

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

September 12, 2018  
Start: 1:44 p.m.  
Recess: 2:56 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Corey Johnson  
Speaker

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- Adrienne Adams
- Alicka Ampry-Samuel
- Diana Ayala
- Inez D. Barron
- Joseph Borelli
- Justin Brannan
- Fernando Cabrera
- Margaret S. Chin
- Andy Cohen
- Costa Constantinides
- Robert Cornegy
- Chaim Deutsch
- Ruben Diaz
- Daniel Dromm
- Rafael Espinal
- Mathieu Eugene
- Vanessa L. Gibson
- Mark Gjonaj
- Barry S. Grodenchik
- Robert Holden

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Council Members: Ben Kallos  
Andy L. King  
Peter A. Koo  
Karen Koslowitz  
Rory I. Lancman  
Brad S. Lander  
Stephen T. Levin  
Mark Levine  
Alan N. Maisel  
Carlos Menchaca  
I. Daneek Miller  
Francisco Moya  
Bill Perkins  
Keith Powers  
Antonio Reynoso  
Donovan Richards  
Carlina Rivera  
Ydanis Rodriguez  
Deborah Rose  
Helen K. Rosenthal  
Rafael Salamanca  
Ritchie J. Torres  
Mark S. Treyger  
Eric A. Ulrich  
Paul Vallone  
James G. Van Bramer  
Kalman Yeger  
Steven Matteo  
Laurie A. Cumbo  
Joseph Borelli



1  
2           SPEAKER JOHNSON: For Marcia Bystryn, hi,  
3 how are you? Good to see you. A pleasure, of course,  
4 absolutely. So happy to have you here. Do you want  
5 to grab the proc [sic]? Hi Laurie. Hi, how you  
6 doing? Okay, so today, the New York City Council is  
7 very proud to honor Marcia Bystryn for her service of  
8 19 years as Executive Director and President of the  
9 New York League of Conservation Voters. She joined  
10 the League in 1999, and she has created a lengthy  
11 legacy of achievements which include the Education  
12 Fund and the development of clear policy data on a  
13 wide array of subjects. So, I want to hand it over  
14 to our Environmental Chair, Costa Constantinides, to  
15 introduce before we read the Proclamation.

16           COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank  
17 you, Speaker Johnson, and thank you for your  
18 environmental leadership. I really want to thank  
19 Marcia for your years of service, not only to the  
20 League of Conservation Voters, but to all of New  
21 York, whether it's been issues of clean water,  
22 whether it's been issues of how do we better fight  
23 greenhouse gases and climate change. LCB has been on  
24 the cutting-edge, and holding Council Members  
25 accountable as well, as we see our score card every

1  
2 single year making sure that in all of our minds the  
3 environment is never too far away, and as we see the  
4 big picture, attacks from Washington on this city and  
5 on the climate change, we always needed strong  
6 leaders, but never more than over the last couple of  
7 years, and you've been a Stallworth champion for the  
8 environment. So, thank you, Marcia, for all that  
9 you've done. We're going to miss you a great deal.  
10 I-- I'm not going anywhere yet, but we are going to--  
11 I tried introducing legislation to see if we-- you  
12 could stay, but it didn't work. But really, for your  
13 19 years of service with LCB and as President, I want  
14 to thank you and have the rest-- a proclamation from  
15 all the Council here to say thank you.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: So we're going to ask  
17 the Clerk to please read the proclamation and then  
18 hand it over to Marcia.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Council City of New York  
20 Proclamation: The Council of the City of New York is  
21 proud to honor Marcia Bystryn for her 19 years of  
22 outstanding service and leadership to the New York  
23 League of Conservation Voters, and whereas, despite  
24 all of the extraordinary progress our city and others  
25 continue to make, the future of our nation will be

1  
2 decided largely by how we address our single greatest  
3 threat, climate change. Established in 1969, the  
4 League of Conservation Voters has played a major role  
5 in this mission by working to turn environmental  
6 values into local, state and national priorities.  
7 Since its founding in 1989, New York League of  
8 Conservation Voters has remained committed to  
9 advancing this cause, supporting those working to  
10 protect the environment and holding public servants  
11 accountable to their votes and their actions. Marcia  
12 Bystryn has guided this organization's noble cause  
13 for the last 19 years, and whereas, Ms. Bystryn  
14 joined the New York League of Conservation Voters as  
15 Executive Director in 1999 and excelled in that role  
16 until 2008 when she became the organization's  
17 President, and whereas, throughout Ms. Bystryn's  
18 tenure with the New York League of Conservation  
19 Voters, she created a lengthy legacy of achievements,  
20 this includes the creation of an Education Fund which  
21 assists in informing voters and policy makers of  
22 conservation and environmental protection issues. In  
23 addition, she directed the development of Clear  
24 Policy Dicta on a range of critical subjects such as  
25 climate change, clean air and water, public health,

1  
2 renewable energy, transportation, and open space.  
3 These efforts have resulted in numerous state and  
4 local legislative and administrative victories for  
5 sound environmental policies, and whereas, prior to  
6 joining the New York League of Conservation Voters,  
7 Ms. Bystryn worked at the Port Authority of New York  
8 and New Jersey, fulfilling the duties of Senior  
9 Corporate Policy Manager for the Environment, and  
10 later, Senior Business Manager for Economic  
11 Development. early in her career, she served as the  
12 Assistant Commissioner for Recycling at New York City  
13 Department of Sanitation as well as Deputy Director  
14 of the 20<sup>th</sup> Century Fund, now known as the Century  
15 Foundation, and whereas, after nearly two decades of  
16 stewardship at the New York League of Conservation  
17 Voters, Ms. Bystryn is stepping down to pursue other  
18 career opportunities, but she can be proud knowing  
19 that her distinguished contributions will continue to  
20 shape our City and for generations to come. Now,  
21 therefore be it known that this Council of the City  
22 of New York gratefully honors Marcia Bystryn for her  
23 dedication in making New York a leader in  
24 environmental protection. Corey Johnson, Speaker for  
25

1  
2 the entire Council, Costa Constantinides, Council  
3 Member 22<sup>nd</sup> District Queens.

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Congratulations.

5 [applause]

6 MARCIA BYSTRYN: I'll be very brief.

7 First, thank you very much, Speaker, and thank you so  
8 much Councilman, and all of you, all of you. It has  
9 been fantastic working with you. I hope you feel the  
10 same way. As you noted, we do really two things. We  
11 lay out an agenda and advocate with you and hold you  
12 accountable and on-- I'm waiting for a ripple of  
13 quiet laughter here. And then, there's our education  
14 function where I think we work to empower New Yorkers  
15 to be effective advocates for the environment. And  
16 while this may be good-bye for me, it is certainly  
17 not good-bye from the League. We will remain  
18 intimate part of your life, and you will be  
19 delighted. My successor, who starts October 1<sup>st</sup>,  
20 Julie Tighe, is a wed to the same kind of goals I've  
21 been wed to, and I think will take the organization  
22 to a new level. So, thank you, very, very much.

23 [applause]

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Okay, our next  
25 Proclamation, we're going to ask the amazing police



1 officer, Osvaldo Nunez. So, today, the Council is  
2 extraordinarily proud to honor-- extraordinarily  
3 proud to honor the heroism of a newly-graduated NYPD  
4 Officer, Osvaldo Nunez, for using CPR to revive a 20-  
5 month-old baby. On July 30--

6 [applause]

7  
8 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yes. On July 30<sup>th</sup>, so  
9 not that long ago, this past summer, Officer Nunez  
10 was standing outside the 115<sup>th</sup> Precinct when a woman  
11 frantically came up to Officer Nunez-- I'm getting  
12 the chills saying it-- and pleaded to help her with  
13 her lifeless daughter. Officer Nunez took the little  
14 baby, the girl, inside and starting doing chest  
15 compressions. After several attempts by Officer  
16 Nunez, this little baby girl finally gained  
17 consciousness and was taken to the hospital and was  
18 evaluated and released. It cannot be underscored,  
19 the dedication and sacrifice that our New York City  
20 Police Department Officers do day-in and day-out, and  
21 we are unbelievably grateful for Officer Nunez's  
22 heroism, proving he is truly one of New York's  
23 finest. Congratulations Officer. We're so happy to  
24 have you with the NYPD, and I'm going to hand it over  
25

1  
2 to Council Member Danny Dromm whose district this  
3 happened in.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you, Mr.  
5 Speaker, and it is indeed an honor for me to be able  
6 to present this Proclamation along with you on the  
7 day after 9/11. And we recognize what our police  
8 officers, our fire officers, our first responders do  
9 for us on a daily basis, and this particular case is  
10 also an example of what our NYPD officers do for us.  
11 Officer Osvaldo Nunez is 22 years old. He was born  
12 and raised in Queens, but his family is from the  
13 Dominican Republic.

14 [applause]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: He attended  
16 Queensborough Community College and studied Criminal  
17 Justice and then transferred to John Jay College of  
18 Criminal Justice and studied policing and crime  
19 analysis and investigation. He always knew that he  
20 wanted to become a police officer since he was young.  
21 He eagerly anticipated the day when he turned 18  
22 years old. He took the NYPD exam during spring break  
23 of that year and was later sworn into his dream job  
24 at age 21 on January 10<sup>th</sup>, 2018. He graduated the  
25 NYPD Police Academy on July 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2018, only two

1 months ago, okay, and was assigned to the 115<sup>th</sup>  
2 Precinct. His career in the NYPD, as far as that's  
3 concerned, he wants to make his way through the  
4 investigatory route and obtain his detective shield  
5 and then take promotional exam throughout his career  
6 to get as high as he can within the Department. He  
7 is motivated to succeed. He is the first police  
8 officers in his family and wants to lead by example.  
9 He wants to be the best that he can be. His first  
10 month out on the streets afforded him the opportunity  
11 to save a little girl's life. Her distressed mother  
12 ran towards the precinct with the child in-hand. She  
13 was unresponsive and not breathing. His training  
14 immediately kicked in and he did CPR on the child.  
15 She then came back to a responsive state. He cannot  
16 explain the feeling he experienced at that time, and  
17 words can never describe exactly how he felt and how  
18 we in the community when we learned about the  
19 incident felt as well. The happiness and look of  
20 relief on the mother's face was priceless. This is  
21 the reason that Officer Nunez always wanted to become  
22 a police officer, to help people and be a positive  
23 role model within the community. He will forever be  
24 grateful for having the opportunity to become a  
25

1  
2 police officer and he will always wear his uniform  
3 with honor.

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Council  
5 Member Dromm. We're going to have the Clerk read the  
6 Proclamation, and then hear from the hero who is with  
7 us today.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Council City of New York  
9 Proclamation: We are a city of 8.5 million people  
10 who depend upon the unwavering dedication of the  
11 NYPD's 36,000 officers and 19,000 civilian employees  
12 who perform a wide range of roles from public safety  
13 and law enforcement to traffic management, counter-  
14 terror and emergency response roles. It is a great  
15 privilege to honor one of the NYPD's newest  
16 graduates, Police Officer Osvaldo Nunez, for saving  
17 the life of one of the newest New Yorkers, and  
18 whereas, born and raised in Queens, Osvaldo Nunez  
19 knew he wanted to become a police officers from an  
20 early age and eagerly awaited his 18<sup>th</sup> birthday so he  
21 could finally take the NYPD test. After studying  
22 criminal justice at Queensborough Community College,  
23 he was transferred to the renowned John Jay College  
24 of Criminal Justice where he studied policing and  
25 crime analysis and investigation. On January 10<sup>th</sup>,

1  
2 2018, he began his dream job at last and became the  
3 first police officer in his family, and whereas, on  
4 July 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2018, Officer Nunez graduated from the NYPD  
5 Police Academy and was assigned to the 115<sup>th</sup> Precinct  
6 which primarily serves the communities of Jackson  
7 Heights, East Elmhurst, and North Corona. Just a few  
8 weeks into his assignment, the 22-year-old officer  
9 faced an incredible challenge, a 20-month-old girl,  
10 and whereas, on July 30<sup>th</sup>, Officer Nunez was standing  
11 in front of the precinct station house when a  
12 distressed mother ran up clutching her practically  
13 lifeless toddler, "My daughter's not breathing. My  
14 daughter's not breathing," she said. As Officer Nunez  
15 confirmed the tot was unresponsive and had no pulse,  
16 he took the child inside, placed the baby on a stool  
17 and began performing CPR. And whereas, Officer Nunez  
18 took extreme care performing CPR on the baby girl,  
19 yet his first round of chest compressions didn't  
20 work. When he started a second round she opened her  
21 eyes and returned to a responsive state. While he  
22 made sure nothing was in her mouth, her mother beamed  
23 with happiness and relief. Medics soon rushed the  
24 toddler to Elmhurst Hospital where she was treated  
25 and released. Everyone believes that the tot had

1  
2 suffered a seizure as she had prior to this incident,  
3 and whereas, Officer Nunez noted that, "This was the  
4 reason I always wanted to become a police officer, to  
5 help people and be a positive role model to the  
6 community." In the words of Deputy Inspector Carlos  
7 Ortiz, the 115<sup>th</sup> Precinct Commanding Officer,  
8 "Officer Nunez has a very good career ahead of him."  
9 And whereas because of Officer Nunez's quick  
10 response, a young resident is alive and well today.  
11 Officer Nunez graduated only weeks before this  
12 incident, yet such heroism proves that he is truly  
13 one of New York's finest. Now, therefore be it known  
14 that the New York City Council proudly honors NYPD  
15 Officer Osvaldo Nunez for his life-saving rescue on  
16 July 30<sup>th</sup>, 2018 and his stellar service to New York  
17 City. Corey Johnson, Speaker for the entire Council;  
18 Daniel Dromm, Council Member 25<sup>th</sup> District Queens.

19 [applause]

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: We of course want to  
21 hear from the officer, as well as Deputy Inspector  
22 Ortiz afterwards.

23 OFFICER NUNEZ: Thank you all for being  
24 here and thank you all for inviting me to Council.  
25 It's an honor to be here. The night of July 30<sup>th</sup>

1  
2 when baby Leah's [sic] mother came into-- in front of  
3 the precinct, you know, distressed that her daughter  
4 wasn't breathing, it was truly a miracle what  
5 happened. Training immediately kicked in. The  
6 Academy, a long six months, training is very  
7 tactical. They go very into depth with everything.  
8 I'm just glad that baby Leah's now healthy and happy  
9 and reunited with her family. There's no better  
10 feeling in the world knowing that she's on a great  
11 track and she has a wonderful family. I'm very  
12 thankful for that.

13 [applause]

14 DEPUTY INSPECTOR ORTIZ: A couple of  
15 things. I can't be more proud of. We get new  
16 officers in, you kind of don't know what you're  
17 getting, and when you see this from a brand new  
18 rookie who has 20 years ahead of him, it's amazing,  
19 and it also goes far to the other officers, because  
20 he's proven example for the officers even that have  
21 been there 10, 15 years to see, you know, his  
22 reaction. He didn't hesitate. It was just I gotta  
23 [sic] get this done. I mean, I was working that day,  
24 and it was like one of those things where it was like  
25 he was like in the zone. It was amazing. You know,

1 watching the mother from one point of anguish,  
2 screaming, crying to the minute the baby opened her  
3 eyes it was just like-- it's amazing, and it's  
4 something that I've never seen in 21 years of my  
5 career, and it's just-- as a parent it's something  
6 that, you know, we never want to see from our  
7 children, but just to see something good come out of  
8 it, it was amazing. And yes, thank you.

9 [applause]

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Let's get a photo with  
11 the officers.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Ladies and gentlemen,  
13 can I have your attention, please? Quiet on the  
14 floor, please. Quiet on the floor, please. Thank  
15 you. Quiet please. At this time, I ask that you  
16 please place all electronic devices, all electronic  
17 devices, to vibrate. Will all non-council employees,  
18 non-council employees, please leave the main floor of  
19 the chambers. Thank you. Madam Majority Leader,  
20 it's all yours.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Good afternoon,  
22 and welcome to the Stated Meeting of September 12<sup>th</sup>,  
23 2018. Quiet in the Chambers. Please rise for the  
24 Pledge of Allegiance.  
25



1  
2 ALL MEMBERS: I pledge allegiance to the  
3 flag of the United States of America and to the  
4 Republic for which it stands, one nation under God,  
5 indivisible with liberty and justice for all.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Roll call?

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Present.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Present.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Here.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli? Brannan?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: [off mic]

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera? Chin?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Constantinides?

22 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Present.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Present.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch?

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.  
3 COUNCIL CLERK: Diaz?  
4 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ? Present.  
5 COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm?  
6 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Present.  
7 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal?  
8 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.  
9 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene? Gibson?  
10 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Here.  
11 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj?  
12 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Present.  
13 COUNCIL CLERK: Grodenchik?  
14 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: here.  
15 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden?  
16 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.  
17 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos?  
18 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.  
19 COUNCIL CLERK: King? Koo?  
20 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.  
21 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz?  
22 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.  
23 COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman?  
24 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.  
25 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander?

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: here.  
3 COUNCIL CLERK: Levin?  
4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.  
5 COUNCIL CLERK: Levine?  
6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.  
7 COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel?  
8 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.  
9 COUNCIL CLERK: Menchaca?  
10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Présenté.  
11 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller?  
12 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Here.  
13 COUNCIL CLERK: Moya? Perkins?  
14 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Here.  
15 COUNCIL CLERK: Powers?  
16 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Here.  
17 COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso?  
18 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Here.  
19 COUNCIL CLERK: Richards?  
20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.  
21 COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera? Rodriguez?  
22 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Here.  
23 COUNCIL CLERK: Rose?  
24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.  
25 COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal?

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.  
3 COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca?  
4 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.  
5 COUNCIL CLERK: Torres?  
6 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Present.  
7 COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger?  
8 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: [off mic]  
9 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich? Vallone?  
10 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.  
11 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer? Williams?  
12 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.  
13 COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger?  
14 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here.  
15 COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo? Cumbo?  
16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Present.  
17 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson? Rivera?  
18 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present.  
19 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli?  
20 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Here.  
21 COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo?  
22 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.  
23 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?  
24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Here.  
25

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: We have a quorum.

We will now have today's invocation which will be delivered by Rabbi Avrohom Hect, Spiritual Leader of the Hatikva Russian Jewish Center located at 8109 Leopard's Boulevard in Cue Gardens. Please rise.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.

RABBI AVROHOM HECT: Before I begin my remarks I would like to express our deepest gratitude to Speaker Corey Johnson and the entire New York City Council for enabling the JCC of Canarsie and Project League to uplift thousands of precious individuals on a regular basis. Let us pray. Our Father in Heaven, look upon all of us assembled today with your love and admiration. We are here to pay tribute to those who toil in the vineyards of public service. We pray that the almighty showers his goodness upon our New York City Council Members who seek to govern justly, honestly, and lovingly, providing direction and leadership for all New Yorkers and people from all walks of life. We pray for their ability to work together in true harmony. Bestow upon them wisdom and fortitude to govern our people with kindness, understanding and clarity. Enable them to continue to serve as beacons of light so that they can protect

1  
2 and uplift the neediest among us, including the frail  
3 elderly, the poor, the hungry, and the immigrants.  
4 Help all of us show the downtrodden that they are not  
5 alone. Enable all of us to inspire others so that  
6 they feel they are not forgotten. We must remember  
7 to work together to for the good of all New Yorkers,  
8 extending X [sic], hope and harmony. May we always  
9 be guided by a spirit of justice, kindness, and  
10 mutual respect. May all of us be blessed with  
11 personal piece and fulfilment. Amen.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much,  
13 Rabbi Hect, and we are so pleased to have you here  
14 during this particular time. The Jewish Caucus is  
15 particularly proud to have you here, Chaired by  
16 Council Member Chaim Deutsch. And we are now going  
17 to have-- the invocation will be spread by Council  
18 Member Karen Koslowitz.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Thank you. I  
20 move to spread the invocation on the record.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much,  
22 Council Member Koslowitz, and now we are going to  
23 have the Adoption of Minutes by Council Member Mark  
24 Gjonaj.

25

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you,  
3 Majority Leader. I motion that the minutes of the  
4 Stated Meeting of July 18<sup>th</sup>, 2018 be adopted as  
5 printed.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much,  
7 Council Member Gjonaj. We are now going to have  
8 messages and papers from the Mayor.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Communication from  
11 City, County and Borough Offices.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Petitions and  
14 Communications?

15 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Land Use Call-Ups.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: M93 through M99, various  
18 applications.

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: That's coupled on a  
20 Call-Up Vote, and at this time I would ask for a roll  
21 call on all of today's Land Use Call-Ups.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Aye on all.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Aye on all.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala?

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye. I'm sorry--

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [interposing] I'm  
sorry.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: We're voting on Land  
Use Call-Ups.

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yeah, aye on all.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Barron?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes.

COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli?

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan? Cabrera? Chin?

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen?

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Constantinides?

CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy?

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch?

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Diaz?



2 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Madam Chair Lady,  
3 with permission, I would like to vote on all Land Use  
4 Call-Ups and coupled items on the General Order  
5 Calendar. On all Resolution, I vote yes on all with  
6 the exception of Introduction 954A and Resolution 113  
7 which I vote no.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission  
9 granted.

10 [laughter]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: I'm sorry. Thank  
12 you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Of course, Ruben  
14 Diaz.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye on all.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene? Gibson?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Aye.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Aye.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Grodenchik?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden?

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos?

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Permission to explain my vote?

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission granted.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I'm proud that we're voting on over--

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [interposing] At this time we're just voting on Land Use Call-Ups.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Yes. I'm proud that we're voting on about a thousand third-party transfer units on the Land Use agenda. In those units the City had originally planned affordability rates at 150 percent of AMI. That translates to 109,000 dollars a year, 600-- and so those units were going to be affordable to people making 109,000 dollars a year, and I'm not sure why the City would be building affordable housing for folks who are making six figures or what's wrong with our city that we need affordable housing for folks making six figures, but the good news is as a result of our questioning and work and Planning, Dispositions and Concessions, our Committee Members as well as our

1  
2 Land Use Chair were able to negotiate that down, and  
3 moving forward the City will only be doing 120  
4 percent of AMI, which translates to 87,000 dollars a  
5 year. It's still higher affordability than expected,  
6 but it's a step in the right direction. We hope to  
7 bring it further and build more affordable housing to  
8 more New Yorkers, and I proudly vote aye.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you for your  
10 vote.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: King? Koo?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Levin?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Levine?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Aye.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Menchaca?

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Miller?

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Moya? Perkins?

COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Powers?

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso?

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Richards?

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera?

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez?

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Aye, and with permission I would like to vote aye on all General Orders. I would like to ask permission to vote on all General Order.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I will confirm that shortly.

COUNCIL CLERK: Moya?

COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Rose?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Yeger?

COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal?  
COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca?  
COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Torres?  
COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger? Ulrich?  
COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Aye.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone?  
COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer? Williams?  
COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo?  
COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Aye.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo?  
COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan?  
COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN? Aye.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene?  
COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.  
COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?  
SPEAKER JOHNSON: Aye [off mic]

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Today's Land Use  
3 Call-Ups are adopted by a vote of 47 in the  
4 affirmative, 0 in the negative. And now we will have  
5 communication from the Speaker, and if anyone needs  
6 to vote early, in advance, please see Jason Goldman  
7 [sp?].

8 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yeah, please see Jason  
9 Goldman. Good afternoon. First and foremost, today  
10 we commemorate the anniversary that we can never and  
11 will never forget. Yesterday we gathered to mourn  
12 and celebrate the lives lost on September 11<sup>th</sup>, 2001.  
13 Seventeen years later, that tragic day still breaks  
14 our hearts for those New Yorkers and their families,  
15 the spouses, children, and parents who said goodbye  
16 to their loved ones for the last time. Every single  
17 one of us remembers where we were when the World  
18 Trade Center was under attack. We now remember every  
19 single first responder and office employee, anyone  
20 who we lost that fateful day. Yesterday, I had the  
21 privilege of being at the reading of the names  
22 ceremony at the World Trade Center site, and  
23 yesterday evening I had the privilege of being on  
24 Staten Island in Council Member Roses' district, had  
25 post cards, and both of them were incredibly moving,

1  
2 unbelievably heartbreaking for the families who still  
3 have not healed from what happened 17 years later.  
4 Also, I'd like to remember a number of courageous New  
5 Yorkers we lost recently. Last month, Carlos  
6 Gabrielli [sp?] slipped at a construction site in  
7 Staten Island while using a chainsaw and cut his own  
8 hands and throat. His coworkers did what they could  
9 to stop the bleeding, but he died of his injuries at  
10 the hospital. Carlos was 50 years old. Jose  
11 Alvarado, 37-year-old pizza delivery man was shot and  
12 killed while returning to Papa Johns from a delivery.  
13 Alvarado was known as an upstanding man in his Harlem  
14 neighborhood. The police reported that there was  
15 nothing stolen from Alvarado, and the killing did not  
16 appear to be part of a robbery, more senseless gun  
17 violence in our city. If people could please rise so  
18 we could have a moment of silence for those lost on  
19 9/11 and Mr. Alvarado and Mr. Gabrielli.

20 [moment of silence]

21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you very much.  
22 Finally, I want to wish a happy new year to all  
23 Jewish New Yorkers. I hope you had a blessed Rosh  
24 Hashanah filled with joy, meaning, good health,  
25 prosperity, and contentment. [speaking Jewish] I hope

1  
2 your stomachs were full like mine were from being at  
3 Council Member Koslowtiz's home on Rosh Hashanah.  
4 Last but not least, we have some congratulations in  
5 order as well. Just in case anyone didn't know  
6 already, one of my senior advisors, Ebony Meeks  
7 Ladely [sp?] and her husband Jason are expecting  
8 their first child. Ebony is expected to have this  
9 beautiful baby next month. We are so happy and  
10 excited for Ebony and for Jason, their entire family,  
11 and of course, Grandpa Congressman Greg. The Women's  
12 Caucus threw a wonderful baby shower this morning for  
13 Ebony downstairs, and the celebration continues here  
14 in the Chambers. Congratulations, Ebony. We look  
15 forward to meeting this new beautiful member of the  
16 City Council family.

17 [applause]

18 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Jumping into our docket  
19 for the day, the Council will vote on a few Article  
20 XI property tax exemptions: 501 West 143<sup>rd</sup> Street in  
21 Manhattan is in Council Member Levine's district,  
22 Morningside Heights Apartments in Manhattan, again,  
23 is in Council Member Levine's district, and Argyle  
24 Road in Brooklyn is in Council Member Eugene's  
25 district. I want to thank the staff who worked on



1  
2 these, Rebecca Chaisson. Next, the Council's going  
3 to vote on the following Land Use items. These are  
4 applications for rezonings: 1601 Dekalb in Brooklyn.  
5 It's in Council Member Rafael Espinal district; 5563  
6 Summit Street in Brooklyn, in Council Member Brad  
7 Lander's district; Five Bement Avenue on Staten  
8 Island in Council Member Debbie Rose's district.  
9 We're voting on some landmark designation in Council  
10 Member Richards' district in Far Rockaway. Two  
11 landmarks were first identified through the downtown  
12 Far rezoning-- Far Rockaway rezoning, which Council  
13 Member Richards shepherded through the Council, and  
14 that was approved in September of 2017. These two  
15 landmarks today recognize the importance of the  
16 historic FDNY firehouse and the NYPD police precincts  
17 in downtown Far Rockaway. We are voting to approve a  
18 site selection in my district for the New York City  
19 Police Department Bomb Squad to be located on West  
20 26<sup>th</sup> Street between Seventh and Eighth Avenue, as it  
21 will house the headquarters of the New York City  
22 Police Department's bomb squad, a new facility that  
23 will improve their needs and enhance operations and  
24 productivity. The Council will be voting to approve  
25 six applications for tax exemptions related to

1  
2 property subject to final judgements of In Rem  
3 foreclosures in Queens, Brooklyn and the Bronx.  
4 These are third-party transfer tax exemptions, and  
5 this is under Article XI tax exemptions and UDAAP  
6 approval, and some of these are the triple HDFC in  
7 Council Member Diana Ayala's district, Nueva Era in  
8 Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez's district, and  
9 Deshler Apartments in Council Member Perkins'  
10 district. Moving on, the Council will vote on the  
11 following pieces of legislation: First, a package of  
12 bills concerning the L Train shut-down. Just about  
13 every New Yorker is aware by now that the L Train  
14 will be shutting down in April of 2019 for no less  
15 than 15 months. Understandably, New Yorkers on both  
16 sides of the East River are getting more and more  
17 anxious about what some are calling the "L-  
18 pocalypse." I understand their concerns and I share  
19 them. I ride the subway all the time, and I  
20 frequently ride the L Train. It runs through my  
21 district. It runs cross-town, and even people who  
22 don't live along it use it regularly. It's a closure  
23 that's going to have a huge impact for our City and a  
24 huge loss for the entire system. I think we'd agree  
25 there are no perfect solutions here. There will be a

1  
2 significant disruption to strap [sic] hangers and the  
3 local residents, and that is my primary concern,  
4 mitigating the pain for these subway and bus riders,  
5 pedestrians, cyclists, and neighborhood residents.

6 I'm also deeply concerned about how traffic is going  
7 to impact the quality of life for everyone effected.

8 It's why I'm proud to co-sponsor two bills in this  
9 package with our Transportation Committee Chair

10 Ydanis Rodriguez. Introduction 989A would require

11 the Department of Transportation in coordination with

12 the MTA to designate a least one community

13 information center in each of the boroughs in

14 Manhattan and Brooklyn during the 2019 Canarsie

15 Tunnel reconstruction. Introduction 990 would

16 require the Commissioner of the Department of

17 Transportation to designate an ombudsperson to

18 receive and investigate complaints and comments in

19 connection with the Canarsie Tunnel closure starting

20 in 2019. And Resolution 377, sponsored by Council

21 Member Rafael Espinal would call upon the Governor

22 and the MTA to commit to an expeditious transition to

23 electric bus fee and to use electric buses as a

24 robust part of the replacement services during the L

25 Train shut down. I want to thank all the staff who

1 worked on this, James DiGiovanni [sp?], Malik  
2 Nasiradeen [sp?], Johnathan Masserano [sp?], Rick  
3 Arbello [sp?], Emily Rooney [sp?], and Teresa Nassir  
4 [sp?]. Next, we'll vote on a bill of mine,  
5 Introduction 954A which would allow individuals to  
6 set attest when changing the sex designation and  
7 gender marker on their birth record to confirm to  
8 their gender identity. The bill will also allow  
9 individuals who can identify as exclusively male or  
10 female to change the sex designation on their birth  
11 certificate to X. This groundbreaking legislation  
12 will make New York City birth certificates more  
13 inclusive for all and will send a powerful signal to  
14 the world that our government works for everyone.  
15 Now, more than ever, it's important for us as public  
16 servants to show our constituents. We see them. We  
17 have their backs. We respect them for who they are.  
18 That continues today with our vote on this bill. I  
19 want to thank the Health Committee staff who worked  
20 on this, Jeanette Merril [sp?], Emily Balcon [sp?],  
21 and Zi Emmanuel Halu [sp?]. Next, Introduction 447A  
22 co-sponsored by Council Member Danny Dromm. It would  
23 require that the Department of Corrections to post  
24 quarterly and yearly reports on departmental facility  
25

1  
2 and housing area lock-downs. Such reports would  
3 include information on the average duration of lock-  
4 downs, the average number of individuals affected by  
5 such lock-downs, mandated services either cancelled  
6 or delayed due to a lock-down, and reasons for such  
7 lock-downs. I want to thank the staff again who  
8 worked on this bill, Daniel Aides [sp?], Josh  
9 Kingsley, Alanna Siven [sp?], Robert Calandra [sp?],  
10 and Brian Crow. We will also vote on a Resolution  
11 today sponsored by Council Member Carlos Menchaca and  
12 Helen Rosenthal, led by the proud sponsors Helen  
13 Rosenthal and Carlos Menchaca calling upon the US  
14 Congress to pass and the President to sign the  
15 establishing a humane immigration enforcement system  
16 which would abolish US Immigration and Custom  
17 Enforcements and reassign some of the functions to  
18 other federal agencies. I want to thank the staff  
19 who worked on this, Rob Newman, Richard Podero [sp?],  
20 and Kassie Addison [sp?]. Finally, the Council will  
21 vote on a comprehensive school siting legislation  
22 package which would aim to eliminate overcrowding at  
23 City schools. As we continue to kick off the new  
24 school year and encourage New York City students to  
25 thrive in the classroom, we must continue to be

1 committed to providing stellar resources and  
2 increasing the quality of our schools and other  
3 educational facilities. For too long we've allowed  
4 our children to learn in schools that are  
5 overcrowded. Students who are educated in  
6 overcrowded environments are at a disadvantage in an  
7 increasingly competitive world. The greatest city in  
8 the world deserves educational facilities to match  
9 that. While our city has made significant new  
10 investments in our children's education, there is  
11 still much more that we can do. Earlier this year,  
12 the Council released a report entitled "Planning to  
13 Learn, the School Building Challenge" to examine  
14 challenges faced in planning for and siting new  
15 schools, which can lead to overcrowding. The report  
16 and its recommendations will result in a year-long  
17 review of the process by an internal Council working  
18 group, and today, we're taking action. This started  
19 under Speaker Mark-Viverito and Chair Julissa  
20 Ferreras-Copeland, and we are proud of the work that  
21 they did in getting us to today. And some of the  
22 bills we're voting on today related to this are  
23 Introduction 449A, sponsored by Council Member Danny  
24 Dromm which would require the Department of Education  
25

1  
2 to post online maps showing the geographic boundaries  
3 known as sub-districts used by the Department of  
4 Education and the School Construction Authority to  
5 identify where new capital funding will be targeted  
6 for building new schools. Introduction 461A also  
7 sponsored by Council Member Danny Dromm would require  
8 the Department of Citywide Administrative Services to  
9 provide written notice to Department of Education and  
10 the School Construction Authority within 30 days  
11 after city owned or leased property of at least  
12 20,000 square feet is determined to have no current  
13 use. Introduction 729A, sponsored by Council Member  
14 Ben Kallos, would require the Department of Education  
15 to post online the process, data and criteria used by  
16 the Department and the School Construction Authority  
17 to calculate the number of seats needed to build to  
18 meet future enrollment needs. And Introduction 757A,  
19 sponsored by Council Member Vanessa Gibson, would  
20 require the Mayor to create an inter-agency taskforce  
21 on school siting to identify potential city-owned  
22 properties for school siting and identify vacant lots  
23 that may be good candidates for school siting.  
24 Resolution 286, sponsored by Council Member Ritchie  
25 Torres, calls upon the New York State Legislature to

1  
2 pass and the Governor to sign legislation that would  
3 give New York City and any public authorities or  
4 public benefit corporations, including the School  
5 Construction Authority, broad authority to utilize  
6 design-build-delivery methods for capital projects.  
7 And lastly, Resolution 289, sponsored by Council  
8 Member Paul Vallone, would call on the School  
9 Construction Authority to more clearly communicate to  
10 the general public how city residents can submit  
11 potential school sites and the guidelines used by the  
12 School Construction Authority in considering whether  
13 a suggested school site meets the evaluation  
14 standards used by the authority. That is a lot that  
15 we are doing on DOE and on the SCA. It has been a  
16 long process. It is not the sexiest stuff. It is  
17 not headline grabbing, but it is incredibly important  
18 as each one of us seek to get the necessary seats in  
19 schools in our district and identifying new potential  
20 sites in neighborhoods across the City that need new  
21 school. So I am incredibly proud of all the Council  
22 Members who worked on this in the past and coming to  
23 today, and I want to thank the staff. The staff did  
24 an incredible job on this report. I want to thank  
25 Beth Golum [sp?], Smita Desmuk [sp?], Andrea Vasquez,



1  
2 Kaitlin O'Hagan [sp?], Elizabeth Hoffman, and Rebecca  
3 Chaisson, as well as other members of the working  
4 group from the staff, Jan Atwell, John Douglas, Jeff  
5 Hune [sp?], Raju Mann, and Regina Poreda-Ryan. That  
6 concludes our agenda for today's Stated Meeting, and  
7 I look forward to proceeding with today's votes.  
8 Thank you, Madam Majority Leader.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much,  
10 Speaker Corey Johnson, for all of the work that you  
11 have done as well as the City Council Members and all  
12 of their perspective staffs. We will now move into  
13 the Discussion of General Orders. Before we begin,  
14 I'd like to ask members to please limit your  
15 discussion only to items being voted on in today's  
16 General Order Calendar. Thank you, and do I see  
17 anyone prepared to discuss? Seeing none, we will  
18 now move on to report of Special Committees.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: We'll have reports  
21 of Standing Committees.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
23 on Criminal Justice Intro 447A, emergency lock-ins.

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
25 General Orders.

1  
2 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
3 on Education Intro 449A, sub-district maps.

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
5 General Orders.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Intros 461A, 729A, and  
7 757A, school siting.

8 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
9 General Orders.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
11 on Finance Resolution 286, design-build-delivery.

12 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
13 Orders.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Pre-considered LU 196 and  
15 Reso 516 through Pre-considered LU 198 and Reso 518,  
16 tax exemptions.

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
18 Orders.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
20 on Health, Intro 954A, birth records.

21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
22 General Orders.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
24 on Land Use, LU 152 and Reso 519 and LU 153 and Reso  
25 520, landmark designations.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
Orders.

COUNCIL CLERK: LU 176 and Reso 521, NYPD  
Bomb Squad Headquarters.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
Orders.

COUNCIL CLERK: LU 177 and Reso 522  
through LU 187 and Reso 530 on page seven, various  
property tax exemptions.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
Orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 188 and Reso 531 and  
LU 189 and Reso 532, zoning map amendments.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
Orders.

COUNCIL CLERK: LU 190 and Reso 533, 205  
Park Avenue Rezoning.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved and laid over.

COUNCIL CLERK: LU 191, 205 Park Avenue  
rezoning.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with  
modifications and referred to the City Planning  
Commission pursuant to rule 11.70B of the Rules of

1  
2 the Council and section 197D of the New York City  
3 Charter.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 195 and Reso 534, Five  
5 Bement Avenue rezoning.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
7 Orders.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
9 on Transportation, Intro 989A, community information  
10 centers.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
12 Orders.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 9--

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] Sorry,  
15 amended and coupled on General Orders.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 990A, DOT  
17 ombudsman.

18 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
19 General Orders.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Resolution appointing  
21 various persons, Commissioner of Deeds.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
23 Orders.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: On the General Order  
25 Calendar, Intro 720, site safety training.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Laid over.

COUNCIL CLERK: LU 164 and Reso 535 and  
LU 165 and Reso 536, 1601 Dekalb Avenue rezoning.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
Orders, and at this time I would ask for a roll call  
vote on all of the items on today's General Order  
Calendar.

COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez?

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Perkins?

COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Adams?

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel?

COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: I vote aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala?

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Barron?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye with the  
exception of Land Use 188 and the accompanying  
resolution, and 190, if we're voting on that today.  
We're not? Okay, 188. Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli?

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all  
3 except Intro 954A.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye on all.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera? Chin?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye on all.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Constantinides?

11 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye on all  
16 except for 954A.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: With my warmest  
25 gratitude and appreciation to our Finance Chair and

1  
2 Education Chair and the Speaker for their  
3 collaborative effort in passing today's comprehensive  
4 package of bills related to school siting. I vote  
5 aye on all. Thank you.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Aye.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Grodenchik?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye on all except  
12 954A.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: King? Koo?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye on all.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman?

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Mr. Clerk? I just want  
21 to remind members we're voting on three resolutions  
22 after the General Order Calendar, so folks must stick  
23 around to vote on those three resolutions. Thank  
24 you. I apologize.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander?

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Levin? Levine?

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel?

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

COUNCIL CLERK: Menchaca?

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to  
speak?

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission  
granted.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you. I  
want to-- I rise to speak on the incredible package  
of SCA bills. These bill represent the will of so  
many of the people that we represent, the mothers and  
the students who are seeking, in middle of crisis,  
for a better education system, literally building a  
better education system. These bills represent good  
research. But I want to lift the stories of Sunset  
Park. More than 25 percent of the seats that are  
getting built today as we speak are getting built in  
my district in District 38. This includes District  
15 and 20 where we are seeing incredible crisis in  
overcrowding. The success was connected to people  
organizing on the ground, and literally walking block



1  
2 by block looking for sites. And the stories of the  
3 Council Members here today that are saying yes to  
4 these packages understand that. When we bring more  
5 transparency to this process of building better  
6 schools and bring the neighborhood and community  
7 members who understand their neighborhood. They  
8 might not have the data. These bills will bring the  
9 data that they hear and understand and feel every  
10 single day when they drop off their kids, when they  
11 participate in the PTAs and when they're part of  
12 their child's life, that is what is at the spirit of  
13 these bills and so I'm so proud to be here with all  
14 of you saying yes. And I vote aye on all. Thank  
15 you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I vote aye.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Moya?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I vote aye.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Powers?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Aye on all.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye on all.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Richards?

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera?

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Rose?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal? Salamanca?

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Torres?

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich?

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone?

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: A brief moment  
to explain my vote?

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission  
granted.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you.  
Congratulations to the Speaker and all the Council  
Members on these bills. I can't think of a more  
contentious topic at our Community Boards when they  
are not included in the site selection process. In  
residential communities like ours, that's the final  
straw, and they always felt left out and completely  
devoid of a process that involves the future of their

1  
2 children. So by us today doing this and having a  
3 site selection process that we can be involved with,  
4 the community can be involved with is a huge step in  
5 the right direction. So, thank you Corey Johnson and  
6 to everyone that worked on these bills. Thank you.  
7 And I proudly vote aye on all.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Williams?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye on all.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye on all with  
13 the exception of Intro 954A.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: No on 954A, aye  
16 on the rest.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I vote aye.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote aye on all.  
21 That was a record-breaking roll call vote.

22 [applause]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: You're welcome,  
24 Majority Leader. Okay, all items on today's General  
25 Order Calendar were adopted by a vote of 47 in the

1  
2 affirmative, 0 negative, and 0 abstentions, with the  
3 exception of Intro 954A which was adopted by a vote  
4 of 41 in the affirmative, 6 negative, and 0  
5 abstentions, and LU 188 plus Resolution 531, which  
6 was adopted by a vote of 46 in the affirmative, 1  
7 negative, and 0 abstentions. The revised Land Use  
8 Call-Ups vote is 47 affirmative and 0 negative. We  
9 will now have an introduction and reading of bills.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: All bills have been  
11 referred to committees as indicated on the agenda.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: We will now move  
13 into the discussion of resolutions. Are there any  
14 members who wish today to speak on the resolutions at  
15 hand? We have Council Member Vallone.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you, Madam  
17 Majority Leader. I'll pass since I had my comments  
18 in general time. Thank you.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: We now have Council  
20 Member Rafael Espinal.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I'll pass as  
22 well just to keep things going.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Happy new year,  
25 everyone.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: We will now bring  
3 it to Council Member Rosenthal.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Well, we  
5 should, you know, apologize. So, I'm going to make  
6 this really fast. I'm very pleased that the Council  
7 will be voting today on my Resolution which calls on  
8 Congress to pass legislation that would abolish ICE  
9 and establish a more humane immigration enforcement  
10 system. #abolishice at its core resonates because it  
11 represents a willingness to reshape our institutions  
12 to rectify injustice and move toward a more human  
13 place. In its 16 years, ICE has racked up an  
14 appalling and infamous record of abuses while failing  
15 to make our country safer. The pending federal  
16 legislation, HR6361, would create a taskforce to  
17 review the truly essential functions currently under  
18 the jurisdiction of ICE and transfer them to other  
19 federal agencies while eliminating those that fail to  
20 serve a public safety or national security purpose.  
21 This conversation to abolish ICE is similar in many  
22 ways to the discussion of closing Rikers here in New  
23 York City. Yes, there are practical and political  
24 challenges. Yes, transforming institutions is  
25 complicated work, but it must get done. I want to

1  
2 thank Council Members Carlos Menchaca, Chair of the  
3 Immigration Committee, and Speaker Johnson for their  
4 support in moving this resolution forward. Thank  
5 you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council  
7 Member Rosenthal. We now have Council Member  
8 Menchaca.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you, and  
10 I also want to thank Council Members Rosenthal,  
11 Rivera, Speaker Johnson for joining me in an op-ed on  
12 this topic to abolish ICE. The Trump  
13 Administration's zero tolerance family separation  
14 policy has drawn much-needed attention to the abuses  
15 perpetuated by ICE, but this crisis didn't start  
16 here, and the debate around what to do with ICE is  
17 not as complicated as you believe when you hear some  
18 people talk about this topic, it boils down to one  
19 very basic truth, that ICE was created to improve  
20 public safety and Homeland Security and to create  
21 connections between agencies. I believe, and we  
22 believe, today with this resolution to support  
23 Congress to abolish ICE, that it has failed. Instead  
24 of targeting and prioritizing human trafficking or  
25 terrorism, ICE is going after our Dreamers, day

1  
2 laborers, our loving parents, and we spend almost 18  
3 billion on immigration enforcement. That's more than  
4 the budget of all the other law enforcement agencies  
5 combined, like the FBI, the DEA, the ATF, the Secret  
6 Service, and we recently learned this week that Trump  
7 moved money out of FEMA as we hear about this  
8 hurricane burling through to hit the east coast, and  
9 moved it over to ICE. This is an abomination, and is  
10 cruel, and we need to end it. No further time. I  
11 urge you all to support this resolution. Thank you.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, and now  
13 we will-- let me read today's resolutions into the  
14 record. I would like to remind all members who want  
15 to vote against or abstain on any of these  
16 resolutions to register their vote with the clerks at  
17 the dais. Resolution 289, calling on the New York  
18 City School Construction Authority to more clearly  
19 communicate to the general public how city residents  
20 can submit potential school sites and the guidelines  
21 used by the School Construction Authority in  
22 considering whether a suggested school site meets the  
23 evaluation standards used by the Authority. All in  
24 favor say aye.

25 ALL MEMBERS: Aye.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: All opposed?  
3 Abstentions? The ayes have it. Resolution 377,  
4 resolution calling upon the Governor and the  
5 Metropolitan Transportation Authority to commit to an  
6 expeditious transition to an electric bus fleet and  
7 to use electric buses as a robust part of its  
8 replacement service during the upcoming L Train  
9 shutdown. All in favor say aye.

10 ALL MEMBERS: Aye.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: All opposed? Any  
12 abstentions? The ayes have it. Pre-considered  
13 Resolution calling upon the US Congress to pass and  
14 the President to sign the Establishing a Humane  
15 Immigration Enforcement System Act, HR6361,  
16 legislation that would abolish the US Immigration and  
17 Customs Enforcement. All in favor say aye.

18 ALL MEMBERS: Aye.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: All opposed? All  
20 opposed? Any abstentions? The ayes have it. Give  
21 us one moment. I'd like to call on Council Member  
22 Levine to-- Levin. I'd like to call on Council  
23 Member Levin to vote on the General Order Calendar.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Just to make sure  
25 I vote aye on all on all General Orders. Thank you.



1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. We  
3 will now move into General Discussion. If members  
4 have signed up for General Discussion, we will now  
5 begin that portion of the meeting. We will begin  
6 with Council Member Barron.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Madam  
8 Public Advocate. I want to call our attention to the  
9 passing of world renowned pianist, composer, and  
10 creative musician, Randy Westin who died at the age  
11 of 92.

12 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Hold on. And folks--

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [interposing]  
14 Quiet in the Chambers. Quiet in the Chambers.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: If folks could please  
16 be quiet for Council Member Barron and anyone else  
17 who has general remarks. Go ahead.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. Randy  
19 Westin was trained as a classical pianist, but he  
20 decided on the music genre that we call jazz, but  
21 which he called African rhythms. His major influence  
22 was Falonius Monk [sp?], but Randy Westin was  
23 constantly reshaping his cadences and lingering  
24 without a steady pace. The New York Times said,  
25 "Everything he played was edited in the essential

1 notes of a phrase, and each phrase stood on its own,  
2 carefully separated from the next. His concerts and  
3 seminars emphasize the African roots of jazz."  
4 "Wherever I go I try to explain that if you love  
5 music you have to know where it came from, whether  
6 you say jazz or blues or bassinova [sp?] or samba  
7 [sp?] or salsa, all these are names of African  
8 contributions to the western hemisphere. If you take  
9 out the African element of our music, you would have  
10 nothing." Randy Westin says in his memoirs that he  
11 recalled his father, a supporter of Marcus Garvey's  
12 Universal Negro Improvement Association, that his  
13 father hung maps and portraits of African kings on  
14 the walls and was forever talking about African and  
15 Caribbean culture. He wrote of his father, "He's  
16 planting the seeds that I would become, for what I  
17 would become as far as developing my consciousness on  
18 the plight of Africans all over the world." His  
19 mother embedded in him a love of African-American  
20 church music. He traveled around the world and he  
21 visited many countries. He played on many lofty  
22 venues and gave his performances, but he also had a  
23 very common touch. He came to the House of the Lord  
24 Church where we have a small elementary school, less  
25

1  
2 than 50 children, and he did a benefit concert for  
3 us, and he taught the children. He didn't just play.  
4 He taught the audience between the pieces that he  
5 rendered as to what the origins of the music was. So  
6 he'll be forever missed. A great man. Six foot  
7 seven, but great in his musical talent, and his last  
8 album was recorded just two years ago at the age of  
9 90, and he said it featured an orchestra-sized  
10 iteration of African rhythms through music and spoken  
11 word that traces origin of man back to the Nile  
12 River. Thank you, Madam Public Advocate.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much  
14 Council--

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing]  
16 Madam Majority Speaker-- Majority Leader.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much,  
18 Council Member Barron. And the great legend Bobba  
19 [sic] Randy Westin was also a member of my district,  
20 and there was a very powerful and regal home-going  
21 service at the cathedral of St. John the Divine, and  
22 Randy Westin will certainly be an icon that will be  
23 missed, but his music and talent will live on  
24 forever. I would now like to call on Council Member  
25

1  
2 Levin. We're now going to call on Council Member  
3 Rose.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you, Madam  
5 Majority Leader. I'm excited to seek the support for  
6 two bills I'm co-sponsoring with Council Members  
7 Treyger and Kallos, which will direct DYCD in  
8 consultation with DOE one, to report on and establish  
9 the implementation of a program of universal  
10 afterschool for all public school students-- that's  
11 Intro 1100-- and report on our current afterschool  
12 programs and the funding allocated to these programs,  
13 and that's 1113. My colleagues, we all know too well  
14 that we have a dearth of opportunities for our youth  
15 after school in many of our communities with  
16 difficulties and sometimes deadly consequences. It  
17 is imperative that we get a better understanding of  
18 the patchwork of afterschool programming that we have  
19 created in New York City and move towards creating  
20 universal after school so that all of our students in  
21 New York City public schools have the opportunity to  
22 continue to learn, be productive, be safe, and thrive  
23 as they prepare to enter the world of work, and I  
24 look forward to holding hearings on this important  
25 legislation as soon as possible. Thank you.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council  
3 Member Rose. And now I'd like to call on Council  
4 Member Rivera to clarify her vote.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I vote aye on all  
6 with the exception of 186 and 187. I'll have to  
7 abstain, my husband is the Director of Operations at  
8 Camber [sic] Properties.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you for the  
10 clarification, and now we are going to reflect  
11 revisions that have been recently presented to us.  
12 In the matters of Land Use 186 plus 187 with  
13 accompanying Resos, which was adopted by a vote of 46  
14 in the affirmative, 0 negative, and 1 abstention. We  
15 will now call on the Speaker to close today's  
16 meeting, and I want to say, Council Member Koslowitz,  
17 I too like good food, and so now we will pre-- and  
18 now we will turn it over to Council Member Speaker,  
19 Majority Le-- excuse me, Speaker Corey Johnson.

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: We did that designation  
21 bill today on gender, Majority Leader Cumbo, so.  
22 Thank you for, of course, presiding over today's  
23 hearing, and I want to thank all the Council Members  
24 for their hard work on all these bills, and with  
25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

that, today's Stated Meeting of September 12<sup>th</sup>, 2018  
is hereby adjourned.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And vote tomorrow.  
Please make sure that everyone votes tomorrow. This  
is an important election year, and we must make sure  
that our vote counts. Thank you. This meeting is  
now adjourned.

[gavel]

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date September 18, 2018