

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
EDUCATION

----- X

May 22, 2018
Start: 10:07 a.m.
Recess: 1:58 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: DANIEL DROMM
Chairperson

MARK TREYGER
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Adrienne E. Adams
Andrew Cohen
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Laurie A. Cumbo
Vanessa L. Gibson
Barry S. Grodenchik
Rory I. Lancman
Steven Matteo
Francisco P. Moya
Keith Powers
Helen K. Rosenthal
James G. Van Bramer
Alicka Ampry-Samuel
Inez D. Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Justin L. Brannan

Chaim M. Deutsch
Joseph C. Borelli
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Eric A. Ulrich

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Richard Carranza, Chancellor
NYC Department of Education

Ursulina Ramirez, Chief Operating Officer
NYC Department of Education

Ray Orlando, Chief Financial Officer
NYC Department of Education

Lorraine Grillo, President and CEO
NYC School Construction Authority

2 [sound check] [gavel]

3 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Good morning and
4 welcome to the City Council's 10th day of hearings on
5 the Mayor's Executive Budget for Fiscal 2019. My
6 name is Daniel Dromm, and I chair the Finance
7 Committee. We are joined by the Committee on
8 Education chaired by my colleague Council Member Mark
9 Treyger, and we have been joined by my colleagues
10 Council Member Steve Matteo, Council Member Adrienne
11 Adams, and I think we will be joined by others later
12 on. Today we'll hear from the Department of Education
13 and the School Construction Authority. Before we
14 begin, I'd like to thank the Finance Division staff
15 for putting this hearing together including the
16 Director Latonia McKinney, Deputy Directors Regina
17 Poreda Ryan and Nathan Toth, the counsel—the
18 committee Counsel Rebecca Chasan, Unit Head Dohini
19 Sompura, Finance Analyst Liz Hoffman and Caitlin
20 O'Hagan, and the Finance Division Administrative
21 Support Unit Nicole Anderson, Maria Pagan and Roberta
22 Caturano who pull everything together. I'd also like
23 to thank Evia Cardoso from my staff who has been with
24 me at all the Budget hearings. Thank you for your
25 efforts as well. I'd like to remind everyone that

1 the public will be invited to testify on the last day
2 of budget hearings on May 24th beginning at
3 approximately 4:00 p.m. in this room. For members of
4 the public who wish to testify, but cannot attend the
5 hearing, you can email your testimony to the Finance
6 Division at financetestimony@council.nyc.gov and the
7 staff will make it a part of the official record.
8

9 I'd like to start by welcoming our new Schools
10 Chancellor Richard Carranza. Thank you for being
11 here with us today. This is the first Council
12 hearing at which the new Chancellor is testify and we
13 look forward to an open and productive relationship
14 in discussing the DOE's budget programs and policies.
15 Thank you also to the other representatives here to
16 testify, DOE Chief of Staff Ursulina Ramirez, DOE
17 Chief Financial Officer Ray Orlando and SCA President
18 Lorraine Grillo. Today we will examine the DOE's
19 Fiscal 2019 Executive Budget, which totals \$25.5
20 billion in expense funding not including pensions and
21 debt service. This is 29% of the city's entire
22 budget. This significant level of funding is what
23 supports over 1.1 million students across 100-1,800 K
24 to 12 schools as well as a robust Pre-K program and a
25 new book growing early childhood education program.

1
2 However, we must ensure that our education dollars
3 are being spent efficiently and effectively. The
4 Council's Budget Response called on the
5 Administration to direct education dollar to schools
6 by increasing Fair Student Funding or FSF, and I
7 really want to thank my co-chair for the hard work
8 that he did all the way from Albany starting in
9 Albany to actually working on the DMT (sic) with us
10 and then actually getting it to make it happen here
11 at the—at the City Council level with the
12 Administration. The funding will increase the FSF
13 floor from 87% to 90%, and increase the FSF average
14 from 90% to 92.7%. As a result, over 850 schools are
15 currently receiving less than 90% of their FSF
16 allocation will see increased funding in Fiscal 2019.
17 While the Council applauds this investment in school
18 budgets, there is more to be done. The Council's
19 Budget Response called on the DOE to add a weight for
20 students in temporary housing and to the FSF formula
21 so schools can appropriately support these students.
22 The Executive Budget does not include \$11.9 million
23 for DOE students in shelter programs, but this
24 program only reaches—oh, it does. Excuse me. It does
25 include \$11.9 million for DOE students in shelter

1 plans, but this program only reaches 100 schools.
2
3 Moreover, as in the past years, this funding is not
4 baselined as included in Fiscal 2019 only. While we
5 understand the need to evaluate and refine
6 programming, it's baffling that moving into its third
7 year the Administration is unwilling to baseline this
8 funding. In addition, the Council's Budget Response
9 called on the Administration to phase in funding for
10 FSF so that all schools will be receiving 100% of the
11 FSF allocations by 2021. However, the funding added
12 will only maintain the floor at 90% and the average
13 at 92.7%. The Administration has continuously said
14 that they are waiting on the state to fulfill their
15 campaign for Fiscal Equity or CFE obligation in order
16 to increase FSF. The Council agrees that the state
17 owns our students much more than they're getting, and
18 continues to advocate in Albany for this funding.
19 However, the city cannot and should not wait on the
20 state to adequately fund our schools. In that same
21 vain, the city should more realistically project
22 state education and revenues. The Executive Budget
23 continues to project 4.3% year over year growth in
24 state education aid even though this year DOE
25 received 3.3% and last year DOE received only 2.4% in

1
2 increases. The Council wants to adopt a budget that
3 will realistically forecast the state revenues and
4 city spending. Today, we will examine the DOE's
5 Capital Budget and Capital Commitment plan as well ad
6 the February 2018 Proposed Amendment to the Fiscal
7 2015 to 19 Five-Year Capital Plan, which includes
8 \$16.5 billion, which totals \$16.5 billion. Before we
9 begin, I'd like to remind my colleagues that the
10 first round of questions for the Department of
11 Education will be limited to five minutes per Council
12 Member, and if Council Members have additional
13 questions, we will have a second round of questions
14 at three-minutes per Council Member. I will now turn
15 the mic over to my co-chair Council Member Treyger
16 for his statement, and then we'll hear testimony from
17 the Chancellor of the Department of Education,
18 Richard Carranza

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you Chair
20 Dromm and thank you for your leadership. You-you
21 have already made a significant impact in your role
22 as Finance Chair. Good morning. I am Council Member
23 Mark Treyger and Chair of the Education Committee.
24 Welcome to the Fiscal 2019 Executive Budget hearing
25 on the Department of Education and the School

1
2 Construction Authority. I'd like to take a moment as
3 well to personally welcome Chancellor Richard
4 Carranza. I very much look forward to working with
5 you, and I hope we can have a productive and
6 cooperative relationship, and I just want to not for
7 the record when we met, I—I simply asked visit as
8 many schools as you can, and Mr. Chancellor, you have
9 been non-stop all over the place, and we really truly
10 appreciate that. The Department of Education's
11 Fiscal 2019 Budget, \$25.5 billion is \$1.2 billion
12 more than the Fiscal 2018 Adopted Budget. This
13 includes more than \$191 million in new needs for
14 Fiscal 2019. While I support many of these programs
15 and new needs, I have concerns about DOE's priorities
16 and some of the spending choices made in this budget.
17 One of my primary concerns as Chair of the Education
18 Committee is ensuring schools have the funding they
19 need to support and educate students. That is why I
20 traveled to Albany with the Speaker and Finance Chair
21 Dromm and my colleagues to advocate for increase
22 state funding to support a fully funded Fair Student
23 Funding—Fair Student Formula. That is why I
24 advocated to DOE to support this funding request even
25 when state funding fell short of reaching this goal.

1
2 A fully funded FSF formula enables schools to provide
3 a complete range of educational programs students
4 need, and I know this funding has the biggest impact
5 on students in schools. With adequate funding,
6 schools have real choices on how to best support
7 their students. Social workers and guidance
8 counselors can be hired. Additional support for
9 vulnerable students to over barriers to learning can
10 be provide. Enrichment programs in the arts and
11 sciences can be offered. These services should not
12 be a rarity in schools. These shouldn't be hard
13 choices for principals. These programs and
14 supportive services should be provided to every
15 student in every school. Out of \$191 million in new
16 news in the Executive Budget, only \$1.2 million is
17 being used to support ten new Bridging the Gap social
18 workers and ten more social workers simply isn't
19 enough. We have more than 5,500 school safety
20 agents. That's more than the number of social
21 workers, guidance counselors and school psychologists
22 combined. We need to step back and listen to our
23 students. Our students are asking us to add more
24 social workers because increasing the emotional and
25 social supports at schools is what really makes

1
2 students feel safe. With \$191 million in new
3 spending, more of this money should be directed to
4 school budgets and more of this money should be used
5 to hire social workers and guidance counselors to
6 support our students' needs. According to DOE's own
7 estimate it would—it would only cost \$5.2 million to
8 add at least one full-time guidance counselor or
9 social worker to the 41 schools that currently do not
10 have one. In a budget of \$25.5 billion, and \$191
11 million in new needs, \$5.2 million to ensure every
12 school has at last one full-time social worker or
13 guidance counselor seems like an obvious choice to
14 me. Why wasn't this added to the Budget? Why won't
15 DOE commit to providing every school with a dedicated
16 social workers or guidance counselor to ensure we are
17 meeting the social and emotional needs of all of our
18 students? In a school system with 50—with 5,511
19 full-time school safety agents, and only 4,173 full-
20 time social workers and guidance counselors, we I
21 think we need to be doing more to increase counseling
22 services in schools and we need to hire more social
23 workers and guidance counselors. That is why I have
24 real concerns about DOE's priorities and spending
25 choices, and I'd like to have answers today. And

1
2 this brings me to the next point about
3 accountability. At our Preliminary Budget hearing in
4 March, I opened the hearing by saying that as a
5 Council we're looking for accountability from each
6 city agency. At that time we had many outstanding
7 questions DOE had not answered and the agency was not
8 being accountable to the Council. Unfortunately, I'm
9 here again telling you that DOE is not being
10 accountable. We received DOE's responses to our
11 follow-up letter from our Prelim Budget hearing
12 yesterday less than 24 hours before our Executive
13 Budget hearing, and almost six weeks after it was
14 sent to DOE. This is not acceptable. The Council's
15 role in overseeing the Department of Education
16 including the spending choices made by this
17 administration need to be taken serious-seriously.
18 DOE's budget represents 29% of the city's budget and
19 we need answers to our questions in an appropriate
20 time frame in order to adopt the budget. Going
21 forward we expect the DOE to do better. I'd like to
22 also take a moment to re-emphasize the need for paid
23 parental leave. If we want our students to learn in
24 the best and most support environment possible we
25 need to make sure we're providing basic

1
2 accommodations for teachers, school leaders and
3 support staff. School staff deserve to be treated
4 with dignity, but right now our teachers who are
5 overwhelmingly women are being denied paid parental
6 leave. In New York City our educators have to use
7 their sick days to take time off to bond with their
8 child. Do we as a city realize what we are saying
9 when we force women to use sick days for maternity
10 leave? The city of New York is effectively saying
11 that pregnancy is a sickness, and that is absolutely
12 unacceptable. Paid parental leave should be a right
13 for all of our school staff. This is a way to uplift
14 our schools, our students, our families in our city.
15 We also need to do more as a city to fully integrate
16 our schools. Segregation is a problem in New York
17 City. It is real. We need to address segregation in
18 all its forms. Our schools are racially segregated.
19 Our schools are also segregated by English language
20 learners. One school may have hundreds of English
21 Language learners and the school down the block may
22 have none, and many of our schools are not accessible
23 to our students. I have no fully accessible schools
24 in my district, zero. What kind of message are we
25 sending families when we say that this school is not

1
2 for you? We must address all forms of segregation in
3 our schools. At today's hearing we'll also hear from
4 the School Construction Authority. The Council's
5 Budget Response called for an additional investment
6 in accessibility and school security in Fiscal Year
7 2019. We are disappointed that there are no plans to
8 reallocate funding for these Council priorities in
9 the coming fiscal year. The Council's Preliminary
10 Budget Response also called for the Administration to
11 implement the recommendations of the planning to one
12 report. We had a productive hearing to discuss this
13 report last month and look forward to continue
14 working with the DOE, SCA and other city agencies to
15 implement these recommendations. I'd like to echo
16 the Chair-Chair Dromm's thanks to the Finance
17 Division for their work in preparing for this
18 hearing. I'd like to also thank the Education
19 Committee staff, our new Education Committee Counsel
20 Beth Golub, Jan Atwell, Colima Johnson, and Millie
21 Bonilla. Finally, I'd like to also thank my staff
22 Anna Scafe, Vanessa Ogle and Eric Fameburgh. I will
23 now turn back the hearing Chair Dromm.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much,
25 and we have been joined by Council Member Holden,

1
2 Council Member Grodenchik, Council Member Rose,
3 Council Member Levine, Council Member Ambry-Samuel
4 and Council Member Powers, and I'm going to ask my
5 Counsel now to swear the Chancellor in. Swear—let's
6 do the whole panel. Just swear the whole panel in.

7 LEGAL COUNSEL: Do you affirm that your
8 testimony will be truthful to the best of your
9 knowledge, information and belief?

10 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Yes, I do.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, Chancellor,
12 whenever you're ready.

13 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: So, good morning.
14 Buenos Dias, Chairs Dromm and Treyger. It's good to
15 have two educators in Chairmanship positions. So,
16 school is in session, and I also want to welcome and
17 thank all of the members of the Finance and Education
18 Committee that are here today. It is my pleasure to
19 appear before the City Council for the first time
20 today, and to testify on Mayor de Blasio's Fiscal
21 Year 2019 Executive Expense Budget for the New York
22 City Public Schools. Joining me this morning are
23 Ursulina Ramirez, DOE Chief Operating Officer; Ray
24 Orlando, DOE Chief Financial Officer; and Lorraine
25 Grillo, President & CEO of the New York City School

1
2 Construction Authority who will also discuss the
3 Capital Plan for our schools following my comments.
4 I would like to begin by thanking Speaker Johnson,
5 Chairs Dromm and Treyger and all of the members of
6 the City Council for your leadership, advocacy and
7 support of New York City's 1.1 million students in
8 our school communities. I have had the opportunity
9 to work in several urban school districts across the
10 country and work with many elected officials in
11 different municipalities and New York City elected
12 officials' knowledge and support of their schools is
13 incredibly unique. I would say supremely unique.
14 Just a few weeks ago I was proud to stand with the
15 Mayor, Speaker Johnson, both Charis Dromm and Treyger
16 and many council members to announce the
17 unprecedented \$125 million increase to school
18 budgets. I know that the DOE has had a longstanding
19 partnership with the City Council and I'm committed
20 to continuing this collaboration with the City
21 Council in the months and years ahead. Since this is
22 my first time appearing before the Council, I would
23 like to tell you a little bit about myself, my career
24 and why I believe in the power of traditional public
25 education. I am the son of a sheet metal worker and

1
2 a hair dresser, and the grandson of Mexican
3 immigrants. I grew up in a Spanish speaking home in
4 Tucson, Arizona. Like so many New York students, my
5 parents spoke another language at home, and I didn't
6 learn English until I entered the public schools in
7 Tucson in Kindergarten. Although my parents never
8 attended college, they knew that the path forward for
9 my twin brother and I included an education, a strong
10 education. They wanted more for their children, a
11 pathway to college and career many New Yorkers I have
12 met. My parents were right, public education is the
13 greatest gift I have ever received, and many years
14 ago I decided to devote my life to it. I started
15 teaching nearly 30 years ago in the same public high
16 school that I attended. I began as a bilingual social
17 studies and music teacher and later became a high
18 school principal in both Tucson and Las Vegas. I
19 then went on to be a Regional Superintendent in Las
20 Vegas and the Superintendent of Schools in San
21 Francisco and most recently in Houston. This is my
22 eighth week as the New York City Schools Chancellor
23 and I spent my first month in a whirlwind city tour
24 visiting schools in all five boroughs where I have
25 heard directly from student and from parents,

1
2 educators, administrators and support staff. I've
3 also met with elected officials and heard about their
4 needs and concerns. In all, I have visited more than
5 30 schools and hosted more than 4,000 students,
6 parents and employees at 21 town halls as part of the
7 listening tour. What an incredible way to get the
8 pulse of this city, this vibrant diverse city and the
9 nation's largest school system. In total since I have
10 arrived in the city I have visited over 55 schools.
11 I need to update that because as yesterday I have now
12 visited 57 schools, and I'm proud to be living by my
13 motto, which is: A Chancellor in the field is worth
14 three in the seat back at Tweet. Among the
15 highlights of my tour were visits to a 3-K and Pre-K
16 For All class in the Bronx with students who were
17 learning about plants. I also visited dual language,
18 Spanish and band classes in Brooklyn, an aviation
19 program in Queens, a community school and computer
20 science fair in Manhattan, a future teacher's academy
21 on Staten Island. Amongst many of my visits and
22 throughout my visits I've been struck by our
23 educators' commitment to their students, their
24 passion for professional growth, and their
25 willingness to make their classrooms laboratories not

1
2 just for academic excellence, but also for social
3 justice. Most of all, I've been struck by our
4 amazing students and families. At the town halls
5 that I've hosted, I've got the best question quite
6 frankly from my students. It's clear that they are
7 informed about our school system and the types of
8 services they need to succeed. Parents did not hold
9 back either sharing their hopes for their children's
10 education with me. Across boroughs it all—it is also
11 clear that students, parents and educators believe in
12 the city's Equity and Excellence for All vision and
13 want more. They want more 3-K for all. They want
14 more universal literacy in their communities. They
15 want more computer science education and AP classes,
16 more arts, more bilingual programs and career and
17 technical education programs. They want more social-
18 emotional supports. These are profound investments
19 in our children's future and in the future of this
20 great city. My key takeaways are that our schools
21 are doing a lot of things right, and our stakeholders
22 and the people we serve are aware of the tremendous
23 progress that we've made, but it is also clear to me
24 that we have lots of work to do. As Chancellor, I'm
25 diving head first into the work of Equity and

1
2 Excellence for All, and you're going to hear me speak
3 a lot about key themes. You're going to hear me
4 speak a lot about social justice. You're going to
5 hear me speak a lot about creating positive
6 environments for students and educators. You're
7 going to hear me speak about lifting up all children
8 and empowering not just engaging our parents. The
9 Administration's Equity and Excellence Agenda for all
10 embodies these principles by focusing on putting
11 every child on the path to college and careers. We
12 are building a strong foundation for early—for early
13 learning with our 3-K and Pre-K, our Universal
14 Literacy Initiatives and Algebra for all. We are
15 expanding access to rigorous and college aligned
16 courses with AP for All and Computer Science for All,
17 and we are providing more support to our students
18 along the way with College Access for All, our Single
19 Shepherd Program and Community and Renewal Schools.
20 The New York City public schools are making real
21 progress. Since establishing Equity and Excellence
22 for All, our graduation rate has climbed to 74.3%,
23 the highest it's ever been while our drop-out rate at
24 7.8% is the lowest it's ever been. New York City
25 students also out-performed the rest of the state in

our English Language Arts Exams for the second year in a row, and our overall improvement outpaced the rest of the state in both ELA and math.

Additionally, a record number of our students are taking and passing AP exams and are ready to attend college. I am eager to build on this success. I

want to speak briefly about some new investments in the FY 2019 Executive Budget that are going to do just that. The Executive Budget of approximately

\$32.3 billion includes \$25.5 billion in operating funds and another \$6.7 billion in education related pension and debt service funds. Our funding is a

combination of city, state and federal dollars with city tax levy dollars making up the largest share at 57%. State dollars are at 37% and federal dollars are

at 6%. Through the Executive Budget we are doubling down on our commitment to Early Childhood education, which is game changer. The budget includes funding

to speed up the rollout of 3-K for All. We are bringing the city's 3-K commitment to approximately 19,000 seats in 12 districts by the fall of 2021,

which is up from 15,000 seats in eight districts in our original plan. We are also investing an additional \$30.5 million in our Universal Literacy

1 Initiative, which will expand to ever community
2 school district this fall. Specifically, as a result
3 of this investment, we'll add more coaching at the
4 highest needs schools, more targeted training to
5 support English Language Learners, and we'll double
6 the number of after school reading programs for
7 children in shelters. Early literacy is one of the
8 best investments we can make, and more of our
9 children reading on grade level today means more
10 young adults succeeding in middle school, high school
11 and as the New Yorkers of tomorrow. The Mayor's
12 Budget increases funding to \$11.9 million to support
13 schools with a high concentration of students in
14 shelters including ten additional social workers in
15 schools serving this population. Our 62 schools with
16 some of the highest population of students in
17 shelters will also continue to receive health and
18 mental health support services, and all students in
19 shelters will continue to receive targeted enrollment
20 supports. We are also investing \$24 million in an
21 unprecedented Multi-Year Health Education Initiative
22 modeled on PE Works, which will revitalize health
23 education citywide. We will focus on teacher
24 training and support so that teachers are prepared to
25

1
2 provide age-appropriate medically accurate and
3 inclusive instruction. We will significantly
4 increase school wellness councils to engage schools,
5 families, communities and partners. We will create a
6 model health education schools--we will create model
7 health education schools that meet state requirements
8 and establish best practices for instruction, family
9 engagement and connection with health services. As a
10 former social studies teacher and a social studies
11 teacher at heart, I'm particularly excited that the
12 budget includes funding for our new Civics for All
13 Initiative. Yesterday, in fact, we held our first
14 ever citywide student voter registration day with the
15 support of the Council and other key partners, and
16 I'm also very excited to say that I was registered to
17 vote yesterday by students for the city of New York.
18 I have to add a little editorial. I've been asked
19 what did you register? What part did you register
20 for, and again I'm not going to publicly disclose
21 that, but I will tell you my favorite color is blue.
22 [laughter] I want to thank those of you who
23 participated yesterday and I look forward to your
24 continued support as we strengthen civic education
25 across our schools including new civics education

1
2 curricula, and new participatory budgeting program
3 where high school students will work together to
4 decide how their schools should spend \$2,000 each
5 year. Finally, I'd like to highlight two new
6 investments that are essential to the long-term
7 success of our Equity and Excellence for All agenda.
8 The first is an investment in implicit bias training
9 and culturally responsive training over the next four
10 years. Culturally Responsive Training meets our
11 students and families where they are, and tailors the
12 way we teach and serve our kids to their unique
13 backgrounds and experiences that they bring into our
14 classrooms. We know from experience that teacher
15 training is one of the best investments we can make.
16 If we can better tailor our teaching to the
17 communities we serve, we can improve instruction and
18 outcomes across the board in our city. This—the
19 second is a \$125 million annual commitment to ensure
20 that all schools receive at least 90% fair student
21 funding beginning next school year. As a result,
22 over 800 schools will see increased funding in 2019.
23 More funding means more teachers, guidance counselors
24 and social workers in school. In fact, as I've talked
25 to principals following this announcement, principals

1
2 have talked about adding social workers, and adding
3 teacher positions, and creating enrichment programs.
4 As a Manhattan Principal also succinctly said to me,
5 when you're a principal every dollar counts. Every
6 one of these 20-\$125 million counts for our kids, our
7 families and our schools, and I would again like to
8 thank the City Council for your advocacy and for
9 helping us make this a reality. We are committed to
10 reaching 100% of all schools, but we can only achieve
11 this goal if the state keeps its commitment to
12 fulfill the campaign for fiscal equity settlement. I
13 pledge to ride any vehicle, ride any bus, and stand
14 shoulder-to-shoulder with any Council Member or
15 elected official in Albany to make this case. In this
16 school year alone, New York City public school
17 students have been short-changed \$1.6 billion in
18 state education funds. This is unacceptable. I look
19 forward to discussing these new investments as well
20 as our continuing work towards equity and excellence
21 for all with the members here today and into the
22 future. Let's have the tough conversations. Let's
23 talk about school safety, about school segregation a
24 and integration, about school climates that support
25 all students including LGBTQ students, about serving

1
2 our English language learner students and students
3 with disabilities, about serving our students in
4 temporary housing, about tuning our historically
5 underserved schools as a parent and as a man of
6 color, as a former teacher and as a principal, I have
7 always believed that the high quality education is
8 the great equalizer in our society. A great
9 traditional public education is not only the
10 cornerstone of our democracy, it is also the best way
11 to empower the next generation. I am aware that it
12 will take hard work to continue to move our school
13 system forward, but I also know that thanks to your
14 efforts and those of our educators, our students, our
15 families, our school communities, our workers, we are
16 building on a strong foundation. New York City's
17 public schools are a model for the nation. All eyes
18 are on us in our innovative approach to equity and
19 excellence is at the forefront. It is my honor to
20 serve in this vibrant diverse progressive city, and
21 to work alongside each of you as we seek answers to
22 the city's most pressing educational challenges. I
23 am confident that together we will help all of our
24 students achieve their full potential. I want to
25 thank you again for this opportunity, and at this

1
2 point I would like to turn it over to Lorraine Grillo
3 who will update the Committee on the Capital Plan. We
4 will then be happy to answer any questions that you
5 may have.

6 LORRAINE GRILLO: Thank you so much,
7 Chancellor. Good morning Chair Dromm, and Chair
8 Treyger and members of the Finance and Education
9 Committees. My name is Lorraine Grillo, and I'm
10 President and CEO of the New York City School
11 Construction Authority. I'm pleased to be here today
12 to discuss the proposed February 2018 amendment to
13 the FY2015 to '19 Five-Year Capital Plan, and the
14 changes to our Capital Plan as a result of the
15 Mayor's Executive Budget released on April 26. I'm
16 continually grateful to the City Council for its
17 support and generous funding for our schools. The
18 collaboration we've had is truly critical to our
19 success, and I look forward to continuing our great
20 work together for all of our students. Since the
21 Preliminary Budget hearing in March, we have seen
22 some positive changes including additional funding
23 for our Capital Improvement Program as well as an
24 increase in the number of sited seats. Our Capital
25 Investment Program has increased by \$130.5 million,

1
2 which includes an additional \$125 million in FY2019
3 for the Air Conditioning Initiative. I'm also happy
4 to report that we were able to increase the number of
5 Queens High School seats by almost 2,000 since the
6 publication of the February 2018 Amendment. The Panel
7 for Educational Policy approved the February 2018
8 proposed amendment on April 25th. I would like to
9 take a moment to briefly talk about the highlights in
10 the amendment, which the Council will be voting on to
11 approve at the adoption of the 2019 Budget. The
12 Capacity Program. The proposed 2018 Amendment
13 includes \$6.5 billion for the Capacity Program, an
14 increase of over \$500 million from the 2017 Adopted
15 Budget. Our Capacity Program consists of four
16 categories? New Capacity, Pre-Kindergarten
17 Initiative, class size reduction, and facility
18 replacements. Of the \$6.5 billion allocated to
19 capacity, \$4.8 billion is dedicated to creating more
20 than 44,000 new seats through an estimated 88
21 projects within school districts experiencing the
22 most critical existing and projected overcrowding.
23 The amendment identifies the total need of
24 approximately 83,000 seats. Since our February
25 amendment we have identified nearly 8,000 additional

1
2 seats, which will bring us to nearly 40,000 total
3 cited seats. Included in our Capacity program is
4 \$872 million for the city's Pre-K for All Initiative
5 an increase of approximately \$70 million from the
6 2017 Adopted Budget, which will create almost 8,800
7 new seats across the city. In addition, \$287 million
8 has been allocated to the replacement program. This
9 represents an increase of \$145 million. Finally,
10 \$490 million is allocated in our Class Size Reduction
11 Program to build additions on new buildings near
12 schools that would significantly benefit from
13 additional capacity. This program recognizes the
14 need for targeted investments in areas of the city
15 that may be geographically isolated and have unfunded
16 seat needs. I'm happy to report we have moved into
17 feasibility for three additional sites, one in
18 District 27, one in District 29 and one in District
19 31. The Plan Amendment directs \$6.7 billion for
20 capital investment. Nearly 75% or \$4.1 billion will
21 address the buildings identified in our Annual
22 Building Survey as most in need of repairs, such as
23 roof and structural work safeguarding our buildings
24 against water infiltration and other facility
25 projects. The Capital Investment category also

1
2 includes funding for upgrades fire alarms, public
3 address systems and removal of transportable
4 classroom units. More specifically, \$395 million has
5 been allocated to remove TCUs and redevelop the yard
6 space where the TCUs have been located. To date we
7 have removed 171 TCUs and have developed plans to
8 remove 84 more leaving a remaining balance of 99 TCUs
9 not yet slated for removal. It's important to note
10 that the removal schedule is contingent upon capacity
11 constraints within the area and input of local school
12 communities. Also, included in our Capital
13 Improvement Program is work to enhance school
14 accessibility. Working in collaboration with the New
15 York City Department of Education, we have completed
16 or in the process of completing 30 projects in 28
17 buildings across the city positively impacting over
18 31,000 students. Currently, over 940 buildings in
19 our system are either fully or partially accessible.
20 Over 25% or \$1.7 billion will go towards School
21 Enhancement Projects. The two main programs in this
22 category are facility enhancements and technology.
23 Included in our Capital Investment Program is funding
24 to support our citywide effort to ensure air
25 conditioning in all classrooms. In order to complete

1
2 this work by 2022, and provide thousands of students
3 with more—a more comfortable learning environment,
4 the Capital Plan allocates \$175 million in funding to
5 support this initiative. As I previously mentioned,
6 the city has added and additional \$125 million in
7 FY19 to our Capital Plan for these electrical
8 upgrades. The Mandated Programs Category with \$3.4
9 billion allocated includes approximately \$750 million
10 for boiler conversions in approximately 110 buildings
11 currently using No. 4 Oil. The remaining funds are
12 assigned to cover other required costs including
13 insurance and completion of projects from our prior
14 plan. Additionally, our work to remove and replace
15 all PCB containing lighting fixtures was completed
16 under this funding. In conclusion, we understand
17 that the public school system as a whole continues to
18 experience pockets of overcrowding, and we are
19 working to address these concerns through new school
20 construction. We remain focused on remedying these
21 issues and will continue to rely on your feedback and
22 support as we do so. Our annual capital planning
23 process has already benefitted significantly from
24 your input and our students have benefitted from your
25 generous support of capital projects. With continued

1
2 collaboration, and tens of thousands of seats slated
3 to come online over the next five to seven years, we
4 remain confident that the expansion and enhancement
5 of school buildings across the five boroughs will
6 improve the educational experience for the city's 1.1
7 million school children as well as the teachers and
8 staff who serve them. Thank you again for allowing
9 me to testify today, and we would be happy to answer
10 any questions you might have.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much
12 President Grillo and thank you Chancellor for your
13 testimony as well. I'm particularly grateful to you
14 Chancellor for your willingness to put issues that
15 sometimes there might have been a hesitancy to talk
16 about in the past, and specifically saying the word
17 segregation, integration, lesbian, gay, bisexual,
18 transgender. These are issues that are out there and
19 the only way that we can confront them is by actually
20 using the words necessary to talk about them, and so
21 we're grateful to you for that—that openness. It's a
22 real breath of fresh air, and we look forward to
23 continuing to work with you on those issues. I'm just
24 curious to know what have you identified as your top
25 challenges moving forward and what's your assessment

1
2 of the adequacy of the overall budget to help you
3 meet those challenges moving forward?

4 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Thank you, Chairman
5 Dromm. So, eight weeks into the role, I'm doing a
6 lot of looking and listening. I would say that
7 there's some really good news and there's some nice—I
8 would say some challenges that—that I'm starting to
9 notice. Obviously one of the—the biggest challenges
10 or I would say opportunities that have is President
11 Grillo just mentioned that. I will say that we have
12 a portfolio of historic facilities, which is a very
13 diplomatic way of saying we have some old buildings,
14 and they present some challenges for us not only in
15 terms of how we maintain and how we upkeep, but how
16 plan for programming in those buildings. You add to
17 that the complexities around the air conditioning and
18 the livability in those buildings, and then add to
19 that as well then how we maintain them, and then add
20 a third layer, which is how do we ensure connectivity
21 for computers and—and Internet. So, it's a big
22 portfolio. I think that's one of the opportunities
23 that going forward we will have to actually move the
24 ball in a very, very strategic way around those
25 facilities. I think also we're a big system. So,

1
2 while I think it's a—it's a good notion to have a
3 decentralized approach at how you program what
4 happens in schools. I also think there has to be a
5 conversation about what are some unifying threads of
6 work system wide because we know that we're not a
7 confederation of independent schools. Back to our
8 social studies days. We're not a confederation of
9 independent schools that geographically happen to
10 exist in the same place. We're a unified intact
11 school district. So there are things that should
12 drive what we do in our districts. So, when I talk
13 about social justice, you can only achieve social
14 justice if you're meeting the needs of different
15 communities not from an equally based perspective,
16 but from an equity based perspective. So,
17 understanding that different communities have
18 different needs, we must be able to allocate
19 resources and put support systems in place to enable
20 systems to improve and communities to shine. That
21 will be—I will—I will tell you right now an
22 organizing principle as how we go forward in terms of
23 our budget priorities and our strategic priorities as
24 well. The third thing that I would say that is
25 really, really an opportunity for us are some of the

1
2 big social societal conversations, and I thank you
3 for your words of encouragement and your words of
4 support. I think that we have to be in the city of
5 New York, which is one of the most diverse cities—
6 cities not in the America but the world where we have
7 the diversity of—we-we are America in just a few
8 years from now. It's New York City. We have to talk
9 about every single opportunity that students have to
10 access our traditional public schools without
11 barriers. That means it doesn't matter who you are,
12 where you come from, we need to make those
13 opportunities available to all of our students, and
14 as I take a deep look at what we do, there are some
15 perhaps policies, there are some practices that we
16 need to have a conversation are these truly giving
17 all students the opportunity to access the wonderful
18 public schools that we have in New York City. That
19 being said, I have to tell you this is my fifth state
20 now and the fifth school system that I've been able
21 to live and work in. I feel like I am a kid in
22 Disneyland. There is no other municipality in this
23 country that supports its traditional public schools
24 like the city of New York does. The issue of
25 investing in community schools, the issue of

1
2 investing in implicit bias training, the investing in
3 homeless students, as much more as we want to do, I
4 will tell you there is no other large urban system
5 that is investing in its students, its communities
6 and its children more than New York City. So, I—I am
7 absolutely just euphoric with the ability to actually
8 move these types of programs, these types of
9 approaches in a very enlightened and I would say
10 progressive way that will truly make a difference for
11 our schools in our historically underserved
12 communities. My observation so far are that we have
13 a lot of work to do, but that we have a great
14 underpinning in terms of the not only philosophical
15 alignment, but the city's commitment to its
16 traditional public schools, and that gives me great
17 hope and—and great energy ad we move forward.

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Chancellor, there's a
19 number of longstanding issues here in the city of New
20 York like poor student performance in certain areas,
21 low parental engagement, high staff turnover and
22 subpar student attendance rates. Are those going to
23 be part of your focus moving forward?

24 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Chair—Chairman
25 Dromm they absolutely will be part of our agenda and—

1
2 and actually have been part of the agenda. What we
3 want to do and I'm very grateful that Chancellor
4 Farina and the work that she brought to really
5 highlight the professionalism of our organization. I
6 want to take that mantle and continue to run and
7 perhaps run a little faster with that. I think it's
8 critically important that as we think about schools
9 and the need to improve schools and the performance
10 of schools, what I've been talking in our communities
11 and my listening tour, and as I've been able to
12 explain to people where I come from, we often start
13 when we talk about schools at a point of
14 accountability. How are you accountable? We rarely
15 talk about how are we building capacity to meet the
16 needs in communities. So, for example, if you are
17 working in a community that—and because you live in a
18 larger urban environment, suffer from the ills of
19 large urban cities. So, it can be intergenerational
20 poverty. It could be homelessness. It could be
21 intergenerational incarceration, food insecurity.
22 You name it. The ills of society, and you have a
23 concentrated place where that is happening, you can't
24 treat those schools equally. Everybody gets the
25 same. By definition you must treat them equitably,

1
2 and that begins by assessing what are the challenges
3 and then how do we allocate resources not to lower
4 the bar, but to empower and to build and to support
5 communities to actually reach the bar that we've set
6 for college and career readiness. You can only do
7 that by building capacity in the teachers. So,
8 strong professional development, culturally relevant
9 pedagogy, systems and structures that support
10 continuous improvement. You have to look at how the
11 strength of the leadership in the school is aligned
12 to the needs of the community, and then you have to
13 fund an ability for schools not to become test prep
14 factories, but to actually broaden the experience of
15 students so that they have experiences in the arts,
16 that they can draw, they can dance, they can express
17 who they are as human beings. So, that equity
18 investment is going to mean that there are going be
19 resources that will be prioritized from an equity
20 perspective in communities that have historically
21 been underserved. Now, I purposely used the term
22 historically underserved because I refuse to use the
23 term failing schools or schools that are under-
24 performing because I have never in my almost 30 years
25 as an educator ever met a community that consciously

1
2 decides I'm going to fail school, I'm going to fail
3 students today. I've never seen it. What I have
4 seen is underfunding of schools. What I have seen is
5 our systems and structures that create dis-
6 disincentives for students to attend those schools.
7 What I have seen is policy that perhaps unintended
8 consequences become that we disincentivize
9 communities to go to their own local schools. So, as
10 we look at our systems and our structures and our
11 policies and how we fund our schools, the things that
12 you have talked about Chairman are going to be first
13 and foremost. How are we not only providing support
14 for our students and communities? Part of our
15 Community Schools Objective. How are we providing an
16 early start for our students to have a great
17 beginning for educating? That's our 3-K, Pre-K. How
18 are we going to invest in students' understanding and
19 parents empowered with knowledge to know how their
20 children are going to go forward to a post-secondary
21 experience whether that's career or college? That's
22 our College for All Initiative, then more
23 importantly, how are we then going to provide tools
24 for our educators, our principals, our support staff
25 to meet the students and communities where they are,

1
2 our Implicit Bias Training, our Culturally Relevant
3 Pedagogy training and then quite frankly yours truly
4 is going to be allowed a very upfront spokesperson
5 for historically underserved communities, our LGBTQ
6 community. The most endangered student group in any
7 school district in America is our LGBTQ students. We
8 have a responsibility to serve those students and
9 provide them with the social-emotional learning
10 needs, and the support systems to be successful. As
11 a former English Language Learner student [Speaking
12 Spanish] By the way, if you didn't speak Spanish,
13 welcome to what it feels like to be an English
14 Language Learner.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Uh-hm.

16 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: You don't know the
17 language. That's all. So, I want to make sure that
18 every student group in this organization is serving
19 those student groups. So, the very issues that
20 you've identified, my experience has been that when
21 you are very clear about the investment, you're very
22 clear about the monitoring, you're very clear about
23 the alignment of the system that teacher retention
24 goes up, student achievement goes up, and not just
25 measured by test scores, but by holistic measures,

1
2 and that communities actually revitalize around their
3 schools. That's been my experience, and I hope work
4 with my colleagues in our system and with our elected
5 officials to make that a reality in every community
6 in the New York City Public Schools.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I think—I think one
8 of the hallmarks of Chancellor Farina was her
9 emphasis on collaboration as well, and that
10 particularly affects professional development. I
11 know that as a teacher I would be hesitant to
12 collaborate or share ideas with teachers if I thought
13 it was going to be a competitive environment. There
14 would be no incentive for me to want to do that to
15 give other ideas to teachers if it was, in fact,
16 competitive. So, I'm glad to hear a number of the
17 programs that you're talking about. Can you tell us
18 how much will be spent this year on professional
19 development?

20 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: I—let me see if I
21 can find that number. I know it's a significant
22 investment including the investments that I've just
23 spoken about in terms of Culturally Relevant Pedagogy
24 and Implicit Bias training. I know that in our
25 conversations with UFT initially we are on the same

1
2 page in terms of investing in our educators. As I've
3 spoken with our administrators as well, we are on the
4 same page about professional development for our
5 principals. So, if you have the ability to determine
6 what school budgets are going to be, it should
7 probably be a thing that there's collaboration around
8 what those dollars are going to be. I'm going to ask
9 our Chief Operating Officer Ursulina Ramirez to see
10 if she has that specific number, sir.

11 URSULINA RAMIREZ: So, Chair Dromm, we're
12 going to get back to you with the specifics on how-
13 how much we spent in this past fiscal year on
14 professional development, but as the Chancellor
15 alluded to, a lot of the initiatives that we are
16 launching all include a profession development
17 component including Civics for All, and our recent
18 announcement Health Education, but we'll get back to
19 you with the specifics on what was spent.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: How do you assess
21 your Professional Development?

22 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: [background
23 comments] So, we're going to tag team this one.
24 Again, I'm the new guy in-in the building so I'm
25 still trying to assess how we assess our professional

1
2 development if that makes sense, but by and large the
3 indicator of the professional development is you have
4 to start with those receiving the profession
5 development. So, as a teacher I was always struck by
6 the drive-by professional development. You have one
7 dosage. Now, you're fixed. Now you're an expert at
8 implementation. We know that professional
9 development is much more complex. It has to be job
10 embedded. It has to be job related, and it has to be
11 a continuous process for refreshing and building on
12 those skills. I am happy to say that as I've looked
13 at the approach we've taken in the Department of
14 Education, we've built coaching and--and coaching
15 positions not consultants, but our own teachers in
16 master teacher roles that are doing that kind of
17 professional development for our own teachers. I
18 think that is a universal best practice. For me, the
19 other indicator is what is the intent of your
20 professional development, and then you align. Are
21 you seeing outcomes that are better after you've had
22 professional development implemented? So, for us
23 quite frankly as I look at our investment for example
24 in restorative practices, the restorative practices,
25 the positive behavioral supports, inclusionary

1
2 practices, one of the indicators that I'm going to be
3 monitoring is how many students are now being
4 expelled from school? So how many suspensions?
5 Who's being suspended? How long are they being
6 suspended? I'm going to look at disciplinary
7 infractions in schools and what do they look like?
8 I'm going to be looking at the climate and culture
9 surveys that we do in our schools in terms of how do
10 students feel? How do parents feel? How do staff
11 members feel in terms of the climate. One of the—one
12 of the sayings and—and Chairman you'll hear me use
13 lots of sayings. That's just how I learn, but one of
14 the sayings that I think is really, really important
15 is: Culture eats strategy for breakfast. So, if you
16 don't address culture in a school and in a school
17 system, it doesn't matter what strategy you use, it's
18 never going to take hold. So what I'm very grateful
19 to Chancellor Farina for is her real focus on
20 changing the culture of the organization. I want to
21 continue that, and accelerate that with the
22 professional development that we're doing.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, one of the things
24 that used to drive me crazy as an educator is when a
25 certain reading program would come into the schools

1
2 to train us, and they would turn the question on you
3 to say well, how would you deal with that situation
4 in the classroom? Rather than giving me concrete
5 ideas. I hope that you will look at some of those
6 programs, and make sure that they're not telling
7 teachers that same thing because that's what they're
8 being hired to do. The same thing kind of applies I
9 think also to the Restorative Practices, and they are
10 different types of restorative justice programs
11 within the schools. Some of them do have full-time
12 people. Some of them are like the Positive Learning
13 Collaborative that the United--the United Federation
14 of Teachers has been doing. So, I would urge you
15 also to look at how effective the different programs
16 are. From my experience, the programs that have a
17 full-time person dedicated and ensuring that
18 everybody in the school is trained in restorative
19 work much better than those who, you know, when you
20 only train teachers, and I've used this example
21 before. For me even I would try to use restorative
22 practices in my classroom. Yeah, okay, I was able to
23 get so far with the kids, but then I'd have to bring
24 them down to--to the cafeteria or out to the yard for
25 lunch time, and inevitably every day I'd have two or

1
2 three kids sitting in the principal's office when I
3 went to pick them up because others in the school
4 building were not trained in the same practices. So,
5 we hope that you'll look at that as well. Let me go
6 to some questions on fair student funding. Will this
7 Administration commit to bringing fair student
8 funding to 100% level by the end of this Mayor's
9 term.

10 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: So, just a quick
11 comment on what you just mentioned, sir. We
12 absolutely will keep that in mind. I couldn't be
13 more aligned with your thinking about professional
14 development. Fair Student Funding I've often
15 ascribed this in the community meetings that I've
16 had. As the Chancellor of Schools I don't sell
17 anything. I don't have the ability to raise the
18 price on the product. We don't educate—we don't
19 build widgets. We educate souls. So, as a result,
20 we're dependent on the funding that we receive not
21 only from the city, but more importantly from the
22 State of New York and the Constitution of the State
23 of New York has a requirement for public education.
24 So, what I am absolutely committed to is working
25 hand-in-hand with our City Council in advocating for

1
2 full funding from the state to the—the city of New
3 York, but also to the Department of Education so that
4 we can actually invest that money directly in schools
5 and bring everybody up to 100%. Now I have to say
6 that as I looked at the percentage of investment from
7 the city's tax levy into our public schools I was
8 both amazed, impressed and saddened to see the fact
9 that city of New York has really taken up the mantle
10 and invested in our public schools whereas quite
11 frankly, and I'm not picking a fight with anybody,
12 but I'm going to have that fight. The state has not
13 lived up to its responsibility. So, while I give
14 kudos to the City Council and the City and the Mayor
15 for investing in our public schools, we need to have
16 an all-out I would say action to encourage Albany to
17 live up to their Constitutional responsibility and
18 fully fund our public schools. We know that if that
19 happens, we will be able to not only reduce class
20 size, we know that we will be able to address some of
21 the differentiated learning needs of our communities.
22 We know that communities that want to have a full
23 array of different kinds of programming for our
24 students will be able to do that. Full funding lifts
25 all votes. So, we're committed to working hand-in-

1
2 hand, shoulder-by-shoulder with all of our elected
3 officials in the city of New York to advocate for
4 full funding at the state level.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: How much more money
6 will be needed to get to the 100% level?

7 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Yeah.

8 RAY ORLANDO: Hi, approximately \$610
9 million would be necessary to bring all schools to
10 100%?

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: \$610 million.

12 RAY ORLANDO: Yes.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And just identify
14 yourself for the record.

15 RAY ORLANDO: Ray Orlando, Chief
16 Financial Officer.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Okay, so
18 \$610 million more. Let me talk a little bit now
19 about the school support services. In 2016, the New
20 York City–New York City created the New York City
21 School Support Services, a non-profit to provide
22 custodial staff to schools. At the time of the
23 announcement, the Administration said this would cost
24 neutral by Fiscal 19. However, significant funding
25 was added in Fiscal 2017 to 21 for the custodial

1
2 restructuring. What cost savings resulted from the
3 transition to--to the School Support Services Program,
4 and what are the expected cost savings in Fiscal 19
5 and the out-years?

6 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Thank you,
7 Chairman. So, at this point I'm going to--I'm going
8 to use the first of my phone a friend card because
9 I'm not fully briefed on this, but I'm going to ask
10 our Chief Operating Officer Ramirez and perhaps our
11 CFO if they can answer that for you.

12 URSULINA RAMIREZ: So, we're working
13 close with our--with NY--we call it NYSAIS to address
14 cost savings in the out-years, but our primary goal
15 is to make sure that all of our schools are clean and
16 a safe place for our students to be, and so we're
17 working closely with OMB to make sure that there's
18 ample funding so that our--our schools stay clean, and
19 that our principals are satisfied with the work
20 that's happening in the buildings.

21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, we know that
22 there's \$45 million included in the Budget for the
23 contract for--in Fiscal 2020 to 2021. Some of the
24 members of that union who are worker in that--

25 URSULINA RAMIREZ: [interposing] Yes.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: --in that program are
3 here. Are you committing to making sure that we
4 continue that funding right through the end of the--of
5 2021?

6 URSULINA RAMIREZ: So, we're committed to
7 working with both the union OMB and City Hall to make
8 sure that our schools are kept intact in terms of
9 being clean and working with the unions to make sure
10 that there are no impacts on their work.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well, hopefully we're
12 going to come to that conclusion--

13 URSULINA RAMIREZ: [interposing] Yes.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: --and we're going to
15 keep a close on that as well here in the Council.
16 Before I go to my colleagues, by the way, let me just
17 say that we have been joined by Council Member
18 Gibson, Council Member Brannan, Council Member
19 Lander, Council Member Gjonaj, Council Member Barron,
20 Council Member Rodriguez, Council Member Rosenthal,
21 Council Member Menchaca and Council Member Diaz. We
22 have a very large education committee, and a large
23 Finance Committee, but we're glad that everybody is
24 here joining us today, and because we have so many
25 people, I am going to cut it short. Of course I have

1
2 to ask a question about the Anti-Bullying Complaint
3 Portal and how that's going. So, that's something
4 that came about as a terrible tragedy that had
5 occurred in the Bronx when a LGBT student was accused
6 of killing another student in his class allegedly
7 because he was bullied. None of that has been
8 settled yet. The case is in court and I'm not asking
9 to speak to that, but at that time the Mayor did
10 commit I think it was \$10.3 million to creating this
11 portal to educating staff, staff training,
12 development, professional development on it as well
13 as funding for diversity clubs and GSAs. Can you
14 update us on the status of what's happening with that
15 program?

16 URSULINA RAMIREZ: So, I can give you a
17 high level update around the bullying portal. It has
18 launched and we are constantly looking at ways to
19 make improvements on it so that we can make sure that
20 it's accessible for families, and I can report back
21 on kind of high level what we're seeing from the
22 portal after this. I don't have the details in front
23 of me. We are making, as you mentioned--

24

25

1

2

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Ms. Ramirez, did you
say the portal. I'm sorry, it's a little hard to
hear. Did you say that the Portal has launched?

5

6

URSULINA RAMIREZ: There has been--there
has a parent-facing part of the portal that has
launched. We looking to make consistent updates to
it to make sure that it is more accessible and tech
friendly.

9

10

11

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Can you just tell me
how--if somebody was to make a complaint--

12

URSULINA RAMIREZ: Uh-hm.

13

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: --where does that go?

14

15

URSULINA RAMIREZ: So, if you can--if you
call 311, that automatically goes into our internal
systems and we have somebody contact the family.

16

17

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So--

18

19

URSULINA RAMIREZ: [interposing] But you
can also go online and also fill out--

20

21

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: [interposing] Is that
done through the Office of Kenyatte Reid?

22

23

URSULINA RAMIREZ: Part of Kenyatte
Reid's office, correct.

24

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay.

25

1

2

URSULINA RAMIREZ: It's Safety and Youth
Development.

3

4

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: What I'm trying to
get at is who is responsible to make sure that
there's a follow up to that complaint?

5

6

7

URSULINA RAMIREZ: So, Kenyatte Reid's
Office is responsible for that. I will circle back
with who explicitly is responsible for getting back
in touch with parents, but we do make sure that we
are being responsive to families who are putting in a
complaint to that portal.

10

11

12

13

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, and when do you
expect to have the portal fully up and running?

14

15

URSULINA RAMIREZ: In the spring. I'm
sorry. This year--later on this year so spring.

16

17

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, alright. We'd
really, really like to get that answered fully--

18

19

URSULINA RAMIREZ: Yes.

20

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: --because that's a
really important question.

21

22

URSULINA RAMIREZ: 100%.

23

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And then it's a life
saving question, what about the GSAs? Has money

24

25

1

2

gone—has money gone out to the GSAs and to the
diversity clubs?

3

4

URSULINA RAMIREZ: One second. Yes. So
we have made investments this year and are in GSAs in
addition to other student clubs. I believe we have
spent approximately \$ Yes. So we have made
investments this year and are in GSAs in addition to
other student clubs. I believe we have spent
approximately \$50,000 on supporting individual
schools for GSAs thus far. We have more investments
to make.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: For \$50,000?

14

URSULINA RAMIREZ: Correct.

15

16

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And it's supposed to
go to a million, right?

17

18

19

URSULINA RAMIREZ: I have a—I have a half
a million for all of our LGBTs, but I'll circle back
with you on that.

20

21

22

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well, I thought it
was a million for support for Diversity Clubs.

[pause]

23

24

25

URSULINA RAMIREZ: Yes, it—it would—it's
a million dollars that goes to all students clubs
including GSAs. Sorry.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Uh-hm. Oh, so that was \$50,000 specifically for GSAs?

URSULINA RAMIREZ: That was \$50,000 just that has been allocated thus far.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Alright.

URSULINA RAMIREZ: But I'll—I'll specify and circle back with you of whether that was for GSAs explicitly or if that was for all school clubs.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, it-it is a million?

URSULINA RAMIREZ: Yep.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: But when—when do you think that that money will be spent? Does that money have to be spent by June 30th? [background comments, pause]

RAY ORLANDO: So, there's funding in the current year as well as out-years for this, and we'll know better on how the—how much was spent as the year ends next month.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, and I see—

RAY ORLANDO: [interposing] We can get back to you for sure.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: --that a memo went
3 out on how schools can apply for this funding
4 recently--

5 RAY ORLANDO: Yes.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: --and I think the
7 deadline is the 25th.

8 RAY ORLANDO: Yes.

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Is that correct.

10 RAY ORLANDO: I believe so.

11 URSULINA RAMIREZ: [off mic] Correct. [on
12 mic] That is correct.

13 URSULINA RAMIREZ: Okay and then what
14 about the professional development?

15 URSULINA RAMIREZ: So, the professional
16 development is ongoing, and you know, I-I do want to
17 thank you for your initial investments that you've
18 made in this work, and as you know, both Kimberly
19 Shannon and Jared Fox have been kind of doing a road
20 show and making sure they're providing professional
21 development to a lot of schools. But things are
22 ongoing and they're--and a lot. There's a lot of
23 requests for PD in this area, and we are making sure
24 that we are providing Jared ample supports to do
25 that.

1

2

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, I'm glad that you
acknowledge that are a lot of requests and I think
that Jared has been doing a fantastic job. Maybe we
need another Jared, and I would really urge you to
consider that because from what I understand is that
he's pretty much overwhelmed with requests.

8

URSULINA RAMIREZ: He is overwhelmed with
requests, and he is trying to figure out how to
prioritize--to--to the Chancellor's point around
equity, you know, what is the most need. I think
Jared is not replicable, but trying to find somebody
who can support him I think is--is the right idea.

14

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: No, I agree. I just
think that, you know, now that this issue is being
discussed fully and it's a priority for the
Chancellor that we should probably look at that
because I think that teachers want this information
and they need it desperately because they are dealing
with this--with this issue more and more in the
classrooms.

22

URSULINA RAMIREZ: Agreed. So, we'll
look into that and get back to you.

24

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, you. I'm going
to turn it over Chair Treyger now.

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you, Chair Dromm and I just want to before I go into my questions, I just want to also thank the Chancellor for acknowledging the the—the state of some of many of our schools, for acknowledging that our—that there are a quite a number of schools that have historically been underfunded, underserved systematically, methodically disproportionately affecting certain communities more than others, and I share that exact same sentiment and I really appreciate that. No, child, no staff member of a school, no teacher, no parent makes a conscious decision to underperform, and it's the government that has failed too many communities. So I do want to begin by thanking you for that acknowledgement. Mr. Chancellor, I shared some data before in my opening remarks. I just want to repeat some of it. According to DOE figures, there are 1,293 social workers. There's 2,880 guidance counselors, 583 school psychologists and over 5,500 school safety officers, and just to note guidance counselors at the elementary school level are not mandated. In a school system of over 1.1 million children, do you

1
2 believe that we are effectively meeting the social
3 and emotional needs of our students?

4 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: So, Chairman
5 Treyger, I think that we always can make more
6 investments in that regard. Unfortunately, some of
7 the legacy federal programs and rhetoric that has
8 happened around public education has focused on
9 accountability in terms of academics and that's
10 important, but there is a growing body of research as
11 well as a movement to recognize that not only is it
12 important for students to be able to read and to
13 write and do arithmetic and science, but it's also
14 important for students to be well adjusted and well
15 supported in an educational environment to be able to
16 engage in the academic learning process. So, as all
17 of us across the nation are now realizing and
18 revamping our systems to acknowledge that in terms of
19 not only curriculum, but also professional
20 development and staffing, we are in the process of
21 aligning ourselves to that. So, I-I-I am very much
22 professionally in support increasing how we provide
23 that support in terms of essential positions around
24 guidance counseling, in many of our schools social
25 workers that are necessary, community school

1 coordinators as well. So that is a growing body of
2 work that I'm very, very interested in supporting in
3 our system.
4

5 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right, as I shared
6 with you, Mr. Chancellor and at the—at the past
7 funding press conference, the Chair and I witnessed
8 the impact of a social worker in a school building
9 creating a feeling of safe—of welcomeness and a
10 sanctuary and safety and how that had a cascading
11 effect on attendance and academic outcomes. So, I—I
12 really believe that this is an area that we have to
13 do better on. According to an answer we received
14 from the DOE, we—we received this reply to a
15 questions about—the question was: How many schools
16 do not have a dedicated guidance counselor and/or
17 social worker and what is the cost of providing this
18 in all schools and this is the answer we received:
19 Forty-one schools have no guidance counselor or
20 social worker. The cost to provide at least one
21 full-time guidance counselors or social worker to
22 these schools would be approximately \$5.2 million.
23 So, \$5.2 million in a budget of over \$25 billion.
24 Mr. Chancellor, can you commit to making sure that
25

1 every single school has at least one guidance
2 counselor and social worker?
3

4 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Well, again, not
5 knowing what those schools are, what the composition
6 of those schools are, and again, being very clear
7 that I think it's important that we have guidance
8 counseling and that we have social workers. I also
9 think it's important and our system has memorialized
10 the notion that there is local control. Students-
11 principals get to make decisions along with their
12 staffs around what they want to prioritize in their
13 funding. Again, I'll go back to the plea that I've
14 made and that is Council has been very supportive of
15 fully funding the Fair Student Funding Formula.
16 That-that would give everyone a level of funding that
17 would ensure that there's resources to fund these
18 types of essential positions. What I will commit to
19 is that we will look at what those schools are and
20 where they're-where they are investing their
21 resources, and absolutely work towards making sure
22 that all student needs are being met in those
23 schools.

24 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right, and as we-as
25 I also mentioned in my opening remarks there is only

1
2 I believe a minimal increase to the amount of social
3 supports for students in temporary housing. Over
4 100,000 students in temporary housing. There is an
5 insufficient amount of social support, social
6 workers, dedicated licensed personnel and the reason
7 why I specify these titles these are folks who are
8 licensed and credentialed to do this work. We can't
9 cut corners on these issues.

10 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Uh-hm.

11 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: We need folks who
12 know what they're doing, who are trained and licensed
13 in this particular field, and this is a critical
14 needed investment because we--we have read reports,
15 we have spoken with families where students are, you
16 know, there's chronic absenteeism, there's almost no
17 follow-up work happening. This is an area that we
18 have fallen short on, and we--we have to address. I
19 want to Fair Student Funding. I know my colleague
20 touched upon this, but let's--let's go back to this
21 issue. So there are currently 93 schools receiving
22 over 100% of their Fair Student Funding. These
23 schools range from receiving 101% to 161% this school
24 year. At the same time, there are 703 schools
25 receiving less than 90%. Please explain this

1
2 variance in funding in funding amount and if there
3 are plans to correct this and equitably distribute
4 FSF among all schools?

5 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Chairman Treyger,
6 I'm going to ask our CFO to answer that question for
7 you please.

8 RAY ORLANDO: Good morning. Yes, there
9 are schools that are over 100% of the Fair Student
10 Funding formula. I would remind everyone that the
11 Fair Student Funding Formula makes up about 60% of
12 the average schools' budget, the 40% coming from the
13 100 odd other school allocation memos. As to the
14 schools that are over 100%, the—at the birth of the
15 formula back in school year 2007-2008, no school was
16 determined—was going to be allowed to receive less
17 money than it had received in the prior school year.
18 So, at that time, schools had different levels of
19 support based on each community school district and
20 superintendents' determination, and so when you ran
21 the formula against those allocations, some schools
22 were, in fact, above. At that time, the decision was
23 made that no school could lose—would receive less
24 money year over year and so it's a legacy of the
25 implementation of the formula dating back over ten

1
2 years that some schools are over 100%. For what it's
3 worth, the fact remains that we have been working
4 very carefully over the last four years to go like
5 this, if you'll pardon the—the image to bring the
6 schools at the bottom up, to bring the schools over
7 100 down. We've made significant changes to our
8 policies to—to allow for schools to float downwards
9 over time in an attempt to make the system more
10 equitable. For what it's worth, most of the schools
11 over 100% are between 100 and 110 not that that's
12 much comfort obviously to schools below 100% but it
13 is both a small number of school and a legacy of the
14 implementation of the system.

15 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right, and I just
16 want to, you know, give for an example Abraham
17 Lincoln High School in Coney Island in my district
18 because they were at 87% and the new floor will be
19 90%, we'll see a couple hundred thousand dollar
20 increase to their school budget, and that's the
21 difference between, you know, art/music programs,
22 social workers, and other types of supports and we
23 just have so much more to go in terms of raising the
24 floor. Now look, I—I agree with you. We—we went to
25 Albany, and we spoke to the Governor directly, we

1
2 spoke to other folks directly about fulfilling CFE
3 obligations and we made it also very clear that there
4 is transparency in our school budgets. There is—
5 there is lot of misinformation about their—about that
6 issue, and we brought copies of school allocation
7 memos with us. Having said that, we have to make
8 sure that when we do see increases in school aid that
9 they actually reach the school communities, and-and
10 that's something that is very important to us. Do
11 you believe that FSF is the right measure in
12 determining how much funding a school requires for
13 their instructional needs? Are there other measures
14 that DOE should be looking at to assess whether
15 schools are adequately funded?

16 RAY ORLANDO: We strongly support the
17 formula. We review the formula annually based on the
18 data available to us that feeds the various
19 components of the formula, but we believe that the
20 formula does allocate—we don't believe there's a
21 problem with the formula. We believe there's a
22 problem with the funding right, and if we were able
23 to bring all schools to 100% with the state aid
24 that's been denied to us, we think the formula works
25 for us. Could the formula have—you've made some

1
2 suggestions about what other—other permutations that
3 could be added to the formula and stuff like that.
4 We'd be happy to talk about those kinds of things
5 with you, and other interested parties for sure, but
6 we—we—we believe in the formula.

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right, I—I just
8 want to just reiterate that in examining the formula
9 I believe that poverty has accounted for up to the
10 third grade, but the amounts of funding that we have
11 pegged for poverty I think is grossly insufficient.
12 It is under \$500 per student. I—I believe that first
13 of all I think we need to understand that poverty
14 exists beyond the third grade a well, and I do not
15 believe that test scores are an effective proxy
16 beyond the third grade to deal with issues of poverty
17 and we do need increase that amount. Do we agree on
18 that?

19 RAY ORLANDO: I could agree with you that
20 the formula could encompass other types of weights,
21 and we'd be happy to discuss what those weights might
22 look like and how much they might cost when we've got
23 to. (sic)

24 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: The Executive
25 Budget baselines \$20 million in OTPS savings at DOE

1
2 from unspent funds in school budgets. At the same
3 time, it makes a \$125 million investment in school
4 budgets. Was this \$20 million in savings used to pay
5 for the additional investment in funding. If not,
6 why not and what will these savings be used towards?
7 [pause]

8 RAY ORLANDO: As part of our ongoing work
9 with the Office of Management and Budget, and City
10 Hall and you all, we're constantly looking at our
11 budget to identify policies and programs to meet the
12 needs of students. This particular reduction is
13 related to the fact that it's very difficult to
14 manage your budget to zero, as I think we all know,
15 and so from time to time schools run surpluses in any
16 given year, and we have business rules around which
17 schools are able to use those funds in the subsequent
18 year. This doesn't affect the current year. It
19 affects the—the—schools in the current year will be
20 able to continue to roll over their surpluses as they
21 have and in the next year we're going to look at the
22 business rules around that, and if we can find a
23 better way to save that \$20 million, we will.

24 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I—I will take you
25 up on your offer, Mr. Chancellor to—we'll go up to

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Albany together. We'll advocate as much as we can to make the case. We just need to be clear when we go to Albany and others where this funding actually goes towards, but this is an area that we do agree that Albany needs to fund--New York State the city schools both the historic costs and--and the current costs. I want to discuss Paid Parental Leave. How much would it cost to provide Paid Parental Leave to all DOE Staff?

URSULINA RAMIREZ: I'll--I'll start this, and it's--it's complicated in terms of--these are ongoing labor negotiations and it's kind of complicated to develop those costs, but I'll have Ray kind of speak to that.

RAY ORLANDO: Sure, just briefly, Councilman. It depends a lot on how many people become pregnant, how many women become pregnant or how many folks choose to adopt or foster children. It becomes very difficult to determine with, in fact, that occurs. There are a lot of--it's very--it's very complicated and it's very hard to--to calculate how much it might cost, and as Ursulina mentioned, we're--we've been speaking with folks about that on the

1 labor relations side as part of the collective
2 bargaining discussions that have been ongoing.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right, I-I just
5 want to make very clear that as I mentioned in my
6 opening remarks, Mr. Chancellor right now our current
7 system forces educators to declare a sickness in
8 order to raise a family, and I don't believe raising
9 a family is a sickness. I think my colleagues agree
10 with that statement, and I hope that the DOE agrees
11 with that statement, and I believe that we have to do
12 everything possible to rectify this immediately and--
13 and I understand that there are negotiations and
14 discussions, but the--the--the public impact of not
15 having this policy in place is first of all according
16 to DOE's own figures we are losing quality educators
17 particularly after three, four, or five years of
18 service. That data is clear. There are public
19 health benefits. There are so many other social
20 benefits in making sure this policy is in place. I
21 just want to emphasize to this Administration to the
22 Chancellor and--and to folks this is critical. This
23 is critically important to this Council, critically
24 important to New York City, and our families that we
25 get this done.

1
2 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Chairman Treyger,
3 if—if I may. So, obviously we're not going to
4 negotiate in public.

5 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right.

6 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: That
7 notwithstanding let me be very clear as the
8 Chancellor of the New York City Public School System
9 our biggest, greatest most valuable asset in our
10 system aside from the students we serve are those
11 that are teaching our students, those that are in the
12 classroom, those that are working with our students
13 directly. So, we will be and I will be very
14 supportive of anything that helps those individuals
15 not only stay with our system but provide the best
16 service to our students and our communities, and also
17 treat them with the respect that they deserve. So,
18 again, I think it's pretty clear our commitment is
19 exactly aligned with what you've stated here today.

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you. Thank
21 you, Mr. Chancellor. We have some things in common.
22 We're going up to Albany to fight for our schools.
23 We both like the color blue, and we—we value our
24 educators. I have one last question area, and then
25 I'll turn to my colleagues who have been very

1 patient. Accessibility. True integration of schools
2 would require the integration of students with
3 mobility impairments. DOE's current quantitative
4 accessibility goals focus on district percentages for
5 elementary grades. Under the current Capital Plan,
6 DOE's goal is to reach a maximum—a minimum sorry—a
7 minimum of 30% building accessibility for elementary
8 grades in every district. DOE's goal for the next
9 Five-Year Capital Plan is to reach 40% for elementary
10 grades across all districts contingent upon available
11 funding. How many additional projects or how much
12 additional funding would be required to meet 50%
13 building accessibility for elementary grades in every
14 district in the next Five-Year Capital Plan?

16 LORRAINE GRILLO: Thank you, Chairman.
17 At this point it would be impossible for me to say.
18 We would have to do a survey and we would have to
19 figure that out. We can get back to you on it.

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: This is an issue
21 that's very personal to me as a former teacher and
22 personal very much to our colleagues. We have heard
23 from parents and families, from advocates. This is a
24 real, real problem in our school system. This is a
25 part of the segregation conversation as well that

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

there are too many schools not accessible to our kids, and to our families and the message is—the message it's sending is that this school is not for you, and that is just not acceptable. Now, I also just want to just make sure that we're clear. Before the Prelim Budget hearing, you confirmed that you are on track to have 60 accessible emergency shelter sites by the fall of 2018. Is this still the case?

LORRAINE GRILLO: That's still the case.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: There's been no change?

LORRAINE GRILLO: No, none.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And no request of a court extension because last year the City Administration asked the court to extend--

CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: [interposing] We're on track, sir.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: We're on track. I will—I have some additional questions, but in the interest of time, I will now turn it back to Chair Dromm.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Just before we leave that question, though, President Grillo, I had the BOE here, the Board of Elections last week, and they

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

spend a large amount of money on ramps for the elections, and I'm wondering are you coordinating with them, and is there any possibility that we could look at permanent ramp construction to alleviate the cost that we had to spend not only just for putting those ramps in every election time, but also for the storage. So, do you coordinate with the DOE?

LORRAINE GRILLO: We-we do coordinate with the Board of Elections, and-[background comments, pause] So--

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I'm sorry.

LORRAINE GRILLO: This is Tom Taratko (sp?) He is in Charge of Space Management and really is managing for the DOE the Accessibility Program. So, he's best to answer that question.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, we--so that's--that is part of the conversation--that is a conversation that's ongoing in terms of making the schools more accessible?

LORRAINE GRILLO: Absolutely, absolutely and we coordinate with Board of Elections constantly.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Will we see in the future some reduction in terms of the number of ramps that the DOE needs to install?

1
2 LORRAINE GRILLO: As we continue to make
3 these building accessible, I'm sure that's—that will
4 be the case.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, alright. Thank
6 you. Oh, one last question if I can with Chair
7 Prerogative here. In your testimony, President
8 Grillo, you mentioned that were 8,000 new seats,
9 additional seats. Where will those seats be?

10 LORRAINE GRILLO: Throughout—throughout
11 the city in those overcrowded districts and you will
12 see that in the Capital Plan.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, and it's about
14 eight schools maybe right?

15 LORRAINE GRILLO: Eight to ten schools
16 depending upon the grade levels.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. Alright, thank
18 you. We have been joined by Council Member Borelli,
19 Council Member Levin, Council Member Kallos, Council
20 Member Salamanca, and now we're going to go to
21 questions from Council Members. We'll start with
22 Council Member Grodenchik, followed by Adams, Holden
23 and Rose.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you, Mr.
25 Chair. Good morning, Chancellor. Good morning

1
2 Lorraine. I was worried that we were going to ignore
3 you totally. I was just sitting there and figuring
4 [laughter] you might not. So, I want to say before I
5 get into the Chancellor, I want to thank you, Ms.
6 Grillo for—for your collaboration in Eastern Queens
7 and look forward to building those and more at more
8 sited. So, I promise you. Mr. Chancellor, I think
9 it's the fourth time I've seen you, which is pretty
10 good for a guy from Eastern Queens. I don't—we—we—
11 we—it's where the—where the prairie meets the city.
12 I do want to talk about what Chair Treyger talked
13 about and that is fair student funding, and Mr.
14 Orlando said that it only makes up 60%. So, that's
15 disappointing, but it's also encouraging at the same
16 time because it means more money is going into the
17 classrooms. I know you've only been here eight
18 weeks, and you've had whirlwind, but I can't stress
19 strongly enough how important it is to get more money
20 into the hands of the educators taking it out of the
21 hands of the bureaucrats because principal after
22 principal that I speak to and I meet with all of them
23 during the school year some of them many times,
24 relate to how, as Chair Treyger said, how they could
25 do more whatever they want to do. I'm not—I'm not

1
2 picking on whether it's guidance counselors and more
3 parents and more teachers, but it's so important that
4 we get more money into the hands of the principals
5 and the leadership teams in the schools. You know,
6 some of my schools I was trying to figure out. I
7 have three of my schools here they're fair student
8 funding formulas. I counted 33 separate lines, and I
9 was being generous, and it may be more. So, I don't
10 know if you've had a chance to look at this for
11 formula yet, but take a few Excedrin before you do
12 because it's a cause of an instant headache. I-I
13 would just ask in my question I guess I would like to
14 Mr. Orlando, if you could give me a card because I'd
15 like to call you, and we can talk about how funds get
16 into schools. I'd like to talk to you, Mr.
17 Chancellor and just ask you how do you-do you have a
18 plan yet for getting more money out of the
19 bureaucracy and more money into the classrooms
20 because that really where the rubber meets the road.

21 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: So, I appreciate
22 it, sir and I-I promise I'm not stalking you, but it
23 has been good to see you.

24

25

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: That's

3

alright, I've stalked—I've been stalked by worse.

4

So, you know, the School's Chancellor is not so bad.

5

CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: But I have enjoyed

6

our—our visits together. So, thank you so much.

7

Again, you—the—the lens that we're applying is the

8

lens of equity. So, in a system in any system you

9

have to assess the needs of the system, and if we

10

truly believe that all students in the system should

11

be served well, then recognizing that not all

12

students cross our threshold equally prepared or with

13

even the same amount of challenges or privileges,

14

then you have to from an equity perspective provide

15

the supports are necessary in schools. Now, there

16

are funding mechanisms for providing for those kinds

17

of students. We've talked about how are we providing

18

supports for students in temporary housing. By

19

definition, the supports that we—the millions of

20

dollars that we invest in making sure that we are

21

providing supports to those student in temporary

22

housing could be considered bureaucracy because

23

they're not people that are necessarily in the

24

classroom teaching students, but they're critically

25

important in meeting the need that exists within the

1
2 organization. So, part of the work that we're doing
3 is to identify what are those essential supports?
4 How are they tied to the priorities that not only the
5 Mayor has identified but the City Council has
6 identified, and our, quite frankly, our stakeholders
7 have identified, and then be as transparent and clear
8 as possible about where that's going. I'll give you
9 an example. We have social workers in our school
10 system that work in schools, but we also have Single
11 Shepherd Program where we have social workers that
12 don't work necessarily tied to a school, but tied to
13 a caseload. I heard a story of a Single Shepherd
14 social worker that followed a student to court
15 because they had an incident they had to go to court
16 to, waited in court with that student for almost
17 seven hours until that case was looked at by the
18 judge, and the judge was impressed that that student
19 had an advocate there with them the whole time, and
20 whereas that judge may not have granted that student
21 the ability to leave. Because they had an adult that
22 cared said you're free to go. Those are the types of
23 investments that we're making where that social
24 worker had they been placed specifically at a school
25 may not have had the latitude to leave the school and

1
2 go with that student. So, we're trying to be as
3 thoughtful as we can about how we're supporting
4 schools and how we're supporting the goals that we
5 have and quite frankly our moral values in our school
6 systems. That being said, we are looking at
7 efficiencies. We are looking. I'll—I'll and I'll be
8 very clear about this. As I've looked at how we for
9 example a central part of what we do in our school
10 system is how do we teach reading in our school
11 system? I've stopped counting the number of reading
12 programs we have in our school system. Why? Because
13 we have this sense that we should have local control
14 and local decision making, and that's fine and that's
15 good except when you're talking about efficiencies
16 when you're talking about economies of scale, there
17 needs to be a little bit more tighter alignment
18 between what are we doing instructionally? How are
19 we then leveraging resources to provide not only
20 professional development support, supervision,
21 instructional materials, et cetera, and laissez-faire
22 system that allows anybody to decide anything because
23 you have local control. That's the balance that
24 we're going to be working, and that's the balance
25 that I'm going to be engaging in conversations not

1
2 only with our principles but our teachers around how
3 much is too much? How can we go from 32 different—
4 and I'm just using that as an example, 32 different
5 reading programs to let's say five. Five that we
6 know are effective, five that we know that are—are
7 showing results for our communities in the school
8 system, and then we can much more effectively support
9 five rather than 30 or 40 or 50. Those are the types
10 of efficiencies that I'm just rolling up my sleeves,
11 and getting into as we go forward, but whatever we
12 do, we want to identify how we're going to be able to
13 invest more resources in our schools, and actually
14 give principals, and I want to be really about this.
15 I am a former principal, but I've—I often become
16 very, very nervous when I hear—and this is not to you
17 Council Member, but anyone in the community that says
18 well the principal can decide how they're going to
19 use their resources? No, they can't. A principal
20 should be working with their community. So, they
21 should be working with their teachers. They should
22 be working with their support staff. They should be
23 working with their parents and the community should
24 be deciding how they're investing their resources in
25 that particular community. So, there's a number of

1
2 things that we're trying to do to make sure that
3 that's effective and efficient, but again I'm going
4 to keep—I'm going to be a broken record on this. We
5 need to ensure that Albany is going to fully fund
6 because then that gives us resources to actually move
7 right directly into our school communities as well.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: So, just to
9 follow up if we got more money from Albany we could
10 sent it right to the classrooms because we wouldn't
11 need any additional bureaucracy. [laughter]

12 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Well, it depends
13 what you mean by bureaucracy. I mean--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: [interposing]
15 Well, listen, I—I have bureaucracy in my house. I
16 have to pay for the—the, you know, I got to pay Con-
17 Ed, I got to pay National Grid, but I don't want to
18 give them one penny more than they deserve. So,
19 that's where I'm at and—and--

20 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: I agree.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: --and I—I
22 appreciate you, and I appreciate your willingness to
23 take on this very, very difficult task. Thank you,
24 Mr. Chairman.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Council
Member Adams.

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you very
much [coughs] Chairs Dromm and Treyger. Good morning
to all of you. It's so nice to see you. So, nice to
see you President Grillo as well. Chancellor,
welcome. I represent the 28th District, Jamaica,
Richmond Hill and South Ozone Park in Queens, and
I've been hearing of your visits, and I thank you
very much for them. I have been a very vocal
proponent of co-location for a number of years, and I
don't think it's any secret to a lot of folks out
there. I just wanted to mention something, and then
I'm going to go into another line of questioning.
August Martin High School in Jamaica, in September
will [coughs] include a sixth school, which will be a
District 75 school within one building. I've said
repeatedly that I believe that the Blue Book has been
used as a weapon against communities of color for a
number of years now, and to me this is yet another
glaring representation of how the Blue Book is being
used as an instance of quote/unquote
"underutilization" in a school. I just thing that we
can do far better for our students all across the

1
2 board especially District 75 students. I happen to
3 have a nephew who—who is in that community, and is
4 doing quite well. I just think that we in New York
5 City need to do a much better job of that. Moving
6 onto another line of conversation, which is one that
7 we don't have too often, and I think that it's
8 something that we need to seriously start speaking
9 about, and that is the issue of human trafficking in
10 New York City amongst our students. I just need to
11 know whether or not the DOE has a formal protocol
12 regarding human trafficking among students.

13 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Council member
14 Adams, I don't know if we do or not, but we are going
15 to get back to you with that answer, a formal
16 protocol for human trafficking of students.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Okay, I would—I
18 would—my thought was that the DOE Child Abuse and
19 Neglect Prevention and Intervention Unit would
20 provide specific training to our educators regarding
21 this serious issue, but I really would appreciate
22 follow up to that. We are—we are making very much
23 needed allowances for our students in shelter. We
24 are providing funding for our students in shelter,
25 yet we are not really conversing around the issue, a

1
2 very serious issue because I know that it's going on
3 in my own district [coughs] which is why I bring it
4 up, and you and I can have another conversation about
5 that very serious issue. I really need to know
6 whether or not the principals and educators are being
7 trained to handle students who have been trafficked
8 and who are sitting in our classrooms. Some age 16
9 and 17 are sitting with students who are 13 and 14
10 years old and are not equipped to handle the classes
11 that they are taking spaces in. So, I do want to
12 leave that at your front door, and I do welcome your
13 follow up on that issue. Thank you so very much.

14 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Council Member
15 Adams, I really appreciate you mentioning that.
16 We're going to follow up specifically around that
17 issue. I will state that I am very sensitive to the
18 issue of human trafficking having worked with the
19 Commission on the Status of Women in San Francisco
20 and then most recently in Houston, which is a hotbed
21 for human trafficking. This is an issue that is very
22 dear to my heart because our vulnerable students
23 become prey, and so I am very sensitive to this
24 issue, and thank you for bringing it up. We will get
25 back to you, but more importantly I want to know for

1
2 my edification, what are our protocols and how we're
3 training folks. So, thank you for bringing that.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you very
5 much, Mr. Chair.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you vey much
7 and Council Member Holden and then Rose. We've been
8 joined also by Council Members Cohen and Ulrich.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you,
10 Chancellor, and President Grillo. I just want to
11 mention I represent District 24, which is the most
12 overcrowded. We need something like 5,000 new seats,
13 which are unfunded as of now, and we have a crisis
14 situation certainly in the district, and looking
15 forward to working with Lorraine Grillo on this, but
16 we—we're in—we're in dire straits, and the we have
17 up-zoning of Queens Boulevard going on with, you
18 know, thousands of more apartments coming in. So, we
19 need—we need a task force in our area, but I want to
20 talk about something that's near and dear to me. I
21 visited a school, District 75. I want to piggyback
22 on District 75 students who are the most neediest,
23 obviously and we have a situation, and I visited the
24 headquarters in Queens of District 75 at least my
25 part of Queens, PS-9, which is a building built in

1
2 1905 for all boys. It's now obviously boys and girls
3 in there. One bathroom per floor, which is and the
4 boys have to wait for the girls to get out, and the
5 girls have to—vice versa. We have changing tables in
6 front of urinals in there. We have a most
7 disgraceful situation. I want to—I want to praise
8 Chair Treyger for coming out and spending a couple
9 hours visiting last week, and he saw for himself, and
10 I also want to thank Chair Dromm for supporting this
11 school and putting money toward the auditorium, but
12 this is a situation where we need immediate
13 attention. There's the bathroom facilities are in
14 adequate obviously. There's not real gymnasium.
15 There's no real cafeteria, and many of these children
16 with autism, Downs Syndrome and many of the students
17 are from homeless shelters, special needs students,
18 obviously and foster children. They have some—they
19 have the challenges when they go home. When they go
20 to school, they should have a bright nice building.
21 This is more than just an old building. This is
22 totally ridiculous. It's actually something from
23 medieval timers almost, and it's—and to make matters
24 worse, Chancellor, this is in a heavily industrial
25 area. They're hiding these kids, and it's sickening.

1
2 Previous administrations have neglected the—this
3 population and this is the poster child. The PS-9 is
4 the poster child of neglect. So, I'd—I'd like your
5 attention on this. I'd like to bring you out there.
6 I'd like you to see for yourself what we're doing and
7 this has to be put aside. This should be the last
8 semester that these students have to tolerate this
9 situation.

10 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: So, Council Member,
11 thank you for mentioning this particular issue. It
12 is unacceptable that any student regardless of their
13 needs, any student would be in an environment that is
14 substandard. [bell] So this is of particular concern
15 to me. Staff brought this to my attention, and I
16 invite in the future—please feel free to bring it to
17 my attention directly as well, but staff brought this
18 to my attention. We immediately have asked people to
19 come out. I know that President Grillo herself has
20 gone out to visit. So, I'd like to ask her if she
21 can update you on where we are, and what the status
22 is.

23 LORRAINE GRILLO: Sure. Thank you,
24 Council Member. You and I have spoken about this,
25 and I've also spoken with Chair Treyger about this.

1
2 We recognize the challenges of this building. Right
3 now we're in the process of evaluating next steps,
4 and evaluating the building overall. In the
5 meantime, as a result of some of the conversations
6 we've had, we have halted the elevator project right
7 now, and we're going to re-evaluate that. The other
8 thing is at the request of the Chairman, we've taken
9 some air quality testing. We've done that in the
10 building, and just so everyone knows, I received the
11 results this morning. The building is safe for
12 occupancy. I can share that with you, but we take
13 this very, very seriously. I've been meeting with
14 the Chancellor's staff as well as internally as the
15 SCA to see what-what next steps can-can be.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And I'm really
17 supporting Council Member Holden in this effort. I
18 mean I-I have given money to Sandy Krochek (sp?) who
19 is one of the instructional people there. It's
20 fantastic and she's really fighting for that school.
21 I have not had the opportunity to visit it, but from
22 what Council Member Holden has describe, it really,
23 really needs our attention quickly. So, let me-let
24 me also take another chair prerogative question here
25 for President Grillo. In your testimony you stated

1
2 that you were able to increase the number of Queens
3 high school seats by 2,000 since the publication of
4 the February Amendment. Are these 2,000 seats in
5 addition to the 3,595 seats funded in the February
6 Amendment?

7 LORRAINE GRILLO: No, no, what we were
8 talking about we were able to increase the number of
9 sited seats.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, alright, that's
11 what we wanted to know. That's what we wanted to
12 know. Those are sites here, and the same thing for
13 the other 8,000 like those were—you were able to sit
14 those?

15 LORRAINE GRILLO: Correct.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Right. Okay, good.
17 Alright, so we're going to go now to Council Member
18 Rose followed by Powers and then Gibson, then Lander.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you, Chair,
20 and it's good to see you again. I'm always impressed
21 when people find their way to Staten Island, the
22 other borough and [laughter] it's—it's one of five,
23 but anyway, I—I want to thank you, you know, for—for
24 your visit, and at that time I did tell you that I
25 really needed to have a meeting with because I have a

1
2 whole plethora of—of issues that I'd like to speak
3 to, and that has not changed, and so in keeping with
4 the forum here I only have five minutes, but I have a
5 panoply of questions for you. So, I'm going to just
6 like throw as many out as I can with the hope of
7 getting a response. So, there's \$3 million that was
8 set aside for expanding Restorative Justice Programs
9 within our schools. Could you, you know, tell me
10 what that expansion, you know, looks like or entail,
11 and on Staten Island we had a persistently dangerous
12 school. It was deemed persistently dangerous, and
13 one of the options that they gave us was to become a
14 community school, but through the 21st Century Grant,
15 which is funding at a fraction of what a DOE funded
16 community school is funded at, and I was just
17 wondering if there's any plans to increase the
18 funding for community schools? For President
19 Grillo, you said in your statement that—that you had
20 moved into the feasibility of three additional
21 sites, one of which was District 31. I hope that you
22 could elaborate on that, and—and one of the—and my
23 last question is one of the issues that my parents
24 talk about all the time is with the increase of gun
25 violence in the schools, what measures are being

1
2 taken to structurally like cameras, sound systems
3 within the school that—that are functioning and-and
4 audible, and is there anything in the making to make
5 sure that all of our schools are prepared, and if so,
6 is there funding to do this in an expeditious manner?
7 Thank you.

8 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: So, Deputy Leader
9 Rose, well done. You got them all in. [laughter]
10 So, I want to publicly restate that we will schedule
11 a time where you and I can sit and actually work
12 through a number of the issues in detail. For some
13 of the things that you've asked we're going to have
14 to get back to you. I can tell you that in terms—in
15 terms of restorative justice [bell] we're increasing
16 our footprint into Districts 12, 5 and 16 in terms of
17 the professional development. I recently met with
18 our Deputy Chancellor who is going to be rolling it
19 out. We want to make sure that the anti-bias
20 training and the restorative practices include
21 substantial tools whether it's protocols, whether
22 it's curricula, but tools that teachers can use to
23 establish positive—positive environments in their
24 classrooms. So, we wanted to be useful, but then we
25

1
2 also wanted to be replicative across the system as
3 well.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Chancellor, would
5 you consider social workers a part of those tools
6 that would be useful in Restorative Justice.

7 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: I wouldn't consider
8 the social workers to be part of the restorative
9 practices. I would consider them to be additional
10 supports that's--that let's see how I want to put
11 this. They--they help solidify practices in school
12 environments, but they the are not-- In other words,
13 let me be--let me try to be clearer. A school that
14 receives training on restorative practices doesn't
15 absolutely need a social worker to make sure it's
16 going to be effective, but we know that when you add
17 a central personnel like social workers, that it
18 helps to solidify that practice. So, it's a best
19 practice that we're going to be working towards. I
20 know you asked a question specifically of President
21 Grillo around safety.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Yes.

23 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: And I think it's
24 important that if you don't mind, if I just state a
25 couple of philosophical--

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Sure.

CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: --positions and then I'll turn it over to President Grillo. I can—I can tell you Deputy Leader Rose as a teacher, as a principal having worked in the classroom, we will never, ever be able to harden our school sites against a motivated attacker. It's just not going to happen.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Uh-hm.

CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: We know that because we could invest in additional fencing. We could invest in additional—we could in metal detectors. We could do random searchers. We could have—it's starting to sound a lot like a prison, and we know that in even in prisons with all of those measures that things happen in those schools in those environments. So, we can never sufficiently harden any—any structure against an attacker, and I just want to be very clear about that because that's also been a theme that parents have talked to me about. Because if you hardened it, how do you harden recess? How do you harden drop-off? How do you harden pickup? How do harden—there's just a—schools are schools, but what we have found and the research is

1
2 clear is that when you are able to create and nurture
3 and provide resources so that you create environments
4 that students feel a sense of responsibility for
5 their safety as well as their peers, and they feel
6 that they have an environment where they see
7 something, they hear something, they suspect
8 something. They can—they—they have somebody in that
9 school that they can tell, and they know they're
10 going to be held anonymous, and they know that the
11 adult is going to actually follow up on. Those are
12 the most effective security systems in our schools
13 because while the adults we may think we know what's
14 happening in the school, but the ones that truly know
15 what's happening in the pulse are students. So, it's
16 been documented that that's effective, and that's why
17 our investments around Restorative Practices,
18 positive behavioral supports, the addition of
19 counselors, the addition of social workers, the
20 addition of culturally relevant pedagogy while it's
21 educationally sound, it also is going towards
22 creating that safe and secure environment. I will
23 just share one little factoid that is painful to me
24 having most recently prior to coming to New York City
25 served in Houston, Santa Fe, Texas. It was about 30

1
2 miles south from Houston. I know the superintendent.
3 I know who the principal is in Santa Fe, and this
4 weekend having a conversation with my colleagues that
5 are still in Texas with that tragedy. This school
6 had everything that people talk about. They had
7 security cameras. They had armed police officers at
8 the doors, and they had practiced just the week
9 before an armed intruder drill, and yet we saw what
10 happened, and the tragedy that is even more profound
11 is that the perpetrator of violence and the--the
12 school police officers--and I don't know if this has
13 been widely advertised--but engaged in a 20 plus
14 minute firefight. So, as they are conducting
15 autopsies on the victims, they're trying to determine
16 whether they were really killed by the perpetrator or
17 friendly fire in that firefight. So, this notion
18 that if you just put police officers or if you just
19 add cameras or you just harden buildings--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Not. No.

21 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: --is going to
22 protect you, it is not the answer. It is part of the
23 answer, but the biggest safety initiative we can do
24 is exactly what this city has already invested in,
25 building those safe supportive environments where

1 students feel safe and supported, and when they see
2 something, they hear something, they suspect
3 something, they report it, and it gets acted upon.
4 With—with that soliloquy I'm going to turn it over
5 [laughter] to our President. President Grillo.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you.

7 LORRAINE GRILLO: It's very hard to
8 follow the Chancellor I can tell you that. We do
9 have an ongoing program for camera with Internet
10 protocol. We call them IPDVS, Video Surveillance
11 Cameras, and we've been working through that over
12 this Capital Plan. We've successfully implemented
13 that in 714 buildings and it's an ongoing program.
14 We did mention earlier the class size reduction
15 funding for a site in District 31. I would that we
16 do not publicly state that site until the Feasibility
17 Study is completed because it's, in fact, it's not
18 feasible. I don't want the school or the community
19 to be disappointed. So, we will let you know as soon
20 as that Feasibility Study is complete.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay, thank you.

22 LEGAL COUNSEL: Okay.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: You know, and when
24 I talked about some of the—the things that we need,
25

1
2 the PA system in most of our schools is not, you
3 know, adequate and I really—it-it-it transcends the
4 safety issue. So, I was just wondering is there some
5 sort of internal plan to sort of upgrade the PA
6 systems and, you know, in all of the schools?

7 LORRAINE GRILLO: As I've mentioned,
8 every year the SCA sends a group of architects and
9 engineers to every building and we rate every major
10 system. So, if a PA system is not functioning,
11 certainly that will be rated a No. 5, which is the—
12 the worst condition, and those are the projects that
13 we undertake in the Capital Plan, the 5s. So, that's
14 an ongoing practice for us.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay, thank you so
16 much. Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you,
18 Council Member Gibson. We've also been joined by
19 Council Members King, Cornegy, and Moya.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you so much
21 Chair Dromm and Chair Treyger. Good afternoon
22 Chancellor, good afternoon President Grillo. It's
23 great to see you here to you and your team. I'm
24 grateful that after eight weeks you're still smiling,
25 and you're still optimistic about moving the city

1 forward as it relates to our public school scholars.
2 So, I'm grateful, and I'm also grateful that you have
3 given attention to the Bronx where we throw our
4 excess (sic) at the Bronx, which I appreciate. The
5 Bronx is considered, you know, certainly we have a
6 lot of schools that are in need, and facing certain
7 challenges, but I do appreciate a lot of the work
8 that has been done. So, I have a few questions that
9 I'm usually just going to spit out, but I do want to
10 recognize Chair Treyger talked a little bit about
11 recognizing the investments that we should continue
12 to make social workers and guidance counselors. When
13 you compare that to school safety agents, we're
14 certainly not providing an equitable distribution,
15 and certainly we want the message to be that we care
16 about social workers and psychiatrists and guidance
17 counselors just as we do about public safety. I'm
18 grateful that this Executive Budget is going to add
19 an additional 10 social workers for students in
20 temporary housing, which I represent School District
21 9 in the Bronx, which has a high concentration. So,
22 that's very important to me, and that brings us up to
23 62 schools. So, I wanted to understand further what
24 the ongoing conversations are with DOE and DHS
25

1
2 because it seems like the numbers are going in the
3 wrong direction where we have more students in
4 temporary housing entering our schools. Certainly,
5 Restorative Justice has been very important to me and
6 many others, and we've talked about addressing the
7 school to prison pipeline and looking at restorative
8 practices, which we have in many of our schools. So,
9 certainly I want that to continue. I wanted to ask
10 two question about school food. This City Council
11 has been very supportive Universal Free Lunch as well
12 as breakfast in classroom. We have a city issue of
13 dealing with hunger. So, certainly we want students
14 to be in school with a well nutritious meal. The
15 quality of the food as well as getting breakfast and
16 lunch. So, I wanted to find out an update on that,
17 and our efforts to provide our universal access, and
18 then school closures and Renewal and Rise schools.
19 Ursula is very familiar with me, and some of the
20 schools that I have had closed under the Renewal
21 Program, but we still have remaining schools that are
22 now Rise Schools. So, I wanted to understand what
23 the budget looks like, and how we continue to focus
24 on many of those schools because although they may be
25 out of the area of closure, they're not that high in

1
2 terms of excelling that we want to lose sight of
3 them. And so I—I do want to make reference that I
4 have a lot. I probably have about six remaining
5 middle schools that are Renewal schools, and my
6 superintendent is amazing, but we do need support.
7 So, I wanted to understand that, and certainly
8 students in temporary housing. I've always said that
9 your housing status should not determine your
10 academic future, and although we've done great with
11 dealing with truancy and absenteeism, adding bus
12 routes, and more literacy coaches, we need to do
13 more, and so I wanted to just throw those questions
14 out just so that you can understand our perspective
15 from District 9 in the Bronx. Thank you.

16 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Council Member
17 Gibson. Thank you so much for those questions. I've
18 really enjoyed the time that we spent at schools in
19 the school. I have to tell you I've had a great time
20 in all of our boroughs, but the Bronx has really
21 taken it on in many ways, and I think you've
22 articulated some of the opportunities. I'm not going
23 to say challenges, but opportunities that we have to
24 do right by our students particularly in the Bronx.

1
2 So a couple of—a couple of thoughts, and then I'm
3 going to ask my colleagues to jump in—

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: [interposing]

5 Yeah.

6 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: --with some of
7 those questions as well. We are very, very
8 supportive of increasing the—the support systems for
9 our students especially from an equity perspective
10 recognizing that certain communities have significant
11 challenges, and as we're able to ameliorate those
12 challenges, students are able to perform better in
13 school, and have a much more stable experience.
14 Nowhere is that more evident than how you've
15 expressed some of the challenges in the Bronx as
16 well. So, we're really proud of the fact that we're
17 investing in more social workers. We also are
18 looking at and working with principals around how
19 we're establishing more counselor positions there,
20 but that will never be sufficient because we are—we
21 do have a community schools approach, and as folks
22 have asked me what's your stance on community
23 schools, I've said to them: As you look at a
24 community—if you—if you see one community school, you
25 have seen one community school. There is no cookie

1
2 cutter approach, but the essence of a community
3 school is that a community will identify what are the
4 needs that are—that exist in that community, and then
5 how are you able to bring to the table whether it's
6 municipal agencies or community-based organizations
7 or local non-profits that will meet the needs that
8 are[bell] present within that community. So, what
9 we're doing is doubling down on our approach in
10 community schools and especially in the schools in
11 the Bronx where there are a number of needs. I've
12 just started meeting with my colleagues in DHS, and
13 what we're looking at is how are we going to leverage
14 our resources not only in terms of manpower, head
15 count, but also specifically braiding the services so
16 that we're not duplicating, but we're multiplying
17 our reach in terms of the schools that have specific
18 types of needs. That includes schools that, you
19 know, it may be—it may be difficult to understand
20 this in a city like New York City, but there—in—in
21 certain parts of our communities there are food
22 deserts, and by that I mean students can't get
23 nutritious—nutritious food but for the fruit at the
24 local liquor store or bodega. So, we—we absolutely
25 take it very seriously about nutritious food in our

1 schools. We are proud of the fact—I am proud of the
2 fact that we have universal food nutrition for all of
3 our students. It's free. It's not free, but we
4 provide it, right, but I'm really thankful for the
5 funding to be able to make that happen, but we have
6 breakfast in the classrooms, we have breakfast in our
7 schools, we have breakfast and lunch in our schools,
8 ubiquitously across the—the system. We're also
9 looking at how we're including a supper program for
10 those students that need that additional support as
11 well. I will tell you that as I've gone across the
12 city and done my listening tour, my students, our
13 students have been very vocal about food and
14 nutrition, and what they think is good, and what they
15 think is not so good. What I will tell you is we've
16 been sensitive to that. So, we're forming an ad hoc
17 student advisory that will meet with us and do taste
18 testing so that we're getting multiple selections
19 that are culturally appropriate, but that are also
20 good tasting. I'm very proud of the fact that our
21 Deputy Chancellor Rose and her team are on student
22 nutrition are taking an approach where they're not
23 only looking at what is the food that is being
24 consumed, but they're also taking into account what's
25

1 the environment in which that food is being consumed?
2 So, it's the aesthetic. So, we all know that when we
3 go for our coffee or for our little lunch, and we
4 meet somebody, we like to have a nice environment.
5 We've—we've started redoing some of the class-
6 cafeterias so that they are much more inviting
7 environments for students to gather and have down
8 time, and meet with each other. I will share with
9 you an interesting tidbit, which is probably
10 psychological—more psychological than—than actually
11 architectural, but in those environments where we've
12 actually redone the environment and made them much
13 more appealing and when we've surveyed students and
14 said what do you think of the environment, students
15 say oh, we love the environment, and then on the same
16 survey we'll say and what about the food? And they
17 say the food is better, and we actually haven't done
18 anything different, right? So there is this—there is
19 this connection to where you eat and how you eat and
20 what the food looks and tastes like. Nonetheless, we
21 still want to focus in making sure because we know
22 that in many cases this is probably the only meal
23 students will have. We want to make sure that
24 they're nutritious, but they're also appealing and
25

1
2 appetizing to our students as we—as—as we provide the
3 food. The Renewal and Rise Programs. So, I was
4 quoted when I was entering about some concerns that I
5 had with the Renewal Program. I talked about a fuzzy
6 theory of action. I talked about unclear goals. I
7 talked about our theory of action and engage the
8 community. I am happy to say that as I have now come
9 on board, and met with my colleagues in the
10 Department of Education, many of those concerns that
11 I had expressed publicly are now being—already being
12 taken into account. So you will see of the 50
13 schools that still remain in either, you know,
14 renewal type approach, there will be re-engagement
15 that is going to happen with that school community
16 and the community at large, and part of that is that
17 I've—I've been unconvinced that we've really done as
18 much as we can to engage not only obviously the exact
19 school community, the parents, the teachers, the
20 administrators, the support staff, but what we've
21 done beyond the usual stakeholders. Have we engaged
22 the elected officials like yourself? Do you know
23 what the plan is for every single one of those
24 schools, and what the investment is going to be by
25 the DOE, and then what the school community is going

1
2 to be responsible for bringing to the table. So our
3 faith-based organizations in that community know what
4 the plan is, and what we're trying to do? Do our
5 advocacy partners know what the plain is? Again, I'm
6 convinced that we have done that in—in terms of the—
7 the deep level dive that we need to, but you're going
8 to see a re-engagement so that everybody is on the
9 same page. And then as I've spoken several time in—
10 in response to several questions, we're applying an
11 equity lens to that particular issue. So, it's
12 important that as we identify what are the challenges
13 that are getting in the way for students to show
14 academic progress in those communities, we're going
15 to invest and continue to invest resources in a
16 targeted way to support the learning in those
17 communities, but again Council Member Gibson to your
18 question about Rise, so schools that have come out of
19 the ICU, if you will, and are now just in intensive
20 care, we can't afford to let go of some of those
21 supports that we've put in place because without
22 those supports and recognizing that those are
23 addressing some persistent issues that they have with
24 being able to be well performing schools, we know
25 that if you pull those supports away, they're going

1
2 to fall right back. So, we-we also are looking how
3 do we continue to support our schools as we go
4 forward? The Fair Student Funding Formula again
5 becomes really critical because the more resources we
6 have to directly invest in those schools, the better
7 we're able to stabilize those communities, and quite
8 frankly, the better that we're able to look
9 strategically about where our schools and school
10 communities are? What is the programming? How are
11 we providing opportunities for all students and all
12 members of the community to access those programs,
13 the better I think that communities will readopt
14 their local schools, and that's what we want, good
15 schools in every neighborhood. That is a viable
16 option for every student. So, those are just some of
17 the thoughts on the questions that you asked, and I'm
18 going to ask any of my colleagues if they want to
19 chime in on any of the other particular points.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I think you
21 answered them well. Thank you. I look forward to
22 working with you and meeting with you and in terms of
23 support services, just want you to add Suicide
24 Prevention counselors as well. I've been very big on
25 that, too. Great organizations that make sure that we

1
2 protect all of our kids that may be suicidal. So I
3 think you and look forward to working with you, and
4 thank you Chair Treyger and thank you Chair Dromm.

5 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you Council
6 Member and next we have Council Member Lander.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you very
8 much, Mr. Chair. Chancellor, wonderful to have you
9 with us here this morning, and I really am encouraged
10 by your testimony, and by the leadership you've
11 already taken. So when you say in your testimony
12 let's have the tough conversations, obviously you've
13 shown, you know, that you're really willing to have
14 them, and I'm—I'm really grateful for it.

15 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Thank you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I'm going to
17 follow the model I guess of—of Council Member Rose
18 and others and just lay my questions out. I have
19 three questions, and the issues that I've worked on
20 most in recent years have been school segregation and
21 air conditioning. So, and unusual basket of issues,
22 but I appreciate the work you're doing on both. So,
23 in addition to being encouraged by your remarks, I'm
24 really encouraged by the District 15 process that we
25 have underway, and I know we've got our town hall

1
2 with you next week, and I hope you can join us for
3 the fourth public workshop in that process because it
4 really has been having tough conversations and moving
5 toward a more thoughtful and more integrated District
6 15 Middle School approach, and I'm encouraged by it.
7 It now looks like we're starting to put resources into
8 confronting the challenges of segregation and racial
9 inequity in some different ways in the implicit bias
10 training and the cultural response of education and
11 the resources provided to the—to bring WXY into the
12 District 15 process, the SIP grants, but how those
13 are being spent is pretty opaque to the Council, and
14 they feel somewhat disconnected to it. So, either
15 today or at some follow-up point, could you get us
16 both a more detailed report on that spending and a
17 sense of how it's being coordinated to achieve some
18 shared goals? So, that's question 1. Question 2 on
19 air conditioning you—I guess there's—you conducted
20 the survey that found 5,200 more classrooms that you
21 had previously told us, the 1,106, and so I'm trying
22 to understand—well, I guess a little bit like what
23 accounts for that discrepancy, but more give us an
24 updated version of the report you've provided in
25 March that brings those 5,200 classrooms in, and just

1 clarifies how many schools need electrical upgrades.
2 I appreciate the new money you're putting in, but
3 again, I guess we would like to see a report, and
4 just be clear how many classrooms, which schools need
5 electrical upgrades? Where are they getting them and
6 how does that tie to the budget, and then third I was
7 also really encouraged by enthusiasm about civics for
8 all something I also care a lot about and in
9 particular participatory budgeting, And I wonder if
10 you've considered or if you would consider there's
11 some amazing young leaders high school students who
12 have helped lead the way from our districts in
13 participatory budgeting a youth steering committee to
14 help implement that, and bring their leader—you know,
15 build from their remarkable leadership as you
16 implement the program. Thank you.

18 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: So, Council Member
19 Lander, thank you very much. I'm going to take on
20 questions 1 and 3 and I'm going to ask President
21 Grillo maybe to take on 2. Thank you for your
22 support. I think it's always important in a
23 participatory democracy that we endeavor to ensure
24 that all stakeholders are represented, and that all
25 stakeholders have opportunity to benefit from the

1 public school. So, I appreciate your support, and I—
2 I want to thank you for the D15 process that the—
3 District 15 has not always received all of the
4 attention, but they are doing some transformative
5 work in a very real and grounded way. I'm very
6 familiar of that—with that. I'm also very heartened
7 by the district wide Diversity Steering Committee
8 that we have in place. I've been—I've had the
9 opportunity to attend one of their meetings and
10 address them. These are very smart, passionate, very
11 committed individuals who have committee to bringing
12 to as a district wide recommendations some short-
13 term, and some long-term recommendations and they've
14 agreed to do this by December. So, I think there is
15 now a confluence of many work strands that are
16 coming: District 3, District 15, the work that's
17 happening with the District Wide Diversity Council.
18 So, just in time for the holidays. We're going to
19 have some conversations and terms and maybe, you
20 know, I think it's important. So, I want to thank
21 you for your support in that regard. You will
22 continue to see us working to solidify that within
23 the organizational structure of the DOE so that we
24 can engage from equity, excellence, access
25

1
2 perspective with other advocates, other elected
3 officials, and other representatives in our school
4 communities. I think that's very important and I--and
5 I will say this: At a time in our nation's history
6 where there is a deafening silence from Washington,
7 D.C. enlightened educational policy, New York City
8 has the opportunity, and I think the--the fire power
9 to actually set a national conversation on the table,
10 and that's not lost on us either. So, we want to
11 make sure that we're not hiding from it, but that as
12 we engage we're doing it in a very systematic way. I
13 think the idea of youth steering committee around
14 participatory government is brilliant. Absolutely.
15 I was grilled. I have been grilled. With all due
16 respect to our Council Members, if you want to see a
17 real grilling, you should have seen the youth town
18 halls that had.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: [interposing] Our
20 high school students are definitely tougher than--

21 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: [interposing] Wow.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: --than any of the
23 City Council.

24 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: And well prepared,
25 knowledgeable, specific. Didn't let me get away with

1
2 a thing, right. You're not either but they were—they
3 were very, very impressive. So, wherever we can
4 engage our youth, have the youth voice guide where
5 we're going, I am a big fan, and we will absolutely
6 take that into consideration, and work to make that
7 happen. Air conditioning. President Grillo.

8 LORRAINE GRILLO: [laughs] Thank you.
9 To explain the discrepancy, the original list was
10 based on the 2015 principal survey. The updated
11 principal survey included a number of other rooms
12 that had to be included. In terms of what buildings
13 need electrical upgrades, we are still surveying
14 these buildings. We're moving forward. We have, as
15 he said about 17,000 classrooms to deal with. So, we
16 expect to have by the end of the year to be complete
17 with all of those surveys. We can give you an
18 updated number now.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: End of the school
20 year or end of the Calendar year?

21 LORRAINE GRILLO: The end of the calendar
22 year.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: That's when
24 you'll have all the updated information?

1
2 LORRAINE GRILLO: Well, all the—we'll be
3 able to have seen every single building.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Okay, well let's—
5 we'll follow up with the Chair and the staff and
6 figure out what will be the most useful update
7 schedule that can have the most useful full
8 information, but also meets our timeline. So, thank
9 you, and then just on this issue of some budget
10 transparency on the implicit bias culturally
11 responsive education, D15 and other expenditures of
12 that type, which are largely new in the budget, which
13 is—I'm—I'm thrilled to have those resources in. It
14 makes it harder for us just to see them and know
15 that's underneath them. So, we can get some more
16 details on that.

17 URSULINA RAMIREZ: We definitely think,
18 yes, we can get you provide you detailed budgets, and
19 I think it probably is worthy of another conversation
20 around how do we build a strategy around all of these
21 things, but we could do that.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you very
23 much and welcome. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much.
25 Council Member Barron followed by Gjonaj. [pause]

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you to the
3 Chairs and thank you to the panel for coming. In
4 this country, we know that it was build upon the
5 appropriation of the lands that belonged to the
6 indigenous people, and we know that it grew based on
7 the exploitation of enslaved Africans, free labor,
8 and every institution in this country has embedded
9 racist policies in it bar none, and I know that as we
10 look at the Board of Education, and we see how there
11 have been improvements, there were still systemic in
12 my opinion things that need to be addressed. We look
13 at the specialized high schools, and even though we
14 know that blacks represent 70% of the population,
15 they only represent 11% in specialized high schools,
16 and it's even less than that in the elite, the top
17 three schools that we talk about. So, I wanted to
18 know are you in favor. I've got a lot of questions
19 so I'm going to run them down. Are you in favor of
20 multiple criteria being used for selection at
21 specialized high schools? You talk about social
22 justice, and we know that we've had instances of a
23 teacher telling a student he could not—a public
24 school student—he could not do a report of Malcolm X
25 because of Malcom X's history, and other teacher who

1 told black children to lie down so that they could be
2 stepped on so that they would know how it felt in the
3 Middle Crossing. I want to know what kind of
4 consequences those persons face, not the retraining,
5 but the consequences that they face. In terms of
6 locations I think the temporary locations where
7 they're needed are fine, and I'm particularly talking
8 about the East New York Family Academy, which will be
9 relocated for I believe it's two years perhaps three,
10 with the Maxwell House School because they're going
11 to be getting--East New York Family Academy is
12 getting a brand new building. Even though you want
13 to force--what do you call them? You call them
14 cafeteriums, and something other--the cafeteria or
15 whatever, which is a combination, which in my opinion
16 a high school needs a dedicated gymnasium and that's
17 what I'm pushing for because the plans are not
18 finalized there. But were other co-locations are
19 forced on schools, the whole school loses out. Two
20 years ago the Langston Hughes School was forced into
21 a co-location with a charter school. The Langston
22 Hughes school was promised that by that September
23 they would have their TV media room replaced. They
24 would have their library and media room replaced.
25

1
2 They would have their indoor gardening space
3 replaced. They would have their music for the Brain
4 Program accommodated. None of that has happened to
5 completion. None of that has happened to completion
6 and we're coming to the end of the second year. So,
7 I want to know how we're going to as schools are
8 forced to take on a co-located school meet the
9 promises that we make to sweeten the pot to force
10 them to go into something they really don't want to
11 have. You've talked about AP classes. I'd like to
12 know what the results were for the students. What
13 are the numbers? I haven't been able to find those
14 numbers yet. We talked about homelessness, and we
15 know that each school only gets \$100 through the
16 McKinney-Vento allocation. I want to know do you
17 think that's enough to just rely on feds to do that
18 or can we dedicate money within the city budget to
19 address that as well? And finally, thank you, Mr.
20 Chair. Finally, in the middle-schools in the middle
21 grades, there are still teachers teaching
22 particularly math and science who are not certified
23 by the state to teach math and science, and I want to
24 know what is that number? I've asked this question
25 for years, and I've never gotten an answer. What is

1
2 that number and what can we do to address that
3 because we know that as students are graduation at
4 greater percentages they are still getting into CUNY,
5 70% of city schools go to—city high school graduates
6 go to CUNY and need deep remediation, which cuts into
7 their costs of the tuition assistance that they're
8 able to get, and lengthens their time in—in college.
9 So, those are the questions that I would like for you
10 to address. Thank you.

11 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Councilwoman
12 Barron, thank you so much for your questions. It's
13 nice to see you again. So, specialized high schools.
14 In my career, I've been part of a conversation
15 wherein specialized or specific admission high
16 schools we've implemented multiple measures for
17 identifying student qualifications to those schools.
18 I will tell you in every single one of those
19 instances—instances, we have never diluted the talent
20 pool. In fact, we've increased the diversity and
21 we've been able to I think strengthen those schools
22 because they do have an influx of diversity. Our
23 approach here under my leadership as the Chancellor
24 will be no different. I want to cast the widest net.
25 I want to make sure that we are providing

1
2 opportunities for the widest array of students, and
3 I'm going to err underlying what I'm about to say.
4 These are public schools. These are not private
5 schools. They belong to the public, and as such, it
6 is my philosophical and personal and professional
7 belief that all schools should accessible to all
8 students in the city of New York because the city of
9 New York taxpayers pay for those schools. So, our
10 approach will be to cast the widest net, provide the
11 best opportunity to identify students that are
12 eligible for those schools. In terms of implicit
13 bias training, I think the incidences, while I'm not
14 familiar with the specifics of the incidences that
15 you mentioned in your question, I think that begs the
16 question and actually is justification for why we're
17 implementing implicit bias training, why we're
18 investing in culturally relevant pedagogy, and
19 culturally relevant curriculum. I think it's
20 incredibly important that we recognize that race and
21 class in our history is something that we should not
22 stray away from. We have to recognize it, and as we
23 recognize it we have to talk about it, and in our
24 classrooms we should be preparing all our students,
25 are para professionals, our teachers to be able to

1
2 have that conversation in a culturally responsive and
3 respectful way. So, that's why we're investing in
4 those-in those-those items and why we're going to
5 continue to increase the investment as we go forward.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: If I could just
7 jump in.

8 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Sure.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Where teachers
10 don't reflect that training, what are the
11 consequences that they will face?

12 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Well, it's
13 unacceptable for any teacher to abuse a student. So,
14 we will follow up, and again, I'm not familiar
15 specifically with the incidences that you mentioned.
16 I will actually follow up on my own to find out where
17 that is. It's important to recognize, and I know
18 that you do, that incidences that-that-in which any
19 employee has been accused of unprofessional conduct,
20 are incidences in which disciplinary process kicks
21 in. I can't talk about those publicly, but what I
22 will say is that we will never allow any adult in any
23 environment to either act unprofessionally or in a
24 misguided way or in any way, shape or form that harms
25 children, and not follow up with the full-the full

1
2 due process afforded in terms of the disciplinary
3 process. In terms of co-location, in my entire
4 career, I have been faced with the issue of co-
5 locations usually initiated because of state law that
6 require a vacant space be afforded to charter
7 schools. That happened to me in California. It
8 happened to me in Texas. Now here we are in New
9 York. It's the same story with a different set of
10 characters. I will tell you that the best thing that
11 we can do is to do the very investments that we're
12 talking about building local community schools,
13 building programming, strengthening the academic
14 portion of the--the school community and making sure
15 that the very community itself in many-in many
16 situations changes their own narrative about their
17 local school. I can't tell you even in the eight
18 weeks that I've been in New York City how many times
19 I've had conversations with community members in
20 various areas where they will say well everybody
21 knows that nobody is going to go to that school.
22 They should be going to that school. Well, you
23 create this self-fulfilling prophecy where people say
24 well, then why am I going to go? The community
25 doesn't even want to go there. So, when I talked

1
2 about in response to a previous question we're re-
3 engaging our communities in our historically
4 underserved or historically under-performing schools,
5 that's part of the reason. We want everyone to own
6 the village. We want the village to be informed.
7 So, we changed the narrative, but as we're changing
8 the narrative, we actually want to do something to
9 make those schools a destination that the local
10 community wants to go to. As we build our enrollment
11 there is less unused space, which then is less space
12 that is subjected to co-locations as--as mandated by
13 state law. So, we're very much sensitive to that
14 fact. Again, I--I want to make sure this is public
15 testimony. I want to make sure. The other question
16 I get asked all the time is are you pro-charter or
17 are you anti-charter? I'm not going to get involved
18 in that fight. That's a red herring argument. Are
19 we about building good schools, and really strong
20 programming in our schools? Absolutely. I'll talk
21 to anybody anywhere all day long about that, but in a
22 co-location initiative, you have to build schools
23 that are going to bring enrollment, and the best way
24 to do that is to build strong programming in our
25 schools. We're committed to doing that.

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: But in terms of an
eight-week timeline presented by your department
taking two years, that's unacceptable.

5

CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Again, I--

6

7

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] But
I wanted to know, you know, when now can we expect
what was promised to give them in eight weeks to be
concluded.

9

10

11

CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: So, I believe,
Councilwoman Barron, you're referring to the promises
you referenced to Langston Hughes.

12

13

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Correct.

14

15

16

17

18

CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Okay, so I'm going
to find out where we are with that. I may ask
President Grillo to update us on where we are with
that. My understanding is that those projects have
been completed, but I'm gong to ask--

19

20

21

22

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing]
Well, the principal that's there has indicated only
the library and media has been completed, and I was
with them last week so--

23

24

25

CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Okay.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: --there's much

more to still be done.

1

2

CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Sure, well if you--

3

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] And

4

it's unacceptable that a school that had a prize

5

program, their TV film studio is still not up and

6

running after two years.

7

CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Great. So, what

8

we'll do is we'll make sure that our staff visits and

9

we'll get an update to you.

10

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

11

CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Okay, in terms of

12

AP classes, we will respond in writing to you in

13

terms of the question that you asked about the depth

14

and breadth of that particular program and initiative

15

for us, and then in terms of McKinney-Vento, again,

16

we're going to--I'm going to look into that.

17

McKinney-Vento is, as you know, a federal

18

designation, but I think as we've already talked

19

about the investment that the city and the Mayor is

20

making in additional dollars to serving our students

21

in temporary housing, our homeless students, if you

22

will, I think is significantly more than that, but I

23

want to get a precise answer to you.

24

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: One last thing.

25

Certification of teachers in middle-school?

1
2 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Yeah, I'm unaware
3 of--of that issues. So, I'm going to look into that.
4 It's, again our teachers need to be certified. So,
5 we're going to look into specifically you mentioned
6 the middle schools. So, I want to make sure and you
7 specifically referenced math and science teachers at
8 the middle school. We'll--we will also get back to
9 you with a specific written response on that.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Council Member
12 Gjonaj.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you, Chairs
14 and once again congratulations. Chancellor, it's
15 going to be very different. It's a follow-up on
16 Councilwoman Barron, but I'm going to do my best. In
17 a city where were measure things by a New York
18 minute, eight weeks has been a long time.

19 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: [laughs]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: In essence, the
21 honeymoon is just about over, but well embraced.
22 There's s much to talk about, and whether it's
23 keeping those school buildings open more hours in a
24 day than they are closed. Whether it be about the
25 school food, and why only 450 out of the 530 schools

1
2 have breakfast in classrooms. Whether it be
3 discussions of lead in water or lead paint that still
4 exists in these buildings, mold and air quality that
5 are impacting so many of our children and in the
6 Borough of the Bronx with the highest rate of asthma
7 certainly a huge concern for many of my parents and
8 throughout the year for children. (sic) From the
9 headcount of this administration, where it may be too
10 top heavy where teachers are still spending their own
11 money for classroom supplies, lack of gyms that was
12 mentioned, overcrowding and fully funded school
13 facilities to school safety and—and I love your
14 directness, but I can't go back to my district and
15 tell my parents that our schools buildings are not
16 the safest buildings in New York City. I need them
17 to know that we're doing everything possible to
18 prevent anything happening to those children in our
19 classrooms. You certainly got them CFE and certainly
20 after school programs, but I do want to talk to you
21 specifically about the tale of two students, the
22 demoralizing of our children. The dangerous
23 condition, and if you haven't guessed it yet, I'm
24 headed to the trailers that we have in many of our
25

1 schools. I understand that we have about 70,000
2 students that are in 4-PK. Is that correct?

3 LORRAINE GRILLO: I think it is yes.

4 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: And now our 3-PK
6 program is 19,000 by Year 2021?

7 LORRAINE GRILLO: That's correct.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: How many students
9 do we have in trailers? [background comments, pause]

10 LORRAINE GRILLO: We'll get you that
11 number in a moment.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: While you look it
13 up, I believe my recollection is about 2,800 student,
14 and I—the 55 schools that you visited, I'm not sure
15 if you've been exposed to the school trailer
16 scenario?

17 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: I've—I've seen
18 learning cottages. [bell] That is another term
19 that is used or temporary classrooms, portable
20 classrooms. Trailers is another way of saying the
21 same thing. Yes, I have seen them.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Well, these
23 trailers are truly hazardous conditions. If you want
24

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

to talk about the inconvenience, I've had to put a jacket on to use a restroom--

CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: [interposing] Yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: --or the lunchroom or to have to go to gym or any of that through cold and snow and rain and heat where there's privileged children that are able to enjoy the same privileges inside a controlled setting. It is just so disturbing--

CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: [interposing] Yeah.

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: --that there was a commitment by this Administration in 2014 that committed and pledged to getting rid of all of the trailers by 2019 and today the best case scenario we removed 171. There are 84 more in the process. I don't know that process, that timeframe, and 99 that haven't even begun being transitioned out. So, I'd really like to have a firm commitment, an understanding that we can't ask our children to dream big because all things are possible and create the tale of two students where there's--there's a feeling of demoralizing and substandard condition that we are allowing to continue, and as--thank you Chair for the extension. The Budget, the Executive Budget of \$32.3

1 billion equivalates to about \$29,000 per student.
2
3 That is twice more than I believe it's California per
4 pupil and certainly much higher than other major city
5 in the country. To spend that kind of money and it's
6 the wisest investment that we can make, and for it
7 not to trickle down into the classrooms and to the
8 students is an injustice, and I'd love—I'd live to
9 know what the balance—what the per-pupil cost was in
10 Houston, and Las Vegas and compare the two, and how
11 is it that they are able to do so much more with so
12 little, and how we've invested and we keep throwing
13 the money at the problem, and the problem just seems
14 to be getting worse. So, thank you.

15 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Thank you, sir. I
16 appreciate your perspective, and so to your question
17 at the very end, you don't want to be in Houston.
18 You don't want to be in Las Vegas in the per-pupil,
19 and I will very respectfully challenge that argument
20 that they do more with less. Houston when I left was
21 less than \$9,000 per student.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: [off mic] \$9,000?

23 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Less than \$9,000
24 per student. In Houston, there were counselors one
25 for every 850 students. There were no social

1
2 workers. There very little to none of school
3 librarians. There were little to no nurses in the
4 schools. So, I will challenge that assumption very
5 respectfully because I lived there and tried to make
6 ends meet. Las Vegas was even less. It was less
7 than \$5,000 per student. So, the fact, and I've said
8 it again there is a cost of live in New York City,
9 but even accounting for that, the fact that this
10 organization that this Council and this Mayor are
11 investing the resources into game changers, 3-K, Pre-
12 K, Equity and Excellence and Equity for All, College
13 for All. We're investing in social workers. We're
14 investing in counselors. We're investing in the
15 number of-of initiatives that we are investing in
16 here in New York City speaks to a very enlightened
17 approach. Now, are there things that we can do
18 better? Absolutely there are things that we can do
19 better, but if you're implementing a 3-K program, you
20 have to train those 3-K teachers. Who's going to
21 train those 3-K teachers? That could be considered
22 part of the bureaucracy. I consider it part of the
23 infrastructure to ensure high quality programming.
24 If you're going to implement culturally responsive
25 classrooms, that doesn't just happen. You need to

1
2 train teachers and continuously provide support for
3 teachers to be able to implement those initiatives.
4 So, there is an infrastructure that is important to
5 be able to replicate good practices. Now, my goal is
6 to come in with fresh eyes, and take a look at how
7 are we implementing? How are we organized to be able
8 to not only implement what we said we want to
9 implement, but also to partner with municipal
10 agencies and other governmental agencies and
11 community based organizations, et cetera. Part of
12 that is us being prepared to do that as well. I know
13 that and I haven't been fully briefed on this, but I
14 know that there—the commitment towards removing
15 temporary classrooms is—is a real commitment. I'm
16 going to ask President Grillo in just a minute to
17 give us an update of where that it is, and what the
18 challenges are, and then how do we work together to
19 actually make that real in terms of whatever
20 commitments have been made, but the notion that I am
21 so happy to hear you talk about Councilman is this
22 tale of two children in our city. And as I've
23 traveled across the city in eight weeks, I can also
24 point to the tale of two children where children in
25 the same grade level in different parts of our city

1
2 are getting drastically different experiences every
3 single day, and it's not only facilities. It's about
4 academic programming, it's about opportunities, it's
5 about social-emotional learning and feeling
6 comfortable in their classrooms. So, we are going to
7 be great allies as we work to eliminate that tale of
8 two students in our city, but I do appreciate the
9 passion and the questions and look forward to working
10 with you. I'm going to ask President Grillo if she
11 can update us on where we are with the temporary
12 classrooms.

13 LORRAINE GRILLO: Absolutely. Happy to do
14 that. Again, Council Member, you are correct in that
15 we have removed 171 of these trailers. We began this
16 process with over 350 trailers. We've removed 171.
17 We have plans to remove another 84, and as you said
18 correctly, we have 99 still remaining with no plan,
19 but there is a reason for that, and the reason is
20 there are children in those classrooms. Now, the
21 issue is where are those children to be relocated to
22 because we have the money. We have the funding. The
23 city has committed to providing the funding to remove
24 these trailers. If there are children in those
25 classrooms, we have to either send them to another

1 school location where there is room or find room,
2 within their existing buildings. In some cases that'
3 next to impossible.
4

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Well, I, you
6 know, I agree with you on the challenges. Don't get
7 me wrong, but it's very hard for me to accept those
8 explanations when you found room for 70,000 pre-K, 4-
9 PK students over night.

10 LORRAINE GRILLO: I can explain that.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: And now you have
12 an additional 19,000 3-PK students in three years
13 time that you are going to find room for, and what is
14 the number of children in those trailers?

15 LORRAINE GRILLO: Again, I believe the
16 number is—in the 2016 to 17 school year was 5,800.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: So, you—this
18 Administration found room for 70,000 4-PK students
19 literally overnight, and we're committed to 19,000 3-
20 PK students within three years, but we can't find a
21 learning environment for 5,400 students and the chair
22 is very familiar with this because I believe Chairman
23 Dromm taught in one of these trailers for a number of
24 years, and has been at the forefront of this. It's
25 an embarrassment. There can't be an acceptable

1
2 explanation, none to the parents of those children--of
3 those children that are in those environments. You
4 want to talk about school safety? There is no safety
5 for those children. The unthinkable can happen to
6 those 5,400 children and no one would even know
7 because there is no metal detector. There is no
8 sign-in book. There is no security. They can walk
9 into these playgrounds into these classrooms, and no
10 one would even know for a period of time. There's a
11 moral question here. There's a responsibility
12 question here. 5,400 students need permanent
13 placement in those structures yesterday and the 84
14 that are in a phase of being planned out, I believe
15 is 10-year plan. Is that my understanding?

16 LORRAINE GRILLO: No.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: The 84 are being--
18 54,000 or 5,400 students.

19 LORRAINE GRILLO: It's 5,400.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: 5,400, but the 84
21 trailers--

22 LORRAINE GRILLO: Yes.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: --like what is
24 the time length, the timeframe for those as well as
25 the 99 that there is no plan?

1
2 LORRAINE GRILLO: Okay. So, so,
3 Councilman, we could not agree with you more in terms
4 of the need to get rid of those trailers. We
5 absolutely agree, and we are doing our very best to
6 get moving on them. There are two things that I did
7 want to say. Those 84 are in various stages meaning
8 that for example, if the school has six trailers in
9 the yard, but we are able to build an addition to
10 that school, we cannot get rid of the trailers until
11 the addition is completed. So, there are a variety of
12 timelines for this. Some of these may be in design
13 or, in fact, a new school may be built nearby where
14 the trailers are and rezoning will allow those
15 students to go to the new building. So, a lot of
16 that depends upon the construction schedules, design
17 and construction schedules. The other option that-
18 that it's taken and we work very closely with the
19 Department of Education on providing programs in
20 nearby schools that might attract students so that
21 they could reduce the enrollment, and then get rid of
22 the trailers. We are very anxious to get rid of
23 those trailers. We-and in terms of how we compared
24 that to Pre-K, okay, first of all, the location of
25 those trailers I will venture to guess are in areas

1
2 that-or schools that are very overcrowded. So, I
3 would guess and-and I believe that you're not going
4 to find Pre-K seats in that school building, but the
5 SCA's role in this was to find small locations where
6 we could build and, in fact, four classrooms for Pre-
7 K with some play space attached to it. There are for
8 example in a Pre-K space you're not building a
9 cafeteria. You're not building a kitchen. You're
10 not building a gymnasium. These are small locations,
11 and not adequate for the student body that's in the
12 trailers now.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Council Member, we'll
14 have to wrap it up.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: We'll continue
16 this afterwards.

17 LORRAINE GRILLO: Oh, okay.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: It's one that's
19 of great concern on me. Those same scenarios existed
20 for 4-PK and 3-PK, and yet when there's a desire and
21 a willingness, this Administration has found ways to
22 make it happen. There really needs, and I will look
23 toward you, Chancellor, to really address this
24 injustice and we'll talk offline, Chancellor.

25 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Thank you.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you, thank
you.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Now we have Council
Member Rosenthal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you so
much Chair Dromm, Chair Treyger. Great to see you
Chancellor and President. Chancellor, thank you so
much for registering to vote yesterday. That was so
much fun and really your story and everyone's story
was so inspirational. It's a great effort. Thank
you for that.

CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I have two
types of questions. The first are--the first two are
capital related--

CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Sure.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --and then the
last three have to do with the school responsibility.
So, in terms of capital the school accessibility
issue is one that we've talked about a bit, and I'm
wondering if as you are reviewing each of the
buildings you would allow for flexibility where
perhaps very quick small changes to certain schools--

CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: [interposing] Sure.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --could make a
3 real big difference. For an example, in my district
4 for the O'Shay Complex where the computer school is,
5 a very small inexpensive lift that perhaps we could
6 add to the staircase just knowing the students who
7 are there would go a long way to accommodating those
8 students fully actually. So, the kids wouldn't have
9 to come in the back door. So, I'm wondering if you
10 would consider that and secondly with capital I'm
11 wondering President Grillo if you're working sharing
12 what you've done with your MWBE program, which is so
13 successful, whether or not the Administration is
14 picking up on your--some of the reasons it's been so
15 successful, the Parks Department comes to mind. And
16 then in terms of fiscal responsibility, I'm concerned
17 about three different things. First of all, in terms
18 of Medicaid reimbursements, I know that and you
19 weren't here Chancellor, but five years ago we were
20 looking at why Medicaid reimbursements were so low
21 for OT and PT services. Actually, Deputy Mayor
22 Shorris had--came up with this great plan where you
23 invested many more--I think it was iPads and trainings
24 so that you guys could bill better, and what I'm
25 seeing here is even in exec you're showing that

1
2 you're going to collect nearly \$100 million in
3 Medicaid reimbursement, but you're not going to
4 collect. You're already only at half of that amount
5 and how could you sort it from a fiscal response—a
6 fiscal—that's not fiscally responsive because you
7 know already what's going to happen. Exec just came
8 out. Secondly, and what are you doing to make it
9 better? Secondly in terms of parity, pay parity with
10 ACS Daycare Centers, which, by the way is the answer
11 to the Council Member's question about where you're
12 putting the 70,000 kids, it's, of course, in [bell]
13 in community based organizations but, you know, given
14 the pay parity problems when it comes over—when they
15 come over under the edicts of DOE, I hope you'll deal
16 with that pay parity problem because the amount of
17 staff that's lost at the CBOs making them so not
18 steady. I'm hoping that you will address that issue
19 and then lastly with the custodial operations, and
20 this again goes to the fiscal irresponsibility issue,
21 you know, that at least \$72 million needs to be added
22 to the budget next year for custodial services. You
23 had it in the money—the money in the budget this
24 year, and I'm not clear how you could convince
25 yourself that you shouldn't put it—the money in the

1 budget for next year, but that's more-less for you
2 Chancellor and more sort of fiscal issue. Thank you.

4 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Council Member

5 Rosenthal, thank you so much, and thank you for being
6 there yesterday. I have to tell you it's really
7 refreshing to see all of our Council members but you
8 in particular. Everywhere I go, there you are. So,
9 thank you. . [laughter] We really appreciate it.

10 I'm going to answer a couple of questions, and we'll-
11 we'll have my-members and my colleagues will answer
12 some specifics. So, in terms of pay parity, this is
13 an incredibly important issue, and as was mentioned,
14 the-the number of seats for Pre-K and 3-K can't just
15 be within the portfolio of facilities in the DOJ. We
16 are working with our community based organizations.
17 We talk about high quality programming and obviously
18 the teacher in the classroom is part of that high
19 quality, and it's an incredible factor for that. So,
20 it's very important to me, and I know it's important
21 to the Mayor and I-I just want you to know that it is
22 important. So, what I'd like to do. Oh, the other
23 issue in terms of the MWBE, we consider that and I
24 consider that also to be significantly important.

25 Every community in which I've served as a leader of a

1
2 school system we've taken an active look at how we're
3 implementing that because that also is a matter of I
4 consider it equity for our community, and how that
5 translates. So, I'm going to be diving a little more
6 into that, and I know President Grillo has done a
7 great job with that particular issue, but we—we want
8 to learn. We want to get better as we go forward. In
9 terms of the other specific issues, I'm going to ask
10 if not only maybe Mrs.—Ms. Ramirez and Mr. Orlando
11 can also take those, but any facility issues I'm
12 going to ask President Grillo to take those.

13 [background comments, pause]

14 LORRAINE GRILLO: Thank you, Council
15 Member. Yes, as far as the accessibility issue that
16 you asked about earlier, certainly when we're doing
17 our surveys when the DOE under Tom Taratko is doing
18 the surveys of the building, certainly those that
19 require minor changes to make the difference we
20 would, of course, accelerate. They wouldn't require
21 things like design and things like that. So,
22 certainly. So as for our MWBE program--

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing]
24 Sorry, can we follow up on that since this is
25 available. (sic)

1

2

LORRAINE GRILLO: Absolutely.

3

4

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you so
much.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

LORRAINE GRILLO: Absolutely. As far as
our MWBE program, we're very, very proud of that
program, and we have a team of folks who work very,
very hard to make sure it's successful. I will say
this that under Deputy Mayor Thompson, he has—his
staff has been meeting with us regularly, and had
instituted a number of programs that replicate what
the SCA does. So, we're really excited. We had a
program this past year called the Opportunity Academy
where we took young people from community college and
trained them in construction back office work, and
they—it was so successful we're going it again. So,
similarly, other—other agencies can do programs like
that, but it's certainly might not be related to
construction. So, they would have to formulate their
own program, but they're very, very interested.

21

22

23

24

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay, and so
you're saying it's Deputy Mayor Thompson who's fairly
new is—is now coordinating that effort between SCA
and other agencies?

25

LORRAINE GRILLO: Correct.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay, that's a see change. That's great to hear about. Thank you.

URSULINA RAMIREZ: So, I'll take the question around the custodial services. So, as you noted there is a discrepancy in terms of the resources. We do anticipate having additional funding for -for the upcoming fiscal year, and hopefully that will happen at the Adopted Budget. This is an ongoing conversation-

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [interposing] You're saying that you'll be able to sip in \$95 million without blinking for Adopted?

URSULINA RAMIREZ: So, we're having additional con-we're having ongoing conversations with OMB and City Hall around how do we ensure that there are adequate services in all of our schools and making sure that our schools are clean and safe. So, do expect additional resources in the budget. At the end of the day, this is-there are ongoing yearly conversations with OMB, and City Hall to make sure that we are making sure that we have our school buildings very clean.

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So, they've held aside and reserved some money for this, or is it something I don't understand how that just slips in.

5

URSULINA RAMIREZ: I--

6

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: But I have a couple more projects I'd love to just slip in.

8

[laughter]

9

URSULINA RAMIREZ: I hear you. This is--I mean it's ongoing conversations with--with OMB and all happy to have conversations with them in terms of where the resources are coming from.

10

11

12

13

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay. It just seems, I mean, okay and then will it be baselined or year by year?

14

15

16

URSULINA RAMIREZ: Right now we're looking at it from a year-by-year stance of just making sure of what, you know, what schools need and how. There was an earlier question of how do we actually get cost savings? So, it's year-by-year discussions around how do we do--have more effective and efficient services.

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: One of the things I

24

hear you saying on that, though, if I'm not mistaken--

25

-

1

2

URSULINA RAMIREZ: [interposing] Yes.

3

4

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: --is that there maybe
a redefinition of the jobs like there was the last
time where you had a super--where you had custodians
taking over two schools where they were only serving
one in the past. Is that something that's under
consideration? [background comments, pause]

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

URSULINA RAMIREZ: Sorry, we're just--
[background comments, pause] There is a custodian--
there's a custodian for each building. There is the
and I--I might get the terms a little bit incorrect
here. It's like the--the host school and then there's
usually some smaller schools associated with that,
but there is one custodian for each building, but I
can--I can--I'd be happy to sit down with you and talk
through and with the, you know, Executive Director
for NYS AIS to sit down and have a conversation around
what do the services look like, and the ongoing
conversations that we have year to year to make sure
that (1) we're doing this efficiently, and (2) make
sure that there's enough money in the budget so that
schools are clean.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, what I'm hearing
you say, though is that you--

1

2

Uh-hm. URSULINA RAMIREZ:

3

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: --to make work more

4

efficiently?

5

URSULINA RAMIREZ: Yes.

6

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Can you shed some

7

light on what you mean by work for more efficiently?

8

URSULINA RAMIREZ: I mean this is in the

9

initial announcement around NYS AIS. As you noted

10

earlier, there was a goal to have some cost--some

11

cost savings here, and so we are trying to assess

12

what is the best way to do that in a way that does

13

not actually have any detrimental effects on schools,

14

and that has been. That's complicated as you--as you

15

might know, and we--we want to make sure that we're

16

not either harming the workforce and/or making sure

17

that the schools are not cleaned. So, I--I do think

18

it's worthy of having a discussion in a sit-down

19

meeting to kind of talk through the details of

20

NYS AIS.

21

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you.

22

URSULINA RAMIREZ: Uh-hm.

23

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: If you could

24

touch on the Medicaid reimbursement because on that

25

one, I--that, too, are you counting on the city just

1
2 to make up for your not be able to collect that
3 money. So, it's additional money that the city is
4 going to have to come up with for that again. Then
5 resulting in the fact that we have—because you're—you
6 haven't implemented the systems that we gave you
7 everything you needed for it, four years ago.
8 Somehow that hasn't happened, and now it's going to
9 mean that some program that, you know, we would like
10 very much to find that that actually would be helpful
11 to students won't be funded because you're not
12 getting the reimbursement that you're owed. I mean
13 either, you know, it's sort of one of those fish or
14 cut bait things. You know, if you're just not going
15 to be able to set up a system to collect the Medicaid
16 revenue that you're owed, don't—don't tell us that
17 you are, and we'll know that we can spend money on
18 something more meaningful or whatever. Just be
19 honest about it. No?

20 RAY ORLANDO: So, the target for the
21 current year is \$97.5 million, and we are working
22 very hard to collect all of the money that we can
23 from the Medicaid program. We feel like we've made a
24 lot of progress on both OTPT and Speech. The target
25 had contemplated in the current year, had

1
2 contemplated that we would have been more successful
3 and work more quickly at speech collecting services,
4 but that work is actually ongoing, and we do have
5 time after the year ends. We have up to a year to
6 bill for services that were provided in the previous
7 year. So, we're hopeful that we'll meet the target.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay. I just
9 think it goes—it questions fiscal responsibility, and
10 I don't know, it would be great to really understand
11 what you're—what you guys are doing or not doing.

12 Thank

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you,
14 Council Member. We're to—the Chancellor has to leave
15 shortly so, we're going to move along here, and we
16 have questions from Council Member Salamanca, Kallos,
17 Deutsch and Cornegy and then a follow-up by Chair
18 Treyger, and we hope that you'll stay with us for
19 that and then I'm going to—that will be end of it.
20 We will not have a round 2.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you, Mr.
22 Chair. Good afternoon, Chancellor. First,
23 Chancellor, I want to commend you and applaud you on
24 your Tweet back in April where you called out wealthy
25 white Manhattan parents angrily ran plans to bring

1
2 more black kids to their schools. I thank you for
3 standing up against segregation in our public
4 schools. I am—I thank you for this type of
5 leadership that you demonstrated ensuring that all
6 kids regardless of their race or their status have
7 access to the best public schools, and the type of
8 leadership that we need in a Chancellor. So, thank
9 you for that. My question here: There is a national
10 conversation now on opioid and heroin overdose, and
11 it's getting the attention now from more—it's getting
12 national attention because overdose heroin is
13 affecting more affluent communities. Recently the
14 Mayor announced four locations for safe injection
15 sites, and one of those sites are in my district, and
16 I am supportive of this. I am working on the
17 Administration ensuring that we pick the right
18 location for this site, but in my district it's
19 ground zero for heroin use especially on 149th Street
20 and Third Avenue. Last year I introduced a bill,
21 which would require all public schools to have
22 Naloxone in stock in case that there's overdose
23 inside or in the surrounding areas of the—of the
24 school. I immediately found resistance from the
25 prior administration prior to you, the prior

1
2 Chancellor and her team because they had data that
3 showed the very small percentage of overdoses in the
4 last five years in public schools. Weeks after that,
5 a special education teacher at the Bronx Public
6 School 811 in my district he passed away from an
7 overdose, a heroin overdose in one of the bathrooms,
8 and so I am reintroducing this bill, and I am looking
9 for support from the Department of Education now that
10 we have a new chancellor, and I wanted to know what
11 was your opinion on this?

12 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: So, thank you,
13 Councilman and thank you for your words of support.
14 I—I very appreciate all of that, and what you see is
15 what you get. You'll continue to hear me at times be
16 as blunt as a spoon, but I think it's a an important
17 issue, and I thank you for your support. I think
18 it's important that we have all available
19 opportunities to save lives whether that's
20 defibrillators at entrances of our schools to CPR
21 training for our employees. So, what I would like to
22 do is actually sit with you, learn more about what
23 you're bill is proposing, and then work through how
24 that could be actionable or not in—in our schools as
25 we think about all 1,800 schools. I think that the

1
2 opioid the opioid issue is an issue that is—I agree
3 with you, of a growing concern. So, I'm really,
4 really wanting to learn more about what that bill is,
5 and then how we can work together.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you.
7 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much.
9 Council Member Kallos followed by Deutsch and then
10 Cornegy.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you Finance
12 Chair Dromm, Education Chair Treyger, Chancellor
13 Carranza and President Grillo and your amazing staff.
14 Pencils out, we have a timer and you don't. So here
15 come the questions. Over the past four years I
16 focused on overcrowding, building a school seats—
17 civics and hunger. On Universal Pre-Kindergarten for
18 three and four-year-olds, thank you for the new Pre-
19 Kindergarten seats being built for this September.
20 That said, how many 4-year-olds applied for Pre-K
21 seats on the Upper East Side and how many received an
22 offer within one mile of their home. How many were
23 offered seats more than two miles away? Many of the
24 pre-kindergarten seats are offered in private
25 childcare settings some of whom are represented by

1
2 District Council 1707. Do these Pre-kindergarten
3 instructors offer the same quality in curriculum as
4 public schools? If they are doing the same work,
5 shouldn't they get paid the same rate? Over the past
6 four years I have asked the President of the School
7 Construction Authority whether my district needs more
8 seats, and I have been advised repeatedly that there
9 is "no identified seat need." Feel free to interrupt
10 and correct me if I am wrong. However, according to
11 the School Construction Authority's enrollment
12 capacity and utilization report Manhattan based on
13 October 31, 2016, audited Registers, the Councilmanic
14 edition, and elementary schools in my Council
15 district have a target cap of 3,519 seats, but
16 enrollment of 3,598 seats for 102% utilization. With
17 my district overcapacity and new construction planned
18 ore in progress could the new Five-Year Capital Plan
19 include more seats? Would the School Construction
20 Authority agree to reach out to every new development
21 in my district to meet with the developer recording-
22 regarding including new school seats in their
23 building and report on progress with my office.
24 Would the School Construction Authority work with me,
25 the Mayor and the City Planning Commission to create

1
2 incentives for new schools with new construction, and
3 Chancellor Carranza, with half of my seats serving
4 the borough and city in schools that are almost
5 entirely children of color across the street from
6 schools that are majority Caucasian, would you commit
7 to expanding integrate seats for the district?
8 Additionally, as you may know, lunch shaming is a
9 real thing. It happened to me 20 years ago, and I'm
10 so grateful to your predecessor for rolling out
11 Universal Free Lunch in addition to Breakfast After
12 the Bell, and in our one-on-one brief meeting, I
13 already mention it to you, but how do we move forward
14 with guaranteeing every one of our public school
15 students after school supper and fresh food to bring
16 home to their families. On civics, after four years
17 of asking, I'm pleased to see citywide voter
18 registration of high school students on Monday
19 despite it happening on a Jewish holy day. Would you
20 support legislation to mandate this valuable practice
21 continue permanently. Along the same lines, would you
22 support mock voting in June and fall's elections?

23 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: [Exhales/laughs]

24 Well done. Well, done, sir. Look, for right before
25 the clock. So again, it was a real pleasure to visit

1 a school with you and thank you for being there. So,
2 lots of questions. We're going to try to dive into
3 some of them and whatever we can't answer here, we
4 will follow up with in writing as well. Around the
5 Pre-K seats and which are—which are the seats offer
6 within a mile, within two miles, we will get back to
7 you with that specific information. It's very
8 district specific. So, we'll get back to you with
9 that information ASAP. In terms of the supper, I—I—I
10 think supper is an incredibly important option for
11 our students. We know that many of our after school
12 programs offer a supper option already to the schools
13 in which they are placed, but I understand the—the
14 urgency that you feel around a ubiquitous breakfast,
15 lunch and supper program. We're—we're actually
16 looking into what that would look like. It's a cost
17 issue, of course, but just like we've been able to
18 find a way to have universal lunch and universal
19 breakfast, we—we—we're hopeful that we're going to be
20 able to find a path forward for that, and we'll
21 continue to work with you on that. In terms of the
22 other questions that were asked, I'm going to ask my
23 colleagues to kind of jump and tag team because I
24

1
2 think there were a number of them having to do with
3 facilities and planning.

4 LORRAINE GRILLO: Sure. Council Member,
5 appreciate the kind words from my wonderful staff.
6 They are fabulous. In terms of overcrowding, we've
7 had this discussion before. I'm not going to make
8 any great correction to that. However, I will say
9 that there are a number of large new developments
10 planned, and I think my staff has--has--has mentioned
11 to you that we are in constant contact with those
12 developers. So, we can--we will continue to do that.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Just, yes, great.

14 URSULINA RAMIREZ: We're going to have to
15 get back to you on the specifics to your question
16 around Pre-K in your district in terms of you said
17 two miles away I believe was your parameters. We're
18 going to get back to you on the specifics after this--
19 after the hearing.

20 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: What did we miss?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Pay parity for
22 the private and school based sites, whether or not we
23 could--and--and then the whole civics piece.

24 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Yes. So, pay
25 parity obviously we want to make sure that anybody

1
2 that's working with our children that are compensated
3 appropriately. That has been brought to my attention
4 as an issues, and I'm working with not only our
5 staff, but also the staff from the Mayor's Office
6 around that particular issues, but-but we agree.
7 Anybody that should be-that's with our students we
8 want to make sure that they're-they're being treated
9 fair and responsibly. Around Civics for All,
10 thrilled about Civics for All. I think it's
11 important that we're registering students. I know
12 that the intent is to continue to not only register
13 students, but have the active participatory
14 experiences in government. Mock elections, I have to
15 find out what we're doing around that. I know in
16 other districts that I've worked in we've had mock
17 elections, and they're run pretty well. So, let me
18 find out what we're doing around that particular
19 issue in-in our school district, and we can respond
20 back to you as well.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: But I think the-
22 the last piece is so on the School Construction
23 Authority I'd like them to build more seats, but for
24 you they build, you set the program. Half my seats
25 are not designated just for my district, and they now

1
2 serve the entire borough, the entire city. Those
3 seats tend to be almost entirely children of color
4 while the seats that only serve my district are
5 majority Caucasian. How can we work on integrating
6 those additional seats or setting aside more for the
7 district in a way that can be integrated so you don't
8 literally have segregated school across the street
9 from segregated school?

10 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Yeah, that's the
11 work that we're talking about, this whole issue of
12 immigration, segregation, institutional barriers. I
13 think you just identified and institutional barrier.
14 So, that's—that's on our radar. We will engage you
15 in that conversation, but we're also going to engage
16 the local school districts, the local districts of
17 the schools as well around identifying how we do
18 eliminate those kinds of issues.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I'm raising my
20 hand. I'd like to work with you to integrate my
21 schools. Thank you.

22 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Thank you,
23 Councilman.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you.
25 Council Member Deutsch.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you,
3 Chair. So, I'm going to be very brief. Council
4 Member Kallos just asked 51 out of my 52 questions.
5 [laughter] So, I'm going to get down to it. So, I
6 had a conversation with the Administration beginning
7 in January, and I had a conversation with you,
8 Chancellor, just a few weeks ago when you were in my
9 district. So, I'm looking to see if we can add
10 another two boxes in order to—on the student's
11 application form asking students if they are a child
12 of a parent who's in active military, and in addition
13 to that, asking the child if they're a child of a
14 veteran. This helps in a number of reasons. Number
15 1 is that when a child is failing in school or a
16 child may have issues, it may be too late to find out
17 that the parent, a parent is a veteran maybe
18 suffering from PTSD or other related issues. In
19 addition to that, there are a lot of resources
20 available for students, children of veterans or
21 students of—of a parent who is in active military
22 duty, and as well as results—many resources for
23 parents. So, sometimes a veteran or someone who's in
24 active military duty doesn't know what resources are
25 available to them. So, this way we could collaborate

1 with DVS, and—and with a—with a peer counselor with
2 the student—with the counselors in schools to better
3 understand and better know which children are
4 children of veterans of a child of active military.
5 So, I've been going back and forth with the office
6 since January. So, I'm asking you respectfully if we
7 can make this happen for this coming school year?
8

9 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Councilman Deutsch
10 thank you again for the—for the question. We've
11 actually—have actually elevated that question to our
12 enrollment team about—it seems like a very
13 straightforward request, but what I've asked the team
14 to get back to me on is oh, so let's say we identify
15 and let's just say we have out of 1.1 million
16 students, let's just say we have 5,000 that identify
17 in those particular—with those particular
18 characteristics. Are we prepared then to have
19 appropriate staff and resources to fully engage with
20 that information, make the appropriate connections to
21 federal authorities, state authorities, local
22 authorities. Do we have then the processes in place
23 to if a student is demonstrating any kind of either
24 anti-social behavior or less than what we would like
25 to see academic progress, how would we then intervene

1
2 and connect people with those? So, it-it seems like
3 a very simple prospect and-and I-I think it's a great
4 ideal. I want to make sure that when we come back to
5 you and say yes we can do this or no we can't do
6 this, that we have the appropriate information so
7 that we then have the ability to think about then how
8 do we make that happen? So, as I said, I've elevated
9 that to our enrollment team. [bell] They're
10 updating me on what that's going to look like. I
11 can't make a commitment that that will happen for
12 this enrollment season as we're already in essence in
13 that enrollment season, but it is something that I'm
14 taking very seriously, and we've asked our team to be
15 very thoughtful about.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Okay, I just
17 want to respond with two-two quick things. Number
18 one is the Department of Veterans Services. I'm sure
19 they'll be willing to collaborate with the
20 Administration and train--

21 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Right.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: --these
23 coordinators, and number two, is that the Chancellor
24 mentioned that you don't know if the school is
25 prepared in case you come across a child who is not

1
2 doing well because of a parent who—who has PTSD. So,
3 if nothing is being done now, we can't handle it, then
4 we need to, you know, at least we have those
5 services, and you better understand those services by
6 having that information beforehand because we can't
7 just let the child go by saying we don't have the
8 services. There are services available, and we tend
9 to forget, and when this federal money is available
10 for such things, we neglect it because the money is
11 there. It's no big deal. It's more exciting to
12 fight for the budget than to fight for money than to
13 say, you know, the money is there. You know, too
14 bad. You know, let's—let's just go with the flow.
15 So, the federal funding is there. We have an agency
16 the Department of Veterans Services who are—who have
17 peer counselors throughout all five boroughs who
18 could have a job—additional job to go out to the
19 schools and train these people. So, I'm asking the
20 respectfully if we could make this happen for this
21 school year. We cannot wait another school year if a
22 child is not doing well to say we don't—we don't know
23 what resources there are. So, I think you and I look
24 forward to a response before the school year. Thank
25 you.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Councilman—thank you Council Member, and again I remain jealous of your voice. That is an—that—I want everyone of our public announcement systems that we installed to make us sound just like our council members.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So, I—the chair just gave me an extra three minutes just to talk.

CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: [laughter] We—we—we share your sense of urgency, sir. Again, I—I want to make sure that as we respond that we're responding in a very, very proactive, very systematic way to the responses. Implementation is key, and—and I understand that. I also want to be clear for those of us that are listening or watching as any student that presents any kind of a difficulty we have processes in place to assess how are they doing, what's the root cause of that. So, we're not letting any student go, but this is just another layer I think that could be very useful. We just want to make sure that we're informed as we engage about what the—what the—what are our capacity to implement this school year is and if we make the promise we're going to do it, we can actually deliver on that.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you, and I-I just want to-I'm-I'm also on a track to see how many school children are currently in college, and who don't know what resources are available and-are are paying off a student loan when, in fact, they may be eligible for that scholarship as being a child of a veteran. So, that is also one of the points. It's not just on a child, but also giving the resources to the children, and as well as to the parents. So, the services are there. There's an agency there. So, that's one out of three things you just mentioned that we need to figure it out, but being proactive and getting this information over can't hurt growing up. Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Council Member Cornegy.

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Thank you, Chair Dromm. Good afternoon and welcome, Chancellor Carranza. Unfortunately, my office has not been able to effectively coordinate a meeting between us, and so I'm going to take some of my time just to let you know what issues are germane to my community, and the city at large that we'd like to address. Firstly, I'd like to piggyback off of what--Council Member

1
2 Barron began the conversation around parity in the
3 specialized high schools. We believe that we have a
4 very simple solution. I'm wondering if, you know,
5 you'd entertain it, which is we know that we could
6 double the enrollment in specialized high schools for
7 minorities just by doing what some schools across the
8 country, some higher-higher institutions are doing
9 primarily Ivy League Schools, which are allowing
10 merit-based entrants, which is not away from the
11 exam. For example, if just every student who was a
12 valedictorian or salutatorian in junior high schools
13 who was—who wanted to attend could attend, we would
14 double the enrollment. The funny thing was when I
15 suggested this several years ago, I had a very high
16 ranking person in DOE say to me no we can't do that
17 because the valedictorian in East New York doesn't
18 have the same academic background as the
19 valedictorian in Prospect Heights, and I said well
20 explain. They said. Well, in—in East New York what
21 they'll do is they'll base it on attendance and—and
22 how they work socially in their community and not on
23 academics, and I said I—I hope you say that out loud
24 at some hearing that I get you to because it's that
25 kind of parity that we're trying to fight for. So,

1
2 that's—that's one concern that I have about the
3 specialized high schools and the pathway ultimately
4 to Ivy League colleges, which I—I represent Bedford-
5 Stuyvesant and Northern Crown Heights, and all of—
6 we're facing a tremendous brain drain because all of
7 my best and brightest students are now forced to go
8 to other communities to be educated because C16 lacks
9 some of the foundation necessary to be a guidepost
10 and pathway to those schools. And then the second
11 thing I'll get to, which is another pathway is gifted
12 and talented programs. Prior to your arrival here we
13 had kind of a—a knock down, drag-out fight with your
14 predecessor around gifted and talented and she made a
15 valid point. She said she'd love for the entire DOE
16 to be comprised of gifted and talented schools. And I
17 said unfortunately in the Borough of Brooklyn CC16 at
18 that time had no gifted and talented program. Zero
19 and C and CC21 had 13. So, they were creating a
20 pathway. They had insulated themselves in a way that
21 they created a pathway to—to higher education, to the
22 specialized high schools, and we had created a path—a
23 prison path—a prison pipeline. So, summarily, she
24 relented and we began to implement in all of the
25 minority communities around city [bell] gifted and

1 talented programs. So, now in my district where CC16
2 resides, in Bedford-Stuyvesant and Crown Heights we
3 have one gifted and talented elementary class, and
4 one gifted and talented junior high class, but
5 they're tremendously under-resourced. So, my parents
6 are not willing even if they live in the area because
7 they can make comparisons to other gifted and
8 talented programs across the city, and the resources
9 have not been allocated. So, we were given it in
10 minority communities in the South Bronx, in Southeast
11 Queens, in--in Bedford-Stuyvesant and East New York.
12 We were given the gifted and talented programs back
13 but a shell of themselves in comparison to their
14 equals around the city. I want to know if you'll
15 look at the resourcing. So anecdotally, I'm telling
16 you they're under-resourced because I visit them, and
17 what they're supposed to provide in an academic
18 pathway, they don't provide and the administrators
19 and the teachers are telling me that they're under-
20 resourced, and when I visit District 21, I can see
21 evidently. It is evident to me what--what a gifted
22 and talented program should look like and what
23 resources should be available. So, there was an
24 effort made, which I commend the DOE for doing once
25

1 they realized that there were no gifted and talented—
2 First of all, there were no gifted and talented
3 programs for the last two decades in minority
4 communities, and under your predecessor, she allowed
5 for them to be restored, but then they're under-
6 resourced. So, I'm—I'm asking for a commitment to
7 look at those gifted and talented programs, to get
8 them resourced appropriately so that parents can do
9 for their children what they'd like to do, provide an
10 excellent level of reading, writing and arithmetic,
11 but the socialization that's necessary for them to
12 live, work, play and be educated in their own
13 communities.
14

15 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: So, Councilman,
16 again thank you for the issues that you've brought
17 up. I've spent a lot of time in Bed-Stuy, Crown
18 Heights. I'm sorry we haven't been able to connect,
19 but it's no difficulty to get in touch with me. So,
20 I'm—I'm after this I'm going to make sure you have my
21 scheduling person so we can spend some time together.
22 Would really welcome that conversation. In terms of
23 specialized schools, thank you for your
24 recommendations. I have to tell you that what you've
25 shared has made it onto my radar as some potential.

1
2 So, again, as we've had conversations with lots of
3 different folks in the city as I have, as I've come
4 into this conversation, I want you to know that that
5 idea has been brought forward as well, and it's part
6 of a portfolio of possible fixes. One of the issues
7 that continues to vex us, and I think it's important
8 just to mention is that at least in some of these
9 specialized schools there's state law, which now
10 regulates what is exactly required. I've never seen
11 that. In all of the states I've ever lived in, I've
12 never seen where there's state law that specifically
13 requires a certain entrance exam for students in a
14 public school system. I've just never seen that.
15 So, that's a different variable that I think we can
16 work together to—to address as well, but we are
17 looking at that particular issue. The Mayor is very
18 interested in that issue as well, and—and I want to
19 thank you for your advocacy around making sure that
20 all schools are open to all of our students. In
21 terms of gifted and talented I'm—I'm happy to hear,
22 and I understand that there's at least one—and this
23 sounds horrible. There's at least one in every
24 district. Based on your comments, I understand why
25 that's important based on what the—the recent past

1
2 was. Our commitment in terms of how we utilize our
3 resources from an equity perspective falls squarely
4 within the concern that you have raised here today.
5 If we look from an equity perspective where are the
6 communities that have historically been underfunded?
7 Where are the communities that have historically been
8 underserved? We have as a guiding principle, and one
9 of my guiding principles is how do we then equitably
10 distribute resources so that students and communities
11 are being served in their communities? That is a
12 guiding principle, and I'd look forward to working
13 with you on how we go forward, but that's also
14 something that is important for us as well. I think
15 it's also important to, you know, my career almost 30
16 years now as an educator I've seen a lot of
17 permutations around gifted and talented, and I want
18 to make sure that when we're talking about gifted and
19 talented, that we're talking about gifted and
20 talented programs that are truly serving needs of
21 gifted and talented students and not programs that
22 are monikers for others, the adults. My child is a
23 gifted and talented student. I have 30 programs in
24 my district. I want to make sure we're serving
25 students, and if we're student-serving students and

1 they require a gifted and talented program because
2 they are truly gifted and talented, then we need to
3 be investing in those kinds of programs, ubiquitously
4 across the city. In some cases that may mean that we
5 may have to re-examine our portfolio of what those
6 programs look like. But again, in my general comment
7 that I've made today, and I want to be very clear
8 about what I'm saying, we should not use either
9 programs that—that are school based, programs that
10 are city based like schools and entrants to schools s
11 filters for who gets in and who gets out. I think
12 that that is just fundamentally in our democracy
13 undemocratic. So, I look forward to working with the
14 City Council and my colleagues in the Department of
15 Education, and quite frankly, the community around
16 identifying where are those either intentional or
17 unintentionally established barriers to all students
18 having access, and then working very aggressively at
19 eliminating those barriers for all of our students
20 here in the city of New York.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I—I will just—
23 I'm sorry, Chair. I will let you know that on the
24 gifted and talented front, we've done a lot. I want
25 to work with you on it meaning there are some

1
2 communities who find a way to insulate themselves
3 ancillary programs that support gifted and talented,
4 and we don't have that. So, we've been working with
5 the National Society of Black Engineers in my
6 community, which does test prep. There's test prep
7 available in other communities at a cost that, you
8 know, we don't have the resources to do. So, I'd
9 like to talk to you about resourcing even the test
10 prep portion of it just to get students up to speed
11 who may not have identified clearly as gifted and
12 talented, but with the right resources could be
13 identified. So, that's the second level to it, and I
14 just want to say that your predecessor also did
15 something that we appreciated in the academic sphere,
16 which is to change the on-ramp from kindergarten to
17 third grade. We believe that that was a disparity
18 that really negatively impacted communities of color
19 going in in kindergarten. It was about language, it
20 was like by third-by third grade you should be able
21 to recognize a student who may have an acumen that
22 suggests that they are gifted and talented as opposed
23 to a kindergartener where that's just language. So,
24 it's what the parents say. It's what the vocabulary
25 in the household is and those kinds of things. So,

1
2 there were--there were questions about even the exam,
3 which--which your predecessor addressed that I
4 appreciate. I think that there's more that can be
5 done. Myself, my community, the education committee
6 that I sit on are willing to work to make sure that
7 we can bring parity and not just put it on the DOE.
8 We sit poised and ready to work with you to make sure
9 that every student can an opportunity, and every
10 student can have the potential to be gifted and
11 talented.

12 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Councilman, we're--
13 we're singing off of the same hymn book. So, I
14 appreciate that and look forward to working with you,
15 and look forward to meeting you soon. Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yeah, I mean I have
17 to just get my little piece in here as well. I mean
18 this is the problem with--with the high stakes
19 standardized test to begin with is that, you know, do
20 they really measure true giftedness or true, you
21 know, learning ability? You know, I believe that for
22 the--for the admission of kindergarten G&Ts is based
23 on one test if I'm not mistaken here, right? So, and
24 then, you know, does that really measure true
25 giftedness and--and should we really be using like

1
2 Renzulli measures of G&T, which to me is the real
3 measure of gifted and talented students. But, you
4 know, those high stakes standardized tests have
5 always been culturally biased and to base admission
6 into program just on those alone, in my opinion is
7 not something that we should be engaging in. Anyway,
8 let me turn it over to our chair, and I thank you so
9 much. We're going to close it out with him.

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you, Chair
11 Dromm. Yeah, I will not get on my soap box about
12 testing although I have a lot to say on that subject,
13 and—but I do appreciate Chancellor, your—your
14 connection to our concerns on the issue of high
15 stakes testing. In a previous hearing, Chancellor,
16 Deputy Chancellor Rose minimized the impact that
17 overcrowding has on instruction in schools. I'd like
18 to get your take on whether or not you believe an
19 overcrowded school, an overcrowded classroom does
20 that have a negative impact on instruction in class?

21 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Thank you, Chairman
22 Treyger, and I will say to both chairs I share your
23 concerns about the bias in single tests. That's
24 another conversation for another day. You know, my
25 experience as a teacher was such that at one point in

1
2 my teaching career, I had a classroom where I had 46
3 students in my classroom, and that was probably one
4 of my five classes that I taught, and I know that in
5 subsequent years when I had anywhere from 25 to 27
6 students, which in some cases would say that's still
7 a lot, I could actually do a better job. I could pay
8 more attention to students. I could actually
9 differentiate for my students. I could actually know
10 where my students were in terms of their learning
11 progression. I could implement and innovate because
12 we weren't crowded. So, while it may not seem like
13 it's significant because it's, you know, it, you
14 know, you still have curriculum, you still have a
15 teacher, you still have materials. I think the
16 learning environment is important, and—and I think
17 that as we look at the constraints that we have
18 around making that happen, I know that if I was to
19 say to—to President Grillo, you have an unlimited
20 checkbook. Fix it. She would fix it, and
21 unfortunately [laughter] operative word being 'if'
22 [laughter] but—but unfortunately, many of these issues
23 especially as it pertains to facilities have to do
24 with funding, and I know that there's—there's been
25 the expressed sentiment that, you know, we just can't

1
2 throw money at the issue. Money isn't a solution.
3 I—I just wish once in my career somebody had thrown
4 money at the issue. We could fix a lot of things.
5 So, the—in my perspective, my professional experience
6 the issue of facilities and the facilities'
7 appropriateness for the instructional purpose are
8 inextricably intertwined. So, as we look at how we
9 go forward, we will be working very closely, and I
10 have to say, President Grillo has done a phenomenal
11 job of managing this portfolio of—of real estate and
12 on our capital plan, but we're going to be very
13 focused on making sure we're ameliorating those
14 issues of overcrowding, that we're being very
15 proactive around how we're planning for new seats.
16 And on the instructional side, we're going to be
17 very, very aggressive at providing the structures,
18 the supports, the professional development to grow
19 academic programs so that there is no seat untaken
20 because people want to come to our schools.

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, I really
22 appreciate you answer to that, too, to this question
23 because this—this does mean a lot to us as a
24 committee, and—and educators and folks who believe in
25 public schools because we were told by the Deputy

1
2 Chancellor that some of the most successful schools
3 in New York City are greatly over capacity, and my
4 response to that sentiment is that success has to be
5 within reach to all, and not to some. As a former
6 teacher, I remember if I'm being observed, and I have
7 a class of over, you know, definitely over 30 kids,
8 but only five or six are asking this—or I'm being—I
9 want to call on five or six kids or only hearing from
10 five or six kids, that's not truly accountable to
11 all. We want to hear from more kids than that. So,
12 we have to make sure that success is within reach to
13 all and that we're not letting any kid fall through
14 the cracks. So thank you, Chancellor for that
15 answer. A quick question on, yeah, I mentioned before
16 about community schools and I agree with your
17 sentiment exactly that each community school is a
18 community school. There's no cookie cutter approach.
19 I agreed with that. What is the current number of
20 community schools that we have right now in—right now
21 in New York City, and is there a plan to increase
22 them?

23 URSULINA RAMIREZ: We're currently around
24 and I'm going to correct it approximately 220
25 community schools right now.

1

2

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Is there a plan to
increase that number?

3

4

URSULINA RAMIREZ: I think with, you
know, additional resources, of course, we would have--
like to have conversations around how do we get more
community resource coordinators in our schools? I
think the Chancellor would probably note that some of
our schools are doing this kind of on their own. I
know that they are without additional resources and I
know that folks are looking for kind of a resource
coordinator to help kind of get the resources within
communities. There's ongoing conversations with OMB
around how do we expand the Community Schools
Program.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Because I will tell
you this is a part of the answer my original
question--

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

URSULINA RAMIREZ: Uh-hm.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: --at the start of
the hearing about how can we best meet the social-
emotional needs of students? This is a part of the
answer as well, and--and--and there are--and I
appreciate your--your acknowledgement of different
approaches and strategies. There's the Community

1
2 Learning School Strategy, which is very, very hyper-
3 local based, which really taps into the local
4 community, which I think we need to learn from and-
5 and build on. So, this is an area that I'd like for
6 us to work together on as well because you-you're
7 going to hear me sound like a broke record about
8 social-emotional and academic. I think that they're
9 all intertwined. I think that we are teaching to the
10 whole child, not just to an exam. That is--that's--
11 that's very important to me. A quick--a couple other
12 quick questions. I--with regards to, I--I heard before
13 testimony about the anti-bias training. So, it's my
14 understanding that all DOE staff will be required to
15 undergo anti-bias training over the next four years
16 with additional funding included in the Exec Budget.
17 Will this include school safety agents?

18 URSULINA RAMIREZ: This is for DOE staff.
19 So, school safety agents are on the NYPD--on the
20 NYPD's payroll and NYPD staff. I--I--I will get back
21 to you in terms of I know NYPD has their own plans
22 around anti-bias training, and I would be curious to
23 see if they're also implementing the school safety
24 agents. So, this would be for DOE employees. As you
25 noted and our goal is to get to 142,000 of our staff

1
2 in the next several years, and it would be providing
3 procession for all of the—our—our staff so they can
4 get that training.

5 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: But, would you
6 agree that it's important that this type of training
7 be extended to all folks working in a school
8 building.

9 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Chairman Treyger,
10 what I would say to you is that every single person
11 that works in a school site should be trained. I
12 think it's important. If nothing else, what it does
13 is it provides us with a common language, a common
14 Lexicon through which we can have these sometimes
15 very difficult conversations about how we're serving
16 our students and what our expectations are. So,
17 everyone from the school safety agents to our student
18 attrition workers to our custodians to our teachers,
19 our parents, our principals, everyone would benefit
20 from this kind of training.

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you, Mr.
22 Chancellor and will the anti-bias training provided
23 to DOE staff include issues around sexual harassment
24 and abuse?

1
2 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Absolutely. I
3 think that's part of creating a safe and supportive
4 working environment.

5 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you, thank
6 you for that answer. I also just want to touch on
7 the issue of—very quickly on the issue of school
8 maintenance budgets. We heard before Chancellor
9 about universal, you know, lunch and more breakfast
10 and breakfast in the classroom, and that also means
11 that there will be spills in the classroom, and there
12 will be sometimes incidents where folks have to
13 better maintain. You know, the DOE posts budgets at
14 the school level on its website including the
15 formulas used to determine school funding levels such
16 as FSF. However, there's no similar transparency on
17 the allocation of buildings' custodial operations
18 budgets. Not even custodial engineers can see the
19 factors that determine their building's custodial
20 budgets. Will the DOE commit to making the formulas
21 for determining custodial allocation in schools
22 public, and provide the Council with a list of
23 custodial allocations to each school including the
24 factors that determine each allocation?
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

URSULINA RAMIREZ: I do think that there's—I think that we should have a broader meeting with—with yourself, Chair Treyger and Chair Dromm around the NYSAIS and the custodial spending just so we can have a deeper discussion around how the resources are allocated. We have—obviously when we built after some profit, we have more insight around how budgets are spent within the schools[coughs] but at this time, I can't provide you with the details of—of—of how and when we're going to give that information out, but I would love to have—sit down and have a conversation with you about that in the future.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right because do far—[coughing]—what I've learned so far and I'd like to learn more--

URSULINA RAMIREZ: [interposing] Uh-hm.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: --is that they look at the size of the school' square footage--

URSULINA RAMIREZ: Yep.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Which—which I understand--

URSULINA RAMIREZ: Yep.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: --but what I did not hear is that they take the age of the school into account. I have schools in my district that were built with money the New Deal--

URSULINA RAMIREZ: Yep.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: --but have not seen big-big upgrades since the New Deal.

URSULINA RAMIREZ: It's like that is one of our newer buildings.

CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: Right. [laughter]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, this-this is an issue I-I do think that the age of a building needs to be factored in, and I'd like to learn more about how-how we-but do you, are-are we-because this is an issue that I just want to be clear on. Are there cuts to-are there any cuts to the maintenance budgets of individual schools right now?

URSULINA RAMIREZ: So, no, there are no cuts. There-there have been situations where we've had to reallocate resources within schools around specific spending lines within the custodial budgets, but there are no cuts, and we do expect to have ongoing conversations with OMB and we do this-we want to do this yearly to ensure that there will be no

1 impacts to-to the cleanliness of our buildings. So,
2 I-those conversations are ongoing.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Alright. So, this
5 might have been asked before because the DOE is-in
6 Fiscal 2018, the DOE is spending \$684 million on a
7 contract with--

8 URSULINA RAMIREZ: interposing] Uh-hm.

9 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: NYSAIS. However,
10 the financial plan projects spending \$612 million,
11 right. Is this an accurate--?

12 URSULINA RAMIREZ: We do and this is-we're
13 still having conversations with the OMB, but we do
14 expect additional resources so that we will not see
15 any cuts to schools.

16 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay, I'm just
17 going to close by just--

18 URSULINA RAMIREZ: Uh-hm.

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: --a few quick
20 comments, just sort of like a summary of--

21 URSULINA RAMIREZ: Yeah.

22 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: --the-the wrap-up.
23 Chancellor, I appreciate again the thing that you
24 mentioned before about schools historically
25 underfunded, underserved. I-I just want to just

1
2 bring to your attention the impact that still has
3 today. We—we discussed this in terms of numbers, but
4 I just want to make—make sure that we understand in
5 terms of perception in our communities. We talk
6 about enrollment. We talk about schools that have
7 difficulty. You know, people who work really hard in
8 these buildings that still suffer from enrollment
9 gaps and this is one of my issues when I had a
10 hearing about the Renewable School Program. Schools
11 need help from the DOE to get the word out about the
12 good work that they're doing inside those buildings.
13 They need help for a lot of reasons. First of all,
14 they—they are doing good work. The public deserves
15 to know about it, but there's—there are also private—
16 privately funded big funded agendas out there looking
17 to really I think denigrate their—their good work in
18 looking to just continuously, you know, just
19 stereotype public schools and say that they're
20 failing and that they're horrible, and they're also
21 reaching into multi-ethnic media outlets where I—I—
22 from the Russian speaking community where they have
23 gone on Russian radio to bash public schools to try
24 to send kids for example to charter schools. And I
25 share your view that kids are our kids whether they

1
2 go to public, district public school or charter
3 school, these are our kids. We want to serve
4 everybody, but I take issue when someone calls my
5 student failing or someone calls my school a failing
6 school, I take issue with that, as well, but our
7 schools need help, and how can we help, you know, use
8 the DOE's public relations arm to support individual
9 schools to deal with issues of perception. Has-has-
10 have you given this any thought?

11 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: So, Chairman
12 Treyger, I-I appreciate the passion. I'm right with
13 you. I-I-I was recently at an evening event, which
14 was lot of CEOs in the city, and I was a little
15 shocked by some of the preconceived notions where I
16 got to tell you I rolled up my-my sleeves, put on my
17 boxing gloves and went-went at it with these folks
18 because there is this perception that traditional
19 public schools are failing and I-and I absolutely
20 deft that definition. So, I'm with you. We as a
21 school system quite frankly are not organized to be a
22 marketing firm. I'm just going to say that, and the
23 reason I say that is that in other school systems
24 that I've led, we've come to the realization that we
25 are in a market, and that there is tremendous

1
2 marketing dollars in other sectors of the education
3 field that are specifically not just promoting those
4 options, but are denigrating our portfolio of
5 schools. So I do think there is an opportunity and a
6 need for us to take a marketing approach, and really
7 market the good things that are happening in our
8 schools. I will tell you that some of the schools
9 that perhaps the reputation is you don't want to send
10 your child to that school, and I've walked those
11 schools. To the Councilman's point in Bed-Stuy, and
12 I've seen some of the most incredible teaching that
13 is happening in those schools, and I think that's
14 something we need to celebrate. So, with-with your
15 support, and as I work with my colleagues here as I
16 enter this role, do not be surprised if we do not
17 come back at some point in the future with a
18 marketing plan. For New York City's public schools,
19 and really, really work with not only philanthropic
20 partners, some potential private public-private
21 partnerships around really celebrating what the good
22 things are that are happening in our traditional New
23 York City public schools. Sometimes the opportunity
24 to be from an external experience and come into the
25 city is a real benefit, and as I am—as I was

1
2 reminded, the honeymoon is over. I get it, but I
3 still bring with me that fascination that fascination
4 that incredible optimism as I go into our communities
5 and see different schools in New York City, and I
6 compare that to what my experiences have been in
7 other communities and the level of dedication, the
8 level of funding, the level of investment and I
9 compare that dichotomy. We are in an incredible
10 position. So, I agree with you. Let's celebrate.
11 Let's lift it up. Let's lift up educators that are
12 doing in—in many ways God's work in some of the most
13 difficult circumstances, but students are learning
14 and communities are vibrant, and that's going to
15 require us to think a little differently about the—
16 the—the old paradigm of the school system just
17 kind of chugging along to this school system that's
18 not only doing remarkable things for students and
19 building communities, but we're going to celebrate
20 that. We're going show it. We're going to market
21 ourselves. We're going to talk about what we're
22 doing. We're going to talk about the people. I
23 think that is something we should be very, very proud
24 of and we can do together.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I—I greatly appreciated that answer. I was passed a budget note. I just want to just respond to it earlier just before—I think before—you mentioned before that there are no cuts to the maintenance. I’m—I’m being told that in the Executive Budget that there’s a cut of— Actually, what I’m reading here is that release on April 26, 2018, contains a cut of \$99,768,135 from Fiscal Year 2018 to—to the budget for school facilities. Are you disputing those numbers? Can you speak to that, please?

URSULINA RAMIREZ: That. Yes, there—that is the—the delta between last year and this fiscal year. We are—this is where we’re having conversations with OMB to ensure that—that our schools are not impacted, but there are—but there are conversations ongoing with OMB and folks really understand the concerns there.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yeah, but just respectfully, I don’t know how the schools will not be impacted with that type of cut. That—that is significant, and I just don’t want to—because one of the things we have to value in education is the physical space.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

URSULINA RAMIREZ: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: It's clean, it's safe, and this is something that we would like the administration to prioritize. Not cuts to our maintenance budget especially there's been no cuts to education in this budget. So, we should not see that suffer in—in our schools. The last point I'll make, Chancellor, I have a bill that's—it's make its way in the Council just to bring it to your attention on the issue of equity. I applaud—I really applaud those schools that have active and really engaged, whether it's the PA, PTA organizations, alumni organizations, that's extraordinary. We should celebrate them and applaud them. What I also recognize is that there are certain communities that don't have the capacity to raise the type of dollars that some of these very active PTAs particularly in let's say wealthier neighborhoods have. And I've—and I've heard anecdotally that sometimes PTAs could raise over-up to a million dollars or some of the like to raise over—over a million dollars, and that will fund air conditioners in the school, and that will fund debate teams, and that will fund some of the clubs and the activities and that school possesses. But

1 schools in neighborhoods that don't have that type of
2 wealth and that type of money don't have that type of
3 capacity. Just wanted to get your thoughts on this
4 because the bill that I have would just create
5 transparency that it would—it would ask the DOE to
6 share with us the—the PTA and PA numbers of how much
7 money is—is being raised to make sure that equity is
8 felt across the board in New York City.

10 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: So, Chair Treyger,
11 that is also one of those items that is universal
12 everywhere I've—I've worked and you have the
13 privilege in some communities of being able to raise
14 significant funding, which we know then affects the
15 programming. It affects the physical plan. It
16 affects extracurricular. It affects everything.
17 While we don't besmirch any parent community the
18 ability to be able to raise those kinds of funds, I
19 think transparency is always important, and
20 transparency becomes even more important when we talk
21 about from an equity perspective why there's going to
22 be certain communities and certain schools that are
23 going to get different levels of funding based on the
24 challenges. My understanding is we—and we can
25 clarify. We don't actually collect that information

1
2 from our PTAs, PTOs. So, we'll verify what—how would
3 we be able to even collect that information? What
4 mechanism would that kind of look like? But I will—
5 I—I will—I will share a story with you. I hope you
6 don't mind. In one of my past experiences, when we
7 talked about equity, and I've used that word I don't
8 know how many hundreds of times and during this
9 testimony. But in one of those communities I was
10 having a very difficult conversation with a community
11 where we had just announced that we were going to be
12 in vesting resources in historically underfunded
13 communities, and because of that, the base allocation
14 was going to be greater in another community, which
15 would be considered one of those community you don't
16 want to send your kids to, but we were really working
17 to build up that community. And I went to a town
18 meeting or a community meeting in a—in the community
19 where they were going to see a reduction in their
20 base allocation, but we knew that there was
21 incredible resources that parents in that community
22 was raising external to the base allocation. And I
23 remember that a parent took me on, and said to me in
24 very uncertain—no uncertain terms: How dare you take
25 the funding from my child in this school and sent it

1
2 to another school. You are disadvantaging my child
3 and you are advantaging another child, and that's
4 just un-American. That's not okay. She called me
5 every name in the book, and after about five minutes
6 of trying to make the case of why there are
7 inequities in the system and that if all schools are
8 able to rise, then the entire system rises and we are
9 living up to our commitment to the community, and
10 this parent said absolutely not. That is not
11 acceptable, and I finally said to the parent, I
12 understand. I get it. Money is important, and she
13 said to me, That's what I've been trying to tell you
14 for the last ten minutes that money is important.
15 So, what I did is I said to this parent, Here's my
16 business card. I want you to call me tomorrow
17 morning, and I will guarantee your child a seat in
18 one of those schools where we're sending the
19 additional resources to because money is important. I
20 have yet to receive a phone call or an email from
21 that parent. [laughter] So, I think this issue of
22 resources is an incredibly important issue, and while
23 we don't besmirch anyone the ability to raise
24 additional resources, I think it is important to have
25 a clear picture of what is it--what are the actual

1
2 conditions in each one of those communities because
3 then when we as the Department of Education, we as-
4 you as the City Council, the Mayor as the Mayor
5 advocates for an equity allocation understanding that
6 there are challenges in communities, then we're all
7 very clear and sober about why that should be
8 something that we think about. So, I would love to
9 meet with you, learn more about your bill, and then
10 actually examine how we can continue to work towards
11 transparency.

12 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you,
13 Chancellor. This was-it's almost like a marathon
14 hearing, and you've stayed from beginning to end, and
15 that says a lot about your leadership and your
16 leadership style and approach, and it-it feels good
17 to have an educator continue in the home and we have
18 been greatly impressed at this point, and with your
19 musical abilities as well and talents and your
20 connection to kids in our schools. Thank you very
21 much, Chancellor for today.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: [Speaking Spanish]
23 Thank you very much for coming. It's been a pleasure
24 to have you and for spending so much time with us.

25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: [Speaking foreign
3 language]

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you to the
5 panel. Thank you.

6 CHANCELLOR CARRANZA: A true honor and
7 thank you for the opportunity. Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Now this
9 concludes our hearing for today. The Finance
10 Committee will resume Executive Budget hearings for
11 Fiscal 2019 on Thursday, May 24th at 10:00 a.m. in
12 the room. On Thursday, the Finance Committee will
13 hear from the Office of Management and Budget, the
14 Independent Budget Office, the Comptroller, the
15 Health and Hospitals Corporation and the public. The
16 public will be invited to testify at approximately
17 4:00 p.m. on Thursday. For any member of the public
18 who wishes to testify, but cannot make it to the
19 hearing, you can email your testimony to the Finance
20 Division at financetestimony@council.nyc.gov and the
21 staff will make it a part of the official record.
22 Thank you and this hearing is now adjourned. [gavel]

23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
EDUCATION

195

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
- 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date June 15, 2018