

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

November 16, 2017

Start: 2:01 p.m.

Recess: 3:11 p.m.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: LETITIA JAMES  
Public Advocate

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO  
Speaker for the Council

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Inez D. Barron  
Joe Borelli  
Fernando Cabrera  
Margaret S. Chin  
Andrew Cohn  
Costa G. Constantinides  
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.  
Elizabeth S. Crowley  
Laurie A. Cumbo  
Chaim M. Deutsch  
Daniel Dromm  
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.  
Mathieu Eugene  
Julissa Ferreras-Copeland  
Daniel R. Garodnick  
Vincent J. Gentile  
Vanessa L. Gibson

David G. Greenfield  
Barry Grodenchik  
Corey D. Johnson  
Ben Kallos  
Andy L. King  
Peter A. Koo  
Karen Koslowitz  
Rory I. Lancman  
Brad S. Lander  
Stephen T. Levin  
Mark Levine  
Alan N. Maisel  
Steven Matteo  
Darlene Mealy  
Carlos Menchaca  
Rosie Mendez  
I. Daneek Miller  
Annabel Palma  
Bill Perkins  
Antonio Reynoso  
Donovan J. Richards  
Ydanis A. Rodriguez  
Deborah L. Rose  
Helen K. Rosenthal  
Ritchie J. Torres  
Rafael Salamanca  
Mark Treyger  
Eric A. Ulrich  
James Vacca  
Paul A. Vallone  
James G. Van Bramer  
Jumaane D. Williams

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Pastor Janet Hodge, Sr. Pastor  
Crawford Memorial United Methodist  
3757 White Plains Rd., Bronx N.Y. 10467.

2 [sound check, pause] [background  
3 comments, pause] [background comments]

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Ladies and gentlemen,  
5 can I have your attention please? Can I please have  
6 your attention? At this time, quiet please, quiet  
7 please. [gavel] At this time, please place all  
8 electronic devices, all electronic devices to  
9 vibrate. Will all non-Council employees, non-Council  
10 employees please leave the main floor of the  
11 chambers. There is additional sitting upstairs in  
12 the balcony.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Can we close the  
14 doors please and everyone have their seats. May we  
15 come to order. Everyone please find a seat. Those  
16 in the balcony, there's plenty of seats.

17 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: If you're standing in  
18 the back, please find a seat.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
20 [pause] [shushing for quiet] All rise for the Pledge  
21 of Allegiance.

22 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise. [Pledge of  
23 Allegiance]

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.  
25 Roll call.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

5

2 CLERK: Barron. Borelli. Cabrera.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

4 CLERK: Chin.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

6 CLERK: Cohen.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

8 CLERK: Constantinides. Cornegy.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Here.

10 CLERK: Crowley.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Here.

12 CLERK: Cumbo. Deutsch.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.

14 CLERK: Dromm.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

16 CLERK: Espinal.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here. Eugene.

18 Ferreras-Copeland.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Here.

20 CLERK: Garodnick.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.

22 CLERK: Gentile.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.

24 CLERK: Gibson.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Here.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

6

2 CLERK: Greenfield. Borelli

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Here.

4 CLERK: Grodenchik.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.

6 CLERK: Johnson.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Here.

8 CLERK: Kallos.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here. [background  
10 comment]

11 CLERK: King.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.

13 CLERK: Koo.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

15 CLERK: Koslowitz:

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

17 CLERK: Lancman.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.

19 CLERK: Lander.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.

21 CLERK: Levin.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

23 CLERK: Levine.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

25 CLERK: Maisel.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

7

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.

3 CLERK: Mealy.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Here.

5 CLERK: Menchaca.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.

7 CLERK: Eugene.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Here.

9 CLERK: Mendez.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.

11 CLERK: Miller.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.

13 CLERK: Palma.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Here.

15 CLERK: Perkins.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aqui.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER: Aqui. Oh, I like that.

18 CLERK: Reynoso. Richards.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

20 CLERK: Rodriguez.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Here.

22 CLERK: Rose.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

24 CLERK: Rosenthal. Salamanca. Torres.

25 Treyger.

2 CLERK: Ulrich.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Here.

4 CLERK: Vacca.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.

6 CLERK: Vallone.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

8 CLERK: Williams.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.

10 CLERK: Matteo.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.

12 CLERK: Van Bramer.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

14 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Here.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the  
17 Chambers. All rise for the Invocation.

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: The Invocation  
20 will be delivered by Pastor Janet Hodge, Senior, the  
21 pastor at Crawford Memorial United Methodist Church  
22 in the great borough of the Bronx. Quiet in the  
23 Chambers.

24 PASTOR JANET HODGE: Spirits of love, we  
25 gather in this place set aside for the work of those



2 elected to serve. May this serve in the strength of  
3 mutual care, in the power of unity that comes from  
4 wisdom, understanding and patience. May every bitter  
5 thought and nagging worry be erased by love and  
6 desires and gentle inspiration consumed by the sense  
7 of privilege to serve. We pray for our city that the  
8 needs for all for food and shelter and work so  
9 justice and dignity might be met. For the diverse  
10 people living here may we all join the efforts to  
11 seek the good of all. May vision and hope for the  
12 future be clear and all-inclusive filled with  
13 compassion, as we move with purpose towards goals and  
14 objectives. May their leadership be strong, one that  
15 witnesses to bring in unity, peace and equality. Let  
16 them be role models for the young and be lights to  
17 those whose vision with age is now dimming. May each  
18 have the strength to do right, to do good and to seek  
19 justice. Help us all to serve each other with  
20 integrity in word and deed. We are thankful for  
21 their willingness to give of themselves for their  
22 commitment to preparing the way to a better future  
23 for the city, thus the nation and the world. Help us  
24 to be supportive that we may show gratitude just as  
25 quickly as we are to show contempt. Spirit of love,

2 be with each member of this this Council and this  
3 journey, for their work is not easy and sometimes the  
4 journey will be lonely, and sometimes it will seem  
5 thankless. Yet, we know that this work is a special  
6 privilege. In those difficult times renew in them  
7 the desire and passion for the people that move them  
8 to serve. Surround them in their homes, their  
9 offices, their coming in and going out with the  
10 support that they need to keep try to the task that  
11 is set before them. For in indeed, they are servants  
12 of the people. Amen.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amen.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER: Amen.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.

16 [background comment] A motion to spread the  
17 Invocation upon the record, Council Member Andy King.

18 [Shushing for quiet]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Good afternoon,  
20 all. Thank you so much Madam Public Advocate for the  
21 opportunity to spread the Invocation upon the record,  
22 and acknowledge Pastor Janet Hodge of Crawford  
23 Memorial United Methodist in the Williamsburg section  
24 of the North Bronx in the Twelfth District. You  
25 know, the great things of Pastor Hodge as layperson

2 Janet was a member of Crawford Methodist Church where  
3 she served as various ministries, and it's while she  
4 was nurturing in this faith, she was called and  
5 ordained to this ministry, and she's now the founder  
6 of Crawford Saturday Morning Breakfast Program for  
7 the needy. We are so happy that she came home to  
8 lead this path and—and lead as the pastor of this  
9 important congregation for 165 years. In addition to  
10 our ministry, the pastor—our pastor has had a  
11 successful career, a 25-year in business management.  
12 The Pastor has received her Bachelor of Science  
13 Degree from the College of New Rochelle and her  
14 Masters of Divinity from Drew University, and  
15 currently studying for a doctorate at Hartford  
16 Seminary. Also, I'd like to just add inclosing that  
17 for the past two years being a pastor of this church,  
18 she has stepped forward as a sister from the Island  
19 of Tahollah in the British Virgin Islands to do all  
20 she can for all of our brothers and sisters who have  
21 been struggling during this hurricane season. I want  
22 to thank her for her leadership. I want to thank her  
23 for her partnership, and the drives that we've done  
24 in the North Bronx in sending and shipping out  
25 materials to our brothers and sisters who are

2 struggling in the British Virgin Islands as well as  
3 the United States Virgin Islands. Again, I thank  
4 you, Pastor for your day. I thank you for your  
5 blessings and I thank you for your guidance, and I  
6 thank you for your prayers. God bless.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Thank  
8 you, Council Member and thank you Pastor. God bless  
9 you. Adoption of Minutes, Council Member Chin.

10 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Anyone  
11 standing in the balcony, have a seat, please. You  
12 have to have a seat. This is not the way. (sic)

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Those in the  
14 balcony, I would ask that you have a seat before the  
15 sergeant-at-arms escorts you to the exit.

16 [background comment, pause] [group begins to sing:  
17 We who believe in freedom...]

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing]  
19 Alright, we thank you for being here with us today,  
20 but we do have to move the agenda so we're going to  
21 ask if you are going to continue to sing then we're  
22 going to have to ask you to leave. [group continues  
23 to sing] Alright, so we can clear the Chamber,  
24 please. I appreciate it. Thank you.] [group

2 continues to sing] [background comments, pause]

3 [group shouts]

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Adoption of

7 Minutes, Council Member Chin.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: A motion that the

9 Minutes of the Stated Meeting of September 27, 2017

10 be adopted as printed.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. May

12 we have quiet in the Chambers, please. [group member

13 shouts] Messages and Papers from the Mayor.

14 CLERK: None.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication

16 from City, County and Borough offices.

17 CLERK: None.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and

19 communications.

20 CLERK: None.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call-

22 Ups.

23 CLERK: None.

24

25

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the  
3 Chambers, please. Quiet in the Chambers as we now  
4 hear from the Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madam  
6 Public Advocate and Buenos tardes, good afternoon to  
7 everyone. Kicking off today just wanted to announce  
8 that the Council released earlier today its  
9 Legislative API, which is a platform to provide to  
10 the public with a direct source from which to pull  
11 data for applications and other civic engagement  
12 tools. This method offers the most up-to-date  
13 information, and was a key goal in my Council 2.0  
14 Technology Road Map to increase access and  
15 transparency in government. This has been a crucial  
16 next step in increasing access and transparency for  
17 this institution, and I want to thank our incredible  
18 Public Tech and Digital Strategy Division, and  
19 Council Members Kallos and Lander for moving this  
20 important act forward, as well as advocates from the  
21 civic technology community such as BetaNYC, Council  
22 manic and Participatory Politics Foundation for their  
23 support. So, thank you for that. Yay.  
24 [applause/cheers] Ben is very happy. [laughter]  
25 Alright, on a more somber note, our last Stated

2 Meeting had the distinction of being overlapped by  
3 (coughs) by a tragic and horrifying attack of terror  
4 just blocks away. Our city lost eight visitors and  
5 residents on October 31<sup>st</sup> including Belgian citizen  
6 Ann Lori Dekatz (sp?), Argentinian friends: Herman  
7 Diego Mendoza, Diego Enrique Angelini, Alejandro  
8 Damian Fanutro, Ariel Erlij, Herman Ferruchi, New  
9 York Nicholas Cleaves and New Jersey resident Darren  
10 Drake. Our thoughts are with their families and  
11 friends during this trying time. We want to thank  
12 the first responders who were on the scene within  
13 minutes, and whose quick actions saved countless  
14 additional lives—

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
16 [shushing for quiet]

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --from being  
18 senseless—senselessly taken. However, only days later  
19 our nation experienced another incident and a  
20 historic loss with the mass shooting at Sutherland  
21 Springs, Texas, the deadliest mass shooting by an  
22 individual ever to take place in the state with 26  
23 lives lost, and we just, I think, had another one  
24 recently. It's just never ending, and we just cannot  
25 get action from this Congress, and it is just

2 deplorable and just unacceptable. So, I want to ask  
3 everyone to join me and rise in moment of silence to  
4 honor all these individuals here and across the  
5 country who were unfortunately touched by all of  
6 these tragic events.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All rise.

8 [moment of silence observed by the full  
9 Council]

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, my  
11 colleagues. Jumping into our docket today, the  
12 Council would begin by voting on rezoning of 3  
13 Livonia Place in the Bronxville neighborhood of  
14 Brooklyn to allow for the development of a non-profit  
15 support housing facility. Next, the Council will  
16 vote on Introduction 1722-A, which I sponsored, which  
17 would amend the Administrative Code of City of New  
18 York in relation to providing notice to Class 2  
19 property owners about registration of rent stabilized  
20 units and housing affordability programs. Anything  
21 we can do to improve the quality and availability of  
22 affordable housing options in this city is a move in  
23 the right direction. So, I want to thank my  
24 colleagues for their support on this item and look  
25 forward to its vote.



2 Moving on, the Council will vote on  
3 Intros 1528-A and 1707-A both sponsored by Technology  
4 Committee Chair Jimmy Vacca, which would update the  
5 Open Data Law and extend the time DOITT and the  
6 Mayor's Office on Data Analytics have to submit their  
7 Annual Compliance Plan. I want to thank on staff  
8 Malika Jubali, Patrick Mulvihill and Sebastian Bacchi  
9 (sp?) As we move closer to our goal of cutting  
10 greenhouse gas emissions in New York City 80% by  
11 2050, the Council will be voting-

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
13 [shushing for quiet]

14 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
15 down, please.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --on Introduction  
17 1637-A sponsored by Council Member Corey Johnson,  
18 which would create a long-term energy plan in 2019,  
19 and every four years thereafter and establish a City  
20 Energy Policy Advisory Subcommittee of the city's  
21 Sustainability Advisory Board. I want to thank  
22 Samara Swanston, Nadia-Nadia Johnson, John Seltzer  
23 and Jim Wilcox,

24 Having received multiple reports in  
25 recent years of residents affected by waterborne

2 illnesses from contaminated tanks, the Council will  
3 be voting on Intro 657-A sponsored by Council Member  
4 Dan Garodnick, which would codify in the  
5 Administrative Code the submission requirement that  
6 currently exists in the Health Code and require the  
7 Department of Health and Mental Hygiene to post  
8 documentation of annual inspections on its website,  
9 and the city's open data portal. The Department of  
10 Health and Mental Hygiene would also be required to  
11 provide guidance on its site to assist users in  
12 determining whether a building is required to have a  
13 water tank inspection and to post information on how  
14 to submit a complaint about a water tank or water  
15 from a water tank to the department. I want to thank  
16 Zima Ohalu (sp?) David Seitzer, Crystal Pond, Terzah  
17 Nasser, and Andrea Vasquez.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
19 [shushing for quiet]

20 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down, will you  
21 please.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And looking to  
23 build upon the initial goals of the Vision Zero  
24 program, the Council will be voting on three items to  
25 enhance traffic safety around our city. Intro 1116-A

2 sponsored by Majority Leader Jimmy Van Bramer would  
3 codify the Vision Zero View Portal in the  
4 Administrative Code, and require the Commissioner of  
5 Transportation to publish a map showing the  
6 approximate locations of motor vehicle related  
7 injuries and fatalities in the city in a manner that  
8 allows users to disaggregate crash data by year,  
9 month and time of day of occurrence. Additionally,  
10 this bill would require the Commissioner to publish  
11 summaries of recent design improvements that the  
12 Department of Transportation has made to city streets  
13 for the purpose of enhancing motorists, passengers,  
14 cyclists or pedestrian safety.

15 Intro 1257-A also sponsored by Majority  
16 Leader Van Bramer would require the Department of  
17 Transportation to develop strategies for enhancing  
18 pedestrian and traffic safety near schools (coughs)  
19 in the city and to provide report on a bi-annual  
20 basis describing such strategies including  
21 information on whether the safety strategies have  
22 been implemented and their implementation status, and  
23 finally, Intro 1463-A sponsored by Transportation  
24 Committee Chair Ydanis Rodriguez--

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
3 [shushing for quiet]

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Could we please  
6 keep it down? The Speaker is in the middle of the  
7 calendar. Thank you.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --which would  
9 require the city to establish an alert system to  
10 notify the public and media of hit and run incidents  
11 resulting in serious injury or fatality in order to  
12 assist in the identification of drivers responsible  
13 for these incidents. I want to thank Sylvester  
14 Yavana, Kelly Taylor, Malak Nasser Nassereddine, and  
15 Jonathan Masserano, Emily Rooney, Terzah Nasser and  
16 Andrea Vasquez. Continuing our work to open our-to  
17 open Democratic participation to all eligible  
18 residents, the Council will vote on Intro 508-A,  
19 sponsored by Governmental Ops Chair Ben Kallos, which  
20 would require the Campaign Finance Board to create a  
21 website and mobile application that allows  
22 individuals to complete voter registration forms  
23 online. I want to thank Brad Reed, Elizabeth Cronk,  
24 Zachary Harris, and Rachel Cordero.

2 In an intimate relationship, both  
3 partners should feel safe in the knowledge that  
4 sexual photos or vides they may have shared with each  
5 other will never be made public without their  
6 consent. Unfortunately, as the technology to easily  
7 share photographs and videos expands, we are hearing  
8 more and more stories of people maliciously  
9 distributing intimate photos or videos as a means of  
10 punishing a current of former partner. This is  
11 commonly referred to as revenge porn, and  
12 unfortunately, it is entire legal under state and  
13 federal law. Here in New York City we are proud to  
14 be taking a stand on this widespread and abhorrent  
15 practice. Intro 1267-A, sponsored by Council Member  
16 Rory Lancman would prohibit that the non-consensual  
17 distribution of sexually explicit videos or images,  
18 commonly know, as revenge porn of another person with  
19 the intent to cause harm to the individual depicted  
20 in such videos or images. The bill would also  
21 prohibit any legitimate threats to do so, and create  
22 both a criminal penalty and a civil cause of action.  
23 I want to thank Beth Golub, Deepa Ambekar, David  
24 Seitzer, Brian Crowe, and Robert Calandra.

2 City employees and contractors interact  
3 with millions of residents each year from providing  
4 services and benefits to processing professional  
5 licenses. New Yorkers give their information to the  
6 city with the expectation that it will be kept  
7 confidential and only used for their benefit. While  
8 the vast amount of information the city uses can help  
9 in providing better and more efficient services, it  
10 can also create serious potential from its use  
11 including improper disclosures and needless  
12 collection or retention. First announced during my  
13 2017 State of the City Address, the following  
14 legislative will go far in placing safeguards on the  
15 information collected and disclosed by city agencies.

16 Intro 1557-A, which I sponsored would  
17 require every city agency to report on their data  
18 collection, retention and disclosure policies and  
19 current practices. It would also establish a chief  
20 privacy officer and interagency committee charged  
21 with the review of those reports, and developing new  
22 and detailed protocols for protecting identifying  
23 information.

24 And Introduction 1588-A sponsored by  
25 myself and Council Member Jumaane Williams, which

2 would require city employees and contractors to  
3 protect all identifying information including contact  
4 information, sexual orientation, religion, and  
5 immigration status by limiting its collection,  
6 disclosure and retention except where required by  
7 law. Requests for the collection or disclosure of  
8 identifying information will be processed by a newly  
9 established privacy officer within each agency who  
10 would analyze whether the collection or disclosure  
11 would further the purpose or mission of the agency.

12 Related to our mission to protect New  
13 Yorkers as they seek city services, the Council will  
14 be voting Introduction 1579-A sponsored by myself and  
15 Carlos Menchaca, which would restrict access to non-  
16 public areas of city property as well as locations  
17 where human services contractors provide services-

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
19 down, please.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --unless the  
21 purpose of the access meets certain criteria. Taken  
22 together, these three bills represent an excellent  
23 opportunity to further ensure the safety and  
24 protection of our residents and their information.  
25 So, I want to thank my fellow council members for

2 their collaboration on these items. I want to—we'll  
3 hear from them in a minute. I want to thank Indiana  
4 Porta and Jim Lee. That's completes the highlights  
5 of our docket. I do want to take a moment and again  
6 thank all of those council members that did take time  
7 go to Puerto Rico Delegation and provide suppliers  
8 and water filters and we made deep lasting contacts  
9 with organizations doing incredible work that we're  
10 hoping that we will continue to build on that  
11 partnership moving forward. So, again that really  
12 means a lot to me and—and to the island as well that  
13 continued partnership. So, I appreciate that. I  
14 want to wish everyone a happy Thanksgiving holiday.  
15 Look forward to proceeding with today's votes, and  
16 with that, end Communication from the Speaker.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
18 Discussion of General Orders beginning with Council  
19 Member Rodriguez.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.  
21 Thank you, Speaker and my colleagues for all your  
22 support that you are giving to me today as we are  
23 voting the hit and run alert. Today, we'll be voting  
24 on Intros 1463 the Jim Poguerro (sp?) which will  
25 require the city to create an alert system similar to



2 the Amber Alert to notify the public of hit and run  
3 crashes. With this, we're going to following Los  
4 Angeles, San Francisco and now Philadelphia who is  
5 also trying to install similar hit and run alerts.  
6 During the Fiscal Year 2016, a total of 44,865 hit  
7 and runs were reported and only 510 arrests were  
8 made. This year hasn't been the exception. From  
9 January 10—from January to September 2017, 42 hit and  
10 runs resulting in critical injury were reported.  
11 From the data provided through the end of September,  
12 only 18 hit and run arrests have been made. Using  
13 technology already available to us to make New  
14 Yorkers aware of hit and run crashes that results and  
15 severe physical harm or death will make all New  
16 Yorkers and visitors a resource for the NYPD in  
17 finding the suspect. Hit and run is an epidemic that  
18 we can eradicate. Today, we are also voting on two  
19 more bills that I have the opportunity to be co-prime  
20 with my great friend, Majority Leader Van Bramer,  
21 which aims to strengthen Vision Zero goals. I thank  
22 my staff Jose Lewis, Stephanie Milliano, and Jennifer  
23 Martinez and the Transportation Committee staff  
24 Malak, Jonathan and Emily. With that, [Speaking  
25 Spanish]

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
3 Council Member Johnson.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam  
5 Public Advocate. This week over 15,000 scientists  
6 from 184 countries joined together to issue an urgent  
7 warning to humanity about climate change. This  
8 notice was issued on the 25<sup>th</sup> Anniversary of the 1992  
9 World Scientists Warning to Humanity, which called on  
10 human kind to take urgent action before it is too  
11 late. As a coastal city, New York City is the cross-  
12 hairs of this crisis, and it is incumbent upon us to  
13 lead. Mayor de Blasio and I have—

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
15 [shushing for quiet]

16 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
17 down, folks, keep it down, please.

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS 2: Keep it down please.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We apologize  
20 Council Member. May we have quiet in the Chambers,  
21 please.

22 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down. May we  
23 have quiet, please.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Mayor de Blasio  
3 and our Environmental Protection Committee Chair  
4 Costa Constantinides have been leading the way in  
5 setting renewable energy goals for our city. We can  
6 compliment these existing efforts by bringing  
7 together a wide range of key public and private  
8 stakeholders on a new City Energy Policy Task Force.  
9 My bill would bring together a task force that would  
10 work with our city agencies to create a long-term  
11 energy plan for achieving the clean energy goals set  
12 by de Blasio Administration. This plan, which would  
13 be updated every four years would include a review of  
14 the current energy supply, a summary of current  
15 citywide energy demand, and a projection of future  
16 citywide energy demand over the next four years. The  
17 plan would also include an estimate of renewable  
18 energy sources integrated into the energy supply, an  
19 accounting of energy efficiency measures that have  
20 been deployed in the city and specific  
21 recommendations of renewable energy sources and  
22 energy efficiency measures that could feasibly be  
23 developed or integrated by the city.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
25 [shushing for quiet]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: These steps are  
3 necessary for the future of New York. I'd like to  
4 thank Speaker Mark-Viverito and Environmental  
5 Protection Chair Constantinides for their leadership  
6 on this bill. My colleagues have lent their support  
7 to this legislation, and all those working everyday  
8 both in the public and private sectors to make our  
9 city cleaner, more efficient and more sustainable for  
10 generations of New Yorkers to come. I ask my  
11 colleagues to please vote in favor of this piece of  
12 legislation. Thank you.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member  
14 Van Bramer.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you  
16 very much, Madam Speaker. Four years ago right  
17 around time an 8-year-old boy name Noshat Nahian  
18 (sp?) was run over by a truck crossing the Street to  
19 get to school at PS-152 in Woodside. His 11-year-old  
20 sister was holding his hand at the time. We vowed  
21 then to make sure that our schools were safe places,  
22 and today Intro 1257, the Safe Routes to School Act  
23 will be passed. This is incredibly important and  
24 will require the DOT to identify 50 schools that are  
25 the most dangerous where there is the most-highest

2 propensity for crashes, injuries and even fatalities,  
3 and that you come up with a plan to make those routes  
4 to school safer. It is absolutely essential that we  
5 save the lives of children, that we don't have any  
6 more tragedies like that of Noshat Nahian. I was  
7 there with his mother at the vigil a few days after  
8 he was killed, and I never want to see another mother  
9 in the pain that Noshat Nahian's mother was in after  
10 he was killed on Northern Boulevard in Woodside. I'm  
11 also proud that we're passing Intro 1116, which will  
12 codify and strengthen the Vision Zero Portal, making  
13 sure that New Yorkers can see where crashes are  
14 happening in their neighborhood, when they're  
15 happening, what are the most dangerous intersections.  
16 Transparency is key to making our streets safer as  
17 well. So, I want to thank the Speaker and the  
18 Transportation Chair for working with us on these two  
19 very important Vision Zero bills. I thank my staff  
20 Matt Wallace and Andre Spejah (sp?) for working on  
21 these issues as well, and may the memory of Noshat  
22 Nahian be a blessing for all of us. Thank you very  
23 much, Madan Speaker.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
25 Council Member Menchaca.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you,  
3 (coughs) Madam Public Advocate, and I'm rising to  
4 talk about Intro 1579-A. Our communities are  
5 stronger when all residents feel safe and secure  
6 while seeking assistance. Intro 1579-A will benefit  
7 all New Yorkers no matter their race, their religion,  
8 their gender identity, nationality or immigrant  
9 status.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
11 [shushing for quiet]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Protecting non-  
13 public areas of city property—on city property will  
14 create a greater incentive for every New Yorkers to  
15 access basic benefits to report crimes in their  
16 communities and to preserve their health and  
17 wellbeing. We will preserver public safety and  
18 protect New York City residents from non-local law  
19 enforcement when they are interacting with city  
20 government, and seeing New York City is a sanctuary  
21 city, and my City Council colleagues and I led by our  
22 Speaker are fully committed to protecting our  
23 residents. Recent enforcement actions targeting  
24 immigrants in sensitive locations have been  
25 aggressive and have harmed residents' confidence in

2 public institution, and therefore, harming our  
3 ability to have public safety. In our city protect  
4 our institutions, and we preserve the right—we  
5 preserve public trust in local government and law  
6 enforcement. Everything we do everyday is about  
7 building trust with communities. This bill extends  
8 that, and so, I want to say thank you to the Speaker,  
9 India Porta, and the rest of the city led staff that  
10 helped make this happen today, and I encourage all  
11 our colleagues to vote yes on that bill, and the rest  
12 of the package that you heard today.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
14 Council Member Kallos.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you. I—  
16 speaking about Introduction 1692 legislation, and  
17 I've been able to work with Land Use Chair David  
18 Greenfield on. We've been focused on privately owned  
19 public spaces—spaces. They're 538 of them in the  
20 city attached to 329 buildings. Buildings got to be  
21 taller because of these spaces, but often times they  
22 don't offer the amenities that were promised. In—  
23 earlier this year in Local Law 116 we started the  
24 process of regulating them and requiring signs, and  
25 this finishes that process by adding penalties of

2 \$4,000 for the first offense and \$10,000 for  
3 subsequent offenses so bad landlords will actually  
4 have to pay. In November we had another election and  
5 with every election, New York City hits a new low for  
6 voter turnout. Earlier this month just 21% of  
7 eligible voters cast a ballot leaving the city near  
8 the bottom of national lists for voter turnout. I  
9 think it's high time for the city of New York to join  
10 the 20<sup>th</sup> Century now that it's the 21<sup>st</sup> Century.

11 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
12 down, please.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
14 [shushing for quiet]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Joining—joining  
16 36 states and the District of Columbia in adopting  
17 online voter registration where folks could use their  
18 phones, their fingers, stylus or even a picture of  
19 their signature to register to vote. Folks would be  
20 able to use apps like Facebook, Uber, Seamless, you  
21 name it to register to vote. This is based on the  
22 work of New York State Attorney General Eric  
23 Schneiderman, who issued an opinion stating that  
24 municipalities such as ours could have online voter  
25 registration forms where things could be completed



2 online and then we could then print out the voter  
3 registration form and deliver it to the Board of  
4 Elections. I'd like to thank the Speaker for her  
5 support on this initiative as well as the Committee  
6 team, Brad Reed, our Counsel Elizabeth Cronk, our  
7 Analyst Zach Harris, our Finance Analyst and my  
8 Legislative Director Paul Westrick. Also, I just  
9 want to take my last five seconds and thank a number  
10 of the members who have been advocating [bell] with  
11 commissioners and others and the Board of Elections  
12 to try to make sure this happens. Thank you.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. That  
14 concludes Discussion of General Orders. Report of-  
15 Report of Special Committees?

16 CLERK: None.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Well, excuse me.  
18 [door bangs] I'm sorry. Council Member Garodnick,  
19 we apologize.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you.  
21 That's quite alright, and thank you for the  
22 opportunity. I'm pleased that the Council today is  
23 going to vote on Intro 657-A, a bill that will help  
24 to ensure that our drinking water is safe. Water  
25 tanks are an essential element of New York City's

2 water infrastructure, and for many residential  
3 buildings, it would really hold our drinking water,  
4 and therefore, it is critical for the public to  
5 understand their condition. Yet, for many years, it  
6 was actually impossible for a member of the public to  
7 find out whether the water tank providing water to  
8 their family was meeting basic maintenance  
9 requirements. In fact, you couldn't even get a water  
10 tank inspection if you go a subpoena to get one.  
11 That is why I passed a bill back in 2009 that gave  
12 building residents access to this vital information,  
13 proof that inspections were actually done and what  
14 the results were. Nevertheless, over time  
15 investigations by the Department of Health and the  
16 New York Times found that few buildings were actually  
17 having their water tanks inspection. Even when water  
18 tanks were being inspected, those buildings were  
19 largely not posting the required notice to tenants  
20 that the inspection results were available if the  
21 system was still broken. This law will codify a  
22 requirement for buildings to submit annual water tank  
23 inspection results to the Department of Health. It  
24 will require that the department post these results  
25 to its website, and provide guidance to site users

2 about whether a building is required to have the  
3 inspection, how to find historical inspection data,  
4 and how to file a complaint. It also required the  
5 department post this information to the city Open  
6 Data Portal, which will better allow the public to  
7 access the information. Finally, our bill would  
8 require the Department of Health to submit annual  
9 reports on water tank inspections to the Council so  
10 we can better track compliance ourselves. This bill  
11 will make it easy for anyone, anywhere at any time to  
12 check that their water source has been inspection,  
13 when it was inspected, and what the results were, and  
14 it will make it east to know how to complain if  
15 there's a problem. With this greater openness, we  
16 can together make sure that the water coming out of  
17 our taps is as clean as we expect it to be. I want  
18 to thank the Health Committee Chair Corey Johnson for  
19 moving the bill as well as to all of the staff, and I  
20 ask my colleagues to vote in support. [bell] Thank  
21 you very much.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. I  
23 apologize Speaker. Council Member Lancman.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Thank you. Intro  
25 1267 to create criminal—creates criminal and civil

2 penalties for the non-consensual distribution of  
3 sexually explicit images, commonly known as revenge  
4 porn. This is the kind of legislation that shouldn't  
5 be necessary, but is. No one should ever have to  
6 worry that intimate images might be shared without  
7 their consent, with their family, friends, employer  
8 or strangers on the Internet. Yet, more and more  
9 women and occasionally men have had their most  
10 private photos and videos shared publicly without  
11 their consent in an attempt to traumatize, humiliate  
12 or punish them. Indeed, domestic abusers are  
13 increasingly using the threat of sharing such images  
14 to coerce and manipulate victims to stay in a  
15 dangerous relationship, to accede custody of shared  
16 children or as yet another means to shame and  
17 terrorize their partners. As domestic violence  
18 offenses have risen New York City this bill is  
19 another way to protect these victims from real and  
20 long lasting harm. This bill allows prosecutors to  
21 criminally punish those who intend to cause harm by  
22 sharing or threatening to share intimate images with  
23 up to a year in prison. Civil courts will also be  
24 able to award damages, and prevent images from being  
25 posted or order them taken down and force offenders

2 to pay victims attorney's fees. Today's vote sets the  
3 stage for New York City to become one of the largest  
4 jurisdictions in the country to criminalize revenge  
5 porn. Over the course of this process we have worked  
6 with the victims and their advocates, district  
7 attorney's offices, the NYPD, and private attorneys  
8 to be able to tell any perpetrator who thought that  
9 they can get away with this kind of conduct not in  
10 New York City. I'd like to thank Vanessa Gibson,  
11 Chair of the Committee on Public Safety as well as  
12 Brian Crowe—

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
14 [shushing for quiet]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: --and Deepa  
16 Ambekar who worked so hard on this legislation.  
17 Thank you.

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
19 down, please.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Seeing  
21 none other, Report of Special Committees.

22 CLERK: None.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of  
24 Standing Committees.

2 CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
3 Environmental Protection, Intro 1637-A, Energy Policy  
4 Subcommittee.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
6 coupled on General Orders.

7 CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
8 Finance, Intro 1673-A, Recording of Real Estate  
9 Instruments.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
11 coupled on General Orders.

12 CLERK: Intro 1722-A, Notice to Class 2  
13 Property Owners.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
15 coupled on General Orders.

16 CLERK: Preconsidered Intro 1763,  
17 Exemption for Veterans.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
19 General Orders.

20 CLERK: Preconsidered Reso 1713 through  
21 Preconsidered Reso 1715, Adjusted Base Proportion and  
22 Tax Resolution.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
24 General Orders.

2 CLERK: Preconsidered LU 813 and Reso  
3 1718, and Preconsidered LU 18-814 and Reso 1719, Tax  
4 Exemptions.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
6 General Orders.

7 CLERK: Report of the Committee on-on  
8 Governmental Operations, Intro 508-A, Voter  
9 Registration.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
11 coupled on General Orders.

12 CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
13 Health, Intro 657-A, Water tank Inspections.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
15 coupled on General Orders.

16 CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
17 Immigration, Intro 1557-A, 1579-A, 1588-A, Handling  
18 of identifying information and access to city  
19 property.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
21 coupled on General Orders.

22 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Land  
23 Use, Intro 1692-A, Technical Corrections to Local Law  
24 116.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 40

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
3 coupled on General Orders.

4 CLERK: LU 784 and Reso 1720, Special  
5 Permit.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
7 General Orders.

8 CLERK: LU 787 and LU 788, Zoning  
9 Amendments.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Approved with  
11 modifications and referred to the City Planning  
12 Commission pursuant to Rule 11.70(b) of the Rules of  
13 the Council and Section 197-d of the New York City  
14 Charter.

15 CLERK: Excuse me. LU 789 and Reso 1721,  
16 Sidewalk Café.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
18 General Orders.

19 CLERK: LU 791 and Reso 1722, Property  
20 Acquisition.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
22 General Orders.

23 CLERK: LU 792 and Reso 1723 through LU  
24 795 and Reso 1726, various applications Council  
25 District 41.



1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 41

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on

3 General Orders.

4 CLERK: Preconsidered LU 815 and Reso

5 1727, Landmark Designation.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

7 [shushing for quiet]

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on

9 General Orders.

10 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Public

11 Safety-

12 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet,

13 please. Keep it down.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

15 [shushing for quiet]

16 CLERK: Intro 1267-A Prohibiting

17 Disclosures of Intimate Images.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and

19 coupled on General Orders.

20 CLERK: Report of the Committee on

21 Technology, Intro 1528-A, Public Data Sets.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and

23 coupled on General Orders.

24 CLERK: Intro 1707-A, Amending Open Data

25 Standards.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

42

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
3 coupled on General Orders.

4 CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
5 Transportation, Intro 1116-A, Mapping Motor Vehicle  
6 Related Injuries.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
8 coupled on General Orders.

9 CLERK: Intro 1257-A, School Safety  
10 Report.

11 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet.  
12 Please quiet down.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
14 coupled on General Orders.

15 CLERK: Intro 1463-A, Public Notification  
16 of Hit and Run Incidents.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
18 coupled on General Orders.

19 CLERK: On the General Order Calendar,  
20 Resolution Appointing Various Persons Commissioner of  
21 Deeds.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: General Order—I'm  
23 sorry, Commissioner of Deeds. Coupled on General  
24 Orders. I ask for a roll call vote. I'm asking for a  
25 roll call vote on all General Order items.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Can we begin with  
3 Council Member Cohen. [shushing for quiet]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you, Madam  
5 Public Advocate. I vote aye on all items on General  
6 Orders.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

8 CLERK: Borelli.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all  
10 except Preconsidered Reso 1713, 1714, 1715, and  
11 Intros 1557, 1579 and 1588. Thank you. [background  
12 comment]

13 CLERK: Cabrera.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye on all.

15 CLERK: Chin.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Permission to  
17 explain my vote.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Well, first I  
20 wanted to congratulate all my colleagues on passing  
21 important legislation, and on a personal note I  
22 wanted to thank all my colleagues for your support,  
23 help, and warm wishes in my re-election campaign.  
24 Thank you. I vote aye on all.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 [background comments]

4 CLERK: Constantinides.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Madam  
6 Public Advocate, may I be allowed to explain my vote?

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I just  
9 want to congratulate all my colleagues on the passage  
10 of their bills today. In particular, I want to  
11 single out Council Member Johnson for Intro 1637-A  
12 relating to an Energy Policy Advisory Subcommittee.  
13 As we look to reduce our emissions 80% by 2050, we  
14 need to identify renewable energy sources and how  
15 they'll work in New York City. And then secondly, I  
16 want to congratulate Council Member Kallos on online  
17 voter registration, an issue that he and I have  
18 worked on together for over 10 years as young  
19 attorneys, and now being in the Council I'm proud to  
20 vote aye today. So, aye on all.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

22 [background comments]

23 CLERK: Cornegy.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Cornegy.

25 [background comments]

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 45

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Uh-[laughter] I

3 vote aye.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, you do.

5 [laughs]

6 CLERK: Crowley.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I vote aye on

8 all.

9 CLERK: Deutsch.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye on all.

11 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: I vote

13 aye on all.

14 CLERK: Dromm.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you. I vote

16 aye on all.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

18 CLERK: Espinal.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I vote aye on

20 all. Congratulations to my colleagues especially Ben

21 Kallos. Thank you.

22 CLERK: Eugene.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.

24 CLERK: Garodnick.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

46

2 CLERK: Gentile.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: I vote aye on all  
4 with congratulations to all.

5 CLERK: Gibson.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I vote aye on  
7 all, and with my warmest congratulations to all of  
8 our colleagues passing legislation today, wishing all  
9 of you and your families a wonderful and blessed  
10 Thanksgiving season. May God bless you and keep you.  
11 I vote aye on all.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

13 CLERK: Greenfield.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I say amen to  
15 Council Member Gibson, and I vote aye on all the Land  
16 Use Call-Ups and all items on the General Order  
17 Calendar, and happy holidays as well.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: You have to say  
19 it with some soul.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: [laughter]  
21 Maybe Jumaane can join me if we do a little rendition  
22 of happy holidays. [laughter] Come on, Jumaane.  
23 Ever since he became a Speaker candidate, just hasn't  
24 had the same foil. (sic) [laughter] f

25

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Continue with the  
3 vote. [laughs]

4 CLERK: Grodenchik.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: If it's an  
6 assemblyman, he's not necessarily going to. If  
7 Council Member Greenfield keeps it up, I'm going to  
8 start singing and then no one will be happy. I just  
9 want to congratulate all my colleagues on the bills--

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
11 [shushing for quiet]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: --that  
13 they're passing today, and I'm especially excited  
14 about making voter registration easier in the city of  
15 New York. I want to ditto to my colleague Ms.  
16 Gibson, and wish everybody a very, very happy and  
17 joyful and meaningful Thanksgiving, and remember  
18 still that there are many people in this city that do  
19 not have enough to eat on Thanksgiving or any day of  
20 the week. With that, I vote aye on all.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amen.

22 CLERK: Johnson

23 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.

24 CLERK: Kallos.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you for all  
3 the well wishes and partnerships through the years.  
4 I vote aye on all.

5 CLERK: King.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Congratulations to  
7 every one today. Wishing everyone well, and I vote  
8 aye on all.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

10 CLERK: Koo.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Happy holidays and  
12 happy Thanksgiving. I vote aye on all.

13 CLERK: Koslowitz:

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I vote aye and  
15 wish everybody a happy Thanksgiving.

16 CLERK: Lancman.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: [off mic] Aye.

18 CLERK: Lander.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I'm also very  
20 enthusiastic about online voter registration. So,  
21 congratulations, Ben. I want to say thank you to the  
22 Speaker for the very powerful trip that we had in  
23 Puerto Rico and the real extraordinary set of  
24 organizations we saw on the ground. The devastation  
25 is heartbreaking, but the resilience is even more



2 inspiring. So, thank you for organizing the trip. I  
3 vote aye on all.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 CLERK: Levin.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye on all.

7 CLERK: Levine.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye on all.

9 CLERK: Maisel.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

11 CLERK: Mealy.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: May I explain my  
13 vote?

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes. [shushing  
15 for quiet]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Today, we are  
17 approving an affordable and supportive housing  
18 development at 3 Livonia. This project will bring  
19 125 units of affordable and supportive housing all  
20 below 60% AMI. When this project first was planned,  
21 it was 100% supportive housing and 100% studios. I  
22 fought a hard—I fought hard to make this development  
23 more inclusive and diverse by incorporating  
24 affordable housing and larger units for families.  
25 This project will be approved with units of 2, 3-

2 bedroom apartments for families, supportive and  
3 affordable. Overall, this—less than half of this  
4 project's units will be studios now. I also fought  
5 for commercial space, and community recreation and  
6 culture funding from other developments in the  
7 community as part of this project. Breaking Ground  
8 also has agreed to pursue a credit union and a ground  
9 floor tenant, and the administration has agreed to  
10 provide funding to support the operation of a boxing  
11 gym and reinvest in the Brownsville Recreation Dance  
12 Studio. This project will now bring affordable and  
13 supportive housing and essential community services  
14 to this property on Livonia Avenue that has been  
15 vacant for decades. I want to thank Uma from the  
16 Mayor's Office. I want to thank my colleague, co-  
17 leader Mark Treyger, Council Member Annabel Palma,  
18 Steve Cohen and the Chairs Rafael Salamanca and David  
19 Greenfield and in particular for their support. I  
20 want to thank Raju and Ami Levitan and Ben Kallos for  
21 their support. With all of these improvements that  
22 have been made to this proposal I am now in favor and  
23 urge my colleagues—colleagues to do so also. And one  
24 thing that I do want to say it's a slippery slope  
25 when we go against one another. So, I just thank all

2 my colleagues for being patient and supportive  
3 because we should be a family.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: How do you vote?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I vote aye.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Congratulations.

7 CLERK: Menchaca.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to  
9 explain my vote.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you. I  
12 want to thank and congratulate Council Member Mealy  
13 on her victory and land use—her land use victory  
14 today, and all my—my colleagues who proposed amazing  
15 legislation today, and especially the three, 1537,  
16 1579, and 1588 package that's going to help all New  
17 Yorkers. I also want to thank the Speaker for  
18 leading the contingency, the—the—the group of Council  
19 members that went out and saw first hand the  
20 devastation in Puerto Rico. The work that we did  
21 there was—was—was small, but it had a big impact not  
22 just on the people that we saw everyday, the  
23 testimonies that we heard everyday, but in our  
24 hearts. And I hope that those memories will stay  
25 with us as we continue to fight for Puerto Rico, the

2 U.S. Virgin Islands and everyone impacted by natural  
3 disasters. We are recovering still today from Sandy.  
4 This body continues to lead that effort here in our  
5 own back yard.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
7 [shushing for quiet]

8 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
9 down, please. Keep it down.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: But I will say  
11 that I hope this Council continues. The Speaker is  
12 proud of her heritage where she was born in Puerto  
13 Rico, and that is not by accident. It is who she is  
14 that is the power of the voice that we have here, and  
15 I hope that we can continue and we will continue to  
16 fight for Puerto Rico. I also want to thank the  
17 Mayor and his team. We got to see first hand the  
18 Office of Emergency Management in the Parks  
19 Department who have been there since right after the  
20 storm. Team 7 just got transitioned in, and will be  
21 there for the next two weeks, and I hope that we  
22 continue to make it a priority for New Yorkers who  
23 have so many families that are living here to lift up  
24 the voices of Puerto Rico as they continue to in this

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 53

2 humanitarian crisis, recover and—and respond. Thank  
3 you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 CLERK: Mendez.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote aye.

7 CLERK: Miller.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: (coughs) Miller.

9 [pause]

10 CLERK: Council Member Miller.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member--

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I'm right here

13 (sic)

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes. What is—you

15 vote aye?

16 CLERK: Palma.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: [off mic] Aye.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

19 CLERK: Perkins.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye on all.

21 CLERK: Reynoso.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Congratulations

23 to Council Member Darlene Mealy and her district, and

24 I vote aye on all.

25 CLERK: Richards.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye on all.

3 CLERK: Rodriguez.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Rodriguez.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, I would  
6 like to ask permission to vote on all General Orders.

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
8 down, please.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ? Aye.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

12 CLERK: Rose.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Permission to  
14 explain my vote.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Congratulations to  
17 Council Member Mealy and to Council Member Lancman on  
18 Intro 1267. I believe that this legislation is  
19 protecting the privacy of residents of New York City  
20 from what I-I perceive as a hate crime. I'm going to  
21 vote no on Preconsidered Resolutions 1713, 1714, and  
22 1715, and aye on all others--on the others.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

24 CLERK: Rosenthal.

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Permission to  
3 explain my vote.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you. I  
6 vote aye on all and I want to congratulate all my  
7 colleagues on some really astounding legislation this  
8 time around, Council Member Lancman and Council  
9 Member Kallos in particular. I also want to thank  
10 the Council and Council Member Ferreras-Copeland and  
11 also the General—the Counsel to the Finance  
12 Committee, Eric Bernstein and my Legislative Director  
13 Sean Fitzpatrick for shepherding through my bill that  
14 will protect homeowners from having the deed to their  
15 property stolen from out under them. And lastly, I  
16 want to echo gratitude to our Speaker Melissa Mark-  
17 Viverito, who offered to all Council Members to join  
18 her on a relief mission to Puerto Rico to see towns  
19 that—that are—are—have been decimated by the  
20 hurricane, and who—towns that are really being  
21 abandoned their government. And so, we saw the  
22 resiliency of the Puerto Rican people who are working  
23 together to organize community kitchens, working  
24 together to allow for the distribution of the water  
25 filters that we brought and the small solar panels.

2 I-I will-I'm-I've already started speaking with  
3 members or residents on the Upper West Side to help  
4 make sure that we direct them to-

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
6 [shushing for quiet]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: -donate to-

8 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet,  
9 please.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: -organizations  
11 that are truly getting help to the people of Puerto  
12 Rico, and I-I want to express again my gratitude to  
13 the Speaker for giving us the opportunity to join you  
14 on that trip. [bell]

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

16 CLERK: Torres.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I vote aye.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Thank  
19 you.

20 CLERK: Treyger.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: With  
22 congratulations to my colleagues on their bills, and  
23 also another big kudos to my [bell] co-chair of the  
24 Brooklyn Delegation, Council Member Darlene Mealy for  
25 scoring a major victory in the bottom of the ninth



2 inning for her—for her district near the—near the  
3 11<sup>th</sup> hour and near the end of her tenure in this  
4 Council. Congratulations colleague. I vote aye on  
5 all.

6 CLERK: Ulrich.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I vote aye on all  
8 with the exception of Preconsidered Reso 1713, 1714,  
9 1715, and also voting no on Intro 1557, 1579, and  
10 1588-A. Aye on all others. Thank you.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Thank  
12 you.

13 CLERK: Vacca.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Explain my vote?  
15 I'm going to vote aye on all except 1713, 1714 and  
16 1715. I vote no on those with the hopes that this  
17 will promote a discussion of the need for immediate  
18 relief for and one and two-family homeowners and co-  
19 op and condo owners in this city. I'm aware that we  
20 have lawsuits and we have task forces, and everybody  
21 says that the real estate formula for taxation is  
22 inappropriate, is terrible and is really  
23 confiscatory. Yet, nothing is done. For three years  
24 knowing that we're going to have these lawsuits and  
25 long discussions, I have asked that we reinstitute

2 the \$400 rebate for homeowners that existed  
3 previously because these homeowners have been taxed  
4 to the hilt. Small property owners and senior  
5 citizens and immigrant families taxed to the hilt.  
6 So, we are told that this Council has never raised  
7 the rate. I'm here 12 years. In 12 years the  
8 Council raised the rate once. I voted no, but the  
9 body raised it once. All the other increases were  
10 based on assessments going up. So, we say we never  
11 raised the rate. You're getting these bills and  
12 you're pay more, but it's not us. No, it's not us,  
13 but the people are still paying more. The new  
14 Council taking Office in January I hope will fight  
15 for that rebate, go to Albany and get the whole  
16 message we need and finally do something in the  
17 interim, and not use the pretense of the pending  
18 lawsuits and the pending committees that will be  
19 formed. That's much to do about nothing when it  
20 comes to short-term relief that our people are  
21 entitled to. Talking about fighting for the middle-  
22 class, well, talk is over, and I do think now that  
23 what we've tried to do here for three to four years  
24 has finally got to be done until we have a long-term  
25 solution. Thank you.

2 CLERK: Vallone.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: May everyone  
4 have a blessed and happy Thanksgiving and aye on all.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you.

7 CLERK: Williams.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I be  
9 excused to explain my vote?

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: First, just  
12 congratulations to all my colleagues, but  
13 particularly to Council Member Mealy on the victory  
14 she scored and to Council Member Kallos on an awesome  
15 bill, and also Council Member Lancman on an awesome  
16 bill, which I was shocked to understand wasn't even  
17 legal. It wasn't—it wasn't illegal up until now.  
18 So, congratulations to them. On the package of the  
19 bills that I'm a part of I want to thank Council—  
20 Council Member Menchaca and the Speaker for their  
21 help and leadership, and also for Menchaca for  
22 painting this rightly as a public safety package.  
23 When residents and people who live in a community  
24 can't trust their government and the agencies, we are  
25 all in danger. We're in a time period now where that

2 fare is pervasive across this country. So, the bill I  
3 have will ensure that collections, closing, and  
4 retentions all identifying information would not be  
5 allowed unless it furthers the mission of an agency  
6 or it's required by law and creates the position of a  
7 privacy officer to analyze whether the collection or  
8 disclosure meets the new standards set forth in the  
9 law. In other words, if we don't need it, we won't  
10 ask for it particularly when it comes to information  
11 like address, race, religion, employer and other  
12 things that many people are now fearful of. Once  
13 again, New York City is leading the way. This  
14 country is now fearful, and my hope is as we often  
15 do, lead the way. People see us and they follow.  
16 Hopefully, they'll do that here. So, again, thanks  
17 to everyone including Kelly Taylor and my Legislative  
18 Director Mike Toomey, and I want to make sure I say  
19 happy birthday to Megan Chin from the Housing  
20 Committee whose birthday was yesterday and Kevin  
21 Fagan, my Communication Director whose birthday is  
22 today. Thank you.

23 CLERK: Matteo.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: I certainly want  
25 to echo the comments of my good friend and colleague

2 Jimmy Vacca about property tax relief and—and I  
3 assure that's in my delegation and the new counsel  
4 will—will continue the—the fight and advocate for  
5 property relief and property tax rebates. So with  
6 that, I'm voting no on 713–1713, 1714, and 1715. Also  
7 on Intros 1557-A, 1579 and 1588 I'll be voting no,  
8 and aye on the rest.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

10 CLERK: Van Bramer.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on all.

12 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I vote aye on  
14 all. I also just want to take a moment. I don't  
15 know if they're still here. I know we were joined  
16 earlier or they're still, by Alicka Samuel and Keith  
17 Powers. They were here for the member training  
18 earlier this week, and I think it's Keith Powers'  
19 birthday as well. So, welcome to the Chambers, and  
20 they'll be the newest Council Members as of January.  
21 So, thank you for being here with us, and I vote aye  
22 on all. [pause] [background comment]

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Okay. All items  
24 on today's General Order Calendar were adopted by a  
25 vote of 47 in the affirmative, 0 negative and 0

2 abstentions with the exception of Resolution 1713,  
3 which was adopted by a vote of 42 in the affirmative,  
4 5 negative and 0 abstentions; and Resolution 1714,  
5 which was adopted by vote 42 in the affirmative, 5  
6 negative and 0 abstentions; and Resolution 1715,  
7 which was adopted by a vote of 42 in the affirmative,  
8 5 negative and 0 abstentions; and Intro 1557-A, which  
9 was adopted by a vote of 44 in the affirmative, 3  
10 negative and 0 abstentions; and Intro 1579-A--  
11 [background comment] Quiet in the Chambers, please.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing]  
13 We're almost done.

14 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet,  
15 please.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We're still in  
17 session. Intro 1579-A, which was adopted by a vote  
18 of 44 in the affirmative, 3 negative and 0  
19 abstentions; and Intro 1558-A, which was adopted by  
20 40-by a vote of 44 in the affirmative, 3 negative and  
21 0 abstentions. Introduction and Reading of Bills.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All items are  
23 referred to the Committee, as indicated on their  
24 agenda.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We have one  
3 change in the vote. Council Member Miller.

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
5 down, please.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: One correction.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I vote no on Reso  
8 1713, 14 and 15. Is that correct? [pause]

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Welcome to the  
10 City Council. Hello. [pause, background comments]  
11 Okay, an amended tally. All items on today's General  
12 Order Calendar were adopted by a vote of 47 in the  
13 affirmative, 0 in negative and 0 abstentions with the  
14 exception of Resolution 1713, which was adopted by a  
15 vote of 41 in the affirmative, 6 negative and 0  
16 abstentions, and Reso 1714, which was adopted by a  
17 vote of 41 in the affirmative, 6 negative and 0  
18 abstentions and Reso 1715, which was adopted by a  
19 vote of 41 in the affirmative, 6 negative and 0  
20 abstentions.

21 Now, discussion of Resolution. The  
22 Resolution reads as follows: A Resolution calling  
23 upon the New York State Legislature to pass and the  
24 Governor to sign legislation to require all real  
25 property conveyances to be memorialized by a deed

2 recorded in the Office of the Clerk of the County  
3 where such real property is situated. Anyone will-  
4 wishing to speak on the resolution? Council Member  
5 Vallone.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Madam Advocate,  
7 just real quickly I want to thank you for the  
8 resolution going to day. We sponsored this. It's-  
9 it's one of those critical situations where many of  
10 our seniors and homeowners are unaware that fraud is  
11 being perpetuated upon their home. [background  
12 comments]

13 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down, please.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
15 [shushing for quiet]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Having this  
17 requirement showing Albany that we stand united to  
18 make sure that there is a notice requirement to  
19 protect our deeds that are on file, and that  
20 predators stop using the tactics that they do against  
21 our seniors and all other homeowners would be a great  
22 step. So, I urge everyone to vote aye on this.  
23 Thank you, Madam Advocate.

24

25



2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,  
3 Council Member. Any other members? All those in  
4 favor of this resolution say aye

5 COUNCIL MEMBERS: [in unison] Aye.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All of those  
7 opposed? Any abstentions. They ayes have it, and  
8 now general discussion beginning with Council Member  
9 King.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Thank you, Madam  
11 Public Advocate. I just wanted to take a moment just  
12 offer a brief message of thanks, as we embark on this  
13 holy holiday seasons. As you all recently know, I  
14 recently lost my dad, and I want to thank you all  
15 again for your kind words and your support to my  
16 family during this transition and, of course, you  
17 know, the loss of my dad for so many things in life  
18 and to another perspective. As we gather today, some  
19 of us will be leaving soon and we will--

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
21 [shushing for quiet]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: --some new friends  
23 in this building--

24 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
25 down, please.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: --who will be  
3 joining the Council shortly, and I want to  
4 congratulate them and thank them for their commitment  
5 to serving our communities. With the election behind  
6 us I want us all to give thanks for the opportunity  
7 to serve, and to make our constituents who we serve,  
8 those who will need us—who need us the most, our  
9 seniors without heat, our parents worrying about lead  
10 paint in their apartments, those young people aging  
11 out of foster care trying to find their place in the  
12 world. I thank you, my colleagues for your service,  
13 and I ask that we all try to keep that spirit of  
14 service in our mind, the calling that we have to do  
15 the right thing by those who put us in office, and  
16 finally be thankful to our parents, our families, our  
17 staffs, our friends and to all who will participate  
18 in helping us do this work we do each and every day.  
19 So, with that, I am grateful, thankful, and I wish  
20 everyone a happy holiday. God bless.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
22 Council Member-Elect Keith Powers, happy birthday.  
23 Council Member King. No, I'm sorry. Council Member  
24 Williams. Excuse me.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you very  
3 much. Last year Republic Congress Member Mark Kirk--

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet,  
5 please. Keep it down, please.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
7 Excuse me, Council Member. We are still in session.  
8 Please keep your conversations to a minimum or take  
9 them outside. Thank you. Council Member Williams  
10 has the floor.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.  
12 Actually, I think it was Republican Senator Mark Kirk  
13 who was voted out of office for his support of gun  
14 control measures. I thought that that was removed to  
15 the Speaker by my colleague Council Member Liz  
16 Crowley. I know she left today, but I wanted to  
17 honor her for her convictions that she stood in terms  
18 of homeless shelters and in terms of closing down  
19 Rikers. It was an illumination of how hard it is for  
20 some people to do what they do, and the courage that  
21 it takes. Some of us have to have more than others.  
22 There were two other Congress members who were voted  
23 out several years ago also in the Republican Party,  
24 and the risks that they take to do the moral  
25 conviction--what their morals convict them to do, and

2 I think Council Member Crowley did that, and she  
3 should be applauded for that. And I can only imagine  
4 all of us who would take those risks. If we're in a  
5 comfort zone, we probably have to push a little  
6 further like Council Member Crowley did, and I think  
7 if we did that, this city would be a much better  
8 place. So, I just wanted to lift her name up today  
9 and applaud her courage. Thank you. [pause]  
10 [applause]

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: She is certain a  
12 profile in courage. Council Member Treyger.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you,  
14 Public Advocate. Colleagues, as many of you are  
15 aware, a teenage girl was raped by two Brooklyn South  
16 Narcotic Detectives in my district in September. The  
17 detectives tried to mount a defense by claiming it  
18 was consensual. They have since resigned, but we  
19 need strong laws in place to make sure this never  
20 happens again. My consent legislation will make it  
21 clear that anyone in the custody of a law enforcement  
22 official is incapable of giving genuine consent to  
23 sexual contact. I commend Kings County District  
24 Attorney Eric Gonzalez for moving swiftly to bring  
25 charges against these detectives, but the victim in

2 this case is a teenager who will now be forced to  
3 relive the trauma of this crime in the public eye.  
4 If my bill was already law, the District Attorney  
5 wouldn't have to prove this was a rape case. There  
6 would be no consent defense. In addition to my bill,  
7 I'm also introducing a resolution that calls on state  
8 lawmakers to amend the State Penal Code to end the  
9 loophole that allowed the detectives to claim that  
10 the rape was consensual. There can be no meaningful  
11 consent when you're in the custody of a law  
12 enforcement officer. State law wisely recognizes  
13 that inmates can't give consent to corrections  
14 officers and parolees can't give consent to parole  
15 officers. All law enforcement officials must be held  
16 to the same standards. I want to thank all the  
17 advocates, and the Public Advocate who have already  
18 shown so much support, my colleagues who have shown  
19 support. I'd like to give again a big thanks to  
20 Public Advocate Tish James who joined me yesterday to  
21 show her strong support on this issue. This is just  
22 the very beginning of many more necessary  
23 conversations we must have regarding the nature of  
24 sexual consent and power dynamics. We must make sure

2 our laws are in line with common sense and moral  
3 decency. Thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,  
5 Council Member, and lastly Council Member Miller.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Madam  
7 Public Advocate. (coughs) Today, I call on my  
8 colleagues in the Council to adopt-

9 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Please  
10 keep it down, please.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: --Resolution 1716  
12 calling on the UN Security Council to urge the  
13 (coughs) to urge the government of Myanmar to  
14 immediately cease the hostiles--the hostile acts  
15 against Rohingya Muslims and permit the safe return  
16 of these refugees. Since August, Myanmar security  
17 forces have engaged in what the U.N. Human Rights  
18 commission has described as textbook ethnic cleansing  
19 to the Rohingya state Muslim population including  
20 acts such as burning villages, mass executions  
21 between 5 and 10,000 infants and families, and as  
22 reported yesterday Human Rights watched the  
23 systematic sexual assault and rape of women and girls  
24 estimated in the hundreds. [background comment] To  
25 date, the UN Security Council--

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
3 [shushing for quiet]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: --has yet to  
5 achieve consensus.

6 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down, please.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: To date, the UN  
8 Security Council has yet to achieve consensus taking  
9 forceful actions to condemn--condemn these atrocities.  
10 Despite the fact that there is a "mounting evidence"  
11 to suggest that these facts are present and genocide  
12 certainly exists the population according to the U.S.  
13 Holocaust Memorial Museum and the Southeast Asian  
14 Human Right Advocacy groups. The international  
15 communities' failure to act upon this has led to  
16 rapidly worsening humanitarian crisis that has  
17 compelled more than a half a million Rohingyans to  
18 see refuge in nearby Bangladesh. The situation in  
19 Myanmar is dire, and it is imperative this body as a  
20 matter of principle take unequivocal stands against  
21 these horrors. I want to thank the Speaker for her  
22 support of this resolution, and joining me on this  
23 reso--on this Resolution Council Members Van Bramer,  
24 Constantinides, Lancman, Menchaca, Barron and Koo. I

2 urge the rest of the colleagues to sign on as well.

3 Thank you, Madam Public Advocate.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Any other  
5 speakers?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: No. Thank you.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And now to close,  
8 the Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Well, thank you  
10 again to my colleagues. Hopefully, I'll see some of  
11 you now at 3:30 with the alumni--I guess yes that are  
12 going to be meeting next door, or actually  
13 downstairs, but thank you all, and see you at the  
14 next Stated.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing] And  
17 with that, we're adjourned. [gavel]

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25



C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 28, 2017