

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

September 27, 2017

Start: 2:00 p.m.

Recess: 3:39 p.m.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: LETITIA JAMES  
Public Advocate

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO  
Speaker for the Council

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Inez D. Barron  
Joe Borelli  
Fernando Cabrera  
Margaret S. Chin  
Andrew Cohn  
Costa G. Constantinides  
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.  
Elizabeth S. Crowley  
Laurie A. Cumbo  
Chaim M. Deutsch  
Daniel Dromm  
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.  
Mathieu Eugene  
Julissa Ferreras-Copeland  
Daniel R. Garodnick  
Vincent J. Gentile  
Vanessa L. Gibson

David G. Greenfield  
Barry Grodenchik  
Corey D. Johnson  
Ben Kallos  
Andy L. King  
Peter A. Koo  
Karen Koslowitz  
Rory I. Lancman  
Brad S. Lander  
Stephen T. Levin  
Mark Levine  
Alan N. Maisel  
Steven Matteo  
Darlene Mealy  
Carlos Menchaca  
Rosie Mendez  
I. Daneek Miller  
Annabel Palma  
Bill Perkins  
Antonio Reynoso  
Donovan J. Richards  
Ydanis A. Rodriguez  
Deborah L. Rose  
Helen K. Rosenthal  
Ritchie J. Torres  
Rafael Salamanca  
Mark Treyger  
Eric A. Ulrich  
James Vacca  
Paul A. Vallone  
James G. Van Bramer  
Jumaane D. Williams

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Reverend Victor T. Hall, Senior Pastor  
Calvary Baptist Church,  
110-10 Guy R. Brewer Blvd, Jamaica, NY 11433.

2 [sound check, pause]

3 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We're going to  
4 get started. We have a long agenda.

5 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet  
6 please, quiet down.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We want to make  
8 sure we get through it.

9 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down please.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: So, we're going  
11 to start off with two ceremonials today. We're going  
12 to start off with Council Member Chin, who's honoring  
13 the Chargers Softball Team, and they can start coming  
14 up here whoever the representatives are. [applause]  
15 Honoring the Chargers Softball at IS-276 in Battery  
16 Park City for winning their first ever New York City  
17 Softball Championship. [cheers/applause] Alright.  
18 Now, I played softball, too, but I was not very good.  
19 I will say that and we played against the Mayor's  
20 side a couple of times, softball. I think it's even,  
21 right? I think we lost one, we won one, whatever.  
22 Huh?

23 FEMALE SPEAKER: [off mic] And how did  
24 you do?

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We never lost.  
3 Okay, yes, let's say that. So, congratulations to  
4 all of you and I'm going to pass it off to Margaret.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Speaker.  
6 I'm so excited to present this proclamation the  
7 District 1's own real live team of feel it go. (sic)  
8 [cheers/applause] Recognized as the Girls with the  
9 Golden Arm, the IS 276 Chargers Softball Ball Team  
10 carried out a fierce 20/17 season, and won their  
11 first ever citywide softball championship.  
12 [cheers/applause] You know, I know how close you were  
13 to winning last year, right? It just goes to show  
14 that your teamwork, leadership and perseverance  
15 turned this victory into a reality. Now, I also want  
16 to take a moment to thank our Mayor for his  
17 investment in our city's after school program. So,  
18 thanks to our city's middle school expansion program,  
19 organizations like Manhattan Youth can get the  
20 funding they need to provide free, diverse after  
21 school programs like their SONYC School's Out NYC  
22 Sports League. So, without this vital after school  
23 funding from our city, victories like this would not  
24 be possible. So, I want to congratulate again to all  
25 the members of the Chargers for showing us what

2 exactly our girls can achieve. So, congratulations  
3 to Ella [cheers/applause] Andrea, Grace, Natalie,  
4 Olivia, Leah, Haley, Catalina, Savanna, Annie, Lola,  
5 Allie, Lena and Haley. [cheers/applause] Yes,  
6 softball and to the coaches, Jon Carey, Zane Holmes  
7 and Ryan Bucci for their guidance. Of course our  
8 principal Terry Ruyter, Assistant Principal Nico  
9 Victor-Victorino and, of course, the Manhattan Youth  
10 Team: Jesus Rose, Cynthia Deleon, Lena Madison and  
11 Brian Vivera and lastly the student's family. Thank  
12 them for continuing to support their daughter's  
13 dreams and ambition. So, can I ask the Clerk to read  
14 the proclamation.

15 CLERK: Council City of New Yorker  
16 Proclamation.

17 The Council of the City of New York is  
18 proud to recognize an inspiring team of fearless  
19 girls in our Lower Manhattan Community.

20 FEMALE SPEAKER: [interposing] They are,  
21 they're beautiful. [laughter]

22 Fearless girls in our Lower Manhattan  
23 community the Chargers Softball Team at IS 276 in  
24 Battery Park City for winning their first ever New  
25 York City softball championship; and

2           Whereas, after coming close to winning  
3 the Downtown Championship in 2016, the Chargers  
4 returned to the game in full force in 2017 and  
5 swiftly carried out a strong successful spring season  
6 winning all but one game this year; and

7           Whereas, comprised of 14 spunky young  
8 women from the sixth, seventh and eight grades, the  
9 Chargers hit their stride in the playoffs scoring 9,  
10 12 and 14 home runs in their final three games. In  
11 no small part to their balanced teamwork and smart  
12 and timely hitting, all 10 members of the Chargers  
13 starting line have scored at least one home run in  
14 their championship game; and

15           Whereas, the IS 276 Chargers are a part  
16 of Manhattan Youth's Schools Out New York City SONYC  
17 Middle School Athletic League, a program modeled  
18 after the Public School Athletic League that provides  
19 competitive sports leagues for New York City students  
20 at the middle school level; and

21           Whereas, when Mayor de Blasio expanded  
22 Department of Youth and Community Development funding  
23 for the SONYC program in 2014, thousands more middle  
24 school students received access to enriching after  
25 school programs like sports. Today, Manhattan Youth

2 is a proud provider of these free services for 22  
3 public middle schools and 4,000 students across the  
4 city. During the 2016-2017 school year more than  
5 3,500 middle school students had the opportunity to  
6 play for their school's Sports League; and

7           Whereas, through their hard earned  
8 victory, the IS 276 Chargers have risen up as and  
9 exemplary model of teamwork, dedication and girl  
10 power to their peers across the city, and have earned  
11 the respect and recognition of New Yorkers across  
12 generations.

13           Now, therefore, be it known that the  
14 Council of the City of New York proudly honors the IS  
15 276 Chargers for finishing a successful spring 2017  
16 season by capturing their first New York City  
17 Championship and we wish them continued success both  
18 on and off the softball-softball field. Melissa  
19 Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the Entire Council,  
20 Margaret S. Chin, Council Member First District,  
21 Manhattan.

22           SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright.  
23 [cheers/applause] I have—I—I have to say I don't  
24 think I've ever seen Margaret this excited.  
25 [laughter] Oh, she's very enthusiastic. What? Your



2 first sports proclamation. Okay. So, I'm going to  
3 ask the Captain and who? I'm sorry, who's the  
4 captain of the team? Who? You're going to  
5 something. [laughter] We want to develop your women  
6 to speak up, right? That's what we do, but we're  
7 also recruiting for the Council. We only have 13  
8 members out of 51, so we're looking for members to  
9 our team of woman here. So, maybe we can recruit  
10 some of these young women. Alright, so the captain  
11 is over here, and then obviously the coach will speak  
12 as well, but let's have the young women speak first,  
13 and give us your name.

14 OLIVIA MAZUEL: Hi. I'm Olivia Mazuel,  
15 and I'd to thank everyone for this opportunity to be  
16 here and we are so honored and excited.  
17 [cheers/applause]

18 LEAH MEYERSON? Hi. My name is Leah  
19 Meyerson, and we'd like to thank our coaches, family,  
20 Manhattan Youth, and Councilwoman Chin for all the  
21 support and making this happen. We are also hoping  
22 to defend this title in the spring and hopefully come  
23 back next year and thank you again. [cheers/applause]

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Also, you'll be  
25 coming back here. Okay, to the coach.

2 ZANE HOLMES: Hi, thanks everyone for  
3 having us. Obviously, extremely proud of all these  
4 girls and everything they accomplished. You know, it  
5 wasn't a lot of work for us because they already had  
6 everything they needed to succeed, and we just tried  
7 to put them in the best position to do that, and we  
8 did. So, I'm very proud and looking forward to  
9 following this season and defending that title.  
10 [cheers/applause] Thank you.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright, well  
12 congrats again. Did you get the photos?

13 MALE SPEAKER: Right, we got the photos.  
14 [background comments, pause]

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright, thank  
16 you. Alright, thanks a lot. Alright, the next  
17 ceremonial is my personal ceremonial. I don't do  
18 many of these. I'm very proud of this one. I'm gong  
19 to ask the Harlem African Burial Ground Task Force  
20 members to join me up here. I've ask colleagues of  
21 mine to also join me up on the front here. Today  
22 we're voting a project that is in my district, and I  
23 don't know if people have taken the time to see the  
24 boards that we have around regarding the Harlem  
25 African Burial Ground that is in my district. The

2 person who brought to my attention was Reverend  
3 Singletary who is Chair and I co-chair with her, but  
4 the chair of the task force to talk about this sacred  
5 site in our district and that we needed to do  
6 everything possible to figure out how to memorialize  
7 this African-African-Harlem African Burial Ground.  
8 So, now we are at a point where this task force has  
9 been operating for about ten years, completely  
10 volunteer. I give a little bit of money to help with  
11 some of their administrative expenses, but they've  
12 been doing this work out of sheer love and commitment  
13 to this project, and we're at a point now where  
14 through EDC's partnership a decommissioned bus depot  
15 at 126<sup>th</sup> Street, which actually does sit on the site  
16 of the original African Burial Ground Task Force.  
17 That site is going to be-has been decommissioned, and  
18 is going to be developed. While we have a commitment  
19 from EDC that whatever project gets built there (1)  
20 will never be built on top of the original perimeter  
21 of the burial ground to respect the site, but (2)  
22 that money will be provided to administer a memorial  
23 at that site, and also an area in which programs and-  
24 and exhibition space can be provided. That will be  
25 funded through this development project. So, this

2 work today, yes, it's historic. It really is a good-  
3 there's an article I think that came out in the New  
4 York Times today or yesterday, but it really speaks  
5 to the great effort of Reverend Singletary, and all  
6 the members of the task force, and she will introduce  
7 them, but I want the, please the clerk to read the  
8 Proclamation. This is really-really something that I  
9 am very proud of, and a legacy project. I'm really  
10 excited that we've been able to get this far. At the  
11 beginning when many thought we would never get here,  
12 we have come a long way, and it's through sheer,  
13 sheer love and commitment. So, with that, let me ask  
14 the clerk to read the proc and then I'll have  
15 Reverend Singeltary say a few words.

16 CLERK: Council City of New York  
17 Proclamation.

18 The Council of the City of New York is  
19 proud to honor the Harlem African Burial Ground Task  
20 Force where its outstanding teamwork and dedication  
21 while working to reclaim, preserve and recognize one  
22 of our city's sacred sites, and

23 Whereas, in 1660 when the Village of New  
24 Harlem was incorporated, the Low Dutch Reformed  
25 Church of Harlem now the Elmendorf Reformed Church

2 erected a church building at the corner of First  
3 Avenue and 126<sup>th</sup> Street. A quarter acre of church  
4 property was set aside a segregated cemetery know as  
5 the Negro Burying Ground or Harlem African Burial  
6 Ground. This remained an active cemetery from the  
7 mid-17<sup>th</sup> to the mid-19<sup>th</sup> Centuries; and

8           Whereas, Reverend Dr. Patricia A.  
9 Singletary, the Pastor of Elmendorf Reformed Church,  
10 who saw that plans for the replacement of the Willis  
11 Avenue Bridge and the 126<sup>th</sup> Street Bus Depot  
12 threatened to disturb a Colonial Era African-American  
13 burial ground acted quickly to safeguard this  
14 ancestral space and helped create the Harlem African  
15 Burial Ground Task Force in 2009. Comprised of  
16 community stakeholders, city agencies,  
17 archaeologists, urban planner, architects and  
18 historians the task force gather neighborhood  
19 feedback, monitored the construction of the new  
20 bridge and the placement of historic markers and  
21 called for the removal of the bus depot at 100-at  
22 126<sup>th</sup> Street; and

23           Whereas, seeking to correct a historical  
24 injustice, the task force mobilized to help the  
25 Elmendorf Reformed Church remember and memorialize

2 the historically and culturally significant Colonial  
3 African Burial Ground. This land and the individuals  
4 who lie within are an integral part of our cultural  
5 heritage not just for the African-American community,  
6 but for our entire city; and

7           Whereas, guided by its Executive  
8 Committee and co-chaired by Reverend Dr. Singletary  
9 and Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito, the Harlem African  
10 Burial Ground Task Force has sought to obtain  
11 historic designation for the site, and to celebrate  
12 the indigenous people who inhabited this area prior  
13 to the arrival of the Europeans. The Task Force has  
14 worked tirelessly to honor the memory of Harlem's  
15 colony builders enslaved and free Africans, who were  
16 major contributors to the growth and success of New  
17 York's economy, infrastructure and society; and

18           Whereas, the Harlem African Burial Ground  
19 Task Force has also supported the development of a  
20 memorial and cultural center where the history of the  
21 sacred site and of Harlem can be shared and explored  
22 with the public; and

23           Whereas, the Task Force has made great  
24 strides thanks to seven distinguished members of it—  
25 of its Executive Committee: Melinda Valez, Deborah

2 I. Gibson, Lois Brown, William Long, Thomas Lunke,  
3 Sharon Wilkins and Jean Ballard Terepka, and the  
4 support of the Consulting Architect Anthony Carrion,  
5 and several honorary members including several  
6 elected officials; and

7           Whereas, today as the Task Force's  
8 mission has reached a very important milestone, it is  
9 a great privilege to publicly recognize those who  
10 have worked for many years to ensure its success.

11           Now, therefore, be it known that the  
12 Council of the City of New York gratefully honors the  
13 members of the Harlem African Burial Ground Task  
14 Force for their stellar service and enduring  
15 contributions to East Harlem and all of New York  
16 City. Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the Entire  
17 Council.

18           SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you. I-I  
19 said that this [applause] this task force is one  
20 that-that I co-chair with Reverend Singletary, but I  
21 know she's sitting down because she's too-What? But  
22 this is-if people had not mattered-this is my  
23 District Office, Chief of Staff Melinda Valez who  
24 sits on the task force for me, [applause] and has put  
25 in so much work into this. I want to thank her for

2 that, and I'm going to pass it off to Reverend  
3 Singletary.

4 REVEREND SINGLETARY: Thank you. Thank  
5 you so much. What a great Speaker you have,  
6 [background comments] [applause] and what a great co-  
7 chair we have. It's been a journey, but I'm so  
8 pleased that we've been blessed to rise at this point  
9 of our journey, and I truly want to thank the  
10 faithfulness of my Task Force members: Thomas Lunke,  
11 Sharon, Jeannie and others. [coughs] Thank you.  
12 Just thank you so much. [applause]

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: The Reverend is  
14 not usually one at a loss for words. No, it's a very  
15 proud moment and if everybody knew the amount of work  
16 this took, you'll understand, but thank you all for  
17 standing here with us and congratulations to the task  
18 force. [applause] [pause] That ends ceremonials.  
19 [background comments, pause]

20 CLERK: Could I have your attention,  
21 please? Can I please have your attention, please.  
22 Quiet on the floor, please. Quite please.

23 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please. At  
24 this time, I ask that you please place all electronic  
25 devices, all electronic devices to vibrate. Will all



2 non-Council employees, non-Council employees please  
3 leave the main floor of this Chambers. Additionally,  
4 can we have all staff members away from the sides  
5 that do not belong on the side over there, please  
6 behind the ropes. So, we don't have to move you  
7 later. Thank you. [background comments] Quiet,  
8 please. [gavel]

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Everyone, please  
10 find a seat. Close the doors. All rise for the  
11 Pledge of Allegiance.

12 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise.

13 [Pledge of Allegiance]

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.

15 Roll call.

16 CLERK: Barron

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.

18 CLERK: Borelli.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Here.

20 CLERK: Cabrera. Chin.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

22 CLERK: Cohen.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

24 CLERK: Constantinides.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

2 CLERK: Cornegy. Crowley.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Here.

4 CLERK: Cumbo. Deutsch.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.

6 CLERK: Dromm.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

8 CLERK: Espinal. Eugene.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Here.

10 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Here.

12 CLERK: Garodnick.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.

14 CLERK: Gentile.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.

16 CLERK: Gibson. Greenfield.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Here.

18 CLERK: Grodenchik.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: I'm here.

20 CLERK: Johnson. Kallos.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

22 CLERK: King.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.

24 CLERK: Koo.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

2 CLERK: Koslowitz.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

4 CLERK: Lancman.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.

6 CLERK: Lander.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.

8 CLERK: Levin.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

10 CLERK: Levine.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

12 CLERK: Maisel.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.

14 CLERK: Mealy.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Here.

16 CLERK: Menchaca.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.

18 CLERK: Mendez.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Is that Mendez?

20 I mean—I'm here.

21 CLERK: Miller.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Here.

23 CLERK: Palma.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Here.

25 CLERK: Perkins.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Here.

3 CLERK: Reynoso.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Presente.

5 CLERK: Richards.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

7 CLERK: Johnson.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Here.

9 CLERK: Rodriguez. Rose.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

11 CLERK: Rosenthal.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

13 CLERK: Salamanca. Torres. Treyger.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

15 CLERK: Ulrich.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Present.

17 CLERK: Vacca. Vallone.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

19 CLERK: Williams.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.

21 CLERK: Matteo.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.

23 CLERK: Van Bramer.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

25 CLERK: Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Here.

3 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Quiet  
4 in the Chambers, please.

5 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: May we ask the  
7 gentleman to remove his cap. Gentlemen, please  
8 remove your caps. All rise for the Invocation.

9 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Will you keep it down,  
10 please.

11 CLERK: All rise.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Delivered by the  
13 great Reverend Victor T. Hall, the Senior Pastor of  
14 Calvary Baptist Church in the great borough of  
15 Queens. Quiet in the Chambers.

16 REVEREND HALL: Let us pray. Dear God  
17 our Heavenly Father and our eternal friend in whom we  
18 live and move and have our very being. This is the  
19 day that you have made, and we rejoice and are glad  
20 in it. We thank you for this august body of public  
21 servants. We thank you for our Speaker Melissa Mark-  
22 Viverito, for our Public Advocate Tish James, and for  
23 Council Members Ira Daneek Miller, and all of the  
24 City Council persons in this body. Lord, we thank  
25 you for the immeasurable gifts and talents you have

2 invested in the members of our Council. We thank you  
3 for the determination, for the sacrifice of time and  
4 service and labor, and Father, even as we recognize  
5 all that you have given to each member, we yet come  
6 to ask for your guidance and for your strength. For  
7 without you we can do nothing. Lord, I ask for this  
8 City Council that you will give to the members the  
9 courage that you gave to Sampson. Grant to them the  
10 wisdom that you gave to Solomon, the commitment to  
11 justice that you gave to Isaiah and the love and the  
12 compassion and the kindness that you gave to Jesus  
13 Christ. Bless this house. Let your presence meet as  
14 they meet to do a work that is pleasing to you and  
15 that will aid and benefit and help all New Yorkers.  
16 We thank you this day. In your name we pray. Amen.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amen. Please be  
18 seated. [background comments] Quiet in Chambers,  
19 quiet in the Chambers.

20 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet down. This is  
21 serious stuff. [gavel] Quiet in the Chambers.  
22 [background comments] A motion to spread the  
23 invocation of my mother's pastor Reverend Hall in  
24 full upon the record by Council Member Ira Daneek  
25 Miller.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Yeah, hey.

3 [cheers] Okay. So, I'm going to tell you all the  
4 story after that. [background comments] A motion to  
5 spread the invocation in full on the record. It is  
6 my pleasure to welcome Pastor Hall to City Hall today  
7 to these Chambers in particular in the times that our  
8 city and our nation find themselves, and particularly  
9 those who have been devastated throughout the  
10 diaspora from the forces of nature. For as a great  
11 inspirational pastor of Calvary Baptist Church in  
12 Jamaica, Queens better known as the Friendly Church  
13 on the Boulevard. He has demonstrated the type of  
14 compassion and concern that is necessary to see us,  
15 our city through these times, and he is deeply  
16 concerned about all humanity. Because of his  
17 leadership, we had seen in Southeast Queens some of  
18 the first grandparent housing throughout the United  
19 States. We had also seen through the-the Amani  
20 Ministry our young people go from the streets to  
21 universities. We've seen through the food ministry  
22 thousands of folks be fed, and as a Phi Beta Kappa  
23 Morehouse man, he has demonstrated the leadership  
24 mainly through the Union Theological Semi-Seminary  
25 that he has the type of passion to really serve. Let

2 me just say, because I'm going to go off the record  
3 and say something about my good friend and my  
4 neighbor, beside the fact that he is a valiant Cowboy  
5 fan, we can forgive you here in this chamber here,  
6 that he said that nations shall be judged on how they  
7 treat the least of us. Because we have housed those  
8 who were—who were homeless, and we have fed those who  
9 are hungry, and we have clothed those who were naked  
10 and out of doors (sic) together and that means that  
11 I'm very, very proud to work with you here to this  
12 Chamber, and that leadership that you have  
13 demonstrated. So, it is my pleasure again, once  
14 again to—to spreads the invocation and welcome Pastor  
15 Victor T. Hall to the Chambers of the people's house.  
16 Thank you.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,  
18 Council Member Miller. [applause] Thank you.

19 REVEREND VICTOR T. HALL: Madam Advocate,  
20 may I just say I have quick questions. Is it against  
21 city code if I put the Councilman on my payroll?

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs]

23 REVEREND VICTOR T. HALL: I—I would just  
24 like for him to come and give that introduction to my  
25



2 members because if he introduces me I think I might  
3 get a raise this year.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs]

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: He can do that  
6 without getting paid. [laughter]

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs] Thank  
8 you, Reverend Hall, and thank you Ira Daneek Miller,  
9 Council Member Miller. Adoption of Minutes, Council  
10 Member Debbie Rose.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Ira. [background  
12 comments]

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
14 [shushing for quiet]

15 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [coughs] Sorry. A  
17 motion that the Minutes of Stated Meeting of August  
18 9, 2017 be adopted as printed.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
20 Messages and papers from the Mayor.

21 CLERK: M 547, the Mayor's Management  
22 Report.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Received order.  
24 Printed and filed.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

26

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication  
3 City, County and borough offices.

4 CLERK: Preconsidered M 548, transferring  
5 funds between agencies.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Finance.

7 CLERK: Preconsidered M 549, Fiscal 2018  
8 Capital Budget.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Finance.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and  
11 Communications.

12 CLERK: None.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call-  
14 ups.

15 CLERK: M 550 and 551.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
17 [shushing for quiet]

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on call-  
19 up vote, and I will ask for a roll vote on Land Use  
20 Call-ups.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the  
22 Chambers as we engage in a roll call.

23 CLERK: Barron

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [off mic]

25 CLERK: Borelli.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all.

3 CLERK: Chin.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

5 CLERK: Cohen.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

7 CLERK: Constantinides.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.

9 CLERK: Cornegy. Crowley. Deutsch.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.

11 CLERK: Dromm. Espinal. Eugene.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

13 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Aye.

15 CLERK: Garodnick.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

17 CLERK: Gentile.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye.

19 CLERK: Gibson. Greenfield.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye.

21 CLERK: Grodenchik.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

23 CLERK: Johnson.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.

25 CLERK: Kallos.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Kallos.

3 CLERK: King.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye on all.

5 CLERK: Koo.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

7 CLERK: Koslowitz.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.

9 CLERK: Lancman.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

11 CLERK: Lander.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.

13 CLERK: Levin.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.

15 CLERK: Levine.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

17 CLERK: Maisel.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: [off mic] Aye.

19 (sic)

20 CLERK: Menchaca:

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.

22 CLERK: Mendez.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

24 CLERK: Miller.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Miller.

2 CLERK: Palma.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

4 CLERK: Perkins.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye on all.

6 CLERK: Reynoso.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

8 CLERK: Richards.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

10 CLERK: Rodriguez. Rose.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

12 CLERK: Rosenthal.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye.

14 CLERK: Salamanca. Torres. Treyger.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

16 CLERK: Ulrich. Vacca.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye.

18 CLERK: Vallone.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye.

20 CLERK: Williams.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.

22 CLERK: Barron. Matteo. Van Bramer.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.

24 CLERK: Rodriguez.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

2 CLERK: Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

3 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I vote aye.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Today's Land Use

5 Call-ups are adopted by a vote of 38 in the

6 affirmative, 0 in the negative. Quiet in the

7 Chambers as we now hear from the Speaker Melissa

8 Mark-Viverito.

9 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quite down, please.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the

11 Chambers.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Madam

13 Public Advocate—Madam Public Advocate. I'm going to

14 ask if we can stand for one moment for--

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing] All

16 rise.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --all the victims

18 of all of these hurricanes, the catastrophes that

19 have occurred. We're voting on a construction bill

20 today. We had too many construction workers who have

21 died, most recently two after we talked about voting

22 on this bill. So for all of those, I would ask that

23 we have a moment of silence. [moment of silence]

24 Thank you, my colleagues. Before we dive into what is

25 turning out to be at stated, a very charged agenda

2 today, I want to wish everyone a belated Shanah  
3 Tovah, and an east fast as we move through the Jewish  
4 holiday season. And following up on the opening of  
5 our last Stated meeting, I want to reiterate the  
6 ability of City Council and City of New York  
7 employees to enroll in the New York City Gives  
8 Program, enabling them to automatically direct a  
9 portion of the paycheck toward qualifying non-profit  
10 organizations. Yesterday, I returned from Puerto Rico  
11 where I saw first hand the devastation that has  
12 wrought by the succession of hurricanes that have hit  
13 Puerto Rico, U.S. Virgin Islands, and the Greater  
14 Caribbean. The scale of destruction cannot  
15 be overstated, and help is desperately needed. I  
16 don't think it's coming fast enough. It will take  
17 months, if not years, and it will be years to rebuild  
18 much of the island, and parts of the Puerto Rico that  
19 we once knew may never exist again. This has become  
20 obviously a climate crisis, a health crisis, a  
21 humanitarian crisis, and as our federal government  
22 drags their feet on providing relief to other three  
23 million U.S. citizens, this has become an undeniable  
24 moral crisis. I want to thank Mayor de Blasio and I  
25 want to thank the New York City Office of Emergency

2 Management for attend—their attention to this cause.  
3 They deployed efforts early and—and—and I'm immensely  
4 proud of that response. I was actually there at the  
5 requite of Mayor San Juan, Carmen Yulan Cruz, who was  
6 asking for assistance and the Mayor he did the call,  
7 and so we have some first—first responders, and some  
8 emergency personnel there helping the metropolitan  
9 area set up emergency systems that need it,  
10 distribution centers, et cetera, but as the current  
11 presidential administration to suspend the Jones Act,  
12 this is incredibly critical. No ship, no ships and  
13 we know that some of our sister island want to  
14 provide support and relief. No ships can enter  
15 Puerto Rican ports unless they are U.S. flagged and  
16 staffed ships. So, we actually have donations that  
17 cannot enter Puerto Rico because they do not comply  
18 with the Jones Act, and we have gotten a refusal by  
19 this administration and it is reported that Trump has  
20 denied the request to waive the Jones Act  
21 requirements despite the fact that the same was  
22 provided to Texas and the same was provide to  
23 Florida. So, I want to ask and I thank the  
24 generosity. I mean the level of generosity that has  
25 been expressed and demonstrated, contributions and



2 donations, physical donations is unbelievable. It  
3 really is inspiring and in a time where we could have  
4 so much that is drawing at us and draining us. It's  
5 good—great to be uplifted by—by the support that  
6 we're getting, and obviously we're trying to figure  
7 out how we centralize all of that. There's so much  
8 that people are giving, and so many people that want  
9 to volunteer. We definitely want to help build some  
10 sort of an infrastructure to provide that relief, and  
11 that help to the Caribbean, particularly Puerto Rico  
12 and the Virgin Islands. Many of us come from  
13 communities with close ties to the islands and  
14 nations affected this year, but we're not coming from  
15 the islands ourselves. Many of us are. Obviously,  
16 our relatives are. So, I really hope and encourage  
17 people to continue to aid in this mission to recover  
18 and to rebuild.

19                   So, I'm jumping into the docket for  
20 today. We're going to begin by voting on multiple  
21 Land Use items, including the 126<sup>th</sup> Street Bus Depot  
22 Redevelopment and Harlem African Burial Ground  
23 Memorial Project located in my own district of East  
24 Harlem. I want to thank Reverend Patricia Singletary  
25 and the entire Harlem African Burial Ground Task

2 Force. We just met them earlier today at the  
3 ceremonial. I want to thank them for their years of  
4 dedication and hard work to ensure the historic  
5 cemetery at this site is finally properly  
6 memorialized. I also want to thank DEC and their  
7 staff for patiently working with us on framing a  
8 viable project that respects the history of this  
9 site. This bill comes after a long series of  
10 conversations and negotiations with the task force  
11 and community stakeholders on how best to commemorate  
12 the historic important of the site while also serving  
13 the needs of our current community through its  
14 redevelopment. The project will include approximately  
15 730 residential units with preference for proposals  
16 that maximize the number of housing units at the  
17 deepest levels of affordability including 20% of the  
18 project affordable to extremely low income households  
19 of 30% of Area Median Income. So we have 15,000 gross  
20 square feet of commercial retail and office space  
21 with the commitment for local hiring, and dedicated  
22 space and ongoing funding for both an indoor and  
23 outdoor memorial to commemorate the Harlem African  
24 Burial Ground Memorial. And has obviously been a  
25 delicate conversation, a lot of hard work. We're

2 proud of the agreement we've come to with the  
3 neighborhood advocates on promoting the history of  
4 the space, and imparting the respect that it deserves  
5 as a final resting site of the unjustly enslaved.

6           And our first legislative items include—  
7 will be Introduction 1375, sponsored by Minority  
8 Leader Steve Matteo, which would require the  
9 Department of Transportation to provide electronic  
10 notification to affected Council Members, borough  
11 presidents and community boards upon its approval of  
12 a permit application to open a street segment or  
13 intersection that has been reconstructed or  
14 resurfaced within the previous five years. On the  
15 staff I want to thank Faizah Malik, Jonathan  
16 Masserano, Emily Rooney, Terzah Nasser, Jeff Baker  
17 and Ayesha Schaumburg.

18           Intro 1031-A sponsored by Council Member  
19 Mark Levine and Transportation Committee Chair Ydanis  
20 Rodriguez would require the Department of  
21 Transportation to conduct a study of traffic  
22 congestion results and from truck deliveries in  
23 Manhattan below 59<sup>th</sup> Street, and in Downtown  
24 Brooklyn. The bill would require the study to  
25 include traffic congestion from truck deliveries at

2 all hours of the day, night and overnight and to  
3 include an analysis of the feasibility and necessity  
4 of implementing measures to reduce traffic congestion  
5 resulting from truck deliveries. I want to thank  
6 Faizah Malik, Jonathan Masserano, Emily Rooney,  
7 Terzah Nasser, Jeff Bake, and Ayesha Schaumburg.

8 Intro 1292-A sponsored by Council Member  
9 Cost Constantinides would require the Procurement  
10 Policy Board to publish rules to facilitate the  
11 development and implementation of agency programs to  
12 accept electronic procurement vouchers and each city  
13 agency to develop and implement programs to accept  
14 procurement vouchers electronically to the extent  
15 practicable and consistent with the operational and  
16 fiscal needs. On staff, I want to thank Alex  
17 Paulenoff, Casey Addison, Jeff Baker and John  
18 Russell. On legislation relating to the sale of  
19 second hand vehicle, Introduction 39-A sponsored by  
20 Consumer Affairs Chair Rafael Espinal, would mandate  
21 that used care dealers disclose certain information  
22 to consumers including the price of add-on products,  
23 the total cost of the vehicle broken down by monthly  
24 payments and with or without any add-ons. The lowest  
25 APR offered by a finance company and any other

2 financing related to disclosures the Commissioner  
3 prescribes by rule. It also requires used car  
4 dealers to offer a two-day contract cancellation  
5 option, whereby consumers may cancel their vehicle  
6 purchase and any related financing contract with two  
7 days subject to certain conditions. And Introduction  
8 1540-A sponsored by Council Member Dan Garodnick  
9 would require second hand automobile dealers to  
10 conspicuously post and provide perspective buyers  
11 with the Consumer Bill of Rights. I want to thank  
12 Rachel Cordero, Valkief Mirrig, Ali Ali, Jeff Baker  
13 and Israel Martinez. In representing a major step  
14 forward in the health of New York City, the Council  
15 will vote on the following package of three bills  
16 related to regulating the sale and conception-and  
17 consumption of Hookah and other non-tobacco products.  
18 Intro 139-C sponsored by Council Member Vinnie  
19 Gentile would prohibit the opening of new Hookah by  
20 eliminating the non-tobacco Shisha exemption and the  
21 Smoke Free Air Act. It would allow existing Hookah  
22 bars that earn more half of their revenue from Hookah  
23 related sales to continue to operate by creating a  
24 new permitting system operated by the Department of  
25 Health and Mental Hygiene. Intro 1075-C sponsored by

2 Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez would add signage  
3 requirements to Hookah bars permitted to operate  
4 under the permitting scheme created by Introduction  
5 139-C. It would require that Hookah bars post a  
6 prominent sign at their entrance and in any area in  
7 which smoking occurs warning of the health risks  
8 associated with smoking. And Intro 1076-C.

9 We have a lot of C versions today in this  
10 agenda, a lot of work that's gone into all of these,  
11 and Introduction 1076-C, also sponsored by Council  
12 Member Rodriguez, would set the minimum age for the  
13 purchase of non-tobacco Shisha, rolling papers and  
14 pipes to 21 years of age, bringing them in line with  
15 tobacco products and e-cigarettes. With the passage  
16 of this bill, all smoking products would have a  
17 minimum purchase age of 21. For staff I want to  
18 thank David Seitzer, Ze-Emanuel Hailu, Crystal Pond,  
19 Jeff Baker and Janette Merrill. And the final four  
20 bills being voted on today relate to standards and  
21 practices being carried out by the Department of  
22 Buildings and the Department of Housing, Preservation  
23 and Development.

24 Introduction No. 934-A sponsored by  
25 Council Member Steve Levin would create a real time

2 enforcement unit in the Department of Buildings. On  
3 staff I want to thank Guillermo Patino, Megan Chin,  
4 Jose Conde, Sarah Gastelum, Jeff Baker and Jen  
5 Wilcox.

6 Intro 1359-A also sponsored by Council  
7 Member Steve Levin would require HPD to audit  
8 buildings receiving benefits under 421-A Tax  
9 Exemption Program to determine whether such buildings  
10 are complying with the Applicable Affordability  
11 Requirements. And Introduction 1366-A, sponsored by  
12 Housing and Buildings Committee Chair, Jumaane  
13 Williams would require HPD to audit buildings  
14 receiving benefit under 421-A--

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
16 [shushing for quiet]

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --and to  
18 determine whether such buildings are in compliance  
19 with app--

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
21 [shushing for quiet]

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --applicable rent  
23 registration requirements. The staff I want to thank  
24 Guillermo Patino, Megan Chin, Jose Conde, Sarah  
25 Gastelum, Jeff Baker and Jim Wilcox, and finally

2 after eight—more than eight months of reviewing  
3 extensive feedback from stakeholders, a public  
4 hearing and hundreds or hours of conversation with  
5 local laborers, unions, day laborers, developers,  
6 contractors, community organizations and many other  
7 interested parties, the Council will vote on Intro  
8 1447-C, which will establish safety training  
9 requirements for workers at construction sites. This  
10 bill is sponsored by Housing and Buildings Chair  
11 Jumaane Williams, and Council Member Carlos Menchaca,  
12 would require workers at most construction sites to—  
13 to receive between 40 and 55 hours of safety training  
14 as specified in by the Department of Buildings. You  
15 can clap. I'll let you clap. You can clap.

16 [cheers/applause] The bill—the bill would also  
17 include provisions to help workers in getting this  
18 training including allowing laborers to continue  
19 working while they complete the training and having  
20 the Department of Small Business Services develop a  
21 program to ensure that all workers have equal access  
22 to training, particularly those who may have a harder  
23 time obtaining training through their employers,  
24 notably day laborers and workers employed by small W—  
25 MWBE contractors. Too many fatalities have occurred



2 on construction sites in this city including a recent  
3 death just one day after the announcement of this  
4 bill. So, it has clearly become well past time to  
5 task action—to take action on ensuring the safety of  
6 our workers and residents. The staff I want to thank  
7 Guillermo Patino, Megan Chin, Jose Conde, Sarah  
8 Gastelum, Ed Adkin, Jeff Baker, Jim Wilcox and Ramon  
9 Martinez, and with that, that ends communication from  
10 the Speakers.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Now  
12 discussion of general orders beginning with Council  
13 Member Gentile. Quiet in the chambers, please.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Today, the  
15 Smokefree Air Act gets a modern look. While the 2002  
16 Act outlawed tobacco smoking indoors, Intro 139-C now  
17 brings smoking—now brings smoking non-tobacco Shisha,  
18 casually referred to as Hookah smoking under the  
19 Smokefree Air Act. This bill also recognizes it's  
20 dangerous to smokers' health using non-tobacco  
21 Shisha. Anyway you cut it, research shows Hookah  
22 smokers inhale large high levels of carbon monoxide,  
23 tar and other hazardous substances including the  
24 carcinogens associated with the combustion of  
25 charcoal in the Hookah pipe, and water in the Hookah

2 does not filter the effects. Moreover, these  
3 chemicals are more deeply inhaled for much longer  
4 periods compared to smoking one cigarette. The  
5 Center for Disease Control found one session is  
6 equivalent to smoking about 100 cigarettes. Seven  
7 years ago parents who from the Brooklyn's Arab-  
8 American community made me aware that many teenagers  
9 used-casually engaged in this kind of smoking at  
10 bars, restaurants and Hookah lounges. Now, this will  
11 end, but recognizing those who run full Hookah  
12 lounges as small businesses, those sites will be  
13 grandfathered in if they have at least half their  
14 gross sales related to the sale of the non-tobacco  
15 smoking product. If they register with a \$25 permit  
16 from DOH, refuse to allow entry to those under 21,  
17 institute new ventilation, sterilization and Fire  
18 Code requirements, they can remain open. But if  
19 found guilty of adding tobacco to any Shisha, they  
20 will lose their permit to operate. 139-C clears the  
21 air on the dangers of non-tobacco Hookah smoking.  
22 Too many youngsters unwittingly inhale this toxic  
23 smoke and workers and neighbors of Hookah lounges  
24 suffer from the second hand effects of it. Hookah  
25 smoking indoors has been the elephant in the room by

2 making it part of the smoke—a Smokefree Air Act, 139-  
3 C protects the integrity of the act ensuring New  
4 Yorkers we'll have clean air in public spaces. It  
5 recognizes the health dangers, promotes the city's  
6 efforts to denormalize smoking and--

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
8 Council Member, please conclude.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Yes, okay, I  
10 will. Respects access to the establishments where  
11 Hookah can be smoke. I'll save the thank yous when I  
12 explain my vote. Right now, I want to remind you  
13 that Hookah smoke is no joke.--

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
15 Thank you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: --and I ask all  
17 of you to join in voting yes--

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
19 Thank you, Council Member.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: --on Intro 139-  
21 C. Thank you.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
23 Council Member Jumaane Williams. [background  
24 comments] Quiet in the Chambers, please.

25 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet down.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: So, thank you  
3 very much. I have two bills. One is 1366-A. I want  
4 to thank Council Member Levin for his assistance in  
5 co-priming, making sure that those who have 420-421-A  
6 for tax abatements ordered by HPD to make sure  
7 they're following the abysmal program that was, and  
8 the worst one that we have now. Also, I have 1447-  
9 C. I want to thank the co-prime Council Member  
10 Menchaca, and the Speaker for their leadership as  
11 well as Borough President Gale Brewer, and this is  
12 seen also in-in my Stated and my voting remarks. But  
13 I wanted to make sure that we are clear that we  
14 addressed all of the issues that were brought to us  
15 by everyone: union, non-union, web made, developers,  
16 day laborers, MWBEs. This was not a rush job. This  
17 took eight months. This discussion has been going on  
18 for years. We passed six bills of the package in  
19 April. No one said that it was rush job. On that,  
20 we had the hearings in January. Again, I-I would  
21 defy anyone so a bill that would have better to pass  
22 for all of the things that we agreed upon. I want to  
23 lift up some of the workers: Juan Jamil, Joe  
24 Pachecho to Costa Taminos and Tom Moses, a project  
25 and Demach (sp?)and Martin Enright (sic) and Manuel

2 Sobar (sp?). I do want to thank some of my--our  
3 partners including Gary LaBarbera, who has been a  
4 phenomenal partner in this conversation, and people  
5 like Sean Memes(sp?). [cheers/applause] [laughter].

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
7 [shushing for quiet] Quiet in the Chambers. Quiet  
8 in the Chambers.

9 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down, keep it  
10 down.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the  
12 Chambers, please. Thank you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: People, I get  
14 like a couple a couples of seconds back.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: People like  
17 Sean Memes from--on the Public Communities, Inc. I  
18 started off rough, but she continued to engage. I  
19 would--as I said in the press conference, I would  
20 rather enemies who tell they don't want something  
21 than friends who pretend, and I say that because this  
22 was tougher than when I was dealing with the police  
23 unions. I just want to make sure I put on the record  
24 that REBNY was abhorred partner in this. [bell] They  
25 were disreputable. They told untruths. It was

2 almost immoral what I saw happening in REBNY, and I  
3 expected them to be a better partner than what I saw  
4 there. The bill is closer to what they wanted, but  
5 they are complaining. And I must say the bill is  
6 further away from what the unions wanted, and they-  
7 ever step of the way, workers, they grumbled, they  
8 complained, they lobbied, but we made sure we  
9 maintained—that this was safety for everyone, not  
10 just for some, and I congratulate them. I think  
11 REBNY has a lot of work to repair trust when we  
12 negotiate. As I said in the press conference, the  
13 only way that I can explain what they did is a power  
14 phrase from Rich James, and that is: The love of  
15 money is a hell of a draw.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

17 [cheers/applause] Quiet in the Chambers.

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: For those, yeah,  
20 this how we express our approval. Thank you.

21 Council Member Menchaca.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you,  
23 Public Advocate James. So, I rise to speak on 1447-  
24 C, a third version of the bill that started just  
25 eight months ago. [Speaking Spanish] We are

2 protecting every single working. This is a beautiful  
3 moment to celebrate. The table that is set invited  
4 everyone that needed to speak on this issue from day  
5 laborers that have never been invited before with the  
6 leadership of Gary Labarbera (sp?) and his entire  
7 team, Pat--

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
9 [shushing for quiet]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --Pat, thank  
11 you so much for your leadership.

12 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
13 down, please.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: The entire team  
15 came together even with the MWBE construction  
16 companies and REBNY. The road was tough, but  
17 everyone was dedicated to that one mission that we  
18 did something legislatively with budget and a real  
19 change in culture to make sure that not one more  
20 death come before us in our construction sites in the  
21 richest city in the country, potentially the world  
22 that we set an example for others, and we are going  
23 to change that culture today, and I want to thank all  
24 the council members that have the courage to stand up  
25 today to that bigotry, to that misinformation, and

2 we're going to say yes. Yes to every single worker.  
3 The day laborers have been such a beautiful spirit in  
4 this conversation that were supported by everyone,  
5 and I just want to lift them up for a moment. These  
6 are folks that have been supported by the Council in  
7 the past to bring initiatives into every borough.  
8 These day laborers were once not at all connected to  
9 OSHA. Now they're training their own fellow workers  
10 in the language that they speak. This is the power  
11 of the city. This is the power of our Council to  
12 support this kind of legislation. I am so proud to  
13 be here, and the leadership that Chair Williams  
14 showed every single moment in those tough discussions  
15 should be praised, and I'm so happy to call him my  
16 brother. [Speaking Spanish] Let's keep doing it.  
17 Let's keep rocking it. Thank you so much to  
18 everybody in this room.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Thank  
20 you. Minority Leader Steven Matteo.

21 MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: Thank you, madam  
22 public advocate. I just want to make some brief  
23 comments on the bill that I've introduced that we're  
24 voting on today about utility cuts and street cuts,  
25 and since we've started here in 2014, colleagues and



2 the Speaker and—and those like Borough President  
3 Oddo, and Council Member Borelli when he was elected  
4 to this Council. We've been fighting for more funds  
5 for those, and we have paved more than 4,000 lane  
6 miles since 2014 investing \$1.6 billion over ten  
7 years. Our roads are starting to become drivable  
8 again, but that progress and the significant  
9 investment of taxpayer dollars we are making is being  
10 under mined by almost everyday that unnecessary  
11 street cuts and substandard repairs made to them.  
12 You don't have to drive or walk very long in the city  
13 before you come across a shoddy patch of asphalt, or  
14 sinking trench where there used to be clean,  
15 continuous—contiguous pavement. This isn't just an  
16 aesthetic problem. It's a matter of safety. It' a  
17 matter of properly managing city resources and  
18 keeping our infrastructure in a state of good repair.  
19 The streets are a lifeline for our businesses and  
20 especially for outer borough residents who have fewer  
21 transportation options. While Intro 1375 will not  
22 solve the entire problem, it begins the process of  
23 creating a solution. This bill will require that DOT  
24 notify local officials once they issue a permit to  
25 work on a recently paved street, and give us a chance

2 to help correct or minimize the damage. It will also  
3 facilitate better communication between all parties  
4 involved, and provide much needed transparency to a  
5 process that has been anything but transparent for  
6 many years. We certainly have more work to do to fix  
7 this process, and that includes improving the  
8 standards of repairing the street cuts, but right  
9 now, there's no written or legal standards for these  
10 repairs and that has to change. But this is a start.  
11 I want to thank my Council colleagues for their  
12 support, the Speaker, Chair Rodriguez and  
13 Particularly Transportation staff, central staff and  
14 my own, and I urge my colleagues to vote yes.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Quiet  
16 in the Chambers, please. Council Member Rodriguez.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.  
18 I'm proud to stand here to day with my colleague and  
19 so the colleague on Intro 1031, Council Member Mark  
20 Levine. With this bill, we will create a task force  
21 that will help us to have a student about the impact  
22 of truck deliveries in our streets. We look forward  
23 to the recommendation that this task force will do  
24 for-to advance our efforts to tack-to tackler  
25 congestions in our city. I would also like to speak

2 about the other bills. Within increasing popularity  
3 of Hookah, and its prevalence used particularly among  
4 young people, we face the great public health  
5 challenges that we must address now. The rate of use  
6 among Hispanic—especially Hispanic, Asian and Latino  
7 use of the Hookah is something that is hurting their  
8 health. According to the Department of Health, New  
9 York--New Yorkers did, New Yorkers between 18 and 20  
10 years of age are three times more likely to smoke  
11 Hookah than people 29–21 and older. Intros 1075-A  
12 and 1076-AA, will require a seamless warning on  
13 health rates associated with the smoking of Shisha,  
14 and on tobacco smoking establishments, and raise the  
15 age of Hookah to 21. As with the cigarettes use,  
16 smoking Hookah presents great health risks for users  
17 as well as second hand smokers such as workers at  
18 Hookah establishments. Today, we're sending the  
19 message to everyone: If you want to use Hookah, go  
20 to a Hookah bar, but if you want to have a dinner in  
21 a restaurant, that's a nice place to—for Hookah to be  
22 sold. Thank you.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: That concludes  
24 our discussion of General Orders. Report of Special  
25 Committees.

2 CLERK: None.

3 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of  
4 Standing Committees.

5 CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
6 Consumer Affairs, Intro 1539-A and 1540-A, second  
7 hand auto dealers.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
9 coupled on General Orders.

10 CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
11 Contracts, Intro 1292-A, Electronic Vouchers.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
13 coupled on General Orders.

14 CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
15 Finance, Reso 1639, Business Improvement Districts.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
17 General Orders.

18 CLERK: Preconsidered Reso 1658,  
19 organization funding.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
21 General Orders.

22 CLERK: Preconsidered Reso 1659,  
23 Rescindment in the expense budget.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
25 General Orders.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

53

2 CLERK: Preconsidered M 548 and Reso  
3 1661, Transfer of City funds.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
5 General Orders.

6 CLERK: Preconsidered M 549 and Reso  
7 1662, Fiscal 2018 Capital Budget.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
9 General Orders.

10 CLERK: Preconsidered LU 754 and Reso  
11 1663, Noonan Plaza.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
13 General Orders.

14 CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
15 Health, Intro 139-C, Hookah Establishments.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
17 coupled on General Orders.

18 CLERK: Intro 1075-A, signage warning for  
19 Shisha.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
21 coupled on General Orders.

22 CLERK: Intro 1076-A, prohibiting the  
23 sale of smoking products to minors.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
25 coupled on General Orders.

2 CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
3 Housing and Buildings, Intro 934-A, Real Time  
4 Enforcement Unit, Department of Buildings.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
6 coupled on General Orders.

7 CLERK: Intro 1359-A and 1366-A, 421-A  
8 tax exemption.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
10 coupled on General Orders.

11 CLERK: Intro 14-1447-C construction site  
12 safety training.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
14 coupled on General Orders.

15 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Land  
16 Use, LU 738 and Reso and 1664 through LU 742 and Reso  
17 1668 on page, property tax exemptions.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
19 General Orders.

20 CLERK: LU 751 and Reso 1669, automated  
21 accessory parking garage.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
23 General Orders.

24 CLERK: Preconsidered LU 756 and Reso  
25 1670, HPD application.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

55

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
3 General Orders.

4 CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
5 Transportation, Intro 1031-A, Traffic Congestion  
6 Study.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
8 coupled on General Orders.

9 CLERK: Intro 1375-A, DOT resurfacing  
10 notifications.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and  
12 coupled on General Orders.

13 CLERK: On the General Order Calendar, LU  
14 733 and Reso 1671 and LU 734 and Reso 1672, Zoning  
15 Amendments.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
17 General Orders.

18 CLERK: LU 735 and Reso 1673, City Map  
19 Amendment.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
21 General Orders.

22 CLERK: LU 736 and Reso 1674, Disposition  
23 of City-owned property.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
25 General Orders.

2 CLERK: Resolution appointing various  
3 persons commissioner of deeds.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on  
5 General Orders, and ask—I ask for a roll call on all  
6 General Order items.

7 CLERK: Barron

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye with the  
9 exception of 738 and the accompanying reso. LU 738  
10 and the accompanying resolution. Thank you.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

12 CLERK: Borelli.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all  
14 except 139-C, 1075, 1076, 1539 and 1540-A, and I'm  
15 especially pleased to vote yes on 1447.

16 CLERK: Chin.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I just want to  
18 congratulate to all my colleagues especially to  
19 Council Member Williams for your courage. I vote aye  
20 on all. Thank you.

21 CLERK: Cohen.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

23 CLERK: Constantinides.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Madam

25 Public Advocate may I be allowed to explain my vote?



2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I just  
4 want to talk briefly about Intro 1292, which we're  
5 passing today. You know, this Council had done a  
6 great deal this session relating to environmental  
7 concerns and meeting the 80 x 50 Mandate. There's a  
8 lot we can do to ensure that even the smallest of  
9 government transactions are green as well. Everyday  
10 the City agencies interacted hundreds of contractors  
11 from dozen of different fields. Many-many times they  
12 generate OC, a procurement voice or other documents  
13 in the transactions. This means that in the age of  
14 Smart Phones and tablets, hundreds and thousand of  
15 piece of paper are being generated by the city  
16 activity every week. There is simply no reason that  
17 this should. That's were Intro 1292 comes in, and  
18 somebody directs all agencies to accept vouchers and  
19 invoices electronically and instructs the Procurement  
20 Policy Board to promulgate rules to assist them in  
21 doing so. I want to make sure I thank our Chair of  
22 the Committee and great friend Helen Rosenthal and  
23 the Speaker for all their leadership. I thank my  
24 colleagues for their support on each one of the  
25 trees. They're being cut down. Can absorb up 40

2 pounds of carbon year. So, by, you know, it's  
3 ceasing to use trees. We are going to be, you know,  
4 reducing our goal, but we're getting to 80 x 50. I  
5 am going to vote no on Intro 139-C, aye on all the  
6 rest. I just have concerns relating to my community,  
7 and my neighborhood's voiced their opinion. I'm  
8 going to vote no on 190-139-C.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Quiet  
10 in the Chambers, please.

11 CLERK: Crowley.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I vote aye on  
13 all.

14 CLERK: Deutsch.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye on all.

16 CLERK: Dromm.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye on all.

18 CLERK: Eugene.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.

20 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: [off  
22 mic] I vote aye.

23 CLERK: Garodnick.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

25 CLERK: Gentile.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: May I be  
3 explained—excused to explain my vote?

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Congratulations  
6 to all my colleagues and their bills being passed  
7 today. On 139-C there are many people to thank in a  
8 seven-year journey to get this bill on the floor. I  
9 first want to thank the parents from Brooklyn's  
10 African-American community led by activist Kathy  
11 Katari, and Pastor Adair, and your team for bringing  
12 this issue forth and causing me and my staff to  
13 investigate and ultimately draft legislation. Also,  
14 I have to thank my colleagues in government and  
15 especially the Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito, Council  
16 Members and Health Chair Corey Johnson, and Council  
17 Member Ydanis Rodriguez for—for all being strong  
18 proponents for regulation, and protecting the health  
19 of minors, and I congratulate Council Member  
20 Rodriguez for his two pieces of legislation today in  
21 regard to Hookah smoke. I also want to thank the  
22 Administration particularly John Paul Lupo and his  
23 staff and those at the Department of Health for being  
24 willing to partner with us and for working on  
25 acceptable and workable mechanism to implement these

2 changes. On the staff side I'd like to thank the  
3 irrepressible Ramon Martinez, the wisdom of Laura  
4 Popa, the hard work of legal counsel David Seitzer  
5 who was instrumental-

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
7 [shushing for quiet]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: --in getting a  
9 handle in all parts of this issue, and who labored  
10 through all the meetings, hearings and numerous  
11 drafts of the bill until we got to the C version  
12 today, Policy Analyst Crystal Pond and Ze-Emanuel  
13 Hailu, and finally my Legislative Director Jonathan  
14 Shabshaikhes, who has lived with this bill for a very  
15 long time, and assisted greatly in its drafting.  
16 Madam Public Advocate, it's been a long time coming,  
17 but today I proudly vote aye on Intro 139-C, and aye  
18 on all the other items.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,  
20 irrepressible. Thank you. [laughs]

21 CLERK: Greenfield.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Irrepressible  
23 and not able to be controlled or restrained. Sounds  
24 about right. That's a fair description of Mr.

2 Martinez, although I think he definitely has other  
3 qualities?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Although I'm-  
5 I'm-I'm going to use my time. How much time do I  
6 have? Two minutes? May I explain my vote?

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, you may.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you  
9 very much. I only have good things to say about  
10 Ramon Martinez. I congratulate all my colleagues. I  
11 appreciate the Speaker's warm remarks on the Jewish  
12 holidays, and certainly I'm hoping that we have an  
13 easy fast. I join in her remarks on the  
14 ridiculousness of the non-waiver of the Jones Act,  
15 and I do want to address some of the controversy  
16 regarding 1447-A. I see, I'm sorry, right but I  
17 actually heard a joke. One members said we're going  
18 to get a Z version. I don't think that happened yet.  
19 So, I-I think there's two lines of criticism, one  
20 which is fair and one which is not. The one  
21 criticism that is not fair is that there's criticism  
22 on the process. I personally have been involved in  
23 the process. There were hundreds if not thousands of  
24 hours of process and conversations and discussions  
25 and deliberations, and I witnessed many versions of

2 change, and I think that anyone who is aware of the  
3 process would understand the process was a good  
4 process, and was a fair process and was a respectful  
5 process. As for the second line of the criticism,  
6 which is that the bill is not perfect, that's a fair  
7 criticism, but very few of the bills that we passed  
8 are perfect. There's a nature of negotiations that  
9 we end up with bills that are inherently imperfect  
10 bills, and this bill certainly could have a few  
11 tweaks that I would have wanted, but I'm balance. I  
12 think many of the challenges and the changes and the  
13 concerns that we have were, in fact, addressed and,  
14 therefore, I am proud to vote aye on this and all  
15 other pieces of legislation. Thank you.

16 CLERK: Grodenchik.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Permission  
18 not to explain my vote. [laughter] I just want to  
19 say thank you to all my colleagues and especially to  
20 Chair Williams on his hard work for 1447-C. We've  
21 seen an epidemic of deaths on construction sites in  
22 the City of New York. I know and all the members of  
23 this Council know that we can and must do better.  
24 So, I want to thank all the people that worked on  
25 that. I want to thank the Chair and the staff who

2 worked long hours to make this as acceptable as  
3 possible while hopefully saving many, many lives as  
4 we go forward into future. And, I also want to say  
5 to my friend Ira D., I named my son after an Ira D.  
6 and he's doing just fine. I vote aye on all.

7 CLERK: Johnson.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye on all.

9 CLERK: Kallos.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Permission to  
11 also vote on Land Use Call-Ups and to explain my  
12 vote?

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I just want to-

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member,  
16 is your mic on?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: How's this?

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: There you go.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: As a co-primary  
20 sponsor of Intro 1447, I want to thank the Housing  
21 Chair Jumaane Williams for the courage of carrying  
22 the bill, and getting it over the finish line, and  
23 getting that touchdown for all of us, and every  
24 single one of our workers in the city. We've asked  
25 ourselves how many more must die, and now moving

2 forward people working on construction projects over  
3 a three-family, will actually get training before  
4 they go onto the job, and so not quite as much  
5 training as you need to be a real estate agent or cut  
6 somebody's hair but it's a good start, and I'm proud  
7 to vote on this and aye on all.

8 CLERK: King.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: No on 1539 and aye  
10 on all.

11 CLERK: Koo.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

13 CLERK: Koslowitz.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye on all.

15 CLERK: Lancman.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

17 CLERK: Lander.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request

19 permission to explain my vote.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: First, I want to

22 congratulate Council Member Levin on both the Real

23 Time Enforcement Unit and the 421-A documentation

24 bills, and just add my voice to praise. I guess 1447

25 may be at its C version, but I think the effort to



2 bring home a bill we can all feel good about rates an  
3 A and not a C. I do want to thank all of the folks  
4 who worked hard on it, but I just do want to  
5 especially thank Jumaane who took a lot of phone  
6 calls from me, and I think navigated a process that  
7 comes to something that I think we can feel very good  
8 about, and I believe it's going to make a real  
9 difference in saving lives and construction worker  
10 safety thanks to folks up in the balcony as well. I  
11 vote aye on all.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

13 CLERK: Levin.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission toe  
15 explain my vote.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, Madam  
18 Public Advocate. My colleagues, today I want to  
19 thank you very much for voting on two pieces of  
20 legislation of the Housing and Buildings Committee  
21 that I am sponsoring. The first Intro 934-A will  
22 create a Real Time Enforcement Unit, as the Speaker  
23 said, in the Department of Buildings that will track  
24 monitors with the response, work without a permit  
25 that endangers and threatens our residents in their

2 own homes. This is the final piece of the Stand for  
3 Tenant Safety, but it's in a package made possible by  
4 the dedicated coalition of grassroots activists, and  
5 tenant organizer, that—that really made this package  
6 of legislation happen along with my colleagues in the  
7 Progressive Caucus and—and the Speaker. I want to  
8 especially thank Brandon Cabasa, Luz Rosero, Sonya  
9 Martinez, the famed Felipe and Carmen Ricardo, Lena  
10 Chevy, and Rafina and Orlando Guzman and Phil Schneck  
11 and Kay who advocated for this legislation, and I  
12 want to acknowledge the—the Housing and Buildings  
13 Committee staff, Jen Wilcox, Megan Chin, Faizah  
14 Malik, Guillermo Patino, as well as my staff Director  
15 Boucher, and Ed Paulino, and special acknowledgement  
16 to the Speaker and—and Ramon Martinez for making this  
17 as strong a bill as possible. I know that it—it  
18 followed—it lagged a little bit behind the rest of  
19 the package, but that was necessary in order to craft  
20 a strong bill, and will for the first time have a  
21 Real Time Enforcement Unit within the Department of  
22 Buildings that will increase the—the response time  
23 for complaints from 40 days on average now to no  
24 longer than 10 days for working without a permit  
25 complaint, and 12 hours if it is a threat to safety.

2 So, I also want to thank—I also want to acknowledge  
3 Council Member Williams on 1447, and Council Member  
4 Menchaca and all the great work that they did on that  
5 bill, and with that I vote aye on all.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

7 CLERK: Levine.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you. I  
9 will voting aye on all except for no on Intro 139-C.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11 CLERK: Maisel.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: [off mic] Aye.

13 CLERK: Menchaca.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to  
15 explain my vote.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I just want to  
18 add my comments earlier. The—oh, and I—and before I—  
19 I continue with my comments on 1447-C, I also want to  
20 wish a Shanah Tovah, to my Jewish brothers and  
21 sisters. The work that—that happened with 1447-C was  
22 I thought and incredible story. Gary and Pat Purcell  
23 (sp?) and Santos and—and Alethea, and Gonzalo, and  
24 Manny and the teams that they brought. I also want to  
25 give a shout out Karen Blondell from my—from my

2 district who really advised me at every corner about-  
3 about being-being in the industry, and understanding  
4 it from her perspective as a NYCHA resident. These  
5 perspectives I'd seen in a room before together  
6 talking and I think that we learned a lot about the  
7 power of communication, and really setting-setting  
8 the standards for having-having-having good and open  
9 Communication. There's a lot more to be done around  
10 our construction. Safety, we get it, but I'm so  
11 proud of-of that work that we have in front of us.  
12 So thank you so much to all these brothers and  
13 sisters, people I call family at this point, and then  
14 finally, I want to thank my Chief of Staff Veronica.  
15 Veronica did so much every single day to pull people  
16 together and-and keep us all in line, but also  
17 reminded about what it was-what-what this is all  
18 about having come from the industry and having come  
19 from-from labor. So, I think you all and I vote aye  
20 on all.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

22 CLERK: Mendez.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote aye on  
24 all.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

2 CLERK: Miller.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Permission to  
4 explain.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: First of all, I  
7 do want to say I vote on all, but in particular I  
8 want to just congratulate Council Member Williams and  
9 all those involved in 1447-C. Once again, this  
10 Council has demonstrated that we value people over  
11 profit that this was always about saving lives, to  
12 bring in safety to an industry that lacks safety that  
13 no other industry would have seen the loss of more  
14 than 40 lives over the past year and half, and-and-  
15 and would have stood that. And often these were  
16 black and brown men and women of color that were  
17 suffering at these hands, and there's been a million  
18 narratives about this impact on our community. Our  
19 communities deserve better, and this legislation  
20 gives them that, that they deserve. So, thank you so  
21 much.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I vote aye on  
24 all.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

2 CLERK: Palma.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 CLERK: Perkins.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye on all.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

8 CLERK: Reynoso.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Permission to  
10 explain my vote?

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I'm extremely  
13 concerned about Intro No. 139-C asking for a flawed  
14 business model to—to try to work in Hookah bars. I  
15 think I think I might actually even encourage more  
16 looking asking for Hookah bars who make more than 50%  
17 of their profits off of the smoking portion of their  
18 business doesn't fall in line with the business model  
19 of just general Hookah bars. More alcohol is  
20 consumed in these bars than actual Hookah products.  
21 So if you're smoking—if you need to smoke, 50% the  
22 sales they're going to have to start churning out  
23 more Hookahs not less. I just think legislation is  
24 flawed. I wish we would have had more conversations  
25 about what the business model looks like, and I want

2 to vote no on Intro 139-C, but on the other pieces of  
3 legislation regarding Hookah, I think were well done,  
4 and I want to say for Intro 1447-C it's an-an amazing  
5 day today. We finally are starting to see parts of  
6 our work here aligned with a lot of the work that  
7 we've been doing on the outside that speaks a true  
8 and real safety for our workers. I want to say that  
9 in many of the deaths that happened over the last  
10 couple of years have been mostly Latino workers and  
11 now they're not voiceless. Now they are being  
12 recognized, and we're going to make sure that we pass  
13 these pieces of legislation, this piece of  
14 legislation in their name. So, congratulations to  
15 Jumaane Williams and Carlos Menchaca and the work you  
16 do on that bill, and I proudly vote again aye on all  
17 except for Intro 139-C. Thank you.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

19 CLERK: Richards.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

22 CLERK: Rodriguez. To explain my vote?

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Hookah has  
25 been eliminated from L.A., Toronto and even the

2 Congress of the Dominican Public, and the reason why  
3 those cities that we've been competing good policy is  
4 because they know that they've been killing a lot of  
5 people. Recently, Mia Sushi, it's right in my  
6 district. I wanted to see on Saint Nicholas Avenue  
7 was shutting down.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
9 [shushing for quiet]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: But the liquor  
11 license because based on the article that the Daily  
12 New York printed a few months ago, the last incident  
13 was a person who was intoxicated from using Hookah.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I believe what  
16 we're doing today is growing, not-what we are doing  
17 today and being sure that we establish group policy,  
18 and that we don't go back there. The crack was  
19 invented in my community in Northern Manhattan. We  
20 have 104 homicides every year. A lot of people  
21 especially youngsters, they been using Hookah  
22 combined with liquids, combined with other pills that  
23 create addiction to our youngster. If any one wants  
24 to use the Hookah, as I said before, go to a Hookah's  
25 bar. It is the rise of any individual to do whatever



2 they want in their private life. However, it is  
3 unfair for us in the name of just creating more jobs  
4 to try to justify that policy that can create  
5 addiction to our youngsters. With that, I vote aye.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

7 CLERK: Rose.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I vote aye on all,  
9 and I want to congratulate Council Member Williams on  
10 this legislation, 1447-C. Coming from a borough where  
11 we've had numerous accidents and deaths and  
12 fatalities due to unsafe practices. I-I commend you  
13 on this legislation, and I-I want to thank you for  
14 ensuring the safety of all of our workers citywide.  
15 Thank you.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

17 CLERK: Rosenthal.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Pass.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Sure.

20 CLERK: Okay. Treyger.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I vote aye on  
22 all.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

24 CLERK: Ulrich.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I ask for  
3 permission to vote on Land Use as well.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I vote aye on  
6 Land Use and aye on all on the General Order  
7 Calendar.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. \

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you.

10 CLERK: Vacca.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I vote aye on all.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

13 CLERK: Vallone.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Madam advocate,  
15 may I explain my vote?

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you. I  
18 congratulate all my colleagues today for their great  
19 bills, and I-I vote aye on all. No one would ever  
20 claim for me to be a poet, but on ride in today, I--  
21 I just felt compelled. I needed to express how I  
22 felt like so many of us did today. So, here's my-my  
23 simple attempt at a poet. Today I rise. I do not  
24 take a knee. I stand with the hope and promise about  
25 continued unity. I stand to respect the men and

2 women who are for to protect my family who stand for  
3 those heroes who gave the greatest sacrifice to  
4 protect our rights and liberties. So, I join the  
5 generations who have stood before me to honor our  
6 freedom, and that we remain a beacon of light and  
7 liberty. Thank you Madam Advocate.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Thank  
9 you Council Member.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: God bless.

11 CLERK: Williams.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I be  
13 excused to explain my vote?

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes sir.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: First, I want  
16 to say that that was a great poem, and those of us  
17 that are near to you for the very same reason. I  
18 want to just continue what I was saying about 1447-C.  
19 Just to clarify. I saw it, too, and I wanted to make  
20 sure I clarified that it was the unions who also  
21 grumbled who also lobbied and also pushed back, but  
22 they were, as the two partners should stayed at the  
23 table and helped us get to where we needed to go, and  
24 I also wanted to just look at, as—as my colleagues,  
25 the day laborers came kicking and screaming hard, and

2 also did the same thing. All the people who avail  
3 themselves saw that we were addressing all of their  
4 issues. My word means a lot to me. I know that my  
5 colleagues do as well, and we said we weren't going  
6 to have union only bill. We said that we going to  
7 keep safety as the focus and not allow this to be a  
8 proxy. We did all of those things. We started from  
9 the framework that everyone agreed we needed some  
10 additional training. Everyone agreed that OSHA was  
11 a good framework, and everyone agreed that we needed  
12 some additional training. We did that. I'm very  
13 proud of that and this is about the culture of  
14 safety. This will not end the issue, but it does  
15 help push that erosion of culture backwards. What we  
16 have here included changes in the—in the fines and  
17 the fees, and the refresher courses that are needed.  
18 We'll take a huge step forward. I do want to thank  
19 everybody who assisted including staff, Mike Toomey,  
20 my Legislative Director, Jose Conde, Sarah Gastelum,  
21 Megan Chin who heard more than one choice word from  
22 people, Ed Atkin, Ramon Martinez. A special shout  
23 out to Guillermo Patino, our Legislative Counsel,  
24 this is his last stated. So, I want to thank him and  
25 congratulate him as he moves forward. Jon Paul Lupo

2 from the Mayor's side, the Commission from the  
3 Mayor's side, and all of the advocates and the  
4 stakeholders who helped us move forward. As was  
5 mentioned, this bill is not perfect. I just ask for  
6 folks to let's focus on the things that need to still  
7 be tweaked, but don't make things up that aren't  
8 there. I again ask our media to ask people what they  
9 sent us, what are their concerns, then look at this  
10 bill in black and white and tell me what we could  
11 have done better including having a \$5 million  
12 commitment. That's just the first step, and \$36  
13 million to the Department of Buildings, and most of  
14 that money is going to go local groups, and we are  
15 going to—going to additional funding before to  
16 address the main problem we heard with MWBE day  
17 laborers to make sure that people who can't afford  
18 this have access to the training. That will help.  
19 This is just a pretty—pretty good day for this  
20 Council. We took something that was a hot potato,  
21 made it real, and I think we're going to save some  
22 lives here today.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.

25 CLERK: Rosenthal.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Permission to  
3 explain my vote.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes. Quiet in  
5 the Chambers, please.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I'm proud to  
7 vote aye on all and—and with congratulations to my  
8 colleagues, Council Member Williams—

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
10 [shushing for quiet]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: -who stayed  
12 with this, and Council Member Levin for some really  
13 smart 421-A bills, but in particular to Council  
14 Member Constantinides who really is ahead of the game  
15 in thinking about procurement reform and brining the  
16 city into the 21<sup>st</sup> Century in its procurement, which  
17 will ultimately drive down the cost of contracting in  
18 New York City. So, congratulations to all.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

20 CLERK: Council Member Williams.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thanks. I vote  
22 aye on all with the exception of Land Use 738 and  
23 accompanying Reso.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Okay.

25 CLERK: Matteo.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Sorry. I abstain  
3 on that one.

4 CLERK: Council Member Matteo.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: No on 139-C,  
6 1075, 1076, 1539 and 1540. Yes on the rest.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

8 CLERK: Van Bramer.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Permission to  
10 explain my vote.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes. Quiet in  
12 the Chambers, please. [shushing for quiet]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you  
14 very much. Briefly I-I vote proudly aye on all, but  
15 I do want to particularly commend my colleagues,  
16 Council Members and Menchaca for this very important  
17 piece of legislation. I also want to thank all the  
18 folks who sat and spent a lot time with me including  
19 Gary Labarbera and Pat Grocell (sp?), my good friend  
20 Bernard Calagary and the laborers. Mike McGuire, the  
21 plumbers in my district. It was an important  
22 discussion to have, and I'm glad we had it. All work  
23 is worthy and all workers deserve to be safe, and the  
24 question was often asked in the campaign: To pass  
25 this legislation, how many more must die? It's my

2 hope that with this bill passing the answer will be  
3 none, no more will die. May that be what comes of  
4 this legislation and with that, I'm proud to vote  
5 aye. Thank you very much.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

7 CLERK: Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] I vote  
9 aye on all. [pause]

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Three  
11 pages? All items on today's General Order Calendar  
12 were adopted by a vote of 42 in the affirmative, 0  
13 negative and 0 abstentions with the exception of Land  
14 Use 738 and Resolution 1664, which was adopted by a  
15 vote of 40 in the affirmative, 1 negative and 1  
16 abstention; and Intro 1539-A, which was adopted by a  
17 vote of 39 in the affirmative, 3 negative, and 0  
18 abstentions; and Intro 1540-A, which was adopted by a  
19 vote of 40 in the affirmative, 2 negative and 0  
20 abstentions; and Intro 139-C, which was adopted by a  
21 vote of 37 in the affirmative, 5 negative and 0  
22 abstentions; and Intro 1075-A, which was adopted by a  
23 vote of 40 in the affirmative, 2 negative and 0  
24 abstentions; and Intro 1076-A, which was adopted of  
25 40 in the affirmative, 2 negative, and 0 abstentions.



2 The Revised Land Use Call-Up vote is now 42 in the  
3 affirmative, 0 in the negative. Introduction and  
4 Reading bills.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All those are  
6 referred to the committees as indicated on the  
7 agenda.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We do not have-  
9 okay, I guess you want to make it rip, rip. Let it  
10 go. Go ahead. [cheers/applause] [gavel] Okay,  
11 settle down. We're still in Stated session.

12 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet down, please.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And now for  
14 general discussions we begin with the star of the  
15 hour, Council Member Jumaane Williams.

16 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: As you exit, be quiet,  
17 please.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the  
19 Chambers. If you're exiting, please exit quietly  
20 those in the balcony. We thank you for attending.  
21 Congratulations. [shushing for quiet] Council Member  
22 Williams.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: No.

24

25

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Okay. Do you  
3 want go now or--? Okay, Council Member Levin, Steve  
4 Levin.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very  
6 much, Madam Public Advocate. I just actually—I wanted  
7 to take a moment to lend my thoughts and prayers to  
8 the people of Puerto Rico, and to my colleagues, and  
9 constituents who have family in Puerto Rico. You  
10 have—you have my full thoughts and prayers with you  
11 for this at this time. Thank you.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,  
13 council member and I, too, join with others. Again,  
14 our thoughts and our prayers are with those in Puerto  
15 Rico. I've got friends who have family. Please  
16 reach out to the Hispanic Federation, and for those  
17 in Dominica, there is a Dominica Hurricane Relief  
18 Fund as well. We pray for Puerto Rico, Mexico and  
19 those in the Virgin Islands. The next speaker is  
20 Council Member Treyger.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you,  
22 Public Advocate and colleagues. Today I ask for your  
23 support for Introduction 1720, which would create a  
24 task force to evaluate Hurricane Sandy recovery  
25 efforts and develop recommendations about how our

2 city and others can prepare for and respond better to  
3 future natural disasters. Over the last few week our  
4 thoughts and prayers have been with all those  
5 impacted by the harrowing destructions of Hurricanes  
6 Harvey, Irma and Maria, devastating earthquake as  
7 well in Mexico. Our fellow Americans from the Gulf  
8 Coast of Florida to Puerto Rico and the U.S. Virgin  
9 Islands have turned to New York for disaster response  
10 support and relief advocacy, and advice on how to  
11 approach the daunting task of recovery. As we  
12 approach the fifth anniversary of Hurricane Sandy,  
13 recovery for New York City is well under way,  
14 although far from complete, and progress has been on  
15 improving resiliency in emergency preparedness. Our  
16 recovery has not always been smooth, but through  
17 those challenges, we have gained valuable insight on  
18 how to navigate complex aid processes, how to engage  
19 survivors, and impacted communities as active  
20 participants in the recovery process, and how to  
21 build stronger, more resilient more prepared  
22 neighborhoods. This task force would include reps  
23 from government agencies, the non-profit section, the  
24 faith based community and residents from Sandy  
25 impacted neighborhoods across the city to reflect the

2 wide range of experiences with recovery and to  
3 develop holistic recommendations for how to best  
4 approach disaster recovery, emergency preparedness.

5 I want to publicly thank Staten Island Borough  
6 President James Oddo for his steadfast leadership on  
7 Hurricane Sandy recovery efforts in his borough and  
8 for his advocacy for review of the successes and  
9 failures of our recovery efforts thus far. This  
10 legislation is born out of a shared desire to ensure  
11 that we learn from the challenges of Sandy recover.  
12 Introduction 1720 will help us create a better  
13 blueprint for disaster recovery both for our city and  
14 for others coping with the devastation of a natural  
15 disaster. I respectfully ask my colleagues to sign  
16 on thank you.

17 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet-be  
18 quiet please.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
20 Council Member Rodriguez.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. I  
22 would like to invite my colleagues and any New Yorker  
23 to go to the co-naming of Willie Mays. It was-it was  
24 done this coming Friday at noon where his son, Willie  
25 Mays' son will come, and also the Vice President of

2 the San Francisco Giants. Again, that's going to be  
3 Friday at noon. I also would like to speak about the  
4 crash that happened—the bus crash that happened in  
5 Council Member Koo—in Queens where two New Yorkers  
6 lost their life. After that crash happened, with the  
7 support of the Speaker, we are putting together a  
8 Transportation hearing on October 26 on chartered  
9 buses. We would like to how DOT is regulating  
10 especially those stops used by the charter buses, and  
11 again inviting my colleagues to be part of this  
12 hearing, and also any New Yorkers interested to know  
13 on how we can regulate more especially the area where  
14 DOT and the city has power 4 (sic), which is more  
15 related to the stops that they are getting the  
16 permits for. Thank you.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

18 Council Member Ira Daneek Miller.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Hey, hey, that  
20 guys started something. [laughter] So, I just want  
21 to say that Council Member Rodriguez he did not steal  
22 thunder. He just really touched on a really  
23 important issue, which I was going to speak about.  
24 As we talked about and congratulated everyone about  
25 1447 and this impact that it's going to have around

2 safety, and—and providing a safe work environment  
3 for—for workers. Conversely, what we witnessed last  
4 week in Flushing is as a result of an industry that  
5 over the years have been deregulated in so many  
6 different ways that workers' rights have been  
7 diminished and under-valued. This is an industry  
8 where over the roads ride--drivers do not even  
9 qualify for overtime. Therefore, causing them to  
10 work long hours and driver's fatigue, which has been--  
11 resulted in many accidents that we've seen, and I  
12 want to make sure that—that I'm there and a part of  
13 this working with the Council Member, and members of  
14 the Transportation Committee that we address this  
15 issue that has been long plaguing this industry. And  
16 so, certainly it's not just the over the road, but  
17 there are many folks that are operating even within  
18 the city. As we struggle to regulate these  
19 industries, there are other that are coming in and  
20 finding ways to usurp that regulation that the  
21 Council has put forward. So I'm looking forward to  
22 with you on that. Thank you. Thank you, Madam  
23 Public Advocate.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member  
25 Constant—Constantinides.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: You got  
3 it. [laughs] Thank you, Madam Public Advocate. I'll  
4 ask my colleagues today to join me in supporting 1708  
5 ad 1709 taking on asthma. There are 84,000 children  
6 in the city of New York who are diagnosed with  
7 asthma. 7,000 every year are hospitalized, and  
8 there's real cost to that. Every year those kids  
9 miss on average between 10 and 30 days of school. If  
10 they're falling behind their classmates through no  
11 fault of their own other than being sick. Everyday  
12 the families have to make tough choices about how to  
13 spend their dollars. Staying on an asthma regimen is  
14 very expensive, and there's five—a few medications  
15 you can take just to stay well, or when you're sick,  
16 it's a whole lot more. So, these bills today that I  
17 introduced with my colleagues, Council Member Corey  
18 Johnson, Rosenthal and I. Daneek Miller (1) would put  
19 a nebulizer in every school, making that in a pinch  
20 where there are children in distress that we have the  
21 apparatus in the school for the kids to be safe and  
22 deal with that distress so they don' have to miss  
23 more school. The second bill would create an asthma  
24 map, looking at age, race demographics of asthma in  
25 New York City and hospitals and hospitalizations.

2 Making sure that we know where the clusters of asthma  
3 are and that how we can deal with those percussions  
4 going forward with real policy as we, you know, do so  
5 much leading to air quality in the city of New York  
6 and this Council has made that a huge force behind  
7 what we do. We need to know where the asthma is and  
8 primarily it's-it's in communities of color and low-  
9 income neighborhoods. We need to make sure we can  
10 deal with those pollutants in the neighborhoods, and  
11 make sure we protect our-our students, protect our-  
12 our-our populations. So, I ask my colleagues to join  
13 these bills in making sure that we can fight asthma  
14 in the city of New York. Thank you.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you and our  
16 last speaker is Council Member Williams.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you very  
18 much. I, too, just want to add my voice to those who  
19 are suffering from the hurricane and--

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
21 [shushing for quiet]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: --earthquake  
23 relief including more recently-

24

25



2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
3 Council Member, could you turn the mic on. There you  
4 go.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Including  
6 Puerto Rico and the Virgin Islands. Both are U.S.  
7 territories, all Americans. They both are being very  
8 much ignored and not address by too many including  
9 this President who is more focuses on protest  
10 speaking of which many of us said from the beginning  
11 that we have to approach this Trump from day one, and  
12 not to wait. People were proud to see when Colin  
13 Kaepernick did what he did. Party of me wants to  
14 thank the President because he had the exact opposite  
15 effort of what he wanted, or he wanted the then ten  
16 players to convene this weekend, and everyone is  
17 focused and talking about this issue. We can't  
18 forget, however, that these protests and these issues  
19 did not start with Trump. They had been around from  
20 the exception of this country, everything that we  
21 enjoy about this country, everything, everything  
22 began with protest. Some, in fact, there's section of  
23 this country that started with violent revolution.  
24 Yet and still we believe that and pretend that  
25 protest is not needed to propel this country forward.

2 Protest is meant to disrupt. It's meant to make  
3 people uncomfortable. It's meant to call attention  
4 to issues to demand that they are focused and the  
5 issues addressed. We cannot confine protest to when  
6 it's convenient. Although people pretend that his a  
7 protest that they don't support, they'll support  
8 other ones. The people who don't like this are very  
9 often any other protest of people, they don't support  
10 as well. History, however, will show us that many  
11 people who say they marched with Martin, they voted  
12 for Kennedy, they support Muhammad Ali, never really  
13 did. They were part of the group of people who were  
14 bashing them. My expectation are now to the future  
15 people will say they took with me the capitol (sic),  
16 and he will be elevated to where he belongs. What I  
17 ask is that people who are expressing their  
18 patriotism are through saying the pledge do not  
19 demean who are expressing their patriotism by sitting  
20 or take money (sic). I could argue that it is even  
21 more patriotic, but I will at least say it is the  
22 same for this particular argument. I will argue as  
23 well that many people who are making those arguments  
24 like Trump are doing so many things, saying so many  
25 things, supporting so many policies. That is un-

2 American particularly when it comes to the ideals.  
3 Far more than any protest that will be, which is  
4 probably the most patriotic thing that we can do.  
5 Thank you.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, and  
7 let us keep in our thoughts and our prayers the 16-  
8 year-old who lost his life in the Bronx as a result  
9 of senseless violence and let's pray for the other  
10 children. Hopefully, they'll—they'll make it  
11 through. And now to close Speaker Melissa Mark-  
12 Viverito.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madam  
14 Public Advocate. I want to just lastly just mention  
15 to the members here that we have two staff who are  
16 leaving us, moving on to other endeavors, and we wish  
17 them the best, Guillermo Patino in the Housing and  
18 Building Committee staff and Faizah Malik in  
19 Transportation, I know they're—they're leaving.  
20 Yeah, he wants to fight. (sic) So, thank you very  
21 much for your service to our City Council and our  
22 city and good luck in your future endeavors.  
23 [applause] Again, I definitely want to join in what  
24 the Public Advocate just said with regards to  
25 unfortunate incident in the Bronx and the death of

2 this young student. Senseless violence obviously has  
3 no place in our city, and also just to remind members  
4 and staff that we did circulate information on where  
5 people can contribute, and be supportive of efforts  
6 in Puerto Rico, U.S. Virgin Island and Mexico. So,  
7 please make sure you pass that around to your  
8 communities as well, and I thank you all very much.  
9 Have a great afternoon, and we are adjourned. [gavel]

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date October 1, 2017