

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

February 14, 2018
Start: 2:00 p.m.
Recess: 2:50 p.m.

B E F O R E: LETITIA JAMES
 Public Advocate

 COREY D. JOHNSON
 Speaker for the Council

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Adrienne Adams
 Alan N. Maisel
 Alicka Ampry-Samuel
 Andrew Cohen
 Andy King
 Antonio Reynoso
 Barry S. Grodenchik
 Ben Kallos
 Bill Perkins
 Brad S. Lander
 Carlina Rivera
 Carlos Menchaca
 Chaim M. Deutsch
 Costa G. Constantinides
 Daniel Dromm
 Deborah L. Rose
 Diana Ayala
 Donovan J. Richards
 Eric A. Ulrich

Fernando Cabrera
Francisco P. Moya
Helen K. Rosenthal
I. Daneek Miller
Inez D. Barron
James G. Van Bramer
Joseph C. Borelli
Jumaane D. Williams
Justin L. Brannan
Kalman Yeger
Karen Koslowitz
Keith Powers
Laurie A. Cumbo
Margaret S. Chin
Mark Gjonaj
Mark Levine
Mark Treyger
Mathieu Eugene
Paul A. Vallone
Peter A. Koo
Rafael Espinal, Jr.
Rafael Salamanca. Jr.
Ritchie Torres
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Robert F. Holden
Roy I. Lancman
Ruben Diaz, Jr.
Stephen T. Levin
Steven Matteo
Vanessa Gibson
Ydanis A. Rodriguez

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Invocation Delivered by:

Rev. Hung Tse, Chinese Christian Herald
Crusades, 156-03 Horace Harding
Expressway, Flushing, NY 11367

2 [sound check, pause]

3 SPEAKER JOHNSON: We're going to start
4 with ceremonials.

5 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down, please.
6 Be quiet.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: If members want to come
8 up. I invite Commissioner Silver up. Good to see
9 you Commissioner. Good to see you. Good to see you
10 as always. So, our first ceremonial today Council
11 Member Chin is going to present, but before I hand it
12 over to her, I want to just mention that we are so
13 fortunate to be joined by some of our fantastic parks
14 officers, our PEP officers who are here, who are
15 Halloween of last year responded to a terrorist
16 attack, which started in my district at Houston
17 Street, and the West Side Highway, and took the lives
18 of eight individuals and ended in Council Member
19 Chin's district, and so we want to recognize their
20 service to the city of New York, and I want to turn
21 it over to Council Member Margaret Chin.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Speaker.
23 I also wanted to thank Council Member Salamanca for
24 helping to put this together, and also Council Member
25 Grodenchik who's the Chair of our Parks committee.

2 It's a great honor for us to recognize the Park
3 Enforcement Patrol Officers who often don't get
4 recognized for the hard work that they do protecting
5 our parks, our senior, our children. So, it's really
6 a great opportunity for us recognize their whole—you
7 know, their effort at that terrorist attack that
8 happened last Halloween. And, as the Council Member
9 representing the area where the last Halloween's
10 horrible terrorist attack occurred, I'm happy to help
11 honor members of the Park Enforcement Patrol for
12 their bravery and courage, and to thank them
13 especially Captain Luz Carrion and her team who were
14 right there when the incident happened. And, instead
15 of running away, these officers put themselves in
16 harm's way to protect others. They were there
17 helping the victim, and—and it's really something
18 that we really need to appreciate, and we all—all of
19 them with that gratitude to these brave men and women
20 who help ensure the safety of hundreds of local
21 school students—local school students, parents and
22 passers-by. Once again, New Yorkers show the world
23 that our city is truly about neighbors helping
24 neighbors in a time of need and from the bottom of my

2 heart, I thank you for your service. And I'm going
3 to ask the clerk to read the Proclamation.

4 CLERK: Council City of New York
5 Proclamation. The New York City Council is proud to
6 honor Hudson River Parks Park Enforcement Patrol
7 Officers for their courageous response to the October
8 31, 2017 terrorist attack; and

9 Whereas, New York City—New York City's
10 parks cover more than 30,000 acres of land, 14% of
11 New York City and Parks Enforcement Patrol or PEP
12 Officers help ensure they remain a safe environment
13 for all to enjoy whether they are members of the Park
14 Security Services, Mounted Parks Enforcement Patrol,
15 Mounted Auxiliary Harbor Unit, the Honor Guard or
16 Search and Rescue, PEP Officers have distinct all-
17 green uniforms and unique special patrolman shields
18 allowing them to issue summonses and make arrests
19 when needed as they patrol all five boroughs. On
20 this occasion, it is a privilege to recognize a
21 special group of PEP Officers for their incredible
22 service in the midst of a very dangerous attack; and

23 Whereas, on Tuesday, October 31, 2017,
24 New Yorkers and tourists of every age and background
25 were going about their lives. In Lower Manhattan not

2 far from the Freedom Tower, many were leaving school
3 or work, shopping or enjoying the park and bike lanes
4 along the Hudson. It was a day that had begun full
5 of promise just like any other day in New York City.
6 That afternoon, however, the day was shattered when a
7 truck drove onto the Hudson River Park bike-bicycle
8 path at high speed and plowed into bicycles and
9 pedestrians indiscriminately. In the end, the act of
10 terror resulted in eight deaths and many injuries;
11 and

12 Whereas, New York City's--New York City
13 Parks Enforcement Patrol Officers immediately radioed
14 Central Communications while officers ran to give aid
15 to those who had been struck by the vehicle. Park
16 Enforcement Officers remained with the initial
17 victims while others followed the path of the truck
18 to assist additional victims in its path. PEP
19 Officers continued to function in support ensuring
20 that emergency personnel could do their jobs aiding
21 the injured and stopping the perpetrator; and

22 Whereas, at a time where our city was
23 struck by a terrorist attack, Parks Enforcement
24 Patrol Officers did not panic or shy away from the
25 chaos and disorder, but remained calm, focused and

2 committed to providing any assistance they could.

3 While we reflect on those who were killed or injured
4 during this attack, as well as their friends and
5 loved ones, we also reaffirm the resilience that
6 defines us as city. We commend these officers for
7 their unwavering commitment to the safety of our
8 city. They have truly excelled in their service and
9 are worthy of the enduring gratitude of all New
10 Yorkers.

11 Now, therefore, be it known that the New
12 York City Council gratefully honors the officers of
13 Hudson River Parks Park Enforcement Patrol for their
14 extraordinary service to our city and nation on
15 October 31, 2017. Corey Johnson, Speaker for the
16 Entire Council: Margaret S. Chin, Council Member,
17 First District, Manhattan, Rafael Salamanca, Jr.,
18 Council Member Seventeenth District the Bronx, Mark
19 D. Levine, Council Member, Seventh District,
20 Manhattan, Barry S. Grodenchik, Council Member
21 Twenty-Third District, Queens.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, thank
23 you. [applause]

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you very much.
25 [coughs] I also want to thank Council Member

2 Salamanca for bringing this to our attention, and—and
3 saying that these wonderful officers should be
4 recognized here at a Stated Meeting of the Council.
5 I want to thank the former Parks Chair Mark Levine
6 who was Parks Chair when this horrible incident
7 happened. I want to thank our new chair of the Parks
8 Committee, Barry Grodenchik, and quickly, I want to
9 allow our great Parks Commissioner Mitchell Silver to
10 make a few remarks as well.

11 COMMISSIONER SILVER: Well, first, on
12 behalf of the Parks Department and Parks Enforcement
13 Patrol, Mr. Speaker and Council Members Chin and
14 Salamanca, I want to thank you. As was stated, our
15 PEP officers often go unnoticed. We have great
16 heroes and sheroes in our city from NYPC and the
17 finest and the boldest and the strongest, but we
18 don't often know how often our peace officers and
19 that's what the Parks Enforcement Patrol, they're
20 peace officers. They do not have weapons. They
21 enforce quality of life rules, but often put
22 themselves in harm ways—harm's way. You may not know
23 it, but they prevented kidnappings, sexual assaults,
24 suicides as they are patrolling the park each and
25 every day. On this particular day, no one could

2 imagine what a horrific event it was, and they turned
3 out to be the first responders, the ones that went to
4 the scene, and saw things that we all could say was
5 unimaginable. They not only went there first and
6 contact the other first responders, but they stayed,
7 and I'm very proud of the fact that they had the
8 resilience and compassion to help those who were both
9 injured and, of course, some that are no longer with
10 us. More importantly, I have to give a special
11 recognition to Captain Luz Carrion. She understood
12 how traumatic this event was for the officers, and
13 encouraged them through conversations and counseling
14 to ensure that they would still remain strong, and
15 underscore the important work they do for the city.
16 I thank you because again the PEP are not often
17 recognized. They're heroes and sheroes that patrol
18 all of our parks. They do an outstanding job, and we
19 recognized about a month ago, and I am so honored and
20 pleased, and I know they feel the same way that they
21 can be in this really outstanding chamber to be
22 recognized by the outstanding City Council of the
23 City of New York. Thank you very much for this
24 honor. [audience protests]

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: So, thank you,
3 Commissioner. So, I'm going to allow Captain Carrion
4 to say a few words if she would like, but before we
5 do that, I think we should take a moment of silence
6 for the eight folks that we lost on that horrible
7 day. [moment of silence] Thank you. I'm going to
8 give it to Captain Carrion.

9 CAPTAIN CARRION: I just want to say
10 thank for recognizing what we do not just for that
11 one day, but in general overall. I couldn't—I
12 couldn't ask for a better team to be with. You know,
13 they kept their professionalism. We, you know,
14 everybody rose to the occasion. That's all I can
15 expect. [applause]

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: And then, lastly, I
17 want to read the names of some of the folks that were
18 there that day who are with us here today who are
19 part of Captain Carrion's team. So, of course, we
20 have Captain Luz Carrion, and I apologize if I
21 mispronounce your name. You can correct me if I do
22 that. We have Michelle Mason. We have Arshad
23 Mohammed. We have Kyle Schnabel, Matthew Brooks,
24 Christine Soto, Ashley Gopie, Malcolm Smiley,
25 Antonique Bedward, Neferteria Walter, Cynthia Jones,

2 and Darlene Francis. One big final round of applause
3 [cheers/applause] for our amazing PEP Officers.
4 Thank you very much, Captain. Thank you so much.
5 Thank you very much for your service. Thank you.
6 Thank you, sir. Thank you very much. Thank you very
7 much. Thank you, thank you. Thank you all.

8 Okay, we have another ceremonial, and
9 this one is going to be presented by Council Member
10 Levine I believe. Yes? [pause] So, if-if Council
11 members could stay up here, we're going to have a
12 ceremonial led by our colleague Council Member Mark
13 Levine in observance of National Mentoring Month.
14 The New York City Council is proud to honor Big
15 Brothers and Bit Sisters of New York City, and I want
16 to turn it over to Council Member Levine.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Alright, come on
18 up. [background comments, pause] Alright, I am
19 pleased that in honor of National Mentoring Month we
20 are recognizing the incredible work of Big
21 Brother/Big Sister. Let's give them a big round of
22 applause. [cheers/applause] As a former big brother
23 myself, I've experienced the incredible work of this
24 organization up close for over 100 years, 110 years.
25 How old are you guys? 114. I was selling you short.

2 They have been touching young lives here in New York
3 City now I believe over 5,000 young people a year and
4 research has shown and people who have been part of
5 mentoring relationships know this instinctively to
6 have a strong positive adult in the life of a young
7 person can change everything, and when you add it to
8 the services that Big Brother/Big Sis provides with
9 social workers and academic enrichment, it really can
10 be a game changer in the lives of kids and our city
11 is so, so lucky that we have them here as a resource.
12 Do I cue the clerk now to read the reso, and then
13 we'll hear from our wonderful CEO Hector Figueroa.
14 SO, Mr. Clerk, if you can please do the honor.

15 CLERK: Thank you. Council City of New
16 York Proclamation. In observance of National
17 Mentoring Month, the New York City Council is proud
18 to honor Big Brothers and Big Sisters of New York
19 City for its extraordinary dedication for shaping the
20 lives of countless young people across the five
21 boroughs; and

22 Whereas, National Mentoring Month is a
23 time to celebrate those mentors who positively shape
24 and influence the lives of children across the city.
25 Whether they are family members or members of the

2 community at large, they answer the call to service
3 by mentoring a child in need and ultimately have a
4 profound impact on the child's life; and

5 Whereas, through--through volunteering
6 their time, support, love, energy and guidance, they
7 serve as mentors and positive role models instilling
8 valuable life skills and empowering young people to
9 pursue their highest aspirations and realize their
10 full potential. They are big brothers and big
11 sisters from across New York City; and

12 Whereas, Big Brothers and Big Sisters of
13 New York city is the founding agency of the nation's
14 youth mentoring movement. Since 1904, their mission
15 has been to give children who face adversity an
16 opportunity to experience strong, enduring,
17 professionally supported one-to-one mentoring
18 relationships with adults that help change their
19 lives for the better. They partner with families,
20 volunteers, organizations in the community to inspire
21 positive change in all; and

22 Whereas, every year the organization
23 connects more than 5,000 children with a Big who
24 could help them believe that their present situation
25 doesn't have to be their future; and

2 Whereas, Big Brothers and Big Sisters
3 have transformed lives of struggle into lives of
4 opportunity where success is attainable. By
5 establishing a strong connection between children and
6 responsible adults, they have changed the course of
7 communities across our city for generations to come.
8 They have earned our gratitude and recognition not
9 only this month, but throughout the year.

10 Now, therefore, be it known that the
11 Council of the City of New York proudly honors Big
12 Brothers and Big Sisters of New York City for their
13 extraordinary service and enduring contributions to
14 New York City and the nation. Corey Johnson, Speaker
15 for the Entire Council and Mark D. Levine, Council
16 Member, Seventh District, Manhattan. [applause]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: I-I also want to
18 acknowledge the Chair of our Youth Services Committee
19 and an incredible advocate for mentoring, the great
20 Debi Rose and our [applause] immediate past chair and
21 long-time champion of Youth Services Dr. Mathieu
22 Eugene. [applause] And, I would like to pass the mic
23 to the incredible leadership of Big Bro Big Sis in
24 New York City, the great Hector Batista. [applause]

2 HECTOR BATISTA: Well, thank you Council
3 Member Levine. I want to thank you for—for hosting
4 us today. I want to first—I also want to thank the
5 Speaker, and I want to thank the City Council for all
6 your support. Because of your support over the last
7 couple of years, Big Brothers and Big Sisters of New
8 York City have been able to double the amount of kids
9 that we service, 54%. We're servicing more kids now
10 because of your support. I'm also very excited to
11 tell you that we just recently launched a new
12 strategic plan, and our plan has some really new
13 programs that we're trying to launch. One that I
14 just sent you an invitation for that. I hope you—you
15 will come. We're launching our first LGBTQ program
16 where we're going to really work with young people in
17 this community. It took me a couple of years to put
18 that program together because in our organization
19 even though we're a mentoring organization, we want
20 to do it responsibly. So, we talked to a lot of
21 people in the field to assure that we were doing this
22 the right way, and we really believe that this
23 population, we service kids who really use our help.
24 As you know, they've been in homelessness, bullying,
25 and they've been in prison, and this—these youth

2 really deserve a program like ours. We're positive
3 role models in their life. We're also going to be
4 launching a-a program that's going to focus on the
5 Muslim community because we service kids, right, and
6 we don't care from what-what are the issues we really
7 try to do programs to help that population. As you
8 know, those youth are really having a lot of
9 challenges here in New York and throughout the
10 country. We couldn't do any of the work that we do
11 without the support of the-of the City Council. It's
12 a partnership. Council Member Rodriguez and a lot of
13 the other Council Members, Rose who have been really
14 champions of our organization, and Council Member
15 Eugene when he was heading up the-the Committee. We
16 really want to thank you for all your support and for
17 the recognition. I'm very lucky to lead an amazing
18 team of people. I get credit for all the great work,
19 and they really are very talented, and every single
20 day they're ally helping young people find their
21 work, and I'm going to give you a little promotion.
22 99% of our kids are getting promoted to the next
23 grade, 97% of them are graduating from high school,
24 and 94% of them get accepted into college. So, those

2 are really remarkable stats. [cheers/applause]

3 Thank you. Thank you for the recognition.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Alright. That's
5 it. Okay.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: One more big round of
7 applause for the staff of Big Brothers and Big
8 Sisters for all the work that they do. Thank you all
9 very much. Congratulations. Thank you. Good to see
10 you, Hector. Good to see you. [background comments,
11 pause] Okay, we're going to get started. If folks
12 could take their seat. [background comments]

13 CLERK: Keep it down, please. Quiet on
14 the floor, please, quiet on the floor please. At
15 this time please place all electronic devices, all
16 electronic devices to vibrate. Will all non-Council
17 employees, non-Council employees please leave the
18 main floor of the Chambers. Thank you.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [gavel] All
20 members please take their seats. [background
21 comments]. Quiet please.

22 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [off mic] Please find
23 a seat. All non-council (sic) please take a seat
24 upstairs.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All rise for the
3 Pledge of Allegiance.

4 CLERK: All rise. [pause]

5 CLERK: Adams.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Present.

7 CLERK: Ampry-Samuel

8 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Present.

9 CLERK: Ayala.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Present.

11 CLERK: Barron.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.

13 CLERK: Borelli.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Here.

15 CLERK: Brannan.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: I'm-I am here.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

18 [shushing for quiet]

19 CLERK: Thank you. Cabrera.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

21 CLERK: Chin.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

23 CLERK: Cohen.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Cohen.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

2 CLERK: Thank you. Constantinides.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Present.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

5 [shushing for quiet] Quiet in the Chambers.

6 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet please. Please
7 keep it down.

8 CLERK: Cornegy. Deutsch.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.

10 CLERK: Dia.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Here.

12 CLERK: Dromm.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Present.

14 CLERK: Espinal. Eugene.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Present.

16 CLERK: Gibson.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I'm here.

18 CLERK: Gjonaj. Grodenchik.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.

20 CLERK: Holden.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.

22 CLERK: Kallos. King. Koo.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

24 CLERK: Koslowitz.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

2 CLERK: Lancman. Lander.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.

4 CLERK: Levin. Levine.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

6 CLERK: Maisel.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Present.

8 CLERK: Menchaca.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.

10 CLERK: Miller.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.

12 CLERK: Moya.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Present.

14 CLERK: Perkins.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Present.

16 CLERK: Powers.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Here.

18 CLERK: Reynoso. Richards.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

20 CLERK: Rivera.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Here.

22 CLERK: Rodriguez.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Here.

24 CLERK: Rose.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

2 CLERK: Rosenthal.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

4 CLERK: Salamanca.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.

6 CLERK: Levin.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

8 CLERK: Torres.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Present.

10 CLERK: Cornegy.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Present.

12 CLERK: Treyger.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

14 CLERK: Ulrich.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Here.

16 CLERK: Vallone. Van Bramer.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: here.

18 CLERK: Williams.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.

20 CLERK: Yeger.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here.

22 CLERK: Matteo.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.

24 CLERK: Cumbo.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Here.

2 CLERK: Speaker Johnson.

3 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Here.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
5 Gjonaj.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Here.

7 CLERK: Thank you.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All quiet in the
9 Chambers, please. All rise for the invocation.

10 CLERK: All rise. All rise.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: The invocation
12 will be delivered by Reverend Hung Tse, from the
13 Chinese Christian Herald Crusades, at 156-03 Horace
14 Harding Expressway in the great borough of Queens.

15 REVEREND HUNG TSE: Would you bow your
16 head and pray with me. Almighty God, dear Heavenly
17 Father, thank you and praise you for this wonderful
18 opportunity and privilege to be here at this great
19 assembly. We ask your blessings on the people who
20 have been called to lead the community in which we
21 live and work. I pray for all the elected officials
22 and trust that with the holy calling of public
23 services and particularly members in this Council.
24 Bring them wisdom, courage and compassion to know and
25 do what is right and good and true to the people in

2 this great city, the city of New York. Pray that you
3 will strengthen them with endurance, give them
4 capacity to make wise decisions for the future of the
5 city of New York. I also pray for the agenda set
6 before them today. Please give them assurance of
7 what would please you and what would benefit those
8 who live and work in and around our beloved city of
9 New York. Thank you that every decision that is made
10 today will be government and guided by your mighty
11 hand, and fill us with joy and peace as we continue
12 to serve in these noble positions. I pray all these
13 things in the glorious name of our Lord Jesus Christ.
14 Amen.

15 ALBERT JOHNSON: Amen. Please be seated.
16 A motion to spread the invocation, Council Member
17 Koo. [background comments] Council Member Koo, do
18 you want to--

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Sorry. Yeah. Thank
20 you, Madam Public Advocate. Thank you, Reverend Hung
21 Tse is the Associate Executive Director of the
22 Chinese--

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
24 [shushing for quiet]

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down, please.
3 Keep it down.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: --of the Christian
5 Herald Crusades, CCHC headquartered in Queens and
6 established in 1982. CCHC is a faith-based Christian
7 organization that embraces the mission to reach out
8 to the community through the Community Service and
9 evangelistic--

10 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down please.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
12 Excuse me Council Member.

13 CHAIRPERSON CHIN: --that are holistic

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Excuse me. May
15 we have quiet in the Chambers, please and have
16 respect for Council Member Koo. He has the floor.

17 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down, please.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We apologize,
19 Council Member.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah, let me repeat
21 the last sentence I said, huh. CCHC is a faith-based
22 Christian organization that embraces the mission to
23 reach out to the community through community service
24 and evangelistic efforts. Reverend Tse emigrated to
25 the United States in 1994. He previously was a

2 university employee working as program developer for
3 the Hong Kong Baptist University. He then received
4 is masters at the Ohio State University majoring in
5 political science and public administration. He also
6 received a masters in divinity at Alliance
7 Theological Seminary in Nyack, New York. He joined
8 CCHC in 1995 where he serves s the Superintendent of
9 the CCHC Mission Center and has been ministering at
10 CCHC for more than 20 years where he has assisted
11 numerous new Chinese immigrants settle into their new
12 community. Its my honor to make a motion to spread
13 the invocation in full upon the record. Thank you.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: So moved.

15 Adoption of minutes, Council Member Lancman, the
16 motion that the minutes of the charter meeting of
17 January 3rd be adopted as printed. Messages and
18 Papers from the Mayor.

19 CLERK: M13 City debt and reserves.

20 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
21 down please.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Received, ordered,
23 printed and filed.

24 CLERK: M14 and M15 Conflict of Interest
25 Board appointments.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

27

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Rules, Privileges and
3 Elections.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication
5 from City, County and Borough Offices.

6 CLERK: None.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and
8 communications.

9 CLERK: None.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call-
11 Ups.

12 CLERK: None.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: May we have quiet
14 in the Chambers please as we now hear from the
15 Speaker, Speaker Corey Johnson.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: You got me while I was
17 eating a Hershey Kiss. Good afternoon. Happy
18 Valentine's Day to all. I would like to take a
19 moment to acknowledge the passing of Ronald Svec we
20 lost over the weekend due to a 9/11 related cancer.
21 Ronald was a long-time firefighter when he spent
22 weeks Ground Zero following the attack on our nation
23 and our city. We thank Ronald for his service to the
24 FDNY, and our thoughts and prayers are with his

25

2 family during this difficult time. If folks could
3 please rise as we take a moment of silence—

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing] All
5 right.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: --to honor the
7 firefighters Ronald Svec. [moment of silence] Thank
8 you. It's sad how many of these we see, folks
9 passing away from 9/11 related illnesses. So, I want
10 to jump into our docket for the day. We're only
11 voting on a few Land Use items. First, we'll be
12 voting on the 425 Grand Concourse Rezoning located in
13 Council Member Rafael Salamanca's district, the Chair
14 of our Land Use Committee. This would redevelop the
15 former PS-31 school into a 27-story mixed-use
16 building with 277 affordable residential units, some
17 retail space and some community facility space.
18 We'll also be voting on the East 88th Street Special
19 permits located in Council Member Ben Kallos'
20 district. He is on paternity leave. This would
21 modify the use and bulk regulations to allow a
22 tutoring and test prep center in the Rhinelander
23 Building located at 350 East 88th Street while
24 restoring a 121-year-old landmark parsonage Holy
25 Trinity Church. That completes the highlights of our

2 docket. I look forward to proceeding with today's
3 votes. I want to wish you all a good President's Day
4 and holiday weekend, but I will have that opportunity
5 to wish you the same thing tomorrow at our next
6 Stated Meeting, [laughter] and then it's out of the
7 way for February. I want to turn it back to the
8 Public Advocate and to the Clerk.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

10 Discussion of General Orders. Seeing none, Report of
11 Special Committees.

12 CLERK: None.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Report of
14 Standing Committees.

15 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Land
16 Use, LU 6 and Reso 183, East 88th Street.

17 [background comments]

18 SPEAKER JOHNSON: If Cornegy and Chaim
19 will quit it. Coupled on General Orders

20 CLERK: LU 7 Landmark designation.

21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Laid over.

22 CLERK: LUs 8 through LU 810, 425 Grand
23 Concourse.

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with
25 modifications and referred to the City Planning

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 30

2 Commission pursuant to Rule 11.7(b) of the Rules of
3 the Council and Section 197(d) of the New York City
4 Charter.

5 CLERK: LU 14 and Reso 184, Tax Ex-Tax
6 Exemption.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
8 Orders.

9 CLERK: Preconsidered LU 25 Hopkinson
10 Park Place.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Laid over.

12 CLERK: On the General Order Calendar LU
13 8 and Reso 185 through LU 10 and Reso 187, 425 Grand
14 Concourse.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
16 Orders.

17 CLERK: Resolution appointing various
18 persons commissioners of deeds.

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
20 Orders, and at this time I would ask for a roll call
21 vote on all items on the General Order Calendar
22 today.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
24 Chambers, please.

25 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down please.

2 CLERK: Adams.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Aye ono all.

4 CLERK: Ampry-Samuel.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Aye on all.

6 CLERK: Ayala.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye on all.

8 CLERK: Barron.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye.

10 CLERK: Borelli.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye.

12 CLERK: Brannan.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.

14 CLERK: Cabrera.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye .

16 CLERK: Chin.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye on all.

18 CLERK: Cohen.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

20 CLERK: Constantinides:

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye on

22 all.

23 CLERK: Cornegy.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.

25 CLERK: Deutsch.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.

3 CLERK: Diaz.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Aye.

5 CLERK: Dromm.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

7 CLERK: Espinal. Eugene.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

9 CLERK: Gibson.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Aye.

11 CLERK: Gjonaj.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Gjonaj

13 CLERK: Grodenchik.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

15 CLERK: Holden.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye.

17 CLERK: Koo.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

19 CLERK: Koslowitz.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.

21 CLERK: Lancman, Lander

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.

23 CLERK: Levin.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye

25 CLERK: Levine.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

3 CLERK: Gjonaj.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Aye.

5 CLERK: Maisel.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

7 CLERK: Menchaca.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.

9 CLERK: Miller.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Affirmative.

11 CLERK: Moya.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Aye.

13 CLERK: Perkins.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye.

15 CLERK: Powers.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Aye.

17 CLERK: Richards.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

19 CLERK: Rivera.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye on all.

21 CLERK: Rodriguez.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

23 CLERK: Rose.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

25 CLERK: Rosenthal.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye.

3 CLERK: Salamanca.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye.

5 CLERK: Torres.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye.

7 CLERK: Treyger.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

9 CLERK: Ulrich.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Aye.

11 CLERK: Vallone. Van Bramer.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.

13 CLERK: Williams.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye.

15 CLERK: Yeger.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye.

17 CLERK: Matteo.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Aye.

19 CLERK: Cumbo.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye.

21 CLERK: Speaker Johnson.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Aye. I think it was

23 unanimous.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All items on

25 today's General Order Calendar were adopted by a vote

2 of whatever the Speaker said, 46 affirmative, 0
3 negative and 0 abstentions, and Introduction and
4 Reading of Bills.

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: All bills have been
6 referred to committees as indicated on the Agenda.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: There are no
8 resolutions. We'll begin with general discussions
9 beginning with Council Member Koo.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, Madam
11 Public Advocate. I would like to wish my colleagues
12 a happy and healthy year of the Dog, and I would like
13 to invite every one here to join me in the Flushing
14 Lunar New Year Parade this Saturday at 11:00 a.m.
15 The Lunar New Year officially begins this Friday and
16 lasts until March 1st. This is a time for families
17 to come together often from around the world to
18 celebrate and spend time with one another. We
19 embrace our family, our health and good fortune--

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
21 [shushing for quiet]

22 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
23 down please.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: --and we're prepared
25 to take on the coming year of positive energy and

2 enthusiasm. So, happy new year to my colleagues. In
3 the spirit of the holiday, I would like to take this
4 opportunity to ask my colleagues in joining me in
5 signing onto Intro 75. This is a bill that would
6 expand alternate side parking regulations on the eve
7 of the Lunar New Year. As you know, this is the time
8 of the year when families will travel from around the
9 world to be with each other. Today, before Lunar New
10 Year is the time of a great commuting for people
11 returning home in Asian cultures. In many areas of
12 the city, using alternate side regulations will
13 provide for an easier commute for the thousands of
14 Asian-Americans living in our great city. So, happy
15 new year to all. I hope to see you this Saturday in
16 Flushing. Thank you.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Happy new year to
18 you as well. Council Member Barron.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Madam
20 Public Advocate. As we know, February is designated
21 as Black History Month—

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
23 [shushing for quiet]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: --and I do want
25 to just share a brief bio with you about Carter G.

2 Woodson. So, Carter G. Woodson is a scholar, an
3 author of over 30 books, a journalist and educator
4 and historian. He is known as the Father of Black
5 History Month, which originally started as a week and
6 expanded to a month. He as a youth worked as a farm
7 laborer, a garbage truck driver, and a coal miner,
8 and his father taught him learning to accept insult,
9 to compromise on principle, to mislead your fellow
10 man or to betray your people is to lose your soul.
11 He was self-educated to the age of 20 at which time
12 he went to high school and completed high school
13 within less than two years. He became a teacher, a
14 principal, a school administrator in the Philippines.
15 He went on to get a degree also from Howard
16 University—no, Harvard. Some people think Harvard is
17 better than Howard. Harvard University, University
18 of Chicago and Maria College. He was convinced that
19 the roll of blacks in our history was not recorded
20 adequately. He said it was overlooked, suppressed,
21 ignored and misrepresented, and unfortunately, that
22 is still the issue as we read about current
23 situations that are happening right here in our
24 public school system. He devoted his life to
25 historical research and he did at one point belong

2 the NAACP in Washington, but left when they refused
3 to support his call for a boycott. But one of his
4 most famous quotes as is listed in the book that he
5 wrote, the Miseducation of the Negro is as follows:
6 "If you can control a man's thinking, you don't have
7 to worry about his actions. If you control what a man
8 thinks, you don't have to worry about what he will
9 do. If you can make a man think he's inferior, you
10 don't have to compel him to seek an inferior status.
11 He will do so without being told. And finally, if
12 you can make a man believe that he is justly an
13 outcast, you don't have to order him to the back
14 door. He will go to the back door on his own, and if
15 there is no back door, the very nature of the man
16 will demand that you build one." Carter G. Woodson.
17 Thank you.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We recognize him
19 at Howard University as well. Council Member Chin.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Madam
21 Public Advocate. I also want to take this
22 opportunity to wish all my colleagues a happy Lunar
23 New Year. It's coming up on Friday, and this is the
24 year of the dog. So, anyone whose in the year of the
25 dog are friendly, loyal, works very hard and I think

2 they also know how to enjoy life, and guess what?

3 Our Speaker was born in the year of the dog.

4 [laughter] As our Council Member Koo said Luna New

5 Year's Eve. It's a very important day for families.

6 So, that's why I co-spon-co-sponsored the

7 legislation, but we are also--the two of us are

8 inviting all of our colleagues and your staff to join

9 us tomorrow at our annual Lunar New Year luncheon at

10 the members' lounge. We will have Korean food,

11 Chinese food, Vietnamese food, and kosher Chinese

12 food. Okay, so come early noon so, and celebrate

13 with us, and I also invite you to come to the Fire

14 Cracker Ceremony on Friday at noon at Sara D.

15 Roosevelt Park, and we also have a community event at

16 2:00 at the Chinese Consolidated Benevolent

17 Association, and we also have a parade--

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: [interposing] Yes

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: --Council member

20 Koo, you start in Flushing, and we will have one in

21 Chinatown and Lower Manhattan on Sunday, February

22 25th. So, bring your family and enjoy the festivity

23 with us. [Speaking foreign language]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: [Speaking foreign

25 language]

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Happy New Year to
3 you. Something tells me you'll have full attendance
4 tomorrow. Council Member Williams.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.
6 Happy Valentine's to everyone, and happy new year.
7 Yesterday, Errol Louis posted an op-ed that I was
8 embarrassed to read basically saying that people
9 should be leery using Ravi Ragbir as a hero in the
10 immigration movement. I have a lot of respect for
11 Errol Louis, but he couldn't have been more wrong.
12 He talked about Ravi's background and trying to
13 commit as a reason not to be push him up. I want to
14 make sure that we push back against that enforcement.
15 He is forming the Trumpian trap of separating us. We
16 should be very careful when we use crimes in general
17 as separation. We should look at people as
18 individuals and as what they did. If we tend to use
19 crimes, too many people, so many folks will get
20 caught up in that, and so we must be very careful we
21 resist in doing that, and that the crime he committed
22 was a non-violent crime, if that makes a difference.
23 He's not one of the people Mr. Trump said that he
24 would be focused on, and then everyone is worthy of
25 rehabilitation even immigrants. If people want to

2 know, he actually had a green cards when the crime
3 was committed. Also, how much time do you serve
4 before you have paid your debt back to society? He
5 served two years in jail, two years house arrest and
6 two years in immigration detention center. Since
7 then, he has been a model student—a model resident.
8 If there is anybody talking of this, I'm extremely
9 proud that I stand with Ravi, and I would ask Errol
10 Louis to rescind his op-ed in trying to separate us
11 in the time we need to be unified and using such
12 Trumpian excuses to do so. With that said, we all
13 have a lot of our resolutions and intros, but I want
14 to point my attention to Resolution 182 by myself,
15 Council Member Rodriguez, Menchaca, Richards, Cumbo
16 and Espinal calling on the United States Congress to
17 pass and the president to sign HR 4937, which is
18 Congresswoman Nydia Valazquez resolution, which would
19 provide immigration relief for New York resident
20 Ravi—Ravidath--Ravi Lawrence Ragbir and denouncing
21 the unlawful targeting immigrant rights activist for
22 deportation by the U.S. Immigration and Custom
23 Enforcement, also known as ICE [bell] and I want to
24 thank the Chair of the Immigration Committee Council
25 Member Menchaca for expeditiously having a hearing a

2 on this tomorrow, and I hope everyone will join on.
3 Thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We welcome Errol
5 Louis the personality of New York One and his class.
6 They're in the balcony. [applause] [laughter]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Well, hi,
8 Errol. [laughter] [background comments]

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
10 Treyger.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] Errol,
12 there's an empty seat down here next to member
13 Williams. [laughter]

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughter] Talk
15 about perfect timing.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Well, that's-
17 that's. We-we love-we love our educators. So, we
18 love and protest.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
20 [shushing for quiet]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Public advocate
22 and my colleagues, as many of you are aware, a
23 teenage girl was raped by two Brooklyn South
24 narcotics detectives in my district last fall. The
25 detectives have tried to mount a defense by claiming

2 it was consensual. They have since resigned, but we
3 need strong laws in place to make sure this never
4 happens again. My consent legislation Intro 571
5 which I introduced in November and I'm reintroducing
6 today with co-prime sponsors, Council Member Carlina
7 Rivera and Donovan Richards will make it clear that
8 anyone in custody of a law enforcement official is
9 incapable of giving genuine consent to sexual
10 contact. In addition to my bill, I'm also
11 reintroducing my resolution, Reso 177 that calls on
12 state lawmakers to amend the Penal Code to end the
13 loophole that allowed the detectives to claim that
14 the rape was consensual, which was outrageous. There
15 can be no meaningful consent when you're in the
16 custom of a law enforcement officer. State law
17 wisely recognizes that inmates can't give consent to
18 corrections officers, and parolees can't give genuine
19 consent to parole officers. All law enforcement must
20 be held to the same standard. I'm also working with
21 the Assembly to make sure that this change happens at
22 the state level, and a bill based on our City Council
23 resolution just passed the Assembly. I'm pleased to
24 have the support from my colleagues Council Member
25 Carlina Rivera, and Donovan Richards who are prime

2 co-sponsors of the bill and the resolution, and I
3 thank you for your time. Happy Lunar New Year as
4 well.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

6 Council Member Powers

7 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Thank you and
8 happy Valentine's Day and happy Ash Wednesday. I
9 wanted to just recognize today the important announce
10 that was made by Rikers' Island and putting us on a
11 timeline in the process for doing that, and I want to
12 thank both Speaker Corey Johnson and the four
13 representatives of the sites, Council Member Ayala,
14 Council Member Chin, Council Member Steven Levin,
15 Council Member Karen Koslowitz for being open minded
16 and willing to have a discussion in their community
17 about the eventual closure of Rikers Island and the-
18 the siting of borough based facilities, which will
19 put us in a place to do that in a-in a short time
20 frame. So, I want to thank this whole body also for
21 leading this conversation over the last few years,
22 and including my Council member right in front of my,
23 Council Member Daily-Danny Dromm. Today was a-not
24 just about talking about it any more, but actually
25 moving the city into a process to do it. So, I-I

2 want to thank again my—the Speaker and my colleagues
3 for their willingness to move the ball down field on
4 this one. So, thank you.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And our last
6 speaker is Council Member Rodriguez.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
8 Public Advocate. First, I would like to thank you
9 for taking the initiative today bringing three of our
10 five DAs to a press conference in front of the
11 Federal Court at 60 Court Street calling ICE to stop
12 coming to the court or in front of the court, and try
13 to deport individuals that they been accused by the
14 court system. However the case is actually pending
15 and ICE has been deporting many of them. Last
16 Friday, there was three individuals in front of my
17 building waiting for me. There was a family member—
18 there as a family that they lost—they—one of the
19 family members was picked by ICE at 6-100 Center
20 Street. Legal Aid has been defending that case. If
21 those families, they would have known where I lived
22 and waiting for me in front of the building, mostly
23 likely Legal Aid would not know that one of her
24 clients was already in the detention center in
25 Jersey. I signed into my colleague Council Member

2 Williams taking advantage that our good friend Errol
3 is here to also say yes because someone has made a
4 mistake in the past, it doesn't justify that this
5 immigration policy led by a Right Wing Donald Trump
6 is dividing families. So, this is a time where
7 America is on the attack. You know, this president
8 and his followers, they don't understand that this
9 nation is being built by and for immigrants, and we
10 come in all shape form. We came from Africa, Europe,
11 Asia or Latin America, but at the end of the day, we
12 need to be sure first of all that we should stand for
13 Ravi because standing for Ravi is standing for Amanda
14 Morales. It' just standing for everyone who
15 represents our great nation of America. Thank you.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
17 Council member. Seeing none other, on behalf of the
18 Women's Delegation and myself we want to thank
19 Council Member Ulrich for these lovely roses. Thank
20 you, and now we hand it over to the Speaker to close.
21 Speaker Corey Johnson, you didn't get one.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I want—I want to thank
23 Council Member Ulrich for his blazer. [laughter] I
24 am grateful that Council Members Koo and Chin are
25 providing us with a delicious lunch tomorrow. So,

2 hopefully, that lessens the blow of two States in a
3 row. I also want to welcome Errol Louis and his class
4 for being here today. I'm sorry we have a short
5 agenda. I'm sure that his students have heard this
6 already but, you know, the seat that our Public
7 Advocate sat in and the seat that Council Member
8 Cumbo sits in Errol Louis ran for that seat in 1997
9 against Mary Pinkett and James Davis who was
10 assassinated here in this very room, and who Public
11 Advocate James succeeded in, in a special election in
12 that seat, and so we appreciate Errol's political
13 activity spanning decades--although he doesn't look
14 that old--here in the city and for being--even when we
15 disagree for being a conscience of the city and
16 raising issues that other folks won't raise. With
17 that, I will see you all tomorrow. We are adjourned.
18 Thank you.

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date February 26, 2018