuals for
18 possible provisional appointment pending the
19 certification of the actual list, and appointment on
20 a permanent basis. As well, we are currently working
21 the maintenance worker, Civil Service list. If you
22 recall last season, we had a number of heating plant
23 technicians that promoted upwards to maintenance
24 worker and assistant resident building
25 superintendent. We were successful in this movement

2 of the current, most current civil service list for
3 maintenance worker to appoint 23 heating plant
4 technicians in place in our Heating Department, and
5 moreover, for the next maintenance worker exam, we
6 were successful in getting a Selective Certification
7 option that will be deliver—the test will be
8 administered in December of this year. The Selective
9 Certification option will allow us to call from the
10 master list, the overall open competitive Civil
11 Service list for maintenance worker for those that
12 have a heating specialty. So, we will be able
13 strategically to be able to pinpoint those who are—
14 currently are heating plan technicians, and service
15 and those in the general public who have the heating
16 skill mix to join us in our Heating Department. On
17 the—on the provisional front for the periods when we
18 don't have an active civil service list, we've
19 improved our recruiting. So, again, we've partnered
20 with DCAS and their Office of Citywide Recruiting
21 Services. We held a job fair in April for example.
22 We've improved our outreach through--

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]

24 How many did you pull from the provisional list?

25 Like how many people have you hired? How many people

2 are like ready to be deployed who are—during this
3 heating season now?

4 DAVID MARCENECKE: I'm—I'm not
5 understanding your question.

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Because you
7 were saying that you—what you've improved on. So,
8 I'm just like asking like for body members for the
9 provisionals. Did you—did you hire like 20 more
10 provisional people for this heating season to work in
11 the heating plants? Is—is-can you like give me
12 numbers at all?

13 DAVID MARCENECKE: There are several
14 dozen provisionals for HPT at this point. So, we're
15 hiring provisionals again. Again, until such time as
16 we get a new Civil Service list. It was given in
17 August. It takes about nine months for it to be
18 certified, established and certified. So, we do
19 anticipate that it would be ready for the next
20 heating season, the next Civil Service list.

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay.

22 DAVID MARCENECKE: We've—we've even done—
23 gone out to such platforms as LinkedIn, sent out
24 invitations to HVAC professionals, and have been able
25 to make appointments for those.

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: If you
3 working in the perfect world right now, how many
4 people would you need employed at NYCHA right now to
5 assist with all of the vacant positions--whatever
6 vacancy positions or whatever you could project as a
7 problem from the skilled workers or the oilers or the
8 electricians or the plumbers, how many people do you
9 think you would--NYCHA will need to have employed
10 right now to assist with this heating season based on
11 the information and knowledge that you have about
12 your buildings and your systems?

13 DAVID MARCENECKE: Yeah, so I can't
14 answer that--

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]
16 Okay.

17 DAVID MARCENECKE: --right now, but what
18 I--I do want to stress, though, and it is mentioned in
19 my testimony is that in addition to having--having 25--
20 20% more HPTs, there are a number of other titles
21 that we are using specifically to address the
22 problems. So, it's not just the HPT title series,
23 and what's important to note that also in my
24 testimony that in addition to the five developments
25 that were under third-party management, we've

2 increased that up to 46, right. So, at the same time
3 that we have 46 developments that will be managed by
4 a private third party, we've increased the number of
5 HPTs. So, they're responsible for fewer
6 developments, but we have 20% more. So, it's
7 important, and I think what we're going into this
8 heat season staffing wise, we're comfortable with
9 that, and obviously we have the—the ability, and—and
10 the support of the Administration to increase that if
11 we need to.

12 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, that's
13 what we want to hear the fact that in the event there
14 is some type of emergency, some type of outage—
15 outage, and you know that you are not—that the
16 particular development needs a new boiler. They
17 don't have one. There is not an opportunity to put
18 or it doesn't make sense to put a mobile boiler
19 there, but you do have somebody readily available
20 that can be deployed to go there. If it's an
21 electrician, if it's a plumber, if it's an oiler,
22 someone. So, that's what we want to hear. Like if
23 there is a cadre of folks that you can call at the
24 last minute and give them—

2 CATHY PENNINGTON: [interposing] So, in-
3 in-

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]
5 All boarded.

6 CATHY PENNINGTON: Right, and so in
7 addition to what the GM just mentioned, you know, and
8 with our temp hires, it-not only did we increase the
9 numbers, but we're really looking at what are the
10 skills required to manage very, very old plants,
11 right. So, we have given to our contractors the
12 newer plants because they can bring in the best
13 skillsets to those newer plants, and our staff we're
14 bringing in more skillsets to our old plants that we
15 continue to manage like the stationary engineers, we
16 added more plumbers and plumber helpers. We also
17 have a whole other department called Skilled Trades
18 Division that we use plumbers and electricians in
19 addition to the-to the over 500 in the Heating
20 Department to supplement repair services for heating
21 now.

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]
23 Now for this heating system-this heating season.

24 CATHY PENNINGTON: Yes, and the Caretaker
25 H?

2 DAVID MARCENECKE: So, the Caretaker H
3 program is not yet online. We are in the midst of
4 finalizing the memorandum of understanding with New
5 York City College of Technology, and that will
6 produce a training program, principally recruiting
7 from the resident population who would be able to
8 come on board as caretakers.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: [interposing]
10 What's the timeframe?

11 DAVID MARCENECKE: The timeframe?
12 [background comments, pause]

13 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: We don't believe that
14 that will be in place for this heat season.

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay. but the
16 reason why I mention that is because it--when we
17 submitted the--the letter asking like several
18 questions related to the Heating Plant Technicians
19 and what's happening, and I'm talking about the
20 oversight and investigation letter, the joint letter
21 between myself and Council Member Torres. It took a
22 very long time to get responses to that particular
23 letter, and we received the responses I want to say
24 last month, September 18th and it specifically states
25 that there would be I want say 28 cohorts, and they

2 would tired or going through this process, the fall
3 of 2018 and it will be completed and ready in early
4 2019. So, that's why I asked about this. So, just
5 want to—if you want to clarify. [pause]

6 VITO MUSTACIUOLO: Okay. So, I just want
7 to address that. So the Caretaker H so we expect it
8 to begin in early 2019 at the program and it will
9 take approximately one year for the staff to be fully
10 trained.

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, and the
12 last set of questions are related to what's happening
13 with the design process and procurement phase in the
14 construction. Someone's got it. [pause] Can you
15 just explain to us the amount of time that you were
16 able to cut off for this process, and I know that—I
17 want to say maybe March or so there was an
18 announcement around the 20 months of—of time that you
19 were able to save, and the Mayor has mentioned it
20 several times. So, can you just explain to us where
21 you are now in that process.

22 CATHY PENNINGTON: Sure. So the aspect
23 that we can most control by ourselves, of course, is
24 our design process, and we proposed to cut that in
25 half from 12 months to 6 months. We did do that, and

2 those projects are on the street now for bid. We
3 also have an agreement with-

4 CATHY PENNINGTON: [interposing] And
5 just so we can be clear, can you just give us an
6 example? Can you give us like what does that mean,
7 you know, the-it's out on the street now for bids.
8 So, can you relate it to maybe a particular
9 development or particular project that you're working
10 on just so it could be real?

11 CATHY PENNINGTON: Sure. So, the sites
12 that are getting new boilers under the city program
13 are Farragut, Wrangle, Sotomayor, Cypress, Capp,
14 Morris, which includes Morris 1, 2 and Morrisania,
15 Ferrantino, Robinson, Long Island Baptist Houses and
16 Morris 2. They are on the street for bid. It should
17 take us about four to six months in the procurement.
18 That means advertising, getting them in, evaluating,
19 doing the vendor name check and awarding. We expect
20 that generally on the construction depending on the
21 number of boilers, so some plants have two, some have
22 eight. It can go up, you know, a range. It would be
23 2 to 3-1/2 years for full-full construction. One
24 thing I do want to say is, of course, one of the
25 first things that happens is we tie in the new gas-

2 fired mobile boilers. So, consistent quality heat
3 would be provided as soon as we get the mobile
4 boilers tied in ahead of demolition of the existing
5 plant. Total timeline through all the sign-offs and
6 everything we hope to see shrink from, and I'm
7 reading this just to be accurate. Generally, we run
8 from a little over three years to five years. We're
9 hoping to be under three years to a little over three
10 years, and some of the ways in addition to the design
11 savings, we've- DEP has offered expedited permitting
12 approvals for us, investigations. We give them the
13 heads-up notice, they will prioritize us and be out
14 to us. Likewise, DOB has agreed to work with us to
15 get their inspections done rapidly. Again, we give
16 them heads-up notice. They will deploy the staff
17 correctly, and we are also working with the
18 Comptroller's Office around the registration process.
19 I would also add that in order to get the boilers
20 going, the city money, as you know, is on a July 1st
21 basis. We did use federal funds to advance the
22 designs as soon as possible rather than wait 'til
23 July 1.

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Alright, thank
25 you so much. You mentioned Ferrentino. So, because

2 they are in need of a new boiler and they have, you
3 know, some—some issues, and the bid is in the street,
4 for it—can you just paint a picture for the residents
5 because this process is going to take so long, what
6 do they do now? And I know we mentioned the hiring
7 of new staffers, but just in closing, can you just
8 paint a picture for the residents that there are
9 significant needs in the developments now? And what
10 can they look forward to or anticipate during this
11 heating season?

12 CATHY PENNINGTON: So, I would start off
13 with we are making every commitment we can for a
14 rapid response to repairs. The reality is that 56%
15 of our boilers are outdate and need replacement. It
16 will be years to come before we're going to be able
17 to replace those, but 50–56% of the boilers we know
18 may have interruptions in services. So, that's just
19 our reality moving forward. So, what we've committed
20 ourselves to is how can we build in through our
21 operations, and through our contractors improved
22 response time? So, that's why we've hired up more
23 technical—more technicians who we think can help us
24 diagnose problems more quickly, try to improve our
25 communications, and we'll continue to enhance those,

2 digitize all of our boiler room inspection reporting.
3 So, we're making sure, and holding our staff
4 accountable to do all of the checks they need to be
5 doing on a daily basis. So, all of these steps we
6 think will contribute to improved response time for
7 repairs, and we're—we're trying to be real straight
8 with—with our residents, about what to expect, and I
9 think we—really that's another area we need to
10 improve our communications on so that as we're
11 entering this winter season we're telling them yes,
12 you're plant—your—your facility is on a list for
13 repair. It's not going to happen for years. We try
14 to provide these updates, but, you know, we could
15 probably do more to communicate with residents about
16 what to expect. So, again, we remain fully
17 committed. We've built our staffing up. We've done
18 more training. We've brought in more contractors.
19 We have contingency plans to bring in mobile boilers.
20 Even the ones that we're placed orders for, and they
21 are being made, if something occurs next month and we
22 need a mobile boiler, we have an emergency contract
23 that can deliver within 24 hours a mobile boiler to
24 us that we can get installed. Our staff are trained
25 and know how to do the mobile boiler installations.

2 So, we feel like we have built contingencies, you
3 know, increased in all the areas that we could within
4 our current budgets.

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay. So, in
6 closing, we were off to a rough start at the
7 beginning of this hearing, and we were also just off
8 to a rough start just being able to deliver to some
9 of the residents heat and hot water and water over
10 the past couple of weeks, and from the testimony
11 today we're off to a rough start with the third-party
12 vendor just over the past couple of weeks. And so, I
13 would really hope that this is an opportunity to
14 continue the lines of communication between the
15 Council as well as the residents so that we can
16 figure out a way to work together to be able to
17 articulate what's happening, and it starts with the
18 transparency and accountability. It starts with
19 transparency of the websites, right, to make sure
20 that those are accurate, and we know what's going on,
21 we know what's happening because we're all in this
22 together. We're all public servants, and we're here
23 to serve the people, and so I just hope that even
24 with the rough start, we can figure out a way to make
25 sure and ensure that the residents have a clean and

2 decent place to call home. And when Ms. Newman from
3 Legal Aid mentioned abatements, and then it came up
4 again from my colleagues in the comments, NYCHA is a
5 landlord, and the—and leases were signed, and there
6 is a warranty of habitability. And so, this is
7 related to that, providing families with heat and hot
8 water and water, and so that's another conversation
9 that we do need to have because families are paying
10 their rent 94%--there's a 94% rent collection rate,
11 and so we really have to figure this out together.
12 So, I just want to thank you for coming. I want to
13 thank you for staying and being able to have this
14 discussion. We have a ton of other questions that
15 were not asked, and so we will send these to you for
16 answers, and just some follow-up throughout the
17 course of the past several hours. So, thank you so
18 much for being here, and we're going to get to the
19 next panel, and hopefully—I'm not sure who is going
20 to stay, but just let us know who is going to stay
21 from NYCHA throughout the rest of the hearing. Thank
22 you so much. So, the next panel we'll hear from
23 Douglas Davis, Karen Blondell, and Robert Creamer, or
24 Robert Cramer. [background comments, pause]

2 FEMALE SPEAKER: I'm assuming Helen
3 Rosenthal left, too. Yes, she left a long time ago.

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Assemblywoman,
5 wait. Okay. So, Robert Cramer and Douglas Davis, and
6 that's the only cards that we have left. So, this
7 will be the last panel. [background comments, pause]
8 Mr. Davis. Are you Mr. Davis? Mr. Davis? Okay.

9 MR. DAVIS: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And who is
11 staying from the Administration? [background
12 comments] Okay. Thank you, Mr. Davis. I know you've
13 been here a while.

14 DOUG DAVIS: It's been a very interesting
15 and productive day. It's wonderful to be here.

16 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: If you can
17 just state your name again.

18 DOUG DAVIS: Doug Davis.

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And you're
20 from?

21 DOUG DAVIS: Cassonic (sp?). [background
22 comments]

23 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, you can
25 bring your testimony.

2 DOUG DAVIS: Yeah, I just wanted to maybe
3 comment on a few things, and maybe in an active
4 transparency and discovery, which I think this whole
5 process is about is just to maybe at some future date
6 have Vito and NYCHA just comment on--actually this
7 slide is a wonderful depiction of the budget and
8 where the funds come from to operate. Just
9 yesterday, there was an announcement of a new \$100
10 million energy service contract, which I'm assuming
11 may or may not be in this figure, but maybe to talk a
12 little bit about the process that NYCHA used to award
13 that contract. I think it could be transformative to
14 the replacement of these 50 some odd boilers that all
15 have to be replaced, and then maybe make sure the
16 committee is fully versed on what is in the contract
17 because it will eventually result in larger energy
18 savings, of course, but also much bigger contracts
19 for the eventual upgrade and replacement to all this,
20 you know, heating system, which is clearly in need
21 of-of both people and funding to move forward, and
22 make it a more reliable system. I think a lot of the
23 comments we heard today were good interesting
24 dialogue, but, you know, clearly the problem here
25 isn't necessarily a technical one. I think we all

2 can feel comfortable with that. In this day and age
3 we know how to design and operate boiler systems.
4 It's clearly been a management and a funding problem,
5 and I just thought this might be something that the
6 committee could explore with this new energy service
7 contract to make sure that it's going to bring them
8 to the point where we all need to be to not have to
9 talk about the deficiencies of the system in another
10 five years.

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: If you don't
12 mind, could you just explain what you mean by that?
13 Like how would it be beneficial because I'm not an
14 energy person.

15 DOUG DAVIS: Sure.

16 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, it would
17 be very helpful to explain what's happening, what's
18 this—explain the \$100 million that you're—you're
19 referring to.

20 DOUG DAVIS: Yeah, again I would actually
21 think I can just give you an overview of how an
22 energy service contract works in normal places like a
23 federal government and university.

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: That would be
25 helpful.

2 DOUG DAVIS: But I—I would really
3 recommend Vito talk specifically about it because he
4 was mentioned in the article yesterday or in a press
5 release, but in general, what an energy service
6 contract is, is you have a large operating cost of
7 some sort of facility, and you're going to spend you
8 know, because you've spent in the past a certain
9 amount to own and operate that system from an energy
10 standpoint, and as technology gets more efficient,
11 modern methods are developed to produce heating
12 systems. You can basically say wait a minute, I'm
13 going to—I replace 53 boilers over the next couple of
14 years, I'm going to have a quantum leap in energy
15 savings because technology is better today than it
16 was 20, 30 years ago, and you can award an energy
17 service contract, which would basically be paying
18 someone to design and fund the planned replacement of
19 X efficiency to something better, and results in
20 lower operating costs, which means the pie here
21 changes. And, you know, normally an energy service
22 contract our federal government does it all the time,
23 states are deploying these things, even private
24 entities will use energy service contracts to kind of
25 pay for the replacement and upgrade their facilities

2 based on reduced operating costs over the next 20 or
3 30 years. So, \$100 million NYCHA contract to I
4 believe a vendor is Ameresco, would be a benefit if
5 it goes well because the—the pie her gets smaller in
6 the future and you pay for these upgrades out of
7 energy savings. I think the real goal I think of
8 transparency is to make sure the leadership here
9 understands the process, what was in the original
10 \$100 million contract because it's obviously going to
11 be instrumental to the future success of being ab
12 able to deliver heat and hot water to residents. So,
13 it's—it's something that I think is an important
14 thing, and the timing is right because obviously I
15 think this contract was awarded in large part because
16 there's a dire need here, and we need to fix the
17 system and move forward, and pay for it in some
18 manner. So, to me it's a great opportunity, but it
19 certainly is probably a more important discussion for
20 you to understand than, you know, how to test the
21 boiler or, you know, hire a person. That's—that's
22 management stuff. This is the future of New York
23 City's Housing program.

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, I
3 appreciate that. Thank you, and I would love to-to
4 follow up, and have another conversation.

5 DOUG DAVIS: I look forward to that.
6 Thank you very much for your time.

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you.
8 [pause] We have for the record testimony from
9 Assembly Member Helen Rosenthal; testimony from the
10 Legal Aid Society; testimony Fifth Avenue Committee;
11 and that is all the testimony we received for the
12 record. So that will conclude our Public Housing
13 Hearing today on preparing for the winter, heat and
14 hot water at NYCHA developments. Thank you everyone.
15 [gavel]

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date October 31, 2018