

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

----- X

May 23, 2018
Start: 9:38 a.m.
Recess: 11:00 a.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: DANIEL DROMM
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- ADRIENNE E. ADAMS
- ANDREW COHEN
- ROBERT E. CORNEGY, JR.
- LAURIE A. CUMBO
- VANESSA L. GIBSON
- BARRY S. GRODENCHIK
- RORY I. LANCMAN
- STEVE MATTEO
- FRANCISCO P. MOYA
- KEITH POWERS
- HELEN K. ROSENTHAL
- JAMES G. VAN BRAMER

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Mary Bruch
Associate at Nixon Peabody LLP

Jonathan Hogstad
Member of SEIU Local Union 32 BJ

Alex Hecht
Member of SEIU Local Union 32 BJ

Will Rajas
Member of SEIU Local Union 32 BJ

Ron Wade
Member of SEIU Local Union 32 BJ

Suzanne Con
Member of SEIU Local Union 32 BJ

Cabella Vasquez
Member of SEIU Local Union 32 BJ

Rairis Martins
Member of SEIU Local Union 32 BJ

Prunie Leon
Member of SEIU Local Union 32 BJ

Alina Kareem
Member of SEIU Local Union 32 BJ

Eugenia Kim
Member of SEIU Local Union 32 BJ

Phoebe Shell
Member of SEIU Local Union 32 BJ

Liz Boyd
Member of SEIU Local Union 32 BJ

Monica Cruz
Member of SEIU Local Union 32 BJ

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Good morning and welcome to today's finance committee meeting. My name is Council Member Daniel Dromm and I'm the Chair of committee. We've been joined today by Council Member Helen Rosenthal, Council Member Adrienne Adams, Council Member Keith Powers, Council Member Barry Grodenchik, and Council Member Steve Matteo. Today the committee will be voting on 11 items. Intro 882 relating to the commercial rent tax, three resolutions relating to the banking commission's recommendation on interest rates and seven article 11 property tax exemptions. Let's start with Intro 882 introduced by request of the Mayor which would change the initial date of eligibility for the small business tax credit against the commercial rent tax. Last session the council approved Local Law 254 of 2017 which created.. which created a credit against the CRT that was to be provided to small businesses earning less than 20 million dollars per year and that paid less than 550,000 dollars annually in rent beginning on July 1st, 2018. At the time the bill was negotiated over the council's objections the administration insisted that the start of the credit

1
2 would be aligned with the fiscal year rather than the
3 CR tax year which runs from June 1st through May 31st.
4 For purposes of administrative ease and to avoid tax
5 credit confusion the administration has now come
6 around to the council's position and is requesting
7 that we move the initial date of eligibility to June
8 1st, 2018, the start of the next CRT tax year. Next,
9 we have the resolutions that would set certain
10 interest rates for fiscal 2019. Every year the
11 banking commission provides recommendations to the
12 council relating to the discount received by property
13 owners who pay their property taxes early and the
14 interest rates paid property owners who pay their
15 property taxes late. For fiscal 2019 the banking
16 commission has made the following recommendations; a
17 one-half percent discount rate for those who pay
18 their property taxes early, a seven percent interest
19 rate for the late payment of property taxes on
20 properties with an assessed value of 250,000 dollars
21 or less which is approximately 95 percent of all
22 property in the city and an 18 percent interest rate
23 for the late payment of property taxes on properties
24 with an assessed value of more than 250,000 dollars.
25 After careful consideration the banking commission's

1
2 submission to the council, the council is
3 recommending that the interest rates be approved as
4 set forth by the banking commission's
5 recommendations. As per state law the interest rates
6 for the late payment of water and sewer bills will
7 match the rates set for the late payment of property
8 taxes. A representative of the banking commission is
9 here to answer any questions that we may have on the
10 interest rates. Last, we have the Land Use Items. The
11 first is Essie Jeffries Apartments in Council Member
12 Levine's district in Manhattan which will provide a
13 full 40-year Article 11 tax exemption to support the
14 preservation of 64 units of affordable housing. The
15 second is Inwood House in Council Member Rodrigues's
16 district in Manhattan which would provide a partial
17 40-year Article 11 tax exemption to support the
18 preservation of 94 units of affordable rental
19 housing. The third is Rockaway Village in Council
20 Member Richard's district in Queens which would
21 provide a full 40-year Article 11 tax exemption to
22 support the construction of 457 units of affordable
23 rental housing. The remaining four items are in
24 Council Member Salamanca's district in the Bronx and
25 they are Lafayette Morrison which would provide a 32-

1
2 year Article 11 tax exemption part of which would be
3 full and retroactive and part of which would be
4 partial moving forward to preserve 900 units of
5 affordable rental housing. 1314 Seneca Avenue which
6 would provide a partial 40-year Article 11 tax
7 exemption to support the preservation of 59 units of
8 affordable rental housing. Aquinas Deacon Juan Santos
9 which would amend a prior resolution approving an
10 Article 11 tax exemption that the council approved in
11 May 2015 to correct certain technical errors and 943
12 to 947 Teller Avenue which would amend a prior
13 resolution approving an Article 11 tax exemption that
14 the council approved in December 2016 to extend the
15 length of the tax exemption from 35 years to 40
16 years. Each of the council members are supportive of
17 the projects in their districts, representatives from
18 HPD are here to answer any questions that we may have
19 on any of the land use items. Those are all of
20 today's items. Are there any questions? Uh-huh.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Chair Dromm I
22 want to thank you for all this. I just want to note,
23 I guess I could have saved this for the vote but
24 appreciation to the staff for going through the
25 interest rate information and appreciation to the

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Department of Finance and the banking commission for, you know providing the information to the council. This is I think the second year that we've had the information and it encouraged a very robust debate among the council members and the increased awareness of the... of the details and so I really just want to thank you for that and thank the council and the staff in particular for bearing with all the questions that it evoked. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you very much. Now we are going to hear some testimony on some of the legislation and I'm going to call people up in panels and I just want to remind everyone that they are limited to two minutes a piece and first we're going to hear from Mary Bruch from Nixon Peabody. Just hit that button.

MARY BRUCH: I'm here just to testify on the Article 11 for Inwood Houses not on the proposed...

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: For what?

MARY BRUCH: For... I'm here to testify on an Article 11 just if there are any questions from the city council for Inwood Houses, I believe that's further down in the list.

1

2

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Are you hear to... so,
3 that's fine, I couldn't hear you, I'm sorry, it's a
4 little echoey in here..

5

MARY BRUCH: Oh, sorry Council Member..

6

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, are you here to
7 answer questions or to give testimony?

8

MARY BRUCH: Just to answer questions if
9 there... [cross-talk]

10

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, so the... [cross-
11 talk]

12

MARY BRUCH: ...are any... [cross-talk]

13

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: ...so you're not giving
14 testimony?

15

MARY BRUCH: No.

16

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, so then we... you
17 don't need to be seated then.

18

MARY BRUCH: Okay, thank you.

19

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Alright, any
20 questions on that? Alright, now I'm going to call up
21 other people who are here today. The first one is
22 Jonathan Hogstad. I believe, okay; Alex Hecht, 32 BJ;
23 Phoebe Shell, 32 BJ; Ron Wade, 32 BJ and can we get
24 another chair Sergeant and Will Rojas... or Rajas, 32

25

1
2 BJ. Okay and we have been joined by Council Member
3 Gibson, Cumbo and Cohen.

4 [off-mic dialogue]

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, would you like
6 to start?

7 JONATHAN HOGSTAD: Yeah, my name is
8 Jonathan Hogstad, I am a... I'm with SEIU Local 32 BJ.
9 We have been engaging Phipps Houses for over two
10 years now. When Phipps Houses workers came to us
11 workers were dealing with issues of homelessness,
12 most workers were on Medicaid. I'm going to read from
13 the op ed of one of the workers that couldn't be here
14 who's work... living in a homeless shelter for years
15 with his daughters while working at, at Phipps Houses
16 suppose... nonprofit, mission driven organization. So,
17 this is from Carmelo Dejesus. Every day for the past
18 four years I've woken up with the same thought, is
19 this the week that my girls and I will finally have a
20 home of our own. I'm the father of three daughters
21 who are 24, 18 and 14 and the grandfather of a nine-
22 month-old baby, baby girl. We have been living in a
23 homeless shelter in the Bronx for the last three
24 years. For the last two years I've worked as a porter
25 doing cleaning and some very basic repairs at an

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

1
2 affordable housing complex called Courtlandt Corners
3 that was developed by Phipps Houses, a nonprofit
4 affordable housing developer in the Bronx. Still I've
5 not been able to get my family out of the shelter.
6 Living in a shelter and working in an affordable
7 housing complex I know that many New Yorkers struggle
8 to find affordable housing, housing. I have learned
9 that what counts as affordable housing is only
10 affordable if you have a good job. I take a lot of
11 pride in my job and I like the people I work with,
12 but I do not make enough to find decent affordable
13 housing for my family of five. In fact, I learn way
14 too... I earn way too little working at Courtlandt
15 Corners to afford an apartment there that's because
16 my employer only pays me 13 an hour. when I started
17 in June of 2015 I was only making \$11.50 an hour but
18 less than a year later I was promoted to lead porter
19 and I got a \$1.50 raise, I still don't receive any
20 meaningful benefits, this was in last year. This is
21 not enough for us to get by, my girls are relying on
22 me, my paycheck isn't enough to cover food, diapers
23 and rent on a decent apartment for five people. With
24 no meaningful health benefits at my job we also have
25 to rely on Medicaid for our health care. My daughters

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

1
2 have big dreams, the youngest two love animals and
3 both dream of going to college and becoming
4 veterinarians, I wonder how I will help them pay for
5 college. They also dream that we'll move into an
6 apartment of our own where we can... where they can
7 have a pet, maybe a bunny or a dog but right now even
8 a small thing like a pet feels completely out of
9 reach. It doesn't feel good to work so hard for so
10 little. When I first heard about this job I jumped on
11 it quick because it was close to where I live, and I
12 thought it would be a good job that would get us out
13 of the shelter soon. I really like the idea of
14 working in a place where I can help other working
15 families like my own have a nice place to live. The
16 company even says that it works towards a New York
17 City in which no one is caught in a cycle of poverty
18 but here I am almost two years later working in one
19 of their developments, my family and I are trapped in
20 a cycle of poverty and homelessness that we can't get
21 out of unless I earn higher wages and better
22 benefits. My coworkers and I recently joined together
23 to fight for better jobs at Courtlandt Corners. I'm
24 optimistic that we'll be able to get higher wages
25 with regular increases, good health insurance and

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 retirement benefits and access to training that will
3 allow me to advance in my career. We're asking Phipps
4 Houses to commit to being a responsible developer and
5 making sure they're creating good jobs. I want this
6 for my side of Courtlandt Corners and I want it for
7 other workers in the Bronx and throughout the city
8 who are also struggling to make ends meet. This is
9 the way that we can break the cycle of poverty and
10 provide a bright future to our kids and grandkids.
11 Carmelo Dejesus, Porter at Phipps Houses in the
12 Bronx.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you, next
14 please.

15 ALEX HECHT: Good morning chair Dromm and
16 members of the Finance Committee. My name is Alex
17 Hecht, I'm here with SEIU Local 32 BJ and I'd like to
18 read into the record an open letter from Bronx
19 elected officials to Phipps Houses CEO, Adam
20 Weinstein. Dear Mr. Weinstein, we elected officials
21 representing the Borough of the Bronx are writing to
22 you to express our concerns about Phipps Houses
23 recent actions in our borough. Phipps Houses has a
24 long and valued history of building high quality,
25 affordable housing for our constituents that's why

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

1
2 we've been so alarmed to hear from another long-term
3 partner in the responsible development of the Bronx,
4 32 BJ SEIU that Phipps has been undermining job
5 standards for building service workers. At the
6 largest of Phipps Houses, Newark Complexes in the
7 Bronx, workers have struggled for years to get by on
8 wages as low as \$11.79 an hour. Many have relied on
9 Medicaid for themselves and their families with no
10 meaningful health coverage or retirement benefits
11 from their employer. One worker spent years living in
12 a homeless shelter while working in the building. In
13 fact, Phipps Houses receives significant government
14 subsidies, these subsidies assume that Phipps will
15 use tax payer's money responsibly. When workers are
16 struggling to support their families while Phipps CEO
17 brings home more than three quarters of a million
18 dollars a year in total compensation. Phipps violates
19 the trust of taxpayers and their representatives. Our
20 borough is in the midst of a building boom and an
21 affordable housing crisis. We've been working hard to
22 ensure that the new developments in the Bronx include
23 significant amounts of affordable housing, but we
24 also need good jobs. Building service workers have
25 fought hard to establish a wage and benefit rate that

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 allows them to support a family in the Bronx, we're
3 calling on you Phipps Houses to return to your
4 organization's roots and ensure that across the Bronx
5 workers earn family sustaining wages and benefits.

6 Sincerely Rafael Salamanca, Andy Cohen, Fernando
7 Cabrera, Ritchie Torres, Andy King, Louie Seplivata,
8 Carmen Aroyal, Jose Rivera, Latoya Joiner, Mark
9 Gjonaj, Jamal Bailey, Ruben Diaz Senior, and Jose
10 Serrado Junior. Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much,
12 next please.

13 WILL RAJAS: Good morning, my name is
14 Will Rojas. I'm reading a statement that 32 BJ made
15 in July regarding the Rockaway Village development.
16 We still believe this is true. As you have heard we
17 think this rezoning can do a lot of good for the
18 neighborhood, but we have been concerned to hear that
19 the rezoning may be facilitating a deal to put the
20 largest parcel, the site to be designed as an urban
21 renewal area directly in the hands of Phipps Houses
22 instead of going through an open transparent
23 competitive process. 32 BJ believes that any
24 developer in the DFR URA should be selected through a
25 transparent process. Such a process would guarantee..

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

1
2 such a process would be guaranteed if the city
3 purchased the land either through a negotiated sale
4 or through imminent... through eminent domain. Once the
5 city acquires the land it will have to follow the
6 public ULURP process to subsequently dispose of it to
7 a developer. At that point there would be opportunity
8 for public input and, and for stakeholders to weigh
9 in on the track records and plans of the applicant
10 seeking to develop the site. If the city does not
11 intend to acquire the land it can still guarantee an
12 open process for the selection of the develop... of a
13 developer. Once the site is, is designated as an
14 urban renewal area the city will have the ability and
15 responsibility to intervene to implement its urban
16 renewal plan. This plan should include a commitment
17 to transparency and community input in the selection
18 of developers through a competitive process. The Far
19 Rockaway community deserves a chance to weigh in on
20 who will develop this enormous parcel which has the
21 capacity to be a tremendous resource for the
22 community. 32 BJ does not believe Phipps would be
23 selected to develop this site through a more open
24 process. In recent years Phipps has undermined job
25 standards for building service workers in New York

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 City. The DFR URA offer... area offers a unique
3 opportunity to create good jobs and affordable
4 housing for Far Rockaway residents on a large scale.
5 An open process would allow the community to
6 prioritize selecting a developer committed to the
7 creation of both quality jobs and quality affordable
8 housing.

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you, next
10 please.

11 PHOEBE SHELL: I'm here from 32 BJ to
12 read another letter into the record... into the record
13 signed by 24 elected officials to deliver a message
14 to Phipps CEO, Adam Weinstein. Dear Mr. Weinstein, we
15 write to you as members of the New York City council
16 to express our concerns about Phipps Houses recent
17 record. New York City is in the midst of an
18 affordable housing crisis that we need to come
19 together to help solve. As one of the largest
20 developers of affordable housing in this city, Phipps
21 has a crucial role to play but Phipps can't play this
22 role if the building service jobs at it's affiliated
23 buildings pay poverty wages. We have been alarmed to
24 hear that at newer Phipps buildings workers have been
25 struggling to make ends meet and find housing. At

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

1
2 Phipps two most prominent new complexes in the Bronx
3 Courtlandt Corners and Via Verde, workers are
4 struggling to get by. For years many workers at
5 Courtlandt Corners made under 12 dollars an hour and
6 received no meaningful health and retirement
7 benefits. Many relied on Medicaid for health coverage
8 for themselves and their families and one worker
9 spent years living in a homeless shelter while
10 working at the building. The same irresponsible
11 contractor who employed these workers at Courtlandt
12 Corners continues to employ workers at Via Verde
13 where workers face similar low wages, as little as
14 \$12.65 an hour and unaffordable health insurance
15 offers. Meanwhile executive compensation has soared.
16 New York's housing crisis stems not just from rising
17 housing prices but also from employers that pay
18 poverty wages. To be a real partner with this city
19 Phipps must commit to addressing both sides of this
20 crisis. We are calling on you to return to your
21 organization's roots and ensure that across the city
22 building service workers at Phipps affiliated
23 buildings earn family sustaining wages and benefits
24 that allow them to continue to call New York City
25 home. Thank you.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you, next
3 please.

4 RON WADE: Yes, good morning. My name is
5 Ron Wade, I'm a member of SEIU 32 BJ executive board.
6 As you know 32 BJ members maintain, clean and provide
7 security services in residential buildings all across
8 the five boroughs including ones like the proposed
9 development at 1675 Westchester. Throughout... through
10 our jobs we receive access to high quality health
11 care and can save for retirement. I believe that all
12 workers in New York should have the same opportunity,
13 this is why I'm here today. The way workers are
14 treated at Phipps buildings across the city vary
15 significantly. In a number of their existing
16 properties, Phipps has created high quality building
17 service jobs for workers like me at these buildings.
18 Phipps ensures supers, porters and handypersons
19 receive family sustaining salaries, good health and
20 retirement benefits but at other more recent opened
21 Phipps buildings building service workers report
22 making wages well below their area standard with
23 receiving no meaningful benefits. We know one worker
24 who lived with his family in a shelter for five years
25 while working at a Phipps building. I know how hard

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 it is to work for people who like to make it in this
3 city. As housing prices have risen my union brothers
4 and sisters have struggled to stay in their homes,
5 thanks to our union jobs we are able to do that, but
6 I can't imagine how I would be able to keep my family
7 here if I had to pay out of pocket for health
8 insurance, I definitely would not be able to save for
9 retirement. 32 BJ members know how important it is
10 for affordable housing developments can build.. be in
11 our city but it's not helpful if the job they create
12 as to the housing crisis instead of helping to solve
13 it. We wanted to work with Phipps to make sure that
14 employment practices at their buildings to help
15 further their mission instead of undermining it but
16 if Phipps isn't committed to this we do.. we don't
17 think the City Planning Commission should support
18 their project. Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much
20 and thank you to this panel for coming in and for
21 giving your testimony. I'm going to call the panel up
22 and then we'll make comments at the end. Thank you.
23 So, the next panel would be Suzanne Con from 32 BJ;
24 Eugenia Kim, 32 BJ; Carmela Vasquez, 32 BJ; Monica
25 Cruz, 32 BJ. And I'll also do Trey Allen, 32 BJ.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 We're missing a few people on the panel, Suzanne Con,
3 okay; Eugenia Kim, okay; Carmela Vasquez, okay;
4 Monica Cruz, okay; Trey Allen, is that... Tyrae, I'm
5 sorry, is it Ty... Tyrae? Okay, so we just got to make
6 sure we have the, the forms correct here. Alright and
7 what's your name ma'am?

8 [off-mic dialogue]

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I'm sorry, I can't...
10 can you put the mic on?

11 PRUNIE LEON: I'm sorry, my name is
12 Prunie [sp?] Leon.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I know you. Okay, so
14 one, two, three, four and we can bring up one person.
15 Okay, Rairis Martins, R a I r I s, okay. We'll...
16 they'll give them another chance if... when they come
17 back, Lori Garcia, okay so let's do Eugenia then.
18 Okay. Alright, would you like to start?

19 SUZANNE CON: Good morning. My name is
20 Suzanne, I'm here to speak about the Article 11, Far
21 Rockaway Village. Good quality building service jobs
22 are a pathway to the middle class for many New
23 Yorkers, SEIU 32 BJ, the largest property service
24 workers union in the country represents 80,000
25 building service workers in New York City. We have

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

1
2 fought hard for an industry standard wage and
3 benefits package that allows building service workers
4 to raise families in this city. All 32 BJ members
5 receive a family sustaining wage and benefits that
6 include employer paid health care along with the
7 guaranteed benefit retirement pension plan, a 401K
8 and access to continuing education and legal
9 services. We believe these are the kinds of jobs that
10 foster prosperous local economies, and these are the
11 kinds of jobs that Far Rockaway needs and that can be
12 created at Rockaway Village. Unfortunately, these are
13 not the kinds of jobs that have been created at
14 Phipps Complexes in recent years. For years Phipps
15 seemed to recognize that it helped New Yorkers build
16 strong communities not only by constructing
17 affordable housing but also by ensuring all Phipps
18 affiliated entities created good jobs for building
19 service workers but Phipps commitment to good jobs
20 has faltered under the leadership of its current CEO,
21 Adam Weinstein. We know that workers at many of
22 Phipps older buildings even buildings not represented
23 by 32 BJ earn family sustaining wages. At Weinstein
24 area affiliated buildings however, we have met
25 workers who bring home only poverty wages. For

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

1
2 example since August 2016 SEIU 32 BJ has been working
3 with employees at Phipps Courtlandt Corners complex
4 in the Bronx who have come together to improve their
5 wages and benefits at Courtlandt Corners when we
6 started working with the workers they were making
7 only poverty wages and receiving no meaningful
8 benefits, they had... many had been making as little as
9 \$11.78 an hour for over three years and had received
10 only a single raise since being hired, many were...
11 rely on Medicaid and as you already heard one was
12 living in a shelter. As a nonprofit affordable
13 housing developer Phipps receives significant
14 subsidies from New York City these subsidies assume
15 that Phipps will use taxpayer money responsible yet
16 while workers have struggled to get by at Courtlandt
17 Corners the pay Phipps top, top executives have grown
18 quickly. So, in... yeah, in conclusion a developer
19 who's allowed poverty jobs to be created in the
20 buildings... in build... it's buildings runs counter to
21 the goals of the New York City Housing... or the
22 Housing New York Plan and we don't think they should
23 continue to get city subsidies.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: How much does the
25 executive make?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 SUZANNE CON: According to the 2015 990
3 which is the most recent available to us it was over
4 800,000 a year.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: 800,000 dollars...
6 [cross-talk]

7 SUZANNE CON: In total compensation,
8 yeah.

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Wow, 800,000 dollars,
10 unbelievable.

11 CABELLA VASQUEZ: Good morning, my name is
12 Cabella Vasquez and I'm a representative of 32 BJ.
13 I'll be reading on behalf of worker Carmelo Dejesus.
14 Hi everyone, I'm Carmelo Dejesus, I'm a lifelong New
15 Yorker, a porter at Phipps development, a father and
16 a grandfather, I also live in a shelter. I have been
17 at my job for the last two years, when I got the job
18 I was living in a shelter with my three girls for
19 almost a year. I jumped at the chance because I
20 thought it would help me get us into our own home.
21 When I started I was making only \$11.50 an hour, when
22 I got a promotion... then I got a promotion and now I
23 make 13 dollars an hour. I still haven't been... it
24 still hasn't been enough to get us out of the
25 shelter. I'm supporting five people; my daughters,

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 myself and my baby granddaughter on my salary, that's
3 not easy. My two youngest daughters are in high
4 school, my paycheck isn't enough to cover food,
5 diapers, and rent on a decent apartment for five
6 people. With no meaningful health benefits at my job
7 we also have to rely on Medicaid for our healthcare.
8 I started working with 32 BJ because my daughters and
9 I have dreams. My daughters want to go to college and
10 become veterinarians, before that they want to move
11 into an apartment where we can have a pet, I want
12 that for them and I also want to be sure that when I
13 go I leave something behind for them. I'm hopeful
14 that things are changing for me, but I want to make
15 sure that other workers don't go through what I have
16 been through. Phipps should commit to creating good
17 jobs at this development before it goes up otherwise
18 more workers will get stuck like my family did. Thank
19 you.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much,
21 next please.

22 MONICA CRUZ: I'm Monica Cruz, my union
23 32 BJ... New York about Phipps an irresponsible
24 developer for over two years. I'm going to read from
25 a petition that community have signed to support good

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

1
2 jobs at Phipps House. Phipps House is currently
3 seeking approval for two proposed developments in the
4 Bronx that require their purported property to, to be
5 rezoned. We believe that in recent years Phipps House
6 has done a disservice to our communities by creating
7 bad jobs in the Bronx going so far as to work with a
8 contractor that pays employees of Phipps affiliated
9 complex poverty wage and not meaningful benefits
10 meanwhile in the last decade the salary increased for
11 top executive have ballooned, CEO, Adam Weinstein
12 receives 760,000 in total compensation in 2015 while
13 workers at Phipps affiliated complexes built under
14 his leadership struggle to make ends meet many of
15 them resorting to medical Medicaid or other insurance
16 to care for their family's health. We believe this is
17 unacceptable behavior on the prior developer that
18 receives significant subsidy from New York and for
19 good.. federal income taxes through their 501 status
20 while benefitting from taxpayer's dollars. Phipps
21 House has a moral obligation to ensure those dollars
22 are well spent. We urge the council members
23 Salamanca, Council Member Palma and all our
24 representatives in New York City and in state
25 government to oppose Phipps plans in the Bronx only..

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 if commit to creating high quality jobs as all it's
3 new developments, the Bronx needs affordable housing
4 and good jobs, the city should only work with
5 developers who are committed to creating both. Thank
6 you.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much,
8 next.

9 PRUNIE LEON: Yes, good morning. My name
10 is Prunie Leon and I want to say to you that I have
11 worked as a porter in the Bronx for the last five
12 years. During that time, I have also been a member of
13 32 BJ. The good wages and benefits that I get through
14 my job have helped me to support my family. For my...
15 for me being a union member has also made an
16 opportunity for advancement. Through the union I also
17 get to take all sorts of classes to improve my skills
18 on the job. Those courses have helped me to advance
19 in my job, I think that all workers should have
20 opportunities that is why I am here today. I know how
21 hard it is for working people to make it... to make it
22 in this city... to make it decent in the city. It is
23 important that affordable housing developer can build
24 in our city, but it is not helpful if the jobs they
25 are creating add to the housing crisis instead or

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

1
2 helping to solve it. all workers deserve the
3 opportunity to... the opportunity I have had, there is
4 no reason that workers doing the same job that I do
5 should earn good wages and benefits. 32 BJs want to
6 work with Phipps to make sure that the jobs at their
7 buildings help further the mission if that's all...
8 undermining it but if Phipps is not committed to this
9 we don't think the project should be moved forward,
10 we all as a community and we should be moving
11 forward. Thank you.

12 EUGENIA KIM: Hi, good morning. My name
13 is Eugenia Kim, I'm a member of SEIU 32 BJ and as you
14 know 32 B, BJ members maintain clean and provide
15 security services at various residential buildings
16 throughout the five boroughs including some at
17 Phipps. Through our jobs we receive access to high
18 quality health care, we... and we're able to save for
19 retirement, I believe that all workers in New York
20 should have the same opportunities and that's why I'm
21 here today. The way workers are treated at Phipps
22 buildings across the city varies greatly, the number...
23 in a number of it's existing properties Phipps has
24 created some high-quality building service jobs for
25 workers, certain porters, supers and handy persons

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

1
2 receive family sustaining salaries and good health
3 care but at other more recently opened Phipps sites
4 and developments they're making wages well below the
5 area standard and receiving no meaningful benefits.
6 We know one worker who has lived in a family shelter
7 for years while working in a Phipps building and I
8 believe that's unacceptable. I know how hard it is
9 for working people to make it in this city. As
10 housing prices have risen, union brothers and sisters
11 have struggled to stay in their homes. Thanks to our
12 union jobs however we're able to do that but I can't
13 imagine how I'd be able to keep... how families are
14 able to stay here while having to pay out of pocket
15 for health insurance and no meaningful chance to save
16 for their future. I definitely want to be able to do
17 that and provide for my family members one day. 32 BJ
18 and members know how important it is that affordable
19 housing developers should be able to build in this
20 city but also it is not helpful when the jobs they
21 created and add, add to the housing crisis. Instead
22 we want to work to help solve it. in order for Phipps
23 to build sustainably and develop... and develop in a
24 way that is responsible we believe that they should

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 have good wages and good retirement savings benefits.

3 Thank you so much.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much
5 and thank you to this panel, I think it's absolutely
6 disgusting that the director is making close to
7 800,000 dollars and that some of your workers
8 actually have to live in shelters, it's just totally
9 unacceptable. Thank you, we're going to call up
10 another panel.

11 [panel thanks chair]

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Lori Garcia, Ariatha
13 Roma [sp?], Carlos Warsuk [sp?], Fran, Fran Strite
14 [sp?] and Liz Boyd. Okay, so can you just give me
15 your names? Lori Garcia and, and... okay, let's go to
16 the other panel... okay. Alina Kareem, nope; Rairis
17 Martins and Tyrae Allen, T R... t y r a e, okay then
18 that appears to be... yeah, would you like to start,
19 okay?

20 EUGENIA KIM: Sure. Good morning. I'll be
21 reading from a petition from Kips Bay building
22 service workers demanding Phipps Houses sell
23 responsibly. Phipps Houses has announced plans to put
24 Kips Bay Court on the market. Press reports estimate
25 that Phipps could make as much as 700 million through

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

1
2 this sale. We, the building service workers at Kips
3 Bay Court currently have good union jobs that pay a
4 family sustaining wage and provide health and
5 retirement benefits. In recent years workers with
6 good job... good union jobs have found that when a
7 building is sold the new owners sometimes fail to
8 retain the income... building service workers or
9 maintain the worker's wages and benefits. We're
10 asking that Phipps commit to finding a buyer who is
11 committed to maintaining a high quality.. sorry, high
12 quality, union building service jobs as well as the
13 building services that are important to Kips Bay
14 tenants and workers. We demand that Phipps Houses
15 sell Kips Bay Court to a responsible owner and this
16 petition is signed by... I don't have an exact number
17 but pages and pages and pages of workers and tenants.
18 Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Do you have a copy of
20 that?

21 [off-mic dialogue]

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yeah, I'd love to
23 just have that because that's good testimony to...

24 EUGENIA KIM: Thank you.
25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes, yep. I'm sorry
3 Keith... Council Member Keith Powers.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: And I, I don't
5 actually represent Kips Bay Towers but I represent
6 the area just adjacent to it and nearby and walk past
7 every single day and certainly care about the people
8 that are working there and the jobs there so I'll,
9 I'll certainly have to talk to the local member about
10 it as well but certainly support ensuring that in any
11 sale the jobs are, are preserved that are good paying
12 jobs and that a new buyer is committed to maintaining
13 those jobs so I'll talk to... I'll talk to your folks
14 after about any way to be supportive to that and
15 something I care about in any sale as well. So, thank
16 you for bringing that up.

17 EUGENIA KIM: Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, would you like
19 to start?

20 LIZ BOYD: Sure. Good morning, my name is
21 Liz and I'm here with SEIU Local 32 BJ. As you know
22 Phipps Houses is the largest affordable housing
23 nonprofit developer in the city. It has a stated
24 mission of helping the people of New York City build
25 healthy more prosperous communities, but we know that

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 some workers in Phipps buildings in the Bronx are not
3 prospering. Workers at Phipps complexes are relying
4 on Medicaid for health care and one lived in a
5 shelter, this isn't right. 32 BJ members know how
6 important it is that affordable housing developers
7 can build in our city but it's not helpful if the
8 jobs they create add to the housing crisis instead of
9 helping to solve it. We want to work with Phipps and
10 other developers to make sure that employment
11 practices at their buildings help further their
12 mission instead of undermining it but if developers
13 aren't committed to this we don't think the council
14 should support their projects. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much
16 and I see we have been joined at the table by another
17 person, can you identify yourself for the record
18 please?

19 [off-mic dialogue]

20 ALINA KAREEM: Good morning. My name is
21 Alina Kareem and I'm a researcher from SEIU Local 32
22 BJ. 32 BJ members maintain, clean and provide
23 security services in residential buildings all across
24 the five boroughs. Through their jobs they receive
25 access to high quality health care and can save for

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

1
2 retirement. I believe that all workers in New York
3 should have the same opportunities, this is why I'm
4 here today. The way workers are treated at Phipps
5 buildings across the city vary significantly. In a
6 number of it's existing properties Phipps has created
7 high quality building service jobs for workers and at
8 these buildings Phipps ensures supers, porters,
9 handypersons... gives them family sustaining wages,
10 good health and retirement benefits but at other
11 Phipps buildings building service workers report
12 making wages well below the area standard while
13 receiving no meaningful benefits. I know how hard it
14 is for working people to make it in this city. As
15 housing prices have risen, my union brothers and
16 sisters have struggled to stay in their homes. Thanks
17 to union jobs they're able to do that but I can't
18 imagine how they would be able to keep their families
19 here if they have to pay out of pocket for health
20 insurance people would definitely not be able to save
21 for retirement as well. 32 BJ members know how
22 important it is for affordable housing developers to
23 build in their city but it's not helpful if the jobs
24 they create add to the housing crisis instead of
25 helping to solve it. We want to work with Phipps and

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 other developers to make sure that employment
3 practices at these buildings help further their
4 mission instead of undermining it but if developers
5 aren't committed to this we don't think the council
6 should support these projects. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much
8 to this panel, you know I have to say that I am not
9 happy about how this all went down and, you know I am
10 very disgusted by the actions of Phipps, you know I
11 have heard of these stories about Phipps before,
12 there have been other issues, I myself have been
13 supportive of the efforts of 32 BJ to get justice for
14 their workers in this situation and in other
15 situations as well. So, I'm just going to say to you
16 right now that this will not happen again, we will
17 continue to fight Phipps and we will continue to
18 fight for justice for your workers moving forward. I
19 am very upset about what has happened here and, and I
20 thank you very much for coming in and for giving your
21 testimony. Thank you

22 [panel thanks the chair]

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And we just want to
24 see there.. if there.. if any of the other people have
25 showed up, Tyrae Allen, no; Rairis Martins, nope.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 Okay, Carlos Warsuck I think it is, Carlos is here.

3 Ariatha Roma and Fran, okay. Alright.

4 RAIRIS MARTINS: Hello... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: You, you can begin,
6 yeah.

7 RAIRIS MARTINS: I'm reading this..
8 [cross-talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And just turn the mic
10 on, the red light has to be on.

11 RAIRIS MARTINS: I think it's on, oaky,
12 yeah. Dear Mr., Mr. Weinstein we the elected
13 officials representing the borough of the borough of
14 the Bronx are writing you to express our concerns
15 about Phipps Housing recent actions in our borough.
16 Phipps Houses has a long and valued history of
17 building high quality affordable housing for our
18 constituents that is why we have been so alarmed to
19 hear from another long-term partner and the
20 responsible development of the Bronx 32 BJ SEIU that
21 Phipps has been undermining job standards for
22 building service workers. At the largest of Phipps
23 houses complexes in the Bronx workers have struggled
24 for years to get by on wages as low as \$11.79 an
25 hour. Many have relied on Medicaid them.. for

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

1
2 themselves and their families with no meaningful
3 health coverage or retirement benefits from their
4 employer. One worker spent years living in a homeless
5 shelter while working in the building. In fact,
6 Phipps, Phipps housing receive significant government
7 subsidies and these subsidies assume that Phipps will
8 use taxpayer's money responsibly when workers are
9 struggling to support their families while Phipps CEO
10 brings home more than three quarters of a million
11 dollars a year in total compensation. Phipps violates
12 the trust of taxpayers and their representatives. Our
13 borough is in the midst of a building boom and an
14 affordable housing crisis. We have been working hard
15 to ensure that the new developments in the Bronx
16 include significant amounts of affordable housing,
17 but we also need good jobs. Building service workers
18 have fought hard to establish a wage and benefit rate
19 that allows them to support a family in the Bronx. We
20 are calling on you to return to your organization's
21 roots and ensure that across the Bronx workers earn
22 family sustaining wages and benefits. The Bronx can
23 only thrive if we create good jobs and affordable
24 housing.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much
3 and again horrible, horrible behavior on the part of
4 Phipps, it's just totally unacceptable. Thank you for
5 coming in and for giving testimony.

6 RAIRIS MARTINS: Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And I'm sorry, I need
8 to know your name again for the record.

9 RAIRIS MARTINS: That's okay Rairis.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: What's your name?

11 RAIRIS MARTINS: Rairis.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Last name?

13 RAIRIS MARTINS: Martins.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Martins, okay.
15 Alright, we're, we're going to now just give.. wait a
16 few minutes for the members to gather and then we
17 will proceed. Okay, we are now going to proceed with
18 the vote. I'm going to ask the clerk Billy Martin to
19 call the roll.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: William Martin,
21 Committee Clerk, roll call vote Committee on Finance,
22 all items are coupled, Chair Dromm?

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Very, very
24 reluctantly, yes.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Gibson?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Pass.

3 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Cohen?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Permission to
5 explain my vote?

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes, sir.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I, I have to say
8 on, on LU 99 Rockaway Village, you know the, the
9 Chair used disgusted and I, I really feel like that
10 is my visceral reaction here and, you know when I
11 have two friends who are having a dispute I really
12 try to stay neutral and encourage them to work out
13 their dispute which is what I feel like I've done
14 here but I feel terribly disrespected by Phipps
15 houses, I've invested an inordinate amount of time in
16 trying to bring resolution here to no avail and... but
17 I think the proof is in the fact that, you know I
18 serve on this committee, I've served in Land Use in
19 the past, we supported the development of a myriad of
20 affordable development projects and this issue has
21 not come up except with Phipps so to me it, it, it...
22 that, that seems irrefutable that we can sit here and
23 have... and produce, you know thousands of units of
24 affordable housing and not have this issue take place
25 except with Phipps makes me believe... you know and 32

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 BJ obviously involved in many of those developments
3 makes me believe that it's, it's Phipps fault and,
4 and again Phipps has a good reputation and I hate to
5 see it so tarnished here but that's how I feel and I,
6 really.. if this project were in my district I would
7 not support it and I would not vote for it but in
8 light of the fact that the local member does support
9 it I am going to support it so I, I vote aye.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you Council
11 Member, please continue with the roll.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Matteo?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: No on Pre-
14 considered 360, aye on the rest.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Cumbo?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I pass.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Rosenthal?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Permission to
19 explain my vote?

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you. I'd
22 like to associate my comments with those of Council
23 Member Cohen and with yours as well Chair Dromm. This
24 is a very disappointing situation, I stand in support
25 of my brothers and sisters at 32 BJ, really

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

1
2 appreciate you all coming out here today to describe
3 in detail what's going on, it's why everyone here is...
4 I speak for the two people who I just mentioned by,
5 you know really disappointed where, where, where this
6 has landed and for me this falls... you know but by the
7 same token Phipps is doing very low AMIs which we
8 support, they're setting aside 45 units for homeless
9 house, households and they're highest AMI is at 100
10 percent. So, I mean for me this falls back to my
11 fights on the human service contracts, if the
12 government is not going to pay an organization to pay
13 it's workers a real livable wage I think government
14 is falling short so, you know in the same way that I
15 say that I appreciate the De Blasio administration
16 for at least giving 400... 40 million of the 200
17 million that's needed for human service contracts I
18 am going to vote aye on this but with the hope that,
19 you know an encouragement that 32 BJ continue its
20 fight and that, you know people continue to work with
21 Phipps Houses to get them to do the right thing. I
22 really appreciate all of you coming out here today. I
23 vote aye on all.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Grodenchik?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Pass.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Adams?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Permission to
4 explain my vote?

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes, ma'am.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I too concur with
7 the Chair's remarks to my friends at 32 BJ, I stand
8 with you as I have in the past, I am too torn by this
9 situation and extremely, extremely disgusted by what
10 I've heard today, the disparity of treatment is
11 absolutely horrendous among the workers that do
12 report to work for Phipps. I, I think the conditions
13 are deplorable, whenever we sit here and have to say
14 that some people are actually living with poverty
15 wages are.. and are in shelters, no one should ever
16 have to be in that position. I too.. like I said I'm
17 torn, we know that through my colleague Donovan
18 Richards the project at Rockaway Village has been
19 underway for quite a number of years and as one who
20 quite frankly has gone through the district and knows
21 the, the needs of that district specifically on that
22 I must support my colleague and vote aye.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Moya?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Permission to
25 explain my vote Chair?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes, sir.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Thank you Chairman.

4 I just really want to express how upset I am about
5 how quickly this came to the floor, to a vote without
6 the proper process here. These are big decisions that
7 we have to make and they're never easy, some of this
8 needed to have much further discussion but to me when
9 we have a developer that has been clearly a bad actor
10 when it comes to good jobs I also think that it is
11 our role to protect workers and create housing and
12 not sacrifice one for the other and for that reason I
13 will be voting no on LU..

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: On all others you're
15 aye, right.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Yes, correct.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Powers?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Permission to
19 explain my vote?

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes, sir.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: I'll fill in
22 myself with prior comments from other colleagues
23 which is that while some of this is.. I agree with..
24 and I also agree with, with the.. with Council Member
25 Moya around the, the process and the expedition of,

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 of having to, to make a decision on this and, you
3 know coming to... some, some of the details to it as we
4 are approaching the vote and, and certainly
5 disappointed that Phipps wouldn't be here either,
6 certainly other applicants are here to talk about
7 their application and their record and we heard a
8 substantial amount of people who are effected by, by
9 not this application maybe particularly or, or maybe
10 but certainly by activities in other parts of the
11 city. The... you know it's, it's, it's disappointing
12 to, to continue to hear about the bad behavior
13 throughout the city or near my district and around
14 the city. I certainly understand these applications
15 and for the local member too are difficult and we are
16 talking about things like affordable housing, so I
17 share, you know the concern and the comments of my
18 colleagues as well. Thank you.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Gibson?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to
21 explain my vote?

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes, ma'am.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you so
24 much. So, I am going to be voting aye on all with the
25 exception of Land Use 99, the Rockaway Village

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

1
2 application before the committee and certainly I echo
3 the sentiments of the Chair and my Bronx colleague,
4 Council Member Cohen and understanding the lengthy
5 deliberate process that we've unfortunately been a
6 part of as a Bronx delegation with Phipps Houses.
7 Over the past year this stemmed from a development
8 from Bronx County so I feel compelled to speak up on
9 it and certainly I understand the process as someone
10 who went through a rezoning for three years but as a
11 member of this city council certainly always hearing
12 from my colleagues about issues within their district
13 where they need my support or my opposition is very
14 important and so I do want to make sure that moving
15 forward all of our colleagues understand that we
16 should not be told the day that there's a vote on the
17 agenda where many of our, our members stand and I
18 don't accept that and I don't operate like that and I
19 don't expect anyone else to operate like that and
20 when you talk about supporting working families and
21 members of the union and giving them sufficient wages
22 where they can live as someone who faces a saturation
23 of shelters and many other supportive housing needs
24 in my district it's always important to make sure
25 that our members, our constituents are a part of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

1
2 development of real affordable housing and while I
3 appreciate all of the work that's been done in the
4 Rockaways and I know what that district has faced
5 post Sandy and there is a lot of work that needs to
6 be done and I do think that this project will make an
7 impact and will make a, a difference but where we are
8 in this committee I cannot support this right now and
9 I will take the next few hours to think about it as
10 we prepare for stated but certainly want to call out
11 Phipps once again and their leader for not coming to
12 a resolution on Courtlandt Corners, it's unacceptable
13 that we still have that project in limbo with workers
14 that are affected and we have to hear about every day
15 stories of what workers go through and yet Phipps
16 continues to work with the city on other housing
17 projects as if we're not going to continue to call
18 them out for their practices, it's not right, it's
19 not acceptable and in a city of millions and millions
20 of people that need quality affordable housing we
21 want the right neighbors at the table and as of this
22 date Phipps is not a good neighbor and they need to
23 be a better neighbor and so I hope that if they're
24 not here they're listening we are calling them out as
25 a Bronx delegation that we want them to come to the

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 table and find a resolution with 32 BJ. We are over a
3 year, a year talking about this issue and yet we have
4 no resolution, so I would say to HPD and everyone
5 else help us so that we can get to a conclusion on
6 this matter, so we can move forward so with that I am
7 abstaining, I will not vote on Rockaway Village and I
8 will be voting aye on all the rest of the agenda.
9 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And I just want to
11 echo your...

12 [applause]

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I just want to echo
14 your concerns also, this was not brought to my
15 attention that there was a... that there was no
16 understanding on this, no agreement on this until
17 about 2:30 yesterday afternoon when I began to try to
18 find out more information about it so I am also very
19 upset about that process as well and my former
20 protest was to remove my name as the sponsor of the
21 legislation to show that I am not happy about this
22 situation. Please continue with the... with the roll
23 call.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Cumbo?
25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Council Member

3 Gibson really said everything that I would have ever
4 wanted to say so if I were to give a speech it would
5 just be a repeat of what Council Member Gibson has
6 stated. I would just add that I'm also very
7 disappointed that Phipps did not come here to face
8 the workers and to face the council to bring further
9 clarity to this particular situation and I think that
10 they have taken our support ultimately for granted
11 and I, I feel that they should come here and they
12 should face the council and they should man up and
13 woman up and look the workers in the eye and look at
14 the members directly in the eye. I also want to state
15 that I have a tremendous amount of respect for
16 Council Member Donovan Richards and so all of this
17 puts this... the way this was rushed through, the way
18 protocol was not followed this puts everyone in a
19 horrible situation, wanting to be supportive of a
20 member who's worked tirelessly to build a... rebuild
21 the Rockaways and to have a tremendous amount of
22 support there but the way this was brought forward is
23 just something that I too will need the next few
24 hours between now and stated to talk with my
25 colleagues and government to think about this and to

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 make a decision at stated so I too will be abstaining
3 from LU 99 at this time. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Grodenchik?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you
7 very much, I too want to join with the rest of my
8 colleagues in seeing how I am disturbed that this
9 matter has gotten to this point. I do know that the
10 great work that Donovan Richards has done in his
11 district is a district that was suffering long before
12 Sandy and he has performed several small miracles
13 down there in the Rockaways, his end of the Rockaways
14 is beginning to move forward and while I am troubled
15 I am going to vote to move this out of Land Use... out
16 of Finance right now so I am eye on all except for
17 Resolution 360 so that's a no.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: All items on
19 today's Finance agenda have been adopted by a vote of
20 ten in the affirmative, zero in the negative, no
21 abstentions with the exception of the following
22 bills; Resolution 36 is adopted by the committee
23 eight in the affirmative, two in the negative, no
24 abstentions and Land Use Item 99 which is adopted by
25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

2 the committee seven in the affirmative, one in the
3 negative and two abstentions.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you Billy
5 Martin and with that this meeting is adjourned at 11
6 a.m. in the morning.

7 [gavel]

8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

June 15, 2018