CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

----- X

June 14, 2018 Start: 1:38 p.m. Recess: 2:08 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E: DANIEL DROMM

Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Adrienne E. Adams

Andrew Cohen

Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.

Laurie A. Cumbo
Vanessa L. Gibson
Barry S. Grodenchik
Rory L. Lancman
Steven Matteo
Francisco P. Moya

Keith Powers

Helen K. Rosenthal James G. Van Bramer A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

[sound check] [gavel]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Good afternoon, and welcome to today's Finance Committee hearing where we-where we will be adopting the Fiscal 2019 Budget. I'm Council Member Daniel Dromm, and I chair the committee. We've been joined by my colleagues Council Member Francisco Moya, Council Member Barry Grodenchik, Council Member Barry Grodenchik, Council Member Steve Matteo, Council Member Keith Powers, Council Member and Chair of the Subcommittee Vanessa Gibson, Council Member Helen Rosenthal, Council Member Robert Cornegy, Council Member Adrienne Adams and Council Member Jimmy Van Bramer, and we may be joined by others. I'm not sure, but we will continue to move on, and announce as they come. Today, the Finance Committee will take the necessary actions to allow the City Council to adopt the Fiscal 2019 Budget, which totals approximately \$89.2 billion. total, this committee will vote on 12 budget related items. In addition, we will also be voting on four LU items. Before we get started, there's a long list of people that need to be thanked for getting us here today. First, I need to thank the Speaker Corey Johnson for leading us through budget negotiations.

2 What really came through this year is that the Speaker wanted the process to be inclusive for every 3 4 Council Member to feel engaged and part of the 5 budget, and that he wanted the body to speak in a unified voice. I think he achieved all of that, and 6 the Fiscal 19 Budget is better for it. With Corey Johnson at the helm, the Council realized some 8 amazing victories, and that is why we can pass a 9 budget today that we can all be proud of. Of course, 10 I also want to thank the chair-the Speaker's Chief of 11 12 Staff Ramon Martinez for all that he does for the Council, and for each and every one of us. Thank you 13 to my fellow Finance Committee members for being part 14 15 of my first budget as Finance Chair. Together, at 16 the Executive Budget hearings we spent over 60 hours together listening to testimony from dozens of 17 18 agencies about how the budget proposed by the Mayor affected their ability to perform their core 19 20 services. On the last day of Executive Budget hearings we also heard from over 80 members of the 21 2.2 public about how the Executive Budget affected them. 23 We shared what we learned through the budget hearings with our colleagues and B&T in delegations and with 24 25 each other, and worked together to have our voices

2	heard. So thank you Finance Committee members for
3	being partners and an integral part—participants with
4	me during this budget cycle. I must also thank our
5	talented and dedicated Finance staff under the
6	leadership of Finance Director Latonia McKinney.
7	Latonia is a seasoned effective and skilled
8	negotiator, and we couldn't have done this without
9	her. Thank you Latonia for your excellent work. I
10	also want to thank the staff of the Finance Division
11	individually. Everyone played an important role, and
12	I thank you for all the hours you worked around the
13	clock being responsive to Council Members' questions
14	and requests for information, and guiding us through
15	delegations and B&T. I'd like to thank Deputy
16	Director and Chief Economist Raymond Majewski, Deputy
17	Director Regina Poreda Ryan, Deputy Director Nathan
18	Toth, Deputy Director Paul Simone, Assistant Director
19	Emre Edev, Supervising Economist Paul Sturm,
20	Committee Counsel Rebecca Chasen, the Unit Heads
21	Ayisha Wright, Chima Obichere, John Russel, Dohini
22	Sompura, and Crilhien Francisco. The Finance Analyst
23	and Economist Alia Ali, Sebastian Bacci, John Bacile,
24	Sevanna Chow, Raymond Furlong, Sarah Gastelum, Hector
25	German. Kenny Grace. Zach Harris. Elizabeth Hoffman.

2 Daniel Crook, Willian Cheramatang (sp?), Jen Lee, Kyra McDonald, Janette Merrill, Vanera Nuzha (sp?), 3 Caitlin O'Hagen, Jimmy Reyes, John Seltzer, Kendall 4 Stephenson, Andrew Wilbur, Steven Williams, and Davis 5 Winslow and the Finance Division Administrative 6 7 Support Unit Nicole Anderson, Maria Pagan, Roberta Caturano who pull everything together. Next, I want 8 to thank my staff Carolyn Tran, Sebastian McGuire, 9 Michael Mallon, and especially Evia Cardozo. 10 want to thank everyone in my district office who kept 11 12 everything going while I was spending a lot of my 13 time down here at City Hall. So, thank you also to 14 Jacqueline Cosme (sic) and Kevin Ye. Lastly, I want 15 to thank Chuck Davis and the Appointments and 16 Investigations Team for vetting every organization receiving discretionary funding. It is a lot of work 17 18 in a short amount of time, and we appreciate all that you do and all that your team does. Thank you to 19 20 Francesa Del Vecchio, Alicia Vassel and our Ethics Counsel in the General Counsel's Office Patrick 21 2.2 Bradford who assisted us with our disclosures. 23 you all. Now, with all that said, let's adopt this budget. [laughs] [applause] Alright the Fiscal 2019 24 Adopted Budget includes many significant wins for the 25

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

Council and most importantly for the people of New York City. When the Executive Budget was released and so a few of the Council's priorities were-and so few of the Council's priorities were included, there were many of us who were uncertain about how much influence the Council would have on this year's Adopted Budget. However, after very successful negotiations, it is absolutely clear that the Adopted Budget reflects the Council's great impact and our emphasis on protecting the social safety net while pushing for accountability measures that will protect our budget stability in the long term. This year we targeted our priorities at several large scale programs that we wanted to see included in the In addition to the agency's specific improvements, and enhance-and enhancements that we advocated for, and the result is a negotiated budget that includes the Council's signature proposals, much needed capital funding, and capital budget reform and significant investments in the city's reserves. First and foremost, I must highlight the launch of our Fare Fairs, a program to make nearly 800,000 New Yorkers living at or below the poverty line and 12,000 veterans enrolled in city colleges eligible

for a half price Metro Card. No longer will anyone
have to choose between a meal and Metro Card or beg
for swipes at the turnstile. This transformative
program will save participants over \$700 a year, a
huge sum for low-income New Yorkers. In addition, as
a former teacher and former chair of the Education
Committee, I cannot be more proud of the Council's
advocacy on behalf of the city's school children. As
a result of our efforts, the budget will include a
\$125 million in funding that will go directly into
school budgets; \$150 million in capital funding to
make schools more accessible for disabled children
and any disabled parents or teachers, and \$2 million
to make sure that our neediest schools have at least
one guidance counselor or social worker on staff.
These investments will make a real difference on the
learning environment and educational experiences of
our students. But these are not the only investment
that we made in the city's youth. The Council
successfully negotiated for \$15 million to restore
summer SONYC programs. \$10.3 million for the Summer
Youth Employment Program to support an additional
5,000 slots for a total of 75,000 jobs in the summer
of 2018. \$19 million for Work, Learn and Grow the

year round youth employment program; \$16 million for 2 COMPASS and \$3 million for Runaway and Homeless 3 These are incredible victories, but this 4 Youth. 5 budget really contains something for everyone. Among the other of the Council's priorities that will be 6 included in the budget are a commitment to property tax reform with the creation of a Property Tax Reform 8 Commission that will put forward recommendations to 9 10 make the property tax system simpler, clearer and fairer. A priority for permanent housing with an 11 12 agreement from the Administration to construct more supportive and congregate housing at a faster rate 13 and to construct 1,000 new senior housing units 14 15 across six new developments. \$17.3 million in 16 operating funds for the libraries as well as \$60 17 million in capital funding; \$16 million for the 18 District Attorney's offices for salary parity and other programmatic incentives; \$2 million for LGBT 19 20 Community Services; \$12.3 million for parks to allow for the employment of an additional 150 parks 21 2.2 maintenance workers, a one-week extension of the pool 23 and beach season and for increased tree stump removal. \$12 million to continue the city's Adult 24 25 Literacy Programs; \$1.8 million for the Trans Equity

2 Program to support a range of services to help empower the transgender and gender non-conforming 3 community; \$20 million for the Emergency Food 4 Assistance Program; and \$35.4 million for the Crisis 5 Management system that deploys teams of credible 6 7 messengers who mediate conflicts on the street and connect high risk individuals to services, and 8 amazingly the list goes on. But throughout the 9 negotiations we were not only focused on where 10 spending could most significantly have a positive 11 12 impact on New Yorkers' lives and protect the social 13 safety network. An important part of the Council's 14 position was that the city must be better prepared 15 for any economic downturn that may come in the future. Therefore, we also focused on ensuring that 16 17 the Administration further shored up the reserves. 18 Our persistence paid off. The Adopted Budget will include an additional \$225 million for reserves with 19 20 a portion going to fund the Retiring Health Benefits Fund to help reduce a large unfunded liability. And 21 2.2 another area where the Council worked diligently to 23 keep the Administration accountable was our focus on capital budge reform. This year, we made meaningful 24 25 strides towards that goal. Excess appropriations are

2 often a result of the city frontloading the Capital Commitment Plan, which generates unnecessary new 3 appropriations. With larger available appropriation 4 balances, the Administration can raise, lower or create new capital projects mid-year without coming 6 7 to the Council for approval. Better alignment between appropriations and more realistic planned spending in 8 the Capital Commitment Plan ensures the Charter 9 mandated checks and balances on the city's Capital 10 Budget are maintained. Responding to the Council's 11 12 advocacy, the Administration agreed to rescind \$5.8 13 billion in excess appropriations to the Adopted 14 Budget in consultation with the Council. 15 redistributed \$6.4 billion in planned commitments on 16 Fiscal 18 and 19 across Fiscal 20 to 22 in the 17 Executive Capital Commitment Plan, and they put in 18 additional and more descriptive budget lines. meaningful balanced package of spending and 19 20 accountability measures is a tribute to unity of this Council and our dedication to the people of New York. 21 2.2 We should all be proud of what we have accomplished 23 for Fiscal 2019. Before we move on, I'd also like to 24 acknowledge that none of this would have been 25 possible without the Administration's willingness to

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

partner with us and to negotiate in good faith. like to thank and congratulate Melanie Hartzog on her first budget as OMB Director, and I look forward to continuing to work with her over the next few years. Now, with all of that good news laid out, let's discuss the items that the Finance Committee will vote on today, which will actually make these great things a reality. Finance Committee members should have a budget packet that contains all budget related legislation that must be voted on by the committee and again by the full Council at the Stated Meeting. The packet also includes supporting schedules that are not vote on, but filed with the Committee as well as other non-budget related items that are being voted. I want to strongly emphasize that Finance Committee members will be given only one budget packet. So, after you vote on the packet items, you must bring your packet and all of its contents to the Stated Meeting to vote again. Council Members who are not on the Finance Committee will be given their budget packets at that Stated Meeting. A description of all of the items were emailed to you by the Committee Counsel Rebecca Chasen so I will simply list the items that are on the agenda today that

2 require a vote. The 1st item is Reso A for the Fiscal 2019 Capital Budget approving the schedule of 3 changes or the Capital Budget since the Executive 4 Budget including Council discretionary allocations. 5 The 2nd item is Reso B for the Fiscal 2019 Capital 6 7 Budget, which is approval of the Capital Budget as amended by Reso A. The 3<sup>rd</sup> item is the Resolution 8 adopting the Fiscal 2019 Contract Budget. The 4th 9 item is the Resolution adopting the Fiscal 2019 10 Expense Budget. The 5th item is the Resolution to 11 12 approve the Fourth Annual Amendment to the Five-Year Education Capital Plan. The 6th item is the 13 Resolution approving the 45<sup>th</sup> year of the Community 14 15 Development Program and the 44th year reallocations. The 7th, 8th and 9th items are the three property tax 16 17 rate fixing resolutions for Fiscal 2019. The 10th 18 item is the Resolution approving an expense budget modification for Fiscal 2018. The 11th item is the 19 20 Resolution approving a revenue budget modification for Fiscals 2018. The twelfth item is a transparency 21 resolution and the 13th through 16th items are land 2.2 23 use items. The other documents in your packet, which do not require a separate vote are a list of the 24 terms and conditions adopted for Fiscal 2019; 25

2

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

Schedule C and other supporting schedules, and the Borough President Proposed Capital Changes. As a reminder to members, Schedule C is a schedule of the expense and contract budgets and the appropriations for organizations listed in Schedule C on the Expense and Contract Budgets. Council Members will have to sign a disclosure form indicating whether or not a conflict exists with any of the groups listed in Schedule C or Reso A. If any Council member has a potential conflict or interest with any of the organizations included, he or she has the opportunity to disclose the conflict at the time of their vote. If you have not yet signed those disclosures form, staff from the General Counsel's Office are available to guide you through the process. So, pleas see ne of them before you vote. As a further reminder, please disclose any conflicts you may have with proposed subcontractors that are used by any of the organizations sponsored. These disclosures must be made before the subcontractor can be approved. will now speak briefly about the four Land Use Items and the Transparency Resolution. All four Land Use Items will receive property tax exemptions to preserve affordable housing units through the city's

2 HDFC program. They are as follows: Jamie's Place in Council Member Ayala's and Council Member Perkins' 3 districts, which will receive a partial 40-year 4 exemption to preserve 124 units. 215 Audubon Avenue 5 in Council Member Rodriguez's district, which will 6 7 receive a partial 36-year exemption to preserve 46 units. Mount Hope Renaissance in Council Member 8 Cabrera and Council Member Gibson's districts, which 9 will receive a full 40-year exemption to preserve 516 10 units and 1296 Sheraton Avenue in Council Member 11 12 Gibson's district, which will receive a partial 30year exemption to preserve 59 units. Representatives 13 14 from HPD are here to answer any questions we may have 15 on the Land Use items. Next, we have a transparency 16 resolution. This resolution sets forth new changes in the designation of certain organizations receiving 17 18 local, aging and youth discretionary funding as well as new changes in the designation of certain 19 20 organizations receiving funding pursuant to certain initiatives in the Budget. Organizations appearing 21 2.2 in the resolution that have not yet completed the 23 pre-qualification process conducted by the Mayor's Office of Contract Services, the Council or another 24 entity are identified in the attached charts with an 25

- 2 asterisk. As with all transparency resolutions,
- 3 Council Members will have to sign a disclosure form.
- 4 As previously stated, staff from the General
- 5 Counsel's Office is available to assist you with any
- 6 questions or concerns regarding disclosures. Those
- 7 are all of our items for today. We will not take
- 8 questions from members, and then I will have
- 9 Committee Clerk Billy Martin call the roll. Any
- 10 questions? Okay, we're good and, therefore, I'm
- 11 going to ask the clerk to call the roll.
- 12 CLERK: William Martin, Committee Clerk.
- 13 | Roll call vote Committee on Finance. All items are
- 14 | coupled. Chair Dromm.
- 15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I vote aye.
- 16 CLERK: Gibson.
- 17 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to
- 18 | explain my vote.
- 19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes.
- 20 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you so
- 21 | much, and good afternoon to all of my colleagues and
- 22 to our phenomenal Chair Danny Dromm in your first
- 23 | year serving as Finance Chair. I want to commend you
- 24 on an exceptional job well done, and I want to join
- 25 you in just expressing my admiration for the entire

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

Finance team led by Latonia McKinney, and all of our unit heads and our analysts, but as the Chair of the new Subcommittee on Capital, it's really been an honor working with all of you. We've spent countless hours together here at City Hall, and I've learned so much about the budget process, and the victory that you've talked about, the excess appropriations being rescinded and also stopping the front loading of capital commitments are really a testament to this City Council's priorities. It has never been this significant in terms of capital changes, and this subcommittee really set forth on a very clear agenda making sure that we were able to get these historic achievements. So, I want to thank you. I want to thank Rebecca. I want to thank Latonia and Regina, and Nathan for really helping me understand this process. I want to also thank Ayisha Wright for helping the Bronx Delegation, and as you alluded to, many of the programs that my district cares about are in this budget and for that I'm grateful. The Fair Fares, the Fair Student Funding, the School Accessibility, Summer Youth, which was personal priority, Summer SONY and COMPASS and Adult Literacy and ESAP and quidance counselors, the additional beds

for Runaway and Homeless Youth, funding really
affordable senior housing for seniors and more
supportive housing units, libraries and culturals,
and as you said, the list goes on and on. But I'm
truly grateful and I know that this budget is really
a reflection of New Yorkers' values, and we represent
all New Yorkers from all walks of life, and these
programs not only invest in their future, but they
really do make a difference. And so, it has been my
honor and privilege working with you on our first
budget together on the Finance team, and I really
want to thank all of my colleagues, certainly the
colleagues that were on the budget and negotiating
team. It wasn't easy making some really tough
decisions, but I feel good about the work we've done,
and now we can all go back to our districts and
celebrate all of the great success because we know
that only good thing will come. We have set tone in
this term that only better things will come. So,
congratulations and I proudly vote aye on the budget
and all the items on today's agenda including my
Article XIs, the Mount Hope Portfolio as well as 1296
Sheraton Avenue. I vote aye on all. Thank you.

25 CLERK: Cohen.

1 19 2 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: [off mic] Aye. 3 It's good. (sic) Aye. [laughter] 4 CLERK: Cornegy. 5 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I vote aye. 6 CLERK: Cumbo. 7 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission to 8 explain my vote. 9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes, Majority Leader. 10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I just simply want 11 to thank Chair Dromm as well as Chair Gibson on a 12 remarkable budget. We thank you so much for your 13 work and for this to be your first budget together 14 working together, you've done an extraordinary job, 15 and all of the work that we have done is going to 16 certainly benefit the City of New York in a major 17 way. So, I say congratulations and I vote aye. 18 [pause] And I am disclosing on the record of the Council proceedings that the New York City Department 19 20 of Education is funding in the budget we are adopting, and my sisters are employed as teachers 21

CLERK: Rosenthal.

with the Department of Education, and again, I vote

2.2

23

24

aye.

2	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I'd like to
3	add my name to the comments of my colleague. So, I
4	vote aye on all and I'm very-very privileged to be
5	working with you, Council Member Dromm and to Council
6	Member Gibson as well. Thank you.
7	CIEDV. Van Bramor

Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: [off mic]

9 Aye.

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

CLERK: Grodenchik.

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Permission to explain what's in front of me.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: It just happened, but we have to follow the rules, Mr. Chairman. I do want to associate myself with the remarks make by the leader of my-also my Subcommittee Ms. Gibson, and thank you. I don't know if you're phenomenal, but you're pretty damn good. So, that'sthat's a good start, and it's been a pleasure to work with you on this budget, and with everybody around this table, of course, our Speaker. I am disclosing on the record today of the Council proceedings that Queens College is funded in this budget we are

## COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2.2

2 adopting and my son is a newly enrolled student at 3 Queens College, and I thank you and I vote aye.

CLERK: Adams.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: [off mic] I
6 proudly vote aye.

CLERK: Moya.

COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I vote aye.

CLERK: Powers.

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you.

Permission to explain my vote?

CLERK: Yes.

One second. I just wanted to congratulate Chair
Dromm and Chair Gibson as well for a fantastic job on
this budget and for sitting through hours and hours
and days really of meetings and—and getting us to a
place as a Council where we have a budget we can be
very proud of that. I wanted to just note one or two
things, which is that there are a few items in this
budget that really reflect the public coming before
this council and making a case for certain items. I
know the school accessibility money was something
that came up in the public testimony, and the Speaker
and the Chair of the Finance Committee felt very

## COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2.2

moved by that public testimony, and—and we did make an allocation for money to improve accessibility. Fair Fares, those stories we heard on and on and on. So, I am-I am very proud that the public had a-an important part of the discussion in this debate. I will be proudly voting aye. I also am disclosing on the record today that I-we are allocating money to Mount Sinai, and my mother is an employee of Mount Sinai currently. With that public disclosure, I proudly vote aye. 

CLERK: Matteo.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: May I be excused to explain my vote?

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes, sir.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Thank you. Thank you, Mr. Chair. Thank you my colleagues. I want to start by thanking the wonderful Finance staff. I know it's been said, but I've been in this building since 2004. As a staff member, I worked with a lot of you, and as an elected official I really, really appreciate the time and the effort that you all put into this. So, for me personally on behalf of my constituents, and my staff, I know we can be a pain on our stuff, but thank you. Thank you so much to—

2 to-to staff. I have four kids so I have to mention a few conflicts of interest. So, I'm disclosing that 3 4 my kids go to Susan Wagner High School and we are 5 funding it. My brother works at Richmond University 6 Medical Center, and we are also funding that. Two of 7 my kids are in the Summer Youth Employment Program, and my youngest is attending PS30, which we are also 8 funding. As for the budget, I'm going to be voting 9 no on Preconsidered Resolutions 397, 398, 408 and 10 M64. These are the resolutions the Council pass 11 12 every year. So, the property tax revenue and every year property taxes grow faster than the average 13 14 homeowner's ability to pay them. This is the fifth 15 budget I have voted on since I came into office, and 16 since the first one, property taxes has risen more 17 than 30%. That is more than three times the rate of 18 inflation. With the rate, household incomes have increased during that period, and it is exactly why I 19 20 felt it was so critical to include a property tax rebate in this budget. At a time when the city's 21 2.2 economy is thriving and revenues are soaring, I think 23 we missed an opportunity to help so many families 24 that are struggling to make ends meet. With that 25 said, I am grateful that despite the fact that we

often have very different ideas, about what the		
city's budget priorities should be, Speaker Johnson		
and many of my colleagues here today fought with me		
for this rebate, and also share my ultimate goal of		
bringing more fairness to the city's inequitable and		
arcane property tax system. I will keep fighting for		
property tax relief, and I can only hope next year we		
can work together and find a way to make it happen.		
I am pleased that we were able to work together to		
significantly increase our budget reserves. So we		
will be better prepared for an economic downturn, and		
I am once again grateful to the Speaker for working		
with me to fund projects and initiatives that will		
improve the lives of the residents of Staten Island.		
So, once again I'm voting no on Preconsidered		
Resolutions 397, 398, 408 and M64 and age on the		
rest.		

CLERK: Lancman.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: I would vote aye, and let me disclose on the record that the Young Israel of Hillcrest is funded in this budget, and I am associated with this entity. I'm a congregant.

CLERK: By a vote of 13 in the affirmative 0 in the negative--

## COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2	CHAIRPERSON DROMM: [interposing] Do you
3	want to comment Council Member Cornegy before the
4	vote?

COUNCIL MEMBER Yes.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay.

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I'm sorry. So,

I'm disclosing on the record of the Council

Proceedings today the New York City Department of

Education is funded in the Budget. I have six

children who graduated and gone on to be very

productive citizens. I have one graduating today.

So, I'll be left with two in the system so
[cheers/applause]

affirmative, 0 in the negative and no abstentions, all items are adopted with the exceptions of Resolutions 397, 398 and M64 with Resolution 408 have been adopted by the Committee 12 in the affirmative, 1 in the negative and no abstentions.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much and with that, this meeting is adjourned at 2:08 in the afternoon. We will now meet in the Chambers for the Stated Meeting. [gavel]

2.2

## ${\tt C} \ {\tt E} \ {\tt R} \ {\tt T} \ {\tt I} \ {\tt F} \ {\tt I} \ {\tt C} \ {\tt A} \ {\tt T} \ {\tt E}$

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date July 10, 2018