



**TESTIMONY BEFORE THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL
SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME USES
REGARDING DESIGNATION of
THE INTERBOROUGH RAPID TRANSIT COMPANY POWERHOUSE
and
THE EMPIRE STATE DAIRY COMPANY BUILDINGS
February 26, 2018**

Good afternoon Chair Adams and Subcommittee Members, my name is Lisa Kersavage, director of Strategic Planning and Special Projects at the Landmarks Preservation Commission, and I am joined by Ali Rasoulinejad to present two recent designations by the Landmarks Preservation Commission. On December 5th, 2017, the Commission voted to designate the Empire State Dairy Company Buildings in East New York, Brooklyn, and the Interborough Rapid Transit Company Powerhouse in Manhattan.

EMPIRE STATE DAIRY COMPANY BUILDINGS

The Empire State Dairy Company Buildings are a prominent ensemble of late-19th and early-20th century industrial buildings on Atlantic Avenue in East New York. Comprising six buildings, these together represent the manufacturing history of the neighborhood and showcase a significant development in the milk industry, which was making great strides in quality and safety at the time these buildings were constructed.

LPC identified this as a potential landmark in 2016 as part of our work to identify historic preservation opportunities in East New York in conjunction with its rezoning. The complex is prominently located on the south side of Atlantic Avenue, between Schenck Avenue and Barbey Street, in an area characterized by a mix of industrial and commercial buildings, and low-scale residential buildings dating mainly from the early- to mid-20th century, when expanding transit lines and roadways to the area advanced the growth of the population and the industry in the area.

The Empire State Dairy Company was founded in 1869. The earliest buildings on this site were constructed in 1906-07, when technological advancements were being made to improve the safety and quality of milk, when New York City required all dairy farms and milk processors to submit to inspection, and when the company was expanding its business.

These 1906-07 buildings presently anchor the complex at the intersection of Atlantic and Schenck

Meenakshi Srinivasan, Chair

1 Centre Street, 9th FL, New York, NY 10007 ♦ 212-669-7855 ♦ www.nyc.gov/landmarks



Avenues. They were designed by Theobald Engelhardt in the Renaissance and Romanesque Revival styles. Engelhardt, a prominent Brooklyn architect is known for his commercial and manufacturing buildings, including buildings within the Eberhard Faber Pencil Factory Historic District in Greenpoint.

The complex was expanded in 1914-15 when milk started to be processed in high volumes and company needed larger, more modern facilities. On Atlantic Avenue, the annex included four additional buildings, shown on the left, with a façade arrangement that grouped them in a near-symmetrical composition.

The Commission held public hearings in July and September 2016, and five people testified in favor of designation including representatives of the New York Landmarks Conservancy, the Historic Districts Council, Preserve East New York, and the Friends of Terra Cotta. The Commission also received written testimony in favor of the designation from Council Member Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.

Representatives of the owner testified citing structural issues and significant hazardous waste issues on the site. Prior to the vote for designation, the owners submitted a letter supporting designation of the complex, but asked the commission to recognize the reuse and remediation challenges in the building, which the LPC did in the designation report. The Commission designated the Empire State Dairy Company Buildings as calendared and heard, and any future changes required by remediation efforts will be reviewed by LPC.

INTERBOROUGH RAPID TRANSIT COMPANY POWERHOUSE

The next property is the Interborough Rapid Transit Company Powerhouse, on Eleventh Avenue in Manhattan. It was heard most recently at the special backlog hearing of November 5, 2015 when 22 people spoke in favor of designation, including Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer, Senator Brad Hoylman, Assembly Member Linda Rosenthal and Council Member Helen Rosenthal. The owner, Consolidated Edison, spoke in opposition. Since then, LPC has made a concerted effort to work with the owners to address their concerns about how landmark designation would affect a working power station. We have since gained ConEd's support for the designation, and earlier this year approved a detailed master plan to appropriately and efficiently guide future changes.

Opened in 1904 to provide electric power for the pioneering IRT Subway, the Interborough Rapid Transit

Meenakshi Srinivasan, Chair

1 Centre Street, 9th FL, New York, NY 10007 ♦ 212-669-7855 ♦ www.nyc.gov/landmarks



**Landmarks Preservation
Commission**

Company Powerhouse represents a unique integration of 20th-century engineering and classical architectural expression. The largest electricity generating station constructed up to that time, built to support the entire IRT system, the Powerhouse's exterior was designed by the renowned architect Stanford White in his typically opulent style. Since 1959, it has been owned by the Consolidated Edison Company.

In the late 19th century, Manhattan's extreme traffic congestion and population density were threatening its leadership as a business center. This led city leaders to push for an underground rapid-transit system that would free up its streets and open vast portions of the Upper West Side, Upper Manhattan, and the Bronx to intensive development.

The Rapid Transit Company decided to run the new system using electricity, which was then in its infancy as a form of motive power. The city took the novel approach of public funding and ownership of the new subway line, with its construction and operation to be carried out by a private firm. This firm would be founded in 1902 as the Interborough Rapid Transit Company, or IRT. The IRT Subway was a remarkable achievement—upon its opening in 1904, it was only the sixth subway in the entire world and, at more than 20 miles in length, the largest subway ever completed as a single project.

Its powerhouse needed to be of unprecedented size, with a waterfront location facilitating the delivery of immense amounts of coal and the removal of mountains of waste ash. Its builders sought "as commanding a site as possible" for the structure, reflecting their belief that "the powerhouse of the city's great transit system will be something in which New Yorkers will take no little pride."

Formerly the site of large slaughterhouses, the entire block bounded by Eleventh and Twelfth Avenues, and West 58th and 59th Streets, along with property extending to the Hudson River's bulkhead line, were acquired in 1901. The planning and basic design of the building were undertaken by a team of distinguished engineers including John Van Vleck and Lewis B. Stillwell. As the powerhouse neared completion in 1904, it constituted the largest building operation underway in the entire city.

With the basic design of the powerhouse worked out by its engineers, Stanford White was called in to design its exterior. White's design for the building's exterior masterfully concealed the disparate boiler house and generating station within elegant, unified facades. He cloaked the facades in Milford granite,

Meenakshi Srinivasan, Chair

1 Centre Street, 9th FL, New York, NY 10007 ♦ 212-669-7855 ♦ www.nyc.gov/landmarks



buff Roman brick, and creamy terra cotta, with classical ornament. Over the decades, White's design has been praised by numerous architects and historians.

In 1940, the City purchased the IRT's equipment, including this building and in 1959, it was acquired by the Consolidated Edison Company. Under Con Edison's ownership, it provided power to the city's subway system for many years before being converted to a generating plant for the city's steam system.

Over time, as technologies to produce and deliver energy have changed, the building has been adapted to meet evolving power needs. Such adaptations have resulted in changes to the building's exterior, including the removal of the original smokestacks, the construction of a new, higher smokestack at the building's eastern end and changes to windows and entries.

Despite these alterations, the IRT Powerhouse retains its classical grandeur. As an architecturally significant structure designed for the production of power, it has remained in continued use as a power station. It plays a vital role in the city's utility infrastructure as a part of Con Edison's Manhattan steam system, the largest in the nation, which serves hundreds of Manhattan buildings including the Empire State Building and the United Nations.

We urge the Council to uphold these two designations.

Meenakshi Srinivasan, Chair

1 Centre Street, 9th FL, New York, NY 10007 ♦ 212-669-7855 ♦ www.nyc.gov/landmarks

February 26, 2018

STATEMENT OF THE NEW YORK LANDMARKS CONSERVANCY BEFORE THE N.Y.C. CITY COUNCIL SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND MARITIME USES REGARDING DESIGNATION OF THE EMPIRE STATE DAIRY COMPANY, 2840 ATLANTIC AVENUE, BROOKLYN, AS AN INDIVIDUAL LANDMARK

Good day Chair Adams and Council members. I am Andrea Goldwyn, speaking on behalf of the New York Landmarks Conservancy. The Conservancy is pleased to support designation of the Empire State Dairy Company.

As the City undertakes neighborhood rezonings, increasing development pressures, we appreciate that the Landmarks Commission has prioritized buildings for designation that have significance to these communities. The Empire State Dairy is certainly such a site. This complex, which is eligible for listing on the State and National Registers, is part of East New York's early 20th-century industrial history. With a prominent location on Atlantic Avenue, it served as a distribution center for the Empire State Dairy Company and later for the Borden Dairy.

The low-scale, masonry complex is notable for the 1904 corner building attributed to Theobald Engelhardt, the prolific architect responsible for numerous industrial, residential, and religious buildings in North Brooklyn. It retains distinctive round- and segmental-arched windows on both facades. The larger, 1913-14 building by Otto Strack features two large ceramic tile decorative panels, illustrating pastoral scenes of cows and their herders, in a setting of pastures, streams, and snow-capped mountains, an exquisite site on Atlantic Avenue.

The Empire State Dairy is well-deserving of landmark designation for both its association with local history and its attractive architecture. We hope that this designation will open up opportunities for adaptive use of the complex, so that it can play a major role in East New York's future.

Thank you for the opportunity to present the Conservancy's views.

DISTRICT OFFICE
209 EAST 3RD STREET
NEW YORK, NY 10009
(212) 677-1077
FAX: (212) 677-1990
District2@council.nyc.gov



CITY HALL OFFICE
250 BROADWAY, ROOM 1808
NEW YORK, NY 10007
(212) 788-7366
FAX: (212) 442-2738

CARLINA RIVERA
COUNCIL MEMBER, 2ND DISTRICT
CITY OF NEW YORK

February 26th, 2018

Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Siting and Maritime Uses
New York City Council

Re: Landmark designation of 827-831 Broadway

Dear Fellow Council Members:

I would like to reiterate the support of this office to designate 827-831 Broadway as individual landmarks and to protect this historic resource in District 2.

The Landmarks Preservation Commission (LPC) granted the deserved landmark designation to these buildings in 2017. These two structures are elegant, nineteenth-century buildings built of cast iron in the neo-greco style and date back to the Civil War era. They serve as reminders of the industriousness of New York City's former manufacturing district and the detailed architecture of the period.

As many of Manhattan's downtown lofts shifted from purely commercial use to centers of cultural output, 827-831 Broadway became home to the art studios of twentieth-century greats such as William and Elaine de Kooning and Paul Jenkins.

Currently, we are experiencing increased development in this neighborhood. The area from 8th to 14th Streets, from Fourth to Fifth Avenues has become the latest target of site-assembling speculators. Beautiful, historic townhouses and ornate industrial-revolution era buildings have met the wrecking ball. We are losing, piece by piece, the architectural significance of central Greenwich Village as it is replaced by uniform glass towers.

Since these buildings not only serve as examples of architectural history, but also stand as reminders of our city's industrial age and artistic heritage, I ask that you preserve their role by supporting their designation as New York City landmarks.

Thank you.

DISTRICT OFFICE
563 COLUMBUS AVENUE
NEW YORK, NY 10024
(212) 873-0282

CITY HALL OFFICE
250 BROADWAY, SUITE 1765
NEW YORK, NY 10007
(212) 788-6975

HRosenthal@council.nyc.gov
www.council.nyc.gov



**THE COUNCIL
OF
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

HELEN ROSENTHAL

COUNCIL MEMBER
6TH DISTRICT, MANHATTAN

CHAIR
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN

COMMITTEES
CIVIL AND HUMAN RIGHTS
CONTRACTS
ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
FINANCE
HOUSING AND BUILDINGS

Council Member Adrienne Adams
Chair, Committee on Landmarks, Public Siting, and Maritime Uses

February 26, 2018

Dear Chair Adams,

I write in support of the landmark designation of the Interborough Rapid Transit (IRT) Company Powerhouse located at 855-969 11th Avenue (Block 1106, Lot 1). At the time of its construction, the IRT Powerhouse was the largest generating station in the world. In response to the City's population increase in the late 19th century, the City committed to funding a new subway line that would need an unprecedentedly large powerhouse. The building, whose exterior was designed by the celebrated architect Stanford White, was designed in the French Neoclassical style and represents a unique integration of 20th century engineering and classical architectural expression.

I proudly offer my support in granting landmark designation to the Powerhouse's beautiful and breathtaking exterior. I also applaud the work done by the Landmarks Preservation Commission and Consolidated Edison in reaching an agreement that works for both parties. I hope that the Committee, and ultimately the Council, join me in approving this designation.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Helen Rosenthal".

Helen Rosenthal

DISTRICT OFFICE
786 KNICKERBOCKER AVENUE
BROOKLYN, NY 11207
(718) 642-8664
FAX: (718) 889-6017

CITY HALL OFFICE
250 BROADWAY, SUITE 1880
NEW YORK, NY 10007
(212) 788-7284
FAX: (212) 227-5636
respinal@council.nyc.gov



THE COUNCIL
OF
THE CITY OF NEW YORK
RAFAEL L. ESPINAL, JR.
COUNCIL MEMBER, 37TH DISTRICT, BROOKLYN

CHAIR
CONSUMER AFFAIRS

COMMITTEES
HEALTH
HOUSING AND BUILDINGS
IMMIGRATION
PUBLIC SAFETY
RULES, PRIVILEGES AND ELECTIONS
STATE AND FEDERAL LEGISLATION

February 22, 2018

Re: Statement in support of the proposed landmark designation of Empire State Dairy Co., locate at 2840 Atlantic Avenue, Brooklyn, NY 11207

Dear Chair Adrienne Adams and Members of the Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Siting, and Maritime Uses,

Cypress Hills, East New York and Ocean Hill were the first neighborhoods to undergo a rezoning under Mayor de Blasio's *Housing New York* plan. In my discussions with the community and the administration, I was always clear that the final East New York Community Plan must take concrete steps to preserve the existing character of our neighborhoods.

The Empire State Dairy is known across the community for its distinct appearance and is an ongoing reminder of East New York's industrial past. My goal throughout the rezoning process was to make sure that industrial businesses thrive in East New York once again, and I'm proud that the final East New York Community Plan includes an investment of more than \$16 million to support and improve the East New York Industrial Business Zone. We must continue to strike a balance between building livable neighborhoods—neighborhoods that include quality affordable housing and community resources—and creating space for manufacturers and businesses to thrive.

The Empire State Dairy is already a landmark in every East New Yorker's heart. As our neighborhood grows and new buildings begin to appear along Atlantic Avenue, the smokestacks of the Empire State Dairy will serve as a reminder of our neighborhood's history and resilience.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.".

Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Council Member, 37th District





45 Clermont Avenue #6M
Brooklyn, NY 11205
Telephone : 347.615.6240
Email : peny.bk@gmail.com

February 26, 2018

Testimony of Zulmilena Then, Founder of PENY
The New York City Council
Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Siting and Maritime Uses
Public Hearing of the Empire State Dairy Company Buildings,
2840 Atlantic Avenue (Block 3964, part of Lot 8)

Good afternoon, My name is Zulmilena Then, founder of Preserving East New York (PENY). PENY is an organization advocating Historic Preservation for the neighborhood of East New York (ENY). I am here today on behalf of PENY to commend the city agencies in acknowledging this building as an important historic resource that represents the history of the city as a whole and specifically the history of ENY.

However, we are not satisfied. We have to do better than this. What does it say about the city when they have an agency in place such as the Landmarks Preservation Commission to help recognize buildings worth preserving but the plan does not allow them to move an extra step forward into actually protecting those significant neighborhood features? Ever since the beginning, we knew the impact of what the ENY rezoning would cause within the other fourteen communities that would follow in its footsteps. For this reason, we took it upon ourselves to beg the city to include historic preservation as an effective means of community revitalization to ensure that our neighborhoods are protected. If not, the rezoning plan, would act as spinning tornado, destroying every community's soul as it lands by allowing irresponsible and insensitive development within existing and established communities. We were heard... But the plan was approved like if our concerns did not have any validation. We asked for all of our endangered buildings to be protected but only one was considered out of fourteen. What an injustice that is? Don't you think? What a crime it is to recognize the need for protection and not take the responsibility to do it. It's like when a parent abandons their children, and leaves them vulnerable out there in the world exposed to all the threats knowing very well what the consequences could be. Would you do that to your own child, niece, nephew or grandchildren? Would you? Our communities are no different, like children, they need nourishment, guidance to help them grow into fruitful beings. How will our communities survive, if we don't take the responsibility to care for them?

All of you are here, because of us. We put you in this position. We voted for you to represent us the best possible way. So, why are you not thinking about us when you make your decisions? We would like to believe that all of you got passionately involved in this career to make a difference. However, what happened, when once in, you might have probably realized that the system is not setup for you to become community superheroes but instead to follow an established agenda where many of you have felt trapped in between two walls and had to probably succumb to the unbreakable system. Has your old self survived? Have you let the system of politics break you and steer you away from what you truly believe in? Have you stayed true to yourself? Next time when something is presented in front of you to take a stance, forget about the big guy and think: Are you, you? And are you doing this for the community that you represent?

With this single designation, knowing that there are thirteen other buildings at risks and worse to know that the city recognizes this, we feel that we've been left alone in the middle of the desert with starving hyenas. However, that has given us the strength to continue our work, to help our people understand the power of preservation, and show how together we can become stronger. Preservation is not just about saving history and pretty old buildings... it's about lifting communities up and empowering them. But clearly this seems of no interest to the city. Instead, the city shows how blinded it is by greed and money and focuses well on how to break our communities apart because that's the way it will take hold of the precious land and all the gold that it can extract from it, by creating and implementing laws that instead of uplifting us, they are uprooting us into displacement. Why is it that this city is so afraid of losing money and not of losing communities? Let's get our priorities straight! And let us not destroy the neighborhoods that we love, for this is what makes New York City a special place.

Sincerely,

Zulmilena Then
Founder



New York City Campaign Finance Board
100 Church Street, 12th Floor, New York, NY 10007
212.409.1800 | www.nyccfb.info

**Testimony of Amy Loprest
Executive Director
New York City Campaign Finance Board**

**City Council Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Siting and Maritime Uses
February 26, 2018**

Good afternoon Chair Adams and members of the subcommittee. I am Amy Loprest, Executive Director of the New York City Campaign Finance Board (CFB).

I am here today to discuss the acquisition of new office space for the CFB staff consisting of the entire fourth floor of 255 Greenwich Street. I want to thank our colleagues at the Department of Citywide Administrative Services (DCAS) for assessing our needs thoroughly and identifying an appropriate space that will better support our ongoing work.

Our current facilities at 100 Church Street do not meet the current and future needs of the agency.

As you know, the CFB administers one of the strongest, most effective campaign finance systems in the country, and is directed by the City Charter to perform voter education and engagement activities for all city elections.

As new responsibilities and functions have been added to the CFB's mandates in recent years, our staff and the demand for public access have grown concurrently.

Our staffing needs exceed the capacity of our current office. The day we moved into our office space at 100 Church Street, we were already at capacity. To meet our expanded responsibilities, the CFB currently has 116 full-time employees, plus several part-time

employees and interns. We have taken several steps to create more space for staff by converting conference rooms, file rooms, and copier rooms into additional workstations, but additional space is still needed.

Upon initial occupation of the 100 Church Street space, the public meeting space was clearly insufficient to meet the demand for public access to our offices. To accommodate public attendance at our Board meetings, two additional conference rooms, two smaller file rooms and staff closets were eliminated to expand the size of our Board Room. In addition to Board meetings, the Board Room is used to host the bi-monthly meetings of the Voter Assistance Advisory Committee, full-staff meetings, and large trainings for partners in our voter engagement work.

As you know, candidates who participate in the matching funds program are required to send personnel to CFB trainings. During 2017, we hosted 55 training sessions for 647 individuals. Though the CFB provides these trainings year-round, the original training room at our 100 Church Street office was able to accommodate only six to eight people at a time. This led to the conversion of another mid-size conference room to expand our training room, which currently accommodates 12-16 people.

Additionally, the unavoidable cost of running supplemental heating and cooling after hours and weekends in our 100 Church Street office represents an additional, undue strain on our resources. Due to the nature of our work, staff is often required to work evenings and weekends—especially in an election year, to produce the Voter Guide and approve payments of public funds on tight, legally mandated deadlines. Audit deadlines set in the Campaign Finance Act can also lead to off-hours work even during non-election years. For the current fiscal year,

we were forced to budget \$450,000 for supplemental heating and cooling in order to provide these necessary services to the public and the candidates in our system during the election year.

The space identified for us by DCAS, based on their assessment, will accommodate the current and future needs of the agency, and will provide added resource efficiencies.

As noted, the CFB's mandates have grown over the years, and continue to expand. In recent years, Charter amendments have added significant voter outreach and engagement efforts to our work, and expanded our oversight to include independent expenditures in city elections. The most recent example is Local Law 238 of 2017, which directs the CFB to create an online system for voter registration. To provide these critical resources for city voters while continuing to manage our regular workload, additional staff is required.

The space at 255 Greenwich Street is approximately 50,000 square feet, which will provide appropriate working space for our staff and satisfy demand for public access. The new space will have a larger training room, which will allow us to train more individuals in larger groups. With term limits creating an unprecedented number of open seats in the 2021 elections, this added capacity will help us meet the significant increase in demand for trainings we anticipate during the next election cycle.

The new space will contribute other efficiencies to our work. It will provide the ability for CFB staff to produce candidate video profiles for our Voter Guide on-site. In previous elections, the CFB has contracted with a production facility to film and produce this useful resource at significant cost, which also constrains our ability to provide scheduling flexibility for candidates during some of the busiest weeks in the election season. The building can provide supplemental heating and cooling to our space as required, alleviating the extra cost to the city imposed by our current location.

The CFB has been working with DCAS since the fall of 2016 to locate appropriate space based on a comprehensive assessment of our needs. Their efforts have been considerable. 255 Greenwich is easily accessible by public transit, and is within blocks of the New York City Board of Elections, the City Council offices and City Hall. This acquisition resolves the challenges created by our move to 100 Church Street, and we anticipate that the space will allow us to meet our obligations to serve the public and our local democracy for many years into the future.

I thank you for the opportunity to testify today, and I am happy to answer any questions that you have.

FOR THE RECORD

Con Edison Testimony

Before the New York City Council Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Siting and Maritime Uses

February 26, 2018

Good afternoon Chair Adams and members of the Subcommittee. My name is Michael Corcoran and I am a project engineer at Con Edison. I am pleased to submit these comments on behalf of Con Edison regarding the landmark designation of the Con Edison 59th Street Steam and Electric Generating Station (“59th Street Station”).

Con Edison is the owner and operator of the 59th Street Station. This facility is the first operating power plant to be designated a landmark anywhere in the country. Originally constructed by the Interborough Rapid Transit Company in the early 1900s to power the first subway system, the plant continues to serve New Yorkers’ energy needs. Today, the site is still one of the most critical energy facilities in the City and it will continue to play an important role in the energy infrastructure well into the future.

As an operating generating plant that will have to meet future energy infrastructure and customer needs, the 59th Street Station is a unique landmark. In addition, Con Edison is a regulated energy company that is obligated to serve our customers and operates under extensive regulatory oversight that directly impacts the site’s future energy uses and capital projects. In light of these unique circumstances, Con Edison has worked collaboratively with the Landmarks Preservation Commission and its staff so that we can continue to maintain and operate the station for energy purposes under the landmarks designation. This will be an ongoing collaboration established under a master plan.

With this master plan in place, Con Edison supports the landmark designation. We will continue to maintain and preserve the architectural significance of the building. At the same time, we will preserve the original (and current) use of the building for energy production while also accommodating future energy needs as

technologies and requirements continue to evolve. We will have the necessary guidance and framework in which we can plan and move forward with capital improvements necessary to meet future customer energy needs.

The 59th Street Station is part of Con Edison's integrated district steam system, the largest in the country. The steam system provides heating, cooling and other services to approximately 1,650 customers south of 96th Street, including such iconic buildings as the Empire State Building and the Museum of Natural History. Overall, the system provides significant environmental benefits because its customers do not have on-site local emissions and it aggregates customer loads to be more efficient than smaller individual installations. Approximately 60 percent of the steam produced is done through cogeneration. As the City's energy needs and resources continue to evolve, the 59th Street Station can also support moving the City toward its goals of greater clean green energy in the future.

Thank you for the opportunity to submit these comments to the Subcommittee.



A GUIDE TO HISTORIC NEW YORK CITY NEIGHBORHOODS

EAST NEW YORK BROOKLYN





The Historic Districts Council is New York’s citywide advocate for historic buildings and neighborhoods. The Six to Celebrate program annually identifies six historic New York City neighborhoods that merit preservation as priorities for HDC’s advocacy and consultation over a yearlong period.

The six, chosen from applications submitted by community organizations, are selected on the basis of the architectural and historic merit of the area, the level of threat to the neighborhood, the strength and willingness of the local advocates, and the potential for HDC’s preservation support to be meaningful. HDC works with these neighborhood partners to set and reach preservation goals through strategic planning, advocacy, outreach, programs and publicity.

The core belief of the Historic Districts Council is that preservation and enhancement of New York City’s historic resources—its neighborhoods, buildings, parks and public spaces—are central to the continued success of the city. The Historic Districts Council works to ensure the preservation of these resources and uphold the New York City Landmarks Law and to further the preservation ethic. This mission is accomplished through ongoing programs of assistance to more than 500 community and neighborhood groups and through public-policy initiatives, publications, educational outreach and sponsorship of community events.



**Council on
the Arts**



Support is provided in part by public funds from the New York City Department of Cultural Affairs in partnership with the City Council and by the New York State Council on the Arts with the support of Governor Andrew Cuomo and the New York State Legislature. Additional support is provided by New York City Council Members Margaret Chin, Daniel Garodnick, Vincent Gentile, Corey Johnson, Ben Kallos, Peter Koo and Stephen Levin.



232 East 11th Street, New York, NY 10003 tel 212-614-9107 fax 212-614-9127
e-mail hdc@hdc.org www.hdc.org 6tocelebrate.org

EAST NEW YORK

East New York is a dynamic and largely unrecognized jewel in New York City. In the mid-17th century, Dutch farming families began migrating here from the town of Flatbush, referring to the land as the “new lots,” and it was soon identified as a subsidiary of Flatbush. In 1852, residents deemed themselves independent and began to refer to the community officially as New Lots. Present-day East New York is part of what was once the town of New Lots. In 1886, New Lots was annexed to help form the city of Brooklyn, and in 1898, was annexed again when Brooklyn and the other boroughs were consolidated to become the City of Greater New York.

In 1835, developers began buying farms in New Lots and laying out streets and lots. The area was prime for development due to the presence of the Jamaica Turnpike and the Long Island Railroad tracks along Atlantic Avenue. It was also a well-known destination for its two horse racing tracks, Union Course and Centerville Race Track (both demolished). The area’s most influential developer was a Connecticut merchant named John Pitkin, who purchased 135 acres and named his neighborhood East New York. The renaming was not only to set it apart for real estate purposes, but Pitkin envisioned a world-class and impressively-designed community filled with factories, shops and housing to rival New York City – an illustrious goal. Although Pitkin experienced significant losses during the financial panic of 1837, sales picked up in the mid-19th century and East New York became a thriving community even before neighborhoods much closer to Manhattan had even begun to be developed. Transportation improvements in the 1880s, including the opening of the Brooklyn Bridge and the introduction of steam cars and the elevated railroad on Atlantic Avenue, led to a building boom in East New York. Immigrants, including Germans, Italians, Russians and Eastern Europeans, migrated from crowded Manhattan neighborhoods to settle in the East New York countryside, in hopes of building a community where they would be free to communicate in their native languages, congregate and worship, patronize businesses catering to their cultural tastes and provide their children with opportunities to become skilled and educated citizens.

By the 1930s, East New York was widely regarded as a stable, working class community, boasting of great housing stock, schools and low crime. After World War II, however, the neighborhood experienced a slow decline that it is still recovering from today. After the war, the city lost a great number of manufacturing jobs at the same time as large numbers of Puerto Ricans and African Americans were arriving in the city seeking employment. East New York was hit particularly hard in the 1970s by the FHA Mortgage Scandal and the unscrupulous and racially-charged real estate practice of “blockbusting,” which resulted in home foreclosure and abandonment. Unemployment, drug abuse and crime became commonplace in East New York, and its notorious reputation unfortunately lingers today. In recent years, East New York has begun to experience a rebirth. Vacant lots have been transformed into community gardens; well-maintained homes have helped to revitalize blocks; desolate sections under the elevated train tracks now exhibit vibrant murals; and diverse groups are working to enhance the neighborhood. One of these is Preserving East New York, a grassroots preservation group that formed to protect the neighborhood’s historic resources and illuminate its 300-year narrative of refuge, expansion, battle and rebirth. The group is advocating for landmark designation of some of the area’s historic buildings, an effort mainly spurred by the city’s announcement in 2015 that East New York would be rezoned for increased density as part of Mayor Bill de Blasio’s *Housing New York* plan.

I

**HOLY TRINITY RUSSIAN
ORTHODOX CHURCH**
400 Glenmore Avenue
(Roman Meltzer, 1935)



Founded in 1909 by immigrants from Belarus, the Holy Trinity Russian Orthodox Church commissioned this magnificent structure a few decades later, with construction completed in 1935. The church was designed in the traditional Russian Orthodox style by Roman Meltzer, a notable Russian-born architect. Before arriving in New York in 1921, Meltzer worked as an architect and decorator for several of the Imperial palaces in St. Petersburg, and was appointed court architect in 1903. He was best known for his Art Nouveau style interiors and for the wrought-iron grillework he designed for the Winter Palace entrance gates and garden railing. In the late 1950s, the interior of the Holy Trinity Russian Orthodox Church was redecorated with murals by the famed iconographer Pimen M. Sofronoff. On the exterior, the church's domed copper roofs, which have tarnished to reveal a beautiful green patina, have become neighborhood icons and serve as a beacon to those of the Russian Orthodox faith. After many years of coping with a diminishing congregation, the church's membership has increased in recent years due to an influx of Russian immigrants to southern Brooklyn.

LEGEND OF DESIGNATIONS

National Historic Landmark:	NHL
National Register of Historic Places—District:	NR-D
National Register of Historic Places—Property:	NR-P
New York City Historic District:	NYC HD
New York City Individual Landmark:	NYC IL
New York City Interior Landmark:	NYC INL



2

SECOND CALVARY BAPTIST CHURCH
503 Glenmore Avenue
(Architect unknown, 1921)

There is a longstanding tradition in New York City of adapting religious buildings for use by other religious groups, and the Second Calvary Baptist Church is a shining example of this practice. This structure was originally constructed for the Agudath Achim B'nai Jacob Synagogue, which operated here until transferring ownership in 1974 to the Second Calvary Baptist Church. Remarkably, while the church made changes to adapt the building, it left nearly all of the Jewish iconography and ornament intact on the building's exterior. If not for the church's new signs at the corner of Glenmore and Miller Avenues, the grand structure would appear to still function as a synagogue, as it retains Hebrew inscriptions above the three entrance doors, a prominent depiction of the Torah in the center of the building's pediment, three large sculptures of the Star of David on the roofline and stained glass windows containing the Star of David. Through the preservation of these elements, the new congregation has honored the building's past, beautifully merging the old and the new. Aside from its religious symbols, the building commands a strong presence with its Classical style temple front, sculptural details, decorative brickwork and iron fence, which are all wonderfully intact.

This stately Gothic Revival style church was originally built for the German congregation of St. John's Evangelical Lutheran Church, which referred to itself as St. Johannes Evangelisch-Lutherische Kirche – a



3

GRACE BAPTIST CHURCH OF CHRIST
233 New Jersey Avenue
(Architect unknown, 1898)

name memorialized in stone at the base of the church's tower. From its formation in 1847, this German immigrant congregation worshipped in a wooden church building at the corner of New Jersey and Liberty Avenues, making it one of East New York's earliest institutions. The new church, constructed just south of the original building, was dedicated in 1898. Committed to staying connected to their heritage, the members of the church spoke German and for many years refused to conduct services in English. This was largely in response to the early 20th century trend of German congregations switching to English-speaking services. This eventually led to a schism in the congregation, wherein a group broke off to form the English-speaking Lutheran Church of the Reformation on Barbey Street. By the mid-20th century, most of the German population had moved out of East New York, so in 1972, the parish voted to disband and sold the building to the congregation of Grace Baptist Church of Christ, which continues to worship here. The structure is adjoined by a charming rectory building, faced in the same rough-hewn brick as the church.

4

FORMER 75TH POLICE PRECINCT STATION HOUSE
484 Liberty Avenue
(Emile M. Gruwe, c. 1886-92)
– NR-P



To protect its rapidly growing population in the 1880s and 1890s, Brooklyn greatly expanded its police force and built precincts throughout its neighborhoods. This magnificently adorned but dilapidated structure served as the 75th Precinct until the 1970s. Affectionately known to the local community as "The Castle," it was designed in the Romanesque Revival style with Venetian and Norman Revival ornament, including brick molded cornices, arched openings, brownstone moldings and stone bandcourses with carved faces and Byzantine leafwork. It originally had a crenellated roofline, lending it a fortress-like quality, but that detail has been removed. In 1976, the People's First Baptist Church bought "The Castle" at auction from the City, but due to the declining health of the church's owner and faith leader, the building fell into disrepair. In 2016, the building again changed hands, but its future is uncertain. A near-identical twin of this building, designed by the same architect, stands at 4302 Fourth Avenue in Sunset Park, Brooklyn and was designated as an

individual landmark in 1983. That building is also in a state of disrepair but is currently being considered for use as a public school.



5

FORMER MAGISTRATE'S COURT
135 Pennsylvania Avenue
(Mortimer Dickerson Metcalf, 1929)

While many buildings on Pennsylvania Avenue have been altered or demolished, it was once considered East New York's grand boulevard, home to fine residences and institutional buildings, including this former courthouse. Designed in the neo-Classical style popular for government buildings at the time, the Magistrate's Court was the work of Mortimer

Dickerson Metcalf, who previously worked for the prestigious New York architectural firm of Warren & Wetmore (architects of Grand Central Terminal). It was one of many such courthouses in Brooklyn, where low-level criminal cases were heard until the city's court system was centralized in 1962 (the building's near-twin, an individual landmark also designed by Metcalf, is located at 4201 4th Avenue in Sunset Park). The location, previously home to St. Clement's Protestant Episcopal Church, was likely chosen for its proximity to the local police precinct (site 4). After 1962, the building housed the Arnold and Marie Schwartz Community Center, a day care program, the Police Athletic League and the offices of Brooklyn Community Board 5. In 2009, due to a lack of funding, the community center was forced to close, but new funds set aside in the 2015 East New York Neighborhood Plan should enable its reopening. Despite its change of use, the building's history as a courthouse remains legible through an inscription on the frieze that reads "MAGISTRATES COURT."

6

**CORNERSTONE SEVENTH-DAY
ADVENTIST CHURCH**
138 Pennsylvania Avenue
(Builder: Frank Richards, 1922)



This stately structure was built in 1922 as the Homestead Branch of the National City Bank of New York, an institution founded in 1812 and known since 1976 as Citibank. A

Brooklyn Eagle article from January 9, 1922, described it as “a handsome, but not extravagant, structure, with all the up-to-date appointments of a first-class bank.” The same article described some of its interior features: “There are windows on three sides, admitting real daylight into the tellers’ and bookkeepers’ cages. The finish of the cages is Tennessee marble and bronze. Metal desks that have the verisimilitude of mahogany harmonize with real mahogany trim and chairs.” In 1977, the property was sold to the Cornerstone Seventh-Day Adventist Church, which made only minimal changes to the front façade, including the addition of a sign and awning over the entrance and the removal of its original sign band above the grand columns, which read “The National City Bank of New York.” Its conversion to and continued function as a church is an excellent example of successful adaptive reuse.

7

PIELS BREWERY
124-128 Sheffield Avenue
(c. 1900)



Considering East New York’s thriving German immigrant population in the second half of the 19th century, it is no surprise that the neighborhood was once home to a significant brewing complex, the Piel's Brewery. In 1883, Gottfried, Wilhelm and Michael Piel – three brothers from Düsseldorf, Germany – purchased a small brewery at Georgia and Liberty Avenues and slowly expanded the complex. Its success was largely due to the ingenuity and skill of the youngest brother, Michael, who incorporated traditional brewing techniques with the new science of refrigeration. As expected with any large brewery at that time, the location included a traditional, open-air beer garden for its patrons. In 1912, due to the brand’s growing popularity, the brothers closed the garden in order to expand the brewery itself. After surviving Prohibition by producing “near beer,” the brand installed the world’s largest beer sign, featuring neon lights, atop the complex in 1936. The Piel's brewing legacy lasted for ninety years until September 1973, when it closed its doors. At that time, much of the complex was demolished, though this structure still stands as a reminder of the once thriving local business and East New York’s German heritage. Also surviving at 315 Liberty Avenue is the company’s 1959 Administration Building, whose original Modern style has unfortunately been altered beyond recognition.

8

PRINCE HALL MASONIC LODGE
68 Pennsylvania Avenue
(Harde & Short, 1906-07)



With much fanfare, a procession marched on July 29, 1906, from Liberty Avenue to 68 Pennsylvania Avenue, where the cornerstone was laid to begin construction of the Tyrian Masonic Lodge. The Tyrian Masons trace their history back to the ancient Biblical city of Tyre, but this particular lodge, number 618, was founded in 1867. The organization had previously been headquartered in a building on Atlantic Avenue and then in Happ’s Hall at Liberty and Wyona Avenues before constructing this larger building. Pennsylvania Avenue runs through East New York and the adjoining neighborhood of Cypress Hills, and was once a premier avenue, making it a desirable location for the new headquarters. The organization’s membership consisted of upper middle class men, but the building was also home to the Tyrian Ladies Auxiliary, a charitable group. In 1971, the property was acquired by the Prince Hall Masons, an African-American Masonic body, so named in honor of an African-American abolitionist recognized for his leadership in the free black community. Although a community center primarily operates here today, it has been reported that the free masons still utilize the space.

9

MRS. MAXWELL’S BAKERY
2700 Atlantic Avenue



A crucial stop on a tour of the neighborhood is Mrs. Maxwell’s Bakery, which has been serving the community since 1928. During World War II, the bakery, previously known as “Essential Cheesecake,” changed its name in a bid to secure a contract to provide baked goods to the troops stationed at Fort Hamilton. “Mrs. Maxwell” was conceived as a motherly, nurturing mascot by the bakery’s owners, who sought to tug on the heart-strings of the procurement decision makers. Their effort paid off, and Mrs. Maxwell’s Bakery was awarded the contract. The fictional Mrs. Maxwell has been an integral part of the business ever since, and the bakery continues to serve a loyal clientele. Try one of her pastries or take home one of her cakes. You will undoubtedly return!

10

NEW LOTS TOWN HALL
109-111 Bradford Street
(Architect unknown, 1873)



This structure stands as a rare remnant of the town of New Lots. In 1873, the newly established and growing town authorized a \$10,000 bond for the construction of a town hall. Opening in December of that year, this building included office space, rooms for public assembly and a fire department. Later, space was made for a police force and jail cells, as well. After New Lots became the 26th Ward of the City of Brooklyn in 1886, a town hall was no longer necessary and the building became the 71st police precinct until 1892, when a larger police station was built at 484 Liberty Avenue (site 4). In 1899, the building became the 26th Ward Homeopathic Hospital and Dispensary, later the Bradford Hospital, until it closed in 1934. Eventually, the building was converted into a multi-family residence. Today, while its large windows have unfortunately been shrunk, their lintels and sills remain as a memory of the original openings. The building also retains its cornice and 1930s entrance porch.

11

**EMPIRE STATE DAIRY COMPANY
(LATER BORDEN DAIRY CORPORATION) BUILDINGS**
2840 Atlantic Avenue
(Theobald Engelhardt and Otto Struck,
1906-07 and 1914-15)
— NYC IL



Constructed as a dairy distribution center for the Empire State Dairy Company, this complex was sold soon after completion to the Borden Dairy Corporation. The complex was built in two stages, with the earlier buildings at Atlantic and Schenck Avenues completed in 1907 and the later ones just east on Atlantic Avenue completed in 1915. Unlike most factories, where functionality takes precedence over design, the buildings exhibit fine architectural details, including two remarkable terra cotta murals facing Atlantic Avenue. One depicts a woman leading a cow and a calf to water and the other depicts a man leading a bull to water. The characters in these scenes are set within bucolic, lush landscapes of water, meadows, pines and mountains, harkening to the agrarian beginnings of the dairy industry. The murals were manufactured by the American Encaustic Tiling Company, and are considered the largest extant decorative tile installations by the company. In large part due to the rarity of these art works, members of the local community were instrumental in advocating for the designation of the complex as a New York City Individual Landmark, which was finalized in 2017.

12

VIENNA FLATS
2883 Atlantic Avenue
(William Danmar, 1885-90)



This Queen Anne style apartment building was commissioned one year before East New York was annexed as part of the City of Brooklyn. Upon its completion in 1890, it was the largest building in the area, designed to cater to small, working class families, with rental

apartments advertised in the *Brooklyn Eagle* for \$10.00 per month and up. Its Danish architect, William Danmar, was also an author, notable professor of architecture at Cooper Union and one of the founding members of the Architecture Department of the Brooklyn Institute of Arts and Sciences (precursor to the Brooklyn Museum). Although many of its architectural details have been lost over the years, the Vienna Flats retains its mansard roof with pedimented dormer windows and its distinctive curved corner bay, which runs the entire length of the building. The curved bay has a swooping entrance hood at the bottom and bears the building's name in large capital letters at the top.

I3

ST. MICHAEL'S ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH

225 Jerome Street
(Church: 1920-22, supporting buildings: 1897-1956)



St. Michael's Roman Catholic Church has served its community for over 150 years, during which time its campus grew to occupy almost the entire block between Atlantic and Liberty Avenues and Jerome and Warwick Streets. In 1860, a group of German immigrants received authorization from John Loughlin, the first Bishop of the Diocese of Brooklyn, for the construction of a Roman Catholic Church in New Lots. A wood frame structure was erected that same year, with Bishop Loughlin himself dedicating the site. Soon after, a school and rectory building was constructed next door. In 1897, a larger brick elementary school was constructed at the corner of Warwick Street and Liberty Avenue. The campus continued to expand with the enlargement of the rectory and the construction of more educational facilities on Warwick Street. By 1920, the growing parish was in need of a larger worship space, so a grand Romanesque Revival style church with an elegant bell tower was planned to take the old church's place. The new

church extended the width of the block to Warwick Street, where it also extended northward to accommodate a new monastery. In 1956, a high school was built at Jerome Street and Liberty Avenue. While the church originally served a German congregation, its demographics shifted over the years to serve Irish, Polish and Italians, and later African Americans, Puerto Ricans, Dominicans and Mexicans. Today, its congregation is predominately Spanish-speaking. In 2006, the church merged with St. Malachy Roman Catholic Church, a historically Irish parish in East New York, to form the new parish of St. Michael-St. Malachy.

I4

THOMAS JEFFERSON HIGH SCHOOL

400 Pennsylvania Avenue
(Probably Charles B. J. Snyder, New York City Board of Education, 1922-24)



In 1921, plans to build a high school in East New York were made public. Prior to that, students had to travel significant distances to schools outside of the neighborhood, so the announcement was extremely well received. In May 1922, Mayor John Francis Hylan, local leaders and six live bands led the parade and celebrations surrounding the school's groundbreaking ceremony. Dedicated to the third President of the United States, Thomas Jefferson High School opened with roughly 4,000 school seats in September 1924. Some of the school's notable attendees include Howard Zinn, Danny Kaye, Shelley Winters, Jimmy Smits and Al Lewis, who played Grandpa Munster in the 1960s TV show *The Munsters*.

I5

**PUBLIC SCHOOL 149
THE DANNY KAYE SCHOOL**

700 Sutter Avenue
(Charles B. J. Snyder, 1906)



Public School 149 was one of the roughly 400 schools constructed during the tenure of the notable architect/engineer C. B. J. Snyder, superintendent of school buildings for the Board of Education from 1891 to 1923, when the city's population was growing and new laws mandated children's education. Snyder was known for his innovative "H-plan" design, inspired by the medieval Hôtel de Cluny in Paris, which allowed for improved ventilation, advances in fireproofing, better lighting, larger classroom sizes and the incorporation of two courtyards for recreation. Public School 149 initially housed kindergarten through ninth grade classes, but in the 1920s was downsized to offer only sixth, seventh and eighth grade classes when the city adopted a Junior High School system in an effort to relieve overcrowding. At that time, it became known as either Junior High School 149 or East New York Junior High School. In 1967, the city opened another junior high school nearby, I.S. 292, and P.S. 149 became an elementary school. The school is named for famed actor, dancer and musician Danny Kaye (born David Daniel Kaminsky), one of the school's most illustrious alumni (he attended from 1919 to 1927), who also attended Thomas Jefferson High School (site 14).

I6

**FORMER BROOKLYN
POST OFFICE**
950 Glenmore Avenue
(c. 1920)



This charming building originally served as the New Lots Post Office, as evidenced by the faded letters just below the cornice that read “BROOKLYN POST OFFICE.” At the time the building was constructed in the 1920s, it cost just twenty cents to send a package via first class mail. Though most of the building’s window openings have been filled in, its symmetrical façade still features many original details, like arched windows, Corinthian style pilasters and a bracketed cornice. Due to the construction of a new post office on Sutter Avenue, the building was sold in the 1960s to Milford Tile, which continues to operate it as their Brooklyn-based showroom.



I7

**GLENMORE AVENUE
PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH**
994 Glenmore Avenue
(1899)

This lovely Shingle Style church at the corner of Glenmore Avenue and Doscher Street might seem more at home on a country lane in the Hudson Valley, but when it was constructed in 1899, East New York

was still a quiet suburban enclave. It was built for the Glenmore Avenue Presbyterian Church, which is still an active congregation. While the structure has suffered some insensitive alterations, including the loss of its original clapboard siding and the replacement of its front porch, it retains its general massing, including a graceful and oversized corner tower with an arched belfry and bell-shaped roof, as well as most of its original windows and dormer windows on both of its side façades.

I8

ENGINE COMPANY 236
998 Liberty Avenue
(1895)



“BFD,” the initials fancifully engraved just above the first story of this Romanesque Revival style fire station, say a lot more than one might think on first glance. Standing for “Brooklyn Fire Department,” the initials confirm that this building dates to sometime between 1869, when the Brooklyn Fire Department was organized, and 1898, when the boroughs were consolidated to form the Greater City of New York. The Brooklyn Fire Department only lasted a few decades before merging with the FDNY after the city’s consolidation. Interestingly, this building was constructed in 1895 to house Engine 36, so it only served the Brooklyn Fire Department for about three years. Shortly after the consolidation, the fire companies were renumbered to avoid confusion, and this company became Engine 136 until 1913, when it was reorganized again to become Engine 236. Referred to as “The Pride of East New York,” Engine 236 continues to serve the community today.





**Citywide Administrative
Services**

Lisette Camilo
Commissioner

The David N. Dinkins
Municipal Building
1 Centre Street
New York, NY 10007

212 386 6310 tel
nyc.gov/dcas

March 2, 2018

Hon. Adrienne Adams
Member, NYC Council
250 Broadway Suite 1877
New York, NY 10007

Dear Council Member Adams:

We are writing in response to your request for additional information on Application No. N180167. We appreciate the opportunity to further explain to you and members of the committee why the Campaign Finance Board (CFB) and the Department of Citywide Administrative Services (DCAS) selected this location and why it best meets the agency's programmatic needs.

1A. When the CFB moved to 100 Church Street, that space had 16 meeting rooms. Since that time, the CFB has eliminated and consolidated rooms so that only eight remain. Those eight are in constant demand with the staff. The meeting rooms in the 255 Greenwich Street space will serve a variety of CFB needs. CFB determined the total number of meeting rooms from DCAS specifications of how many meeting spaces are allowable for the number of staff. CFB took the total number allowed and made specific requests based on its particular needs. The staff, the vast majority of whom are seated in an open plan format, work collaboratively on numerous projects. As such, regular access to meeting rooms is essential to the CFB's work. While arguably the staff is busiest during the year of a city-wide election, the work for preparing for each election, training and supervising staff, developing computer systems, auditing the previous election, and voter assistance and engagement work are consistent year to year.

1B. While the plan allocates meeting space by unit, any meeting space will be used by any staff as the need arises to perform the work of the CFB.

1C. In recent years, the CFB has increased the number and types of trainings, including adding online trainings. In the 2017 post-election survey, respondents indicated a continued preference for onsite, in-person trainings where they can ask questions and receive immediate feedback. The CFB's goal is to continue to provide trainings that best meet the needs of the candidates whether that is online or in-person.

1D. During the current lease-term at 100 Church Street, DCAS has not expended any funds to rent additional space for CFB training or video production. CFB has not asked DCAS to identify space that could be used for limited, seasonal election-year purposes. The CFB conducts all trainings in its current office space, with limited exceptions. The CFB paid an outside production company \$381,714 to produce the 2017 video voter guide. The money paid to the production company covered the cost for the facilities used to produce the video.

CFB did request that DCAS identify permanent space that could meet the agency's programmatic needs. Prior to initiating any site search, DCAS reviews if there are any available City-owned options that could satisfy the requirement; in the case of the CFB requirement there was no City-owned space that met the need. DCAS initiated a site search and identified eight other sites within the catchment area. CFB approved 255 Greenwich Street because it satisfied its programmatic requirements.

2. The base rent at the current CFB space at 100 Church Street is \$33/SF. The base rent at the proposed location of 255 Greenwich Street will be \$57/SF. The base rent when the CFB vacated 40 Rector Street in March of 2014 was \$23/SF. The CFB's former landlord at 40 Rector would not renew the leases for 215,000 SF associated with the seven City agencies that occupied the building and all the agencies were forced to vacate the building. DCAS successfully identified appropriate space for all seven.

3. The existing CFB space at 100 Church Street is serviced by a central HVAC. Accordingly, per the lease, when off-hour HVAC is required the central cooling tower needs to be activated. In 2017, the CFB was billed for approximately 160 hours of off-hour HVAC for a total cost of approximately \$230,000 (note that the CFB budgeted \$450,000 in FY18 to cover their anticipated off-hour expenses, but has not received invoices for some of their usage). The landlord at 255 Greenwich Street will provide HVAC as part of the lease during the normal business hours of 8AM and 6PM. Additionally, the new location at 255 Greenwich Street will have ceiling-mounted package units dedicated and zoned to the areas that the CFB uses most frequently during off-hours. The maximum cost of running the dedicated package units will be \$20,000. If the CFB needs to provide central HVAC in their entire space, the cost will be \$209 per hour with a four-hour minimum usage. Note: The combination of the dedicated package units and lower cost of the central HVAC option creates multiple cost-effective options for HVAC delivery. Accordingly, the combination of the reduced hourly minimum, the reduced hourly cost, the delivery options, and the installation of dedicated package units will result in a significant reduction in off-hour HVAC costs.

4. Other than rare air-cooled HVAC systems, DCAS nor its tenant reps are aware of an office lease that provides off-hour HVAC at no cost to the tenant.

5. CFB currently occupies approximately 20,000 SF at 100 Church Street. The current space at 100 Church reflected the appropriate amount of space allocation at the time and given the relocation timeframe from 40 Rector.

6. DCAS utilizes an involved process to determine how much space is required for an agency to fulfill its need. The space requirement for CFB's headcount and operational requirement has

been determined to be approximately 33,000 carpetable square feet. Adding in common spaces, circulation, and a loss factor brings the rentable square foot number to approximately 45,000. Additionally, the landlord at 255 Greenwich was unwilling to divide the floor so we were required to lease the entire 50,000 SF floor. Please note that DCAS is exploring other outstanding space needs that could be met by the additional 5,000 SF of space at 255 Greenwich Street, including making space available to other City agencies that are currently in the building.

7. Locating the CFB offices in lower Manhattan is important for candidates in the campaign finance system. Proximity to the offices of Board of Elections and other city agencies like the Conflicts of Interest Board allows candidates to easily access other city services and resources related to their election. A location close to City Hall and the offices of the City Council will further enhance the efficiency and effectiveness of the work. The many public transit options available in Lower Manhattan also increase convenience for candidates who visit the CFB offices. The CFB's work with voter engagement also requires close proximity to the BOE and to other city agencies who are charged with voter engagement through Local 29 of 2000 and Local Law 63 of 2014.

8. The CFB anticipates that added staff will be necessary to meet the directives outlined in the "Democracy NYC" plan. Further analysis is required before we can share a detailed estimate of increased staffing needs, but as the plan proposes an expansion of the CFB's work, significant growth may be required to fully implement the initiative. Growth for new initiatives of this kind was built into the application for new space with DCAS.

Sincerely,



Lisette Camilo
Commissioner



Amy Loprest
Executive Director
NYC Campaign Finance Board

DISTRICT OFFICE
ROCHDALE VILLAGE MALL
165-46 BAISLEY BOULEVARD
ROCHDALE VILLAGE, NY 11434
TEL: (718) 723-0680



CITY HALL OFFICE
250 BROADWAY, SUITE 1877
NEW YORK, NY 10007
TEL: (212) 788-6850
FAX: (212) 442-2729

THE COUNCIL OF
THE CITY OF NEW YORK

ADRIENNE ADAMS

COUNCIL MEMBER, 28TH DISTRICT, QUEENS

February 27, 2018

Commissioner Lisette Camilo
NYC Department of Citywide Administrative Services
One Centre Street, 17th Floor South
New York, NY 10007

Amy M. Loprest, Executive Director
New York City Campaign Finance Board
100 Church Street, 12th Floor
New York, New York 10007

**Re: Application No. N 180167 PXM by the Department of Citywide
Administrative Services for the for the acquisition of office space
at 255 Greenwich Street (Block 127, Lot 18) in Manhattan for the
Campaign Finance Board**

Dear Commissioner Camilo and Ms. Loprest:

At yesterday's public hearing on the above referenced application before the Subcommittee on Landmarks, Public Siting and Maritime Uses, a number of important questions went unanswered. Significantly, the applicant, the Department of Citywide Administrative Services (DCAS), did not send anyone to provide testimony about the application. To facilitate the Subcommittee's deliberations, I write now to request that (DCAS) and the Campaign Finance Board (CFB) provide written answers to the following questions by the end of this week. In particular:

1. Why does CFB, with a staff of 107, need 11-13 meeting rooms?
 - a. What are CFB's specific needs for conference room space, reception areas, and other accessory spaces? Describe the variations in space usage during a four-year election cycle.
 - b. What is the usage plan for meeting spaces in the existing and proposed CFB offices? How do such plans ensure that divisions within the CFB share conference room space to the maximum extent possible?

- c. Has the CFB explored reducing the need for onsite meeting spaces by conducting online trainings and what plans, if any, does it have to provide such trainings in the future? If it does not have such plans, why not?
 - d. During the current lease term at 100 Church Street, how much has DCAS spent renting additional spaces for CFB to conduct trainings and produce candidate videos? What efforts has DCAS made to identify space it currently owns or leases that CFB could use in election years for these limited purposes?
2. What is the cost per square foot of the current CFB office space and what is the cost per square foot of the office space that is the subject of the application? Please provide the monthly or annual rent, for the prior and proposed CFB office spaces at 40 Rector Street locations, 100 Church Street, and 255 Greenwich Street.
3. What have been the exact supplemental heating and cooling costs under the current lease and how would those be reduced under the proposed lease?
4. Why did DCAS enter the current office lease subject to supplemental heating and cooling charges, knowing that the CFB does a significant amount of its work at night and on weekends?
5. Why did DCAS decide to house CFB in its current space, a space that CFB testified was too small from the outset?
6. Why has DCAS proposed a lease for a new 50,000 square foot location when CFB's stated need is 32,000 square feet? Why can't DCAS continue looking, rather than taking 18,000 square feet of unneeded space?
7. Why was the search for office space limited to downtown Manhattan?
8. Does the administration estimate that the CFB will have to add staff as part of the "Democracy NYC" initiative?

I look forward to your responses.

Sincerely,



Council Member Adrienne Adams
Chair of the Subcommittee on Landmarks,
Public Sitings and Maritime Uses

cc: Council Member Rafael Salamanca, Chair of the Committee on Land Use
Raju Mann, Director of the Land Use Division
Amy Levitan, Deputy Director of the Land Use Division
Julie Lubin, Land Use General Counsel
Jeff Campagna, Land Use Counsel
Chris Fleming, DCAS
Jeff Lynch, Mayor's Office
Andrew Heimowitz, Mayor's Office
Ahmed Tigani, Mayor's Office

THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. Empire Dairy Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Simeon Sawisa

Address: _____

I represent: HDC

Address: 232 E 11 St NY 10003

THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK

Empire Dairy

Appearance Card

0027

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Andree Goldwyn

Address: _____

I represent: NY Landmarks (use -anc)

Address: 1 Whitehall St NYC 10004

THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. 0027 Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: 02/26/18

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: ZULMILENA THEN

Address: 45 CLEMONT AVE #6M

I represent: PRESERVING EAST New York (PENY)

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. 1470 Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Amy Loprest

Address: _____

I represent: Campaign Finance Board

Address: 100 Church Street, NY, NY

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Andree Golden

Address: _____

I represent: NY Landmarks Conservancy

Address: 1 Whitehall St NYC 10004

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: LISA KERSAVAGE

Address: _____

I represent: Landmarks Preservation Commission

Address: _____

THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Ali Basoulinejad

Address: _____

I represent: LPC

Address: _____

THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. IRT Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: SIMON BANISH

Address: _____

I represent: HPC

Address: 252 E 11 St NY 1003

THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. IRT #26 Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 2/26/2018

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: SEAN KHORSAUDI

Address: _____

I represent: LANDMARK WEST!

Address: 45 W 67th St

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms