

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

December 19, 2017
Start: 2:30 p.m.
Recess: 6:13 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: LETITIA JAMES
Public Advocate

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO
Speaker for the Council

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Inez D. Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Andrew Cohen
Costa G. Constantinides
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Elizabeth S. Crowley
Laurie A. Cumbo
Chaim M. Deutsch
Inez E. Dickens
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Mathieu Eugene
Julissa Ferreras-Copeland
Daniel R. Garodnick
Vincent J. Gentile
Vanessa L. Gibson

David G. Greenfield
Barry S. Grodenchik
Corey D. Johnson
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Peter A. Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
Darlene Mealy
Carlos Menchaca
Rosie Mendez
I. Daneek Miller
Annabel Palma
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
James Vacca
Paul A. Vallone
James G. Van Bramer
Jumaane D. Williams

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Rev. Dr. T. Kenjitsu Nakagaki
Buddhist Council of New York
Delivered Invocation

2 [sound check, pause]

3 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I think we've got
4 to get started with the ceremonials.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
6 [shushing for quiet]

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I think we'll
8 start with Council Member Crowley since she's up
9 here. [laughs] So, Council Member Crowley. Those
10 that are here for the photo can stay up I guess,
11 right? These are the honorees? Council Member
12 Crowley is posthumously honoring Julia Elizabeth
13 Roman for the groundbreaking achievements as a
14 Dominican immigrant and U.S. citizen who became the
15 first woman maintainer of elevators and escalators
16 and whose life helped inspire a local law on maternal
17 mortality, and with that, I want to ask Council
18 Member Crowley to speak on behalf of this
19 proclamation. [applause]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you, Madam
21 Speaker. Today, we posthumously honor a trailblazing
22 woman who was taken from us far too soon. Julia
23 Roman. We are honoring her for her dedication to the
24 city of the New York and for her leadership. As a
25 young working woman, Julia started a non--started a

2 non-traditional employment for women and became a
3 skilled electrician and elevator repair mechanic. She
4 proudly joined the ranks of New York City Transit as
5 the first female maintainer of elevators and
6 escalators. She was also the first female elected by
7 her peers to become shop steward at TWU Local 100.
8 We are grateful to her family for joining us today,
9 her husband Victor, her children Valerie, Duane,
10 Victoria, Isabella and Grace and her sister-in-law
11 Nadia. [background comments] She was a devoted
12 parent and a true role model to her children. She
13 died after child birth complications. Her untimely
14 passing is a painful reminder for all of us that
15 maternal mortality still happens today despite all of
16 the modern medicine and medical advances we have made
17 over the years. It is our responsibility to Julia's
18 life. She did not die in vain, and that we as a city
19 will address maternal mortality head on. Recently,
20 this Council passed a bill, Local Law 55 requiring
21 the Department of Health to not only report annually
22 on maternal mortality, but also to make
23 recommendations on steps that could be taken to avoid
24 this tragedy. Unfortunately, the sad truth is more
25 American women are dying of pregnancy related

2 complications than in any other—than in any other
3 developed country. More mothers are dying in New
4 York City than in other major cities in America.
5 The United States has a rate of maternal mortality
6 that has been rising, and our hospitals have found—
7 have been found to be woefully unprepared to for
8 maternal emergencies and not enough federal and state
9 funding goes to the health of mothers. We must do
10 more. [pause] To Victor and to the rest of Julia's
11 family, we could never fully comprehend your loss,
12 but we are so inspired by Julia's life, the leader
13 she was as a working woman, and remain fully
14 committed to doing everything we can to prevent
15 others from a death related to child birth. Now, I'd
16 ask for a moment of silence in her memory. [moment
17 of silence] Thank you and I'd ask for the proc, the
18 Committee Clerk to read the proc. Thank you.

19 CLERK: Council, City of New York
20 Proclamation:

21 The Council of the city of New York is
22 proud to posthumously honor Julia Elizabeth Roman for
23 her groundbreaking achievements and the legacy, which
24 inspires others today; and
25

2 Whereas, Julia Elizabeth Roman was born
3 on August 11, 1974 in the Dominican Republic and
4 later moved to the United States to become a citizen.
5 Eventually, she joined NEW, Non-Traditional
6 Employment for Women, an organization that prepares,
7 trains and places women in careers and the skill-and
8 skilled construction, utility and maintenance trades,
9 helps women achieve economic independence, and the
10 secure future for themselves and their families.
11 Before long she had learned the electrical trade and
12 joined the International Brotherhood of Electrical
13 Workers Local Union No. 3. In her-earlier in her
14 career, she began working for Century Elevator where
15 she honed her skills as an elevator apprentice before
16 being promoted to elevator mechanic; and

17 Whereas, when Ms. Roman left the private
18 sector to join in New York City Transit, she became
19 the first woman maintainer of elevators and
20 escalators. Her peers also elected her to be the
21 first woman shop steward for Transport Workers Union
22 Local 100; and

23 Whereas, like countless women, Ms. Roman
24 worked tirelessly to juggle all the responsibilities
25

2 of career and family to secure a better life for her
3 children.

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
5 down, please, keep it down.

6 CLERK: On November 16, 2017, she gave
7 birth to beautiful fraternal twins. The celebration
8 of birth, however, was interrupted by tragedy. Just
9 a short time after bringing two lives into the world,
10 Ms. Roman died from an Amniotic Fluid Embolism; and

11 Whereas, Ms. Roman's death is a painful
12 reminder that maternal mortality still happens in the
13 21st Century. In fact, more women are dying of
14 pregnancy related complications in America than any
15 other developed county. Only in the U.S. has the
16 maternal mortality rate been rising; and

17 Whereas, this year Council Members
18 Elizabeth Crowley, Laurie Cumbo, Corey Johnson and
19 Helen Rosenthal sponsored Local Law 55. Enacted in
20 March, Local Law 55 required the Department of Health
21 and Mental Hygiene to report to the Council annually
22 on maternal mortality. This annual report will
23 include maternal mortality numbers and rates
24 disaggregated by race and borough. It will also lead
25 to recommendations on steps that can be taken by the

2 Department and others to reduce maternal mortality;
3 and

4 Whereas, Julia Roman is survived by her
5 devoted husband Victor, her 26-year-old daughter
6 Valerie Rosario; her 19-year-old son Dwayne Little
7 who will soon join the Air Force; her 5-year-old
8 daughter Victoria and her newborns Isabella and
9 Grace. While we could never fully comprehend their
10 loss, we will remain fully committed to doing
11 everything we can to prevent others from death in
12 child birth.

13 Now, therefore, be it known that the
14 Council of the City of New York honors the life and
15 indelible memory of Julia Elizabeth Roman for her
16 outstanding achievements and her service to her
17 fellow New Yorkers. Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker
18 for the Entire Council; Elizabeth Crowley, Council
19 Member 30th District, Queens; Ydanis Rodriguez, Chair
20 New York City Council Transportation Committee;
21 Laurie A. Cumbo, Co-Chair Women's Caucus; Helen
22 Rosenthal, Co-Chair Women's Caucus.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you. I
24 want to recognize Rosario Polante who's here as the
25 Division Vice Chair for TWU Local 100 joining the

2 family. I want to thank the family for being here
3 today, and—and we will never forget. This Council
4 will do all we can to reduce maternal mortality in
5 the future. Thank you.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [Speaking
7 Spanish] [applause] [background comments, pause]
8 Okay, okay. I think the next one is Council Member
9 Rose. Council Member Rose is honoring the 2017 TCS
10 New York City Marathon Race Week Youth Grand
11 Marshals. It's a long title. [laughs] So the Youth
12 Grand Marshals of the 2017 TCS New York City Marathon
13 Race. Five special students representing each of New
14 York City's boroughs and their peers while
15 inspiriting 50,000 runners as they completed the 26.2
16 mile marathon run. So, congratulations and I'm going
17 to hand it off to Council Member Debbie Rose,

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. We are
19 really glad to honor the first time that the New York
20 City Marathon has had youth—youth grand marshals, and
21 these young people are participants in their New York
22 Rising Road Run—Road Runners program. These are
23 [laughs]—these are inspiring young runners and they
24 have had the opportunity to work with TCS and we're
25 joined here today by Peter Ciaccia, who is the New

2 York Road Runners President of events and race,
3 Director of the TCS New York Marathon and Michael
4 Capiraso, who is the New York Road Runner's President
5 and CEO, and these very important young people who
6 are a part of the New York Road Runners Free Youth
7 Fitness Program, Rising New York Road Runners, and I
8 thought it was really fitting that since the marathon
9 goes through all five boroughs that they have one
10 young person from each borough be a grand marshal.
11 This is the first time, and they were able to
12 participate in all of the activities, and so, with
13 that, we'd like to recognize these young—these five
14 young people and I'm going to try not to butcher the
15 names too bad, Speaker.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] No, no
17 just the first names.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Just the first
19 names?

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay. I get a
22 reprieve. We get the first names only. Oluwaseni
23 Jaylyn, Peter, Hope and Emma, and so thank you.

24 [cheers/applause] [laughter]

2 STUDENT: Thank you. You could call
3 Oluwaseni, Sheni.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I could call
5 Oluwaeni, Sheni? Okay. [background comments] Okay,
6 and so now, would the City Clerk please read the
7 proclamation.

8 CLERK: Council City of New York
9 Proclamation. The TCS New York City Marathon is the
10 premier event of the New York Road Runners. Since
11 the event began in 1970 with 127 entrants running
12 laps around Central Park, it has grown into a five
13 borough affair, and the largest marathon in the
14 world. More than one million people have finished
15 the race. Held annually on the first Sunday of
16 November, the race features over 50,000 runners
17 including the world's top professional athletes, and
18 a vast range of competitive recreational and charity
19 runners. Participants from roughly 125 countries for
20 the city starting on Staten Island, running through
21 the neighborhoods of Brooklyn, Queens and the Bronx
22 before ending in Manhattan. More than a million
23 spectators and thousand of volunteers line the city
24 streets to support the dedicated runners in person

2 while millions around the world do so as they watch
3 the race on TV; and

4 Whereas, in 2017 the New York Road
5 Runners launched its enhanced Free Youth Fitness
6 Program, Rising New York Road Runners, which is
7 designed to help students in our city and across the
8 nation develop positive and lasting attitudes towards
9 health and fitness through running. Five special
10 Rising New York Road Runners were chosen ad the
11 first-

12 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
13 down please. Keep it down.

14 CLERK: --ever youth grand marshals
15 representing each of New York City's boroughs and
16 their peers while inspiring the 50,000 runners as
17 they complete their 26.2 mile run. They are:
18 Oluwaseni from Staten Island; Jaylen from Brooklyn;
19 Peter from Queens, Hope from the Bronx and Emma from
20 Manhattan. This is one and this is only the fifth
21 time in New York City marathon history that the event
22 has featured a grand marshal; and

23 Whereas, during the 2017 TCS New York
24 City Marathon Race week, the Youth Grand Marshals
25 accompanied by Olympic Metalists and teen New Balance

2 athlete Jenny Simpson, Ambassador and Special Advisor
3 to Rising New York Road Runners, participated in Race
4 Week festivities including the opening of the TCS New
5 York City Marathon Expo and the TCS New York City
6 Marathon opening ceremony. On Marathon day, the
7 group rode in the official Grand Marshal vehicle
8 through the 26.2 mile marathon course with Ms.
9 Simpson and Peter Ciaccia, President of Events for
10 New York Road Runners and the race director of the
11 TCS New York City Marathon; and

12 Whereas, each of the youth grand marshals
13 has excelled in their roll, and has earned the esteem
14 of their fellow New Yorkers.

15 Now, therefore, be it known that New York
16 City Council is proud to honor Peter Oluwaseni,
17 Jaylen, Emma and Hope for their outstanding service
18 to New York City and the nation and congratulates
19 them upon being named TCS New York City Marathon
20 Youth Grand Marshals. Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker
21 for the Entire Council; Deborah Rose, Council Member
22 49th District Staten Island; Helen Rosenthal, Council
23 Member, Council Member 6th District Manhattan; Rafael
24 Salamanca, Council Member, Jr. Council Member 17th
25 District the Bronx; Eric A. Ulrich, Council Member

2 32nd District Queens; Laurie A. Cumbo, Council Member
3 35th District Brooklyn.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I want to thank you
5 so much. [cheers/applause] I want to thank the—the
6 New York Road Runners for recognizing the need for
7 exercise and—and positive activities for young people
8 and in so doing, they have the New York Road Runners'
9 free Youth Fitness Program, and these young people
10 are a part of the program called Rising New York Road
11 Runners, and although we can't pronounce their names
12 here today, I—I assure you that you will see them in
13 some marathon as winners crossing that—that finish
14 line in the future, and so now Madam Speaker, would
15 you--?

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: No, no, no, I
17 just wanted to congratulate our young people in
18 particular as Council Member Rose said and what
19 you're doing in terms of inspiring them. This is a
20 leadership program as well. We should always see
21 these types of programs not just as a recreational
22 and athletic program, but it is a leadership building
23 program as well. So, congratulations to all of you.
24 I'm sure you'll be running the marathon soon, right?

2 [laughter] I don't know if somebody wants to speak
3 on behalf of the group? [background comments, pause]

4 FEMALE SPEAKER: Right. I think a lot of
5 what's been said is what I would I say here today,
6 but in New York City we serve over 135,000 young
7 people in over 800 schools, and that's of the 267,000
8 total across the United States. So, we're—and all of
9 our programs are free, and you can see the results
10 standing here in front of you. These young grand
11 marshals represent our children from all those
12 schools in every borough, every community district,
13 every City Council District. So, thank you very much
14 for having us here today. [cheers/applause]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. Thank
16 you. [background comments, pause] Okay. [applause]
17 [background comments]

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright, where's
19 the last description? Alright, Council Member
20 Williams. [background comments] Honoring Carolyn A.
21 Butts for 20 years of outstanding achievements and
22 contributions with the Real Sisters Film Festival an
23 internationally respected film festival that
24 showcases films by women of color from Brooklyn to
25 Brazil. [laughter] Do we have others that are being

2 recognized? [background comments] There it is.
3 They're coming up. They're coming up. Alright, so
4 I'm going to pass it off to Council Member Williams.
5 Welcome, congratulations and I'll have Council Member
6 Williams talk about all the great work that you've
7 been doing. [background comments]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you so
9 much, and thank you Carolyn Butts for allowing us to
10 celebrate you. Most folks know my first love is
11 acting. I was a film production minor and the reason
12 I switched from dram to film production was that the
13 auditions that were going-

14 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
15 down. Keep it down.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: --we always for
17 murderers and drug dealings and type casting. So, I
18 said I have to figure out a way to tell my own story.
19 So, when I found Carolyn Butts who was doing just
20 that, telling the story of people who weren't being
21 told in the right way. She's been helping to elevate
22 and amplify the voices of women of color in the arts.
23 She's the founder of African Voices for 25 years, and
24 the Real Sisters of the Diaspora Film Festival for 20
25 years. She has also spread her love of story telling

2 to low-income areas with her Get Up Get Your Read On
3 for 15 years, a program, and we're just so excited
4 that you allowed us to be here. It's close to my
5 heart. It's close to everyone's heart here and
6 please continue the great work. Thank you so much.

7 CAROLYN BUTTS: Thank you. [applause]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Would you
9 please read the proclamation?

10 CLERK: Council City of New York
11 Proclamation.

12 Whereas, the Council of the City of New
13 York is proud to honor Carolyn A. Butts for 20 years
14 of outstanding achievements and contributions with
15 the Real Sisters Film Festival; and

16 Whereas, in 1996, Ms. Butts co-produced a
17 short film called Underground Voices, which Reg E.
18 Gaines. Although footage from the film was broadcast
19 on PBS, the filmmaker was still unable to raise money
20 to produce a full length documentary. During this
21 time, she learned of the scarcity of prospects for
22 African-African-American women filmmakers and
23 committed to correcting that. In 1997, she founded
24 the Real Sisters of the Diaspora Film Festival, a
25 lecture series. The first Annual Brooklyn based

2 festival that highlights opportunities for women of
3 color in the film industry; and

4 Whereas, under the leadership of Ms.
5 Butts, Real Sisters has grown into an internationally
6 respected film festival that showcases the films by
7 women of color from Brooklyn to Brazil. Each year
8 the festival fosters dynamic and rewarding dialogues
9 about the ways women of color are portrayed in film
10 and about the expansive definition of feminism in
11 today's society. Since its debut 20 years ago, the
12 film festival has presented more than 3,000 films and
13 given over \$25,000 in scholarship money to aspiring
14 filmmakers, and

15 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
16 down, please.

17 CLERK: Whereas, the Real Sisters Film
18 Festival owes much of its success to the vision and
19 passion of its founder, yes, it is also only one of
20 Ms. Butts' many endeavors to increase the visibility
21 of African-American artists over the last three
22 decades. In 1992, Ms. Butts became the Founder,
23 Publisher and Executive Director of African Voices, a
24 leading not-for-profit Arts Magazine devoted to
25 presenting fine art and literature by artists of

2 color. Now in its 25th year, African Voices not only
3 publishes a quarter magazine with poetry, visual
4 arts, fiction and features from artists across the
5 nation, but also sponsors community forums, literary
6 readings and artistic programs for youth as well as
7 the Real Sisters Film Festival; and

8 Whereas, Ms. Butts also has a lengthy
9 history of supporting arts education for young
10 people. In 2002, she launched Get Your Read On, an
11 initiative to bring the love of writing, reading and
12 story telling to young people in low-income
13 communities. Between 2002 and 2007, she worked as
14 the Associate Director of the Restoration Youth Arts
15 Academy. In that role she managed arts training in
16 dance, theater, visual arts, and writing for more
17 than 1,500 students in public schools and on-site
18 workshops. Ms. Butts has truly distinguished herself
19 in all of her endeavors, and has—and has earned the
20 esteem of her fellow New Yorkers.

21 Now, therefore, be it known that the
22 Council of the city of New York gratefully honors
23 Carolyn A. Butts in celebration of the 20th
24 Anniversary of the Real Sisters of the Diaspora Film
25 Festival and Lecture Series. Melissa Mark-Viverito,

2 Speaker for the Entire Council; Jumaane D. Williams,
3 Council Member, 45th District Brooklyn; Laurie A.
4 Cumbo, Co-Chair Women's Caucus; Helen Rosenthal, Co-
5 Chair Women's Caucus and many other council members.
6 [cheers/applause]

7 CAROLYN A. BUTTS: I just want to thank
8 everyone, Jumaane Williams, who has been the
9 ambassador for Real Sisters for the last seven years,
10 Laurie Cumbo and Tish James, and all of the City
11 Council Members. But I would like to say especially
12 with Laurie Cumbo before she was City Council she
13 opened up her doors in Mikado (sp?) for the Real
14 Sisters. She also—we were standing in line getting
15 out ramps together, and she's like, let's come here
16 at 12:00 midnight because—So I mean I just want to
17 thank all of the City Council members. I'm very
18 touched by this honor. You know, I'm a child of the
19 Red Hook projects. This is very important to me
20 because, wow, when I started out at 10 years old
21 wanting to be a journalist, I never, never, ever
22 could imagine--

23 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
24 down, please. Keep it down.

2 CAROLYN A. BUTTS: --that I'd be here
3 accepting this proclamation at the City Council, and
4 I just want to say that the power of the arts, you
5 know, if you--when you read a good book or magazine
6 you are moved. When you see a good film, you are
7 moved. Conversations you have never had before
8 emerge, and I wanted to just say one, my dad whose
9 up in heaven will be very proud that I'm doing this.
10 The meaning of the power of the arts happened when I
11 was visiting him at the hospice. He had was--
12 prostate cancer he had, and a nurse--he said give the
13 nurse your magazine, and I was like she doesn't want
14 that, you know, she doesn't care, you know. So, I
15 gave it to her and I--I figured that she would not
16 read the magazine. Then the next day she came up to
17 me very excited and she said oh I love the magazine.
18 There was this one poem there about a dad, a
19 daughter waiting for her dad who never came, and she
20 said this was the first time ever that we opened up
21 and had a really difficult conversation about her
22 father, and she just said thank you. And, the power
23 of the art, as you all know here can change the
24 world one poem at a time, one film at a time, one
25 painting at a time. So, I just want to thank

2 everyone, and I'm really proud of the young people
3 who were honored before me. That's the reason why
4 I'm inspired to keep everything I do going, and
5 just, you know, like I said, as a working class
6 daughter of Brooklyn's Red Hook Projects, I
7 represent all the young dreamers and visionaries in
8 neighborhoods that people sometimes describe as
9 undesirable places to live. There are dreams here,
10 too, people with vision and talent. It is important
11 from children-for children everywhere to see the
12 limitless opportunities available. To the young
13 people in Red Hook and everywhere I say you are a
14 publisher, a software engineer, an architect and
15 artist. Thank you, the City Council for fighting
16 the good fight to make sure children have safe
17 places to sleep by preserving affordable housing,
18 working to improve our public school, and
19 healthcare. Thank you for this award. [cheers/
20 applause] [pause]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: --ask all the
22 women in the Women's Caucus to come forward and all
23 the department members of the Council. So, Dan
24 Garodnick that means you, Vinny, David, Crowley, Liz
25 [background comments] Karen. Adrienne, if you could

2 join us up here. Liz. [background comments] Well,
3 we're doing depart--everyone can come up. Of course,
4 everyone should be up here. We're thinking the
5 department members of the Council and the Women's
6 Caucus in particular, the department members of the
7 Women's Caucus. No everyone is up here. So, maybe
8 step back just a little bit.

9 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
10 down please. Keep it down please. Keep it down
11 please.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Just step back
13 just a little bit. Anyone who's departing maybe be
14 in the front. Alright, Melissa, I'm afraid you're
15 coming up here, which is very upsetting to me.
16 Rosie. [background comments] Julissa. Do you want
17 to do the flowers? Laurie and I think-- Do you
18 want to do flowers, too, Monica? Monica, let's do
19 the flowers. Let's give the flowers as well. So,
20 is everyone--? Oh, Annabel.

21 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet,
22 please.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
24 [shushing for quiet]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So, I'm gong
3 to cry.

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
5 down, please.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So, everyone
7 has their own proclamation, of course, that thanks
8 you for your specific contributions to the city and
9 to this City Council, but as Co-Chair of the Women's
10 Caucus, and for all the departing members, the—the
11 good men, and Laurie, I want you to say a few words.
12 I, you know, the number of women in the Council is
13 going down from 15 to 11. Of the people who were—
14 who were term limited or there was another race, 60%
15 of those women left, and—and we didn't pick up any.
16 [background comments] No, no, pick up. Pick up
17 would have been, you know, but anyway. So, the
18 point is—the point is that—the point is we're really
19 going to miss you. I mean if I can just say having
20 Melissa and Julissa as leaders in the Council it
21 really was quite a moment when the two of you stood
22 up there with Latonia McKinney and—and spoke about
23 negotiating the City's Budget. That was very
24 powerful for a lot of women and, of course, women of
25 color in particular and I admire all of you. I'm

2 going to turn it over to Laurie because she's great.
3 [laughter] Better at this.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Helen and I are so
5 proud of what this Women's Caucus has been able to
6 accomplish. As women leaders we rock. We are
7 dynamic, we are battle tested. We have shown that
8 we can do it, and we can do it better than anybody
9 can. We have held positions of leadership. We have
10 been chairs of some of the toughest committees in
11 the New York City Council. We passed monumental
12 legislation, and we're going to keep rising to the
13 top, and anybody who thinks that because we're women
14 that they can just run against us and run all over
15 us, they have another think coming. Because of this
16 body right here, and we're going to continue to
17 raise up the next generation of women leaders
18 because our voice is so important and so necessary
19 to this body, to this state and to this nation. It
20 has been an honor to be chair, co-chair with my co-
21 chair Helen Rosenthal, and to be chair of the
22 Women's Issues Committee, and every issue is a
23 woman's issue, [cheers] and we're going to continue
24 to rise to the top. And as I always say to my male
25 leaders, you are so much more powerful and so much

2 more dynamic when under the leadership of women.
3 So, keep supporting us. Keep raising us up, and
4 we're going to continue to rise as a body. Thank
5 you so much. [cheers/applause] Yay. You're great,
6 too, and--[background comments] No, we're going to
7 have--

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
9 You're great too, but she has the mic. [laughter]
10 Alright, with that, we end ceremonials, get ready
11 for our last session. [background comments, pause]

12 CLERK: Okay, could I have your
13 attention, please for the last time this year. Can
14 I have your attention, please? Can I have your
15 attention, please? At this time, please place all
16 electronic devices, all electronic devices to
17 vibrate. Will all non-Council employees, non-
18 Council employees please leave the main floor of the
19 Chambers. We have additional people on the floor so
20 we have a lot more staff than anticipated so if we
21 could please not block the doors, exits and
22 entrances. Please stand clear of the doors. It
23 would be appreciated. Madam Public Advocate.
24 [applause]

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Everyone please
3 find a seat. Please find a seat. Please clear the
4 aisles. Please close the doors. Quiet in the
5 Chambers. Everyone please be seated. [background
6 comments] Quiet in the Chambers. All members
7 please be seated. Quiet in the Chambers, please.

8 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
9 down, please.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: May we please
11 close that back door.

12 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet,
13 please. Keep it down.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All rise for the
15 Pledge of Allegiance.

16 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise.

17 COUNCIL MEMBERS: [in unison] [Pledge of
18 Allegiance]

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.
20 Roll call. Quiet in the Chambers, please.

21 CLERK: Adams.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Present.

23 CLERK: Barron.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.

25 CLERK: Borelli, Cabrera.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

3 CLERK: Chin.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

5 CLERK: Cohen.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

7 CLERK: Constantinides.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

9 CLERK: Cornegy.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Here.

11 CLERK: Crowley.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Here.

13 CLERK: Cumbo.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Present.

15 CLERK: Deutsch.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.

17 CLERK: Dromm.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

19 CLERK: Espinal.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.

21 CLERK: Eugene.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Present.

23 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland. Garodnick.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.

25 (children's voices] [background comments, laughter]

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

30

2 CLERK: Gentile.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: For the last time
4 here.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Oh. [laughs]
6 Quiet in the Chambers including myself.

7 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND:
9 Present. [background comments]

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Okay, guys.
11 Okay, okay, we've got a long agenda. Quiet in the
12 Chambers.

13 CLERK: Gibson.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Oh, you guys.
15 I'm here.

16 CLERK: Greenfield.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Here.

18 CLERK: Grodenchik.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.

20 CLERK: Johnson.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Here.

22 CLERK: Kallos.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

24 [shushing for quiet]

25

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

31

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
3 down, please.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

5 CLERK: King.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.

7 CLERK: Koo.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

9 CLERK: Koslowitz.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

11 CLERK: Lancman.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.

13 CLERK: Lander.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Lander. [pause]

15 CLERK: Levin.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

17 CLERK: Levine.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

19 CLERK: Maisel.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here. Can I

21 explain my answer?

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: No.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Sorry. [laughter]

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Not at all.

25 Continuing with roll call.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

32

2 CLERK: Mealy.

3 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

4 [shushing for quiet]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Present.

6 CLERK: Menchaca.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.

8 CLERK: Mendez.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Present.

10 CLERK: Miller.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: No?

12 CLERK: Palma.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Oops.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Here.

15 Clerk: Perkins.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Here.

17 CLERK: Reynoso.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Present.

19 CLERK: Richards.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

21 CLERK: Rodriguez.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Here.

23 CLERK: Rose.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

25 CLERK: Rosenthal.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

3 CLERK: Salamanca.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.

5 CLERK: Torres.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Present.

7 CLERK: Treyger.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

9 CLERK: Ulrich.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Here.

11 CLERK: Vacca.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.

13 CLERK: Vallone.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

15 CLERK: Williams.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.

17 CLERK: Lander.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.

19 CLERK: Matteo.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.

21 CLERK: Van Bramer.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

23 CLERK: Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Here.

25

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. All
3 quiet in the Chambers, please. All rise for the
4 Invocation.

5 CLERK: All rise.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: The Invocation
7 will be delivered by Reverend Dr. T. Kenjitsu-
8 Nakagaki from the Buddhist Council of New York.
9 Quiet in the Chambers, please.

10 DR. T. KENJITSU-NAKAGAKI: As we celebrate
11 the holiday seasons, let us keep the holiday spirit
12 of hope, wisdom, love, compassion and peace in our
13 mind. Hanukkah for Jews, Christmas for Christians
14 celebrated widely, Muslim friends celebrate the
15 birthday of Prophet Mohammed on December 1st this
16 year and Buddhists celebrate the Day of the
17 Enlightenment on December 8th. December is, indeed,
18 a special month for many religions. As the New York
19 City is filled with many lights in this season,
20 which can represent a light of hope, a light of
21 wisdom, a light of love, and a light of compassion
22 and a light of peace. Each of us should nurture
23 such lights within, which—which eventually brighten
24 our city. Join me in meditation. So, close your
25 eyes and breathe in and out slowly and deeply using

2 your lower stomach. As I offer the moment of
3 silence, let us nurture the light of hope, light of
4 wisdom, light of love and compassion, and the light
5 of peace within ourselves, and as I ring this bell,
6 you turn on mind lights. [bell rings multiple
7 times] May these lights become the source of our
8 wholesome actions for the true benefit for New
9 Yorkers. [Chanting] Peace and blessings to all of
10 you, and have happy holidays. Thank you.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.
12 [background comments] Quiet in the Chambers, please.
13 Quiet in the Chambers, quiet in the Chambers. A
14 motion to spread the invocation in full upon the
15 record.

16 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
17 down, please.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: May we have quiet
19 in the Chambers, please. We are in session. I
20 would urge everyone to take your conversations
21 outside. Council Member Garodnick.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you,
23 very much, Madam Public Advocate, and good afternoon
24 everyone. I would like to welcome and extend my
25 deepest gratitude to Reverend Dr. T. Kenjitsu-

2 Nakagaki for joining us today. Reverend Nakagaki is
3 President of the Buddhist Council of New York a 32-
4 year-old organization whose mission is to foster
5 dialogue, cooperation and unity within the Buddhist
6 community of our city. Reverend Nakagaki is not
7 only a leader in his own community, he's also
8 reached out across religious lines and has been a
9 remarkable civic leader on behalf of all New
10 Yorkers. Reverend Nakagaki is past Vice Chair of
11 the Interfaith Center of New York, and currently
12 serves as the Community Clergy Liaison for the New
13 York City Police Department. Since 1994, he has
14 organized an interfaith peace event to commemorate
15 the Hiroshima and Nagasaki Atomic bombings and
16 previously organized the World Trade Center Memorial
17 Floating Lantern Ceremony.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
19 [shushing for quiet]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: As part of his
21 research for his Doctor of Ministry Program at the
22 New York Theological Seminary, he visited Poland
23 touring the Auschwitz and Treblinka death camps.
24 Reverend Nakagaki's actions from diving into
25 interfaith work to strengthening his own spiritual

2 community show New Yorkers concrete steps we all can
3 take to make our city the best it can be. With
4 leaders like Reverend Nakagaki we have a shining
5 example of what we can do strengthen our beautiful
6 mosaic of a city, and I'm so glad that he has joined
7 us at our City Council Stated Meeting today, our
8 final one of the term. Also, on a personal note, I
9 just want to recognize because you couldn't possibly
10 avoid noting it, the presence of my family, my wife
11 Zoey and my two sons, Asher almost age 7 and Devin
12 who is age 4, as well as my father David Garodnick
13 and we're so glad that they are all able to be here
14 for this final meeting, and in this spirit, I would
15 like to make a motion to spread the Invocation in
16 full upon the record. Thank you.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: So be it. I want
18 to thank Reverend Dr. T. Kenjitsu-Nakagaki for that
19 beautiful prayer and we also want to welcome to the
20 Chambers Zoey, Asher, Devin and Mr. Garodnick.
21 Welcome. Adoption of Minutes. Council Member
22 Torres. [pause] Motion that the minutes of the
23 Stated Meeting of November 16, 2017 be adopted as
24 printed. Messages and papers from the Mayor.

25 CLERK: None.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication
3 from City, County and Borough Offices.

4 CLERK: None.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and
6 Communications.

7 CLERK: None.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call-
9 Ups.

10 CLERK: None.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
12 Chambers. Quiet in the Chambers, please as we now
13 hear from the Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madam
15 Public Advocate and good after. Buenos Tardes to
16 all my colleagues and everyone here in the Chamber.
17 As this legislation session draws to a close, I want
18 to thank all of my colleagues for their invaluable
19 support and friendship throughout all of these
20 years. Under this Council we were able to pass a
21 record a record of over 700 bills, and I'll speak a
22 little bit more towards the end of speaker time. I
23 also want to recognize the recent death of former
24 Assembly Member and Manhattan Representative Michael
25 Brian Hertaug (sp?) who passed away last week. We

2 will all miss him and remember him fondly. And as we
3 all saw yesterday, tragedy struck in Brooklyn. The
4 Azan Family had been celebrating Hanukkah when the
5 unthinkable occurred and a menorah went on fire. The
6 Azans lost their mother and three children. Our
7 hearts go out to Yossi Azan and the entire Azan
8 family during this very difficult time, and I would
9 like to ask Council Member Chaim Deutsch to say a
10 few words.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you, Madam
12 Speaker. Early yesterday morning my district
13 suffered the tragic loss of a mother, Aliza Azan and
14 her three young children in a house fire. Moshe was
15 11, Vitzchak was 7 and Henrietta was on 3 years old.
16 Their father, Yossi heroically saved the lives of
17 two of his teen-age children Shilat and Daniel. He
18 made every effort to attempt to charge back into the
19 burning home to rescue the others. The three are
20 still in critical condition receiving treatment for
21 injuries sustained during the fire. Our community
22 and our city has been stricken with grief at this
23 horrific loss. Yesterday's events is stark
24 reminder of the importance of fire safety. Please
25 remind your constituents to be—your constituents to

2 be extra careful with the candles and lights during
3 the holiday season. Once again, I want to express
4 my heartfelt condolences to the Azan family and the
5 entire community for this terrible loss. I ask you
6 all to join me in praying for a full recovery of
7 Yossi, Shilat and Daniel.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
9 Council Member Deutsch, and let's take a moment of
10 silence for our fellow New Yorkers.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: A moment of
12 silence, please. [moment of silence observed]

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Than you Madam
14 Public Advocate. Thank you to my colleagues.
15 [pause] Okay, now on a much lighter note we are--this
16 is something that I did not know until we came in
17 today. We want to congratulate our colleague
18 Council Member Antonio Reynoso and his wife.
19 [cheers/applause] [laughter] Everybody knows by
20 now? Yes. But Antonio and his wife Iliana welcome
21 their first child--

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
23 [shushing for quiet]

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --Alejandro--

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Please
3 keep it down.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --over the
5 weekend. So, to Antonio and to Iliana
6 congratulations. A really, really happy moment.
7 So, congratulations. Before we jump into the docket
8 for today, I wanted to just mention that I'm really
9 excited to announce that we are launching a new New
10 York City Council Legislative website located at
11 laws.council.nyc.gov. New York City Councilmatic
12 allows the public to more efficiently search the
13 Council's legislative information and pulls its data
14 directly from our legislative API. You can now sign
15 up for notifications about specific issues,
16 notifications from individual members or meetings
17 and this new site is iterative, which--iterative,
18 which means that the Council will continue to
19 improve it--improve it based on user feedback. So,
20 definitely we need people to give us feedback. I'm
21 proud to say that in my tenure as Speaker we have
22 transformed every single one of the Council's
23 digital assets. We have continued to focus on
24 people over products and this new tool aims to make
25 it easier for everyday New Yorkers to access the

2 Council's legislative information. By adopting
3 Councilmatic as an official government tool, we are
4 continuing to demonstrate our commitment to
5 transparency access and digital inclusion. I want
6 to thank Council Members Kallos, Vacca and Lander
7 for their dedication to these issues and to our
8 partners David Moore of the Participatory Politics
9 Foundation and Beta NYC and DataMade for pushing
10 this project forward. Then jumping right into the
11 docket, the Council is going to vote on a number of
12 land use items including the development of all
13 National Black Theater or the National Black Theater
14 in Manhattan, the rezoning of 1965 Lafayette Avenue
15 in the Bronx and the Self-Storage Text Amendment
16 that applies to various districts throughout the
17 city. I want to thank Raju Mann really much for his
18 work on this. Next, the Council will vote on
19 legislation concerning runaway youth. Intro 1705-A
20 sponsored by Council Member Rafael Salamanca will
21 require DHS and DYCD to create and maintain a
22 process while taking intake and assessments for any
23 runaway or homeless youth who are seeking to enter a
24 DHS shelter. Intro 1619-A sponsored by Council
25 Member Corey Johnson would require DYCD to provide a

2 biannual report on the number of runaway youth and
3 homeless youth who are not able to access runaway
4 and homeless youth shelters. For staff, I want to
5 thank Jeffrey Baker, Andrea Vazquez, Michael
6 Benjamin, Jessica Ackerman and Kiru Gishuru (sp?).
7 While Kiru is no longer at the Council, we want to
8 acknowledge and thank him for his work. I hope I
9 pronounced the last name correctly. Moving on we
10 will vote on a few transportation bills: Intro 1658
11 sponsored by Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez would
12 require the Department of Transportation and the
13 Parks Department to report annually on the number of
14 bollards installed throughout the city. I want to
15 thank on staff Jeffery Baker, Gafar Zaaloff, Malak
16 Nasser Rudeen (sp?), Jonathan Masserano, Emily
17 Rooney, Terzah Nasser and Andrea Vazquez. Intro
18 1397-A sponsored by Council member Steve Matteo
19 would set out conditions, which may apply when a
20 permit is issued to cut open a street within five
21 years or less after completion of a city capital
22 construction project, which required resurfacing or
23 reconstruction of the street. On staff, I want to
24 thank Jeffrey Baker, Balkese (sp?) Murad, Malak
25 Nasser Radeen, Jonathan Masserano, Emily Rooney,

2 Terzah Nasser and Andreas Vazquez. Next, the
3 Council will vote on Intro 1466 sponsored by
4 Majority Leader Jimmy Van Bramer. It would require
5 the Department of Parks and Rec to clean the
6 playground equipment after the spraying of
7 pesticides. On staff I want to thank Jeffrey Baker,
8 Chris Sartori, Patrick Mulvihill, Chima Obichere,
9 and Kenneth Grace. Moving on, we're going to vote on
10 a number of bills sponsored by Housing and Buildings
11 Committee Chair Jumaane Williams. Intro 1120-A
12 would require that the Department of Environmental
13 Protection be notified whenever excavation or
14 drilling to a depth greater than 50 feet is proposed
15 in the Bronx or north of 135th Street in Manhattan or
16 greater than 100 feet elsewhere in the City, and
17 Intro 1039-A would require the Department of
18 Housing, Preservation and Development to report on
19 the vacant buildings that may be suitable for the
20 development of affordable housing. I want to thank
21 on staff Jeffrey Baker, Megan Chin, Jose Conde and
22 Sarah Gastelum, and Introduction 1269-A sponsored by
23 Council Member Donovan Richards, which would require
24 the Department of Housing and Buildings to enter
25 into regulatory agreements with community land

2 trusts. I want to thank Jeffrey Baker, Megan Chin,
3 Jose Conde and Sarah Gastelum. Next, Council Member
4 will—next the Council will vote on Intro 1036-A
5 sponsored by Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez, which
6 would require the Department of Housing,
7 Preservation and Development to conduct an analysis
8 of vacant residential buildings and vacant lots. I
9 want to thank Jeff Baker, Megan Chin, Jose Conde and
10 Sarah Gastelum. Also, vote on Intro 1015-A
11 sponsored by Council Member Ben Kallos, which would
12 require HPD to establish a Housing Portal. I want to
13 thank Jeff Baker, Megan Chin, Jose Conde and Sarah
14 Gastelum. In addition, we'll be voting on
15 legislation by the Public Advocate Tish James, Intro
16 1009-A would require HPD to create an online
17 database for registered dwellings containing and
18 owner's information. Again, the same staff Jeff
19 Baker, Megan Chin, Jose Conde and Sarah Gastelum.
20 Moving on the Council will vote on Intro 385-C
21 sponsored by Council Member Rosie Mendez, which
22 requires dwelling owners to annually inspect units
23 for indoor allergen hazards. Also, vote on bills
24 sponsored by General Welfare Committee Chair Steve
25 Levin. Intro 1739-A would require HRA to issue an

2 annual report on the number of individuals and the
3 number of families who exit domestic violence
4 emergency shelters. I want to thank Jeff Baker,
5 Andrea Vazquez, Tonya Cyrus, Dohini Sompura, and
6 Amira Newzat. Intro 1714-A requires educational
7 continuity materials and information be provided to
8 families with children applying for shelters, and
9 Intro 1577-A, would require the Mayor's Office of
10 Operations to complete a study on client information
11 management systems. I want to thank Jeff Baker,
12 Aminta Kilawan, Andrea Vazquez, Terzah Nasser, Tonya
13 Cyrus and Amira Newzat. Also, Intro 855-B sponsored
14 by Council Member Ben Kallos would require the
15 Mayor's Office of Operations to produce a study
16 regarding the feasibility of notifying individuals
17 who apply for public assistance about other
18 assistance opportunities. I want to thank Jeff
19 Baker, Andrea Vazquez, Tonya Cyrus, Dohini Sompura
20 and Amira Newzat. Also Intro 572-A sponsored by
21 Council Member Liz Crowley, which would require the
22 Department of Homeless Services to post a daily
23 report Monday through Friday on its website with
24 information on the daily shelter census. The same
25 staff as before, Jeff Baker, Andrea Vazquez. Tonya

2 Cyrus, Dohini Sompura and Amira Newzat. The Council
3 will also vote on Intro 1632-A sponsored by Council
4 Member Dan Garodnick, which would require that
5 property owners post the information about a
6 building's energy efficiency in a conspicuous place.
7 I want to thank Jeff Baker, Megan Chin, Samara
8 Swanston, Nadia Johnson and Jonathan Seltzer. Next,
9 the Council will vote on a couple of bills sponsored
10 by Environmental Protection Chair Costa
11 Constantinides. Intro 54-A would ~~the~~ the use of
12 alternative fuels and alternative fuel technologies
13 in the city ferry fleet. It's going to log and
14 register the use of alternative fuels. Jeff Baker,
15 Samara Swanston, Nadia Johnson and Jonathan Seltzer,
16 and Intro 1629-A would require the Department of
17 Buildings to submit proposed amendments to make the
18 City's Energy Code match the model stretch code
19 created by the New York State Energy Research and
20 Development Authority. I want to thank Jeff Baker,
21 Megan Chin, Samara Swanston, Nadia Johnson and
22 Jonathan Seltzer. We're also going to be voting on
23 Intro 1465-A sponsored by Council Member Ritchie
24 Torres, which would accelerate the timeline for such
25 plants to shift from using higher grade fuel oil.

2 Intro 978-D also sponsored by Council Member Ritchie
3 Torres would establish minimum standards for
4 carrying out mold assessment, mold abatement and
5 mold remediation for certain buildings. Jeff Baker,
6 Samara Swanston, Nadia Johnson and Jonathan Seltzer.
7 Moving on, the Council will vote on Intro 717-A
8 sponsored by Council Member Helen Rosenthal, which
9 would require reporting on idling complaints and
10 their dispositions. We're going to also vote on
11 another bill sponsored by Council Member Rosenthal,
12 Intro 880-A, which would require a review of the use
13 of the biodiesel fuel in school buses. Next, we're
14 going to vote on Intro 1653-B sponsored by Council
15 Member Ben Kallos, which would require DEP to review
16 responses to noise complaints, and also Intro 1616-A
17 sponsored by Council Member Danny Dromm would create
18 a temporary task force to address reentry issues
19 that older adults face when returning from state
20 prisons and local jails, and then I think Danny
21 might give a very compelling case about a 65-year-
22 old person been in jail 20 years. Imagine what, you
23 know, having to try to reintegrate, how do you do
24 that successfully if there's no assistance. So,
25 very important legislation. Thank you for that.

2 Also, Intro 1185-A sponsored by Council Member Chaim
3 Deutsch would require DFTA to regularly provide
4 written materials from OEM to senior centers and
5 NORCs on how to register with the utility company if
6 they use life-sustaining medical equipment or are an
7 individual for whom a disruption in electrical
8 services would create a medical emergency. I want to
9 thank Jeff Baker, Caitlin Fahey, Emily Rooney,
10 Andrea Vazquez and Terzah Nasser. In addition, the
11 council will vote on Intro 1399-A sponsored by
12 Council member Debbie Rose, which will protect
13 employees who seek temporary changes to work
14 schedules for persona events and certain other
15 scheduled changes. I thank Jeff Baker, Terzah
16 Nasser, an Annie Decker, Matthew Carlin, Alexis
17 Wazenberg-Wanzenberg and Kevin Kotowski. Next we
18 vote on legislation sponsored by Council Member
19 Laure Cumbo, Intro 1615-A. It would require SBS to
20 develop and make available to all contracting
21 agencies a subcontractor resource guide. Jeff
22 Baker, Alex Paulenoff, Nadia Johnson, and Alia Ali.
23 Next, we're going to vote on Intro 1486-A sponsored
24 by Council Member Ben Kallos, which would require
25 the DOE to report the number of students who applied

2 to, received and offer of admission for and enrolled
3 in schools in grades Pre-K, Kindergarten, 6 and 9 in
4 schools in each community school district as well as
5 the anticipated number of school seats available in
6 each school. Jeffrey Baker, Smita Deshmkh, Andrea
7 Vazquez, and Terzah Nasser. Thanks for working on
8 those bills. The Council will also vote on Intro
9 1497-A sponsored by Council Member Rafael Salamanca,
10 which would require DOE to publish an annual report
11 on students in temporary housing. The Council will
12 then vote on Intro 1604-A, sponsored by Council
13 Member Rosie Mendez, which would require the Mayor's
14 Office of Operations or other agencies designated by
15 the Mayor to review the official forms of certain
16 designated city agencies to determine whether they
17 are eligible for updating to be updated to include
18 voluntary questions regarding individuals' gender
19 pronouns and if so, eligible to update such forms.
20 Intro 804-A sponsored by Council Member Inez Barron
21 who would require reasonable accommodations for
22 individuals with disabilities under the New York
23 City Human Rights Law. Jeff Baker, Emanuel Halu
24 (sp?), Annie Decker and Rachel Cordero. I'm proud
25 to discuss the final bills of which I sponsored,

2 Intro 1499-A would require the Commissioner of
3 Sanitation and DCA to study the feasibility of
4 penalty mitigation program. Jeff Baker, Sylvester
5 Yavana, Nicole La Bien, Jennifer Wilcox, Megan Chin,
6 Michael Kurtz, Terzah Nasser, and Andrea Vazquez.
7 Thank you and Intro 1419-A would allow the city to
8 recover penalties for construction site safety
9 violations that result in or accompanied by death or
10 serious physical injury. And Intro 1012-A would
11 amend the New York City Human Rights Law to improve
12 its organizational structure and enhance its
13 clarity. Jeff Baker, Annie Decker, Michelle Lee,
14 Juanita John, Emanuel Hailu, and Malak Masur Radeen.
15 (sp?) And finally, the Council will vote on what is
16 commonly known as the Right to Know Act. Intro 182-
17 D sponsored by Council Ritchie Torres would require
18 that all sworn police officers employed by the NYPD
19 offer a business card to an individual during
20 certain police interactions, and give reason for the
21 law enforcement activity. Intro 541-C sponsored by
22 Council Member Reynoso would require the NYPC to
23 develop and provide guidance to its officers with
24 respect to obtaining voluntary knowing and
25 intelligent consent prior to conducting a search

2 that is based solely on an individuals' consent. I
3 want to thank Deepa Ambekar, Casey Addison, Steve
4 Riester, so many people that worked on this. I
5 really appreciate it, and that completed the
6 highlights of the docket. So, again just
7 reiterating as we all know today is the last Stated
8 of 2017, and my final Stated as Speaker of the New
9 York City Council. Twelve years ago when I was
10 first sworn in as the first Latina, the first Puerto
11 Rican to represent my district of El Barrio East
12 Harlem and the Bronx. I tried to process what that
13 all meant. I was a labor organizer, a community
14 activist of Museo Del Barrio not a politician. But
15 I knew as a council member I had a real chance to be
16 a voice for all those in our city. For-for too long
17 having cast aside and silenced the poor, the
18 undocumented [speaking Spanish] and every single New
19 Yorkers who felt that there was more to be done to
20 make our great city more responsive, fair, and just
21 for our people. Above all else, justice has been
22 the driving force behind every significant step or
23 decision I've made as a Council Member as Speaker,
24 and it's that quest for justice that has driven this
25 Council to act as it never has before. We provided

2 free legal services to those who would otherwise not
3 have representation in immigration court. We
4 invested in our youth, our immigrant communities and
5 all vulnerable New Yorkers, and not only did we kick
6 ICE off Rikers Island, we got the Mayor to agree to
7 close it. That is the legacy I am proud and I'm
8 hoping to leave behind. By now—by now everyone knows
9 who I am and where I came from, and I can't say
10 enough about how incredibly honored and grateful I
11 am to have the privilege to lead this body. All of
12 our success could not have been done without your
13 support. I am a defender of this institution. I
14 understand its value. I believe in its value, and
15 in this—in governing the city of New York. You all
16 understand that as well, defended members and stood
17 up against criticism for that, and I will continue
18 to do that. So, I've been honored and grateful and
19 it's a privilege to lead this body, and really
20 incredible that coming here at the age of 18 really
21 not having any networks in this city, and not really
22 understanding how this city worked or how it was
23 governed, but I've been able through hard work to
24 and commitment been able to arrive at this position
25 is definitely truly what come and strive to the

2 country for, and I'm really proud of that. So,
3 that's [bell] who we are. That is who I am, and
4 because this legislative body will be nothing
5 without all of you who have been at my side for
6 eight and now twelve year. We turned a Speaker
7 driven institution into one where members have had a
8 real say in things. Even when we didn't always
9 agree, we always listened. Visiting our
10 communities, visiting your communities, meeting your
11 constituents and learning about the challenges
12 facing your districts has made me a better person
13 and a more compassionate legislator. So for that I
14 want to thank each and every one of you. To my
15 colleagues, to the staff, and to all those who held
16 us accountable by testifying at hearings, to aiding
17 complaints, a rally on the steps of City Hall, I
18 thank you, and I thank my colleagues, but obviously
19 the staff of this institution is incredibly
20 professional. You have made us proud, and we
21 definitely want to salute each and every one of you.
22 I think we can all say right that we thank the staff
23 for all the work [cheers/applause] that they've done
24 in this session. [cheers/applause] You know, and
25 I—you know I could go on and on, you know, talking

2 about stuff, but look I obviously I'm supported by a
3 very strong team. I deeply, deeply appreciate
4 everyone in the Speaker's Office, all of our
5 division heads who have demonstrated incredible-
6 incredible leadership in your own right. Latonia
7 coming in to being the Finance Director, right.
8 [cheers/applause] You know, having--you know,
9 having Camille in that Administrative Division,
10 having Robin in our Communications Division,
11 [applause] having Erica in-in the division that she
12 leads, and having obviously Ramon and Joey and Joe.
13 [cheers/applause] They've all--they've all seen my
14 growth in many ways as well, and--and I'm really
15 proud to have worked alongside each and every one of
16 you. So, I don't--people ask me what are your
17 regrets. I don't have regrets because we have to
18 use every opportunity as growing experience, and
19 maybe you're not 100% thrilled. You're not 100%
20 happy with a particular issue, but those are
21 alerting opportunities and this has been the most
22 productive legislative session and we should all be
23 proud of that because we're making the city a better
24 city for all New Yorkers for every single New
25 Yorkers who often times feels invisible or feels

2 disrespected or-or disenfranchised. That is not who
3 we are as a city. And so, our work has been to
4 really make it a more equitable city, and-and we've
5 done an incredible amount of work in four years.
6 So, thank you for your partnership and to all of
7 those that are leaving office as well, term limited,
8 we'll all be civilians as of January 1st and excited
9 about the new Latin life and the opportunities that
10 will bring. So, thank you all very much. This
11 place, this City Hall would be nothing without each
12 and every one of you. So, thank you so much.
13 [cheers/applause] Thank you all. So, I-I didn't-I
14 didn't write my last comments down. So, obviously
15 told that make sure we-Laura Popa, where are you,
16 Laura. Oh, you're right here. [cheers/applause]
17 When-and Rob Newman and everybody else that this
18 incredible number of bills that we have passed oh,
19 my God it's just incredible. So, you guys have been
20 the driving force behind all of that and Jeff Baker
21 and everyone else. So, I could name names, but you
22 all have been deeply important to me personally and-
23 and this is just a dream job, and a dream
24 opportunity and I look forward to exploring other
25 opportunities in the future as well. So, with that,

2 I will end Communication from Speaker. [applause]

3 The last communication from the Speaker.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Discussion of
5 General Orders beginning with Council Member Torres.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [off mic]

7 FEMALE SPEAKER: Your microphone.

8 [background comments]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [on mic]

10 Perfect. Okay. [background comments]

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Can you switch
12 seats? Yeah, right. [background comments, pause]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Divine
14 intervention. [laughter] I want to -first I'm-I'm
15 internally grateful for the Speaker. You know, this
16 has been the most challenging week of my political
17 life and you have stood with me unwaveringly at
18 every turn, and so from the bottom of my heart I
19 want to thank you. I love you and it's been an
20 honor to serve under your leadership. I'm the
21 youngest elected official in New York City. The
22 humiliation of a street encounter is no extraction
23 to me. It is a pain that I have felt deeply and
24 repeatedly in my own life. I know from my own lived
25 experience as well as from years of negotiation that

2 Intro 182 will improve the kind of street level
3 policing that I painfully experienced as an
4 adolescent and as an adult. Intro 182 is the most
5 comprehensive police reform that the City Council
6 has ever undertaken. Never before has the City
7 Council set standards of accountability and
8 transparency aimed at improving the everyday street
9 encounters between police and civilians. Intro 182
10 once enacted will require every single officer to
11 have a business card. The business cards will
12 include the name, rank, shield number, and command
13 of the officer. It will include the number to 311
14 where a civilian can go to express concerns,
15 compliments or complaints about the conduct of an
16 officer. It will include the website where a
17 civilian can go to require video footage of the
18 street encounter. Every officer will be required to
19 provide a business card upon request in every single
20 interaction. Every officer will be required to
21 provide a business card proactively regardless of
22 request. In every Level 2, Level 3 and Level 4
23 interaction. Level 2 interactions consist of
24 investigatory questioning based on the suspicion of
25 criminal activity. Level 3 interactions consist of

2 stop, question and frisk. Level 4 interactions
3 consist of searchers as well as arrests. These are
4 the most intensive and intrusive interactions that
5 have been the subject of most civilian complaints.
6 Asking for an ID card in the midst of an escalating
7 encounter runs the risk of deepening tensions. The
8 point of Intro 82 is to demand proactive
9 identification as a means of deescalating the very
10 street encounters that do escalate. When a street
11 encounter escalates to the level of accusatory
12 questioning, or escalates to the level of stop,
13 question and frisk, or escalates to the level of a
14 search, that encounter immediately will become
15 subject to a proactive ID requirement. Intro 182
16 proactively deescalates that which escalates. The
17 historical context here is worth considering. The
18 Right to Know Act was originally part of the
19 Community Safety Act, which emerged against the
20 backdrop of Stop and Frisk policing. At the height
21 of Stop and Frisk policing, there were 700,000 stops
22 in the City of New York. If Intro 182 had been the
23 law back in 2011, every single one of those 700,000
24 stops would have been subject to the proactive ID
25 requirement. By way of further illustration,

2 compare Intro 182 to the famous federal court
3 decision in *Floyd versus New York City*. In *Floyd*,
4 the Federal Court required the NYPD to provide tear-
5 offs for Level 3 encounters. By contrast, Intro 182
6 will require the NYPD to provide pre-printed cards
7 which are more reliable than handwritten tear-offs
8 and it will require those pre-printed cards to be
9 distributed not only at Level 3 but Level 2, Level 3
10 and Level 4 interactions. We'll compare Intro 182 to
11 the Community Safety Act. The Community Safety Act
12 established new office, which is something the
13 Council has done before. It created a private right
14 of action in court, which is something the Council
15 has done before. By contrast, Intro 182 regulates
16 the day-to-day street encounters between police and
17 civilians which is something the Council has never
18 done. It is historic, it is unprecedented, it is
19 real reform in the truest sense of the word. Well,
20 compare intro 182 to Intro 541. Intro 541 only
21 applies to consent searchers, which makes up a
22 narrow subset of enforcement actions. By contrast,
23 Intro 182 affects every single police-civilian
24 interaction, and it has the greatest deescalating
25 effect on the very police-civilian interactions that

2 end up escalating. There are those who might be
3 wondering why I've chosen to proceed with a
4 compromise. Why did I not discharge or why did I
5 not delay the bill until the next legislative
6 session. Here is the reason I chose compromise.
7 Progress in the present does not foreclose the
8 possibility of even more progress in the future. If
9 there are imperfections in Intro 182, there is
10 nothing in the compromise that prevents a new
11 Council Member from introducing a new bill aimed at
12 correcting those very imperfections. Progress is a
13 floor, not a ceiling. It is a foundation on which
14 to build deeper reforms in the future. Here's the
15 reason I decided against delaying Intro 182. Young
16 people of color who live the reality of street
17 encounters every day cannot afford to wait. Young
18 people of color I know cannot afford to be delayed
19 by the purity of politicians and advocates who can
20 afford to wait. We owe it to those young people to
21 forge ahead in a progressive, but pragmatic spirit
22 that recognize what Dr. Martin Luther King calls the
23 fierce urgency of now. The next City Council will
24 likely be more conservative than the present one.
25 The political landscape will likely be more hostile

2 to police reform. I have concluded in good faith it
3 is better to legislate as much progress as we can in
4 the immediate term and to let police reform languish
5 at the mercy of a more conservative City Council.
6 Here is the reason I decided against discharging
7 Intro 182. If we had gone forward with a discharge
8 over the vehement objections of the Administration,
9 the Mayor would have refused to implement the law,
10 which is his legal right. The NYPD would have sued
11 us. We would have embroiled ourselves in years of
12 litigation, and since we are admittedly legislating
13 an uncharted territory, there is a real risk that a
14 court would have struck down these laws. I have
15 concluded in good faith it is better to guarantee
16 progress in the immediate term than to risk emerging
17 empty handed in the long run. And finally, here is
18 the reason I chose cooperation rather than
19 confrontation with the NYPD. Real reform not only
20 requires a change in law, it requires a deeper
21 change in culture. A culture shift is most
22 successful when it commands the buy-in and the
23 cooperation of the very institution whose culture
24 you seek to change. We have searing memories of
25 2014 when an open revolt broke out in the rank and

2 file of the Police Department. If we can pursue a
3 path to police reform without provoking an upheaval
4 in the NYPD, then why not do so? Why not pursue
5 police reform zealously but responsibly? The
6 reality of the City Council is that we can only
7 change the status quo at a rate that the system can
8 absorb, and the reality is that we as Council
9 Members cannot implement our own laws. We are
10 inevitably dependent on agencies like the NYPD for
11 the implementation of our laws and that inevitable
12 dependency demands compromise and cooperation. The
13 need for a deep change in culture rather than a
14 surface change in law demands compromise and
15 cooperation. Traffic Stops: Here is the risk of
16 covering traffic stops. With the Criminal Justice
17 Reform Act we have been moving the city in the
18 direction of fewer arrests and fewer summonses,
19 fewer coercive interactions between police and
20 civilians. When it comes to traffic violations,
21 officers often have the discretion to issue warning
22 in the place of summonses. If you require officers
23 conducting traffic stops to proactively provide a
24 business card that contains a number that you can
25 call to complain about them, the PBA will likely

2 direct their officers to issue formal summonses
3 instead of informal warnings in order to main an
4 official—maintain an official paper trail that
5 protects them from litigation. And so, I had to ask
6 myself a hard question as a legislator: Should I do
7 what the advocates have demanded of me and derail a
8 hard fought and historic compromise over something
9 that could have the unintended affect of generating
10 hundreds of thousands of summonses in New York City.
11 I concluded the answer should be no. Even though
12 about a year ago I stood firmly and forcefully in
13 opposition to the administrative agreement that the
14 Speaker negotiated, I've come to realize the wisdom
15 of the Speaker's long gain. She has taken an
16 approach that in the words of Theodore Roosevelt
17 speaks quietly but carries a big stick, an approach
18 that eases the NYPD, an entrenched institution if
19 there ever was one into and ever greater acceptance
20 of reform. The city is better and fairer because of
21 the Speaker's patient but persistent advocacy, and
22 when the Speaker brokered the Administrative
23 Agreement, there were those who predicated at the
24 time that proceeding with the agreement would make
25 it harder to pass the Right to Know Act, but

2 experience tells us that this simply has not been
3 so. The Administrative Agreement made it easier to
4 pass the Right to Know Act, and passing the Right to
5 Know Act even in the present form will make it
6 easier to progress even further in the future. I
7 will end on—on these final notes: Advocates for
8 police reform have every right to expect a seat at
9 the table. Advocates have every right to make their
10 voices heard even loudly and vitriolically, but no
11 advocate should ever have veto power over the
12 legislative agenda of the New York City Council.
13 And like the Speaker, I, too, have no regrets. I
14 stand by what I've chosen to do even if it means
15 standing alone, even if it means straining in
16 severing political relationships, even if it means
17 I'm no longer beloved in progressive circles. Even
18 if it means I have no future in progressive
19 politics. I remain convinced as I have ever been
20 that I'm doing the right thing in moving the ball
21 forward and I am at peace with the path that I have
22 chosen. Thank you, Madam Speaker. [cheers/applause]

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
24 Chambers, please. Quiet in the Chambers.

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
3 down.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
5 Reynoso.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Hello.

7 [laughter] Try-try to follow that up. [background
8 comments] Well, mine is going to be a lot shorter
9 and sweeter because I actually want to get out of
10 here laughter] as soon as possible so I can be with
11 my newborn son. [applause] [background comments]
12 Before I begin, I want to personally recognize Laura
13 Popa and Deepa Ambekar for their hard work that they
14 put together to have these two bills move forward
15 here in the City Council. I also want to thank
16 Ramon Martinez, and Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito
17 who will always-always have my back when I was
18 fighting against the Administration to make sure
19 that these bills happened. I also want to thank our
20 Speaker for the great that she's done over the last
21 four years. It truly is a model and a lesson to
22 leadership on how she conducted herself and how she
23 has pushed us forward in what I consider the most
24 progressive Council in the history of our Council,
25 which is not too long, but still important. I also

2 want to give a farewell to all my outgoing
3 colleagues. We love you very much. This Council
4 has been an amazing place and your leadership and
5 our wisdom has been extremely helpful. Working with
6 all of you in my first terms has at times been
7 challenging, but always a rewarding experience. I
8 wish you all the absolute best in the future
9 endeavors. The road to bring the Right to Know Act
10 to a vote has not been easy. Since being introduced
11 in 2014, we have faced multiple roadblocks and
12 challenges. However, we have persevered and pushed
13 police reform to bring about true justice. Intro
14 541 will increase transparency and accountability
15 regarding unconstitutional searches or ones that
16 have no legal basis. It will require consent to
17 search their non-emergency encounters. New Yorkers
18 are often unaware that they have the right to refuse
19 a search when an officer does not have legal
20 justification for it, and even if they do know their
21 rights, they can often be uncomfortable or
22 prohibited from exercising it because of fear of
23 escalation by the officer. There is a power
24 imbalance when you are being asked to empty out your
25 pockets by someone with a gun. However, by

2 increasing NYPD accountability and transparency we
3 can build trust between communities and the NYPD.
4 For communities of color that are disproportionately
5 affected by increased policing, this bill empowers
6 us. It protects us and prevents discriminatory
7 based interactions with the Police Department. We
8 have to defend ourselves against an administration
9 and their attacks on immigration—on immigrant
10 communities who are often the target of abusive
11 policing. As local officials, we must enact reforms
12 at the local level like this that help reduce
13 unnecessary and abusive police interactions
14 everyday. This is what it means to be a true
15 sanctuary city. I want to thank the Speaker and her
16 legislative team as well as the Mayor and his team
17 for their support in the last two months to get this
18 bill over the finish line. I would like to thank
19 the Progressive Caucus and their Director Zara
20 Marcias (sp?) for their early support of the bill as
21 well as Council Members Williams and Lander who in
22 2013 set the bar with the Community Safety Act. I
23 want to thank my staff and my former Legislative
24 Director Lacey Tauber who left my office just last
25 week. Her work on this bill was instrumental. I

2 would also like to recognize all of my Council
3 colleagues who co-sponsored this bill to advance
4 social justice in the city of New York as well as
5 Ritchie Torres my partner in crime, no pun intended
6 [laughter] [coughs] for his-- We're not real
7 criminals. For his partnership in this process.
8 Finally, I must recognize Communities United for
9 Police Reform and its members and partners and 200
10 plus organizations in the Right to Know Act
11 Coalition. I'll be as quick as possible here. It's
12 not 200. Make the Road New York, Malcolm X
13 Grassroots Movement, Picture the Homeless, New York
14 City Liberties Union, Legal Aid Society, Justice
15 Committee, Jay Fledge (sp?), Moms Rising, Bronx
16 Defenders, Arab American Association for New York,
17 Brooklyn Movement Center, Center for Popular
18 Democracy, Drug Policy Association; Girls for Gender
19 Equity, Fierce, Latino Justice, Pro Deaf, NAACP,
20 Legal Defense Fund, New York City Anti-Violence
21 Project, Rockaway Youth Task Force, Vocal New York,
22 National Action Network, Justice League, New York
23 State Conference of NAACP, Color of Change, New York
24 Communities for Changes, CAAAV, Organizing Asian
25 Communities, Youth Represent, The Close Rikers

2 Campaign, 32BJ and 1199, New York Working Families
3 Party, Faith in New York and many other
4 organizations. And to all of the families of those
5 who have lost loved ones unjustly—unjustly in police
6 incidents who have been fighting for the Right to
7 Know Act, somewhere here in chambers for the vote
8 today including the families of Eric Garner, Darren
9 Small, John Corrado, Chantel Davis, Anthony Biaz,
10 Anthony Rosario, Hilton Vega, Amadou (sp?) Diallo or
11 Marty Graham, Akai Gurley, Sean Bell, Yonson Vaughn
12 (sp?), Kamanni Gray, Mohammed Bah, Kenny Lazzo,
13 Jason Thiallo (sp?) and Rio Orumadin (sp?). I am
14 proud of this bill. As a father who has welcomed my
15 son to this world just four days ago, I cannot tell
16 you how much this bill personally means to me. The
17 work that I do and the district that I represent.
18 So, I want to thank you all and encourage you to
19 vote aye on all. Thank you.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Alejandro would
21 be proud. Council Member Deutsch.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you.
23 Today, we are voting on Intro 1185, my bill to
24 require the Department for the Aging to conduct
25 outreach in multiple languages to educate seniors

2 who rely on life sustaining equipment about how to-
3 how important it is to register their home address
4 with their utility company.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
6 [shushing for quiet]

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
8 down, please. Keep it down. Quiet please.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
10 [shushing for quiet]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: This information
12 will be posted on the Department for the Aging's
13 website on DFTA's website as well as shared with
14 senior centers and NORCs throughout the city.
15 Having their home address registered ensures that in
16 the event of a power outage emergency services are
17 immediately aware of homes that may require a
18 generator or transportation to a medical facility.
19 The utility company will also prioritize these homes
20 for repair. For example, when phone lines were down
21 after Hurricane Sandy, many were trapped in their
22 homes without any means of alerting first responders
23 to their location. Those who relied on medical
24 equipment to help them breathe were in particular
25 danger this would not be the case if these older

2 adults were registered with their utility companies.
3 The more you know the better off you are and I urge
4 my colleagues to vote in support of Intro 1185, a
5 bill that can truly save lives. I want to thank
6 Caitlin Fahey and Emily Rooney for their work on
7 this bill. Thank you.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Quiet
9 in the Chambers, please. Council Member—

10 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet,
11 please.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
13 Garodnick.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: [coughs]
15 Thank you very much. I want to ask my colleagues to
16 support Intro 1632-A, which is a bill that would
17 require large buildings to post their energy
18 efficiency scores and associated grades near their
19 public entrances. New York's buildings account for
20 two-thirds of the energy that our city consumers and
21 are our biggest contributors to global warming.
22 Since we passed local 8—Local Law 84 in 2009, a law
23 that I'm proud to have authored. New York buildings
24 over a certain size have been required to annually
25 measure their energy and water consumption in a

2 process called benchmarking. The law standardized
3 this process by requiring building owners to enter
4 their annual energy and water use in the U.S.
5 Environmental Protection Agency's online tool Energy
6 Start Portfolio Manager and to use the tool to
7 submit data to the city. The scores generated by
8 this tool indicate how efficient a building is
9 relative to comparable buildings. Originally, the
10 requirement applied only to buildings over 50,000
11 square feet and we broadened it to include those
12 over 25,000 square feet. With Intro 1632-A we are
13 taking the next step. Going forward, buildings will
14 be assigned a letter grade based on their energy
15 score, and will be required to post that grade along
16 with the energy score in a conspicuous location near
17 their public entrances. This will make information
18 about building energy use easily available to
19 tenants and visitors including prospective tenants
20 and building purchasers and presented in the easily
21 understood form of a grade. This transparency
22 initiative will promote interest in, and better
23 understanding of energy use by our city's buildings.
24 Tenants and buyers who value energy efficiency will
25 push building owners to improve. They will reap the

2 financial benefits, and all of us will reap the
3 environmental benefits. I'm pleased to help New
4 York move toward a more sustainable future, and I
5 hope you will all join me in supporting this
6 legislation. Madam Public Advocate, I see I have
7 nine seconds and perhaps I'm the first on a clock
8 today, but I just want to take a point of personal
9 privilege for my final meeting. It will take about
10 30 seconds.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I just wanted
13 to say thank you to my constituents for the
14 opportunity to have served in this City Council over
15 the past 12 years. It has been a tremendous honor
16 for me to represent the community where I was born
17 and raised, and Madam Speaker, to you and to all of
18 my colleagues, thank you for your years of
19 friendship and collaboration. I have truly enjoyed
20 it. I have learned from all of you, and I know that
21 there will be many opportunities for further
22 collaboration, and I look forward to that. To my
23 staff, some of whom are here and some of whom have
24 moved on to other things, I thank you for being just
25 so good at what you. I'm eternally grateful for

2 your time and person sacrifices. I expect great
3 things of all of you, and I am here to support you
4 in whatever you need. And of course to my family,
5 my wife Zoey, my dad David Garodnick, my two boys
6 Asher and Devon, I love you all very much. I'm so
7 happy to be on this journey with you. I also want
8 to mention my mom Barbara who was here on my first
9 day 12 years ago, but passed away nearly four years
10 ago. Mom, I miss you everyday and I know that you
11 are watching over all of us. So, on the occasion of
12 this final meeting, again, please do accept my
13 thanks and appreciation and also, please do join me
14 in voting for Intro 1632. [laughter] [applause]

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: May your mother
16 rest in peace and Mr. Garodnick, Senior, you should
17 be very proud of your son. Council Member Kallos.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Residents call my
19 officer everyday seeking affordable housing. Thanks
20 to a hero whistleblower at Department of Housing,
21 Preservation and Development, Steven Warner. We
22 learned through Propublica that at least 50,000
23 units of affordable housing were not being
24 registered with the state, which meant landlords
25 receiving an estimated \$100 million in taxpayer

2 dollars might not be offering them as they promised.
3 Introduction 1015-A requires all new and existing
4 city subsidized affordable housing to register
5 annually or face escalating fines, offer new and for
6 the first time existing units through Housing
7 Connects and provides transparency around these
8 affordable Housing units and who manages them.
9 Thank you to Propublica, whistleblower and HPD
10 Analyst Steven Warner, OSC President Robert Cron for
11 protecting his members' whistleblower rights,
12 Housing Chair and co-sponsor Jumaane Williams and
13 Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito, Jeff Baker, Ed Atkin
14 and Megan Chin for a very tough, but successful
15 negotiations. New York City may be the city that
16 never sleeps, but that shouldn't be because of after
17 hours construction noise waking you up. Noise is a
18 top complaint in New York City with booming
19 construction surrounding residents who complain only
20 to see their concerns go unaddressed for days, or
21 met with a small fine paid developers as a cost of
22 doing business. After hours noise will be targeted
23 by Introduction 1653-B with new rule for responding
24 when noise is still happening or likely to happen
25 again. Turning down the volume on after hours

2 construction noise in residential neighborhoods over
3 the next two years and empowering the Department of
4 Environmental Protection to shut down equipment
5 that's too loud. Thank you to the Department of
6 Environmental Protection Commissioner Vincent
7 Sapienza for his agency's partnership, Environmental
8 Committee Chair Costa Constantinides for his co-
9 sponsorship and support and Speaker Melissa Mark-
10 Viverito for standing up for residents and Jim
11 Wilcox and Samara Swanston for their hard work
12 drafting and negotiating this legislation. Please
13 also vote for Introduction 855-B and the school
14 tracking legislation.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
16 Council Member Richards.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I want to talk
18 on community land trusts. Today, we take a critical
19 step toward taking power away from speculators and
20 giving land back to local communities and non-
21 profits that serve them. Intro 1269 will not only
22 define community land trust for the first time in
23 New York City law, but it would also require that
24 the community land trust enters into a 99-year
25 ground lease agreement ensuring land will remain

2 affordable for generations. In order to fully grow
3 in force with the city, we need to not only build
4 affordable housing, but we must also increase
5 opportunities for affordable homeownership. I'd
6 like to thank our Speaker, Jim Wilcox and Megan Chin
7 and the New York City Community Land Initiative and
8 my Legislative Director--

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
10 [shushing for quiet]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --Jordan
12 Gibbons and Matt Dan-Danbar (sp?) as well. I'm
13 going to take the liberty of speaking on Intro 182.
14 First off, I would like to commend Council Members
15 Reynoso and Torres for their courageousness in
16 taking up these bills known as the Right to Know
17 Act. I must admit over the last few days I've
18 struggled on the ID bill Intro 182 because I'm one
19 who truly believes that we must not let--

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
21 [shushing for quiet]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --perfect be
23 the enemy--

24 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
25 down, please.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: -of good, but
3 in this circumstance, my own personal interactions
4 as a young black man and even as a Council Member
5 with DWB driving, Driving While Black and Stop and
6 Frisk has me concerned that this compromise won't
7 lead to addressing the underlying causes have sown
8 mistrust between communities and the Police
9 Department. Let's be clear. The most common
10 interactions between police and my constituents are
11 Level 1 and traffic stops whether the data shows it
12 or not. And while I applaud all the stakeholders
13 who put in countless hours to arrive at this
14 compromise, as a father of a two-year-old black boy,
15 who will one day encounter a Level 1 stop, I cannot
16 support this bill in its current form. If you can
17 give me a few more minutes, Madam Speaker. You
18 know, when I was--Madam Public Advocate. When I--when
19 I was elected in 2013, there was mother who called
20 my office because her 12-year-old--

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
22 Council Member--

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I'm going to
24 speed it up.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: If you can bring
3 your comments to a close, we would appreciate that.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And—and his
5 experience being stop and frisk coming out of a
6 vehicle forced me to--

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
8 Council Member, I apologize.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --not
10 compromise on this issue today.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
12 Council Member, I apologize. You're--

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: [interposing]
14 I'm going to—I'm going to shut up--

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: --out of order at
16 this point.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --but-but this
18 bill does not resolve the issue. We—we have--

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
20 Thank you.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --a long way to
22 go in the city--

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
24 Thank you, Council Member.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --and Level 1s
3 are still the interaction most common in our
4 communities.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
6 Council Member--

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing]
8 We're not--we're not--we still--

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: With that I-I
10 vote. [applause]

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: -- we're not
12 going to--

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I vote no on--

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: You're not voting
15 yet.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Oh, we're not
17 voting. Okay.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: But we are going
19 to stick to the two-minute clock here. You
20 obviously have an opportunity when you vote to speak
21 again, I would ask. Thank you.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
23 Council Member Williams.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you,
25 Madam Public Advocate. My comments with all due

2 respect to Council Member Reynoso and Council Member
3 Torres who have spent countless hours in here, they
4 are not in opposition to the sincerity that Council
5 Member Torres spoke. I will not be a part of any
6 tactics that attack him personally. I believe that
7 he actually is sincere in what he is saying and
8 believes is the right thing to do, and I want to
9 respect that. A few years ago four bills of the
10 Community Safety Act would have been here, and
11 there's a precedent set of us taking two of those
12 bills and laying them aside simply because we
13 thought it had not gone far enough, and that is what
14 we were asking for it to happen here. Just to
15 dispel a few myths, the advocates are not asking for
16 100%. The people who are voting no are not asking
17 for 100%. This is not about compromise. This is
18 about compromise that is worth it, and we should not
19 let the perfect be the enemy of the good, but we
20 should not let the good be the enemy of what's
21 necessary when we have the ability to do it. Case in
22 point: Three of the bills have passed. One of them
23 were passed today. It is not what all the advocates
24 wanted, but it is a compromise that met the
25 threshold of the capital colloquial that put in

2 already, and the difficult discussion that we have
3 to have going forward. Intro 119 is a bill I passed
4 that the advocates did not agree with. Just for
5 an example: If a police officer asked me for my ID,
6 and asked where I am going, that is not an
7 investigatory—it doesn't—so that is not a criminal
8 stop in my ID when they will not give me a card
9 under this bill. That is a majority of stops that
10 are included. The fact that traffic stops are not
11 included means also that the majority of stops are
12 not included in this bill. What was asked for was
13 an investigatory stops to be included. It is
14 correct that any of the bill we could have taken
15 away Level 2 stops. It still would have moved the
16 ball forward, but not enough to pass the bill now
17 amending a bill is not as easy as folks are making
18 it seem. It's been four years since we passed this
19 bill. We waited for the last possible moment for a
20 zero sum game. Madam Public Advocate, because
21 others were given more time [bell] I'm asking for an
22 additional minute. I'm going to take a minute.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing]
24 We're not going to entertain that. I have—I have the
25 benefit. I—I asked and I gave both sponsors of the

2 bill extra time. People have time when they vote to
3 again discuss this issue. I'm going to ask that we
4 maintain the two minutes here in General Orders.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [interposing]

6 So, why did you put that two minutes--?

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing] The
8 general discussion. When you vote--

9 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [interposing]

10 The vote has started.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --you can feel
12 free. The sponsors of the bill--

13 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [interposing]

14 I'm understand that.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --had to have the
16 time.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [interposing]

18 We didn't make that a rule.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I'm going to ask
20 everyone else to maintain the two minutes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I'm asking for
22 an additional minute.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you. I'm--
24 I'm saying no. I appreciate it.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Alright, I'm
3 going to keep talking.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I appreciate it.
5 Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I'm going to
7 keep talking then.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We do--

9 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [interposing]
10 Amending a bill is a very big move--

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing]
12 We're going to move on.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: --to do what
14 we've seen here.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing]
16 We're going to move on.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: And so the best
18 thing to do--

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing]
20 We're going to move on.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
22 Council Member.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: --is to pull
24 this forward.

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We ask that you
3 please-

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
5 Williams, you're out of order.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Advocate, the
7 advocates got us here.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
9 Mendez.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: The advocates
11 have got us here, and many of us in leadership have
12 gotten here.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We're going to
14 move on. Thank you. Council Member Mendez, please.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [off mic] You
16 made those people wait, and they should go on. (sic)

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright, if
18 Council Member Mendez doesn't want to speak, who's
19 the next on the list?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [off mic] Both
21 of us. We want to speak. (sic)

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Who's the next?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [off mic] And
24 put them in fear. (sic)

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Well, I'm going
3 to—I'm going to accede my time to Council Member
4 Williams and I'll speak about my bills later.
5 [cheers/applause]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [off mic] Well,
7 I told you they won't—

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
9 Council Member Mendez, the rules do not allow that.
10 Council Member Rose.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Um, you know,
12 I'm—I'm term limited. So, I just am asking. This
13 is my last and I'm asking for a little discretion.
14 So, okay, I'll--

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member,
16 go ahead.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: --I'll speak. I
18 was going to speak about 385, and I really do need
19 to do that because, you know, it has been more than
20 ten years that we've worked on this bill.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAM: [off mic]
22 [interposing] We need to change things. We need a
23 change.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: And today, we
25 will be codifying mold abatement and integrated pest

2 management. After ten years of diligently working
3 on this issue with—with the advocates the Asthma-
4 Free Homes Act also known as Intro 385-C. After
5 much negotiations we are passing this crucial bill
6 that will go a long way to eradicating mold, taking
7 preventative measures to address mold and asthma
8 triggers, and asthma has a debilitating effect on an
9 individual's quality of life, and here in New York
10 City there are approximately one million individuals
11 who have been diagnosed with asthma. This
12 legislation will go a long way to benefit tenants
13 and their health, and it will allow the city to
14 recapture funds that they may expend through
15 Emergency Repair Program. There is a portion of the
16 bill that—that's the position referral. I refer to
17 this as the Hurley Provision. Dr. Matthews Hurley
18 was part of our Coalition for Asthma-Free Housing.
19 He passed way December 9, 2016, and we fought hard
20 to keep that provision in because of him, and there
21 are 30 members of the Coalition. So, I can't
22 mention all their names, but I want to give a
23 special thank you to Cecil Corbin Mark, Matt Sasheer
24 and Harvey Epstein who worked very closely with me.
25 Ramon Martinez, thank you for helping me get here.

2 Megan Chin, Jim Wilcox, Jeff Baker. I-I also want
3 to say I'm going to be voting no on 182-D. You know
4 traffic infractions are-should be covered by this
5 bill. I was topped by the cops the other day while
6 driving, and when I asked why I was being pulled
7 over, they would not tell me why. They said they
8 will tell me afterward and they explained it to me
9 when they handed me a summons for running a red
10 light. [bell] I am clear that as a white skinned
11 Puerto Rican woman--

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
13 Council Member Mendez, could you bring your comments
14 to a close?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I would-a-a-a
16 black man in that situation would have been under
17 the danger of driving while black.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
19 Council member.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: And it my have
21 been lethal. It wasn't for me, but this bill
22 doesn't cover that, and that is a shame-

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
24 Thank you.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: --and I will not
3 vote for it.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
5 Rose.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. Intro
7 1399 the right to temporary changes in work schedule
8 and the right to request flexible work without
9 penalty. Unfortunately, emergencies happen to all
10 people in all walks of life. While many New Yorkers
11 are fortunate enough to have employers who
12 understanding this and make reasonable
13 accommodations, a 2015 survey of New Yorkers
14 revealed that 45% of respondents have no access to
15 flexible work arrangements.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
17 [shushing for quiet]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And 58% of them
19 feel uncomfortable or very uncomfortable asking for
20 such changes. Intro 1399 would give all employees
21 working in New York City the right to a temporary
22 change in schedule twice a year to attend certain
23 specific personal needs such as family caregiving
24 situations, family offense matters or sexual
25 offenses, and the right to request any other changes

2 in schedule without risking retaliation from their
3 employer. This bill is especially important for
4 early career low-income workers, nearly 70% of whom
5 cannot change their schedule start time or stop time
6 if needed. Low-wage workers, female workers and
7 workers of color disproportionately lack access to
8 flexible work arrangements. No one should lose
9 their livelihood for asking for an unpaid day to
10 tend to an emergency and that is what this bill
11 assures. The results of this bill should be
12 positive for employees and employers alike leading
13 to a more satisfied and productive workforce.
14 Employees with workplace flexibility are more likely
15 to report better overall job satisfaction, increased
16 engagement with their job, fewer life interferences
17 with job performance, improved physical health,
18 improved mental health status and a higher
19 likelihood of remaining with their current employer.
20 Many hours went into making this legislation, which
21 will ultimately help improve working conditions for
22 thousands of low wage working women and men in New
23 York City a reality. I want to thank just a few of
24 them: Annie Decker [bell] the Deputy Director of

2 Legislative Drafting; Terzah Nasser, Alexis
3 Weinberg--

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
5 Council Member, bring your comments to a close.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Yes. Sherry River
7 and my Deputy Chief of Staff. Thank you.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
9 Council Member Lander.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Than you, Madam--

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
12 Quiet in the Chambers, please. [shushing for quiet]

13 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
14 down, please. Keep it down.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, Madam
16 Public Advocate. I have the greatest respect and
17 admiration for Council Member Torres, and I'm a
18 long-standing ally of both the Speaker and the
19 Mayor. So, it pains me to part ways from them on
20 Intro 182-D, but I cannot support this bill as it
21 has been amended over the opposition of the
22 Coalition of 200 civil rights groups, community
23 based organizations and advocates who have been the
24 champions of police reform in New York City over the
25 past decade. As amended, as you've heard, the bill

2 would not cover Level 1 encounters at traffic stops.
3 The majority of non-arrest interactions that people
4 have with police officers where a law enforcement
5 action is taken there's little need for a business
6 card since individuals will have the summons or be
7 in custody. It is precisely in the interactions
8 where no enforcement action is taken that the
9 business card is needed, and it is too many of those
10 that his bill exempts. As for the argument that
11 NYPD officers would make up or needlessly elevate
12 charges rather than hand New Yorkers a simple
13 business card and explain the reason for a traffic
14 stop because their union told them to, I have much
15 more faith in our officers than that. But perhaps
16 even more than these substantive disagreements my no
17 vote today reflects a different belief on how social
18 change happens. Real change especially on
19 challenging issues like police reform in a country
20 with a deep history of racial injustice does not
21 happen primarily because of the bills we pass in
22 this chamber. It happens because people who
23 experience injustice, organize, build organizations,
24 building coalitions, build an insistent movement for
25 justice that must be heard and that partnerships are

2 built between activists and legislators.

3 Communities United for Police Reform has built a
4 coalition like that over the past six years, which
5 has given people a powerful way to come together to
6 make change. Of course, they do not get to dictate
7 what we do here. Compromises must, indeed be
8 reached, which reflect a balance of idealism and
9 pragmatism as we're seeing on Intro 541-C, Council
10 Member Reynoso's bill. But it is not a compromise
11 if the entire coalition of community based
12 organizations, advocates and civil rights group who
13 fought for it are opposed to it, and that is why
14 despite my high regard for Council Torres--

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

16 Thank you.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: --I must vote no
18 today.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
20 Council Member. Council Member Van Bramer.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you
22 very much, Madam Public Advocate. I am really proud
23 of Intro 1466, a bill that I have put forth, and
24 that I hope my colleagues will support today. It is
25 incredibly important that when the city of New York

2 sprays pesticides including for West Nile Virus,
3 that they clean appropriately the playground
4 equipment, and this is a matter that was brought to
5 me by constituents who were worried that their young
6 children we playing playground equipment shortly
7 after the city sprays but not cleaning down the
8 equipment. So, 1466 will require the Parks
9 Department in coordination with the Department of
10 Health to clean playground equipment in city parks
11 within 24 hours of an aerial spraying of pesticides
12 by any city agency. There is nothing more important
13 than keeping young people safe, and making sure that
14 parents have peace of mind when their children are
15 playing on playground equipment in the city of New
16 York. So, I'll talk about some of the other bills
17 later when I vote, but I certainly want to recognize
18 the importance of this bill that my staff and I
19 worked on very, very hard and for a long time. So,
20 I want to thank my Chief of Staff Matt Wallace, my
21 Deputy Chief of Staff and Legislative Director Andre
22 Sveja (sp?) and all of the staff members, the
23 central staff who helped make this possible. So,
24 with that, I say thank you and we're really, really
25 thrilled that we're going to make sure that parents

2 have peace of mind taking their children to
3 playgrounds and that every child including in
4 particular the smallest children will be safe when
5 doing so. Thank you.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
7 Council Member Rodriguez.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.
9 Thank you, Speaker for all your support. As someone
10 that, as I said before in these past four years I've
11 been able to be prime or co-prime to close to 50
12 bills. I can say that it never happened in my first
13 10. Today, I would like to speak about Intro 1658
14 that will require the Administration to report to
15 the Council every year for all the installation of
16 sidewalk bollards throughout the city. You know, it
17 doesn't make sense that we have so many bollards, as
18 they should, in front of Bank of America at Sixth
19 Avenue and 42nd Street, but there's no pedestrian
20 bollards protecting the theaters at 42nd between 7th
21 and 8th. In the same place where terrorists killed
22 eight people there were pedestrian bollards in the
23 other side of the street, but not in the area where
24 the cyclists were using those lanes. So, today we
25 are voting to mandate DOT to provide every year a

2 report to the Council on where are we installing
3 those bollards so that we can have a better policy
4 to plan to install bollards in any arear, in any
5 sidewalk that we have high volume of pedestrians and
6 cyclists. I also would like to speak about
7 Introduction 1036-A, and I would like to thank the
8 Public Advocate for also being a partner. It will
9 require—this law will require the Mayor or an agency
10 designed by the Mayor to conduct an analysis of
11 vacant properties in New York City. What I hope is
12 that New York City will be using every single vacant
13 land to build 100% affordable housing, but we need
14 to know where do we have those vacant lands.

15 [Speaking Spanish] [bell] Thank you.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Gracias. Council
17 Member Salamanca.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you,
19 Madam Public Advocate. Today, I speak in support of
20 Intro 182 and it's lead sponsor Council Member
21 Ritchie Torres who has worked diligently to fight to
22 bring this bill to the floor, creating what I
23 believe will bring greater accountability from our
24 police officers, the that I and many in my
25 communities like mine believe is needed. I stand

2 strongly beside my colleague Council Member Torres
3 and to say that many of the unfounded attacks that
4 have been leveraged against Council Member Torres
5 recently regarding this bill including from members
6 of this body are preposterous and shameful. No one—
7 no one can second guess Council Member Torres'
8 leadership as a progressive leader for the city and
9 someone who will always stand up for the people of
10 our beloved Bronx. Council Member Torres
11 understands the plights of the impoverished. He
12 understands the importance of creating positive
13 community and police relations and needed police
14 accountability. And finally, certainly more than
15 most in this Chamber, he understands what it's like
16 to be a young black and Latino man unfairly profiled
17 just because of his color and age. So, the basis of
18 attacks against Council Member Torres should not go
19 unanswered, and the grandstanding that's happening—
20 that has happened in the past few days should not
21 stand in the way of incremental changes that will
22 help thousands of New Yorkers across the city
23 notably those of color. Enough is enough and with
24 that said, I urge my colleagues to support Intro 182

2 sponsored by Council Member and my brother Ritchie
3 Torres. Thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. That
5 concludes General Order. [background comments]
6 Council Member Barron.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Madam
8 Public Advocate. I just want to speak briefly about
9 182-D. For years, for decades the activists, the
10 advocates, the victims, the family of the victims
11 who have been subjected to police brutality and
12 organizations have indicated that there's a problem.
13 This problem is one that the advocates brought to a
14 representative of this body asking that person to
15 bring their issue forward. The issue that was
16 brought forward at that time was one that was widely
17 supported by members in this body. When there was
18 some resistance, there were certain members
19 including myself who said, Listen, this is stuck.
20 We need to get it to the floor and I among others
21 signed for a motion to discharge for what the bill
22 was at that time. The bill that we have now is not
23 the bill that the persons who came forward as the
24 voice in this issue want to have on the record, and
25 I cannot see how we can go forward and bring this

2 bill for a vote. When we talked about it was
3 extracted from the Community Safety Act because it
4 had not yet gotten there, we could keep it here
5 still until we can get it to the point where it
6 addresses and includes Level 1 offenses because that
7 certainly is one of the areas where we talked about
8 black and Latino communities being
9 disproportionately involved in that. So, based on
10 the fact of my having been involved in these kinds
11 of issues for more than 55 years, I think that we
12 need to move forward in terms of making this
13 holistic and including all of that. So, with that,
14 I will not be voting in favor of this bill, and I'll
15 have further comments when I make my vote. Thank
16 you.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
18 Council Member Johnson.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam
20 Public Advocate. [coughs] I just want to mention
21 to colleagues that today we're voting on
22 Introduction 1619, which is a bill that's going to
23 protect runaway homeless youth in New York City.
24 They are some of the most vulnerable New Yorkers,
25 and during this holiday season, which is a very

2 difficult time for them, I want to just highlight
3 the work that this Council and this Administration
4 has done for Runaway and Homeless Youth. This is
5 one of the most difficult times of the year for them
6 because of familiar rejection, parental rejection,
7 the holidays. It's very, very difficult. In the
8 package of bills we're passing today with Council
9 Member Salamanca and my bill looks to protect these
10 young people even further. I also want to add that
11 I'm extremely proud of Council Member Reynoso, and
12 I'm extremely proud of Council Member Torres. I
13 know there are disagreements. I know there is
14 disappointment, but I also know that there is good
15 intention on all sides here. I respect their
16 character. I respect their integrity, and I respect
17 how they negotiated these bills, and I look forward
18 to voting in favor of them. Thank you.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
20 Council Member Greenfield.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you
22 very much. I'm mindful of the clock and the fact
23 that I'd like to make some thorough (sic) remarks
24 earlier, I just wanted to first note that we are
25 hopefully going to be passing 38 pieces of

2 legislation today. Spending a lot of time on one
3 particular piece, but I do want to acknowledge folks
4 have asked about that. I think deadlines are a good
5 thing and the end of the year was coming, and there
6 were a lot of great things that we wanted to do, and
7 I want to congratulate all of my colleagues who are
8 passing bills here today. I also wanted to thank
9 the staff. They literally have worked night and day
10 over the last few weeks to get all of this done and
11 to wrangle us all together. It was quite
12 challenging over the last 48 hours to be at multiple
13 committees at once, but I think we pulled it off.
14 And so I want to thank them as well. I want to say
15 I—I think it's great and a true testament to this
16 body that we can have robust and respectful debate
17 on issues, and I think that's what you're seeing
18 happening here today, and I admire that. And I did
19 just want to take a moment considering I'm only
20 going to have two minutes later just to thank my
21 recent staff who worked with me specifically. I
22 want to thank Danny Paulson who is my Chief of
23 Staff, Elena Sytcheva who's my Council, Ben Segal my
24 Deputy Chief of Staff, and I want to thank folks who
25 were with me in the last year, Seth Campagna and

2 Steven Snowder and Becky Stern and Fannie Lynn who
3 does my schedule and Eva Kachi, who is my District
4 Director and Guy Lee Fulmer who is a Constituent
5 Services Rep and Yule Schoenfeld who does
6 Constituent Services and Dave Kenser (sp?) who does
7 my communications. I think all of us here recognize
8 that we're just one person, and it really is thanks
9 to our personal staff, our district staff and the
10 amazing central staff that we're able to get things
11 done, and I wanted to just take a moment and
12 acknowledge that and, of course, yesterday I thanked
13 the incredible Land Use staff that I've had the
14 privilege of working with for the last four years as
15 the chair as well. So thank you all, and you'll hear
16 my other two minutes in a little bit.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Any
18 others? Seeing none, Report of Special Committees.

19 CLERK: None.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Report of
21 Standing Committees.

22 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Aging
23 Intro 1185-A, information to users of life
24 sustaining equipment.

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
3 coupled on General Orders.

4 CLERK: Intro 1616-A, Post Incarceration
5 Reentry for older adults.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
7 coupled on General Orders.

8 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Civil
9 Rights, Intro 804-A reasonable accommodations.

10 Amended and coupled on General Orders.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO:

12 CLERK: Intro 1012-A New York City Human
13 Rights Law.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
15 coupled on General Orders.

16 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Civil
17 Service and Labor Intro 1399-A Employee Work
18 Schedule.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
20 coupled on General Orders.

21 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
22 Economic Development, Intro 1615-A, Subcon-
23 Subcontractor Guide.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
25 coupled on General Orders.

2 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
3 Education Intro 1497-A, Students in Temporary
4 Housing.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
6 coupled on General Orders.

7 CLERK: Intro 1604-A Gender Pronoun
8 Information.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
10 coupled on General Orders.

11 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
12 Environmental Protection, Intro 54-A, City Ferries.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
14 coupled on General Orders.

15 CLERK: Intro 717-A, Idling Infractions.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
17 coupled on General Orders.

18 CLERK: Intro 880-A, Biodiesel Fuel in
19 School Buses.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
21 coupled on General Orders.

22 CLERK: Intro 978-D, Mold Abatement.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
24 coupled on General Orders.

2 CLERK: Intros 1629-A and 1632-A, Energy
3 Efficiency for certain buildings.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
5 coupled on General Orders.

6 CLERK: Intro 1653-B, Noise Complaints.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
8 coupled on General Orders.

9 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
10 Finance, Preconsidered Reso 1780-A, Organization
11 Funding.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
13 General Orders.

14 CLERK: Preconsidered LU 834 and Reso
15 1785, Tax Exemption.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
17 General Orders.

18 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
19 General Welfare, Intro 572-A, Shelter Census Data.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
21 coupled on General Orders.

22 CLERK: Intro 855-B, Public Assistance
23 Eligibility.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
25 coupled on General Orders.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

107

2 CLERK: Intro 1577-A, Client Information
3 Management Systems.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
5 coupled on General Orders.

6 CLERK: Intro 1714-A, Educational
7 Continuity.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
9 coupled on General Orders.

10 CLERK: Intro 1739-A, Domestic Violence
11 Emergency Shelters.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
13 coupled--Amended and coupled on General Orders.

14 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
15 Housing and Buildings, Intro 385-C, Indoor Allergy
16 and Hazards.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
18 coupled on General Orders.

19 CLERK: Amended and coupled on General
20 Orders.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Intro 1009-A,
22 Report of Registered Property Owners.

23 CLERK:

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
25 coupled on General Orders.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 108

2 CLERK: Intro 1015-A, Housing Portal.

3 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
4 coupled on General Orders.

5 CLERK: Intros 1036-A and 1039-A, Vacant
6 Properties.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
8 coupled on General Orders.

9 CLERK: Intro 1120-A, Foundation Work.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
11 coupled on General Orders.

12 CLERK: Intro 1269-A, Community Land
13 Trusts.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
15 coupled on General Orders.

16 CLERK: Intro 1419-A, Construction Site
17 Safety Violations.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
19 coupled on General Orders.

20 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Land
21 Use, LU 512 and Reso 1786, Affordable Housing.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
23 General Orders.

24 CLERK: LU 797 and Reso 1787, Tax
25 Exemption.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 109

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled to be
3 filed pursuant to letter of withdrawal.

4 CLERK: LU 816 and Reso 1788, Property
5 Tax Exemption.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
7 General Orders.

8 CLERK: LU 831 and Reso 1789, Landmark
9 Designation.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
11 General Orders.

12 CLERK: LU 832 and Reso 1790 and LU 833
13 and Reso 1791, Tax Exemptions.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
15 General Orders.

16 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Parks
17 and Recreation, Intro 1466, Clean Park Playground
18 Equipment.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
20 General Orders.

21 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Public
22 Safety, Intro 182-D, Officer Identification.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Intro 182-D. I'm
24 sorry. Amended and coupled on General Orders.

25 CLERK: Intro 541-C, Consent Searchers.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 110

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
3 coupled on General Orders.

4 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Small
5 Business, Intro 1499-A, Penalty Mitigation Program.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
7 coupled on General Orders.

8 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
9 Transportation, Intro 1397-A, Opening of a Protected
10 Street.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
12 coupled on General Orders.

13 CLERK: Intro 1658-A, Installation of
14 Bollards.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
16 coupled on General Orders.

17 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Youth
18 Services, Intros 1619-A and 1705-A, Runaway Youth.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
20 coupled on General Orders.

21 CLERK: On the General Order Calendar,
22 Intro 1465-A, Use of Residual Fuel Oil.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
24 coupled on General Orders.

25

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 111

2 CLERK: Intro 1486-A, Department of
3 Education Reports.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
5 coupled on General Orders.

6 CLERK: LU 828 and Reso 1768, and LU 829
7 and Reso 1769, Property Tax Exemptions.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
9 General Orders.

10 CLERK: LU 800 and Reso 1792 and LU 801
11 and Reso 1793, Lafayette Avenue Rezoning.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
13 General Orders.

14 CLERK: LU 802 and Reso 1794 through LU
15 804 and Reso 1796 on the next page, 1776 East
16 Chester Road Rezoning.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
18 General Orders.

19 CLERK: LU 805 and Reso 1797 through LU
20 807 and Reso 1799, National Black Theater Zoning
21 Amendment.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
23 General Orders.

24 CLERK: LU 817 and Reso 1800, Subservice
25 Storage Facilities.

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
3 General Orders.

4 CLERK: Resolution Appointing Various
5 Persons Commissioner of Deeds.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
7 General Orders, and I ask for a roll call on—a roll
8 call vote on all items on today's General Order
9 Calendar.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Beginning with
11 Alejandro's daddy, Council Member Reynoso.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I proudly vote
13 aye on all, and thank you to Speaker Melissa Mark-
14 Viverito and all our veteran colleagues. Thank you.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: The next person
16 to vote is Council Member Lancman.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Thank you. I
18 apologize for leaving early, but I need to
19 participate in a judicial swearing in ceremony back
20 in Queens. To all my departing colleagues, all the
21 best. I especially want to thank the speaker for
22 giving me the opportunity to chair the committee
23 that I chair and I hope that she's found out
24 collaboration is meaningful and worthwhile as—as I
25

2 have. With that, I vote aye on all except Intro
3 1419. I vote nay on that.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
5 Vallone.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you, Madam
7 Advocate. I vote aye on all with the exception of
8 182 and 541. Merry Christmas, Happy Holidays and
9 God Speed everyone.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
11 Dromm.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I vote aye on all.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
14 Rodriguez.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye on all.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Back to the
17 general-to the order.

18 CLERK: Adams.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Permission to
20 explain my vote?

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I sit here today-

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

24 [shushing for quiet]

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: --in conflict with
3 a vote. You know, I live walking distance to where
4 Sean Bell was murdered. Over the years I have come
5 to know his parents. As a member of Community Board
6 12 since 2009, the first vote that I said I, too,
7 was a vote to rename a street Sean Bell Way. With
8 Intro 182-D some say it goes too far. Some say it
9 doesn't go far enough. I sit here today in support
10 of the mothers. I sit here today in support of the
11 families who have lost loved ones. I sit here today
12 in support of those who are stopped needlessly
13 because of the color of their skin, yes, I do
14 respect my colleague. He is brilliant, but the bill
15 doesn't go far enough for the mothers. It doesn't
16 go far enough for the families. It doesn't go far
17 enough for those that look like me. For that, I
18 vote aye on all except Intro 182-D I vote no.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Continue.

20 CLERK: Barron.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to
22 explain my vote.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

25 Congratulations on 541-C and then as it relates to

2 182-D. It has been substantially diminished from
3 its original presentation at the time that I saw the
4 form to the form that it now exists and is asking to
5 be voted on. Some people say that what's lacking
6 can be added later. We could do this little by
7 little, but I would quote for you what Martin Luther
8 King said.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
10 [shushing for quiet]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: For years I
12 struggled with the idea of the reform of the
13 structure of institutions in the South. A little
14 change here a little change there. Now, I feel
15 quite different. I think you have a lot—you have
16 got to have a radical reconstruction of the entire
17 system, a revolution of values. So, I'm not
18 concerned that the culture that you might find in a
19 police precinct is one that's motivated by love. I
20 don't want them to be motivated by love. I want
21 them to be constrained by the law, and I want them
22 to follow the law. [applause]

23 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
24 down.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
3 [shushing for quiet] Quiet, please.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I want our
5 children to not be subjected because there are still
6 numerous stops for no reason. I see them in my
7 community in East New York. So, now we're saying
8 that those stops that children are subjected to on a
9 daily basis don't get the dignity. Our witness was
10 stopped two years ago where the cop stopped him. I
11 said why did you stop that teenager and yanked him
12 by the book bag, Oh, we were trained at the precinct
13 that we can do that and we might find some
14 contraband or some weapons. So, I say no. I don't
15 want to be motivated by love. I want police to be
16 constrained by the law, and just as the
17 investigatory stops don't include the--nor does that
18 include the provision for the card to be given, I
19 think it's a major flaw. It should have been
20 withdrawn I think, and I'm not making any kind of
21 personal decisions about the sponsor or any of that,
22 but it should have been withdrawn to make it fuller.
23 So, for that, Madam Speaker, Madam Public Advocate--

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: --I vote aye on
3 all with the exception of 182-D and with the
4 exception of Land Use 512.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

7 CLERK: Borelli.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: I would like to
9 wish the Speaker and my colleagues who are departing
10 a farewell and good luck in the future, and for
11 those of us who are returning, I'm looking forward
12 to the more conservative Council [laughter] that--
13 that honorable Mr. Torres so vividly depicted
14 earlier today. I'll keep it short because my list
15 of no's are quite long.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
17 [shushing for quiet] Quiet in the Chambers, please.

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
19 down, please. Keep it down.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all
21 except 182, 541, 385, 717, 804, 1012, 1015--

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
23 [shushing for quiet]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: --1013 or 1039.
25 Excuse me. 1265, 1399, 1419, 1629, 1632--

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
3 [shushing for quiet]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: --1604, 1465,
5 and Land Use 817 and I'll give you a list.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
7 [background comments, laughter]

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
9 [shushing for quiet] Continuing on with the vote.
10 Quiet please.

11 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
12 down, please.

13 CLERK: Cabrera.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Permission to
15 explain my vote.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes. Please,
17 please there's a lot of bills. We need to make sure
18 we get the vote correct.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Council Member
20 Borelli, I think you have a record for the no's
21 today. First, I want to wish the Speaker and
22 departing colleagues, I wish you truly the best.
23 The smiley is the future smiling at you. You had
24 truly served this city. What a privilege literally
25 to be one of the 51. I was just talking to Council

2 Member Mealy that we truly do have a position of
3 privilege to be here and to work with you alongside
4 with you, especially if I constitute (sp?) those in
5 the Bronx as well. Council Member Palma, thank you
6 for being the dean of delegation. You led us well.
7 Council Member Vacca, thank you for all your advice
8 when I first came in, for all the ladies right here
9 in the row I'm going to truly miss you. Your-your
10 advice was-and your-and your example and all the
11 talks and support has been amazing and Council
12 Members on the other side like Dan Garodnick and
13 Julissa-Ferreras, and David-David Greenfield. I
14 just wanted to mention you all because you do
15 matter. You do matter in what you have done here.
16 It truly matters. I vote no on Intro 182-D and
17 Intro 541-C and vote aye on the rest. Thank you.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

19 CLERK: Chin.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Permission to
21 explain my vote?

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you. First,
24 I wanted to congratulate and thank our Speaker
25 Melissa Mark-Viverito for a successful and historic

2 four years as our leader in the City Council.
3 Together this Council passed more pieces of
4 legislation than any other, many of which have made
5 the city more progressive, more livable, and more
6 just for all New Yorkers. Under the leadership of
7 our Finance Chair, Council Member Julissa Ferreras-
8 Copeland, we have achieved a new level of
9 transparency on our budget process. One of that has
10 encouraged unprecedented engagement with Community
11 based organizations that do such good work for our
12 city. Whether it's pushing for more funding for a
13 growing number of seniors, jobs for our youth or
14 critical support for caregivers—

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
16 [shushing for quiet]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: --these fierce and
18 wonderful women have show us all what leadership
19 looks like and they will be missed. As I look
20 towards the next four years as a member of this
21 great body, I must point to the fact that we will
22 enter the new term with few number—fewer woman as
23 members, just eleven total in the City Council.
24 While I'm excited to welcome new woman colleagues
25 who are strong fighters for their communities, this

2 city is home to more than 50% women. We must work
3 together to ensure that women have an equal seat at
4 the table and that the Council of the greatest city
5 in the world reflects the wonderful diversity that
6 is its greatest Strength. So, to all my departing
7 colleagues, especially to my sister Rosie Mendez and
8 all of you—

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
10 [shushing for quiet]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: --thank you so much
12 for your service to the city.

13 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
14 down, please.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: It's been an honor
16 and privilege to serve alongside all of you, and I
17 wish all a wonderful holiday and a happy and healthy
18 New Year. I have to abstain on 182-D and I will
19 vote aye on all. Thank you.

20 CLERK: [pause] Cohen.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you. I'm
22 going to vote no on 541-C and I'm going to vote yes
23 on all other items on the General Orders Calendar.
24 Thank you.

25 CLERK: Constantinides.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Madam
3 Public Advocate, may I be allowed to briefly explain
4 my vote?

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I really
7 want to thank and congratulate our Speaker and wish
8 her well, for her myriad of accomplishments. When
9 New York City is talked about as an environmental
10 global leader, it's because of her leadership. So,
11 I really want to thank Melissa Mark-Viverito for
12 being an environmental Champion, and someone whose
13 fought to make our city greener and more
14 sustainable. And to all my colleagues who are
15 leaving office today it's been an honor and
16 privilege to work with you all. Thank you for your
17 leadership and friendship and being the great
18 leaders of New York City, and I really want to thank
19 my first boss in the City Council, Council Member
20 Darlene Mealy who hired me as a Legislative
21 Director, 11-1/2 years ago and so I really
22 appreciate you giving me the opportunity to enter
23 this body and-and be, you know, work in this
24 institution and-and give me the opportunity. So,
25 thank you very much Council Member Mealy for your-

2 the opportunity, and I wish you all the best. Thank
3 you. [background comments]

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Who would have
5 knew that? Hm. [pause]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Oh, aye
7 on all. [laughter]

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: My
10 apologies.

11 CLERK: Cornegy.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Madam Speaker,
13 permission to explain my vote?

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: So, to all my
16 colleagues who I've had the pleasure of working for
17 the last four years in particular and especially the
18 Speaker, I thank you for the Chairmanship of the
19 Small Business. I just want to point out, though,
20 that under your leadership I want to thank you for
21 increasing minority employment in the Council and
22 sometimes doubling the numbers that we had before we
23 came in. I think that that's important and
24 something to look forward to building on. So, I

2 want to vote no on 182-D, no on LU-Land Use 817 and
3 Reso 1800, and aye on all the rest.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 CLERK: Crowley.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Madam Public
7 Advocate, if I could have a minute?

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you.
10 Today is my last stated meeting as a New York City
11 Council Member. I want to thank the speaker for her
12 leadership, and my colleagues for their continued
13 friendship and support. I want to thank my staff
14 who has been so dedicated and has gone above and
15 beyond to meet all the demands of the office. The
16 last nine years have been some of the most rewarding
17 and fulfilling of my entire life. I want to thank
18 the communities that I represent for both believing
19 in me and for the good work that we did together to
20 improve our city. I remain committed to public
21 service and whatever the future holds, I will bring
22 the same passion and dedication to fighting for our
23 city that I brought to my work as a Council Member.
24 Thank you to you also Madam Public Advocate--

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: --and I vote aye
3 on all.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Congratulations
6 to both of my colleagues who have the Right to Know
7 Act, Antonio Reynoso and Ritchie Torres and best of
8 luck to all of my colleagues over the next four
9 years and to those who are serving their last year
10 this year. Thank you.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

12 CLERK: Cumbo.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission to
14 explain my vote?

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. I want
17 to begin by thanking Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito
18 as Co-Chair of the Women's Caucus as well as the
19 Chair of the Women's Issues Committee. You have
20 changed the dynamics of how we see women throughout
21 city politics, and because of you, women all over
22 the city and this nation and the world are going to
23 know what they can aspire to be. So, for that, I
24 thank you. You have been an incredible speaker.
25 Your legacy is going to be one that is going to

2 inspire people for generations to come. The Young
3 Women's Initiative is something that I'm
4 particularly proud of as it's a perfect example of
5 the way your leadership has made a difference for
6 New Yorkers everywhere. When we talk about more
7 women in office, this is something that we all have
8 to champion, men and women because our voice is so
9 critical, and for us four years from now in 2021, we
10 want to see at least 21 women sitting in these
11 seats, and we're not going to stop until we make
12 that happen. To the women that are leaving us we
13 are so proud of you. Council Member Ferreras-
14 Copeland, you've been an incredible Chair of the
15 Finance Committee, a leader for women on the
16 menstrual equality act, incredibly progressive
17 budgets that put women's needs front in center. As
18 I said earlier, you taught me how to have a baby,
19 run for office, do a land use deal and look fabulous
20 all at the same time. [laughter] I thank you for
21 that. [cheers/applause] Council Member Mealy you
22 have been an incredible leader, labor routes, a
23 trailblazer for women in the labor movement coming
24 from TWU. You took that experience into the Council
25 and fought for priorities like the living wage and

2 prevailing wage protection for workers. You have
3 successfully beat off challenges for the last 12
4 years, and for that, I celebrate you and I'm going
5 to miss you, and I look forward to continuing to
6 work with you. Council Member Mendez, you have
7 chaired the Women's Caucus, Black, Latino and Asian
8 Caucus and LGBT Caucus. You are a legend as it
9 pertains to women's issues and the fight for LGBT
10 equality. You have continued to put in safeguards
11 such as the asthma protection bill and many other --

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
13 Council Member, can you bring your comments to a
14 close?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I'm coming to a
16 close on these dynamic women [laughter] dynamic
17 Public Advocate Letitia James. [cheers/applause]

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs] Well,
19 keep going, honey. No. [laughter]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Council Member
21 Crowley, you have been an incredible chair of the
22 Women's Caucus advocating for greater gender equity-
23 -

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
25 Council Member, please.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: --at the FDNY and
3 outstanding leadership on closing Rikers Island, and
4 when you're ready to get back on the saddle, we're
5 going to saddle up with my baby and knock doors for
6 you. [laughter] Council Member Palma, you have rose
7 from so many challenges to become a leader
8 representing equity, women's rights and responsive
9 government. Coming from a labor organizer at 1199,
10 you are a mom, a wife and so many things. You've
11 been on this journey with me. You have organized
12 workers and let walk-outs over unfair working
13 conditions. You are awesome. I proudly vote aye
14 and we are going to fill these seats in 2021 with
15 dynamic women just like you. [cheers/applause] To
16 all my sisters, I vote aye.

17 CLERK: Deutsch.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you, could
19 I get four minutes, too?

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Are you going to--
21 are you going to clap it up for women?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yeah.
23 [laughter] Permission to explain my vote.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shush.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Permission to
3 explain my vote.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, sir.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So, at first, I
6 was considering to—to vote in favor of 182 for
7 officers to distribute business cards, but honestly
8 at that time I thought they were PBA cards. So,
9 since then I changed my vote, but that's a joke.
10 [laughter] I vote no on 182, 1604 and 541. Thank
11 you.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughing]
13 Continuing.

14 CLERK: Espinal.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I vote aye.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We love you.

17 [laughs]

18 CLERK: Eugene.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye except
20 on Intro 182-D, I abstain.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

22 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND:

24 Permission to explain my vote.

25

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, Council
3 Member.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: To my
5 parents, their unquestionable trust and faith in me
6 made me the confident offensive woman I am today. I
7 thank you, Mom. You're just-mom, my desire to help
8 others comes from you. Thank you for showing me
9 that the most important quality that a leader should
10 always be compassionate empathy. To my husband,
11 thank you for supporting me throughout the years
12 even when we were in different states, but guess
13 what baby, I'm coming home tonight. [cheers/
14 applause] To my son Julian you are my greatest
15 achievement and my biggest inspiration. To my staff
16 past and present thank you. I am who I am because
17 of you. To our wonderful Director Latonia McKinney,
18 four budgets wasn't enough. I wish we could have
19 had more time together. To Mayor de Blasio, we work
20 together to make New York a more welcoming and
21 progressive city and I am proud of our
22 accomplishment and forever grateful for your
23 friendship. To our Speaker [Speaking Spanish] thank
24 you for your leadership and support. Thank you for
25 your amazing—for this amazing opportunity you gave

2 me to serve as your Finance Chair. To my fellow
3 members, I have enjoyed working with each one of you
4 in this Council. Success is a result of our work
5 together, our accomplishments together and now the
6 end is near and so I face the final curtain.
7 Regrets I've had a few, but then again too few to
8 mention. I did what I had to do and saw it through
9 without exemption. I planned each chartered course,
10 each careful step along the byway, and more, much
11 more than this, I did it my way. [cheers/applause]
12 [background comments] I vote aye.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs] She did
14 it my way.

15 CLERK: Garodnick.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

17 CLERK: Gentile.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: May I have
19 briefly explain my vote?

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes. What song
21 are going to sing. [laughter]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Let me just say
23 as I finish with my last vote that it has taken me
24 14 years to get my diploma and graduate from the
25 City Council [laughter] but, I-I-I've done it slowly

2 over 14 years because this is an amazing place. As
3 shown by today's meeting, this is an amazing place
4 that does amazing things and has amazing people in
5 it both members and staff. So, I am so pleased and
6 honored to be part of this Council. Madam Speaker,
7 thank you for your confidence in me, and everything
8 you've done for me over the years, and we were
9 together when--when many other weren't in the last
10 Council in the last mayoral election, but certainly
11 I want to thank all of you, wish you the best and I
12 will stay in touch. I'm not sure what I'm doing,
13 but I will stay in touch, and it's almost--looking
14 over 14 years is almost as if we just got started,
15 and before you know it, comes the time to say so
16 long, and with that, I will vote aye on all.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Okay, Carol
18 Burnett. [laughter]

19 CLERK: Gibson.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to
21 explain my vote?

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Madam
24 Public Advocate, and certainly I want to join all of
25 my colleagues in congratulating and wishing all the

2 very best to all of our outgoing members, to our
3 Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito, it's been an honor
4 and a privilege to work with you so many issues of
5 importance to every New Yorkers. You and I are both
6 graduates from the Baruch College School of Public
7 Affairs, and you are the first to run for office,
8 and I am the second, and you have been a roll model
9 and a champion and a woman who rocks. So, it's been
10 an honor working with you and I wish you all the
11 best. And to all of our colleagues who are leaving,
12 Council Member Vinny Gentile, Darlene Mealy,
13 Elizabeth Crowley, David Greenfield, Jimmy Vacca,
14 Dan Garodnick, Julissa Ferreras-Copeland, Rosie
15 Mendez and Annabel Palma. Thank you for serving
16 your districts so well and the city of New York. I
17 wish God's Speed and continued blessings to each and
18 every one you. Colleagues, thank you. To the
19 members of the Public Safety Committee, it's been an
20 honor to serve as your chair, the first woman and
21 the first person of color, and while I am the first,
22 I should not be the last. We have worked together
23 on the Criminal Justice Reform Act, crisis
24 management work, anti-gun violence, alternatives to
25 incarceration. We have done our best to make young

2 black and Latino men and women success stories and
3 not statistics. Summer youth, all year-round youth
4 employment program I am so proud of this Council.
5 To my public safety team to Deepa--

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
7 [shushing for quiet]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: --to Beth, Casey
9 and Steve. Thank you. To Ramon, to Laura, and
10 Latonya and all of my district office staff I am so
11 proud to work with you. To the Women's Caucus, what
12 we lack in quantity, we make up in quality, and I
13 look forward to work with all of my colleagues.
14 Congratulations to every member who has passed
15 significant legislation today. I especially want to
16 recognize Council Members Reynoso and Torres for
17 staying true to their word, for keeping the faith
18 and standing firm in your values and your
19 principles.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
21 Council Member--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: It is my honor to
23 work with you and I vote aye on all. Happy Holidays
24 to all of my colleagues. May God bless you and keep
25 you.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 CLERK: Greenfield.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you and
7 happy holidays as well. Madam Public Advocate, may I
8 have a couple of minutes to say farewell?

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Two.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Two. Okay.

11 [laughter] Okay, I will take it. You know, I was
12 thinking how do you sum up eight years in two
13 minutes? So, I'm going to share a story, but I-I
14 don't think I've actually ever shared it before.
15 Fifteen years ago my wife and I went on our
16 honeymoon. We went to Italy. It was very nice. As
17 luck would have it on Shabbat we were staying in a
18 hotel and we bumped into some folks who were from
19 Inwood and the community, and one of them came over
20 to me, and at the time I was working behind the
21 scenes and one of them came over to me and said, you
22 know, some of us elders (sic) can be terminated in
23 seven years. You should really think about running
24 for City Council, and I laughed and I actually said
25 to my wife I that's ridiculous. Why would I want to

2 do that? And I'll tell what's interesting is we
3 have a saying in Yiddish it's called: *Mentsh planz*
4 *aun Got lafs*, which means that, Man plans and God
5 laughs, and eight years ago when I came in if you
6 would have told me that I was leaving in eight years
7 to run one of the largest Jewish Charities in the
8 New York, I would have laughed as well. And the
9 reason for that is that Ramon Martinez can tell you
10 then I came into the City Council I thought I was
11 going to change the world. And I really did believe
12 this and I think a lot of us believe it and what the
13 Council really taught me and Ramon helped teach me
14 this as well is that it's not about changing the
15 world. It's really about helping people. It's the
16 people in our district. It's our friends, our
17 neighbors, the people that we're never even going to
18 meet, and quite frankly, it was the people in this
19 Council who I never would have met who taught me
20 those lessons as well. When Laurie Cumbo, who I've
21 sat next to for the last four years, when she told
22 me that she was expecting it was like my sister that
23 I never had was expecting. When Julissa told me
24 that she was leaving to spend time with her family,
25 I was so happy for her and for Aaron and for Julian.

2 I was really—I came to tears. When my friend Matteo
3 told me of the loss of his father, it actually moved
4 me and I rushed out to Staten Island to be there at
5 the wake because I felt a closeness to him. Jumaane
6 Williams when he lost his intestines—intestines and
7 God know I don't know how the heck he did that, but
8 when he lost his intestines, I went to visit him in
9 the hospital because who would I kibbutz and debate
10 with about race and policy in the members lounge?
11 All of this really came from the people that work
12 here in the City Council. [bell] And finally, I
13 just want to state that Melissa taught me the value
14 of her homeland, the value of Puerto Rico. I was
15 proud to partner with her to raise funds for the
16 relief effort. I didn't think we would raise over
17 \$100,000 but we did and that was something I learned
18 from her as well. I want to thank all of my
19 colleagues. I want to thank all of the amazing
20 staff Raju and Amy, Ramon, Joey and Joe, Latonia,
21 and Nathan and Paul and my former Chiefs of staff
22 Danny Pearlstein and Janey Carey. And I just want
23 to say that this is really—

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
25 Council Member--

2 COUNCIL MEMBER -this is really-I'm
3 wrapping up, ten seconds.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: This is
6 really an amazing place. The people of New York
7 City if they knew how much time and effort and
8 passion and commitment and devotion that the people
9 of this body had for the people of New York, they
10 would be proud and I am proud as well, and with
11 that, I will conclude by voting no on 541-C, yes on
12 182-D and yes on all the other items on the agenda.
13 Thank you and very happy holidays and a happy
14 Hanukkah to my constituents who gave me this
15 amazing opportunity. Thank you.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I didn't lose
18 all of my intestines.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Intestines, huh?
20 [laughter] That's a new one. [laughter]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I lost about
22 eight inches but not all of them.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: That will ever go
24 down in the annals of history. [laughter]

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I swear I
3 still don't understand what happened.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
5 [shushing for quiet] Continuing the roll call.

6 CLERK: Grodenchik.

7 [background comments, laughter]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Madam Public
9 Advocate.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, sir.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: May I follow
12 my distinguished colleague from Brooklyn and explain
13 my vote?

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, sir.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you so
16 much. To my colleagues who are leaving the Council.
17 I can promise you that there is life after
18 government and politics. I've been there. I've done
19 it. I've come back more. You will find that there
20 is life after politics. It's a been an honor and a
21 pleasure to serve with each and every one of you and
22 Madam Speaker, I want to thank you for your many
23 kindnesses to me personally and for your leadership
24 here in this Council. To my colleague Ritchie
25 Torres, your eloquence and your gentle good nature

2 will take you very far in this life, and don't give
3 in. Never give in. To my partner in the Garodnick,
4 Grodenchik Caucus, Dan Garodnick [laughter] please
5 be assured I will continue to fight the good fight
6 for our caucus once I figure out exactly what it
7 does. [laughter] And finally to all, I leave you
8 with the words of my dear Uncle Julius a blessed
9 memory. He was the first born of our family in the
10 new world. He was a gentle soul, a teacher, a
11 graduate of Columbia University when it was not easy
12 for a Jewish person to get into that school. He was
13 also a Bronx person through and through and a
14 published author and a poet. His words as we
15 approach a new year: "Thought picking friends makes
16 a wonderful thesis, don't overdue the job and pick
17 them to pieces." With that, I wish you all a merry
18 Christmas, a happy New York and with that I vote aye
19 on all except Intros 182-D and 541-C. Thank you for
20 indulging me, Madam Public Advocate, and may I say
21 you look absolutely marvelous up there.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Oh, thank you.
23 Thank you so much. He's the only one that's
24 mentioned me. Thank you. [laughter]

25 CLERK: Johnson.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I want to thank
3 Public Advocate Letitia James. [laughter] No,
4 thank you, Madam Public Advocate. I want to just
5 say the thing I'm most proud of over the last four
6 years, and each one of us come here with our unique
7 life experiences that brought us into the madness of
8 running for office, and serving in this body. Each
9 one of us have faced adversities, and challenges,
10 and for me I'm sitting in the same seat. I don't
11 think it's the exact same seat, but the same exact
12 Council seat as Tom Duane who served in this Council
13 as the first openly gay member of this body. Was
14 the first openly HIV Positive elected official in
15 the United States of America, came out about his HIV
16 status in 1991 at the height of the HIV and AIDS
17 epidemic when there were on drugs and Protease
18 Inhibitors, when gay men were dying in droves when
19 it was called GRID and not AIDS. He won in the
20 early '90s as an openly gay, openly HIV Positive
21 man, and today I am here in the same seat as an
22 openly gay, openly HIV Positive man. I am here
23 because of the people that came before me.
24 Christine Quinn and Tom Duane and Larry Cramer and
25 Audrey Lord and Michael Cowan and all the folks that

2 laid the foundation for all of us LGBTQ members to
3 be in the Council today. And the thing I am most
4 proud of is the over \$40 million we have gotten to
5 end the epidemic in New York City. Two weeks ago
6 the Health Department announced HIV—new HIV
7 infections are at the lowest level ever recorded in
8 the history of HIV and AIDS and Melissa Mark-
9 Viverito deserves an enormous amount of credit.
10 She has been a champion, a staunch ally and a
11 supporter to the HIV and AIDS community and to me
12 when I have come to her on these issues I am proud
13 of her speakership, and I am proud of all the
14 members that I have served with. Happy holidays and
15 I vote aye on all.

16 CLERK: Kallos.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Permission to us
18 into double overtime after 5:00? [laughter] Two
19 minutes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: On the Right to
21 Know Act I'm an attorney and the Fourth Amendment
22 matters to me. I carry it in my pocket along with
23 the Bill of Rights, and on a purely academic level,
24 it's interesting that folks who would want to
25 protect the Fifth Amendment with Miranda Rights

2 because we see it on TV where the Fifth Amendment
3 provides no such protections, and the Fourth
4 Amendment, which is arguably stronger, doesn't. And
5 that is just from an academic level why this package
6 is so important. The next piece is just if you grow
7 up in the City of New York, as I did, and you go to
8 high school in the Bronx, as I did, you're going to
9 get stopped and searched against your consent, and
10 that—that is just a lived experience for myself and
11 so very many New Yorkers. And it's part of why I
12 fought so very hard for this legislation both with
13 my colleagues asking folks to sign onto the bill and
14 being fairly forceful with the sponsors about being
15 aggressive as possible to make sure we got it done.
16 I've received all sorts of pushback including from
17 the Mayor Office, but I continue to stand strong for
18 it, and after everything we've done, it would be
19 hard to vote against it. I understand that there's
20 a lot left to do, and I'm committed to getting it
21 done next year. I also just wanted to take a moment
22 to say that some people say they are progressives,
23 but some people actually act like it, and that is
24 most Melissa Mark-Viverito who passed rules reforms
25 and actually followed them. Eliminated LULUs, made

2 the body full-time. It's been member driven or a
3 place that people who are independent like me are
4 able to still get things done. Time and time again,
5 the Speaker has stood up for residents over special
6 interests, and the big question has always been is
7 this good policy. No one is like you, Melissa, and
8 no one will be able to replace you. I vote aye on
9 all.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11 [coughs]

12 CLERK: King.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I just want to say
14 congratulations to everyone who has passed
15 legislation over the last four years and done all
16 they've done to improve the lives of all of us here
17 in the City of New York. It's been a pleasure and
18 congratulations to all of those who are starting a
19 new chapter in their lives, and I will be voting yes
20 on all and abstaining from 1604-A and 182.

21 CLERK: Koo.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Madam Public
23 Advocate, I will save my remarks for future
24 meetings. [laughter] I will vote aye on all except
25 541.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
3 [shushing for quiet] Thank you.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you for
6 that.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, and I
8 want to wish everyone a happy holidays, and all the
9 Council Members, and all the central staff, and all
10 of us.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Happy holidays to
12 you, too.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: And everyone, yeah.
14 Thank you.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, sir.

16 CLERK: Koslowitz.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Thank you.

18 May I please be excused to explain my vote?

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, Council
20 Member.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I want to
22 thank our Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito for the last
23 four years on a great job. I also look forward to
24 seeing the Public Advocate for the next four years
25 facing us during Council meetings.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Oh, thank you.

3 [laughter]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I also want to
5 address my colleagues who are leaving who are term
6 limited. I know what it feels like to be term
7 limited, but four years from now you can return.

8 [laughter] [cheers/applause] I waited eight, but
9 here I am and I have another four years. So, to all
10 of you good luck and as I walk out the door in four
11 years, I look forward to seeing some of you walk in
12 the door in four years. Thank you and have a great
13 holiday.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

15 CLERK: Lander.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request
17 permission to explain my vote?

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, Madam
20 Public Advocate. To Annabel, Dan, Darlene, David,
21 Jimmy, Julissa, Liz, Rosie and Vinny, I have learned
22 from you, been inspired by you, argued with you, had
23 you plastic bags on my door, but nothing in them.
24 To be clear, the roomers that they contained
25 Jumaane's intestines are entirely false [laughter]

2 and grown a lot from working with you. Really,
3 deepest thanks for our friendships, which have grown
4 and for your service to our city, which has been
5 powerful. Melissa, it has been an extraordinary
6 privilege to serve in this Council under your
7 speakership thanks in very large part to your
8 leadership. We are on a path to close Rikers. We
9 are setting the model nationally for what a
10 sanctuary city looks like for a right to counsel for
11 low-income tenants facing eviction, for a fair work
12 week, for fast food and retail workers, protections
13 against freelancers against getting stiffed. The
14 largest participatory budgeting program in North
15 America except for Paris and we're going to catch
16 them. Comprehensive reform that have made the body
17 more fair, effective and transparent in a way that
18 has served us extraordinarily well this term, and I
19 believe will carry us strongly into the future.
20 Unlike some others, I hope it's an even more
21 progressive Council next term, but whatever comes
22 next this one has been extraordinary. Thank you.
23 With that, I vote aye on all with the exception of
24 Intro 182-D on which I vote no.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 [coughs]

4 CLERK: Koslowitz.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I vote aye.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

7 [background comments]

8 CLERK: Levin.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to
10 explain my vote.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, Madam
13 Public Advocate. I want to also acknowledge our
14 great colleagues who are leaving the Council this
15 being their last stated meeting. Darlene Mealy who
16 is one of the most extraordinary negotiators that I
17 know who has done such an amazing job for her
18 constituents over these last 12 years. Darlene,
19 congratulations. I wish you all the best. Jimmy
20 Vacca who has brought so much Joy to this job. I-I-
21 I know of nobody else that takes whatever that he's
22 working on with that it occupies—it could be the
23 most—whatever it is, it's the most important thing,
24 and—and Jimmy you've just been an inspiration to
25

2 everybody that's worked with you. Dan Garodnick is
3 such a wealth of ideas, and has taken-

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
5 [shushing for quiet]

6 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
7 down please.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: --every issue with
9 plumbing the depths to make sure that this city is
10 working for every single resident of New York City.
11 David Greenfield who is one of the most brilliant
12 people I've had the opportunity to serve with.
13 David Greenfield has-is always striving to make sure
14 that-that everybody gets the services that they
15 deserve. Julissa Ferreras-Copeland led this Finance
16 Committee and this amazing finance staff through
17 four of the most progressive budgets that this has
18 ever seen and maybe will ever see.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
20 [shushing for quiet]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: So, Julissa, thank
22 you. Rosie Mendez.

23 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
24 down, please.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Rosie, you have
3 been like a big sister to me since before I was a
4 Council Member. I think you'll continue to be a
5 like a big sister to me, and just your commitment
6 even just in the last couple of days to the
7 legislation that you've advanced over the years has
8 been totally inspiring. Thank you. Liz Crowley,
9 who is amazingly courageous and took stands that may
10 have cost her politically, but have—have—will—will
11 stand the test of time as major courageous stands.
12 Thank you, Liz. Vinny Gentile whose love of
13 Brooklyn has been evident every single day that he
14 has been in this job. Thank you Vinny. Annabel
15 Palma who really is the heart and soul of this
16 council, and Annabel since I first met you, you have
17 continued to be an inspiration. I wish you all the
18 luck in the future. I can't wait to work with you
19 when you're with the Administration, but really
20 truly the heart and soul of this council, and last—
21 last but not least, Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito
22 who has been such an amazing steward of this body
23 and as an institution, we have grown and become more
24 democratic and stronger under leadership, and I want
25 to thank you and wish you all the best and with

2 that, I vote aye on all. Happy holidays to
3 everybody. Thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 CLERK: Levine.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Madam Public
7 Advocate, permission to briefly explain my vote?

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Alright, well,
10 I'll be voting aye on all today including Intro-

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
12 [shushing for quiet]

13 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
14 down please.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please.

16 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
17 down or take it outside.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: --including Intro
20 182, and I have to say that the remarks offered by
21 Council Member Torres earlier were the most eloquent
22 and powerful I've heard on the floor of this body,
23 and I want to thank him for a bill, which will help
24 thousands of constituents in my district and New
25 Yorkers around the city ensure that their rights are

2 protected in the midst of encounters with police.

3 I'm just so proud of what this body has accomplished

4 over the past four years under the leadership of our

5 incredible Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito who's rock

6 solid commitment to social and economic justice

7 never waivered. Who made this term the most

8 productive in history and whose openness and

9 fairness made this an incredible time to be a

10 Council Member, and I want to thank the other nine

11 colleagues whose last stated is today. Unlike

12 Laurie, if it's okay, I'm going to have pity on the

13 men and include them as well, and I'll start with

14 Dan and thank him for being an unfailingly-

15 unfailingly thoughtful and insightful voice. Thank

16 you Rosie for your passion and for your

17 fearlessness. Thank you, David, for applying your

18 searing intellect to the cause of making the city a

19 better place and for destroying the low-carb diet of

20 all of us on every Jewish holiday. Thank you Vinny

21 for never being afraid to fight for the causes you

22 believe in. Thank you, Annabel for your commitment

23 to the people so often left behind in the city.

24 Thank you Julissa for being an inspiring model of a

25 strong and passionate and effective leader. Thank

2 you, Darlene for your friendship, for your inspiring
3 life story and for nurturing young Costa
4 Constantinides into the great leader that he is
5 today. Thank you Elizabeth for never backing down
6 from a fight no matter the odds, and thank you Jimmy
7 for never hesitating to say the one thing everyone
8 else in this room was thinking, but didn't have the
9 guts to say. [laughter] I will miss all of you
10 terribly and I look forward to many years of
11 friendship and partnership with you, and wish you
12 all the best. Thank you.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

14 CLERK: Maisel.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: In favor of all
16 except no on 182-D and 541-C.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

18 CLERK: Mealy.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: May I explain my
20 vote?

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I just want to
23 vote no on Intro 182-D, aye on all. I just want to
24 thank all my previous co-leaders of the Brooklyn
25

2 Delegation, Martin Deman, Public Advocate Tish
3 James--

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
5 Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: --David
7 Greenfield, Carlos Menchaca, and the one I must say
8 Mark Treyger for--for supporting me even when I'm not
9 here or here and giving me the encouragement to go
10 further. I want to thank you so much. I want to
11 thank Annabel Palma for keeping me off the edge at
12 times. I just want to thank Mark-Viverito for all
13 that she have done as our Speaker. I want to thank
14 the Woman's Caucus, Laurie Cumbo a fearless woman.
15 I want to thank Elizabeth Crowley who was co-leader
16 in our Woman's Caucus. I want to thank Helen
17 Rosenthal for doing--passing the torch onto us, and I
18 want to thank all the ladies in this Caucus, Karen
19 Koslowitz, Annabel Palma, Debbie Rose, Rosie
20 Martinez, Margaret Chin, Inez Barron--

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
22 [shushing for quiet]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: --warrior, our
24 achiever warrior. I want to thank Vanessa Gibson of
25 Bronx for all that you do, and I just want to let

2 everyone know I must say being an elected official I
3 never in my wildest dreams thought I would become an
4 elected official. Sometimes I even pinch myself.
5 Only by the goodness of God that I am here today,
6 and I am glad that I'm not a politician. I am a
7 servant of the people, and I thank Costa
8 Constantinides for all that he have done with her,
9 and we have to go back and reach that and bring
10 young people into this body, because we need new
11 vision. We need new strong vision for this and not
12 all conservatives. I want to thank—all the things
13 that I've done in Brownsville, Imagination
14 Playground the second in the world, the historic
15 land use of Stone Avenue Library, the first
16 children's library in the world in Brownsville, and
17 I want to thank all the things I've done in
18 Breevoort (sp?) State of the Art, and one thing I
19 want all my colleagues who are leaving to know, my
20 motto is: The best is yet to come, and I'm
21 Councilwoman Darlene Mealy. [laughter] [background
22 comments]

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
24 Council Member. Please be mindful that we still

2 have two resolutions to vote for those who are
3 leaving. We need to meet—maintain a quorum.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] And
5 to our Public Advocate.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you so
7 much, Council Member.

8 CLERK: Menchaca.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to
10 explain my vote?

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 CLERK: I want to thank Speaker Melissa
13 Mark-Viverito and her entire staff for the work that
14 we've done together. The work that we've done
15 around sanctuary cities out of the beautiful honor
16 of being the chair of the Immigration Committee has
17 been something I'll never forget. I don't think
18 that we'll have this kind of alignment when you
19 include our incredible Finance Chair Julissa
20 Ferreras-Copeland. When we three got together, and
21 decided that something was going to happen, it
22 happened from adult literacy at the highest levels
23 we've seen in recent history over a \$12 million
24 initiative to really commit to our adults who need
25 education.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
3 [shushing for quiet]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --to the
5 incredible public defender program NYFUP. We-we did
6 it. We did it together, and I cannot wait to
7 continue to do that in-in that spirit in the next
8 term. Thank you to all the members who are termed
9 out, for your incredible service to this community.
10 You have left a wake for us, and all of you from the
11 Speaker to-to all of the members will leave us with
12 a lot of to do for this next term. But we have done
13 a lot already, and I want to say that one of the
14 things that I'm lifting up today is the concept of
15 participatory democracy. When we put our people in
16 our districts first, beautiful thing happens. This--
17 these last four budgets have been passed with a lot
18 more in the millions of dollars of participatory
19 budgeting project, the most we've ever seen and I
20 hope we can continue to grow that. Each of these
21 projects means that somebody in our community was
22 connected to it, and also legislation--

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
24 [shushing for quiet]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --legislation
3 that was born and grown out of our districts is
4 important to me because those people who are right
5 now thinking about the work that is important in
6 their neighborhood on their block in their schools
7 will one day become future Council Members and we
8 will have an incredible diverse especially with more
9 women in this council. And so I want to thank
10 Ritchie Torres and Antonio Reynoso who have pushed
11 this work together in the Right to Know Act, but I
12 will voting no on 182-D and aye on the rest. Thank
13 you.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

15 CLERK: Mendez.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you. I'd
17 like to say a few thank yous. I want to say when I
18 first entered the Council there were 21 women.
19 We're going to be going down to 11, but also with my
20 departure we now will have no out Lesbians in the
21 Council. [background comments] In order to
22 summarize my 12 years, all I want to do is say thank
23 you to my staff. I am only as good as you are, and
24 I have to say names. Thank you Vanessa Diaz Lopez,
25 Lisa Kaplan, Shiela Rodriguez, Greg Taylor, Chris

2 LaBarge, Jasmine Torres, Carlina Rivera, Matt Giano,
3 a Alta Aloveria, Iraq Sohoski, Silica Galvez Malan,
4 Jasmine Askew (sp?), Michael Schweinberg (sp?)
5 Alicia Martin, Tricia Ramsharik, Georgian Chris,
6 John Felt, Darrio Quinset, Jorge Jaminez, Michelle
7 Burger, Rose Marie Diaz, Victoria Herbus, Kate
8 Mikuliak, Jessica Nopomiachi and Barbara Sherman.

9 Thank you for your years of service to Council
10 District 2. I want to thank the BLAC Caucus staff
11 that I worked with, Alex Riashum Ahakam (sp?) and
12 Susanna Davis and my then Public Housing Committee
13 staff Baaba Halm and Ben Goodman. Thank you is not
14 enough for your service to my district to my
15 community and to this city. Thank you very much.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, Rosie.
17 [pause] Council Member Mendez, how do you vote?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you. I'd
19 like to vote no on 182-D and yes on all the rest.
20 Thank you very much, Madam Public Advocate.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

22 CLERK: Palma.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Madam Public
24 Advocate, permission to explain my vote.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: I want to take
3 this moment to recognize all my colleagues former
4 and current who I have had the privilege and-and
5 honor to serve with. You all have been-worked with
6 knowledge, support, your compassion and-and your
7 commitment and the commitment that you bring to this
8 body has always inspired me, and has always made
9 this job a little bit easier to do. I want to thank
10 my-the staff that I've had Team Palma. So, I'd like
11 to refer to them. My former Chief of Staff has
12 joined me here today and Maria Salazar. I want to
13 thank her for taking time out to come to what is now
14 my last Stated Council meeting as a member, but my
15 entire staff: Avi, Tonya, Jason, Kenny, Sharee.
16 Without you guys, we are not able to do the work
17 that we do, but I'm all-I think you and I met twelve
18 years ago. Well, not I think. I know we met 12
19 years ago under very a very distressed situation
20 [laughs] and I-I want to say that the friendship
21 that we have developed I will take with me for the
22 rest of my life, and-and you will forever be part of
23 my life and forever be part of someone that I will
24 call for advice when I see myself in a certain
25 situation. The Bronx Delegation has been my system

2 in the Bronx. I thank each and every one of the
3 members that have served with me previously and—and
4 today. Vanessa, thank you for always stepping in
5 when I needed someone to—to co-chair, to chair the—
6 the meeting for me. You've never hesitated as any
7 of the members did. Ritchie, stay goals, stay
8 strong. I am so proud of you today for the pieces
9 of legislation that you're voting but most proud for
10 your stance for not letting anybody rock your
11 foundation, and for know that at the end of the day
12 when you go to sleep today, your conscience will be
13 clear in knowing that you did the right thing. You
14 make me proud, my brother, and lastly, I just want
15 to say thank you to my loving husband who's here
16 with me for being my rock, for being most of all my
17 sounding board when a lot of things in this place
18 didn't go the way I thought they would. You—you
19 were there to give me a sound voice. Thank you so
20 much for your support, and thank you to the people
21 of District 18 who had the courage to—and I say
22 courage and I don't mean that lightly, but courage
23 sort of like me, four times to the City Council. I
24 thank you for the privilege. Thank you. I vote
25 aye.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 [applause]

4 CLERK: Perkins.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Thank you, Madam
6 Public Advocate and to my colleagues, it's great to
7 be back at the City Council.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes. [laughter]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: And I—I want to
10 vote aye on all with the exception of Intro 182-D. I
11 vote no.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Thank
13 you.

14 CLERK: Richards.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Permission to
16 explain my vote?

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Alrighty. I
19 will not be long, but I—I just want to pick up where
20 I left off in saying that, you know, we're having a
21 debate about giving a card to people who are—who are
22 stopped, and I don't think that this is earth
23 shattering. I think--I have faith in our Police
24 Department and the men and women in the Police
25 Department that they would be able to give the

2 people a card. We're not talking about anything
3 earth shattering. So with that, I vote no on 182.
4 I also want to give a ton of credit to Council
5 Member Ritchie Torres, who I-I call the Donovan
6 Richards of the Bronx [laughter] Because he's
7 endured an immense amount of attacks from both
8 allies and enemies alike while he's worked
9 honestly—honestly and diligently to negotiate the
10 best bill he could deliver for the residents of New
11 York City and I want to add to the statement and
12 then say may we save our attacks for the very system
13 that resists reforms and not our allies in the
14 struggle. I'll move on and say we're passing self-
15 storage today, which has certainly been overlooked,
16 and some work around that. I want to thank all of
17 the individuals who—who worked on this issue,
18 Industrial Jobs Coalition, Raju Mann, Brian Paul and
19 all of our colleagues who worked in the IBZ
20 Coalition, ANHD. We are making good on our first
21 promise in the industrial Action Plan by preserving
22 good paying jobs for high skilled workers who are
23 mostly from communities of color that have a lack of
24 access to high paying job opportunities or adequate
25 education. And one of the best parts about this

2 offer as well is that we are also empowering members
3 to have more control over the projects that get
4 built in their districts. So, with that being said,
5 I vote aye on everything except 182. Thank you.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thanks.

7 CLERK: Rose.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Permission to
9 explain my vote?

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I've always
12 supported comprehensive police reform--

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
14 [shushing for quiet]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: --that protects the
16 civil rights of all New Yorkers--

17 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Please
18 keep t down.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: --while ensuring
20 that the public is safe and that police officers can
21 do their jobs effectively. These are common goals
22 shared by almost all New Yorkers, and I believe
23 today's Right to Consent bill brings us closer to
24 these goals. The final version of Intro 182-D,
25 however, is not something I can vote for today.

2 While I support its principles, and its intentions
3 of supporters—of the sponsors, after close reading
4 of the bill and conversations with constituents and
5 advocates, I believe it is better to start this
6 conversation in the next term. I look forward to
7 continue to work with my colleagues to what our
8 shared goal of public safety and civil rights for
9 all. I want to commend Council Member Torres for
10 his tenacity and courage, and my vote today is not
11 personal. It's emotional. I cannot in all good
12 conscience vote for this being the home district of
13 the death of Eric Garner and it still hasn't been
14 resolved. So, I'd like to also say it's been an
15 honor and privilege to having served—to having
16 served with my departing colleagues. I want to
17 thank you all for making this the most productive
18 Council in the City Council history, and to Speaker
19 Melissa Mark-Viverito you have left and indelible
20 blueprint, and I will miss you, and with that I vote
21 aye on all except Intro 182-D.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

23 CLERK: Rosenthal.

24

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I proudly vote
3 aye on all. Madam Speaker—Madam Public Advocate,
4 can I explain my vote?

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Okay. Listen,
7 I respect those in my district who have called
8 asking me to vote no on 182-D, but I'm very proud to
9 stand with Council Member Torres, and thank him for
10 all of his hard work and the work that he's done I
11 believe to move the ball forward. I think that your
12 analysis of the situation is spot on. I think you
13 have the long view in mind. I think that what this
14 will do is begin to make the PD feel very
15 comfortable about what you're asking them to do, and
16 with much admiration for getting the Administration
17 on board. And as you say, much admiration to the
18 Speaker for starting the negotiations in good faith.
19 I'm just—I learned from you everyday, colleague and,
20 you know, your wisdom I think will prevail in this
21 one, and I thank you for that. It's so sad to see
22 my female colleagues go. Yes, my male colleagues,
23 too, but mostly my female colleagues. I've learned
24 from all of you and, you know, hope that some of you
25 run for office again in 2021 just move somewhere

2 else of something and come back. You've been
3 incredibly inspirational, and especially, of course,
4 to Council Member Melissa Mark-Viverito who's been
5 an extraordinary speaker and has set the bar high
6 for whichever male follows her. Thank you so much.

7 CLERK: Salamanca.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I proudly vote
9 aye on all. Thank you.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11 CLERK: Torres. [pause]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Permission to
13 explain my vote?

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I'm going to miss
16 all of my colleagues who are leaving, but I-I do
17 want to note that I would not be where I am today,
18 but for Council Member Jimmy Vacca who is one of the
19 most honorable and decent public servants I know.
20 Jimmy, I'm speaking about you. [laughter]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I wanted to be
22 here to listen to this.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Even when—even
24 when he disagrees with you, he has a way of
25 disarming people with his sense of humor. The Jimmy

2 Vacca Comedy Hour is the highlight of leadership
3 meetings. [laughter] And there's no public servant
4 to whom I owe a greater debt than Council Member
5 Jimmy Vacca. The first campaign for which I ever
6 worked was Jimmy Vacca's 2005 campaign for the City
7 Council. The first legislative office in which I
8 ever worked was the Office of Council Member Jimmy
9 Vacca. The first speech I ever gave was delivered
10 at Jimmy Vacca's inauguration in 2006. I was an
11 anxious 16-year-old speaking in front of 700 people.
12 To say that Jimmy has had a profound influence on my
13 life is an understatement. He has dedicated nearly
14 four decades of his life to public service. He
15 spent 26 years as a District Manager for Community
16 Board 10 in the East Bronx, and in 12 years in the
17 New York City Council, and as a District Manager he
18 was such a force of nature that he earned a profile
19 in the New York Times. The title of the New York
20 Times article reads: *James Vacca: The King of*
21 *Clean*. The article begins with the following
22 passage: Spotting an abandoned car on a Pelham Bay
23 side street, James Vacca stomps on the brake, whips
24 out a pen and scribbles the location and license
25 number on a take-takeout menu. Later, driving

2 solely through a housing project in Throggs Neck,
3 his normally cheerful face looks chagrined as he
4 sees candy wrappers and newspaper flutter along the
5 sidewalks. Jimmy Vacca, the District Manager of
6 Community Board quickly assures the passenger: My
7 streets are 90% clean. The article continues. Not
8 too long ago, he says he saw a man toss a cup from a
9 car. Mr. Vacca tapped on the window and hurled the
10 cup back inside. [laughter] Excuse me. You've lost
11 something. [laughter] That moment—that moment is
12 Vintage Vacca. If I could have just 30 more.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Sure.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Early in the
15 week, I was touring the Urban Assembly School for
16 Wildlife Conservation where the tragic stabbing took
17 place, and toward the end of the tour the principal
18 asked me, How did you enter politics? And I replied
19 I actually went into politics at the urging of my
20 high school principal Robert Leader who at the time
21 was the longest serving principal in the public
22 school system. The principal then said, Robert
23 Leader is a legend, and I replied, Robert Leader
24 introduced me to then District Manager and now
25 Council Member Jimmy Vacca, and that principal said,

2 Jimmy Vacca is another legend. And it struck me at
3 that very moment how blessed I have been. How
4 blessed my life has been by the guidance and
5 generosity of legendary public servants from Robert
6 Leader to Jimmy Vacca. Jimmy, I will miss you
7 dearly. I love you like family and I will forever
8 be proud to be an alumnus in the Jimmy Vacca School
9 of Public Service. Thank you for serving the City
10 of New York and thank you for mentoring those or us
11 who proudly carry your mantle long after your
12 service in this body. Thank you, Jimmy.

13 [cheers/applause]

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Eloquent.
15 [background comments] Continuing on with roll call,
16 Jimmy Mac.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Oh, oh. I
18 definitely—I want to be clear. I might be the
19 deciding vote. So, I definitely vote [laughter] for
20 all including Intro 182-D. Thank you.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Excellent. Thank
22 you.

23 CLERK: Treyger.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Why do I have to
25 follow Ritchie Torres?

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs]

3 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Rules reform
4 change. [laughter] Public Advocate may I please be
5 excused to explain my vote?

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I would like to
8 congratulate all of my colleagues who are passing
9 bills today, and to extend my gratitude to Speaker
10 Melissa Mark-Viverito who led us through an
11 incredibly productive Council session—

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
13 [shushing for quiet]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: --the leadership
15 on immigrant rights including expanding language
16 access and improving police-community relations has
17 made an indelible mark on our city. She also helped
18 create the recovery and resiliency committee and
19 some folks question what could that committee do?
20 Well, thanks to my Speaker and my colleague Ritchie
21 Torres, we had the first hearing ever in a NYCHA
22 complex in Coney Island. We secured \$3 billion for
23 NYCHA from FEMA. That is a victory we could all be
24 very-very proud of. I'd like to particularly also

25

2 congratulate Council Members Ritchie Torres and
3 Antonio Reynoso—

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
5 [shushing for quiet]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: --on the passage
7 of the Right to Know Act, which constitutes a
8 significant step forward in further
9 professionalizing and restructuring encounters
10 between police and civilians. I am grateful to
11 Council Member Reynoso for working with me to
12 strengthen the language access requirements in the
13 bill to ensure that Right to Know is universal
14 regardless of English language proficiency. I'm
15 equally grateful to Council Member Ritchie Torres,
16 whose steady advocacy convinced me of the pressing
17 importance of these reforms, and while I appreciate
18 many advocates' concerns about the scope of 182
19 including advocates for victims of sexual harassment
20 and assault, I firmly believe that this bill is a
21 step in the right direction towards increasing
22 transparency and police encounters. As with many of
23 our efforts to undo systemic issues in our society,
24 which were built up over decades, these bills are
25 imperfect, but they are not the end of this body's

2 dedication to criminal justice reform. In this
3 Council—in this Council and in the previous Council
4 we as a body have been committed to pursuing
5 criminal justice reform. In the next Council I am
6 confident that we'll continue to engage in serious
7 dialogue about the issues of public safety that will
8 work to implement innovative policies that advance
9 justice and equality for New Yorkers. I just want
10 to also give a shout out to some of the members who
11 are leaving, my dynamic colleagues Rosie Mendez, Dan
12 Garodnick, our awesome and dynamic Speaker, whose
13 had—whose had my back, Council Member Jimmy Vacca,
14 Council Member Annabel Palma who is so
15 compassionate, has a heart of gold and has the best
16 recipe for Sofrito anywhere in New York. [laughter]
17 Council—Council—the Chair of the Finance Committee
18 Julissa Ferreras-Copeland, who has been so
19 supportive including helping get Teacher's Choice to
20 record levels. My courageous colleague Elizabeth
21 Crowley, my awesome Co-Chair of the Brooklyn
22 Delegation Darlene Mealy, and my—my—my—my colleague,
23 my neighboring colleague—Actually both of my
24 neighbors Vinny Gentile and David Greenfield are
25 both leaving, but I'm still here in Southern

2 Brooklyn with Chaim Deutsch. With that, I vote aye
3 on all. Thank you Public Advocate. [applause]

4 CLERK: Ulrich.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Okay, let's get
6 this show on the road. [laughter] I'm voting yes on
7 everything except Intro 1182-D--

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
9 [shushing for quiet]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: --385-C, 541-C
11 and 1399-A, and a happy and a healthy New Year to
12 everyone. Thank you very much.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Alright.

14 [background comments, pause]

15 CLERK: Vac-- [coughs] Excuse me,
16 Vacca. [background comments]

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
18 [shushing for quiet]

19 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
20 down, please.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
22 Chambers, please. We're still in session.

23 [background comments] Council Member Vacca.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Yes, thank you. I
25 can explain my vote.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: May we have quiet
3 in the Chambers, please.

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
5 down, folks. We need to have it quiet.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
7 [shushing for quiet]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: It's very hard to
9 fully respond or fully appreciate Councilman Torres'
10 statement and his faith in me. I have been lucky
11 over my life, and I'd have to thank my staff. I
12 have to thank my daughter. I thank my daughter so
13 much. For 12 years, I've had great people, and I've
14 tried to mentor them and they have achieved
15 fantastic heights all of them. We've worked
16 together and we have disagreed and I we have been--
17 I've encouraged that, and we've learned all together
18 and seeing my staff grow has meant the world to me.
19 Hearing Ritchie Torres speak today was an amazing
20 moment of pride, and that I've made a contribution
21 to that is just overwhelming to me. I want to thank
22 everybody here. You know I love you all, and I do.
23 I say that from my heart. I love you all. I'm in
24 awe of this institution. I've been involved in
25 government as Ritchie said. I don't know how many

2 of you know these stories. I've been involved since
3 I'm 12 years old. I—I came to the steps because I
4 was in the 8th Grade at Junior High School 101 and
5 the buses never came. So, I went to an anti-MTA
6 demonstration [cheers/applause] on the steps of City
7 Hall, and I most take—I most times take the train
8 here today, and I want you to know that not all
9 demonstrations were successful [laughter] because we
10 still have fighting to do, and I realize that very
11 much. But, boy, do I value this institution. We
12 have such a great body. We have a Chamber that
13 every time walk in here I know I'm privileged. I'm
14 a kid from the Bronx. I grew up in modest—modest
15 means—with parents of modest means who did the world
16 for me, and I've—I've loved giving back. I give
17 back when these people walk in my office, and they
18 don't know where to go, and they think that Jimmy
19 Vacca knows where to get them. I'm so honored by
20 that. I love them. When they yell at me, I hug
21 them and I tell them it's going to be okay, and that
22 has been my reward in life. So, God bless you all.
23 I'm not going anywhere, and I'm going to be involved
24 somehow, and—and I know that my life will continue
25 to be full. So, God bless. [applause]

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
3 [shushing for quiet]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I do--Ritchie, I
5 love you, but I--I do vote no on 182-D [laughter]
6 [cheers/applause]

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
8 [shushing for quiet]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I do vote no on
10 182-D and 541 and 717 as well. Thank you.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
12 [shushing for quiet] Thank you.

13 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
14 down, please.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Jimmy Mac, I'm
16 going to miss him.

17 CLERK: Williams.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I be
19 excused to explain my vote?

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.

22 Just to finish my speech I was giving before, the
23 advocates got us here. They're the reason that many
24 of us are in leadership--

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
3 [shushing for quiet]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: --and so to
5 cast them aside now doesn't really make particular
6 sense. When I was listing to the speeches on the
7 Speaker rout, I heard many people say that movements
8 are created not by elected officials, but by
9 advocates, by activists. Yet, we're pushing them
10 aside. Every advocacy group all of them, CPR, NAN,
11 NWAACP, legal groups, Black and Latino law
12 enforcement organizations.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
14 [shushing for quiet]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Everyone. Not
16 just the crazy lefts, but everyone who helped bring
17 us here. All the people we go to for cover, all the
18 people we've asked for advice are against 182. Most
19 importantly the families of the movement, the people
20 who have lost people like Nicole Bell's and Sean
21 Bell's mom, Eric Garner's mother, Ramarley Graham's
22 mother and Anthony Biaz's mother, Delrawn Small's
23 sister and family. All of them including the youth
24 that were spoke about today--

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
3 [shushing for quiet]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: --have asked us
5 to vote no, not in opposition to Ritchie Torres, who
6 I believe is very sincere and I congratulate what he
7 did today and not take away that sincerity. But, so
8 that when the tape is replayed we can say we stood
9 with them when they stood with us, and that was what
10 I wanted to complete. I do want to say just in the
11 eight years I've been here, I called a lot of things
12 generally not dishonest and generally not
13 disrespectful. I have never been cut off. That was
14 my most—I've felt the most disrespected in the eight
15 years that I've been here simply because I follow
16 the rules, and I have never pushed forward when
17 asked not, but there seemed to be a mismatch in what
18 the rules were here and who was allowed to speak
19 further and who wasn't depending on what was—folks
20 wanted to hear say. So, I felt personally
21 disrespected. I am proud, however, to say that I'm
22 been led by women in this body particularly the
23 Public Advocate, Madam Speaker, the Finance Chair
24 who all made history, and I would never do anything
25 to disrespect any one of you. I think it's a great

2 day when we can look at this body and say we've
3 accomplished so much in the years we've been here,
4 and we've been led by women. Even though [bell] I
5 have nuts in places, when come in the bird side view
6 under the leadership that was present here, I think
7 we've moved the city in the right direction. With
8 that, I am going to vote aye on all with the
9 exception of 182-D where I vote no, and Land Use
10 802, 803, 804 and accompanying resos where I
11 abstain.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

13 CLERK: Matteo.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Madam Public
15 Advocate, may I be excused to explain my vote?

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: To my good friend
18 Ritchie, Ritchie you pull out all the stops today,
19 but you are going to give into Jimmy and you
20 certainly are not going to give into me. [laughter]
21 I want to begin by wishing my colleagues who are
22 leaving all the best. I've been in this building for
23 quite some time as a staff and now as an elected
24 official. You all have a certain warm place in my
25 heart to—I—I do want to mention to the Speaker we

2 certainly don't agree on a lot. Okay, we don't
3 agree on much, but we have worked well together--

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
5 [shushing for quiet]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: --on the things
7 that we can agree with, and we've passed come good
8 piece of legislation together. I thank you for
9 that. I thank you for your friendship. I wish you
10 nothing but the best. To my good friend David
11 Greenfield on my left, you have been a great
12 confidante and friend, and during my toughest time
13 this year with dad, you--you certainly were there.
14 Ill neve forget that, and I wish you nothing but the
15 best. I think Mark Levine talked about Jimmy Vacca
16 and--and what he says here. You should see him in
17 Leadership. He really--we're going to miss you in
18 Leadership and B&T. Jimmy, you have been such a
19 great council member, such a great friend to me.
20 You're going to do great in anything that you do.
21 Please make sure that you keep in touch with all of
22 us and we love you. To the rest of my colleagues,
23 we wish you nothing but the best. I do want to
24 thank all of my colleagues for--for--it was a tough
25 year for me, and you're all there on a personal and

2 on a friendship level, and I thank you for that.
3 Back to business, I have a lot of no votes. I'm
4 going to vote no on 182-D-

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
6 [shushing for quiet]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: --385-C, 541-C,
8 717-A, 804-A, 1012-A, 1015-A, 1039-A, 1269-A, 1399-
9 A, 1419-A, 1465-A, 1604-A, 1622-1629-A, 1632-A,
10 Land Use 817 and Reso 18--and Reso 1800. So, with
11 that I will vote yes o the rest. I wish everybody a
12 Merry Christmas, Happy Hanukkah, a safe and happy
13 New York, and I will see the rest of my colleagues
14 in January.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
16 Continuing.

17 CLERK: Van Bramer.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Permission to
19 explain my vote?

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: So, I wasn't
22 expecting to say these remarks when I got up this
23 morning, but I have to tell you that when I got up I
24 was incredibly torn about this vote. But watching
25 Ritchie Torres today at the Pre-State press

2 conference reminded me of something I had been
3 thinking a lot about, and that is during the Speaker
4 debates over the last couple of months, I've heard
5 Corey Johnson talk about his depression as a young
6 man. I've heard Ritchie Torres talk about his
7 depression as a young man. I, too, have talked
8 about that, and I've sat there some of those nights
9 and remarking to myself how awful the homophobia
10 that drove these three young men to those places.
11 And as I watched Ritchie today at the Pre-Stated
12 press conference defend himself, defend his
13 positions, I very much identified with that young
14 gay man who was trying to do something that he
15 thought was right, and that he thought was best
16 where there were lots of people pushing incredibly
17 hard on him forcefully. In some cases unfairly
18 because I believe that Council Member Torres wants
19 the best result here, and wants justice and I
20 thought where am I a much older gay man who's seen a
21 lot more in this. Let me be clear, the bill is not
22 all that I wish it was, and I wish it went further,
23 but I want to stand with Council Member Torres, and
24 I want to speak in favor of this piece of
25 legislation, which is not all that we need but that

2 is a step forward. And while it is frustrating to
3 some, I am not going to join the chorus of those
4 attacking this young man. I want to support this
5 today, support him today and then hope we can all
6 come back and do something even more profound in the
7 next Council. So, with that, I vote aye on all.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 [coughs]

10 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Again as we are
12 taking our—our final votes for this session, I again
13 just want to extend the deepest appreciation to all
14 of the staff here, and at my district office. I'm
15 very happy that we're joined by Diana Ayala who will
16 be succeeding me to represent District 8, someone
17 that I believe in, I reached out, I've mentored and
18 thankfully she's—the same way I'm hearing the story
19 of empowered mentorship of Ritchie with Jimmy, the
20 importance of us taking the time to invest in the
21 future generations and in the next—in the next
22 generation of leadership. I have to say that today
23 I've been extremely proud. I think that today has
24 been a defining moment for my colleague Council
25 Member Torres. I've seen a level of courage that is

2 exemplary. This is what to me leadership is about.
3 That is what our job as legislators is that we
4 evaluate, we are pushed yes by advocates. We are
5 pushed by our experiences, but we look at a lens, a
6 wider lens when we have to make decisions in this
7 body and he took a tough decision and he knew—he
8 knew that he was going to get knocked, and as many
9 have mentioned, unfairly so. Anyone that would try
10 to question his integrity or his reasons for
11 arriving at that choice, really should do some self-
12 reflection. This is a young man who truly and
13 passionately believes in what it is that he stands
14 up for, what he chooses to do, what direction he
15 decides to take, and I'm proud of him today because
16 I have seen a level of maturity also in being able
17 to understand that it's not about going with which
18 way the wind goes, it's about being principled in
19 your decision, understanding that you may still be
20 criticized. I'm really, really proud today in
21 everything that's been said, and Ritchie, I consider
22 you a friend. I hope that you can consider me a
23 friend and a mentor. I can always be available to
24 you, be a partner to you in all that we do, and
25 again, I've tried to lead this body in the most

2 collegial way, and we're not going to agree every
3 single time. I hope that when we close this chapter
4 here today, that we can all fondly look at the work
5 that we've accomplished and fondly look at the
6 direction that we've taken this Council in, and I
7 have no regrets. Again, thank you all as we take
8 our final vote, and I know we have some other
9 matters here, but the final vote, which I proudly
10 vote aye on all.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. I,
12 too, want to recognize and congratulate Council
13 Member-Council Members Torres and Reynoso. They
14 have both profiles in courage, and I want to thank
15 the Speaker and all of the members of the Council
16 for allowing me to Chair this body. It's been an
17 honor and a privilege and I, too, want to say not
18 goodbye, but I am confident that I will see them
19 again, the Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito, Council
20 Member Miller-Mealy, Gentile, Greenfield, Garodnick,
21 Ferreras-Copeland, Vacca, Crowley, Mendez and Palma.
22 When one door closes, another door will certainly
23 open. All items on today's General Order Calendar
24 were adopted by a vote of 50 in the affirmative, 0
25 negative and 0 abstentions with the exception of

2 Intro 182-D, which was adopted by a vote of 27 in
3 the affirmative-- [applause] I'm not finished.
4 [laughter, background comments] 27 in the
5 affirmative—I got six pages. 27 in the affirmative,
6 20 negative and 3 abstentions, and Intro 541-C,
7 which was adopted by a vote of 37 in the
8 affirmative, 13 negative, and 0 abstentions;
9 [cheers/applause] Ah-ah, I'm not finished. I'm not
10 finished. [applause] Silencio. Thank you.

11 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
12 down, please.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And Intro 385-C,
14 which was adopted by a vote of 47 in the
15 affirmative, 3 negative and 0 abstentions, and Intro
16 1419-A, which was adopted by a vote of 47 in the
17 affirmative, 3 negative and 0 abstentions, and Land
18 Use 512 and Resolution 1786, which was adopted by a
19 vote of 49 in the affirmative, 1 negative and 0
20 abstentions, and Land Use 817 and Resolution 1800—We
21 are still in session.

22 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
23 down, please. Keep it down, please.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We're still in
25 session. Which was adopted by a vote of 47 in the

2 affirmative, 3 negative and 0 abstentions and Intro
3 717-A, which was adopted by a vote of 47 in the
4 affirmative, 3 negative and 0 abstentions; and Intro
5 804-A, which was adopted by a vote of 48 in the
6 affirmative—

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
8 down, please.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: --2 negative and
10 0 abstentions. Quiet in the Chambers, please. And
11 Intro 10—and Intro 1012-A which was adopted by a
12 vote of 48 in the affirmative, 2 negative and 0
13 abstentions; and Intro 1015-A, which was adopted by
14 a vote of 48 in the affirmative, 2 negative and 0
15 abstentions and Intro 1039-A, which was adopted by a
16 vote of 48 in the affirmative, 2 negative and 0
17 abstentions, and Intro 1269-A, which was adopted by
18 a vote of 48 in the affirmative, 2 negative and 0
19 abstentions, and Intro 1399-A, which was adopted by
20 a vote of 47 in the affirmative, 3 negative and 0
21 abstentions, and Intro 1465-A, which was adopted by
22 a vote of 48 in the affirmative, 2 negative and 0
23 abstentions, and 1604-A, which was adopted by a vote
24 of 46 in the affirmative, 3 negative, and 1
25 abstention, and Intro—

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
3 down, please. [shouting] Keep it down, please.
4 Keep it down.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
6 [shushing for quiet]

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
8 down, please.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And Intro 1629-A,
10 which was adopted by a vote of 48 in the
11 affirmative, 2 negative and 0 abstentions, and Land
12 Use 802, 803, 804 and accompanying resolutions,
13 which was adopted by a vote of 49 in the
14 affirmative, 0 abstentions and 1-0 negative and 1
15 abstention. Excuse me, and that concludes the tally
16 for today's vote. All items--

17 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
18 down, keep it down, please.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We still have
20 resolutions to vote for. Can we please have quiet
21 in the chambers? [background comments] I think
22 that's it. Introduction and reading of bills.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: For what it's
24 worth. I don't know how far it will go. Hold on.

2 All items have been referred to committee as
3 indicated on the agenda.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
5 [shushing for quiet]

6 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet
7 down, please. Quiet, please.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We're still in
9 session. We still have resolutions. If you're
10 exiting, please exit quietly. The first resolution
11 is Resolution 792-A, a resolution establish-
12 establishing January 30th annually as Fred T.
13 Karamatsu, of Civil Liberties and the Constitution.
14 Seeing no speakers, all of those in favor say aye.

15 COUNCIL MEMBERS: (in unison) Aye.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All those
17 opposed. Any abstentions. The ayes have you-have
18 it, and Resolution 1484-A, a resolution denouncing
19 the termination [interposing] [shushing for quiet].

20 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
21 down, please.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: A resolution
23 denouncing the termination of the DACA Program, and
24 calling the state and federal government to extend
25 protections for undocumented youth by passing the

2 New York State DREAM Act of 2017 as well as the
3 Federal DREAM Act of 2017, and the speaker—the first
4 speaker on that resolution will be Council Member
5 Menchaca. We are still in session. [shushing for
6 quiet]

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
8 down, please. Keep it down, please.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
10 Chambers as we now hear from Council Member
11 Menchaca.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you so
13 much, Public Advocate James. This has been a long
14 year resistance in action, and I'm proud that our
15 accomplishments have been so—of so many in our city,
16 and I stand in solidarity with all the DREAMers of
17 New York City and of our nation. Congress must pass
18 a clean DREAM Act before the end of the year. The
19 DREAMers, which include business leaders and—

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
21 [shushing for quiet]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --al those who
23 are supporting like elected officials and
24 immigration advocates. We heard from you yesterday
25 on the steps of City Hall, and dem—you demonstrated

2 how DREAMers mean—how much they mean to us and our
3 communities. New York City has consistently
4 demonstrated its full commitment to protecting
5 immigrants. We passed legislation and set policies
6 that forced the city agencies to protect personal
7 data of all New Yorkers--

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
9 [shushing for quiet]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --empowered our
11 Department of Education to keep ICE away from our
12 school children, prohibited ICE agents from entering
13 many city-owned buildings and properties and funded
14 legal services, adult literacy programs, mental
15 health and job service immigrants. I say pass the
16 Clean Act—Clean DREAM Act now in Congress in the
17 federal government and also pass the New York State
18 DREAM Act of 2017. Justice must be served. Thank
19 you.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
21 Seeing no other speakers, all of those in favor of
22 Resolution 1484-A say aye.

23 COUNCIL MEMBERS: (in unison) Aye.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All those
25 opposed. Any abstentions? The ayes have it, and

2 General Discussion and the only—oh, two speakers.

3 Council Member Jumaane Williams whose mother is in
4 the balcony. [background comments]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: My mother is in
6 Grenada.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: She was there.
8 [laughs]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: No, she's in
10 Grenada. [background comments]

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Okay.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: You know I'm
13 taking my time.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Okay, okay.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you very
16 much. Just for the advocates here, we should be—

17 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
18 down, please.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
20 [shushing for quiet]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Quiet. I do
22 congratulate Ritchie Torres, but we got a long way
23 on this in very—in just a few days. So, no one
24 should leave here with their heads hung high. As I
25 said, I do want to say that I'm proud of the

2 leadership that I was allowed because of this
3 Speaker. I'm proud of being the Housing Chair. We
4 got a lot done. Honestly, I was thinking we could
5 get more, gut on a bird's eye view, we did a lot,
6 and we want to say thank to Council Member Mendez,
7 who was the first elected official to endorse me
8 against an incumbent. So, I'm always so proud to
9 have her. Ferreras-Copeland, Garodnick, Vacca,
10 Palma, Greenfield, Mealy, Gentile, Crowley and the
11 Speaker, and I-it's just been an incredible time
12 with these folks. I really believe we've moved the
13 needle forward. I want to thank the Housing and
14 Buildings staff including Megan Chin, Jose Conde, Ed
15 Atkin, Jim Wilcox, Sarah Gastelum, and formerly
16 Guillermo Patino. Also, thank you, Ramon Martinez
17 for helping-

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
19 [shushing for quiet]

20 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
21 down, please.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: --move so many
23 thing, and I think I helped push you sometimes, and
24 Nick Smith who was stolen from me by the Mayor's
25 Office. I am chasing some big dreams, but I don't

2 know where I'll be when I come back, but I really
3 think in this Housing and Buildings Committee we did
4 a fantastic job. Look, King disagreed with Malcom
5 who disagreed with Farma who disagreed with Hamo,
6 who disagreed with Randolph, who disagreed with
7 King. They all were moving in the right direction.
8 Tomorrow is another day. There will always be time
9 for discussion. There will always be time for
10 debate. When we come back next session I know we'll
11 be ready to move forward in the legacies that we
12 were able to do today, and I say than you all. God
13 bless everyone. See you on the flip side.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
15 Mendez.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you, Madam
17 Public Advocate. When thanking all of my current
18 and former staff, I left out someone that the office
19 always calls the favorite, my current Director of
20 Communications--

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
22 [shushing for quiet]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: --John Blasco.
24 So, I apologize, John--

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
3 [shushing for quiet]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: --and I'm going
5 to take the moment to thank Annabel Palma and Felix
6 for letting me officiate their wedding, and to may
7 sister Margaret Chin and my brother Dan Garodnick,
8 thank you for being more than colleagues, and always
9 being there for me, and thank you, Madam Public
10 Advocate.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, and I
12 would be remiss if not to give my regards and my
13 sympathy to the former Assembly Member Roger Green
14 on the loss of his mother, Theopia Green, as well as
15 the Kirkland Family and Council Member--no, no? Oh,
16 Treyger. [laughs]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you,
18 Public Advocate. Public Advocate, I-I rise today as
19 well. Our city needs more common sense legislation.
20 I'm proud to work with my colleagues Council Member
21 Adams and--and Levine on Legislation Intro 1836 to
22 building positive police community relations.
23 Today, I've introduced a bill that would make sure
24 all of our police precincts have social workers
25 stationed at the precinct 24 hours a day, 7 days a

2 week. Police precincts don't have the resources to
3 help individuals with their social emotional needs.
4 This bill would help make sure that no one's needs
5 would fall through the cracks. My bill again,
6 Council-co-sponsored by Council Member Adams and
7 Levine, would also provide valuable resources to
8 police precincts that allow officers to focus more
9 on energy-on law enforcement rather than entangling
10 complex social issues and navigating bureaucracy.
11 Thank you so much for your time. I'm very happy and
12 blessed. Happy-Merry Christmas, Happy Hanukkah,
13 Happy Kwanzaa, Festivus and a happy and healthy to
14 my colleagues. Thank you.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, and
16 continue to pray for Council Member Domenic Recchia
17 on the death of his mother as well, and Council-
18 Speaker for the very, your very last comments as the
19 Speaker of this City Council. Quiet in the
20 Chambers.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We are adjourned.

22 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
23 down, please.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: For the Speaker
25 Melissa Mark-Viverito.

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing]
3 here final time. Thank you all and we are
4 adjourned. [laughter] [cheers/applause] [gavel]

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Madam Speaker-
6 [pause]

7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date January 13, 2018