

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

----- X

November 21, 2017  
Start: 12:44 p.m.  
Recess: 1:14 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E: DAVID G. GREENFIELD  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Vincent J. Gentile  
Annabel Palma  
Daniel R. Garodnick  
Darlene Mealy  
Rosie Mendez  
Ydanis A. Rodriguez  
Peter A. Koo  
Brad S. Lander  
Stephen T. Levin  
Jumaane D. Williams  
Deborah L. Rose  
Donovan J. Richards  
Inez D. Barron  
Andrew Cohen  
Ben Kallos  
Antonio Reynoso  
Ritchie J. Torres  
Mark Treyger  
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.  
Barry S. Grodenchik

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

2 [sound check, pause]

3 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: I'm David  
4 Greenfield. I'm the Councilman from the 44<sup>th</sup>  
5 District of Brooklyn. I'm privileged to serve as the  
6 Chair of the Land Use Committee. I want to welcome  
7 my esteemed colleagues and members of the Committee  
8 Council Members Gentile, Garodnick, Koo, Lander,  
9 Rose, Williams, Richards, Barron, Kallos, Reynoso,  
10 Torres, Grodenchik and Chair Salamanca. I want to  
11 thank Council Member Laurie Cumbo who has joined us  
12 as well, as well as Council Member Perkins. I want to  
13 thank Chair Salamanca, Chair Richards and Chair Koo  
14 for their outstanding work on the Land Use  
15 Subcommittees. Today, we're going to be voting on  
16 the Bedford Union Armory, East River Fifties Alliance  
17 (sic) for a Zoning text amendment, the East Harlem  
18 Neighborhood Rezoning Sendero Verde, Special Harlem  
19 River Waterfront District Zoning Text Amendment 697-  
20 seat intermediate school and several tax exemptions.  
21 We're going to be voting to modify the East Harlem  
22 Neighborhood Rezoning Application, LUs 773 through  
23 775 to densities and lights along portions of the  
24 park, Lexington and Third to Second Avenue to better  
25 respond to neighborhood context and minimizing the

2 risk of the deployment (sic) of rates of stabilized  
3 units. The Council is also removing Eugene McCabe  
4 Field and a church site from the rezoning area,  
5 modifying non-residential requirements along Park  
6 Avenue and changing the MIH option removing Option 2  
7 and adding a deep affordability option. We'll be  
8 voting to modify this Sendero Verde application LU  
9 776 through 782 to a strict disposition of city owned  
10 land to require that a minimum of 1,000–11,450 feet  
11 of lot be devoted to a community garden or passive  
12 recreation use and a minimum of an additional 18,000  
13 square feet be devoted to use as a publicly  
14 accessible open space. We'll also be voting to  
15 approve a related tax exemption LU 790. We'll also  
16 be voting to approve with modifications LU 785 and  
17 786 the Special Harlem Waterfront District Expansion.  
18 We will be modifying a text to require that some  
19 sites comply wit the new rules rather than the  
20 previously applicable rules, and to introduce the CPC  
21 Authorization that would allow for a waiver of the  
22 required setback from the Deegan Expressway on  
23 certain sites. Today we'll be voting to approve with  
24 modifications LUs 808 through 812 the Bedford Union  
25 Armory Applications, EDC's applications for a

2 proposed rezoning map amendment from R6 to R7-2 and  
3 R7-2/C2-4 zoning text amendment to establish a  
4 Mandatory Inclusionary Housing Area Special Permit  
5 pursuant to Section-ZR Section 74-743, Special Permit  
6 pursuant to ZR Section 74-532 and Disposition  
7 Approval for city-owned property at 1555 Bedford  
8 Avenue in Brooklyn in order to facilitate the  
9 redevelopment of the Bedford Union Armory as a mix-  
10 units community facility--could we ask folks if you  
11 have to speak just to please whisper--recreation  
12 office and residential center. We will be modifying  
13 the application to strike MIH Option 2. I was  
14 talking about--I was talking about your neighbors to  
15 the left. And we will applicable MIH Option 1.

16 I want to acknowledge our colleague  
17 Council Member Cumbo who worked with her constituents  
18 in the community for over a year to achieve to the  
19 affordable housing plan that we have with us today.  
20 We'll be voting to approve with modifications  
21 Preconsidered LU, the East River 50 Sutton Place Text  
22 Amendment. The text amendment would establish and  
23 modify a version on the Standards Tower on base  
24 regulation for certain zoning lots in R10 districts,  
25 roughly bounded by the Queensboro Bridge, First

2 Avenue, 61<sup>st</sup> Street and the East River and Community  
3 Board 6 in Manhattan. The area is in districts of  
4 Council Member Kallos and Garodnick and they are co-  
5 applicants along with other elected officials in the  
6 East Fifties River's Alliance for this text  
7 amendment. The Council will be modifying the zoning  
8 text to remove the grandfathering provision added by  
9 the City Planning Commission to cover a specific  
10 development, which is out of scale and character with  
11 this neighborhood. The ERFA application did not take  
12 this development by surprise. The development  
13 continues to have a standard recourse already  
14 provided under the City's existing zoning regulations  
15 to appeal for the BSA for more times to vest is we-is  
16 what we expect that they will do. We'll be voting to  
17 approve Preconsidered LU the siting of a new 696-seat  
18 intermediate school in Council Member Van Bramer's  
19 district. The proposed school will be located in the  
20 Sunnyside Gardens Historic district. We're voting to  
21 approve a Preconsidered LU Application regarding 1646  
22 Amsterdam Avenue. HPD seeks an exemption from real  
23 property tax pursuant to Article XI of the Private  
24 Housing Finance Law for property located at Block 2  
25 on East 73, Lot 32 in Council Member Levine's

2 district in Manhattan. We're voting to approve LU  
3 818 the Dunwell Plaza Application submitted by HPD  
4 pursuant to Article XI of the Private Housing Finance  
5 Law. This application is for real property tax  
6 residential property located at Block 2114, Lot 35 in  
7 Council Member Levine's District in Manhattan. We've  
8 also been joined by Council Member Treyger. We will  
9 also be voting to approve Preconsidered LU the Los  
10 Tres Unidos Application. HPD seeks an exemption of  
11 real property taxes pursuant to Article XI of the  
12 Private Housing Financing Law to facilitate the  
13 rehabilitation of the property located a Block 1617,  
14 Lot 7 in Council Member Perkins' district in  
15 Manhattan. The NCP Park and Elton Apartments  
16 Application LU 746 have been withdrawn. Accordingly,  
17 we will vote on a motion to file to remove it from  
18 our calendar. Are there any questions on these  
19 applications? Any council members like to make brief  
20 remarks on these applications? Yes, Council Member  
21 Cumbo for some brief remarks on the applications.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Chair  
23 Greenfield. I apologize the remarks are not brief,  
24 but they are important.

2 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Can the clerk  
3 please put up the clock? No, I'm joking.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: For more than six  
5 years, the Crown Heights Community has discussed and  
6 debated what to do with the Bedford Union Armory. I  
7 was proud to be there with Congressman Major Owens  
8 when this idea was first conceived of. Discussions  
9 originally centered on a goal of a state-of-the-art  
10 in-door recreation center. At the start, housing was  
11 seen as secondary to this goal and was primarily  
12 included in the project as a way to defund the  
13 recreation center. However, by the time EDC  
14 announced the selection of a developer in 2015,  
15 conditions in the community had dramatically changed.  
16 The frontlines of gentrification have arrived in  
17 Crown Heights and Central Brooklyn. Since 2010, the  
18 average rent in Crown Heights has increased by over  
19 20%, and for many it has doubled and tripled. Market  
20 rent rates are now far outreaching long-time  
21 residents who built and sustained this community. My  
22 family who has now lived in the community for over  
23 five generations are amongst them. Many of those in  
24 rent stabilized apartments are facing pressure and  
25 harassment from new landlords. Development on



2 affordable housing on public land is one of the most  
3 important tools we have to address the affordable  
4 housing crisis, and the Bedford Union Armory Project  
5 is one of the most significant pieces of public land  
6 we have left in Crown Heights. Throughout this ULURP  
7 process, I have repeatedly stated that development of  
8 the Armory must focus on helping Crown Heights ease  
9 the impacts of rising rents and gentrification. I  
10 promised to reject any proposal that included market  
11 rate condominiums and failed to provide a majority of  
12 apartments at rents that are truly affordable to the  
13 Crown Heights community. Today, I am proud that we  
14 have revised the Bedford Union Armory project that  
15 now lives up to the values of the community, and what  
16 I have fought so hard to achieve. I want to take a  
17 few moments to go through some of the original  
18 aspects of the project, and how we've improved it.  
19 The original proposal included 50% market rate  
20 housing including 48 luxury condominium units. Those  
21 48 luxury condominium units have been completely  
22 eliminated. Luxury condominiums have no place on  
23 public land. I said it a year ago, and I've  
24 continued to say it, and I'm proud to say that we  
25 have eliminated all of the luxury condominiums on

1 this project. I'm proud to say that the original  
2 project included 67 units at or below 60% AMI. Only  
3 67 units. Today, as a result of my negotiations with  
4 the Administration, pressure from the community, and  
5 local elected officials, the luxury condominiums not  
6 only have been eliminated, but we now have 60% of the  
7 units that represents 250 units will be affordable at  
8 the 60% AMI level or below. This is unprecedented.  
9 Crown heights has never seen this level of  
10 affordability in decades. So, from 67 units the  
11 residents of Crown Heights now have 250 units. Fifty  
12 units will be affordable at 30% of AMI. This  
13 represent low-income housing and deep affordability.  
14 Twenty-four units at 40% of AMI and 24 units at 50%  
15 of AMI and 152 units at 60% of AMI. There will also  
16 be a 10% set-aside for those coming out of our  
17 shelter system into brand new high quality housing.  
18 The community has spoken loud and clear, and together  
19 we are collectively addressing the issue of  
20 homelessness in our community by creating real  
21 permanent affordability. We stood up for real  
22 affordability and we won. 250 units at 60% of AMI  
23 and below is the most significant new affordable  
24 housing project Crown Heights has seen in decades. I

2 also want to in the interest of time bring your  
3 attention to the recreation center. The Bedford  
4 Union Armory will also deliver on the original goal  
5 of a state-of-the-art indoor recreation center with  
6 low-cost community access. The Armory's historic  
7 jewel shed will be converted into a center with three  
8 full sized basketball courts, multi-purpose court  
9 space for activities like indoor soccer, a six-lane  
10 25 meter indoor swimming pool and fitness rooms.  
11 Never before has Central Brooklyn seen a recreational  
12 facility of this quality and scale. Growing up in  
13 Brooklyn, New York I remember that these sorts of  
14 amenities were things that we had to go very far to  
15 achieve. So, for the community to have these sorts  
16 of amenities right at their front door is really a  
17 benefit to the community. As part of the terms of  
18 the 99-Year Ground Lease, the developer will be  
19 required to provide a baseline of \$1.25 million of  
20 community benefits annually, and is incentivized to  
21 provide an annual total of up to \$1.75 million, which  
22 escalates over time. Half of all memberships will be  
23 reserved for the local community at a rate of \$10 per  
24 month, and \$8 per month for children. This is well  
25 below the cost that it is at many community centers

2 and recreational facilities across New York City.  
3 Young people will be able to participate in programs  
4 like Imagine Swim and New Height–New Heights Youth  
5 will be able to do affordable basketball programs for  
6 our local young people. The recreation center at the  
7 Armory will bring an amenity to the community that we  
8 have lacked for decades, and greatly expand the range  
9 of low-cost athletic programming available to our  
10 youth. I also want to bring your attention to not-  
11 for-profit organizations that will be a part of this.  
12 The developer has already reached an agreement with  
13 the following local not-for-profits: Brooklyn,  
14 Community Pride Center; Digital Girl; Essay (sic)  
15 Title Cultural Arts Academy; the James E. Davis Stop  
16 the Violence Foundation; New Heights Youth; West  
17 Indian American Day Carnival Association to name a  
18 few, and this is going to preserve institutions that  
19 have been working in our communities for decades, but  
20 have also faced the real challenges that  
21 gentrification has brought. On top of this, there  
22 will be an additional 24,000 square feet of space  
23 available along President Street where the developer  
24 has pledged to work to bring Brooklyn Plaza Medical  
25 Center into the project, which will provide an

2 invaluable community health resource for those that  
3 are uninsured. This will be a tremendous opportunity  
4 for so many who have not been able to experience  
5 quality healthcare in their own community simply  
6 because they lacked health insurance. There will  
7 also be a community advisory committee that's going  
8 to work with the neighborhood as well as the  
9 community to make sure that the Bedford Union Armory  
10 remains a part of the development and growth of the  
11 community, and that the community's needs are met.  
12 Finally, as it pertains to labor, MWBE, local hiring  
13 and procurement, I am confident that the construction  
14 process of the Bedford Union Armory will also bring  
15 local benefits to Crown Heights. The developer has  
16 agreed to provide a living wage to all construction  
17 workers on the project and has committed to hosting  
18 multiple job fairs in the neighborhood to ensure  
19 local residents will have the opportunity to  
20 participate. I also want to bring your attention to  
21 the fact that under this ULURP process, this very  
22 well might be the most dramatic change in  
23 affordability that has ever been achieved on a single  
24 project. Thanks to the dedicated advocacy of the  
25 Crown Heights and the community, the Bedford Armory

2 has been transformed from a project with market rate  
3 condominiums and less than 20% of housing units  
4 actually affordable to the community, to a project  
5 that will stay fully in public ownership with 60% and  
6 I'll say it again, 60% at 200—of 250 units will be  
7 truly affordable low-income housing to the community.  
8 In closing, I just wanted to simply add that this has  
9 been a tremendous process. I want to thank all of my  
10 colleagues that have worked with me. Negotiating a  
11 project during maternity leave is certainly a  
12 challenge, and I thank each and every one of you for  
13 your leadership, for your dedication. When this  
14 project began, many people didn't want to see housing  
15 as part of the project. Many people wanted to see  
16 100% affordable housing. Some people wanted a  
17 recreational center. Some felt that the recreational  
18 center wasn't that important. Some people wanted to  
19 see not-for-profit organizations. Others did not.  
20 This was an opportunity to hear all voices and to  
21 come up with the best solution possible. While  
22 everyone is not going to be pleased with the final  
23 outcome, it is an example of many different ideas and  
24 views coming together in order benefit the community.  
25 I'm proud of this project. I see that this is going

2 to be an opportunity for our youth for generations to  
3 come to be able to play in safe environment, to be  
4 able to have a safe comfortable area where they can  
5 explore their many talents. This is also going to be  
6 a place where people are going to be able to afford  
7 to live in their own community. This is going to be  
8 a place for individuals to have that are coming out  
9 of our homeless shelter to have permanent housing.  
10 This is going to be a place where the uninsured are  
11 going to be able to have free or low-cost quality  
12 healthcare. This is going to be a place where local  
13 not-for-profits who have built and developed the  
14 neighborhood will have a place to stay, and this is  
15 going to be a safe space, and I care greatly about  
16 the future of our young people, which is why I have  
17 supported this project all along. I believe in the  
18 lives of our children, and I believe that they  
19 deserve to have a place to live, a place to play, and  
20 a place to learn, and that's what has inspired me  
21 this entire project. I thank everyone here today. I  
22 look forward to the support of my colleagues, and I  
23 will conclude just by saying thank you because this  
24 has been a tremendously difficult process. So, I

2 turn it back over to Chair Greenfield, and I thank  
3 you for your support.

4 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you very  
5 much for those brief remarks. [laughter] I will now  
6 turn it over to Council Member Kallos for what we  
7 hope will truly be brief remarks. [laughter]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you to my  
9 colleagues on the Subcommittee on Zoning for voting  
10 in favor of the rezoning, the East River Fifties  
11 Sutton Place Text Amendment. I refer to my comments  
12 in the Subcommittee, and will summarize for Land Use  
13 Committee members. We're hoping to stop the march of  
14 super tall buildings from commercial districts on  
15 East 57<sup>th</sup> Street into residential districts where  
16 they would displace rent regulated residents to build  
17 buildings for billionaires. They formed the East  
18 River Fifties Alliance, which has grown to 45  
19 buildings in the area with 2,600 individuals from 500  
20 buildings all over the city with support from Friends  
21 of the Upper East Side Historic District, CIVITAS,  
22 and citywide organizations like the Municipal Arts  
23 Society. Council Member Dan Garodnick, Senator Liz  
24 Krueger and Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer  
25 are also co-applicants and this has the support of



2 Congress Member Carolyn Maloney. We worked with the  
3 Department of City Planning on several options  
4 providing affordable housing as part of a proposal.  
5 DCP ultimately advised that with the change to a  
6 tower on based zoning the most effective way to  
7 produce affordable housing was to use existing  
8 inclusionary housing framework, which is what we have  
9 done. I'm pleased that DCP has also committed to  
10 reviewing and making changes to the inclusionary  
11 housing framework citywide, which will help us  
12 further incentivize the affordable housing that our  
13 community is eager to see built in the East Fifties.  
14 With the erroneous inclusion of a grandfathering  
15 provision, I am asking my colleagues to modify the  
16 application as we initially submitted, and as the  
17 City Planning Chair initially recommended. Your vote  
18 today is in support of real housing for real New  
19 Yorkers and will protect octogenarians like  
20 Herndon(sp?) Worth and seniors like Charles Fernandez  
21 and his sister who has faced displacement from their  
22 affordable rent regulated units from billionaires  
23 buildings for other billionaires. Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Billionaires  
3 building buildings for other millionaires. Say that  
4 fast five times.

5 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: I love alliteration.

6 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Okay, wonderful.  
7 Council Member Barron to make some remarks.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Mr.  
9 Chair. My remarks are regarding the Bedford Union  
10 Armory, the project that my colleague just described.  
11 We know that we have a serious housing crisis in our  
12 city. Predominantly, we're looking at the number of  
13 ever-increasing homelessness. We now that the city  
14 has an obligation to address those issues. As I  
15 reviewed the reports from the Association for  
16 Neighborhood Housing and Development, they indicated  
17 that the greatest need for housing was for people who  
18 were at 60% of AMI and below. So, while we've looked  
19 at a number of increase in the housing units, and we  
20 see that we have a number that has been increased in  
21 this project, to say that nearly half of the units  
22 are at market rate, namely 40% to me does not address  
23 the issue of bringing housing to most of the city  
24 that has a need for housing. So, understanding that,  
25 and understanding that communities of Crown Heights,

2 of Bed-Stuy and of the Northern part of East New York  
3 are looking to bring in housing for a group of people  
4 that differ from the people who presently live there  
5 to me does not address the housing crisis that we  
6 face in this city, and for that reason, I will not be  
7 able to support this project. I think that until we  
8 match where the needs for housing are with the  
9 incomes of the people who live in this city, we will  
10 not address the housing crisis. Thank you.

11 [cheers/applause]

12 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Council Member  
13 Cumbo would like to respond. Council Member Cumbo.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much,  
15 Council Member Barron for your comments. I, too,  
16 share those, and part of the challenge with this  
17 project unlike-unlike many other projects is that  
18 this particular project was formed around a state-of-  
19 the-art recreational facility that was going to need  
20 income in order to be able to manage the project for  
21 the life of the project, and so there were  
22 discussions about we could truly achieve the  
23 affordability at AMIs of 60 and below for the entire  
24 housing portion if we eliminated the recreational  
25 facility because the recreational facility in order

2 to provide affordability and accessibility we had to  
3 manage the project by allowing for there still to be  
4 40% at market rate in order to offset for the life of  
5 the project the cost to operate the recreational  
6 facility, as well as the not-for-profit spaces as  
7 well as the opportunity for Brooklyn Medical Plaza to  
8 be a part of the project. If we eliminated all of  
9 that, we could have achieved the 100% at 60 AMI and  
10 below, but the community spoke loud and clear that a  
11 recreational facility is what they thought was most  
12 important for this community, and recreational  
13 facility of this caliber has never existed in Central  
14 Brooklyn before. So, I understand your—I understand  
15 your concerns. I understand that of the communities,  
16 and while everyone is not going to be in support and  
17 favor of every project, as we should not be, I just  
18 wanted to address that to provide clarity for the  
19 broader audience as well.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I thank you for that,  
21 and Mr. Chair if I may? I thank you for that, and I  
22 understand that, and that's always the argument that  
23 is advanced when we talk about increasing affordable  
24 housing. Well, Council Member, in order to do this,  
25 we've got to be able to have a tradeoff, and that's

2 the same argument that's being presented for the  
3 Brooklyn Bridge Development. Well, in order to pay  
4 for this affordability, this beautiful Brooklyn  
5 Bridge project, you've got to have this housing. I  
6 don't accept that. I think the city can find other  
7 ways to do what its obligation is, to meet housing  
8 needs of people who are in the greatest need.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Respected.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

11 Respected.

12 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Okay, any other  
13 Council members have any other comments or questions?  
14 Hearing none, I would like to congratulate the  
15 Speaker on her significant achievements in rezonings  
16 today including the deeper level of affordability. I  
17 want to congratulate Council Member Cumbo for really  
18 an incredible achievement. I think a lot of folks  
19 don't realize that when this project first started,  
20 the previous Council Member, State Senator and  
21 Borough President only asked for one thing, which was  
22 to have a recreational center, and here we are  
23 several years later you not only have the rec center,  
24 you have a guaranteed access to people who are low-  
25 income, and you have 60% of those units will be at

2 60% of AMI or below, which means that it will not be  
3 for-- The max will be for families who are making  
4 \$57,000 a year. That is the maximum income, and it  
5 will go all the way down to families who are making  
6 as little as \$20 something thousand dollars year.  
7 So, that's a significant achievement and we  
8 congratulate you, and finally, I want to congratulate  
9 Council Members Kallos and Garodnick and especially  
10 Council Member Kallos for his fortitude, and his  
11 perseverance. I'm sure there's going to be a book in  
12 here somewhere or at least you can check it out on  
13 his Twitter handle @benkallos, the saga of how he got  
14 this done, and it was a significant achievement, and  
15 it was really very done community organizing to get  
16 to this space as well. Congratulations as well.  
17 With that, I know call a vote in accordance with the  
18 recommendations of the subcommittee through the  
19 support of the local Council members to approve  
20 Preconsidered LU 697, seat intermediate school; LU  
21 818 the Dunwell Plaza Tax Exemption; Preconsidered LU  
22 1646, the Amsterdam Plaza Los Tres Unidos Tax  
23 Exemptions, as well as LU 790, the Sendero Verde Tax  
24 Exemption, and to approve with modifications that I  
25 have described the Bedford Union Armory, LUs 808

1 COMMITTEE ON LAND USE 23

2 through 812; Preconsidered LU East River 50 Sutton  
3 Place, LU 773 through 775, the East Harlem  
4 Neighborhood Rezoning; LU 776 through 782 Sendero  
5 Verde and LU 785 through 786, the Special Harlem  
6 River Waterfront District and to file through a joint  
7 application for the NCP Park and Elton Apartments, LU  
8 746. Will the Clerk please call the roll.

9 CLERK: William Martin, Committee Clerk,  
10 roll call vote Committee on Land Use. All items are  
11 coupled. Chair Greenfield.

12 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: I vote aye on  
13 all.

14 CLERK: Levin.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to  
16 explain my vote.

17 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Sure.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very  
19 much, Mr. Chair.

20 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: I know.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I wanted to—I—I  
22 just wanted to take a couple of—a brief moment. I  
23 wanted to congratulate Council Members Kallos and  
24 Garodnick, but I especially want to acknowledge my  
25 colleague Laurie Cumbo, a colleague and friend. Over

2 the last year and a half I've seen up close how  
3 Laurie has approached this extremely difficult land  
4 use proposal, and I can say that I am very proud of  
5 the way that she has approached this. She has  
6 approached this with the utmost dignity and  
7 integrity, and political courage, and decency, and  
8 and professionalism. And every step of the way she  
9 was conscientious of all sides of the argument and  
10 seeking the best solution and holding to her deeply  
11 held positions, and not compromising where it  
12 mattered and making sure that she was listening to  
13 all sides and—and—and getting to an excellent,  
14 excellent outcome, And I just want to be on the  
15 record saying how proud I am to call Laurie a  
16 colleague and a friend, and how proud I am of her  
17 through this process, and with that I vote aye on  
18 all. Thank you.

19 CLERK: Gentile.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye on all.

21 CLERK: Garodnick.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

23 CLERK: Mendez. Rodriguez.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

25 CLERK: Koo.



2 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote aye.

3 CLERK: Lander.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: With

5 congratulations to Council Member Cumbo and Council

6 Member Kallos, and the Speaker and enthusiasm for the

7 inclusion of the Certificate of No Harassment in the

8 East Harlem Rezoning and more on that to come soon, I

9 vote aye on all. Congratulations.

10 CLERK: Rose.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye

12 CLERK: Williams.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye.

14 CLERK: Richards.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Congratulations

16 Council Member Cumbo, and I'm glad the Administration

17 is obviously reviewing their policy on luxury condos

18 being placed on city land. So, I want to

19 congratulate you in ensuring that you are obviously

20 getting some real affordable housing for your

21 community. So, congratulations. I vote aye.

22 CLERK: Mendez.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote aye.

24 CLERK: Barron.

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye with  
3 the exception of the Bedford Union Armory, Land Use  
4 808 through 812 on which I'm voting no. Thank you.

5 CLERK: Kallos.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you to all  
7 my colleagues. I vote aye proudly.

8 CLERK: Reynoso.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I will vote aye  
10 on all and just want to make mention to the fact that  
11 the affordable housing in the city of New York  
12 continues to be built in places of color almost  
13 exclusively. Thank you.

14 CLERK: Torres.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Just a quick  
16 permission to explain my vote. I want to  
17 congratulate Council Member Cumbo for negotiating  
18 what I take to be a strong deal for your community.  
19 I do feel that we should have a—we should strive  
20 toward a citywide policy of reserving the disposition  
21 of city-owned land for community development of  
22 affordable housing purposes. So, I hope that we're  
23 not addressing this issue on ULURP by ULURP basis,  
24 but adopt a citywide policy that advocates for proper

2 uses of publicly owned land. So, with that said I  
3 vote proudly aye.

4 CLERK: Treyger.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I vote aye.

6 CLERK: Grodenchik.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: [off mic]

8 Aye.

9 CLERK: Salamanca.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I want to  
11 congratulate my colleague Laurie Cumbo on a job well  
12 done, and I vote aye on all.

13 CLERK: Williams.

14 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Council Member  
15 Williams to explain his vote.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you very  
17 much. As you mentioned, I am abstaining on  
18 Preconsidered LUs at East River 50 Sutton Place.  
19 Although I know a lot of work was done just trying to  
20 remain consistent with my philosophy on affordable  
21 housing. It just wasn't addressed in that one. I'm  
22 not sure why. I haven't gotten any real reasons.  
23 So, I'm must going to abstain on that. I'm also for  
24 the moment, and my vote may change on the floor,  
25 going to abstain on the Bedford Armory, and wanted to

2 explain that. One, I did want to also congratulate  
3 Council Member Cumbo. I stood with her awhile back  
4 when she said she wasn't going to support the project  
5 unless there was some significant changes, and so  
6 even with some the opponents now have to agree that  
7 there has been some significant changes in the  
8 project. It went from very little units below 60%--  
9 below 60% to 60% of the units, and that's--that over  
10 half of the units there. Where--where I get stuck is  
11 the other 40%. I do believe if there was no rec  
12 center, it would be a clear slam dunk for me to--to  
13 oppose this, but it seems that the community really  
14 did want a rec center and then to be part of it.

15 (coughs) Excuse me. It is persuasive whether it is  
16 additional affordability our rec center. It has to  
17 be paid for somehow, and the money is not  
18 perpetuated. The money doesn't just come out of the  
19 trees. So, somebody has to pay for it. The city--the--  
20 the community seemed to want the rec center. It's  
21 important so it has to be paid for. It's also  
22 persuasive that we want to make sure it's paid for in  
23 perpetuity, and so if it's not in perpetuity, if it  
24 is just city funds, it is open to being cut in the  
25 future so that does provide some difficulty in

2 funding. The way that it is set up now with the 40%  
3 of market rate, we can clearly say that the rec  
4 center can provide some services in perpetuity.  
5 Since I just got this, I do want to do a deep dive  
6 into what access to that community center the  
7 community actually has, and I haven't had time to do  
8 that, and so for that reason I'm going to vote—I'm  
9 going to abstain on this for the time being.  
10 Congratulations to all my colleagues and aye on all  
11 the rest.

12 CLERK: By a vote of 18 in the  
13 affirmative, 0 in the negative and no abstentions,  
14 all items have been adopted with the exception of the  
15 following: The Preconsidered Land Use Item  
16 Application No. N8180082ZRM has been adopted by a  
17 vote of 17 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and  
18 1 abstention, and Land Use Items 808 through 812 have  
19 been adopted by the committee 16 in the affirmative,  
20 1 in the negative and 1 abstention.

21 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: This concludes  
22 the Land Use Committee for November 21, 2017. I wish  
23 all of you a happy Thanksgiving. This meeting is  
24 hereby adjourned. [gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 6, 2017