

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

December 11, 2017
Start: 1:40 p.m.
Recess: 2:48 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E:

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO
The Speaker of the Council
LETITIA JAMES
The Public Advocate

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Adrienne E. Adams
Inez D. Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Andrew Cohen
Costa G. Constantinides
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Elizabeth S. Crowley
Laurie A. Cumbo
Chaim M. Deutsch
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Mathieu Eugene
Julissa Ferreras-Copeland
Daniel R. Garodnick
Vincent J. Gentile

COUNCIL MEMBERS: (CONTINUED)

Vanessa L. Gibson
David G. Greenfield
Barry S. Grodenchik
Corey D. Johnson
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Peter A. Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
Darlene Mealy
Carlos Menchaca
Rosie Mendez
I. Daneek Miller
Annabel Palma
Bill Perkins
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
James Vacca
Paul A. Vallone
James G. Van Bramer
Jumaane D. Williams

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Deputy Inspector Iocco
NYPD

Officer John Hasiotis
NYPD

Officer Michael Welsome
NYPD

Officer Ryan Nash
NYPD

Officer Kevin McGinn
NYPD

Rev. Dr. Jacques Andre DeGraff
Associate Pastor
Canaan Baptist Church

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

4

[sound check]

[pause]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Okay, I think we're gonna get started. [background comments] And I'd like to ask my colleagues to join us; this is an important ceremonial. Today another stark reminder of the courageous men and women of our NYPD and what they do each and every day to protect us, and we're here today to commend officers in blue who work hard every day to maintain that safety and security. One of our prior State Meetings, October 31st, people remember the incident that was unfolding as we were here in the chamber deliberating on the west side, Officers Nash, Hasiotis, Welsome, and McGinn embody the tremendously selfless spirit and dedication of the NYPD and the Council is proud to recognize them today for their quick thinking and brave efforts to stop the terrorist attack in October which could have resulted in more fatalities if it was not for their swift actions, and I think the same could be said of those officers that responded today. So again, we are here in a small way; we work in partnership with the Administration; we work in partnership with our commissioner to ensure that we have a great working

1 relationship to support NYPD officers that protect us
2 each and every day in our neighborhoods, so we're
3 here to say thank you and issue these proclamations
4 to basically demonstrate the heroism and the
5 appreciation that we have for the work that you've
6 done to maintain us safe.

7
8 So with that, maybe we can give a round
9 of applause to our officers.

10 [cheers, clapping]

11 Well we're gonna... this is one of the very
12 few ceremonials where I think all the members are up
13 here, so you have pulled off a great feat; that's how
14 much support. But I want to ask the clerk to read
15 the Proclamation. Oh, I don't... he is coming as we
16 speak. [background comments] Yes, we need you sir
17 to come up, please. Come on, come on, come on; I
18 know you're being the photographer for them, but
19 we've got professional photos we can definitely give
20 you.

21 CITY CLERK: Council, City of New York
22 Proclamation. The Council of the City of New York is
23 proud to honor NYPD Police Officers Ryan Nash, John
24 Hasiotis, Michael Welsome, and Kevin McGinn for their
25

1
2 courageous response during the deadliest terrorist
3 attack in New York City since 9/11.

4 And whereas, every hour of every day the
5 men and women of the NYPD work together to enforce
6 our city's laws, keep our neighborhoods safe and
7 protect their fellow 8.5 million New Yorkers.

8 Whether safeguarding property or the public, these
9 heroes and heroines commit themselves to their daily
10 duties which often necessitate extraordinary risks
11 that few others can fully comprehend; we pay tribute
12 to four such heroes today.

13 And whereas, on Tuesday, October 31, 2017
14 New Yorkers and tourists of every age and background
15 were going about their lives; in Lower Manhattan, not
16 far from the Freedom Tower, many were leaving school
17 or work, shopping or enjoying the beautiful park and
18 bike lanes along the Hudson. It was a day that had
19 begun full of promise, just like any other day in New
20 York City; that afternoon, however, the day was
21 shattered by a cowardly act of terror that resulted
22 in eight deaths and many injuries. New York City and
23 the nation are deeply indebted to everyone at the
24 scene and especially the four officers who
25 intervened.

1
2 And whereas, Police Officers Ryan Nash,
3 Kevin McGinn, John Hasiotis, and Michael Welsome were
4 responding to an incident at Stuyvesant High School
5 when they were alerted of a vehicle collision between
6 a truck and a school bus nearby on West Street and
7 Chambers Street; all four officers rushed to the
8 scene of the collision and witnessed the individual
9 who had exited the truck, armed with two guns.
10 Officer Nash discharged his firearm and hit the
11 perpetrator in the abdomen. The perpetrator was
12 taken into custody by the four officers with no
13 further incidents.

14 And whereas, while we reflect on those
15 who were killed or injured during this attack, as
16 well as their friends and loved ones, and as we
17 reaffirm the resilience that defines us as a city, we
18 commend these officers for their unflinching
19 commitment to the safety of our city, they are truly
20 among the finest of New York's finest and have earned
21 the esteem and enduring gratitude of every American.

22 Now therefore be it known, that the
23 Council of the City of New York gratefully honors
24 Police Officer Michael Welsome, Police Officer Kevin
25 McGinn, Police Officer John Hasiotis, and Police

1
2 Officer Ryan Nash for their extraordinary service to
3 the City of New York and the nation on October 31,
4 2017. Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the Entire
5 Council; Vanessa L. Gibson, Chair, Committee on
6 Public Safety.

7 [cheers, clapping]

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you. We
9 also remember those that were lost in that incident,
10 but obviously, due to your swift action we know that
11 many other lives were saved and for that we are
12 eternally grateful and for what you do each and every
13 day on our behalf. I know that Deputy Inspector
14 Iocco is here; I would like him to say a few words,
15 but also would welcome each of you to say a few
16 words; I know probably some will say they don't want
17 to speak and very humble, but definitely would love
18 to welcome the opportunity to hear you all say a few
19 words, so Deputy Inspector.

20 DEPUTY INSPECTOR IOCCO: Good afternoon.
21 I just wanna say thank you to the Council, it's
22 always good to see recognition for work that's being
23 done by the NYPD; we greatly appreciate it and we
24 look forward to working with you all, and thank you
25 so much.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

[clapping]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright and with that, we'll hand it off to Officer Hasiotis and then the rest; we can hear from you. [background comments] You don't wanna say anything? [background comments] Come on guys, say something. Anybody wanna **[inaudible]**. Go ahead.

OFFICER HASIOTIS: Just thank you everybody; we really don't have much to say -- [background comment] but thank you, thank you for having us and [background comments, clapping, cheers] we appreciate it.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: You're welcome.

DEPUTY INSPECTOR IOCCO: They're much better at police work than public speaking, [background comments, laughter] I just wanna say that. Thank you so much. Thank you.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: That's great. [background comment] Right, and 1st Precinct, which is actually Margaret Chin's district, so with that, thank you so much for being here.

[background comments, clapping, cheers]

[pause]

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 10

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright; I don't
3 know if we can... [background comments]

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Ladies and gentlemen,
5 could I have your attention please? Can I please
6 have your attention please? [background comments]
7 Quiet on the floor. At this time, please place all
8 electronic devices to vibrate, all electronic devices
9 to vibrate. Will all non-Council employees, all non-
10 Council employees please leave the main floor of the
11 chambers, there's additional seating upstairs in the
12 balcony? Thank you.

13 [pause]

14 [background comments]

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
16 chambers please. Please close the doors. Everyone
17 please take a seat. Individuals in the balcony,
18 please have a seat. All rise for the Pledge of
19 Allegiance.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS:

21 All rise.

22 [Pledge of Allegiance]

23 [pause]

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Adams.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Present.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 11
2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.
3 [background comments]
4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Borelli. Cabrera.
5 Chin.
6 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.
7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cohen. [background
8 comment] Constantinides. [background comment]
9 Cornegy. [background comment] Crowley. Cumbo.
10 Deutsch. Dromm.
11 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.
12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Espinal.
13 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.
14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Eugene. Ferreras-
15 Copeland. Garodnick.
16 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.
17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile.
18 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: I'm here.
19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gibson. Greenfield.
20 Grodenchik.
21 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.
22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Johnson.
23 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Here.
24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos.
25 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COMMITTEE CLERK: King.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koslowitz.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lancman.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin. Levine.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Maisel.

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy. Menchaca.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez. Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma.

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Perkins.

COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Reynoso.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Here.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COMMITTEE CLERK: Richards.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez. Rose.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rosenthal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Salamanca.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres.

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Present.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Treyger.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Ulrich.

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Present.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Vacca.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Vallone. [background
comment] Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Matteo. Van Bramer.

Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Present.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you. Okay and
uh... Matteo.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.

[background comments]

COMMITTEE CLERK: Borelli.

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.

[background comments]

COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Here.

MALE VOICE: You have the floor.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. All quiet in the chambers. All rise for the invocation. The invocation will be delivered by Rev. Dr. Jacques Andre DeGraff, the Associate Pastor of the great Canaan Baptist Church, 132 W. 116th Street in the Village of Harlem.

REV. DR. DEGRAFF: To some you are the creator; to others you are my higher power, but I come in the tradition [sic] of the God of Abraham, Isaac and Jacob on this afternoon and we bow our heads and incline our ears and hearts to you just to say thank you, thank you for this opportunity to serve in the great chamber of the greatest city in the world. We are reminded of the song that was sung

1
2 by a young singer who said, "He's got the whole world
3 in his hands." And on this day, as we face danger in
4 Times Square, we are reminded of the dangers of being
5 a democratic body in a mean and sin-sick world. We
6 as, Father God, that you would consider the men and
7 women who serve here, remember who they are and where
8 they came from and remind them of what they came to
9 do. Father God, we too want to salute and to
10 recognize those whose careers in this room are
11 winding down; we appreciate their sacrifice and their
12 service and their contributions. And while you're
13 passing out blessings, Father God, we pause for one
14 more request and that is, in the tradition of this
15 body, it has been more about deliberation and
16 consideration; it has also been about setting
17 example; not just for New York; not just for the
18 nation, but for the world that watches what we say
19 and do in this room, and in that tradition we have
20 always been barrier-breakers and precedent-setters
21 and so we looked to Astoria at a time for leadership
22 and saw an Italo-American from Astoria, and then
23 looked at Chelsea for leadership and we saw an Irish-
24 American gay person for leadership; we looked at East
25 Harlem and found a Latina, a voice and a vibrant

1 leadership and so now those who once sat in the back
2 of the bus are looking for a coalition of courage
3 that might join together to provide new leadership in
4 2018. But Father God, whatever you do and however
5 you do it, we ask that you would bless this place
6 with the sunshine of harmony and the melody of
7 justice, empower each person under the sound of my
8 voice to remember whose they are why they're here.
9 We know that as they do these things I am convinced
10 and convicted that the best is yet to come.

12 God bless you and may God bless America.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Amen.

14 Please be seated.

15 [background comments]

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
17 chambers please. Quiet in the chambers. Shhhh.
18 Motion to spread the invocation. Council Member
19 Perkins.

20 [background comments]

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
22 Perkins, if you don't mind.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Alright. So be
24 it.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
3 Perkins, thank you. Rev. DeGraff has been a leader
4 and an activist against gun violence, working with
5 One Hundred Black Men and 1199 Hospital Workers
6 Union; he's led historic delegation of African-
7 American clergy on the Israeli mission of bridge-
8 building an interfaith fellowship; he was honored by
9 the State of Israel with his Dr. Martin Luther King,
10 Jr. Award and was the first Christian clergyman to
11 serve as Dr. King's keynote speaker at the New York
12 Synagogue. He spearheaded a clergy prayer vigil at
13 the United Nations to protest the bloodshed in
14 Darfur, and he was a featured speaker at the United
15 Nations at its Commission on violence against women.
16 He was visited by Pope Benedict to attend the
17 ecumenical prayer service during the papal visit,
18 along with Christian and Orthodox leaders from across
19 this country. We welcome him and we thank him for
20 that thoughtful prayer this afternoon. Thank you,
21 Pastor.

22 And now motion to spread the adoption of
23 Minutes. Council Member Cabrera. Motion that the
24 Minutes of the Stated Meeting of October 31, 2017 be
25 adopted as printed.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 18

2 Messages and papers from the Mayor.

3 COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered M 562,
4 submitting Anne Holford-Smith for appointment to the
5 Landmarks Preservation Commission.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Rules, Privileges
7 and Elections.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication
9 from City, County and Borough offices.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered M 563,
11 Alameda Sky Chapman for recommendation [background
12 comment] to the Youth Board.

13 [background comments]

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Rules, Privileges
15 and Elections.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: M 0564, recommending
17 Sylvia Di Pietr to the Board of Elections.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Rules, Privileges
19 and Elections.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: M 0565, submitting the
21 Certifications of the Members of the City Council.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Received,
23 ordered, printed and filed.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and
25 Communications.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call-Ups.

COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the chambers as we now hear from Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito. Thank you.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Give me one moment, please. [pause] So good afternoon to everybody and obviously, as we all heard and we discussed it at the ceremonial earlier today, this morning there was an explosion at the Port Authority Bus Terminal and on behalf of the entire Council, I want to thank our first responders for acting so quickly and keeping our city safe, as they do each and every day, we are deeply grateful for their commitment and the professionalism and sure that lives were saved, thanks to their quick action.

We are also joined today by the Coro PD Youth Fellows; we welcome all of you to City Hall and we thank you all for the support in participatory budgeting process. Are they sitting up in the balcony? Where are they at? [cheer] Alright.

1
2 Welcome to the chamber. [background comments,
3 clapping]

4 I also want to take a moment just to
5 remember a couple of legendary New Yorkers that we
6 lost this week -- Maurice Mickey Carroll and James
7 Hanley. Mickey was not only a renowned figure in New
8 York politics and journalism, but a mentor to many
9 who roam here in City Hall. James was a fearless
10 leader and extraordinary public servant who proudly
11 represented the hardworking laborers of our great
12 city, and just taking a moment to just remember them.

13 Thank you. And so we're gonna jump right
14 into our docket for the day.

15 The Council will begin by voting on a
16 number of land use items.

17 Introduction 1533-A, sponsored by Council
18 Member Margaret Chin, would empower elected officials
19 and their constituents with tools they need to
20 advocate for zoning and land use policies in
21 neighborhoods that are currently and were formerly
22 designated urban renewal areas.

23 Intro 1661-A, sponsored by Council Member
24 Rafael Espinal, would require the City to establish a
25 website on NYC.gov by July 1, 2018 to promote

1 commercial and community-based agricultural uses in
2 the City of New York.

3
4 And finally, the Council will also vote
5 on construction of a new school in Council Member
6 Menchaca's district.

7 The Council will next vote on one finance
8 item, Intro 1737, sponsored by Council Member Julissa
9 Ferreras-Copeland and Council Member James Vacca that
10 would establish the Morris Park Business Improvement
11 District in the Bronx.

12 For staff, I wanna thank Latonia
13 McKinney, Eric Bernstein, Rebecca Chasan, and Aliya
14 Ali.

15 Next the Council is going to vote on
16 Intro 270, sponsored by Council Member Annabel Palma,
17 which would permanently change the name of two
18 thoroughfares in the Borough of the Bronx to East
19 177th Street and amends the New York City map
20 accordingly.

21 Staff -- I wanna thank Jeffrey Baker,
22 Chris Sartori, Patrick Mulvihill, Chima Obichere,
23 Kenneth Grace, and Jenn Wilcox.

24 Moving on, we will vote on Intro 1696-A,
25 sponsored by Council Member James Vacca, which would

1
2 require the creation of a task force that provides
3 recommendations on how information on agency
4 automated decision systems, otherwise known as
5 algorithms, may be shared with the public. The task
6 force would also provide recommendations on how
7 agencies may address instances where people are
8 harmed by agency automated decision systems.

9 [background comments]

10 I wanna thank Jeff Baker, Malaika Jabali,
11 Patrick Mulvihill, and Sebastian Bacchi.

12 Next the Council will vote on bills that
13 require the reporting of information on the workforce
14 of developers and contractors receiving funding from
15 the City.

16 Intro 1382-B, sponsored by Council Member
17 Robert Cornegy, would require certain contractors
18 employed to work on City-funded construction projects
19 to disclose to an agency designated by the Mayor the
20 zip code of their employees' primary address. This
21 bill would also create recordkeeping requirements for
22 such contractors and would give the authority to
23 enforce the provisions of this bill to the designated
24 agency.

1
2 Intro 752-C, sponsored by Public Advocate
3 Tish James, would require contractors employed to
4 work on City-funded construction projects to disclose
5 certain information regarding the demographics of
6 employees working on those projects in addition to
7 other administrative information.

8 The staff, I wanna thank Jeff Baker, Jenn
9 Wilcox, Terzah Nasser, Rachel Cordero, Sylvester
10 Yavana, Alex Paulenoff, Nadia Johnson, Casie Addison,
11 Michael Kurtz, Nicole Abene, Eric Bernstein, and Matt
12 Carlin.

13 Moving on; we will vote on Intro 1651-A,
14 sponsored by Council Member Costa Constantinides,
15 which would require the Department of Citywide
16 Administrative Services to provide an annual report
17 on electricity and fossil fuel use in certain City-
18 owned buildings including identifying whether such
19 buildings have been fitted with equipment for
20 monitoring energy usage in near real time.

21 Staff -- I wanna thank Jeffrey Baker,
22 Samara Swanston, Nadia Johnson, and Jonathan Seltzer.

23 Next the Council will vote on
24 Intro 1062-A, sponsored by Council Member Margaret
25 Chin, which would require that by January 1, 2019 the

1 Administration for Children's Services would produce
2 a study regarding its ability to provide access to
3 language classes for foster care children whose
4 parents are limited English proficient in order to
5 ensure that children temporarily removed from their
6 homes never lose the ability to communicate with
7 their parents.
8

9 I wanna thank Jeffrey Baker, Andrea
10 Vazquez, Tonya Cyrus, and Daniel Kroop.

11 We will also vote on bills sponsored by
12 Council Member Vinny Gentile. Introduction 1618-A
13 would require annual public outreach campaigns to
14 educate the public on how to identify and submit
15 complaints regarding different forms of government
16 corruption, fraud and waste.

17 And Intro 1633-A would require that
18 whenever practicable, DOI must complete a vendor name
19 check of a perspective vendor for a City contract 30
20 days prior to the commencement of the contract
21 between the City agency and the vendor.

22 I wanna thank Jeff Baker, Josh Kingsley
23 and Sheila Johnson.

24 Also we will vote on Intro 1764-A,
25 sponsored by Council Member Barry Grodenchik, which

1
2 would increase the assessed value limitation for
3 eligibility of J-51 improvements to \$32,000 per
4 dwelling unit and would increase each year by the
5 cost-of-living adjustment percentage.

6 I wanna thank Jeff Baker, Meagan Chen,
7 Jose Conde, Sarah Gastelum, and Jenn Wilcox.

8 We'll also vote on Intro 1241-A,
9 sponsored by Council Member Rafael Espinal, which
10 would require diaper changing stations in assembly
11 and mercantile occupancies for both male and female
12 occupants.

13 I wanna thank Jeff Baker, Meagan Chen,
14 Jose Conde, Sarah Gastelum, and Jenn Wilcox.

15 Council will also vote on a couple of
16 NYPD reporting bills. Intro 1611-A, sponsored by
17 Council Member Ritchie Torres, would require the NYPD
18 to report on a quarterly basis the number of index
19 crimes by borough where at least one person has been
20 arrested and charged with a commission of the
21 offense.

22 And Introduction 1664-A, sponsored by
23 Council Member Rory Lancman, which would require the
24 NYPD to report on a quarterly basis the number of
25 thefts of services arrests and fare evasion offenses

1
2 returnable to the Transit Adjudication Bureau
3 disaggregated by age of the offender-arrestee, subway
4 station in which the offense took place, the transit
5 bureau of the offense, and in the case of a criminal
6 enforcement, whether the individual was issued a desk
7 appearance, ticket or whether the arrestee was
8 processed through Central Booking.

9 I wanna thank Jeff Baker, Deepa Ambekar,
10 Casie Addison, and Steve Riester.

11 Since the definitions of sexual
12 orientation and gender in the City's Human Rights Law
13 were drafted, society has evolved its understanding
14 of sexual orientation, gender and gender identity;
15 therefore, the Council will vote on Intro 1186-A,
16 sponsored by Council Member Danny Dromm, which would
17 update the language in the Human Rights Law to better
18 capture the current understanding of sexual
19 orientation and gender, recognizing that sexual
20 orientation ranges along a continuum.

21 I wanna thank Jeff Baker, Ze-Emanuel
22 Hailu, Deepa Ambekar, and Rachel Cordero.

23 We will also be voting on Intro 1678-B,
24 sponsored by Council Member Peter Koo, which would
25 expand the definition of harassment to include

1
2 threats based on a person's actual or perceived
3 status in a protected class, including threats to
4 report immigrant tenants to ICE.

5 I wanna thank Jeff Baker, Meagan Chen,
6 Jose Conde, Indiana Porta, Ze-Emanuel Hailu, Sarah
7 Gastelum, and Jenn Wilcox.

8 And finally, in September the City was
9 stunned as a student was fatally stabbed and another
10 critically wounded by a fellow student at a school in
11 the Bronx. Early reports indicated that the student
12 who allegedly committed the act is a victim of
13 bullying. The Council immediately acted by holding
14 an oversight hearing to examine DOE's efforts to
15 address bullying in City schools and introducing
16 legislation to increase transparency about the DOE's
17 policies.

18 Intro 1538-A, sponsored by Education
19 Committee Chair Danny Dromm would require the
20 Department of Education to post on its website
21 information regarding how to report incidents of
22 bullying, harassment, intimidation, or discrimination
23 including on each school's website the contact
24 information for the school's Dignity Act Coordinator.

1
2 I wanna thank Jeff Baker, Paul Sinegal,
3 Smita Deshmukh, Andrea Vazquez, and Terzah Nasser.

4 And Intro 1757-A, sponsored by Council
5 Member Mark Treyger, would require the DOE to report
6 every six months on the number of material incidents
7 of student-to-student bullying, harassment,
8 intimidation, or discrimination in violation of
9 Chancellor's Regulation A-832, and to annually report
10 on supports that DOE provides to schools in an effort
11 to prevent bullying incidents.

12 I wanna thank Jeff Baker, Smita Deshmukh,
13 Andrea Vazquez, and Terzah Nasser.

14 And that completes the highlights of
15 today's docket. I look forward to proceeding with
16 today's votes and I especially look forward to seeing
17 everyone tonight at the Council's holiday party.
18 This will be a particularly bittersweet holiday
19 season for me as I say goodbye for all of the New
20 York City Council.

21 Serving as Speaker these past four years
22 and having the opportunity to work with all of you to
23 help make this city a better, [background comments]
24 fairer place [background comments] have been two of
25 the most... Having served as Speaker for these past

1
2 four years and having the opportunity to work with
3 all of you to help make this city a better, fairer
4 place has been two of the most rewarding experiences
5 of my career, and I couldn't be more proud of all the
6 great work that we've accomplished together.

7 In addition to passing legislation and
8 championing policies that have helped bring greater
9 equality, justice and fairness to all of our
10 communities, we successfully advocated for a budget
11 year after year that's more inclusive of all New
12 Yorkers and that addresses some of our city's most
13 urgent needs, and we've consistently stood up for
14 what's right, because that is who we are as a city
15 and who we are as a City Council, so my thanks to
16 each and every one of you; I am excited to celebrate
17 all of our accomplishments with all of you tonight.

18 [background comments, clapping]

19 And before I close; just got word here
20 that Council Member Adrienne Adams' family welcomes a
21 grandson today, Micah [sp?] Ryan. [cheers, clapping]
22 So congratulations to you, Council Member, and with
23 that, I end Communication from the Speaker.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Congratulations,
25 grandma.

2 General Orders. Seeing none. Report of
3 Special Committees.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of
6 Standing Committees.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
8 on Civil Rights, Intro 1186-A, amending the
9 definitions of sexual orientation and gender.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
11 coupled on general orders.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
13 on Contracts, Intro 752-C, construction projects.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
15 coupled on general orders.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
17 on Education, Intro 1486-A, DOE reporting.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and laid
19 over.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1538-A and
21 Intro 1757-A, school bullying reporting.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
23 coupled on general orders.

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee on Environmental Protection, Intro 1651-A, electricity and fossil fuel usage.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee on Finance, Intro 1737, Morris Park BID.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered Intro 1783, commercial rent tax.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered LU 826 and Reso 1763 and LU 827 and Reso 1764, tax exemptions.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee on General Welfare, Intros 1062-A, foster care study.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on general orders.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee on Housing and Buildings, Intro 1241-A, diaper changing accommodations.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1678-B, amending the definition of harassment.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1764-A, J-51 benefit eligibility.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee on Land Use, Intro 1533-A and Intro 1661-A, urban renewal plans and agriculture website.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered Reso 1761, Restore NY Communities Initiative.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on general orders.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 785 and Reso 1765
and LU 786 and Reso 1766, Harlem River Waterfront
District.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Approved with
modifications and coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 800 to LU 817 on
page 7, various applications.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Approved with
modifications and referred to the City Planning
Commission pursuant to Rule 11.70(b) of the Rules of
the Council and Section 197-(d) of the New York City
Charter.

COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 825 and Reso 1767,
UDAAP Queens.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered LU 828
and Reso 1768 and Preconsidered LU 829 and Reso 1769,
property tax exemptions.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Approved and laid
over.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered LU 830
and Reso 1770, Primary School, Council District 38.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
on Oversight and Investigations, Intro 1618-A, DOI
reporting.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1633-A, City
vendor name checks.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
on Parks and Recreation, Intro 270, renaming two
thoroughfares and public places.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
on Public Safety, Intro 1611-A and 1664-A, police
department reports.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
on Rules, Privileges and Elections, Preconsidered
M 562 and Reso 1771, approving the appointment of

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

Anne Holford-Smith, Landmarks Preservation
Commission.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered M 563 and
Reso 1772, approving the recommendation of Alameda
Sky Chapman, Youth Board.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
on Small Business, Intro 1382-B, workforce reporting.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
on Technology, Intro 1696-A, automated decision
systems.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: On the general order
calendar, Intro 1465-A, residual fuel oil and city
power plants.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Laid over.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Reso appointing various
persons, Commissioner of Deeds.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on general orders and I ask for a roll call vote on all coupled general order items.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Beginning with Council Member Ulrich.

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you Madam Public Advocate. [background comments] I ask for unanimous consent to vote on all land use items and all matters on the general order calendar.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I vote aye and I just wanna give a special... [crosstalk]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Yes, give...

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: shout-out to my grandmother Rosemary who's here with me today; she came for the swearing in and [background comments, clapping] she was with me nine years ago on the day that Council Member Ferreras [background comment] and I, along with Kenny Mitchell were sworn in, and she's still here, so I love you [background comments] and thank you for being here today. Thank you...

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Madam Public Advocate, thank you.

[clapping]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: God bless you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Adams.

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I vote aye.

[background comment]

COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Borelli.

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all
except Land Use 817 [background comments], 752-C,
1382-B, and 1678.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Cabrera.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Chin.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Permission to
explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I urge my
colleagues to vote for Intro 1062-A and 1533-A, and I
congratulate all my colleagues on their [background
comments] land use and legislation.

I wanted to thank Speaker Melissa Mark-
Viverito for her support on these legislations, thank
Council Member Steve Levin, Chair of the General

1 Welfare Committee, and Council Member David
2 Greenfield, Chair of the Land Use Committee, for
3 their leadership on these bills. And I also wanna
4 thank staff -- Ramon Martinez, Andrea Vazquez, Raju
5 Mann, Julie Lubin, Jeff Campagna; my Land Use
6 Director, Roxanne Earley and my Deputy Chief of
7 Staff, Vincent Fang for all their hard work on these
8 two important legislations, and I vote aye on all.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cohen.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Yes.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Constantinides.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Madam
14 Public Advocate, may I be allowed to explain my vote?

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank
17 you. I wanna ask my colleagues to support
18 Intro 1651-A, which [background comment] will require
19 DCAS to provide [background comments] annual reports...

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member,
21 excuse us.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Quite
23 okay.
24

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Could we have quiet in the chambers please? Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I'd like to ask my colleagues to support 1651-A, which will require DCAS to provide an annual report on electricity and fossil fuel use in certain city buildings, including identifying whether such buildings have been fitted with equipment for monitoring energy use in near real time. This report will require assessments and improvements to building envelopes; it would also require DCAS, in conjunction with other agencies, to coordinate the installation of energy usage equipment and any software in city buildings that DCAS identifies as appropriate for such installation.

I wanna thank our Speaker, Melissa Mark-Viverito, our Committee Counsel Samara Swanston, Ed Atkin; intern Ryan Moser for all their work on this bill, as well as DCAS, and of course, my Legislative Director, Nick Widzowski. Thank you and I vote aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Cornegy.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Madam Public Advocate, may I have permission to explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I encourage all of my colleagues to sign onto and vote for Intro 1382-B, which will require contractors employed to work on City-funded construction sites to report the demographic information of persons employed on the worksite, including hourly rate of payment and zip code or primary residence so we can be sure City funds are benefiting all New Yorkers. This information will add much needed accountability to the awarding of large contracts to developers who promise a diverse workforce and will ensure that we in government are making our commitment to create a fair and equitable city for all New Yorkers.

I'd like to thank Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito, Terzah Nasser, Aysha Schomburg, Committee Counsel Sylvester Yavana, Policy Analyst Michael Kurtz, Fiscal Policy Analyst Aliya Ali, and my staff for all their work on this bill, and I would like to extend an extra special thanks to Bertha Lewis of The Black Institute and Hazel Dukes of the New York State

2 NAACP, without whose advocacy this bill would not be
3 as strong. Thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cumbo.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Oh I'm sorry --
7 and I vote aye on all.

8 [laughter, background comment]

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Cumbo.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye on all.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Deutsch.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: No on 1186 and
14 aye on the rest.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Dromm.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye on all.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Espinal.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Permission to
20 explain my vote.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Yeah, I just
23 really wanna highlight the two bills that I am
24 passing today; one is Intro 1661-A and this would
25 require the City of New York to create a website in

1 the NYC.gov portal dedicated to urban farming, so it
2 will be an informational hub for commercial farmers
3 and also community gardens to know what are the rules
4 and regulations the City has in place, and this also
5 I believe will help spur urban gardening, because it
6 will incentivize people to go out there and start
7 growing their fruits and vegetables. It's only a
8 first step; I know there's a lot more work that needs
9 to be done, I'm dedicated and committed to doing that
10 in the new coming session.
11

12 Second is a bill that would require
13 diaper changing stations in all public restrooms;
14 it's a bill I introduced to my colleague Dan
15 Garodnick and something I'm very proud of. After
16 seeing a father actually changing his daughter's
17 diaper on top of a public bathroom sink, so just
18 imagine you have hundreds of people washing their
19 hands after using the restroom going to use that
20 sink, but then you also have someone changing their
21 child's diaper in that sink. So I hope this is a
22 bill that also will benefit all of our young parents
23 in the Council; I know Laurie Cumbo just had a child
24 and Antonio Reynoso is also having a child in the
25 next few months and hopefully they can use this for

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

their families, so thank me later, and all New Yorkers as well, I hope this benefits all parents across the city. So I vote aye on all. Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Eugene

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I want to vote on all the land use call-ups and also I vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you. I vote aye. Congratulations to all and particularly Council Member Espinal; I think that's a great thing for the dads and all families. I vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Gibson.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: With my warmest congratulations to all of our colleagues, especially Council Member Espinal, thank you so much, I vote aye on all. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Greenfield.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: A special congratulations to Council Members Chin and Espinal

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

on their outstanding land use legislation; I vote
aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Grodenchik.

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Yes, aye on
all, with the exception of Preconsidered Reso 1761; I
abstain on that.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Johnson.

COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: King.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Congratulations to
everyone who's passing legislation today. I vote aye
on all except for Intro 1186-A; I abstain.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koslowitz.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I vote aye on
all.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lancman.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Levine.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Maisel.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Maisel.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Menchaca.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Madam Public

Advocate, permission to... [crosstalk]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yeah, ta... take it
easy.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: yeah. If you'll
grant me, all land use and call-ups, aye... [crosstalk]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Okay. Thank you.
Watch that back.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma.

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Maisel.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Maisel.

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Perkins.

COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Reynoso.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Permission to
explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I want to
acknowledge that Lacey Tauber, my Legislative
Director, will be leaving the Council today, as her
last day, and she will be joining the dark side and
HPD. A reference -- next weekend Star Wars will be
coming out; you guys should all go watch it -- Lacey
Tauber dons the same initials as the great Lawrence
Taylor of the New York football Giants and they have
many things in common these two: they aggressively

1
2 pursue their goals -- in this case, passing laws for
3 Lacey Tauber -- no matter who is in front of them;
4 while she may be deterred at times, trust me, she
5 persists, and I wanna thank her for everything she
6 has done to enhance my office and continue to help me
7 pass legislation in this time; she has been a great
8 employee and staff member and now that she will be
9 leaving me, I want to acknowledge the great friend
10 that she also has been in my office. I am proud that
11 Lacey Tauber has been in my office for the last four
12 years and has helped me achieve my goals and the many
13 accomplishments that I have. I am very proud of her
14 and wish her the best at HPD; they have a superstar
15 with them now. So thank you again, Lacey, for
16 everything you've done for me. And I wanna thank
17 Rafael Espinal for the changing tables that I will
18 soon be using. And I vote aye on all.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Richards.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I vote aye and
22 thank you, Espinal for looking out for us forgotten
23 dads. [background comments] Thank you.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Donovan too.

25

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: The men who get
3 it.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye on all.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rose.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rosenthal.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Permission to
10 explain my vote.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye on all.

13 [background comments] Congratulations to Lacey
14 Tauber. Lacey, we are all gonna miss you; it's one
15 of those things where I'm happy for you and very sad
16 for me. And I want to especially thank Council
17 Member Chin for carrying legislation that will help
18 in all of our districts when it comes to land use
19 decision-making; it was an incredibly important bill
20 and I know it will be important for the Upper West
21 Side. Thank you.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Salamanca.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all,
3 except Land Use Item 817.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Treyger.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to
7 explain my vote.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Public Advocate,
10 I'd like to speak about my bill that we're voting on
11 today, Intro [background comment] 1757. We have
12 seen, especially in recent months, how bullying leads
13 to tragic consequences -- several New Yorkers have
14 lost their lives because of incidents rooted in
15 bullying. As a former teacher, I know firsthand the
16 physical, emotional and psychological impact that
17 bullying can have on students; with the rise of
18 social media, bullying has taken on new forms and it
19 is likelier than ever to spill out of the school
20 campus and into the home lives of students. My bill
21 will help us learn how bullying begins, where
22 bullying persists, and whether or not schools have
23 enough resources and are utilizing them properly. My
24 bill also examines if schools are effectively
25 informing [background comments] parents and guardians

1
2 of bullying incidents involving their children and it
3 will also make sure parents and guardians are
4 involved in the process every step of the way.

5 I would like to thank Speaker Melissa
6 Mark-Viverito, Education Chair Danny Dromm, the
7 Education Committee, the great staff -- Smita
8 Deshmukh; Rob Newman, my Chief of Staff; Anna Scaife,
9 my Policy Director; and Vanessa Ogle [sic], and all
10 of my colleagues who have expressed support in this
11 important issue and I ask you all to please vote yes,
12 and I vote aye on all. Thank you.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Vacca.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I'd like to
16 explain my vote.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, sir.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I wanna thank the
19 Council for voting for 1696, my bill about
20 algorithms, and I wanna thank especially the members
21 of the Technology Committee, which I chair, and my
22 staff -- Zach Hecht and all the members of the
23 Council staff.

24 We are increasingly governed by
25 technology and the data that goes into algorithms

1 that makes decisions for you and I is not at all
2 transparent at this point and not at all accountable
3 to our oversight here at the Council. My legislation
4 creates a mayoral task force that must report, during
5 the next Council, on what they propose to do, agency
6 by agency, to make that information more available,
7 to make it transparent, and how we can oversee the
8 use of data that goes into algorithms and how people
9 who dispute the findings can have a recourse to take
10 action and appeal should there be a government
11 decision that they don't agree with. We're the first
12 city in this country to enact legislation like this,
13 because it's kind of wonky; it's kinda complex, but
14 it's something that we have to put our arms around
15 and we have to do it soon; the public will demand
16 nothing less than that in the days ahead. So this is
17 groundbreaking legislation, New York City leads the
18 way once again; I'm proud of all the work that went
19 into this, and I hope that the next Council will put
20 on their oversight hat and make sure that agency by
21 agency is held accountable, makes the reports that
22 are needed, and that we have a comprehensive approach
23 to data, algorithms, and all that goes with it.

24 Thank you.
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye on all.

[laugh]

COMMITTEE CLERK: Matteo.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: No on 752, 1382,
1678, and aye on the rest.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: I wanna thank all
of you for voting for 752; it will go a long way
making sure that our City-funded construction
industry is both diverse and represents the best
developers and contractors in the City of New York,
and I thank all of you for your support.

And are all the fellows up in the balcony
women? [background comment] No? One guy. Where's
the gentleman at? There you go, one gentleman, two,
very good, very good; proud of you. [background
comment] Thank you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

All items on today's general order calendar were adopted by a vote of 46 in the affirmative, 0 negative and 0 abstentions, with the exception of Intro 752-C, which was adopted by a vote of 44 in the affirmative, 2 negative and 0 abstentions, and Intro 1382-B, which was adopted by a vote of 44 in the affirmative, 2 negative, and 0 abstentions, and Intro 1678-B, which was adopted by a vote of 44 in the affirmative, 2 negative, and 0 abstentions, and Intro 1186-A, which was adopted by a vote of 44 in the affirmative, 1 negative, and 1 abstention, and Resolution 1761, which was adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative, 0 negative, and 1 abstention, and that's it for the agenda.

Introduction and Reading of Bills.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All bills have been referred to the Committee as indicated on the agenda.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. We have no resolutions today; we'll go immediately to general discussion, beginning with Council Member Grodenchik. [background comment] Oh my goodness, Happy Holiday. [background comment, laughter]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Council Member Williams will not waive his right to speak. [laughter]

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: You are correct, Madam Public Advocate.

[background comments]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the chambers.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I will be brief though. Obviously I want to please send my prayers for anyone who may have been injured today and thank our armed men and women for their response today.

I do wanna talk about two things; the Speaker had a bill that we passed [background comments] dealing with... [crosstalk]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member Williams has the floor...

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: dealing with...

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: please be quiet.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: dealing with concealed carry and licenses. We do know that the concealed carry has passed at least one house, which is extremely dangerous. As we've known, the Congress has been unable to pass legislation after attacks and we see now that they can very well pass legislation

1
2 when it comes to guns, as long as they are making
3 this country more dangerous and it just seems unreal
4 that they won't even look at what's happening here in
5 New York City; we are now the safest bit city in the
6 country; we have a long way to go, but we've moved so
7 far and to not look at what's happened here and try
8 to make it less safe is just a crazy thing and I hope
9 to continue to push back; I thank the Congress people
10 who have been supporting pushing back; hopefully this
11 body will continue to speak louder.

12 I do want to just say I was moved when
13 the conviction and sentencing of Walter Scott, the
14 officer that killed him, it is not enough that we
15 actually see officers being held accountable and it
16 actually made me a little teary because I speak about
17 black lives matter, but very often you see on the
18 news that it doesn't, and this is one time -- but it
19 doesn't happen often enough -- we saw someone being
20 held accountable and I hope that it's something that
21 reverberates across the country; it will go a long
22 way into moving in the direction we wanna continue
23 moving.

24 Last but not least, I wanna thank Council
25 Member King for bringing us all together on the steps

1
2 today and we should all be pushing against; will soon
3 be firefighter Cassano, for the words of hate that
4 he's been known to tweet from time to time,
5 repeatedly, against Jews, against blacks. I kept
6 thinking [bell] that if he was one of the responders
7 today and he had to make a split second decision and
8 he saw a yarmulke and he saw a Star of David or he
9 saw black skin, what decision would that be, so I
10 hope we as a body continue to push back on this
11 Administration not to have him hired. Thank you.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
13 Council Member King.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I rise and I'll be
15 short. I just wanna say thank you to everyone who
16 came out this morning to denounce [background
17 comments] what FDNY has done by hiring someone
18 [background comments] who stands against everything
19 that we fight for and what we've advocated against
20 since the last four years in this Council, so it is a
21 slap in the face to the great work that this Council
22 has done for one of our agencies and FDNY to think
23 it's okay to hire the poster child that represents
24 bigotry and hatred. So we'll be calling on the Mayor
25 and everyone else, and all of you have received

1
2 letters from me; we're asking you to make sure that
3 we get that letter signed; that we can get it to the
4 Commissioner and the Mayor, urging them to remove
5 this individual from ever serving New Yorkers, since
6 he can't seem to figure out how to show love or find
7 love in his heart for New Yorkers, and again, it's
8 been a real honor and a pleasure working with
9 everyone this legislative season. Thank you and
10 Happy Holidays again.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. And
12 lastly, Council Member Greenfield, last... [crosstalk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you
14 very much. I just wanted to take just a minute to
15 recognize that my counsel, Elena Sytcheva is.. this is
16 her last Stated Meeting and she will also be joining
17 HPD as a Deputy Chief of Staff; she's done fantastic
18 work in my office for the last couple of years,
19 especially around MIH, ZQA and all of the land use
20 issues and legislative issues in my office; I wanted
21 to thank her for her work and recognize her
22 outstanding contribution to the City of New York and
23 to wish her well at HPD, where I'm sure she'll
24 continue to be an outstanding public servant. Thank

1
2 you very much and I wish everybody a Happy Hanukkah
3 this week.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
5 Treyger.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you,
7 Public Advocate. Colleagues, I please bring to your
8 attention a bill I'm introducing today in the
9 Council, Intro 1790. It's no secret that our PTAs
10 are not as equitable as they should be and we must
11 make sure that all of our students have equal
12 opportunities across the board. Your zip code should
13 not determine your number of opportunities. My bill
14 will offer much-needed transparency over our parent
15 associations and parent-teacher associations. My
16 bill would require the DOE to report information
17 annually regarding PAs and PTAs, including the number
18 of parents registered and attending, the frequency of
19 meetings, and the annual income of the PTAs, noting
20 fundraising activities and the annual expenditures.
21 There is no secret that in certain neighborhoods in
22 our city there is greater capacity to raise a lot
23 more resources than other areas in New York City and
24 I wanna make sure that our students, regardless of
25 where you live, what zip code you're in, that you're

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

receiving a level playing field. So my bill would offer more transparency with regards to PAs and PTA processes and help even the playing field for our kids. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you and without objection, we reopen the vote for Council Member Crowley. How do you vote?

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you, Madam Public Advocate. I vote aye on all calendar orders and all land use items. Thanks.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. A revised tally. All items on today's general order calendar were adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative, 0 negative and 0 abstentions, with the exception of Intro 752-C, which was adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative, 2 negative and 0 abstentions, and Intro 1382-B, which was adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative, 2 negative and 0 abstentions, and Intro 1678-B, which was adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative, 2 negative and 0 abstentions, and Intro 1186-A, which was adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative, 1 negative and 1 abstention, and Resolution 761 [sic], which was adopted by a vote of 46 in the affirmative, 0

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

negative and 1 abstention. And now to close is
Speaker, Melissa Mark-Viverito.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madam
Public Advocate. To all my colleagues, I hope to see
you at the holiday party and following in Council
Member Greenfield's footsteps, Happy Hanukkah to all.
So thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Happy Hanukkah to
all. We now close.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 27, 2017