CITY COUNCIL CITY OF NEW YORK -----Х TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES Of the SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITION AND CONCESSIONS ---- Х September 25, 2017 Start: 1:28 p.m. Recess: 3:19 p.m. HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Rm, 16th Fl. BEFORE: RAFAEL SALAMANCA, JR. Chairperson COUNCIL MEMBERS: Darlene Mealy Ydanis A. Rodriguez Andrew Cohen Mark Treyger World Wide Dictation 545 Saw Mill River Road - Suite 2C, Ardsley, NY 10502 Phone: 914-964-8500 * 800-442-5993 * Fax: 914-964-8470

1

www.WorldWideDictation.com

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jordan Press Executive Director Development & Planning Government Affairs Unit Housing Preservation and Development

Nadja Ratcliffe Director of Homeownership Programs Office of Development Housing Preservation and Development

Sal D'Avola Executive Director Neighborhood Restore and Restored Homes

Cecilia Kushner Senior Vice President NYC Economic Development Corporation

Nick Molinari Chief of Planning and Neighborhood Development NYC Parks

Josue Sanchez Representative L&M Development Partners

John Weed Assistant Executive Director Bronxworks

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Annie Tirschwell Representative Type A Projects

Lisa So Representative Marvel Architects

Rocky Bucano Executive Director Universal Hip Hop Museum

Joyce Hogi President Bronx Council for Environmental Quality

John Tyler Falcone Senior Associate Workforce and Economic Development JobsFirstNYC

Paul Philps District Manager Community Board 4

John Howard Algarin Chairperson Parks Committee Community Board 4

Jill Crawford Type A Project

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND |
|----|---|
| 2 | CONCESSIONS 4 [sound check] |
| 3 | [pause] |
| 4 | [gavel] |
| 5 | CHAIR COHEN: Alright, good afternoon. |
| 6 | I'm Council Member Andrew Cohen, acting Chair of the |
| 7 | Subcommittee on Planning, Dispositions and |
| 8 | Concessions. Welcome everybody to today's hearing. |
| 9 | Today we will hold hearings on several NYCHA Small |
| 10 | Homes Rehab applications the Hope Homes Cluster |
| 11 | and the Lower Concourse North Rezoning application. |
| 12 | We will be voting on the Small Homes applications, |
| 13 | the Hope Homes applications and the other items were |
| 14 | laid over from our last meeting. |
| 15 | The first hearing will be on LU 739-742, |
| 16 | the NYCHA Small Homes Rehab application. In these |
| 17 | applications, HPD is seeking a UDAAP project approval |
| 18 | and property tax exemption for numerous properties in |
| 19 | Queens and one in Brooklyn. These applications are |
| 20 | located in the district of Council Members Cornegy, |
| 21 | Ulrich; Miller in Council District 28. |
| 22 | The approval would facilitate the |
| 23 | rehabilitation of 24 one- to four-family homes that |
| 24 | would be sold to prices affordable to families making |
| 25 | |
| I | |

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 5 |
|----|---|
| 2 | 120% of AMI or less. I am now opening the hearing on |
| 3 | LU 739-742, the NYCHA Small Homes application. |
| 4 | JORDAN PRESS: Good afternoon, my name is |
| 5 | Jordan Press; I'm Executive Director for Development |
| 6 | and Planning in HPD's Government Affairs Unit. |
| 7 | Land Use No. 739, 740 and 741 consist of |
| 8 | 23 single-family homes located in Queens Council |
| 9 | Districts 27, 28 and 32 and is known as Southeastern |
| 10 | Queens Small Homes NYCHA-run Cluster II. |
| 11 | Land Use No. 739 consists of three NYCHA |
| 12 | properties located at 89-24 168th Street; 210-33 |
| 13 | 113th Street; 102-47 187th Street; and one City-owned |
| 14 | site located at 110-60 Wood Street in Council |
| 15 | District 27. |
| 16 | Land Use No. 740 consists of 16 NYCHA |
| 17 | properties located at 116-02 139th Street; 117-31 |
| 18 | 135th Street; 129-23 135th Street; 129-41 135th |
| 19 | Street; 129-59 135th Street; 130-15 135th Street; |
| 20 | 130-16 149th Street; 131-15 Sutter Avenue; 133-16 Van |
| 21 | Wyck Expressway; 133-18 134th Street; 147-06 Sutter |
| 22 | Avenue; 107-34 Princeton Street; 111-14 169th Street; |
| 23 | 115-41 147th Street; 150-22 118th Street; 167-08 |
| 24 | 110th Avenue; and two City-owned properties located |
| 25 | |
| | |

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 6 at 114-47 Inwood Street and 145-36 111th Avenue in 2 3 Council District 28. Land Use No. 741 is located at 103-16 4 Plattwood Avenue in Council District 32. 5 Each NYCHA home was foreclosed upon as a 6 result of the default on a HUD/FHA mortgage over 20 7 8 years ago; the homes were turned over to NYCHA by HUD 9 to operate as part of their public housing portfolio. Over time the homes became vacant and are currently 10 11 in dire need of rehabilitation. NYCHA, with approval 12 from HUD, selected the sponsor to convey the 13 properties to and each will undergo gut 14 rehabilitation through HPD's Small Homes Rehab 15 program, which is an affordable home ownership program for one- to four-family homes. 16 The three 17 City-owned homes will be clustered with the portfolio and all of the homes will be rehabilitated to meet 18 19 Enterprise Green Communities Certification. Upon 20 completion of the work, the sponsor will convey the 21 properties to low- to moderate-income families 2.2 earning up to 120% of AMI under program guidelines. 23 The sponsor has committed to conducting marketing outreach events where the homes are located in order 24

25

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 7 |
|----|---|
| 2 | to reach as many potential local applicants as |
| 3 | possible. |
| 4 | And Mr. Chair, did you say we're |
| 5 | including Land Use 742 in this round right now? |
| 6 | [background comment] Okay. [background comment, |
| 7 | laughter]. I'd be happy to include that now, before |
| 8 | any questions. |
| 9 | So Land Use No. 742 consists of an |
| 10 | amendment to a previously approved project located at |
| 11 | 580 Lafayette Avenue in Brooklyn Council District 36. |
| 12 | On July 25, 2012, the City Council |
| 13 | approved Resolution No. 1461, facilitating the |
| 14 | transfer and approval of UDAAP and Article XI tax |
| 15 | benefits under the Third Party Transfer Program |
| 16 | Brooklyn, In Rem Action No. 51. |
| 17 | Subsequently, on August 8, 2012, the |
| 18 | property was conveyed to the sponsor, Neighborhood |
| 19 | Restore Housing Development Fund Corporation, for |
| 20 | redevelopment. Currently the sponsor is proposing to |
| 21 | transfer title of the property to an affiliated |
| 22 | entity known as Restoring Urban Neighborhoods, which |
| 23 | will rehabilitate 580 Lafayette Avenue, also under |
| 24 | the Small Homes Rehab NYCHA program. Under the |
| 25 | amended project, the sponsor will convert the |
| | |

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 8 |
|----|---|
| 2 | property into three family homeownership buildings |
| 3 | instead of four family rentals, as previously |
| 4 | approved. Upon completion, the homes will also be |
| 5 | marketed to a qualified purchaser earning no more |
| 6 | than 120% of AMI in accordance with the program. |
| 7 | In order to facilitate Land Use Nos. 739, |
| 8 | 740, 741, and 742, HPD is before the Planning |
| 9 | Subcommittee seeking disposition approval for 114-47 |
| 10 | Inwood Street; 145-36 11th Avenue; 110-60 Wood |
| 11 | Street; as well as UDAAP tax benefits for all 23 |
| 12 | properties, including Land Use No. 742. Thank you. |
| 13 | CHAIR COHEN: Thank you. I just want to |
| 14 | sort of understand what's happening at large. HUD |
| 15 | gave the property to NYCHA; NYCHA's conveying the |
| 16 | property to not-for-profits who are going to rehab |
| 17 | them and then through an HPD program we're gonna |
| 18 | convey them to eligible purchasers who will |
| 19 | apparently, earn up to 120% of AMI. |
| 20 | JORDAN PRESS: And we're also the |
| 21 | authorized entity to request the UDAAP tax benefits |
| 22 | as well. That's correct [crosstalk] |
| 23 | CHAIR COHEN: That's why ultimately, |
| 24 | that's why we're here, for the… the tax benefit is |
| 25 | part of the package. |
| | |

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 9 JORDAN PRESS: And the disposition, yes. 2 CHAIR COHEN: And the disposition? 3 4 JORDAN PRESS: Yes. 5 CHAIR COHEN: But NYCHA is the ... NYCHA owns the property? 6 7 [background comments] 8 JORDAN PRESS: The three City-owned 9 properties NYCHA owns ... [crosstalk] 10 CHAIR COHEN: Okay. Could... I'm sorry; 11 could you put your name on the... [crosstalk] 12 JORDAN PRESS: Yeah. 13 NADJA RATCLIFFE: Nadja Ratcliffe ... Nadja 14 Ratcliffe, Director of Homeownership Programs in 15 Development at HPD. 16 CHAIR COHEN: So 23 of the homes are 17 owned by NYCHA and 3 are owned by the City? 18 NADJA RATCLIFFE: Twenty are owned by 19 NYCHA; 3 are owned by the City. 20 CHAIR COHEN: Okay. But there's ... Are there 24 homes or 23 homes? 21 2.2 NADJA RATCLIFFE: [inaudible] TPT. 23 JORDAN PRESS: And then... which is also ... So it's 20 plus 3, plus 1. 24 25 CHAIR COHEN: Plus 1.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 10 CONCESSIONS JORDAN PRESS: Yeah and... [interpose] 2 3 CHAIR COHEN: I know Jordan may have said 4 all of this, but I'm just trying to make... [crosstalk] 5 JORDAN PRESS: that... that's okay; they're all [inaudible]... 6 7 CHAIR COHEN: I'm trying to prove that uh... or disprove that I understood what he's saying. 8 9 [laugh] JORDAN PRESS: So 20 plus 3 [background 10 11 comments] and then plus an additional one, which is coming from the Third Party Transfer ... 12 13 CHAIR COHEN: Okay. 14 JORDAN PRESS: program. 15 CHAIR COHEN: Do you know what the breakdown is of one-family, two-family, three-family, 16 17 and four-family? 18 JORDAN PRESS: I believe these are all ... 19 these are all one-family? 20 NADJA RATCLIFFE: All two-family, except 21 for one three-family. 2.2 CHAIR COHEN: All twos ... 23 NADJA RATCLIFFE: Except for the last TPT; that'll be a three-family. 24 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 11 2 CHAIR COHEN: That'll be a three-family. 3 Okay. Is that... [interpose] 4 JORDAN PRESS: We're... We're going to ask the sponsor, Sal D'Avola, to introduce himself 5 and provide clarity ... 6 7 CHAIR COHEN: Welcome. JORDAN PRESS: as he always can do. 8 9 [background comments] SAL D'AVOLA: Sal D'Avola, Executive 10 11 Director of Neighborhood Restore and Restored Homes; 12 we're the nonprofit that's gonna take title to these 13 properties. 14 The NYCHA houses are all single-family; 15 the HPD ones are all single-family; the Third Party 16 Transfer one at 580 Lafayette is currently a four-17 family that we're converting to a three-family. 18 CHAIR COHEN: So 23 ones and 1 four? 19 NADJA RATCLIFFE: Correct. 20 [background comments] 21 CHAIR COHEN: 'Kay. JORDAN PRESS: Which will become a three. 2.2 23 CHAIR COHEN: Which will become a three. That's good, 'cause anecdotally, I have concerns 24 about the people's ability to manage the multi-25

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 12 |
|----|--|
| 2 | families, but I guess in this case that's not really |
| 3 | an issue; the three-family you'll make sure… make |
| 4 | extra effort to make sure that that ends up in the |
| 5 | hands of someone who can manage a three-family house. |
| 6 | SAL D'AVOLA: Yeah, all of our homeowners |
| 7 | will go through homeownership training; they'll all |
| 8 | be required to do that before they qualify to |
| 9 | purchase the homes and one of the classes that is |
| 10 | offered is landlord training for the multi-family |
| 11 | properties. |
| 12 | CHAIR COHEN: How long is the tax break |
| 13 | for? What is the duration of the tax benefit? |
| 14 | [background comments] |
| 15 | NADJA RATCLIFFE: Twenty years. |
| 16 | CHAIR COHEN: Twenty years. And you've |
| 17 | explained this at hearings before and maybe I |
| 18 | understood, but I'm gonna try to understand one more |
| 19 | time. If someone… I'm an eligible, qualified |
| 20 | purchaser; I purchase the home; at 10 years I decide |
| 21 | I wanna move; what happens? |
| 22 | NADJA RATCLIFFE: There will be some |
| 23 | level of subsidy There'd be some level of subsidy |
| 24 | that would have to be repaid back to the City, but as |
| 25 | |
| | |

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 13 2 far as the tax exemption, it would go to the next 3 owner who resides in the home. 4 CHAIR COHEN: The tax exemption is sort 5 of a... you get that benefit in the year you get it and that just ... 6 7 NADJA RATCLIFFE: It'll stay with the property as long as it's owner-occupied. [background 8 9 comment] That's the key; it has to be owneroccupied. 10 11 CHAIR COHEN: But what about the HPD ... Besides the tax benefit, what else is HPD giving 12 13 these... what else in the subsidy? 14 NADJA RATCLIFFE: We provide funding for 15 the construction so that we can keep the house prices 16 low. 17 CHAIR COHEN: You're financing the rehabilitation? 18 19 NADJA RATCLIFFE: Yes. A portion of it, 20 yes. 21 SAL D'AVOLA: Along with private financing. There's a facility that we have; we will 2.2 23 be getting construction financing from a private lender and there will also be additional subsidy from 24 HPD in the deal and we will also be applying for 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 14 State Affordable Housing Corporation subsidy. 2 Each 3 homeowner will have an enforcement note and mortgage 4 that's tied to it when they purchase the home; the enforcement note and mortgage will actually lay out 5 the terms under which the homeowners will be 6 7 obligated to remain in the properties, and if, in your instance, if someone were to sell the home 8 9 within 10 years, depending on the enforcement note and mortgage, there probably will be some recapture 10 11 of funding that was put into the deal. So the money would come back and HPD and the State would have to 12 13 approved the sale of that property because the 14 enforcement note and mortgage will probably be -- I 15 think it's 20 years ... 16 NADJA RATCLIFFE: Right. 17 SAL D'AVOLA: is what the enforcement 18 note and mortgage is. So for the period of 20 years, 19 any refinancing or any sale of that property would 20 have to come back to the City of New York and the 21 City of New York would have to approve that 2.2 subsequent sale, and it's at that point when they 23 would look at the documents and determine how much would be recaptured, in terms of subsidy. 24 25 [background comment]

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 15 CHAIR COHEN: Can the purchaser sell it 2 3 for any amount that they want to; is there ... 4 SAL D'AVOLA: The enforcement note and 5 mortgage that we are talking to the City about -- and we've done one cluster of these houses already; we 6 7 are actually in the process of completing 19 NYCHA 8 homes, so the assumption is is that those enforcement 9 notes and mortgages will be the same for the second There are nuances in the enforcement note 10 cluster. 11 and mortgage that are tied to the affordability on 12 the subsequent purchaser. A portion of these homes 13 we are selling cannot exceed 80% of AMI and a portion of these homes cannot exceed 120% of AMI; it's a 14 15 50/50 split essentially in the homes. On subsequent resale of these properties, if one of the homes was 16 17 sold to someone who was below 80% of AMI, let's say; 18 when they go to sell the home within the recapture 19 period, if they sell it to someone who is also below 20 80% of AMI; then they are not required to actually 21 repay those subsidies; those subsidies will transfer 2.2 to that subsequent homeowner. 23 CHAIR COHEN: If I qualify, do I put money down? I mean, is there ... 24 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 16 CONCESSIONS SAL D'AVOLA: Yes, there's a... it's a 2 3 mortgage; I mean they are affordable housing 4 mortgages, there are lenders that have community lending products for this population of people, but 5 there will be a requirement of at least 5% down. 6 7 CHAIR COHEN: Five percent. But you're gonna put the whole package together; once we 8 9 identify an eligible purchaser ... SAL D'AVOLA: We will abide by HPD's 10 11 marketing guidelines. So HPD has a set of marketing 12 guidelines and they have a plan; we will work out a plan on how we identify purchasers to this -- it will 13 14 be a lottery; through that lottery we will then have 15 certain preference categories that are laid out by HPD in the marketing plan; we will then interview all 16 17 of these purchasers, interested purchasers and we 18 will qualify them and then they eventually will have 19 to get a mortgage, and so they will also be 20 underwritten by a lender who's gonna look at that to 21 make sure that they can afford that mortgage. 2.2 CHAIR COHEN: Is the lender someone 23 you're gonna work with too or they could ... SAL D'AVOLA: Yes, we have a pool of 24 lenders that have this community lending product 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 17 CONCESSIONS 2 that's available to these purchasers, and so we 3 recommend to interested purchasers three or four different lenders to talk to about this. 4 5 CHAIR COHEN: So the ultimate price of the home is gonna a function of all of the programs 6 7 more so than whatever the market might bear for these 8 homes? 9 SAL D'AVOLA: These will all be below 10 market. 11 CHAIR COHEN: Okay. We've been joined by 12 Council Member Treyger; I was gonna ask Council 13 Member Treyger if you have any questions. [background comment] I know that myself and Council 14 15 Member Treyger though are big fans of programs that ultimately give people an opportunity for 16 17 homeownership and that is what we're doing today, so 18 I am very pleased. So I'm now going to ask if 19 there's members of the public who wish to testify? 20 That's what I'm gonna do; I'm gonna ask if there's 21 members of the public who wish to testify? Seeing 2.2 none. Alright. 23 I'm now gonna close the public hearing on LU 739-742 and I'm gonna go on to our next hearing, 24 which will be on Preconsidered LU -- the Hope Homes 25

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 18 |
|----|--|
| 2 | Cluster Tax Exemption application. In this |
| 3 | application, HPD is seeking approval of an amendment |
| 4 | to a previously approved tax exemption for several |
| 5 | properties in The Speaker's district in Manhattan. |
| 6 | The amendment will extend the term of the exemption |
| 7 | from 10 years to 20 years. I am now opening the |
| 8 | public hearing on the Hope Homes Cluster application. |
| 9 | Mr. Press. |
| 10 | JORDAN PRESS: Thank you. This |
| 11 | preconsidered item consists of an amendment to a |
| 12 | previously approved project in our HPD's Neighborhood |
| 13 | Homes Program known as the Hope Homes Cluster. |
| 14 | On June 28, 2001, Resolution No. 1987, |
| 15 | the City Council approved the disposition of 14 |
| 16 | properties, all within the Borough of Manhattan. Of |
| 17 | the 14 buildings, 4 are in Council District 9 and 10 |
| 18 | are in Council District 8. More specifically, the |
| 19 | locations are: Block 1644, Lot 65; Block 1749, Lot |
| 20 | 16; Block 1750, Lots 57 and 58; Block 1751, Lot 50; |
| 21 | Block 1783, Lots 109 and 110; Block 1785, Lot 8; |
| 22 | Block 1796, Lots 41 and 21; Block 1806, Lots 37 and |
| 23 | 111; Block 1807, Lot 113; and Block 1796, Lot 4. |
| 24 | The original approval allowed for the |
| 25 | redevelopment of the properties into two-, three- and |
| | |

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 19 |
|----|--|
| 2 | four-family homes, which HPD conveyed on May 13, |
| 3 | 2002. Upon completion of the rehabilitation, the |
| 4 | sponsor began selling the buildings to homebuyers, |
| 5 | which occurred between 2004 and 2006. As part of the |
| 6 | original project approval, each property received |
| 7 | UDAAP tax benefits for a period of 10 years which |
| 8 | have now expired. The program also had an owner- |
| 9 | occupancy requirement. Once that obligation was met, |
| 10 | the owner was free to sell the property with few |
| 11 | restrictions. |
| 12 | It has been brought to HPD's attention |
| 13 | that the homebuyers were originally given information |
| 14 | indicating that the UDAAP tax benefits were to be |
| 15 | granted for a period of 20 years rather than 10 |
| 16 | years. To date, many owners are still in occupancy |
| 17 | and are experiencing hardship due to the |
| 18 | implementation of real property taxes, given that the |
| 19 | 10-year tax exemption has expired. After very |
| 20 | careful consideration, HPD is before the Planning |
| 21 | Subcommittee seeking to extend the UDAAP tax benefits |
| 22 | for an additional 10 years, for a total of 20 years |
| 23 | under UDAAP statutes. The exemption will effectively |
| 24 | pick up where the original 10-year period ended. It |
| 25 | should be noted that under UDAAP statutes, during the |
| | |

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 20 CONCESSIONS last 10 years of the exemption phase the benefits 2 3 will decrease in equal annual amounts of 10% until full taxes are due. 4 5 Also, as a requirement of HPD's homeownership programs, eligible property owners will 6 be required to document owner occupancy by entering 7 8 into a regulatory agreement for the duration of the 9 extended tax benefit. This request has the support of Speaker 10 11 Mark-Viverito and Council Member Bill Perkins. Thank 12 you. 13 CHAIR COHEN: You know first I'll say something nice about HPD -- [inaudible] once in a 14 15 while -- but it does seem that HPD is really going 16 that extra mile to try to work something out with 17 people who have in good faith entered into this 18 program, purchased these homes; whether it was 19 miscommunication or whatever happened, to try to come 20 up with a resolution that is fair and equitable, so I do think that HPD deserves credit for that. 21 2.2 JORDAN PRESS: Thank you. The statute 23 does allow for 20 years; I'm a little bit unclear as to why it was only done for 10, but this was the 24 homeowners' expectation and after, again, very 25

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 21 |
|----|--|
| 2 | careful consideration, we believe this is the right |
| 3 | thing to do. |
| 4 | CHAIR COHEN: I'm just curious; I haven't |
| 5 | conducted a real estate closing in a long time, but |
| 6 | wouldn't a title search have told the owners that |
| 7 | they had a 10-year tax exemption versus a 20-year tax |
| 8 | exemption? |
| 9 | JORDAN PRESS: I don't know that it would |
| 10 | have been the title search; the 10-year exemption was |
| 11 | attached to the resolution that the Council passed; |
| 12 | DOF is then responsible for implementing that tax |
| 13 | exemption. I think it's fair to say that a very |
| 14 | diligent attorney on behalf of the purchasers may |
| 15 | have caught that, but our property tax system is |
| 16 | quite arcane in the City and I can understand how it |
| 17 | could've been missed. |
| 18 | CHAIR COHEN: Yeah, I can too I guess, |
| 19 | but it sort of just circles back to my initial |
| 20 | concern that it's important that we really offer a |
| 21 | deep level of support to people who you don't have a |
| 22 | tradition of being homeowners of how complicated a |
| 23 | transaction that they're entering into and I mean |
| 24 | this is clearly if you thought you had a 20-year |
| 25 | tax exemption and you had a 10-year tax exemption; |
| | |

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 22 |
|----|--|
| 2 | that is, you know, thousands and thousands and |
| 3 | thousands of dollars that you didn't anticipate; it's |
| 4 | important that we… and again, I think HPD really |
| 5 | seems to have stepped up to the plate to try to solve |
| 6 | the problem, but again, trying to make sure that |
| 7 | people who are purchasing these homes really know |
| 8 | what they're purchasing. |
| 9 | JORDAN PRESS: We will take the praise |
| 10 | and leave the room [inaudible] [laughter]. |
| 11 | CHAIR COHEN: Excellent. Alright. |
| 12 | [background comments] Alright, I'm gonna go back to |
| 13 | where I [inaudible] here; I'm not gonna do that. I'm |
| 14 | gonna do our last hearing today; it will be on |
| 15 | LU 747-750, the Lower Concourse North Rezoning. |
| 16 | The application submitted by the New York |
| 17 | City Economic Development Corporation seeks approval |
| 18 | of a disposition of City-owned property, zoning map |
| 19 | amendment, text amendment, and special permit. These |
| 20 | approvals would facilitate the development of the |
| 21 | site located on the Harlem River, just north of the |
| 22 | 145th Street Bridge in the Bronx. The proposed |
| 23 | development would include over 1,000 units of housing |
| 24 | and a mix of retail, office and community facility |
| 25 | leases, and a significant amount of publicly |
| | |

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 23 CONCESSIONS accessible open space. The development site is 2 3 located in The Speaker's district and she was 4 planning to be here today, but the hurricane and crisis in Puerto Rico have pulled her away. In her 5 absence she has asked me to read a brief statement. 6 7 From The Speaker: 8 "At almost five acres, the Lower 9 Concourse North site is one of the few large plots of City-owned land in the South Bronx and has remained 10 11 undeveloped for over 20 years, so a site of this size 12 requires us to make sure we are doing everything we 13 can to achieve a variety of policy goals. 14 We know that open space has been a key 15 issue for this project from the start. There has 16 been a lot of confusion and miscommunication about 17 the plans for the site, which makes it even more 18 critical that this project deliver high-quality, 19 publicly accessible open space for the community, 20 which includes waterfront access and an extension to Mill Pond Park. 21 2.2 Affordable housing is another core 23 concern, with 600 units planned for Phase 1 and up to 400 units in Phase 2. We need to ensure that these 24 units will reach a deep level of affordability 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 24 CONCESSIONS including units at 30% and 40% of AMI not just for 2 3 Phase 1, but also in Phase 2. 4 The schools in the adjacent district are overcrowded and this project will only increase those 5 challenges, so we need to ensure that we are building 6 7 school seats as we are building housing. These are all significant and serious 8 9 concerns and I look forward to continuing the dialogue to see if we can address these issues in the 10 limited amount of time we have." 11 I am now opening the hearing on LU 747-12 13 750, the Lower Concourse North Rezoning. If you guys 14 could introduce yourself, please. 15 CECILIA KUSHNER: Good afternoon, Council 16 Member Cohen and Council Member Treyger. My name is 17 Cecilia Kushner; I'm the Senior Vice President of the 18 Economic Development Corporation. I'm joined here by 19 Nick Molinari from the Parks Department. Thank you 20 for the opportunity to discuss this very important 21 project. As The Speaker mentioned in her remarks, 2.2 23 this project is a unique opportunity to develop one of the last large vacant waterfront sites owned by 24 the City to deliver on multiple community and City 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 25 CONCESSIONS objectives in the South Bronx; namely, affordable 2 housing, high-quality waterfront open space and 3 4 cultural and community amenities. 5 I'm happy to be joined today by the development team that was selected by EDC to develop 6 7 the site; it's a joint venture partnership between 8 L&M Development Partners and Type A Projects, which is a woman-owned emerging developer. The development 9 team and many of their project partners are here 10 11 today to walk you through the details of the Bronx 12 Point projects; I don't wanna steal their thunder, 13 but I wanted to give some context to the work that the City and EDC in particular have been doing in the 14 15 neighborhood so you understand how the Bronx Point 16 projects fit overall. 17 And before I begin, I also wanna thank 18 The Speaker's staff -- George Sarkissian and Rebecca 19 Crimmins, who have been instrumental in helping us 20 coming to today. 21 So the Bronx Point project is a key 2.2 component of the Lower Concourse investment plan, 23 which is a \$194 million infrastructure and open space investment that was announced by the Mayor in the 24 2016 State of the City and which is currently being 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 26 CONCESSIONS To guide and prioritize this \$194 2 implemented. 3 million allocation, EDC conducted investigative 4 analysis on the state of existing infrastructure and through interactive workshops and community visioning 5 sessions worked closely with local residents in 6 7 Community Board 1 and 4 in the Bronx to identify the four [inaudible] community priorities that are on the 8 9 slide behind me. So the four priorities that the community 10 11 really drove home for us were, first, a desire for development of mixed-income, affordable housing that 12 13 meets the needs of the people in the surrounding area but also provides option for moderate- and middle-14 15 income Bronx residents who wanna stay in the South 16 Bronx but struggle to find quality housing options. 17 The second goal was a strong desire for 18 more open space including opportunities to extend the 19 Harlem River waterfront greenway. 20 The third one was community facility uses 21 that benefit the local community including activities 2.2 for youth and cultural and educational space. 23 And the fourth one was access to jobs and

workforce development opportunities.

25

24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 27 CONCESSIONS In response to these priorities, the City 2 3 has committed to a number of projects to use the \$194 million allocation, including the acquisition of 4 building of the new waterfront park that will be 2.3 5 acres that is at 144th Street. This is a park that 6 7 was mapped parkland during a 2009 City Planning rezoning in the area, but it was never funded and 8 9 therefore the City never moved forward with actually creating the park. 10

We also are working through a full-depth reconstruction of Exterior Street which is the major street under the Deegan Highway, including new sewers and water line; the redesign of three very large and dangerous intersections at 149th Street, 144th Street and 138th Street.

17 The Bronx Point project in the Lower 18 Concourse North site, which is our third kind of 19 major investment, and finally, broadband 20 infrastructure to spur the area potential as a jobs 21 hub.

All of these investments are currently under various stages of advancement, but broadly, to update you, we aim to complete the street and sewer infrastructure in 2021, secure the title for the park 1SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
CONCESSIONS282at 144th Street by early next year and open the new3park in 2022.

4 Redevelopment of the Lower Concourse North site into the Bronx Point redevelopment is 5 critical in realizing its overall vision for the 6 7 Historically an industrial site, the only area. remaining [inaudible] building that was on the site 8 9 was demolished in the early 2000s; since then, the site has remained vacant with its waterfront in 10 11 disrepair and activities only with temporary uses. 12 Over time, many ideas for this site were discussed 13 but were never funded, including using it for open space, indoor recreational uses and even a velodrome 14 15 during the 2012 Olympic bid.

Lower Concourse North is one of the very few remaining vacant City-owned parcels in this neighborhood; its large size allows the City to deliver on all of the goals that were established through the community process that we held for the last couple of years.

22 So these are the land use actions that 23 are in front of the City Council for approval. To 24 make sure that the site produces the best possible 25 design, we've crafted special rezoning requirements

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 29 |
|----|--|
| 2 | as part of an extension of the new subdistrict in the |
| 3 | Special Harlem River District, which is to the south |
| 4 | of our site. Additional land use actions for the |
| 5 | project include disposition authority, a rezoning |
| 6 | from M2-1 to an R7-2 with a C2-5 overlay to allow for |
| 7 | a mixed-use development program, the mapping of MIH, |
| 8 | as well as the establishment of the Waterfront Access |
| 9 | Plan that guarantees quality waterfront open space. |
| 10 | And finally, we are also seeking a special permit to |
| 11 | waive requirements for parking spaces for units that |
| 12 | are above 80% of AMI to support the affordability |
| 13 | goal of the project as well as in recognition of the |
| 14 | transit access of the area and the existing large |
| 15 | supply of parking space directly across from our |
| 16 | site. |
| 17 | So just to conclude: since the mayoral |
| 18 | announcement of investment in the Lower Concourse |
| 19 | neighborhood we've been committed to work really |
| 20 | closely with the community to make the best of our |
| 21 | money and to make sure that the City delivers. The |
| 22 | Bronx Point is a really important project in this |
| 23 | endeavor for the City; as part of this process, we've |
| 24 | committed to form also a dedicated working group that |

25 will meet with CB4; local stakeholders to provide

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 30 |
|----|--|
| 2 | input and make sure that the implementation of both |
| 3 | the City's investment as well as the Bronx Point |
| 4 | project is done in pure collaboration. So with this |
| 5 | site and the [inaudible] \$194 million investment in |
| 6 | the area, we believe this improvement will be a |
| 7 | source of pride for residents and an opportunity to |
| 8 | address longstanding issues for continued engagement. |
| 9 | Thank you for your time. I can take any |
| 10 | questions or can wait for my colleague at Parks to |
| 11 | give his remarks and then we can take questions |
| 12 | together. |
| 13 | CHAIR COHEN: Yeah, I think I'd prefer |
| 14 | the testimony first. |
| 15 | CECILIA KUSHNER: Okay. |
| 16 | NICK MOLINARI: Good afternoon, Council |
| 17 | Member Cohen, members of the Subcommittee and other |
| 18 | members of the City Council. I am Nick Molinari, |
| 19 | Chief of Planning and Neighborhood Development at New |
| 20 | York City Parks. Thank you for providing me with an |
| 21 | opportunity to offer testimony on EDC's project at |
| 22 | Lower Concourse North. |
| 23 | Parks is committed to expanding |
| 24 | waterfront access along the Harlem River and |
| 25 | improving open space, and we have many projects that |
| | |

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 31 work to accomplish this. Specifically, we worked to 2 3 complete Mill Pond Park, refurbished the historic 4 High Bridge, and completed a portion of Bridge Park at the bridge's footing. We continue to work towards 5 completion and are also pursuing acquisition of the 6 7 Putnam Rail Line, which could create an important 8 greenway connection between the Harlem River 9 waterfront and Van Cortlandt Park and areas further to the north. Partnering with Bronx Council for 10 11 Environmental Quality and New York State Department 12 of State, we completed the Harlem River Brownfield 13 Opportunity Area Report, which outlines a 14 comprehensive vision for the Bronx waterfront of the 15 Harlem River. To the south, we are also working closely with EDC to acquire and develop a 2.3-acre 16 17 site as a waterfront park at 144th Street. 18 The Lower Concourse North project will 19 help us to achieve our goals of expanding waterfront 20 access and improving public open space along the 21 Harlem River. It will provide substantial, high-2.2 quality open space and presents an opportunity to 23 provide amenities the community has been requesting, and expands towards a more continuous waterfront 24 The residential and commercial uses on 25 esplanade.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 32 the site will also bring more eyes on the neighboring 2 Mill Pond Park, which we've found can help make 3 4 people feel safer. While we believe this project will 5 accomplish many of the City's objectives, we also 6 7 understand that some member of the community feel that this site is already parkland. I would like to 8 9 take the time now to address those concerns and review the site's history. 10 11 In 2006, New York City Parks was assigned 12 jurisdiction of Piers 1 through 5, the area between 13 the Major Deegan Exit 6 Ramp and the 145th Street 14 Bridge. The mere assignment of those parcels to New 15 York City Parks did not dedicate them as parkland. 16 Although some may associate Pier 5 with the Yankee 17 Stadium and Gateway Center projects, a commitment to 18 create parkland at Pier 5 was not part of either 19 project. 20 In connection with the new Yankee 21 Stadium, a total of 22.42 acres of parkland was 2.2 alienated. Replacement parkland (a total 24.56 23 acres) was acquired and developed, including Piers 2 and 3, which were mapped as parkland. 24 25

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 33 |
|----|--|
| 2 | Piers 4 and 5 are not mapped parkland. |
| 3 | Pier 4 was developed as open space in connection with |
| 4 | the Gateway Center development to the east of the |
| 5 | Major Deegan Expressway. |
| 6 | After New York City Parks was assigned |
| 7 | the Pier 5 property in 2006, the area remained vacant |
| 8 | and unimproved. As a sizable vacant site, it was |
| 9 | used in part by various entities for construction |
| 10 | staging, for a pilot demonstration capturing storm |
| 11 | water runoff, and for occasional circuses and |
| 12 | carnivals. Pier 5 has since been transferred to the |
| 13 | New York City Department of Small Business Services. |
| 14 | As the steward of parkland, Parks is |
| 15 | committed to creating and sustaining thriving parks |
| 16 | for all New Yorkers. We are avid protectors of this |
| 17 | incredibly important resource. Although Pier 5 has |
| 18 | been in Parks' portfolio, it is not mapped or |
| 19 | otherwise dedicated parkland, and Parks supports |
| 20 | EDC's proposal for the site as it delivers new open |
| 21 | space and expands waterfront access to the public. |
| 22 | I thank you for allowing me to testify |
| 23 | before you today and I'm happy to answer any |
| 24 | questions you may have. |
| 25 | |

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 34 2 CHAIR COHEN: Okay. I guess sort of the predicate matter; you both mentioned the park at 3 4 144th Street and that that was ... the City committed to that in 2009? 5 CECILIA KUSHNER: The City mapped it 6 7 parkland as part of the Harlem River Special District 8 rezoning that was conducted and led by City Planning 9 at the time. So there was a land use action to map it as parkland, but then the City needs to take the 10 11 action to actually put money in its budget to pay for 12 the acquisition of private property and realize the 13 development and the creation of a new park, which 14 this Administration has been doing through our 15 investments in the area. 16 CHAIR COHEN: But the 2009 commitment, we 17 still haven't acquired the land... [crosstalk] CECILIA KUSHNER: We're in the process of 18 19 acquiring them. We're in the process of going 20 through the eminent domain process of these 21 properties. 2.2 CHAIR COHEN: It seems like it's taking a 23 long time; 2009 was a long time ago. CECILIA KUSHNER: So nothing happened 24 between 2009 when it was mapped parkland and the 25

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 35 |
|----|--|
| 2 | announcement in the State of the City in 2015 from |
| 3 | this Administration to fund the acquisition of the |
| 4 | private property. So since then we've moved forward; |
| 5 | we've had an eminent domain public hearing in the |
| 6 | winter of 2016; we're now going through the courts |
| 7 | and through all the process that is required by the |
| 8 | City to actually acquire private property under |
| 9 | legislation, and then by early probably February or |
| 10 | March the courts will actually give the City title |
| 11 | for these properties. |
| 12 | CHAIR COHEN: Are we using eminent domain |
| 13 | whoever the entity that owns the property now |
| 14 | doesn't wanna sell it? |
| 15 | CECILIA KUSHNER: There are three |
| 16 | different property owners, it's three different |
| 17 | properties; there is a wide variation of willingness |
| 18 | to sell and willingness to negotiate with the City, I |
| 19 | would say. But all property owners are waiting for |
| 20 | the full court process to take action prior to |
| 21 | negotiating with the City. |
| 22 | CHAIR COHEN: Okay. But you think the |
| 23 | acquisition phase will be completed |
| 24 | CECILIA KUSHNER: Sure. Yeah, like the |
| 25 | site was the three properties were mapped as |
| | |

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 36 parkland, so the City needs to go through the 2 3 process, but the City is very confident... [crosstalk] 4 CHAIR COHEN: I'm sorry; did you say a timeline for when you think that acquisition will be 5 completed? 6 CECILIA KUSHNER: Sure, sure. 7 So we think we will get title, which allows the City then 8 9 to kick in like design, by early next year, like February or March we should be able to get title for 10 11 the three properties. Then we'll work with Parks 12 for... [crosstalk] 13 NICK MOLINARI: Yeah ... 14 CECILIA KUSHNER: That's right. 15 NICK MOLINARI: if you go through the 16 eminent domain process, it can take a number of 17 years, but once you [inaudible] title, you can start 18 improving the property. 19 CECILIA KUSHNER: That's right, and that 20 allows the City to actually fund funding towards 21 creating the park. CHAIR COHEN: Okay. I mean unfortunately 2.2 23 it still sounds like we're a ways away though before people are enjoying a park. 24 25 CECILIA KUSHNER: Yeah...

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 37 |
|----|--|
| 2 | CHAIR COHEN: Yeah, okay. |
| 3 | CECILIA KUSHNER: a few years away. |
| 4 | CHAIR COHEN: Okay. I guess also I just |
| 5 | have concern, you know not exactly in the project, |
| 6 | but is school capacity; [background comment] I think |
| 7 | that people are concerned you're talking about a |
| 8 | thousand units; how does this project fit into the |
| 9 | scheme of the current capacity; are you working with |
| 10 | SCA in terms of developing additional capacity, if |
| 11 | needed? |
| 12 | CECILIA KUSHNER: Sure. So for our |
| 13 | projects, in the final EIS, the environmental review |
| 14 | documents, we have a commitment letter for SCA and |
| 15 | EDC to monitor the project; that's the way we deal |
| 16 | with school impact for projects that will be |
| 17 | happening in the future; that allows the City to |
| 18 | really year by year have a better sense of like when |
| 19 | the project will be delivered, how many families are |
| 20 | expected in the project; how many school kids are |
| 21 | expected in the project so that the City can be a |
| 22 | little bit more granular about the future needs, so |
| 23 | that's how we're dealing with our projects. But it |
| 24 | is true that currently in the subdistrict in which |
| 25 | our project is located; absent our project, there is |
| | |

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 38 a school need today. So we understand that doesn't 2 3 make sense from a planning perspective to plan for 4 future kids if you cannot serve existing kids, so we're working really closely with SCA to try to find 5 a solution to the existing school need. 6 7 CHAIR COHEN: I mean just as a Bronx council member, I can tell you that there's not 8 9 enough seats and the scale of this project would be a real concern to me if there wasn't a real... a 10 11 meaningful commitment; not just a desire, but sort of 12 a plan to increase capacity in terms of seats ... 13 [crosstalk] 14 CECILIA KUSHNER: Yeah; understood. 15 CHAIR COHEN: You know I am sort of familiar with the site and it's not that easy to get 16 17 to. 18 CECILIA KUSHNER: Uhm-hm. 19 CHAIR COHEN: How is that gonna ... How is 20 that ultimately gonna work, other than -- 'cause I 21 like to get off at 153rd Street and kind of barrel 2.2 down... [crosstalk] 23 CECILIA KUSHNER: And then make your way down? Okay. 24 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 39 2 CHAIR COHEN: I come down the ramp and 3 then ... 4 CECILIA KUSHNER: Yeah. 5 CHAIR COHEN: you go under to the market 6 there ... 7 CECILIA KUSHNER: Yeah. 8 CHAIR COHEN: I... I quess you can ... as you 9 come down there's a stop sign that there is not much reason to stop at now, but I do ... 10 11 CECILIA KUSHNER: Yeah. CHAIR COHEN: but ultimately there would 12 13 be I guess traffic there; is that it? 14 CECILIA KUSHNER: Uhm yeah. So I think 15 you're completely correct that right now Exterior 16 Street, like under the Major Deegan, really is a 17 barrier to pedestrian safety and just to people 18 getting to the waterfront and being able to really 19 enjoy like Mill Pond Park, which is why part of like 20 the... a significant investment that is part of \$194 million allocation... [interpose] 21 CHAIR COHEN: This is south... like there's 22 23 a tennis bubble [sic] there; this is south of there? 24 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 40 2 CECILIA KUSHNER: Correct. Correct. You have the tennis bubble, you have Mill Pond Park and 3 4 then our site is right next to... [crosstalk] 5 CHAIR COHEN: Right at ... CECILIA KUSHNER: right next to the 6 7 bridge, right next to ... So the intersection that is 8 the one that would really lead to our park is the 9 149th Street intersection... CHAIR COHEN: That's a crazy ... 10 11 CECILIA KUSHNER: it's a very, very 12 dangerous intersection; each time our team goes 13 there, we always wonder whether or not we're gonna 14 make it across the street. Part of the \$194 million 15 investment that we're making is a complete redesign of this intersection. So the three major 16 17 intersections that we're completely redesigning with 18 pedestrian safety and [inaudible] in mind are 149th Street, 144th Street, which would be right at the 19 20 entrance of the new park, and 144th Street is the 21 only street that goes from the west side of the 2.2 neighborhood directly into the neighborhood, and 23 138th Street. So the idea is that people can actually cross these streets safely getting to the 24 25 other side, where now, with Bronx Point and the new

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 41 park, there is actually a reason for folks to go and 2 3 cross the street. 4 CHAIR COHEN: There will be very little access from the north though; right? 5 CECILIA KUSHNER: I mean you'll continue 6 to have -- How north is north? 7 CHAIR COHEN: North of 149th Street; I 8 9 don't know how you kinda get over there. CECILIA KUSHNER: Oh. Yeah, I mean 10 11 there's like a... we're looking at like all of 12 transportation -- you're right; we need to like 13 strike a balance between pedestrian safety and the traffic flow of the Major... [crosstalk] 14 15 CHAIR COHEN: I'm not even sure 16 pedestrians [inaudible]. 17 CECILIA KUSHNER: right? And so whether 18 or not like once you've taken care of 149th you need 19 other points to cross, like higher up on 150th and 20 like all the subsequent streets is something we're 21 also looking at. CHAIR COHEN: When would those traffic 2.2 23 improvements be implemented? CECILIA KUSHNER: Sure. So we're in 24 25 concept design right now and we have a designer; that

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 42 |
|----|--|
| 2 | takes about 20 months to work with DOT for like the |
| 3 | exact kind of circulation design; the idea is that |
| 4 | it's implemented with a brand new intersection by |
| 5 | 2021. |
| 6 | CHAIR COHEN: I'm not 100% sure what this |
| 7 | question means exactly, but I'm gonna ask it anyway. |
| 8 | A pedestrian circulation impact was identified in |
| 9 | your EIS to the subway at 149th and Grand Concourse; |
| 10 | can you explain how this is being addressed? I'm not |
| 11 | sure that you can understand what that question |
| 12 | means, but it… [interpose] |
| 13 | CECILIA KUSHNER: I think… I think I do; |
| 14 | I'll give… [crosstalk] |
| 15 | CHAIR COHEN: Okay. |
| 16 | CECILIA KUSHNER: [inaudible]. So in the |
| 17 | EIS that we did for the site, there is pedestrian |
| 18 | impact; it is mainly due to a residential building |
| 19 | that is on 149th Street that is putting its garbage |
| 20 | out in a way that is blocking pedestrian access to |
| 21 | the site, and that is the main reason why we have an |
| 22 | impact, so we're working with Sanitation to see who |
| 23 | their operation… [crosstalk] |
| 24 | CHAIR COHEN: Is that on the north side |
| 25 | of 149th? |
| | |

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 43 CONCESSIONS CECILIA KUSHNER: I think so. Yeah. 2 3 Yeah. Yeah. So we're working with Sanitation to resolve the issue. 4 CHAIR COHEN: I quess Hostos has most of 5 the property on the south... [crosstalk] 6 7 CECILIA KUSHNER: On the south; that's That's right. 8 right. 9 CHAIR COHEN: Okay. I have questions for the developer. Mr. Treyger; do you have any 10 11 questions for this panel? Please. 12 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you, 13 Mr. Chair. Just a couple of questions, and I think 14 the Chair alluded to it before, but just for 15 clarification. So a lot of times we go through these 16 actions and the illustrations look pretty cool and things look very nice, but we have to be very upfront 17 and blunt and honest with residents about this and 18 19 manage their expectations, [background comment] so 20 you have not acquired all the properties yet that 21 we're talking about as far as future park; is that 2.2 correct; that's still in the process? 23 CECILIA KUSHNER: Sure. So for the 144th Street park, which is not part of the actions that 24 are in front of City Council for hearing... [crosstalk] 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 44 CONCESSIONS 2 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Okay. 3 CECILIA KUSHNER: they're just for 4 context of what the City is doing ... 5 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Okav. CECILIA KUSHNER: we are in the process 6 7 for eminent domain and the City is extremely confident in its ability to be able to get title for 8 9 the three properties early next year. COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: So forgive me; 10 I'm not... this is not my district, but as I'm trying 11 to understand this, are those parks close or nearby? 12 13 CECILIA KUSHNER: They're three blocks south of the Bronx Point site for which we have a 14 15 hearing today. COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Okay, alright. 16 17 But to be clear, you haven't yet acquired these 18 properties? 19 CECILIA KUSHNER: We're in the process of 20 acquiring them, correct. 21 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Alright ... 2.2 [interpose] 23 CECILIA KUSHNER: I wish the eminent domain process was faster, trust me. 24 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 45 CONCESSIONS 2 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Okay, I hear 3 you; I think there's a couple of those actions in 4 Coney Island as well. CECILIA KUSHNER: That's right. 5 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Now with regards 6 7 to the housing plans [background comment] for these sites; the Chair alluded to a number of 1,000 units; 8 9 is that correct? What do... [interpose] CECILIA KUSHNER: That's the maximum 10 11 capacity for the site, correct. 12 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Okay. And is 13 there an AMI breakdown yet? 14 CECILIA KUSHNER: Yes and the development 15 team that's coming right after us... [interpose] 16 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: They're gonna ... 17 They're gonna ... They're gonna discuss that ... 18 [crosstalk] 19 CECILIA KUSHNER: correct -- will be able 20 to walk you through, yeah. 21 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Okay. I also 2.2 didn't hear anything about local hiring. 23 CECILIA KUSHNER: They will do the same. COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: That's gonna be ... 24 25 [crosstalk]

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 46 CONCESSIONS 2 CECILIA KUSHNER: That's right. 3 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: But what is ... 4 from your end though... [crosstalk] 5 CECILIA KUSHNER: Yeah. COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: what ... what can 6 be done from the City's perspective to build capacity 7 8 now... [interpose] 9 CECILIA KUSHNER: Sure. COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: because 10 11 something that I'm already dealing with in my 12 district that I want to address I guess in a more 13 city-wide basis, is that whenever these projects come 14 down the pipe we hear about local hiring and then the 15 excuse is, well many residents lack the capacity 16 [background comments] to work in local hiring; since 17 these things are still a year or two or more away, 18 what are we doing now to build capacity at this very 19 moment... 20 CECILIA KUSHNER: Yeah. 21 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: to help make 2.2 sure that there is local hiring? 23 CECILIA KUSHNER: No, you're totally right; I mean we need two things to happen in the 24 25 development so there are jobs available and so that

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 47 CONCESSIONS developers are required to seek kind of local and 2 3 give equal opportunity to local folks for these jobs 4 and then local folks on the ground need to actually be ready to take these jobs. Here I think like we --5 and you're exactly right, it's a lot of capital 6 7 investment that the City is doing; this is a very 8 large project, so we began to work building capacity 9 on the ground; we have an organization here that's gonna speak, JobsFirst; that's what they're doing is 10 11 organizing all local non-for-profit that works on 12 building capacity for local residents to get into job 13 training and be ready when jobs come online, and so 14 they are already beginning to build a network and 15 some capacity locally, so they can talk you through 16 that. The developer that was picked for the project 17 as well is working with Bronxworks, which is another 18 local organization that does a lot of capacity 19 building, and so they're fully integrating that 20 thinking into their work. So you'll have two 21 testimonies coming through that can talk to you in detail about how we seek to do this in this project 2.2 23 and in this neighborhood. 24

25

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 48 |
|----|--|
| 2 | COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Yeah, because |
| 3 | we're talking about a significant investment |
| 4 | [crosstalk] |
| 5 | CECILIA KUSHNER: That's right. |
| 6 | COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: \$194 million is |
| 7 | nothing to sneeze at [crosstalk] |
| 8 | CECILIA KUSHNER: Sure. Yeah. Yeah. |
| 9 | COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: and we wanna |
| 10 | make sure that that creates an impact in the local |
| 11 | community; that it doesn't job benefit the |
| 12 | development team, but benefits certainly the |
| 13 | residents [background comment] who need help the |
| 14 | most… [crosstalk] |
| 15 | CECILIA KUSHNER: Local… Yeah, it's a key |
| 16 | goal of ours here, so we completely agree. |
| 17 | COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Okay, very good. |
| 18 | Thank you, Chair for the time. |
| 19 | CHAIR COHEN: I just have a few more |
| 20 | things that either I thought of or I missed it. One; |
| 21 | I just in terms of the you said the maximum |
| 22 | capacity for the site is 1,000 units, but it's your |
| 23 | intention to phase development. Why is that? |
| 24 | CECILIA KUSHNER: Why are we phasing |
| 25 | development? |
| | |

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 49 |
|----|--|
| 2 | CHAIR COHEN: Yeah. |
| 3 | CECILIA KUSHNER: Because 1,000 units is |
| 4 | just too large of a project even just to build. So |
| 5 | the way we're conceiving of the site here is in two |
| 6 | different phases; the large look, the biggest one |
| 7 | would be Phase 1, which is like a little bit north of |
| 8 | 600 units, and then Phase 2 will be the remaining |
| 9 | units. |
| 10 | CHAIR COHEN: But the project, it's |
| 11 | conceived of as one project [interpose] |
| 12 | CECILIA KUSHNER: Right. Yeah. |
| 13 | CHAIR COHEN: similar levels of |
| 14 | affordability, similar… |
| 15 | CECILIA KUSHNER: We know We have like |
| 16 | details on affordability and programming for Phase 1, |
| 17 | because it's the one that's actually gonna happen |
| 18 | now, so we can look at like HPD term sheets and fully |
| 19 | understand the level of subsidy that's necessary for |
| 20 | the City and be very specific and granular around the |
| 21 | affordability. Phase 2 is further in the future; it |
| 22 | needs to be we'll probably discuss like exact |
| 23 | programming and levels of affordability like once we |
| 24 | know that we are close to completion of Phase 1; by |
| 25 | then HPD may have new term sheets; the market will be |
| | |

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 50 CONCESSIONS different in the area, so the City's goal is for 2 Phase 2 to maximize affordability and maximize the 3 number of units there, and we have the framework for 4 5 affordability, which is that at least 50% units be below or at 80%, but we can't be as specific as we 6 7 can be in Phase 1. 8 CHAIR COHEN: I would just say, you know, 9 you're coming to us and you're asking us to exercise our powers and you don't have the ... you know, we're 10 11 only getting a half baked cake; I would be somewhat 12 concerned about that; that we would want some greater 13 clarity on what the totality of the project is in Phase 2. Also, I'm curious about -- the project 14 15 envisions over two-and-a-third acres of open space; 16 who would have jurisdiction over the open space and 17 in light of the time it's taken to develop 144th, 18 what actions could be taken to make sure that the open space in this project gets done, you know, early 19 20 on; that the community is not waiting... [interpose] 21 CECILIA KUSHNER: Sure. Sure. 2.2 CHAIR COHEN: another, you know, decade 23 plus to get access to [inaudible]... [crosstalk] CECILIA KUSHNER: Yeah. Yeah. So it's 24 25 very different, 144th Street, we're actually

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 51 acquiring private property; here, this is like a 2 3 City-owned parcel that we completely own as-of-right. 4 All of the open space that's associated with the entire project would be delivered at the same time 5 that Phase 1 is delivered. So in order for the 6 7 development team to get a certificate of occupancy by 8 DOB and to be able to open the building, they will 9 have to have delivered the open space. So the idea is absolutely to make sure that like the open space 10 11 benefits are realized before or exactly at the same time than the housing benefits, because we know this 12 13 is a really important topic for the community. 14 CHAIR COHEN: The developer is building 15 the open space? 16 CECILIA KUSHNER: Yes. Right? Yeah. 17 Yeah. 18 CHAIR COHEN: In terms of scoping what 19 the open space will look like, is there a process 20 envisioned that will... [interpose] 21 NICK MOLINARI: No; there'll be a public So there are some renderings -- to Council 2.2 process. 23 Member Treyger's question, there were some renderings that were released, so those are conceptual 24 25 renderings; we will have a public process to see what

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 52 CONCESSIONS 2 goes into the open space as far as the project. The 3 developer will also be contributing maintenance for 4 the open space as well. CHAIR COHEN: The developer is going to ... 5 [crosstalk] 6 7 NICK MOLINARI: Yeah. 8 CHAIR COHEN: to main ... Is the developer 9 solely gonna maintain or? [background comment] 10 NICK MOLINARI: They'll be contributing 11 to Parks to maintain [sic], for maintenance... 12 13 [crosstalk] 14 CECILIA KUSHNER: They're gonna pay Parks 15 to maintain it. 16 CHAIR COHEN: They're gonna pay Parks to 17 maintain it. 18 NICK MOLINARI: Yeah. 19 CHAIR COHEN: Okay. [inaudible]. Okay, 20 thank you very much. 21 CECILIA KUSHNER: Thank you. 2.2 CHAIR COHEN: Alright, so now we're gonna 23 call the next panel. [background comments] COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Josue Sanchez, Lisa 24 So, John Weed, and Rocky Bucano. 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 53 CONCESSIONS [background comments] 2 3 CHAIR COHEN: Thank you. 4 [background comments] JOSUE SANCHEZ: Thank you, City Council 5 Thank you, EDC, Parks Department, and also 6 Members. 7 members of The Speaker's Office. My name is Josue 8 Sanchez; I'm with L&M Development Partners, who in 9 partnership with Type A Projects make up the development team for Bronx Point. 10 So we're thrilled; we're honored; it is a 11 12 true privilege to be here to discuss Bronx Point and 13 development at this extraordinary site. It's an 14 incredibly important location, a gateway location for 15 the Bronx and we look forward to creating a development program that really catapults community-16 17 enhancing projects for the area and particularly the Bronx Harlem River waterfront. 18 19 So Bronx Point brings together City 20 partners as well as local community stakeholders to 21 really bring about exceptional, engaging open space; 2.2 we're looking to bring entertaining uses and 23 education-focused community spaces as well as permanently affordable housing, all while really 24 pushing economic opportunity here and jobs for all. 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 54 So today you'll hear the story of Bronx 2 3 Point beginning to unfold. You'll hear from the 4 development team, L&M Development Partners and Type A Projects. You'll also hear from Bronxworks, which is 5 our critical community partner who has been serving 6 7 the Bronx for over 40 years. You'll also hear from 8 Marvel Architects, the landscape architect who brings 9 over their experience from designing the adjacent Mill Pond Park, and you'll also hear from Universal 10 11 Hip Hop Museum, which brings along a level of 12 excitement to the project, even though I think 13 everything's a little exciting. So we'll get started and next you'll hear from John Weed from Bronx Point, 14 15 whom we support in community services programming. 16 JOHN WEED: Thank you. I'm John Weed, 17 Assistant Executive Director of Bronxworks and we are 18 proud to be a key member of this team. Bronxworks 19 has been working in the community for over 40 years 20 and we're already working with L&M on two different 21 projects, which have been very, really excellent. We 2.2 believe that this project will bring important 23 affordable housing, key open space and job opportunities, and we think the site itself will 24 25 allow us to expand on our mission; we feed, shelter,

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 55 |
|----|--|
| 2 | teach, and support and we will work with the team in |
| 3 | order to develop programs for the community. We know |
| 4 | that the community is more than just the 1,000 units, |
| 5 | so typically what we do is, we work with L&M on a |
| 6 | project and then we will open up our services to the |
| 7 | residents who live in the complex, plus the |
| 8 | surrounding community, and it could be youth |
| 9 | services, could be senior services; it could be |
| 10 | workforce development; we do all three of those types |
| 11 | of services and we've done those with L&M in other |
| 12 | projects. And we're also very excited to be partners |
| 13 | with the other exciting community activities that are |
| 14 | gonna be coming into the complex. |
| 15 | So once again, we are very proud to be |
| 16 | part of this and we believe it'll be a really great |
| 17 | project, based on our experience, you know working |
| 18 | with L&M and their team. So that's what I had to |
| 19 | say. Thank you. |
| 20 | [background comment] |
| 21 | JOSUE SANCHEZ: Next you'll hear from |
| 22 | Annie Tirschwell from Type A Projects. [background |
| 23 | comments] |
| 24 | ANNIE TIRSCHWELL: Okay, great. So first |
| 25 | I wanted to thank the City for including a preference |
| | |

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 56 |
|--|---|
| 2 | for emerging developers in this RFEI. Type A |
| 3 | Projects has been building community and school |
| 4 | spaces for the last 15 years; we've built a number of |
| 5 | schools in the Bronx, but without this preference I |
| 6 | don't think we'd be sitting at this table, despite a |
| 7 | long and respected relationship with developers, and |
| 8 | so we're very grateful for this inclusion, preference |
| 9 | in the RFEI, and respectfully, we believe that the |
| 10 | voices of women and minority businesses do impact the |
| 11 | responses and ultimately the fabric of our city, so I |
| 12 | wanted to start by saying thank you. |
| | |
| 13 | So it is with great excitement that we |
| 13 14 | So it is with great excitement that we too join L&M in responding to this RFEI; we also |
| | |
| 14 | too join L&M in responding to this RFEI; we also |
| 14 15 | too join L&M in responding to this RFEI; we also believe that this site is a real gateway to the |
| 14 15 16 | too join L&M in responding to this RFEI; we also believe that this site is a real gateway to the Bronx; certainly not the only gateway to the Bronx, |
| 14 15 16 17 | too join L&M in responding to this RFEI; we also believe that this site is a real gateway to the Bronx; certainly not the only gateway to the Bronx, but an important one. We think that its location and |
| 14 15 16 17 18 | too join L&M in responding to this RFEI; we also believe that this site is a real gateway to the Bronx; certainly not the only gateway to the Bronx, but an important one. We think that its location and size demand that this project take its role as a |
| 14 15 16 17 18 19 | too join L&M in responding to this RFEI; we also believe that this site is a real gateway to the Bronx; certainly not the only gateway to the Bronx, but an important one. We think that its location and size demand that this project take its role as a catalyzing force to activate and further transform |
| 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 | too join L&M in responding to this RFEI; we also believe that this site is a real gateway to the Bronx; certainly not the only gateway to the Bronx, but an important one. We think that its location and size demand that this project take its role as a catalyzing force to activate and further transform the Bronx waterfront and the broader community and we |
| 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 | too join L&M in responding to this RFEI; we also believe that this site is a real gateway to the Bronx; certainly not the only gateway to the Bronx, but an important one. We think that its location and size demand that this project take its role as a catalyzing force to activate and further transform the Bronx waterfront and the broader community and we need to do this with great care and intention, but |
| 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 | too join L&M in responding to this RFEI; we also believe that this site is a real gateway to the Bronx; certainly not the only gateway to the Bronx, but an important one. We think that its location and size demand that this project take its role as a catalyzing force to activate and further transform the Bronx waterfront and the broader community and we need to do this with great care and intention, but activation from whom and stemming from what? We |
| 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 | too join L&M in responding to this RFEI; we also believe that this site is a real gateway to the Bronx; certainly not the only gateway to the Bronx, but an important one. We think that its location and size demand that this project take its role as a catalyzing force to activate and further transform the Bronx waterfront and the broader community and we need to do this with great care and intention, but activation from whom and stemming from what? We believe that the RFEI correctly mandates that this be |

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 57 |
|--|--|
| 2 | the existing fabric of the community and we believe |
| 3 | that this happens visually, physically, economically, |
| 4 | and culturally. The RFEI further demands that |
| 5 | respondents preserve and provide a rare commodity in |
| 6 | New York City, open space, so it's been a huge |
| 7 | priority in our response. The RFEI further goes on |
| 8 | to demand that we serve a diversity of uses and of |
| 9 | income levels. It also requires that this project be |
| 10 | an economic and jobs driver for the community. And |
| 11 | lastly, the RFEI sets forth that this project is both |
| 12 | feasible and implementable. Next slide, please. |
| 13 | So as Josue says, we're here today to |
| 1 / | |
| 14 | bring you Bronx Point. We hope that you find that |
| 14 | bring you Bronx Point. We hope that you find that this response is responsive and respectful to the |
| | |
| 15 | this response is responsive and respectful to the |
| 15 16 | this response is responsive and respectful to the community that we're being borne out of. Our project |
| 15 16 17 | this response is responsive and respectful to the community that we're being borne out of. Our project partners will talk in more specificity, but we |
| 15 16 17 18 | this response is responsive and respectful to the community that we're being borne out of. Our project partners will talk in more specificity, but we believe that with this response we've activated |
| 15 16 17 18 19 | this response is responsive and respectful to the community that we're being borne out of. Our project partners will talk in more specificity, but we believe that with this response we've activated exterior streets and [interpose] |
| 15 16 17 18 19 20 | this response is responsive and respectful to the community that we're being borne out of. Our project partners will talk in more specificity, but we believe that with this response we've activated exterior streets and [interpose] CHAIR COHEN: I'm sorry to interrupt you |
| 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 | <pre>this response is responsive and respectful to the community that we're being borne out of. Our project partners will talk in more specificity, but we believe that with this response we've activated exterior streets and [interpose] CHAIR COHEN: I'm sorry to interrupt you [crosstalk]</pre> |
| 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 | <pre>this response is responsive and respectful to the community that we're being borne out of. Our project partners will talk in more specificity, but we believe that with this response we've activated exterior streets and [interpose] CHAIR COHEN: I'm sorry to interrupt you [crosstalk] ANNIE TIRSCHWELL: It's alright.</pre> |
| 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 | <pre>this response is responsive and respectful to the community that we're being borne out of. Our project partners will talk in more specificity, but we believe that with this response we've activated exterior streets and [interpose] CHAIR COHEN: I'm sorry to interrupt you [crosstalk] ANNIE TIRSCHWELL: It's alright. CHAIR COHEN: could I ask you to just</pre> |

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 58 CONCESSIONS CHAIR COHEN: [background comment] I 2 3 will, but I'm gonna call the roll on the preceding 4 land use items... [interpose] ANNIE TIRSCHWELL: Sure. 5 CHAIR COHEN: because my colleague is 6 7 chairing another committee meeting. So I'm gonna now ask counsel to call the roll on Land Use 738-742; 8 9 LU 746 and Preconsidered LU -- the Hope and Homes 10 Cluster. 11 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Rodriguez. 12 13 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye. 14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Cohen. 15 CHAIR COHEN: I vote aye. 16 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member 17 Treyger. 18 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye. 19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: By a vote of 3 in the 20 affirmative, 0 in the negative and 0 abstentions, the measures are recommended for ... submitted to the full 21 Land Use Committee. 2.2 23 CHAIR COHEN: I apologize for interrupting your testimony. Also, could the whole 24 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 59 panel just identify themselves, [background comment] 2 3 just so we're making sure that we ... ANNIE TIRSCHWELL: Yes; I... I did not do 4 that. So I am Annie Tirschwell from Type A Projects. 5 LISA SO: I'm Lisa So from Marvel 6 7 Architects. JOHN WEED: I'm John Weed from 8 9 Bronxworks. ROCKY BUCANO: Rocky Bucano from the 10 11 Universal Hip Hop Museum. 12 CHAIR COHEN: Excellent. Is Lisa So 13 here? 14 LISA SO: That's... [background comment] 15 That's me. 16 CHAIR COHEN: Oh okay. Okay. Sorry. Ι 17 apologize... [crosstalk] 18 ANNIE TIRSCHWELL: [inaudible]... 19 CHAIR COHEN: please continue. 20 [laughter] 21 ANNIE TIRSCHWELL: Yeah, okay. So we believe that this proposal, our proposal, that Bronx 2.2 23 Point activates exterior street and the waterfront with uses that can enrich the community's access both 24 25 to open space and to the Harlem River and that we

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 60 provide spaces for neighborhood residents to commune 2 3 with each other and with nature. We believe that we've created corridors of access to and through the 4 site; that our site is knitted to the neighborhood 5 physically and that rather than cutting the site off 6 and turning our back to the neighborhood, more 7 broadly we believe that this project pulls 8 9 neighborhood citizens down and through our site, down and through to the water. We believe that we've 10 11 created a roster of culturally and environmentally 12 site-specific program that is borne out of and for the Bronx that is borne out of and for the river. 13 We believe we've provided a balanced housing program 14 15 that is family friendly and meets a diversity of 16 needs and income levels. We believe we've created 17 pathways to economic development, with job creation, job training and incubation to support local 18 19 businesses, and I think we've done so with a great 20 partnership of developers and community leaders. 21 So the next slide EDC has already shown; 2.2 as we can see, it's an incredibly large site really 23 amazingly situated, but dramatically underutilized. More of the same. 24

25

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 61 |
|----|--|
| 2 | So next slide So again, my partners |
| 3 | here are gonna run through the specifics of the |
| 4 | project, but as mentioned, this site, at its |
| 5 | potential, will provide up to 1,000 units of |
| 6 | permanently affordable housing and approximately |
| 7 | 150,000 sq. ft. of commercial and community facility |
| 8 | space. |
| 9 | Our park and open space designers are |
| 10 | here today to walk you through the space plan, but it |
| 11 | will include an extension to Mill Pond Park, a new |
| 12 | waterfront esplanade, landscaped and planted open |
| 13 | space, a host of community center programming areas |
| 14 | for kids and adults alike, and all seamlessly |
| 15 | integrating into the existing Mill Pond Park. |
| 16 | Josue Sanchez will guide you through our |
| 17 | housing plan that includes, as we mentioned, |
| 18 | approximately 600 units of permanently affordable |
| 19 | housing. I'm gonna swing back around to talk to you |
| 20 | about our community facility partners and Rocky |
| 21 | Bucano, who is the Executive Director of the Hip Hop |
| 22 | Museum, will introduce you to their plans for the |
| 23 | long-awaited bricks and mortar location of their |
| 24 | program, which will serve Bronx Point, the Bronx and |
| 25 | |

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 62 2 the universe. [laughter] So I hand it over to Lisa 3 So. LISA SO: Hi. Yes, again, I'm Lisa So 4 with Marvel Architects, and we had the opportunity 10 5 years ago to work with Parks and EDC to develop the 6 7 design for Mill Pond Park, so we're extremely excited 8 about the opportunity to extend Mill Pond Park and 9 really work it into the development of the Lower Concourse. 10 11 So as we started looking at the planning, when we were doing the competition, we really looked 12 13 at -- we wanted to open the site up as much as we could and really make a visual and physical 14 15 connection between the neighborhood and the park, all 16 the way to the waterfront. We also wanted to 17 maximize -- and we've been talking a lot about open 18 space today; this is a really critical part of this 19 project, and we wanted to maximize that open space 20 and make a true seamless connection between Mill Pond 21 and the project, and so those were priorities as we 2.2 set forth. And so one of the things that we did in 23 the mapping of the building was we turned it to the north and opened up the courtyard of the building 24 facing that north and then brought a grand stair that 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 63 CONCESSIONS allows this open space to really kind of climb up 2 3 into the building and really make it open to the 4 public. As we go to the next slide. 5 So as part of our original project of Mill Pond Park, we had a lot of community engagement 6 7 that we went through; we had work sessions and public presentations and we really heard from the community 8 9 what they wanted in the park, and so... [interpose] CHAIR COHEN: Uh... 10 11 LISA SO: Yeah. 12 CHAIR COHEN: Just so I understand what 13 I'm looking at. Are these renderings Phase 1 and Phase 2? 14 15 LISA SO: Correct. CHAIR COHEN: Okay. 16 17 LISA SO: Yes. 18 ANNIE TIRSCHWELL: So just to be clear, 19 Phase 1 is the building uh ... 20 LISA SO: It's the U-shaped building as 21 Phase 1 and then the ... the ... 2.2 ANNIE TIRSCHWELL: And the other one. 23 LISA SO: taller building, right, as Phase 2. 24 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 64 So we had these community work sessions 2 3 and so we understand that that is a very critical 4 piece of this and that we really need to understand what the community wants in this open space and we'll 5 have work sessions with the community and that will 6 7 really be part of our design process. And so when we 8 go to the next slide, we're really looking at the 9 goals that we set forth at the beginning of this process, but we really understand that it will evolve 10 11 and as we understand what the community wants, then 12 we will incorporate that into the design. 13 So first and foremost, expanding publicly accessible open space; second, really creating that 14 15 seamless connection with Mill Pond Park; we don't 16 really want that there be a line between what is Mill 17 Pond and what is part of this development. Mill Pond 18 has a continuous walking path; it's this bright red 19 path, and we're looking to continue that from the 20 park into the new development and really kind of 21 close the loop on that walking path. There's also 2.2 active and passive parts of Mill Pond Park and we're 23 looking to bring that in as well so that there'll be animated active areas, but also just green areas and 24

landscaped areas. The esplanade will be a big part

25

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 65 |
|----|---|
| 2 | of this waterfront development; it'll be a critical |
| 3 | role in the design, and then last but certainly not |
| 4 | least, Exterior Street is a big piece of this as |
| 5 | well, creating a public plaza that promotes the |
| 6 | safety along Exterior Street front and the building. |
| 7 | So really, connection to Mill Pond Park, |
| 8 | extending walking paths, the esplanade, this new |
| 9 | grand open stair, a children's playground would be |
| 10 | developed, planted seating areas; Exterior Street, |
| 11 | but also, publicly accessible restrooms will be part |
| 12 | of the program, and all of these things coming |
| 13 | together, understanding where they wanna be on the |
| 14 | site, will be the key to a successful park. Next |
| 15 | slide, Josue. |
| 16 | And really, we're looking to create an |
| 17 | animated open public space. The picture on the right |
| 18 | shows this grand stair that comes down into the |
| 19 | landscape and we see that as an opportunity to have |
| 20 | public presentations and public performances; it |
| 21 | really becomes an opportunity for that landscape to |
| 22 | engage in the building, and looking at basically |
| 23 | taking the green from the building front to the |
| 24 | waterfront. This is a picture of a playground; we're |

25 looking to work with Bronx Children's Museum or local

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 66 artists to really develop what that playground could 2 3 be, but really creating an active, lively open space. 4 ANNIE TIRSCHWELL: And in developing our 5 response to the RFEI, we were very insistent upon figuring out ways to connect our programming to 6 7 neighborhood and the natural environment, and so 8 obviously the river is something that we wanted to 9 key into and so because there is a train line that runs in the river, it doesn't allow us access to the 10 11 water; we've partnered with two organizations to 12 provide both stewardship of the river and 13 environmental education to the local community; that is CityScience, who is a STEM-based program; we're 14 15 gonna hear a testimony from them in a little bit, as 16 well as Billion Oyster Project, who's been working in 17 numerous areas throughout the City to reintroduce the 18 oyster population to New York Harbor as a resiliency 19 measure, and as much as that's important from a 20 resiliency measure, really they rely on the community 21 to be stewards of those stations and so it really ties in both children and adults into caring for the 2.2 23 environmental sustainability of the neighborhood. One thing I think that Lisa didn't mention is that as 24 25 part of this process we will be working to revision

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 67 |
|----|--|
| 2 | the waterfront from a sustainability perspective |
| 3 | actually, we have a slide on that coming up and so |
| 4 | working with these organizations will be part of that |
| 5 | process. And we're very excited to be including the |
| 6 | Bronx Children's Museum, at a minimum, in helping us |
| 7 | to design the playground space; they, as part of our |
| 8 | process, noted that there is no really active space |
| 9 | for children of early childhood age, and we're |
| 10 | excited to work with them and with Parks to |
| 11 | collaborate on a playground at the site. |
| 12 | Obviously we also spent a lot time |
| 13 | thinking about how this project can serve to activate |
| 14 | the waterfront, not just from an open space |
| 15 | perspective, but what commercial uses would really |
| 16 | bring people down to the water, and so we're excited |
| 17 | to include a movie theater as part of this project; |
| 18 | we're also very excited to include a food incubator |
| 19 | as part of this project. One of the first things |
| 20 | you'll notice on a beautiful day when you go down to |
| 21 | Mill Pond Park is the amount of food that's being |
| 22 | consumed and so we wanted to expand upon sort of the |
| 23 | tailgating that's happening in the neighborhood |
| 24 | already, but work with local food purveyors to |
| 25 | provide both food and jobs to the local community |
| | |

 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS
around food and eating. And of course, we're
incredibly excited about the Universal Hip Hop
Museum.

68

5 ROCKY BUCANO: Thank you, Annie. My name is Rocky Bucano; I'm the Executive Director of the 6 7 Universal Hip Hop Museum, and we are excited to be 8 part of this Bronx Point project; we've been 9 searching for a suitable location for the Universal Hip Hop Museum for about four years; we had some 10 11 highs and some lows, but it wasn't until I got the 12 call from my boy over there, Josue Sanchez from L&M, 13 that the magic actually took place, because L&M and 14 Type A truly understood the vision that we had for 15 the museum and how the museum is a sense of community 16 empowerment. As you know, hip hop was born in the 17 Bronx 44 years ago, it started in the South Bronx by 18 a bunch of teenagers, and it has since become the 19 most popular art form in the entire planet and it's a 20 shame that you know hip hop hasn't been celebrated 21 and properly documented up until now and we take on 2.2 that responsibility; that's part of our mission is to 23 document, archive and celebrate the global history of hip hop, but more importantly, the role of the Bronx 24

25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 69 and how the Bronx played a role in making sure that 2 that evolution of hip hop became so popular. 3 Our partners that we had included in this 4 project -- we've been working with Microsoft over the 5 past year; we participated in an inclusive design and 6 7 visioning session with Microsoft and we went to four 8 different cities, we went to Los Angeles, we went to Detroit, we went to Atlanta, and obviously, we 9 finished the design sessions here in New York, and 10 11 the purpose of those design sessions was to meet with 12 different people from the community, from teenagers 13 to elderly people, just to get a sense of what the expectations would be for a Hip Hop Museum and what 14 15 they thought the Hip Hop Museum should be, in terms 16 of the overall experience and how it should engage 17 with community. So we had some great insights that 18 came out of those four different sessions from people from different backgrounds from different cities 19 20 because we believe that the Universal Hip Hop Museum 21 will serve as a great cultural arts destination, a 2.2 new destination for tourism in New York City and 23 specifically for the Bronx. So we're excited about that, we have partners with Google and we have Sony 24 Music just because obviously the music is gonna be a 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 70 CONCESSIONS big component of the museum, but we are also working 2 3 with local artists from break dances and the graffiti 4 artists, which are important elements of the culture, to make sure that their work and their artistic 5 expression is also celebrated, and we also look at 6 7 the museum as being a source of an opportunity to 8 mentor kids to get their creativity, to get their 9 innovation skills and to give them an opportunity to express themselves through the museum to find out how 10 11 they can place their creativity in today's modern 12 society. 13 JOSUE SANCHEZ: Thank you, Rocky. And here you see a preliminary rendering, a night shot, 14 15 for the museum and the potential area for performance 16 space. 17 So I'll talk a little bit about housing, 18 which is also part of this project. [laughter] So 19 as EDC pointed out, Phase 1 is approximately 600 20 units -- studios, one-, two- and three-bedroom 21 apartments. Obviously affordable housing is a great 2.2 need for the City of New York and from the onset of 23 responding to this RFEI, making these units permanently affordable housing was very important to 24 25 the entire team. So that's what you see here; the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 71 team has committed to providing permanently 2 3 affordable housing for all those units. We're really 4 looking to serve a wide range of incomes, from 30% to 130% AMI, in accordance with how we just [sic] 5 mentioned; the City term sheets. 6 7 So here you see specific breakdowns on the site and most of the units will be at low-income 8 9 tiers; you also have bands at the moderate and middle-income tiers as well. There'll be many 10 11 amenities; one of the highlights of the amenities is 12 a central courtyard landscape area which we're 13 looking to program for active use in the central courtyard and also have a viewpoint out to Mill Pond 14 15 Park. 16 And then just touching on Phase 2; as was 17 stated, this site is about 1,000 units all in, so a 18 little over 400 units we'll be including in Phase 2 19 as well. 20 Design and sustainability: We realize 21 it's a waterfront site, so we need to be cognizant of 2.2 the potential impact and dangers of doing so. One of 23 the things I'd like to point out is; from the early stages of the project we're gonna remediate the site, 24 25 so we're looking to enter the Brownfield Cleanup

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 72 |
|----|--|
| 2 | Program which will provide valuable resources to fund |
| 3 | the project, but also really remediate any potential |
| 4 | environmental issues with the site. As was stated, |
| 5 | the site has been vacant for a very long time and |
| 6 | we're looking to clean that up. Environmental |
| 7 | sustainability is very important to us; we're |
| 8 | obviously gonna comply with City programs such as |
| 9 | Enterprise Green Communities; we're also considering |
| 10 | LEED Gold and also, not listed here, but NYSERDA |
| 11 | Multifamily Performance Program is also a program |
| 12 | that we routinely adhere to in our projects. |
| 13 | Flood mitigation and shoreline resiliency |
| 14 | we're bringing on reputable firms, such as Langan |
| 15 | Engineering, to really make sure that our |
| 16 | environmental and engineering controls on the |
| 17 | waterfront are exceptional. We're not building a |
| 18 | cellar here; we're looking to put a boiler room on |
| 19 | the roof and these are just some of the examples |
| 20 | of the measures that we take to make sure that the |
| 21 | site is safe. |
| 22 | And as was stated, through all the |
| 23 | programming you see in this site, this is really an |
| 24 | active design project; whether you come in early, go |
| 25 | to the food and beverage hall, eat something, go to |
| | |

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 73 watch a movie, hang out at the museum; maybe catch a 2 3 performance at night, it's really meant to move 4 people -- get on a bike -- I don't know; there's a lot of things to do here and I hope that you can feel 5 that excitement from the programming that we've tried 6 7 to design here.

8 Economic Opportunity: So obviously we 9 thank the City for committing nearly \$200 million in infrastructure here, so this project really 10 11 compliments that effort. This site, based on the 12 uses, especially with the Hip Hop Museum and the 13 movie theater as well, it's really gonna be a magnet and draw people into the site and so we look forward 14 15 to really keep the area buzzing and keep the pedestrian traffic in the area. 16

The food and beverage market, which is really an incubator for local entrepreneurs, so we're looking to push that as well, and obviously a project of this magnitude -- there's gonna be over 1,000 jobs here and so we're really excited about that.

22 MWBE commitment and local hiring -- you 23 know we share the same concerns here and one of the 24 things that we've taken -- learning lessons that 25 we've done -- Essex Crossing, which you're probably

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 74 |
|----|--|
| 2 | familiar with with EDC and so we've learned a lot |
| 3 | in terms of community engagement. We have a |
| 4 | dedicated team to MWBE and local hiring, so we're |
| 5 | really looking forward to mobilize and really engage |
| 6 | the community on these issues. So we're looking here |
| 7 | to target 35% of MWBE contracts. As we engage the |
| 8 | community not only on park design; obviously |
| 9 | recruiting, outreach, job fairs, and workforce |
| 10 | development will be a part of this project so we can |
| 11 | provide jobs to everyone in the community, and we |
| 12 | look forward to doing that, not only with the |
| 13 | community, but the City of New York. |
| 14 | So I think we've said a lot; we just |
| 15 | wanna thank you all and this is really exciting; |
| 16 | we're thrilled to be here. Thank you. |
| 17 | CHAIR COHEN: Thank you for your |
| 18 | testimony; I do have some questions; I guess we'll |
| 19 | start back where we started before. In terms of the |
| 20 | access to the site, have you had any input or are you |
| 21 | working with DOT at least on what you think the |
| 22 | design for 149th, in particular, I guess, makes sense |
| 23 | to you; that everybody's working hand in glove to |
| 24 | make sure that there's safe and I think access is, |
| 25 | |
| | |

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 75 |
|----|--|
| 2 | you know, fundamentally important to the success of |
| 3 | this site so. |
| 4 | ANNIE TIRSCHWELL: Well I think, yeah, |
| 5 | Josue went back to the mapping diagram; the way that |
| 6 | we've sort of delineated between Phase 1 and Phase 2 |
| 7 | is to create pathways through the site. As you've |
| 8 | pointed out, you don't want people to have to go too |
| 9 | far north or south to be able to access the |
| 10 | waterfront or the open space. So it's important to |
| 11 | realize that this was a response to an RFEI and so we |
| 12 | have not yet started the dialogue with DOT, but as |
| 13 | stated, there will be a task force in addition to our |
| 14 | work with DOT through Chairman Di Barito's [sp?] |
| 15 | office, and so that's one of the first things we're |
| 16 | gonna dig into, but we have not yet formally been |
| 17 | awarded the site, but that is certainly a huge |
| 18 | priority of ours, getting people to and through. |
| 19 | CHAIR COHEN: I also not that I'm |
| 20 | criticizing Parks, but the fact that the development |
| 21 | of the open space is on your plate, I think that that |
| 22 | makes a lot of sense, but I also think that its |
| 23 | fundamental that there is delivery on the open space |
| 24 | in a timely fashion. I mean the example of 144th |
| 25 | |

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 76 CONCESSIONS Street is not unusual, unfortunately, in New York 2 City in terms of development and parks. 3 4 JOSUE SANCHEZ: Yeah, I think that's a 5 great point; I'm trying to find ... yeah. So I think what's very important to echo is that we won't be 6 7 allowed to TCO the building and have people move in 8 without development of the open space, so that's key; 9 no one wants to fill the building and have open space lag behind; the development in its entirety will be 10 11 moving forward simultaneously. Phase 1 is not just 12 the building; Phase 1 is also the esplanade and the 13 open space, and I would also that we're not doing it 14 solely on our own; there will be several approval 15 steps along the way, working with the task force and 16 community stakeholders; there's also a public design 17 commission approval as part of this process, so even 18 though -- I don't feel like this is the development 19 team's effort; it's really a collective effort and 20 there's various parts, both public and private involved. 21 Well I look forward to 2.2 CHAIR COHEN: 23 watching it and [laughter] [inaudible]. I have a question about Phase 2, but I guess as predicate, 24 25 because I have, I quess -- I don't know if concerned

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 77 CONCESSIONS is the right word, but do you have the capacity to --2 if this was a single project, do you have the 3 4 capacity to develop Phase 1 and Phase 2 simultaneously? 5 JOSUE SANCHEZ: I think [inaudible] 6 7 question. The issue -- I think one of the struggles 8 we're having is one of the things we mentioned, one 9 of our objectives is for it to be feasible and implementable and so I think there's some ... as EDC 10 11 mentioned, there's some concern about putting on those number of units in one shot and also this 12 13 project will impact the area greatly and it'll be ... I 14 think it'll be beneficial to see the impact of the 15 development and what could potentially benefit the 16 project or the community more as Phase 1 unfolds. 17 And also, in terms of financing, it's quite an 18 investment; it's about \$300 million of an investment, 19 and so I think just based on the scope that Phase 1 20 already has and then financial resources and effort 21 for Phase 1 and the learning lessons that we'll take 2.2 from that, I think it'll benefit the community going 23 forward. ANNIE TIRSCHWELL: I would add just one 24 25 other thing, which is that because the open space

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 78 CONCESSIONS activation is so critical, it's not just building 600 2 3 units of affordable housing, building an esplanade 4 and the waterfront is a very large endeavor and I think we're glad that the City has prioritized that 5 as part of the first phase; it will certainly add a 6 7 complication to the project that is commensurate with 8 a phased delivery.

9 I guess -- I mean like you CHAIR COHEN: said, the project could have a significant impact on 10 11 the community and I think that we wanna lock in Phase 2; that Phase 2 is consistent with Phase 1 and I 12 13 think that there are deep levels of affordability in Phase 1, you know diverse affordability, but also 14 15 deep affordability and I guess we just wanna make sure that the character of Phase 2 is consistent with 16 17 the character of Phase 1 and there might be -- you 18 know, again, we're all at the table right now; there's an argument I think for making, you know, 19 locking it all up, but maybe between now and this 20 21 project's approval that will happen; I don't know. 2.2 This is sort of a technical question, but 23 I guess Phase 2 could conceivably be 400'. and you're

proposing it for 320'. Is there any reason like why

25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 79 CONCESSIONS 2 that gap should be preserved; as part of this 3 application; should we cap the height at 320? 4 JOSUE SANCHEZ: I mean I just think that given the timing of Phase 2, I think it'll benefit to 5 have that flexibility, so I think we could look at 6 7 the site and see if there's -- the footprint of Phase 2 obviously is not nearly the size of Phase 1 8 9 and so it would be good to maintain that flexibility to incorporate additional uses if need to. 10 So 11 whether that be additional community facility uses or 12 other uses that really engage the community, I think 13 having that flexibility would benefit, yeah. 14 CHAIR COHEN: I guess I would just say 15 is, you know advice, for whoever wants my advice, but I think that that ambiguity is a double-edged sword 16 17 for you guys. 18 All the units in Phase 1 and Phase 2, 19 there's 100% affordability in this project, right? 20 [background comments] Is there any thought to in the 21 design about noise and sound, I mean you have the Major Deegan I guess to the east and I don't know how 2.2 23 active the rail is to the west, but does rail to the west [background comment] and ... 24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 80 2 ANNIE TIRSCHWELL: Yeah, I think that the 3 west is for garbage and it happens two trains a 4 night, in the middle of the night, and so part of the reason -- yeah -- part of the reason we designed a U-5 shaped building to begin with I think was to in a way 6 7 shelter as many units as we could form the Deegan, 8 but we will certainly need to employ, you know, a 9 curtain wall or not curtain wall; facade designed to mitigate noise and impact on the residential units 10 11 for sure. And it's also part of the reason we've 12 raised the building up so high; part of the reason 13 our podium includes so much commercial and community facility space is that we wanted to bring units above 14 15 the line of the Deegan, so that was one of the first 16 measures at this early stage to try and mitigate the 17 impact of the highway on our residences. 18 JOSUE SANCHEZ: I would also say that 19 coming out of rezoning I believe we'll have E-

designations on the site and so whether or not we have, for example, noises is a common one, but we would incorporate consultants to help us mitigate any noise concerns. So we've worked a lot with, for example, Cerami Associates, who's done a lot of work in the City and so obviously not only what's going on

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 81 |
|----|--|
| 2 | in the area, but also our uses the museum, the |
| 3 | theater so we'd be looking to retain those |
| 4 | professionals to help with that. |
| 5 | CHAIR COHEN: Again, I wonder if the U- |
| 6 | design I mean there is a quality of life |
| 7 | difference between the unit that faces the Deegan |
| 8 | versus the unit that faces the Harlem River; |
| 9 | [background comment] I wonder if, sort of the pluses |
| 10 | and the minuses of the site, if there's any way to |
| 11 | sort of make that more equitable; I don't know the |
| 12 | answer to that, but I would… again, I would much |
| 13 | prefer I think to be on the… [laugh] looking out at |
| 14 | the river than looking out at the Deegan. So again, |
| 15 | I don't know how that would play itself out. |
| 16 | You have a contract with a movie theater? |
| 17 | JOSUE SANCHEZ: We're considering several |
| 18 | operators; there's one that we're closer to getting |
| 19 | there; we don't have a contract yet, but there's been |
| 20 | extensive conversations with a movie operator for the |
| 21 | space. |
| 22 | CHAIR COHEN: You're telling us you're |
| 23 | very confident you can deliver a movie theater |
| 24 | operator ultimately? |
| 25 | |
| | |

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 82 CONCESSIONS JOSUE SANCHEZ: Yeah, absolutely. 2 Ι 3 think if you look at the Bronx, there's not a lot of 4 movie theaters out there. I used to go to 5 Whitestone; that's closed down; you have Bay Plaza, so given the lack of supply, the movie theater 6 7 operators are certainly interested in opening the 8 space up. 9 CHAIR COHEN: Well that's great. JOSUE SANCHEZ: Yeah. 10 11 CHAIR COHEN: In terms of the not-for-12 profit space; how is that gonna work and how are we 13 gonna make sure that the Hip Hop Museum is viable and has a deal that they can -- gotta look out for the 14 15 Hip Hop Museum? How is that gonna work? 16 JOSUE SANCHEZ: So we've talked, I don't 17 know, maybe a year, and so we have an agreement if 18 you will to get there. We're obviously ... [interpose] 19 CHAIR COHEN: You agree to agree? 20 JOSUE SANCHEZ: Well yeah [laughter] ... 21 We're obviously making a lot of public 2.2 representations, our reputations are important, and 23 so you know, we've worked with a lot of nonprofits such as Bronxworks in years past, so I think -- and 24 25 we continue to do so -- so we've had those

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 83 2 conversations; we have a form of agreement, and so we're getting there. 3 4 CHAIR COHEN: Yeah. ANNIE TIRSCHWELL: I would also add that 5 we're looking at adding layers of subsidy into the 6 7 creation of their box and so we don't expect them to do it alone and we're gonna help assign and attribute 8 9 subsidy to their [inaudible]. JOSUE SANCHEZ: And just a quick 10 11 clarification on the affordable housing for Phase 2, that's still to be determined, so I know EDC and the 12 13 City and local stakeholders have been discussing that, so 50% of the units will be available for 14 15 incomes at 80% AMI or below and then above that 50% 16 is to be determined. 17 CHAIR COHEN: So you're saying there 18 could be units that are not regulated in Phase 2? 19 JOSUE SANCHEZ: I think that's still a 20 conversation between the City partners, yeah. CHAIR COHEN: Conversation to continue. 21 2.2 Does Bronxworks have -- will you have space in the 23 facility ultimately? JOHN WEED: Yes, we haven't really 24 discussed what, because we've done a lot of different 25

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 84 |
|----|--|
| 2 | projects with L&M we've done workforce development, |
| 3 | we do senior work; we do youth programming, and |
| 4 | generally we've gone into their locations, we've |
| 5 | funded programs through them, through DYCD, through |
| 6 | other foundations, so it'll be you know I mean |
| 7 | we've got a lot of time to plan this, but we fully |
| 8 | expect to be there providing social services in some |
| 9 | capacity. |
| 10 | CHAIR COHEN: Could you just briefly talk |
| 11 | about local hiring, in terms of construction? |
| 12 | JOSUE SANCHEZ: Sure. I mean I would say |
| 13 | it's part of our agreement with the City to provide |
| 14 | local hiring in compliance with the HireNYC program; |
| 15 | we have a history of local hiring and MWBE |
| 16 | commitments. Last year we were awarded over \$35 |
| 17 | million in MWBE contracts; over 120 of those since |
| 18 | 2014 within the New York/New Jersey area we've hired |
| 19 | over 350 people; we've worked with local |
| 20 | organizations such as Building Skills NY, the Osborne |
| 21 | Association as well, and so we have a history of |
| 22 | partnering up with local organizations for local |
| 23 | hiring; it's in our agreement with EDC, and we look |
| 24 | forward to working with the local community members; |
| 25 | Speaker's Office to make sure we hit the goals. |
| | |

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 85 CONCESSIONS CHAIR COHEN: You know, whether it's 2 3 perception or reality I don't know, but Bronxites and 4 the Bronx elected officials I think have a perception that other projects have not delivered on local 5 hiring, so it really ... it's important not only that 6 7 you do it, but I think that you demonstrate that you're doing it in a way that's very visible; that 8 9 people really can tangibly see that that commitment is being met and that it's your neighbor who's 10 11 getting these jobs. Because again, whether it's 12 reality or not, the perception is that people come, 13 they shake your hand; they say they're gonna do something and then it's either hard to verify or ... but 14 15 it's important to us and you know, on behalf of you 16 know my Bronx colleagues I know it's particularly 17 important to us that we see, in a tangible way that 18 that commitment is fulfilled. 19 Alright, I don't have any more questions 20 for this panel. Thank you. 21 Joyce -- I don't know if it's Hogi or 2.2 Hogi. [background comment] Hogi, Joyce Hogi. 23 You're a panel of one. Miss Hogi, just 'cause the hour's getting late, I'm gonna [background comment] 24

put the panels on ... on four minutes ... [crosstalk]

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 86 CONCESSIONS 2 JOYCE HOGI: I will be brief. Okay ... 3 [crosstalk] 4 CHAIR COHEN: Okay. If we could put everybody on a four-minute clock, that would be 5 6 great. 7 JOYCE HOGI: You know my late husband had a saying when the kids were trying to convince us to 8 9 do something, you know, don't dazzle me with the fancy footwork. That said; I just have a couple of 10 11 statements. 12 CHAIR COHEN: So can you state your name 13 for the record? 14 JOYCE HOGI: Joyce Hogi, H-O-G-I; sounds 15 like the sandwich; spelled a little differently. 16 I've been livin' in the community for 40 years 17 [inaudible]; I'm the President of the Bronx Council 18 for Environmental Quality (BCEQ), so we're very 19 committed to the environment. The Bronx, South Bronx 20 specifically, has one of the worst air qualities in the nation; no one is addressing how we're going to 21 mitigate that. We think being able to mitigate that 2.2 23 involved parkland and trees. Pier 5 was promised to the community as parkland; the City has refused to 24 fund it; the Bronx Council for Environmental Quality 25

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 87 |
|----|--|
| 2 | and the Harlem River Working Group have they've |
| 3 | commissioned a couple of studies and we've, you know, |
| 4 | presented great plans for parkland with trees and |
| 5 | different ways of dealing with the air quality in the |
| 6 | area. That said; no other sites have been considered |
| 7 | for housing; we have taken free public land, giving |
| 8 | it to a developer and now we're gonna go across the |
| 9 | street and buy private land to create a park. It |
| 10 | doesn't seem very cost efficient and does that \$200 |
| 11 | million or whatever the figure is, does that include |
| 12 | the purchase and relocating of those businesses? |
| 13 | Just food for thought we don't think it's a good |
| 14 | deal. |
| 15 | CHAIR COHEN: Thank you for your |
| 16 | testimony. [background comment] Okay. John Taylor; |
| 17 | I think that's Falcone; David Dishy; Jill Crawford |
| 18 | I'm doing everybody? one large panel Paul |
| 19 | Philps; and John Howard. [background comment] Okay. |
| 20 | [background comment] Yes, everybody'll How are you? |
| 21 | [background comments] I know everyone's gonna be |
| 22 | brief, but just 'cause the hour's getting late, |
| 23 | everybody's on a four-minute clock and if everybody |
| 24 | could identify themselves before their testimony. |
| 25 | You seem ready to go. [laugh] |
| | |

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 88 2 JOHN TYLER FALCONE: And I am John Tyler 3 Falcone; I am the Senior Associate of Workforce and 4 Economic Development with JobsFirstNYC. Good afternoon, Council Member Cohen and 5 other distinguished members of the Council's Land Use 6 7 Subcommittee on Planning, Dispositions and 8 Concessions. My name is J.T. Falcone; I'm the senior 9 associate of Workforce and Economic Development at JobsFirstNYC, a policy to practice intermediary 10 11 working to improve the workforce development system 12 and ensure that all New Yorkers are in a position to 13 access and climb the economic ladder of New York City's labor market. 14 15 For 10 years, JobsFirstNYC has been working with local communities and citywide 16 17 developing and supporting collaborative and 18 innovative strategies to find effective solutions to 19 support out of school, out of work young New Yorkers. 20 We're here today to lift up one such strategy, the 21 Lower East Side Employment Network, the LESEN, that has for the last 8 years worked to serve the needs of 2.2 23 residents of the Lower East Side while that neighborhood has seen a swell of economic development 24 activity. The coalition of 8 nonprofit agencies came 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 89 CONCESSIONS together in partnership with their local community 2 3 board (which is CD3) in a neighborhood-wide effort to 4 ensure that local residents were appropriately trained and positioned to benefit from those 5 opportunities as they arose, so the local hire topic 6 7 that we've heard come up a few times here.

8 By agreeing to collaborate rather than 9 compete, these 8 nonprofits have improved their engagement of local employers and developers to the 10 benefit of residents of the Lower East Side. 11 With 12 CB3 as a partner, LESEN is able to leverage this 13 strong relationship to negotiate with incoming 14 employers. Further, because employers have a clear 15 access point for local talent, they know who to reach 16 out to when they need candidates and the nonprofits, by pulling their resources, can offer a broader range 17 18 of training options and ready a larger talent pool. 19 Thus the network collectively fills a greater 20 percentage of job openings than a single agency would exclusively fill on its own and maintain deeper 21 2.2 relationships with a larger array of employers. 23 All parties benefit from the employer-

24 facing network model; the LESEN partners have engaged 25 173 businesses as of June 2017 and they have achieved

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 90 |
|----|--|
| 2 | a 3:1 interview to hire ratio, reducing costs |
| 3 | associated with, referring and interviewing excess |
| 4 | candidates to employers. What's more, incoming |
| 5 | businesses give LESEN partners lead time base don |
| 6 | projected jobs and because of this advance notice |
| 7 | they're able to build out customized programs for |
| 8 | residents to ensure that they're skilled and |
| 9 | credentialed in what employers need, expanding |
| 10 | employment access for local community residents. |
| 11 | As testimony to the value businesses see |
| 12 | in the LESEN, they have taken a notable step of |
| 13 | signing MOUs designating a 30% local hire expectation |
| 14 | at Essex Crossings, a new large-scale development |
| 15 | project in the Lower East Side. |
| 16 | Given the contextual similarities between |
| 17 | the Essex Crossing development work and the Lower |
| 18 | Concourse work on the agenda today, the NYC Economic |
| 19 | Development Corporation approached JobsFirstNYC early |
| 20 | last year to discuss the possibility of developing a |
| 21 | similar employer-facing network in the Lower |
| 22 | Concourse. Since that time we've worked to gauge the |
| 23 | local workforce community's interest in exploring an |
| 24 | employer-facing network model and found them to be |
| 25 | receptive, particularly given LESEN's success. Based |
| | |

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 91 on our firsthand experience working with LESEN, the 2 3 opportunity to develop a similar model to serve the 4 Lower Concourse would help the community to better prepare to serve not only public development 5 activities, but the private development that is sure 6 7 to follow. By facilitating direct connections 8 between existing residents and new businesses, an employer-facing network can help to ensure that the 9 improvements to the neighborhood are good for all New 10 11 Yorkers, particularly those that call the surrounding 12 neighborhoods home. Thank you for your time. 13 PAUL PHILPS: So my name is Paul Philps; I'm the District Manager for Community Board 4 and 14 15 our Board voted in favor for this project in May with 16 a number of conditions, many of which have already 17 been discussed here. The first one that I wanted to 18 talk about was employment opportunities and he stole a little bit of my thunder, but [laughter] we are 19 20 excited to hear about LESEN, but I do wanna emphasize 21 the importance for us that the jobs before, during 2.2 and after construction, that they go to local people, 23 both in Community District 4, but also in the Bronx; it's really, really important for us; this is a great 24 opportunity to leverage a publicly-owned site, a 25

1SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND
CONCESSIONS922City-owned site for the people of the Bronx, so3that's really important. We are excited to work with4JobsFirst, as well as EDC in creating a model for5LESEN, so that's really important for us.

The other thing that I wanna touch on is 6 7 the schools piece and I know we talked a little bit 8 about this before. There is already a need for 9 school seats without this project, both in elementary and I believe in secondary school seats, and as 10 11 someone from EDC alluded to, there is a letter for 12 commitment to monitor this process, but I have to be 13 very frank that we feel very strongly that the City should commit to not just monitoring the process; 14 15 they should identify a site and put funding toward 16 Today in SCA's capital plan, there is a need for it. 17 seats in this subdistrict as well as an adjacent 18 subdistrict, and this is without this project and 19 also without the Jerome Avenue project, which is not 20 part of the hearing today, but is north of this 21 project and also in my district. So we feel very 2.2 strongly that the City should commit to that, they should commit to a site and provide funding. 23 We've given examples of several different sites which are 24 in the broader catchment area which could be used. 25 Ι

 SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 93
should note that a lot of those sites are owned by
the City, although they are tied up in an agreement
for Bronx Park and Development, but they are City owned sites; they are woefully underutilized and they
are a public resource.

7 Lastly, or the last few things are just on the transportation piece. So I know that there 8 are gonna be major improvements to the intersections; 9 one of the things that will not be provided as part 10 11 of this project will be parking; most of the parking 12 will not be required pursuant to zoning. What I will 13 say is that perception is not reality; the number that indicate that there are not a lot of cars or 14 15 drivers in the district is woefully untrue, so what I 16 would ask is that we look at some creative ways to 17 provide some parking for new residents that come in 18 here; there is capacity in the adjacent Gateway Center, in their development, but the issue with that 19 is that it's all about price and so if there is a way 20 21 for the City to think about being creatively and 2.2 thinking outside the box to provide at some level 23 some affordable parking for the people in the district, that would go a long way. 24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 94 CONCESSIONS And then the last piece on that is in 2 3 terms of transportation. We're looking at improving the intersections, but I have to say we're excited 4 about this project, but when you talk about 5 additional users, 1,000 units, the Hip Hop Museum, 6 7 all of those uses coming to that intersection in an 8 area that is already seeing tremendous amounts of 9 development -- I went to a groundbreaking last week for another 265 units just north of this site, so 10 11 we're busting at the seams. So all of that is to say that we need to have investments in infrastructure as 12 well as investments in affordable housing; they're 13 extremely, extremely important. 14 15 And then lastly what I will say is that 16 we are very much committed to creating a 17 steering/governing committee for this project; we're 18 very interested and excited to work with EDC and its 19 other partners; we think it's a really important 20 component for all us within the community to monitor that site but also to be engaged in the community 21 2.2 engagement piece of that. 23 And then lastly I just want to thank EDC specifically -- Kate Van Tassel, Charlie Samboy, 24 Elijah Hutchinson, as well as Cecilia Kushner for 25

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 95 |
|----|--|
| 2 | their partnership and their collaboration and their |
| 3 | willingness to work with us, and we're very excited, |
| 4 | and on behalf of Community Board 4, we look forward |
| 5 | to working with everyone on this project. Thank you. |
| 6 | JOHN HOWARD: Good afternoon everyone |
| 7 | [inaudible] [mic off] press the button. [laughter] |
| 8 | You couldn't hear me before, right? [laughter] Well |
| 9 | here's the concern I have and I'm grateful to |
| 10 | [interpose] |
| 11 | CHAIR COHEN: I'm sorry; could you just |
| 12 | re-identify yourself? |
| 13 | JOHN HOWARD ALGARIN: Sure. John Howard |
| 14 | Algarin; I'm the chairperson of the Parks and |
| 15 | Recreation's Committee for Community Board 4. |
| 16 | Now my focus or the focus of my |
| 17 | statements will have to be with the development and a |
| 18 | long-term view towards not ending up with staccato |
| 19 | waterfront access for green spaces. We have a great |
| 20 | traveling walkway or bike path that ends at the High |
| 21 | Bridge; we have a beautiful bike path that begins on |
| 22 | the northern side of Mill Pond Park and winds through |
| 23 | the park and goes nowhere. I hear commentary coming |
| 24 | from the developers in the group that they will |
| 25 | create a loop on that walk path that will kinda turn |
| | |

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 96 CONCESSIONS back on itself and then we're gonna have another park 2 3 at 144th Street, and my concern is that -- and my 4 overarching vision for that entire waterfront is that we have one contiguous waterfront access travelway, 5 akin to what they have in the -- well the majority of 6 7 Manhattan that would allow people to enjoy the green spaces that you're developing; it makes no sense to 8 9 have a new park on 144th Street if the access is just 144th Street and no one from the surrounding areas 10 11 will find themselves in a fluid pathway that leads to 12 that location. So I'd like to see the development 13 include concepts with parkway or parkway pathways that continue to the southernmost tip of the Bronx 14 15 peninsula where we know that new development is 16 coming. We're grateful to see the activation of the 17 parkland and we look forward to actually gaining more 18 acreage for use by the community, but in addition to all things that have been said and promised, and 19 20 particularly what our district manager, Mr. Philps 21 said, you know keep that in mind and we'd like to see 2.2 some projected depictions that show you know the 23 waterfront park access travel thoroughfare with a mind towards it's continuing south and continuing 24 25 north, with the hurdles that come with some of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 97 CONCESSIONS landowners to the north and to the south dealt with 2 3 in future sessions. And I thank you for your time. JILL CRAWFORD: Thank you, Chairman. I'm 4 Jill Crawford from Type A Projects and my colleague 5 David Dishy from L&M. We were meant to read 6 7 statements from CityScience and the Billion Oyster Project, but I think in the interest of time we'll 8 9 submit those. [background comment] Thank you. CHAIR COHEN: Alright, thank you for your 10 11 testimony everybody. [background comment] Alright. 12 I'm gonna go back to the script. [background 13 comments] 14 Alright. Alright, so I will now close 15 the public hearing on LU 747-750; we will be laying 16 over these items until our next hearing. 17 I'd like to thank the counsel and Land 18 Use staff for preparing today's hearing and the 19 members of the public and my colleagues for 20 attending. This meeting is hereby adjourned. Gavel. 21 [gavel] 22 [background comments] 23 24 25

CERTIFICATE

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date October 5, 2017