

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

----- X

AUGUST 28, 2018
Start: 2:18 P.M.
Recess: 4:34 P.M.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Fernando Cabrera
Costa G. Constantinides
Chaim M. Deutsch
Ruben Diaz, Sr.
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Peter A. Koo
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Carlos Menchaca
I. Daneek Miller
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Deborah L. Rose
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Mary Beth Kelly, Families for Safe Streets

Lizzy Rahman, Founding Member, Families for Safe Streets

Sophia Russo, Families for Safe Streets

Jane Martin Laveaux, Families for Safe Streets

Debbie Kahn, Founding Member, Families for Safe Streets

Rita Barravecchio, Families for Safe Streets

Polly Trottenberg, Commissioner, New York City
Department of Transportation

Juan Martinez, Director of Traffic Operations Policy
New York City, Department of Transportation

Thomas Chan, Chief of Transportation, New York City
Police Department

Dennis Fulton, Deputy Inspector, New York City Police
Department

Oleg Chernyavsky, Legislative Director, New York City
Police Department

Ariel Savansky, Advocacy and Policy Advisor
UJA Federation

Vincent Riggins, Public Safety Committee Co-Chair,
Community Board 5

2 [sound check] [background comments,
3 pause] [gavel]

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please. Quiet
5 in this room.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Good afternoon
7 and welcome to today's hearing of the City Council
8 Transportation Committee. I am Ydanis Rodriguez, the
9 Chair of this committee here today with Speaker Corey
10 Johnson. First, let me recognize my colleagues who
11 are here with us today, Council Member Diaz,
12 Richards, Koo, Menchaca, Levin, Deutsch, and—and now
13 let's turn the microphone to the person who has shown
14 his leadership with this and many other important
15 issues for the City of New York, the Speaker Corey
16 Johnson.

17 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Thank you, Chair
18 Rodriguez. I want to thank you for your unwavering
19 support and leadership on this issue. You have been
20 a real leader on this, but in everything Vision Zero
21 related. So, I'm really grateful for your leadership
22 of this committee that you've shown over the last
23 five years. When we talk about the role of government
24 in people's everyday lives, there is nothing more
25 fundamental to what we do than ensuring the safety of

2 those we were elected to represent especially
3 children. The bill we're going to be discussing
4 today in emergency session will keep New Yorkers
5 safe. Most importantly it will keep kids who are
6 walking to and from school safe. It will save lives,
7 and is the least that we can do for children in New
8 York City and for their parents. This is not a
9 temporary fix It will place State Speed Camera Law,
10 which we all know recently expired due to cynical
11 political maneuvering by the Republic led State
12 Senate. That state law only allowed for 140 speed
13 cameras in the city at any given point in time.
14 Those cameras were proven to be effective. They were
15 proven to save lives, which begged the obvious
16 question: Why weren't there more of them? Our bill
17 would broaden the scope of the program by expanding
18 the hours in which cameras can operate and by
19 allowing more cameras to be installed around more
20 schools throughout the city. The State Senate and
21 particularly the Republicans in the Republicans in
22 the State Senate failed to act, so we must.
23 Something has to be done, and it is our
24 responsibility to do it. With the school year set to
25 start in just eight days, we cannot afford to wait on

2 them any longer. Given what we've already seen,
3 there is no earthy reason to believe that we'll be-
4 that they will do the right thing. Shame on them for
5 their failure, but where they have abandoned
6 responsibility, others have filled the void.
7 Governor Cuomo is one. We needed his help and we got
8 it. I appreciate the work he and his team did in
9 giving the city access to the State Department of
10 Motor Vehicles' data. It is essential for this law
11 to work. We needed—we needed Mayor de Blasio's help,
12 and he gave it to agreeing to provide the Council a
13 message of necessity to pass this bill in time for
14 the first day of school. Both the Mayor and governor
15 stepped up, and they both deserve an enormous amount
16 of credit, and the State Legislature can still decide
17 to act. State Senate Republicans can still do the
18 right thing. If the Senate Republicans want to come
19 back with a program that substantially increases the
20 number of cameras, then I would support that, and
21 this law would sunset if we get a real and effective
22 state program, but we're not rolling back protections
23 for children. This program will stand unless we get
24 something substantially better. This isn't about
25 credit and who gets it done. It's about doing the

2 right thing. Advocates are expanding the Speed
3 Camera Program also deserve an enormous amount of
4 praise. I want to thank Paul Steely White who can't
5 be here today from Transportation Alternatives.
6 Thank you, Paul. I want to thank Amy Cohen and
7 everyone at Families for Safe Streets. Thank you
8 all, every single one of you. Amy lost her son Sammy
9 five years ago when he was killed by a speeding
10 motorist. Her suffering to me and to Joan is
11 unimaginable. It is a grief no mother or grandmother
12 should have to shoulder. The fact that Amy and every
13 person here today from Families for Safe Streets
14 channel their grief toward ensuring that others won't
15 suffer a similar fate is a testament to their amazing
16 character and strength of will. I want to thank you
17 all and for bring those beautiful photos today. This
18 law will allow the city to issue violations for
19 speeding in school zones. If you're going more than
20 10 miles per hour over the speed limit, you'll be hit
21 with a \$50 fine, and hopefully, you won't do it
22 again. I am confident in our authority here. We
23 have strong home rule authority on this issue, and I
24 can think of no better way to use it. There are
25 lives at stake, children's lives, and now it falls to

2 us to fulfill our obligation as elected officials to
3 do right by them. I urge all of you to keep that in
4 mind as we consider this important legislation today.
5 Thank you, Chair Rodriguez.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
7 Speaker. I would like to thank all members of the
8 Transportation Committee of the Council, but
9 especially to Robert and Kelly for all those hours
10 that you have spent in the last five days. You know,
11 your work makes a difference to allow to take us here
12 today. I also would like to take this moment to
13 dedicate this hearing to all the angels that are here
14 protecting us. The beautiful light that they are
15 somewhere. I always say that no one will be able to
16 get the energy that those of us that have not lost a
17 loved one are feeling when we are in this type of
18 room, but we know that you are fighting not for
19 yourself, but you're fighting to avoid future victims
20 also. Our great workers, middle class, upper class,
21 Black, White, Asian, Latino, who unfortunately we're
22 losing life every week in the city of New York
23 because sometimes elected officials has failed to
24 act. We're here today for the second emergency
25 hearing of the Transportation Committee this month

2 because we are on the edge of a crisis. Over one
3 million students will go back to school on Monday.
4 Some of them have already started and does go into
5 charter schools. They will be with countless
6 parents, teachers, crossing guards, and the school
7 staff, all to make sure our children get an education
8 and that they're taken care of nurtured each day.
9 They deserve to do that without worrying whether or
10 not they will make it to class or get home safely.
11 Make no mistake, speeding cameras is not about just
12 trying to beat the traffic or getting there a little
13 faster. Speeding kills, and let's be clear, speed
14 cameras are not about revenue. They are about saving
15 lives. In a perfect world, no one will ever get a
16 speeding camera ticket. Drivers will be following
17 the law, and will be doing the right things.
18 However, until we reach that day, when all drivers
19 respect their fellow New Yorkers and follow the law,
20 we will continue to need the tools to enforce it
21 especially in areas where our most vulnerable could
22 be put in harm's way. We are her again today
23 following on Governor Cuomo's executive order
24 authorizing the Council to legislate on the speed
25 cameras, and not fail our children. The most sacred

2 obligation of government is to keep its people safe,
3 and we intend to honor that obligation that some
4 legislators in Albany have forgotten. I made safety
5 one of my top priorities when I became chair of this
6 committee. We have passed that in our bills focusing
7 on traffic safety, and with the support of Speaker
8 Johnson, my colleagues at the Council and in
9 partnership with Mayor de Blasio and Governor Cuomo,
10 we are continuing that critical work to keep our
11 students safe when they walk in the surrounding areas
12 of their schools. I'm proud to co-sponsor the bill we
13 are hearing today with Speaker Johnson leading and
14 Council Member Ampry-Samuel, Lander and Gjonaj. This
15 bill will create a local speed camera program
16 allowing the city to issue violations for speeding.
17 The program will be similar to the State's Program.
18 Owners of vehicles going more than 10 mile per an
19 hour over the speed limit in a school zone will be
20 liable for 50 civil penalty, but we are improving the
21 state's programming in two key ways: (1) The number
22 of cameras isn't cape-capped in the bill, (2) DOT can
23 expand the hours of operation. That's what we need
24 in our great city. The Council is going into
25 emergency session to hear this bill. So, obviously a

2 lot of work has gone into getting this ready, but the
3 real reason we are here today are you, Families for
4 Safe Streets, Transportation Alternatives and the 8.5
5 million New Yorkers in the city and the 65 million
6 tourists that came here last year that deserve to
7 walk in safe streets. Families for Safe Streets and
8 Transportation Alternatives made sure that no one
9 forgot how important these cameras are. They know
10 all too well that what we do here matters. Better
11 enforcement and better street design saves lives. We
12 can make a difference. We have worked together for
13 many years, and I'm proud that they have let me their
14 partner. I owe them an enormous debt of gratitude to
15 all New Yorkers and visitors, too. I would like to
16 welcome the first panel who are composed by the
17 members of Families for Safe Streets. [speaking
18 Spanish] Now, I would like to welcome the first panel
19 who will be the members of Families for Safe Streets.
20 [pause] Will the members who already know that you're
21 going to be testifying come: Rita, Jay, Martin,
22 David and Mary Beth. [pause] You may begin in
23 whatever order you have established.

24 MARY BETH KELLY: [off mic] My name is

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

12

2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: If you could turn
3 your mic on.

4 MARY BETH KELLY: Sure. Okay. Is that on?

5 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Yes.

6 MARY BETH KELLY: Okay. My name is Mary
7 Beth Kelly, and it's been 12 years since I became and
8 advocate for safe streets in the City of New York, 12
9 years since I lost my husband when we were cycling on
10 a beautiful summer night, the same night hear that I
11 got arrested in front of the Governor's office. We
12 had been married for 33 years. We have two wonderful
13 children. My husband was a physician who served the
14 Upper West Side of Manhattan for over 30 years, a
15 soccer coach, a marathoner. He held the record for
16 the most consecutive New York City marathons that
17 anyone had ever run, and quickly, but we were cycling
18 and had been doing that round the world, but on that
19 night in an intersection a tow truck failed to yield
20 and came speeding around the corner, missed me, hit
21 him and he died three days from his injuries. He was
22 the only thing in my life that I was more passionate
23 about than bringing safety to the streets of New
24 York, and every time over the last 12 years that a
25 community board shut down a protected bike lane, I

2 cried, and every time we made one happen, I cheered,
3 and wept again, but here today I'm hoping that
4 something very, very special is going to happen, and
5 I'm counting on that. I thank you Corey Johnson,
6 Ydanis Rodriguez, Polly, the people who have been
7 front and center in helping us, the family members of
8 families of...the members of Families for Safe Streets
9 do this work year after year often without much hope,
10 and particularly this summer it certainly felt that
11 way, to get to a place where New York is more of the
12 vision that I think we all would to see. A place
13 where a city filled with walkers, filled with
14 cyclists can do their harmless behavior in a way that
15 keeps them safe, and allows them, unlike my husband,
16 to come home at the end of a day, and embrace his
17 children and carry on his life. Fifty-six is far too
18 young to die particularly when you're in the prime of
19 life. So, I ask you all here to do the most
20 important thing that you can do in your careers, and
21 that is always the right thing, and it takes courage,
22 and it takes backbone and it takes putting politics
23 aside to step inside our shoes and for a moment feel
24 the pain that if not yours, but actually could be,
25 and that's a horrible thing to have to thank about.

2 But we hope that you will do the right thing today
3 with the same kind of passion that we have mounted
4 our fight for something that came from pain and
5 sorrow, but hopefully will move this city forward.
6 Thank you.

7 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Mary Beth, thank
8 you so much as always. Thank you.

9 LIZZY RAHMAN: Thank you. I already
10 provided you with a printout, but I might not follow
11 it exactly. This is my son. Asif Rahman. You might
12 have heard my story many times, and my name Lizzy
13 Rahman. I'm one of the founding members of Families
14 for Safe Streets, and today I'm here to show my
15 support for this speed camera bill because I strongly
16 believe that this bill is designed to save lives.
17 Before I get into details, I want—would like you to
18 know that why I'm here. I want you to know that I
19 already told you I lost my son Asif, and he was
20 killed in a car crash. He was a vibrant talented
21 young man. He was hit by a speeding reckless truck
22 driver on Queens Boulevard on his way home from work,
23 and the driver hit him from the back. He fell down.
24 The driver didn't realize that he hit somebody, and
25 he just drove over him crushing all his organs, and

2 the truck driver didn't really only crush his organs,
3 he crushed all his dreams and hopes. My son wanted
4 to be a music teacher. He had a plan to release his
5 music city and many more, and after this tragic loss,
6 our house became silent as a grave. There was—there
7 is no laughter, no sound of bid (sic) boxing around
8 the house, no calling out loud, Hi, Ma. His voice has
9 stopped forever, and this truck driver didn't just
10 kill my son Asif, he killed us all, and it's a pain
11 like a slow poison. It kills you everyday day by
12 day, and it has been when I think that I will not see
13 my son graduate from college. I will not see him
14 getting married. I will not see him having a family
15 like most of his friends. It hurts me very much.
16 He—the truck driver didn't only crush my son's dreams
17 and hopes, he crushed my dreams and hopes, too. It's
18 been 10 years. It didn't happen yesterday. Ten
19 years, but I'm going through the same pain, and after
20 my son was killed, I made it my mission to make New
21 York City's streets safer, and this is what kept me
22 going, and I found the new meaning of life of
23 survival by saving lives of other people. I do not
24 want any other mother to go through this pain, the
25 pain of losing a child, and I have been trying to

2 attend as many events as possible to raise awareness
3 for street safety so that our children will not die
4 on the streets. I strongly believe that speed
5 cameras will ensure that the drivers drive with
6 caution and lives are saved. Drivers and owners
7 should be held accountable for the safety of our
8 streets and our kids. We know that speed cameras
9 have helped reducing deaths and injuries on our
10 streets. Overall fatalities are down to 28% in New
11 York City, and there is no doubt that if—to more put
12 in commission this number will even go down, and I
13 want the Council to think—think about a person not
14 the numbers how many kids died, how many people died,
15 and what is the percentage of death. Don't think
16 about the numbers, think about the person behind the
17 number, the family behind that person, and the
18 community behind that family. Think today it's our
19 child, our siblings, our spouses. It could be us,
20 and the next time who knows, it could your child. It
21 could be your family members. It could be your loved
22 ones. So, think twice, think twice before you say
23 no. Please think hard and pass the bill for the
24 safety of all our people. Thank you.

2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Thank you so much
3 Lizzy. Thank you.

4 SOPHIA RUSSO: My name is Sophia Russo.
5 I'm the mother of Ariel Russo who was born on March
6 10, 2009 and who was killed on June 4, 2013. On June
7 4, my family and I learned the ultimate lesson about
8 how speeding in New York City can end the life a
9 child, and completely shatter an entire family
10 crushing all the hopes, dreams, and plans you thought
11 you had for your future. On that Tuesday morning, my
12 4-year-old daughter, Ariel Marina Russo was walking
13 to school hand-in-hand with my mother. It was 8:15
14 a.m. when they were waiting on the sidewalk for the
15 pedestrian traffic light to give them the signal to
16 cross. The police report said that a driver made a
17 left turn at 35 miles per hour on 97th Street and
18 Amsterdam Avenue when he lost control, and drove up
19 onto the sidewalk right where my little girl waited
20 with my mother. I remember when I got the call at
21 work from the officer letting me know that my
22 daughter and my mother had been hit by a car. I
23 remember the moment he said it, denial set in, and I
24 tried to imagine something minor leaving them with
25 just scrapes and bruises. I thought maybe the car

2 just bumped into them ever so gently and made them
3 fall down, and now they're in the ER getting checked
4 because that's protocol, but in the pit of my stomach
5 I could feel that this was way more serious, and so I
6 asked the police—the police officer to tell me her
7 heart beats per minute, and when he said 30, my legs
8 gave out. I was on the floor and I couldn't breathe
9 and I couldn't hear anything because I knew that my
10 daughter's little hear was giving out as we spoke.
11 When I got to the hospital, my husband was hysterical
12 trying to break the hand sanitizer off the wall, and
13 I knew she was gone. Going home that night without
14 our baby girl was excruciating, heartbreaking,
15 incomprehensible. Our apartment had her written all
16 over it, her Barbie Dream House, her Baby Alive doll,
17 the clothes she handmade for all her small stuffed
18 animals from her socks, her artwork on the
19 refrigerator, her clothes and shoes all over, and on
20 her bed the Rainbow Build-A-Bear that she had just
21 made. We have to live in a constant—with a constant
22 sick feeling like we have poison in us. Our son
23 asked us where Ariel was everyday, and when we told
24 him that she was in heaven, he responded: Maybe
25 she's just playing hid and seek because that's her

2 favorite game, and he'd look around under the table,
3 in the closets, behind the doors. He did this every
4 single day for six months, and we had to start
5 therapy for our 3-year-old because we didn't know
6 what to do. As for my mother, she was in critical
7 condition required multiple major surgeries and had
8 to spend one month in the hospital, and she's still
9 in the process of recovering from her injuries today.
10 I never want this to happen to anyone ever. I don't
11 want other parents and grandparents to feel this. I
12 don't want other siblings to go through this. One
13 year after Ariel's death, I became a founding member
14 of Families for Safe Streets, because as someone who
15 knows this loss and this pain, I believe I owe it to
16 all New Yorkers and to all children who walk to
17 school and to my daughter Ariel to do whatever it
18 takes to prevent this from happening to another
19 child, to another family. And that is why I stand
20 here before you today pouring out my heart and soul
21 retelling my darkest experience because even though
22 it hurts to relive, you need to know what I know
23 about speeding in New York City so that together we
24 can change the culture of driving and save lives. We
25 have gathered and analyzed the data about the 140

2 speed safety cameras that have been in NYC school
3 zones as part of a pilot program since 2014. We know
4 they reduce speeding. We know they change driver
5 behavior, and we know they save lives. I believe
6 that just as I have been called into action so have
7 you as our elected officials. Please protect our
8 children as they walk to and from school. Increase
9 driver accountability and pedestrian safety in school
10 zones by voting to amend the Administrative Code of
11 the City of New York in relation to imposing
12 liability on vehicle owners for failure to comply-to
13 comply with maximum speed limits in school speed
14 zones. With this implementation of the Photo Speed
15 Implementation Monitoring Program. To those who
16 oppose this program, I say: If you do not want a
17 speeding ticket, do not speed especially not in front
18 of a school. Everyday I wonder what life would be
19 like if Ariel were still here with us. She would
20 have been 9 years old. She would have been staring
21 fourth grade on September 5th. Her brother Jacob is
22 8 years old and he will be starting third grade. He
23 now fully understands exactly what happened to his
24 sister. He knows about the Speed Safety Camera
25 Program, and he asked me to you this: My name is

2 Jacob Russo, and I think we need the cameras to keep
3 us safe. It makes me sad when I think about what
4 happened to my sister. I get scared it will happen
5 again. As a mother who lost a child to speeding, as
6 street safety advocate, and as an Assistant Principal
7 at New York City public school, I sincerely thank you
8 for the opportunity to bring you this testimony. I
9 pray no parent will have reason to repeat it.

10 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Thank you so
11 much, Sophia. [coughs] [background comments, pause]

12 JANE MARTIN LAVEAUX: Good afternoon. My
13 name is Jane Martin Laveaux, and I'm a New York City
14 resident, a parent and New York City public school
15 teacher. As you well know, traffic violence is
16 hardly a new phenomenon. Growing up, I was well
17 aware that my grandfather Benjamin Canter had been
18 struck and killed by a reckless driver when I was a
19 mere infant. I later learned that my great
20 grandfather, Emmet Chelson had also been struck and
21 killed by a reckless driver. That's quite a heavy
22 toll for one family to bear. In addition, I lost a
23 dear friend and father figure when Irwin Meyer,
24 Director of the Kings County American Legion Band, in
25 which I played for a dozen years or so was struck by

2 a vehicle dying two days later at the age of 96.
3 There's no more band. Over the years I've lost my
4 grandmother, numerous aunts and uncles, and my
5 parents all of whom I've loved and miss dearly, but
6 none of my family history or personal losses could
7 prepare me for the news that I received on the
8 morning of January 5, 2015 when two police officers
9 arrived at my door and informed me that my daughter
10 Lenora Laveaux had been killed in a car crash along
11 with two other people during the night. I don't know
12 how many times I repeated the words no, no that is
13 impossible. No, it can't be. No, there must be some
14 mistake. No, not my daughter. No, not my baby. No.
15 I waited two hours for my husband to come home to
16 share the news with him before I woke up my younger
17 daughter Jumani (sp?) and broke the news to her, and
18 then the nightmare began, a trip to the morgue to
19 identify the body. No one should have to see their
20 child in a body bag, meetings with reporters at
21 Lenora's apartment, and at the site of the site of
22 the crash trying to wrap my brain around how a
23 speeding vehicle had crashed into another car
24 carrying my daughter, the two spinning around and
25 hurtling into parked cars ultimately slamming into an

2 oncoming bus, wondering which of the impacts had
3 caused the death of my child and whether or not it
4 was immediate. Later in the week another
5 identification of my beautiful daughter laid out so
6 peacefully as if sleeping in a casket. The receipt of
7 the death certificate on my birthday. The last two
8 times that I saw Leonora alive were on Christmas when
9 we shared a meal that we had all shopped for and
10 cooked together in new apartment and on New Year's
11 Eve 2012. The last time I spoke with her was in the
12 afternoon of what would turn out to be the last day
13 of her life. We were discussing withdrawing funds
14 for tuition for the upcoming semester at Brooklyn
15 College. My last words to her were: I love you. Five
16 and a half years later, not a day goes by without one
17 or several reminders that my daughter is gone. We
18 just celebrated what would have been her 30th
19 birthday, but she was not here to join us. Many of
20 her friends turned 30 this year. They've all
21 graduated, and many have married and begun families
22 of their own, but we have to live through the
23 numerous markers each year birthdays, holidays,
24 vacations without her wondering what she would be up
25 if she were still here. We know that drivers who

2 receive tickets for speeding largely do not repeat
3 the offense, and we know that in a period of nearly
4 two weeks no fewer than 132,000 drivers sped past
5 speed cameras with no penalties. We have a choice:
6 We can let speeding drivers continue to put all of
7 our lives at risk and go unpunished for their
8 recklessness, or we can give them a modest slap on
9 the wrist. That's what it amounts to, a \$50 fine,
10 and change the culture of driving in New York City
11 and beyond. Speed cameras save lives. We must renew
12 and expand the speed safety camera program to protect
13 New York City school children and communities so that
14 no other family has to experience such a devastating
15 loss as I and so many members of Families for Safe
16 Streets that suffered. Thank you.

17 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Thank you, Jane
18 and thank you for being there yesterday. [pause]

19 DEBBIE KAHN: Hi. My name is Debbie
20 Kahn, and I'm a founding member of Families for Safe
21 Streets. My only child is dead, and nothing you do
22 today will ever bring him back to me, but we'll never
23 know the countless lives that will be saved by having
24 come up with the solution to reinstate the speed
25 safety cameras. When my son Seth was killed by a

2 reckless driver, I knew that life as I knew it would
3 never be the same. The driver was speeding through
4 the crosswalk while my son was simply walking across
5 the street. There were no speed safety cameras then
6 that would help slow down driver. So, they—that's my
7 sweet, smart, kind, generous, helpful, charismatic,
8 funny, talented child, Seth, became a statistic in
9 the epidemic of traffic violence. We members of
10 Families for Safe Streets know all too well what the
11 epidemic of traffic violence does to families and how
12 it rips us apart. Our lives are ruined, destroyed.
13 Our planned futures, hopes and dreams for our
14 children are now turned into nightmares. Just this
15 weekend my husband and I endured yet another family
16 wedding. As the groom's mother danced with her son,
17 I cried along with my husband as those around us
18 smiled, applauded and cheered. We grabbed each other
19 and I couldn't stop crying. We live in our own
20 personal hell that hopefully none of you, most of you
21 will never have to suffer. Traffic violence is an
22 emergency. Someone is killed every 38 hours. Ever 5
23 minutes someone in New York City is injured.
24 Thousands of these are life altering injuries. As a
25 mother—as a member for FSS Steering Committee, I hear

2 horror stories everyday from people seeking help or
3 needing support. Speed cameras work. The data is
4 clear. Speeding is down 63% and fatalities 55% in
5 places where there are cameras. They are helping to
6 change the culture of reckless driving. Overall, New
7 York City fatalities are down 29% and up 15% in the
8 rest of the country. Each number is not just a
9 statistic. Is it about—it is about real human beings
10 that once lived and breathed and meant something
11 someone. Life is sacred. Life is precious. Lives
12 must be protected. On Sunday evening, I posted the
13 very exciting news on our Families for Safe Streets
14 Facebook page and Twitter feed that the life-saving
15 speed safety cameras at New York City schools will
16 operate again starting September 4th. We have so far
17 reached well over 3,200 people with this news story,
18 and the comments and re-postings are far-reaching and
19 very grateful. I, too, wish to thank you for coming
20 up with this brilliant plan to reinstate the speed
21 safety cameras, something that took Herculean effort
22 on so many people's parts. Our purpose now is to
23 fight so that no one else will suffer as we do. I
24 urge you—I urge you to pass this bill, but that
25 should not be all. There is no good reason, no good

2 reason at all why should we—we should not be
3 restricting these life-saving speed cameras to just
4 schools. The lives of our loved ones are at stake
5 and I urge you with all of my heart for all of us to
6 do whatever it is in your power—in your power to
7 allow speed safety cameras to operate wherever,
8 whenever they are needed. Thank you very much.

9 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Thank you,
10 Debbie, and we agree with you.

11 DEBBIE KAHN: Thank you.

12 RITA BARRAVECCHIO: My name is Rita
13 Barravecchio, and I am sadly a new member of Families
14 for Safe Streets. Just two months ago on June 25th,
15 my 17-year-old niece, Maddie Sershen was hit and
16 killed by a reckless driver in Queens right in front
17 of an elementary school. My life and my family's
18 lives were ripped apart. Maddie mom, my sister, had
19 her heart ripped into thousands of pieces that will
20 never be able to be put back together again. The
21 pain, sadness and heartache is still so raw. My
22 nieces, nephews and my own children have a hole in
23 their heart that will never be repaired. The tears
24 are like knives stabbing the heart, and there is
25 nothing I can say or do to take away the pain. No

2 mom should have to explain to her 8-year-old son that
3 he will never see his cousin again. My kids never
4 had a chance to say good-bye or to hug Maddie one
5 more time or to tell her how much she means to them.
6 Maddie will never have the opportunity to get her
7 license or go to prom, graduate high school, or go to
8 college. She will never experience dorm life or a
9 marriage proposal, never experience child birth or
10 buying her own home. Her life was ended too soon.
11 Speed cameras save lives. Turning them back on is a
12 non-brainer. Speeding and fatalities have been
13 drastically reduced in places where there are cameras
14 and many fewer people are dying in crashes citywide.
15 It is a disgrace that the New York State Senate's
16 petty politics is putting the lives of our children
17 in danger. I am grateful that that Governor, Mayor
18 and City Council are stepping in to turn the speed
19 cameras back on. This measure will save lives and
20 prevent others from living the terrible nightmare my
21 family never wake up from.

22 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Thank you, Rita.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] You
24 were going to say something?

2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I just really
3 want to thank you all for—for not just today, but
4 for, you know, your tireless advocacy whether it be
5 Rita who most recently suffered this tragic loss or
6 you Mary Beth who have been doing this for 12 years
7 and all of you who have been relentlessly advocating
8 so that other families and loved one don't have to
9 suffer in the way that you all have, and I am
10 incredibly moved and, um, incredibly moved by the
11 testimony today as I always am. I wish there were 1
12 words that I could say that could comfort you all to—
13 to make it better. I know that's not possible, but I
14 hope that our action today and our trying to do the
15 right thing brings someone comfort that the loss of
16 your loved ones is not in vain, and that we are
17 taking action based off of your heartfelt advocacy to
18 stop this from happening to other families. So, we
19 will keep fighting. We know that this is not the end
20 of the process. We know that this isn't a fix all.
21 Um, and I just extraordinarily grateful, um, because
22 I really believe that without your advocacy and
23 telling your own personal stories of deep pain, I'm
24 not sure we would have gotten to where we are today,
25 and so you all should consider this a very

2 significant step forward that is based off of all the
3 work that you all have done, and the families who
4 can't be here today, but who you're representing, and
5 I'm really sorry to each and every one of you for the
6 heartbreak that you've had to endure.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
8 Speaker and with that again thank you. My wife
9 friend and the Rosa family they used to work to work
10 together in the same school, George Washington High
11 School, and knowing that you have dedicated in the
12 past many hours dedicated to work with students with
13 specialized-specialized need, and everyone here.
14 Like I—we are here not as a politician. Like I can
15 tell you that as a father of two daughters 5 and 11,
16 it's like about, you know, being so connected and
17 knowing that there's nothing that we can do to bring
18 them back, and it's not only these members of this
19 panel, but all of you sitting here, too, that are
20 holding the thought of those beautiful smart, you
21 know, great New Yorkers that we have lost so fast.
22 So, all we can say we've been here in the same
23 journey. Those of us that had no loss of loved one,
24 we would never be able to understand all the pain
25 that you're going through, and I know that you have

2 dedicated, you know, the loss of the loved one is to
3 fight for justice. New York City and the whole
4 nation will really—will always appreciate it, and we
5 just come here to say thank you for this.
6 Unfortunately, we know that this is not the end of
7 this journey because with that number that one person
8 will die every 3–36 hours. There is going to be new
9 members of Families for Safer Streets that
10 unfortunately will be joining us in the next couple
11 of hours. So, that's brand new, that's exciting about
12 here we are with great partners to say we are
13 dedicated to continue fighting with you. So, with
14 that, thank you. Now, I'm calling the next panel
15 represented by the Department of Transportation and
16 the NYPD to deliver their testimony, and I also ask
17 the counsel to please administer the affirmation, and
18 before that, I'd like also to acknowledge the Council
19 Members that have been here, or are here Council
20 Member Miller, Espinal, Rosenthal and Reynoso.

21 [pause]

22 LEGAL COUNSEL: Please raise your right
23 hand. [background comments, pause] Please raise
24 your right hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth,
25 the whole truth and nothing but the truth in your

2 testimony before this committee, and in respond
3 honestly to Council Member questions? [pause]

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: You may begin.

5 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Good
6 afternoon. Thank you, Speaker Johnson, Chairman
7 Rodriguez and members of the Transportation
8 Committee. I'm Polly Trottenberg, Commissioner of
9 the New York City Department of Transportation. With
10 me today is Director of Traffic Operations Policy,
11 Juan Martinez, and we're joined by NYPD
12 Transportation Chief Thomas Chan and Inspector Dennis
13 Fulton. We are very pleased to be here today on
14 behalf of Mayor Bill de Blasio to testify in strong
15 support of the Preconsidered Introduction regarding
16 school speed cameras before you today. This
17 legislation will allow us to reactivate our life-
18 saving school speed cameras in time for the start of
19 the school year in the wake of the failure of the New
20 York State Senate to reauthorize and expand the
21 program. I want to start by first thanking all of
22 you who fought on behalf of this program. The City
23 Council particularly Speaker Johnson and Chairman
24 Rodriguez, the Governor, our allies in the State
25 Legislature and a large coalition of advocates led by

2 those who have lost loved ones to terrible crashes.
3 Today, we heard from all of them: Mary Beth, Lizzy,
4 Sophia, Jane, Debbie, Rita. Your testimony was so
5 powerful to all of us, and obviously, I want to join
6 in thanking you all for being here. I think the
7 Speaker said something very eloquent: Perhaps today
8 some angels are looking down on us as we...as we
9 undertake this work. I want to thank the Council for
10 holding this important emergency hearing, and for
11 working as quickly as possible with the
12 Administration and the Governor to ensure that Speed
13 Camera Program is operating again by the start of the
14 school year. The Mayor stands ready to issue a
15 message of necessity to ensure the Council can act in
16 an timely manner on the legislation being considered
17 today, and if passed, the Mayor will sign the
18 legislation allowing to once again issue speed
19 cameras violations to any driver exceeding the speed
20 limit by more than 10 miles an hour in a school zone
21 while the school is in session. At DOT we stand
22 ready to reactivate our existing cameras on September
23 5th the first day of school. As you've heard me
24 testify multiple times and as Margaret Forgione,
25 DOT's Chief Operations Officer testified earlier this

2 month along with Chief Chan and our colleagues we
3 know these speed cameras work. Speeding is the
4 leading cause of fatalities and speed cameras area
5 fundamental part of our Vision Zero toolkit for
6 reducing deaths and serious injuries on New York City
7 streets. At a time when traffic fatalities have
8 risen 15% nationwide over the last four years, as
9 you've heard from some of our eloquent witnesses
10 today, New York City is bucking that trend with
11 Vision Zero bringing fatalities down to about 26%
12 over that same period, and this year we're on track
13 to see fatalities decline yet again, and as we all
14 know, these are not just numbers. As Debbie said in
15 her powerful testimony, these are not just
16 statistics, these are our families, our friends, our
17 co-workers, our neighbors and our fellow New Yorkers.
18 New York City Speed Camera Program was first
19 established as a pilot by New York State in 2013.
20 The goal was to determine whether the program would
21 be effective, and whether the city could run the
22 program fairly. At this point, five years later, the
23 results are clear and unequivocal. Speed cameras
24 provide predictable and consistent enforcement of the
25 speed limit, which encourages drivers to maintain a

2 safer speed, and that in turn reduces crashes—
3 crashes, injuries and deaths. And as we testified
4 earlier this month, the city administers the program
5 in a data driven and fair manner always with an
6 emphasis on safety. Our data showed that schools
7 with fixed cameras, as you've heard today, speeding
8 violations dropped by 63%. DOT analysis shows that
9 through December 2016, there were 17% fewer
10 pedestrians, motorists and cyclists injured—injured in
11 traffic crashes each year at schools with fixed
12 cameras, and 21% fewer fatal and severe injuries
13 annually. As DOT testified previously, major streets
14 with speed cameras in every borough saw dramatic
15 safety improvements since the cameras' arrival. From
16 the day—from the date cameras were installed on a
17 given corridor through the most recent data, we've
18 observed the following:

19 On Ocean Parkway: Speeding declined 63%
20 and 32% fewer people were injured. The Grand
21 Concourse: Speeding declined 83% and 22% fewer
22 injuries. Union Turnpike: Speeding declined 80% and
23 43% fewer injuries. Tenth Avenue in Manhattan:
24 Speeding declined 83%, 26% fewer injuries. Forest
25 Ave in Staten Island: Speeding declined 27%, 35%

2 fewer injuries, and speed cameras do have a lasting
3 effect on driver behavior, as you've heard today.
4 During the two-year period between the start of the
5 program in 2014 and 2016, just over 80% of the
6 vehicles that received one violation from a speed
7 camera did not receive another. That means drivers
8 got the message and were deterred from future
9 speeding by one \$50 ticket, but already since we've
10 stopped being able to issue violations at 120 our 140
11 school locations, we've seen over 330 instances of
12 vehicles speeding at least 11 miles an hour more over
13 the speed limit in a school zone at the time of day
14 when schools will be open in the fall. As a city,
15 it's our responsibility to do all we can using a data
16 driven approach and every tool at our disposal to
17 save lives and achieve the Vision Zero goal of
18 eliminating traffic fatalities and serious injuries
19 so that we don't have, as you've heard today, more
20 people having to join Families for Safe Streets being
21 part of that—that painful partnership. Faced with
22 Senate inaction, this new proposed law and the
23 actions this Administration will take to carry it out
24 live up to that responsibility by ensuring that
25 predictable and consistent enforcement provided by

2 speed cameras will continue to save lives. On behalf
3 of the de Blasio Administration, I would again like
4 to thank the City Council and the Speaker for their
5 leadership and partnership, and we're happy to take
6 your questions.

7 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Thank you,
8 Commissioner for your partnership, and for everything
9 you've done to get us to this point. Your team has
10 worked overtime with the great lawyers here at the
11 Council, Kelly Taylor and Rob Newman to get us to
12 this point today before school starts. I do have
13 some questions for you. If the bill—if this bill is
14 enacted, will the speed cameras be up and running by
15 our goal of September 5th, which is the first day of
16 school?

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yes.

18 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: And how does the
19 city plan to partner with the Department of Motor
20 Vehicles to continue to collect information on
21 vehicles that are caught speeding under the same
22 memorandum of understanding that exists between the
23 NYPD and DMV?

24 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yes, I mean
25 the—the NYPD and Department of Motor Vehicles have a

2 longstanding arrangement, and—and as you know, Mr.
3 Speaker, obviously you were able with the Governor to
4 announce a deal through the Governor's Executive
5 Order that we will continue that strong partnership,
6 and obviously having the state as part of what we're
7 doing here today will be very helpful.

8 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: What steps do you
9 believe city can take to expand the Speed Camera
10 Program so that additional cameras can be placed near
11 schools?

12 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well, I think
13 the—the Mayor last night was on Inside City Hall, and
14 he committed to—once the city gets the existing
15 program back up and running for the first day of
16 school September 5th. He then committed to take the
17 next step, which is to expand the program to 290
18 cameras, which is what was authorized in the bill
19 that passed the State Assembly three times, and that
20 the Governor supports. So, that's the next phase we
21 will be looking at. We will start the process of
22 procuring those cameras and—and considering their
23 placement.

2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: So, you—you still
3 believe it is still better for the State to take some
4 action here?

5 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: I mean I—I
6 think—I think you know a lot of the folks involve in
7 this deal have said in the end, you know, state
8 action it—it can streamline and clarify the
9 enforcement piece, but I also think we feel very,
10 very grateful that the Council is acting today. We
11 think the legislation you all are looking to pass is
12 robust. It's going to enable us to continue to run
13 the program, and as you pointe out, Mr. Speaker, to
14 expand it.

15 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: So I agree with
16 you. Um, you know, I—I am really grateful that we're
17 doing this today, and I feel like we're on solid
18 ground when it comes to our authority to do so
19 because of the Governor's executive order
20 facilitating the continued data sharing with the
21 Department of Motor Vehicles so that the Department
22 of Transportation and the New York City Police
23 Department can continue to run the existing program,
24 but I also feel confident that we have the authority
25 and ability to expand the program when it comes to

2 hours or operation and additional cameras. Though I
3 said this, and I think it's important to repeat it in
4 my opening statement, we did put a sunset provision
5 in this bill, and the reason why was it—it would be
6 better if the state took action. It would be better.
7 It would be easier. It would be cleaner if they took
8 action, but in the absence of them doing that, we
9 needed to come up with a creative approach to get
10 these cameras turned back on, to expand the program
11 in a responsible way as we think should happen, but
12 nothing really fills the void of the state coming up
13 with a fully robust expanded, strengthened Speed
14 Camera Program, and so I look forward to continuing
15 to advocate with you, of you—as you have done since
16 this what was called the demonstration project began
17 a few years ago, I look forward to continue to do
18 that with you. Will the information shared by the
19 Department of Motor Vehicles include vehicles
20 registered outside of New York State?

21 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I believe it
22 will but I—I might turn to my NYPD colleagues to talk
23 a bit about some of the issues with out-of-state
24 information.

25 JUAN MARTINEZ: Yeah, actually—

2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well,
3 actually, I'll turn to my colleague Juan Martinez.

4 JUAN MARTINEZ: Yes, um, that's—that's
5 not going to be a problem.

6 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: And what steps
7 can the city take in addition to speed cameras to
8 ensure that pedestrian safety is paramount
9 specifically around schools.

10 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I—oh, go
11 ahead.

12 CHIEF CHAN: We testified the last time
13 her that we had a contingency plan. That has not
14 changed. We are going to still nevertheless
15 implement and utilize our Traffic Safety Teams to
16 target speeding enforcement in and around schools,
17 and other hazardous violations. I went—I went
18 through a series of initiatives we'll be doing—we'll
19 be conducting, and we have a Speed Enforcement
20 Initiative scheduled for the first week and the
21 second week of this—of—of our school year, utilizing
22 our neighborhood policing officers, our sector
23 officers and community affairs officers, we will be—
24 kind of having an additional presence at the schools
25 itself. Our School Safety Officers, who are

2 civilians, that are assigned in our public schools,
3 there are 1.1 million students there. We will have
4 our officers, and we've involved them in meetings and
5 we've been meeting throughout the summer on this
6 particular issue of traffic safety and also the
7 cameras itself. So, again, they visit over 200
8 schools, the Uniformed Safety Task Force from the
9 School Safety Division. Those are police officers.
10 We will be visiting over 200 schools each week there
11 at the start of the school. In conjunction our
12 Traffic Enforcement District traffic agents will be
13 targeting parking violations, hazardous violations,
14 parking in crosswalks violations where it will cause
15 pedestrians more difficulty in terms of crossing.
16 They'll be issuing summonses out there for that
17 particular violation. We have reached out to our
18 Department of Education Partner, and again, they will
19 be getting this information, guidance to our parents
20 and recommendations for people who are pedestrians,
21 children to use additional care when they're
22 crossing. Don't assume that you're going to be seen.
23 Use the crosswalks. Avoid crossing midblock and
24 ultimately stay away from cell phones and texting
25 while they're crossing our streets. Again, since

2 the, um, expiration of the Camera Program on July
3 25th, we've increased our enforcement, and we're up
4 22% higher in that last 30 days that we compared to
5 since the expiration of the Camera Program. So, I
6 would venture to say we are going to set the tone for
7 the school year. We are going to be out there along
8 with our officers, our school crossing guards, our
9 school safety and as a team and working with our
10 Department of Transportation to make sure that our
11 kids, our most precious gifts have a safe school
12 year.

13 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: I want to thank
14 you Chief Chan, of course, for all the work that you
15 do in your department at the NYPD. I know that in
16 the last hearing that we had a few weeks ago where we
17 heard a few bills related to this very subject, there
18 were Council Members that had questions for the NYPD
19 related to traffic enforcement officers that were
20 stationed by schools, related to crossing guards that
21 were stationed by schools and to understand if I
22 believe the number that you cited in that hearing was
23 that are 3,200 traffic enforcement agents, but that
24 includes people who are ticketing, going around as
25 well. I would love, of course, specific information

2 on the number of traffic enforcement agents that are
3 stationed by schools to understand out of that large
4 number what percentage every single day are being put
5 forth—put near schools for children's safety?

6 CHIEF CHAN: Again, without traffic
7 enforcement agents, they're deployed throughout the
8 city, they are doing summonses enforcement, traffic
9 control. They're doing construction compliance, tow
10 trucks, and—and we have other areas that they take a
11 look at. It's 24/7 that we provide coverage out
12 there, and again, it's not only our traffic
13 enforcement agents, as we mentioned, it's going to be
14 a team effort whether it be school cross guards.
15 Currently, last semester we did have some traffic
16 enforcement agents, who were backfill the school
17 crossing guards, but ultimately the department has
18 hired additional personnel for these school crossing
19 guard positions. So, it's a group effort in terms of
20 dealing with the safety of our children, and we're
21 looking to work closely with our partners in DOE and
22 also DOT.

23 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Every needed
24 crossing guard position that needs to be filled

2 across the city on all of the schools both public and
3 non-public schools, are those positions filled?

4 CHIEF CHAN: Right now the—the department
5 is assessing as the year students start coming back
6 so does the school crossing guards, and we have to
7 anticipate that some of them may retire. They may
8 not return for the school year. So, again, we are
9 currently assessing it, and we can get back to you
10 with specific numbers as we get closer.

11 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Well, Chief, that
12 assessment should happen before school starts. We
13 should have that information before the first day of
14 school.

15 CHIEF CHAN: Yes.

16 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: We want to know,
17 and we should be spending the summer filling
18 positions if we think there is going to be attrition
19 or retirements so that we are fully aware. If the
20 Council could swear Oleg in.

21 LEGAL COUNSEL: Please raise your right
22 hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole
23 truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony
24 before this committee, and in answer to all Council
25 Member questions?

2 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: I do.

3 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: OLEG.

4 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Yes, Mr. Speaker. So,
5 what-it's-as-as you know, we-we speak about this
6 usually during the budget hearings and the challenges
7 involved both hiring and retaining school crossing
8 guards depending on the areas of the city we're
9 talking about. What we've done is expand the School
10 Crossing Guard Program that we now have in addition
11 to the school crossing guards that we hire for
12 particular school. We also have a pool of crossing
13 guards that we hire that can be deployed as needed
14 based on crossing guards calling out sick, based on
15 somebody not returning after a school year, retiring.
16 So, we do have that. We've also hired school
17 crossing guard supervisors and provided them with
18 vehicles that they can deploy these crossing guards
19 to fill gaps where they exist. On top of that, what
20 we've also done is where we don't have crossing
21 guards for a particular area, we augment them and
22 supplement it by using whether it's traffic
23 enforcement agents. Sometimes we use auxiliary
24 officers to control traffic, but the goal is and what
25 we've I think got a lot better at over time is

2 filling all of the needed slots whether it be with
3 crossings guards and which is the number one goal is
4 to fill all the spots, but again, there are inherent
5 challenges in some areas of the city. But, we have
6 plans to backfill and make sure that those slots are
7 being filled whether by crossing guards or some other
8 resources within the department.

9 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: How many current
10 crossing guards do we have right now?

11 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: 2,563.

12 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: And what is the
13 projected? 2,563, you said?

14 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Yeah, that's--yes,
15 that's the number I'm getting and the goal is 2,638.

16 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: So, we're a
17 little less than 100 away from what we--

18 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: [interposing] Correct
19 and about this.

20 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: --what we use.

21 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: As I said, we use the
22 additional resources that we have whether it's
23 officers, traffic enforcement agents auxiliary
24 officers to backfill those spots to make sure that
25 we're not leaving any gaps in coverage.

2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: So, I just want
3 to be clear before the first day of school, which is
4 a week from tomorrow, we are going to ensure that the
5 schools that don't have the necessary crossing guards
6 that every single one of those schools will have a
7 traffic enforcement agents or agents plus potentially
8 auxiliary police officers or officers from the local
9 command, the local precinct to ensure that during
10 arrival hours and dismissal hours that those schools
11 will be covered with appropriate city personnel to
12 ensure the safety of children coming to and leaving
13 school?

14 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Yes, sir.

15 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: So, we're going
16 to make sure there's a plan in-Okay.

17 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Yes.

18 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: On it. Okay. So
19 out of the 3,200 traffic enforcement agents, Chief
20 Chan, that you had mentioned, how many on a regular
21 basis are stationed and patrolled near schools?

22 CHIEF CHAN: Our traffic enforcement
23 agents are deployed again based on volume locations.
24 For an example, commercial traffic linked tunnels and
25 things of that nature. The traffic safety the

2 majority of the time is-is-is covered by our school
3 crossing guards, and things of that nature. Our
4 traffic enforcement agents aren't necessarily
5 deployed based on the school programs and the
6 locations.

7 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: So, that's-that's
8 what I thought--

9 CHIEF CHAN: Uh-hm.

10 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: --and I think
11 that we need to rethink that, and if you need
12 additional resources from the city to hire additional
13 traffic enforcement agents for there to be a certain
14 subset of those traffic enforcement agents to be
15 trained, and to just be deployed near schools where
16 the Department of Transportation and the NYPD have
17 seen an increase in injuries, fatalities, speeding
18 incidents, based off of the data that we're receiving
19 that we provide that because what it sounds like you
20 were saying the 3,200 move around and are deployed as
21 traffic is assessed whether it bet at the Lincoln
22 Tunnel or the Holland Tunnel or other hot spots where
23 there is congestion and traffic in the city. But what
24 I'm saying, and what I think other Council Members
25 have advocated in the past is that we want a full sum

2 program. We want a program that includes cameras at
3 every school, crossing guards at every school,
4 traffic enforcement agents that can be deployed as
5 necessary in the schools that need it, speed bumps,
6 other Vision Zero tools that we think work whether it
7 be shorter crossings near schools, protected bike
8 lanes, things of that nature. So that we have a
9 program that is really round and filled out. So, I
10 would love to have a conversation with you about
11 understanding what your personnel needs would be for
12 us to seek to do that with each other in the coming
13 year.

14 CHIEF CHAN: Sure and it's a continuing
15 process, and the Police Department has streamlined
16 the-the-the hiring process for our school crossing,
17 or traffic enforcement agents and also the recent-the
18 apps-the number applicants have increased, but again,
19 it's a-it's a constant thing where we're-we have over
20 3,000 agents, but we also have a fairly hit attrition
21 where we lose almost 10%, 300 agents a year. So,
22 we're constantly battling, but certainly we have
23 plans to move ahead, streamline to get more agents on
24 board.

2 SPEAKER COREY JOHNSON: Well, one—I
3 believe the endemic issues that has related traffic
4 enforcement agents is they haven't seen a substantial
5 increase in pay, which has been an issue, and the
6 vast majority of these folks are people of color. A
7 lot of them are women of color, and we, of course, as
8 a—as a body in the past have advocated for employees
9 to be paid a fair wage so that we don't have
10 significant attrition and loss. So that's another
11 conversation that we'd be happy to have with you so
12 that we can have better retention rates. I want to
13 add one other thing, which is I believe, though,
14 again I'm sure Families for Safe Streets or
15 Commissioner Trottenberg or you Chief Chan, may have
16 the answer to this. I think that the significant
17 number of the serious injuries and fatalities that
18 occur, occur outside of normal school hours. They
19 occur outside of the window of arrival and dismissal.
20 They occur in the evening when the sun is going down,
21 and so one thing that I think we need to thin about
22 moving forward is to not be inflexible and rigid with
23 the hours of crossing guards, traffic enforcement
24 agents, auxiliary officers, and other folks, but to
25 think about how we can potentially stagger and ensure

2 that if there is a school that on a regular basis has
3 a—has a large after school program that has hundreds
4 of students that are participating in it who are
5 going to be leaving school two hours late than the
6 normal dismissal time, those students still deserve a
7 crossing a guard or a traffic enforcement agents or
8 someone of uniformed personnel to be there to ensure
9 that those children are safe as well when they're
10 leaving school. So, that's another conversation that
11 I want to continue to have, and I'm sure that would
12 need to include the Department of Education on
13 examining which schools could fit a certain criteria,
14 which would receive an expansion of coverage from
15 city personnel. So I would—I would like to have that
16 conversation as well. So, thank you very much, Mr.
17 Chairman. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.
19 Speaker. I have a few questions, two or three
20 questions and then I will be calling my...calling on my
21 colleagues. The first one is I hope that with this
22 executive order and the partnership of working
23 together from Speaker Johnson and all of us at the
24 Council and Mayor de Blasio, and the Governor, we
25 will be starting a more aggressive plan to get the

2 state to allow New York City to permanently regulate
3 all matters related to a speed camera. Will you
4 agree that that should be our goal, and how do you
5 think that this bill can advance in that direction?

6 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean, Mr.
7 Chairman, I think I certainly know the Mayor and I
8 have both long said we think the city should have
9 more control over its ability to use speed cameras
10 and—and keep its street safe for sure. I think today
11 obviously the—the Council and the Administration are—
12 are taking a very important step obviously deciding
13 to pass a local law and start to give ourselves more
14 ability to run the program. I did also hear from the
15 Council Speaker, though, there is also a continued
16 desire to work with the state. So, I—I think I'd
17 defer to all the policy makers about what that right
18 balance is, but I certainly think today again this is
19 I think an important and inspiring day for the city
20 to take control of a program that I think most
21 everyone in this room agrees has—has saved lives and
22 we couldn't bear the thought of it not being open and
23 operational for the first day of school in New York
24 City.

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And my second
3 question is how have speed cameras been helpful to
4 use as a tool to fight against hit and run?

5 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean the—I
6 think speed cameras it's—it's quite simple, you know
7 have spent now 4-1/2 years working on the Vision Zero
8 program and—and having really gotten in very deeply
9 on the causes of crashes and looking at what causes
10 injuries and fatalities and crashes on our roadways.
11 There's so many different factors, but the number one
12 overriding factor in such a vast majority of the
13 crashes is speed, and I've said it before. New York
14 City streets can be distracting, things can go wrong,
15 but if you are driving at safe speed, you have more
16 reaction time. You are more able to react quickly if
17 a child or whatever or something pops out onto the
18 road or you become inattentive. Likewise, if you're
19 going at a safer speed, and there is a collision, it
20 is less likely to result in a fatality or a serious—
21 and it broke my heart. I don't remember who said
22 this, but someone took a turn going 35 miles an hour.
23 In New York City you should take a turn going 5 miles
24 an hour. That's the safe speed to take a turn in
25 this city. So, the thought that someone would be

2 going at that kind of a speed. If they had just
3 driven at a safe speed regardless of some kind of a
4 conflict that happened, the results would not have
5 been so tragic. So for us the cameras quite clearly
6 create a tempo on the streets, which encourages all
7 vehicles to slow down, and we think it has sort of
8 the hail effect that goes beyond the immediate school
9 zones. We like to think that it is also--again, we're
10 seeing it in the--in the numbers for the city that
11 even driers that aren't good drivers, hit and runs,
12 people who are reckless, calming all our streets down
13 had had the effect of dramatically reducing
14 fatalities.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But Chief Chan,
16 has the speed camera also being used the--you said a
17 tool that we can use with the images that it's able
18 to capture those vehicles? Have we--can we say that
19 the speed camera also provides tools or images that
20 allow the NYPD to investigate especially the unit
21 that do investigations to identify some of those
22 drivers that they have leave the scene after they hit
23 and crash an individual.

24 CHIEF CHAN: I would---I would agree 100%
25 with Commissioner Trottenberg that is an effective

2 tool that speed is a major, major factor in terms of
3 a—a collision and the amount of injury or causing
4 fatalities out there. Barring a speed camera being
5 in close proximity to a location where we may have
6 had a—a CIS job or where the investigators are
7 looking for any additional video tape or cameras or
8 things and things of that nature, I would say that it
9 would be a useful tool if we need that to investigate
10 a possibility of leaving the scene collision. Yes.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, when you—
12 when you look at the data that's hit and run, have we
13 seen an increase or decrease by this time compared to
14 last year?

15 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: The data on
16 hit and runs?

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Hit and runs

18 CHIEF CHAN: The information we looked at
19 it's slightly less than what it was last year overall.
20 The number of injuries involving leaving the scene
21 has increased slightly. I don't have the exact
22 number, but I believe it is up a small percentage,
23 but overall where CIS where it was a collision the
24 Investigation Squad is in investigation, those
25 numbers are down for the year.

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay and that's a
3 number that as you know all of us are committed to
4 reduce--

5 CHIEF CHAN:

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ:

7 CHIEF CHAN:

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ:

9 CHIEF CHAN: [interposing] Yes.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --the amount of
11 people being injured because unless the number has
12 changed from the like 44,046 that we had last year,
13 like most of them there are damages, but there's like
14 4,000 that end with the individual being sent in
15 critical condition to the hospital, and the average
16 of probably one person dying every wee as a result of
17 the--of the hit and run. So the fact that there has
18 been, you know, some increase of people being
19 injured, is something that I know that we care, and I
20 know that this is something that also you care for as
21 well. And--and my last question just so before--before
22 calling my other colleagues is what steps can the
23 city take in addition to a speed camera to ensure
24 pedestrian safety especially for clear around the
25 schools and I--for me the two specific ones is about

2 increase of the number of stop signs and second,
3 redesigning the streets around the school. Is there
4 a plan already to continue, you know, making changes
5 and redesigning a school around the school that make
6 those school safer as also increasing the number of
7 stop signs?

8 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Absolutely. I
9 mean DOT runs a school safety program and—and one
10 thing that I have always said throughout this debate
11 on speed cameras because sometimes the question has
12 come up well, why do we need the cameras? Why don't
13 we just do these other things? And we've always said
14 we have an all-of-the above strategy here in New York
15 City. If we want to reduce fatalities and serious
16 injuries to zero, we don't need any proven approach
17 off the table. You know, we again try and be very
18 data drive, and looking at every intersection, every
19 corridor. As you know, we've mapped out for the
20 whole city where the highest crash areas are. We
21 have—I—I have to say right now I particularly feel
22 confidence in one of the world's most remarkable team
23 of engineers and planners who, as you know, have done
24 hundreds of projects on our streets, street
25 redesigns, putting in signs, putting in signals,

2 speed humps, retimings, I mean I think we have tried
3 to do it all every year, and so far almost every year
4 thanks to the resources we've gotten from the Council
5 and the Mayor, we've been able to increase our
6 activities on the street. So, I think the results
7 have shown we have driver fatalities down now four-
8 four years in a row. You know, if all goes well
9 fatalities are down quite a bit this year, at this
10 time this year as compared to last year. So, we—we
11 leave nothing on the table, and we do a lot of
12 aggressive work around schools, but we—we make sure
13 we're looking at the data, and putting in what we
14 think makes the most sense from a planning and
15 engineering point of view. Sometimes it's stop
16 signs. Sometimes signals, sometimes speed humps,
17 sometimes redesigning a whole intersection.
18 Sometimes banning left turns, narrowing a street,
19 putting in bike lanes. We have issued now, Mr.
20 Chairman, a whole toolkit of approaches.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Oaky, I think
22 that probably that—that could be like a good hearing
23 to add, and if we can work it out with your team to
24 probably do something in the beginning of September

2 go over the School Safety Plan-Program that you have
3 So that we can--

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]
5 Sure.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --get, you know,
7 continue having more conversation. So, with that,
8 [off mic] I would like call my colleagues. First,
9 Council Member Levine and Carlos.(sic)

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, Mr.
11 Chair. I know that he had leave, but I want to thank
12 Speaker Johnson for acting decisively together with
13 the Administration and the Governor to head off this
14 crisis in the face of really a--a shameful dereliction
15 of duty by the Republicans in the State Senate, and I
16 think we should force very Republican State Senator
17 to watch the video of the testimony of the--the brave
18 and eloquent--eloquent parents of Families for Safe
19 Streets. It's so powerful. It's undeniable lives
20 are at stake and--and I'm glad that we're acting. Um,
21 Commissioner, we have four work day between now and
22 the first day of school. Can you explain how much
23 logistically there is to do to get these cameras act--
24 activated between now and next Tuesday?

2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Right. It's—
3 it's a good question, and—and again, fortunately we
4 never—as I think a lot of you know we never shut them
5 off. We just ceased issuing violations. So, the
6 cameras are still in place. We await obviously the—
7 the—the Council to take your action, and then once
8 the Mayor signs the law, we are already preparing.
9 We're going to have to basically change some of the
10 verbiage in the notices we send out, because it will
11 be referring to the Local Law as oppose to the state
12 law, but—the infrastructure is all in place. Our
13 staff is still ready to go. So, we're confident we
14 will be up and running on September 5th and—and be
15 able to start issuing violations.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: That's great to
17 hear. You've cited just a stunning statistic of
18 330,000 instances of speeding of 11 miles or more
19 above the speed limit. During—just during this
20 period where the cameras were inactive so over a 2-
21 month period, a third of a million. I mean it's a
22 terrifying number. I presume and—and maybe you have
23 some comparative data to the past years to back us up
24 that part of this was an effect of—of drivers seeing

2 in the news that the cameras were off, and therefore,
3 being more careless and speeding around school zones.

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I-I mean I-I
5 have a feeling that may be part of what we're seeing.
6 I want to be careful not to overstate because, you
7 know, if-I don't know what's in the hearts and the
8 minds of all the drivers. I can tell you this much,
9 though, and I have my colleague Juan jump in, we do
10 see in other jurisdictions where speed cameras have
11 gone away for various reasons. Speeding continues to
12 go up. So, the effect does take place over time.
13 Unfortunately, that thing, which was previously a
14 deterrent--again a 4. I-I mean I-I have a feeling
15 that may be part of what we're seeing. I want to be
16 careful not to overstate because, you know, if-I
17 don't know what's in the hearts and the minds of all
18 the drivers. I can tell you this much, though, and I
19 have my colleague Juan jump in, we do see in other
20 jurisdictions where speed cameras have gone away for
21 various reasons. Speeding continues to go up. So,
22 the effect does take place over time. Unfortunately,
23 that thing, which was previously a deterrent again a
24 \$50 ticket, which doesn't, you know, in the grand
25 scheme of things no one likes to get it, but it has

2 an incredibly powerful effect. Juan, do you want to
3 just add anything to this.

4 JUAN MARTINEZ: That's it.

5 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Okay, I made
6 his point for him.

7 JUAN MARTINEZ: You did.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Right, I-I-this
9 is about deterrence, and so we're accomplishing
10 nothing if all that happens is people speed and get
11 tickets. We need them to not speed, and so I-I hope
12 that we can communicate to the public between now and
13 Tuesday that if you thought-if-if you were mistaken
14 and thought that you had a free ride and like that's
15 over. We need everyone now to be extra vigilant.

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: We will-
17 Council Member, we will absolutely be communicating
18 that and again I think obviously the announcing of
19 what I think again is a very important agreement with
20 the Council, the Mayor and the Governor I think it's
21 already luckily gotten a lot of coverage and-and
22 believe me I think the-the Administration and we will
23 be doing everything on our part to make sure that we
24 are getting the word out that New Yorkers will know

2 when school is back in session, and the cameras are
3 back on and we need you to drive at a safe speed?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: A point that
5 you've made a number of times, but it's just so
6 important it has to be reported, is this is not about
7 the money. People who say this is a grab for money
8 by the city success in this program would be if we
9 got zero dollars of revenue, right. This is purely
10 about safety and that just—it can't be repeated
11 enough and—and I know you know that, um, but I do for
12 the benefit of the public record feel the need to
13 make sure New Yorkers understand that all we want is
14 people to obey the law and to keep our kids safe. I
15 will observe that unless kids live across the street
16 from their school buildings, they're going to be
17 crossing other streets where they could at risk, and
18 that certainly argues for expanding this program
19 beyond the 140 cameras. You're forgetting about
20 keeping adults safe, which we also care about, but
21 just thinking about the—the patterns of kids who walk
22 to schools and may walk many blocks and cross many
23 streets. So, I think you said this before, but am I
24 right that you and the Administration also believe

2 that we should expand this program beyond the 140
3 cameras that we have?

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]
5 Absolutely. The Mayor—I've committed last night on
6 New York One publicly that we will be gearing up to
7 take the next step, which is to expand the program
8 once the 140 are back on and operational, ultimately
9 at least to start with the 290 [coughs] excuse me,
10 which was the number authorized in the Assembly Bill,
11 which passed the Assembly three times and was
12 supported by the Governor, and I think it will be an
13 ongoing discussion about where we go from there, but
14 we're certainly committed, you know, in the short run
15 to taking that [bell] immediate step. You—you are
16 absolutely correct. We think we need to cover more
17 of the city, and I want to thank you for making the
18 point. I have said it and I will say it again, we do
19 see that speeding goes down when a camera is in
20 place. We see violations go down. We see revenue
21 drops. That's what we want. If the city collected
22 zero dollars, and everybody were driving a safe
23 speed, we would declare a victory.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you,
25 Commissioner. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

3 Council Member Deutsch followed by Council Member
4 Richards.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you.

6 Thank you, Chair. So-so I'll—I just want to say that
7 I want to touch upon a little bit what the Speaker
8 has mentioned before earlier. So, speed-speed
9 cameras are definitely or certainly proven to reduce
10 the number of speeders and to reduce the amount of
11 fatalities, but we also must reduce and eliminate any
12 tragedy from—from happening at all our schools not
13 only where there's a speed camera. In addition, we
14 cannot only rely on technology. We need to use any
15 revenue that the city receives from these speed—from
16 the speed cameras to be reinvested in keeping our
17 children safe. Um, that being said, I just want to
18 bring up again three points. When it comes to
19 bussing to all our school children from K through 6th
20 grade not all the children are eligible for bussing,
21 which then cause parents to either drive or walk
22 their children to school. And, therefore, we need to
23 eliminate the pedestrian and the vehicle traffic
24 round schools by expanding busing for all elementary
25 school children, I have a bill in the City Council

2 that's being drafted for just that reason. Secondly,
3 school crossing guards many of our schools across the
4 city don't have school crossing guards. In
5 addition, to those that do have, don't have those
6 school crossing guards to fill the gap that if a
7 school crossing guard is out sick on maternity or
8 paternity leave or on vacation. So, we need to make
9 sure as a city that all our schools have a school
10 crossing guard, and this way we know that the
11 children can cross the streets going and coming from
12 school. Thirdly. I want to just touch upon the
13 traffic control officers that we should have at least
14 a pilot program that again should be reinvested by
15 any revenue that comes in from the speed cameras to
16 pay for traffic control officers, and at least to
17 have a pilot program because it might be very costly
18 at locations at those schools within 100 feet to-and
19 those areas that have a high traffic accident-prone
20 locations, and also in addition to keep traffic
21 flowing smoothly around those areas near or around
22 the schools. So, I think that putting these extras
23 layer-layers of protection in addition to speed
24 cameras sends a very strong message that we as a city
25 and we as a state will protect all our school

2 children. Currently you have 140 speed cameras. So
3 many schools don't even have that protection of
4 technology, but again having a whole package of
5 protection in areas in and around schools that will
6 make sure that we have zero fatalities. And
7 listening to the testimony today was really a tear-
8 jerker and I will as the Council if they can take
9 that video clip of the testimony that we have heard
10 today and send it to all members and send it out.
11 This way we could send it out on our social media
12 because many people believe that the speed cameras is
13 a way to take money from motorist and from people who
14 live in New York City. We need to send a message out
15 that children have died. Loved ones have died
16 because of speeders. We need to get the message out
17 to everyone. So, in order for me to-to be totally
18 happy about what we are doing as a city as a whole,
19 I'd just like once again to touch upon what the
20 Speaker said is to put this whole package together of
21 making sure that we have those extra layers to show
22 our residents in our city that we are truly serious
23 about having any fatalities around our schools, and
24 we need to protect our school 100% no 99%. So, thank
25 you. [bell]

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

3 Council Member Richards followed by Council Member
4 Miller.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you,
6 Chair and I want to congratulate everyone who's made
7 this day happen, but especially to the advocates and
8 to those who've lost their loved ones unfortunately
9 to the traffic incidents. I'll start with this and
10 I-I wanted to acknowledge Ms. Lizzy Rahman. Your-
11 your testimony was very powerful. In your testimony
12 you said his voice is stopped forever, but I want you
13 to know his voice is not stopped forever. You know
14 the work that you've done-I think she might have
15 left-but the work that you do and that all of you do
16 day in and day out keeps the voices of your loved
17 ones alive, and I wanted to acknowledge that. It's
18 really shameful and mind-boggling that our colleagues
19 in the Republican Party and the State Senate would
20 hold something like this up, you know, public safety
21 for children, and this is politics I would imagine at
22 its worst. This is why people are so cynical when it
23 comes to politics and it's-it's shameful and they
24 should not just watch the video. They should be
25 required to meet with each and every one of you and

2 look you in the eye and tell you why they are on
3 vacation, and can't go back up to Albany to do the
4 people's business. I have a few questions. This is
5 for DOT and the NYPD. So, I'm interested in hearing
6 a little bit more on what coordination is going to
7 look like now that there's going to be an expansion
8 of the CAMBA Program, how do you prioritize areas,
9 and I'm interested in hearing a little bit more of
10 how coordination is going to look like for
11 problematic areas, and how those areas are
12 prioritized?

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I'll-I'll-I'll
14 kick it off and then-and then turn it over to Chief
15 Chan. I-I mean we're going to continue the practice
16 that we have used for the current speed camera
17 program, and-and one that I-I think we have tried to
18 take a lot of pains with, and brought a lot of deep
19 analysis looking at crash data, looking at injury and
20 fatality data, looking at roadway geometry, really
21 trying to make sure we're placing the camera in place
22 where we-we think they're going to do the most good,
23 and where I think we've-we've been pleased to see
24 such great reductions in speeding. Our program
25 consists of cameras at 100 fixed locations and then

2 40 mobile cameras that go to school zones all over
3 the city. I think for the next phase of camera
4 installations we've gotten a lot of data from these
5 mobile cameras, and it's enabled us to sort of survey
6 hundreds of school sites, and I think from that help
7 us pinpoint, you know, the next set of schools.
8 That's going to be another 150 sites, pinpoint the
9 next step the makes the most sense to go in and
10 install those cameras. Now we—we obviously are
11 always in consultation with our partners at NYPD
12 because in addition to the data we get, they have
13 their own data, their own experience from their own
14 precincts.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And I always,
16 and I don't want to take anything away from the work
17 you're doing, but there seems to be a lack of true
18 coordination when it comes to crash data. So, I
19 don't want to hold because I have two more questions,
20 but I'm interesting in hearing what that coordination
21 is really going to look like when it comes to data
22 sharing and really prioritizing the areas in a way
23 that makes sense. Also, you know, I guess I would
24 add to that how do we know where you surveyed? Is
25 that data listed on a website? How would I know that

2 you surveyed schools in my district? Is that
3 information publicly accessible?

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I don't know.
5 Maybe Juan wants to talk about that a little bit.

6 JUAN MARTINEZ: Yeah. In general,
7 because we've had such a limited number of cameras
8 in the past and we don't want people to speed where
9 they know a camera is not. We've held information
10 about where camera enforcement is active.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Not just
12 cameras, but in terms of any studies, traffic device
13 studies.

14 JUAN MARTINEZ: [interposing] Oh, well,
15 the—

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So, let's not
17 limit it to that?

18 JUAN MARTINEZ: --let me—let me start by
19 the Pedestrian Priority Plans, which are a joint
20 project between NYPD and DOT. Because that's really
21 the foundation that we build on when we are looking
22 to figure out where we're going to do our work,
23 right? And so, we—we—we get together. We compile
24 all the crash data, and we analyze it and we try to

2 find those corridors, those neighborhoods, those
3 intersections.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay. Only
5 because I have one minute.

6 JUAN MARTINEZ: Okay.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Where is that
8 information?

9 JUAN MARTINEZ: The Queens—the Queens
10 Pedestrian Borough plan.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So, there is
12 website we can go to.

13 JUAN MARTINEZ: [interposing] We will get
14 to it. It's on the website.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay,

16 JUAN MARTINEZ: We will get it to you.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Alright and
18 then a question I have for the NYPD is there any
19 additional data that you will gain from the
20 arrangement? So, you—you normally get information
21 from DMV? Is there any additional information you'll
22 be gaining through this process or you'll be getting
23 exactly what you've been getting prior to this
24 arrangement?

25

2 CHIEF CHAN: We've—we've had a—a great
3 partnership the Department of Transportation. Our
4 statisticians they talk on a daily basis. If we have
5 a particular incident we share the information
6 immediately. We have the locations, the 100
7 stationary locations where the cameras are currently
8 set up, and then DOT has also identified locations
9 where there are high violations on cameras whether
10 they're mobile and we were given that information.
11 We've shared that information with our local
12 precincts. The individual precincts themselves do an
13 analysis on their collisions based on vehicle and
14 vehicle—vehicle and persons and persons and bicycles
15 and things of that nature---

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay.

17 CHIEF CHAN: --and they comprise a plan
18 that will then target enforcement in those particular
19 locations.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay and the,
21 um, the last question I have. So, I—this is a great
22 step forward, and I think the cameras will still be
23 centered just around school zones, correct?

24 JUAN MARTINEZ: Correct.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Why didn't we--
3 did we raise the--the probability of looking outside
4 of school zones and was there reluctance to doing
5 that in this conversation or did we strictly just
6 want to focus--

7 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]
8 I mean I--

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --on the schools
10 but I--I would have deemed it an opportunity to have
11 a--a broader conversation--

12 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: [interposing]
13 I mean I--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --and was there
15 a reluctance on the Governor's side? Did we raise it
16 or--?

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I think--I
18 think there was a high level of negotiation obviously
19 involving the Speaker--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: [interposing]
21 Yes.

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: --and--and the
23 Council Legal team.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: [interposing]
25 Uh-hm.

2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: --the Mayor
3 and--and the City's Law Department and the Governor
4 and his team, and I think you can see a least I take
5 that the approach was to some ways mimic the Assembly
6 passed bill--

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --with that.

8 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: --which
9 obviously there's been a lot of consensus. Some
10 decision in terms of expansion, number of schools and
11 potentially hours. I guess at the time there was a
12 decision made not to expand geographically, but that
13 was certainly something that the city has been for,
14 and so again I think that--I think that discussion
15 will continue. I think today is a great first step
16 obviously.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Uh-hm.

18 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: It raises the
19 possibility of--of where the city wants to go next
20 with this program.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Well, thank you
22 for your--for your work on this. I am interested in
23 seeing a little bit more information on what school
24 areas you've studied, and--and that being more

2 publicly accessible, but congratulations on some
3 great work. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
5 Council Member. Council Member Miller, Reynoso and
6 Rosenthal.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Mr.
8 Chair and I'd also like to thank Speaker Johnson, as
9 well as the Mayor and the governor and—and making
10 this happen. This is so important that we're here
11 today. It is very unfortunate that we are here
12 because of some of our colleagues in government have
13 subverted the process, and allowed special interest
14 to distract them from doing the work of the people,
15 and so I am glad that we are here taking up that—that
16 mantle, and ensuring that we're keeping our children,
17 obviously our most precious commodity as well the
18 rest of our citizens safe in doing so. Um, this is
19 an important step here, and obviously we, the
20 Transportation committee and the leadership of the
21 Chair Rodriguez earlier in the summer held a hearing
22 on what could be done in lieu of the cameras here,
23 and so there were a lot of ideas that happened. So,
24 my question is will we be resting on our laurels or
25 will we be implementing some of the—some of the

2 programs that we talked about obviously that DOT has
3 some of the other tools in the tool box, too, that
4 guarantees safety. There's been some conversation
5 obviously, um, with vendors and, um, what we think,
6 um, would help this process along, but we are quickly
7 approaching September 5th and a lot of the—the
8 suggestions and implementations we have yet to see,
9 but we just want to know that we're not stopping
10 that—the speed cameras. That is one, speed cameras
11 have certainly changed the culture, but there has to
12 be other tools that work along with that as we have
13 this interagency, intergovernmental collaboration
14 using all the tools in the toolbox. As a result of
15 the last hearing where are we?

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Let me—let me
17 assure you, Council Member Miller, we—we are not
18 resting on our laurels. We have never rested on our
19 laurels when it comes to Vision Zero. Again, as I—as
20 I was sort of saying, I think the view of the de
21 Blasio Administration and DOT and I know NYPD as well
22 and actually some of our other sister agencies is, it
23 is in all of the above strategy. The city again in
24 partnership with the Council has first of all made a
25 profound investment in Vision Zero. We will be

2 investing between Fiscal Year 18 and Fiscal Year 22
3 \$1.5 billion in street redesigns in traffic
4 operations and enforcement and education. I don't
5 know that there is another city in the country maybe
6 even the world that is making that kind an
7 investment. At DOT we have staffed up, as I've said,
8 I really think with world class engineers and
9 planners. We are redesigning streets. We have a
10 school safety program, and certainly I know some of
11 the things that were discussed at the Council hearing
12 are things that we do. We do put up speed boards, we
13 do put up stop signs, we do traffic signals, speed
14 humps, protected bike lanes, but we do it very much
15 in the data driven way, and, you know, happy to
16 continue that dialogue with the Council. I have to
17 say that—that my team particularly my—my
18 Transportation Planning and Management, my School
19 Safety folks, our Traffic Operations, we have a team
20 of hundreds of people that work every day on the
21 streets of New York, and particularly this summer
22 that's when we put a lot of our projects in. We've
23 put in dozens and dozens and dozens of safety
24 projects that summer. A lot of miles of protected
25 bike lanes. So, believe me, we are—I assure you not

2 resting on our laurels. We always know there's more
3 to do, and, you know, happy to come back and continue
4 that discussion with the Council, but there is—
5 there's not an idle day when it—when it comes to
6 Vision Zero I think, you know, at DOT and in the de
7 Blasio Administration.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So, I—I know
9 that, um, your staff and team have done citywide
10 particularly in—in—in my—in Southeast Queens/Jamaica
11 area forums around Vision Zero taking safety
12 suggestions and so forth, and that has been probably
13 a two or three-year process. At what point have we
14 really taking that community engagement into account,
15 and really manifested it into real action as opposed
16 to the just coming in and saying—understanding that
17 these are tools that are available, but also
18 considering the—the culture kind of the—the expertise
19 of—of—of the area there. I've—I've seen in
20 particular, um, and—and—and there's were good with
21 that. They did a lot of street repaving, but the
22 street repaving kind of creates a situation where you
23 can go ten blocks without stopping because there's no
24 stop signs, and instead of people traveling on many
25 streets, they now fly up and down side streets, but

2 we haven't caught up with putting the proper
3 apparatuses that would control traffic on those
4 streets as well. So, we've had conversation, but the
5 conversations have not translated to real safe
6 streets yet, and so they should—as we do that, we
7 should know as [bell]—that the coach is going to
8 change as well that they're no longer going to stop
9 on a main street where they have to stop at stop
10 lights and they're riding on the back streets, which
11 is smooth, which don't force them to stop at all.

12 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean I—I
13 think you know and—and I've been to your district a
14 few times. We've done a couple town hall, and I know
15 my—my Queens Borough Commissioner and her team have
16 been on the ground a lot and we try very hard to
17 work with local communities to that their input, work
18 with community boards. Sometimes that actually
19 frustrates our—our advocates and allies who want us
20 to go faster, but we—we try and strike that right
21 balance of doing safety projects, but making sure we
22 are listening to local voices. They often strengthen
23 our projects and make them better, and I think when
24 there's buy-in and working together that—that helps
25 change the culture. I think when you look at the

2 reductions and the fatality rates and—and Queens has—
3 I think Queens has actually been ahead of in—in terms
4 of percentages, in terms of the citywide overall.
5 We're seeing culture change happen. Not to say there
6 isn't more to do, and we're always-- You know, one
7 thing I found is—is we—we mentioned that we put out—
8 we mentioned this to Council Member Richards, a few
9 years ago our Borough Pedestrian Safety Action Plans
10 for each borough. We're going to be updating that
11 soon, and I think it will be a great learning
12 experience for all of us. We'll see places, and, you
13 know, in every neighborhood, in every borough where
14 our interventions have lowered fatalities, but then
15 new areas now where we want to make a priority. So,
16 when we're ready to release those, I think we want to
17 come and present them to all of you, and talk about
18 what the next step will be.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you.

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Did you—Juan
21 hand something to add.

22 JUAN MARTINEZ: At the last hearing you
23 brought up the specific question about long distances
24 between a stop sign or a signal.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Uh-hm.

2 JUAN MARTINEZ: I know that we're
3 reviewing recent studies in your area, and I don't
4 know if a—the discussion has been scheduled yet, but
5 I—I know it's underway.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, that was
7 because bad coaches shifts, right? When—when the
8 speed cameras are her, they go somewhere else. When
9 there's no lights here they—and so we just kind of
10 want to make sure that we're holistically addressing
11 this.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you and
13 before calling, you know, my colleague Reynoso,
14 there's no doubt that city can, you know, I would say
15 celebrate all the advancement that we've been able to
16 make in the last couple of years because of the
17 partnership with everyone, and also having, you know,
18 a mayor that has a vision with the great partners
19 like Commission Polly Trottenberg, but again it
20 require for her to be listening to all of us, and—and
21 we in this panel we will continue bringing to the
22 table a different area where we believe that we can
23 continue investing more to make, you know, changing
24 the culture on how drivers interact with pedestrians
25 and cyclists and this—this is our business, you know.

2 It isn't to be popular, but just to be sue that
3 everyone feels that they're safe when they walk on
4 the streets. So, as we recognize the leadership and
5 the partnership that we've been having together, and
6 especially today, the last 24 hours, 72 hours have
7 been a day that we are showing that when the city and
8 the state, in this case with the Mayor and the
9 Governor and we together with the Speaker-Speaker
10 Johnson and all of us together, we work together. We
11 get things done. So while were are showing in this
12 Executive Order that that Governor listened to us.
13 This is something that we asked before that the
14 governor also and his team, they're working with the
15 other team at the city level working with the-with
16 the Speaker's side, and finally, I can say that
17 there's a day that we can say that we are—we can
18 celebrate on how when we, the state and city work
19 together we can listen much better to the advocates
20 that have been advocating for these speed cameras to
21 be sure that they—that they will continue running
22 after September 5th. So with that, Council-Council
23 Member Reynoso.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you, Chair
25 and thank you to the Families for Safe Streets, the

2 advocacy, which has been very impactful in my
3 district, and I hope that I've done my part, and
4 happy to see this victory here today, and the short
5 victory here today. Because we have a lot more to do
6 and I want to speak to a lot more. It just really is
7 concerning to me when we don't allow for the
8 Department of Transportation to be the experts that
9 push policy related to what we think is of value for
10 saving lives. I just would really want to speak to
11 the fact that a lot of these families talked about
12 hearing a bike lane get shut down in a community
13 board and what that meant to them in their story, and
14 the fact that we even would go to a community board
15 to ask for a bike lane where we know ensures safety
16 is always of concern to me. The same thing would go
17 with these speed cameras that they should positioned
18 where the NYPD and the Department of Transportation
19 think they are going to be most effective and so
20 forth, and I want play more to breaking car culture.
21 The statistics that we have is over 300,000 people
22 have been speeding in the city of New York since
23 these cameras have been shut down. One of these
24 cameras have been—not been giving tickets for these
25 cameras, but I'm racial bound, but I've been played.

2 The fact that this city allows for folks to run over
3 35 miles an hour, which is practically a killing
4 machine, a vehicle—making a vehicle a killing machine
5 is beyond me. We really have to start talking about
6 doing more against car culture including the NYPD and
7 the Collision Department, which I think doesn't do
8 justice to many families that are suffering, and
9 families that have been crashes whether there are
10 fatalities or not, and really want the city to start
11 taking more seriously the fact that we need to break
12 this car culture and start taking care of pedestrians
13 in our city. So, while today is a victory and we
14 should all be celebrating the fact that we are going
15 to have these speed cameras in and around schools, we
16 need to do more. We need to do a lot more. If
17 there's one vehicle that's operating at an unsafe
18 level in the city, then we haven't done our part to
19 really achieve Vision Zero, and I want to continue
20 and let you know that I'm advocate in make sure that
21 that happens.

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I just thank
23 you, Council Member, and just—I guess I want to just
24 say, I'm proud to say that I really do think in
25 recent years, you know, we—we certainly work closely

2 with community board, but I don't actually think they
3 have stopped that many projects, and we have been
4 building our the bike network at a very aggressive
5 pace. I think someone will correct me if I'm wrong.
6 I think we did 66 miles including 25 protected miles
7 this past year, which is extraordinary. Again, I
8 don't think any city has come close to that, and I
9 think to speak to your vision, and—and, you know, I
10 want to thank you for your leadership particularly
11 now obviously with the L-Train closure. I think
12 we're taking some pretty bold steps. We are going to
13 be doing—we've started even before the L-Train with
14 some crosstown protected bike lanes, in Manhattan.
15 We're going to be doing those further down in the
16 East and West Village. We're going to be
17 envisioning, you really a bus and bikeway for Grand
18 Street, a busway for 14th Street. So, I think, you
19 know, obviously from what we all know is this
20 incredibly challenging situation I think we're going
21 to be doing some really big and bold things, and I'm
22 hoping, you know, again with your leadership and the
23 leadership of others that's really going to hopefully
24 show New Yorker what a city can look like that is
25 less car focused, that is more mass transit and

2 pedestrian and cyclist focused. We have a great
3 opportunity to get it right here I think.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Just a—I guess
5 more of a call to this committee to allow for the
6 Department of Transportation to do its job as
7 experts, and data, and then the folks with the data
8 that can make a more sound and professional decision
9 and not allow for anecdotes or stories and community
10 boards to dictate the safety of the citizens or the
11 residents in the city New York. We would never ask
12 the Police Department or a captain to move all their
13 resources to one area or another or to take them out
14 one way or another. We allow for the professionals
15 in the Police Department to do their job, and I think
16 that the Department of Transportation should be
17 allowed the same autonomy. So, I just wanted to make
18 sure that I-I communicate that constantly in this
19 committee, and I'm always—I'm happy for these
20 victories, but I always want to keep pushing forward
21 because this is not enough. So, thank you for your
22 time here, and thank you to the Chair and to the City
23 Council, and I'm always going to be here for you and
24 let's keep fighting. Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member
3 Rosenthal.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you,
5 Chair, and thank you for your—together your joint
6 work on this obviously life-saving effort. I guess I
7 do want to start by speaking to Families for Safe
8 Streets. I don't know if you—I would really urge you
9 to go back and look at the video. Your testimony
10 together was incredibly powerful, and I do think it
11 would be worth sending a copy of that video to the
12 State Senate Republicans. They, of course, should be
13 ashamed of themselves for going on vacation without
14 doing their duty and their—the people's—doing the
15 people's work, and I imagine you've tried to meet
16 with them, and that you'll continue to try to meet
17 with them. You are skilled story tellers. You talk
18 with passion, your heart, and I know many of you, and
19 again, I'm just very sorry for your loss, and thank
20 you for coming again today to tell your story. So,
21 Commissioners, I—I have two questions sort in the
22 weeds. We've talked about the larger picture, but if
23 I could just get a little bit practical for a second.
24 So, can I first confirm that, the 140 or the 160 will
25 start right away?

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION 90

2 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: The 140. Yes.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay.

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: September-
5 September 5th.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay.

7 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: But first
8 we'll have them ready for the first day of school.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: If there are
10 an additional 20?

11 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: There-the-the
12 program, remember the original pilot program was 20
13 cameras, and then the next year the city--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]
15 Yep.

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: --got an
17 addition 120. So, it was a little--

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Oh, 120.

19 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Right and so
20 it was a little confusing when we--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]
22 No, it's alright.

23 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: --shut the
24 program down this summer, the first 20 we actually
25 were allowed to let them run a couple more months.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]
3 What's your timing, um what's your--what are your
4 thoughts about procurement for the next 150 cameras?
5 Will that be done on sort of, um, requirements
6 contract or will you have to issue a new RFP?

7 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: We're going to
8 be able. We hope to amend our existing camera
9 contract, and we are committed to getting that
10 procurement, you know that part of it underway as
11 quickly as possible. It--it will take a little time,
12 but we will move as expeditiously as possible and
13 keep the--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]
15 Have they confirmed the availability of those
16 cameras?

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: That's a good
18 question. Have they confirmed the availability?

19 JUAN MARTINEZ: Yes.

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: They seem
21 enthusiastic, so I believe the cameras will be
22 available. I think for--

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]
24 If you could get back to the Council--

25 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Sure.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --on timing,
3 just when you'll have those in, how long they'll take
4 to be installed and up and going. That would really
5 be great.

6 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yes.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: You know the
8 330,000 number is just so powerful. The thought of
9 being able to identify 330,000 more, um, with the
10 additional cameras is just so critical. Secondly, I'm
11 really concerned about the modicum of data about the
12 school safety agents. You know, every year during my
13 tenure on the Council, we have gotten a report that,
14 um, is part of the terms and conditions. Do you know
15 what I'm talking about in the budget, and it's a term
16 and condition of giving--allocating the funds to the
17 Police Department, it is required that we get a
18 report on the number of school safety agents by
19 precinct, and that report is missing for the most
20 current year. So, I don't know. I don't know
21 whether or not you know the number of safety agents
22 by precinct. This has always been a concern of mine
23 because every year in the report, the information for
24 my 20th Precinct is never there, and that is my
25 precinct with the fewest number of street safety-

2 school safety--school crossing guards. So, um, did
3 you ever even, and may I—I apologize for being a
4 little rough, but do you—I’m not confident you have
5 the data because it’s required by the terms and
6 conditions of our budget that you give the
7 information to the Council, which then puts it up on
8 our website. It was Term and Condition No 56 I think
9 the school crossing guards. So, um, I—I would like
10 to know for my two precincts. I use this information
11 because when I see that they’re low, I talk to my
12 precinct commander about the use of [bell] of their
13 patrol cars or traffic safety agents and, you know,
14 those two options, of course, are not trustworthy
15 because if they have an emergency they’re going to
16 leave. It’s, you know, not their required post to be
17 at that school. So, I’m seriously concerned about
18 the lack of knowledge by this Administration where
19 you have budgeted school crossing guards, and what
20 your actual number is by precinct. What’s your sense
21 of this? Do you think you have this information and
22 just never got over to the Council? If you have the
23 information now, would you be willing to send it over
24 now?

2 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Sure Council Member.

3 So, I-I just want to make sure that we're talking
4 about the same—the same individuals. You started off
5 the question with school safety agents.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Sorry. I
7 apologize.

8 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: We are talking about
9 crossing guards.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Right. Nope,
11 I don't mean—

12 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Yeah. Okay, so what--

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --safety
14 agents. I apologize. So we—

15 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: That's fine.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --could back
17 in the transcript.

18 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: No, no, I'll—I'll
19 answer the question with respect to crossing guards.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]
21 School crossing guards.

22 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: I just—I didn't want a
23 complaint. Um, so I'll—I'll speak to our Deputy
24 Commissioner of Management and Budget, who always
25 does—who always sends the answers over—to the

2 questions that you're saying have been unanswered.

3 But, what I can tell you about the general--generally
4 about the School Crossing Guard Program is we have
5 identified posts for the individuals, and based on
6 the number of identified posts, we know how many
7 individuals we need to hire to fill those posts.
8 What you're asking is too particular schools in your
9 district?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: No, I've just
11 never gotten--

12 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: [interposing] Or just
13 generally.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL:--the
15 information about my precinct, Precinct 20. So, I
16 have to get the information from the precinct
17 captain, but my point to you is this is isn't just
18 random data that you're getting over to the Council
19 because we randomly asked about it. This I
20 information that's used by people who are looking at
21 the safety of the kids, you know, crossing the street
22 near their schools. I have parents who count on that
23 information, and who hold my feet to the fire about.
24 So, I--just go be very clear, and if this is
25 confusing, I'll say it--I'll try to get it clearer.

2 Does the NYPD know today how many school crossing
3 guards are budgeted for each precinct, and do you
4 know how many of those positions are filled? Not in
5 the pipeline. Filled.

6 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Understood. So, what--
7 I--I understand your question, but what I'm--what I'm
8 saying is that the number of posts gets determined.
9 It's not a set number, this school gets five posts.
10 I mean there's--there's an out--

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]
12 No, I really understand how you get to the number,
13 but you're telling me the--

14 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: [interposing] But I'm
15 trying--

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --process of
17 getting the answer to that question. I don't care
18 about the details. I just want to know--

19 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: [interposing] But the
20 details are important to answer your question with
21 that.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]
23 So, you're telling me that the precinct captains are
24 going to decide in the month of September--

25 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: [interposing] No.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --how many
3 they need?

4 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: No, not-no, no, that's
5 not what I'm saying. So, earlier we provided the-the
6 numbers of agents, right, the number of agents and
7 the number of vacancies are-are based on the number
8 of posts, right. So, we know the number of posts
9 that need to be filled. Now how do we come up--

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]
11 So what are--

12 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: [interposing] How do
13 we--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]
15 So, you know the grand total. You don't know the--

16 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: [interposing] If I
17 can-if I can-if I can--

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]
19 by them by precinct.

20 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: [interposing] So, if I
21 can-if I can finish.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Right.

23 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: So, we have--
24
25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]
3 I missed that testimony. I apologize. What's the
4 grand total that's budgeted?

5 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: So, we have—

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: 25—2,563 is the
7 number that you shared with us before.

8 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Right, 2,563 assigned
9 school crossing guards. The goal is 2,638. That's
10 the number of posts, and what I—what I testified in
11 response to the Speaker's question was we've designed
12 a program with the realization that certain precincts
13 have challenges, inherent challenges in having
14 individuals come forward to fill those posts. So,
15 what we've created is a program that has a reserved
16 pool of crossing guards, and we've created the
17 crossing guard supervisor position that can deploy
18 this reserve pool of crossing guards to vacant
19 positions, and that could be because there's a
20 vacancy because we simply can't--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]
22 Sure.

23 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: --fill it or it could
24 be that somebody called in sick.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]

3 Well, right now you have 755 (sic)

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]

5 Sorry, Council Member. I'm sorry Council Member.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I think this
7 is report-

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Again, it is-it
9 is important, but just finalize the question then we
10 can-can move on.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Uh-hm.

12 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Right so the-the short
13 answer is that's-that's the model. The posts are-are
14 created based on input from the schools based on
15 crash data, based-

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]
17 Of course.

18 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Right. All of these
19 factors come in--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]
21 Right.

22 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: --the posts are
23 designated. We utilize--

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]
25 So, you have 755.

2 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: --we utilize these
3 resources to fill the posts. Where if in spots
4 where crossing guards aren't available, we have
5 additional resources we can deploy whether from the
6 reserve pool, whether TEAs, whether Auxiliaries,
7 whether officers. So, we fill the post, and the
8 other part of your question, which is there is an
9 outstanding request for data, I'm going to go back to
10 the office after this hearing is over and find out
11 what--what the data is and make sure that we're--we
12 respond to you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So, according
14 to what you just testified, there are 75 vacancies?
15 Right? Did I do the math right?

16 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Hold on one second.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: 2638 and you
18 and it would be 2563?

19 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: [interposing] That's
20 what it--that's what it looks like. I just want to
21 verify something. Okay, so correct. There are 20--
22 there are 75 spots that need to be filled, but there
23 is a class--there are two classes in September that
24 will add 120 more crossing guards. So, 60 I believe

2 on September 10th and another 60 on September 17th.

3 So, again, it's—I think you're right.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Are you
5 confident that the entire 2563 are coming back?

6 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Well, that's—and that
7 was part of the testimony in response to the
8 Speaker's question that once we got there we'll see,
9 right? We—there—there are going to be occasions
10 where somebody doesn't come back, but that's why we
11 designed this model where have this reserved pool of
12 crossing guards that we can deploy as needed and we
13 have the additional resources.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I appreciate
15 that. I understand my time is done. I would just
16 urge you to know the answer to these question at
17 least four days prior to when school starts. I mean
18 if you don't know today where your vacancies are, I
19 think it's concerning. As a parent I'm concerned.

20 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Okay.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So, um, I
22 hope—I hope you can be a little more forethoughtful
23 about it next school year.

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
25 Council Member, and again that—that same—similar

2 questions were asked by Speaker Johnson. So, I think
3 that the message I got from the Speaker and also from
4 the Council Member is it is important for—for us as
5 a city to know what I the plan that we have in place
6 starting September 5th when all the students they go
7 back to school, and also you hear from my colleague
8 Council Member Rosenthal that it is important that
9 the City-City Council will have all that information
10 that we know exactly how the NYPD deploy all those
11 men and women who work as a crossing guard and
12 assuming those information is something that you can
13 break down to us by precinct.

14 OLEG CHERNYAVSKY: Sure. Okay.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, with that,
16 unless Council Member Deutsch has [pause] some
17 questions?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So, I just want
19 to touch upon what Council Member Rosenthal said.
20 So, you have a shortage of school crossing guards.
21 You said 75, but then you did mention that there is a
22 reserve. This morning I spoke to four different
23 precincts asking them the numbers of how many—how
24 many requests or vacancies they do have. There—there
25 is a—there is a gap that if—if a school crossing

2 guards does not show up, you mentioned that there is
3 a reserve. That is what the protocol is—what you're
4 looking at, what hopefully should be done, but it
5 usually doesn't happen that way. I think there is an
6 issue also with how much a school crossing guard gets
7 paid—get paid because a lot of even those school
8 crossing guards that graduate end up dropping out.
9 So what I would just ask is in addition to getting
10 this information to find out exactly what the reasons
11 are when someone does drop out. This way we could
12 work next time in the budget to see—or—or legislative
13 to see what we can do working with the—whit the
14 Administration to maybe try to figure out why they're
15 dropping out and to work on those reasons to see, to
16 make sure that it's appealing for them to stay
17 because they have a very tough job standing outside
18 in all types of weather, and it's very important that
19 we—that they get paid according to what their job is
20 protecting our children. So, I think that is a good
21 piece of information that we need in the Council.
22 This way we could fight for that and advocate and
23 work with the Administration on that. So, I just want
24 of finally say, with the speed cameras that it is
25 important. For the record I just want to say that

2 speed cameras alone is not the answer to everything.
3 We need to have those extra protections to make sure
4 that we are 100% protected as the best to our ability
5 by expanding bussing, which I have a bill for that to
6 expanding traffic control officer officers in areas
7 that have a high accident location, which I have a
8 bill in the Council for that. That's being drafted,
9 and putting these extra layers, and putting the
10 entire package together with speed cameras, that is
11 when I personally as a parent of five and a
12 grandfather of two grandchildren, I will be happy.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. So
14 with that, thank you. As I said, thank you DOT
15 Commissioner but also Chief Chan. Also he's bringing
16 a great partners with, you know, Vision Zero
17 Initiative, and now we have to continue working. As
18 we know, our plan is that tomorrow we hope that we
19 can be voting on this bill our committee and
20 hopefully—hopefully we'll be voting at the Stated
21 Meeting tomorrow, and we will send a message loud and
22 clear that working together with Executive Order by
23 the Governor, working with the support of Mayor de
24 Blasio, Speaker Johnson and all of us, that tomorrow
25 will be a good day that we are being sending a

2 message that we will be maintaining the speed camera
3 and more than maintaining, we're going to be
4 expanding the speed camera in the city of New York.
5 So, with that, thank you and now we're calling the
6 last panel. I don't know if those three great New
7 Yorkers are here. Mark O'Connor, Transportation
8 Alternatives, Ariel Saransky, UJA Federation, and
9 Vincent Region.

10 MALE SPEAKER: [off mic] All at the same
11 time?

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yes, at that same
13 time. Yes. So, it's going to be on three minutes.
14 So, please, just as long as you summarize. [pause]
15 [background comments] We assumed that there was not
16 anybody else from the public who signed to testify.
17 So, with these three testimonies we will end this
18 hearing. [pause]

19 VINCENT RIGGINS: First? Ladies first.
20 No. Yes, let me be a gentleman today. Thank you
21 [background comments, pause]

22 ARIEL SAVANSKY Okay. Good afternoon
23 Chairperson Rodriguez. I my name is Ariel Savansky,
24 and I'm an Advocacy and Policy Advisor at UJA
25 Federation. We're also a member of the Coalition.

2 So, you've heard extremely moving stories. I think
3 you know all the facts. You know that speed cameras
4 work. So, I'm just going to be very brief, and just
5 put on the record that we are extremely supportive of
6 this bill passing. We are really grateful for your
7 work with the Speaker with the Governor with the
8 Mayor trying to make sure that this program can
9 continue to operate in school district, and we look
10 forward to working together as we expand this program
11 because it is truly a very vital program, and we need
12 to make sure that no more parents have to suffer the
13 loss of their children or other family members. So,
14 thank you for this opportunity to testify, and we
15 look forward to continuing to work together.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] Thank
17 you.

18 MARK O'CONNOR: Good afternoon, Chairman.
19 My name is Mark O'Connor. I'm the Legislative and
20 Legal Director with Transportation Alternatives, and
21 Ariel, we also want to thank you, you know, on behalf
22 Transportation Alternatives and the Every School for
23 Speed Safety Camera Coalition for your tenacity on-
24 working on-on these issues for so, so long. As I
25 mentioned today, I'm also representing the Every

2 School Coalition for Speed Safety Cameras. This
3 coalition not only strongly supports your life
4 affirming actions today to reactivate our city's
5 speed safety cameras, we encourage you to use your
6 authority to allow operation of the cameras whenever
7 and wherever needed to protect other New Yorkers. At
8 the very least, to do so at every school and every
9 senior center to begin with. The Every School
10 Coalition consists of more than 300 schools, parent-
11 teacher associations, nearly every major hospital in
12 New York City, doctors, school crossing guards,
13 religious institutions, child welfare organizations,
14 disability rights groups, major businesses, four
15 district attorneys and many more institutions in New
16 York City. Speeding is the leading cause of-of
17 crashes in our city, and speed safety cameras, as you
18 have seen today, have been an effective deterrent to
19 speeding. We at Transportation Alternatives believe
20 that the city of New York through legislation
21 originated in the Council today, has the legal and
22 the moral authority to operate an improved speed
23 safety camera program that protects more New Yorkers
24 than the program that existed between 2014 and 2018.
25 Those powers are rooted in the right that we have as

2 a city to legislate for the protection, for the
3 safety, health and wellbeing of people who live in
4 our city, and who travel here. Speed safety cameras
5 do exactly that. They deter dangerous driving,
6 making our streets safer. They save lives.
7 Furthermore, New York City has extensive policing
8 powers [bell] including the general power to enforce
9 speed limits. Traffic violence affects us all. As
10 this Council votes to make our streets safer, we urge
11 you, Chairman, to strongly consider allowing speed
12 safety cameras to operate at any time when speeding
13 is prevalent and at any school, senior center and
14 Naturally Occurring Retirement Community. Ultimately,
15 we hope that very soon our city will be able to
16 operate speed safety cameras whenever and wherever
17 life threatening speeding is prevalent. Thank you.

18 VINCENT RIGGINS: Good afternoon, Chair
19 and I want to thank you guys for—for having this
20 hearing. My name is Vincent Riggins. I live in
21 District 42 in Brooklyn, and just so I have some
22 different opinions that may be kind of nuanced, but I
23 want to give you some foundation on why I think they
24 are valid. One, I'm a member of Community Board 5
25 Public Safety Committee Co-Chair. I'm also the

2 author of the Resolution Against Stop, Search and
3 Frisk. Once the community board and the whole city
4 submitted that, we did that in Community Board 5.
5 I'm also the Correspondence Secretary for the 75th
6 Precinct Community Council. Great relationship
7 police officers, and I'm also organizers—organizer of
8 the Concerned Families of Starlight City doing their
9 proposed sale. (sic) To say that cameras is not
10 about revenue is a moral way of showing empathy, but
11 it is void of rational implementation. Now, what do
12 I mean by that? There's—it's impossible to secure
13 everyone in the city like the gentleman just alluded
14 to without considering revenue. We're not talking
15 about—I'm not talking about revenue that the city is
16 trying accumulate, but in order for us to have zero
17 fatalities, it's going to take revenue. It's going
18 to take a partnership with the state and the city.
19 That interprets revenue. Cameras cost money. So,
20 for somebody to say that it's not about revenue, just
21 a little bit ingenious. Two days ago I spent time
22 with Carmen and Michael Ojeda, right, the organ—the
23 founder—the Foundation for Brianna's Law, right.
24 Over 7,000 lives have been saved within the last year
25 just by implementing that law, and it took them seven

2 years. So, I'm here just offering an alternative. I
3 think creating a block between the Republicans and
4 the State Senate this body and the Assembly is part
5 of the problem that we are not getting the resources
6 we need throughout this city. My suggestion: Make
7 revenue an issue. Okay. My suggestion is that the
8 revenue that's garnered from every speed camera,
9 school cameras, part of that revenue turned back over
10 to the community board, our district and—and once the
11 revenue was gathered. There is no Republican or any
12 other elected official that is not going to take
13 revenue for their community because they refuse to
14 take a vote. So, I think we will be able to solve
15 that issue immediately. So, we have to think outside
16 of the box, and we're going to accomplish what we
17 after. We can't make a political issue. There—there
18 is nobody—I mean this—this is a bi—this should be a
19 bipartisan initiative. Yet, we're using it for
20 political fodder in this political season. So, I
21 just wanted to share it with you. One more [bell]
22 powerful suggestion I want to give you.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Sir, summarize,
24 please.

2 VINCENT RIGGINS: Yeah, I'm sorry. I
3 had—I am going to summarize. I did have it written
4 up a little bit better, but I left it running. Let
5 me see so I could summarize for you.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I'm sorry, sir.
7 We need to—we need to leave it here. If there's any
8 additional information that you can share with us we
9 will take it, but with that, this hearing comes to
10 the end. Hopefully, we will see you tomorrow, and
11 hopefully, we will be able to vote it from committee,
12 and also vote it in the Stated Meeting. With that,
13 this hearing is adjourned. [gavel]

14 VINCENT RIGGINS: Sorry. I don't have
15 it. (coughs)

16 MALE SPEAKER: This is the end. (sic)

17 VINCENT RIGGINS: What?

18 MALE SPEAKER: This is the end. (sic)

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date September 1, 2018