CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

----- X

December 18, 2017 Start: 11:54 a.m. Recess: 12:21 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E:

DAVID G. GREENFIELD

Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Vincent J. Gentile

Annabel Palma

Daniel R. Garodnick

Darlene Mealy Rosie Mendez

Ydanis A. Rodriguez

Peter A. Koo

Brad S. Lander

Stephen T. Levin

Jumaane D. Williams

Deborah L. Rose

Donovan J. Richards

Inez D. Barron
Andrew Cohen

Ben Kallos

Antonio Reynoso

Ritchie J. Torres

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Mark Treyger Rafael Salamanca, Jr. Barry S. Grodenchik A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1	COMMITTEE ON LAND USE 4
2	[sound check]
3	[pause]
4	[background comments]
5	[gavel]
6	[background comments]
7	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Good morning.
8	My name is David Greenfield; I am the Council Member
9	from the 44th Council District in Brooklyn; I'm
10	privileged to serve as the Chair of the Land Use
11	Committee. I want to welcome my esteemed colleagues
12	who are members of the Committee to our last Land Use
13	Committee of this session. [background comment] I
14	know; I am getting misty-eyed as well, Council Member
15	Cohen. Thank you for that.
16	I want to first recognize Council Member
17	Gentile, Council Member Palma, Council Member
18	Garodnick, Chair Koo, Council Member Lander, Council
19	Member Levin, Council Member Rose, Council Member
20	Barron, misty-eyed Council Member Cohen, Council
21	Member Kallos, Council Member Treyger, and Council
22	Member Grodenchik.
23	As always, I would like to thank Chair
24	Salamanca, Chair Richards, and Chair Koo for their
25	outstanding work on our Land Use Subcommittees,

2.2

2.3

especially for the hundreds of hours that they have put in each and every single year over the last several years, it's really been a privilege and a pleasure to partner with the three of them. Thank you, Chair Koo, thank you, Chair Richards, and thank you, Chair Salamanca for your outstanding leadership.

I also want to recognize that this being the sixth day of Hanukkah we are joined by my son Shua [sp?], who has the day off [background comments, clapping] and he has joined us for our last hearing. Shua is 8 years old and very excited to be here. Thank you for joining us, Shua.

We have six items on our agenda for our consideration, five recommendations for our Subcommittees for approval, and one motion to file an application has been withdrawn.

The first item is LU 831, which is a designation by LPC of the Salvation Army National and Territorial Headquarters located at 120-130 West 14th Street in Council Member Johnson's district in Manhattan as an exterior landmark; this was built from 1923-1935. This Art Deco style complex, including an office building and an adjacent auditorium structure, with a distinctive recessed

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 entrance portal has served as the headquarters of the 3 Salvation Army for more than 80 years.

Our second item is LU 512, the Queens Hospital Center T Building lease. This is an application by the Health and Hospitals Corporation for approval of a 99-year sublease for a property located at 82-61 Parsons Boulevard, in Council Member Lancman's district in Queens. Approval of this lease would allow for the development of 206 units of housing, 75 which will be supportive housing for those at 60% of AMI; of the remaining units, 79 will be affordable to those at 60% of AMI; 51 will be available to those at 100% of AMI; the development will also contain 1,200 square feet of nonresidential space to be used by HHC, and 8,000 square feet of community facility space, and I know Council Member Kallos is gonna share some thoughts with us on this project, hopefully.

Our third item is LU 832, the UHAB tax exemption application for property located at 278

East 7th Street in Council Member Mendez's district in Manhattan. HPD is the applicant for this tax exemption under Article XI of the Private Housing

Finance Law. The property contains an existing six-

2.2

2.3

story rental building with 17 units, most of which are occupied and all which will be converted to homeownership housing units. The sponsor, UHAB HDFC will also rehabilitate the property in order to ensure the continued affordability. The existing exemption must be terminated and replaced with this new 40-year Article XI exemption.

Our fourth item is LU 833, the Mother

Gaston disposition and tax exemption application for property located at 249 Mother Gaston Boulevard in

Council Member Espinal's district in Brooklyn. The property is comprised of two tax lots, one of which was conveyed in 2006, while the other lot was erroneously excluded from prior applications and as a result was never conveyed. I know this is shocking, but once in a while government makes mistakes. HPD seeks to rectify this and convey Lot 8 pursuant to Article 16 of the General Municipal Law to the current owner and to apply a tax exemption pursuant to Article XI of the Private Housing Finance Law to the entire property, Lots 7 and 8.

Finally today, we have LU 816, the Lower
East Side Inclusionary Housing tax exemption
application filed by HPD for properties located at

2.2

2.3

377 East 10th Street and 544 East 13th Street in Council Member Mendez's district in Manhattan which are comprised of 26 homeownership units. We will be voting to approve the application to replace existing J51 tax exemption with an Article XI tax exemption for 40 years, retroactive December 17, 2015, the date of construction closing and the date of regulatory agreement with HPD. The units are targeted to households at 30% of AMI to 80% of AMI.

LU 797, the Archer Green tax exemption application, has been withdrawn by HPD; we'll vote on a motion to file it to remove from our calendar.

I want to recognize that we've been joined by Chair Salamanca; as I mentioned before, the Chair has done extraordinary work in his Subcommittee; I want to thank him for his leadership and hard work the time that he's been Chair and the record amount of housing, affordable housing he's brought to his district, congratulations on setting those new standards.

I also just want to take the opportunity
to thank several folks, this being the last Land Use
Committee that I am chairing. I want to thank of
course Raju Mann, who is the Director of our Land Use

2.2

2.3

Division. Raju... where is Raju? Raju is hiding in the corner, as usual. That's for security purposes, by the way. What happens is; if someone comes in and they're about to attack one of us, he speaks into a secret microphone and then all of us are protected. Raju, I have to say, has shown endless patience throughout the Land Use processes and I think that we worked on what, some thousand Land Use applications, and I have to say that he's actually never gotten visibly frustrated or angry at any of those times, which is incredible when you consider the variety of challenges that we've had and I want to thank you, Raju, for your outstanding leadership; well, well deserved, and we're really grateful.

I also want to thank Amy Levitan, who is our Deputy Director; I'm quite convinced that we would never have quorum, among other things, but for Amy and we have all made her life very stressful over the years, and so Amy, we apologize to you for not following the rules and regulations, but we appreciate that you've kept us on the straight and narrow.

And speaking of the straight and narrow,

Julie Lubin works hard every single day to make sure

2.2

2.3

-- in fact, people don't realize; one of the reasons that we always start with full committee hearings is because Julie makes sure that we've got 11 people in the room before we actually start the committee, which is rare for committees, and that's because it's an old precedent in the Land Use Committee that we should have the votes before we actually vote, and Julie, I want to thank you for your -- I know it's a crazy idea; we should have the votes before we vote, but it's not super democratic, but there is a method to our madness, Council Member Garodnick. The point being that she works very hard; she's an outstanding counsel and we're very grateful for her work.

I want to thank Dylan Casey, who has worked tirelessly over the years; Jeff Campagna for his outstanding work; on my own staff, Elena Sytcheva, my counsel and the point person on Land Use, and Danny Pearlstein. I also want to give a shout-out to our phenomenal project managers Brian Paul, James Lloyd, Liz Lee, Jeff Yuen, John Douglas, Rosie Perez, who has the unenviable task of doing sidewalk cafés, which I could have sworn one of the ideas was we were gonna give it to another committee, but I don't think we actually pulled it off, Raj; did

1

3

.

4

5

6

7

8

,

10

1112

13

14

1516

17

18

19

20

2122

2.3

24

25

we? No, we're still stuck with it here at our Land Use; maybe Council Member Lander will explore that for some time in the future.

Finally, I just did want to note that

over the last four years we've been very busy, we've done some amazing stuff; we passed Intro 775, which was a landmarks reform; we instituted deadlines in the landmarking world for the first time in the history of New York City; we cleared the backlog of nearly 100 buildings that were there for over 50 years; we passed Mandatory Inclusionary Housing; for the first time, you have to mandate that you actually must build affordable housing in New York City, which is exciting in the world of zoning and land use; we passed ZQA (nobody knows what that stands for), but we know that ZQA actually, the short version is that it makes it easier to build affordable housing in New York City, which is exciting... [background comments] yes, exactly, exactly. [background comments] Zoning for all, that's right. That's right. That's gonna be a new theme of a Mayoral candidate in 2021, zoning for all. And we passed... I think originally the Administration said they were going to do 15 rezonings; is that roughly right, Raju, around 15

2	rezonings in the first four years. Raju and I
3	laughed; we had a bet over how many rezonings that
4	they would get through, and quite frankly, we both
5	lost because the number ended up being far short of
6	even our expectations, and there were three rezonings
7	that went through; very excited about these of
8	course, we did East New York, which was amazing
9	rezoning we did in Council Member Espinal's district;
10	we did the Far Rockaway rezoning is Chair Richards
11	here? Where is Chair Richards? [background
12	comments] He's not here, but he did yeoman's work on
13	that, and then of course, we did the Harlem rezoning
14	just recently in The Speaker's district; not to
15	forget, even though technically it's not a
16	neighborhood rezoning; it took probably a good ten
17	years off of his life and is responsible for at least
18	the three gray hairs that you could see, which is the
19	Midtown East Rezoning in Council Member Garodnick's
20	district, and we congratulate him on that and that
21	was a terrific achievement as well. And just this
22	past month, for the first time in New York City, we
23	created actual protections for industrial business
24	zones as well in the form of self-storage
25	regulations, and that was very exciting; I know very

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

near and dear to Council Member Lander's heart; I
want to thank him for all his work on that, and we
even had a zoning symposium last year at Brooklyn Law
School, the next 100 years of Brooklyn zoning.

And so the point of all this is that we've done some amazing work here together; I'm very proud of the work that we've done; I'm very grateful to all of my colleagues for the outstanding work and leadership that you've shown, and I really have been honored to chair this Committee. I was joking a moment before the Committee; someone actually said you know the powerful Chair of the Land Use Committee is here, and I said it's not true, I said it is -- I think it was Council Member Grodenchik who said this -- and I said it is in fact the Chair of the powerful Land Use Committee, right, because the Committee inherently itself has a lot of power and it's one of the great privileges that we have in the City that we can and the Council have the final say on all zoning and land use items and I will say that despite the occasional criticism from Conor and others at Politico (Conor deserves a shout-out for actually being the only reporter to show up here today), the reality is that we get it right nine times out of

)

25 | 1

ten, and folks, if we were basketball players or football players who actually hit the ball or scored nine times out of ten; we would be in the Hall of Fame, and so I like to think that what we've done here is extraordinary, and even when the media doesn't think we got it right, there are other issues in play where we may have actually focused on points and privileges that we believe were in the best interest of the City and the City Council, so I'm certainly proud of the work that we have done here and I want to thank all of my colleagues and especially want to thank the outstanding staff, because but for the staff, none of this would actually come together.

I want to finally now call a vote and, of course, the recommendations of the Subcommittees and with the support of the local members, to approve LUS 512, 816, 831, 832, and 833 and to file LU 797.

Once again, I want to thank you all for your patience, for your collegiality, for your hard work, and for generally respecting the prerogative of members and their district. With that, I will turn it over to the Clerk and ask him to please call the roll.

1	COMMITTEE ON LAND USE 15
2	COMMITTEE CLERK: Committee Clark Matthew
3	DeStefano, Committee on Land Use, roll call vote to
4	approve LUs 512, 816, 831 through 833, and to file
5	LU 797. Chair Greenfield.
6	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Shua; do you
7	want to say aye on all?
8	SHUA: Aye on all.
9	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Good job. Thank
10	you. Aye on all.
11	COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: It's a tough act
13	to follow, but may I explain my vote?
14	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Council Member
15	Gentile to explain his vote.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: I too want to
17	congratulate the professionals here at the Land Use
18	staff consummate professionals. Probably one of
19	the longest lasting legacies that I leave here came
20	from this committee; although many of you weren't on
21	this committee or staff not here at the time, the
22	contextual downzonings that we did from this
23	committee in Bay Ridge, 349 blocks in Bay Ridge, and
24	then another 200 blocks in Dyker Heights in my

district, back in 2005 and 2007 will be a lasting

25

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

2.2

legacy that came from this committee and I'm very,
very grateful for that, and certainly the
professionalism has continued through the years, and
the ultimate consummate professional is our Chairman,
David Greenfield and not only a professional, but a
friend and I thank you for all your leadership and
your friendship over the years, and with that, I vote
aye on all.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma. Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote aye and I want to thank Chair Greenfield for his dedication and his leadership for the last four years in Land Use matters. Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you Mr. Chairman.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: With very real gratitude to the Chair for a term which has been by turns entertaining, speed reading, serious, and with some very, very real accomplishments and good work bringing a broad and diverse group of people together

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

to do important work for the City and still even have a little fun too. I thank you and I vote age on all.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to explain my vote.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Council Member Levin to explain his vote.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I would like to vote aye on all, Mr. Chairman, but I would also like to acknowledge the great work that you have done. would also like to acknowledge the great work the staff has done in this term, but also I want to acknowledge you, with your leadership and ensuring that this Council discharges it duty on land use matters with full professionalism and full consideration of all parties' concerns; you have done an excellent job as steward of this very important committee. And following up on what Council Member Lander just said, perhaps... I know you're gonna be busy come January, but if you need to moonlight in any other profession, perhaps they could have a new spokesperson for Micro Machines -- if anyone remembers Micro Machines -- or announcing horse

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Fair enough;

25 duly noted.

real problem with it, but...

2.3

24

1	COMMITTEE ON LAND USE 19
2	COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Mr. Chairman,
3	thank you very much for all that you have done
4	[crosstalk]
5	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I vote aye on all.
7	COMMITTEE CLERK: Rose.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Permission to

explain my vote.

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Council Member Rose to explain her vote.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Chair, I've really appreciated how you handled this committee in an evenhanded and fair manner, and I too am impressed with your skills to articulate the entire Land Use calendar in less than half a second. So I'm sure that that's a skill you'll find useful when you're dealing with a community-based organization, and I want to wish you well in your new endeavor. all of the Committee members who will not be here for the next four years, we're gonna miss your skills and your tenacity to make sure that land use in New York City is fair for all, so thank you, and I'm gonna miss you, and the Land Use staff is gonna be around, so you guys still have to deal with us... [crosstalk]

would have a lease with the City; my concern is, once again, that we're giving away City land to developers

19 that in fact remain to be a detriment financially to

20 the City, such as what happened with the stadiums

that were built, when we realized after the fact that

22 we weren't getting a fair return, so I vote aye on

23 all, with the exception of 512. Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Cohen.

24

21

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

1

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Permission to 3 explain my vote.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Council Member Cohen to explain his vote.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: As usual, I'll be very brief. But I do want to thank you here in front of all my colleagues for your leadership; I know I'm keeping your friendship, but it has been an honor to serve on this committee with you; you've done an excellent job; you've been a role model for me, a mentor; I appreciate it, so thank you very much and with that, I vote aye.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Pass.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Torre...

[laughter] [pause] [background comments]

COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: For the record, so you understand that; there is a brotherly rivalry between myself and Council Member Kallos, and in passing, Council Member Cohen recognized that Council Member Kallos will now in fact have, once again, the

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

2.2

2.3

	last word.	We'll	go	back	to	we'll	go	back	to	the
3	roll.									

COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres.

just want to say I'm gonna sorely miss David

Greenfield as a colleague; I consider him one of the

brightest minds in public service, he has a razor
sharp wit and I enjoy the rhetorical sword fighting

between Ben Kallos and that's gonna be a huge loss

for the City Council, so, but thank you for

everything you've done.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you. We're thinking of going on tour in the spring; we'll get those dates out there. Thank you very much.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Treyger.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to explain my vote.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Council Member Treyger to explain his vote.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you,

Mr. Chairman. I'd like, you know, for the Committee

to know; for the public to know, who's watching, that

during that ZQA process -- Zoning for Quality and

Affordability -- the Chairman personally, not just

staff, and the staff has been incredibly helpful; so
responsive and so accessible, but the Chairman
personally sat down with members to go through every
single block that was labeled as a transit zone to
make sure that the members had adequate input and
adequate say in the entire process from beginning to
end, and that is leadership, that is inclusive
leadership, and as a matter of fact, the Chairman
went on to say that if members did not feel satisfied
with the transit zones, which would determine where
parking would be waived in exchange for affordable
housing, that he would push back against the
Administration, and so he had our back, and by
extension, he had our community's back throughout the
entire process and that is just one example of the
type of leadership. He didn't just defer to staff,
which again, has been very helpful; he sat down
himself personally for hours and hours with members
to go over the needs of their district. And so I
cannot thank you enough, Chairman Greenfield, for
your hard work, your honesty, and just really being
with us every step of the way and I think that you
have been a you have raised the bar for a Land Use
Chair in the City Council.

2.2

2	And I also just want to commend my
3	Subcommittee Chair, Chairman Salamanca, who just in a
4	short time as Subcommittee Chair has really
5	championed so many units of affordable housing, also
6	having members' backs throughout the entire process;
7	he had some contentious hearings, but always was with
8	us every step of the way, supporting us and our
9	communities, so I just want to commend both Chairmen,
10	and again, you will be missed but you will not be
1 1	for So with that I woto awa on all

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Grodenchik.

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: I'm gonna pass. [background comments] Alright, I withdraw my pass.

My weeks of experience on this committee has led me to believe that you have indeed been an outstanding Chairman and I want to congratulate you, and will miss working with you on an almost daily basis, but I do look forward to working with you on an almost daily basis in your new venture. And I also, at this time, want to congratulate my colleague to the west who's not here, Mr. Lancman, for his work on the T Building, which has been a bone of

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

2.2

2.3

contention in Central Queens for more than a decade
Amy Levitan is shaking her head; she knows it
was originally a tuberculosis hospital, with
beautiful, absolutely beautiful balconies, built
during, I think during the 1930s as probably a WPA
project, but hopefully this will take and it will be
a great addition to the Jamaica Hills/Kew
Gardens/Briarwood/Hillcrest communities, 'cause it's
right in the middle of everything. With that, I vote
aye on all.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Salamanca.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Permission to explain my vote.

 $\label{eq:CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Chair Salamanca} % \begin{subarray}{ll} \begin{subarray}{$

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: First I want to thank you, Chair Greenfield; in my short time in the Council you've been a friend and you've guided me through some of these land use matters that I may have questions on, and as Chair of the Subcommittee, we work closely to ensure that we get members to a good place so that we can move these projects forward and bring true affordable housing to the City of New

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

2.2

2.3

2	York,	and	with	that	Ι	congratulate	you	and	Ι	vote	aye
3	on ali] . 「	Thank	VO11 -							

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos.

 $\label{eq:CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: We saved the best for last. \\$

now get the last word, as you and Council Member

Cohen so aptly noticed. I'm not sure if you remember

when we first met at a December holiday party in some

basement -- thanks to Jenny Berger -- probably

something like ten years ago, but it has been a

pleasure to serve with you. I think that it is clear

that you have empowered members in their ULURP

negotiations and that this has been an incredibly

democratic committee.

You made Mandatory Inclusionary Housing and Zoning and Quality for All happen; you amended it in a way that made enough members happy with it that it was a different proposal than what the Mayor put forth and I believe will benefit the City, at least I know that it will be benefiting my district.

On Introduction 755, you brought meaningful reforms to Landmarks Preservation

Z 4

Commission and even with advocates, where you weren't able to make all of them happy, and some people, even perhaps myself, voted no, you still made reforms to the original bill that you didn't necessarily have to make that made the bill better.

When we were dealing with the proliferation of buildings for billionaires, you've actually protected my district from getting, at least in the East 50s, buildings taller than 1,000 feet, and that is huge.

The Land Use Committee hasn't been known for doing legislation, and in addition to
Introduction 755, you also took on the issue of privately owned public spaces; really shined a light on it and President Trump, and really helped reform and I appreciate the partnership.

In what probably made the *Politico's*Gloria Pazmino and Sally Goldenberg a little bit

unhappy, we've been kinder and gentler with another

as each Yom Kippur comes around and we apologize and

seek forgiveness for one another, and I think that

this year has probably been less entertaining than

usual, but it is rarely boring and I guess I will

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you very

much. I just want to thank the very patient clerk

24

25

for his outstanding work; we're very grateful. Once
again, I want to thank the outstanding staff of the
Land Use Committee for making us all look good. I
also want to recognize that there are two chairs who
are not here with us; they are in the world but not
here in this room anymore, and that of course is
Chair Dickens and Chair Weprin, both of whom did
outstanding work as well and I was privileged to
serve with them as well. And once again, really just
want to thank our colleagues, I want to thank the
staff people do not realize how hard the staff
works how many hours they put in, many of them are
working on weekends and evenings and unfortunately,
Council rules do not allow for overtime, but they're
here anyway and they are absolutely dedicated in a
way that very few people are dedicated to their jobs,
because they care about the mission of the work that
we do.

With that, it's been a privilege to serve as the Chair of the Land Use Committee for the last four years here in the New York City Council. Final Land Use Committee for the term, the meeting of December 18, 2017, is hereby adjourned.

[gavel]

${\tt C} \ {\tt E} \ {\tt R} \ {\tt T} \ {\tt I} \ {\tt F} \ {\tt I} \ {\tt C} \ {\tt A} \ {\tt T} \ {\tt E}$

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date January 11, 2018