

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON HEALTH

----- X

April 24, 2018  
Start: 10:17 A.M.  
Recess: 1:03 P.M.

HELD AT: 250 BROADWAY - COMMITTEE ROOM 16<sup>TH</sup>  
FLOOR

B E F O R E: Mark Levine, Chair

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Alicka Ampry-Samuel  
Inez D. Barron  
Mathieu Eugene  
Keith Powers  
Paul Vallone

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Corinne Schiff, Deputy Commissioner for  
the Division of Environmental Health

Risa Weinstock, President and CEO of  
Animal Care Centers of New York City

Julie Friesen, Deputy Commissioner for  
Admission at the Health Department

Matt Burshower

Michelle Via Gomez, ASPCA

Jane Hoffman, President of Mayor's  
Alliance for New York City Animals

Debra Thomas

Elizabeth Jason, Best Friends Animal  
Society

Adita Burncraz, NYCLAS Executive  
Director

Esther Kaslow, President of Shelter  
Reform Action Committee

Nancy Regulo, Guardian Angels Animal  
Protection

Zelda Penzo, Save Our Shelter Animals  
(SOSA)

Greg Seamon, Voices for Shelter Animals.

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Marilyn Gelfin, Voices for Shelter  
Animals

Delores Ferraro

Judith Luskgarten

Roxanne Delgato

Barbara Stewart, Coalition of Animal  
Rights Activist

Diane Signarelli

Barbara Neeley

Neal Sayer

William Spacey

Janice Giacolb

Barbara Malley

Lauren Frossa, Public and Animals

Zuli Rodriguez, Astoria Queens

Ashley Ashinback

2 (Test. Test. Test. Today's date is April  
3 24, 2018. This hearing is on health, being recorded  
4 by McKenzie Joseph.)

5 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Good morning  
6 everybody. Welcome. I'm Mark Levine, Chair of the  
7 City Council's Committee on Health and I'm pleased  
8 today that our hearing will focus on our City's  
9 Animal Shelter System and that we will be considering  
10 Intro 401, sponsored by the great Council Member Paul  
11 Malone, sitting to my left. A Bill that would  
12 require a full time animal shelter be maintained in  
13 each borough of the City, what a radical idea. Uhm,  
14 now a little history here is in order, 20 years ago,  
15 New York City's Shelter System was severely  
16 underfunded and in dire straights. In 1994, an  
17 astonishing 75% of shelter animals in the city were  
18 euthanized. Those horrific circumstances lead the  
19 City Council in 2000 under the leadership if I'm not  
20 mistaken of Speaker Malone who is watching online  
21 from his office no doubt and under, under the  
22 leadership of then Speaker Peter Malone Sr. the  
23 Council passed local law 26. The Animal Shelters and  
24 Sterilization Action which required that a full  
25 service animal shelter operate in each of the five

2 boroughs. After a decade of noncompliance and many  
3 years of litigation brought by a non-profit volunteer  
4 organization called Straight from the Heart. The  
5 Bloomberg Administration and the City Council came to  
6 an agreement in 2011 to repeat the five borough  
7 requirement and instead focus on improving the  
8 existing shelter system. As part of this agreement,  
9 the Administration committed to increasing its  
10 investment in Animal Shelters by nearly 10 million  
11 over three years. This additional funding has  
12 allowed animal care centers, a nonprofit which  
13 contracts with the City to dramatically grow its  
14 staff to increase adoptions, provide improved  
15 veterinary service and expand rescue response and  
16 transport services. This infuturitive resources has  
17 yielded dramatic results. By 2015, ACCs live release  
18 rate had increased to 80% where it had been about 25%  
19 in 1994. And uhm the rate continued to climb, now  
20 reaching this year 93%. It is critical that we keep  
21 this remarkable progress going and this hearing will  
22 focus on the important question of what additional  
23 resources, programming and staffing are needed to  
24 achieve an even higher release rate, that is our  
25 goal. Part of the answer no doubt is that the city

2 needs to finally fulfill it's promise to operate a  
3 full service shelters in each of the five boroughs.  
4 DOHMH has in fact dedicated 98 million in its Capital  
5 Plan for the construction and renovation of the  
6 City's Animal Care Centers and in January the de  
7 Blasio Administration announced the location of a new  
8 full service animal shelter in the Baychester  
9 neighborhood of the Bronx. Progress in Queens,  
10 however, has been slower and so far the  
11 administration has only promised a largely admission  
12 center for the borough. The Bill we will be  
13 considering today sponsored by Council Member Vallone  
14 will ensure that our City once and for all live up to  
15 it's commitment to open full service shelters in  
16 every borough. I look forward to hearing today with  
17 testimony from DOHMH, ACC as well as our important  
18 advocacy community as we discuss and learn about  
19 recent progress in the shelter system and what we can  
20 do to make it even better. So without further ado,  
21 I'm going to ask Committee Counsel to administer the  
22 Affirmation uhm for our first panel, the  
23 administration and ACC.

24 COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell.

2 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: I, I uhm I uhm I  
3 forgot a very, very, very important thing which is  
4 the Sponsor of today's Bill uhm also is going to be  
5 delivering opening remarks. So please take it away.

6 PAUL VALLONE: Thank you Chair, uhm it's  
7 an honor to sit with you today and continue this,  
8 this passionate conversation and I thank every one of  
9 you that I have taken this journey with us out there,  
10 uhm I think from when I was grown with my mom Tina  
11 Vallone is truly the matriarch behind this one  
12 because dad wouldn't have been allowed to come home  
13 if, if this did not happen so back when I, that's how  
14 passionate that was. So as we continue our journey  
15 and now we teach our children and I understand as a  
16 new Matteo that our newest ASPCA member was just  
17 born, right, so he is joining in on the group. We  
18 teach through the children and we learn and until we  
19 see in every borough a full operating animal shelter  
20 with veterinarian care and educational facilities and  
21 doctors and staff and the ability for helping the  
22 folks who want to drop off and maybe we can help them  
23 keep that pet with resources and help and anything we  
24 can do to keep a pet with a family or a new family is  
25 really what the goal is. We are so happy that the

2 administration has launched in the Bronx, so I have  
3 those remarks but I think talking from the heart is  
4 always best and I think that until we see that  
5 includes we will keep this going uhm with Chair  
6 Levine, uhm with the speaker. We had almost 40  
7 Council Members in the previous term and Intro 401 is  
8 taking that same path to show that we won't stop  
9 until we see it in every borough. You know we have  
10 your back and during that, we want to make sure that  
11 the funding is there, that is location is found.  
12 That the receding, the expanded receding is not  
13 really where my path and heart is so I understand the  
14 temporary status of it but we always get nervous  
15 until we see the shelter and hear where the site is  
16 going to be, we are going to keep pushing along. It  
17 is beyond a Vallone dream. It is really, everyone  
18 really knows that this needs to happen. It has been  
19 way to long and we have a Mayor and Administration  
20 and Speaker and a Council that is all behind us, so  
21 now is the time and as we are very excited about 401,  
22 we are very excited about the path of this. We are  
23 very excited about our chair, taking today's hearing,  
24 uhm and I think and I look forward to working with  
25 the Administration and working with everyone here.



2 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Alright thank you  
3 Council Member Vallone. And now we will do the  
4 affirmation.

5 COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell the  
6 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in  
7 your testimony before this committee and to respond  
8 honestly to Council member questions?

9 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Take it away.

10 CORINNE SCHIFF: Good morning, Chair  
11 Person Levine, Council Member Vallone. My name is  
12 Corinne Schiff. And I am the Deputy Commissioner for  
13 the Division of Environmental Health at the  
14 Department of Health and Mental Hygiene. On behalf  
15 of Commissioner Bassett thank you for the opportunity  
16 to testify on the Department's Animal Shelter work.  
17 Testifying with me today is Risa Weinstock, President  
18 and CEO of Animal Care Centers of New York City. One  
19 of the important missions of the department is to  
20 promote and protect human health by working to  
21 prevent, discover and intervene in cases of animal  
22 borne diseases. The scope of our Veterinary Public  
23 Health Work is broad and ranges from inspecting  
24 animal handling facilities to investigating animal  
25 nuisance complaints and monitoring wildlife and

domestic animals for diseases that can impact human health. Today I will speak specifically to our work as it relates to animal shelters. The Department is charged with managing and caring for the city's population of owner surrendered, abandoned, homeless and lost animals. In 1995, the city created a nonprofit entity now known as Animal Care Centers of ACC to operate the animal shelter system. The services that the department carries out through a contract with ACC include receiving and sheltering animals, providing medical services and animal placement. ACC also performs a vital public safety function by handling potentially dangerous animals, accepting suspected rabid animals for observation or preparation for testing and working with city and state agencies in wildlife management. ACC performs these services by operating full service animal shelters in Manhattan, Brooklyn and Staten Island, admission centers in the Bronx and Queens and field operations throughout the city. ACC is required to accept all animals without regard to their condition, age, temperament or adaptability. The improvements in the animal shelter system during the de Blasio Administration have been dramatic. In 2015, the

2 placement rate in the city shelter system was 80%.

3 Today ACC is a national leader among municipalities

4 with a placement rate in 2017 of over 93%. ACCs

5 innovative programming has been recognized around the

6 country and an invigorated independent Board of

7 Directors has enabled the organization to increase

8 private fund raising and deepen its marketing and

9 promotion strategies. ACC has developed strong

10 partnerships with Animal Welfare Organizations such

11 as the ASPCA and the Mayor's Alliance for New York

12 City's Animals as well as hundreds of new hope

13 organizations. These partners provide support every

14 day and work closely with us, just over a year ago

15 when we mobilized a rapid and life-saving response to

16 the cat influenza outbreak. I will let Ms. Weinstock

17 speak to the impressive developments in ACC

18 operations and will now provide details about the

19 city's expanded capital investments. The de Blasio

20 Administration is a strong supporter of ACC. The

21 Administration has committed nearly \$100 million in

22 Capital Funding to support new construction or

23 renovations in every borough including new full

24 service shelters in the Bronx and Queens. In January

25 we were excited to announce that after a long search,

2 the city had secured a site in the Bronx to build a  
3 new State of the Art Animal Shelter and we are  
4 starting the public review process for that project  
5 at the end of the month. In Staton Island a newly  
6 renovated care center will open later this year, also  
7 in the works is the renovation of an existing garage  
8 to house a standalone adoption center in Manhattan  
9 which will provide an expanded and welcoming space  
10 for New Yorkers looking for that just right new pet.  
11 In Brooklyn, a substantial renovation of the Brooklyn  
12 Care Center will almost double the usable square  
13 footage, improve indoor air quality, provide more  
14 room for the animals and fill the space with natural  
15 light and finally the department is committed to  
16 opening a full service shelter in Queens and has been  
17 actively evaluating locations. We are hopeful that  
18 we will soon identify a suitable property. In the  
19 meantime, we will relocate the Queens Admission  
20 Center to a larger and more accessible space. The  
21 administration fully supports having a full service  
22 animal shelter in all five boroughs as demonstrated  
23 by our ongoing commitments to these projects and  
24 particularly to opening full service shelters in the  
25 Bronx and Queens. This commitment is aligned with

2 the requirements of Introduction 401 under  
3 consideration today. We support the Bill and are  
4 pleased to have the Council's strong support as we  
5 plan for those sites. The transformation at ACC has  
6 been due not only to the support of the Council, the  
7 Mayor and the Health Commissioner but most  
8 importantly to the deep dedication and hard work of  
9 the ACC leadership and staff. I want to take just a  
10 moment to acknowledge Risa Weinstock and her  
11 management staff, they are the best in their field  
12 and on behalf of Commissioner Bassett I want to thank  
13 them for the service to the people and animals of New  
14 York City. Thank you again for the opportunity to  
15 testify. Ms. Weinstock will testify next and then I  
16 will happy to take questions.

17 RISA WEINSTOCK: Good morning Chair  
18 Person Levine, Council Member Vallone, your staff who  
19 we recognize from many tours at ACC and I thank Chair  
20 Person Levine to take the time to visit a couple of  
21 ours centers and getting to know our staff and  
22 actually seeing firsthand what it is to run an  
23 organization like ACC. I am Risa Weinstock. I'm  
24 President and CEO of Animal Care Centers of New York  
25 City. I want to thank you for the opportunity to

2 testify in today's oversight hearing. ACC has  
3 steadily improved over the last five years thanks to  
4 the substantial support of Council and the New York  
5 City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene. I  
6 would like to thank all of you for your commitment to  
7 the health and welfare of New York City's Shelter  
8 Animals. ACC is also grateful for the commitment of  
9 Mayor de Blasio toward ensuring the future success of  
10 ACC through the construction of a shelter in the  
11 Bronx and in Queens as well as much needed renovation  
12 of our existing facilities. A little bit of  
13 background, ACC was incorporated in 1995 as a 501c3  
14 not for profit organization dedicated to the health  
15 and welfare of pets and people in New York City. For  
16 over 20 years, ACC has been the city's sole  
17 contractor, charged with operating the existing  
18 municipal animal shelters and providing animal rescue  
19 and welfare services to all five boroughs, seven days  
20 a week, 24 hours a day, 20 years ago, only 25% of the  
21 animals entering the shelter system were placed.  
22 Today ACC is a dramatically different organization.  
23 In 2017, ACC achieve an unprecedented placement rate  
24 of 93% for cats and dogs. The most significant  
25 achievements have occurred over the last five years

2 beginning with local law 59 which gradually increased  
3 our City Contract Budget by nearly double for staff  
4 and services, enabling ACC to raise the caliber for  
5 care, programs, staff and partnerships required for  
6 the kind of work we are contracted to do. As we  
7 improved internally, ACC began getting recognition  
8 externally from grant funding organizations and  
9 private donors which has supplemented our budget by  
10 several million dollars annually over the last five  
11 years and has enabled ACC to add innovative programs  
12 plus staff beyond the City Contract Budget. Our  
13 mission is to end animal homelessness in New York  
14 City. Through targeted strategies and programs ACC  
15 has become a leader in animal welfare and a respected  
16 model for animal sheltering nationwide. ACC remains  
17 committed to using the successes of the past years  
18 only as a foundation for even greater success in the  
19 future. We know that there is much work to be done  
20 and while we are proud of the historic success, we  
21 continue to raise the bar to bring the best care to  
22 the most animals throughout New York City. By  
23 contract with the city, ACC operates under an open  
24 admission model. This makes ACC unique among all  
25 other animal welfare organizations in New York City

2 because we accept any animal brought to any of our  
3 five locations whether the animal has been abandoned,  
4 surrendered, found as a stray, brought in by the  
5 public, NYPD or our animal rescue team and also  
6 regardless of age, health status, breed, species,  
7 temperament or physical condition. We operate three  
8 city owned full service animal care centers located  
9 in Manhattan, Brooklyn and Staton Islands and two  
10 admission centers located in the Bronx and in Queens.  
11 We are the only organization that accepts and seeks  
12 placement for companion animals as well as wildlife,  
13 birds, reptiles and farm animals. In calendar year  
14 2017 ACC took in over 28,000 animals or roughly 75  
15 animals every day. I am going to talk a little bit  
16 about our progress in the past years starting with  
17 recruitment and hiring. Successful recruitment and  
18 retention of staff is at the core of ACC success.  
19 Since the passage of local law 59, ACC has nearly  
20 doubled in size in more than 265 staff across 13  
21 departments with a specific role as it relates to our  
22 overall mission. With over 28,000 animals in our  
23 care annually, we are keenly aware that we cannot  
24 simply end animal homelessness through adoptions  
25 alone. Staff at all levels of qualifications have



2 been added, including individuals with excellent  
3 skills in animal handling, customer service and  
4 social work, as well as advanced degrees and  
5 experience in animal welfare and not for profit  
6 business. ACCs core programmatic strategy focuses on  
7 reducing intake, decreasing behavioral stress and  
8 medical illness inside the shelter, increasing life  
9 placements and building awareness of ACCs  
10 comprehensive services throughout the five boroughs.  
11 We have become a leader in animal welfare because of  
12 the innovative work we are doing inside our care  
13 centers and outside in the community. Here are just  
14 a few examples driving our success in recent years.  
15 Surrender prevention. Thousands of animals in need  
16 of care and homes continue to arrive at our shelter  
17 each year. In response ACC start resources beyond  
18 our contract with the city to build a department  
19 dedicated to surrender prevention. This new approach  
20 to intakes combines our passion for helping animals  
21 with our interest in the human welfare issues facing  
22 pet owners in the community. With the help of  
23 funding and training from ASPCA to date, we have  
24 successfully helped thousands of animals remain out  
25 of the shelter by offering resources and counseling

2 to pet owners. We will continue to seek government  
3 and private funding for this essential program so  
4 that we can help preserve the human animal bond  
5 whenever possible and appropriate and also help  
6 reduce shelter intake. Those who haven't been to one  
7 of our care centers in recent years would be quite  
8 surprised by the innovations ACC has embraced to  
9 increase the chances of adoptions for dogs, cats and  
10 rabbits. Backyard play groups and dog walkers under  
11 the supervision of behavior and enrichment staff  
12 simulate New York City Dog Park Environments as most  
13 New York City Adopters seek social and playful dogs.  
14 Enrichment programs and improved housing for our cats  
15 and rabbits to help them stay healthier which trained  
16 enrichment staff have been added to help calm the  
17 animals, making them less fearful of potential  
18 adopters. With respect to community outreach, in  
19 Fiscal 16, ACC introduced a pilot called the  
20 Community Pet Program funded by the State Senator  
21 Jeffrey Cline which works within the Bronx  
22 neighborhoods to identify dog and cat owners in need  
23 and assist them in keeping their pets. The program  
24 offers a pet food pantry, free basic obedience  
25 classes, free vaccination clinics, free spay neuter

2 services and has impacted nearly 1,500 animals in the  
3 Bronx last year. This program presents a very real  
4 opportunity to help New York City Pet Owners who  
5 struggle with pet ownership either financially or  
6 simply or simply without a support network. ACC is  
7 dedicated to bringing the Community Pet Program to all  
8 five boroughs with the goal of keeping more pets with  
9 their families. We have also grown our adoption rate  
10 and outreach work with two mobile adoption vehicles.  
11 For the past two years, we have deployed or mobile  
12 adoption centers each weekend to different  
13 neighborhoods for an additional 150 adoption and  
14 outreach events annually, increasing adoptions by  
15 nearly 2500 animals since 2016. And finally with  
16 respect to our New Hope Adoption Partners, ACC  
17 strives to provide our animals with medical care,  
18 nourishment, behavior enrichment and mental  
19 stimulation yet thousands of animals require medical  
20 and behavioral resources beyond our capacity. This  
21 is where Community Partnership is vital. Our New  
22 Hope Adoption Partners provides specialized medical  
23 care and behavioral attention to animals that may  
24 otherwise not be ready or suitable for adoption to  
25 the general public or that are at risk of euthanasia

2 due to medical or behavioral issues. In 2017, ACC  
3 added 27 organizations to our roster of over 300  
4 partners and finally ACC appreciates Council's  
5 consideration of Council Member Vallone's proposal to  
6 add a full service shelter in the Bronx and in  
7 Queens. We believe the addition of these shelters  
8 will help continue to improve New York City's Animal  
9 Welfare System, provide more services to a greater  
10 number of New York City residents seeking to adopt or  
11 in need of animal resources, will alleviate the  
12 stress on the existing care centers that ACC operates  
13 and in the long run save more lives. In addition to  
14 building new facilities, it is essential to have  
15 adequate funding to support the many departments and  
16 staff required to run these new shelters optimally.  
17 We urge Council to consider the cost associated not  
18 just with building new shelters but with continuing  
19 to make New York City's Animal Sheltering System  
20 premiere. I thank you for the opportunity to testify  
21 and I am happy to take any questions.

22 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Okay thank you Deputy  
23 Commissioner, thank you President Weinstock. Anytime  
24 we hear the magic words we support this Bill that  
25 makes the City Council very, very happy. I want to

2 acknowledge that we have been joined by stallwork  
3 Health Committee Member Keith Powers and uhm I will  
4 open by asking you to clarify the timeline on the  
5 Bronx shelter development. When can we expect that  
6 to be up and running?

7 CORINNE SCHIFF: Uhm we, we are in the  
8 middle of the, uhm we are just starting the ULURP  
9 process. Let me just get their, our anticipated, uhm  
10 opening date. Just give me a moment.

11 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: So there is a ULURP  
12 required in the Bronx as well.

13 CORINNE SCHIFF: Yes so there is a land  
14 use process which we are beginning now.

15 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: So ULURP clock has  
16 not started ticking yet on the Bronx site?

17 CORINNE SCHIFF: It is just starting now.

18 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Got it so then  
19 construction presumably start in, in a year?

20 CORINNE SCHIFF: Let me just pull the.

21 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Okay got it.

22 CORINNE SCHIFF: Dates then I can answer  
23 your questions just give me one moment.

24 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Alright.

2 CORINNE SCHIFF: So, sorry for the delay,  
3 so we uhm go through the ULURP process and then there  
4 is a design phase, and we expect to open in 2024.

5 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Wow. Uhm so you are  
6 anticipating a five year, of time line from design to  
7 completion which uhm, uhm, hardly is going to be  
8 breaking any speed records, uhm I think we would like  
9 to look at that process and understand whether we can  
10 shave some time off of that for the benefit of  
11 animals and, and companions in the Bronx.

12 CORINNE SCHIFF: So we would be happy to,  
13 to meet and talk about the details of, of the city's  
14 land use process and design and development and we  
15 are certainly, you know the Mayor has been very clear  
16 that he is committed to opening full service shelters  
17 in the Bronx and in Queens. We were as you noted, a  
18 very, we were excited in January to be able to  
19 announce that we had secured a site uhm and we are  
20 embarking on, on the land use process and the design  
21 and construction. These things are, are, take more  
22 time than, than anyone would like but these are, you  
23 know.

2 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Right, can you not  
3 start design now while ULURP process plays out? Is  
4 there a legal reason you can't do that?

5 CORINNE SCHIFF: I don't know if it's a  
6 legal reason but these are, these are steps that  
7 happen sequentially. It is not a process that the  
8 Department of Health owns so we are being guided by  
9 the city's land use process and design and  
10 construction processes.

11 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Alright well we  
12 should, we should perhaps looks at that, to me it  
13 seems like a wasted year, if, if the money is there,  
14 it's been funded, there is no real political dispute,  
15 dispute around, around this project, uhm why not  
16 start design so that the minute we get approval of  
17 the rezoning we can start with procurement?

18 CORINNE SCHIFF: So we are, we are  
19 surely, we are working on every step that we can.

20 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Shall, shall we bring  
21 in another voice here? We can do the affirmation as  
22 well if she would like to speak.

23 CORINNE SCHIFF: Yeah sure, Julie Friesen  
24 is the Deputy Commission for Administration at the

2 Health Department and manages these processes and can  
3 provide the details.

4 COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell the  
5 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in  
6 your testimony before this committee and to respond  
7 honestly to Council Member questions?

8 JULIE FRIESEN: Yes I do. Thank you.  
9 Yes.

10 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Can you clarify this  
11 question of the timeline in the Bronx.

12 JULIE FRIESEN: Sure of course, these, as  
13 Corinne said, these things take longer than any of us  
14 would like, uhm, we, we are working closely with the  
15 city department of design and construction to T this  
16 up to start design and we, we can't because for legal  
17 reasons we can't start these ticket to proceed  
18 process until ULURP is completed. We have just  
19 started ULURP, usually that takes about seven months  
20 to go through that process. We are going to try and  
21 speed that up. As soon as ULURP we can proceed with  
22 DDC to start the design.

23 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Okay well I would  
24 like to examine with you the legal pattern that is  
25 there. It just doesn't seem like it is common sense.



2 Uhm what can you tell us about the timeline in  
3 Queens?

4 CORINNE SCHIFF: So as I noted the  
5 Mayor is very clear that he is committed to a full  
6 service shelter in Bronx and in Queens and we have  
7 been actively looking in Queens. Uhm we have  
8 evaluated about 25 properties, we came very close in  
9 two of two potential properties, we were disappointed  
10 to lose those. Uhm we are actively looking, we are  
11 hopeful that we will have good news soon. I can't  
12 comment on a specific timeline but we think we are  
13 getting close.

14 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: This would be a  
15 property that would be suitable for a full service  
16 shelter or this is a search for a new receiving  
17 center?

18 CORINNE SCHIFF: No I'm talking about a  
19 search for a full service shelter. Uhm we are also,  
20 and I think you noted in your opening comments, we  
21 are relocating the admission center so that in the,  
22 in the interim period before we are able to open the  
23 full service shelter, which as in the Bronx will be a  
24 state of the art uhm full service shelter, uhm we

2 will be expanding the admission center to that we  
3 will be able to increase the capacity in Queens.

4 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Has money been  
5 allocated in the Capital Budget for construction in  
6 Queens?

7 CORINNE SCHIFF: So we have money in the  
8 Capital Budget for Design and once we have identified  
9 the location and have been able to determine exactly  
10 what we will need, we will be able to secure funding.

11 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: So the 90, is it \$95  
12 million is to cover the entire process in the Bronx  
13 and the design phase in Queens, is that right?

14 CORINNE SCHIFF: Correct.

15 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Okay, uhm do you know  
16 yet whether you will need a ULURP at the new site in  
17 Queens?

18 CORINNE SCHIFF: Uhm that depends on the  
19 property so we.

20 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: So if it's not.

21 CORINNE SCHIFF: One of the things that  
22 we look at.

23 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: If it's privately  
24 owned currently then a ULURP is required, is that

2 correct? Do I have that right? If it's sitting on  
3 land we might avoid the ULURP.

4 RISA WEINSTOCK: Julie is our ULURP uhm  
5 expect so I will ask.

6 JULIE FREISEN: Once we identify that  
7 property in Queens, we will know whether we will need  
8 ULURP or not.

9 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Right, again it could  
10 be another lost year uhm if we are waiting on design  
11 for ULURP so uhm.

12 CORINNE SCHIFF: The good thing about  
13 ULURP is, some of the stuff, it's, it's about a seven  
14 month process but it could be shorter if all of the  
15 parties involved you know, work to expedite it and  
16 that includes the community boards and so on.

17 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Right, I've never  
18 heard anyone say a good thing about ULURP in any  
19 context but, but okay. Uhm I have a myriad additional  
20 questions, we are getting ready to pause and allow  
21 the Bill sponsor, Council Member Vallone uhm to ask  
22 questions.

23 PAUL VALLONE: Thank you chair and sure  
24 we, we will split up the time amongst all of our  
25 members. I, I guess when you hear the timeline all

2 of the positivity that we brought into the room just  
3 kind of goes out, out the door so if I'm hearing 2024  
4 for the Bronx and we don't even have a site for  
5 Queens, I'm out of office, we are all out of office.  
6 I don't know who the next Admin, Mayor is going to  
7 be, I don't know who the next speaker is going to be.  
8 I have concerns. I mean this, this was a process  
9 that has had concerns from 2000. Is it going to be  
10 another lawsuit, the next Mayor is get financial  
11 crisis in the city, someone is not going to pose the  
12 site. There is a myriad of things that can happen  
13 and that's why we funded the Site Selection Process a  
14 few years ago now to try to expedite this so we can,  
15 you can have our support, who is right here in front  
16 of you and a speaker and a Mayor and we've got the  
17 group and I don't know what the next group's going to  
18 be. So can we not fight for the inclusion in the  
19 Budget this year, a funding for the Queen site, we  
20 know what the Bronx site estimate is going to be. We  
21 don't know the square footage, we don't know the  
22 site, I get that but not putting anything in the  
23 Budget, I don't get. So what is our plan with  
24 actually funding our future site?

2 CORINNE SCHIFF: Uhm the Mayor has been  
3 clear about his commitment and we will, we have been  
4 assured that when we are able to determine the  
5 funding that we will need uhm that we'll, we'll be  
6 able to secure that. I think we are in a very  
7 different place then we were in 2000 when your, you  
8 know your family's longstanding support uhm for the  
9 shelters.

10 PAUL VALLONE: Ut-oh, uhm dad's watching,  
11 he just knocked over the counter.

12 CORINNE SCHIFF: Uhm and, and when we talk  
13 about opening we are, there are certainly many steps  
14 along the way uhm where the process will be  
15 irrefirmable so we will be breaking ground uhm and so  
16 I think I'm, I'm confident in saying that, that this  
17 administration and the health department are working,  
18 are working actively uhm toward the goal of the full  
19 service shelters in the Bronx and in Queens and we,  
20 we really are in a very different place both with the  
21 Capital Projects and with all of the progress that  
22 you are hearing uhm from Ms. Weinstock about what is  
23 happening at ACC.

24 PAUL VALLONE: Well that's why we have  
25 Intro 401 because even though we are positive, we

2 stil as a Council want to make sure that this will  
3 not be deterred by someone in the future who may not  
4 have the same positivity that we have uhm we can only  
5 hope that folks who sit in these seats after us and  
6 the future Mayor and the future Speaker will have the  
7 same uhm support of this but we are planning on going  
8 forward to make sure that this is law, that we get  
9 our animal shelters in every borough uhm and I think  
10 as the Chair said, we've got to find a way to speed  
11 this up and I think whether it is Parks, whether it's  
12 libraries, whether it is this type of project, is it  
13 over, there is just a frustrational element back in  
14 our communities of why things take so long, so uhm  
15 can we work on, like Queens is just really not an  
16 acceptable situation, as with the Bronx. We have,  
17 you don't even want to look at the receding center  
18 that we have so what's the plan for the new temporary  
19 receiving shelter? Is it just going to be a bigger  
20 space or are we going to provide some additional  
21 services, veterinary care, drop off care, resources?

22 CORINNE SCHIFF: Do you want to speak to  
23 the? Do you want to speak to the services that.

24 PAUL VALLONE: A loading zone? Or is  
25 actually going to have?

2 CORINNE SCHIFF: What we offer at the  
3 admission center and the distinction between the  
4 admission center and the, and the full service  
5 shelter?

6 JULIE FRIESEN: The admission center is  
7 unlike a full service shelter, formally known as  
8 receiving centers. Uhm we are really thinking about  
9 animal welfare differently and we don't want it to be  
10 uhm publicized as this is a place it's bigger so we  
11 can take in more animals just bring us your animals,  
12 so we really are shifting the way we think about  
13 animals in the community. So we have a Surrender  
14 Prevention Program and we have an admissions  
15 department and these centers are now called admission  
16 centers. There is currently a no, no veterinarian  
17 there. We have admission counselors that serve  
18 pretty much like social workers and people come in if  
19 they have to surrender a pet, we offer counseling to  
20 help them identify if there is an issue that will  
21 help them keep their pet and we also provide  
22 information on lost and found animals, people may be  
23 come in and we can give them guidance on adopting  
24 animals and we send them where they need to go. It  
25 is really a resource center for people either looking

2 for pets or who need help keeping their pets or  
3 perhaps uhm we will run our Community Pet Program.  
4 We don't run it out of Queens right now, we run it  
5 out of the Bronx through uhm, uhm grant funding  
6 outside of our contract but we will expand the  
7 outreach services at the admissions center in  
8 addition to taking in animals that, that people need  
9 to surrender.

10 PAUL VALLONE: Okay so we have to think  
11 out of the box then, because if we are talking about  
12 five years in the Bronx. We are talking at least six  
13 to seven years in Queens. Is there any way that we  
14 can address the situation today with our partners or  
15 bringing additional resources to the Bronx and Queens  
16 while we go through this transformation of getting  
17 all new shelters.

18 CORINNE SCHIFF: Absolutely so we have  
19 mobile adoption events, we, we recognize that the  
20 Queens and the Bronx are big boroughs and we want  
21 people to know about ACC. They want, we want people  
22 to adopt from us. We also want them to know that we  
23 are a resource for the community. We do a lot of  
24 outreach events, we actually have an adoption event  
25 coming up in Queens with one of the Council Members.



2 Uhm we will partner with, with Council, with elected  
3 officials, with people in the neighborhood, with  
4 stores, anything that we can to get animals promoted  
5 and adopted through our mobile adoption and outreach  
6 events and we will also uhm provide services that,  
7 that help people. Uhm you may not be able to adopt  
8 inside the Queens Admission Center but you can get  
9 resources from us and we can set you in the right  
10 direction.

11 PAUL VALLONE: Well uhm the enthusiasm and  
12 the support is there. I think it's, it's the next  
13 step is what do we actually bring. I remember when  
14 we came out to 169 Academy and the kids greeted you  
15 with a video on the need to have a shelter and then  
16 the Mayor came out and said this is great, the kids  
17 were excited and there was a promise then we brought  
18 the mobile out and they adopted some of the, so the  
19 parents would bring some of them, they immediately  
20 got the pets right on the spot uhm but it was, it was  
21 the process, right and it was, it was exciting and  
22 then we did it again at 1:30. Sometimes we say to  
23 you why don't we just get more mobile units and then  
24 it's a matter of an unfunded mandate we can create  
25 the mobile unit but you don't have the staff to do

2 that. These are the type of things I think we need  
3 to do to address today and not eight years from now.  
4 I would like to in the funding and the support from  
5 the Council Members you need a mobile unit we will  
6 get one. I think each, every Council Member would be  
7 happy to have C1 in there but we want to be sure of  
8 the staff of that, do you have the ability to create  
9 those additional places for your staff so that we can  
10 meet you on this adventure while we are getting it?

11 CORINNE SCHIFF: Absolutely, I think one  
12 of the strongest assets that ACC has is a team of  
13 staff leaders, management, senior leadership is here,  
14 if we have the staff, the resources for staff to uhm  
15 put a mobile adoption program together in another one  
16 for Queens or whatever as long as we have the staff  
17 we can make the program work. We get a lot of  
18 Capital Projects and we are thrilled with the \$98  
19 million coming down the pike for new, new full  
20 service shelters and all of the renovations and we  
21 embrace that, we are thrilled about that.

22 PAUL VALLONE: But that's one.

23 CORINNE SCHIFF: But the here and now is  
24 what can we do today and I agree, what, what can we  
25 do today to do better to go beyond where we are at a

2 93% placement rate that, that's record breaking but  
3 we need to add more, more programs, expand the  
4 programs that we are already doing to do even better  
5 than 93% but it's not just a Capital improvement. It  
6 has to come with the people who can staff the vehicle  
7 and select the animals and, and we would welcome the  
8 opportunity to grow mobile adoptions. Uhm it's been  
9 very successful. We have two vehicles in the last  
10 couple of years, we have adopted more than 2000  
11 animals in addition to the animals that we are  
12 adopting in the brick and mortar shelters.

13           PAUL VALLONE: But the fact that we  
14 don't, we don't see them it's like once a year if I  
15 get the van, if I get the mobile unit that, that's  
16 the moment, the need to do these things. If it  
17 doesn't, tomorrow's emergency takes over what is  
18 happening today and if we don't take advantage of  
19 what is happening now with the kid's asking for it,  
20 students want to get involved. We just had a great  
21 meeting with your staff and we talked about food  
22 pantry collection. It is already taking off, the  
23 kids in the district are we, we will collect things  
24 for the pets, there's such an untapped resource in  
25 our children to join us in this but then we can't

2 even have them with, walk the dogs and the cats  
3 because it's a big responsibility. You can't have a  
4 4-year-old running after lassie in the middle of  
5 that. So I think we would be able to grow that. Do  
6 we have plans for fighting for this years budget to  
7 increase for today's problems? That's what I want to  
8 see. I want to see the Budget. I got the Bronx  
9 funded, we got a plan but we are not addressing what  
10 we are talking about between these next zero and  
11 seven years of how we are going to address what is  
12 happening in two of our five boroughs where we don't  
13 have a shelter? That's what I would like to see in  
14 this year while we have a Mayor and we have a  
15 Council, let's fight for the funding to do what we  
16 need, whether it's staffing, whether it's  
17 programming, whether it's resources, our partners,  
18 mobile vans and adoption centers, that's what we want  
19 to see, we want to see that, okay we got this for  
20 Capital, we have reserve which we don't have yet for  
21 Queens and we have this plan in place. It just can't  
22 be that receiving shelter, it's, it's, Queens is just  
23 it's upsetting. It's beyond upsetting. You just  
24 can't go on in our current phase and when you know  
25 what is happening in the Bronx, that it's going to be

2 six or seven years, go back to Queens and say it's a  
3 great hearing then.

4 CORINNE SCHIFF: And in addition to the  
5 meeting that, our outreach team had with you, you are  
6 having meetings with Council Members in the Bro...  
7 many more Council Members. One of the things that  
8 you see, the mobile adoption vehicle, one thing you  
9 don't see, ironically it's a good things because it's  
10 deployed, it's all over the city. I mean, we, our  
11 shelters are not easy to get to.

12 PAUL VALLONE: It's work.

13 CORINNE SCHIFF: So absolutely, so it's  
14 worker so unfortunately we can't just if you pick up  
15 the phone and say how about next weekend, we have, we  
16 are set through the summer pretty much with events  
17 with that vehicle, it's very popular. So we do see  
18 that as...

19 PAUL VALLONE: Because you have to have  
20 the, the animals, it's a demand on the animals, it's  
21 a stress level, you just can't throw them into a unit  
22 and drive around and get pegged. I totally get that.  
23 It's, it's both ways, you want to have the humane  
24 situation for our pets and a learning situation for  
25 the families so it's right, it's not the answer but

2 it, it just keeps that passion going to see the  
3 animals.

4           CORINNE SCHIFF: And outreaches, ke... we  
5 are growing our community outreach that is part of  
6 our strategy for the coming years, especially without  
7 a brick and mortar in Queens and in the Bronx. We  
8 want to get into the community to make sure that we  
9 are reaching children and that people know that you  
10 can adopt from ACC, where we are located, where the  
11 mobile events would be. We have a website that lists  
12 all the events throughout the boroughs, outreach is  
13 really, really critical. It is the next piece of our  
14 strategic plan.

15           PAUL VALLONE: Well and I'll turn it back  
16 to Chair and the Council. I think there, there's an  
17 ability there and it's an educational center also,  
18 even if we are not adopting out of that and that is  
19 where your staff has been unbelievable. There is  
20 also a little Johnny that wants to poke the cat in  
21 between the thing and then you teach the correct way  
22 on how to hold and handle a cat and an animal with  
23 love and then that, that seed is planted in a child  
24 and if mother or father is looking on saying hey  
25 maybe it is time for my family to adopt and that's

2 what is so important about those mobile centers,  
3 especially when you don't have a shelter, is you are  
4 bringing the educational and the heart right to  
5 schools where you have now teachers and parents and  
6 PTAs and CECs who are willing to work with us so  
7 while we have this momentum I think we should think  
8 beyond the box and do even more on that and I'll,  
9 I'll turn it back over to the Chair, thank you.

10 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Thank you Council  
11 Member Vallone. Council Member Powers.

12 KEITH POWERS: Thank you thank you  
13 Chairman and I, this issue is new to me but I have to  
14 admit that to the Vallone's this has been going on  
15 for decades and uhm and uhm I think you are going to  
16 have to get another Vallone in the Council after this  
17 to make sure that we don't uhm, we don't lose site of  
18 it, maybe, maybe I will be here, uhm just to follow  
19 up, just to follow up on the Qu... the timing in the  
20 Queens site and then the legal question around the  
21 ULURP. I just want to the clarification of wh, I  
22 think the clearest answer or maybe I missed it what  
23 what requires the City to be going through the Land  
24 Use process and complete the Land Use process before  
25

2 it is, it goes into the design, into design for the  
3 shelter?

4 CORINNE SCHIFF: So uhm we learned this  
5 through OMB and it's my understanding is it is OMB  
6 Bond Council. I think it is because Capital Projects  
7 are, are funded by city bonds, municipal bonds and I  
8 think uhm the thinking that ULURP should be complete  
9 so that we are 100% that the property is going to be  
10 developed for that particular purpose before Bond  
11 money can be spent, Capital money can be spent.

12 KEITH POWERS: Gotcha it's like OMB  
13 secure, right.

14 CORINNE SCHIFF: Yes.

15 KEITH POWERS: And for Queens you are  
16 still looking for a site, and what is it, what would  
17 trigger the ULURP process, is it private verus public  
18 property or is it, is it disposition of property or  
19 what's the actual mech.. what is the expectation  
20 around.

21 CORINNE SCHIFF: It could be site  
22 selection and it could be zoning.

23 KEITH POWERS: And in, and in the Bronx,  
24 what was the, is it site selection or?

25 CORINNE SCHIFF: Yes.



2 KEITH POWERS: Site selection, gotcha and  
3 for being new to this as well I just wanted to  
4 clarify a couple of things, the City Council passed a  
5 law, am I correct in 2000 that says that required  
6 that the city has to have a full service shelter in  
7 all five boroughs am I correct saying that?

8 CORINNE SCHIFF: I believe is was in 2000  
9 and that was in the Chair's opening comments that it  
10 was in 2000.

11 KEITH POWERS: 2000 so then that was  
12 local law 26 under I guess Speaker Vallone and then  
13 we pas... I gues.. I will just make a comment. I  
14 mean we passed five or six Bills on this topic and  
15 are so out of compliance with it, that seems  
16 wreckless or incredible to me and that we will be by  
17 the time the Queen sites open up 27 years from the  
18 passing of a law by the City Council to have a  
19 shelter. Of, unless I'm wrong, you can correct me if  
20 I'm wrong in reading it, I'm just, I'm reading what's  
21 right in front of me but it seems like we passed a  
22 law in 2000, four speakers ago, to, to require a full  
23 service shelter, so what has been the, so I guess my  
24 question is what has been the delay or the challenge  
25 to actually comply with our own City Law?

2 CORINNE SCHIFF: I can speak for this  
3 Administration and, and say that uhm the Mayor has  
4 been clear that regardless of what is in the ad code  
5 and there is no requirement in the ad code for a full  
6 service shelter at the moment but we are in, but we  
7 have come here to testify in support of Introduction  
8 401 uhm and the Mayor has been clear, ad code  
9 requirement or no it is his commitment to open a full  
10 service shelter in the Bronx and in Queens. He has  
11 made the clear to the public and he has made that  
12 clear to uhm to us at the Health Department and that  
13 is what we are actively working to do.

14 KEITH POWERS: Gotcha and I, my colleague  
15 here did remind me that there was an amendment in the  
16 middle of that so, I, I, my, I'm still challenged by  
17 the fact that they did that I guess but I, I  
18 understand that and so that, the position of the  
19 Administration is regardless of whether we pass a  
20 piece of Legislation or not that the Administration  
21 fully supports opening the five shelters whether we  
22 put it into the ad code or, or not. Just to clarify,  
23 put that on the record too.

24 CORINNE SCHIFF: Yes the Administration  
25 is committed to doing it, uhm we are actively working

2 on it. We are supporting the Bill, uhm Bill or no  
3 Bill this is, this is the intent is to open a full  
4 service shelter in the Bronx and in Queens. We have  
5 announced the location in the Bronx and we are  
6 actively working to make that happen in Queens as  
7 well.

8 KEITH POWERS: And so uhm as Council  
9 Member Vallone mentioned, some, some folks will be  
10 long, long past their City Council tenures, on to  
11 bigger, greener pastures I am sure, uhm, uhm perhaps  
12 I will still be around depending on when that site  
13 uhm, uhm identified. what are the steps that the  
14 city can take around Budgeting or other than to honor  
15 that commitment and to preserve it beyond this  
16 Administration.

17 CORINNE SCHIFF: Well throughout the, the  
18 process as we have been looking for uhm locations, we  
19 have certainly been open and and encouraging Council  
20 Members, you may be more uhm more familiar with  
21 locations in your district and we, we've encouraged  
22 and asked for recommendations. We continue to  
23 welcome those uhm when we undertake the land use  
24 process, there is a public component to that, we  
25 welcome your support in those, in those processes.

2 KEITH POWERS: Gotcha. And the uhm, the  
3 middle village, I think there is a, it's not a full  
4 service shelter that's a like a rece... what's  
5 happening.

6 CORINNE SCHIFF: So that's, that's what  
7 we were just discussing. The new uhm expanded  
8 admission center which we are working to open as an  
9 interim measure while we undertake a full service  
10 shelter in Queens.

11 KEITH POWERS: Gotcha. And what, what  
12 are you needs for a shelter in Queens like size, what  
13 are, what are the needs in terms of what kind of  
14 community it would be in. Thinks like that.

15 CORINNE SCHIFF: That's right so we have  
16 a number of criteria that we use to evaluate all the  
17 sites, uhm size is critically important, uhm  
18 location, location, location, right, we are going to  
19 succeed in making a place where people can come and  
20 and look for a new pet if we, if we are in a place  
21 that is the right location, easily accessible, we  
22 consider, the zoning for a shelter, it's complicated  
23 so that's part of our evaluation. Uhm the ULURP  
24 question is complicated. We evaluate that. We were  
25 pleased that in the Bronx we were able to identify a

2 city owned property uhm that it checked off our bo...  
3 all of the criteria so it made for an ideal site.  
4 Uhm city owned property is a be all and end all but  
5 it changes, makes some of the things easier for us to  
6 achieve so there is all of these criteria and that's  
7 why I said we have, we have examined something like  
8 25 property in Queens, we came very close on two,  
9 those fell thru you know I think real estate is  
10 notoriously difficult challenging in New York City  
11 but we are continuing to, we are actively looking, we  
12 have five, we have Capital projects in every borough,  
13 we are not working on them one at a time  
14 sequentially, we are proceeding full steam ahead on  
15 all of them.

16 KEITH POWERS: Gotcha and, and what's  
17 the, what is the zoning complication around it, is it  
18 what what it is classified as?

19 CORINNE SCHIFF: So there is a specific  
20 zoning category uhm that doesn't mean that, that, you  
21 know that is something that we can sometimes work  
22 with but it is just one of the factors that we look  
23 at as we evaluate a, a project.

24 KEITH POWERS: Gotcha, thank you. And,  
25 the, and I'll hand it back over, the question I have

2 is the 93% rate, the other 7% I real something around  
3 18 hours, is that the 18 hour, can you explain that  
4 to me?

5 CORINNE SCHIFF: I'm going to let Ms.  
6 Weinstock address that.

7 RISA WEINSTOCK: Excuse me 93% is our  
8 placement of dogs and cats, uhm we take over 20,000  
9 dogs and cats every year. With respect to that 7%  
10 those are the animals that were euthanized in 2017.  
11 That was less than 2000 animals. Right outside of  
12 owner requested euthanasia which is a service that  
13 veterinarians provide and we also provide as a low  
14 cost service to the public. With respect to those 7%,  
15 animals that have a health issue or a behavioral  
16 issue are at risk of euthanasia, keeping that, an  
17 animal that has a contagious illness or behavior  
18 challenge is not safe for operating a full service  
19 shelter with so many animals. Again to remind you,  
20 we have 75 animals coming in every day. The 18 hours  
21 is, is an additional amount of time that we give to  
22 any animal that we consider at risk of euthanasia.  
23 We publish a list of those animals for the public and  
24 for our partners to see. This is another chance for  
25 them to be placed. It is in addition to all of the

2 efforts that our team has made to publicize the  
3 animals when they first come into the shelter so many  
4 of them could have been in the shelter for 72 hours  
5 because they are stray and we are waiting to see if  
6 there is an owner, if their behavior changes or  
7 their, their medical issues change they may become at  
8 risk so we post this list at night. It gives the  
9 public and the New Hope Partners an additional 18  
10 hours to look at these animals and decide if they  
11 want to place them uhm, the other thing is well we  
12 mentioned with respect to euthanasia, another  
13 question close to this 18 hour rule, it's not a rule,  
14 again it's 18 more hours to try to get the animals  
15 out. People who say it is only 18 hours may just be  
16 getting onto the site to look at animals that are at  
17 risk and not looking at them when they first come  
18 into the organization when they are available or  
19 could be available for adoption or for placement.  
20 There is no time limit. If an animal comes in and  
21 their health and their temperament are fine we are  
22 going to keep that animal. Our goal is to place as  
23 many animals as possible. We want the best outcome  
24 for the most animals. We agree, let's try and place  
25 more animals. There is no time limit. We have

2 animals. In fact we have a dog who just left the  
3 Brooklyn shelter who has been there four months,  
4 months. There is no time limit, if they remain  
5 healthy and their behavior is, is safe they will stay  
6 with us until we can make an appropriate placement  
7 and in the interim we are doing all kinds of programs  
8 to keep them healthy and to keep them active and  
9 reduce stress and all of that but unfortunately there  
10 are those 7% that had either an illness or a behavior  
11 issue that made them at risk.

12 KEITH POWERS: What's the adoption rate  
13 once they are on the? What's the percentage of  
14 animals that get adopted once they are on that 18  
15 hour list?

16 CORINNE SCHIFF: So in March for example,  
17 posting that list resulted in 89% of the animals that  
18 were on that list, were placed, so we see it,  
19 although it is a very compassion driven list to put  
20 up there and you know it, it creates a lot of  
21 sensitivities. It is another avenue to try one more  
22 time let's see if we can place these animals. Uhm in  
23 the last several months, not a single cat that was on  
24 that list had been euthanized. At you know so it is  
25 just an extra.



2 KEITH POWERS: Are they being adopted by  
3 individual owners like people are going on and seeing  
4 that or it is, are there other organizations that  
5 take them or is it individuals.

6 CORINNE SCHIFF: Because of the  
7 challenges that these animals have it is either  
8 health or behavior, uhm certain animals of that 7%  
9 are only available for our rescue adoption partners,  
10 we call then New Hope Partners and we have an entire  
11 New Hope Team dedicated to connecting with these  
12 partners to make these placements. There are animals  
13 that have serious behavioral concerns that we would  
14 only place with a New Hope Partner because we have an  
15 obligation to ensure safety to the public as well and  
16 we have to make certain determinations based on the  
17 information that we have of a particular animal to  
18 determine whether we can trust that animal in the  
19 public, with someone from the public or if we only  
20 have to place them with a partner who we know and who  
21 we know is going to work with that animal to  
22 hopefully get them into a place for a better  
23 placement.

24 KEITH POWERS: And I'll just my last  
25 question. What's the average stay before, what's the

2 average? You are saying. You made a point that if  
3 it was an important which is that it is not only 18  
4 hours but its 18 hours, right but what is the average  
5 time before dog or cat ends up on that 18 hour list?

6 CORINNE SCHIFF: Again there is no amount  
7 of time. It really depends on the individual animal.

8 KEITH POWERS: What is the average? The  
9 average?

10 CORINNE SCHIFF: Our average, I can't  
11 talk in terms of how much time before they get, they  
12 are at risk of euthanasia. That is an individual  
13 determination. Our average length of stay is five  
14 days, we want to get animals out of the shelter  
15 because keeping too many animals and over population  
16 of animals drives illness. Illness drives uhm  
17 stress, stress drives illness, illness creates more  
18 animals at risk of euthanasia but we don't have a  
19 specific time frame for any one animal before they  
20 are at risk. Every animal.

21 KEITH POWERS: I understand point, I  
22 guess my, my, my point, my questions is if the, if  
23 the which is received is well there is an any amount  
24 of time and then there is a behavioral or a health  
25 issue that leads to putting them on the list and

2 that's, that is the response. Maybe it, I don't know  
3 maybe its the right response to the question of  
4 behavior the end of an 18 hour question. I think it  
5 is a fair and reasonable question to ask what an  
6 average time is before they end up. Am I asking for  
7 every single animals time, I think it is a reasonable  
8 request to ask wh, how fast is that process happening  
9 on average in process?

10 CORINNE SCHIFF: I don't have the  
11 information to answer that. I. Really it is not, we  
12 are studying animals as individuals. I can look. We  
13 can try and run some data to see but again I want to  
14 go back to the 93% placement. The sooner we get  
15 animals out of the shelter the healthier they are  
16 going to be because it is too many, to have a high  
17 population you are going to drive more illness which  
18 of course is going to make that at risk list, uhm it  
19 could make animals get on the at risk list even  
20 sooner so we can study it and I am happy to have that  
21 conversation with you after.

22 KEITH POWERS: Okay thank you. Did you  
23 have more information?

24 CORINNE SCHIFF: No I was just going to  
25 say that we will take a look..

2 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Thank you Council  
3 Member Powers. I think I think another way to phrase  
4 this or to parch the data would be to say that you  
5 have a five day average for all animals before they  
6 exit. Is there a different average for those animals  
7 which are euthanized. That number is knowable,  
8 right?

9 CORINNE SCHIFF: We will, we will take a  
10 look and see if we can, see if we can come up with  
11 that and get back to you.

12 KEITH POWERS: Please do.

13 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: I do want to drill  
14 down on this, on this question of what we can do to  
15 push the live release rate even higher, I think  
16 that's, that's the essential goal here. That is  
17 going to require doing more to keep animals in caring  
18 homes, in part by innovative strategies to support  
19 pet owners, pet companions. You are doing that but,  
20 we want to do more. It is going to require greater  
21 efforts to keep animals healthy in the shelters,  
22 perhaps by improved facilities. Uhm expanded vet,  
23 veterinary care so the animals can return to health  
24 or avoid sickness, expand the efforts to facility  
25 adoptions. This, there is more we can do at every

2 stage to continue the progress. Uhm, so, uhm in  
3 terms of let's start with efforts to keep animals in  
4 their homes. Uhm, you have, uhm, an innovative  
5 project I think in the Bronx, uhm which directly  
6 serves with animal owners, animal companions,  
7 providing them free food for example, essentially a  
8 food pantry for animals and perhaps offering training  
9 and other support. Could you explain how that works  
10 and to the extent of which this is a city wide  
11 program and what it would take if it's not to go  
12 citywide.

13 CORINNE SCHIFF: That's the Community Pet  
14 Program that you are referring to and it is funded  
15 originally it was funded through a grant from State  
16 Senator Jeffery Cline from the Bronx to address areas  
17 of concern, we saw just look at data and where our  
18 pet surrender is coming from, understanding different  
19 pockets of the neighborhood, what we offer in that  
20 program, it's run out of a vehicle, not out of our  
21 admission center and we have basically clinics where  
22 we offer, we promote it so people know in advance and  
23 in fact it has gotten so popular that before we even  
24 arrive there are people lined up around the corner  
25 waiting for our services. We provide vaccines and

2 appointments for spay neuter. We address behavioral  
3 issues by offering vouchers for free basic obedience  
4 training. Uhm its really, what we are seeing is like  
5 this is, you have to think of animal sheltering  
6 differently. This is what is going on outside of the  
7 shelters, if we can reach these people and provide  
8 the services that we need, we are going to really  
9 have an impact on that, live release rate because  
10 people can keep their pets longer and we see that  
11 there is a lack of services and a lack of affordable  
12 services and with with the Bronx shelter you know  
13 keeping animals out of the shelter is terrific but  
14 with a shelter in the Bronx and another one in Queens  
15 we can offer a larger compliment of these services.  
16 Right now it's, it's in the Bronx we have uhm food  
17 pantry and in Queens as well but it's not as, the  
18 Community Pet Program is really more robust in the  
19 Bronx and that's really uhm because of the grant and  
20 also it is a program that we are just trying to push  
21 to add to our complement of services.

22 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: So that, that program  
23 is what's the annual operating costs? The annual  
24 operating costs for the Neighborhood Pet Program?  
25 That vehicle?

2 CORINNE SCHIFF: Well originally, the  
3 first grant that Senator Cline gave us was \$250,000  
4 and we used that to purchase the vehicle and to hire  
5 some staff. We have a really good volunteer core  
6 that helps support it. Of course, you need doctor's  
7 and licensed individuals to, to vaccinate and to  
8 microchip, uhm and I think uhm excuse me. Let me  
9 just. (background noise).

10 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: So to, for each  
11 operation is about 200 a year?

12 CORINNE SCHIFF: A year.

13 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Okay. And we can  
14 definitely use that in Manhattan. I think Council  
15 Member Powers would agree. I can tell you for sure  
16 there are pet owners in my District who are on the  
17 margin and they need help and it's, it's just such a  
18 win to keep an animal in a caring home. For the  
19 animal and for the city and for ACC so uhm I feel  
20 like we need to push the envelope on allocating  
21 resources, I understand it's a Budget fight but we  
22 could, we could use a vehicle like that uhm  
23 everywhere, certainly in my District Uptown I'm sure  
24 on Brooklyn as well and Staton Island. So the, the

2 food pantry is also run out of that vehicle, or is  
3 that a second operation?

4 CORINNE SCHIFF: The food pantry is  
5 located at our admission centers and part of that is  
6 not just handing out food, people come in, we take  
7 their information, we microchip their animals and so  
8 that, there's, there's a support network it is not  
9 just that you come in for free food and you lead. We  
10 are really trying to reach the individual and see  
11 what else can we help you with and sometimes they may  
12 come in for food and we can talk them into uhm spay  
13 neuter and finding you know the ASPCA has been a  
14 tremendous partner uhm to offer free spay neuter  
15 services and so there are, there are surrender  
16 prevention services that we are doing in Brooklyn and  
17 in Manhattan where we will actually put someone in an  
18 Uber and or a taxi and send them to, with a voucher  
19 to a low cost vet clinic. So whatever services we  
20 can offer and this is grant funded and it's really,  
21 when I said to Council Member Vallone before about  
22 Community Outreach being the next major, major piece  
23 of our strategy to save more lives and impact animal  
24 welfare in New York City, this is part of it.



2 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: So you have a grant  
3 to subsidize veterinary care for owners that  
4 otherwise wouldn't be able to afford that?

5 CORINNE SCHIFF: Currently I do.

6 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: So how much are you  
7 allocated? How much have you received for that  
8 program?

9 CORINNE SCHIFF: Well that's all part of  
10 the.

11 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: This is part of the,  
12 this is also part of this. So you are doing a lot  
13 with that \$200,000 or \$250,000 right?

14 CORINNE SCHIFF: There a little more.  
15 Yeah the surrender prevention which is for the  
16 veterinary care and then the Community Pet Program  
17 which is you come to our vehicle and we vaccinate, we  
18 microchip.

19 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: And so what is the  
20 Budget for Surrender Prevention?

21 CORINNE SCHIFF: The surrender prevention  
22 budget is significant because it started as a pilot  
23 in Manh... in Brooklyn excuse me through the ASPCA  
24 and then it was successful and so the ASPCA helped us

2 grow it to provide those services in Manhattan and  
3 based.

4 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Right.

5 CORINNE SCHIFF: On what we learned, we  
6 moved it into the Admissions Centers.

7 RISA WEINSTOCK: And, and we can provide  
8 when it sounds like there are different overlapping  
9 programs and we can, we can work together and provide  
10 the detail, you know the details of this for you.

11 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Yes and sur,  
12 Surrender Prevention is in all five boroughs,  
13 currently? Are you offering these kinds of subsidies  
14 and transportation assistance?

15 CORINNE SCHIFF: Yes.

16 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: In all, in all five  
17 boroughs?

18 CORINNE SCHIFF: Yes.

19 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Is there a resource  
20 limitation? Could you uhm prevent more surrenders if  
21 you had more money for vouchers and cab fare, etc.?  
22 Right. So. (this goes back to us saying lets get  
23 the budget. You feed us those numbers).

24

25

2 CORINNE SCHIFF: I want to say that we  
3 don't want to lose site of all of the work that is  
4 going on inside the shelter to get us where we all.

5 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: And, and I wan, and I  
6 acknowledge that and I want to focus on that but if  
7 we can spend a little money to keep an animal in  
8 their home it is actually probably saving us money on  
9 net versus housing an animal in the shelter with all  
10 the staffing and all of the veterinary cares. It is  
11 also better for the animal and uhm and it precludes  
12 the need for euthanasia so, so, that is, that is  
13 really a worthwhile investment. I think investment  
14 is the right word. And uhm we need to push the  
15 envelope on the resources there. Uhm it just seems  
16 like smart policy and humane policy. Uhm now one,  
17 let's, let's, let's also focus on, on the shelter  
18 itself where I know, you know, you know, I  
19 acknowledge the incredible progress that we've made.  
20 Uhm and all I want to do is continue the progress.  
21 Which I am sure everyone all stakeholders want to do  
22 as well. Uhm, you you are battling the challenges of  
23 animals getting sick in the shelter. Uhm that I  
24 guess is commonly referred to as kennel cough, cough  
25 and other ailments. Uhm could you explain a little

2 bit about why, why it is that animals get sick and  
3 what they are getting sick from? Is it, is it  
4 largely a function of closely, closely confined  
5 quarters and therefore if we had more space, could we  
6 avoid that. Disease and transmission of disease in  
7 the shelters is a factor of a lot of things, one of  
8 the things that we learned after the aiding influenza  
9 outbreak was housing. We were housing way too many  
10 animals to keep disease uhm down and these are  
11 contagious illnesses. The more crowded the shelter  
12 is the more it will spread. What we have done to  
13 really reduce disease and through an amazing medical  
14 department under a fantastic medical director who has  
15 been is us for a couple of years and consulted with  
16 us prior is we looked at housing and so we we changed  
17 out housing and so we changed out housing to more  
18 space and more space for animals and we are very  
19 aware of our cleaning protocols, we are trying to  
20 reduce stress through all kinds of enrichments  
21 programs I mean there are a lot of things that go  
22 into disease management but the number one issue is  
23 putting too many animals in these, in these locations  
24 and we have managed to reduce the intake through all  
25 of the other programs that I spoke about which really

2 drives success for the placement rate because fewer  
3 animals that are sick are great, better candidates  
4 for adoption and will be able to place more animals.

5 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Because if you have  
6 an animal that has avian flu, a cat with avian flu  
7 which is highly contagious if I'm not mistaken. You  
8 put them in isolation? Correct? Are they still in  
9 the same stack of kennels that all the other animals  
10 are in.

11 CORINNE SCHIFF: Let's not talk about  
12 avian flu because that is highly contagious.

13 RISA WEINSTOCK: And that was a very  
14 specific instance, that's not the common thing,  
15 though.

16 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: So there are, there  
17 are several things that we try to do, we try to treat  
18 and place, uhm it is stressful to move animals from  
19 place to place to place. Uhm the isolation that we  
20 have is very limited and it, it does not, uhm you  
21 know it's not state of the art uhm but to the extent  
22 that we can we have an isolation room and we isolate  
23 animals in a room that have highly contagious  
24 illnesses but the best thing that we can do for those  
25 animals is to get them out of the shelter because

2 they will impact the health of all the other animals.  
3 So again going back to length of stay. It is not  
4 wise to keep an animal with a contagious illness  
5 longer until they can get better. The, the goal  
6 would be to get that animal placed and usually that  
7 is through one of our rescue partners.

8 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: But I assume you are  
9 going to have more isolation space in the Bronx  
10 shelter and hopefully in the Queens shelter and that  
11 must be because that's a tool for preventing disease,  
12 right? The spread of, the spread of the disease,  
13 right?

14 CORINNE SCHIFF: That's right and so the  
15 goal of all of the Capital Projects and then we  
16 talked about state of the art projects is designed  
17 with the best practices in mind.

18 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: So the Manhattan  
19 shelter which I don't know if we mentioned up until  
20 now, uhm I believe there is a planned expansion into  
21 the adjacent parking area, is that correct? Will  
22 that allow us for additional isolation space?

23 CORINNE SCHIFF: So the uhm the parking  
24 garage will be converted into an adoption center and

2 that will free up space and allow ACC to make changes  
3 within the uhm existing uhm.

4 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: And what will those  
5 changes be? Do we not know yet?

6 CORINNE SCHIFF: We really, we have to  
7 look at how much space it frees up. The, the garage  
8 is going to become the adoption center, it is 2500  
9 square feet. It has, it has a housing capacity of  
10 approximately 25 animals, 25 to 30 animals so as I  
11 said we get 75 animals every day. We are hoping that  
12 all of the adoption candidates can be in the garage  
13 but we, we really have to look at what our population  
14 is but yet it will free up various, I mean you've  
15 seen the Manhattan shelter are doing adoptions,  
16 really we created a nook in a hallway where we have.  
17 So it will free up that hallway absolutely but the,  
18 the space where the animals are, we expect that it  
19 will definitely alleviate the population constraints  
20 that we have now.

21 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Okay on the adoption  
22 front, mobile vans, uhm in my experience they are  
23 very effective. We had one in my District a couple  
24 of weeks ago. I know that a number of animals were  
25 adopted, it's, it's so powerful to have them right

2 where people live, where they can even casually uhm  
3 stroll in. How many animals are adopted through the  
4 mobile vans. You have two, correct, how many are  
5 adopted every year?

6 CORINNE SCHIFF: We have two and in the  
7 last couple of years it's been about 2500.

8 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: That's a huge number.

9 CORINNE SCHIFF: Total in the last two  
10 years. And I would say about 800... I mean each year  
11 we are doing better.

12 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: So 800 per year?

13 CORINNE SCHIFF: 800 additional adoptions  
14 through the mobile van.

15 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Got it, so again we  
16 have five boroughs, so we want five shelters, we  
17 want, we also want five of everything if we can  
18 because it's a big city and in order to achieve our  
19 goals on the numbers we need to be everywhere so why,  
20 why don't we have five mobile vans? Money again. So  
21 what does it take to op, to operate a mobile van?  
22 You obviously have staffing.

23 CORINNE SCHIFF: So Capital money for a  
24 van is wonderful but if we don't have, we have, have  
25 to put staff on, it's not just a driver. You have to



2 have one drive it. You have to have people who do  
3 adoption counseling so it's drivers, it's staff, it's  
4 the vehicle, it's the program currently runs.

5 RISE WEINSTOCK: Why don't we, we, we'll  
6 get back to it.

7 CORINNE SCHIFF: Yeah, we have, we have  
8 the information on what each program costs but uhm  
9 the vehicle alone is over \$100,000.

10 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Right, the Capital is  
11 probably a lesser challenge although not to be  
12 disregarded. It's the ongoing staffing needs. I  
13 mean this, this is the heart of the matter here,  
14 which is we, we need to invest in the kind of  
15 strategies which are, proven to now be working, to be  
16 preventing, surrender, to be keeping animals healthy,  
17 to be pushing the adoption rate and uhm what if my  
18 understanding is, is correct, we could have a  
19 virtuous cycle here. Because uhm as we reduce intake  
20 uhm as we can more quickly move animals out of the  
21 shelter system, uhm, we are going to have less  
22 contagious disease, we are going to have fewer  
23 animals that are left without an adoptee or a foster  
24 home and uhm that's going, only going to drive our  
25 success rate, our live release rate higher so we want

2 to get on that virtuous cycle and this investment to  
3 me seems like uhm the way to do it and something  
4 that, that I think we need to do as quickly as  
5 possible. Uhm.

6 KEITH POWERS: Is there an ability to  
7 work with any of our partners now in the Queens and  
8 the Bronx to act as that shelter. Is any of our  
9 partners have the space or if we would increase the  
10 funding or the assistance to those partners that  
11 could act as an interim shelter for us or an  
12 increased instead of just a receiving.

13 CORINNE SCHIFF: I'm not sure what you  
14 mean by partners?

15 KEITH POWERS: Well are, our sponsors,  
16 our friends, our, the groups, advocates that are  
17 working with us, does any of them have the structural  
18 or the facility space that could act as a temporary  
19 shelter for us. If we would increase the funding for  
20 those groups. I need something that we can talk  
21 about.

22 CORINNE SCHIFF: So we can think about  
23 that and get back to you.

24 KEITH POWERS: I think that would be a  
25 good, so what are our options until we get to the

2 point of a full working. I think that's, what I mean  
3 by looking at the box, maybe there is one of the  
4 groups that will be able to give us some space to  
5 increase where maybe we just different locations of  
6 what we are already doing now instead of one case in  
7 Middle Village, one in Queens Boulevard, maybe we can  
8 do the Rockaways, Astoria and Bayside. Might be able  
9 to increase.

10 CORINNE SCHIFF: Thank you for that  
11 suggestion, we will take a look at that.

12 KEITH POWERS: Thank you.

13 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Could you say a word  
14 about uhm, a line of questioning that I often get  
15 from the public which is that you uhm spay and neuter  
16 an animal and are forced to euthanize it. Could you  
17 just explain the facts on that?

18 CORINNE SCHIFF: By law every animal that  
19 needs ACC needs to be spayed or neutered. What we do  
20 is we spay and neuter animals that, or dogs, cats or  
21 rabbits that we uhm believe will be good candidates  
22 for adoption. In the last year, with the help of the  
23 ASPCA over 8500 animals have been spayed or, spayed  
24 or neutered before putting them in adoption or before  
25 placement. The goal there is it increases their

2 chances for adoption and to leave more quickly. You  
3 come into the shelter, you want to adopt, you can  
4 take that pet home right away. Otherwise you would  
5 have to wait one or two days and that increases the  
6 length of stay and again there is constantly this  
7 formula the longer an animal stays in the shelter  
8 it's more stressful, stress brings disease. In the  
9 last uhm year over 8500 animals have been altered,  
10 spayed or neutered before adoption. It helps drives  
11 our 93% placement rate. There are animals that are  
12 ready to be placed and unfortunately as I said there  
13 are animals that will get sick or that have behavior  
14 issues and uhm less than 1% of the animals that were  
15 altered uhm last year were euthanized after they  
16 exhibited those signs. They may have been ...

17 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: They got sick after  
18 the procedure?

19 CORINNE SCHIFF: Correct. It is not a  
20 policy.

21 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Because of the  
22 procedure potentially. Or no?

23 CORINNE SCHIFF: No.

24 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Not that they got an  
25 infection due to the surgery.

2 CORINNE SCHIFF: Uhm no, the surgery is  
3 uhm you know that's par.. no it's you know we are  
4 looking at these animals if they have a health issue  
5 or if they have a behavior issue they are at risk.  
6 Uhm their, I lost my train of thought about it.

7 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: This behavioral  
8 assessment is another, this I would like you to say  
9 more about. How do you determine uhm when an animal  
10 has basically unacceptable behavioral issues?

11 CORINNE SCHIFF: Behavior assessment is a  
12 really complicated uhm process. It, we have a lot of  
13 snapshots of animals that come into the shelter and  
14 we, our behavior team very sophisticated people who  
15 work with the animals who assess behavior and they  
16 are looking at all, all signs of the animal so it  
17 could either be through behavior tests plus what they  
18 do in our backyards, in our play groups, how they  
19 interact with other animals, how they interact with  
20 humans. What uhm, you may see one snapshot of what  
21 an animal is like uhm just with humans and it's  
22 totally different than what they are like with, with  
23 other animals so it is a full complement. We get  
24 information from our volunteers that work with the  
25 animals. We get information from all of our staff.

2 They are all handling these animals so they see them  
3 and we put together a picture of, of their behavior  
4 and based on that entire picture we make decisions  
5 about what type of placement that animal should have.

6 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Uhm a term that is  
7 often used is a no kill shelter. Can you define what  
8 that is and what that means in this context?

9 CORINNE SCHIFF: ACC is an open  
10 admissions shelter. We are nationally recognized by  
11 major organizations across the nation, in fact today  
12 we were recognized by the Mattie's fund for our  
13 excellent in leadership and in progressive programs  
14 that are saving more lives. We are saving 93%, last  
15 year was 93%. We take in 28,000 animals 75 animals a  
16 day, what we are is a progressive organization that  
17 is putting resources and staff towards programs that  
18 reduce intake, that reduce illness, that push this  
19 high placement rate and that reaches into the  
20 community rather than put a label on, on what we are,  
21 what we are looking at is we are a national leader  
22 that other organizations come to us and say that,  
23 that playgroup program is excellent. We want to see  
24 how you do it. We have gone to LA to show how we are  
25 doing Surrender Prevention. We have been asked about

2 a lot of our programs and for support so that other  
3 organizations can model what they do.

4 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: So is it fair to that  
5 those shelters in which label themselves no kill have  
6 restrictions on intake?

7 CORINNE SCHIFF: Yes.

8 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Okay uhm we have, we  
9 have a very long list of members of the public who  
10 want to testify which we want to move to quickly.  
11 I'll just note that there were a good number of  
12 issues that you have promised us follow up on and I  
13 think many of them get to this question of how we  
14 move to the next level and what are the resources and  
15 we talked about money but ultimately this is a head  
16 count question really for most of this, so to the  
17 extent that you can give us a sense of the resource  
18 needs that would allow you to go to the next level,  
19 whether it's in in Capital, or Budget or personnel,  
20 we think that is really the critical question here.  
21 Alright, good. Thank you very much for your  
22 testimony this morning and we are going to move to  
23 our next panel which consists of two leaders at the  
24 ASPCA uhm we have, uhm Matt Burshower, sorry if I'm  
25 mispronouncing the name and Michelle Via Gomez from

2 the ASPCA and also from the Mayor's Alliance for NYC  
3 Animals we have uhm Jane Hoffman, sorry for  
4 mispronunciations. And uhm due to the very, very  
5 long list of members of the public who we want to  
6 hear from we do have a three minute clock on this  
7 portion of the testimony. Michelle I guess Jeff had  
8 to leave right? Okay you want to kick us off?

9 MICHELLE VIA GOMEZ: Do we need to be  
10 sworn?

11 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Actually no we only  
12 subject members of the Administration to the  
13 affirmation. We can't image that a member of the  
14 public would ever be untruthful. It's inconceivable.  
15 (SPEAKING SPANISH).

16 MICHELLE VIA GOMEZ: (SPEAKING SPANISH).

17 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: (SPEAKING SPANISH).

18 We got out covered. Uhm do you have your mic on?

19 MICHELLE VIA GOMEZ: Yes.

20 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Okay.

21 MICHELLE VIA GOMEZ: So thank you so  
22 much, I want to thank the Council, the Chair and  
23 Councilman Vallone and please bear with me, uhm,  
24 unfortunately your CEO had to step out so I'm going  
25 to emerge highlights from both pieces of testimony



2 and they will be in the record. Uhm so we are very,  
3 very grateful to be here. This is an issue that we  
4 have been working on for so long and as Council  
5 Member Powers brought up this has been over 20 years  
6 in the making and we keep having this conversation.  
7 We really do think that if you get AC and C the  
8 resources to do more they will succeed. We work with  
9 the ACC virtually with every department and we can  
10 attest to their professionalism, their competence and  
11 their compassions at every turn. We actually provide  
12 many grants to ACC for 2018. We have a grant package  
13 of \$1.4 million ear marked for ACC for that Pet  
14 Retention Program that you were talking about,  
15 transport and something that we called First Alert  
16 Grants which are used to incentivize the rescues to  
17 pull the most at risk animals, being adult cats and  
18 large breed dogs. ACC has worked as an incubator for  
19 some of our pilot programs. The retention program has  
20 been very, very successful so in 2016 the Brooklyn  
21 pilot improved the welfare of nearly 300 pets.  
22 During that same period, ACC experience a 19%  
23 reduction in owner surrenders compared to 2015. And  
24 of the clients that were able to keep their pets,  
25 almost 90% reported that ACC surface offerings were

instrumental in helping them keep their pet. So we see that there is a direct correlation between pet retention and that animal placement rate. We were able to keep animals out of the shelter. Uhm we were also able to provide pet owners resources to veterinary care, supplies and resources. In 2018, the program lunged to five boroughs so that they could use every space for animal intake but also to serve as a resource center and to take this year ACC has helped 115 pets through this program across the five boroughs. ACC has also become an expert in this work, of even lending their experience on the uhm national stage. They have provided advice to Florida's Miami Animals Services Agencies, they provide peer to peer education and it is really showing communities what is possibly beyond the basic constructs of what a shelter is. So we believe that ACC needs funding for yes a shelter in the Bronx, yes a shelter in Queens. We feel much like you were saying uhm that the receiving center is a stop gap but should not be the ultimate goal. We want shelters in each borough and we want to make sure that we continue to fund yes Capital but also operating and program money because we need to be

2 able to have ACC hire the staff to be able to expand  
3 these programs and we feel that uhm from our  
4 experiences that if you give ACC the resources they  
5 really can be the progressive leader in humane  
6 welfare that they have been. You know with that, you  
7 know over 90% placement rate, putting in money for  
8 these innovative programs and giving them the  
9 physical resources and facilities uhm they really can  
10 move that needle forward even further.

11 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Thank you very much  
12 Michelle and uhm we thank Matthew as well for your  
13 incredible work and for your testimony today and uhm  
14 we will pass it on now to Jane.

15 JANE HOFFMAN: Okay my name is Jane  
16 Hoffman I am the President of the Mayor's Alliance  
17 for New York City's Animals and thank you for the  
18 opportunity and thank you for taking this so  
19 seriously. Uhm as everybody has said, animal care  
20 centers has achieved 93% live release rate and we are  
21 delighted to have helped with that but to emphasize  
22 the need for the money. When we created the Mayor's  
23 Alliance in 2003, our goal was to build an  
24 infrastructure for supporting animal care centers and  
25 to help the organization improve outcomes for our

2 communities, thousands of homeless animals. This  
3 transformation was the focus of our strategic plan  
4 and the purpose of the \$37 million Mattie's Fund  
5 Grant which you have heard about which she secured  
6 for New York City assisted by a multi-gear, multi-  
7 million dollar grant for the ASPCA. One of the  
8 founding members of the Alliance. Nearly \$30 million  
9 of that Mattie's Fund Grant was funneled back  
10 directly into the hands of animal care centers and  
11 into the New York City Rescue and Shelter Community.  
12 The rescue partners that have been referenced here.  
13 In 2005, we help create the New Hope Department at  
14 ACC and supported the program in its infancy with a  
15 targeted grant in excess of \$2 million to stress how  
16 important the creation of that was and today ACC has  
17 expanded that department and which is the care of  
18 their life saving program and a testimony what can be  
19 achieved through the community collaboration and the  
20 increasing expertise and you know greatness of ACCs  
21 operations. In 2005, we created our New Hope, sorry  
22 our Wheels of Hope Program to provide free transport  
23 of animals seven days a week out of the ACC shelters  
24 to its partner organizations referenced here at New  
25 Hope Partners. Over the past 13 years that Wheels of

2 Hope has transported than 120,000 cats, rabbits, dogs  
3 and other kinds of animals since they have to take  
4 everything that walks up to their door. Uhm we  
5 continue to support the life saving efforts of ACC  
6 and our adoption partners and other New York City  
7 Shelters and Rescue Groups by providing a vital  
8 adoption outlet multiple times each year. Our Adopt  
9 a Pallooza, Mega Pet Adoption events which finds  
10 homes for more than 1000 animals annually. ACC  
11 typically adopts more than 100% of their animals that  
12 come to those events. The mobile adoption vans are  
13 crucial to this effort uhm and we have other partners  
14 like the ASPCA, ARFF, Bite Away that also have mobile  
15 adoption vans. These are important. It's like Pets  
16 to the People, we really need to fund those. In  
17 2012, with the enactment of local law 59 the alliance  
18 and the ASPCA helped secure additional funding, again  
19 funding for ACC and secured and expansion of the  
20 Board of Directors of ACC to include independent  
21 voting members with a variety of backgrounds making  
22 Animal Care Centers of New York City's Board a  
23 broader mix of individuals committed to making ACC a  
24 more humane community. With regard to Intro 401, we  
25 strongly support the notion of full service shelters

2 in all of the boroughs, thereby allowing residents to  
3 adopt a pet, locate a pet, a lost pet, surrender a  
4 pet or access resources and services that will allow  
5 them to keep on pets in full service shelters in  
6 their homes. The proposal of Council, that's being  
7 sponsored by Council Member Vallone, Brannon and  
8 Holden should be passed into Law but I would  
9 emphasize once again please do not put the burden of  
10 additional shelters on the ACC without giving them  
11 the funding that they need, the Budget to operate  
12 these programs. Without these programs we would not  
13 be where we are today.

14 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Thank you very much.  
15 I think Council Member Vallone has a follow up  
16 question.

17 PAUL VALLONE: Thank you and God bless  
18 your new son that's in the world. Uhm my question to  
19 the first panel on the Admin was are you aware, maybe  
20 you can help with any partners that can act in this,  
21 in lieu of our full animals shelters at this point in  
22 Queens and the Bronx. Is there any way that we can  
23 temporarily work with any of our partners to maybe  
24 handle some of that or at least expand what is

2 happening in those boroughs which is basically  
3 nothing.

4           JANE HOFFMAN: So the ASPCA has a  
5 community engagement department and that departments  
6 works very closely with ACC especially on this Pet  
7 Retention work so are able to supplement that in  
8 places where ACC has not been able to, to reach out  
9 so you were saying that you have in your District,  
10 chairman you know some people that are sort of on  
11 that brink, uhm if that ACC resource is not there for  
12 the they could always come to the ASPCA and are able  
13 to supplement that Pet Retention work with the  
14 vouchers for grooming, veterinary care behavior, all  
15 of that we can do as well. Our, our hope is that  
16 eventually we get to a point where you know the  
17 program can live with ACC and ACC can be able to  
18 provide that and for that, uhm you know they do need  
19 that funding. But they have proven uhm to be able to  
20 run a really effective and impactful program where  
21 they have had the funding to do that.

22           PAUL VALLONE: Well we get the funding  
23 for it I mean that, that's and that's why we are not  
24 going to stop going there because at this point I

2 can't wait for the next Administration or another  
3 Council so we are going full steam ahead on this.

4 JANE HOFFMAN: That's wonderful and then  
5 the same goes for spa... we are able to supplement  
6 with spay neuter surgery and in certain places we  
7 also have an adoptions vehicle and we work with ACCs  
8 adoption vehicle so we may be able to, to bring pets  
9 where the people are as well.

10 PAUL VALLONE: Where, that's, that's  
11 where I was going. There may be an opportunity to do  
12 some additional.

13 JANE HOFFMAN: Yeah so we can and we are  
14 concentrating some of the work especially in the  
15 Bronx so that we find the Bronx is a high need  
16 community which is why we were excited that even  
17 though Matteo will be four at visiting a Bronx  
18 shelter but uhm if we can move that forward it's  
19 great but we are excited that that's one of the  
20 places where we are going to concentrate efforts.  
21 The ASPCA has increased their presence in the Bronx  
22 especially in the south Bronx communities and we are  
23 providing veterinary care, increased spay, neuter and  
24 increased community engagement work trying to keep  
25 the people and pets together. So uhm we are a



2 partner and uhm we we have a wonderful communication  
3 uhm between us so if there are needs they can come to  
4 us and we should be able to help.

5 MICHELLE VIA GOMEZ: You know another  
6 resource which is not directly animal related though  
7 is the uhm food pantries, the people food pantries,  
8 if they would stock, if they could be encouraged to  
9 stock pet food as well, that would be somewhere. You  
10 know these are wonderful programs but they shouldn't  
11 be carrying the entire burden I mean these are social  
12 welfare issues and if those human pantries would  
13 carry pet foods, be encouraged, be not required  
14 perhaps but you know make those available I think  
15 that could go a long way at least while we are trying  
16 to build up the resources of ACC to have additional  
17 pantries. Also I think that the uhm members the New  
18 Hope Partners and the other shelters uhm the way they  
19 are trying to support the effort is to pull as many  
20 animals as possible, now if there was some  
21 discretionary funding that you know in a person's  
22 District, in a Council Member District that they  
23 could apply for, I don't think, you know, they need  
24 to pull more animals, they need to take care of them,  
25 they need to get them adopted. I'm not sure they

2 could do, and they do take public intake but on a  
3 restricted basis as you said but I would look to the  
4 food pantries to see if something could be done  
5 there, the human food pantries.

6 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: I think the chair  
7 just talked about maybe coming up with an initiative  
8 for Council members to do across the Districts and  
9 this could be what we could target because I really  
10 believe that each one of us know the heart of our  
11 communities the best and the schools and the teachers  
12 and the students and the groups that are, that will  
13 do anything for our pets and I think if we can get  
14 just even limited resources out there we can ta,  
15 start to tackle what we are building. We also want  
16 you a part of the creation of the shelters too to  
17 make sure that the design of it is the best possible  
18 use of the square footage and the rest of it because  
19 it only comes to schools you would be surprised, the  
20 principal is like why didn't somebody ask me and we  
21 didn't want this over there and so.

22 JANE HOFFMAN: Right and I think also  
23 there might be opportunities because of the  
24 relationships the Alliance has about the ASPCA and  
25 ACC to get donated goods, you know simple things like

2 we don't necessarily think of like proper harnessing,  
3 proper collars, proper leashes which is necessary to  
4 control behavior and that kind of thing so I think  
5 that is a possibility and maybe that could be  
6 available. It's a little beyond the scope of the  
7 food pantries but maybe a little section for food and  
8 supplies.

9 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Thank you very much.  
10 Thank you panel. We are going to move on to our next  
11 group of witnesses which will include Debra Thomas,  
12 Elizabeth Jason from Best Friends Animal Society,  
13 Adita Burncrazn from NYCLAS and Esther Koslow from  
14 Shelter Reform Action. Go ahead whoever would like to  
15 start.

16 DEBRA THOMAS: Thank you very much.  
17 Thank you for allowing me to testify. Good morning  
18 and my name is Debra Thomas. I am a long time  
19 volunteer at the Animal Care Center's Manhattan  
20 Shelter and I've been there as a cat adoption  
21 facilitator for more than 12 years. During the past  
22 12 years I've really seen the ACC get its act  
23 together and do a complete turnaround from being an  
24 animal flop house where illness was easily spread and  
25 euthanasia rates were very high to be an ever

2 improving shelter where pets are well cared for and  
3 placed into homes and rescue organizations by well  
4 trained and compassionate staff adoption counselors.  
5 These vast improvements as has been mentioned earlier  
6 have resulted in an 93% placement rates for dogs and  
7 gets in 2017 which is a significant rise from the  
8 past years. I am thrilled to have witnessed and  
9 shared in all of this progress and I will share a  
10 little bit of it with you now. First of all, I've  
11 seen the adoption department move from the first  
12 floor where animals used to also be surrendered and  
13 the wait time was often up to four hours to finalize  
14 adoptions. Now it is on the second floor, we are  
15 welcoming knowledgeable adoption counselors can help  
16 potential adopters and they interact with the pets  
17 and they counsel pets and they finalize the adoptions  
18 more quickly and efficiently. I have also seen the  
19 growth of the ACC off site adoptions which many times  
20 I have participated in as a volunteer and with the  
21 help of these two ACC vans which have been spoken of.  
22 This as well as pro bono advertising such at the  
23 Boroughbread Campaign in Times Square, Public Service  
24 Announcements in the media and various fundraising  
25 events and numerous rescue organization partners have

2 contributed greatly to this improved placement rate.  
3 I have also seen the fast tracking of adoptable  
4 animals which allowed them to be spayed and neutered  
5 and preadopted more quickly and that reduces their  
6 chance of getting sick and get them out of the  
7 shelter much more quickly. We also have an ACC  
8 Medical Director now which has been very beneficial  
9 to keeping healthy conditions for the animals. I  
10 can't tell you how wonderful it is to walk into the  
11 shelter now and walk into the cat room and see half  
12 of the cat condos empty because the cats have already  
13 been placed or now with a adopters or rescues and of  
14 course I want to thank Risa Weinstock and the  
15 Executive Staff at the shelter as well as the shelter  
16 staff and the volunteers for making all of this  
17 possible. I also want to thank the City Council for  
18 appropriating necessary funds for all of these  
19 programs and hope that that will continue because as  
20 you all said none of this can be done without the  
21 funding and we want to keep the work going in the  
22 progress keep going also. Uhm I also thank you  
23 Council Member Vallone for Intro 401 and I am very  
24 much for that and hope it will happen and I know it  
25 will happen, I just hope it happens quickly. Uhm I

2 just want to one quickly one thing, I want to suggest  
3 to all animal lovers who are truly concerned about  
4 the animals at ACC please learn the facts about the  
5 progress that been made there and then because  
6 negative misinformation can deter potential adopters  
7 and we don't want that so please come and volunteer  
8 with us and please have a hand in continuing to  
9 improve the ACC. Thank you so much.

10 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Thank you Debra.  
11 Thank you.

12 ADITA BURNCRANZ (SP?): Uhm my name is  
13 Adita Burncrazn and I am the Executive Director of  
14 NYCLAS an Animal Advocacy and Political Action  
15 nonprofit with supporters and activist chapters in  
16 all five boroughs or New York City and I am a  
17 resident of Queens. I want to thank House Committee  
18 Chair Mark Levine and the other committee members for  
19 holding this hearing on the status of New York City's  
20 Animal Shelter Intro, animal shelter system and the  
21 proposed Intro 401. NYCLAS is strongly in support of  
22 Intro 401 which would mandate full service animal  
23 shelters in all five boroughs of New York City in  
24 which 30,000 animals come through every year. This  
25 is a campaign we at NYCLAS have long been committed

2 to and we commend Council Member Vallone, Council  
3 Member Brannon, and Council Member Holden for taking  
4 the lead on this important issue with the  
5 Legislation. We believe that the greatest city in  
6 the world deserves a world class animal shelter  
7 system and our supporters and volunteers in all five  
8 boroughs vehemently agree. We commend the Animal  
9 Care and Control Centers of New York City Staff and  
10 volunteers for their record high 93% placement of  
11 animals in 2017. Thanks of course in large part to  
12 the partnership with New Hope Animal Adoption Partner  
13 Program now in place with numerous animal rescue  
14 organizations which has been discussed. Things are  
15 moving in the right direction for the dogs, cats and  
16 rabbits waiting for homes and we should build upon  
17 this positive momentum. In January the de Blasio  
18 administration committed to investing \$98 million  
19 into the development and renovation of full service  
20 shelters in each borough, announced the location of  
21 the new Bronx shelter to be built and committed to  
22 upgrades to the existing Brooklyn shelter. However,  
23 the new Bronx shelter is not projected to be open  
24 until 2024 and there is no location of a Queens  
25 shelter yet and which we have discussed at length

2 here and uhm it should be a priority that these  
3 shelters get built and operational as quickly as  
4 possible because as we have talked about in the  
5 hearing already this has been going on for decades  
6 and we need solutions. We are eager to work with the  
7 city to increase pet adoptions and care throughout  
8 New York City as well as decrease euthanasia rates.  
9 We are also committed to ensuring the New Yorkers  
10 across all five boroughs have access to the programs  
11 and services offered at city shelters. This includes  
12 facilities to receive loss, stray or homeless dogs or  
13 cats and field service officers who have the capacity  
14 to pick up lost, stray, homeless or injured dogs and  
15 cats and bring them to shelters. Currently both  
16 Queens and the Bronx lack full service animal  
17 shelters and the corresponding services they provide.  
18 The combined population of residents of Queens and  
19 the Bronx is about 3.6 million people yet the  
20 residents in these boroughs only have access to  
21 animal receiving centers meaning that they must  
22 travel to another community which may not be feasible  
23 or financially possible or otherwise wait for a  
24 mobile adoption truck of which there are not enough.  
25 This means they can also, they also cannot easily



2 reunite with lost pets. In addition, the lack of  
3 shelters in Queens and the Bronx leaves the existing  
4 full service shelters in Manhattan, Brooklyn and  
5 Staton Island to be overburdened as a result. These  
6 shelters are operating at capacity and therefore  
7 cannot maximize their efficiency. I'll wrap it up.  
8 Uhm new full service shelters mean better more humane  
9 care for the cats, dogs and rabbits in our shelters  
10 and they will help connect more New Yorkers to loving  
11 companions. Intro 401 provides a much needed and  
12 long overdue investment and commitment to New York  
13 City Animal Pet Population. In our progressive  
14 forward thinking city it is vital that we ensure the  
15 welfare and humane treatment of the millions of pets  
16 that call New York City home and ensure that each  
17 animal in our shelter system gets a fair shot at  
18 being adopted into a loving forever home. Thank you.

19 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: I apologize I have to  
20 step out for one moment but you are going to be in  
21 the very capable hands of Council Member Vallone who  
22 will continue to Chair the meeting and I will be back  
23 in a moment. Thank you.

24 ESTHER KOSLOW: Thank you my name is  
25 Esther Koslow and I am President of Shelter Reform

2 Action Committee and good morning Chairman Levine and  
3 the other members of the committee and to Council  
4 Member Vallone. Shelter Reform Action Committee has  
5 for the past 24 years advocated for the reforming of  
6 our city's animal shelter system and the committee  
7 oversees the health department which long resisted  
8 investing real money into animal welfare. That's why  
9 we appreciate how Mayor de Blasio in one of his first  
10 actions as Mayor insisted the health department  
11 promise to make needed renovations to the existing  
12 shelters as well as creating additional shelters. We  
13 also applaud Councilman Paul Vallone's Bill to  
14 resurrect a law from the year 2000 requiring full  
15 service shelters in all five boroughs and I must add  
16 that for the 11 years from 2000 to 2011 the  
17 Department of Health always used this phrase. We are  
18 actively looking for sites for the Bronx and Queen  
19 shelters and that is a phrase that I have had  
20 repeated here frequently today. They are actively  
21 looking. We have learned that it takes more than  
22 laws or promises to ensure that the Health Department  
23 does right by our city's homeless animals. For  
24 example, the placement of Staton Island has been  
25 plagued by five years worth of delays all of which

2 can be laid squarely at the Health Department's Door.

3 The proposed site of a Bronx shelter is yet to be

4 ULURPe, the replacement of Brooklyn Shelter remains a

5 promise uhm leaving the ACC to operate in a shabby

6 building lacking a proper roof of HVAC system and

7 there has been no progress on the promised Queens

8 shelter just the announcement of a possible site for

9 replacement admission center and where is that

10 promised Manhattan Adoption Center. What's clear is

11 that without constant pressure the Health Department

12 will continue to slow walk these Capital Projects

13 into the end of Mr. De Blasio's term in office when

14 they could very well evaporate. Today the ACC

15 reported that its substantially reduced animal intake

16 and it's euthanasia rate. That is positive news. So

17 why does the Health Department punish rather than

18 reward the ACC. If left to it's own devices the

19 Health Department was short, ACC needed funding. Did

20 anyone, does anyone here know that when the ACC and

21 it does sometimes run out of food for its animals it

22 has to turn to rescue groups to provide funding for

23 that food or that the ACC has to look to rescue

24 groups to provide basic medical equipment that every

25 shelter should have. These monies for these core

2 shelter needs should come from the Health Department  
3 even while the ACC has improved its fund raising.  
4 The Health Department contracts for the ACC to  
5 provide a vital municipal service and the Health  
6 Department should adequately pay for that service.  
7 Without proper funding and shelter buildings, the ACC  
8 will have to continue it's outside reliance on rescue  
9 groups for it's chouted life saving numbers. The  
10 city's homeless animals cannot rely on the kindness  
11 of the Health Department and the Committee can ensure  
12 that the Health Department does right by ACC and our  
13 city's homeless animals. In term, the city's animals  
14 advocates will applaud and support you for your  
15 efforts. Thank you.

16 PAUL VALLONE: Thank you and if my mother  
17 knew how to actually text me I'm sure that she would  
18 tell you that she volunteered for 20 years at ASPCA  
19 and ACC.

20 ADITA BURNCRANZ: That's wonderful.

21 PAUL VALLONE: And once a volunteer  
22 always a volunteer and Adita thank you for always  
23 champing an Esther thank you for that. The urgency I  
24 snow, it's Budget season. The timing of the hearing  
25 is perfect, the timing of the Bill is perfect so

2 please keep your advocacy going, please keep this to  
3 the top of the list, uhm like I said tomorrow's  
4 emergency often replaces all the good will and things  
5 that we wanted to do so we want to put this into law.  
6 We want to fund it. We don't want to handcuff ACC.  
7 We want the system with the funding and that's why we  
8 need that menu item list because that's works so well  
9 with us on our side is this will get you this and  
10 this will get you this but if we just say we can't it  
11 then it doesn't get done. So thank you very much.

12 ADITA BURNCRANZ: Thank you.

13 ESTHER KOSLOW: Thank you.

14 PAUL VALLONE: So our next panel, uhm we  
15 have four on this panel. So from the Guardian Angels  
16 Animal Protection you have Nancy Regulo, from SOSA  
17 Save Our Shelter Animals Zelda Penzo, for Voices for  
18 Shelter Animals, Seamon, Cindy? Greg you got to work  
19 on that handwriting Greg. My mother was a teacher  
20 you would be in big trouble. Voices for Shelter  
21 Animals Marilyn Gelfin and that's our four for this  
22 panel. And if you have testimony make sure you hand  
23 it in. However you would like to work down the table  
24 there?

2                   ZELDA PNEZO: Go ahead, I have turned it  
3 off. Yes, hello I was going to say good morning,  
4 it's good afternoon. My name is Zelda Penzo I am co-  
5 founder of SOSA Save Our Shelter Animals an animal  
6 advocacy group uhm that specializes in networking for  
7 animals in danger or at risk of being euthanized in  
8 animal shelters not only in New York but all around  
9 the country. I am here to express my support for  
10 Intro 401. The Bill that would require animals  
11 shelters in the Bronx and Queens. After years and  
12 years and I've been at this for 25 years now of  
13 seeing so many thousands of innocent healthy  
14 treatable, adoptable cats and dogs killed for space.  
15 It's time for New York to be a leader and not a  
16 laggard in achieving 100% no kill in our shelter  
17 system. 95 to 99% no kill has now been achieved in  
18 many open admission shelters around the country,  
19 contrary to what we heard today. We have reached a  
20 point in our collective consciousness and awareness  
21 where we realized that it is long past time to end  
22 the killing of our beloved companion animals. Having  
23 shelters in the Bronx and Queens will do much to  
24 relieve the burden on the other three shelters. I  
25 receive and network almost daily for the at risk also

2 known as the kill list for ACC. I am happy to know  
3 that not all of those animals are actually killed but  
4 that is what it is called among the general  
5 population. There can be no justification whatsoever  
6 for killing and beautiful adoptable animal for space  
7 and yet we continue to do just that, sometimes we  
8 find that animals get sick and then use that as the  
9 excuse for killing when in fact it is most often an  
10 unacceptable if not a specious argument. The Bronx  
11 and Queens have populations the size of some of the  
12 largest cities in the United States and yet we  
13 provide no shelters for their stray and abandoned  
14 animals. No place for people to go who wish to adopt  
15 a pet. Thus encouraging them to shop for an animal  
16 at a local pet store or from disreputable breeders on  
17 line. We want people to adopt not shop. Uhm it's  
18 time to pass this Bill and move vigorously to  
19 complete the Manhattan Adoption Center which has been  
20 also put off uhm for far too long and updating the  
21 other shelters. It's long past time to joint  
22 progressive cities across the nation that have  
23 stepped up to the plate with modern welcoming  
24 facilities for housing pets, and activities that  
25 encourage and invite community members to come to

2 their local shelter to adopt a companion animal. It  
3 is time for a paradigm that reflects animal  
4 sheltering and the true sense of the word, a place  
5 that provides protection for animals that need  
6 assistance. A place to live and not a place that  
7 condemns the innocent to death simply because they  
8 are homeless.

9           PAUL VALLONE: As much as we are all on  
10 the same page I have to do my teacher duty and say  
11 raise our hands but yes we are all clapping inside  
12 for you I agree. Whoever is next.

13           MARILYN GELFIN: Okay, hi, we are Voices  
14 for Shelter Animals, Greg and I. We want to address  
15 some of the critical issues with the shelter and  
16 offer a solution. Disease is out of control. In  
17 2016, according to the Animal Care Center at Silamore  
18 Records 93% of transfers were not healthy, 40% of  
19 public adoptables were not healthy. In 2017 his  
20 records were not included. In three months along,  
21 December 2017 to February 2018 185 dogs were at risk  
22 for CIRDC, 21 dogs were killed. On today's at risk  
23 list there are 12 cats and dogs. At 3:00 p.m. today  
24 ACC staff will decide who live and who dies. At the  
25 end of the day, some of these animals can be killed



2 for a simple respiratory disease contracted in the  
3 shelter which is easily treatable with antibiotic and  
4 has even stated on the ACC website. Some animals can  
5 be killed for simple behavior issues. In our opinion  
6 we do not thin the killing of these animals is humane  
7 euthanasia. ACC are using behavior assessment as  
8 part of the overall evaluation. These assessments  
9 were not made to be used for life and death  
10 decisions. Sometimes there is a very big gap between  
11 the what the volunteer video show, when you see a dog  
12 licking their face, eating treats out of their hands  
13 and get great volunteer reports but the assessment  
14 says behavior issue and pigeon hose these animals  
15 into getting New Hope Only ratings for such things as  
16 mounting on their lease, hard barking, not thriving  
17 in the shelter, scratching. If a volunteer disagrees  
18 with the assessment and expresses this to the shelter  
19 personnel that you all writing up an in some cases  
20 dismissed. We have seen loving family and the most  
21 traumatized by one entering the shelter and  
22 exhibiting fear based behavior resulting in New Hope  
23 only status. Once labeled New Hope, just limits the  
24 chances for a possible outcome. If a New Hope Rescue  
25 does not pull this animal, this animal will be

2 killed. Once the at risk list is published, 18 hours  
3 is not enough time to save these animals. This list  
4 is published at 6, is removed the next day at noon.  
5 Interested adopters may not be able to fill out  
6 applications while at work, after work is too late.  
7 With the rescue volunteers working full time they  
8 cannot process apps and do home checks. That is not  
9 possible. Some animals have literally been killed in  
10 the middle of applications still being processed.  
11 The lack, the lack of promotion, especially about  
12 risk animals is leading to less animals being saved.  
13 ACC is not telling interested potential adopters  
14 about the at risk animals, whether they are visiting  
15 the shelter or at off site adoption events. Animals  
16 have been left in cages suffering for days with such  
17 things as pyometria and congestive heart failure.  
18 These are extremely painful, this is not humane. We  
19 asked the Council Members that these, issues be made  
20 a priority. The solution to this issues and others  
21 that we haven't touched upon is CAPA. The Companion  
22 Animal Projection Act. We have spoken to many of you  
23 already and is being schedule with the rest of you.  
24 New York City can joint the progressive and modern  
25 age of no kill where adoptable, treatable, where no

2 adoptable, treatable animal is killed unless you are  
3 immediately suffering or has dangerous behavioral  
4 issues. We hope the Council makes this reality where  
5 each of you can be the hero for these animals.

6           PAUL VALLONE: So before we start the  
7 next, this, we have the room to 1:00 o'clock and if  
8 you just look at the papers that I have so if we can  
9 all keep it to three otherwise the last group will  
10 not be able to speak and everyone in this room is on  
11 the same page so uhm it's like the kids who don't  
12 show up to class will get yelled at. So we, we are  
13 all in support of this so we are one big positive  
14 happy.

15           GREG SEAMON: Hi Greg Seamon Voices for  
16 Sheltered Animals. What you are hearing today is  
17 what we see, the numbers behind the numbers and real  
18 first hand experiences that us as activists go  
19 through. One of the problems in evaluating these  
20 numbers is that the health numbers on animal  
21 transfers and the health on the state of the animals  
22 when they are adopted, which really 2016 numbers are  
23 not in 2017 numbers. So thus have disappeared. In  
24 2016, 37% of the animals killed were treatable.  
25 That's a far cry from no kill eventhough there was

2 about a 93%. It hovers up the real and serious  
3 issue, part of the problems as you have heard, the at  
4 risk list 18 hours is not enough. One of the more  
5 serious problems is 501c3 are not part of New Hope  
6 cannot pull animals. The numbers for last year and  
7 this year which are reported is 0 and other public  
8 admission shelters do allow 501c3 to pull in  
9 California. This began with a Hayden Act passed  
10 nearly 20 years ago by the late State Senator Thomas  
11 Hayden. In New York there was an attempt of that 8  
12 or 9 years ago with Oreo's Law which failed. We can  
13 do that here in New York City to allow all 501c3 to  
14 pull. In this mornings New York Post you may have  
15 seen an article that said yes there are nearly 300  
16 New Hope Rescues of which they said about 55 had the  
17 capacity to pull and only 16 were able to be  
18 contacted and the public has the same frustration  
19 that see an animal that is listed as New Hope. Help  
20 me dad, hunt down the New Hope Rescue and it is  
21 difficult to impossible to do that. In 18 hours, 18  
22 hours in which a working person comes home from work,  
23 eats dinner, has a few hours, goes to sleep, gets up,  
24 goes to work. That whole period has to be extended,  
25 ideally 48 hours to give people time to give other

2 501c3 time to pull. We can eliminate that 37% with  
3 that. In addition, in addition in contacting the  
4 rescues they also need to contact those people who  
5 have surrendered animals because if there is an  
6 overcrowding situation often times those who  
7 surrender with the best of intention that their  
8 animal will find a home will at least temporarily  
9 pull back the animal. Give them that opportunity.  
10 When they find the animal that was going to get  
11 rehomed is going to get killed. The solution is the  
12 Companion Animal Protection Act. It has been passed  
13 in major cities, Austin, Reno, Portland, Oregon,  
14 Kansas City, St. Paul, Minnesota, Muncie, Indiana, the  
15 State of Delaware passed it. They all moved toward  
16 no kill. It's not simply about a percentage that you  
17 hear over 90% it's a set of policies. So we are  
18 encouraging the City Council to go beyond the Intro  
19 to build five municipal shelters but to support the  
20 Companion Animal Protection Act to ensure these  
21 animals live.

22 PAUL VALLONE: Thank you do we have one  
23 more?

24 NANCY REGULO: Hi my name is Nancy Regulo  
25 and I am a volunteers with the Guardian Angels

2 Organization. I actually head up the program Animal  
3 Protection.

4 PAUL VALLONE: Welcome Nancy.

5 NANCY REGULO: Thank you uhm I just have  
6 a few observations. First of all I think in theory  
7 of the full service shelter is great although I think  
8 in practice what happened in New York just for so  
9 many years, it's continually you know sort of kick  
10 the can down the road and a lot of money was put up  
11 front for expenditures that never come to fruition so  
12 I think the biggest issue is really oversight at this  
13 point. Uhm to continually keep funding animal care  
14 and control with so much money when they are showing  
15 such horrible results, results is, is pretty  
16 atrocious number one and when you look at the numbers  
17 of the euthanization that they are so happily tauting  
18 now that has everything to do with all of the  
19 partners that they are working with who are the  
20 people who are out there actually doing these things  
21 and actually doing them successfully so there are  
22 lots of school nonprofits and individuals who already  
23 have successful models out there and a lot of those  
24 models have to do with like for example what I do a  
25 lot of and I have seen a lot of people do going out

2 there and actively spay and neutering cats. There is  
3 a tremendous overpopulation issue and they are not  
4 actively doing that whatsoever. I mean if you permit  
5 them to be an intake facility and they are not  
6 obligated to go out there and constantly spay and  
7 neuter cats they are always going to exist. They are  
8 creating this vacuum on their own just to keep  
9 staying there. Uhm the idea that there is a \$16  
10 million shelter to be built in the Bronx that is only  
11 going to hold a little over 200 animals sometimes six  
12 years down the road. I mean that's a lot of animals  
13 that are being born now and dying needlessly on the  
14 street. I mean that's, that's money that shouldn't  
15 be spent for something like that when they show that  
16 they really can't do it. I mean \$10 million was  
17 allotted two years ago specifically for finding full  
18 service locations in the Bronx and Queens and now  
19 here we are two years later and they just found the  
20 one in the Bronx and the only thing that they are  
21 discussing for Queens is doubling the size of the  
22 facility there which isn't full service which  
23 actually exacerbates the problem because you are  
24 saying the more animals you have in, the sicker they  
25 are going to get, the more stress they are going to

2 get so you are actually increasing the chances of  
3 these animals being euthanized. So that doesn't even  
4 make any sense and again I think the idea that there  
5 are so many smaller organizations out there doing so  
6 much they, it needs to be a switch made I think  
7 coming up really soon where you start recognizing  
8 these organizations, start funding them and then if  
9 animal care and control remains and there, there is  
10 some place for it maybe it is just that they are  
11 distributing the funds to these people who are doing  
12 it successfully because they really can't. That's  
13 just not their forte. I mean even Risa Weinstock  
14 when she was giving her testimony before she said oh  
15 we have 20,000 animals per year, it is almost 30,000,  
16 like I mean for the CEO over that organization she  
17 should know how many animals are going through so  
18 like I said I just think that you know, you really  
19 need to start focusing on the people who are out  
20 there doing a great job and doing it with hardly any  
21 funding, spending their time, spending all of their  
22 effort and really it's, it's passionate. They are  
23 passionate about it. I mean if you take the  
24 beuaracrats out of it who don't have an interest and



2 and put these people you are going to see a change  
3 very quickly in New York.

4           PAUL VALLONE: Thank you to the panel and  
5 we can go to the next group. We have Judith  
6 Luskgarten, Roxanne Delgato, Roxanne, sorry, Diane  
7 Signorelli and Barbara Neeley. I like she said I  
8 represent the animals. This way. I had those. I  
9 got it thank you. And if we can. So two didn't so  
10 why don't we add two people. Yeah so let's add two  
11 people we can get four. How about is Delores Ferraro  
12 still here? No. How about Neal, Neal, 360 West 22<sup>nd</sup>  
13 Street? Neal, what is that last name?

14           NEAL SAYER: Sayer.

15           PAUL VALLONE: Sayer, why doesn't that  
16 look like that. I think alright so Neal so let's go  
17 with this group. And William Spacy, is William still  
18 out there? William why don't you join the group, we  
19 can make four that would be wonderful. Thank you. Go  
20 ahead why don't you start since you are on the far  
21 side there.

22           DIANE SIGNARELLI (SP?) : Good afternoon  
23 and thank you for letting me speak before you. I  
24 have had experience where I went to adopt a German  
25 Shepherd dog named Bella and I've had 40 years German

2 Shepherd dog experience and this happened in 2015. I  
3 could not believe what I went through. Temp testers,  
4 the dog was an 8 month old, beautiful shepherd, I was  
5 told that the dog was going to a man who owned an  
6 Akita. The dog was not spayed. I'm I had German  
7 Shepherd dog experience, I offered immediate  
8 adoption, I was going to take that dog to my vet in  
9 New Jersey and I knew if the dog was sick my doctor  
10 who is my vet would take care of it and was able to  
11 get it immediately paid. Greeca had this thing going  
12 where you would pay like \$250 you would bring back a  
13 receipt and then I would get my money back after I  
14 had the dog spayed. Everything was good. It doesn't  
15 work that way, it seems like they like to hold you  
16 captive. I cried I went to all my elected officials  
17 because I know everybody. It didn't matter who I  
18 knew in borough of Staton Island I was so abused,  
19 temp testers and everything. All my documentation  
20 has been documented and I would be happy to give it  
21 to you. Fast forward I ended up at Animal Care  
22 Control June 21, 2015.

23 PAUL VALLONE: Did you ever get Bella?

24 DIANE SIGNARELLI: No the dog died, I  
25 have all of that, they sent it, they made it go from

2 near adopting it to getting kennel cough, suffered  
3 from mange. I have pictures and everything. Shipped  
4 that dog sick to an upstate rescue that was abusing  
5 me telling me that I'm out of their jurisdiction.  
6 Everybody that knows me they know what I went through  
7 and Risa does too because I said it in front of her  
8 at the Board of Directors Meetings, I'm on You Tube.  
9 I do not know I tell the truth. Fast forward I got a  
10 beautiful dog named Sheena, it's a Rotisian Ritsbach  
11 she is my German Shepherd dog. I was at Animal Care  
12 Control on my daddy's birthday which was father's  
13 day, June 21, 2015 with my friend who is the  
14 godmother Alice Devalli and no German Shepherd dog  
15 was there but somebody called me and said you go back  
16 there, there's something about this dog that we  
17 needed to see. I ended up Sheena 3-month-old  
18 Rotisian Ritsbach. Sheena had two stains of kennel  
19 cough and it's cost me a fortune. She is still not  
20 100%. She is my service dog and she is alive and I  
21 was just grateful that I ended up leaving my food at  
22 the Soul Food and running there because she just got  
23 off the van that was parked all day and it was a very  
24 hot day with animals, dogs and cats, everybody was  
25 adopted but my Sheena and they were bringing her back

2 because BACC was closed. They were bringing her to  
3 MACC 110<sup>th</sup> street and I guarantee you if I wasn't  
4 there at 4:30 because at least the manager let me  
5 adopt her because the time frame what they say is  
6 just a time frame. They don't have enough time to do  
7 my adoption and they would have killed her because  
8 they saw I have passion in my heart and I believe  
9 Jesus makes us do these things. We are poor. We  
10 don't care about anything. We care about animals. I  
11 would gladly give up a meal to give it to a stray  
12 animal on the street and have done it and Jane  
13 Hoffman knows that I do with her with ASPCA but I do.  
14 Jane has three generations of.. we try, we try and I  
15 know Jane's trying too.

16 PAUL VALLONE: She's having her hand. I  
17 know I feel your passion but I want to let everyone  
18 to speak.

19 DIANE SIGNARELLI: Thank you sir.

20 PAUL VALLONE: And God Bless for you.  
21 And if you could start with your name, because I just  
22 want to make sure. No, no I know Diane.

23 ROXANNE DELGATO: Roxanne Delgato from  
24 the Bronx.

25 PAUL VALLONE: Welcome Roxanne.

2                   ROXANNA DELGATO: Hi how are you, I'm not  
3 being paid to be here I'm actually here because I  
4 care about the animals that reside in the Bronx. And  
5 I've been here several times through the decade  
6 advocating for a Bronx shelter because we are a high  
7 need, high risk area. Unfortunately many of the  
8 population of the Bronx don't really know how to  
9 handle animals properly. I'm not ashamed to say  
10 that. At first I would like to say that I am all for  
11 a full scale shelter in the Bronx not only because we  
12 need to house all these 200 animals, it's about  
13 educating, having problems to maintain the existing  
14 animals in the household so we do need a full scale  
15 Bronx shelter. I don't know how much it cost, please  
16 put it there.

17                   PAUL VALLONE: Every borough.

18                   ROXANNE DELGATO: Sooner than later. And  
19 my second issue is unfortunately I have been involved  
20 in the undervelli of the no kill rescue in the Bronx.  
21 I can tell you if anything needs oversights because  
22 they self-mediate those animals, they hord them in  
23 cages for years sometimes. Uhm there is also  
24 epidemics of ringworm outbreaks, the kalesha virus,  
25 kennel cough but there is no oversight so these

2 animals just disappear when they die in their cages,  
3 so I'm just, I informed DOH and several incidences of  
4 those but you know the no kill movement is great on  
5 paper but I live in the real world. I would rather  
6 we have low euthanasia like 99.9% placement instead  
7 of saying no kill because most of these no kill  
8 people eat animals I mean I'm vegan so I walk the  
9 talk. It's not about, it's about doing what's best  
10 for the animals it's not about the no kill movement.  
11 So I'm saying improve the shelters, giving ACC the  
12 funding because I think considering how little they  
13 have, they do a great job, yes they could improve so  
14 could everyone, I could improve myself but if the  
15 city council also can send newsletters to advocate to  
16 adopt for animals they can also send letter to  
17 promote adoption events, they could also help because  
18 you have a wide range of newsletters. I get your  
19 newsletters, I get most of the City Council Members  
20 newsletters including the speaker so please also you  
21 held a high position, people look up to you,  
22 advocate, lead by example, adopt a pet and the  
23 restrict buying animals in pet shops. That's the  
24 main thing, as long as we buy animals there will  
25 always be overpopulations. Thank you so much.

2 PAUL VALLONE: You are very welcome.  
3 Make sure you get the mic there. And your name?

4 JUDITH LUSKGARTEN: Hello, hello, My name  
5 is Judith Luskgarten.

6 PAUL VALLONE: Welcome Judith.

7 JUDITH LUSKGARTEN: Thank you uhm we need  
8 the CAPA Bill passed. The Companion Animal  
9 Protection Act which Greg spoke about as they are  
10 doing one by one across the country so therefore if  
11 it can be better and it's proven that it can then it  
12 must. There is no other correct choice, uhm this  
13 might get a little rough guys so sorry. Look, look  
14 up to DOH Marion Mureno. It says veterinary and pest  
15 control. How can these two words even be in the same  
16 title. To me it says volume. This business needs to  
17 be spun out of the DOH and an animal welfare  
18 department created. In every successful business,  
19 I'm a business woman, a numbers person and a systems  
20 person. In every successful business you put the  
21 proper people in the proper position with the proper  
22 plan and just as importantly the proper motivation.  
23 ACC has attorneys, publishers, writers, their friends  
24 and union workers. This business requires qualified  
25 business, admin, marketing and animal professionals

2 and they are not in place. They tell, they tell  
3 untrue, they discredit the advocate saying we pass on  
4 misinformation. Remember there are two sides to  
5 every story. ACC chooses not to disclose the dark  
6 side. They don't want you to know the living  
7 nightmare the advocates live through every day into  
8 every night over and over and over again. ACC  
9 receives funding under the DOH to provide a  
10 government function. They supercede Law section 1983  
11 which infringing on the first amendment right by  
12 deleting comments and blocking people on their  
13 facebook page. They are superceeding the law and  
14 they are getting away with it. Risa and Matt ASPCA  
15 signed off in writing to Senator Avilla about spay,  
16 neuter or kill. He asked about one animal. They  
17 said it was an anomaly. We have shown him a list of  
18 animals, now there are close to 80 animals this has  
19 been done to. They lied in uhm January 16 meeting  
20 with the politician saying Ruston Shelter is not a no  
21 kill. They ship animals to outside facilities where  
22 they can be killed. This is untrue and Austin is  
23 livid. We speak with them. Humane euthanasia means  
24 only killing an animal if terminally ill with no  
25 quality of life or truly, truly a dangerous viscous



2 animal. ACC kills for kennel cough which is like  
3 killing a child for a cold. Leash biting, being  
4 scared, lunging in the shelter, this isn't humane  
5 euthanasia. Animals here are treated like a  
6 disposable commodity. ACC has distance parameters,  
7 that's only relevant if they are doing home checks.  
8 They are not doing home checks. Miami doesn't have  
9 distance parameters. If an animal can find a safe  
10 home outside of that distance, more power, they go.  
11 But not here in New York, contracts, DOHA, ACC, a 45  
12 page contract that silences everyone. They are  
13 walking around like the Stepford Wives all with the  
14 same verbiage. It is like the twilight zone. ACC,  
15 ASPCA agreement they decide if ACCs diseased  
16 environment is acceptable after the spay and neuter  
17 surgery, they think it is, it is not, New Hope  
18 Contract lists 300 rescues, only a handful pull  
19 animals so people's precious times is wasted trying  
20 to pull of the kill list. ACC should be coordinating  
21 all of this but they are totally hands off. This is  
22 their job for God's sake. This is what our tax  
23 dollars are paying for but the advocates are doing  
24 it. If the public knew, the roar would be deafening.  
25 Advocates across the country and the world are

2 networking our animal. People in Australia, Denmark,  
3 Holland, UK, Italy, even the Italian Senator  
4 Kalorocki sent a video plea to de Blasio saying you  
5 are supposed to be the greatest city in the world but  
6 your shelters are in utter disgrace. We have a vile  
7 reputation. It's all about the morrow compass and  
8 professionalism, motivation and mindset must change.  
9 It is time for a new regimen of wisdom, morale and  
10 ethical, integrity and responsibility, humanity,  
11 compassion and justice for every animal who was  
12 unfortunate enough to walk through those disease  
13 riddled doors.

14 PAUL VALLONE: There is a lot more  
15 passion behind you. There are a lot more people with  
16 passion too make sure they all get a chance.

17 ROXANNE DELGATO: Alright. It'll be the  
18 biggest social movement of our times at least one of  
19 them.

20 PAUL VALLONE: You know what.

21 ROXANNE DELGATO: Please help us get this  
22 right.

23 PAUL VALLONE: Keep the choir going and  
24 it's, it's very important to have your voices heard.  
25 I mean they are elected officials who stand with you

2 and there are others who sometimes don't so I thin it  
3 is important to make sure you spread the word. It's  
4 politically sometimes not easy. There is a lot of.

5 ROXANNE DELGATO: We are counting on you.

6 PAUL VALLONE: There are a lot of forces  
7 on the other side too, so sometimes you find  
8 yourself.

9 ROXANNE DELGATO: We've been fighting  
10 them for years.

11 PAUL VALLONE: Alone, so it's uhm it's,  
12 it's a struggle and I think that's why I think  
13 funding it and making the Law so that whoever is  
14 after me and after us has the Laws because they can't  
15 get away from it and I think funding it is always  
16 important and I am I am taking the passionate of the  
17 volunteers and actually doing that and learning is  
18 very very important so thank you.

19 ROXANNE DELGATO: Yeah we don't give our  
20 misinformation.

21 PAUL VALLONE: We're all trying. Go  
22 ahead sir on your end, we didn't forget you.

23 NEAL SAYER: Hi my name is Neal Sayer and  
24 I am a volunteer at ACC with over 800 hours of  
25 volunteer time there. I foster the dogs as well. ACC

2 does have a statutory, contractual and morale  
3 obligation to the people and animals of New York City  
4 and ACC is falling short of meeting those obligations  
5 in some areas. Uhm there is a need for more  
6 transparency, better oversight and more funding which  
7 would help eliminate a lot of the problems to assure  
8 that ACC fulfills its statutory and contractual  
9 obligations. ACC has touted all day as an open  
10 admission shelter meaning it is never suppose to turn  
11 away stray, homeless, abandoned, sick or injured  
12 animals it is plain and simple. The ACC website  
13 should read if you can't keep your pet bring them in.  
14 If you see, if resources are available to help you  
15 keep your pet, send us an email. It's that simple.  
16 Compare that to the current ACC website, readers will  
17 find that they must complete a survey, wait up to  
18 three business days for a call back only to be given  
19 a hard sell which is pressure to consider  
20 alternatives to surrender because their pet may wind  
21 up being euthanized at the shelter. Only after all  
22 that can a person make an appointment to surrender  
23 their pet, which the appointment itself can last 45  
24 minutes. Over 1500 people made an appointment  
25 surrender their pet in 2017 but then never showed up?

2 What happened to 1500 animals? Okay if ACC promotes  
3 their 94 placement rate I would like to know what are  
4 they doing to promote the 1500 animals that  
5 disappeared into the night. If 750 of those dogs had  
6 behavioral issues is it really reasonable to believe  
7 that they were rehomed by the owners of 500 of the  
8 appointment no shows were warned that their cat may  
9 euthanized if surrendered. How many people made the  
10 hard choice of just putting their cat in outside  
11 instead of surrendering them? In fact, the  
12 percentage of stray dogs being admitted to ACC is on  
13 the rise is now back up to the 2014 year level.  
14 Sadly there is no way to know what has happened to  
15 the rabbits because of the barriers to intake. Some  
16 rabbits are surely being abandoned outside while  
17 others are probably being sold on Craig's list. The  
18 other really critical point is the New Hope Program  
19 at ACC. Since more animals are placed with New Hope  
20 Partners than are adopted to the public I submit the  
21 extensive oversight is needed of this program. New  
22 Hope Partners must meet eligibility requirements and  
23 submit to audits and partnership status reviews. So  
24 how long should it take before someone terminates  
25 eligibility of the crazy goat feed store as a rabbit

2 rescue group. New Hope Partners are also required to  
3 provide monthly accounting of who adopted the animals  
4 that came from ACC. So should ACC continue to  
5 certify and organization that releases cats back on  
6 to the street as their ACC partner. If someone came  
7 into the shelter and asked to adopt a cat so they can  
8 put it back outside, I don't think that adoption  
9 would be approved and if I can just address one of  
10 the comments about the at risk list that was  
11 mentioned this morning, or mentioned before, and the  
12 sick dogs. ACC does not keep a permanent record of  
13 the walking history of dogs in there care. There is  
14 no way to tell one day later how many times a dog has  
15 been walked and how long that dog has been walked and  
16 I cannot help but to leave that common sense would  
17 not dictate that if you kept a record and people now  
18 how many times the dog was walked that, that perhaps  
19 you can keep a few more animals healthy rather than  
20 go to the at risk list. Finally, I just, I just want  
21 to make a point that ACC staffing and ACC volunteer  
22 departments need more money. More money is needed to  
23 fund the retention of good staff. There are no clear  
24 guidelines to adopting an animal out of ACC. It is  
25 only through the experience of the, of the staff and

2 the experience only comes with time that people and  
3 the staff can make good adoption decisions. If the  
4 turnover is high and the pay rate is low you get  
5 people who are not as qualified to make those  
6 adoption determinations so I would implore you to  
7 provide more money for staff pay, more money for  
8 retention and more, more money for training. I thank  
9 you for your time. I did submit something to your  
10 office via email uhm yesterday through Amy. I don't  
11 know if you got it but I have extra copies here to  
12 give you as well.

13 PAUL VALLONE: Thank you Neal for your  
14 testimony, and your input and folks I don't know if  
15 this was explained, we don't do applause here. You  
16 can signal your, your approval by.

17 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: I've clearly lost  
18 control. Okay thank you ma'am. Thank you. Our next  
19 panel please, will consist of uhm William Spacey,  
20 sorry for the mispronunciation, Janice Giacolb,  
21 Barbara Malley and Delores Ferraro. I just want to  
22 confirm that all three of your are names that I just  
23 called, is that correct? Okay so we are missing one  
24 but uhm and are you William?

25 WILLIAM SPACEY: Yes.

2 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: You want to kick us  
3 off?

4 WILLIAM SPACEY: Sure uhm in the interest  
5 of time I'm going to throw away because most of what  
6 I would have said has been said and very  
7 passionately. Uhm just one thing here, I'm looking  
8 at a uhm press release that was issued in uhm January  
9 of 2015 and it talks about the adoption center and it  
10 talks about the badly needed HVAC in Brooklyn. Uhm  
11 neither of those projects are complete and there are  
12 still both of them years away. If we are going to be  
13 embarking on the journey to the new shelters I think  
14 we really, absolutely, positively must look at  
15 processes and timelines or I probably won't be here  
16 to see that shelter open. Thank you.

17 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: None of us may be  
18 here. We agree. Okay and is it Janice?

19 JANICE GIACOLB: Yes.

20 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Go ahead just get  
21 close to the mic Janice if you can.

22 JANICE GIACOLB: I don't, I don't  
23 represent any particular group but I have congestive  
24 heart failure and which is why I can't physically  
25 help, why I can't physically help the uhm rescue



2 services that I do financially support but in 2006 I  
3 went up to 110 Street ACC and adopted my first dog  
4 Charlotte. And she became my service dog, I'm sorry,  
5 and what someone up here said that that by law they  
6 have to have the dog spade, viable dog spade, when I  
7 picked up Charlotte, when I picked out Charlotte, she  
8 was not spayed, she was, she was no way ready to go.

9 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: When was that?

10 JANICE GIACOLB: 2006. I got Charlotte.  
11 They when I signed the contract to get her, she was  
12 my daughter's 12<sup>th</sup> birthday gift, when I got her  
13 home, three hours later we had to rush her to what is  
14 now Blue Pearl in 15<sup>th</sup> Street and 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue, she had  
15 pneumonia as a direct result of improper care after  
16 her, her neutering. From the whoever they sent her  
17 to.

18 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: And that was also in  
19 2006?

20 JANICE GIACOLB: That was in 2006, yes.  
21 Uhm that cost me \$4000 my \$100 rescue dog cost me  
22 that was \$4000 and then she got other illnesses which  
23 the society had nothing to do with then unfortunately  
24 she passed away two years ago and I went back up 210  
25 street to save another dog and my Sadie she is a. I

2 had the DNA done on her. She is an American Terrier,  
3 full breed back to her great-great-grandparents and  
4 she was due to be euthanized the next day because of  
5 behavior problems. I said I'll take her and I  
6 brought her home and she too was not spayed.

7 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: What year was that?

8 JANICE GIACOLB: That was two years ago,  
9 three years ago, three years ago, 2015 and she was,  
10 she had no behaviour problems. She lives with three  
11 other dogs, I have three other dogs in my house they  
12 are all pit bulls. They all get along. Two were  
13 rescues from, were rescues from Memphis and she was a  
14 rescue from uhm New York and she is now my full  
15 fledged service dog. I spent thousands of dollars to  
16 have her trained to be a service dig and then she, I  
17 fell the other day and hurt my wrist and she just  
18 stayed by my side and I don't understand how these  
19 rescue groups like New York Bully Crew, rescue dogs  
20 New York City and second chance rescue and all these  
21 other plans can operate and save animals, save and  
22 place animals with all people who volunteer and  
23 contributions and we, we as a city can help save some  
24 more of these dogs and our tax dollars are going to  
25 pay to put down perfectly healthy beautiful dogs like

2 my Sadie who could be someone's dog that could save  
3 their lives like this one saved mine. Especially the  
4 other day when I fell.

5 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Well thank you Janice  
6 for sharing uhm your story and we very much  
7 appreciate your perspective and then ma'am, are you  
8 Barbara?

9 BARBARA MALLEY: That I am.

10 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Okay please.

11 BARBARA MALLEY: Okay my husband and I  
12 went to the ACC in Manhattan on Saturday because I  
13 didn't really want to speak of what I never  
14 experienced myself. On the good part it was a lot  
15 cleaner than I was led to believe. I asked to see  
16 the dogs what I call on death row. I was told I  
17 couldn't. I asked why? They said because if I saw  
18 the dogs there I would not be allowed to adopt a dog  
19 on the regular floor because they were all sick.  
20 Sick means kennel cough which is very similar to a  
21 child's runny nose. There is medicine for it. If  
22 the animals were inoculated when they came in it may  
23 curtail a lot of the problem. And then I was,  
24 because I pushed a bit, I asked, I asked to see the  
25 dogs and they asked if I had any dogs at home and I

2 admitted that I had two. And they said well all of  
3 these dogs are not friendly to other dogs, which I  
4 took as gospel, I tend to be naïve and so I went home  
5 and I checked the dogs and I got lied to right to my  
6 face. They dogs were not viscous to other dogs. I  
7 think one was the rest weren't. There was one dog  
8 there that if I didn't have an insane dog at home I  
9 would have taken home. He has got OCD. He has got a  
10 got. He's a rescue. The dog's name is Eve. He was  
11 on the kill list yesterday and she's back on the kill  
12 list today. There was a woman there from Staton  
13 Island who with tears in her eyes said I want to  
14 adopt this dog but they won't let me. I did some  
15 questioning, it seems when they took Eve out of her  
16 kennel this woman's other dog, they were walking and  
17 Eve made a motion towards the dog. I've had dogs  
18 since I was 11. I would have thought nothing about  
19 it but because of emotion that was refused a home and  
20 the woman was beside herself in sorrow because this  
21 dog is special and I hope she makes it thru the day.  
22 There are, Manhattan is filled with dogs, we know  
23 that, why can't some dogs be moved to other ACCs to  
24 give them a whole new opportunity to meet different  
25 types of people. It might help many but if you help

2 one that's one that would not have been helped. I'm  
3 also, I'm trying to do this as quickly as I can.  
4 I've heard some negative things about some of the New  
5 Hope Rescues. I would like them to be overseed, to  
6 have somebody look at them once very year, once every  
7 two years, make sure they are what they say they are.  
8 I have seen dogs on the list and Manhattan and also  
9 Staton Island and Queens that have tumors touching  
10 the floor, that have broken pelvis', they are given  
11 tramadol for pain, not enough. If they have vets on  
12 permesis a tumor that hangs down like this is  
13 inexcusable. I apologize.

14 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Thank you Barbara for  
15 your testimony and for your activism. We very much  
16 appreciate having your voice. We are going to keep  
17 on moving only because we have more people who want  
18 to speak, uhm and uhm I believe that Delores Ferraro,  
19 is, was not here, has already left, okay. So we have  
20 Elizabeth Jason. Sorry.

21 PAUL VALLONE: Thank you Lisa for staying  
22 for the whole hearing it is much appreciated.

23 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: We have Lauren Frossa  
24 I'm so sorry for Public and Animals, uhm Zuli  
25 Rodriguez from Astoria Queens, we have Ashley

2 Ashinback and finally Barbara Stewart. Barbara who's  
3 going to hold the camera now. You've been holding  
4 the camera the whole time. You are going to have to  
5 do a selfie. Okay uhm, would you like to kick us off  
6 please?

7 ELIZABETH JASON: Sure my name is  
8 Elizabeth Jason I am the northeast regional director  
9 for Best Friends Animal Society uhm we are a national  
10 organization dedicated to ending the killing of dogs  
11 and cats in American shelters and we are considered  
12 one of the leaders in the no kill movement and so  
13 I'll keep mindful of my three minutes but one of the  
14 things that I just wanted to uhm help eliminate is  
15 this idea of what no kill is. And what no kill is is  
16 the ending of killing of dogs and cats in shelters  
17 that are healthy and treatable. There is a lot of  
18 conversation about what healthy and treatable means.  
19 Uhm but the 90% is a threshold so when you look at  
20 agencies that are at a 90% and are very transparent  
21 with their data it's going to tell you a lot about  
22 that agency and, and across the country and in  
23 certain places where I am working in the northeast  
24 there are agencies that are at a 40 something percent  
25 save rate. It is going to tell you something about

2 the programming there but what the 90% is uhm is just  
3 a benchmark for you to be able to get an  
4 understanding. True no kill is when everybody that  
5 is healthy and treatable is saved. Uhm Risa is the  
6 first one to say that they have done incredible work.  
7 There is other things that they are going to continue  
8 to work on and it is a journey and it is a process  
9 that involves the whole community but the term no  
10 kill, uhm I just wanted to clarify exactly what that  
11 means. What, when you talk about no kill, there are,  
12 there are commonly accepted practices that include  
13 owner adopt, that include open adoptions that include  
14 working with the rescue community if you look across  
15 the country at large agencies that do very well,  
16 many, many agencies rely on the rescue community in  
17 the same way that animal care centers does, I'm  
18 working with that in Phillie right now so it is a  
19 common complement in a community that the rescue  
20 community is leveraged and utilized in this way to  
21 help support the shelters. ACC is not alone in that.  
22 Uhm things like managed intake if you do reading  
23 about successful communities a shelter's ability to  
24 say when they have the ability to take an animal in  
25 to give it the most likelihood of a positive outcome

2 is a common practice within no kill shelters and I  
3 don't want to take a lot of time here but there,  
4 there are practices that ACC is absolutely  
5 implementing. We are New Hope Partners, Best Friends  
6 pulls somewhere between 700 and 1000 animals just  
7 like a New Hope Partner from ACC their staff has  
8 always been incredibly gracious and helpful and  
9 really uhm advocating to help us help their animals  
10 and when it comes to legislation the only thing that  
11 I caution is just do your due diligence because  
12 what's being professed in Legislation seems at first  
13 flush like it is life saving but unless you  
14 understand the ramifications to the Legislation or  
15 the cost implications of when you apply that  
16 Legislation sometimes, sometimes they can do more  
17 harm than good. I'm happy to speak with whoever  
18 wants to further about the topic but I did want to  
19 clarify those two points and going back to the fact  
20 that for sure Animal Care Centers if you look across  
21 the country at other agencies that supply these kinds  
22 of resources to a community you are getting a really  
23 good value for your dollar and I would argue that are  
24 probably being underpaid for the services that they



2 do provide when you do go in to look at what they are  
3 offering so I would like at that.

4 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Thank you Elizabeth.  
5 It seems the one thing that everyone agrees is that  
6 we need to pay ACC staff more. Don't spend all the  
7 money yet, guys, please.

8 BARBARA STEWART: Hi I'm Barbara Stewart  
9 I represent a coalition of Animal Rights Activist.  
10 We watch the kill list on the internet on face book  
11 every night, every day, actually I put the animals  
12 out there on the kill list everyday. I don't get  
13 paid for it I do it of my own free will.

14 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: And are you based  
15 here in the city, Barbara?

16 BARBARA STEWART: Am I? No. I came in.

17 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Where do you live?

18 BARBARA STEWART: I came in out of  
19 Pennsylvania I'm from New York. I'm not in New York  
20 any longer but you know you can take the girl out of  
21 the city but you can never take the city out of the  
22 girl. I still have my heart here and my family is  
23 here. Uhm but anyway getting back to why I am here.  
24 I drove in over 3-1/2 hours to be here so that I can  
25 speak and say how I feel. First of all I would like

2 to say the Risa Weinstock and Jane Hoffman should be  
3 replaced with people that are compassionate. I, I'm  
4 sitting here and I'm listening to.

5 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Barbara, this is not  
6 a forum for add hominous acts, you can talk about  
7 policy but.

8 BARBARA STEWART: Okay we will talk about  
9 policy. The policy is first of all there is no  
10 transparency. There is supposed to be nonprofit then  
11 why is there no transparency as dictated by the IARS.  
12 You are supposed to have transparency why is it when  
13 people send foil letters out they get vague answers  
14 and they don't answer the questions. I know people  
15 who have sent letters to foil requests and they come  
16 back with no answers. Okay, Risa says that they are  
17 working on everything. I was watching your  
18 interview, all of them from the shelter, okay, I've  
19 been here all night. She scaves over a lot of the  
20 answers, the questions that you asked her. She  
21 didn't answer a lot of them and she is the Director.  
22 How come she doesn't have the answers to it? The  
23 adoption center that they say they are going to make  
24 out of the garage, they got \$8.5 million from Capital  
25 Funding, what happened to that money? What happens

2 to all the money that they get? They keep asking you  
3 for more and more money but yet where is all the  
4 money going? That's what we would like to know. I  
5 may never get, I'm associated with all advocates, we  
6 all correspond with each other and we see what goes  
7 on. We watch them every single day, now I also would  
8 like to know how was a Jane Hoffman is the President  
9 of the uhm Mayor's Alliance which is not associated  
10 with the Mayor's Office by the way. How is that she?  
11 How did she infiltrate the New York City Animal Care  
12 Control Shelter? How does she have all her people in  
13 there running the adoption process? And how is it  
14 that rescues that are not part of New Hope can't come  
15 in and adopt unless Jane Hoffman says it's okay. How  
16 is that possible? when there are so many rescues out  
17 there that would love to pull but they can't pull  
18 because they are deterred by Hoffmans' rescues and  
19 why is that Jane Hoffman boasts about her New Hope  
20 Program but yet she has not over 250 uhm rescues  
21 under her umbrella but only how many pull. The same  
22 handful of rescues pull all the time, why is that?

23 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Okay you had  
24 impeccable timing there. I I want to emphasize that  
25 we can fight over the policy and the Budget for ACC

2 we should, that's why we are here today but the  
3 people that I know who work there including the  
4 leadership are there because they love animals. They  
5 are not in it for the money, they are not in it for  
6 the money. They are, underpaid.

7 BARBARA STEWART: Wow, really, really.

8 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: They are there they  
9 are there because they want to help animals and that  
10 doesn't prevent us from. Hold on Barbara. That  
11 doesn't prevent us from fighting over every aspect of  
12 policy, procedure and Budget, that is why we are here  
13 but I would appreciate it since your time if the  
14 speakers would not attack.

15 BARBARA STEWART: We are taxpayers and we  
16 are the ones paying for all of that. Why is there no  
17 transparency?

18 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Well Pennsylvania tax  
19 payers don't pay for.

20 BARBARA STEWART: I don't care, I'm still  
21 speaking for the shelters of New York City and why am  
22 I kicked out of there every time I go there and why  
23 do they call the police on me every time I go to  
24 those shelters.

2 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: We, we appreciate  
3 your input Barbara and we are going to move to the  
4 next witness.

5 ASHLEY ASHINBACK: Hi my name is Ashley.  
6 I'm a volunteer at a small no kill shelter in  
7 Pennsylvania. I've been a volunteer there for nine  
8 years so I know kind of, I know it's obviously it's  
9 not the side of ACC but I know the basic goings on in  
10 the shelter and I also help to network similar uhm  
11 help to network animals that are on that risk list  
12 and every night we see them and every night from 6  
13 p.m. when the list goes out until 3 p.m. the next day  
14 is just completely frantic for the volunteers that  
15 are trying to place these animals and then when I  
16 look there are volunteer pages that run to help  
17 network and when I look at the volunteer pages they  
18 have 79,000, 17,000 lines involving from people. And  
19 when I look at the ACC at risk page it has 3,000 so  
20 there is a bit of disconnect for me there as to where  
21 the networking is, where the outreach is. Uhm the  
22 second issue that I wanted to bring up and the most  
23 glaring issue to me is the consistent killing of  
24 healthy treatable adoptable animals that are listed  
25 at risk because of sickness that they contract at the

2 shelter, uhm the behavioral issues, uhm the  
3 behavioral assessments are often contradictory to  
4 what we see that is posted by the volunteers. Uhm  
5 there are animals that have been pets their entire  
6 lives, they are good with children, they are good  
7 with other animals and then they are dumped at the  
8 shelter and then a couple of days later I see that  
9 they were euthanized and there is always it feels  
10 like somewhat like a scape goat an excuse as to why  
11 they they had no choice but to put them down and it  
12 just seems very very much like an excuse, being  
13 nervous or fearful is not a behavioral issue to me  
14 that request euthanasia. I think euthanasia should  
15 be reserved for animals that are not going to get  
16 better whether it is medically or behaviorally and  
17 then I think everyone touched, I don't want to  
18 reiterate so I just want to keep it concise but  
19 animals who need placements the most, the seniors,  
20 the ones who are cautious, the ones who are sick are  
21 usually the ones who get the amount of time, 6 p.m.  
22 to 3 p.m. most of those hours are overnight people  
23 don't even know that it's going on. They have no  
24 time to fill out you know work with the rescue  
25 organizations. The spay neuter kill issue uhm I think

2 that was brought up a couple of times but it was  
3 first brought to my attention with the dog, Hannah  
4 who was stated by Ms. Weinstock that that was an  
5 anomaly that was a rare instance, since Hannah there  
6 have been at last 14 more spay, neuter kill dogs, one  
7 last week, Chloe she was listed as you know her  
8 assessment behavioral was treatable she had some  
9 behavioral but she was with children. She was  
10 allowed handling and then she was spayed and a couple  
11 of days later she was killed due to the kennel cough  
12 which you have heard is like the common cold. I  
13 don't want to take up too much time but I just feel  
14 like I don't want to be patronized and I don't want  
15 others to feel like they are being patronized. I  
16 think New York needs to be better and they need to be  
17 leading in the CAPA Bill discussed. Is it perfect?  
18 No but it has proven success in other places so I  
19 think it is something that we need to look at and I  
20 think that we need to try harder.

21 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Alright thank you  
22 Ashley and thank you for coming from Pennsylvania.  
23 Pennsylvania is showing up strong today.

24 LAURA FROSSA: Hi there, how are you.  
25 Thank you for your time, I'm Lauren Frossa. I'm a

2 business woman, I'm a volunteer, an advocate and I'm  
3 also an animal rescue contributor.

4 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: What state are you  
5 from?

6 LAUREN FROSSA: And a significant one. I  
7 live in New York City, Manhattan.

8 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Alright glad to hear  
9 that.

10 LAUREN FROSSA: So I recognize the  
11 complexities and layers of the animal control and  
12 welfare issue and I think many of us do. It is a  
13 very complex issue. It is also emotionally charged  
14 and at times overwhelming. I think both for rescue  
15 organizations, advocates and the ACC and it's been a  
16 pleasure to hear people's perspectives. I think I'm  
17 also an internal optimist and I want to believe that  
18 everybody wants to do right by the animals of New  
19 York City but I think that as an overarching  
20 statement we need to encourage our Council and  
21 Government Officials to take a look respectfully at  
22 the system because I think it is somewhat flawed or  
23 at least at minimum can be significantly improved. I  
24 don't claim to have the answers and I want to be a  
25 more part of more of a part of the solution but I



2 think we need to look under the hood a little but  
3 more and hold the ACC and other organizations  
4 involved both accountable to uhm us as taxpayers as  
5 well as a transparency to their rescue partners if  
6 you will to optimize the process and operational  
7 efficiency. Uhm to me as a business woman and you  
8 have said this too. I look at the mess and I don't  
9 claim to know all the numbers, right, but I've heard  
10 that there is a \$17 million annual Budget for the ACC  
11 and 80% of that goes to the Admin. I'm not claiming  
12 that we shouldn't get more funding.

13 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: That's not right.

14 LAUREN FROSSA: Okay that's not right.

15 Okay well I guess what I am saying to you is that if  
16 you, if you break down the numbers right and you look  
17 at that even at 50% goes to it and I could be wrong  
18 respectfully that's less than half that goes to "the  
19 animals and the welfare and treatment of animals" and  
20 I think that as a business woman and a former partner  
21 of a firm if my boss every said to me hey you gets  
22 between 50% and 70% but you are not held accountable  
23 for your output and your results I'd be fired so I, I  
24 don't, I don't mean to villianize the ACC because I  
25 think respectfully they have clearly made some

2 significant strong changes but I think we all  
3 collectively have to work together to make it better.  
4 The other thing I would say is it is so disheartening  
5 as a human being, you know, we we all get up and we  
6 are emotionally charged to know that there is  
7 wonderful animals that are worthy of great homes and  
8 just don't, are not given the time. And I'm not even  
9 certainly suggesting that the ACC has a space issues,  
10 I, I get that but I think that we need to improve the  
11 communications and accountability admist  
12 partnerships, the rescue partners, and that would  
13 help us all. We would all be better for it but  
14 especially the animals would be. Thank you.

15 CHAIR MARK LEVINE: Thank you very much.  
16 Thank you to this panel and this concludes a very  
17 productive hearing, thank you all very much.

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date May 25, 2018