

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFARE JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

----- X

October 11, 2017
Start: 10:14 a.m.
Recess: 1:50 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Rm.
16th Fl

B E F O R E: STEPHEN T. LEVIN
Chairperson

DANIEL DROMM
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Annabel Palma
Fernando Cabrera
Vanessa L. Gibson
Corey D. Johnson
Ritchie J. Torres
Barry S. Grodenchik
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Vincent J. Gentile
Daniel R. Grodenchik
Margaret S. Chin
Deborah L. Rose
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Inez D. Barron
Chaim M. Deutsch

Mark Levine
Alan N. Maisel
Antonio Reynoso
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Helen K. Rosenthal
Mark Treyger
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Elizabeth Rose, Deputy Chancellor
NYC Department of Education,
Division of Operations

Lois Herrera, Chief Executive Officer
Office of Safety and Youth Development
Department of Education

Joslyn Carter, Administrator
Department of Homeless Services

Katherine Polite, Executive Director
Students in Temporary Housing,
NYC Department of Education

Liza Pappas, Education Policy Analyst
New York City Independent Budget Office

Giselle Routhier, Policy Director
Coalition for the Homeless

Beth Hofmeister, Attorney
Homeless Rights Project, Legal Aid Society

Randi Levine, Policy Director
Advocates for Children of New York

Grant Cowles, Senior Policy Associate
Youth Justice
Citizens Committee for Children

Stephanie Gindel, Associate Executive Director
Policy and Advocacy
Citizens Committee for Children

[sound check, pause]

CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Good morning,
everyone. My name is Council Member Stephen Levin.
I'm chair of the Committee on General Welfare, and I
want to thank everybody for coming out this morning,
for the day's important oversight hearing entitled
DOE's Support for Homeless Students. In February,
2016, the Committees on Education and General Welfare
previously held a hearing on homeless students, and
I'd like to thank Council Member Danny Dromm, Chair
of the Education Committee for this joint hearing
once again. Today, we will explore what progress has
been made to enhance supports to homeless students
since our last hearing. We will also be considering
three pieces of legislation Intro 1497, which will be
discussed further by Chair Dromm. Intro 572 by
Council Member Liz Crowley, a Local Law to amend the
Administrative Code of New York City in relation to
requiring the Department of Homeless Services to post
daily shelter census counted by borough, a bill that
I have introduced a Local Law—Intro 1714, a Local Law
to amend the Administrative Code of the City of New
York of the City of New York in relation to
Educational Continuity Unit, which would require any

1
2 DHS intake facility for families with children to
3 have an educational continuity unit. New York City
4 has seen record levels of homelessness, and
5 unfortunately the overall number of homeless families
6 in the DHS Shelter System has continued to steadily
7 increase in recent years. For the end of calendar
8 year 2016, there were about 60,000 men, women and
9 children in the DHA Shelter System. Children under
10 the age of 18 accounted for more than a third of the
11 shelter population and more than half of the people
12 served or in shelters for families with children.
13 Today, the number of homeless individuals in shelter
14 remained about 60,000. It is important to not that
15 this number does not include families living in
16 doubled up situations, which means that the overall
17 number of homeless students to the McKinney-Vento Act
18 is significantly higher, and if you saw today's New
19 York Times recent data showing that one in ten
20 children in New York City school system over the past
21 year experienced homelessness according to the
22 McKinney Vento definition. During the 2015-2015
23 school year, nearly 100,000 homeless students
24 attended New York City public schools. This is a 49%
25 increase in six years, which includes approximately

1 33,000 school age children in shelters and 60,000
2 living doubled up without a household. Further, the
3 3,300 students from the city's public schools who
4 live in homeless shelters during the 2015-2016 school
5 year, was an increase of more than 4,000 or 15% from
6 the previous school year, and now it's up to 110,000
7 according to the report that was released yesterday.
8 Research has demonstrated that homeless students
9 experience academic, social and behavioral challenges
10 that result—that result in adverse educational and
11 life outcomes compared to their housed peers.
12

13 In April 2016, DHS released its 90-day
14 review of homeless services that resulted in 46
15 reforms including two reforms specific to homeless
16 students, which are the first, target outreach to
17 doubled up families with school age children and
18 which HRA will work with DOE to identify and
19 proactively target prevention services for students
20 with families living in doubled up situations who
21 were reported as homeless under the McKinney Vento
22 Act, and (2) eliminate the requirement for school age
23 children to be present at PATH, DHS' intake center
24 for families for multiple appointments. DHS has
25 already implemented that latter. However, school age

1
2 children are still required to be present with their
3 parents for the first appointment at PATH, which
4 means that they are still missing a day of school.
5 Today, the General Welfare Committee seeks to learn
6 about the city's progress in DHS (sic) families, and
7 how it currently serves school age children in the
8 shelter system. You know, on a personal note, you
9 now, I woke up this morning and I have an 8-month old
10 daughter, and to think of what it would be like to
11 wake up every morning in a shelter with a child, and
12 what it means for that child, and the level of stress
13 that is toxic and compounds in their brains, in their
14 nervous system is-is-is somewhat inconceivable for
15 those of us that haven't lived there. And, you know,
16 when we talk about numbers, 110,000 children, each of
17 those children is an individual, and each of those
18 children experiences that level of stress, and it-it
19 has such an impact on their lives. So, as we're
20 talking about this and thinking about, let's keep in
21 mind that everyone of those children is an individual
22 with hopes and dreams and aspirations and-and a very
23 future, and it's our obligation to make sure that-
24 that we could support that and maintain that so we
25 that so can pass it on. (sic) At this time, I'd like

1
2 to also acknowledge my colleagues who are here today.
3 We have at the end Annabel Palma from the Bronx,
4 Rafael Salamanca from the Bronx, Barry Grodenchik
5 from Queens, Brad Lander from Brooklyn, and I'm
6 seeing my co-chair Danny Dromm of the Education
7 Committee. I'd also like to thank Committee staff,
8 the General Welfare Committee Andrea Vasquez, the
9 Senior Counsel, Tonya Cyrus, Senior Policy Analyst,
10 Dohini Sompura; Unit Head Namir Nushat-Nuzmat-Nuzmat-
11 Finance Analyst and the Education Committee staff for
12 putting this hearing together. I'd also like to
13 thank my Chief of Staff, Jonathan Boucher, and our
14 Budget Director, Edward Paulino. Now, I'd like to
15 turn it over to my colleague, Danny Dromm for his
16 opening remarks.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you, Chair
18 Levin, and thank you for your empathy, and your
19 concern regarding this issue. I know that it's-it's
20 deeply-it's very, very sincere and deeply felt. Good
21 morning. I'm Council Member Danny Dromm, Chair of
22 the Committee on Education. Welcome to today's
23 hearing. I'd like to say thank you to my co-Chair,
24 Council Member Levin for his collaboration on this
25 important topic, to the sponsors of the legislation

1 we'll be discussing and to all of you here today for
2 being here. Along with legislation being heard,
3 today's hearing will examine the performance and
4 programs that are aimed at supporting homeless
5 students. We will examine DOE's compliance with the
6 McKinney-Vento Act, legislation that was implemented
7 in part to ensure that homeless students are provided
8 with a free and appropriate public education. By
9 law, state and local educational agencies are
10 responsible for examining policies that act as a
11 barrier to enrollment for homeless students. They
12 must develop and implement professional development
13 programs to educate school personnel on problems
14 faced by homeless children, and these agencies are
15 required to ensure that students are not stigmatized
16 or segregated based on the status of being homeless.
17 We will examine the coordination between the DOE and
18 DHS in addressing these needs. Homeless children face
19 enormous challenges and may serious consequences to
20 their physical, socio-emotional and academic
21 wellbeing as a direct result of the stresses of being
22 homeless. For example, these children are sick four
23 times more often and have three times the rate of
24 emotional and behavioral problems compared to housed
25

1 counterparts. Often, children are homes for more
2 than one school year, and are far more likely to
3 transfer schools than permanently housed students.
4 Changing schools can greatly impede a student's
5 academic and social growth, and it is estimated that
6 a child who changes schools takes from four to six
7 months to recover academically. Not surprisingly
8 then homeless students in the city generally perform
9 worse on state English and math tests than their non-
10 homeless peers. Graduation dates for homeless
11 students are far lower than their housed peers, and
12 drop out rates for homeless students are far higher
13 than their housed peers. Studies have found that
14 children who are homeless are also more likely to
15 repeat a grade than non-homeless children.
16 Homelessness is at a crisis level in the city, and
17 sadly, student homelessness is increasing. It is
18 estimated that 140,000 New York City students have
19 experienced homelessness in the last six years.
20 Certain student populations are over-represented in
21 homelessness including Black and Hispanic students.
22 For example, in school year 2015-16, Black students
23 represented 27.1% of DOE's students population and
24 accounted for 33% of homeless students.
25

1
2 Additionally, in school year 2015-16, Hispanic
3 students represented 40.5% of DOE's student
4 population, and represented 52% of homeless students.
5 Furthermore, Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, and
6 Queer youth comprised a disproportionate number of
7 the homeless population and are eight times more
8 likely to experience homelessness. LGBTQ youth
9 comprise approximately 50% of the total homeless
10 youth population in New York City according to some
11 studies. LGBTQ youth, street youth experience greater
12 levels of bullying, sexual assault, domestic
13 violence, dating violence, stalking violence, trauma,
14 HIV infection, mental health issues and substance
15 abuse than their heterosexual counterparts in the
16 homeless youth population. I'm interested—I'm
17 interested in hearing about any DOE programs for this
18 extremely vulnerable population. In addition to the
19 oversight topic, and the legislation discussed by
20 Chair Levin, the committees will also hear
21 introduction 1497 sponsored by Council Member Rafael
22 Salamanca. Intro 1497 would require the DOE to
23 report measures concerning students who live in
24 temporary housing, including information such as the
25 number of students residing in shelters, the number

1
2 of students living doubled up, the rate of students
3 residing in shelters of their school district and
4 borough of origin and the number of requests for a
5 shelter transfer to be closer to school. The report
6 would additionally include funding information and
7 information on transportation for schools including
8 the use of Metro Cards and bussing. I would like to
9 remind everyone who wishes to testify today that you
10 must fill out a witness slip, which is located on the
11 desk of the sergeant at arms near the front of this
12 room. If you wish to testify on a specific piece of
13 legislation, please indicate on the witness slip
14 whether you are here in favor of or in opposition to
15 the legislation, and please note that witnesses will
16 be sworn in before testifying today, and with that, I
17 want to turn it over to Council Member Rafael
18 Salamanca for remarks.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Good morning.
20 Thank you, Mr. Chair. I'm proud to be part of this
21 package of bills today to work towards addressing an
22 issue that is very real in my district. With current
23 trends showing that we are approaching a situation in
24 which one in seven students will be homeless while
25 attending elementary school. I know that my office

1
2 we are seeing cases day after day in which parents
3 are turning to us to help figure out how to ensure
4 they can keep their kids in school while
5 simultaneously navigating the shelter system, or
6 searching for permanent housing. In many instances,
7 the situation can be very sad with parents feeling
8 hopeless and often there isn't much we as council
9 member can do outside of trying our best to work with
10 DOE to keep students in their own school. So, this
11 is—so, this is a real crisis, and one that is quickly
12 becoming unmanageable. In the last five years alone,
13 the Borough of the Bronx has seen a 44% increase in
14 shelter students attending school, and it is my fear
15 that if we do not act swiftly and effectively in
16 finding ways to address this problem, then it will
17 become even more unmanageable than it is today. With
18 that said, we know some of the issues we are facing.
19 Families doubling up is a big issue. Additionally,
20 we know that Black and Hispanic students are
21 disproportionately overrepresented in homelessness.
22 We know of chronic absenteeism, and unfortunately, of
23 the academic disparities that exist among the
24 homeless student population. But to best address
25 this problem, we need to be more concise. A clear

1
2 picture that periodically reports the state of
3 students in homelessness to we policymakers. That is
4 why I'm proud to sponsor Intro 1497, which will
5 require the Department of Education to report on
6 students in temporary housing. Specifically, the
7 bill would require the Department of Education to
8 submit to the Council and post on its website a
9 report for the proceeding—the preceding school year
10 regarding information of students in temporary
11 housing, and just to be clear, this is—this means a
12 lot to my Council District given that I have over 29
13 homeless shelters and over 400 cluster units in my
14 Council District alone. It is my home that we work
15 to get this bill passed before the end of the season
16 along with the rest of legislation here today,
17 because our children cannot afford for us to wait.
18 Thank you. [pause]

19 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Thank you very much,
20 Council Member Salamanca. So, now we'll turn it over
21 to the panel from the Administration. We have Joslyn
22 Carter, who is the DHS Administrator. Welcome to the
23 Administrator for the first testimony. Elizabeth
24 Rose, New York City Department of Education, Division
25

2 of Operations, Lois Herrera, New York City Department
3 of Education for the Office of--so--?

4 LOIS HERRERA: Safety and Youth
5 Development.

6 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Safety and Youth
7 Development.

8 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Safety and Youth
9 Development. Okay, I'll turn it over to the panel
10 for their testimony. Before that, I would ask you to
11 raise your right hand to be sworn in, please. Do you
12 swear to tell the truth the whole truth and nothing
13 but the truth and to respond honestly to Council
14 Member's questions?

15 PANEL MEMBERS: [in unison] I do.

16 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Thank you very much.
17 You may begin.

18 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Good morning
19 Chairs Dromm and Levin and members of the Education
20 and General-General Welfare Committees here today.
21 My name is Elizabeth Rose. I am the Deputy
22 Chancellor for Operations at the New York City
23 Department of Education. I am joined by Lois
24 Herrera, Chief Executive Officer of the Office of
25 Safety and Youth Development. Thank you for the

1
2 opportunity to discuss DOE's work to support students
3 in temporary housing and Intro 1497. Supporting
4 students in temporary housing is a top priority for
5 the Mayor and for the Chancellor. Under this
6 administration, we have taken significant strides in
7 both identifying and supporting our STH, and we have
8 partnered with the Department of Homeless Services
9 and other city agencies to help ensure educational
10 continuity, stability and success for this student
11 population. We recognize that STH are among our most
12 vulnerable students, and experience challenges
13 through no fault of their own. We know that for many
14 of them, school is a vital source of stability. To
15 this end, we provide additional academic, health and
16 mental health supports, and services through school
17 district, borough, central and shelter based staff,
18 and we've invested in an additional \$10.3 million to
19 support students in temporary housing. While we are
20 pleased by the progress made in recent years, we
21 recognize there is much more work to be done, and we
22 thank the City Council for its partnership on this
23 issue. As you are aware, the McKinney-Vento Homeless
24 Assistance Act requires school districts to take
25 action to remove barriers to enrollment, attendance

1 and success in school, attributable to homelessness.
2
3 Chancellor's Regulations A-101 and A-780, outline the
4 DOE's obligations to ensure that these students
5 receive the extra supports they need. Under
6 McKinney-Vento and accordingly DOE regulations, a
7 student in temporary housing is defined as one who
8 lives in emergency or transitional housing or shares
9 housing due to loss of housing or economic hardship.
10 This is doubled up, or lives in motels, hotels,
11 trailer parks or camping grounds due to lack of
12 alternative adequate housing, or is unaccompanied, or
13 lives in cars, parks, public spaces, abandoned
14 buildings, substandard housing or bus or train
15 stations, or has a primary night time residence that
16 is a public or private place not designed for or
17 ordinarily used as regular sleeping accommodation.
18 During the 2016-17 school year, 105,133 New York City
19 public school students were covered McKinney-Vento,
20 35,067 of whom were identified as living in a shelter
21 at some point during the course of the school year.
22 A student's housing status is identified in several
23 ways: All parents are given a housing questionnaire
24 at the time of enrollment in a new school, or when
25 they report a change of address. In addition to the

1 housing questionnaire, we've established in
2 collaboration with DHS a modern efficient data
3 sharing system, through which DHS sends a detailed
4 daily report to DOE about every school aged child
5 living in DHS shelters. This data allows DOE to
6 quickly identify students in shelter and is further
7 shared with our shelter and school based staff, our
8 office of student enrollment, our Office of Early
9 Childhood Education, Special Education Office, and
10 the Office of People Transportation to provide
11 appropriate interventions and supports. Once
12 students are identified, they are assured of the
13 following rights: To attend school regardless of
14 where they live or the duration of their homeless to
15 choose to remain at their school of origin where they
16 attended before they became homeless or to transfer
17 to another school for which they meet the school's
18 eligibility and enrollment criteria. To the extent
19 feasible, a student shall be kept in the school of
20 origin unless this contrary to the wishes of the
21 student's parent. To immediately enroll in a school
22 even if the family is unable to provide proof of
23 residency, immunization, or previous school records
24 at that time, and to have a grace period of 30 days
25

1
2 to compile the necessary documentation; to receive
3 free school meals; to receive free transportation to
4 school and school programs; and to receive comparable
5 services and programs as offered to other students in
6 the school. Within the DOE, the Office of Safety and
7 Youth Development's Office of Students in Temporary
8 Housing coordinates our agency live and interagency
9 approach to supporting STH and their families. All
10 schools are required to publicly display posters
11 information parents of their rights under the
12 McKinney-Vento, and Chancellor's Regulations A-101
13 and A-780. As part of its Youth Development
14 Consolidated Plan, each school must assign an
15 appropriate staff person to serve as their school's
16 STH school based liaison to track the STH population
17 and provide interventions and support services. All
18 STH school based liaisons are required to attend an
19 annual professional development session in the late
20 fall in collaboration with New York State Technical
21 and Education Assistance Center for Homeless Students
22 known as New York Teachers and NYS teachers. Also,
23 school districts with STH populations participate in
24 the STH School Based Liaison Institute that provides
25 enhanced professional development and training. In

1
2 addition, each school is required to allocate a
3 portion of Title 1 Funding to serve STH students with
4 a range of academic and non-academic supports. The
5 DOE has ten STH borough based Content Experts who
6 supervise and support 117 shelter based family
7 assistant. The Content Experts support family
8 shelters within their respective boroughs to ensure
9 that mandated services are provided and that
10 supplementary educational and counseling services
11 such as tutoring, homework help, test preparation,
12 post-secondary planning, mentoring and individual and
13 group counseling are readily available to students
14 and families. They also provide training for shelter
15 and school based staff in order to foster
16 understanding of the law, and to share best
17 practices, offer family workshops where students and
18 their families can identify with one another, and
19 discuss the issues that they face. Our Family
20 Assistants are the primary DOE point of contact for
21 shelter based students and families. Family
22 Assistants identify and interview all shelter based
23 students and families, and inform them of their
24 educational rights, and play an integral role in
25 ensuring the delivery of services. In collaboration

1
2 with the STH Content Expert, Family Assistants
3 monitor the attendance of STH or with families to
4 improve student attendance, assist in recruiting the
5 parents of STH for activities intended for them, and
6 refer students to extended day activities. At PATH,
7 DHS' Intake Center in the Bronx, DOE staff are
8 available to speak with parents, answer questions
9 about education and provide information about
10 students' rights while homeless. DOE added
11 additional staff at PATH now providing coverage no
12 Monday through Friday from 8:00 a.m. to 8:00 p.m. DOE
13 created a new education guide this summer for
14 students in shelter and this guide is now distributed
15 at PATH and in shelters. Over the past two years, we
16 implemented several new initiatives aimed
17 specifically to support students in temporary
18 housing. The first, Bridging the Gap, places full-
19 time students social workers trained in trauma
20 informed practice in elementary schools with high STH
21 populations. This program included 32 elementary
22 schools in the 2016-17 school year. At these schools
23 social workers work directly with 4,910 students
24 providing individual counseling services, group
25 counseling services and crisis interventions. This

1
2 year, the program has expanded to 43 elementary
3 schools. We also established the Afterschool Reading
4 Club, or ARC, a literacy program staffed by DOE
5 teachers. ARC provides reading enrichment three days
6 a week to students in grade K to 5 at 18 DHA
7 shelters. The program including reading instruction
8 and activities, homework help and weekly arts
9 programming to encourage literacy skill development.
10 Students in the program are giving new books each
11 week to keep. Participating sites also receive
12 libraries with over 700 titles each. Through our
13 partnership with the Deutsche Bank Americas
14 Foundation, the Office of Community Schools provides
15 intensive supports to students in temporary housing
16 as well. In the second year of this grant, these
17 initiatives are scaled across all 227 community
18 schools, with a particular focus on the 22 community
19 schools with the highest rates of student in
20 temporary housing. This partnership has brought
21 concrete supports such as innovative data supports
22 that allows CBOs, community based organizations, and
23 school staff access to real time data to identify STH
24 students and track attendance. Targeted resources
25 such as clothing, laundry pods, hygiene kits and over

1 2,000 new backpacks with school supplies as well as
2 the Summer Youth Employment Program, a mentorship
3 program and quarterly professional development for
4 principals and community school directors. We also
5 put in place—place new health and mental health
6 services aimed to support the needs of STH.
7 Approximately, 60 schools with high STH populations
8 received free vision screenings. As a result of this
9 effort, 28,452 students were screened and 4,777
10 students were provided with free glasses. An
11 additional school nurse has been hired to provide
12 more intensive case management and clinical care at
13 ten school campuses with large populations of STH.
14 As part of the citywide Thrive Initiative the Offices
15 of School Health and community schools have a team of
16 clinicians that either provide direct service or work
17 with schools to develop mental health resources where
18 students can be referred to for service as needed.
19 The team works in 62 schools where there are high
20 numbers of STH. Lastly, approximately \$20 million
21 has been allocated to the current Capital Plan to
22 construct school based health centers at schools with
23 high STH populations. Four such health centers are
24 currently under construction and are planned to open
25

1
2 in the fall of 2018. We've also increased support to
3 families in shelters regarding all admissions
4 processes. Over the past school year, our office of
5 Student Enrollment trained DHS and DOE shelter and
6 school based staff on Pre-K, Kindergarten, middle
7 school, and high school admissions and launched a
8 text message campaign so that families can receive
9 text message alerts regarding admissions processes
10 and due dates. OSE also invited approximately 4,000
11 eighth grade students in temporary housing to
12 targeted support centers at the Citywide High School
13 Fair and the Brooklyn and Bronx Borough High School
14 Fairs. In addition, families or roughly 1,300
15 incoming Pre-K and Kindergarten students in Districts
16 9, 10 and 12 in the Bronx, and District 19 in
17 Brooklyn we're inviting to district based elementary
18 admission information sessions. As a result of those
19 efforts, 47% of students in shelter applied to Pre-K
20 up from 38% in the prior year, and application rates
21 for students in shelter increased for Pre-K,
22 Kindergarten, middle school and high school
23 admissions. Now, in the second year of this
24 initiative the DOE continues to expand these
25 supports. To support students with disabilities

1
2 living in temporary housing, DOE recently updated its
3 Special Education Standard Operating Procedures
4 Manual or SOPM to include new guidance specific to
5 students in temporary housing particularly around
6 Special Education Evaluation and IEP review Process.
7 In addition, we provided guidance for supervisors of
8 psychologists to ensure they are expediting annual
9 review s and evaluations for students in temporary
10 housing. Last spring, Committees on Special
11 Education and Committees on Pre-School Special
12 Education staff provided special education overview
13 sessions to DOE shelter based staff in each borough
14 to ensure that this staff can successfully support
15 students with disabilities residing in shelter. We
16 also provide workshops for guardians and parents to
17 help them gain a better understanding of the IEP
18 process. As you are aware, we launched a major new
19 transportation initiative for students in grades
20 Kindergarten through 6, who resided in the DHS
21 Shelter System last year. The initiative offers
22 yellow bus service to an additional 5,000 students
23 with pickups from 478 bus stops near DHS facilities
24 and drop-offs to over a thousand schools. STH who
25 prefer traveling on their own are still eligible for

1 a full fare Metro Card, and the parents of students
2 in Pre-K through 6 are also eligible for free Metro
3 Cards of their own to accompany their child to and
4 from school. The DOE also works collaborative with
5 other New York City agencies to address the needs of
6 students in temporary housing. We work with the
7 Administration for Children's Services and DHS to
8 help families and enroll in the Early Learn Programs,
9 which provide full day, fully year early care and
10 education for children from six weeks to five-year-
11 olds. As the DOE plans for the transition of the
12 Early Learn Programs from ACS to DOE, we will
13 continue to work with DHS and other partners to
14 ensure the needs of our youngest children in shelter
15 are being met. We connect students who reside of
16 Department of Youth and Community Development
17 shelters with referrals for alternative programs and
18 educational services such as the After School
19 Corporation and Learn to Work Programs.
20 Additionally, we conduct professional development on
21 STH youth in collaboration with the Human Resource
22 Administration's Domestic Violence Shelters, and we
23 are currently working with HRA in order seamlessly
24 address the needs of students residing Domestic
25

1 Violence Shelters. I will now turn to the proposed
2 legislation, Intro No. 1497. Intro 1497 requires DOE
3 to publish an annual report on students in temporary
4 housing. While we support the goal of the
5 legislation to provide transparency around STH, we
6 have operational constraints that limit our ability
7 to report on student transportation as required. We
8 welcome the opportunity to work with the Council to
9 ensure that the reporting requirements align with
10 what we capture in our reporting systems. We know we
11 still have work to do, and will continue to work
12 closely with DHS and other agencies to provide
13 additional services. We thank you for your time
14 today, and we look forward to our continued work with
15 the city on this important issue. I will now turn to
16 my colleague Joslyn Carter.

18 JOSLYN CARTER: Good morning. I would
19 like to thank the City Council's General Welfare and
20 Education Committees and Chair Stephen Levin and
21 Daniel Dromm for giving us this opportunity to
22 testify today about the Department of Homeless
23 Services and our work specific to students. My name
24 is Joslyn Carter, and this summer I was appointed by
25 the Mayor to serve as the Administrator for the

1
2 Department of Homeless Services. I'm looking forward
3 to getting to know you all and working together in
4 this new role after 13 years working at DHS. Over
5 the past four decades, the shelter system was built
6 in a haphazard way to meet the needs of homeless
7 Northeastern Towers. Since the 1980s, the phase of
8 homelessness substantially shifted from the larger
9 single adult population struggling with justice
10 system involvement, mental health challenges,
11 substance abuse disorders, and inconsistent
12 employment to what we see today. Seventy percent of
13 those in shelter are families, and 34% of the
14 families with children in shelter have a working
15 adult in them. As of October 6, 2017, our census
16 included 22,987 children, and of these children,
17 14,548 ages 3 to 18 and in school as of October 4,
18 2017. The mass plan the use of all cluster sites or
19 commercial hotel facilities places—and replace some
20 of the small number of high quality borough based
21 facilities will reduce the number of homeless--
22 Department of Homeless Services facilities by 45%
23 across New York City. Our goal is to maintain a
24 vacancy rate to ensure the flexibility we need to
25 implement a more equitable borough based system that

1
2 takes into account the individual needs of the
3 children and adults we must shelter. The plan is
4 guiding principally is Community First given homeless
5 Northeastern Towers who come from every community
6 across the five boroughs the opportunity to be
7 sheltered close in the support network and anchored
8 with life including schools, jobs, healthcare, family
9 houses of worship, and communities they call home in
10 order to more quickly stabilize their lives. In
11 June, Department of Social Services Commissioner
12 Banks provided comprehensive testimony concerning the
13 process by which families enter and move through the
14 DHS system beginning at family intake, and DHS'
15 Prevention Assistance and Temporary Housing, PATH
16 primarily.(sic) To briefly review, upon arrival,
17 reception staff inquire about the reasons—the
18 family's reasons for coming to PATH, and are engaged
19 by PATH's social workers to provide crisis
20 counseling, mediation services, and referrals to
21 community based resources as an alternative to
22 shelter. Along with HRA Homeless Diversion Unit, the
23 HD caseworkers and home based offices, these social
24 workers identify services to assist families in
25 obtaining or securing independent housing without

1
2 having to enter shelter including family mediation,
3 legal services, HRA emergency grants and rental
4 assistance. In City Fiscal Year 2016, PATH Family
5 Intake handled applications for nearly 18,000 needy
6 households, numbers which have remained steady since
7 2013. In addition to HRA's Homeless Diversion Unit,
8 collocated at PATH is HRA Nova--Lavonne Dickens,
9 Department of Education Family Assistants Liaison,
10 the Administration for Children's Liaisons, and a
11 contracted medical provider, which is the floating
12 hospital. DHS' partnerships with our sister agencies
13 are important to who they simply respond to the needs
14 of our clients. For example, ATS staff has in the
15 past conducted nightly clearance of all families with
16 children who present at PATH to apply for temporary
17 emergency shelter. Matches are then provided to DHS,
18 identified families with often ACS cases. DHS staff
19 members also learned of ACS involvement through the
20 standardized intake interview where a family has an
21 opportunity to see the school assistance information.
22 Additionally, shelter staff has access to information
23 fields in the DHS CARES System that identifies a
24 family's ACS involvement. When PATH staff members
25 learn of a family ACS involvement through degrees,

1
2 they contact ACS staff on side of PATH or the ACS
3 staff assigned to the family to inquire further
4 regarding the family's housing needs, and to assist
5 with service continuity. Recognizing that support of
6 students extend because both the class and the school
7 yard, we have improved our collaboration with the
8 Department of Education so that we're identifying and
9 troubleshooting families' unique needs including a
10 special education requirements and transportation
11 options as well as meetings where they assist
12 children for school and relaying information to
13 parents in real time. In partnership with the DOE, we
14 created and now maintain the DHS' first ever
15 comprehensive daily, digital feed data of all school
16 age children in shelter to improve DHS and DOE's
17 information sharing to ensure the educational needs
18 of families experiencing homelessness unmet and
19 immediately and effectively as possible. This feed
20 is updated every day including new students entering
21 shelter, any outstanding changes occurring in
22 families, and any change in shelter or transitioning
23 to permanent housing. The feed provides real time
24 information on specific families' needs based on
25 shelter location, and current schools saw two

1
2 agencies. Upon arrival at a shelter, families are
3 assigned a case manager in CARES, the DHS system of
4 records. The case manager meets with the families to
5 address any immediate needs and makes appropriate
6 referrals. During this time, there are specific
7 special requirements that focus on the needs of
8 children within the household including student
9 enrollment. The case manager refers the client to
10 the Department of Education Family Assistants or to
11 the DOE students in temporary housing borough
12 contact. We've also worked closely with DOE to
13 improve transportation options for students across
14 the system. And beginning the week before the first
15 day of school this year, DHS provided families
16 applying for shelter PATH intake with Metro Cards to
17 ensure they have transportation options immediately
18 to get to school including those families who may
19 ultimately be determined ineligible for shelter. We
20 believe training is a key element, increasing
21 awareness and collaborations among stakeholders.
22 Trainings are provided throughout the years, engages
23 schools and the shelter community. For example, last
24 PATH staff conducted several trainings of DOE
25 attendance teachers and arranged several tours for

1
2 DOE staff to visit PATH. Also, DHS has participated
3 in a citywide and McKinney-Vento workshops
4 facilitated by the New York State Educational
5 Department and the New York State Technical and
6 Educational Assistance Center for Homeless Students,
7 NYAC and Advocates for Children for N-O- NYC DOA
8 schools shelter placement. In the FY17 MMR, we
9 reported that during FY17, there was a decline in the
10 percentage of families with children who were placed
11 in shelter according to the youngest child's school
12 address. DHS makes every effort to place families in
13 shelter at shelter locations that respond—that
14 corresponds to the youngest age child's school
15 address. But due constraints in shelter capacity
16 this is not always possible, and this is exactly why
17 the Mayor is turning a tight plan in visions and
18 approach to shelter that focuses on placement close
19 to the family's community. As we continue to
20 implement a new borough based approach, we will be
21 able to create the necessary capacity to address
22 needs. Further, implementing this borough based
23 approach allows us to prioritize placement for those
24 families from the community where the facility is
25 located, and then for families of surrounding areas

1 on Broadway. (sic) Since the announcement of the
2 Turning the Tide, we've authored or announced the
3 opening of eight new shelters, four of which serve
4 families with children. These facilities will soon
5 be given households including families with children
6 an opportunity to stabilize their lives nearer to
7 their existing social network. The closer proximity
8 to schools will be particularly beneficial for
9 families whose children continue to enter schools in
10 the community and ask for a home (sic), often they
11 must now commute long distances, sometimes across
12 multiple boroughs to remain in those schools.

14 Social Workers in Shelter: In addition
15 to DHS' close partnership with DOE, DHS has also
16 taken important steps to improve educational
17 stability and enhance access to opportunity for those
18 students residing in shelter. Because our guiding
19 principles in communities, we believe it is critical
20 to offer new opportunities to be shelters closed to
21 the anchors of life like schools in order to
22 stabilize their lives. Moreover, DHS acknowledges
23 unique needs of children experiencing homelessness
24 and the fact that they need wraparound services. In
25 2015, the Mayor and First Lady announced Thrive NYC

1
2 to guide the city towards a more effective and
3 holistic system to support the mental wellbeing of
4 New Yorkers especially those among us who are the
5 most vulnerable. This included significant
6 investment to support our families in shelter. As
7 part of this initiative, we have expanded the staff
8 resources needed to help our clients. . We have
9 hired over 180 Client Care Coordinators who are
10 licensed master social workers deployed at shelter to
11 work with families as they navigate multiple systems
12 and cope with the stresses and anxieties associated
13 with homelessness. Client Care Coordinators work to
14 enhance delivery and coordination of services for
15 families with children in shelter, which include
16 identifying and responding to the needs of students.
17 With the goal of strengthening the overall permanence
18 effort for families with children in shelter,
19 coordinated and working to promote our best practices
20 for shelter service-social service provider staff,
21 and improve linkages in mental health and community
22 based services. They're all to task (sic), we
23 increases the-increasing the ability of shelter
24 Social Services staff to address mental health issues
25 in a culturally and linguistically sensitive manner

1
2 that incorporates strength based family driven and
3 youth child guided care. I also would like to note
4 that an agency issued a new LGBTQI policy in April of
5 2017, which includes directions for shelter staff and
6 providers on how to follow up on the many common
7 LGBTQI issues including placement concerns, medical
8 needs such as gendering affirming healthcare and
9 where to reach out to mental health counseling and
10 support. Through our partnership with the Department
11 of Health and Mental Hygiene, we are focusing on
12 early intervention. This initiative will support
13 families with children 0-ages 0 to 3 who have
14 disabilities or development delays. The goal of the
15 Early Intervention Program is to support families in
16 helping their children learn and develop as well as
17 helping families understand that children's strengths
18 and abilities using everyday activities that help
19 their children develop. DHS provides shelter staff
20 and clients with the information and tools needed to
21 apply as well as provide direct technical assistance
22 where needed by our workshops and training. It is
23 worth noting that through coordinated efforts with
24 the DOHMH, early education enrollments have doubled
25 for enrollment in Pre-K.

1
2 Child Care in Shelters: As part of the
3 90-day review of homeless programs and reform—and
4 resulting reforms, the City examined all aspect of
5 the service providers to children in—families in
6 shelter. During the summer of 2016, the city
7 convened a task force and childcare and daycare in
8 homeless shelters to examine childcare services
9 available to homeless children and develop
10 recommendations. The task force includes Department
11 of Homeless Services, the Department of Social
12 Services, Human Resources Administration, the
13 Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, the
14 Administration for Children's Services, the
15 Department of Education, and the Office of Management
16 and Budget. In the fall of 2016, the city conducted
17 the citywide review of the Drop-off Childcare
18 Programs. Our task force members visited shelters
19 across the five boroughs, and as a result of these
20 visits, recommended that the city create new permit
21 category in the York City Health Code regulating
22 onsite drop-off child care programs in family
23 shelters in order to be able to consistently enforce
24 and regulate standards that ensure child safety
25 should sufficiently mitigate the risk of harm.

1
2 Developed in partnership with the Department of
3 Health, Board of Health, ACS and service providers,
4 the boroughs regulations for this new permit category
5 were adopted by the Board of Health—Board of Health
6 in early September. Following that, last month we
7 announced together with our partners in government
8 and partners who provided social services we
9 finalized regulations and enhanced drop-off care at
10 shelters for families with children, implementing
11 more effective standards to ensure this programming
12 is high quality across the board. These additional
13 regulations will improve drop-off care by enhancing
14 on-site staffing and strengthening health, safety and
15 physical space guidelines. With these regulations,
16 we are adding training and child development. As
17 standardizing staff-child issues increases that ratio
18 for infants and toddlers so that homeless children
19 receive the attention and supervision they deserve in
20 drop-off childcare settings. And we are also
21 establishing strict expectations for physical
22 spacing—spaces including health and safety standards
23 like window bars and sprinklers to ensure that drop-
24 off child care spaces are appropriate and our young
25 clients are safe. These are the same standards

1 applied to regulated daycare programs throughout New
2 York City. We should provide no less than homeless
3 children. Currently, there are 37 operating
4 childcare programs in shelter, and an additional
5 eight sites that operate onsite DOHMH licensed
6 daycare. These are separate business entities from
7 the shelter programs. There is one site that operates
8 both drop-off child care and licensed full-time care.
9 DHS in conjunction with New York City's Children's
10 Cabinet, New York City Department of Education, New
11 York City Service, and with book donations from
12 Scholastic, Incorporated, we also developed a pilot
13 literacy program in family shelters. As a result, 30
14 shelter based libraries have been created featuring
15 reading materials for school age children in
16 Kindergarten to 12th grade residing in shelters and
17 serving over 2,000 families. Additionally, in
18 partnership with the New York, Queens, and Brooklyn
19 Public Libraries, the shelters have been linked to
20 the nearest library branch for book loans. The
21 public libraries also provide reading, story time,
22 library cards drivers and read aloud activities at
23 the shelter based libraries. Introducing our shelter
24 families and children to the beneficial programs
25

1 public libraries have to offer, leads them to view
2 libraries as a vital community resource they can rely
3 on after exiting shelters. The shelter based
4 libraries received the 2016 Library of Congress
5 Literacy Award Best Practice Honoree in recognize-
6 recognize--in recognition of our innovative approach
7 to providing literacy services to homeless children
8 and their families.
9

10 The Legislation Before the Committee: As
11 the Committee has presented this package of
12 legislation, we want to provide some initial
13 feedback. We look forward to working with the
14 Council to ensure that the bills are in line with the
15 good work currently underway so as not to duplicate
16 resources and to ensure appropriate outcomes for our
17 families.

18 Intro 1714-2017: The bill would
19 establish an education continuity unit at PATH and
20 every shelter applicant or families with children
21 would be offered an opportunity to meet with such
22 unit while apply for shelter. Currently at PATH, we
23 have DOE staff on site from 8:00 a.m. to 8:00 p.m.
24 Monday through Friday who distribute education and
25 transportation guides to families. However, PATH is

1 not the only opportunities for families to obtain
2 information concerning the educational needs of their
3 children. For families that are losing their homes
4 or entering the shelter system, the intake process of
5 PATH can be a completely overwhelming and stressful
6 process for adults and children. We do not believe
7 that PATH is the ideal location for parents to absorb
8 critical information about their child's educational
9 future. At all shelters families have assigned
10 caseworkers who are able to address educational needs
11 of their children in a more comfortable setting.
12 This dialogue with families is ongoing and included
13 in the Individual Independent Living Plan, the ILP.
14 We believe this is a more appropriate DHS
15 intervention to address the needs of students in
16 temporary housing as case managers that are able to
17 work with the client in a more ongoing way. Creating
18 such a unit of PATH would be a duplication of
19 duplication of efforts already occurring in shelters.

20
21 Intro 1497-2017: The bill will require
22 DOE to publish an annual report concerning students
23 in temporary housing including DYCD and HRA
24 administered housing. This bill, among other things,
25 will require the Department of Education to report on

1 metrics provided by the DHS Homelessness Services—the
2 Department of Homeless Services and Communities
3 Administration. Paragraph 2 will require this
4 upgraded reporting on the number of students residing
5 in all the administered shelters including those in
6 HASA and DV shelters. Reporting on the number of
7 students in these programs may present privacy and
8 confidentiality concerns. The bill further requires
9 the department to report on the rate of placement of
10 students residing in shelter operated by DHS, and the
11 students school of origin and the borough of origin.
12 We currently report to the MMR that the percentage of
13 families placed in the shelter services system
14 according to their youngest children's—child's school
15 address.
16

17 Intro 0572-2014: The bill will require
18 the Department of Homeless Services to post daily
19 shelter census data by borough. DHS currently posts
20 a daily census report on our website, which includes
21 the total shelter census broken down by adults and
22 children and further disaggregated by type of
23 shelter. We also report on the number of families
24 reporting temporary housing at PATH and adult
25 families requesting temporary housing inactive.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

There are a number of operational challenges that we would have in this kind of real time reporting and we're prepared to work with the Council on the best way to address the Council's concern as the bill is reviewed. We remain committed to providing useful and transparent reporting on our shelter census and look forward to working with the Council toward that shared objective. Thank you and I welcome your questions.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much for your testimony, both to the DOE, and to DHS. Let me start off with some questions, and I know we're going to go to Council Member Salamanca because he has another hearing as well. So, right after me we'll go to you if that's okay, and we have been joined by Council Members Maisel, Levine, Rodriguez, Kallos and Deutsch. Deputy Chancellor, I noted in our testimony you mentioned there were 117 Family Assistants. What's the total number of shelters that the Family Assistants serve?

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: It is more than 117.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay.

3 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, we do have
4 some Family Assistants who are assigned to more than
5 one location, and they go from place to place to meet
6 with families at different locations.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Can you get us that
8 exact number later on?

9 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Yes.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, we'll follow up
11 with you on that. How many students are included in
12 the average Family Assistant's caseload?

13 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: I don't have
14 that figure. So, we can follow up with you on that.
15 Do you have idea?

16 LOIS HERRERA: It's—it isn't that we
17 have--

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: [interposing] And
19 just identify yourself.

20 LOIS HERRERA: Loris Herrera. It isn't
21 that we have a specified ratio. It's more about
22 shelter that have school age children, and that's
23 where we try to post the Family Assistants.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, what are the
25 minimal educational requirements for the Family
26 Assistants position? [pause]

1
2 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: We are getting
3 that information in real time.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, are there any
5 plans to upgrade.

6 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: You must be a
7 high school graduate.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: They have to be just
9 a high school graduate, a high school diploma. Are
10 there any plans to upgrade that requirement to a BA
11 or a Masters Degree?

12 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, it's a—that
13 position is planning to continue as it is. What we
14 are doing at the Department of Education is we
15 recognized that the schools can play a much greater
16 role in supporting students in shelter, and so we
17 have actually transitioned some of our focus to
18 providing schools with the additional supports and
19 services to help their individual children. They see
20 these children on a daily basis, you know, throughout
21 the school day, and I think they have a real
22 opportunity and ability to work more closely with the
23 children in order to help provide those supports.
24 So, most of the programs that we've initiated over
25 the past two years really focus on school based

1
2 interventions rather than changing to the Family
3 Assistant.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: With the school based
5 interventions is that part—are they paid out of the
6 money, the \$10.3 million that the Mayor put into the
7 budget?

8 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, several of
9 those initiatives. So, our Bridging the Gap
10 Initiative of social workers in schools that have
11 high students in shelter, and students in temporary
12 housing as part of that \$10.3 million initiative .
13 Some of the programs are in shelters so the after
14 school reading clubs, the ARC, that is part of that
15 \$10.3 million, and those are shelter based.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And how is the—the
17 assignment of these folks determined, and how—I have
18 questions, really a larger question, which is how is
19 the—the—the application, the use of the \$10.3 million
20 determined? Which schools get it, which schools
21 don't get it? What is the requirement to get the
22 extra staffing?

23 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, the—we
24 identified schools based on their student population,
25 and we looked particularly at schools with higher

1
2 numbers and high percentages of students living in
3 shelter. So, for example, the Bridging the Gap
4 Program, those social workers are provided to schools
5 that didn't already have social work staff in their
6 schools, and had at least at least 25 students who
7 were living in shelter.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So at least 25, but
9 I'm aware of some schools that have more than 25 who
10 have complained to me that they have not been given
11 additional resources.

12 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, again the
13 Bridging the Gap social workers are in elementary
14 schools where we are seeing the highest numbers in
15 shelter.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: [interposing] It's in
17 elementary and junior high combo?

18 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: I believe K to H
19 would have—would have counted. We—we did provide
20 social workers to some of our K to 8 schools as well.
21 Some schools may have already had licensed social
22 workers on their staff, and so we were really hoping
23 to support schools that currently don't have those
24 resources.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, the school I'm-
3 I'm concerned about is near the Pam Am Boulevard
4 Homeless Shelter?

5 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Uh-hm.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Do you know what
7 services have been offered to schools in the
8 surrounding area? IS5 is there, 102.

9 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: We're happy to
10 come back to you offline with very specific
11 information about individual schools.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, how many DOE
13 staff working at PATH?

14 LOIS HERRERA: Three. We have three DOE
15 staff at PATH so that we can expand the coverage in
16 terms of hours, and they're there from 8:00 a.m. to
17 8:00 p.m.

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Is that in the summer
19 as well?

20 LOIS HERRERA: It's a reduced staff in
21 the summer, but we do have DOE staff there.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So you have three
23 that are staffers, and what in the summer?

24 LOIS HERRERA: One.
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Just to one. Has the
3 third staffer been hired yet?

4 LOIS HERRERA: Yes.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay so that person
6 is currently in active duty?

7 LOIS HERRERA: In process.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, are there plans
9 to expand the provision of bus services to Pre-K
10 students living in shelters? This this is an issue
11 for us as well?

12 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, Pre-K
13 students we make every effort to ensure that students
14 have a Pre-K seat as close to the shelter as
15 possible, and in fact, this year we made an offer for
16 Pre-K seat to every eligible child-age eligible child
17 in shelter even if they didn't apply. So, even
18 though as we mentioned earlier in our testimony that
19 the rate of application increased to 48%, we still an
20 offer to these children in shelter even if they
21 didn't apply to Pre-K, and we gave them an offer to
22 this site closest the shelter that had an available
23 seat. We don't provide bussing for Pre-K. We do
24 provide support to parents. We try to support
25 parents, but we—we do not currently offer bussing

1
2 unless a child has an Early Intervention IEP in which
3 case they do receive bussing.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: What about students
5 who don't reside in shelters, but who are temporarily
6 homeless?

7 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, students who
8 are doubled up--

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Right.

10 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: --can apply to
11 Pre-K as any other child can and should and--and we
12 support things in their lives.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And overall that's
14 true as well so that in--in the elementary grades and
15 above?

16 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, in
17 elementary grades and above, students who are doubled
18 up have the same rights as students who are living in
19 shelter. They can continue in their school or
20 origin. They are provided with transportation. In
21 the case of students who are doubled up, it is
22 predominantly Metro Cards. They have--can choose to
23 transfer to the school that they are eligible to
24 attend based on their new address, and we provide
25

1 similar supports in terms of their—their set-aside in
2 Title 1, and—and other supports.
3

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And what about the
5 extension of bus services to students in conditional
6 shelter placements like commercial hotels?

7 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, we do
8 provide bus service for students who are placed in a
9 commercial hotel through DHS.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Another question that
11 I have is I became aware recently in my district that
12 there are homeless shelters with the—with HPD. For
13 those who may have been in a fire or another
14 emergency type situation, does the DOE provide
15 services to them equal to the services that you
16 provide through DHS? How are you dealing with those
17 students?

18 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, certainly
19 any child who is homeless for any reason has the
20 right, the same set of rights to continue in their
21 school, to receive additional supports and so forth.
22 We don't have a data feed similar to the one that we
23 have with DHS with HPD, but where we are aware of a
24 child in one of those circumstances, we will
25 obviously work to support them.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Do you know any
3 numbers in regard to the number of homeless students
4 in HPD shelters or DYCD shelters?

5 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, DYCD
6 shelters we work very closely with DYCD. Those
7 shelters have a very high proportion of LGBT youth,
8 and unaccompanied LGBT youth. We work very closely
9 with them.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, can you describe
11 those efforts to work with those LGBT students?

12 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, we train
13 shelter staff on LGBT supports. Our Manhattan STH
14 Office is our hub for working with the LGBT students,
15 and we partner with the shelters particularly on
16 helping more to provide access to housing. Then, of
17 course, those students where we—where they are in
18 school we also support through our LGBT work that is
19 ongoing in our schools where we are working with
20 schools to develop GSAs. We are working on the
21 health side to provide medically accurate and gender
22 support information about health, health services,
23 condom availabilities and so forth.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Another concern that
25 ha been brought to my attention is the coordination

1
2 and collaboration between the DOE personnel and the
3 Social Service personnel in shelters. What type of
4 coordination goes on specifically regarding issues at
5 school versus what's happening in the shelter, et
6 cetera, so forth and so on? [background comment] To
7 me I've—I've heard complaints about a lack of
8 coordination or even a different philosophy in terms
9 of dealing with students who may have behavioral
10 issues, emotional issues, and things like that?

11 LOIS HERRERA: We've worked the shelter
12 providers and we have professional development that's
13 held jointly to help foster this one voice, and
14 training around numerous topics particularly chronic
15 absenteeism, which has been an issue, so that we can
16 all speak in the same voice and approach families in
17 the same way. This has been going on for a number of
18 years actually, but as I said, the collaboration is
19 strengthened over time culminating in the daily data
20 share, which we're very proud of, which helps us have
21 a better sense of how many students are in shelter,
22 and helps us to coordinate our activities.

23 JOSLYN CARTER: The other thing I would
24 add is that we do weekly meetings with the Department
25

1
2 of Education so that any issues that arise we try to
3 mitigate them. We work through them.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: You do the weekly
5 meetings at the administration level, or do you do it
6 at the local grassroots level between the school and
7 shelter?

8 JOSLYN CARTER: We do it at the
9 administration level, and our staff trickles down to
10 the schools and to the shelters.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, does the DOE
12 liaison sit on the community advisory board for the--
13 for the shelters? Do they attend community advisory
14 board meetings?

15 JOSLYN CARTER: Not that I'm aware. I'll
16 have to double check that.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, so I would like
18 to suggest that that that be done as well so that
19 there is better coordination between the two. That's
20 an issue that's been brought to my attention.

21 [background comment] So, the point is being made--

22 JOSLYN CARTER: [interposing] Oh, wait,
23 I'm--I'm--

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Oh, I'm sorry.
25

1

2

JOSLYN CARTER: Council-Council Member

3

Dromm, I'm just-I'm just getting some information

4

that at the Boulevard, yes, DOE is invested into that

5

CAB(sic) at the Boulevard. I think it probably does

6

vary by shelter, but that's happened in the

7

Boulevard.

8

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And is that for the

9

IS5 school or for the PS102 school? Do you know

10

that?

11

JOSLYN CARTER: 102.

12

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: For 102. Okay, thank

13

you and the number of homelessness or the number of

14

homeless folks goes up in the summer. Yet, the

15

number of DOE staff PATH goes down. So, how can we

16

better-how can we improve that situation?

17

LOIS HERRERA: It's something that we've

18

been looking at as well. The issue is that our

19

family workers are 10-month employees. They're-

20

they're union members, but we have offered to-

21

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Are they teachers?

22

Are they on the teacher roll?

23

LOIS HERRERA: No, they're DC37.

24

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Oh, DC37, okay?

25

3 LOIS HERRERA: And so, we've offered--
4 we're--for those who wish to work over the summer, but
5 it's not a requirement of their particular role.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, is that per--will
7 that be a per session assignment?

8 LOIS HERRERA: It's an additional pay if
9 they work over the summer, yes.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: In your testimony,
11 Deputy Chancellor as well, you mentioned that you
12 have a housing questionnaire, which is establishing
13 for in collaboration with DHS. How long has that
14 been in place?

15 LOIS HERRERA: It was formerly called--it
16 was formerly called the Residency Questionnaire. It
17 actually was in collaboration with New York State Ed
18 Department, and it's been in place, although I can't
19 say the specific years, but it's been in place for a
20 number of years. It just recently got renamed to
21 Housing Questionnaire.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Renamed to what?

23 LOIS HERRERA: Housing Questionnaire. It
24 used to be called the Residency Questionnaire and now
25 it's the Housing Questionnaire.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. I think I'm
3 going to turn it over to Council Member Salamanca
4 right now, and then I'll come back and follow-up with
5 those.

6 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Just before
7 transfer a position the caseload of family workers is
8 about 100 students.

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Per, okay, per Family
10 Assistant?

11 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Yes.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you, Mr.
14 Chair. Good morning, ladies. A few questions. In
15 terms of 1497, how does—currently how does the DOE
16 track students in permanent housing compared to
17 students that all under the McKinney-Vento Homeless
18 Assistance Act?

19 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Well, I guess
20 track in what way?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: How does DOE
22 track in terms of how do you know—how do you track
23 per school or do you track per school students that
24 are—have permanent housing compared to students that
25 fall under this McKinney-Vento Act?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, the—there are several ways that we identify this. The Housing Questionnaire that Lois was just speaking about is one of the ways that we learn about a student's residencies, about their housing situation. So, every family completes the Housing Questionnaire when a student enrolls in the school. In addition, we have the daily data feed that we discussed that we receive from DHS, and it identifies each student in—through a matching process, and so we are then able to match those individual students to the schools that they attend.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: So, it's safe to—

LOIS HERRERA: [interposing] We have—
I'm sorry.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Yes.

LOIS HERRERA: I do have a housing indicator in—in our ATF system that indicates whether a student is in permanent housing, or is in one of the categories of under McKinney-Vento.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright. So, it's safe to say that this data exists and—

3 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: [interposing]

4 Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: --and per
6 school?

7 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: So, the data
9 is available per school, and up to what age are you
10 tracking these students?

11 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, we track all
12 of our students in every grade level, and obviously
13 this data changes on a frequent basis, as student
14 status does change. Our primary data would be a one-
15 day in time our audited register of October 31st a
16 week the data does change throughout the year.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: And so, who's
18 responsible for putting this data together per
19 school?

20 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, the school
21 that the Housing Questionnaire information would be
22 taken in by whoever the school is managing
23 enrollments. That could be a pupil accounting
24 secretary. That could be a parent coordinator and
25 that data--they would enter that data into ATS as they
are registering the child. Something coming in

1
2 through the DHS data feed becomes an automatic update
3 in the system.

4 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: [interposing] Sorry,
5 but Commissioner, can you get the microphone a little
6 bit closer so that we have--

7 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Sure.

8 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: --all your comments
9 on the record?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: And so once
11 this data is--is put together--

12 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: [interposing]
13 Uh-hm.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: --where does
15 this data go? Who--who has access to this data? Does
16 it go to the Chancellor's Office? Where does this
17 data go?

18 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, the data
19 resides in our ATS system, and there are a variety of
20 departments who have access to it for different
21 purposes. Our Office of Safety and Youth Development
22 pulled data in order to help for example to prepare
23 this hearing. Our research policy, RPSG Research
24 Policy Support Group is the organization that does
25 most data analytics for the DOE. They are the ones

1
2 who would analyze groups of students. For example,
3 by—for ELA and math results or graduation rates, they
4 would provide that analytic support.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright, so
6 when I mentioned in my opening statement my Council
7 District in the South Bronx, the Seventeenth Council
8 District, I had 29 shelters--

9 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: [interposing]
10 Uh-hm.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: --and over 400
12 cluster sites. It's safe to say that my Council
13 District is oversaturated by homeless shelters. In
14 Community Board 3, and Community Board 6, I have over
15 1,200 individuals whose last know address was in
16 another community board district. So, it's safe to
17 say that my district on top of it being
18 oversaturated, I am taking homeless families from
19 other districts and they're bringing them over to the
20 South Bronx. With that oversaturation--

21 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: [interposing]
22 Uh-hm.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: --you know, I--
24 I think it's safe to say that my school districts as
25 well are being oversaturated. They have to take in

1
2 these families. They have to take in these students
3 that are being brought into my council district.
4 Now, were we not—is it not safe to say that having
5 this data readily available, and having this data
6 available online will help this administration and
7 will help the Council when we are putting our budget
8 together to see what schools need more resources than
9 other schools because of the amount of homeless
10 families that certain districts are taking, and—and I
11 say that with a heavy heart because a few weeks ago
12 there was a—a recent death. There was—there was a
13 killing that happened in one of my schools where a
14 student was being bullied. We all know what it was—
15 you know, we all know what happened there, and I met
16 with the principal. I met with the superintendent.
17 This school falls in Community Board 6, and I was
18 told that the principal made multiple requests for
19 scanners, for more school—for more school safety
20 officers and that request was denied. And so, again,
21 going back to DOE knowing that you can have this
22 data, knowing that certain schools need more
23 resources, would it not be relevant to have this data
24 available to help us know how to identify schools
25 that need more resources?

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, we do use this data constantly for helping to identify schools that need resources. For example, the Bridging the Gap Social Workers those schools were identified based on this data where we were able to see which schools had how many students who were living in shelter attending their school, and what other resources they already had. This data is used by the Department of Finance within the DOE and as part of identifying Title 1 allocations for schools that shelters, students who are living in shelter where schools have to set aside some money, or schools that are not Title 1 receive Title 1 for the students in shelter that are enrolled there. The community schools many of the choices that we've made of which schools to support with greater wraparound services through community school's efforts are based on where do we have schools that are where we have higher needs among our students and, in fact, the community schools as a whole have a higher percentage of students in temporary housing than the system does overall. So, we absolutely do use this information in order to provide our schools with resources.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: So, I think
3 that we both agree that this data exists. So, I
4 just—if you can just please explain. I don't
5 understand what is your—the—the Department of
6 Education's resistance on this bill to have this data
7 available on line so that the public has access to
8 it?

9 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: I don't think
10 that we've expressed resistance to providing this
11 information. There—there are some parts of the bill
12 for example, the points about the number of students
13 who have asked for a shelter transfer. That's not
14 data that we have. That is data that our colleagues
15 in DHS has. There are some aspects of the bill
16 around transportation where some of the data
17 requested is data that we don't currently track or
18 gather or have the capability to track. So, it's
19 not—we have not objected to providing this data about
20 the shelter populations or temporary housing
21 populations at schools.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay. Thank
23 you, Mr. Chairman.

24 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Thank you, Chairman
25 Salamanca. I'll ask 50 questions [off mic]

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, we've been joined
3 by Council Member Inez Barron, Council Member Vincent
4 Gentile, Council Member Mark Treyger, Council Member
5 Helen Rosenthal. I think we already said Brad is
6 here. Dan Garodnick is here. Council Member Dan
7 Garodnick, Council Member Chaim Deutsch, Council
8 Member Antonio Reynoso, and Council Member Debbie
9 Rose. Thank you all for being here, and I see that
10 Council Member-Chair Levin is going to ask questions.
11 [pause] Okay. So, so then we'll go to Council
12 Member Brad Lander.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: [pause] Thank
14 you very much to both chairs for this time, and—and
15 for this hearing, and for the sustained attention to
16 this work, and Steve, I thought your opening
17 statement really put this in an important context,
18 and I want to say also thank you to DOE and DHS for
19 what's an extraordinary amount of work. It's—it's
20 depressing to have to do this amount of work, but it
21 is—it is good to see the energy that you're putting
22 into it. I have two specific questions and then one
23 more general one. The specific one relates to school
24 based health centers. Deputy Chancellor I know note
25 that you spoke about money that you're putting to

1
2 build those audit schools, which is great. I'm sure
3 you're aware unfortunately that the state is cutting
4 the money to school based health centers.

5 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Uh-hm.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I met with some
7 of them recently, and they have some ideas for being
8 able to bill more through insurance. Broadly. Not
9 necessarily just from homeless students, obviously,
10 but where there's Medicaid, where there's, you know,
11 Childhood Plus, where there's insurance. So, I
12 wanted if we could sit down and talk about the
13 opportunities to work with theme. They think that
14 might be a source of resources for a place, and we
15 should fight the state cuts obviously, but we need to
16 make sure that school based health centers are stable
17 broadly. Certainly and I agree that focusing on the
18 schools with high percentages of students in
19 temporary housing is important.

20 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: And-and thank
21 you We agree that the stability for the providers of
22 the school based health centers really is critical,
23 and so that the—a permanent Medicaid waiver to allow
24 school based health centers to bill Medicaid directly
25 is a very important component of that stability.

1 We'd be happy to meet with you to talk about other
2 ways to help support the school based health centers.

3
4 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Alright thank
5 you. We'll follow up offline. Second, just a
6 question about bussing availability for students
7 while--while they're in conditional placements
8 applying at PATH. I know that can sometimes take a
9 week or two. Is there bussing available for them
10 during that time, because otherwise they're going to
11 miss those days and that transition?

12 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, while a
13 family is under conditional placement, they are
14 provided Metro Cards, and parents may also receive a
15 Metro Card to escort their child to school because it
16 takes sometimes about the same amount of time to
17 arrange bussing as it does to get through the
18 conditional housing. We don't automatically route a
19 child until they have been approved for shelter.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Got it. Okay,
21 but you add the extra Metro Card, but we're not
22 currently able to do--to do bussing?

23 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Correct, during
24 the conditional period.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Okay, thanks for
3 clearing that up, and then I—I guess I want to ask
4 just a much broader question really about the
5 relationship to your thinking here to the work around
6 school integration. It is, of course, I thought
7 you're laying out of the rights and the right for
8 students to make their choice to stay in their school
9 if they want to, or go to a school. You know, PS 230
10 is right across the street from the Kensington Family
11 Shelter. Such a wonderful school. Like I'd
12 encourage anyone who wound up there to go--

13 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Uh-hm.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: --but leave, you
15 know, that's got to be a choice of the parents and,
16 of course, maintaining stability makes enormous
17 sense. At the same time, it doesn't make sense to
18 have kids in—in such—to have so many schools, the
19 growing number for the IBO Report and per your data
20 that has such high concentrations of kids who are in
21 temporary housing who are homeless who are so low
22 income. This gest to Council Member Salamanca's
23 point. So, on the one hand, of course, we want to
24 provide the schools the resources and supports they
25 need, and on the other hand, it does not make sense

1
2 to have a policy that further, you know, concentrates
3 our-our-our poorest and most at risk kids in a small
4 number of schools with lots of other low-income and
5 at risk kids. That's why we, you know, school
6 integration is essential. It is in part about racial
7 justice, and it is in part because diverse schools,
8 socio-economically can support their kids, and
9 overwhelmingly poor schools can't. So, I just want
10 to ask in addition to providing supports here, I know
11 that the District 1 plan is starting to think about
12 this. How are we starting to look at this more
13 broadly? Are starting to look at this more broadly
14 so that our work on school integration helps in this
15 process?

16 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Well, the most
17 important thing is that we must comply with the law
18 that requires that a student who is living in a zone
19 it has the right to attend that zoned school, and/or
20 that child- Let me back up.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Uh-hm.

22 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: The law requires
23 that student living in shelter have the same rights
24 of attendance of any permanently housed student
25 living in that area. So, if a shelter is located in

1 a school zone, that student in shelter has the right
2 to attend that school the same way any other child
3 living in that school zone has the right to attend
4 that school. So, from a legal perspective, you know,
5 that potential for concentration is not avoidable. We
6 can offer parents alternative choices. We know that
7 from a convenience [bell] perspective attending the
8 school closest to the shelter may be a more
9 convenient and attractive option to that family than
10 attending another nearby school that's not as close
11 or convenient. We also are required and many
12 families prefer, and there are many very strong
13 educational reasons why they would prefer for their
14 child to maintain—remain at their school or origin
15 even if that's further away, even if that requires
16 distance of travel. And we know families who even
17 when they are placed at a shelter far away or then
18 receive permanent housing far away from that school
19 of origin that stability, the relationships they have
20 there, the services that are provided there are very
21 valuable to that family and to the stability of that
22 child.
23

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: So, I'll just
25 make this final point, and then—and then we're—we're

1
2 going to ask if there's a question. I mean, of
3 course, we have to respect McKinney-Vento and, of
4 course, we want to enable students to stay in their
5 schools, but not to also see it in the broader
6 context of segregation. We are violating for housing
7 laws here, the reason why we want to have a
8 conversation about fair share in shelter siting, and
9 the reason why we're trying to push so hard to think
10 about school integration is that if we only focus on
11 this set of issues, and continue to concentrate, the
12 lowest income students overwhelmingly and in small
13 number of schools, no amount of additional money on
14 school supports is going to help those schools
15 succeed. So, I mean I appreciate all of this work,
16 and the obligations, but this—the dots need to be
17 connected to—to our school integration work, and to a
18 fair share approach to shelter siting because going
19 down a path where we just continue to concentrate the
20 lowest income students in the same schools is not a
21 path to success.

22 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: We certainly
23 agree that the location of housing, the location of
24 affordable housing, the location of shelters is a

1
2 very strong influence on how can we develop diverse
3 schools.

4 JOSLYN CARTER: I wanted to add to that.
5 I think the Mayor's plan that we put forth early this
6 year that's really boosts (sic) for community as a
7 guiding principle, really working this 17-year-old
8 use of clusters that started under the Giuliani
9 Administration as well as the use of emergency hotels
10 as before, you know, a decade long practice that
11 started off and on during Lindsay, and so, our-our
12 plan is to really have families remain in their
13 communities of origin where they will be closer to
14 anchors of life be it school or, you know, religious
15 support, and family because we know that it's better
16 for families, and this is not something that's
17 happening, it's a five-year plan. So, we have a plan
18 to do that. We already made some progress on-in this
19 plan. We've closed over 1,000 cluster units, almost
20 30%. We have sited with open shelters that have been
21 able to have children remain or which goes to school
22 of their community where they originated, and so,
23 we're driving towards that. And I think it's been a
24 haphazard, you know, multi-year system where this has
25 been several years, and it's not-it's not going to

1
2 happen overnight, but that's what we're driving
3 towards, an alternative site plan. [pause]

4 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: [off mic] I don't
5 want—I don't [on mic] speak to those times, but I
6 guess now I just have to push it. I really
7 appreciate all of that, and I think we are not paying
8 attention to the segregating on poverty concentrating
9 consequences of the actions that we are taking, and I
10 appreciate that on an individual it's family-by-
11 family basis, that seems right, but we haven't taken
12 a step back, and said what's the consequence of-of
13 doubling down on segregation and poverty
14 concentration? And I'm—I'm just asking that we find
15 some, and then, you know, I appreciate that it's an
16 exhausting job to serve the families that we have and
17 it's necessary and you're doing a lot of work to do
18 it, but inasmuch as we're also having the
19 conversation about shelter siting and also having a
20 conversation about school integration, we need to
21 find some ways to take a step back and see what the
22 consequences of the programs together also. Thank
23 you.

24 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Thank you, Council
25 Member Lander. So, I have a few questions and then

1
2 I'll—I'll turn it over to my colleagues.
3 Unfortunately, I have to run across the street to
4 take a vote as do the members, the members of the
5 committees, but I'll be back very soon. So, the
6 first thing I wanted to ask about according to the
7 MMR, as-as you referenced in the testimony, the
8 percentage of children, families that are placed
9 according to their—their youngest children's school
10 so within that borough of the—of the youngest
11 children's school, I just want to make this clear
12 what the data is from FY13 through FY17. FY13,
13 70.5%; FY14, 65.4%; FY15, 52.9%; FY16, 51.8%; FY17,
14 50.4%. This is with the objective of reaching 85%.
15 I read that and I see an ever deteriorating
16 situation, and the fact of the matter is, and I
17 appreciate the testimony, and I appreciate the
18 capacity concerns within the system. I know there
19 are capacity concerns within the system. I know that
20 any given day we're probably at 99% of our capacity
21 within the family shelter system. But the fact of
22 the matter is that in FY13 and FY14, we were also at
23 capacity within the system. The system expands and
24 contracts with the need, and so, you know, we didn't
25 have an extra 10% capacity within the system back in

1
2 2013 and 2014, but we were able to meet not our
3 objective, which is 85%, but we were able to be much
4 closer. Now, I appreciate also that that
5 deterioration has slowed down over the last two
6 years, but I guess my question is have we really done
7 an examination beyond just capacity, and capacity is
8 obviously a major component, but do—have we examined
9 what other factors contributed to that deterioration?
10 Is there—I mean, you know, obviously it's a very
11 complicated system. It's a very complicated system.
12 You can't just be moving. I mean we'll get to the
13 issue of—of moving people around, and uprooting
14 people's lives, and that's another question, but in
15 terms of the original placement, and this has to do
16 with—with how we're getting families into their
17 initial placement beyond the—beyond the conditional
18 placement. Have we done an examination of why that
19 happens?

20 JOSLYN CARTER: So, let me take a step
21 back. When families are being placed in in a
22 conditional setting, and we know you talked about it,
23 and I think you hit the nail right on the head,
24 capacity drives this. So, at any given moment, and
25 at any given time, and my last position was a PATH.

1
2 So, I'm very in—you know, intimately aware of what
3 happens in trying to find placements for the families
4 as they're in the building. And so, it really is—the
5 bottom line is capacity. We do work with DOE, and we
6 talked about the bussing and making sure that
7 families can get to school with it, and we also offer
8 educational transfers, right. So, there's that
9 opportunity for families to be transferred closer,
10 but capacity is what it is. And so, for us, you
11 know, and I walk in that building, there's so many
12 families that are waiting to be placed, and
13 availability of units are not there. So that, is
14 what it is.

15 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: But why, you know,
16 back in—in FY13 and FY14, we were able to—it's 20%
17 difference from today. There was still—there was a
18 capacity problem back then.

19 JOSLYN CARTER: The numbers of homeless
20 families increase. It has increased so dramatically
21 for us. Like the families are coming every—when
22 families get to us, everything else has failed, for
23 the safety of the safety net. So, by the time they
24 get to us, everything has failed. Families having—in
25 coming into shelter has increased. It's now 70% of

1
2 who the face of homeless is. It really is for us and
3 for all of us an affordability crisis. So, families
4 cannot afford—34% are working—can't afford, you know,
5 to make ends meet and to pay rent. So, they're
6 coming to shelter.

7 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: I appreciate all of
8 that but I--

9 JOSLYN CARTER: [interposing] Are at
10 capacity for us.

11 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: --I mean I've—I've
12 been on this committee since 2010. That increase--
13 that dramatic increase started in '11 when we saw--

14 JOSLYN CARTER: [interposing] When an
15 agenda.

16 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: --an agenda.

17 JOSLYN CARTER: Right.

18 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: And—and so there's—I-
19 I'm just—it—obviously there was—there was a three-
20 year period where we saw precipitous decline,
21 precipitous decline. One year it's at 70 and the
22 next year it was at—the next year it was at 65, the
23 next it's at 52, and that's a—and then—and then it-
24 and then it stabilized, but there's a-- I mean, it
25 stabilized at the—at the low--

1
2 JOSLYN CARTER: [interposing] The low
3 level.

4 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: --the low level, and
5 so--

6 JOSLYN CARTER: [interposing] Yes.

7 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: --you know, it--I'm
8 wondering--there's--I'm wondering have you--have you
9 engaged with system analysts, folks that are able to
10 harness technologies that are able to figure out just
11 broader system issues about how placement allocations
12 are happening. I mean obviously, there's a capacity
13 problem, but, you know, that is so dramatically off
14 base, and--and it--and I--I mean I appreciate that the
15 Mayor has a long-term plan. Every month that goes by
16 where 50% of the children entering shelter are not
17 placed in their home borough, and are, therefore,
18 forced into all types of traumatic life situations.
19 Every month that goes by is--there's an injustice
20 done, and so I appreciate a long term, we got it, you
21 know, it's great for like expanding capacity, and
22 good, okay, but--but are there any other-- Have we--
23 have we engaged outside analytic firms. I mean
24 normally I'm not like all, you know, looking for an
25 answer for it. We're not merely asking for

1
2 consultants to be hired, but I mean for something
3 like this where we're trying to—to address this, as a
4 serious problem. Is there any—I mean have we gotten
5 outside advice? Any—anybody that's outside of the
6 DHS world to say how can we take another look at this
7 from a different angle?

8 JOSLYN CARTER: [interposing] Council
9 Member, we could—we could talk about other options
10 offline, but for us and looking at of being plenty of
11 spaces, as families are in that building, it is
12 capacity that we receive. We could talk offline
13 about other options, but to look at the helpers to
14 say that because I think that as families come into
15 us, it is our responsibility to provide places that
16 are really looking at appropriate placement for
17 families. Our 90-day review talked about how we
18 should really think about making placements, and
19 during that time recommendations were made, and so we
20 are implementing our training (sic) to try to find
21 out. So, that's a long-term view. I appreciate you
22 searching this out. (sic)

23 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: [interposing] Is
24 there a short-term strategy, and won't that number
25 increase?

1
2 JOSLYN CARTER: At this point it's
3 capacity and I think we can talk off line about the
4 long term.

5 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: [interposing] That's
6 a long-term strategy. There's got to also be a
7 short-term term strategy. I mean I will say this and
8 you can agree or disagree, but 50% unacceptable.
9 Just unacceptable.

10 JOSLYN CARTER: And I would agree with
11 you--

12 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: [interposing] Did any
13 of the-

14 JOSLYN CARTER: [interposing] And I--and
15 I, you know, it's an affordability crisis in New York
16 City. I absolute agree with you. I mean I'm not
17 being argumentative, but it is an affordability
18 crisis, the families by the time they get to us.

19 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: I mean, I will say
20 this, I just got done working, just wrapping up
21 working with a family that's in the shelter system.
22 One year, they've been in the shelter for a year. A
23 year it took to get-to get out of the shelter system,
24 and that's--that's ahead of the curve, and that's with
25 active intervention, active, active intervention.

2 And so, that's also part of the question is how do we
3 get—I mean on the back end, how are we getting
4 families through the system. There were a lot of
5 problems within the system that contributed to that
6 being a year. That could have been six months in my
7 opinion.

8 JOSLYN CARTER: And I respect that. I
9 think there's also the reality of available housing
10 stock, right the reality that's posed there.

11 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: [interposing] Yeah,
12 but I—I couldn't—I—I, you know, I was very intimately
13 involved in this case, and that year could have been
14 six months. Have—have you all read the IBO Report
15 from last fall? Has everybody read that IBO Report?

16 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Yes.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: It is 50 to 58 pages
18 or— I encourage you all to, if you've read it
19 already, it's 50—50 pages. I encourage you all if
20 you haven't read it, to read it. If you have read
21 it, I encourage you to re-read it. One thing that it
22 does, and this is, you know, IBO has rigorous
23 standards of—of how they analyze and accumulate and
24 analyze their data. They interview people. They did
25 100 interviews with—with—with teachers, and with

1 principals, and with families in shelter, and they
2 identified a lot of issues based on interviews with
3 people. Do you guys do interviews with people?

4 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: We actually
5 collaborated and the author is sitting in the room.

6 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Okay.

7 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, we were very
8 involved in this process and supportive of this—of
9 this research.

10 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: So, there was a lot
11 of recommendations out of that. There's a
12 significant issue around—and so, we can go through
13 them, but I mean have you—have you—have you pointed
14 all of the issues identified in that report and said
15 okay, this is our strategy for addressing this issue
16 as identified, and there's probably 25 or 30 real
17 issues that are—are not just, you know, issues that
18 are un-addressable. They're not just—they're not
19 insurmountable issues. They're issues around
20 operation. Have you—have you—I mean this requires
21 that obviously it requires a collaboration between
22 DHS and DOE. Have you—have you set up, you know, you
23 could set up a small task force between the agencies
24
25

1
2 to say, okay, this is how we're going to address the
3 25 issues identified in the IBO report.

4 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: We have staff
5 from both DHS and DOE who meet together and talk
6 together daily, and have regular meetings together to
7 work on what are the areas where we can better
8 collaborate. How do we make our data match more
9 proper—a smoother process. I'm seeing some head
10 nodding in the room. [laughter] So, we are working
11 hard at getting to collaborating together to try to
12 address issues as they come up.

13 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Okay. So, like for
14 example, shelter policies and environment can present
15 obstacles to schooling? Is that something that—that
16 is—is there a strategy for—for how certain shelter
17 policies, whether it's room inspections in the
18 morning and things like that. Are there directives.
19 One thing that they identified is that often times
20 parents are required to be home for their room
21 inspection. You know, there's a—a quote that I—it
22 says that, you know, they got a—they've got to get
23 breakfast ready. They have to do everything that's
24 required in the morning, wiping bums, you know,
25 everything that's required of a parent in the morning

3 and--and there's, you know, they have to sit around
4 and wait for a room inspection to happen. I know
5 we've certified--

6 JOSLYN CARTER: So--so--Council--Council
7 Member, I'm--I'm not familiar with the report and I
8 would have to read it and spend some time talking
9 with my colleagues about it. So, I'm not prepared to
10 talk about it to you.

11 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Okay, you have to get
12 every--you have to leave everything neat and tidy, but
13 the amount of time that they give us to get up, to
14 get children ready for school, to make breakfast, to
15 wipe bums and to leave the place clean is not enough.
16 Said a parent for--the focus group said to remain
17 behind. (sic) I mean, there's an issue of--that was
18 identified of parents having to be home when they're
19 supposed to be taking their children to school.

20 JOSLYN CARTER: So, in--in general. I
21 think we should take a step back and I could give you
22 a little bit of shelter, you know, really how
23 shelters should operate. I'm not so sure about this
24 report and what was said, but one of the things that
25 for us families need to be assessed individually, you
know, families need to get their children to school,

1 families need to get to work. We are providing those
2 opportunities. We're not saying, you know, so I
3 would have to read that report and see what's being
4 reported there, and then figure out, but our plan
5 again, and returning back to what we are doing is
6 looking at families as individuals. We don't want to
7 check boxes. We want to make sure that we're
8 assessing the needs of every family that comes to us,
9 and that we meet those needs in a way that's
10 dignified for those families, and their needs are
11 met, right. So, part of the work that we are doing
12 is driving towards that. So, it's not, you know, I'm
13 checking a box, but you said in your opening these
14 are humans, right. So, when I walked into PATH on
15 that first day, I imagined coming to PATH with my
16 son, and how that would be for me and for him, and so
17 part of the work I did at PATH was to really make
18 changes, and making sure that they're identified with
19 families—that these are families, and that the
20 workers get their needs met so that there could be a
21 mutual understanding between both of them. So,
22 sitting in this role for the last few months that's
23 part of what I'm going to drive towards. So, that,
24 you know, results like this that you are referencing
25

1
2 that I haven't read we can work towards making sure
3 we mitigate those, of course, correct. So, you know,
4 just something as simple as opening a child wait
5 space a PATH when I was there because you wanted
6 children to have opportunities to be children. So,
7 making sure that needs are met for families as they
8 come through the doors whether it's an intake of a
9 shelter, what I want to drive towards. And so, I
10 would love to. I'm going to read that report and
11 then talk with our colleagues about what it entails,
12 but I'm not prepared to kind of ask specifics around
13 that to day at this time.

14 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: A lot of my questions
15 have to do with recommendations out of the report of
16 issues identified out of the report. With Metro
17 Cards--

18 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Uh-hm.

19 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: -we heard that part
20 of the-one of the issues is that Metro Cards are
21 issued on a-on a weekly basis. So, they're weekly
22 Metro Cards. They're not monthly Metro Cards? Is
23 that right?

24 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, parent Metro
25 Cards are weekly Metro Cards.

3 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Uh-hm.

4 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Students receive
5 a semester long Metro Card at their school.

6 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: The parent if they
7 want that Metro Card, and obviously if they're living
8 on public assistance, or-or don't have-don't have a
9 cash case, and are-and are, you know, that is an
10 important part of-of their monthly budgeting, why
11 weekly and not monthly Metro Cards? Because also
12 they have to go to a DOE borough office in order to
13 get that Metro Card. Is that not correct?

14 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: That's not
15 correct. The Family Assistant at the shelter can
16 provide the parent that weekly Metro Card.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Okay. So, they don't
18 have to then go because I think that that was
19 something that identified, buses--

20 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: [interposing]
21 Right.

22 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: --buses, that they
23 were required to down to-to the--

24 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: [interposing] Not
25 correct.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: -- nearby borough
3 office. What if there's not a Family Assistant at
4 the DOE shelter? I mean at the DHS shelter?

5 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, even if
6 there's not a Family Assistant full time at the
7 shelter, they do have--a specific Family Assistant is
8 assigned for each of the shelters, and they make the
9 rounds to ensure that they see their families.

10 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Because those are--
11 those are DOE employees that are assigned to networks
12 that are not necessarily--so there's--there--there--this
13 is the Family Assistants that's going around to
14 various--

15 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Right. So,
16 they'll be going to shelters that are for the most
17 part in the same location, the same general area so
18 that there are multiple shelters in the area. You
19 might have a Family Assistant working across several.

20 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: What about--what about
21 hotels and using hotels?

22 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: We also have
23 Family Assistants who are assigned to cover those
24 commercial hotels.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: What about cluster
3 sites?

4 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: The same thing.
5 We do--

6 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: [interposing] Every--
7 so every--no family has to go down to a borough office
8 in order to get that weekly Metro Card. Okay. So,
9 with the-

10 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: [interposing]
11 So, sometimes DV. Okay, so sometimes DV shelter
12 sites do, and we will look into that and see what we
13 can do to mix that.

14 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Right. That
15 shouldn't be happening obviously with all the other
16 issues that families in the DV shelter are dealing
17 with.

18 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: I agree with
19 you.

20 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: It's one thing that
21 makes no sense.

22 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Completely
23 agree.

24 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Back to the issue of
25 conditional placements. I just want to be--just to

1
2 make it clear on the record, you know, how long does
3 it take to-to establish a-a bus protocol for a
4 family?

5 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Right. So, it
6 can take between 7 and 10 days.

7 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Okay.

8 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Now, if there is
9 already a bus route-let's remember there are-we
10 currently have 500 different bus stops at shelters--

11 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Okay.

12 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: --that are
13 currently going to. Actually, it's well over a
14 thousand schools. So, if it happens that a student
15 is assigned to a shelter where we already have a bus
16 route that's going close by to that student's school,
17 it will take shorter. We still do need, depending on
18 the type of bus, we may still need to contact all of
19 the different people or stops along the way to let
20 them know that there's a change to the route, and
21 their pickup time may change, and that's part of our
22 overall process.

23 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: I-I concur. I think
24 it takes organizational genius to make bus-the bus
25 system work in New York City, and this is a very

1
2 complicated issue, but one thing I want to point out
3 is that conditional placements are not 10 days.
4 They're 30 or 40 days. So, even though they're
5 supposed to be ten days, in reality, they're actually
6 much longer, and so I mean that's-that's just the
7 reality on the ground, and so, you know, while there
8 are only supposed to be 7 to 10 days, they're
9 actually much longer. So, I don't, you know, that's
10 -I would say it's a complicated operational endeavor,
11 but it's not that those two times are not-are not co-
12 you know, when you spend all. (sic)

13 JOSLYN CARTER: So, Council Member, the
14 process to apply for shelter on average this
15 determination is made within 10. The 30 or 40 days
16 that you talk about are outliers. So, the process
17 that we have in place averages 10 days.

18 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: In my experience.

19 [laughter]

20 JOSLYN CARTER: I got it.

21 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: How-what is the
22 process for being-for having a transfer for
23 educational hardships. So, for example families
24 placed, they're not in their home borough. They have
25 the on in two chance of not being placed in their

1
2 home borough. What is—how—how many parents try to
3 get a transfer to their home borough, and—and what is
4 the process for them to do that, and is it—is it a
5 streamlined process?

6 JOSLYN CARTER: Families in shelter make
7 a request to be transferred to the shelter staff, and
8 that's going into the CARES, the DHS CARE system of
9 record. Our staff on our end at DHS headquarters at
10 32 Beaver approves a transfer, and then they go into
11 a queue. So, again, I know I talked about capacity,
12 and so they're—they're put in priority because we
13 have such little spears slots, But when there is an
14 immediate emergency need, families are transferred
15 based on what their needs are. Education is one of
16 them. Medical is one of them. So, it really depends
17 on what the need is of that family. It—the request
18 is streamlined from shelter staff into the CARE
19 system of record. The staff makes the approval and
20 it goes to a unit and it searches for the placement.
21 We have made some strides in this past year in making
22 sure that we're tracking that. So that, we have the
23 opportunity to see who's up next in—in—in a—in a way
24 that's less—less haphazard. So that we have systems
25 to know who needs to be transferred, and so that's

1 something that we're working on, have worked on to
2 make improvements to.
3

4 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: One that the-the
5 report shows is that there are 25% of children in
6 shelter are at two or more schools during the course
7 of the school year, and that's, you know, that's a
8 very high number. What-what accounts for that and
9 what is-what are-what is DOE engage us doing to-to
10 really address multiple transfers of the course of a
11 year? [pause]

12 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Well, what's
13 likely the primary driver there are families who are
14 choosing to change from their school or origin to a
15 different school or school closer to their shelter.

16 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: But then is that-that
17 is an additional transfer. That's two transfers.

18 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, what I don't
19 know or what-what we don't know from the data you're
20 providing is whether they then change shelter
21 location or moved from conditional to permanent or
22 conditional to a shelter and then from shelter to
23 permanent, and each of those transitions for the
24 family may result in their choosing to transfer their
25 child.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: That--so, they are
3 incidents where a child will be in a school just
4 during conditional placement? So for that ten days
5 that, that 30 days or 40 days they're--they're in a
6 separate school because--

7 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: It's possible.

8 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: --because they're
9 there for conditional placement?

10 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: It's possible.

11 We, you know, that again, is a family's choice
12 whether they choose to continue at the school of
13 origin. Obviously, we have made the choice to
14 provide yellow bus service for the youngest children
15 in order to help support families who choose to
16 remain in the school of origin, and that that is the
17 goal of the transportation both to improve
18 attendance, to reduce absenteeism, but also to
19 support a family remaining in that school of origin.

20 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: [off mic] I think
21 that that is--[on mic] I just have one other question,
22 and I'm going to turn it over to Council Member
23 Barron. This issue of absenteeism, the IBO Report
24 also identifies that children in shelter across the--
25 across grade levels have an average of a 10% lower

3 attendance rate, or attendance rate or a higher
4 absentee rate than--than--than housed, permanently
5 housed children.

6 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Uh-hm.

7 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Is that alarming?

8 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Of course, high
9 client absenteeism is alarming and is something that
10 we're deeply concerned about. One of the things that
11 we did last year was we hired some attendance
12 teachers specifically to focus on students in
13 shelter, and to work direct--more directly with large
14 shelters where we saw many students and absentee
15 issues.

16 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: And what is the
17 leading driver of that--of absenteeism then? Whether--
18 whether you heard back, and you report back from--from
19 those attendance issues?

20 LOIS HERRERA: It varies. It really runs
21 the gamut.

22 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: If you can get a
23 little closer to the microphone.

24 LOIS HERRERA: Sorry, the reasons for
25 absenteeism really vary. We're talking about
families in trauma and that also is going to affect

1
2 their daily routines, and being able to get students
3 to school, but we did learn from lessons, and those
4 attendance features that were shelter based last year
5 now are taking a lead in turnkeying the information
6 and lessons learned to other attendance teachers.
7 So, it's gone.

8 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: So, you've—so, you've
9 learned—

10 LOIS HERRERA: We've—we've expanded
11 capacity.

12 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: So an example of a
13 lesson learned. What is—what is—what are some of the
14 lessons that—that we saw from that first year?
15 [background comment]

16 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, we'd like to
17 invite Kathy Polite who is our Executive Director for
18 Students in Temporary Housing to come up and—and
19 address this.

20 KATHY POLITE: Good morning.

21 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Good morning. Good
22 morning. No, I should say afternoon.

23 KATHY POLITE: Is it afternoon already.

24 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: It's 12:02.
25

1
2 KATHY POLITE: So, that means everyone is
3 having a good time, right?

4 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Yes.

5 KATHY POLITE: And I'm past this.
6 [laughs] Yeah, we were able to through the \$10.2
7 million invest in attendance teachers, and they
8 actually went to—they worked in several shelters.
9 Logistically with the staff in shelter that's
10 Department of Education as well as Department of
11 Homeless Services, and student—and what we found is
12 that the attendance teachers tracked the students.
13 That is as students began to move in shelter in
14 Brooklyn, and moved to the Bronx, they also continued
15 work with the family. And so because we know that
16 children and families are experiencing a high degree
17 of trauma in shelter, having that continuity was a
18 big help. So, our—our lesson learned, one of the
19 major lessons was the continuity so that our
20 attendance teachers make contact now with I moved out
21 of Shelter A in Brooklyn moving into—to the Bronx.
22 The attendance teacher that's overseeing or has
23 responsibility for the shelter in Brooklyn makes
24 contact with the attendance teacher and other school
25 personnel. Bridging the Gap also having the social

1 workers here have—has been an integral part. So, the
2 attendance teachers worked extremely close with the
3 Bridging the Gap folks who work it as well. Actually
4 going into the shelters, meeting families, conducting
5 workshops, helping families to overcome the barriers
6 that prevent them from attending school. Once, of
7 course, the immediate challenge at hand is, is dealt
8 with.
9

10 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Right.

11 JOSLYN CARTER: And so, I would also add
12 a daily feed that was developed, right. So, rather
13 than having monthly information about attendance, we
14 have it daily. And so, we are able in collaboration
15 with the Family Assistants workers and the Attendance
16 Teachers the Shelter Caseworkers are also monitoring
17 and ensuring that children leave for school or
18 parents report that they leave for school, and so
19 maybe you get the daily feed that says yes, Justin
20 Carter attended school this day. So, that has been
21 able—has helped us to really track what's happening
22 in real time rather than in a moth's time.

23 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Okay. So, then you
24 believe then than that through these efforts we will
25 see that number—that—that gap closed or continuing to

1
2 close? I mean is that something that is—that is a—an
3 achievable objective—

4 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So.

5 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: --with the tools that
6 we have today?

7 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: We are beginning
8 to see small improvements. We are seeing an
9 improvement, a small improvement in the chronic
10 absenteeism rate for students in shelter where we are
11 slowly but steadily closing the gap against the
12 citywide chronic absenteeism rate. We are seeing
13 closing the gap in the high school graduation rate
14 for students who lived in shelter. So, we—we do
15 believe there is an enormous amount of work still to
16 be done. We believe that this is an--still--an acute
17 set of issues of students who need to support, but we
18 are beginning to see small signs that the efforts
19 that we've been putting in over the past couple of
20 years are beginning to have an impact.

21 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Council Member
22 Barron.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you—thank
24 you to the Chairs, and to the pane that's here. I
25 just have a few questions. The McKinney-Vento Act

1
2 requires or the Department of Education requires that
3 poster be in every school.

4 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Uh-hm.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I don't see them.

6 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: If there are
7 schools where you are not seeing that poster, please
8 let us know.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Secondly, the
10 McKinney-Vento Act provides for \$100 for each
11 student. I believe that's a minimum of \$100.

12 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, it requires
13 a set-aside from our Title 1 funding to a school of
14 \$100 specifically to address issues related to the
15 homelessness to-to provide additional services for
16 these students. They are still receiving and-and
17 clearly a student who is homeless, a student who is
18 in a shelter is also a Title 1 eligible child. They
19 are receiving full title. The school is receiving
20 full Title 1 funding to provide all of the other
21 range of Title 1 services. A portion of that is
22 required to be set aside.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, is this an
24 additional \$100. That's not guessing?

1
2 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: No, it's part of
3 their Title 1 allocation.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So it's not
5 additional. They would have gotten this money
6 anyway, but now out of the money that they're
7 getting, they have to pull \$100 for the student who
8 is temporary housing?

9 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: For a school
10 that is--

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] Is
12 that--is that accurate?

13 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: For a school
14 that is as a school a Title 1 school--

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing]
16 Yes.

17 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: --it--that is
18 accurate. For a school that is not a Title 1
19 eligible school that has students who are homeless,
20 they do receive an income every--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] So,
22 this school now is being doubly penalized. They're
23 entitled to it as-- I don't know if somebody can
24 fix this mic. I've got a lot of feedback here.
25 You're entitled to this designated amount as a Title

1 school, but now since you have a population of
homeless students, you've got to pull from that Title
1 allocation, and have a set-aside for your dedicate-
for your designated students in temporary shelter.
What additional money does the city put into
allocations for schools that have students who are
living in temporary shelters?

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So--

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] I
understand you have the broad programs, and the
social workers, and other personnel. What additional
money do you give the school, and you know I'm asking
the question because I was a principal--

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Yes

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: --and I know what
the burdens are trying to identify how to give
support--additional support to students who are in
temporary shelters. So, does the--

DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: [interposing]
And that's why we're doing programs like the Bridging
the Gap Program where you--where we are providing a
social worker to help support--

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing]

Good.

1
2 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: --and school
3 supports.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I'm rushing
5 because I have to get over to the other side as well.
6 What academic support, what additional monies can be
7 identified in a school budget that says okay, here is
8 additional money for direct services in an academic
9 capacity because we know that it's the students who
10 are in these temporary shelters that are not
11 proficient in these tests that the DOE loves to use
12 as a measure of academic success--success. So, what
13 additional [coughing] academic direct services can we
14 point to in the budget that assists these students
15 that are so needy and so traumatized?

16 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, the school
17 receives the same academic fair student funding for a
18 student who is low income for all of its students who
19 are--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing] DO
21 you think that's sufficient--

22 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: --well, the
23 goals say (sic).

24
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: --and maybe they
3 don't get additional because they have addition
4 population that has those drastic needs?

5 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: [interposing]
6 The school also receives additional funding for
7 students who are below proficiency so they are also
8 receiving funding for these students because they are
9 below proficiency.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Is that the same
11 as any other school, or is it in addition?

12 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: It's the same as
13 any other student--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing]
15 That's a problem, they're not--

16 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: --who is below
17 proficiency.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right, we're--
19 we're not addressing the additional needs of schools
20 that have student who living in temporary shelters to
21 give them additional. Are they getting the same as
22 what everyone else is getting and, of course, we
23 appreciate the social work and the family liaison,
24 but they're not in my opinion getting the direct
25 academic support that they need to help lift these

1
2 students to be able to address these high stakes
3 tests that the DOE administers, and I have another
4 question. In terms of identifying these students
5 that are perhaps doubling up, what mechanism do you
6 use to identify students? Is it that the family
7 themselves has to report that to you? How do you
8 know? I believe that we don't really have the full
9 picture of students that are living doubled up and
10 even tripled up.

11 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, we do
12 receive that information through families. It is
13 self-reported in the Housing Questionnaire when they
14 enroll in a school, and schools also become aware
15 over the course of the year through conversations
16 with [bell] the family or with the children where
17 that information, if something has changed since the
18 beginning of the year that information may come up.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And finally, in
20 terms of students being entitled to after school
21 programs--

22 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Uh-hm.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: --what provisions
24 are made for students who need transportation there
25 or bussing to be able to participate in after school

1
2 programs yet at the same time get the accommodations
3 to be taken back to where they are living?

4 JOSLYN CARTER: We try to provide the
5 after school programs in schools where they are
6 strategically located near the shelter or near the
7 school so that we actually programming directly in
8 the schools or in the DHS facilities. We also have
9 borough wide programs, and we have been able to for
10 example in Queens the Borough Field Support Center
11 has committed buses and provided a grant in order to
12 transport our students from our shelters because
13 they're not on—they're not being transported normally
14 on a Saturday.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, for the
16 services that are given at the facilities, what—what
17 are the—what's the classification of those who are
18 delivered and are they teachers?

19 JOSLYN CARTER: Yes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Are they
21 certified teachers?

22 JOSLYN CARTER: We have certified
23 teachers. We also have our guidance counselors and
24 indoor social workers. We partner with community
25 based organizations to facilitate the activities.

1
2 LOIS HERRERA: And Council Member, I want
3 to add that in shelter we partner, DHS partners with
4 DYCD to bring the COMPASS after school program to
5 shelters. So, we have that opportunity so with
6 shelters—for some shelters to have that on site for
7 families who are participating.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I want to thank
9 you, but I think that the problem that we're seeing
10 of students of the increase in homelessness and the
11 increase in so many other of our systems is a
12 reflection of the racism that's embedded in all of
13 these government agencies that exists. It's seen in
14 housing. We have the same population of students who
15 are coming from families that in many instances are
16 unemployed or underemployed and until we get to those
17 root causes and until we address it and eradicate it,
18 we're going to continue to see a swelling of these
19 kinds of problems, and what we're doing is only
20 temporary and it's not really connecting the
21 situation so that we can move beyond this. Until we
22 address the issue of creating housing for people who
23 are low income, very low income and extremely low
24 income, and—and numbers that address the situation

1
2 that we're facing, we're going to continue to have
3 this problem. Thank you.

4 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Thank you.

5 LOIS HERRERA: Thank you, Council Member
6 Barron. Let me now go to some follow-up questions
7 that I have. I hope I've announced everybody who's
8 here. [background comment] Council Member Chin, and
9 Council Member Gibson have joined us. Council Member
10 Gibson has questions also, but let me just go to a
11 follow-up on something that Council Member Levin had--
12 had started, which was that when the--when the--when
13 DHS opens a new shelter how is DOE informed? I know
14 that this has been a problem even for elected
15 officials because I had the Pan Am (sic) come into my
16 district and was not informed until the students were
17 on their way, and I'm hearing complaints now from
18 elected officials in Long Island City the same
19 situation occurring. So, how is DOE informed and how
20 are the schools, the local schools informed as well?

21 JOSLYN CARTER: The--DHS informs DOE
22 directly of initial--

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: [interposing] How far
24 out?

25 JOSLYN CARTER: As soon as we know.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, it could be the
3 same day? It could be an hour before or it could be
4 during?

5 JOSLYN CARTER: So, emergency hotels that
6 we're using now yes, it could be the same day.
7 Shelters that we have cited and have opened the
8 families with children facilities that you're
9 actually, the building opening, those notices are out
10 earlier, but emergency that those are really covering
11 the folks who are in the PATH intake at the time
12 they're finding out that they do.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, I'm—I mean I'm
14 not going to get into the whole argument right now
15 about what constitutes an emergency but this
16 continues to remain a problem with elected officials.
17 So, I imagine it's probably a problem with DOE as
18 well. How much funding does New York City receive
19 from the federal government from the implementation
20 of McKinney-Vento for services for homeless students?

21 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, I believe
22 the McKinney-Vento Grant is about \$2.2 million.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Are there other
24 sources of funding for implementation of the
25 McKinney-Vento?

1
2 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, there is.
3 There's also an AIDP Grant, and that provides \$8.7
4 million in funding.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And have there been
6 any changes in federal funding that impact the
7 services DOE provides for homeless students?

8 LOIS HERRERA: The McKinney-Vento is a
9 grant that we get through the state. So, the state
10 gets it from the federal government and over time
11 that has increased somewhat.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Do we expect any
13 changes because of the administration in the
14 Washington now?

15 LOIS HERRERA: No, we don't have a
16 concrete sense of what—what will happen with that.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Uh-hm. According to
18 the School Allocation Memorandum No. 8 Fiscal 18,
19 there are 76,910 STH students in the city. This is
20 an increase since 2017 in which there were 71,992
21 students. This means the number increased by 4,918
22 or approximately 7% in one school year. Given the
23 increase in the number of homeless students in the
24 fiscal year, have you able to maintain the same
25

1
2 service levels of previous years? That's an
3 additional 7% or 4,900 students.

4 LOIS HERRERA: Yes, we believe, in fact,
5 that we have augmented services in the past year even
6 with the increase, the work that's being done through
7 the community schools, the health and mental health
8 work that's being done the Bridging the Gap, the
9 money that we received from the city has really
10 helped us tremendously in expanding the programs and
11 supports we're able to offer.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I'm going to go to
13 District 75 schools. Council Member Barron was
14 talking about Title 1 schools before. District 75
15 schools do not, the way I understand it right now
16 receive any additional Title 1 funding. Does the DOE
17 have any plans to change that or to deal with that or
18 to support District 75 Schools?

19 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Well, District
20 75 Schools are funded to meet the needs of each
21 individual child and their classifications within
22 District 75. So, I—I believe we view the District 75
23 funding as sufficient to meet their students' needs.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Even though there are
3 these additional issues that many of these students
4 will be dealing with?

5 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, many of
6 these issues that the student is addressing will be
7 part of and incorporated into their IEP. So, if a
8 student needs additional counseling for example and
9 so those needs would be funded.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Uh-hm.

11 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: What about like
12 emergency supplies, issues like that for students?

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: It's a very fair
14 question, you know, we—I would expect that District
15 75 schools are able to do many of the same things
16 that we see individual schools doing that students
17 who need supplies are provided supplies. Students
18 who may need a, you know, a clean uniform shirt. We
19 have many of our schools that have set up
20 capabilities for families to do laundry to address
21 their basic—students basic needs. We also have
22 partnerships with Volunteers of America that provide
23 several thousand school supply filled backpacks to
24 students, our field support centers have created
25 wonderful programs for students in shelter, students

1
2 in need to come and get school supplies, boot fairs
3 and other opportunities for these students to receive
4 the materials that they need to be successful.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: This is my second
6 hearing on homeless students in the New York City
7 Department of Education in about a year and a half I
8 believe, and I could tell you probably one of the
9 most shocking things that I heard was from a
10 principal at the previous hearing who told me that
11 she has a washer and dryer in her office to-to meet
12 the needs of these students. That's how desperate
13 these students are and-and how some-some principals
14 are coming up with some solutions, but I just think
15 that drives it home so clearly to me what-what these
16 students needs are. In preparing for this hearing, I
17 was a little bit surprised to hear that only 35
18 children had been identified students in temporary
19 housing in-in pre-school who have pre-school IEPs in
20 New York City. So, how come? Why is that number so
21 low, only 35 students? I would-I would--

22 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Because it's-I'm
23 not familiar with that particular statistic. I'd
24 love to-to meet with you offline and understand where
25 that is.

1
2 LOIS HERRERA: But we have a—we have a
3 whole push in terms of registration and finding
4 preschool placement for students in shelter both the
5 three-year-olds and the four-year-olds, and so we—we
6 know that students—we know which students were coming
7 from shelter that went into the—the pre-K programs.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Are those Pre-K—Pre-K
9 programs generally contracted out with community
10 based organizations or private Pre-K programs?

11 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So Pre-K for all
12 I believe is about 60% are DOE operated schools or
13 facilities and about 40% are community based
14 organizations or what we call NYCEECs, New York City
15 Early Education Centers.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: How do you--?

17 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: [interposing]
18 I'm not—I—yeah, I know it's 60/40. I may have
19 flipped fewer.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: How do you identify
21 those pre-schoolers for being homeless?

22 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Well, so through
23 our Data Match, we are able to identify children who
24 are pre-school age who are in the shelters, and our
25 Office of Student Enrollment has worked very closely

1
2 with the shelter organizations and has done a great
3 amount of training in the shelters to increase parent
4 awareness of the opportunities for their students to
5 increase parent applications to the Pre-K programs,
6 and as I said earlier, we made a Pre-K seat offer to
7 every single student in shelter every four-year-old
8 even if the family did not apply. We also work with
9 the shelters to identify Early Learn opportunities
10 for their younger children because we agree, and
11 believe that that early education is incredibly
12 important.

13 JOSLYN CARTER: And at shelters we're
14 doing lots of work to re-educate parents about the
15 importance of using Pre-K because I think
16 traditionally parents they really don't understand
17 that so we're doing lots of education around that.
18 So, they could help, help to increase the
19 registration for those services.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, let me go now
21 to questions from Council Member Gibson followed by
22 Council Member Chin.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you very
24 much Chair Dromm and Chair Levin. Good afternoon.
25 It's good to see all of you today. I have just a few

1
2 questions. Obviously, there's been a lot talked
3 about today but I do remember when we made the
4 announcement on supporting \$10 million of critical
5 resources and programs for students in temporary
6 housing. So, I represent Bronx County specifically
7 district 9 well-known and familiar with the
8 Chancellor. She's visited District 9 many, many
9 times and will continue to do so. District 9 has a
10 high concentration of students in temporary housing.
11 So, I applaud the efforts of the Department of
12 Education and DHS as well as many other agencies to
13 really figure out how we can address this issue.
14 I've always said, and I will continue to say it that
15 a student's housing status should not determine their
16 academic future, and the fact that so many children
17 particularly children of color and children who have
18 disabilities are living in temporary housing, that
19 shouldn't mean that they are destined to fail in our
20 schools. And so, we really have a great
21 responsibility and this Council obviously wants to
22 support all of the endeavors. So, I have not had an
23 update and I definitely want to talk offline about
24 specifically District 9, and how this initiative is
25 working in D9, but I wanted to ask specifically about

1
2 the—the bus the—the us routes, the social workers,
3 the literacy coaches to really focus on students that
4 are truant and, you know, reducing the absenteeism.
5 All of the workers that you—that we're talking about
6 that were hired by DOE are they physically in these
7 shelters, or are they traveling like everyday talking
8 to clients. How does that work?

9 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Well, first of
10 all, I—I want to recognize and acknowledge Community
11 School District 9 does have the highest number of
12 students living in shelter, and it does the number—
13 highest number of students in shelter who are
14 attending the local district schools. So, you are
15 absolutely right that District 9 is a very high
16 concentration of students in shelter who need
17 support. The social workers that are hired as part
18 of Bridging the Gap they are at schools. So, they
19 are in the school where students are attending. The
20 Family Assistant workers they are in shelters, but
21 they may go from one shelter to another either on a
22 daily basis within the day or over the course of a
23 week depending on their caseload and the needs of the
24 families that they're serving.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay.

1
2 LOIS HERRERA: And the after school
3 reading program, ARC--

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: [interposing] I
5 understand that.

6 LOIS HERRERA: --is shelter based and
7 this is DOE teachers who are going and providing
8 literacy work in the shelters.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay.

10 JOSLYN CARTER: And Council Member
11 Gibson, as part of--as part of New York City Thrive,
12 DHS hired and continued to hire social workers who do
13 work in shelters. We have over 180 and we continue
14 to hire to meet the needs of the families to make
15 sure that they--all their needs that they have are
16 assessed while they're in shelter also.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay. I've also
18 been a part of a few efforts ,and I-I do recall one
19 of my schools in District 9 one of my principals at
20 this school we did a couple of days of awareness
21 where we had our postcards and brochures of
22 information just sharing about the services that we
23 were giving out early morning, and then I also know
24 and she did tell me so I can affirm that that is true
25 that she did have a full-time social workers at her

1
2 school because she has a lot of students that are
3 from the local shelters. So, you know, the reason
4 why, you know, I-I focus on this is because district
5 9 is so high, and that's for a reason, right. All of
6 these issues and societal problems we talk about
7 there's an underlying and root causes of why our
8 children are living in these conditions in the first
9 place. And so we want to make sure that as we have
10 these conversations and we're implementing all of
11 these measures, they're actually showing success and
12 they're working. Every case is different, and I've
13 learned that in my own work in the office. I-I also
14 wanted to ask specifically because I've had several
15 cases come to my office with students that are facing
16 high absenteeism. What is the time frame that the
17 department identifies a student that is absent too
18 long? Like how long do we wait before something is
19 triggered to say that there's something wrong in the
20 student's life and we have to do more? What's the
21 time frame? [background comment]

22 LOIS HERRERA: Yeah, actually we just
23 revised our regulation that has to do with the
24 tenants. It's A-210 and at the same time, we revised
25 the regulation that has to do with child abuse and

1
2 neglect prevention, which A-750. These were revised
3 a few weeks ago approved by PEP [bell] and they
4 address the tenant's policies but every school is
5 required to make outreach on the very first day that
6 a child is absent. That's NA-210 and we have
7 strengthened the requirements and I think made more
8 clear-clarified the obligations of the school in
9 terms of informing parents when their students aren't
10 in school, and trying to ascertain why the students
11 are-are missing school, and in the case of our-our
12 students in temporary housing, we have an extra
13 obligation to remove barriers. That's part of
14 McKinney-Vento. So, it all ties in. We don't,
15 however, have a magical cutoff number that at which
16 point that we say this absolutely is educational
17 neglect. It has more to do with what we're hearing
18 from the parent or not hearing from the parent that
19 would trigger a call to the State Central Register if
20 we think that education-educational neglect is
21 transpiring.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay, and Chair
23 if you'll indulge me I just have one final question
24 on interagency collaboration because many of our
25 students face a multitude of challenges in their home

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

and their community in addition to DHS and HRA and DOE, and ACS. I also have students that come from violent homes where their Mayor's Office to Combat DV and the Family Justice Center is involved. Immigration obviously is a big issue. So, whose responsibility is it to ensure that there an actual collaboration so we are having the same conversation and we're not running families through bureaucratic red tape where they have to satisfy DOE's requirement, then ACS, then DHS. I mean it's a multitude of things, and families get very frustrated. So, how are making it easier for them in terms of interagency collaboration on families that are in shelters that have a multitude of challenges? Whose responsibility is that?

JOSLYN CARTER: I think it's all of us.

I think within the past year we have really made strides to collaborate with our partners in DOE and ACS and so we do have memorandums of understanding so that we're sharing data so that if a family is ACS involved and we are aware from self-report and from clearances, but also being able to talk about what needs—what the family needs are, and so that we're not saying that you have to be here when a family has

1
2 other appointments. So, that we're doing
3 streamlining together. I think it's important for us
4 to really recognize that it's time that by the time
5 the families come to us, you know so many things has
6 failed and our work is to be able to bridge that gap,
7 to make sure that, you know, we're looking at
8 individual approaches at every family, and so we're
9 doing that. Every person here is right. So, our
10 partners at DOE, our partners through HRA, our
11 partners at ACS we're working together. We have
12 weekly meetings. You know, we're trying to mitigate
13 and we really look at what's happening and to rectify
14 and course correct when necessary. There are times
15 when, you know, everything does go right that we work
16 to make sure that we course correct of information
17 sharing happens, and I think when we work in
18 isolation, that's what cause families to be pulled in
19 different directions. So, we have really worked to
20 eliminate—eliminate that, and we have several
21 standing committees that work together.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay, thank you.
23 Thank you Chairs.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Council
25 Member Margaret Chin.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Chairs.

As the Chair mentioned, we had another hearing recently about homeless students, and I was surprised to find out that some of my schools in District 2 and District 1 had a large number of homeless students.

So, I want to make sure that we can get updates on the school, and to make sure that they are getting the extra support and for social worker or the Family Assistants to make sure that these students are taken care of. I had a family shelter that was closed down. So, I don't know if that had any effect on the numbers of homeless students in our—in our schools.

I mean most likely they want to be back in the neighborhood with their families, and—and friends so they still travel back. So, if I can get updates online in terms of those students, the homeless students in my district. The other question I have also is also related to the interagency because a lot of the homeless families that I—my office come in contact with oftentimes are a family who got burned out of their homes or were vacated. So, and they end up in the shelter. A lot of them, you know, they don't want to be in the shelter because of the language issues or they just don't know how to

1
2 navigate the system. They'd rather just double up
3 and--and wait for the--the landlord to fix the
4 apartment, and that's how something I wanted to ask
5 is like are there any coordination with HPD to really
6 try to expedite some of these repair issues so that
7 the family move back home and often times it takes a
8 long time. It takes more than year for a family to
9 be able to move back. So, in terms of you
10 interagency's coordination have you worked with HPD?

11 JOSLYN CARTER: DHS worked with HPD on a
12 variety of topics. For us it's really about housing.
13 When the families arrive at--in our family shelters.
14 It is a different system than the emergency shelters
15 that HPD runs, and so we on our end they're working
16 with HPD in terms of trying to help us to find
17 affordable housing for families to exit. So, I can't
18 really speak to the HPD system, emergency system that
19 they have.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: So, you're--you're
21 telling me that HPD has their own--

22 JOSLYN CARTER: [interposing] The
23 families that are burnt out--

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: [interposing] Yes

25 JOSLYN CARTER: --are not managed by DHS.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: But there-so
3 there's no-no coordination at all?

4 JOSLYN CARTER: By the time-if they come
5 to us, alright, so I'm not doing any work upfront,
6 upstream with HPD. We're not. We're working on the
7 families that come to the DHS store to look at can-is
8 this the right place for them. Can we prevent them
9 from coming into shelter? Can we mediate whatever
10 there issue are? Can we provide supports to the
11 family so they don't have to enter shelter? Can we
12 provide rental assistance at the front door so they
13 don't enter shelter? Those are the families that
14 we're serving in DHS. If they're not able to be
15 diverted and to enter the DHS system our work is to
16 help to exit families into-into permanent housing.
17 We also go upstream with families who through our
18 home base, HRA Home Base Program with legal services
19 to prevent the families from being evicted. So, we
20 do that work upfront and when they come to our doors
21 we're trying to mediate with the Department Homeless
22 Services. The HPD shelter system I can't speak to.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Does DOE take care
24 of these families or children?

1
2 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So we certainly
3 take care of the children. Again, we are not in. We
4 don't have a data feed with HPD, but we do support
5 the children whether they continue at their school of
6 origin or whether they transfer to a school near
7 wherever they may be staying. We absolutely support
8 the children.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: So, once they
10 register to the school or they go back to the school
11 I guess if the school finds out that the student is
12 now living in a shelter--

13 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: [interposing]
14 Correct.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: --they report it
16 directly to DOE.

17 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Correct.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Now--

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: But Councilman Chin,
20 too, this is a question that I had raised earlier in
21 the--in the hearing that is of major concern to me is
22 that I see a lack of coordination with the HPD and
23 the DYCD shelters, and that's something that I would
24 like to look at a little bit further with Department
25 of Education as well. So, thank you for reiterating

1
2 circumstances and-and incidents that you've seen in
3 your district as well.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yeah, because often
5 times a lot of the family, I think, you know, because
6 they understand that living in shelter is going to be
7 so difficult if they can find a place, you know with
8 friends or family they would do that, and often times
9 they don't get the support. So, I think that we need
10 to-HRA to really look at how do we help this family?
11 Even though they're doubling up, at least they have a
12 roof over their head, and it is a way to provide some
13 assistance in terms of rental assistance that they
14 could legally utilize to be able to stay. I think
15 that will make a big difference with these students
16 and families who are doubling up and tripling up.

17 JOSLYN CARTER: And I'll tell you about
18 our Home Base programs through HRA. So, Home Base
19 provides services to families who are doubled up, and
20 so if a family does call 311, and they can really
21 assess the family's need, they can also get rental
22 assistance without having to come into shelter for
23 some of those families. So, that's also an
24 opportunity for families who are doubled up.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: We—we're going to
3 follow up on that.

4 JOSLYN CARTER: Absolutely.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Chair, can I just
6 ask one last question. It comes to coordination.
7 It's—what I find so difficult is that, you know, when
8 constituents that end up in the shelter system
9 whether they're families or their seniors and they're
10 lucky enough to get a voucher, a Link voucher or
11 whatever voucher they got, can't find housing. It
12 comes back to my office everyday. You know,
13 especially seniors. Like I got a voucher, and they're
14 very happy that they got a voucher and the voucher is
15 like \$1,280. Can't find an apartment. Can't find
16 anything for them. So, I think that if HRA with the
17 interagency, there's got to be a way of helping
18 people find apartments. Maybe working together with
19 real estate companies, and realtors. I kind of make
20 a concerted effort because yeah, a family gets the
21 voucher but then six months later, they still can't
22 find a place to live.

23 JOSLYN CARTER: And I'll tell you guys
24 yes we do have housing specialists and we do work
25 with brokers. What we do have now as part of HRA is

1
2 a source of Income Discrimination Unit, right because
3 we do know that there are landlords who do not want
4 to rent to those who have any subsidies, and so we do
5 have that. If people are finding that landlords are
6 saying no subsidy. They don't want to rent to them,
7 the Source of Income Unit, Source of Income Unit can
8 help, right, because just having a lawyer call some
9 of those landlords do make a difference, and families
10 and individuals are able to exit shelter. And so, we
11 can talk offline about that, too.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: That's—that's
13 great. I didn't know that. That helps, but I think
14 that we need to have a concerted effort to really
15 work with some good people, good hearty people who
16 might be in real estate to really help identify, you
17 know, homes. Maybe some of them could be sharing an
18 apartment. I mean young people do that. They pay
19 high rent and they share. They have a roommate,
20 family mates. I mean I don't know. I mean there's
21 got to be a concerted effort to really help people.
22 Now that we have resource to help them pay the rent,
23 we've got to help them find a place to live.

24 JOSLYN CARTER: Agreed.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yes.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

JOSLYN CARTER: Talk with you.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Than you very much,
Council Member Chin. So, just a few more questions.
The first question. So, we passed a bill earlier
this year that required ACS to empanel a foster care
task force, and it's a discreet task force. In other
words, it has a certain number of meetings, and at
the end of it, it's tasked with producing a report.
I have attended. I sponsored the bill that created
and I've attended it, in it's—in it's—it's meeting
(sic) thus far. It's been very successful. There's
been representatives from the Department of
Education, Ursula Ramirez has been there. DHS
obviously, Commissioner Banks, and I believe you've
there.

JOSLYN CARTER: We're going to go as well
as my new role.

CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Yes

JOSLYN CARTER: Yes, I've been there.

CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: And—and it's been
really good. It's been really good. Collaborative
and one of the things I've been most impressed by is
that ACS has kind of let the issues determine the

1
2 agenda, and we've broken out into-into subgroups and
3 it's been-and each group is producing
4 recommendations. Would-would you guys be open to
5 doing a similar type task force on the issue of
6 students in temporary housing?

7 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: We are always
8 open to dialogue on how we can better serve students.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Okay, but a structure
10 like that where it's, you know, a discrete number of
11 meetings, it's somewhat intensive. It-they hired a
12 facilitator to-to kind of manage the whole thing and,
13 you know, it's producing recommendations that-that
14 might-might end up being a challenge to implement,
15 but are, you know, that's part of the conversation
16 is-is how, you know, the implement ability of it, but
17 there are issues that are brought up that weren't
18 even on the radar before so-

19 JOSLYN CARTER: So, absolutely, we'll
20 take under consideration, and we'll-

21 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Okay. I'd like to
22 work with you guys on that. I don't want to have to
23 do a bill about it.

24 JOSLYN CARTER: I hear you.

25 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Okay. [laughter]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Just a couple more questions, with-with regard to DOE staff at PATH, one thing that we've seen is that not every family coming in has-actually sees that staff, and I know that there's only the two staff members now, and there staff members, but the third one hasn't actually started there. Anyway, it-what percentage of-of families are actually seeing that DOE staff as they come in with-with school age children? Do we know the-do we know the data on that?

JOSLYN CARTER: I actually do not know the data on that, but what we did do at PATH, you rearrange where the DOE staff sits. Prior to last year, when I got there, I got there a couple of years ago, they were on the fifth floor. I mean, you know, you've been to PATH, you know the process, right? So, families come down, and so now we have the DOE staff on the lower level. Their families are waiting. So, the opportunity for every family that comes through the door, who has come through their interviews and have met with all of the-the stakeholders there, the DOE then sees it at the back end when they're waiting. So, it's not where, you know, they're-they-they're going through having to

1 give it through your housing history and really
2 feeling emergency. So, we moved that, and I think
3 that strategically helps and helps us to be able to
4 ensure that families have much more opportunity to
5 meet with DOE. And so, because we have the families
6 waiting there and they're not sitting downstairs,
7 it's a bigger opportunity for that to happen. So, we
8 did make that change.

10 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Okay. In—in your
11 testimony, you said about regarding the bill to
12 create an educational continuity unit at PATH, that
13 PATH might not be the right location for that. The—
14 the—one of the reasons why we put that in the
15 legislation was that that's what we were hearing
16 from—from—from clients through advocacy organizations
17 that have done focus groups. Have you, you know,
18 talked to families about where they feel like such a
19 unit might make the most sense? You know, my—my
20 concern obviously is that by the time they get
21 through a conditional placement, and into, you know,
22 a long-term, a longer term placement from the DHS
23 system, it's—they're already kind of behind the
24 curve, and so that's the reason why doing it at PATH
25 is so that you're able to kind of try to get into a

1
2 kind of preventative mindset, as opposed to a, you
3 know, a corrective mindset.

4 JOSLYN CARTER: I think for me, and
5 thinking about families, they're in emergency
6 situation to be there at PATH, and my staff are
7 asking lots of questions and the process is long.
8 It's exhausting. We do hand out education materials,
9 transportation information to families, but their
10 focus is really getting through this intake process
11 on this day to get to placement. Children are tired,
12 parents are tired. It's an overwhelming feeling. I
13 know that personally, and so the first day that I
14 walked into PATH and I've been DHS for a long time,
15 and in 2014 I had to cover PATH because I was
16 assigned there, and walked in there the first day,
17 and for me seeing the families coming in with all of
18 their belongings and their children it was, you know,
19 a slap, you know, it really hit me that these are
20 really humans. And, you know, I spent a lot of time
21 on the first floor in the lower level just—just being
22 around families, and just listening to them. I think
23 it's an overwhelming time for them to start really
24 thinking about that, and really putting effort into
25 that. I think it's hard. I—I—I understand right, we

1
2 do want to make sure that there's continuity, and we
3 want to make sure that families don't get left—the
4 children don't get left behind. But I, you know,
5 being there and working in that building—

6 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Uh-hm.

7 JOSLYN CARTER: --especially when it's a
8 long day. It is a long day. It's hard and I—I don't
9 know if we're going to be able to have parents
10 concentrate. We do give some opportunities for
11 children to be in a wait space and away from parents
12 and just be able to have parents when they're doing
13 their family work interview or whether they're
14 meeting with a domestic violence social workers, but
15 their minds are so much on trying to get through, and
16 really recall where did I live for two years, right.
17 So, there's—there's lots of information that we're
18 asking--

19 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Uh-hm.

20 JOSLYN CARTER: --on that first day. I
21 think it will be an overwhelming decision, you know,
22 for families to have to do that. If I was sitting at
23 PATH on that day, I'm not sure I'd listen to you.
24 Right, my 10-year-old being hot—I mean, you know,
25 because I'm going to tell the truth, we have to go

1
2 with my son. I'm like okay I've had enough, right,
3 but they don't have that opportunity unless we give
4 them a three-hour break, but it's hard for families
5 to concentrate on that.

6 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Right, that's what I
7 wanted to ask you.

8 JOSLYN CARTER: So that--

9 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Okay.

10 JOSLYN CARTER: --at shelter level,
11 right, and I'm not saying it's at the conditional at
12 all, either. I think that we have made an effort to
13 really push shelters to work with families as they
14 enter the door, not wait for determinations. So--

15 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: [interposing] The
16 conditional, you know, you're in a hotel somewhere
17 out by the airport. It's not a--

18 JOSLYN CARTER: It's, and you know,
19 council member, I want to talk about right a future,
20 right, but a shelter wherever it is, right. It-it is
21 still less stressful because they have some place I'm
22 going to put my head tonight. At the beginning--

23 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: [interposing] But
24 these are actually, they're
25

1
2 JOSLYN CARTER: --they don't know where
3 they're going to be.

4 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Right, but
5 logistically how does that work? I mean the thing
6 about PATH is it's a single location. So, if you
7 were—I mean if you were in a conditional placement in
8 a hotel out by JFK, whose—who has, you know, can't
9 have obviously three--

10 JOSLYN CARTER: [interposing] I have--

11 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: --three DOE staff
12 people--

13 JOSLYN CARTER: [interposing] Absolutely
14 not, but with DHS providers--

15 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: --you know going
16 around to every hotel room in—in—in Eastern Queens.

17 JOSLYN CARTER: They provide a staff, and
18 so we would lean onto them in this way.

19 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Yeah, but that's—I—I
20 appreciate that, but--

21 JOSLYN CARTER: [interposing] It's
22 really, it's making sure that we focus on giving
23 families information when they're at their location.
24 I mean that's--
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: [interposing] But I
3 will say this. I mean I think you know this, right.
4 So, we rely on our provider staff because the—you
5 know, just everyone so everyone is clear, I mean the—
6 the family DHS system is a 90% not-for-profit run.
7 So, this is not DHS staff that's doing most of the
8 provision of services.

9 JOSLYN CARTER: It is not. We have only
10 two family shelters.

11 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Yes.

12 JOSLYN CARTER: Hopefully be true. My
13 work is to develop providers. My work is to
14 standardize expectations and training. My work is to
15 move us away from the one-size-fits-all. So, my work
16 is to make sure that the information that we're
17 sharing with these families is information that they
18 need, and that we're doing individualized assessments
19 and not just really staying on, you know, doing that.
20 So, I think we're going to driver to make that
21 product work at one of the--

22 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: [interposing] I—I
23 hear you on that, but I—I was going to get to like
24 but there's, you know, when you're in a—when you're
25 in a conditional—so when—and the conditional

1
2 placements are—are also run by not-for-profit
3 providers.

4 JOSLYN CARTER: The conditional placement
5 turns into the regular shelter. So there is no
6 moving from conditional. It just looking at the
7 system.

8 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Well, if you're in a—
9 but if you're in—if you're placed conditionally in a—
10 in a hotel, you might not stay in that hotel. I mean
11 those if—those are just on conditional placements.

12 JOSLYN CARTER: [interposing] You may not
13 stay in that hotel if capacity allows me to move you.

14 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Right, but—but you
15 just said before that ten days is the average time
16 spent in a—in a transitional placement, right?

17 JOSLYN CARTER: No. In the process of us
18 determining whether families eligible for shelter.
19 If—even if, wherever you're place--

20 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: [interposing] No one
21 is looking at transitional placement in Tier 2. (sic)

22 JOSLYN CARTER: Your—if there's a vacancy
23 yes. So, we stopped—we stopped the system where
24 there was a conditional placement once you become
25 eligible you're moved to a permanent shelter. We

1 stopped that system. It's wherever you're placed, if
2 you're found eligible to remain in, right. If you're
3 in a hotel and the capacity needs--capacity comes up,
4 and I can transfer it to a Tier 2, we will, but
5 you're not being moved after ten days. You're not
6 being moved after ten days. That was stopped several
7 years back.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: I mean again--

10 JOSLYN CARTER: [interposing] So, it-it
11 maybe is. Yeah.

12 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: --I was working with
13 a constituent a year ago who was moved out of a hotel
14 after 30 days into a DHS run family shelter so--

15 JOSLYN CARTER: Because the capacity
16 allowed it.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Okay, but she was
18 moved. You're saying that that's an anomaly that
19 most of the time people are not moved?

20 JOSLYN CARTER: I think what I'm saying
21 to you is capacity drives where families are placed,
22 and so if you're placed in a--

23 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: But a conditional
24 placement is--so, how many--what percentage of families

1
2 makes it—what percentage of families are moved after
3 their conditional placements?

4 JOSLYN CARTER: We don't have a data set,
5 I don't have a data set on that. I will have to get
6 back to you on that.

7 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: [interposing] Okay, I
8 understand that--

9 JOSLYN CARTER: [interposing] Because
10 we're not—we're not transferring at the conditional
11 placements.

12 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Except the time when
13 I was working with a constituent a year ago where it
14 did happen.

15 JOSLYN CARTER: I will look into that.

16 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Okay, and then it
17 goes to then—Okay, so then you think that the—the
18 right—the right intervention point because—so the
19 bill calls for establishment of an Educational
20 Continuity Unit at PATH that would be staffed by the
21 Department of Education staff or DHS staff. You're
22 saying that—that it's preferable to have educational
23 continuity interventions at—during the conditional
24 placement?

1
2 JOSLYN CARTER: I'm saying that at PATH
3 we already have DOE staff and DHS staff on site.

4 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: [interposing] But
5 what percentage of--of--of people walking in the door,
6 families walking in the door are meeting with that
7 DOE staff?

8 JOSLYN CARTER: I don't know the data
9 point but I know because we moved the family--the
10 Family Assistants--Family Assistants down to a lower
11 level, that I would--I would want to tell you that
12 most of the families are saying that, but DOE may
13 have much more data on that.

14 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: And I'd also add
15 that when Family Assistants do intake at the
16 individual shelters, that is another opportunity for
17 them to talk to families and work with families and
18 discuss their educational options and that Family--

19 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: [interposing] Right.

20 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: --Assistant is
21 always available to discuss those options because
22 family choices may change after they have been living
23 in shelter for some period of time.

24
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: [interposing] But
3 that Family Assistant is not—I mean how many Family
4 Assistants are there in—in the system?

5 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: There are 117
6 Family Assistants.

7 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: [interposing] 117
8 for 23,000 children.

9 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: They—they're not
10 all coming in. Those 23,000 children are not all
11 coming in at the same time, and so these Family
12 Assistants meet with new families in shelter, and
13 have an opportunity then to reinforce the educational
14 options that a family has, and that any other time
15 that they are interacting with that family they may
16 also have those conversations.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Okay, but what you
18 are describing is the status quo, and the status quo
19 is unacceptable.

20 JOSLYN CARTER: Let me just tell you one
21 last thing. At PATH right now families that enter
22 the door, get—do get an education guide that when
23 they're settled, right, so that first day they
24 probably are not reading it. When they get to their
25 placement, they get the luxury to read and really

1 then have questions. Because when I'm coming into
2 PATH, I don't know where I'm going to be placed,
3 right and so that's the worry. I think that being
4 able to get opportunity to kind of say alright this
5 is where I am, and then think through you—you know
6 the next steps are with Nick, you know, for me to
7 think through it. That's the route that I would want
8 to urge you to think about.
9

10 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: And then lastly, I—I—
11 I'd like you to talk a little bit about how you as a—
12 how we as system are looking at—in an evidence based
13 way addressing the long-term trauma that children
14 endure by being in temporary housing for extended
15 periods of time because we know that the impacts
16 carry far beyond even the time that they're
17 eventually hopefully stably housed that—that trauma,
18 that impact affects their academic ability. It
19 affects the greater absenteeism. You know, these
20 are—these are—these—those traumas stay with those
21 children. So, what are we looking as a system in
22 terms of trauma informed care, evidence based models?
23 Where else—where else are we looking? Are we looking
24 at other systems throughout the country that have
25 adopted programs? What's on the cutting edge right

1
2 now? What are you learning by going to conferences
3 and, you know, San Diego or, you know, Phoenix or
4 wherever around the country that you go to go to
5 these conferences? Where—what are learning? What
6 are you learning about—about trauma informed care for
7 children in [laughter] temporary housing?

8 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: [off mic] I go to
9 conference? [on mic] I'm going to really ask that
10 Kathy come back. Kathy is a Social Worker by
11 background and she has attended these conferences,
12 and knows an awful lot about [laughter] trauma—trauma
13 informed care.

14 KATHY POLITE: You can't go there.
15 [laughter]

16 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Yeah, I would
17 like.

18 KATHY POLITE: Sorry, but I will take
19 that. Yeah, so we partner—well, within the
20 Department of Education community schools and New
21 York State Teach and the Office of Safety, Youth and
22 Development. We work with a Dr. Ham, who we actually
23 became aware of for New York State Teach. Who's
24 actually excellent and known throughout the country
25 in his trauma informed practice, and his work in

1
2 providing professional development. So, what we did
3 last year with our Bridging the Gap social workers in
4 addition to our social work interns, and partnering
5 with community schools is we trained our 32 at that
6 time, 32 social workers in the Bridging the Gap
7 schools to a more intense training in trauma informed
8 care who then turnkey, and they've begun to turnkey
9 the information to school personnel. So, we're
10 building capacity in that way. In addition, the
11 school based liaisons were trained by New York State
12 Teach last year. So, school year 2016-17 and '15 and
13 '16 in trauma informed care through Dr. Ham as well.
14 [background comment] Yes, and teach-teachers have
15 on-thank you-have an ongoing webinar which is-which
16 is online that my educators can go to.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: And this type of
18 professional development is made available to every
19 teacher, every school personnel in the entire system?

20 KATHY POLITE: Well, through the webinar
21 yes it is. Uh-hm, yeah.

22 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: And do you know how
23 it's being utilized, their feedback from UFT or
24 other-other institutional partners on-or-or feedback

25

1 from individual school personnel to—to hear what
2 principals for example, many different principals.

3
4 KATHY POLITE: Okay, so, do you want to—

5 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Well, I want to
6 say that the Teachers' webinars serve the purpose for
7 social workers who are getting continuing ed units
8 that you use, and so they're very popular among
9 social workers because there's that additional
10 benefit that it goes toward their certification and
11 their ongoing certification needs. So, the feedback
12 from the actual participants who are social workers
13 is very positive.

14 JOSLYN CARTER: And so, Council Member,
15 I'm going to add two things. Right, so in addition
16 to the Thrive social workers who certainly use trauma
17 informed with other laws of practice because we don't
18 want to move away from one size-fits-all. We have a
19 clinical services unit at DHS, and so we are looking
20 to build on structure and standards around what
21 models of practice we're using. That's the unit that
22 we're developing, but the third thing I want to point
23 to is really going up stream to parents, right. So
24 we ant to make sure that we're supporting parents to
25 really look at disrupting the intergenerational

1
2 aspects of poverty, right. So, we want to look at
3 providing educational services to parents. So, that,
4 they, too can get jobs and they can understand, you
5 know, kind of how do you move out of poverty and to
6 be—to help the families develop and grow. So, we're
7 looking at our CSU unit at--based at DHS that
8 provides services through the--through the Thrive and
9 so they're working together for--to help families as
10 well as the children. But also looking at how do we
11 make referrals for families, for adults so that they
12 can get their educational needs met, and so we're
13 doing that work also. I think for us it's a, you
14 know, it's really looking at the big picture. It's
15 not just trauma informed but, you know, I'm also a
16 social worker, and have several years of kind of
17 training and looking at what do we need to do to
18 break and disrupt this kind of poverty and the
19 underlines of poverty.

20 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: I'd like to also
21 talk about a couple of other programs because we are
22 looking for ways and identifying ways to partner our
23 students who have experienced homelessness with
24 students who have been formerly homeless who can then
25 help them see the path to a better future for

1
2 themselves. So, I know we have some mentorship
3 programs for our 11th and 12th graders who are
4 temporarily homeless, and actually this year we had a
5 first ever its kind event. We identified a group of
6 students in shelter who are going away to college,
7 and so the needs that they have in how do you think
8 about, you know, moving away from their families and
9 going to a college dormitory, and their specific
10 needs. We had a college, we called it the College
11 Pop-Up Shop where DOE employees voluntarily
12 contributed and bought items that would be useful for
13 these students in their new lives in dorm rooms. We
14 had a celebration for them. We had formerly homeless
15 students coming who are now in college come back to
16 speak to them because we do recognize that ultimately
17 the goal is how do we help them see that better
18 future and-and be successful an continue on that path
19 for themselves.

20 JOSLYN CARTER: And I'm going to add one
21 last thing I promise. It's—for the past three years,
22 we've had a graduation event for our students who are
23 seniors who are graduating who've been accepted to
24 college as educational enforcements here, and so they
25 get a laptop, and we really help to—throughout the

1
2 year really help them to really guide their process
3 so that they can graduate and actually get to
4 college, and this--this was our third year this past
5 year.

6 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: I'd also like to give
7 a shout out to Council Member Van Bramer from the
8 City Council and working with--

9 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: The Girl Scout
10 Troops.

11 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Girl Scout Troops.

12 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Absolutely.

13 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: A very positive
14 program, and hopefully that will be able to continue
15 to thrive. The last question for me. At our last
16 hearing, we had testimony from a principal from PS
17 156, which--is that in Council Member Barron's
18 district?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [off mic] Yes,
20 that is.

21 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Alright, Beverly
22 Logan was the principal. She testified a very moving
23 testimony and she's a principal in Brooklyn, and she
24 talked about the steps that she takes as a principal
25 to providing care for her student in--in temporary

1
2 housing, and it was—not only was it very moving, it
3 was very illuminating, and it spoke to a lot of the
4 practical day-to-day impacts that her students are
5 feeling, and what teachers and—and what
6 administration that school are—are doing to—to—to try
7 to undress that. So, have you—have you continued—
8 have you talked to her since that time when she was—
9 it was a really, really remarkable testimony. That
10 was over a year and a half ago.

11 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So the
12 initiatives that we've been discussing, and that we
13 funded now for the past two years, came out of a
14 series of interviews that we did with principals
15 following that hearing. So, following that hearing
16 in February of 2016, myself, Lois, a woman Emmy Liss,
17 who is now Chief of Staff to Deputy Chancellor
18 Wallack. Three of us actually went out and visited
19 and interviewed a number of principals who have high
20 numbers of students in temporary housing and students
21 in shelter, and so from those conversations there was
22 a generation of a number of different ideas around
23 initiatives that we could pursue, and we came to
24 agreement and funding for the ones that we, in fact,
25

1
2 implemented. So, it comes very much out of
3 conversations with principals.

4 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Great. Council
5 Member Barron, do you have any questions? Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, just to ask
7 I guess a follow-up question. At the time just prior
8 to that hearing, the principal did share with me that
9 based on the high numbers of students that she had
10 who were living in temporary housing, she partnered
11 with a group in the--in the community, and they have
12 laundry service where they provided washing machines--

13 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Uh-hm.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: --for the
15 students to be able to have their clothes washed, and
16 the battle that she had with DOE to pay for the
17 electrical costs of the hookup or whatever. So, I
18 hope that that's been resolved. I haven't spoken to
19 her, but it was a real battle, and I think it was
20 very telling that she had to have that kind of
21 struggle without the DOE saying wait a minute, this
22 is something urgent and necessary. Let's find a way
23 to make it happen. So, I don't know if it's been
24 institutionalized or if she's been--been a pilot for
25 that, but those are the kinds of things that, you

1
2 know, when I talk about principals and the challenges
3 that they face when they have any number of children
4 who are living in temporary housing. But those are
5 the kinds of things that they know about an encounter
6 that, you know, don't get major attention.

7 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Earlier this
8 morning—earlier this morning--

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [interposing]
10 So, do you know whether or not they got the
11 electricity on that?

12 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: I—I don't know
13 but we will follow up. Yes, they did. Okay, thank
14 you, Kathy.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

16 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: But earlier in--
17 in today's questions, one of the things we talked
18 about is we have really focused the initiatives over
19 the past couple of years around how do we support
20 principals in schools that have high populations of
21 students in shelter. You know, the—prior to this the
22 focus was on how do we support the students from the
23 shelter perspective and that's what the Family
24 Assistant workers do, and that's what all of the
25 content experts do. But we've really tried to bring

1
2 these initiatives to support the principals and the
3 schools that have the higher concentrations, and that
4 has been a very new perspective and focus that really
5 came about following the last hearing.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And it's sad
7 because I—I know a principal that who, in fact,
8 retired many years ago. It was about ten years ago.
9 She retired because of the pressure that she felt
10 from the District Superintendent to get these scores
11 up even though I think—I don't know what percentage
12 of her students were in temporary shelters, but she
13 wasn't getting any kind of additional support, and
14 she said, I can't get my scores up if I can't get my
15 children in school, and get them in their uniforms.
16 We're a uniform school. So, it—it really has had a
17 really hard consequence on a lot of families, the
18 children the school, and with our society at large.

19 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Yes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON Thank you.

21 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, thank you very
23 much. I think that's going to end this portion of
24 the hearing, and we're going to now call up our next
25 group of witnesses. [background noise, pause]

1
2 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: So, first I'd like to
3 call up Liza Pappas from the New York City
4 Independent Budget Office, who's the author of the
5 report. Is Liza still here? [background comment,
6 pause].

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well, I usually swear
8 in all my witnesses. I'm going to ask you to raise
9 your right hand. Do you wear or affirm to tell the
10 truth the whole truth and nothing but the truth, and
11 to answer Council Member questions honestly?

12 LIZA PAPPAS: Yes, I do.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And your name, please
14 for the record?

15 LIZA PAPPAS: My name is Liza Pappas from
16 the Independent Budget Office.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And Ms. Pappas, would
18 you like to start?

19 LIZA PAPPAS: Yes.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay.

21 LIZA PAPPAS: Thank you. So, good
22 afternoon, Council Members Dromm and Levin and
23 [laughs] all the members who are here in spirit.
24 [laughs] My name is Liza Pappas. I'm an Education
25 Policy Analyst at the New York City Independent

1
2 Budget Office where I've conducted the agency's
3 research—research on students in temporary housing
4 with a particular focus on students in the shelter
5 system. Thank you for the opportunity to testify
6 today. In our report Not Reaching the Door, we
7 looked at in-depth at the multi-layered challenges
8 temporarily housed students encountered in getting to
9 school. In years 2012-13 and 2013-14, the number of
10 students has grown since we issued our report.
11 According to the Department of Education's statistic,
12 last school year 105,133 students spent at least some
13 part of the year in temporary housing, a 5% increase
14 over the prior year. For students and the families
15 living in the shelter system, just getting to school
16 proved daunting. They faced long commutes and other
17 transportation difficulties, competing demands on
18 their time from other city agencies, along with the
19 transitory nature and stress of life in a shelter.
20 As a result, students who were identified as spending
21 at least part of the school year in a—in a shelter
22 had average daily school attendance rates well below
23 those students in permanent housing or those doubled
24 up in homes of family, friends or other persons.
25 While the average attendance rates for students

1 living in shelters increased a bit in 2015-16, the
2 most recent school year for which we have data their
3 attendance rate remains well below that of students
4 in permanent housing or doubled up housing. In 2015-
5 16, the overall attendance rate for students in
6 shelters was just over 82% compared with over 90% for
7 their peers. Students in the shelter system had
8 lower attendance rates at every grade level, and I
9 have attached a table showing average attendance
10 rates by grade, and housing type for school years,
11 2013-14 through 2015-16. Students residing in the
12 shelter system also had substantially higher rates of
13 chronic absenteeism, which the Department of
14 Education defines as students who are absent 10% or
15 more of the school year, the equivalent of missing 18
16 or more days. While the rate of chronic absenteeism
17 among students in shelters edged down in 2015-16,
18 students were chronically absent from schools, those
19 students in shelters more than twice the rate for-
20 than their permanently housed and doubled up peers,
21 and the rates of chronic absenteeism were highest in
22 the early grades and also in the high school grades.
23 I've also attached a table showing those rates by
24 grade and housing type for the seniors. An IBO
25

1 report released this past April observed that
2 students in shelters tend to be concentrated in a
3 relatively small number of schools across the city.
4 In 2011-12 there were 61 schools that served
5 population where more 10% of students were in
6 shelters. In school year '15-'16 there 155 schools
7 roughly 11% of 1,475 traditional public schools open
8 that year. In our research, school staff
9 overwhelmingly stressed the budget resources have
10 been far short of what is necessary to provide
11 comprehensive and coordinated counseling, attendance
12 out reach and family engagement services. Since
13 then, the city has begun to provide some resources
14 specifically targeted to students residing the city's
15 shelter system. In January 2016, the city announced
16 that all students in shelters enrolled in grades K to
17 6 would be guaranteed busing to any school they
18 attend if the distance from the shelter to the school
19 is more than a half mile and if parents so desire.
20 The estimated annual cost at that time was \$24
21 million. For the second year in a row, the city
22 allocated \$10.3 million in educational support. This
23 year funds that had supported ten attendance teachers
24 were shifted to expand the Bridging the Gap program,
25

1
2 a social worker program to a total of 43 schools. In
3 addition to school based social workers, the Fiscal
4 Year 2018 funds support after school programs,
5 special admission application processes and
6 technology, blackberries, to better connect
7 Department of Education family assistance with
8 schools, shelters and families. So, I thank you
9 again for the opportunity to testify. I'd be glad to
10 answer any questions you may have.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: In my observation in
12 terms of your testimony and I think you were here for
13 the last two hearings as well, if I'm not mistaken,
14 is that it seems that the numbers have more than
15 doubled where there are 10% or more students in
16 schools that are homeless, and the funding, although
17 we are grateful to have gotten it in I guess it would
18 be Fiscal-Fiscal 17 and Fiscal now 18, as well, it's
19 not baselined. And last year in our budget
20 negotiation, it was actually taken out, and then we
21 had to fight to get the \$10.3 million put back in.
22 So, I have deep concerns about the continuation of
23 that funding to meet what to me appears to be a
24 growing need for our students in the public school
25 system. So, these numbers are very helpful to us in

1
2 terms of when we move forward, in terms of our budget
3 negotiations with the administration, and I don't
4 even think that \$10.3 million is enough, nor do I
5 think it's hitting every school where we see pockets
6 of homelessness increasing, and I have some questions
7 about schools in my own district, but basically I'm
8 hearing those stories in other places as well today.
9 So, I do want to thank you for coming in. I don't
10 know, Chair, do you have other questions. Yes.

11 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Thank you, Chair
12 Dromm.

13 LIZA PAPPAS: [interposing] Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: So, thank you very
15 much for your testimony and—and for this—this
16 exhaustive report. So, I just want question
17 including about the methodology. So, you did
18 something, you say in the intro that's somewhat
19 unconventional for an IBO report, which is to go out
20 and talk to—talk to families, and—and school
21 personnel as well. Can you talk a little bit about
22 that decision and kind of how that—that—that factored
23 into the way the report was constructed?

24 LIZA PAPPAS: Sure. I'm primarily
25 trained as a qualitative researcher--

3 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Uh-hm.

4 LIZA PAPPAS: --and we thought that with
5 this issue and with many issues that we see in the
6 school system that adding mixed message research
7 would really enhance our understanding of the kinds
8 of challenges students were facing. In this
9 particular case, students in the shelter system. So,
10 while we knew that students—we could see that
11 students were absent more or chronically absent more.
12 We didn't know why. So the numbers are always
13 helpful, but they don't always get to the whys and
14 the hows, and so we added a qualitative dimension to—
15 to help us with that.

16 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: The—after spending I
17 mean how long did you spend putting—looking at this
18 report?

19 LIZA PAPPAS: In the report in total?

20 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Yeah.

21 LIZA PAPPAS: Three years.

22 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Three years, right.
23 So, three years working on this report. Do you see
24 this as an intractable problem or do you see this as
25 a problem where there are solutions that can move the
needle? [pause]

1
2 LIZA PAPPAS: I don't know that I can
3 assess whether it's intractable or there are
4 solutions, but I-I know there are a lot of people
5 working on it, a lot of people care about it, and it-
6 you know, it behooves us all to work together on it.

7 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Do you think it-do
8 you think it would be helpful to have, you know, a
9 kind -a formalized structure within-between your
10 agencies when you talk about interagency
11 coordination? Do you think having that type of
12 structure so that we can kind of all identify the
13 issues, get on the same page and work towards
14 solutions might be, you know, a good idea?

15 LIZA PAPPAS: Yeah, the-I mean look we-we
16 heard across the board, you know, this is--New York
17 City is a very large diffused system, you know, with
18 at a lot of different people and different pockets
19 working on this issue from different angles, but not
20 necessarily in communication with each other--

21 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: [interposing] Uh-hm.

22 LIZA PAPPAS: --so certainly, you know,
23 more collaboration and communication--ongoing
24 communication so that the agencies that are
25 essentially serving the same families with children

1
2 can better serve them. It seems to be something we
3 heard a lot about.

4 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Yeah. Council Member
5 Barron, do you have any questions or Council Members?
6 So I just—I want to thank you. I mean this is—I—I
7 feel like your report is a blueprint for how we
8 should be moving forward and, you know, the three of
9 us here in four years we're—we're out. We're no
10 longer Council Members, and the Mayor in four years
11 he's going to move on to something else. And so,
12 it's our—you know we have a very short time limit to
13 try to make an impact, and so I would, you know, I
14 would like to, you know, continue working with you.
15 Obviously, you've done the—you've done the written—
16 the leg work here to make this a successful
17 blueprint. So I'd like to try to move forward from
18 here, but we haven't have a kind of a sense of
19 urgency that we want to do this on. So, I'd like to
20 work with you.

21 LIZA PAPPAS: Thank you. We're always
22 happy to work with you.

23 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Okay.

24 LIZA PAPPAS: Thank you very much.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Thanks. Okay, and
3 then we just have one panel. We've got Beth
4 Hofmeister from the Legal Aid Society; with Coalition
5 for the Homeless, Giselle Routhier; Grant Cowells
6 from Citizens Committee for Children and Randy
7 Levine, Advocates for Children of New York. [pause,
8 background comments] Hi, everyone. Whoever wants to
9 begin.

10 GISELLE ROUTHIER: Alright, I can start.
11 My Giselle Routhier and I'm a Policy Director for
12 Coalition for the Homeless. We submitted joint
13 testimony with Legal Aid as usual and it's a little
14 bit more lengthy so I'm just going to summarize here.
15 We know the number of children that have spent at
16 least one night in DHS shelter actually has leveled
17 off over the past three years, but the number of
18 school age children have increased over 2015. So,
19 likewise as we've seen with the DOE data, the number
20 of homeless students in New York City as measured by
21 the State Education Department has reached its
22 highest level yet driven by both an increase in the
23 shelter system and a significant increase in doubled
24 up students. I want to focus my testimony
25 specifically on one of the more difficult times for

1
2 homeless children and families in shelter, and as the
3 application process at PATH. Disturbingly, the
4 eligibility rate families applying for shelter has
5 reached a new low under Mayor de Blasio this past
6 July, just 38% of families with children who applied
7 for shelter were found eligible, and that's down from
8 61% in November 2014. Additionally, 43% of those
9 families had to submit more than one application
10 before ultimately being found eligible. The
11 application process is often the most traumatic and
12 daunting period for families as Administrator Carter
13 actually talked about in her testimony. It's
14 generally filled with stress and uncertainty and it's
15 not uncommon for children to miss a significant
16 amount of school during the application process. So,
17 I want to acknowledge that Administrator Carter
18 acknowledged the difficulty and the stress at PATH,
19 but we want to also talk about the fact that it's
20 possible to change the bureaucratic processes at
21 PATH, and to make it less of a stressful process.
22 So, we've continually recommended that the city
23 implement a much less onerous shelter intake process
24 in which applicants assisted—assisted in obtaining
25 necessary documents and recommended housing

1
2 alternatives are actually verified as available and
3 pose no risk to the health and safety to applicants.
4 If we actually made things much more—much less
5 stressful at PATH and maybe—there may be better ways
6 to actually implement solutions that would support
7 school age students that are coming in as well.
8 We've also recommended that the shelter intake
9 process be revised so that homeless children are
10 completely excused from appearing at PATH so they do
11 not have to miss school in order to be present when
12 the family applies for shelter. We have several
13 other recommendations detailed in our testimony about
14 making sure families are placed near children's
15 school, additional DOE staff at PATH and expanding
16 after school programs, but I want to highlight again—
17 highlight something that's extremely important here,
18 and that's the best solution to helping homeless
19 students in temporary housing, maintain engagement in
20 their school is to actually move them into permanent
21 housing as quickly as possible. And so we, therefore
22 urge the city to immediately increase the number of
23 permanent affordable housing for homeless families
24 including doubling the number of NYCHA apartments and
25 allocating a much significant—much greater number of

1 housing New York plan units to homeless families, and
2 this will ultimately reduce the need to fund all of
3 these supports for students in shelter. It will
4 reduce the need to open new shelters, and improve
5 wellbeing overall. Thank you.

7 BETH HOFMEISTER: Hi. I'm Beth
8 Hofmeister from the Legal Aid Society's Homeless
9 Rights Project. So, Giselle obviously just did a
10 brilliant job of summarizing all the different ways
11 that the city can help, and I just want to highlight
12 on behalf of my colleague Katherine Cliff who wasn't
13 able to testify today because she's actually at PATH
14 doing outreach and helping families with their no-
15 with their legal rights while they're applying. We
16 get calls on our hotline every single day, and talk
17 to families every time we're at PATH who are, you
18 know, hours away from the schools, and the children
19 are also going to different schools, and the children
20 are also going to different schools, and I think, you
21 know, Council Member Levin, you really touched on
22 this idea of the-kind of the day-to-day practicality
23 of what some of these decisions that are being made
24 on a high level and how they're actually impacting
25 their families on a day-to-day basis, and how

1
2 problematic that is, and in touching on something you
3 were—you were kind of talking back and forth with
4 that with the administrator and while the 10-day
5 placement is a good example because each application
6 you might have 10-day conditional placement, and then
7 you might have to go back and have a whole new
8 reapplication. So, while I understand what the
9 administrator was kind of trying to describe is that
10 this 10-day placement, but the reality is, as we all
11 know, we see families that have to reapply 12 times
12 before they're actually found eligible for shelter,
13 and if in those 12 times of 10-day placements you
14 don't have bussing for your kids, that's a big deal.
15 I mean that's a very—if you want—need to work, it you
16 have to go to any other appointment, just—it would be
17 a big deal for me just existing to have to spend my
18 time taking my kids 2-1/2 hours, you know, every
19 single day to and from school. So, I think that in
20 terms of what you're trying to do with the hearings,
21 and with the bills to get no the right path of really
22 pushing, you know, the different agencies to work
23 together to support these families, it's those
24 practical day-to-day considerations the things like
25 the washing machines in school, you know the drop-in

1
2 centers that have access to those things also. All
3 of that is very, very important, and the testimony
4 goes into more detail kind of about generally how
5 that can be done, but we just also want to say that
6 we're really seeing the impact of how these policies
7 affects families on a day-to-day basis with very
8 basic things is a—is a big deal in terms of how
9 they're functioning or not functioning, ore not
10 functioning as well as they could be.

11 RANDI LEVINE: Thank you for your
12 leadership in holding today's hearing, and for the
13 opportunity to speak with you about support for
14 students in temporary housing. My name is Randi
15 Levine, and I'm Policy Director of Advocates for
16 Children of New York. For more than 45 years,
17 Advocates for Children has worked to ensure a high
18 quality education for New York students who face
19 barriers to academic success focusing on students
20 from low-income backgrounds. We're proud to house
21 the New York State Technical and Education Assistance
22 Center for Homeless Students, TEACHS, which works on
23 several thousand cases each year regarding the
24 educational needs of students in temporary housing in
25 New York. Yesterday, we released new state data

1 showing that during the 2016-2017 school year,
2 104,088 students New York City district schools were
3 identified as homeless, a 5% increase from the
4 previous year. In other words, one out of every ten
5 students in New York City schools was homeless. You
6 just heard from the IBO, a lot of their research
7 about the poor educational outcomes for students
8 living in shelter. We have data and statistics and
9 our written testimony as well on that topic. Over
10 the past two years the city has take some positive
11 steps to help students living in shelters. We have
12 additional information on that in our written
13 testimony as well, but as you heard today, and just
14 to highlight yellow bus service for students living
15 in shelters has made a big difference. The efforts
16 to increase Pre-K enrollment among children living in
17 shelter. The \$10.3 million to support students
18 living in shelter including funding for 43 Bridging
19 the Gap social workers in schools, the After School
20 Literacy Programs in shelters and enrollment of such
21 shelters and the community schools' pilot focused on
22 students in temporary housing that you heard about
23 today. We're very pleased that Chancellor Farina
24 identified addressing the needs of the students who
25

1
2 are homeless as one of her priorities for this school
3 year. As such, the city should ensure that there's
4 high level leadership on this issue and an infusion
5 of resources to address barriers to school success
6 for students who are homeless. Importantly, the city
7 needs to work across agencies and across divisions of
8 the DOE to develop coordinated and coherent plans to
9 assist students who are homeless in a number of ways
10 including combatting chronic absenteeism, connecting
11 students with academic intervention services and
12 mental health services. Ensuring that students with
13 disabilities are evaluated and receive the services
14 to which they are entitled, and strengthening access
15 to a variety of DOE programs and post-secondary
16 options. We will be making additional
17 recommendations to the DOE in the coming weeks to
18 this end. In the meantime, here are some important
19 steps that the city should take. First, the city
20 should strengthen and expand the Bridging the Gap
21 Program, placing social workers at schools with high
22 populations of students living in shelters. The city
23 took an important step by funding 43 social workers
24 to work with students living in shelters at
25 elementary schools with high populations of these

1
2 students. However, the city has not baselined the
3 funding for these social workers putting the future
4 of the program in jeopardy. Furthermore, more than
5 150 schools serve a population in which 10% or more
6 of the students are students living in shelter, and
7 most of those schools do not yet have a Bridging the
8 Gap social worker. In addition to placing social
9 workers in schools with high concentrations of
10 students living in shelters, it's important to have
11 trained qualified professionals on the ground at the
12 city shelters who can address the educational needs
13 of students. Many children will attend schools that
14 don't have a Bridging the Gap social worker, and
15 social workers based at shelters can work more
16 closely with parents. As you heard, there are around
17 117 DOE family assistants who work in shelters who
18 are primarily responsible for conducting intakes with
19 families giving basic information and Metro Cards,
20 but the Family Assistants are not required to have a
21 college degree or any formal training in social
22 worker education. They're not a substitute for
23 trained social workers who could provide the social
24 emotional support and advocacy that this population
25 needs. Given the challenges faced by students living

1
2 in shelters, the DOE should hire shelter based social
3 workers to provide intensive case management focused
4 on children's information, and we have some more
5 information in our written testimony about that. The
6 city should also ensure that families receive
7 information about their educational options when they
8 apply for shelter at PATH. When families enter
9 shelter, they need information about their options to
10 keep their child in their original school or transfer
11 their children to a new school and transportation.
12 Furthermore, state law requires local social service
13 districts to assist parents in choosing a school
14 within two business days of shelter entry. We have
15 more information here about the importance of that,
16 but to this end, we thank Council Member Levin for
17 his leadership in sponsoring Intro 1714, and we have
18 some recommendations to make that bill even stronger
19 because what we want to see is education become an
20 integral part of PATH and to ensure that a
21 conversation with every family about education
22 happens there. We heard the testimony today. We
23 don't think it's an either/or, should we discuss
24 education at PATH or should we discuss education with
25 families once they are placed in shelters. These

1
2 conversations may need to happen multiple times, but
3 as Council Member Levin pointed out today, PATH is a
4 single point of entry where we know every family goes
5 to apply for shelter, and we think it's important for
6 parents to have a conversation about education there,
7 and leave with information about their school choices
8 and transportation. We have several recommendations
9 in our written testimony for improving
10 transportation. Of course, this builds on the success
11 of the city's initiative to offer yellow bus service
12 for the first time to all Kindergarten and through
13 sixth grade students living in shelters. We'd like
14 to see that strengthened including by providing
15 transportation to students in conditional shelter
16 placements for the reasons that you've heard today.
17 We think there should be a spearheaded coordinated
18 attendance efforts, as well as increased access to
19 Early Childhood Education, and have also included
20 more information about that in our written testimony
21 and, of course think that the city should make every
22 effort to place children in shelters in their
23 community school district of origin so that they can
24 stay in their schools without long commutes. And to
25 the extent that isn't possible, to have a transparent

1
2 process for families to request shelter transfers if
3 education is—is a barrier, and finally, we support
4 the Data Reporting Bills and have attached
5 recommendations for strengthening these data
6 reporting bills to make sure that we get the most
7 useful information. We thank you for holding the
8 hearing on this important topic. Thank you for the
9 opportunity to testify, and I'm happy to answer any
10 questions that you have.

11 GRANT COWLES: Good afternoon. My name
12 is Grant Cowles. I'm the Senior Policy Associate for
13 Youth Justice at Citizens Committee for Children, and
14 I'm delivering testimony today on behalf of Stephanie
15 Gindel, Associate Executive Director for Policy and
16 Advocacy is out of town at a conference. Not San
17 Diego, Baltimore. First, we'd like to thank Chairs
18 Levin and Dromm and members of the General Welfare
19 and the Education Committee for holding today's
20 extremely important hearing and for your commitment
21 to improving educational outcomes for homeless
22 students. The impact of homelessness can be
23 devastating to a child's education because it often
24 causes disruptions that impact their attendance and
25 academic performance at a time when a child is

1 already struggling with the trauma and life changes
2 associated with living in a homeless shelter. For
3 many children in shelter, however, school and early
4 education programs could be, could provide a
5 structural consistency in their lives.
6

7 Unfortunately, students in the New York City homeless
8 shelters have the highest rates of absenteeism and we
9 also want to highlight and echo the—the data you, you
10 mentioned, Chair Levin about the—the borough
11 placements as well as the IBO report, and then how
12 integral and alarming those data in that reporting
13 was. The magnitude of the family homelessness crisis
14 and the devastating impact it can have on children is
15 what led CCC to partner with Enterprise and New
16 Destiny to co-convene a family homelessness task
17 force. Together with about 40 other organizations we
18 brainstormed recommendations to promote and enhance
19 the wellbeing of homeless families and those at risk
20 of becoming homeless. Our report and recommendations
21 focused on a number of those at risk—focused on a
22 number of key issues including education for homeless
23 students. In short, we are urging the city to
24 reorient the shelter system and the education system
25 to be more proactive about helping homeless families

1
2 with school age children. For the most part, these
3 children are New York City public school children and
4 the school system must redouble its efforts to ensure
5 these children are both getting to school and then
6 having their needs met so that they are able to
7 learn. I'm going to highlight just seven brief
8 recommendations in which are echoed or vision
9 already. First, on making the education success of
10 homeless students a city priority, the city needs to
11 make an intentional effort to increase attendance,
12 decrease the time for transportation to be arranged
13 and ensure homeless children are supported with
14 whatever additional services they might need
15 including IEP services, tutoring and/or mental health
16 services, and strong leadership and commitment to
17 this issue will make a tremendous difference.
18 Second, pass Intro 1714. As mentioned today, talking
19 to parents about education starting at intake will
20 help families learn their options before they are
21 placed, address their questions, alleviate concerns
22 and show how important resolving education issues are
23 to the city. Our one suggestion is to amend this
24 legislation to also require the Education Continuity
25 Unit be staffed during the summer or staffed

1
2 adequately during the summer, and we also would
3 suggest that all families with school aged children
4 be required to meet with the Educational Continuity
5 Unit at the intake office so long as the unit is
6 properly staffed and that it does not make the intake
7 process longer. Third, increase the number and
8 qualifications of educational specialists available
9 to help families year round at their shelter sites,
10 and ensure staff of adequate supervision and
11 accountability measures similarly as mentioned.
12 Fourth, improve and expedite transportation for
13 homeless school children. Again, similar as
14 mentioned, the city should provide transportation to
15 elementary school children during the eligibility
16 process. At a minimum, staff should begin the
17 transportation arrangement process during this time
18 so that this process on average that last three to
19 five weeks is not time lost. The city should also
20 provide monthly Metro Cards rather than weekly for
21 the parents awaiting transportation arrangements. We
22 also believe the city should be arranging bussing
23 rather than just Metro Cards for the children
24 attending Pre-K programs. Fifth, pass legislation
25 that requires the city track and report more data

1
2 with regard to educational continuity for homeless
3 students. Currently, the city provides very limited
4 data. CCC fully supports the intent of Intro 1497.
5 We urge the City Council to pass and the Mayor to
6 sign legislation that requires data to be reported
7 with regard to educational continuity, the number of
8 days it takes to arrange—the transportation to be
9 arranged, absenteeism, attendance and graduation.
10 Local Law 142 of 2016, is an educational continuity
11 law regarding children in foster care. Given that
12 the city's Administration for Children's Services has
13 been able to produce the educational stability data
14 requested in that bill, perhaps this law could be a
15 good model for the similar issues for homeless
16 students. Sixth, baseline and add funding for social
17 workers in schools with a high number of homeless
18 students as Randi mentioned. We would like to see
19 that funding baselined as well as increased from the
20 43 to at least a hundred. And finally, seventh,
21 ensure homeless students have access to the services
22 they need to be able to learn. Generally speaking,
23 the city including DOE, DHS, HRA and DYCD must work
24 together to ensure the students have the supports in
25 place these children need to be able to learn and

1
2 succeed. This includes access to all services
3 included in IEPs as well as tutoring, clean uniforms
4 and mental health services when needed. Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much.

6 Thank you also. I just want an observation about the
7 Legal Aid testimony. I think you were stressing
8 about how stressful PATH is. I was glad to see the
9 administration agrees with you on that because
10 several times the administrator referred to this
11 stressful experience that they have at PATH. So, at
12 least no that we have agreement. So thank you for
13 that. Going back to the Advocates for Children
14 Report, I believe that we pulled a number that I
15 referenced today in testimony with the Deputy
16 Chancellor that there were only 35 children
17 identified as children in temporary housing who had
18 pre-school IEPs. Is that a correct number, and can
19 you elaborate further on that, and just shine a light
20 on why that number seems to me to be very low?

21 RANDI LEVINE: Yes, that number is
22 correct. All of the data that we issued yesterday
23 comes from the State Education Departments, SIRS, the
24 Student Information Repository System, and so, this
25 is information that school districts across the state

1
2 report to the State Education Department. We broke
3 that out by grade level, and for preschool we have
4 students who are preschoolers with Individualized
5 Education Programs and those numbers show that in the
6 five boroughs of New York City only--there were only
7 35 preschoolers with IEPs identified as students who
8 are homeless.

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So just--

10 RANDI LEVINE: [interposing] We think--

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: --how many students
12 citywide UPK or Pre-K have IEPs?

13 RANDI LEVINE: So, Pre-K is--is separate.
14 There may be students attending Pre-K for all
15 Programs who have IEPs--

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: [interposing] At pre-
17 schools?

18 RANDI LEVINE: --and also students
19 without IEPs who are attending Pre-K for All
20 Programs. In terms of pre-schoolers with IEPs, I can
21 get you the exact number, but it's around 30,000.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: 30,000--

23 RANDI LEVINE: Uh-hm.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: --and only 35 have
25 been identified as being homeless.

1
2 RANDI LEVINE: I will say we think that
3 there are probably two things happening there.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay.

5 RANDI LEVINE: So, the first is under-
6 identification of the housing status of preschoolers
7 with disabilities. So, we feel confident that there
8 are more children who are homeless with preschooler-
9 with preschool IEPs than 35, but that number is
10 higher than 35. We believe and recommended to the
11 Department of Education that they examine their
12 process, and develop a process to identify the
13 housing status of preschoolers with IEPs similar to
14 the process that they have, and described today the
15 Housing Questionnaire that they're using in Pre-K for
16 all Programs as well as with school aged students.
17 But secondly, ICPH issued a report last year showing
18 that children who live in shelters are less likely to
19 have an IEP by the end of kindergarten than children
20 in permanent-in permanent housing when you look at
21 students who ultimately get an IEP in elementary
22 school.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, is that because
24 they're transient?
25

1
2 RANDI LEVINE: So, we think that that is
3 for a few reasons, and with respect to preschool in
4 particular the preschool special education process
5 requires a parent often to initiate the process to
6 write a referral letter. That letter goes to a
7 regional office. The parent then gets in the mail a
8 list of evaluation agencies and it's up to the parent
9 to find an evaluation agency, schedule appointments,
10 often get their child there, and only once that
11 happens does an IEP meeting take place and then
12 services are put in place. We think that there's a
13 lot that can happen to streamline this process
14 particularly for children who are homeless. We want
15 to make sure that children who are homeless are being
16 identified as children who may need an IEP in their
17 preschool years and they're getting the support they
18 need to make it through that process, and make sure
19 that they get evaluated, get an IEP and get services.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, it seems to me,
21 Randi, that as a former teacher, there's a lot of
22 referral for special education services. If a
23 student is spending three months or four months in
24 one school, that's actually not even enough time for
25 a teacher to address or to identify the special

1 education issues that might be there if the child
2 then leaves and goes to another school, and then the
3 other school would have to go through the similar
4 process, and then it follows. It just keeps going on
5 and on and on, and--and that's why I was really
6 zeroing in on that number, and--and I think that also
7 the way to help children with special education needs
8 thinking particularly with speech needs is that you
9 address them as early on as possible so that you can
10 correct them. And if that's not being done, or if
11 that's not being caught at Pre-K level, we're losing
12 a lot of time with these students, and I think by the
13 second grade or third grade we may have already lost
14 them in that sense, and we'll still provide services,
15 but it's much more difficult I think to do it.

17 RANDI LEVINE: You're absolutely right
18 and the research shows that the earlier you address a
19 child's needs, the better their long-term educational
20 outcomes and ICPH looked at those specific data for
21 this population in New York City and found the same
22 results. I'll also just say quickly in terms of
23 students, once they're in school, you're right, once
24 students are in school, there are still barriers for
25 children with IEPs if they're switching schools and

1
2 if they're not a school long enough for evaluations
3 to take place, we think the Department of Education
4 did take a good step, which they mentioned today of
5 adding in some language to their Standard Operating
6 Procedure Manual for students with disabilities to
7 provide some guidance to schools. We think there is
8 some additional work for the DOE to do there. For
9 children who are not yet in school, this is another
10 reason why having a conversation at PATH is important
11 so that parents know that preschool special education
12 services even exist. This is a reason why it's
13 important to have education based social workers at
14 shelters who cannot only address barriers for school
15 aged students, but can help families identify
16 children who may be in need of preschool special
17 education services, and help connect them with those
18 services.

19 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: (coughs) Thank you
20 very much, Chair Dromm, and I want to thank this
21 entire panel for your very thoughtful testimony with
22 a number of implementable recommendations that I
23 think we need to really be, you know, I think in
24 combination with the IBO Report, you know, using that
25 as a foundational document to be able to—to go from

1 here. One question that obviously a point that
2 Giselle you brought up that's very concerning is this
3 huge decrease over the last couple of years in the
4 percentage of families that are deemed eligible at
5 PATH. What is accounting for that, because that is
6 obviously terribly concerning. It's not as if when
7 the de Blasio Administration took over they were
8 saying, oh, boy, that—that PATH is really way too
9 easy to—to get, you know, housing fro. So, what has—
10 what policy has gone into place there that's causing
11 this to happen?
12

13 GISELLE ROUTHIER: Yes, like I think in—
14 in short it's—it's a check on the front door, and a
15 check on the shelter census, I meant to put some
16 context on it, and under the first months of de
17 Blasio's tenure the eligibility rate went up from
18 what it had been under Bloomberg, which was actually
19 a very good thing in our view and we were seeing
20 fewer families come into our office with these
21 egregious problems being, you know, trying to be
22 found eligible, and at that time the city had
23 actually—there—there had been a change in the state
24 regulations overseeing the eligibility process that
25 allowed them to be more flexible, but I think at that

1
2 time this—the city realized that they were letting a
3 lot more people in, and actually approached the state
4 and made recommendations for changing the regulations
5 that oversee eligibility at PATH to make it once
6 again more difficult for families to be found
7 eligible and have to jump through more hoops, and so
8 that changed.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: So, the state right
10 now that's—that's causing this?

11 GISELLE ROUTHIER: Yeah, so that changed.
12 The new administrative directive was change in
13 November 2016, and since then we've seen a continual
14 decline in the number of families being found
15 eligible and an increase in the number of problems
16 that—that we see on a daily basis in our office.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: So, and that—so this—
18 what is—what is the—what was the change to it
19 exactly. Can you speak to it?

20 GISELLE ROUTHIER: Yeah, I can send you
21 the—the ADM. It was a very specific language change
22 that sort of governed what housing options can be
23 considered available, and it sort of made that
24 language broader, which allowed the city to sort of
25 get away with saying this house—this housing option

1
2 is available to you even if in reality it isn't. So,
3 I think--

4 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: [interposing] Is the
5 second definition of at risk of being homeless? Is
6 that at risk or--?

7 GISELLE ROUTHIER: The definition of a
8 recommended housing option to the--I'll send you the
9 exact language. I don't know it off the top of my
10 head, but it essentially made that language broader
11 so that the city could interpret it in a particular
12 way.

13 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: And has the city to
14 your knowledge--so this has really been just since
15 last fall?

16 GISELLE ROUTHIER: Yes.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Has the city to your
18 knowledge spoke--spoken to this issue, and--and, you
19 know, I mean if they say look our hands are tied
20 because of the state regs or do they feel like they
21 maybe have some flexibility that they could assert?

22 GISELLE ROUTHIER: We think they
23 certainly have flexibility that they could assert.
24 They could--given that they approached the state to
25

1
2 make the change originally, they could approach the
3 state again or they could also--

4 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: (coughs)
5 [interposing] but they did admit that they approached
6 the state then?

7 GISELLE ROUTHIER: It is our
8 understanding that they approach the state.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Okay.

10 GISELLE ROUTHIER: So, when we talked
11 about--now they talk a lot about, you know, the
12 different diversion efforts, and prevention efforts
13 that they're putting in and all of those things are
14 good, but it's still not getting at the root cause of
15 the problem of a family who's coming in and actually
16 doesn't have any of those resources available to
17 them--

18 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Uh-hm.

19 GISELLE ROUTHIER: --who needs emergency
20 shelter and who is forced to apply multiple times to
21 either be found eligible, or ultimately not found
22 eligible and being forced back into unsafe locations.
23 So-

24 Uh-hm. CHAIRPERSON LEVIN:
25

1
2 GISELLE ROUTHIER: --it hasn't been
3 addressed to--in our view in a real way.

4 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Okay, and this
5 committee is going to have to delve into this issue
6 more in-depth. If--just one question for everybody.
7 If we were to try to establish some type of task
8 force to look at students in temporary housing, was
9 that--would that be something that you would think is
10 valuable and would you want to participate?

11 BETH HOFMEISTER: Yes and yes.

12 GISELLE ROUTHIER: Yeah, we would always
13 be happy to participate in that.

14 GRANT COWLES: I would participate as
15 well. Yes.

16 RANDI LEVINE: Yes.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Okay, very good.
18 Council Member Barron.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Mr.
20 chair. Thank you to the panel for coming and for
21 sharing, and my question is in the same vane as
22 Council Member Levin's question, which is you cited I
23 believe you said the families that were deemed
24 eligible was previously 60 something percent, and it
25 dropped to 31%. So, now, you've indicated that in

1
2 part that was because of the language that was used
3 in the legislation by the state. So, since we've now
4 seen that there's been a change and you're going to
5 get that to us, what do you see as the trend since
6 there hasn't been much time, only perhaps about a
7 year, but since November of 2016, what do you see now
8 as the trend for families who are seeking shelter?

9 GISELLE ROUTHIER: It has been continuing
10 to go. The eligibility rate has been continuing to
11 go down since that change, and I noted it was an
12 administrative director of change that was made at
13 the state level at the request of the city. So, the
14 city does have—have some leverage over that
15 administrative director, and they also have leverage
16 over their, the frontline staff and how they
17 implement that directive.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, and then in
19 one of the—in one of the reports of testimony that's
20 Ciric (sic) indicates that we need to increase access
21 to permanent housing for families, and that is so
22 obvious, you know, it's basic and easy to understand,
23 and I support that, and it's one of the reasons why I
24 vote against some of the projects that come forward
25 to the Council that do not, in fact, have provisions

1
2 for formerly homeless to be a part of the housing
3 that's being built or go down to 27 and 37% of the
4 AMI. It's obvious if you have a housing problem, you
5 need to provide more housing at the levels where
6 people who are now in shelters can be placed and, of
7 course, I support your position that NYCHA needs to
8 be looked at as a source to provide some of that
9 housing as well. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

10 RANDI LEVINE: Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Okay.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, well thank you
13 very much, and that will end this part of the
14 hearing. Do you want to gavel us out?

15 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Sure thing.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay.

17 CHAIRPERSON LEVIN: Thank you, Chair
18 Dromm, and now at 1:51 p.m. this hearing is
19 adjourned. Thank you all. [gavel]

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date October 19, 2017