

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

----- X

May 18, 2018
Start: 10:19 a.m.
Recess: 2:40 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: DANIEL DROMM
Chairperson

MARK LEVINE
Chairperson

DIANA AYALA
Chairperson

JAMES G. VAN BRAMER
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Adrienne E. Adams
Andrew Cohen
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Laurie A. Cumbo
Vanessa L. Gibson
Barry S. Grodenchik
Rory I. Lancman
Steven Matteo
Francisco P. Moya

Keith Powers
Helen K. Rosenthal
James G. Van Bramer
Alicka Ampry-Samuel
Inez D. Barron
Mathieu Eugene
Fernando Cabrera
Robert F. Holden
Joseph C. Borelli
Karen Koslowitz

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Dr. Mary Bassett, Commissioner
NYC Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, DOHMH

Dr. Oxiris Barbot, First Deputy Commissioner
NYC Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, DOHMH

Sandee Rozzo, Deputy Commissioner for Finance
NYC Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, DOHMH

Corinne Schiff, Deputy Commissioner for Environmental
Health, NYC Department of Health and Mental Hygiene,
DOHMH

Dr. Demetre Daskalakis, Deputy Commissioner for
Disease Control, NYC Department of Health and Mental
Hygiene, DOHMH

Tony Marx, President and CEO
New York Public Library

Dennis Walcott, President and CEO
Queens Public Library

Linda Johnson, President and CEO
Brooklyn Public Library

Tom Finkelppearl, Commissioner
Department of Cultural Affairs

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND
ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES
AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS 5

[sound check] [pause] [gavel]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, good-good

morning, and welcome to the City Council's ninth day
of hearing on the Mayor's Executive Budget for Fiscal
2019. My name is Daniel Dromm and I Chair the
Finance Committee. We are joined by the Committee on
Health chaired by my colleague Council Member Mark
Levine, and the Committee on Mental Health,
Disabilities and addictions chaired by Council Member
Diana Ayala. We've been joined by other Council
Members, Council Member Bob Holden, Council Member
Steve Matteo, Council Member Barry Grodenchik,
Council Member Fernando Cabrera as well. Today we
will hear from the Department of Health and Mental
Hygiene the three library systems and the Department
of Cultural Affairs. Before we begin, I'd like to
thank the Finance Division staff for putting this
hearing together including the Director Latonia
McKinney, Deputy Directors Regina Poreda Ryan and
Nathan Toth, the Committee Counsel Rebecca Chasan,
Unit Head Crilhien Francisco, Finance Analyst Janette
Merrill, and Alia Ali and Finance Division
Administrative Support Unit, Nicole Anderson, Maria
Pagan, Roberta Caturano who pull everything together.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

6

1 I'd also like to thank Evia Cardorso, my Finance
2 person for working on the budget and being here with
3 at the hearings all the time. Thank you for your
4 efforts Evia. I'd like to remind everyone that the
5 public will be invited to testify on the last day of
6 budget hearings on May 24th beginning at
7 approximately 4:00 p.m. in this room. For members of
8 the public who wish to testify but cannot attend the
9 hearing, you can email your testimony to the Finance
10 Division at financetestimony@council.nyc.gov, and the
11 staff will make it part of the official record.
12 Today's Executive Budget hearing kicks off with the
13 Department of Health and Mental Hygiene. DOHMH's
14 Fiscal 2019 Executive Budget totals \$1.6 billion, 48%
15 of which is paid for with city funds. Since the
16 Preliminary Budget Plan, the agency has added \$75,000
17 to hire a training coordinator for the Cure Violence
18 Program and \$6.2 million to support Health New York
19 City, the citywide plan to combat the opioid
20 epidemic. Reducing the number of opioid deaths in
21 the city is one of DOHMH's major initiatives as the
22 number of overdose deaths in New York City has more
23 than doubled since 2000. The city will spend \$60
24 million annually across multiple agencies toward that
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

7

1 effort. Given the scope of the problem, the Council
2 called on the administration to fund community based
3 organizations to lead prevention and treatment
4 efforts around the opioid abuse. However, the
5 funding that the Administration included in the
6 budget will largely support the work of city
7 agencies. I look forward to learning today why the
8 Administration chose to focus on agency programs
9 rather than that of community based organizations
10 that are already out in the field doing this work
11 every day. While there is clearly the need for a
12 focus on opioid abuse, I would like to learn more
13 about the department's efforts to combat the use of
14 other drugs like cocaine and crystal meth, which are
15 also on the rise, and in light of my experience as a
16 daycare director and public school teacher, I am
17 incredibly interested in hearing about the
18 department's role in lead exposure prevention and
19 treatment. Following the recent events with respect
20 to lead in NYCHA facilities, I asked NYCHA at its
21 Executive Budget hearing about assessing the more
22 than 200 daycare facilities in NYCHA buildings. They
23 responded that they—that they are licensed by DOHMH,
24 and I hope to hear that your agency has recently
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

8

1 taken a closer look at these daycare centers. Before
2 we begin, I'd like to remind my colleagues that the
3 first round of questions for the agency will be
4 limited to three minutes per Council Member, and if
5 Council Members have additional questions, we will
6 have a second round of questions at two minutes per
7 Council Member. I will now turn the mic over to my
8 Co-Chairs Council Members Levine and Ayala for their
9 statements, and they will--then we will hear testimony
10 from Dr. Mary Bassett, Commissioner of the Department
11 of Health and Mental Hygiene. Alright.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: [coughs] Thank
14 you Chair Dromm, and good morning everybody. As the
15 Chair mentioned today we're going to be reviewing the
16 Budget of the Department of Health and Mental
17 Hygiene, which at \$1.6 million I was just remind is
18 one of the largest in the city, and we're also going
19 to be looking the Council's Preliminary Budget
20 Response. First, I want to reiterate Chair Dromm's
21 concerns about the lack of funding for community-
22 based organizations to lead prevention and treatment
23 efforts around opioid abuse. While I strong support
24 services funded through the Administration's \$22
25 million enhancement and Healing NYC including Relay

1 the Non-Fatal Overdose Response Program. I believe
2 we need to fund CBOs to conduct localized care and
3 navigation and coordination efforts in settings
4 beyond emergency departments and among populations
5 other than recent overdoses. The Budget Response
6 from the Council also called on the Administration to
7 fund programs and services related to animal welfare
8 and health equity, two subjects the Health Committee
9 recently addressed in oversight hearings.
10 Specifically, the Council called on the
11 administration to turn underutilized DOH and DOHMH
12 buildings in Queens and Staten Island into Health
13 Action Centers in order to increase access to social
14 supports and clinical services including behavioral
15 and mental healthcare. The response also asked the
16 Administration to allocate funding to the animal care
17 centers of New York in order to extend receiving
18 hour, increase stray animal pickup and reduce the
19 feral cat population. I look forward to hearing more
20 about the department's funding strategies for these
21 important subjects. Next, I would like to address
22 two public health issues of particular concern in New
23 York City: Tuberculosis and Hepatitis. I recently
24 called on Mayor de Blasio to add \$6.7 million to the
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

10

1 Fiscal 19 Budget for Tuberculosis prevention in order
2 to address the recent spike in TB that has
3 disproportionately affected our city's immigrant
4 neighborhoods including neighborhoods in Western
5 Queens, the Chair's own district included and Sunset
6 Park, Brooklyn. Shortsighted budget reductions in
7 the late 1980s dismantled New York's public health
8 response to TB contributing to a massive outbreak of
9 drug-resistant strains of the disease. I would like
10 to discuss the Administration's plan to fund a TB
11 response in order to stave off a similar outbreak.
12 We know that the public health burden of viral
13 hepatitis in New York City also remains
14 extraordinarily high with an estimated 100,000 New
15 Yorkers infected with Hep-B and 146,500 adults
16 affected with Hep-C. I'm particularly concerned
17 about the cost barriers that low-income New York City
18 residents may encounter when accessing Hepatitis
19 testing, medical care and treatment. Hep-C is
20 curable in almost all patients, but only 14% of New
21 York City residents infected with the virus have been
22 cured. It's imperative that our city's community-
23 based health organizations have the capacity to
24 prevent, identify, manage and treat Hepatitis B and
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

11

1 C. So, I look forward to working and discussing
2 these issues in today's hearing as well as other
3 topics central to protecting and promoting the health
4 and wellbeing of New Yorkers, and back to you, Mr.
5 Chair. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Chair—Chair Ayala.

8 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: [off mic] Okay, thank
9 you. [on mic] Thank you Chairs Levine and Dromm and
10 good morning. I am Council Member Diana Ayala, Chair
11 of the City Council's Committee on Mental Health,
12 Disabilities and Addiction. I would like to start by
13 thanking the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene
14 for the Council Commission Report on supervised
15 injections as a strategy to reduce opioid overdose
16 and public injection. The plan would establish over
17 those prevention centers inside non-profits that
18 already function. Just need to exchange sites. I
19 look forward to discussing the community outreach
20 process in the neighborhoods of the proposed sites as
21 well as any major challenges or opposition that this—
22 that they may impede the plan's progress. To turn to
23 the Council's Fiscal 2019 Preliminary Budget
24 Response, I would like to express my disappointment
25 that our requests to prioritize and enhance services

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

12

1 for New Yorkers with disabilities was not addressed
2 in the Executive Budget. Approximately 950,000 New
3 Yorkers live with a disability, and more than half of
4 these individuals report multiple disabilities. In
5 the response, the Council implored the Mayor's Office
6 of People with Disabilities to work with the Office
7 of Management and Budget, and the city agencies to
8 prioritize services for disabled New Yorkers as they
9 related to transportation, employment, housing,
10 health, and education. However, the Administration
11 did not include any additional funding in the Fiscal
12 2019 Executive Budget. I believe the city does not
13 adequately invest in services and programs for New
14 Yorkers with physical and/or developmental
15 disabilities and I look forward to discussing this
16 unmet need with you today. The response also called
17 on the Administration to allocate funding DOHMH to
18 implement the National Diabetes Prevention Program in
19 order to provide prevention activities and education
20 services in neighborhoods with high rates of obesity
21 and chronic disease. Diabetes disproportionately
22 affects New York City's low-income and working class
23 communities including my district of the South Bronx.
24 Leading to an undue burden of mass illness,
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

13

1 amputation, blindness and kidney failure. I look
2 forward to discussing the important health issues as
3 well as the programming and services funded under the
4 \$22 million Healing NYC Expansion including the
5 Health and Engagement Assessment Team program and the
6 End Overdose Training Institute. Thank you.
7

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you and I'm
9 going to ask counsel to swear in the panel.

10 LEGAL COUNSEL: Do you affirm that your
11 testimony will be truthful to the best of your
12 knowledge, information and belief?

13 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: I so affirm.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, Commissioner,
15 would you like to begin.

16 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Thank you and good
17 morning to Chairpersons Dromm, Ayala and Levine and
18 members of the Committee. I'm Dr. Mary Bassett,
19 Commissioner of the New York City Department of
20 Health and Mental Hygiene and I'm joined today by
21 First Deputy Commissioner Dr. Oxiris Barbot and
22 Sandee Rozzo, our Deputy Commissioner for Finance.
23 Thank you for the opportunity to testify on our
24 Executive Budget for Fiscal Year 2019. The
25 department has once again had a tremendously

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

14

productive year defending the health of New Yorkers.

We've been busy implementing the comprehensive

package of tobacco bills signed into law last summer,

expanding our internal racial justice reform efforts,

scaling up citywide efforts under Thrive NYC, and

rolling out elements of the Mayor's Neighborhood Rat

Reduction Initiative. We reopened the Chelsea Sexual

Health Clinic and worked with our sister agencies to

enroll 80,000 New Yorkers in health insurance to get

Covered NYC, and engaged New Yorkers to Help Me Quit,

an app that is designed to help people quit smoking.

The department launched Living Sure, the city's

campaign to promote Pre-Exposure Prophylaxis or PREP

to women, and recently announced that New York City's

air is the cleanest that it has been since monitoring

began in 2008. Earlier this month, New York City

reinforced its status as one of the most progressive

cities in the country with Mayor de Blasio's support

for a one-year research pilot for overdose prevention

centers or OPCs. The pilot would open up centers in

up to four existing student exchange programs that

can operate the OPC without city funding. We are

pleased with the leadership of the Mayor and the

Council in supporting this demonstrated life saving

1
2 overdoes prevention method. We are standing on the
3 right side of history with this decision. If the
4 requirements to proceed with OPCs are met and we take
5 action here in New York, others across the country
6 will follow, and we look forward to further
7 discussions with our sister agencies, elected
8 officials, and community members about this critical
9 program in the coming months. We are able to do all
10 of this and more thanks to the continued support from
11 the Administration and Council. We are grateful to
12 mayor for the addition of over \$11 million a year in
13 the Executive Budget. With this funding we will
14 continue to tackle the city's opioid crisis. Since
15 the launch of HealingNYC, the department has
16 distributed over 70,000 Naloxone kits contributing to
17 the city's goal to distribute 100,000 kits. We've
18 engaged providers, pharmacists and implemented
19 innovative care linkage approaches. We have
20 conducted public media campaigns, Naloxone training
21 and targeted neighborhood based education efforts to
22 ensure that New Yorkers are aware of this epidemic
23 and that this is all hands on deck effort. We're
24 proud of the great progress made under HealingNYC,
25 but we recognize the need for additional services for

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

16

1 those most at risk for overdose. This new funding
2 will allow us to expand our Relay Program from 10 to
3 15 hospitals. This program uses peer wellness
4 advocates in emergency departments of hospitals for
5 counseling and linkage to care after non-fatal
6 overdose. We will also establish an End Overdose
7 Training Institute to serve as a technical assistance
8 center to help increase overdose prevention capacity
9 and Naloxone distribution, and we will implement a
10 new Naloxone Leave Behind Program with the FDNY so
11 that first responders can leave Naloxone kits with
12 people at risk of future overdose. Additionally,
13 we're expanding the capacity of our Heat and Co-
14 Response units in order to provide behavioral health
15 expertise to individuals with a mental health or
16 misuse crisis. These newly funded efforts will
17 enable the city to provide proactive health oriented
18 interventions to people who need them most. Turning
19 to other budget updates, we were pleased that the
20 proposed cuts at both state and federal levels were
21 not included in final spending legislation, but we
22 are concerned that the consistent attacks on public
23 health funding will lead to future reductions that
24 will force the department to reduce vital services.
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

17

2 We were relieved to see that the state budget to
3 tuberculosis prevention and control funding was
4 rejected in the final budget, and were proposed
5 reductions to other critical public health services
6 such as school based health centers, and poison
7 control centers. At the federal level we were
8 cautiously happy to see that the omnibus spending
9 bill passed by congress did not include the severe
10 cuts to the Department of Health and Human Services
11 proposed in the President's budget. Perhaps this is
12 an indication that congress recognizes that public
13 health is a bipartisan critical area of work, and
14 although we were spared significant budge cuts, our
15 programs are otherwise jeopardized by federal policy
16 shifts outside of the budget process that are not
17 based on science including those that would allow
18 LGBTQ discrimination in healthcare settings, endorse
19 abstinence only sexual health education, and threaten
20 the status of immigrants. It remains clear that the
21 Trump Administration does not share the values of our
22 city Administration, nor its legislators, and we will
23 continue to fight back against proposals that would
24 widen disparities and put New Yorkers at risk. I
25 hope you never tire of hearing me say that we are

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

18

1
2 fiercely committed to health equity, and that we are
3 deploying the most evidence-based skill driven and
4 expert led strategies to do so. We've made progress
5 in the past year, but racial disparities and life
6 expectancy and disease burden, and infant and
7 maternal mortalities remain. This is unfair, unjust,
8 and preventable. Addressing these inequities must
9 remain a top priority throughout all of our work and
10 our staff is taking this challenge head on. I want
11 to thank the mayor for the resources dedicated to the
12 department in the Executive Plan, and thank you to
13 the Speaker, the Chairs Levine, Ayala and Dromm, and
14 members of the committees for your partnership and
15 shared commitment to protecting and promoting the
16 health of all New Yorkers. Thank you once again for
17 the opportunity to testify. I will gladly take any
18 questions.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you,
20 Commissioner and we appreciate you coming in and
21 giving testimony. Let me start with some questions
22 on the lead issues—on lead issues. DOHMH considers a
23 child's blood level to be high if a test at or above
24 10 micrograms per deciliter. However, in 2012, the
25 Centers for Disease Control and Prevention adjust its

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

19

1 threshold to five micrograms per deciliter. If DOHMH
2 were to follow CDC's guidelines, it would have added
3 5,000 children to its list of those who tested high
4 for lead in 2016 to 6,000 children total. Speaker
5 Johnson recently sponsored legislation to lower the
6 threshold for considering children's blood toxic.
7 Why doesn't DOHMH adhere to CDC's threshold and have
8 your own?
9

10 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: So, the Health
11 Cold uses the cut point of 10 micrograms per
12 deciliter as a definition of lead poisoning. The
13 Centers for Disease Control, as you note, has used 5
14 micrograms per deciliter as a surveillance tool. What
15 it tells us is that 95% of children are below that
16 level. Our Health Code has 15 micrograms per
17 deciliter as the trigger for environmental
18 remediation as does Local Law 1, which went into
19 effect in 2005. As the Council is aware, we are
20 tremendously proud of our-of our track record in lead
21 poisoning lead prevention and control. We've seen a
22 nearly 90% reduction in the number of children with
23 blood lead levels above 5, the surveillance criteria
24 since Local Law 1 went into effect. I'd be happy to
25 go over the numbers with you, but I do want the

1
2 Council to be aware that we are succeeding in
3 reducing the prevalence of children with blood lead
4 levels that are 5 and higher, and we intervene on any
5 blood lead level that is 5 or higher, but we use as a
6 trigger for environmental intervention the level of
7 10 for most children, which is lower than the Health
8 Code or Local Law 1 indicate. For very young
9 children, of course, these are the children that we
10 are most concerned about, we intervene at lower
11 levels.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, you feel
13 confident that you're not missing any children or
14 capturing any children with lower lead-of blood
15 levels that they are not going to be poisoned by that
16 lower lead level?

17 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: You might have to
18 go over that again for me, but the-the-if-if you're
19 getting at the idea that there is no level of-of lead
20 in the blood that is considered safe, you are
21 accurate in that statement.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Right, because my
23 understanding is that any level of blood is not safe.
24 Is that correct?

25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

21

1
2 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: That is correct,
3 and as I indicated, we have really—I—I wish I could
4 convey to the Council effectively how pioneering this
5 department has been in tackling lead exposures and in
6 lowering blood lead levels in children. As you know,
7 the Health Department banned lead and paint in 1960,
8 18 years before the federal government and as I've
9 told you, the number of children with blood lead
10 levels over five has steadily declined and has gone
11 down by nearly 90%. I think the actual precise
12 number is 88%. It's now under 5,000 children with
13 blood lead levels over 5 and then both—both of those
14 children are between 5 and under 10.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, following
16 concerns about NYCHA's process for assessing lead
17 hazards, Council Member introduced several pieces of
18 legislation that would strengthen protocols for
19 inspecting lead hazards in residential buildings,
20 daycare centers, soil and drinking water. Do you
21 know of those efforts and do you support any of those
22 efforts?

23 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: I'm aware that the
24 Council has got a whole portfolio of bills. I
25 believe the last count is 22. We are busy reviewing

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

22

1 these and we'll be happy to talk with you about them
2 when we have completed our review.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, has DOH
5 inspected the 200 plus daycare centers in NYCHA
6 facilities for lead paint?

7 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: In order for a-a
8 childcare center to receive a permit, the Center has
9 to be lead-free. So, that's the initial requirement.
10 When our inspectors go out, they look for-for peeling
11 paint regardless of whether it's documented as having
12 lead in it or not, and we remediate it, we-we are
13 quite emphatic about the-about protecting our
14 children.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, have you found
16 any daycare centers that have peeling paint?

17 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: I'm sure that
18 there have been daycare centers that have peeling
19 paint, but I'm just--

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: [interposing] And
21 then do you test that?

22 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: What I'm
23 indicating to you is that in order to get licensed,
24 the daycare center has to show that it is lead-free.

25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: How do they show
3 that?

4 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Right, it's—it's
5 not licensed. It's a permit. I always get these
6 mixed up. They—they—they have to pass an inspection.
7 This is before they start accepting any children.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, what does that
9 inspection look like?

10 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Well, most
11 inspections for lead paint begin with XRF, which is
12 an X-ray technique for looking for—for lead in
13 paint.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And that—that X-ray
15 can determine whether lead paint was originally used
16 in the daycare center?

17 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: I don't—you know,
18 we banned lead paint in New York City in 1960. So—
19 but we continued to look for it because many of—much
20 of our housing stock is old and we have—we have a
21 great deal of housing stock that had lead paint in it
22 at one time. The XRF would simply determine whether
23 or not there's lead in that paint. It also—it's not
24 perfect. If you aim an XRF at something that also
25 has other types of lead of in it, a metal surface

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

24

1 like a radiator or a door frame, we can get false
2 positives. I'd be happy to go over the specific
3 results for our-our daycare centers. As you say,
4 there are 200 out of 2,300 in-in-in NYCHA housing and
5 once again, we ensure that they are lead-free at the
6 time of permitting.
7

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, Commissioner,
9 what-what--

10 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: [interposing]
11 Yeah.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: --what concerns me is
13 that if we're finding lead paint in NYCHA apartments,
14 why wouldn't it be contained in the daycare centers?

15 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: If-if it's a
16 facility that is-has-was built-was open before 1997,
17 then the inspection is for intact paint. I'm joined
18 by our Deputy for Environmental Health who can give
19 you some more details on this.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, Council Member--
21 -

22 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: [interposing] I
23 mean the-the--

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Council Member I
25 just--

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

25

COMMISSIONER BASSETT: --there's a
distinction between being lead-free and being lead
safe. If the paint is intact, then it won't be
shedding, and it won't have the opportunity to get
into the environment.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, where--also where
I'm coming from. I used to be a daycare center
teacher and a director, and peeling lead paint in
daycare centers or peeling paint let me say, was not
uncommon. It was all over the daycare center. So,
that's why I'm--I'm going here, but before--

COMMISSIONER BASSETT: [interposing]
Well, our inspectors look for it, and if they find
it, they--it is remediated regardless of--of lead
content. We don't want peeling paint in daycare
centers.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well, it was always
extremely difficult to get NYCHA to paint even in the
daycare center, but anyway, I--I'm going to swear you
in before you--before you say anything.

COMMISSIONER BASSETT: [off mic] To let
you.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yeah, your assistant.
[laughs]

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

26

1
2 LEGAL COUNSEL: Do you affirm that your
3 testimony will be truthful to the best of your
4 knowledge, information and belief?

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHIFF: Yes.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And could you just
7 state your name for the record?

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHIFF: Yes, Corinne
9 Schiff, Deputy Commissioner for Environmental Health
10 and oversee our Childcare program, and I'll just add
11 to the Commissioner's comments. You asked whether
12 that XRF test would show layers of paint and--and
13 indeed it would, and so for any childcare center to
14 get a permit from us openings after 1997, it does
15 need to submit proof, and if they have chosen a
16 location where there are--where there is lead paint on
17 the walls, they--they have to just abate. They have
18 to get rid of that paint, scrape down and--and
19 repaint. So, those centers are lead-free. They
20 nonetheless cannot have paint. That's a routine part
21 of our inspection. For centers that have--that were
22 open before 1997, they're required to do a self-
23 inspection annually. As you know, paint is a
24 problem, as the Commissioner noted when it is not
25 intact. When it's peeling or chipped that's when

1 children can get access to it. So, that's a part of
2 the self-inspection that we require and it's part of-
3 -
4

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: [interposing] And who
6 conducts the self-inspection?

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHIFF: The
8 childcare provider is required to do it, but it's
9 also a part of our inspection, and if we find paint
10 either that's lead paint or paint where we don't know
11 whether it's leaded, then there is a requirement that
12 they within 24 hours remediate. In other words, they
13 move-remove the children from that exposure and then
14 we require them to fix in a more permanent way. That
15 takes a little longer. So, the first step is within
16 24 hours you have to remove that hazard from the
17 children—for the children, remove that exposure, and
18 then fix in the long term, and we continue to inspect
19 to make sure that that remediation has occurred.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, how often have
21 you found centers with chipping paint?

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHIFF: I—I don't
23 have those—those numbers with me, but we can—we can
24 follow up with—with those details.
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

28

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. Yeah. Oh, I'd
3 like to get those numbers, okay, and it remains a
4 concern to me because having worked in—in a daycare
5 center when I did, I—I constantly saw chipping paint.
6 It's hard for me to believe that there isn't, but
7 anyway, the law—the law requires—

8 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: [interposing] Oh,
9 Council Member, there was something that we didn't
10 mention that we should have mentioned is that as part
11 of an investigation of any child who has an elevated
12 blood lead level, we also look at their—at the--at
13 the place where they get their childcare. So, we
14 inspect that site. So, the principal way that the
15 Health Department tackles elevated—the problem of
16 lead poisoning is because we're receiving all of the
17 blood lead test results at the department, and any
18 time a child has a blood lead level of 5 or greater,
19 we—we take action, and that if the—and if there is a
20 child who needs remediation, environmental
21 remediation at this time that would be at a level of
22 10 or higher, we would look at their childcare
23 center, at their home, any place where they spend
24 quite a bit of time. So, there's another way to get

25

1 at the childcare center than our--our inspections of
2 those centers.
3

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, and let me just
5 talk a little bit then about the Healthy Homes
6 Program that you run. Does the DOHMH identify lead-
7 based paint hazards and monitor the abatement work to
8 enforcement safety regulations through that program?

9 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Sorry, can you
10 restate--restate--say that again? I didn't quite catch
11 it.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, you have a
13 program called the Healthy Homes Program.

14 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Yes.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And--and--and what does
16 that program do. Do you go--go and inspect apartments
17 or what are you looking for through that program?

18 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Well, we look not
19 only for lead abatement, but also for, you know, for
20 other things associated with health at home, the--the--
21 our Integrated Pest Management Program is part of
22 that program as well.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: But lead--lead--

24 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Lead is part of
25 it.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

30

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: --is part of the
3 program.

4 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: You're right. It
5 was expanded beyond lead as we have been successful
6 in bringing lead as a public health problem--program--
7 problem in the city.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, does the U.S.
9 Environmental Protection Agency allow landlords to
10 paint over lead paint?

11 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: There--so to my
12 knowledge and I--I may have to turn to my deputy on
13 this, there's no requirement that people eliminate
14 lead in a building. What we check for is the
15 deteriorated paint surfaces. Abatement means that
16 you scrape down and--and--and eliminate paint and
17 become lead-free, but that--in our city that would be
18 a huge effort. We have a city with a lot of old
19 housing stock and, you know, including very fancy
20 parts of the city. That is fine so long as that
21 paint is intact.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: What is your level of
23 involvement with the remediation work that's being
24 done in NYCHA in regard to the lead paint issue
25 there?

1
2 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: For us the trigger
3 the child. So, we would be involved and we stay
4 involved regardless of what NYCHA does, and when we
5 have a child with an elevated blood level, we want to
6 see the blood level come down.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, do you go to
8 NYCHA to inspect the work that they've done?

9 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: If a child has an
10 elevated blood lead level and it's in NYCHA, we—we
11 ensure that their environment has been abated, and
12 we—as I indicated, we'll look at secondary locations
13 for that child, their childcare center, at
14 grandmother's house or anything place where they
15 spend substantial time.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Currently the law
17 does not protect those who reside—those who go like
18 in grandma's house for instance. I have legislation
19 that I want the Council to pass, which would change
20 the definition of reside, because often times we do
21 have situations where children go to their
22 grandmother's house after school and spend
23 significant amounts of time until their mother can
24 pick them up, but according to the law they're not

1 eligible for any type of lawsuit or something should
2 they get lead poisoned.

3
4 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Well, we'd have to
5 look at—I haven't looked at, and we are, as I noted
6 earlier, reviewing the whole package of legislation,
7 but I just reiterate that if a child has an elevated
8 blood lead level, our investigators will consider
9 places where they spend time beyond their primary
10 residence.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, I have another
12 issue on the No. 7 Train. Do you also, yeah, do you
13 look at structures like that or agencies? Because
14 what's happening in the No. 7 Train is that you have
15 huge chunks of lead based paint literally this big
16 falling into the street. Vendors are there, you
17 know, food is being prepared there. That leads paint
18 stuff is going all over the place. Is that something
19 that you would look at as well?

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHIFF: We do—do an
21 inspection along the elevated train lines for the No.
22 7. We—we did two kinds of inspections. We sent our
23 mobile food vending inspectors out for the very
24 reasons that you just described, and it's a
25 requirement for a mobile food vendor to protect food

1 from contamination, and so we did find that the—the
2 vendors who were vending near the elevated subway
3 lines, did have their food covered, and so we didn't
4 see a—a risk to food. We also sent lead inspectors
5 out to do visual inspections and to look in the
6 parks, and we really did not see a high risk. We've
7 been in—in discussion with our colleagues at MTA, but
8 we—we were satisfied that this is not presenting a
9 risk to the community.
10

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Even with that lead
12 blowing all around the area, and people being able to
13 breathe that lead in, those chips in, and this—one of
14 my employees who is sitting over—right over here by
15 just inches, you still don't think it's a hazard?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHIFF: From our
17 inspections, we—we were satisfied that there was not
18 really a risk there.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well, I'd—I'd have to
20 really disagree with that because that place is a
21 total disgrace. I think that there's a schedule now
22 to paint it, but I don't see how that has not
23 contributed. I think Western Queens, if I'm not
24 mistaken, has the highest level of lead exposure in—
25 in all of Queens. Is that correct? In the Western

1
2 Queens area who have the highest amount of lead
3 exposure?

4 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: I'd have to—we—I'd
5 have to check on that. We—we usually think of the
6 sort of lead belts in the city as the Williamsburg
7 section of Brooklyn.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay.

9 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: So, we can check
10 on that for you and get back to you.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Alright, another—
12 another issue that particularly affects Queens in
13 general is that it—it continues to have the highest
14 burden of tuberculosis, and with 247 cases and a rate
15 of 10.6 per 100,000 households. However, the Corona
16 Chest Center in Jackson Heights, which offers
17 evaluation and treatment services Monday through
18 Saturday only offers extended hours until 8:00 p.m.
19 As you know, it's a heavy immigrant community. Often
20 time business is conducted after 5:00 p.m. Are there
21 any plans to open that Chest Center later than those
22 hours?

23 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: So, I'm not sure.
24 I think that the Corona Center has evening hours.
25 Huh?

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

35

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Two days a week.

COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Two days a week

so-and-and we have weekend hours available as well.

As you point out, TB in our city is now largely an
issue for people who were born outside of the United
States, and who likely acquired their infection
remotely when they were a resident in another
country. So, in a sense it reflects the TB control
programs in the countries from which they emigrated.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I'm sure that Chair
Levine is going to have some more questions on the TB
stuff, but let me move onto Cocaine and Crystal Meth
abuse. Are we still doing enough in those areas? I
know there's been a heavy focus on opioids, but what
are we doing with Cocaine and Crystal Meth.

COMMISSIONER BASSETT: That's-that's a
really good question, and-and one thing that I'd like
to make sure that the committee is aware of because I
know that you have a lot of interactions with your
constituents is that Fentanyl, the synthetic opioid
that has made our street drugs so much more dangerous
has entered the drug supply broadly so that 30% of
Cocaine related drug overdose deaths now how Fentanyl
involved. So many people who use Cocaine may not be

1 seeking an opioid, are in no way prepared for an
2 opioid overdose. So, it's very important to let
3 people know that our street drugs have never been
4 more dangerous because of the presence of Fentanyl.
5 So that has been a principal message that we've been
6 getting out for-around Cocaine that it now can
7 frequently contain Fentanyl and just makes the
8 overdose risk much higher as it does in other drugs.
9 Crystal Meth is a-is an issue in a-in a smaller
10 targeted community, and we've been using social
11 media, and more narrow media campaigns to address
12 that issue. We-we have Dr. Daskalakis here if you'd
13 like to hear more details about that, or I can
14 arrange for him to let you know what we're doing at
15 another time.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I do like the doctor.
18 So, let me-let me just have him up for a minute.

19 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: You like the
20 doctor. Everybody likes Dr. Daskalakis, yes.

21 [laughter] Yes, indeed.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: But I don't want him
23 to run against me because he's a great speaker. I'll
24 tell you that. [laughter] [off mic] State your name
25 for the record and some body has to swear you in.

1
2 LEGAL COUNSEL: Do you affirm that your
3 testimony will be truthful to the best of your
4 knowledge, information and belief?

5 DR. DASKALAKIS: I do and I'm Demetre
6 Daskalakis, the Deputy Commissioner for Disease
7 Control at the New York City Department of Health.
8 So we actually in New York City have what is the most
9 innovative municipally supported crystal
10 methamphetamine program in the country. . Based
11 [coughs] on work that happened before funding came to
12 the agency in the frame of ending the epidemic of HIV
13 we did a needs assessment in the city and identified
14 that there was a gap in crystal meth services. So
15 with the addition of the agency's funding we were
16 able to launch a program by pushing money out to two
17 community based organizations, the Gay Men's Health
18 Crisis and Housing Works. So, they cam together to
19 create a program that's called Recharge. It's about
20 a year old, and went from zero clients to 135 clients
21 in that time. The majority are young men who have
22 sex with men of color. About 40% of them have had
23 unstable housing. It is officially the largest
24 feeder into the Housing Works Pre-exposure
25 Prophylaxis Program. So, in fact, it's a model for

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

38

1 integrative services both mental health, substance us
2 services as well as medical provision of care to
3 people living with HIV and those at risk, a model
4 that a lot of other jurisdictions are now looking
5 toward a-toward-toward us given the fact that it's
6 not really done anywhere else except for New York.
7

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you,
9 doctor. I need to move along here, but always
10 appreciate hearing from you and I'm glad that you're
11 working on that.

12 DR. DASKALAKIS: Thank you.

13 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: And I should point
14 out that this was an issue that was raised to the
15 department by advocates, and one that we took action
16 on. We are very proud of our-of our relationship
17 with the advocacy community, and because it enables
18 us to be more agile in our health response.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well, let me just go
20 through one more area, and then I'll turn it over to
21 the other chairs as well. You recently announced
22 that New York City would implement its new menu board
23 rules following a decision by Food and Drug
24 Administration requiring America's chain restaurants,
25 movie theaters and grocery stores with more than 20

1 locations excuse me [coughs] to provide calorie
2 information on menu boards. What specific
3 nutritional information will the new rules require
4 New York City to post?
5

6 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: As you know, New
7 York City has pioneered the—the posting of calorie
8 information on menus and menu boards. We became the
9 first jurisdiction, but jurisdiction—I think
10 Sausalito, California or something might have been
11 doing something, but we became the first jurisdiction
12 in 2006. What this new federal result that was
13 passed as part of the Affordable Care Act in 2010.
14 So, it's—it's taken a while for the federal
15 government to take action on it, and we're very happy
16 they have. What it will do is extend it to multiple
17 types of chains not just food service establishments.
18 So chain supermarkets that serve prepared foods,
19 convenience stores that may serve foods and they all
20 have to give not only calorie information but also
21 the information that the sort of target amount number
22 of calories a person should have in a day is about
23 2,000. One of the concerns about simply positing
24 calorie information was that the people had no idea
25 whether having a 1,200 calorie breakfast was a good

1 idea or not. The answer is it's not a good idea.

2
3 It's more than half the calories you should eat in a
4 day. Additionally, there--there is a requirement that
5 they keep on site full nutritional information, the
6 type of information that you would get on a facts
7 panel in a supermarket available on request. So, we
8 have indicated that we will be--we will enforce the
9 federal rule. We were ready to do it a year ago, but
10 agreed that we would after being sued that we would
11 wait for the--for the federal rule and--and I'm happy
12 that they did go forward with it.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well, thank you and
14 just--I'd like to just talk a little bit about
15 something else that related to the menu boards and
16 you'll see what I'm--where I'm going in a minute. I'd
17 like to talk about a digestive disorder known as
18 sprue or celiac disease. This autoimmune reaction to
19 eating gluten, which can damage the small intestine
20 affects an estimated 1% of the population worldwide
21 and remains personally significant to me. DOHMH's
22 website, however, does not contain any information
23 about Celiac Disease. Does DOHMH offer any programs
24 for people with Celiac Disease?

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

41

1
2 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: No, not that I'm
3 aware of.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Would the new menu
5 boards include anything on Celiac Disease

6 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: I-I-I think you're
7 asking whether the nutrition facts information
8 contains information on gluten, and I-I-it doesn't.
9 I think people who have decided to have gluten-free
10 diets are [coughs] are often aware of the types of
11 food that can and cannot eat.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: [interposing] Not
13 necessarily.

14 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: But it may be
15 difficult to-to tell, and people often take the
16 position of being better safe than sorry in their
17 selections. Additionally, many, you many places
18 provide this information on request, and we provide--

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: [interposing] Well,
20 if you've ever been to a restaurant with a person who
21 suffers from Celiac Disease, they get poisoned all
22 the time because they had-it's had exposure to the
23 grill. It-it-it's a little drop of wheat gets into a,
24 you know, a meal or whatever it may be, and then they
25 have violent reactions to it, and-and it's something

1 that I—I've spoken to some doctors from Mount Sinai
2 Hospital about it as well, and it's really something
3 I think that the department should really begin
4 looking at. It's—it's—it's—I—I couldn't believe that
5 it's not on the website, to be honest with you.

7 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: The—the main
8 interest that we've had as an agency in labeling food
9 is to let people—is to have an impact on the obesity
10 epidemic, which as you know is—is still headed in the
11 wrong direction so calorie counts was the key that we
12 worked to find on menu boards. I'm pleased that the
13 federal government has expanded that to require that
14 the information be made available on a wider range of
15 nutrients but I—I—you know, I hear what you're saying
16 and we will certainly take it under advisement.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Do you when you put—
18 when you do the food and prepare a course, right for
19 those who are--

20 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: We do.

21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: --chefs?

22 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Yeah, the—I—I—I've
23 had this conversation with staff. Our food prep-
24 preparation is only into safety, food safety, and so

1 far, food safety most refers to hygiene and—and
2
3 hygienic practices.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: But do you teach
5 allergies?

6 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Not—I—I don't
7 know. So, I see the—I'm—I'm sure that we do, but let
8 me get the expert up here to confirm.

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHIFF: Yes, our
10 Food Protection Class, which is every service
11 establishment has to have a supervisor on site at all
12 times when they are operating, and that person has to
13 be trained in food protection, and that course is
14 offered by us as at our Health Academy, and it
15 includes training on allergies. The Ad Code also
16 includes a requirement that every restaurant have an
17 allergy poster on site in the area for workers to
18 make workers aware of the common food allergies and
19 about cross-contamination for allergens.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Is there any standard
21 by which the Department of Health measures gluten
22 content or labeling of something to be gluten-free?
23 Sometimes you'll go to a restaurant and on the menu
24 it says gluten-free, but there may still be gluten in
25 it?

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

44

1
2 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Well, I would--
3 [pause] this matter of labeling, we don't actually
4 determine the content of food. That's--that's not
5 regulated by us.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: But you do manage
7 diseases?

8 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: We do.

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Right. So, do you--

10 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: [interposing] I
11 mean we--

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: --recognize that
13 Celiac grew?

14 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: [interposing] We
15 don't provide--[laughs]

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: But Commissioner,
17 hold up. Okay, it's a very serious issue, okay, and
18 I don't think it's anything to laugh at, and I'm
19 asking you a serious question. Do you recognize it
20 as a disease?

21 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: I--

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: [interposing] You
23 don't seem to know much about it.

24

25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

45

1
2 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: I'm-no, I-I-I'm
3 familiar with it, but I'm not an expert in it. I'm
4 not a gastroenterologist.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And that's the
6 problem. That is exactly the problem, and that's why
7 I'm saying to you and to the Health Department that
8 we need to recognize this as a disease, and that's
9 the point that I'm trying to get it. Thank you.

10 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Understood.

11 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Thank you so much,
12 Mr. Chair. This morning many of us received the-the
13 deeply disturbing news that the Trump Administration
14 is planning to change the rules around Title IX that
15 would bar funding or organizations that provide
16 women's reproductive services or even advise on such
17 services. This could mean devastating financial
18 consequences for non-profit providers like Planned
19 Parenthood. That might not impact wealthy women who
20 probably will find other ways to get such important
21 services, but for low-income women, people without
22 health insurance, communities of color, this could
23 mean a real denial of not just reproductive health
24 services, but broader medical services for women.
25 Our allies in Congress are going to fight this tooth

1 and nail, but in the meantime is the city preparing
2 to a plan to step in and help shore up these
3 services, which are so vital in New York City?
4

5 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Well, we've also
6 read the headlines. We don't know yet what the
7 actual actions of the federal government will be. We
8 know that there have been threats of such actions.
9 As I completely agree with your characterization of
10 Planned Parenthood, it is a vital service for women,
11 and an important partner to us in city government in
12 providing services to many, many women. The--the--they
13 estimate that one out of every five women in this
14 country in her lifetime will use Planned Parenthood
15 services. So, you know, these services should be
16 protected. We in New York City view them as vital
17 and we are still waiting to see whether the federal
18 government will meet its threats. I would remind you
19 that will--will actually find a way to--to carry out
20 its threats. The Affordable Care Act we were told
21 was going to be dead on day one. The threats against
22 Planned Parenthood began before--before the current
23 president took office, and here we are 400 days out.
24 I'm hopeful that we will be able to ensure that these
25 actions don't take place.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

47

1
2 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: I-I remain ever
3 hopeful as well, but a matter with consequences this
4 serious we also have to prepare for the worst, and I
5 do think that the city needs to find a way to shore
6 up these services perhaps by closing the funding gap
7 left a providers like Planned Parenthood, also
8 perhaps by ramping up our own provision of
9 contraceptive services, et cetera in our—in our
10 wonderful sexual health centers and other Department
11 of Health venues, and—and I know you agree with that.
12 I just implore the city not to wait until this crisis
13 is upon up. I do want to ask about Naloxone
14 availability in pharmacies and the New York Times, as
15 you well know, reported that only about [coughs] a
16 third of the [coughs] 720 pharmacies which were
17 listed as providing Naloxone were, in fact, providing
18 it without a prescription. What is the status of
19 that supply today, and has the city updated its
20 website, its app, its 311 services so that the
21 information is accurate about where it actually is
22 available at pharmacies?

23 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: The answer to that
24 question is yes.

25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

48

1
2 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Okay, so ho many-
3 what-what is the number today out of the 720 where
4 it's available without a prescription?

5 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: It's around about
6 700 is the current list. We have visited all of the
7 independent pharmacies, talked to the pharmacy chains
8 that, as you are aware and there were concerns about
9 the pharmacy chains, CVS doing the Rite Aid, which
10 two of them are now actually Walgreens. But the-they
11 also have taken action to ensure that they have it on
12 site. We also have changed the language on our
13 website to indicate that these pharmacies have agreed
14 to make Naloxone available. I would point out to you
15 that the agreement to have Naloxone available doesn't
16 mean that they have it in stock, but when we have
17 checked with everyone on the list, we find that over
18 80% of them had Naloxone in-in stock. Part of the
19 difference between the way we checked, and the way
20 the New York Times reporter checked is that we asked
21 to speak to the pharmacist, and we now include that
22 information on our website advising people to speak
23 to the pharmacist. So, I don't know who the reporter
24 was speaking to. We want everybody who walks into a
25 pharmacy to have the ability to purchase Naloxone.

1
2 We also let people know that the state subsidizes the
3 co-pay, but we—we think that we're doing a good job,
4 but there are a lot of other places to get Naloxone
5 as well. As I indicated, we've handed out 70,000
6 kits.

7 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Absolutely, and—and
8 we're—we're fully supportive of that effort to
9 disseminate the kits. I'm not surprised the
10 pharmacists are well informed, but the average New
11 Yorker is going to walk and the first employee they
12 see they're going to ask, they're going to believe
13 whatever they're told. Very few of them are going to
14 look for a second opinion from the pharmacist.

15 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Is that what you
16 do when you're looking for a prescription drug, you
17 speak to the cashier?

18 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Well, who—whoever is
19 the first person you go to if they say sorry, it's
20 not available, you know, they're—they're going to
21 assume--

22 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: [interposing]
23 Well, I hope that that pharmacist—we've been—we
24 visited them and the independent pharmacies have done
25 in-person visits to each of them, and we are seeking

1 to expend the number of independents that are
2 stocking it and making sure that they train everybody
3 in-in the store.
4

5 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: But just to
6 clarify, so the number today is--there's 700 where
7 this--

8 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: 700. I-I can get
9 you the exact number.

10 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: So, almost so 98%
11 or 97% of the original list now are in compliance?

12 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: I-I wouldn't use
13 the word compliance, Council Member because we don't
14 regulate them. They're volunteering to make Naloxone
15 available. We're please that they're making the
16 Naloxone available, and they have through the chains
17 agreed that they are making it available and training
18 all of their staff as well was our outreach to the
19 independent pharmacies. So, I-I don't want to--you
20 know, I-I really feel that we should be pleased that
21 these small business people have been stepping up to
22 the needs of their neighborhood and support them in--
23 in-in being able to make it available to people
24 without a prescription, which is what happens when
25 they have the standing order.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

51

1
2 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: [interposing]
3 Absolute, but so-so, but just to come here (sic) so
4 about 97% are following these guidelines as now as
5 far as your information?

6 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: That's-I'm-the-
7 the-our list is now 100%. Everyone that we list on
8 our website--

9 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: [interposing] Got
10 it. Okay.

11 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: --is 100%.

12 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Okay.

13 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: You know, the 720
14 number has been updated.

15 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Okay, I-I do want to
16 move onto TB--

17 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: [interposing]
18 Oaky.

19 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: --a disease which
20 you acknowledged and the Chair certainly emphasized
21 really reflect-affects the most vulnerable New
22 Yorkers. These are overwhelmingly immigrants, many
23 undocumented, any are scared to seek services in the-
24 in the-because of the horrors of the Trump Era and
25 how immigrants are treated. And yes, you pointed out

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

52

1 that most cases are contracted abroad but, of course,
2 they're in New York City now and we have to diagnose
3 them in New York City. We have to treat them in New
4 York City, and several years ago we had a network a
5 chest centers open to do that, and many of them have
6 now been closed. In the Chair's district there's been
7 a reduction of hours but some of them have been
8 outright closed. So, there—there was a chest center
9 I believe in Bed-Stuy that's been closed, in
10 Brownsville. I think one on Staten Island, and other
11 locations. We now are funding this at less than 50%
12 of what we funded it 10 years ago. The TB is
13 rebounding up 10% last year as your department
14 reported. Someone could do the math on this, but I
15 bet every dollar we spend now in ramping up service
16 would yield a lot more than a dollar down the road,
17 and to say nothing of the human suffering that could
18 be prevented. So, if—if your budget was restored to
19 double what it is today, what would that mean in
20 terms of service provision? What could you do to
21 help stem—stem the rise of this epidemic?

22
23 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: [off mic] I

24 would—[on mic] Sorry, Council Member. The state had—
25 had reduced our budget in our current fiscal year.

1
2 They cut our budget for tuberculosis control by about
3 \$400,000 and were threatening to further reduce the
4 TB budget. In the current fiscal year, fortunately,
5 that threat was not realized in the final budget, the
6 TB prevention and control cut that's now taken.

7 However, the FY18 cut remains in place. We as a city
8 are committed to maintaining an excellent

9 Tuberculosis Control Program, and we have proceeded

10 with implementing—boosted outreach. As you know, the

11 way that we manage TB is to find the person who is

12 infected, track down their contacts, see if any of

13 those people has TB—have TB, follow them until

14 they're treated to cure, and also seek to identify

15 people who have asymptomatic evidence of infection

16 and prophylaxes. Those are the two key strategies.

17 We boosted outreach and additional funds to maintain

18 clinic hours including evening hours, and weekend

19 hours, which were threatened by the state cut. I'm

20 confident that we have the necessary resources to go

21 forward in the Executive Plan.

22 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Even with the number
23 of centers that are not totally closed?

24 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: The, you know,

25 there was a time when hat 3,700 cases of Tuberculosis

1 diagnosed in the city. The number of cases has come
2 down. It came down every year until this past year
3 in which we saw this 10% reduction. I'm confident
4 that the ability to maintain accessible hours for
5 this hard-working immigrant population that often has
6 TB, and can't—needs evening hours, and weekend hours,
7 and the increase in outreach workers that we are well
8 positioned to continue to drive down TB rates. The
9 budget cut that was threatened was not acceptable.
10

11 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: So, look, I don't
12 exonerate the state in having reduced funds
13 substantially in recent years. You know, our job is
14 just to push that the city fill the gap when
15 necessary, but I think I'm hearing you say that
16 you've been able to move some funds around internally
17 in the department to help shore up some of the gaps,
18 which—which is certainly better than nothing, but I
19 don't have to tell you the difference between taking
20 money from a pot because you have some attrition in
21 some part of your agency versus actually allocating
22 money in the budget that's going to be there long-
23 term year after year. That's obviously what we're
24 pushing. You—you would probably agree with that, but
25 I—I do want to move on to the safe congestion

1 facilities and I do want to acknowledge really the
2 bold leadership of the Mayor in supporting this pilot
3 program, which will save lives. There are three
4 people on average dying everyday in the city because
5 of overdose. This addiction--opioid addiction does
6 not have to be a death sentence, and as--as you know,
7 and as you've stated publicly, this is a proven
8 strategy to reduce fatalities. There was one curious
9 item in the Mayor's Report that I wanted to ask you
10 about, which he said that no city funding would be
11 put into these projects, and it's interesting he
12 didn't say no Administration funding. So, I'm
13 wondering whether the--the intention was to--to
14 preclude even the possibility that the City Council
15 could use some of this money to support these pilots.

17 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Well, as you,
18 we've been guided by advocates in identifying four
19 potential sites for this one-year research pilot, and
20 the advocate are confident that they can move forward
21 with the sites. I'm not aware of the negotiations
22 they may have had with the Council.

23 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Right, but in terms
24 of the funding, is--is did the--did the Mayor intend
25 to declare that the City Council--when he said no city

1 money would be included did the Mayor intend to say
2 the City Council money could not be invested in this
3 pilot?
4

5 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: I-I-I think he was
6 talking about our Executive Budget as proposed by the
7 Mayor.

8 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: And are you--

9 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: [interposing] I'm
10 not aware of the negotiations that might have taken
11 place, but I do know that not only New York, but
12 other cities, the city of Philadelphia, I believe the
13 city of San Francisco are--are--similarly have
14 indicated that they expect principally private
15 funding. I'll defer to OMB on--on what the definition
16 of city is in terms of budget speak.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Okay, I want to ask
18 you about the implementation of the new smoking ban
19 in public housing in New York City. This will have
20 health benefits good public health policy, but we
21 need to make sure we do it right, and I don't think
22 it's enough only to inform residents of these new
23 rules, and perhaps do some marketing around why
24 smoking is bad with sign dumping (sic) developments.
25 We really need to invest in smoking cessation

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

57

1 programs specifically targeting people who live in
2 public housing who are now going to have to
3 transition into this dramatic changing rules. We
4 just raised taxes on-on tobacco in the last session.
5 So, we have some money available. Is some of that
6 money going to be invested into smoking cessation
7 programs for public housing residents?
8

9 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: As you know, the-
10 it's the federal government's mandate on NYCHA that
11 they implement smoke-free housing by July 30th of
12 this year. The Health Department has worked
13 collaboratively with NYCHA on providing them with
14 technical assistance for this. The state runs the
15 principal cessation service for all residents of the
16 state and the city, which is a quit line. The number
17 I should say so that you have it, and everybody here
18 has it is 1-866-NY-QUITS. Anybody who smokes and
19 wants to get assistance in stopping smoking can use
20 this number.

21 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Alright, if-could-
22 could there not be on-the-ground services provided in
23 NYCHA developments that would help-that would be
24 targeted to smokers to help them quit other than just
25 calling the phone number?

1
2 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Well, the-the
3 phone number is not just a phone number. They make
4 medication, Nicotine replacement available to smokers
5 who after interview seem appropriate for NRT.

6 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: And is funding
7 available for NYCHA residents who want to pay for
8 cessation medications or patches or other--?

9 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: But these are made
10 available at no charge through the State Quit Line.

11 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Alright. I'm a
12 strong supporter of our Health Action Centers, and-
13 and give you due credit for having brought them back
14 to life in recent years. We're only in three
15 neighborhoods right now. It's a very big city.
16 There are large low-income communities, communities
17 of color without a Health Action Center: Jamaica,
18 the Rockaways, North Shore of Staten Island to name
19 three that-that come to mind. I was very frustrated
20 by the response of the OMB Director in the recent
21 hearing. I think it was the Chair who asked about
22 this. It might have been another one of our
23 colleagues, and the response was: Well, there's no
24 evidence that these work. Now, you know, that's not
25 really the way things happen in public health

1 interventions. You don't—in very, very, very few
2 cases do you get a statistically significant provable
3 impact on a neighborhood intervention in public
4 health, but we—we don't need that to know that a
5 program which helps residents eat and prepare healthy
6 food is going to yield benefits in obesity and all
7 the attendant diseases. Science already proves that
8 that works. We already know that when you train new
9 mothers on how to put their baby to sleep that you
10 have a reduction in Sudden Infant Death Syndrome,
11 SIDS, this is one of the programs that you're
12 providing there. We already know that when you
13 provide mental health counseling, it reduces rates of
14 suicide. So, all these things are—are established.
15 So, why—why do we need to wait until we get data on—
16 on impact in East—in East Harlem before we can roll
17 out these services in Jamaica and Rockaways and the
18 North Shore of Staten Island?

19
20 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: That whispering
21 was just me asking what, you know, what was said, but
22 I—I won't get into that. I—I—I think that you
23 understand the rationale for having on-the-ground
24 Health Department staff covering an array of—of—of
25 activities that we pride ourselves as an agency in

1 implementing evidence-based programs. We have
2 implemented this model one that really replicates the
3 notions of Mayor La Guardia of having district health
4 offices because these neighborhoods are ones that
5 have a higher disease burden across a whole array of
6 conditions as compared to other parts of the city.
7 The three neighborhoods in which we are based
8 presently East and Central Harlem, Central North
9 Brooklyn, Big Swath at the South Bronx remain the
10 neighborhoods with the highest disease burden, but I
11 agree with you that there are other neighborhoods
12 which have—have higher disease burdens than others,
13 but these are the ones in which we continue to focus
14 our efforts.
15

16 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: One of those
17 neighborhoods that I mentioned was Jamaica, and I
18 realize we have been joined, by the way, by the local
19 Council Member Adrienne Adams, who I know cares a lot
20 about this issue. Because Mayor La Guardia in his
21 wisdom built these district health offices, the
22 buildings are there for the most part, and because
23 we're leveraging CBOs who are in these buildings
24 doing a lot of the direct service provision, the
25 actual cost to the city for each one of these center

1
2 I believe you informed us in another hearing was only
3 a million dollars per center. We're used to talking
4 about programs which have \$10 million, \$100 million
5 price tags. So, I-I do want to move on, but I'm just
6 going to observe that—that the return on investment
7 here is pretty impressive considering the
8 infrastructures are already in place. We had a
9 hearing last month on animal care centers oversight
10 on—on that entity, and one—one of the things emerged—
11 that merged—emerged out of the hearing is that we can
12 invest in successful components of that operation,
13 and reduce or increase the live release rate, and I
14 do want to acknowledge how much ACC has increased the
15 live release rate already. Up to now 92 of 93%, one
16 of the highest in the country. I don't minimize
17 that, but I know you share and ACC shares the desire
18 to make this even better, and to and to continue to
19 push those numbers higher and we have programs, which
20 do that that are in place and limited extent
21 currently at ACC like mobile adoption vans, like
22 offering food pantries to low-income pet owners, and
23 there's other programs, which can help low-income pet
24 owners keep their pets in their homes. Adding
25 capacity in a—in the centers so that we can isolate

1 animals who might be contagious adding to veterinary
2 services. We identified these and many other great
3 programs that we are confident would increase the
4 live release rate further. There was no additional
5 money in the budget for ACC. Can you explain why not
6 and whether we can get funding to continue to improve
7 the work of ACC?
8

9 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: I'm very glad
10 Council Member, Chair that you recognize how well
11 AC&C and is doing. Their live release rate is 93%
12 now is among the highest in the country, and we're a
13 very big city, and many of our dogs that are
14 surrendered to the animal care center are pit bulls,
15 which are often difficult to adopt. So, they've done
16 a terrific job working with others. I expect that
17 they will continue to do this work. You know that we
18 are working on capital investments. I thought your
19 question might be about that. We're committed to
20 having five full service shelters one in each of our
21 boroughs, and we are at work on getting the adoption
22 center repurposed from what had been a garage in East
23 Harlem. All of these will also be added capacity
24 to AC&C. I-I-I, you know, I am very proud of their
25

1 work and I-I feel that they can continue doing this
2 work with their current budget.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Okay, the Centers
5 for Disease Control has put out a report that Vector-
6 borne diseases, which is jargon for things you get
7 from ticks and fleas, et cetera are on the rise, lime
8 disease probably being the most prevalent in our
9 region. Can you comment on the increase in these
10 diseases in New York City, and the extent to which
11 you are going to allocate more staff and other
12 resources to monitor or prevent and treat these
13 diseases in the face of-of what is arise in-in-in
14 these conditions, which we believe has led-driven by
15 global warming by the way.

16 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Right.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: It sadly means it's
18 not going away, and so let's-let's start to prepare-
19 to prepare for long-term battle against Vector-borne
20 diseases.

21 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: You are-you are
22 correct. This is likely related to-t climate change
23 and I-I think in our current political climate we
24 should take very opportunity to point out that
25 climate change is real. The-the Vector-borne

1 diseases that we concern ourselves with at the
2 department also include those that are related to
3 mosquito-borne diseases. It's any disease in which
4 the—the pathogen is carried by a vector rather than
5 person to person, and we have robust programs
6 tackling Vector-borne diseases. We have national
7 experts in our agency who focus on this. We have
8 seen a rise in tick-borne diseases in—in New York
9 City as well as across the country. I'll get you--

11 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: [interposing] Can
12 you quantify that?

13 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: I have to get you
14 the numbers, but I want to point out one thing, their
15 money—I mean for the last two—two years that I have
16 the numbers available 2015 and 2016 they were running
17 about flat at about 950 cases reported to us each
18 year. I want to point out that the majority of
19 individuals who get a tick-borne disease, the most
20 common of which is lime disease, acquire it outside
21 of the city limits, but we are seeing cases and our
22 surveillance suggests because we survey not just the—
23 the people with the diseases but the ticks to see
24 whether they have the virus, the viruses. We ae

25

1 seeing more of them in--particularly in the Bronx
2 and Staten Island.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: So, what are we
5 doing about that? Are we allocating more resources?

6 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Well, we have a
7 program that--that's aimed at deer control. As you
8 know, the--the--the tick that carries the bacteria that
9 cause lime disease is often found on deer, and we
10 have a program in Staten Island to sterilize the male
11 deer--Staten Island is an island--so that control of
12 that deer population is possible, and it's been done
13 through male sterilization. It's a little more
14 complex in the Bronx, which is on the Mainland so the
15 deer, you know, can just walk there.

16 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Thank you. Finally,
17 I want to ask about Hepatitis D and C, which afflicts
18 people who are really on the margins of our society.
19 It's often people who have HIV, intravenous drug
20 users and various immigrant groups. It is a lot more
21 prevalent than the average New Yorker understands for
22 that reason because it's not in the press. We have
23 a--a strange patchwork of programs to combat, Hep-C an
24 it results in very uneven funding of the testing, and
25 I think there's some settings where the testing is

1 free, and there's some that works on a sliding scale,
2 and there's some where the patient just has to pay
3 the full cost. And so in my district we have a
4 wonderful non-profit African Services Committee. You
5 might know them, where they'll have people who come
6 in for an HIV test, and as you all know there's a
7 very high correlation between HIV and—and Hepatitis
8 because you have compromised the immune system. And
9 the HIV test is free, and so the patient will receive
10 the test, and then they're told the Hepatitis test is
11 \$30, and we're generally talking about very low-
12 income New Yorkers for whom that could be at a
13 minimum difficult to pay for if not insurmountable,
14 and so African Services Committee reports that only
15 10% of the patients are getting the Hep test, which
16 to me just seems crazy for such a cheap test. I mean
17 there are medical tests, which cost hundreds of
18 dollars. This one I think is—they're charging \$30.
19 So, could the city not be funding the Hep test in all
20 settings, and can you explain the inconsistencies?

22 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Well, I—I know
23 that in our clinics where we—we offer testing in a—in
24 a—as part of the assessment of somebody with HIV
25 infection. So, we do offer Hepatitis C testing, and

1
2 in our setting we—we don't allow cost to be a barrier
3 for care. I wanted to note that we also provide
4 contraception in that clinic—contraception in
5 clinics. As you know, they barely are. (sic) You
6 know, the—I'm—I'm—I'm not sure that I can speak to
7 our whole healthcare delivery system, which, as you
8 now, is fragmented and complex. For people who lack
9 health insurance the public hospital system is—is
10 always open to them as are our clinics.

11 CHAIRPERSON LEVINE: Right. I'm—I'm
12 going to close. I just going to pass it off to—to my
13 colleague, but the—the communities, which are
14 vulnerable to Hepatitis are often living on the
15 margins, and we need to serve them where we can meet
16 them, and they're often far more comfortable coming
17 into a community-based organization, which has—
18 literally speaks their language just for serving
19 immigrants, or in other words as—in other words as
20 cultural competency, and I think if we have to send
21 them to an H&H facility many of them are not going to
22 make it there. And so, I'd like to work with you to
23 close the gaps in—in this service provision so that
24 we're making sure we meet people where they are for

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

68

1 this important test. Thank you Commissioner. Thank
2 you, Mr. Chair.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Chair
5 Ayala.

6 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Thank you.

7 Commissioner, regarding the Supervised Injection
8 facilities DOHMH's plan would establish over those
9 prevention centers inside non-profits that already
10 function as needed to exchange sites. Proposed sites
11 include Housing Works, 37th Street Health Clinic in
12 Chelsea, Vocal New York and Gowanus, Brooklyn,
13 Washington Heights, Corner Project and Washington
14 Heights, Manhattan and Saint Ann's the corner of harm
15 reduction and Longwood the Bronx. Since the release
16 of the report this month have-have you encountered
17 any major challenges or opposition to the plan that
18 may impede its progress?

19 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: I don't believe
20 we've heard back from the commissioner. I don't
21 believe we've heard back from the State Health
22 Commissioner on the request for him to support a
23 resolution so that we can institute a one-year pilot
24 research study.

25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

69

1 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Is there a timeline?

2
3 No?

4 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Well, the sooner
5 the better.

6 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: No, I agree, but I
7 wonder if, you know, if anyone--

8 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: [interposing]
9 Well, I can't give him--well the letter was written by
10 the Deputy--Deputy Mayor Palacio, but I--I don't
11 believe we can give a deadline. We look forward to
12 hearing from him. I understand from him that he's
13 working on it.

14 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Now, assuming that,
15 you know, he's--he's okay, and that we're able to
16 implement, what would be the community outreach
17 process? What would that look like in neighborhoods
18 that have been selected?

19 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Well, as outlined
20 by the Mayor when he indicated that he would like to
21 see this go forward, the--there are a couple of steps,
22 one is the State Health Commissioner. The other is
23 the local district attorney, the representative of
24 the City Council for that area, and then a 6 to 12-
25 month period will take place when an advisory council

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

70

1
2 comprised of various city agencies including Health,
3 the Police Department as well as community-based
4 organizations, you know, an array of community
5 representatives. The elected officials will all
6 begin a community engagement process to figure out
7 how this place will work.

8 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Alright, thank you.
9 Regarding the Crisis Response Services. So, as part
10 of the Healing NYC the Fiscal 2019 Executive Budget
11 allocates \$5.7 million and 29 positions in Fiscal
12 2020 to expand the capacity of the Health and
13 Engagement Assessment Team. The additional funding
14 and staff will support coordination first of the 24/7
15 Triage Staff operated by DOHMH and the New York City
16 Police Department. How did the Administration
17 determine this funding need, and how would this
18 expansion improve the city's response to opioid
19 overdoses?

20 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: I think you're
21 talking about HEAT, the Health Engagement--

22 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: [interposing] Yes.

23 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: --Assessment
24 Teams. Well, the idea here is to continue our move
25 towards a public health response to mental crises and

1 these will deploy mental health professionals and
2 peer, people living with mental illness as a first
3 line of response to people who are assessed by the
4 Triage unit to be appropriate for that type of
5 response rather than any police department response.

7 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Diabetes prevention.

8 So according to DOHMH Epidata brief from April 2014,
9 Black, Hispanic and Asian New Yorkers are at least
10 twice as likely to have diabetes as New Yorkers as
11 White New York City. Diabetes also disproportionately
12 affects high poverty New York City communities
13 including East Harlem and the South Bronx. What
14 specific diabetes related community outreach does
15 DOHMH conduct or facilitate in these high need
16 neighborhoods?

17 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: You are right to
18 point out that diabetes is a serious health problem.
19 It is among our top ten leading cause off death, and
20 has been rising up through the ranks. So, we have a
21 whole array of-of efforts that are aimed at tackling
22 the diabetes problem starting with prevention, which
23 is aimed mainly at tackling the problem of overweight
24 and obesity focusing on healthy foods even promoting
25 breast feeding to-to-for newborns is part of an

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

72

obesity prevention agenda specifically focused on
diabetes. We are supporting the National Diabetes
Prevention Program.

CHAIRPERSON AYALA: I mean I-I-I can
speak specifically from my-in my district. I don't-I
just-I-I know that it's prevalent. I don't really
feel like we're hearing enough about it or seeing it
enough. So, I-I really just don't--

COMMISSIONER BASSETT: I appreciate that
feedback.

CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Can you tell us how-
how does the-so, how does the agency cater its
diabetes outreach like to engage these low-income
communities? I know Borough President Diaz has
launched like this #Now 62 Campaign, which has been
pretty exciting for Bronxites. We've seen residents
just take control over their developments and start,
you know, exercise classes and healthy eating
programming because of that campaign. I'm not sure
if you're familiar with it, but yeah, yeah.

COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Absolutely. Our
Bronx office is a-is an active participant in #Now
62. So, we do a number of community-based
activities, many of them coming out of our

1
2 Neighborhood Health Action Centers, and focused on
3 neighborhoods which have—know have high rates of
4 diabetes and high rates of poorly controlled
5 diabetes. For example, in East Harlem, we have been
6 running now for a couple of years Community Health
7 Worker project aimed at—at public housing where we
8 aim to reach people who have diabetes, high blood
9 pressure, asthma and work with them to both—to better
10 manage their self-manage their conditions, and also
11 to better cooperate with medical care. The outreach
12 workers do coaching on disease management, and we
13 also support community activities like advocating for
14 farmers markets within the developments, walking
15 clubs, things of that sort. So, I, you know, I'd
16 love to tell you more about these—about these. I—I
17 think that this is something that people have to
18 integrate into their daily lives. It's not a simple
19 issue, but certainly we can do much better.

20 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Regarding the Crisis
21 Prevention and Response Task Force, last month Mayor
22 de Blasio and First Lady McCray and members of the
23 City Council launched the New York City Crisis
24 Prevention and Response Task Force, a 180-day effort
25 to develop a comprehensive citywide strategy to

1
2 prevent mental health crisis and improve the city's
3 response to emotionally distressed New Yorkers. What
4 role does—what role will the DOHMH play in the task
5 force, and how will the task force's efforts to
6 improve New York City's Mental Health system defer
7 from the programs and services funded through
8 ThriveNYC?

9 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: As you're aware,
10 this is a task force that is given 18–180 days, a
11 six-month time frame in which to come up with advice.
12 It's seeking to build on activities that we've
13 already initiated that will help us to have a broader
14 range of responses to mental health, and crises in
15 our neighborhoods. And I hope we'll build on efforts
16 like Co-Response, HEAT and so on. The Health
17 Department will be working on it with other agencies
18 including the Police Department. It will be chaired
19 by the First Deputy Mayor and the Deputy Mayor for
20 Health and Human Services.

21 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Do you know if there
22 is—if there will be any representation from The
23 Department of Education because we have been getting
24 a lot of inquiries from educators regarding the
25 emergency response by police officers in our local

1 schools when children are suffering from some sort of
2 emotional distress?

3
4 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: I don't know but
5 I—I would expect—I would expect that the Department
6 of Education is involved. The answer is yes, the
7 Department of Ed of Education is involved. So that
8 it's something that cuts across many of our agencies
9 as a city.

10 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Great, and I will ask
11 my last question because I—we're running out of time,
12 and I want to afford my colleagues an opportunity to
13 ask questions, but regarding disabilities, I ask this
14 all the time. I just feel that as a city we're not
15 doing enough, you know, to—to really deal with this,
16 but there, you know, funding for mental health and
17 substance abuse services in DOHMH's Operating Budget
18 has grown substantially in recent years. Funding in
19 the Fiscal Year 2019 Executive Budget for mental
20 health services increased by more than \$132 million
21 when compared to the Fiscal 2016 Budget, and funding
22 for substance abuse services increased by
23 approximately \$34 million. Funding for developmental
24 disabilities, however, has remained flat at \$12
25 million.

COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Correct.

CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Why hasn't the
Administration made meaningful investments in
programs and services for people with developmental
disabilities?

COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Well, I'm hopeful
that we are doing a good job with our—with the
funding that we have, and I would—I would agree with
you that many of the things that we do that help
people with disabilities help all of us. It's
something not under the purview of our agency, but
done by the Department of Transportation. The curb
cutouts I think all of us appreciate when we pull a
cart over the curb. So, it's not just for the
disabled, but we, you know, we'll take under
advisement your remarks and—and, you know, take a
look at our programming strategy. I don't know
whether you have any specific recommendations, but
we'd be happy to discuss this with you.

CHAIRPERSON AYALA: I'm—I'm happy to
share them with you, and I mean just to the
Administration I will keep hammering you over the
head over this every single hearing because I think
that it's really important, and I—it was staggering

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

77

1 to me when I was looking at the numbers. We've
2 remained flat for the last, you know, few—several
3 fiscal years, and it just—it makes no sense to me
4 when have, you know, just about under a million, you
5 know, individuals that living with disabilities in
6 this, you know, in the city, and so I appreciate any
7 effort to move that—that conversation along.
8

9 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON AYALA: Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, we now have
12 questions from Council Members Holden followed by
13 Adams and the Powers.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thanks

15 Commissioner for your testimony. I have a few
16 questions. I want to follow up on Chair Dromm's
17 issues with lead. Now, I've had an incident and I—I
18 guess you're aware of it in my district where a sewer
19 project was underway and—and the contractor took soil
20 from the found and tried to bring it to a soil dump,
21 and they rejected it because of the high lead levels,
22 and subsequently the study was done on the—soil and
23 it was discovered that there were lead levels between
24 3 and 600, and possibly 2,400 parts per million,
25 which is hazardous. The soil was actually dumped

1 uncovered across from a local public school with
2 about a thousand—over a thousand children. For five
3 months it was left there uncovered, and we uncovered
4 it—you know, we actually discovered this and with the
5 subsequent lead levels in the ground of 2,400 and the
6 sewer project was stopped. Yet, I've asked your
7 office and I've asked the Mayor's Office to issue an
8 advisory to the people who live in the area of the
9 sewer project against planting. People plant
10 vegetables, certain leafy vegetables and grow and
11 that's a consideration, that's a concern that we need
12 and advisory put out. Also, there was no lead
13 testing offered to the children or the parents of the
14 children in the school, which I thought should have
15 been an afterthought. It's certainly something that
16 we—we—we certainly should do or offer because lead,
17 you know, ingesting lead with children—certainly with
18 children ingesting lead chips, paint chips is one way
19 to get lead poisoning and breathing dust is another
20 way, lead dust—lead-laced dust. So, I—I can't
21 understand since no lead levels are good for anyone
22 certainly children that we wouldn't take the
23 precaution to test the children in—in the school at
24 least. But I also want to just--another part of the
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

79

question is how do we know the numbers? I mean I
guess you get it from the Department of Education
because children are tested per year, each year?

COMMISSIONER BASSETT: So, let me begin
with your last questions--

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Alright.

COMMISSIONER BASSETT: --and I'm try and--
and work through them, and--

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I know I'm on the
clock. So, I've got 30 seconds.

COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Oh, is that right.
Well, the way that it's recommended that children be
tested at age 2 and age 2-age 1 and age 2. In fact
it's the law that children be tested at age 1 and age
2. We rely on physicians who see children
particularly in their first year of life often, and
are in the position to recommend testing to children.
So, the Health Department doesn't actually do any
lead testing. We rely on our Healthcare system and
children's visits to the pediatricians to get the
lead tests done and they are referred to us. We
receive from the labs all of the lead test results.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, because--
because I look at--

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

80

1
2 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: [interposing] So,
3 it's not--by the time the kid gets to school I want
4 you to know that's not the age at which we want kids
5 to be tested for the first time. A lot of lead
6 exposure has to do with ingestion and the hands-in-
7 mouth activities that little children have. So,
8 that's how we find out by receiving the blood lead
9 results.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Okay.

11 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: You had a question
12 about--about planting in our soil.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Right.

14 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Most of the lead
15 in our soil from New York City is from the days of
16 leaded gasoline, and we in general recommend that
17 people not plant in the soil because end-use planters
18 use, you know, get a box and fill it with good soil
19 that you--that you buy, and plant. So, I--I don't--I--I--
20 I don't know whether you feel that your constituency
21 is not aware that this is the recommendation.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: No, they aren't
23 aware of it.

24 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: So, that--that's a--
25 a good thing for you I mean actually.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

81

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing] I
3 don't how many people here are aware of that.

4 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Really?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Certainly in a--in
6 an area that's--was a dump, actually a city dump at
7 one time.

8 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Well, not that--I
9 mean unfortunately, you know, the presence of lead
10 in--in--in gas, you remember that notion that lead
11 stopped the engine from knocking or something like
12 that, resulted in widespread lead contamination of
13 soil. So, we don't recommend that people plant in
14 this soil. The main exposure for lead is lead paint,
15 and that remains the focus of our agency. We--we
16 don't see lead and soil as a particularly prominent
17 exposure. We are focused on the principal exposure,
18 which is from lead paint chips and lead dust, which
19 are right--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing] Yes.
21 I--I know my time is up, but I just have one just
22 quick follow-up, and then I'll reserve for later.
23 The area I'm talking--I'm not talking about all over
24 the city. I'm talking about the levels of lead
25 that's proven for 2,400 parts per million--

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

82

COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: --which is hazardous, which in an area, and it's not a large area, that the Department of Health issued an advisory to people or just a mailing or some kind of notice in their door that they probably shouldn't plant especially in this soil and build boxes above it, and that's all I ask, and that's not a big thing I think.

COMMISSIONER BASSETT: [interposing]

Well, I'm happy to discuss it with you.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, next Council Member Adams.

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Good morning and thank you, Chairs for holding this hearing this morning. My questions are going to revolve around Cure Violence. I represent District 28 in Queens, South Jamaica and two days ago we experienced the first killing in four years. I'm sure you're aware. So, we pretty much took to the streets yesterday in support of our community. The community is very shaken up by this. We have unrest of--by the residents as well as surrounding residents in the community. We're very grateful to organizations like

1 Life Camp and King of Kings Foundation for the great
2 work that they do. So, what I would like to know is
3 the Fiscal 2019 Executive Plan allocates \$20—I'm
4 sorry, \$75,000 annually to the Department of Health
5 and Mental Hygiene to hire a training coordinator for
6 the Cure Violence program that's evidence-based
7 initiative supported by the Mayor's Office to prevent
8 gun violence. How specifically would you coordinate
9 with organizations like Life Camp and King of Kings
10 in an effort to support the Cure Violence Initiative?

12 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Thank you for that
13 question. As you're probably aware, New York City
14 has among the largest Cure Violence Programs in the
15 nation. I believe we have 17 different locations,
16 and Life Camp has been a key part of-of the Cure
17 Violence work. It's coordinated now through the
18 Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice, which adds
19 wraparound services in addition to the Cure Violence
20 program, which is a public health oriented program
21 towards ending Cure Violence. The person who would
22 be hired at the Health Department would play a
23 coordinating and technical assistance role in
24 supporting the organizations that implement Cure
25 violence. We have been playing this role with Cure

1 Violence since it first came to the city, and—and I,
2 you know, I'm—we're big supporters of this program.

3 I am aware of the shooting and the individual who
4 lost his life, and—and, you know, I—I think that the
5 work that Erica Garner—Oh, I got her name wrong.

6 Erica Ford. Sorry. That's another victim is Erica
7 Garner. Erica Ford has done in—in LIFE CAMP has been
8 pretty remarkable.

9
10 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I agree. It's
11 exemplary work. What is the Department of Health and
12 Mental Hygiene's role in the Cure Violence
13 Initiative? How does the agency work—specifically
14 work with the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice to
15 implement and evaluate the program?

16 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Well, we have—the
17 part of the program that we're responsible for is
18 the—the—the public health aspect of it that contracts
19 with the community-based organizations that are held
20 by the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Okay, thank you
22 very much, and—and I hope that we are in agreement
23 that violence is indeed a mental health issue.

24 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: And a public
25 health issue.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

85

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: And a public
3 health issue.

4 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: We are in
5 agreement.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you very
7 much for your testimony.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, Council Member
9 Powers.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you. Thank
11 you for being here and testifying. I had received a
12 concern around the time that the DOH, yeah, I think
13 part of the process for receiving, if you're a person
14 with disabilities concerns about the timing related
15 to getting the parking permit for people with
16 disabilities and DOT has informed me that there's
17 some delays. It appears that the Department of
18 Health related some of the disabilities getting their
19 medical records approved. So, I-I'm not sure if
20 you're familiar with this or somebody?

21 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: I'm familiar with
22 the issue, but I-I would need to get back to you on
23 the specific concern that you have, because actually
24 it was doing better.

25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

86

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: [interposing]

Well, I'll send you the specific concern. My
question is how many physicians or medical aspects
(sic) to review the records and—and potentially
that's a—a reason that there's a delay? How many—how
many people are reviewing it?

COMMISSIONER BASSETT: I'll have to get
back to you with that information.

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: There's somebody
here who might have an answer?

COMMISSIONER BASSETT: There might be as
there is somebody who is standing behind me.
[laughter] But we—we can get those details for you.
We—we certainly have—in the past we've contracted
that service and we've—we've maintained contracts
with people who do the reviews on our behalf.

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Are you
contracts—is that what you're doing?

COMMISSIONER BASSETT: We don't actually
employ—we haven't employed full-time physicians to do
these reviews, but I—I'll have to find the details
for the—for you and happy to get back to you about
it. We certainly don't want people to have to wait a
long time to get back to them.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

87

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: I will. I will
3 send the specific--so I would just note, though, that
4 I didn't think that was a radical question to ask how
5 many folks were reviewing it. So, certainly at--at a
6 hearing I would appreciate it if some of that
7 information was available, but we'll follow up with
8 the--with the appropriate person at the agency to find
9 out the answer.

10 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Thank you.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Yep, thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Council member Holden
13 has some follow-ups.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Commissioner on
15 the--I want to do it quickly, a quick question. No
16 funding got the animal shelter in Queens the full-
17 service animal shelter. You said you're committed
18 to--your agency is committed to the--the shelter?

19 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Not just our
20 agency, our Administration--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing] I
22 know the Administration

23 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: -- is absolutely
24 committed to it.

25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

88

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Alright, the
Administration is committed, but there's no money in
the Capital Budget. [background comments]

COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Those funds will
be--will be available. We have \$5 million for the
design components of it, and as the process proceeds,
the funds are committed. The Administration has made
it very clear that it is committed to having a full
service animal shelter in every--in every borough.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Show me the
money. That's what we--that's what we need--really
need, because Queens seems to be--

COMMISSIONER BASSETT: [interposing]
Well, last the--we had \$98 million put in our budget--

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Right.

COMMISSIONER BASSETT: --in capital
funds.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [interposing]
Yeah, I understand.

COMMISSIONER BASSETT: I--I think that
that should give us the--the--the funds will be there.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Okay. On the
question of outreach because my--my--my police precinct

25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

89

1 captain just told me--[bell] Oh, can I go?—about
2
3 the—

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Go ahead, Bob.

5 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Can I go?

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes, Council Member.
7 I'm sorry. [pause] [background comments]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Okay, the-the
9 mic—the commander of my police precinct, the local
10 precinct says that we—we—we lead the city or
11 consistently in opioid overdoses 1 and 2. Can you
12 tell us the outreach that you're doing to—to actually
13 notify people, you know, people who are victims
14 obviously or of addiction of parents in the outreach
15 that your agency is doing?

16 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Sure. I mean
17 we're—we're doing a lot because as you note, our city
18 has the highest number of overdose deaths that we've
19 ever had on—on record at present. We have a larger
20 citywide campaign going now. It's the third round in
21 a citywide campaign. We focused on promoting the
22 people have Naloxone. We'd be happy to come to your
23 office and offer Naloxone, you know work with you to
24 set up Naloxone training programs. We also want
25 people to understand that treatment is available to

1
2 them. Additionally, when we see a surge in overdose
3 deaths in any particular community we have as part of
4 our newly funded initiative under Healing NYC a sort
5 of outreach team that goes out into the neighborhood
6 and makes sure that healthcare providers in the
7 neighborhood are aware of the increase in overdose
8 deaths, and that people are aware of the role of
9 Naloxone in reversing overdose deaths.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: But I—I came from
11 the advertising world, and I know how you could
12 target certain populations and certain age groups.
13 What's the age group that's most like to—to overdose?

14 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Interestingly,
15 many times people think this will be somebody who's
16 20 years old, but the—the peak in overdose deaths is
17 people between 40 and mid-50s.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I heard that--

19 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: [interposing] Yes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: --which is
21 surprising. So, I just want to know--

22 COMMISSIONER BASSETT: Right.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: --how do you
24 reach these people? I mean do you text them? Do
25 you—do we—do we do massive outreach that way?

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

92

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: We'll take a five-
minute break. [pause for break] Okay, thank you.
We will now resume the City Council's hearing on the
Mayor's Executive Budget for Fiscal 19. The Finance
Committee is joined by the Committee on Cultural
Affairs, Libraries and International Intergroup
Relations chair by Council Member Jimmy Van Bramer.
We've also been joined by Council Members Francisco
Moya, Council Member Adrienne Adams, and I believe
others will be coming shortly. We just heard from
the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, and now
we'll hear from Tony Marx, President and CEO the New
York Public Library; Dennis Walcott, President and
CEO of the Queens Public Library, and Linda Johnson,
President and CEO of the Brooklyn Public Library.
Libraries are no longer just a place for books and
silent retreat. Libraries across the country are
responding to the changing demand and are being
challenge to reform their roles and purposes. The
focus was one circulation, and while circulation is
till crucial to the systems, libraries now provide
free services and programs for children and teens,
immigrants and seniors, New Yorkers who lack access
to a broadband at home, people who need literacy

1 services, New Yorkers who are actively looking for
2 jobs and small business owners. Therefore, I am
3 disappointed that the Administration did not include
4 the additional \$16 million in expense funding and \$60
5 million in capital funding for the libraries that the
6 Council recommended in the Preliminary Budget. This
7 fiscal year, one area in particular that we are
8 bringing a renewed focus to is the city's Capital
9 Program. For the first time the Council has
10 established a subcommittee to focus exclusively on
11 the Capital Budget and process led by Chair Vanessa
12 Gibson. The subcommittee will play an integral part
13 in the next few months in our oversight of the
14 proposed budget as we strive to reform the capital
15 process. It concerns me that the library systems has
16 such as low capital commitment rate. In Fiscal 2017,
17 the Library Systems committed \$18.5 million or 4.3%
18 of the Annual Capital Plan of \$433.6 million. The
19 progress and issues surrounding capital projects
20 needs to be an ongoing discussion between the
21 Council, DDC and the library systems that we can find
22 solutions to the problems. Before we hear from the
23 libraries, I'll open the mic to my Co-Chair Council
24 Member Van Bramer for his statement.
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

94

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: thank you

[coughs] very much, Chair Dromm and to all of the
library workers and supporters who are here. I
welcome you into the Chambers now that we have
rallied on the steps, and I want to channel Lauren
Comiteau who just delivered a rousing address
outside, and just say dispensing with all the talking
points, we know what libraries mean, we know what you
need. What you're asking for is not that much. With
respect to a \$90 billion budget, we have the means to
do this. We just need the political will to make it
happen, and the people of the City of New York
benefit so much by a relatively small investment, and
we just have to do it, and we have to do it now. And
I don't know if Lauren is still here with us? She
had to go? Of course, back to work, but I hope
you'll let her know that I shouted her out, and we're
channeling here, and I hope the three presidents and
CEOs also channel Lauren Comiteau in their testimony
because we know that's the challenge, Dennis, right
there. [laughs] She was plain spoken. She spoke
truth to power, and we have to do this. The people
of the City of New York are desperately in need of
these services. On the expense side we know what we

1
2 need in order to make sure that libraries can stay
3 open, library workers can continue to be paid what
4 they're worth, and to make sure that our library
5 buildings are in a state of good repair. We need a
6 library system that's as good and worthy as the
7 people you serve and the people who work inside the
8 libraries. So, obviously this council has always led
9 the way. We have always led the way in pushing hard
10 for our public libraries. I know we'll continue to
11 do that. That's why our Budget Response called for
12 the \$16 million. Again, a relatively drop in the
13 bucket of a \$90 billion budget. It is doable. The
14 \$60 million in capital continuing to invest it can
15 happen, it should happen, it must happen. So, I want
16 to thank our colleagues for their Queens Panel right
17 now, but we love all five boroughs equally, as I said
18 outside, and we're going to deliver for all of our
19 libraries. So, with that, anxious to hear the
20 testimony. Thank you very much.

21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much,
22 Chair Van Bramer, and I'm going to ask Council to
23 swear the panel. Oh, we don't want to swear this
24 panel in that's right. I like to swear you in, but
25 we'll let you go.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

96

LINDA JOHNSON: We're libraries. We tell
the truth.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: [laughs] Right,
exactly. Alright, would you like to start?

LINDA JOHNSON: Thank you Chairman Van
Bramer, Chair Dromm. Thank you also for giving a
shout out to Lauren Comiteau from the Great Library
in Mill Basin. She used language that we all I think
we could use this morning, but we'll try and tone it
down a bit now that we're inside. We are grateful to
you, to your committee to Speaker Johnson to Majority
Cumbo and our Brooklyn Delegation and the entire City
Council for supporting New York City's libraries.
We're proud of the advances set in motion three years
ago when you made it possible for us to provide
universal six-day service. We depend on your
dedication to our libraries among the city's most
democratic institutions. So we can help over 37
million New Yorkers we see each year. To continue to
serve the public at the level they have come to
expect and deserve, we need the city's increased
support. Unfortunately, the Executive Budget did not
include an increase for libraries. The Fiscal 2019
Tri-Library Budget Request is modest yet urgent. We

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

97

1 are seeking an additional \$16 million in operating
2 funds to be split among the three library systems,
3 paired with an increase of \$60 million in capital
4 dollars. Without additional expense funds this year,
5 we will face difficult choices ahead. For Brooklyn
6 Public Library, the \$4.5 million in operating funds
7 we are requesting will allow us to continue providing
8 six-day service a week, maintain our physical spaces
9 and expand our collections. The cost of library
10 services over the last three years has increased but
11 our Operating Budget has not. People rely heavily on
12 their local libraries and nowhere is that more
13 evident than in our program attendance. Last Fiscal
14 Year Brooklyn Public Library held over 63,000 program
15 sessions across all age groups with nearly a million
16 attendees. We are the borough—we are the borough's
17 largest provider of free WiFi hosting 555,000
18 connections and over 1.3 million computer sessions.
19 It is standing room only for children and the
20 caregivers at our weekly story time programs offered
21 in every branch in multiple language and as often as
22 possible. Our services aim to engage families, jobs
23 seekers older adults, veterans, homeless immigrants,
24 teens, entrepreneurs, truly everyone is welcome here.
25

1
2 Brooklyn Public Library has encouraged innovation, by
3 providing mentorship and resources to library staff
4 with creative new ideas through the BPL Incubator.
5 However, staff costs have risen dramatically and our
6 popular and innovative programming could be at stake
7 if another year goes by without additional operating
8 dollars. Just last weekend, central library was
9 teaming with excitement for the inaugural runway show
10 of Brooklyn Fashion Academy, a pilot program of the
11 BPL Incubator. The first of its kind, this 12-week
12 fashion and business series was spearheaded by out
13 business and career center. Fourteen aspiring
14 designers aged 20 through 70 to 70, showed their
15 lines on the runway at Central Library. At Brooklyn
16 Public Library the size of our collection is also
17 well below what it—what it should be for a system
18 serving over 2.6 million people. In years where we
19 face budget cuts, we chose to keep our staff in
20 place, and the expense—at the expense of the
21 collection budget. However, holding the Collection
22 Budget constant for this long has taken a toll. Our
23 branches need additional materials with an emphasis
24 on world languages and our ebook circulation in
25 soaring, up 19% over this time last year. The

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

99

1 increase we are seeking in expense dollars would
2 allow us to purchase an additional 1,200 new books
3 per branch that our patrons need and deserve.
4 Additionally, our ability to serve the public is
5 compromised by our aging buildings most of which are
6 plagued by maintenance issue and equipment failures.
7 We spend approximately \$1 million precious operating
8 dollars every year maintaining old boilers, replacing
9 dilapidated furniture and funding temporary heating
10 and cooling fixes as we wait for capital projects to
11 replace broke systems. We are funding urgent
12 projects that are neither—that are either not
13 capitally eligible or impractical, costly and time
14 consuming to address through the city's design and
15 construction process. In order to avoid another
16 summer of closing branches in the public—in the—in
17 the public—to the public, branches, which are relied
18 upon as cooling centers, we spent valuable operating
19 dollars to maintain library service. For example,
20 Flatbush Library is set to reopen on May 30th after a
21 one-month closure to retrofit the HVAC and to
22 retrofit the HVAC system, and Spring Creek Library
23 will close on May 25th and reopen a month later. In
24 both branches, the staff and patrons have suffered
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

100

1 through heat and reduced hours over the last few
2
3 summers as they wait for the systems to be replaced.
4 The HVAC units at Bedford, Brownsville and Pacific
5 Libraries, are too old to fix. Instead, staff and
6 patrons must should over the busy, the noisy portable
7 chillers we have installed until capital projects to
8 replace these systems are underway. Just as we are
9 faced with multiple emergency cooling issues every
10 summer, we expect to spend significant expense
11 dollars this coming winter to maintain or replace old
12 boilers throughout our system. Mapleton and Borough
13 Park Libraries both have boilers that are beyond
14 their useful life, and we anticipate they may fail
15 this coming winter. In order to keep our libraries
16 open, these fixes will compete for treasured expense
17 dollars, and ultimately take funds away from other
18 worthy library operations. New code requirements are
19 also adding costs to our operating budget. New York
20 City elevator regulations have been updated and now
21 require door lock monitoring systems, a control that
22 will prevent an elevator cab from moving if the door
23 is open. Accordingly, every one of our 35 branch
24 elevators will be upgraded at the—during the upcoming
25 year, and will cost several hundred thousand expense

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

101

1 dollars. Brooklyn Public Library has 1.1 million
2 square feet of physical space to maintain. At our
3 current level of capital funding, it is impossible
4 for us to address any but the most urgent problems.
5 We spend much of our time and resources responding to
6 emergencies, which can exhaust an entire year's
7 capital allocation rather than holistically
8 approaching building renovations. As I stated at the
9 outset, the three library systems are requesting a
10 total of \$60 million in capital funding this year,
11 \$20 million for each system. In Brooklyn, innovative
12 library construction projects in Sunset Park, Green
13 Point, Brower Park, and Brooklyn Heights have
14 eliminated millions in unfunded capital need. Revenue
15 from the redevelopment of Brooklyn Heights Library is
16 allowing us to improve several branches that are
17 badly in need of repair. So, we are beginning to
18 make progress by reduction Brooklyn Public Library's
19 unfunded needs from \$300 million to approximately
20 \$240 million, but there is a limit to what we can do
21 on our own. Chronic underfunding makes it impossible
22 for us to manage capital plans efficiently. Urgent
23 projects are often delayed over very change in scope.
24 Because libraries do not have recurring discretionary
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

102

1 funding in the 10-year Plan, we cannot draw from
2 future fiscal years to cover current year shortfalls
3 leading to delays and further cost escalations.
4 While each library system needs \$20 million this
5 budget year to fix failing infrastructure, backfill
6 shortfalls and replace equipment, it is equally
7 important for libraries to be included in next years
8 10-Year Capital Plan. Without a reliable recurring
9 source of funding, we are not able to perform
10 necessary preventive maintenance. We cannot ensure
11 projects that encounter a shortfall will continue to
12 move forward and we cannot manage our physical plant,
13 city-owned buildings in the most comprehensive and
14 efficient way possible. As you have already proven,
15 libraries are an excellent investment. Our doors are
16 open wide to everyone and our branches provide
17 resources that support personal advancement and
18 strengthen the fabric of our communities. As you
19 consider requests from many worthy organizations and
20 agencies, remember the millions of New Yorkers who
21 visit our branches each year, people who deserve
22 programs that lift them up and collections that
23 inspire, spaces that are welcoming and buildings that
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

103

are safe. New Yorkers deserve to love their
libraries. Thank you. [applause]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: President Walcott.

DENNIS WALCOTT: Thank you, Sir, and
Linda, well said, and our beliefs definitely. Thank
you, Linda. I would like to add that New Yorkers
deserve libraries that reflect their city's
commitment to providing them with the resources they
need to be successful in their lives. Good
afternoon. My name is Dennis Walcott, and I'm
President and CEO of the Queens Public Library
System. It is a pleasure to be there. Thank you
Chair Dromm, Chair Van Bramer, Speaker Johnson, our
Queens Delegation and the members of both committees
for the opportunity to testify today about our budget
for next year. So, now I'm going to be bad, and I'm
not going to be lowering, but I am going to deviate
from script because (1) Linda really said it all, and
just basically duplicate what Linda said for Queens.
And last night I was at an outstanding dinner that
the New York Public Library hosted, and someone
walked across the room from the New York Public
Library, and said, There's someone at a table who
would like to meet you, and I said I'd be glad to go

1 over to meet this couple, and it was a couple from
2 Jackson Heights no less, and they said, We love our
3 library. We have a 10-month-old child. We take that
4 child to the library almost every day. We look
5 forward to the services and the books for our baby,
6 and we as adults take advantage of the libraries.
7 Multiply this couple with people throughout the five
8 boroughs of New York City. That's what we're about.
9 As I indicated outside, this morning I was at our
10 office this morning first thing. Staff were there at
11 7:30, 8:00 getting the library ready for people
12 coming in at 9:00. I was there at 9:00 to greet our
13 customers coming in, and people walk in the door
14 looking for our services. We are truly the last open
15 democratic institution where we don't ask you who you
16 are or what's your from—where you're from, what
17 you're about. Come in and use our libraries. That's
18 what we're about. That's why we're here. That's why
19 the people up there are here and the people in the
20 audience because we provide a valuable public service
21 to the public at large. This past Wednesday, we had
22 two events going on at the Queens Public Library. We
23 had a lot of events going on, but the two that stand
24 out we had an older American program at one of our
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

105

1 libraries, and the prior Wednesday at this particular
2 library we had roughly 450 some odd people. The
3 Wednesday before we had roughly 460 people. This
4 past Wednesday we have 1,400 people who came through
5 our door for the services. That's what we're about.
6 That evening we had an author talk. It was raining,
7 and I said oh, we're only going to have half the
8 people that registered for the author talk. Every
9 seat was full, and then afterwards the long line that
10 was snaking around our lobby for the author to sign
11 the book was just outstanding. The next day we had a
12 hip-hop program that evening at the library on a
13 Thursday night, and again, the library was full of
14 people there for our service. We are eclectic, we
15 all-purpose, we are all-serving, we are there to
16 serve the public and what we're asking for is a small
17 amount of money because as managers, as CEOs, we're
18 going to have to make difficult choices. I mean the
19 reality is we have a responsibility, a fiduciary
20 responsibility to not just our board, but to the
21 public at large and how we manage our budget. That's
22 why we're here. That's why we're employed. If we
23 don't do our job properly then the library and most
24 importantly our staff and customers will suffer, but
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

106

1 to allow us to do—do our job properly the \$16 million
2 and the \$60 million that we're asking for basically
3 gets us up to the bar minimum because when you were
4 kind enough and led us and allowed us to get money
5 several years ago and then baseline that funding, it
6 allowed us to maintain services, but as Linda
7 indicated, and you'll probably hear from Tony as
8 well, our expenses are going up. Our capital needs
9 are going up. Using expense dollars for capital
10 purposes is unconscionable. It takes away valuable
11 dollars from our core purpose with the capital needs
12 that we have. We're very lucky in Queens, and I'm
13 not saying that because we have a Queens Delegation
14 sitting here, but our Queens Delegation have been
15 true advocates not just with the amounts, but also
16 with the money in making sure that we're constantly
17 investing in our libraries both from an expense side
18 as well as from a capital side, but we need more, and
19 we're not being greedy. We're not being greedy.
20 This is basic, this is core to the mission of the
21 public that we're there to provide services for them.
22 Our public relies on us whether it's computer
23 services, whether it's program services, whether it's
24 collections. You name it, we're there whether it's
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

107

1 immigration services, whether it's legal services,
2 whether it's video visitation. You name it. We're
3 there for the public at large. As the Chair know,
4 Chair Dromm, we're about to do something creative in
5 Jackson Heights our own Pride Day Parade, in that we
6 will be opening the Jackson Heights Library on a
7 Sunday providing a valuable service to the public,
8 creative and having fun in doing it and supporting
9 the public at large. As you know, in Queens we've
10 tried two new things where we've had our 31-hour
11 marathon where we've opened up our libraries for 31
12 straight hours in Corona as well as Peninsula Library
13 providing a variety of public services for the public
14 at large, and we've seen a tremendous increase in the
15 number of customers that come through our door.
16 Those are things that we love to do, but we have to
17 be very careful and very conscious. The core basic
18 service that we provide to the public will not be
19 hurt in the long run, and for us to make sure that
20 we're not in the position to hurt those core
21 services, all we're asking for is \$16 million and \$60
22 million. Bottom line, bottom line, and that will
23 allow us to continue the valuable services to the
24 public that we are here to serve. So, on behalf of
25

1 the Queens Public Library System, but more
2
3 importantly the great staff who are here, and those
4 who are working the library and our customers who
5 come through our door, thank you very much.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. President
7 Marx.

8 TONY MARX: Thank you, Mr. Chairman and
9 both chairmen and the City Council. Gosh, I-I don't
10 know, I'm-I'm not sure I've got much left to say.
11 The-Dennis and Linda have been eloquent as always in
12 making it clear how much our communities depend on
13 us, how much they trust us. I realize there may be a
14 low bar, but all polling data shows that libraries
15 are the most trusted institutions in America, and
16 there's a reason for that for all the reasons that
17 you've heard from my colleagues. At this moment in
18 history when people are losing hope, are losing
19 assurance that they will-that their families will
20 prosper that their communities will prosper, that
21 they'll be able to afford educations and not end up
22 in life long debt, that they will be able to tell
23 fact from fiction. They look to the libraries now
24 more than ever, and we have to maintain and build and
25 what we offer to meet that challenge. You've already

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

109

1 heard the summary. Simply the most important point
2 is as demand rises, staff costs rise as well. We got
3 a great increase in expense, thank you, funding in
4 FY16, but we hired a 100 new staff including 60 much
5 needed children and young adult librarians. As a
6 result, I might say we've gone from I think 100,000
7 ore so folks in our Early Literacy programs when I
8 got here to—about three-quarters of a million at this
9 point, and all those kids and caregivers grabbing
10 books off the shelf as they go so that the
11 circulation of our children's collection is going
12 through the roof. We've created the Education
13 Programs that you all asked us to do because we can
14 meet the real needs in every community whether it's
15 Pre-K, after school, English language, citizenship,
16 computer skills, coding. We've—we've seen—we now
17 have those education programs get 1.5 million visits
18 a year just at the New York Public Library alone,
19 working in close partnership with the Department of
20 Education. I was with the new Chancellor twice in
21 the last four days talking about how we can help the
22 City Council and the Mayor meet the goal of second
23 graders all being able to read at least at grade
24 level. WE get those kids before they get to school.
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

110

1 That is noted as well, but we also partner with the
2 schools. We have to do more if this city is going to
3 continue to prosper, but it's getting harder and
4 harder. Look, the simple fact is we are absolute
5 advocates of the actions of this City Council and
6 this Administration in providing more progressive
7 family leave benefits, in increasing minimum wage,
8 healthcare options totally supportive absolutely. But
9 we haven't gotten an increase in funding in those
10 last three years while those costs have gone up, and
11 as you can imagine, something has to give. We've for
12 a \$16 million tri-li expense increase. Again, I'm
13 not going to pull my punches. We could have asked
14 for three times amount and though we'd get into a
15 game of negotiation. We respect you too much for
16 that. We've worked too closely with you for too long
17 for that. We know that you know, that we are
18 honestly saying this is what we need if you want us
19 to keep our doors open, our hours where they are,
20 whether you want these services to continue because
21 more New Yorkers depend on the library to meet more
22 of what they need to make this city work for them,
23 and for their children than any other institution in
24 this town for a relative pittance of the city's
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

111

1 budget. I mean the bang for the buck here is really
2 quite astonishing. We do not, you do not want us to
3 make difficult choices about hours or days or
4 programs or buying fewer books. Let's not end up in
5 those bad old days, and mean books seriously.
6 Circulation is up in our libraries. That is perhaps
7 unique nationally. We see huge increases in demand.
8 In the-in the Bronx for instance, in fact in all of
9 our-in all of our branches, the test prep books, you
10 know, that help kids as do our education programs,
11 get ready for the test so that they can get into the
12 schools that they want to. They have to be up to
13 date. The cost keeps going up, and they fly off the
14 shelf, right. Again, it's just one of the ways in
15 which are an integral part of how that kid he used
16 what they're learning in school, and added to that
17 the test prep to grab the opportunities that we want
18 them, that we need them as a city, and as a society
19 to achieve. And then there is the non-eligible
20 capital expense, our and the New York Public Library
21 in Manhattan for instance, the average age of
22 libraries is 84. I used to think that was really
23 old. I'm not as convinced as I was once. [background
24 comments, pause] We are so grateful to be finally
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

112

1 after only 100 years in the City's Ten-Year Capital
2 Plan, but we have repairs to cracked paint, flooring,
3 carpet, broken doors, HVAC repairs, et cetera that we
4 need to address. At the 115th Street Library that we
5 recently proudly name for Harry Belafonte, and really
6 quite a moving ceremony. The floors are coming
7 apart. If we don't fix them now, we will have to
8 replace them at much great cost. At Soundview the
9 HVAC system has failed. At Hamilton Fish we have a
10 DDC delay and HVAC replacement, which means we're
11 going to have to spend our money to keep the place
12 cool during the summer so that the work can continue,
13 and that's to say nothing—I'm leaving aside as Danny
14 has already mentioned our more general issues with,
15 you know, how the DDC Library relationship is going.
16 Our average DDC project is now on average 75% over
17 estimate taking twice as long, in many instances
18 costing twice as much. That's the citizens of New
19 York not getting what they need from their elected
20 officials from all of us in terms of how we do
21 business. Critical maintenance, Jimmy has already
22 mentioned \$60 million, \$20 million each program.
23 That's for larger projects, mechanical systems,
24 energy conversation upgrades, façade, preservation
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

113

1 work, ADA compliance, branches of the sort that—that
2 you have seen images of here. Again, let me just say
3 we didn't come in here asking for the star and the
4 moon. We came in here as honest partners who have
5 worked so closely with you to say if you want us not
6 to fall back, and not to have New Yorkers fall back,
7 if you want us to continue the momentum, which I have
8 to with—with these library presidents has been really
9 a renaissance, a remarkable renaissance in these
10 institutions throughout the city. Help us continue
11 to do that, but don't take my word for it. Listen to
12 our fellow New Yorkers.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you very
15 much. We've--

16 TONY MARX: Oops. How long is the video
17 that we have?

18 LINDA JOHNSON: [off mic] It's less than
19 nine minutes. (sic)

20 TONY MARX: Can we do—can we--?

21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Go right ahead. Sure.

22 TONY MARX: Is that alright then?

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yeah.

24 TONY MARX: Thank you. Please. Sorry. I
25 should have made that clear.

VIDEO PLAYING:

CHILD'S VOICE: I'm getting smarter in
the library because I read more books. I do a lot of
math and ELA, and it's helping me a lot because I'm—
I'm preparing for the State test, and whenever I need
help with my homework, they're there to help me.

AMANDA: The library here and Toddler
Time and the whole Children's section is important to
me and my family because it's—it's really giving us
an anchor in the neighborhood. It is helping my
daughter grow leaps and bounds for her love of books,
for her love of stories. We really count on it every—
pretty much everyday to be here. So, it's great. We
love it.

AMANDA: Literacy Leader is basically a
program that helps kids learn and improve their
reading and writing skills, and my job is to help
them do that, and encourage them to actually enjoy
reading. I have two students Hector and Alvin and
they're both in second grade. Since working with
them I have noticed that their reading level has been
improving, and yesterday Hector he passed me and he
was like, "Look, Amanda, look. I finished all the
books in this level." I'm like that's great.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

115

1
2 FEMALE SPEAKER #1: Okay, I'm dinosaur
3 and it makes me feel good when I [laughter] am
4 computer literate from the library. I took it right
5 away into my work situation, and was able to, you
6 know, do things with Excel that every office needs
7 and even more. I could show other people.

8 FEMALE SPEAKER #2: We do a technology
9 goal classes with like Microsoft Word and inform
10 people about the new technologies that are coming.
11 So, I feel like I'm helping the community and I'm
12 helping myself as well. I'm learning. I was looking
13 for something that would also build up my confidence
14 and because of this confidence I could—I was able to
15 win the presidential election for my National Honor
16 Society.

17 MALE SPEAKER #1: One day I was in the
18 Queens Library and using the computer, and I noticed
19 a flyer that states that they are open for free
20 security training. So, I'm like I've got to got. I
21 got to do this. I got to inquire about this jobs
22 skills training. I was able to develop certain
23 skills that I need to have to get a job. [MUSIC]

24 FEMALE SPEAKER #3: I can do—I can go to
25 the doctor. They provide meds too. Sometimes with

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

116

1 man ahead of it, I'm won't—I am not scared because
2 now I speak a little bit in English. Yeah. They
3 helps me a lot.

4 FEMALE SPEAKER #4: That's Mike Prudent
5 (sic) Get up here. [laughter]

6 FEMALE SPEAKER #5: It's helped me a lot.
7 In the New York City Council it's not so easy, but
8 most of all we feel thankful for all the support and
9 help and contribution, a major contribution for all
10 the Queens Library.

11 FEMALE SPEAKER #6: Using the library and
12 I the library in my life closely. It helped me—I
13 think I was able to merge into the American system or
14 society. It helped me to be—to be comfortable to
15 live in America. I can say that. So, I really
16 grateful for that New York City life. For me it's a
17 part of my life. [MUSIC]

18 MALE SPEAKER #2: Well, at first I joined
19 a program to—just to teach them because I wanted to
20 get more involved with my community, and I wanted to
21 start because I had a lot of problems in my—in my
22 life. When I came out to my parents, it wasn't that
23 easy, and to deal with them, and it wasn't—it wasn't—
24 it was a real tough time, and this program has
25

1 brought me back and helped me cope with it in a
2 different way.

3
4 FEMALE SPEAKER #7: It's help with this—
5 it allows me to be able to see my son. So, it was a
6 great help. It was a blessing, and if it was a
7 blessing to me, I know it would definitely be-be a
8 blessing for many other families the class has added.
9 I definitely look forward to him being able to come
10 and utilize any of the programs that they—that he has
11 like reference to resonate building and helping him
12 to find out about internships, jobs and things like
13 that, it would definitely be well appreciated and as
14 him e being a young black man coming back into
15 society from being incarcerated, I definitely want
16 him to not be a part of the recitative population.
17 So, we say thank you very much, and please continue
18 to support. [MUSIC/END OF VIDEO]

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. That was
20 great. Oh, boy. I don't even know where to begin.
21 I'm sorry I missed the dinner. Let me say that. It
22 was last night right. Yeah.

23 TONY MARX: It was. It was actually
24 delicious.

25 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, good.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

118

1
2 TONY MARX: I hope—I hope Dennis got a
3 funder out of it.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Usually I've been
5 going for the last four or so years, but I couldn't
6 make it last night. Let me just talk a little bit
7 about the \$16 million that you are requesting in
8 operating expenses in the \$60 million in terms of
9 capital. I know that you outlined a lot of the
10 programs that you're doing and that you have these
11 real needs. What can be achieved if you get the full
12 \$16 million? What do you actually intend to use it
13 for? Have you decided where that money will go or is
14 that not yet been actually decided? General support?
15 Are there additional programs? What would it be used
16 for?

17 TONY MARX: I can start. At the Public
18 Library, the vast majority would go to staff costs so
19 wages and the increased benefits again that we all
20 total believe in. That's about \$4.6 million of the
21 seven. Materials, additional materials so adding to
22 our collections because I can't have empty shelves
23 when kids say I got no books at home and now there
24 are no books at the library so a million there, and
25 then about \$1.4 million of the 7 for non-eligible

1 capital costs, and again, this was like just trying
2 to keep us from going under water so that we can
3 continue the momentum that we've been building
4 together as a partnership over these last years.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Uh-hm.

6 LINDA JOHNSON: Yeah, Brooklyn Public
7 Library's breakdown is remarkably similar. I'd say
8 the same thing. You know, we made a commitment to
9 being open at least six days a week in some cases
10 seven, and we haven't had an increase in three years
11 now, and to maintain that level of service, you know,
12 we're stretched very thin, and we need to be—we need
13 to be taking care of staff better than we are today,
14 and the other issue was, of course, collections,
15 which I spoke about but this issue of spending
16 operating money in order to take care of emergency
17 repairs is—is really killing us.

18 DENNIS WALCOTT: The same for us and also
19 for funding of our allies (sic) as well and meeting
20 the meeting the minimum wage requirement, and making
21 sure we have we have the additional dollars for
22 that, and then as Tony and Linda indicated, I mean
23 basically core services as well as collections.
24

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

120

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: It was interesting go
3 hear President Marx speak about the need for
4 materials as well because I know that was an issue in
5 Queens probably in Brooklyn also where I remember a
6 few years ago there was a drive just to get
7 additional new books into the library system. I
8 think you were asking me to for contributions of
9 books themselves or for funding for books and, you
10 know, libraries—and I don't think they should really
11 have to be doing that. That should be something that
12 the city is ensuring happens because that's basically
13 why people go to the libraries.

14 DENNIS WALCOTT: We went through a
15 strategic planning process and did a very
16 comprehensive survey of our public, and collections
17 was number one. I mean people want material, and
18 they want new material, and as you know, Tuesday is
19 New Book Day and the demand when people come into see
20 what new books are on the shelves and making sure we
21 have that available is always something that we try
22 to respond to.

23 TONY MARX: And—and that's in addition to
24 the electronic books that as you've already heard
25 there's simply E-App and you can download. There are

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

121

1 thousands of books already. We hope to add millions
2 more for free. So, if you can't come in, there's
3 books we send to people who have various sight or
4 hearing impairments. I gave you one other poignant
5 example. We—two years, you know for 40 years we've
6 been pushing carts of books around on Rikers Island
7 and the other detention centers in New York. It's
8 totally insufficient in my opinion. I was incredibly
9 proud two or three—I think it was three years ago
10 now, that we opened our first physical branch library
11 in the Rhodes East Facility on Rikers. Just two
12 weeks ago we opened our second one at the Manhattan
13 Detention Center, and the reason why I say this is
14 not only because of what the people who are
15 incarcerated there say about this like only time they
16 feel like society hasn't basically said we are
17 throwing you away that they are—we are doing it with
18 the most powerful thing they can imagine which is
19 books. So that that they can learn, gain skills,
20 imagine the other lives, think about their families
21 and building a new life. And one of the things that
22 just blew me away in both of these facilities we have
23 guards who work there who being shopping bags of
24 books for themselves to add to the collections so
25

1 that we can keep lending more books. I mean this is
2 a--this is what, you know, in difficult circumstance,
3 which God knows Rikers and the detention center are,
4 this is New Yorkers coming together about what we
5 believe in and in each other.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Plus I think you
8 provide the vital resources of the book connections,
9 which is distributed when somebody comes into Rikers
10 Island so that they have resources that they can
11 access once they get out.

12 TONY MARX: Well, and thanks to you all,
13 we have the site visitations. We do the mommy and
14 daddy read with me. We, you know, when someone who
15 is incarcerated says I'm scared to read to my kid. I
16 know how important it is, but because I can't read
17 well enough, we set up programs to help them learn
18 how to read so that they can teach their kids to
19 read. We can't have inherited illiteracy and
20 inherited inequality in New York and in America. We
21 just can't.

22 LINDA JOHNSON: I'd just like to add one
23 thing, which is that we all believe deeply that every
24 great city needs a great library, and I think we all
25 believe New York City is the greatest city in our

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

123

1 country, but we are woefully behind when you look at
2 per capita spending on material on books and that
3 just should not be. It should not be that second and
4 third tier cities in this country are better funded
5 for collections than we are. The other thing, in
6 Brooklyn we have in addition to all the branches what
7 we call deposit collections, over 200 pop-up
8 collections in senior centers and in other places
9 where we know people who will not be—necessarily be
10 able to get to a branch or have access to material if
11 we're not already delivering it to them. So, I mean
12 we all are deeply committed to providing access, and
13 we're doing it in the most creative ways that we can
14 imagine.

16 TONY MARX: So, we're talking about the
17 incarcerated as well. Is it the Brooklyn Library
18 that has the Video Visitation Program?

19 LINDA JOHNSON: Yes.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Can you talk a little
21 bit about that program?

22 LINDA JOHNSON: Yes, it—it started with
23 us, but now we're joined by everyone.

24 TONY MARX: By all 15 sites across the
25 three systems.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS
124

2 DENNIS WALCOTT: Right, we all do.

3 LINDA JOHNSON: We're all doing it now.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: You're all doing it
5 and how is that going? Do you have numbers on it of
6 how many people take advantage of this program?

7 LINDA JOHNSON: Yes, if you'll give me
8 one second, I'll--

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Sure. [pause]

10 LINDA JOHNSON: So, in this Fiscal Year
11 2,500 visits.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: How many?

13 LINDA JOHNSON: 2,500.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: 2,500.

15 LINDA JOHNSON: It's very labor
16 intensive. That's a very large number given the
17 amount of planning that needs to happen in order for
18 it to be lined up with the incarcerated person and
19 the--and the family and the library.

20 TONY MARX: [off mic] I apologize. I see
21 here first of all that we have seen at Rosie's--

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: [interposing] Can you
23 put the mic on--?

24 DENNIS WALCOTT: Tony.

25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS
125

2 TONY MARX: Since we are—the facility our
3 branch at Rosie's a 400% increase in material
4 circulation and we are now doing—I apologize. I am
5 finding the actual number—the visitation number for
6 you. So, I will have to get that to you. I
7 apologize.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: That 2,500, is it
9 Brooklyn?

10 LINDA JOHNSON: Yes.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Wow, wow, it's
12 amazing.

13 LINDA JOHNSON: Across all three systems.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Across all three.
15 Okay that's still an amazing number. I mean, that's
16 really unbelievable.

17 DENNIS WALCOTT: And at—in Queens, we
18 provide the service at our Central as well as at Long
19 Island City, as well as Far Rockaway, which serves as
20 a swing site as well, and I can tell you from Central
21 when we walk in the hallways and the video visitation
22 is taking place, you can just hear the emotion and
23 the connection, and the value that it brings to the
24 families and as articulated by the woman in the video

1 as well, and that truly captures I think the dynamic
2 of what's happening for the video visitation.
3

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I think the woman in
5 the video said the key to lowering recidivism rates
6 is keeping families together. So, you know, it takes
7 at least 12 hours to get up, go and get on the bus,
8 go over to Rikers, go through the visitation center.
9 Get on another bus to go to the prison, to go and
10 then wait another hour and then see the person. It's
11 a whole day thing for people. So, this is a—a
12 tremendous program for them to be able to take
13 advantage of.

14 LINDA JOHNSON: And, of course, it's all
15 centered around reading. So, it elevates the
16 importance of reading in a family, and frankly, if a
17 child is going to visit a parent, it means missing an
18 entire day of school.

19 TONY MARX: [off mic] And we have—

20 DENNIS WALCOTT: The mic, Tony.

21 TONY MARX: --well corrections. We
22 circulate 13,000 copies of those a year, as you
23 gotten—it's gotten bigger and bigger and what I find
24 incredibly powerful is, you know, the folks coming
25 off of Rikers, the first stop on the bus stop when

1 you get to Manhattan is right in front on the library
2 on 125th Street right before the bridge there.

3 That's their first stop. They know they can use
4 computers for free. They know they can let their
5 family know by email or—or however that they're—
6 that're they're out. They can start researching
7 immediately. With our help, options for places to
8 live for how to gain skills, how to get jobs, and
9 we're not satisfied that that's good enough. With
10 your help as part of Ten-Year Capital Plan we'll be
11 spending about \$20 million on just that branch to
12 make it absolutely what it should be. We want the
13 New Yorkers who have had the unfortunate experience
14 of spending time forcibly on Rikers Island to come
15 off and come first into our library and see that New
16 Yorkers actually are in investing in them and
17 believing in them. With the books, with the
18 communication, with the programs, but even with the
19 power of what a space says about respect for people,
20 and that's what—an image that we need if we want
21 folks to rebuild their lives.

22
23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Another program that
24 was very popular. My mom was in a nursing home, and

1 she really enjoyed the Library by Mail I think it's
2 called.

4 TONY MARX: Uh-huh, available.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: and-and having the
6 large print book boy that was-that was fantastic for
7 seniors that find themselves in that situation. So,
8 another fantastic program. I know that you've all
9 been mentioning capital and we do have some
10 questioned around capital. So, the Library's
11 Executive Commitment Plan includes \$1.15 billion in
12 Fiscal 18 to 22. Yet in Fiscal 17 the library system
13 committed only \$18.5 million or 4.3% of its annual
14 Capital Plan of \$433.6 million. Why do the libraries
15 only get-manage to commit that 4.3%? What's holding
16 it up? We want to know and we want to try to work on
17 that with you.

18 TONY MARX: I'm sorry you aske, Mr.
19 Chairman. [laughter] We-and we're happy to share
20 with you these statistics. We've done it before.
21 When we do our projects, when we manage our projects
22 ourselves, and-and that's true of our largest
23 projects, whether it's the private investment in the
24 Schwartzman Building or the largely city investment,
25 but matched by us with private funding in the new

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

129

1 Mid-Manhattan, which will be this fabulous Central
2 Library in Manhattan that has never existed as far as
3 I can tell. When we do that ourselves compared to
4 when we work with DDC and we respect the hard work
5 that they're doing, it literally takes twice as long
6 and costs twice as much money, and that's on average.
7 There are outliers way beyond that. Iris here could
8 tell you some fabulous stories. The—I'm be
9 facetious. The—the—this is craziness. I understand
10 that this was designed to provide necessary
11 oversight, and we will accept any oversight that
12 anyone wants because our record is without blemish.
13 Let us do these projects for ourselves so that you
14 bet twice as much bang for your buck, so that the
15 citizens of New York don't have to wait twice as long
16 for the libraries they deserve, and elected
17 officials— I have had friends and colleagues on the
18 City Council who invested millions of dollars in
19 projects. They get—got held up and then never
20 happened while they were still sitting on the City
21 Council. That's crazy. Just the current DDC
22 projects currently are roughly on average 75% now
23 over the original estimate. Time goes by. It costs
24 more. We've got projects that are close to 100% over
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

130

1 the original estimate, and we have to make up the
2 difference in the funding never mind the money we
3 have to borrow to—when we do our own projects and
4 have to wait for the city reimburse us. Look, I
5 don't want to—I—I want to be clear. WE are
6 incredibly grateful to be in the Ten-Year Capital
7 Plan. We are incredibly grateful for getting
8 systemic infrastructural work done at a scale that
9 has never happened before, but the roofs are still
10 leaking, the librarians are still running around with
11 buckets in order to catch instead of running around
12 helping catch that kid who's falling behind in
13 school, and that's just--that just can't be in New
14 York. [pause]

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I remember with the
17 Queens Library, Council Member Chair Van Bramer was
18 there for the design and eight years later after he
19 got elected to the City Council, it finally opened
20 up. So, can you—I—I—can you be more specific. Where
21 do you think it's being held up in DDC? What—what is
22 it that we need to look at to make that—to make that
23 happen?

24 LINDA JOHNSON: The problem is that it's—
25 it's happening at absolutely every stage from going

1 out for bid to procurement, finding that you've got a
2 contractor that's been selected, but then it's seems
3 as actually on a list of contractors that the city is
4 no longer allowed to do business with. I mean it is
5 absolutely at every stage of the construction
6 process.
7

8 DENNIS WALCOTT: And to add to add to
9 that, so obviously we know about the case where Chair
10 Van Bramer's library at Hunter's Point, and where we
11 are and where we are not, and the delays and the
12 delays and the delays that are taking place, and we
13 can talk about that, but I'll put another library on
14 the table in Far Rockaway, and that Far Rockaway is,
15 which is pivotal to the redevelopment of the Far
16 Rockaway area, and that bid came in extremely high.
17 I mean it was so high it was ridiculous and only as a
18 result of working with OMB and the City and the
19 elected officials were we able to get funding to meet
20 the high responses, and so it even starts there. But
21 then there are construction delays and issues, and
22 challenges and gaps in communication and there are a
23 whole host of things, and as I indicated, I think at
24 prior hearings, I'm—I'm spoiled in that when I was
25 Chancellor we had the School Construction Authority,

1 and obviously a different type of animal, a different
2 creation, but I always cite the case where we built a
3 school. Well, quite frankly, three schools up in the
4 South Bronx along the rail yards that were
5 contaminated. We remediated it, built three schools,
6 and opened them up in three years. Three years
7 remediated the land, spent \$240 million and as a
8 result of that, the community had something right
9 away. Part of the challenge is for us at least, and
10 that we have to get money from here, we have to get
11 money from there, and you're putting funding packers
12 together. As Tony so ably put it, then when we're
13 not doing it ourselves when we have to go through DDC
14 and the breakdown takes place with them, but also in
15 fairness just in the way the funding evolves as well,
16 and I think there has to be a better to do this.
17 This is unacceptable. It's unacceptable to me. It's
18 unacceptable to you as elected officials, but most
19 importantly, it's unacceptable to the public at
20 large, and we have to find— I mean we're all
21 creative, intelligent individuals. We shouldn't
22 allow politics to interfere with putting a better
23 mousetrap in place to allow us to build libraries in
24 a more efficient way. [background comments, pause]
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

133

1
2 LINDA JOHNSON: It is true that the
3 funding structure is creating a lot of the problem,
4 and it's creating a situation where there are stops
5 and starts.

6 DENNIS WALCOTT: Yes.

7 LINDA JOHNSON: And, you know, we're
8 excited frankly this year because we might actually
9 hit 50% commitment rate. We're excited about that.
10 Just think about it. I mean that's--

11 TONY MARX: So, the improvement over 1%.
12 What--what you're getting was not because of anything
13 we were lacking to do, but let me be clear in the
14 answer to the question, Mr. Chairman. In our view
15 the DDC has done a good job of estimating costs.
16 They're estimates are out of date. There--the
17 contractors have learned that because it takes twice
18 as long that they should charge a premium to doing
19 business with DDC. So, the bids come in at close to
20 twice the price because they know that's what it's
21 going to cost, and then you just have a vicious cycle
22 that keeps going in the wrong direction as well as a
23 lack of competition with DDC's prequalified bidders.
24 Let me give you an example: Close to Queens in
25 Queens Roosevelt Island we have a branch there.

1 We've been waiting four years for the, you know, sort
2 of final go-ahead, and in those four years the
3 construction estimate has gone up from—it was \$4.1
4 million and it's now \$3.1 million more. So, it's 75%
5 increased. In those four years of waiting to give
6 the good people of Roosevelt Island the branch that
7 they deserve I don't know, just down at the other of
8 the island Cornell seems to be able to build
9 something much bigger probably much more complicated
10 as a science facility at a whole lot faster and
11 cheaper, you know, for, you know, as a result. So,
12 something is not working here. I apologize. You
13 asked me and I'm trying to be honest.

14
15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I really want to hear
16 it. It happened to me in the Elmhurst Library as
17 well. We finally do have a beautiful library.

18 TONY MARX: Uh-hm.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And insanity to me is
20 doing the same thing over, over again and getting—
21 thinking you're going to get different results. I've
22 also heard, and—and I'll say it in regards to the
23 Elmhurst Library the, discussion that I've had with
24 President Walcott that when a mistake is made in the
25 design, you can't use capital dollars to fix the

1 mistake because that has to last for five years
2
3 before you can then add capital dollars to it again
4 even though the mistake was there from the get-go. So
5 this is again another piece of insanity.

6 TONY MARX: No, we know from
7 conversations not only with the City Council, but the
8 folks on the Mayor's side and his senior team.
9 Everybody understands that we have an issue here that
10 New Yorkers need us to solve. It may not be the sort
11 the tabloid news of the day, right. It doesn't sort
12 of grab at that, you know, sort of terrible single
13 human tragedy, but it is an ongoing tragedy for the
14 governance of this city, and the finances of this
15 city. And as far as I can tell, everyone that I talk
16 to at the City Council and everyone I talk to on the
17 Mayor's side are in agreement we need to find a
18 solution that works, and—and respect the—the good
19 folks who work at DDC and the DC37 members who were
20 there were not. We—we understand that this is going
21 to be complicated, but we also understand the current
22 system is not working.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Right, and think we—I
24 think we need some type of a Design-Build situation
25 for just the libraries as well, but anyway, I want to

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

136

1 turn it over to Chair Van Bramer, but I want to
2 announce that we've been joined by Majority Leader
3 Laurie Cumbo, by Council Member Karen Koslowitz and
4 Council Member Joe Borelli, and Council Member Van
5 Bramer.
6

7 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Thank you very
8 much. So, I'm going to be relatively brief because I
9 think we've covered a lot of ground already, but I
10 think it is imperative for us to repeat where all of
11 you were during your testimony, which is we have done
12 some great things over the last several years. We
13 have restored six-day service. We have baselined
14 six-day service. We have put libraries in the Ten-
15 Year Capital Plan. We've added hundreds of millions
16 of dollars, and yet there is more to do, and all of
17 you have come in here responsibly with a very
18 reasonable requests: \$16 million on the expense side
19 in a budget of \$90 billion is a rounding error, and
20 what it would for the people of the city of New York
21 is incalculable in many ways. So, this council has
22 always led the way. In fact, we have pushed the
23 other side of City Hall in many cases to a place of
24 supporting libraries in a meaningful way, and I
25 believe it will continue to do that. The \$60 million

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

137

1 again a drop in the bucket and, you know, the—the
2 situation with the Department of Design and
3 Construction is one that boggles the mind, and is so
4 frustrating, and we've all become experts in
5 construction of—of these capital projects because I
6 feel like we have to manage them almost ourselves,
7 and—and that shouldn't be, but I think some people
8 throw up their hands when it comes to the DDC and
9 these capital projects because everyone knows that
10 it's a disaster, but yet the fix isn't there yet,
11 and—and we need it. It's absolutely a disgrace that
12 the people of the City of New York it is their tax
13 dollars that are going into these projects, and then
14 they are not seeing the return on their investment in
15 any kind of timely manner. As Chair Dromm mentioned,
16 I worked for the Queens Library 20 years ago, and
17 some of those projects started 15 years ago, and only
18 now are we seeing some of those projects come to
19 fruition that I get to go to the ribbon cuttings. As
20 the chair of the committee, on a project that I
21 remember starting 15 years as a staff member of the
22 library, that's insanity. Chair Dromm's Elmhurst
23 Library is one of those examples, but there are
24 plenty of others all across the city of New York.
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

138

1 So, we've got to do better, but I want to speak to
2 all of the library supporters, and you know, we're
3 not allowed to officially clap here, but when like
4 something and we agree we do this, right. So, how
5 many of you think that libraries deserve \$16 million
6 at a minimum? And how many of you think that \$16
7 million is a drop in the bucket and we should get
8 that as well? And now many think that library
9 workers are the best people in the city of New York.
10 [laughter] So, I just want to say the Council and
11 certainly myself, and I know we have an amazing
12 collection of Council Members, who are on this dais
13 who believe that libraries, the truth is we call
14 ourselves and rightfully so, and we defend our right
15 to be a sanctuary city, but libraries were the
16 sanctuary before we started talking about sanctuary
17 cities. You are the sanctuary in the sanctuary
18 cities, and-and-and I know the Queens Library where
19 the New Americans Program was started over 40 years
20 ago that's how far ahead libraries are of the rest of
21 society when it comes to decency and democracy and
22 making sure that every single person is valued, every
23 single person has access, every single person no
24 questions asked can come and be at home and be safe.
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

139

1 All of you save New Yorkers every single day, but you
2 can't do that unless the doors are open. You can't
3 do that if the roof is leaking. You can't do that if
4 there's no AC in the summer and no heat in the
5 winter. So, we've been there. We have accomplished
6 some great things particularly in the last four years
7 on behalf of libraries, but we have a ways to go, and
8 I would just suggest again every time you play that
9 video, you can't play enough, you can't show people
10 enough what you're doing to impact the lives of our
11 constituents. If we are committed to one city, if we
12 are committed ending inequality, then the quickest
13 and best way to do that is to support public
14 libraries absolutely no questions asked because you
15 do that better than any other institution in this
16 city. You always have and you always will as long as
17 you have all of these great library workers with you
18 supporting you and doing that work. So, I don't
19 think you need to have to any questions from me
20 because you know where I am. This is my life's work.
21 This is my 20th budget either chairing this committee
22 or working on behalf of libraries, 20 years of being
23 at this hearing, and I'm still fighting as hard as I
24 did that first time. Thank you to the person who
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

140

1 went up there like that, and I just want to say thank
2 you to everyone for fighting the good fight, and
3 certainly I'm going to be fighting for this money.
4 This is incredibly important. All of you need it,
5 and our people need it more importantly. So, thank
6 you. Thank you DC37 for being out there at the rally
7 in a big way earlier today. Appreciate the support
8 of great leaders like Henry Garrido and—and so many
9 of the—the working people of the city of New York who
10 make our libraries work. So, thank you, Chair Dromm.
11 Thank you to my colleagues. I know other folks have
12 questions, but I want to make a statement, which is
13 you deserve this money. You need this money. You
14 should get this money. Thank you very much.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you, Chair Van
17 Bramer. We have questions now from Council Member
18 Moya followed by Adams and then Borelli.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Thank you to Chair
20 Dromm and to Chair Van Bramer. I'm about to
21 embarrass myself a little bit so if you'll indulge
22 me, my colleagues. As I've always said my mother who
23 watches this consistently texted me and asked if Mr.
24 Walcott would look into the camera and wave at here.
25 [laughter] So, yes. Thank you.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

141

1 DENNIS WALCOTT: How much is that worth?

2 [laughter]

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I have to—I mean
4 given the embarrassment, I have now—

5 DENNIS WALCOTT: It's a mother because
6 somebody mentioned that to me outside as well. So, I
7 will--

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I can deal with the
9 embarrassment now than deal with her wrath later.
10 So, thank you for—[laughter]—indulging me and to my
11 mom who is always watching.

12 DENNIS WALCOTT: Thank you, sir.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: So, I thank you—
14 thank you for—for being here. I also want to
15 reiterate how important the funding is for our
16 libraries. Growing up in Corona being an avid user
17 of the Corona Library I know what it means to have
18 these programs come through. The programs that we
19 see for the Adult Learners Program has been a—a
20 tremendous advantage for us, but as Chair Van Bramer
21 said, the New Americans Program is so critical for us
22 in communities like mine where we have high immigrant
23 communities. These services are—are just vital for
24 my constituency. The job that you all do is
25

1
2 incredible. I couldn't think of where we could be
3 investing more than in our libraries, and if you come
4 to Corona, you will see that we're busting at the
5 seams, but there is just such a great energy when you
6 look into the eyes of these children and adults who
7 go in there because that is their only opportunity
8 that most of them have to access to the Internet, the
9 ability to learn a new language. This is very, very
10 important for us and I think that I-I stand with my
11 colleagues in saying \$16 million is-is-is nothing.
12 We should be pushing for more, and I think that this
13 is a top priority for myself, and I know my
14 colleagues here, but just really quickly. Can you
15 just tell me where we are with the Corona Library if
16 we've made any progress?

17 DENNIS WALCOTT: As you know, we had a
18 meeting with you and the Borough President and the
19 Assembly Member and also I think representative from
20 the State Senator's Office to discuss the Corona
21 Library. My VP of Capital who is the audience is
22 working on the project. We've submitted some ideas,
23 and our goal is to move forward. As you know, we're
24 also engaging with the community group that wanted us
25 to be sensitive to the property that we own adjacent

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

143

1 to the library itself, and I think as we indicated in
2 the meeting that we understand where they're coming
3 from and want to deal with the essence of the
4 individual they say lived in the house next door and
5 how we incorporate that into the designs. But we're
6 moving forward as far as ideas on the Corona Library,
7 and again, we want to build the connection between
8 the existing library as well as with the house and
9 knock down the house, and then build up an extension
10 there. So, we are moving forward on our design plan,
11 but also being sensitive to the community as far as
12 some of the suggestions they want us to incorporate
13 in preserving the essence of Crockett Johnson.

14
15 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Great, and thank
16 you so much.

17 DENNIS WALCOTT: Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you, Council
19 Member Adams.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Good afternoon,
21 Presidents Johnson, Marx and my beloved President
22 Dennis Walcott. So happy to see you all here today,
23 and I am so upset that I didn't wear my T-shirt. I
24 am a proud former member of the Queens Public Library
25 Board of Trustees, and we are the body that so

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

144

1 proudly brought Dennis Walcott to the system that we
2 are just bursting at the seams with pride at the work
3 that he has done and continues to do for the Borough
4 of Queens for all of us especially I-I-I consider he
5 came in at a very tumultuous time, and he really,
6 really came in and just took the bull by the horns
7 when we were having such a difficult time in Queens,
8 and I have thanked him, but I can't thank him enough
9 for the work that he has done and continues to do.
10 That experience for me was one of the most valuable
11 experiences of a lifetime. You will always have an
12 advocate in me--

14 DENNIS WALCOTT: Thank you.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: --for our
16 libraries. I grew up in St. Albans so I practically
17 lived at the library, and the work that we do across
18 the board in New York is an amazing work for adults,
19 for children alike. It is unmatched, and as my
20 colleagues have said, and we will continue to say, we
21 will fight for the funding that you need, and \$16
22 million in a mere drop in the bucket. We all know
23 that. All of us up here know that, and we will fight
24 for that--for that and then some. We have seen in the
25 past the issues of DDC. I can tell you personally

1 behind the scenes it is a nightmare and there is no
2 reason that in year 2018 that we should still be held
3 hostage to a system that cannot seem to work itself
4 out when it comes to the building, the maintenance
5 and the expansion of our libraries. So that said, my
6 only question is going to have to do with
7 initiatives, and the initiatives that we are proud of
8 here in the city. What is the role that the
9 libraries are playing when it comes to the city's
10 First Readers Initiative? I'm a big fan of South
11 Jamaica Reads and Link and I'd just like to hear
12 about that initiative. Thank you.

14 DENNIS WALCOTT: [pause] So, I'll pick
15 up on the South Jamaica program in that we have, as
16 you know, a very collaborative relationship as a
17 result of both funding from the city, the library and
18 the Foundation as well, and looking to expand that,
19 and as I think Tony has indicated and what I've also
20 done is met with the Chancellor on collaboration with
21 Department of Education and making sure we expand
22 both the reading initiatives that we have in place,
23 but also around our UPK Programs as well. So, we're
24 definitely involved in that process, but with South

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

146

Jamaica Reads [bell] that is a primary programmatic
thrust for us as far as our outreach is concerned.

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Are we dittoing
that, President?

LINDA JOHNSON: We'll ditto it and we'll
give you some numbers. Last year we had 229-279,000
children enrolled in the first who benefitted and
attended programs in the First Read Program, and we
were very grateful for the funding that we got for
that program so-

TONY MARX: At the New York Public
Library, as I mentioned, we're now about three-
quarters of a million visits to our Early Literacy
Programs. You know, we just can't keep up, but we've
got to keep up. We've seen the circulation of
material from youth since FY16 go up by close to
600%--600%. The--and we have delivered over 105,000
early literacy kits over the last three years.
Again, with thanks to the City Council's support. .

DENNIS WALCOTT: And just to fill in the
numbers, with our Toddler Learning Center we have
served 1,170 families through 78 of our programs in
our kickoff to kindergarten, our K2K Program. We
have served 675 families through 45 of our programs,

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

147

1 and then we have our Universal Pre-K, which serves 36
2 students, and then we have overall children services
3 which have basically served over—close to 469,000
4 children through 30,000 program contacts.
5

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: That's amazing.

7 We know that those numbers are going to do nothing
8 but increase and increase and increase. So, we're
9 very proud of your work, and we're very grateful for
10 everything that you do. Thank you for your testimony
11 today.

12 DENNIS WALCOTT: Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Thank you. Oh,
14 and you got your shirt. [laughter] It's nice. Ask
15 and ye shall receive. I love it. Alright, I know
16 that Commissioner Finkelppearl is in the wings. So,
17 we are rounding out and closing out here. So, I know
18 Council Member Cumbo and Koslowitz are here for
19 questions, and then we will wrap up the Libraries
20 portion of the hearing.

21 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I don't have a
22 question, but I just have a comment. I've just been
23 so very pleased as a new mother seeing all of the
24 educational programs for children and babies. As you
25 know, we go to Wednesdays reading time at 10:00 and

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

148

1 then we stay for the second session at 10:30 a.m. and
2 I was even more excited when I learned that you had
3 Japanese as well as Spanish speaking classes for
4 babies as well. And so we're debating about which
5 one we're actually going to take. But I would have
6 never seen that lens of the library if not for my
7 son, and so I understand as a new mom just how
8 expensive all of these classes and programs are
9 throughout the city, and an average class or
10 opportunity for a baby for like a 12-week session is
11 like \$400 anywhere in the city for just about
12 anything. And so, to have this free opportunity is
13 valuable and anybody watching out there on television
14 I encourage you bring your child to the muse—excuse
15 me—to the library. I'm getting ready for the next
16 presentation. Bring your children to the library
17 because they have so many great programs and they're
18 free, and they've got Elmo and they've got all the
19 toys and they've got other babies in order to
20 interact with. So, that's been such a great pleasure
21 for me and—and I hope that we can and the Council
22 find ways to continue because early education like
23 really early education for babies shouldn't be only
24 for the wealthy, and it shouldn't be only for the
25

1 well connected. It should be for everyone, and so
2 the library certainly levels the playing field for
3 that. So, children of all economic backgrounds,
4 races, religions, geography can take advantage of the
5 programs. So, my son has sold me, and I am
6 definitely a huge supporter of the work that you do.
7 Thank you.

8
9 LINDA JOHNSON: Well, we thank your son
10 and it's my goal to get you guys in for the next big
11 play date, which will be really nice.

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: [interposing]
13 Yes, I'm so upset I missed that, but we will be at
14 the very next one. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you, Council
16 Member Koslowitz.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Thank you.
18 [coughs] I do not have a question. I just want to
19 say thank you, thank you to Dennis Walcott. Queens
20 is very lucky to have you. You've made my 1993
21 vision of the library in Rego Park a reality in 2018.
22 So, I just want to say thank you, thank you, thank
23 you.

24 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: So, I think
25 we've learned a few things here today. Dennis Walcott

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

150

1 is beloved by all. Mrs. Moya watches a lot of TV,
2 and I know that we will all have arrived when she
3 tells her son, could you ask Jimmy, Danny, Karen, and
4 Adrienne to wave to the camera.
5

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Let's do it now.

7 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: We love you,
8 Mrs. Moya. So, I just want to say in closing this
9 great to hear the level of support for libraries from
10 all of the colleagues here. I think you know that we
11 believe in you. We believe in everyone here the work
12 that you do, and I know that when I worked for the
13 Queens Library, I felt so good knowing that every
14 single day I came to work helping people, and I hope
15 every single person who works for one of these three
16 systems does that as well that you feel you own
17 that. That every single day all of those libraries
18 over 200 libraries, every single day you are changing
19 the world for the better. Each of you is doing that
20 for the people of the city of New York. You should
21 all feel incredibly proud to work for our public
22 library systems, and we here on this side need to
23 make sure that we're continuing to give you the
24 resources to do all of that work. So, I want to
25 thank all of our colleagues, and thank the chairs of

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

151

the respective committees, but also the three
presidents and CEOs for representing today.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you, Chair Van
Bramer. We'll now take a 10-minute break, and then
we will come back for the Department of Cultural
Affairs. [pause for break] [background comments,
pause] [gavel] Okay, we will now resume the City
Council's hearing on the Mayor's Executive Budget for
Fiscal 2019. The Finance Committee is joined by the
Committee on Cultural Affairs, Libraries and
International Group Relations Chaired by Council
Member Jimmy Van Bramer. We just heard from the
Library System, and now we will hear from the
Commissioner of the Department of Cultural Affairs
Tom Finkelpearl, and in the interest of time, I will
forego making an opening statement, but before--
[background comments, pause] Okay, but before we open
them--before we hearing testimony, I'll open the mic
to my Co-Chair Council Member Van Bramer.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Thank you very
Chair Dromm. I'll be very brief only to say that I
am thrilled that City Council has over the last four
years in particular dramatically increased the City
Council Cultural initiatives to record funding

1 levels. We've also successfully joined and pushed
2 for what is now the largest budget that the
3 department has seen and is able to allocate
4 particularly for our program groups. We've seen
5 amazing increases on cultural capital, but we still
6 need more, and I look forward to hearing from the
7 Commissioner and working with him to advocate for the
8 additional funding and for baselining once and for
9 all this cultural funding, which is so absolutely
10 essential. We have got to take our cultural
11 organizations, our cultural groups out of any
12 political ping-pong match and make sure that this
13 funding is permanent and baselined and increased
14 because we know the difference it's making in the
15 city of New York. We know how important this funding
16 is, and we absolutely must increase it and baseline
17 it. So anxious to hear the testimony, but I want to
18 make sure that we are all forcefully advocating on
19 behalf of this community that we so love.

21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you,
22 Chair Van Bramer and Commissioner it's great to see
23 you. Whenever you're ready to start.

24 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yes.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

153

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Oh, excuse me. We
need to swear you in.

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yes.

LEGAL COUNSEL: Do you affirm that your
testimony will be truthful to the best of your
knowledge, information and belief?

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: I do. Okay.
Good afternoon--

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: [interposing] It's
just that I think of you still as my Queens Museum
Director. You get Dennis with the Administration now.

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: I'm with the
Administration now. Good afternoon, Chair Van Bramer
and members of the committee. I am Cultural Affairs
Commissioner Tom Finkelpearl here today to testify in
regards to the Mayor's Fiscal 2019 Executive Budget
Proposal for the Department of Cultural Affairs. I'm
joined by a number of my staff from the agency. I'll
begin with a look at the numbers. DCLA's total FY19
Executive Budget is \$145.3 million. By comparison at
this point last year, our FY18 Executive Budget was
\$143.1. The FY19 Executive Budget includes \$28.5
million for the Cultural Development Fund; \$108.3
million for the Cultural Institutions Group; \$1.25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

154

1 million energy support for groups on city property
2 under the Cultural Affairs; \$6.1 million for energy
3 operations—agency operations; and \$1 million for
4 capacity building other agency programs. As always,
5 these figures do not include the excellent City
6 Council initiatives that are typically added at
7 adoption. I'm happy to report that we have baselined
8 the \$1.25 million in energy support for cultural
9 groups on DCLA property. This group consists of 10
10 diverse organizations around the city from BRIC and
11 Wheatsville in Brooklyn to Ardennes (sic) Theater in
12 the Bronx. We first proposed this funding on a one-
13 time basis in 20—in Fiscal Year 17, and again in
14 Fiscal 18. This baselined funding will provide a
15 source of stable support for these groups that server
16 as community anchors for their respective
17 neighborhoods. Have you ever been to a Celebrate
18 Brooklyn concert or a seen a performance at Harlem
19 Stage, you can appreciate the vitality and vibrancy
20 of this particular group of organizations. [coughs]
21 DCLA's Four-Year Capital Budget, which I testified on
22 at the Preliminary Budget Hearing in March is
23 unaffected by the Executive Budget. It allocates
24 \$933.84 million to projects for 250 cultural groups
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS
155

2 citywide. This investment continues to provide
3 extraordinary cultural facilities accessible to all
4 New Yorkers. Just yesterday I joined National Museum
5 of American Indian Director Kevin Gover just a few
6 blocks south of here to cut the ribbon on the new
7 Imaginations Activity Center with funding from the
8 Mayor, City Council and Madam Borough President. The
9 multi-million dollar upgrade transformed office space
10 into a modernized education and exhibition space that
11 engaged young visitors in learning native innovations
12 throughout history, and next month, we'll help cut
13 the ribbon on a much anticipated Ocean Wonders:
14 Sharks! Exhibit at the New York Aquarium in Coney
15 Island. This project represents a major city
16 investment marking a milestone in the institution's
17 recovery from Hurricane Sandy. As of the Executive
18 Budget, DCLA's FY18 Modified Budget is now \$186.5
19 million. This remains the largest allocation in
20 agency history and the largest public source of
21 cultural funding anywhere in the United States
22 outside of the federal government. We proud to work
23 alongside the City Council to make these historic
24 investments. The roadmap provided by the Create NYC
25 Cultural Plan has made this extraordinary year of

1 progress and new beginnings in the cultural
2 community. One big theme that ran through our
3 hundreds of meetings with tens of thousands of
4 interactions with the public through the Create NYC
5 engagement process was a strong desire for more
6 integration of cultural activity across city
7 government. People saw opportunities for arts to
8 enrich a wide spectrum of public services. They also
9 identified a range of new and existing services that
10 could help artists in wider cultural communities to
11 stay and thrive in New York City. It's important to
12 understand that culture has long been integrated to
13 programs across city agencies. With so---with full
14 support of the Mayor and City Hall, art and culture
15 are valued across a wide range of portfolios that may
16 not typically---typically be linked to the arts. This
17 is not---this not only brings remarkable of culture to
18 the city services, but directs hundreds of million of
19 dollars to artists and cultural workers. Even in
20 agencies with a long history of support the arts,
21 we've seen a major boost in support on this
22 Administration and City Council. For instance, the
23 Department of Cultural---the Department of Education
24 alone invested more than \$400 million in arts
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

157

1 education last fiscal year, an all-time high thanks
2 to the Mayor and City Council's \$23 million increase
3 in arts education funding. DOE employed 2,770 full-
4 time art teachers last year, 377 more in the—than in
5 the 2013-2014 school year, a remarkable fact that
6 marks a major investment in the future of the city.
7 Some other ways city agencies beyond DCLA are working
8 to support culture include these. Just this month
9 First Lady Chirlane McCray under the Department of
10 Correction announced a pilot program designed to
11 allow mothers, currently—currently incarcerated at
12 Rikers Island to visit and participate in activities
13 and their children—wit their children at the
14 Children's Museum in Manhattan. By providing
15 incarcerated parents and their children the
16 opportunity to engage in creative, supportive
17 contacts. They can reconnect simply as parent and
18 child instead of incarcerated parent and child. In
19 this way the power of culture reduces some of the
20 most oppressive burdens of incarceration. Last
21 month, the Mayor's Office of Media and Entertainment
22 announced the five—the Women's Fund, a \$5 million
23 grant program to support film and theater projects
24 by, for and about women. This is a major investment
25

1
2 in expanding the voices that are heard in our
3 creative community, but it's also just one of a range
4 of programs at MOMA that MOMA has launched to list of
5 creators from diverse backgrounds and we're proud to
6 work alongside them on these efforts. The City's
7 first ever Office of Night Life was created thanks to
8 the leadership of the Council especially Council
9 Member Espinal. In March, Mayor de Blasio appointed
10 Ariel Palitz as the first Executive Director.
11 Members of the City's DIY community were among the
12 most vocal and passionate advocates throughout the
13 cultural plan process. We were thrilled to see that
14 one of Ariel's first public engagements at the Secret
15 Project Robot in Bushwick where she heard first hand
16 the range of issues putting pressure on our vibrant
17 and diverse and DIY spaces. We look forward to
18 working with this new office to continue the dialogue
19 around supporting safe, vibrant nightlife. Along NYC
20 EDC and the Mayor's Office, DCLA continues to build
21 on the Mayor's commitment to expand the supply of
22 affordable artist work space. With a \$30 million
23 capital commitment to the Affordable Real Estate for
24 Artists Initiative or the AREA Initiative, we've
25 dedicated—we're dedicate to keeping artists in here

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS
159

2 in New York City. So much of our creative energy
3 comes from being a city where art isn't just
4 displayed and sold but actually made. We also want
5 to make sure that the arts remain deeply connected
6 and rooted to the communities where they're made.
7 Tens of thousands of square feet of projects are in
8 the works including the Peninsula in the Bronx and
9 Art Belt Brooklyn at the Brooklyn Army Terminal. We
10 plan to announce additional projects in the coming
11 months. Another interagency cultural partner-
12 partnership is not new, but continues to reach new
13 heights in its 40th year. The one and only Materials
14 For the Arts based in Chair Van Bramer's district in
15 Long Island City, Queens is a collaboration between
16 DCLA the Department of Education and Department of
17 Sanitation. We like to say that MFTA was green
18 before green-when green was still just a color
19 diverting millions of pounds of waste from the
20 landfill each year. This year it will provide
21 materials valued at over \$9 million to thousands of
22 cultural non-profits, public schools and city
23 programs entirely free of charge. To put that in
24 perspective, that's roughly the amount of funding
25 that the city of Philadelphia will provide to

1 culture. Next we—we did some London's Culture
2 government and Sanitation sectors are visiting for
3 three days to learn more about MFTA with an eye
4 toward setting up their own version. We're proud
5 that his remarkable organization was started and
6 continues to thrive right here in New York. In my
7 March testimony on the Preliminary FY19 Budget I
8 provided more in-depth updates on the Mayor's grant
9 for cultural impact and the Public Artists and
10 Residents programs. These are just a few of the ways
11 DCLA is working with fellow agencies to build
12 programming around the power of culture address some
13 of our most intractable issues. Now, for a few
14 updates on our efforts to promote a more diverse,
15 equitable and inclusive cultural sector since the
16 March budget hearing. [coughs] We announced the
17 Create NYC Leadership Accelerator in March to help
18 mid-level cultural workers grow into leadership
19 positions. The demographic survey of DCLA grantees
20 released in 2016 showed that there is far less
21 diversity at the top of the org chart for many
22 cultural groups. This data highlights barriers
23 within the sector that prevent advancement for under-
24 represented groups. The Leadership Accelerator
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

161

1 Program participants will examine systematic issues
2 that prevent more than—more diverse leadership.

3 Twenty-five individuals will take part in this pilot
4 starting at the end of this month, and we hope to
5 expand it in the future. We announced another
6 exciting outgrowth of the Cultural Plan on May 7th.

7 The CreateNYC Disability Forward Fund will offer a
8 total \$350,000 for programs that deepen the

9 engagement in the arts for people with disabilities
10 as artists, cultural workers and art exhibits. (sic)

11 Promoting greater access and inclusion in the arts
12 for people with disabilities is one of the

13 cornerstones of CreateNYC. Through this new fund, we
14 want to expand existing programs and invest in new

15 efforts from workforce training to disability art
16 programs. We're eager to see how our cultural

17 constituents respond to this call to action.

18 Applications are due on June 1st so please spread the
19 word among your constituents. Additional information

20 is available at NYC.gov/culture. On May 4th the
21 latest group of CUNY Cultural Core students

22 celebrated their graduation at Lehman College in the
23 Bronx. Supported by DCL and the Rockefeller

24 Foundation these extraordinary students, more that
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

162

1 120 of them, had paid internships with 62 cultural
2 partners. To date, two-over 230 students have
3 completed the CUNY Cultural Core Program. About 20%
4 of participants have received job offers from the
5 host sites, and many have gone onto explore careers
6 or areas of study in arts and culture. The Cultural
7 Core has brought hundreds of students into the
8 cultural community who might not otherwise have
9 considered the arts as a career path. Meanwhile,
10 cultural organizations have been thrilled with the
11 smart, skilled students they have the opportunity to
12 work with through the program. This is laying a
13 solid foundation of professional and personal
14 relationships on which these students can build their
15 careers. Unemployment is a systematic issue for New
16 Yorkers with disabilities. The Office of the people-
17 the Mayor's Office for People with Disabilities, MOPD
18 estimate that 77% of New Yorkers with disabilities
19 are unemployed. DCLA's definition of workforce
20 diversity includes disability. So, this is an issue
21 we're committed to making progress on. In March, we
22 collaborated with MOPD to offer a workshop on the
23 subject for culture-for our Cultural Institutions
24 Group members represented from -representatives from
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

163

26 organizations met at Carnegie Hall to hear from
Cultural workers with disabilities, gain insight to
best practices for engaging with the disability
community and learning more about MOPD's NYC At Work
Employment Initiative. We hope to host a similar
workshop in the future for our Cultural Development
Fund grantees. Finally, the requirement for
Diversity Equity and Inclusion, DEI plans for the
members of the Cultural Institution Group as
announced by the Mayor when he released the Culture-
the Create NYC Cultural Plan. As you know, the CIG
consists of a wide range of organizations from larger
museums to community-based performing art centers,
zoos and gardens. Their DEI plans will have to
reflect these disparate sizes, disciplines and
audiences, but across the board the groups see this
as an opportunity to dive into critical issues that
will shape the future of this sector. As our
population grows more diverse, our cultural
institutions will have to keep pace to continue
programming that makes them vital and relevant
institutions. I thank the Council for its ongoing
commitment to supporting Arts and Culture NYC, and

25

1 I'm happy to answer any questions that you may have
2 at this time.
3

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And thank you very
5 much, Commissioner. We appreciate you coming in and
6 answering some questions and giving testimony. Let
7 me start off by just talking a little bit about the
8 Budget Response. The Council called on the
9 Administration to increase the budget for the
10 Department of Cultural Affairs by \$10 million in
11 order to ensure that the goal's intention is to
12 create New York City Cultural Plan is met—is met and
13 that the funding of the cultural community needs.
14 Why was this funding not reflected in the Executive
15 Budget?

16 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: So, we are
17 where we were last year at this time. Last year that
18 money, in fact, more than that money the \$10 million,
19 \$15 million was added at adoption. That's happened
20 in the last two years, and that's been the first
21 significant increases in the cultural budget in a
22 very long period of time. So, we look forward to
23 working with you and I expect vigorous communication
24 about the budget as we head towards adoption.
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS
165

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well, I know that
Chair Van Bramer will certainly be communicating with
you on this.

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: I think—I
anticipate that to be the case. [laughter]

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Capital equity. How
many capital projects does the agency currently have
and how many cultural organizations are these
projects being done?

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: So, we're
working on projects with I think 250 organizations.
I have this information here if you want to know the
exact number. There are 250 organizations with
capital projects in their—in all five boroughs.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: How does that DCLA
track the Capital projects? Can you provide
breakdown by borough?

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: We can. I
don't have that with me right, but we do have that
information yes.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: How do you track it?

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: [interposing]
We'll get that to you, and what do you mean by
tracking?

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

166

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I mean you--

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: [interposing]

We a have Capital Project Manager for every one of
those capital projects. Those capital projects are--
are in three of four different categories, DC, DDC
managed, EDC managed, and then there are CCGs. You
know, those grants through DDC and funding agreements
through EDC. So, some of them are actually projects
managed by the private sector and some are by the
public sector, but we have project managers who are
tracking the project, the process of each of those
capital projects.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, how do you find
the process with DDC? We just had the libraries and
it's a huge problem for us, are you have better luck
with them?

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: So, I have had
very good experiences on some capital projects with
DDC. I know that the--the--and so for example, I can
say that there's a exemplary project recently, which
is a very complex project, which is the
reconstruction of the Wavertree, the ship down in the
South Street Seaport. Chairman Van Bramer was there
to ring the bell when it we arrived back. That's a

1 very complicated project that was done with a very
2 good vendor in Staten Island who—the shipyard that
3 rebuilt that it absolutely can be done. There are
4 many, many rules governing procurement that make
5 sometimes projects more expensive.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Do the larger
8 culturals have an easier time because they can fund
9 the money.

10 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Larger
11 cultural institutions generally speaking don't work
12 with the city agencies, don't work—I mean they—if
13 we're funding, for example there is a big project as
14 everybody knows at Natural History coming up.
15 There's a \$350 million project. We're throwing in
16 \$80 million by the Council--thank you very much--and
17 us splitting that. They are going to privately
18 manage that. That's still tracked by our staff and
19 by EDC. It's the EDC Funding Agreement. So, that's
20 a private sector job with public money in it. There
21 are many rules that are different that make it easier
22 for the private sector to get this work done, but
23 those big institutions have the capacity, they
24 capital units. When I was at the Queens Museum,
25 you've been to the Queens Museum many times by now,

1 we didn't have a capital unit. We relied on DDC to
2 manage the project. We had a person on our staff
3 going to all meetings, but that's not something where
4 the Queens Museum had the capacity to manage a \$68
5 million project. In that--so in that case, that was
6 the appropriate thing that the city managed the
7 project, the city built it. In the case of the
8 Metropolitan Museum of art or--or natural history or
9 the very large institutions, which are often raising
10 very large amounts of private money, they have
11 capital units that manage those projects. And by the
12 way, there's significant risk involved, but there are
13 cost overruns. The city does not come in and say
14 okay, we're going to, you know, figure out how to do
15 this. It's in the hands of the Metropolitan or the
16 Natural History or whatever. Those large
17 institutions, the zoo to raise that additional money.
18 So, big risks involved in managing your own project
19 as well.

21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: In Fiscal 2017, the
22 department--I think it's 2017, the Department of
23 Cultural Affairs committed \$147.4 million or 27.2% of
24 its annual capital plan of \$542 million. The
25 Executive Plan has \$358 million in Fiscal 2018. What

1 does DCLA expect to commit in 2018 and will be rolled
2 over?

3
4 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: So, I mean I
5 don't have the exact numbers in front of me. I can
6 provide them to you, but I know that the commitment
7 rate is of concern, and there's a reason that I can
8 give you. There is a very complicated set of reason
9 that I can give you. There is a very complicated set
10 of reasons, but I just wanted to explain the
11 difference between us and let's say the Police
12 Department. So the Police Department is one agency,
13 and it's building precincts or renovating precincts
14 all over town. It can put resources towards projects
15 that are moving forward. In the case of the
16 Department of Cultural Affairs we have a separate
17 budget code for every single one of those projects.
18 They are not transferrable. So, when a project
19 doesn't move forward, it's not a situation where we
20 can—or when a—when a budget line comes in and there's
21 a bid that's excessive, you can't say okay, well,
22 we're going to slow down on this precinct and put it
23 over here. It's all separate. So, one of the things
24 that we've been doing, we've been working closely
25 with OMB on this, and this requires Council

1 participation and collaboration s well is to put the
2 money in the year that it's actually going to be
3 spent. Right, so that's something where by September
4 when we do the plan by-against which the commitment
5 rate is judged we should have the money in the proper
6 fiscal year. But it's a very-it's apples and
7 oranges, to any other situation. I think the closest
8 comparison would be libraries, but the difference
9 with us is that many of the cultural organizations
10 are private organizations. They're all separate, and
11 I think it better-it was a great, great innovation by
12 the last administration, if I may praise, to allow
13 cultural capital money to be spent outside of the
14 CIG. Before that, all the cultural money was
15 essentially spent for the most part with some
16 exceptions. On CIG institutions, this widened it out
17 to democratize the Capital Budget, but there's been a
18 big problem with commitment rates, and I understand
19 what you're talking about. I know that's the answer.

20
21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, you're working
22 with OMB on that?

23 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yes.
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

171

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And you're going to
get back to us on that? You're going to work with us
on that?

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: The-yearh,
yeah, we can get you statistics of that commitment
right now.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. What-what is
the percentage of capital projects funded as compared
to those who apply that are eligible?

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: So, that
depends from year to year. It's been, you know, a
little under 50% of capital projects are funded, but
you have to understand capital projects can be
anything from buying a vehicle for \$40,000 to
building a wing of a museum or a ground-up-the
institution like City Museum in Harlem for \$100
million. So, there's a wide range of what you say,
but those are, you know, counted as both our count-
counted as individual budget requests.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: How-how do you
prioritize those needs, those capital needs?

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: So, there's a-
a set of criteria. We've added two new criteria this
year, which has to do with disability access and

1 green initiatives. We're very concerned that the
2 Green Initiatives, and that was one of the
3 discussions in the Cultural Plan. So, we—we're
4 hiring and we're about to hire an energy expert who
5 is going to be on our staff who is going to be
6 looking—because we spend, as you know, well over a
7 third of our budget is energy. So, there are a set a
8 criteria that relate first of all to trying to finish
9 projects that are already in process and might need
10 some more money. There's broad distribution and
11 equity, and then there's sort of the service to the
12 city that these cultural capital projects will be
13 rendering.

14
15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you. I
16 just want to say we've been joined by Council Member
17 Gibson, Cumbo and Cornegy, and Chair Van Bramer has
18 questions.

19 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Thank you very
21 much, Chair Dromm. So, you both alluded to the fact
22 that we would probably have vigorous conversations
23 and communications about the budgets. So, why don't
24 we start that right now?

25 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Okay.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

173

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: \$15 million

added at budget adoption last year. No one knows
more than you and I how hard you and I fought to make
that possible, but the Mayor did not baseline that
funding, and did not include it in his Executive
Budget. So, that \$15 million has gone a long way and
done some very good things I think you would agree
between Budget adoption and today. So, do you
believe that it is important that that funding be at
a minimum restored to the budget?

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: So, first of
all, I want to agree with you that the money was well
spent, and as you know, it's sort of divided into
three pots. One was some CIG support, some program
support, individual artist and then goals related to
the cultural plan. So, I will say without hesitation
that we could use that money well. It could be well
spent again, and I look forward to working with you,
working with the administration, and I will I am sure
hear from the constituents as well as we approach
adoption.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: So, it sounds to
me like you agree that that \$15 million is really
important, was well spent, and—and I would argue that

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

174

1 the work of that funding is undone, right. It
2 continues--

3
4 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Uh-hm.

5 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: --that the
6 several million dollars that were specifically
7 earmarked towards advancing the goals as a enumerated
8 in our Cultural Plan, that--that work hasn't finished
9 with the funding that was allocated this year, right.
10 We haven't included--we haven't reached all of the
11 goals when it comes to diversity and inclusion and
12 inequity. So, so I'm assuming that you would also
13 agree that--that if we were able to both include that
14 funding in the budget again that the work continues,
15 no?

16 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yes,
17 absolutely.

18 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: And--and so if we
19 were not to see that funding restored, that would in
20 essence be a cut to the very things that you and you
21 and this Council and the Administration believe in
22 and have fought for.

23 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: So, I'm not
24 going to disagree, but I will create a little analogy
25 here in relationship to the word cut, which is if you

1 receive a certain base salary, and then you receive a
2 bonus in a particular year, and the next year the
3 bonus isn't the same or doesn't come back, is that a
4 cut? That's the question. So, we are where we were
5 last year. We added a bunch of money at adoption,
6 which was again great to have and well spent and I do
7 commend many people on that side of the table
8 particularly the chair for fighting for that, and I
9 just wanted to say one other thing about the-- So,
10 with the Cultural Plan, there are many goals, and
11 some of the goals are in--very much in---integrated
12 into that money that was added, but there are certain
13 goals that just permanent changes in the way we do
14 business, and I just wanted to mention that quickly.
15 So, for example on the CDF Application there are two
16 questions, there are not just one year, but
17 permanently added, which related to the Diversity,
18 Equity and Inclusion practices of organizations on
19 their staff and board is one question, and another
20 question relates to their audiences. And the
21 adoption by all the CIGs of Diversity, Equity and
22 Inclusion plans I think will have a fundamental long-
23 term effect. So, there are some things happening
24 that are long-term, but I do not want to disagree
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

176

1 with your sentiment that that's well--the money is
2 well spent.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: So, look with
5 all due respect I mean we shouldn't engage in a game
6 of semantics here. The truth is that the funding
7 that we were able to include in the Budget last year
8 to further the goals of the Cultural Plan, that you
9 enumerate in your testimony including the Disability
10 Forward Fund--

11 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yes.

12 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: --\$360,000. I'm
13 assuming you would agree that that work is not
14 complete with the \$350,000 that we allocated, and
15 that if we don't see that \$350,000 back in the budget
16 this year at a minimum, that that would actually be a
17 meaningful step back in the goal of furthering access
18 and inclusions for those with disabilities. The same
19 thing with some of the other programs, and--and so, I
20 think we've got to call a cut a cut and not engage in
21 a game of--of semantics and games respecting your
22 position within the Administration. But I would also
23 say to you that baselining this funding is imposs--so
24 important and critical, and would you then agree that
25 we're able to make sure that \$15 million is in the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

177

1 Budget again this year at a minimum, but if we were
2 able to have \$30 million that we would actually
3 double all of the good that we were able to do, and
4 maybe even do a lot of additional things when it
5 comes to diversity, inclusion and equity.

7 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: I can't argue
8 with that. I mean I think that the--

9 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: [interposing]
10 Good, it's done.

11 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: [laughs]

12 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: \$30 million and
13 this--

14 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: [interposing]
15 But I think many commissioners coming in front of
16 you--

17 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: [interposing]
18 I'll text the Mayor and let him know you agree.

19 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Okay, fine.
20 I think that many commissioners coming in front of
21 you if they were--if you were asked, you know, Polly
22 that DOT could use extra money to pave more roads,
23 she would say yes as well. So, there's certain, you
24 know, limit and there's certain resources. I would
25 say that the--you know, the money has been well spent.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

178

1 If the money is back in our budget this year it will
2 be well spent again. I agree with that.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: So, you know, I
5 appreciate the—the—the analogy with the Department of
6 Transportation and certainly, you know, Chair Dromm
7 has seen a lot of commissioners come and go in the
8 last ten days and, you know, a lot of them who—who
9 are—are appointed by the same person that—that you're
10 appointed by, you know, come in here, and—and to
11 varying degrees fight for increases in their budget
12 or want increases in their budget and see where they
13 could do additional work if they were able to see
14 additions to their agency's budget and I think, you
15 know, that's where I'm—I'm asking you because I know,
16 that there's a level of advocacy that goes on behind
17 the scenes and that's really important, but I also
18 think it's important for the cultural community to
19 know that you are in there fighting incredibly hard
20 and that—that we are a team essentially to make sure
21 that we get the resources that we know this community
22 deserves, and—and this agency needs. Some very good
23 things have happened over the last couple of years,
24 and we need to continue that progress, and make sure
25 that we don't fall back. Certainly making sure that

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

179

the agency itself wants this funding, needs this
funding and is fighting for this funding is
imperative in the process both public and private.

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: So, I mean
those commissioners you referred to are my, you know,
my colleagues, and we talk about this, and I
understand that they, you know, that many agencies
like ours are also in the position of seeking
additional funding. So, that's the process. What
goes on behind closed doors obviously is behind
closed doors.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: So, I—I just
want to close by saying again the monies that we have
been able to allocate have been a good step forward
in giving organizations the resources that they need.
If we are not able to see that funding in the budget
again, they will see cuts to their budget.

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: That would be
wrong. We cannot allow that to happen. So, I know
that we will all, everyone in this room who cares
about culture and the arts will be making sure in the
budget process that not only are we making sure that
the \$15 million that was added last year, it was

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS
180

added again and baselined, but that we go further.

\$30 million gets us a long way to where we need to

go, and even then we're not finished, but it is a

good start. So, I want to say thank you to you in

advance for agreeing to everything that I just said--

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: [laughs]

CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: --and look

forward to delivering for this community with my

colleagues. Thank you very much, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Majority

Leader Cumbo.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you to my

Chairs and thank you so much for being here

Commissioner Finkelpearl. Want to ask you is there

any agency or has it quantified in terms of which

agencies bring in the greatest amount of revenue for

the city of New York?

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: So, I mean I--

that's an interesting question to-to quantify agency

like agency by agency?

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Because each

agency does--

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: [interposing]

I haven't see that--

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

181

1
2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: --something
3 different.

4 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Right, yes.
5 That's right.

6 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Right, so ACS is
7 not a revenue generator--

8 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: [interposing]
9 No.

10 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: --for the city.

11 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: [interposing]
12 Right, yeah.

13 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: It provides
14 valuable services for the children of the city of New
15 York, but is there an agency that has been identified
16 as far as which agencies bring in the greatest amount
17 of revenue for the city of New York?

18 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: So, I have not
19 seen such a chart. I think it's an interesting
20 question. I think there might be some kind of
21 overlap also. So, for example NYC and Company and
22 the Department of Cultural Affairs might be claiming
23 a lot of the same revenue, but then again numerous--

24 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: [interposing] And
25 a lot of the same partners also.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS
182

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yeah, yeah.

There have been numerous and by the way MOME, you know, the Mayor's Office of Media and Entertainment and Department of Cultural Affairs both are cultural agencies. So, when the cultural sector is analyzed in terms of how many jobs it creates, et cetera, it's usually a combination of the for-profit and non-profit sector. So, anyway, you see—you know what I'm saying because it's a Broadway in the music business and clubs and this and that like music clubs are in the for-profit sector and aren't under our agency, but, you know, I mean, this without doubts. There's many studies after studies that show that the vitality of New York City's economy is predicated on having a lively arts and culture sector. And so, there are many studies that have quantified the arts and cultural impact have not seen that compared to other agencies. The other agencies like if there weren't roads you couldn't have—you know, if DOT didn't do their work at all you couldn't have arts and culture. If there weren't—if ACS--

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: [interposing] But if there was not arts and culture, people would have no reason to be on the roads.

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: [laughs]

Right. It's circular and I agree with that. You know, there would be nowhere to go. So, yes, it's interesting, but it's all connected. It's also the same thing with police and fire like if you didn't have a city that was safe and where fire just burned out of control, you couldn't have a cultural sector also. So, it's a, you know, all of city government somehow together and the private sector creates the city and then the creative sector is a very important part of the economy, but that—that's an interesting question. I'll have to think about that.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Because I see it more as all of the other agencies that you're talking about provide critical day-to-day survival for a city at baseline, but at the same time, if there's nothing bringing in revenue, then all of the other agencies in this city can't function at its optimal level. I would venture to say that I think that we should do more research on this. I would venture to say that DCLA, Film, Television and Media, tourism, NYC and Co and all of those, I would say combined probably I would venture to say are the greatest revenue generators for the city of New York. I could be very

1 wrong. I mean someone may have some creative thing
2 to sell so how Sanitation makes great money for the
3 city. I don't know.

4
5 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: I would say
6 that EDC would also say that the financial sector is
7 important to the economy.

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Correct. We'll
9 put that up in there.

10 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yes.

11 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: But I would say
12 that if we're going to make a leap but I think we
13 should study this because I feel that if we recognize
14 that this is an agency that the city of New York is
15 dependent upon as far as a revenue generator and
16 everything from job creation to tourism to hotels to
17 transportation to small businesses to all of these
18 different things. If we were to really recognize the
19 impact that this agency has on the vitality of the
20 city of New York, we're—we're expecting an agency to
21 be such a backbone, a financial backbone for the
22 city, but at the same time, we're expecting that
23 cultural community to work at a level that's
24 substandard or not in relation to what they offer and
25 bring to the city. So, I believe and correct me if

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS
185

1 I'm wrong, over the last now going on five years,
2 your agency as far as programmatic funding has only
3 seen a \$10 million increase. Is that correct from
4 your agency side?
5

6 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: So, I'm
7 familiar with the last four years.

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Uh-hm.

9 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: So, are you
10 talking about on the non-CIG funding?

11 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Correct.

12 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yeah, because
13 it's over the economy. (sic)

14 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Well, is that-is
15 that funding altogether, that half goes to one and
16 the other half goes to the other?

17 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: It would be
18 additional funding.

19 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Uh-hm.

20 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: So, again, so
21 this \$186 million budget we have was the biggest
22 we've ever had. That increases, you know, \$18.5
23 million that's added at adoption last year. It's one
24 of the biggest increase that anybody has seen in
25 recent memory. So, I mean there have been increases

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

186

that we've all, you know, collectively fought for
that I think are a good thing and the agency is
agreeing with the Chair.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: [interposing] And
we've put on the Council's side substantial--

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: [interposing]
The substantial as--

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: --over \$30
million.

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: Yes, the
Council Initiatives have skyrocketed as well.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Uh-hm.

COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: So, you know,
I-I think the other thing to-to mention because there
is the Capital Budget also and the Capital Budget has
been very vibrant, and you also have to understand
that there's about \$2.00 a 2 to 1 ratio in private
investment compared to public investment. So our
public investment in capital leverages twice as much
money in private investment. There's all kinds and
that's also jobs that are, you know, construction
jobs and architectural jobs, et cetera. So, there's
a huge amount of job creation and this has been well

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

187

1 studied. There are numerous studies, and the last-
2 last one I think is Center for an Urban Future.

3
4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: However, many of
5 our organization are probably very building rich and
6 staff poor. So, they may not, you know we have these
7 beautiful buildings but the people working inside the
8 buildings are probably not commanding salaries that
9 are of the same scale as the beautiful buildings that
10 they work in.

11 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: I-I think
12 you're right. That can't be good taste. Yes.

13 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: So, how does
14 this-explain to me how in this baseline process
15 because we're still not seeing this really critical
16 funding baselined, and I guess we have to hope and
17 pray that come the handshake or the final adoption of
18 the budget that it's in there. What happens in the
19 negotiations in terms if you say we really need this
20 baselined and then the Administration pushes back or
21 the Mayor pushes back and say, well, we've got to
22 make sure some other agencies are shored up before we
23 baseline this funding. Because I guess growing up as
24 an artist, and as a creative, we in the creative
25 sector although we recognize economically how

1 important we are, but when it's all said and done,
2 it's still kind of in the way it's being treated here
3 as an afterthought. Once we take care of everything
4 else, and we baseline everything else, then we'll
5 look at the arts and see if we can do something for
6 them.
7

8 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: I certainly
9 don't see it that way, and I don't think the
10 Administration sees it that way, and again, I think
11 that what, you know, what has happened has been
12 pretty good and pretty revolutionary to actually be
13 adding money so that when think about, you know, the
14 budget dance in the past history there were cuts to
15 try to get back to zero--

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Uh-hm.

17 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: --in the
18 budget dance and if-if you want to call it that. So
19 I'm not going to dispute they are cuts against ads,
20 right. So, we have been able to add money the last
21 couple of years. It's been terrific. I think it
22 shows a commitment on the part of the Administration
23 to arts and culture and I think the money has been
24 well spent.
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

189

1
2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I just want to
3 add in closing I feel that it's unfortunate because
4 every budget cycle we come forward to try to baseline
5 the \$10 million, and it prevents us from fighting for
6 the real initial ask, which was \$30 million and \$30
7 million to be baselined. So, I feel like we're in a—
8 is it April Fools Day or was it Groundhog's Day? No.
9 I guess maybe a combination of both right. We're
10 kind of in the same space as far as the negotiations
11 that were constantly just asking for a baseline of
12 \$10 million and every year that you don't get an
13 increase, it really is a cut because the cost of New
14 York City and, you know, how inflation. These are
15 arguments that you made when you were on—the other
16 side of the table.

17 COMMISSIONER FINKELPEARL: It's true.

18 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Every year that
19 you don't get an increase is a decrease to your
20 budget because of the cost of living in the city of
21 New York. So, I would hope that at the very least
22 this conversation is different moving forward into
23 the next fiscal year because we're really doing our
24 economics sector—the vitality and the resources
25 that are needed for the city of New York comes from

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

190

1 the cultural community, and we have to support this
2 cultural community so that they can continue to
3 thrive, continue to bring in revenue for the city of
4 New York, and they can continue to afford to live in
5 New York City with all that is happening here. So,
6 thank you and I'll turn it back over to my Chairs.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you very
9 much. Council-Chair Van Bramer.

10 CHAIRPERSON VAN BRAMER: Thank you very
11 much. So, just to I think wrap things up, I think we
12 are going to do a lot more than simply hope and pray.
13 I think we're going to fight like heck to make sure
14 that everyone agrees that this \$30 million is
15 imperative and baselining. Every gain that we make
16 here is that we make here is absolutely essential,
17 and we can do that. We have the ability to do it.
18 We just need the political will to make it so, and I
19 am ready for that fight, ready to continue our
20 vigorous ongoing communications, Commissioner, as we
21 always have and do, and as you pointed out, the \$18.5
22 million increase last year was substantial. The
23 cultural capital is great. The City Council Cultural
24 Initiatives in the last couple of years have doubled
25 and tripled. CASA was \$5 million four years ago.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

191

1 It's now \$13.5 million. We are seeing some real
2 serious investments that's great. We on the Council
3 have our piece to this, but the Administration has
4 the ability to dramatically make a move here and once
5 and for all increase the funding, baseline the
6 funding. Let's do it together. Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Alright, and-but this
9 will conclude our hearing for today. The Finance
10 Committee will resume Executive Budget hearings for
11 Fiscal 19 on Tuesday, May 22nd at 10:00 a.m. in this
12 room. On Monday, the Finance Committee will hear-on
13 Tuesday, the Finance Committee will hear from the
14 Department of Education and the School Construction
15 Authority. As a reminder, the public will be invited
16 to testify on Thursday, May 24th, the last day of the
17 Budget hearings at approximately 4:00 p.m. in this
18 room. For any member of the public who wishes to
19 testify, but cannot make it to the hearings, you can
20 email your testimony to the Finance Division at
21 financetestimony@council.nyc.gov and the staff will
22 make it a part of this official record. Thank you
23 and this hearing is now adjourned. [gavel]

24

25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HEALTH, COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES
AND ADDICTION, COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

192

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date June 12, 2018