

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE, JOINTLY WITH THE
DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION

----- X

May 17, 2017
Start: 10:18 a.m.
Recess: 3:27 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E:

JULISSA FERRERAS-COPELAND
Chairperson

YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ
Co-Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

James G. Van Bramer
Vanessa L. Gibson
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Laurie A. Cumbo
Corey D. Johnson
Mark Levine
I. Daneek Miller
Helen K. Rosenthal
Steven Matteo

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Daniel R. Garodnick
James Vacca
Margaret S. Chin
Stephen T. Levin
Deborah L. Rose
David G. Greenfield
Costa G. Constantinides
Carlos Menchaca
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Mark Treyger
Jumaane D. Williams
Brad S. Lander
Ben Kallos
Bill Perkins
Daniel Dromm

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Polly Trottenberg
Commissioner
NYC Department of Transportation

Elisabeth Franklin
Acting Associate Commissioner
Budget and Capital Program Management
NYC Department of Transportation

Rebecca Zack
Acting Assistant Commissioner
Intergovernmental and Community Affairs
NYC Department of Transportation

Meera Joshi
Commissioner
NYC Taxi and Limousine Commission

Vincent Chin
Assistant Commissioner
Finance and Operations
NYC Taxi and Limousine Commission

Douglas Johnson
Budget Director
Metropolitan Transportation Authority

Stephanie DeLisle
Director of MTA Capital Funding

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE, JOINTLY WITH THE DEPARTMENT OF
TRANSPORTATION 4

2 [sound check]

3 [gavel]

4 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Good

5 morning and welcome to today's Finance Committee
6 hearing. I am Julissa Ferreras-Copeland; I chair the
7 Committee.

8 I want to begin by thanking my co-chair,
9 Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez and the members of
10 the Transportation Committee for joining us today. I
11 want to acknowledge the members of both committees
12 who are here with us. We have Council Member Vacca,
13 Council Member Reynoso and Minority Leader Matteo.

14 This morning the Committee continues its
15 look at Fiscal 2018's Executive Budget with the New
16 York City Department of Transportation. We will hear
17 testimony from Commissioner Polly Trottenberg. I
18 will begin with a brief overview of DOT's Fiscal
19 2018's Executive Budget. The Executive Budget totals
20 \$961.5 million, a slight increase of \$15.2 million
21 when compared to the DOT's Fiscal 2017 budget. The
22 increase is largely due to enhanced funding for
23 roadways, markings and repairs to Staten Island Ferry
24 and labor settlements.

25

2 On the capital side, the Fiscal 2018
3 Capital Commitment Plan includes \$13.2 billion in
4 Fiscal 2017-2021 for DOT, which primarily supports
5 highway and bridge rehabilitation and construction,
6 as well as road repaving and signal improvements.
7 DOT's capital funding in the ten-year capital
8 strategy increased by approximately \$500 million over
9 the preliminary plan, for a total of \$15.2 billion;
10 mostly for bridges and highways.

11 Before we hear from the Commissioner I
12 would like to highlight a few areas that I hope to
13 discuss at greater length during today's hearing.

14 First, the Department's Executive Capital
15 Commitment Plan increased by \$928.7 million (8%)
16 compared to the preliminary plan. As the council has
17 repeatedly noted, OMB will typically frontload
18 budgets for capital projects and then roll unspent
19 funding to future fiscal years. With respect to DOT,
20 the agency committed 83% of its total annual capital
21 plan from Fiscal 2016. Therefore, we can assume that
22 a significant portion of the Fiscal 2017 Capital Plan
23 would be rolled into Fiscal 2018. I would urge DOT,
24 as I have all agencies with large capital budgets, to
25 ensure that its capital appropriations align more

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE, JOINTLY WITH THE DEPARTMENT OF
TRANSPORTATION 6

2 appropriately with the actual commitment during the
3 fiscal year.

4 Additionally, I hope to receive more
5 details concerning the Department's newly proposed
6 funding for capitally ineligible projects; the Fiscal
7 2018 Executive Budget includes baseline funding for
8 \$2 million in Fiscal 2017 and \$5 million in Fiscal
9 2018 and the out years for this initiative, which
10 would provide expense funding for those components of
11 projects deemed ineligible of OMB for capital
12 funding.

13 I would like to hear from DOT regarding
14 projects it expects to benefit from this fund and
15 whether the Department believes this funding is
16 sufficient to meet the needs of the agency's capital
17 projects moving forward.

18 The Executive Budget also includes \$13.5
19 million in Fiscal 2018 and \$2.5 million Fiscal 2019
20 and the out years to support DOT's efforts to
21 rehabilitate pedestrian ramps and making existing
22 intersections ADA compliant. This is essential work
23 that improves access for New Yorkers with
24 disabilities into the daily life our city. I would
25 like to hear from the Department about the progress

2 of these efforts, including how DOT prioritized
3 locations and timeline for the completion of
4 remaining work on non-complaint intersections.

5 Finally, the Council was disappointed to
6 see that DOT's Fiscal 2018 Executive Plan fails to
7 address our call to build out bus rapid transit by
8 funding additional select bus service routes citywide
9 that would provide more equitable access for faster
10 transportation. This is an important priority for
11 those in our communities who experience burdensome
12 daily commutes. We will continue to engage with the
13 Administration to achieve more robust select bus
14 service. I look forward to hearing about these
15 issues and many more in today's hearing.

16 Before I turn it over to my chair, I want
17 to acknowledge the Finance staff that helped prepare
18 this hearing -- Nathan Toth, Regina Poreda Ryan,
19 Chima Obichere, Brandon West, and Eric Bernstein. I
20 will now turn the mic over to Chair Rodriguez for his
21 opening remarks.

22 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
23 Chair. Good morning and welcome to the City Council
24 Finance and Transportation Committees' hearing on the
25 Fiscal 2018 -- [background sneeze] salud -- Executive

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE, JOINTLY WITH THE DEPARTMENT OF
TRANSPORTATION 8

2 Budget. My name is Ydanis Rodriguez and I am the
3 chair of the Transportation Committee.

4 Today we will start by hearing testimony
5 from the City Department of Transportation (DOT); the
6 DOT will be followed by the Metropolitan
7 Transportation Authority (MTA) and the MTA will be
8 followed by the Taxi and Limousine Commission (TLC).

9 DOT's Executive Expense Budget for Fiscal
10 2018 is approximately \$962 million; in addition, \$2.9
11 billion is budget [sic]. In Fiscal 2018, for the
12 Department's Capital Program, I am pleased with the
13 level of funding commitment proposed to maintain and
14 keep our city bridges in good condition; the
15 additional funding of \$132 million to support making
16 pedestrian ramps ADA compliant in Fiscal 2018;
17 funding to increase ferry service, maintain public
18 plazas, and expand Select Bus Service (SBS).

19 Having said that, I must say that I am
20 not as pleased that the Executive Budget failed to
21 include any additional funding for items which were
22 called for in the Council's response to the Mayor's
23 Preliminary Budget. Specifically, this includes
24 funding for Citi Bike expansion into underserved low-
25 income neighborhoods, funding to pilot half-price

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE, JOINTLY WITH THE DEPARTMENT OF
TRANSPORTATION 9

2 MetroCards for New Yorkers living at or below the
3 poverty level, and funding for several additional SBS
4 routes citywide that would provide more equitable
5 access to faster transit services for all New
6 Yorkers. Without these projects, everyday citizens
7 will continue to struggle to get to work and drive in
8 a city that has robust resources but not distributed
9 evenly in many corridors of the outer boroughs.

10 We look forward to the Commissioner
11 updating the Committees on the Department's effort to
12 achieve the City's Vision Zero goal to maintain and
13 improve the City's roadway infrastructure; in
14 particularly, bridges and highways, and the
15 Department's efforts to improve pedestrian safety.

16 Additionally, the Department's proposed
17 Capital Budget for Fiscal Years 2017-2021 totals
18 approximately \$13.1 billion, an increase of more than
19 \$929 million (8%) since the Preliminary Plan. We
20 will examine some of the key projects and all the
21 changes in the Plan and then we will be followed, as
22 I said, by the MTA and the TLC.

23 Again, thank you, Chair, thank you
24 Commissioner, thank you, the staff, and all the
25 advocacy groups, especially the Riders Alliance and

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE, JOINTLY WITH THE DEPARTMENT OF
TRANSPORTATION 10

2 the Community Service that were also standing this
3 morning advocating for the fair fares, trying to make
4 our city to follow Denver, who already established a
5 similar program [sic]. Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
7 you, Chair. Commissioner, our counsel will swear you
8 in and then you may begin your testimony.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell
10 the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth
11 in your testimony before the Committee today and to
12 respond honestly to Council Member questions?

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: We do.
14 Alright, thank you.

15 Good morning Chairwoman Ferreras-
16 Copeland, Chairman Rodriguez and members of both the
17 Finance and Transportation Committees. I am Polly
18 Trottenberg, Commissioner of the New York City
19 Department of Transportation. With me today are
20 Elisabeth Frankly, Acting Associate Commissioner for
21 Budget and Capital Program Management, and Rebecca
22 Zack, Acting Assistant Commissioner for
23 Intergovernmental and Community Affairs. We're
24 pleased to be here today on behalf of Mayor Bill de
25

2 Blasio to testify on DOT's Fiscal Year 2018 Executive
3 Budget and Ten-Year Capital Strategy.

4 The Mayor's Fiscal Year 2018 Executive
5 Budget allocates resources for critical needs such as
6 protecting public safety, improving schools,
7 increasing housing affordability, and investing in
8 infrastructure. While maintaining unprecedented
9 reserves, this budget proposes targeted investments,
10 some of which I will be talking about today.

11 For DOT, this budget builds on our
12 agency's growing accomplishments over the last three
13 years. It will continue and expand our capacity to
14 pursue Vision Zero, enhance mobility, and maintain a
15 state of good repair for our vital transportation
16 infrastructure. Back in March I discussed each of
17 these areas in detail; today I will provide updates
18 and additional highlights for DOT.

19 And DOT will continue to make the most
20 out of every taxpayer dollar, whether we are rolling
21 out neighborhood safety improvements or executing
22 major infrastructure projects. I will talk today
23 about additional specific savings we have identified
24 at DOT.

2 DOT's proposed capital plan for FY17-27
3 is now \$17.8 billion, up \$606 million from the
4 Preliminary Budget. And DOT's proposed expense
5 funding in this Executive Budget is \$962 million.

6 When it comes to the capital budget,
7 under Mayor de Blasio we will have nearly doubled our
8 investment in street reconstruction to build out more
9 safety projects, taking the amount from \$1.7 billion
10 in the last ten-year capital plan in the prior
11 administration, to \$3.3 million [sic] in this ten-
12 year capital plan.

13 And to maintain transportation
14 infrastructure in need of ongoing investment we have
15 increased our capital plan for bridge reconstruction
16 and rehabilitation by 91%, from \$4.9 billion to \$9.3
17 billion. This includes our historic East River
18 crossings as well as our extensive and aging
19 inventory of 789 other bridges, large and small,
20 across the city.

21 As the City's third largest capital
22 agency, responsible for roads, sidewalks, bridges,
23 bike lanes, street signs, signals, streetlighting,
24 and the Staten Island Ferry, our proposed capital
25 plan for FY17-27 includes: \$9.3 billion for bridge

2 reconstruction and rehabilitation; \$5.2 billion for
3 street reconstruction and resurfacing; \$1.4 billion
4 for sidewalk and pedestrian ramp repair and
5 reconstruction; \$678 million for the Staten Island
6 Ferry; \$689 million for streetlights and signals; and
7 \$434 million for the facilities and equipment needed
8 to support DOT operations.

9 Turning to our expense budget, for DOT's
10 FY18 Executive Budget, the Mayor is proposing: \$249
11 million for traffic operations, including signals,
12 streetlights and parking; \$201 million for roadway
13 maintenance; \$206 million for other DOT operations,
14 including sidewalk management and inspection; \$108
15 million for bridge maintenance and inspection; \$101
16 million for transportation planning and management,
17 including installation of street signs and roadway
18 markings; and \$98 million for ferry operations and
19 maintenance.

20 Let me first start by going through a few
21 Vision Zero highlights. DOT's proposed budget
22 dedicates an unprecedented \$2.4 billion to Vision
23 Zero over the next ten years. This includes \$515
24 million in new capital funds, and \$7.2 million in new
25 expense funds, rising up to \$21.1 million by FY21.

2 As you know, this new funding will enable
3 us to better maintain our street markings, continue
4 our left turn traffic calming initiative, upgrade key
5 intersections in the bike network, and install and
6 enhanced streetlights.

7 We have built out a nearly 1,100 mile
8 bike network to serve an ever growing number of New
9 Yorkers and we are proud of our safe and innovative
10 protected bike lane intersections. But we are
11 committed to upping our game, so with this new
12 funding we will be initiating a study focused on the
13 next generation of bike intersection designs. We
14 will consider safety, traffic conditions, cyclist
15 comfort and preferences, and international best
16 practices. We will be dedicating a new staff member
17 to focus solely on protected bike lane intersection
18 design and analysis. Based on this study we will
19 identify and upgrade 20 high priority intersections
20 this year.

21 We are also reassessing our plan for the
22 reconstruction of 4th Avenue in Brooklyn to evaluate
23 the inclusion of parking protected bike lanes. Since
24 bike ridership has skyrocketed in Brooklyn, even in
25 the last five years since we originally scoped this

2 project, and particularly as we have continued to
3 expand Citi Bike, we think it makes sense to consider
4 the addition of protected bike lanes to this once-in-
5 a-generation roadway transformation.

6 DOT will continue funds previously
7 allocated to 4th Avenue with \$43 million of the
8 additional Vision Zero funding in the Preliminary
9 Budget to extend this project, which would have been
10 from 8th Street in the north to 60th Street in the
11 south. Now with protected bike lanes, the project
12 will go from Atlantic Avenue in the north down to
13 65th Street in the south. We recently presented this
14 concept in well attended community workshops; we have
15 been working with some of the Council Members who are
16 here today, and we're looking forward to continuing
17 this conversation.

18 I am also proud that at a recent lively
19 town hall in Long Island City, with Council Member
20 Van Bramer, the Mayor announced \$17 million of our
21 additional Vision Zero funding will be used to
22 develop safety enhancements on Thompson Avenue from
23 Skillman Avenue to Van Dam Street. This corridor is
24 used by tens of thousands of LaGuardia Community
25 College students daily. Located at the foot of the

2 Queensboro Bridge, the BQE, and several major
3 arterial roadways, it has been the site of fatalities
4 and long a source of community concern. We will be
5 announcing other projects supported by the additional
6 Vision Zero capital funds soon.

7 Turning now to accessibility, DOT and the
8 Mayor, working with the Mayor's Office for People
9 with Disabilities, are committed to making our
10 streets accessible. I am proud to say we are
11 proposing an unprecedented financial commitment to
12 accessibility improvements in this Executive Budget.

13 We plan to more than double our total
14 investment in pedestrian ramp construction and
15 upgrades through FY27 to \$880 million. To do this,
16 the Mayor proposes in his Executive Budget to add
17 another \$130 million in capital funds to DOT's
18 pedestrian ramp program on top of the \$480 million
19 addition proposed in the Preliminary Budget.

20 When it comes to signals, this budget
21 also includes an addition of \$9 million to double the
22 installation of accessible pedestrian signals over
23 the next two years from 150 to 300.

24 On the sustainability front, I am proud
25 to say the City recently announced an initial \$10

2 million capital investment to support charging
3 infrastructure to increase the use of electric
4 vehicles. Increasing the proportion of electric
5 vehicles on our roadways is critical to the City's
6 goal of reducing greenhouse gas emissions 80% by
7 2050. On April 20, Mayor de Blasio announced a bold
8 new target for 20% of the motor vehicles sold for use
9 in New York City to be electric by 2025, up from the
10 less than 1% that currently are.

11 As a first step, DOT, DCAS and the
12 Mayor's Office of Sustainability will work together
13 on a citywide electric vehicle charging strategy, in
14 consultation with Con Ed and other electric vehicle
15 stakeholders. This strategy will identify the most
16 efficient and effective ways City investment can help
17 spur the development of on-street charging, off-
18 street charging, and fast charging hubs. The
19 strategy will look at both City property and private
20 sites, and explore potential public-private
21 partnerships with Con Ed and other charging
22 companies. We hope to finalize this strategy by
23 December.

24 Finally, as the Mayor recently announced
25 during his Staten Island week, DOT will be taking a

2 simple but important step that Staten Island ferry
3 commuters have long been asking for, lower level
4 boarding during the morning rush at St. George
5 terminal, in addition into Whitehall terminal,
6 beginning this fall. To implement lower level
7 boarding at St. George terminal, DOT's Executive
8 Budget includes \$900,000 for two deckhands and
9 contract security staff.

10 And of course, DOT will be doing much
11 more. As I discussed in my previous testimony, in
12 the year ahead this budget will allow us to continue
13 our record-setting repaving work, execute the next
14 phases of our Great Streets program on the Grand
15 Concourse, Queens Boulevard, and Atlantic Avenue,
16 keep expanding protected bike lanes, proceed with
17 construction of the three new Ollis class ferries,
18 implement the car share pilot program as codified by
19 the Council, complete our Citywide Transit Study, and
20 so much more. And we will be partnering with the MTA
21 -- who you'll also hear from today -- to add more
22 select bus service routes, we will be working with
23 Motivate to expand Citi Bike throughout the city, and
24 coordinating with EDC to continue its rollout of new
25

2 citywide ferry service, from Astoria to the
3 Rockaways.

4 As I said in my previous testimony, DOT
5 is also working to execute capital projects on time
6 and on budget, even as we commit record amounts of
7 contract dollars. We are working very hard to
8 streamline our own internal procedures and we are
9 eager to partner with our sister agencies and
10 continue a conversation with the Council on
11 improvements to the scoping, procurement, delivery,
12 and oversight of capital projects.

13 For DOT, highlights of this year's
14 Capital Program include work on some of our major
15 bridges, including Queensboro and Manhattan, and
16 moving forward with the replacement of the Unionport
17 Bridge in the Bronx.

18 Finally, when it comes to delivering our
19 largest and most complicated capital projects, the
20 most urgently needed improvement to our process is
21 the use of design-build. New Yorkers were recently
22 very happy to see the opening of the first of two new
23 spans of the Kosciuszko Bridge to carry the BQE over
24 Newtown Creek. And the innovative, striking design
25

2 was completed in just two years, thanks to New York
3 State's use of design-build.

4 But as we all know, just a few miles down
5 the road, New York City lacks the authorization to
6 use the same process to reconstruct the triple
7 cantilever. DOT believes we could significantly
8 reduce both the \$1.7 billion cost to taxpayers and
9 the length of time necessary if we were allowed to
10 use that same process that the state gives itself,
11 and we are continuing to seek that authorization up
12 in Albany.

13 Turning to our ongoing effort to find
14 efficiencies, on top of the saving identified in the
15 November plan and the Preliminary Budget, DOT's
16 Executive Budget includes \$15.5 million in additional
17 new savings and \$6.2 million in savings as part of
18 citywide initiatives.

19 DOT will save \$1.9 million a year in both
20 FY18 and 19 by performing underwater inspections of
21 our Molinari class ferries in lieu of dry-docking.
22 And while unfortunately we will not be able to
23 replace the use of dry-docking entirely, especially
24 on our older ferries, the new Michael Ollis and Sandy
25 Ground, and yet to be named ferries will be able to

2 take advantage of this practice when they arrive in
3 2019 and 2020.

4 And we found even more savings from
5 efficiencies realized through the rollout of our
6 ParkNYC program that allows New Yorkers to pay for
7 parking using their cell phones.

8 As we speak, ParkNYC is active in all of
9 Manhattan and Bronx; we will be going live in
10 Brooklyn and Staten Island tomorrow and expect
11 completion of the rollout in Queens later this
12 summer.

13 In my previous testimony, I reported that
14 we expect to save about \$1.7 million in personnel
15 costs and credit card processing payments through the
16 efficiencies of this program. We took another look
17 during the Executive Budget process and determined
18 that we could reduce an additional five positions,
19 saving another \$200,000 annually starting in 2019.

20 In addition to these and other savings
21 identified by DOT, we will make reductions of \$3.6
22 million annually in our fleet budget and \$2.6 million
23 in overtime as part of a citywide savings initiative.

24 In the year ahead, DOT will be focused on
25 big transportation challenges and opportunities

2 facing the City: implement the impending L train
3 closure, emergency track repairs at Penn Station and
4 the work urgently needed there, plans to replace the
5 Port Authority Bus Terminal, increased congestion in
6 the Manhattan core and elsewhere, and of course the
7 urgent need to continue to drive down the number of
8 traffic fatalities and serious injuries on our
9 streets.

10 At the same time, DOT will be focusing on
11 our everyday commitment to maintain our streets and
12 sidewalks, a multitude of signs, signals, markings,
13 and streetlights, and so much more, from the Brooklyn
14 Bridge to the Staten Island Ferry, the facilities
15 that New Yorkers use every day.

16 As always, we will be balancing the needs
17 of all users on our street while enhancing shared
18 public space and expanding a transportation network
19 that is safe, sustainable, equitable, and efficient
20 to support the needs of our communities and the
21 economy of the City and the region.

22 Thank so much for the opportunity to
23 testify today and look forward to your questions.

24 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you
25 Commissioner for your testimony. I'm gonna ask a

2 round of questions; then the co-chair will; members
3 will have time, and we'll come back for a second
4 round.

5 I wanted to talk about an article that
6 was in today's *Post*; it reported that DOT rejected
7 the lowest bid for a project to fix roads across the
8 city because of a clerical error on their bid.
9 According to the report, the bid accidentally wrote
10 that it would provide a 5% bond rather than the
11 required 10%. The said company said that it
12 contacted DOT to fix the mistake, but it was
13 rejected. As a result, the City awarded the next bid
14 or the next lowest bid at a cost of \$9.2 million. On
15 what grounds did DOT determine that it would be
16 inappropriate to allow the bidder to fix a clerical,
17 or what they deemed was a clerical error, and did you
18 deem that the difference between the 5% and the 10%,
19 which is for a bond, fixing that clerical error could
20 potentially cost us, or will potentially cost
21 taxpayer dollars more money [sic]? So walk us
22 through the decision, and when is it DOT's purview to
23 make this decision as opposed to going back to, you
24 know, rebidding or starting the procurement process
25 again?

2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So I thank you
3 for the question. I think, as you know, New York
4 City, we are, you know, blessed I guess we could say,
5 with an extremely rigorous, robust and transparent
6 procurement process, so certain elements of the
7 procurement process the agency does not necessarily
8 have much discretion; it is a statutory requirement
9 that we require the 2% reserve or the 2% bid security
10 or the 10% bid bond, so those are statutory
11 requirements, and it's a significant one, because we
12 require bidders to submit the bid security or the bid
13 bond to show that they are serious bidders; that
14 they're not just frivolous; that they have some
15 credit worthiness. So there's actually some logic
16 behind that requirement. As a contracting agency
17 though, when you open bids -- and this is something,
18 if you do a lot of bidding in an agency -- you have
19 to have a process that's very fair, that's very
20 rigorous; that's very transparent. It's not
21 typically that you can, once bids have been opened,
22 you can willy nilly declare that well, someone made a
23 mistake and therefore, you know we're gonna give them
24 the chance to sort of have a do-over; that's
25 something, that's discretion that an agency has, but

2 it's something you wanna be very cautious in
3 exercising. And in this case, you know
4 unfortunately, the bidder failed to meet the specific
5 legal requirements of the bid documents, and you know
6 they later alleged that they had never had to meet
7 these kinds of requirements -- they had; they had met
8 them in DDC contracts. But I want to just alert you
9 to one thing in the *Post* article that was not
10 accurate. We have not actually awarded this contract
11 yet, it has not gone to the next bidder; the City
12 does reserve the right in a situation like this to
13 talk to the next set of bidders, so I can assure you
14 we're gonna seek to do everything we can to get a bid
15 that does provide the City with the best possible
16 value; we certainly don't want to leave taxpayer
17 dollars on the table. But I am required to follow
18 the legal and transparent processes of the New York
19 City procurement process; I don't have an ability to
20 just grant do-overs for those that fail to meet the
21 bid requirements.

22 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay.

23 And you know I just wanna get this clear; there has
24 been no award issued..

25 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Correct.

2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: and now
3 your process will take -- when you say that you're
4 looking at or reanalyzing all of this; what is that;
5 what is that process? So if someone -- you know,
6 we're in this situation; what's the window; is it 30
7 days; do you reevaluate the next three or do you just
8 reevaluate the next one available?

9 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean
10 typically in a situation like this, again, where you
11 see perhaps the first bidder has been disqualified
12 because they failed to meet the bid requirements; the
13 next bidder came in at a higher price; the agency
14 does have an ability to talk to the next set of
15 bidders and perhaps see if you can engage in some,
16 you know, better opportunities for taxpayer dollars,
17 so we're in the midst of that process; I can't commit
18 to how it's gonna turn out. But you know we
19 certainly are mindful of the fact that we wanna get
20 the best possible price we can, but we also have to
21 follow procurement rules.

22 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay. It
23 just seems that if you can engage to get a better
24 deal with the second bidder and the first bidder said
25 we made a mistake, it was an error; it's not that

2 they're saying that they can't have -- and I don't
3 wanna advocate for one company over the other, but I
4 do -- you know, I think it's our responsibility --
5 not saying that you're... you know and I'm sure that
6 this is your priority also; that we make this
7 contract one that will not have overruns, right, and
8 also that it's affordable to our city and that we're
9 not paying an addition to that cost, so...

10 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Absolutely. I
11 mean I certainly commit to trying to get the City the
12 best possible deal. But I wanna take a second on
13 sort of the question of a bidder making a mistake,
14 because the bidding process, again, it's highly
15 prescribed; sealed bids are [sic] opened, and you can
16 understand that, you know if afterwards bidders could
17 look at the sealed bid, sit with their competitors
18 and go wait, I made a mistake; I want a do-over, that
19 that starts to get pretty chaotic. And furthermore,
20 to the extent that I grant someone who didn't meet
21 the requirements of the bid contract, the next
22 bidders below have a legal claim to make... [interpose]

23 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Right.

24 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: so it's a
25 weighty decision; you know I don't want you to think

2 that we in any way engaged in this lightly; had a lot
3 of consultations with my general counsel, with my
4 agency chief contracting officer, and when we looked
5 at all the legal questions, we decided this was the
6 best course of action, but we're certainly gonna see
7 if in our continuing negotiations on the bid we'll
8 get the best possible deal we can for the city
9 taxpayers.

10 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay.

11 And do you envision this delaying any of this work?

12 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean I hope
13 not, but you know again, I wanna balance trying to
14 make sure we're getting good value for the taxpayer;
15 I'm keen to get these contracts awarded and get to
16 work.

17 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay. So

18 I wanted to talk about your Ten-Year Capital
19 Commitment Plan. The agency's Ten-Year Capital
20 Strategy totals \$15.2 billion, an increase of \$500
21 million over the Preliminary; what steps has the
22 Department taken to accommodate the increase in size
23 of the Executive Capital Commitment Plan and what
24 does it intend to do moving forward? The proposed
25 Ten-Year Capital Strategy is the second under your

2 leadership; can you summarize your priorities for the
3 capital plan as articulated by the planning team?

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean look, I
5 think you can see -- and actually, I'm gonna pull out
6 my -- I'm gonna pull out my pie chart here -- 'cause
7 to some degree I think you can see in the testimony
8 -- I mean look, clearly for New York City DOT with an
9 inventory of almost 800 bridges, bridges are the
10 largest piece of our capital work, and Madam
11 Chairwoman, you know you asked a good question about
12 capital commitment rates and you know we were I think
13 82-83% last year, and that number has gone up; I'm
14 proud to say in this administration since I've been
15 commissioner, we have committed to trying to be
16 realistically right-sizing what we're seeking in
17 terms of capital funds and what we can deliver. But
18 it's a real challenge; in the New York City
19 environment, as you know, there are a lot of
20 unknowns, particularly in bridge rehabilitation and
21 construction, because we interact with a lot of
22 outside players, State DOT, federal agencies; you can
23 discover a lot of conditions, particularly -- we have
24 bridges, like the Brooklyn Bridge, it's 132 years
25 old, so oftentimes when you start to do work on it

2 you'll discover things perhaps you weren't expecting.

3 But we have a real eagle eye focus particularly on

4 bridge projects, and as you know, we have some big

5 ones that we're getting underway on -- work on

6 Queensboro, work on the Manhattan Bridge, Unionport;

7 obviously our ongoing work on the triple cantilever;

8 we are bulking up in terms of hiring more management

9 expertise, getting in particularly some bridge

10 engineers who have real project delivery experience,

11 and trying I think to work very closely with MOCS,

12 with the Comptroller's office to work through

13 contractual issues, so we are very mindful of the

14 challenges of capital delivery there, and that's

15 certainly I think one of our highest priorities --

16 roadway reconstruction, another big area for us, one

17 where -- as you know, this administration has focused

18 greatly from the Vision Zero point of view, building

19 out great streets; also working in areas like

20 Southeast Queens, where you have a lot of flooding

21 and drainage projects, so DOT and DEP working

22 together to try and really up our game in terms of

23 roadway reconstruction. Another area too where

24 capital, you know where working through the capital

25 commitment issues takes all hands on deck, and

2 something we're very focused on. One thing that we
3 have implemented; we now have regular meetings
4 between DOT, DEP, DEC, and Parks, 'cause our four
5 agencies are so intertwined in a lot of this work, so
6 we now -- at the commissioner level, we meet
7 regularly to troubleshoot and try and make sure we're
8 keeping our projects moving.

9 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So -- and
10 this is very specific to the capital component, but
11 have you found that in your agency -- or how best do
12 you handle your cost overruns on your projects,
13 because now that you're coordinating, I would think
14 that coordination with other agencies may help
15 mitigate some of that? But what percent of the
16 proposed commitment plan for Fiscal 2018 is for cost
17 overruns; do you actually include this in your budget
18 expecting this or?

19 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean there's
20 sort of a general rule of thumb that you look at a
21 10% capital contingency. But it's a very good
22 question; I wanna talk about it a bit I think on both
23 the bridge side and the roadway reconstruction side,
24 as I've said, bridges are a big priority for us and I
25 think it's an area where **[inaudible]**; I think we need

2 to do a better job of estimating costs in the
3 beginning, of doing cost containment. Again, I found
4 those projects; they can be challenging for a lot of
5 external reasons and I think we need to do a better
6 job of anticipating those, and a system that we are
7 now starting to do with bridge projects is
8 essentially doing a risk analysis at the beginning of
9 each project where we put together a list of all the
10 possible risk factors of what can happen in a
11 project, and they can be very surprising things,
12 things that are completely unrelated -- well, there
13 are bunch of weekends where you can't do closure
14 'cause the City's having ten festivals -- you know
15 there can be a whole bunch of factors that come into
16 play, but we're trying to do a better job of
17 compiling that risk analysis ahead of time, and
18 trying to assign a price tag and a timeline to it to
19 help us be more accurate in our estimations.

20 On the roadway reconstruction side, as
21 you know, the City has kind of I think a... it has a
22 challenging system; on DOT we look at what we need in
23 terms of roadway reconstruction, DEP is sort of
24 separately doing an analysis of what they need to do
25 for their infrastructure under the streets; we both

2 bring our needs to DDC, then DDC has to sort of
3 harmonize them and put those projects together, and
4 again, part of what we have now been trying to do is
5 closer coordination between our three agencies up
6 front so that when we... if we... you know my rule of
7 thumb has sort of become, if DOT has a \$200 million
8 roadway reconstruction project, the DEP costs will
9 probably be about that amount as well. So any time
10 now that we're looking at a project, we're sort of in
11 our minds essentially potentially doubling what the
12 costs are gonna be and working through the
13 complexities of DEP has its own process for doing
14 draining surveys in the work that they need to do
15 when we have a roadway project. So look, I think
16 there's always room for improvement there, but we're
17 very mindful about trying to tighten that
18 coordination, get better price and timetable
19 estimates up front so that we're being more accurate
20 in what we're delivering.

21 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So we're
22 gonna follow up closely with you on that, 'cause we'd
23 like to see more of a structure of that. Because the
24 other challenge and the other variables, as you
25 mention, is that if you come and do some roadwork or

2 improvements, constituents are very happy, they see
3 the new street; DEP will come in and do something
4 else and you know, we get **[inaudible]** again; then you
5 have one or utilities rip up the street and not
6 necessarily, you know, place it back again to the
7 condition... so it's like this constant cycle of you're
8 never able to have your streets just paved and nice
9 for a long period of time. So what is the engagement
10 that you have with like let's say in areas like mine
11 and many of the other council members where we have a
12 lot of new reconstruction; reconstruction seems to
13 almost guarantee that streets are gonna be ripped up
14 again and they're not necessarily kind of replaced or
15 done in the same quality, and I know that they're
16 supposed to, but they're not. So what is your
17 engagement, not only with City agencies, but with
18 these private entities that are ripping up our
19 streets?

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well and I
21 wanna make sure I'm distinguishing between roadway
22 reconstruction and resurfacing... [interpose]

23 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Right.

24 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: two separate
25 issues...

2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Right.

3 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean

4 reconstruction is much rarer and I think there.. we
5 try very hard there, 'cause those are projects that
6 tend to be multiyear projects, very disruptive; often
7 tens if not hundreds of millions of dollars and you
8 know we work very, very closely with the utilities on
9 those. I think the frustration that I'm hearing from
10 you, and certainly I've heard it from other Council
11 Members is, as we're actually doing record-breaking
12 resurfacing, one of the challenges we have in the
13 City is, it's true; then sometimes the utilities will
14 go back in and cut up a road that's been freshly
15 resurfaced. Now they're not supposed to do that for
16 the first five years, but you know one of the
17 challenges we have in the City; there's a lot of
18 underground infrastructure, there are emergencies --
19 water main leaks, gas leaks, you name it. We meet
20 very regularly with Con Ed, National Grid, DEP, with
21 all the utilities, but I'll confess, it's certainly
22 an ongoing challenge and I know something the
23 Council's been taking a look at; happy to work with
24 you all on it. Believe me, we're very mindful about
25 it and always trying to improve our work there, but

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE, JOINTLY WITH THE DEPARTMENT OF
TRANSPORTATION 36

2 you know it's certainly one of the ongoing challenges
3 of roadwork in this City.

4 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay. I
5 have two questions before I open it up to my co-
6 chair; one is on the ineligible component that you
7 have slotted for Fiscal 2018's Executive Plan, at \$2
8 million for Fiscal 2017 and \$5 million beginning
9 Fiscal 2018. Can you give us some examples of DOT's
10 projects that would benefit for the use of this
11 funding and currently, what does DOT do when a
12 project component or components are deemed capitally
13 ineligible by OMB and no expense funding is available
14 to cover that portion?

15 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: This has been
16 sort of an evolving issue, one that it sounds like
17 you're familiar with, which is, there's sort of been
18 an ongoing debate about, and it comes from OMB, but
19 also from the Comptroller's office... [interpose]

20 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Right.

21 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: about what
22 the... what is deemed capitally eligible, and you know
23 I'll give an example -- in a bridge project, for
24 example, the City has movable bridges, over bodies of
25 water where we have some kind of a mechanism to raise

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE, JOINTLY WITH THE DEPARTMENT OF
TRANSPORTATION 37

2 or lower the bridge. You know often what will go
3 along with movable bridge projects will be a set of
4 manuals and other instructions about how the
5 operation is supposed to be done. That was something
6 that fairly recently has been very clearly determined
7 as being capitally ineligible. It's not a big
8 expense; in the past sometimes DOT has just found a
9 way... [crosstalk]

10 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So what;
11 the instructions of this, not...

12 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Correct.
13 Right, the instruction manuals that you would need,
14 for example, to operate a movable bridge.

15 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: What
16 would normally come in a box, if we purchase
17 something, that -- So I just wanna be clear, so it's
18 the actual instruction... [interpose]

19 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: The actual
20 instructions. Yes.

21 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay.

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Which, you
23 know in a complex engineering project you'll have
24 some... again... [crosstalk]

25

2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Of
3 course, is probably...

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: or likewise,
5 the training for the staff... [crosstalk]

6 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay.

7 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: that will be
8 operating it. Those are the types of things where I
9 would say maybe perhaps has been a bit of a gray area
10 in the past; now I think we've had a clear
11 determination from OMB that their capitally eligible.
12 And part of why they've started to put some money
13 into the budget for these expenses is; it had become
14 a great source of back and forth with our agency and
15 I think other agencies and OMB -- is this eligible;
16 isn't this eligible; we were, I think -- I've got my
17 budget person; we were spending a lot of time on
18 these negotiations -- I think we all agreed; why not
19 just give us a little budget of expense fund that can
20 cover, you know in some ways what are some
21 incidentals and then we don't have to be having
22 endless back and forth debates about whether they're
23 capitally eligible or not.

24 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay.

25 And in the past, what has happened in this case?

2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well again, in
3 the past I think sometimes it was a gray area and we
4 used capital funds or we found internal agency funds;
5 we had back and forth; sometimes OMB granted us more
6 money. I think it's been ad hoc in the past but I
7 think we're now, because it's become a source of I
8 think a lot of time and negotiation trying to find a
9 more... and I think a very sensible permanent solution.

10 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So is it
11 because we're doing more and the capital plan is
12 growing is why you know you found that \$2 million was
13 appropriate for FY17 and \$5 million is what you need
14 for FY18?

15 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well again, I
16 think these are just... these are just the numbers
17 we've negotiated for now. You know, I think it'll be
18 perhaps subject to some further discussion and
19 refinement as we go forward; I think that was our
20 estimate of the current set of projects. And you
21 know, part of why we wanted just this... again, it's
22 not big dollar... I think what we discovered is, was
23 not big dollar amounts, but we were spending a lot of
24 time back and forth negotiating; rather than spending
25

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE, JOINTLY WITH THE DEPARTMENT OF
TRANSPORTATION 40

2 all that time negotiating for a few million dollars
3 we can just handle these issues as they arise.

4 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay.

5 Every dollar's big dollars for us on this side of the
6 table, so that's why we're... you know we wanna get
7 clarity on that. The proposed budget includes \$3.5
8 million, as you mentioned, in your pedestrian ramps,
9 for additional 13 positions and related OTPS costs to
10 help boost the Department's ADA pedestrian ramp
11 compliance. Can you tell us how the locations are
12 being selected and have there been any changes in the
13 scope or design of the program, and how many sidewalk
14 locations do you plan to make accessible this fiscal
15 year and how many will be done in FY18?

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Yeah, we are...

17 I would say under this Mayor we are basically
18 exponentially increasing our work on pedestrian ramps
19 and we're gonna be doing on a few different levels --
20 I just got my numbers here -- for this fiscal year,
21 1,800 corners, but next fiscal year we're hoping to
22 get up to 5,500 corners and continue hopefully at
23 about that pace. There have been some recent sort of
24 legal rulings and clarifications by Department of
25 Justice and federal highways that all cities are

2 obligated to make a priority of upgrading pedestrian
3 ramps, making sure that they meet ADA standards any
4 place you're doing milling and paving. That was not
5 traditionally the standard that the City used, but
6 that's now clearly the law of the land. So for us at
7 DOT, that right now is a big priority for us, and
8 it's not an insignificant challenge, because like a
9 lot of cities, our milling and paving work, some of
10 it's done by contracts, some of it's done in-house,
11 it's one operation, the pedestrian ramp work is done
12 by a different part of the agency; a lot of that is
13 contracted work, some of that is in-house. So
14 coordinating those two sets of schedules and getting
15 that work harmonized is something that's gonna take
16 us a couple of years to get up and running, but we're
17 committed to making sure, you know, and as quickly as
18 we can that we will be doing pedestrian ramp upgrades
19 as milling and paving occurs. We also, as you
20 mentioned, take in priority requests, we hear from
21 Council Members, from 311, we work with the
22 disability groups to try and go to places where we're
23 hearing a lot of concern about pedestrian ramps and
24 we always do that, and as we're continuing to do both
25 our capital work and our street improvement projects,

2 we do ped ramp upgrades there as well. So I think
3 you're going to be seeing, I'm hoping, a real
4 increase and a real transformation in our work there
5 and we've gotten a robust amount of resources to do
6 that, and again, we're adding more personnel, more
7 oversight so that we can make sure we're really doing
8 a good job on that.

9 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So what
10 in this case would take priority; is it that you
11 would do the ADA compliance where your milling work
12 was already scheduled or do you do kind of the
13 reverse? So how do you prioritize where you start?
14 Are there already scheduled milling projects that may
15 not have had this pedestrian component that will?

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yes, I mean
17 we're going... basically going forward with our milling
18 and paving; we are following on with pedestrian ramp
19 work. There's a bit of a time lag, but essentially
20 we're committed now to making that work. So I'd say
21 in the next couple years that will be harmonized.
22 But it's not an either or; we will also continue to
23 try and address priority locations that we have as
24 incoming and again, as part of our ongoing... you know
25 now we're doing 60, 70, 80 safety improvement

2 projects every year; we do pedestrian ramp upgrades
3 there, and on any of our big capital projects that
4 we're doing with EDC. But again, I would also say if
5 there are locations that are particular priorities
6 for you or your constituents; community boards, you
7 know we're always happy to take those in and try and
8 address them.

9 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Great.

10 And I'm sure you're gonna be hearing from many of my
11 colleagues, but also our community boards. And to
12 wrap up before we hear from Chair Rodriguez, I wanted
13 to know if there's any coordination or any
14 conversations that you've been having with the Port
15 Authority around the issue of LaGuardia Airport's
16 reconstruction; it's the exit that I actually get off
17 to go home; every day it's like, I don't know what to
18 expect, how long it's gonna take me from the Grand
19 Central off to three or four blocks that I live from
20 there, and it seems to get more complicated every day
21 and there is a lot of construction happening and I
22 know some of it is on LaGuardia's property, but it's
23 spilling on into our streets and it just seems that
24 the issue is not being mitigated, so what is your
25 engagement as an agency with this huge project in a

2 very important part of our city that is really
3 becoming a problem, not just for the constituents,
4 for my constituents, but also for the travelers? I
5 literally three days ago saw people getting out of
6 cabs on Junction Boulevard and just walking to the
7 airport because there was a complete standstill.

8 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I mean I
9 guess I'll confess, it's not always been easy working
10 with the Port Authority; I think sometimes,
11 unfortunately, engaging with City officials is a
12 little bit of an after thought in their world, but we
13 have tried and we are... we've come to them -- DOT, our
14 City Hall, as well as NYPD, to help see what we can
15 do in terms of unsnarling the traffic problems there,
16 and I know the parking spillover effects that are
17 happening in East Elmhurst and other neighboring
18 areas. So we're keenly aware of the problem; we've I
19 think had recently some more improved dialogue with
20 the Port Authority, there's a City lot that they're
21 interested in making use of that we're all agreeing
22 we're gonna help them make use of that, so we're
23 trying to find creative solutions. I fully recognize
24 what a big challenge it has been for the local
25 neighborhoods, and believe me, the Port Authority has

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE, JOINTLY WITH THE DEPARTMENT OF
TRANSPORTATION 45

2 heard from us about our frustrations, but getting
3 them to engage and come together on solutions remains
4 an ongoing challenge, I won't deny it.

5 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So I'm
6 gonna be following up with you because I think we
7 definitely need to do more. We just can't take ten
8 years of this, which is the potential timeline for
9 building out LaGuardia Airport, and I know that once
10 the lots go up and hopefully they'll be mitigated,
11 but the way that the... it's definitely impacting off
12 of the airport footprint, which is what they were
13 saying would never happen... [crosstalk]

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I think it
15 would be tremendously helpful to have some of the
16 elected leadership from the area to join the City in
17 some of those discussions; we'd be very happy
18 **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

19 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay,
20 thank you very much Commissioner. Chair Rodriguez.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
22 Chair. Commissioner, first of all, I'd like to
23 express my thank you for all your support on Car-Free
24 Day; without the DOT and NYPD support, you know, we
25 wouldn't be able to close Broadway from 47th to Union

2 Square and other places, Northern Manhattan, Brooklyn
3 and Queens and we just hope that -- we have done it
4 twice for two years, 16 and 17 -- that we can
5 continue building with what we've been able to
6 accomplish. I have some question about congestion,
7 Vision Zero, but before getting into that question, I
8 want to touch on the DOT's recent announcement that
9 the City will be issuing parking placards for all
10 teachers and principals. Does the DOT, the City has
11 put in place the safeguard to ensure that these new
12 placards are not misused?

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So and I just
14 wanna be clear on the background of this, and I think
15 some of you are familiar with this. In the previous
16 administration, I think under Deputy Mayor Skyler,
17 the City pulled back a lot of those DOE parking
18 permits; there was a long set of legal disputes and
19 some rulings that did not go in the City's way on
20 this, so the Office of Labor Relations and the
21 Department of Education have been in protracted
22 negotiations on this, and I guess, you know it's hit
23 the news what the outcome is; the reissuing of a lot
24 of these placards. DOT and NYPD have been part of
25 these discussions about how we can really try and

2 make sure that they're used legally, that we're
3 cracking down on potential and fraudulent behavior
4 and abuses and I think you've heard, the Mayor
5 himself has said, you know he pledges very consistent
6 enforcement, you know we have been part of those
7 discussions with NYPD, but these are gonna be
8 Department of Education issued placards; we've spend
9 some time talking to them about what we think are the
10 best practices here, but I think this is one where
11 clearly, you know you all can help, you and your
12 constituents and the community boards can help be the
13 eyes and ears as this unfolds and we see where we
14 have problem areas and where we need to crack down
15 and where we might need to have enforcement.

16 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I do believe
17 that you know there's a number of teachers that they
18 need the placard, but I also, especially those who
19 live in places that they have to be walking ten
20 blocks to take a train, but I also believe that
21 there's other teachers, they live or work in the same
22 neighborhood that they are not in need of having
23 those placards. So I just hope that you know as the
24 process continues that we also look on who really
25 needs those placards, and as a teacher that I also

2 was, and I used to have one of those placards when I
3 was teaching for 13 years, I want also for the City
4 to take the same approach to the press. Doesn't make
5 sense that if someone... if there's a fire in any place
6 in Queens where people have to be walking ten blocks
7 from a train to the house to cover the story and any
8 media assigned a car and that car will say the press,
9 but that doesn't guarantee that the person who is the
10 person from the media who is covering the story
11 doesn't get a ticket from the NYPD because the press
12 only allow those members of the media to park in
13 designated, few limited space when they can park.
14 It's not that we have areas designated to press
15 throughout the whole city; we only have in few
16 locations. That bill that I have introduced, we have
17 I think more than 40 council members and we just want
18 to take the same approach -- members of the media,
19 they used to have the press parking too, same
20 approach as the teacher, and when Bloomberg got rid
21 of the parking permits from the teachers, he also did
22 the same thing from the media. So I just would like
23 to encourage the Administration to also look at the
24 media as another group that they also... it is a need
25 that we as a city has to provide those members who

2 are covering the story; who are taking the photos of
3 those stories, to be able to say we can work covering
4 the story, informing the City without being subject
5 to get a ticket from the NYPD, because the plaque
6 that we have, they have them in the car; they say
7 "press," it doesn't mean that they don't get tickets.

8 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well

9 Mr. Chairman, obviously we're happy to work with you
10 on this issue and I've had actually a lot of
11 discussions myself, as has my whole team, with the
12 media. And look, I will say, you know knowing they
13 were frustrated by what happened in the last
14 administration, but I think also, I mean my general
15 experience has been -- and they may dispute it --
16 that when an event is happening, a fire or something
17 where the media needs to get there, they can bring
18 their vehicles and they don't typically get ticketed;
19 one of the challenges we have, as you mentioned,
20 something like a fire, we've tried to put parking in
21 places where we know there's gonna be a lot of media
22 activity -- obviously right outside here at City Hall
23 -- but in terms of where there might a fire in the
24 city, it's hard to reserve parking spaces there
25 'cause that could be anywhere. But look, we are very

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE, JOINTLY WITH THE DEPARTMENT OF
TRANSPORTATION 50

2 committed to making sure... obviously we have a robust
3 and vigorous **[inaudible]** in the City and you know,
4 happy to work with you to make sure... I don't want
5 them to be getting tickets if they're trying to cover
6 important newsworthy events, so happy to work so we
7 can figure that out.

8 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: ...continue
9 looking; I say we have super majority, there's more
10 than 40 Council Members that believe that members of
11 the media, they should be... their right should be
12 restored for them to have a permit when they are
13 covering the story.

14 My other question is when it comes to our
15 buses, so behind; right? When we compare to other
16 states or cities, L.A., as we're saying, they
17 already... you know and some of the things we require
18 for the MTA and we will approach the MTA on how they
19 are modernizing the signal system and the buses so
20 that the DOT can do their part, 'cause we also know
21 that DOT cannot complete or do their part without the
22 buses; they also have the technology that will allow
23 those bus drivers to have priority when they are
24 approaching any intersection. But putting aside that
25 aspect of that model that we already have on 5th

2 Avenue; right, where buses, they have priority when
3 they're approaching the light. You know, how
4 optimistic are you that this is something that we can
5 accomplish, working together with the MTA?

6 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Look, I think
7 -- and obviously you'll have the MTA here later today
8 -- to... and I've said this before, to improve bus
9 service in the city, obviously the two agencies need
10 to work together, I mean we both, when it comes to,
11 as you mentioned, transit signal priority, that's a
12 technology we need to make sure that we're equipping
13 our poles and our signals and the MTA needs to equip
14 its buses. We have worked together on some routes,
15 some select bus service routes and other routes, and
16 it's been tremendously successful in places that
17 we've done it; it really does speed up bus times.
18 You know I will say, I think for the MTA... and you
19 know I had mentioned to you the L.A. example -- L.A.
20 has done TSP many years ago -- to be fair, L.A. does
21 not have a massive subway system as New York City
22 does and I think it's obviously clear the MTA has had
23 a lot of priority in keeping the subway system up and
24 running, but we are very interested in working with
25 them to bring more transit signal priority to bus

2 lines to continue to build out the select bus service
3 system, to look at things like off-board fair
4 collection, which can save so much time, that's now..
5 since particularly, for example, the crowded cross
6 town routes of Manhattan, half the time of the bus is
7 spent just waiting for people to swipe their
8 MetroCard. So I think there's a lot of things we can
9 do to speed up and improve the quality of buses, as
10 well as more bus lines, and there's no question that
11 is on DOT to continue to build out those dedicated
12 bus lanes; that's an area where I think we really
13 need to work with you, although there can definitely
14 be real political challenges and real opposition to
15 building out those bus lanes and something you know
16 we really need to work with our elected officials and
17 community boards on.

18 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: How are we
19 moving with a conversation about dealing with
20 congestion, especially in Midtown or any other area
21 in the city, 'cause we know that the Mayor and your
22 agency, they're working to put **[inaudible]**..
23 [crosstalk]

24 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yes. No and I
25 think we'll be testifying here in a few weeks, so

2 we'll share some details. But I think you've.. you
3 know and look, I wanna frame it by saying, you know I
4 always like to bring a little realism to the
5 discussion on congestion, you know it's been very I
6 think interesting and heartening for us all to see
7 the opening of the three new queue stops up on 2nd
8 Avenue and we have seen -- you know ridership has
9 been I think 150,000 on those stops almost
10 immediately; we've seen, looking at the taxi data, a
11 reduction in congestion. I wanna say, obviously one
12 of the big tools for congestion reduction is to
13 continue to build out mass transit capacity, and I
14 think I wanna put that on the table; that's an
15 important thing this city and the state need to think
16 about. But within the City's own set of tools -- and
17 I've talked a bit about it, but we will in the coming
18 weeks be flushing this vision out -- I mean part of
19 what the City can control is you know really a much
20 more coordinated and strategic enforcement and
21 pricing plan; we wanna work closely with NYPD on
22 looking at key corridors in Midtown where we're
23 really gonna focus on you know east-west corridors
24 and some north-south corridors, gonna work with
25 businesses and local buildings to see if we can do

2 more off-hour delivers, we're gonna use technology
3 better to pinpoint where we're seeing congestion hot
4 spots, we're gonna be looking at parking rates; we're
5 gonna be looking at the whole bundle of the things
6 that the City can control and put resources in to try
7 and see what we can do to get at congestion.

8 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And to close
9 on my end in this first round, one thing that I would
10 like to know is -- and say yes or no, if it's
11 possible -- is there any hope or expectation that we
12 can have that as conversation... is there any
13 conversation going on between Motivate and DOT that
14 we believe that will allow to accomplish the goal to
15 see the expansion of Citi Bike?

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Yes. I mean I
17 think I'll talk a little bit -- you know we have been
18 obviously very pleased with Motivate and we're still
19 in the midst of rolling out Phase II of Citi Bike,
20 but it's also true -- now we're all trying to think
21 about what should happen next in Phase III, and I
22 think one of the -- the debate about, you know as
23 we've had with many of you about whether we should
24 put public dollars into Phase III -- one thing that
25 has, I think we all know, come to the horizon in the

2 past few months is that there is a whole new emerging
3 set of players in the Bike Share field, and we've all
4 heard about some sort of the "Chinese bike
5 companies," which potentially offer a model which is
6 more low-cost, has other questions with it: How does
7 it actually work operationally? Would it be as safe
8 and efficient as Motivate? And so I think we're
9 having discussions with Motivate on their views of
10 those new technologies and what they think they might
11 be able to do. We are hearing from those other
12 companies and I think what we wanna commit to is, we
13 all know we wanna get to a five-borough system, we
14 wanna do it in a way that's gonna be safe and
15 efficient; I think we wanna minimize taxpayer
16 investment to the extent that we can, and I think we
17 really wanna make sure we're doing that in
18 partnership with you all in the Council who have been
19 such great partners and such great supporters of Citi
20 Bike.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And my last
22 one is on Vision Zero. Any update on how are we
23 doing so far this year on Vision Zero and how much
24 progress... [crosstalk]

25 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah.

2 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: are we making,
3 since this is a top priority for Mayor de Blasio and
4 you've been the one leading that initiative?

5 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Yeah well --
6 and you know, as I like to say about Vision Zero, you
7 know again, thanks to you, Mr. Chairman and so many
8 of the people on this Committee; you, Chairwoman for
9 the resources and the support, I think it has been
10 transformative; New York City remains I think one of
11 the leading cities on Vision Zero and we were, you
12 know particularly in the past few years, as a lot of
13 you know, in the past few year, tragically,
14 nationwide traffic fatalities have gone up 14% and
15 last year in some of our sister cities,
16 unfortunately, traffic fatalities went up quite a
17 bit; in New York we have continued to see fatalities
18 go down for three years in a row, they're down 22%,
19 and I always wanna be careful talking about
20 fatalities as if they're numbers; of course we all
21 know these are our fellow New Yorkers, our friends,
22 our families, our neighbors and so we treasure every
23 time that we can save a life. You know so far this
24 year, just so you know, you know we look at
25 statistics year over year, so at this point mid-May

2 2017 vs. 2016, we're actually overall down nine
3 fatalities from where we were this time last year;
4 we're down in pedestrian fatalities. But you know I
5 have also learned that this, you know, unfortunately
6 you can't always predict what's gonna happen month to
7 month; we you know this year are, as we always have,
8 pursuing a very, very vigorous effort of building
9 safety projects, protected bike lanes, continuing our
10 work on signal timing, on doing everything we can to
11 enhance the pedestrian experience, the cyclist
12 experience, doing education and enforcement with
13 motorists. I was up in Albany earlier this week
14 talking to some of your state counterparts about what
15 we can do to expand our speed camera program, so
16 we're continuing a very robust effort on every front
17 with Vision Zero, and as I said in my testimony, in
18 this budget I wanna thank the Mayor and the Council
19 for really robust resources which have enabled us to
20 do I think so much lifesaving work.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I just hope
22 that, again, as we are getting close to the budget, a
23 conversation continue that since the Administration
24 did not include any new funding for the Council
25 response when it comes to funding for the new SBS bus

2 route, neither for Citi Bike; neither for the fair
3 fare; neither for the Vision Zero education
4 awareness, you know and especially in the last one,
5 you know I have expressed before like we know how
6 committed we are and how Vision Zero is so critical
7 for this administration and how we have to include in
8 the negotiations to -- we using \$3 million that we
9 the Council were able to negotiate for this year, the
10 fiscal year that we're ending June 30, in the
11 response, there's no dollars for the Vision Zero
12 educational awareness, so are we advocating together
13 to be sure that we not only maintain the \$3 million
14 but we double more funding for the education
15 awareness campaign?

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well let me...
17 let me actually... you mentioned four different things;
18 let me make sure I address them all; I think I'll
19 start with Citi Bike, and it's true; we didn't... I
20 think we didn't put in public funds 'cause I think,
21 honestly, we're still evaluating what the best model
22 is gonna look like going forward to get **[inaudible]**.
23 Again, there are now some low-cost models on the
24 horizon and we've been talking to Motivate about how
25 they might potentially transition to a more low-cost,

2 dockless model, so I think that's an ongoing
3 discussion, you know one we're keen again to have
4 with the Council, 'cause I think there may be ways
5 that we can continue to expand the program and it
6 won't require public subsidy, but again, I think
7 that's an ongoing discussion.

8 On the select bus service, this is an
9 interesting thing, [sic] because I think in select
10 bus service we've been well-funded, our challenge has
11 not been... it's not been a funding challenge, it's
12 been that these projects, because we wanna do them
13 right, they tend to involve a lot of community
14 engagement, usually multiple community boards, many
15 institutions, businesses, churches, schools, so
16 really there -- and I'm proud to say that I think we
17 have tripled the pace of initiating new select bus
18 service routes from what was done in the previous
19 administration, but they're labor intensive, 'cause
20 again, you have to work at a very granular level,
21 basically block by block to make sure you're getting
22 the right design that's both improving bus feeds and
23 bus reliability but also ensuring that local
24 businesses, that churches, that parking; the
25 deliveries, that all the other curb uses are being

2 handled. So I think there it's less a funding issue
3 and more just making sure that we and the MTA can do
4 all the ground work and design work that we need to
5 do.

6 On the fair fares, I mean that's one
7 obviously that the Mayor has I think spoken about at
8 great length, very much understanding the Council's
9 desire to see what can be done to help low-income New
10 Yorkers with transfers. I think he said he feels
11 like the City is making a lot of commitments to low-
12 income New Yorkers in terms of housing, pre-K, mental
13 health, you name it, and that that's one where you
14 know we're ready perhaps to talk to the MTA, 'cause
15 this is a state-run agency, but not one given that
16 the, you know the ultimate price tag would be you
17 know somewhere over \$200 million a year, just a new
18 commitment that he hasn't felt ready to make, but I'm
19 sure that's one there'll be ongoing dialogue on.

20 And then on the public education piece of
21 Vision Zero, **[inaudible]** Mr. Chairman, we've worked
22 so well with you on that; we have identified some
23 internal funds, as we've done in years past, that
24 we're gonna put to the table on that, and obviously
25 that will be part of the final negotiation. I think

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE, JOINTLY WITH THE DEPARTMENT OF
TRANSPORTATION 61

2 we've been very proud of the work we've done together
3 with you on the public education campaign; we think
4 it's made a lot of difference; the multiple languages
5 has been very well received, so again, another area
6 where we're gonna put some of our own internal
7 resources and hopefully continue to work with the
8 Council on that.

9 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: **[inaudible]** if
10 we are able to put the \$3 or \$6 million for education
11 **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

12 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I would
13 benefit, there's no question.

14 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.
15 Thanks. Council Member Vacca.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Yes, thank you,
17 Mr. Chair. Commissioner, I have several questions; I
18 did wanna mention Vision Zero and support all your
19 initiatives that you've indicated; I view speed bumps
20 as a very important part of Vision Zero and something
21 is going on insomuch as the ability of the City to
22 install speed bumps expeditiously. I've been told
23 that the study alone for a speed bump on a block
24 takes two years; in my district, where I always
25 thought schools receive priority for speed bumps, I

2 have a school, nine months I'm asking for a speed
3 bump; it is still under study. So I wanted to bring
4 to your attention that based on the importance of
5 speed bumps in slowing down traffic, I think that
6 there has to be an assessment as to why there is this
7 long wait period that we're now enduring.

8 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I've done the
9 assessment and the assessment is that we're getting
10 an exponential increase in requests for speed bumps,
11 so it's not actually a mystery; we have seen speed
12 bump requests essentially go like this [raises hand
13 to the ceiling] and one of the challenges we're
14 facing, and something, actually, I'm glad you raised
15 it, Council Member Vacca, is we've now put a new kind
16 of interactive webpage online where if you wanna
17 request a speed hump, you can go -- and it asks some
18 key questions up front, and those key questions are,
19 you know how wide is the roadway; does it have buses;
20 does it have trucks; are there too many driveways,
21 'cause part of what's happening, as the number of
22 requests has gone up exponentially, a lot of them are
23 fruitless; we can't install speed humps for a bunch
24 of engineering reasons, so we're trying to actually
25 perform a bit more of an educational gatekeeping

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE, JOINTLY WITH THE DEPARTMENT OF
TRANSPORTATION 63

2 effort up front so that we can save the resources to
3 do the analysis in places where a speed hump can
4 really work. So that's one way you all can help us,
5 'cause right now we're getting so many incoming
6 requests that unless I'm going to hire another
7 hundred people to do speed humps, which probably in
8 this fiscal climate is imprudent, I have to try and
9 figure out another way to prioritize those requests.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I understand that,
11 they're very popular, but I will say that a two-year
12 study is an inordinate amount of time; eight months
13 for a school to wait is an inordinate amount of time.
14 If you need more resources, I, for one, will support
15 more resources for speed bump installation, and I'm
16 willing to work with you, but my community is waiting
17 now at a school site for eight months; two-year
18 study, that's... two-year study and then what; another
19 year to install? It just... It's just not acceptable;
20 I... [interpose]

21 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well I'm... you
22 know, I think we'd be happy to have that discussion.
23 Again, we've added a lot of resources to speed humps,
24 but we are now getting -- I mean say each year we're
25 sort of getting an exponential increase in those.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE, JOINTLY WITH THE DEPARTMENT OF
TRANSPORTATION 64

2 And as I say, as a result, we're trying to find a
3 smarter way to have people ask the right questions up
4 front so that when we go out to do the studies we're
5 looking at places where those speed humps are really
6 gonna work, but I'm not gonna like, we're getting..

7 [crosstalk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Well...

9 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: thousands and
10 thousands of requests now each year.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Okay. Well then I
12 would request maybe a way out of this or to delineate
13 would be to give the community boards and the Council
14 people these guidelines, which I myself am very much
15 aware of; I mean, when I hear people telling me they
16 want a speed bump on a bus route, they want a speed
17 bump on -- I know certain things cannot be done, so
18 my office and the community boards should be able to
19 weed out some of them and be realistic with people;
20 perhaps we could help.

21 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well now the
22 guidelines are online and we are actually requesting
23 that everybody, if you want a speed hump, go online
24 and you can basically.. it's a series of menus that
25 you can click on and it will tell you right away,

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE, JOINTLY WITH THE DEPARTMENT OF
TRANSPORTATION 65

2 like if it says: Is there a bus on this line and you
3 say yes; it'll say not eligible for a speed hump. So
4 that's one of the things we are trying to do to help
5 with the education up front so that the requests
6 we're getting are ones that are really actionable.

7 We are happy to brief community boards, to come work
8 with you all; we're keen to make sure that we're... you
9 know one thing I wanna make sure, 'cause I'm getting
10 so many speed hump requests, signal requests; I don't
11 wanna have my traffic engineers speeding a lot of
12 time on wild goose chases; I want to send them to
13 places where there are real safety needs and their
14 engineering work can really provide value...

15 [interpose]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Well that's why I
17 mentioned school sites taking so long; I think we
18 can't dispute a safety need there.

19 I wanted to bring up also Shore Road in
20 my district; again, it's not in the capital budget;
21 this is a major thoroughfare; the whole... it's about a
22 seven or eight block stretch that is falling apart,
23 literally, and there is no plan to do anything there
24 from a capital budget perspective and I'm upset that
25 it was excluded. I'm told that there are going to be

2 interagency meetings but I have no report of even
3 interagency meetings; I have no knowledge of anything
4 being done and I brought this up before; I need your
5 help, if you can intervene.

6 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: We are in
7 discussions with DEP and Parks to see [bell] if we
8 can do, in the short-term, some in-house solutions
9 while we see how we might fit it into the capital
10 budget. We're happy to sit down and brief you on the
11 details of those discussions.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Okay. And one
13 last thing; I wanted to bring up again -- you
14 mentioned about mass transit and buses, and I support
15 that, but I have brought up before; we should rename
16 express buses in the outer boroughs; they are not
17 express buses; they are non-express buses. They are
18 stuck in the same traffic as everybody else and I
19 know leaving the Bronx people on express buses who
20 are on the bus and not using their cars are
21 frustrated with the delays and with the traffic that
22 they confront; they are in gridlock, those buses are
23 not express. I thought the DOT was working on a
24 plan, insomuch as my borough was concerned, to get
25 these buses into the City sooner; if we don't do

2 that, people will just take their cars and forget
3 about the whole situation, and I thought something
4 was happening, but I'm not aware of anything.

5 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean I'll
6 give you a couple answers to that; I mean we're
7 continuing always to work with the MTA on where we
8 can increase the number of bus lanes; we're gonna be
9 adding a bus lane on 5th Avenue, which is the lane
10 that a lot of the Bronx expresses buses come on;
11 we're gonna be talking about some of -- and I
12 mentioned this to the Chairman -- some of the other
13 citywide things we're gonna look to do on congestion,
14 but I wanna be honest about the City's tools in terms
15 of congestion, we can increase enforcement and look
16 at parking rates and working with private businesses
17 in terms of deliveries, but I also think this city
18 and this region needs to think about more investments
19 in mass transit. I mean as I mentioned, we saw with
20 the opening of those three new stops on the Second
21 Avenue Subway; having looked at the taxi and bus
22 data, we're seeing big reductions in congestion on
23 the Upper East Side, I mean there's no question that
24 more mass transit is part of the good solution here.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE, JOINTLY WITH THE DEPARTMENT OF
TRANSPORTATION 68

2 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Yeah, but here we
3 have mass transit that's not able to get to the City.
4 There is mass transit in place, **[inaudible]**...

5 [crosstalk]

6 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well I mean... I
7 guess I'm saying...

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: we use mass
9 transit and we can't get to the City.. [crosstalk]

10 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Council
11 Member, I will gladly add you to the second round..

12 [crosstalk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I know I'm over my
14 clock, but that's okay, I had to make this point that
15 my residents are in a transit desert; they using mass
16 transit; they cannot get to the City. I'm all for
17 bicycles, they're wonderful; how 'bout the rest of
18 our city that cannot literally access their place of
19 work?

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Right, like I
21 said, Council Member, I mean I've mentioned some of
22 the tools the City has to reduce congestion, but you
23 know, without major new investments in the subway
24 system, I'm not gonna pretend we can be utterly
25 transformative here; this is a city that in the past

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE, JOINTLY WITH THE DEPARTMENT OF
TRANSPORTATION 69

2 twenty-five years has added 1.2 million people, 60
3 million tourists, record amount of construction job
4 creation; I think a lot of things that are good, good
5 trends for the city, but they've certainly made it
6 challenging to divide up the road space, and, again,
7 we're gonna roll out some of the tools that are in
8 the City's control and we're working with the MTA I
9 think to enhance bus service to put more bus lanes
10 where we can; that's the best we can do to try and
11 turn those buses back into more of express buses.

12 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you
13 Council Member. We've been joined by Majority Leader
14 Van Bramer, Garodnick, Greenfield, Menchaca, Treyger,
15 Council Members Rose, Miller, Chin, and Williams. We
16 will now hear from Council Member Reynoso; followed
17 by Van Bramer; followed by Lander.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Hello.
19 Commissioner, thank you for joining us at the Bike to
20 Work event that we did this morning; it was a
21 beautiful day to do this, and you joined us in saying
22 a few words to the folks that were there.

23 I just wanna speak to the fact that even
24 Council Member Jimmy Vacca is for bikes and
25 everything, is what he said; I do wanna say that if

2 we get cars off the road, those buses will be flying
3 through the streets, and that's the big conversation
4 we're having here, is that bikes are a viable
5 alternative to getting around; we wanna build
6 infrastructure in the outer boroughs so that it makes
7 it more popular, but to be honest, so long as we
8 maintain the level of car usage that we have in this
9 city, that the bus system itself is not something
10 that's truly viable unless we could build more lanes,
11 which is counterintuitive to like a movable city. So
12 it's about getting cars off the road and giving
13 people an alternative to be able to use that. So I
14 wanna speak to these other alternatives.

15 First, mass transit is a huge issue for
16 us; it seems like the City, when there are
17 significant investments to be made, does contribute,
18 but in some cases wants to make sure that we're clear
19 that the responsibility and oversight is the State's
20 and not the City. I think I wanna have a
21 conversation about that point. It's in the City that
22 is extremely important for how we move around and how
23 we get to work and how the city runs; I just wish we
24 could separate this whole city/state conversation and
25 really get to a place where this has to be the

2 primary means of transportation, given the headaches
3 that we're seeing recently, that the Department of
4 Transportation and the City of New York really take a
5 stronger look at how they can be helpful there,
6 outside of the trains, but just with the buses and
7 express lanes and removing lanes for cars and leaving
8 them for buses. Those things you can control. What
9 is the Department of Transportation doing to increase
10 bus lanes so that these express buses could move
11 quicker, but just bus lanes in general to move
12 quicker?

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Look, we are...
14 Council Member, we are -- and look, I very much share
15 your sentiments, that I certainly want the City and
16 the State to work together to tackle the mass transit
17 challenges the City has, I mean just... you know as a
18 **[inaudible]** the MTA is an agency that is an order of
19 magnitude larger than New York City DOT, they are the
20 dominant transportation player here; I'm lucky enough
21 to sit on the board, and I am always craving that our
22 two agencies and the City and the State can work
23 together on these issues; I think it's fundamental,
24 it's fundamental for the City; it's fundamental for
25 the region, and I think certainly you on the Council

2 have a role to play in helping to further that
3 dialogue. You know we are continuing to build out
4 our select bus service program where we put in
5 dedicated bus lanes, and again, like I have
6 mentioned, we're adding another bus lane on 5th
7 Avenue and we do it in other key parts of the City.
8 I will say, and I've said it before to the Council,
9 it is challenging, putting in bus lanes is
10 challenging; there's a lot of support for it, but
11 there can often be a lot of strong opposition. I was
12 just up in Albany, as I mentioned, on speed cameras
13 and speaking to some of your colleagues up there;
14 some of them really hate the bus lanes and in fact,
15 have introduced legislation that would really inhibit
16 the City's ability to control what happens in the bus
17 lane. So as much as I'd love to keep spreading them
18 throughout the city, there are a lot of political
19 challenges; we need a lot of support and leadership
20 from you all to continue to make that effort; it's...

21 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Can...

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: unfortunately,
23 in New York City we're not building anymore streets...

24 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Right.

2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: so you know,
3 to the extent that we put in bus lanes and other
4 things, we have to contend with the people who worry
5 about the effects it's gonna have on congestion and
6 local businesses, etc.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Right. So can
8 you just -- statistically speaking, how many people
9 in the City of New York own vehicles?

10 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: It's fewer
11 than 50... I think it's about 40%, and it varies
12 greatly from borough to borough and neighborhood to
13 neighborhood; in Manhattan, I think it's less than a
14 quarter; as you get out into Queens and Staten
15 Island, those percentages are much higher.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Have there been
17 conversations to completely take on streets for only
18 buses, pedestrians and bikes **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

19 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean look,
20 there's an example, you know in Brooklyn, Fulton Mall
21 is basically a bus-only lane, and certainly in the
22 discussion of the L train, that has now emerged as
23 something to discuss potentially on Grand Street in
24 Williamsburg or parts of 14th Street; I would say
25 again, there's a pretty lively debate there, 'cause

2 we're talking to local businesses and institutions
3 and you know there are a lot of stakeholders
4 interested in what happens curbside. But you know I
5 think we're open to continuing to figure that out,
6 and I just... you know to mention a couple of other
7 things, you know a pilot that we're doing this year
8 that I hope may get a little bit of what you're
9 saying about the volume of cars in New York City.
10 We're starting to look at an on-street car sharing
11 pilot, which you know, I've become convinced --
12 really, we've seen this happen in other cities -- one
13 car share in New York, [bell] particularly in areas
14 where people are lucky enough to live near a good
15 subway connection so they don't necessarily need
16 their cars to commute to work every day. One car
17 share can help somewhere between nine and fifteen
18 households shed a car; that may be, in the long run,
19 a big solution here, what's called shared mobility,
20 so...

21 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Yeah.

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Yeah, there's...
23 Yeah, see some... [crosstalk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Right. So...
25

2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: and we have...
3 certainly some of you... some sitting right here have
4 been interested... [crosstalk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Yes, I'm a
6 member... I'm a member of a car share program.

7 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Right. So
8 again, I think perhaps some of the new shared
9 mobility and technologies that are out there, and I
10 think the millennial generation, which is less
11 interested in car ownership per se and more
12 interested in a menu of options, may help chip away
13 at that issue; that's what I'm really hoping we'll
14 see in this pilot.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Yeah. I just
16 wanna end by saying, in this city, we really need --
17 the increase in population that we're having here and
18 the lack of infrastructure to build more streets, for
19 example, and it's not necessarily something we wanna
20 do; the City really has to start thinking about
21 building out the infrastructure for mass transit, for
22 buses, for bikes, and pedestrians, and so if we don't
23 start taking that seriously, we're gonna continue to
24 see a rise in these delays and these issues regarding
25 how we move in the city. So I just hope that the

2 City is willing to take bold steps to make those
3 things happen.

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well thank
5 you, and let me conclude by saying, as something the
6 Council and Council Member Lander had tasked us to
7 do; the City is working on a citywide transit study,
8 where I'm hoping we will put some bold ideas out on
9 the table; I think those ideas will require some
10 dedicated funding; some real political leadership
11 foraging good relations with the City and the State,
12 but we really look forward to having that decision.
13 I mean I feel firmly, as this amazing city grows and
14 prospers, we need to be thinking bigger about
15 transportation; we need to be investing much more,
16 and not surprising the DOT Commissioner would say
17 that, but I really think that's true.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
20 you, Council Member. Council Member Van Bramer;
21 followed by Council Member Lander; followed by
22 Council Member Menchaca.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you
24 very much, Madam Chair. Commissioner, I wanna thank
25 you for including in your testimony the \$17 million

2 commitment from the Mayor and this Administration to
3 redesign and make much more safe the area in front of
4 LaGuardia Community College, which not just serves
5 the thousands of students at LaGuardia, but there are
6 seven high schools also in that complex and in that
7 area, and the death of Tenzin Drudak several years
8 ago there is and has been a real inspiration on that
9 project, so I want to just mention his name. I also
10 wanna ask you about 43rd Avenue and 39th Street that
11 also came up at the town hall with the Mayor where,
12 as you know, Gelacio Reyes was killed; only on April
13 1st and then on April 11th, another cyclist was hit
14 by a truck at the very same location. You mentioned
15 at that town hall, in response to a question, that
16 you were to look into the area; I am calling for a
17 protected bike lane; the community board chair, as
18 you know, has also endorsed my call for a protected
19 bike lane. My question to you is in the wake of the
20 death of Gelacio Reyes and the other serious crash,
21 how are you looking into it and what kind of
22 timeframe are we looking at, because with the support
23 of the Council Member and the community board, we
24 could move quickly for a protected bike lane to make
25 that happen?

2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: No, thank you
3 for your comment, and thanks for your leadership. We
4 are trying to move quickly as well and I think we're
5 gonna circle back with you quickly on what our
6 findings are and you know we're certainly taking a
7 look at what the engineering elements would be of a
8 protected bike lane and it's obviously great to have
9 your support and the community board support and
10 again, I think we'll circle back with you on that
11 very quickly.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Great. It is
13 a wide street, there is ample opportunity, and a lot
14 of support, and I know you share this; we don't want
15 any other crashes to happen before we get this done.

16 I wanna loop back to where Council Member
17 Vacca started on speed bumps and other traffic
18 calming measures, particularly around schools. You
19 mentioned that requests for speed bumps have grown
20 exponentially; I know that they have, they have in
21 our office as well, but can you drill down and talk
22 about the number of speed bumps and traffic calming
23 measure requests that are within a block of schools?
24 As you know, I have several elementary schools where
25 we have had parents who are concerned for the safety

2 of their young toddlers and young children, ask for
3 speed bumps, both in Long Island City, Sunnyside;
4 Woodside; those have taken a very long time. I
5 understand that your requests have grown
6 exponentially, but what I still struggle with is the
7 lack of seeming prioritization of those traffic
8 calming requests that are specifically in front of or
9 within a block let's say of a elementary schools, in
10 particular, so wanted to ask you about whether or not
11 you have those numbers, Commissioner; whether or not
12 you're able to drill down into those number...

13 [crosstalk]

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Yeah, we're
15 digging up the numbers, and I do wanna say -- I hear
16 you and we do try and prioritize schools, but another
17 thing we are trying to prioritize with speed humps
18 is; we take speed readings and we're trying to do them
19 on streets where we see them.. again, because
20 resources are finite, and I hear Council Member... I
21 think it was Council Member Vacca; maybe we want a
22 lot more resources for this; I think obviously that's
23 a budgetary discussion we can have, but let's be in a
24 world where resources are finite; we're trying to
25 prioritize streets where we see the most speeding.

2 Sometimes that's in front of a school, sometimes it's
3 not, but you know we have tried to put an extra
4 emphasis on schools; if there are places where you
5 really think we're lagging, obviously we wanna hear
6 from you. As I said, now that we have this menu
7 online, and you know, I'm not demanding that all of
8 you use it, but it is our attempt to try and help
9 make some sensible prioritization about speed hump
10 requests so that ones where clearly it's not gonna
11 work for engineering reasons, you know, your office
12 or your constituents or community boards can go, put
13 them through the menu of questions and see right away
14 -- don't spend your time on this one; don't make the
15 request, it's not gonna be approved. And I'm hoping
16 that is going to refine our ability to get at the
17 ones that are the highest priority.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: So speaking
19 of finite resources, I have a finite amount of time
20 here, but let me just say, I would ask, Commissioner,
21 that if you don't have it right now, that you get to
22 our office, and maybe to the Committees, how many of
23 your speed hump and bump requests are in front of
24 schools or within a block of schools. The other
25 thing I would say is... [crosstalk]

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE, JOINTLY WITH THE DEPARTMENT OF
TRANSPORTATION 81

2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, we'll
3 get you that.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: just
5 yesterday your office did inform us that we will get
6 a speed bump in front of and adjacent to PSIS 78 in
7 Long Island City... [crosstalk]

8 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Assistant
9 Commissioner Zack just [bell] informed me of that,
10 yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: yeah, which
12 is good, which is great news, but that took years and
13 the only thing I would say is there are others -- you
14 asked that we make you aware of these requests --
15 there is a school, PS 343, in Sunnyside, 47th Avenue
16 and 42nd Street, that is, you know, a situation that
17 is desperately calling for the same thing, so I ask
18 you for that as well... [crosstalk]

19 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Okay. We will
20 put that on the list. But I'll ask you all, help us
21 help you a little bit, which is now again, we have
22 this online tool, so when your constituents come to
23 you and say I want a speed hump, if you can direct
24 them there and then look, if it's on a bus route or
25 it's a truck route or it has some of the other

2 engineering challenges, you can help head some of
3 those off so that we can get to the ones that really
4 are priorities, 'cause I am trying to sort of
5 minimize the use of staff time for what sometimes
6 turn out to be kind of, as I would term them, wild
7 good chases.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Absolutely.
9 I believe 42nd Street absolutely qualifies for a
10 speed bump.

11 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Okay, good.
12 Alright, we will put it on the list... [crosstalk]

13 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So... thank
14 you Council Member; we will hear from Council Member
15 Lander; Menchaca; followed by Rose. I just have one
16 quick follow-up question. I know that you talked
17 about complicated intersections; 23rd Avenue is one
18 of those, in my district specifically; it's where we
19 had the loss of a young child several weeks ago; I've
20 been asking for mitigation on this corridor since
21 2009, and I know that we can't do a speed bump
22 because it is a bus route and you know, and it is
23 incredibly... it's a complicated road; it's a five-
24 lane... it goes in five directions... I mean, not five
25 directions; it has five corridors. However, do you

2 give people the option of what else can be done,
3 because I understand that you want us to discourage
4 people from streets that we know you can't put a
5 speed bump, but I would think since 2009 you
6 should've been able to do a study for a stop sign or
7 a traffic light or you know, what are the other
8 options and how long do these options take?

9 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: No, we
10 certainly should and we do try and always give people
11 a menu of options if a speed hump or signal isn't
12 gonna work -- enhanced crosswalks, building out
13 pedestrian islands, or working with PD on signage
14 enforcement, etc., so apologize if it sounds like
15 that's one that's been taking too long; I'm gonna
16 circle back with our Queens Borough Commissioner.
17 See, 'cause whenever we have a tragic incident like
18 what happened, we usually have our engineers come and
19 take a look and start to think about what some
20 solutions can be. So **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

21 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: It was
22 the one thing I was trying to avoid...

23 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah.

24 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: it was
25 one thing that happened.

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE, JOINTLY WITH THE DEPARTMENT OF
TRANSPORTATION 84

2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Okay. Well
3 let us...

4 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: so time
5 is of the... you know, we've run out of time,
6 essentially.

7 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Okay. Well I,
8 as I say, will get with the Queens Borough
9 Commissioner and come back to you all.

10 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Council
11 Member Lander.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Madam
13 Chair. Thanks Commissioner, good to see you; thanks
14 for the testimony and the good news on 4th Avenue and
15 props to Council Member Menchaca for pushing it
16 along, the public here at session was very good there
17 and thanks for getting Times Plaza also moved along
18 as part of that effort.

19 I wanna ask first about the Citi Bike
20 expansion; I appreciate your exchange with Chair
21 Rodriguez and I appreciated... it's a rapidly moving
22 and evolving field that, as you know, the Council put
23 in our Preliminary Budget response a desire to see an
24 expansion and put the public funds up if necessary;
25 you know, I read this morning's *Politico* article

2 about the possibility of achieving that in some other
3 ways. I guess what I just wanna ask is that we set a
4 timeline for figuring this out, disruptive
5 technologies are hard; it is a complicated situation,
6 but we can't let that mean we just kinda wait to get
7 the next level of expansion, I've got a district
8 that's half covered and half not covered and the
9 other half wants to get covered, so. Normally, when
10 it's a budget item we get things resolved by the
11 budget adoption and I'd like to do that here, so if
12 we do it in the budget, great; if it's done in
13 another way, great, but can we try to work to get
14 some resolution on a plan for a next phase, working
15 together with the Council by budgeted adoption...?

16 [crosstalk]

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Council Member
18 Lander, and I think that's a great idea; we would
19 very much like to talk to you all about it. I will
20 confess though; it is true that the technology -- you
21 know it's funny, as these new technologies have been
22 emerging we have been trying to talk to the various
23 companies that are involved in them and wrap our
24 minds around how they would work in New York City;
25 what might be the interaction with Motivate. So

2 there have been a lot of questions and we are trying
3 to analyze expeditiously, but it is a fast-moving
4 field and you know when New York City commits to a
5 plan of action with a contract, we tend to lock
6 ourselves in for some period of time..

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: yeah.

8 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: so I wanna
9 make sure we get it right. But look, again, we're
10 anxious to talk to you all and see if we can have a
11 sensible resolution. I know all parties share the
12 desire to continue to bring Bike Share to all parts
13 of the City.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: So can we just
15 commit that with Chair Ferreras and Chair Rodriguez
16 and you guys, we will make some time before adoption
17 of budget to sit down and do everything we can to try
18 to get a plan for.. [interpose]

19 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: With our City
20 Hall as well.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Absolutely.

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yes, with
23 Deputy Mayor Glen though; I think she's sort of
24 leading the charge from the City Hall end.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Very good.

3 Alright, great. Thank you. So Madam Chair, let's
4 follow-up on that.

5 I wanna underline the capital projects
6 management challenges; you and I had a very
7 productive conversation in which I think it helped me
8 to understand how frustrating you find the capital
9 project management challenges. I just wanna make you
10 aware the Council, also in our Preliminary Budget
11 response, asked City Hall and OMB to establish a
12 joint task force with the Council; I recognize there
13 are a lot of internal frustrations and that some of
14 those dialogues are taking place, but you know that
15 things appear -- you know we're working on often
16 somewhat smaller projects, but we hear even more
17 frustration, so I'm not asking anything new there,
18 because it's an ask of the budget director and the
19 Mayor, but what the Council wants to be clear is to
20 be part of that conversation so we can really make
21 some progress together.

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean look, I
23 won't speak for the budget director, but you know,
24 you and I, Council Member Lander, have had some good
25 discussions about this; I think the New York City

2 capital project process is one of the most
3 challenging I have ever seen and there are a lot of
4 players and a lot of moving parts and I think a lot
5 of great work we could do together to deliver
6 projects more quickly at a lower cost while
7 maintaining all the protections that we care about --
8 the protections of the integrity of the procurement
9 process, labor protections -- I think all that can be
10 done and we could still make this process a much
11 simpler and faster one. I know other jurisdictions
12 around the country that have managed to do that, so I
13 would love to work on that.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Yeah. No and I
15 thought our conversation helped me see some things in
16 a new way, so I know [sic] we'll keep pushing..
17 [crosstalk]

18 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: You walked in
19 our shoes a little bit.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: we'll keep
21 pushing on City Hall and the budget director to get
22 there.

23 And then I'll end... I'll really... just
24 echoing and following from Council Member Reynoso's
25 questions; we're suiting up for our dialogue with the

2 MTA in a few minutes and as you can imagine, like I
3 have heard nothing for the last several weeks, even
4 given everything going on at the national level, more
5 than woe about the subway system and the MTA, and you
6 know, of course it is state-controlled; the Governor
7 appoints the majority of the board; on the other
8 hand, we've gotta find some other way forward --
9 you're very, you know accessible, but you're not
10 responsible; the MTA is responsible but not at least
11 for my constituents accessible; we've just let that
12 go on too long and we need all the help we can get;
13 we need the Mayor's help, we need your help; we have
14 got... this is just... it can't be business as usual;
15 what it is going to take to bring the MTA service to
16 the place where we've gotta have it be for a 21st
17 century city is much bigger than what we're doing;
18 must bigger than the six-point plan they've put in
19 place. I'm glad the citywide transit study might
20 help point in some interesting new directions, but
21 mostly I'm just asking for your [bell] support in
22 doing what we all have to do to like ring the bell
23 loud enough; it is a crisis and we've gotta find ways
24 to work together to solve it.

2 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: No thank you
3 for that. And look, obviously, you know, the Mayor
4 and I think all of us share the concern; I mean the
5 recent obviously sort of meltdowns and incidents
6 we've had on the subway that have inconvenienced tens
7 and tens of thousands of commuters is something we're
8 all concerned about. And look, I'll give the MTA
9 credit, they put the six-point plan together; I'm
10 with you; it's not gonna solve every problem, but I
11 think it shows a good awareness on their part that
12 they need to step up and try and in the short run, in
13 particular, to tackle some of the places where these
14 real operational breakdowns are happening. But it's
15 true, in the big run -- you know, as I just said, I
16 think this city and this state -- you know when I
17 look at what's happening in some of our sister cities
18 around the world and in this country, there is sort
19 of I think a more functional governance and financing
20 model that is making bigger investments and we need
21 to do that; it's not just here in the City; we need
22 to be with our state counterparts as well, because so
23 much of the funding and the governance and oversight
24 of the MTA does happen up in Albany, whether we like
25 it or not, and obviously we need to work together

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE, JOINTLY WITH THE DEPARTMENT OF
TRANSPORTATION 91

2 with the City delegation on that and we'd really like
3 to do that.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you.

5 Thanks, Madam Chair.

6 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you

7 Council Member. Council Member Menchaca; followed by
8 Council Member Rose; followed by Council Member
9 Miller.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Chair.

11 And thank you, Commissioner for coming out today and
12 also really welcomed your presence at our bike to
13 work event today at the steps of City Hall.

14 So the first thing I wanna say and also
15 just join the echo of thank you for 4th Avenue and I
16 think my interpretation of all this is, when an
17 agency can really listen and respond in real time
18 when a generational project like this is on its way,
19 we all benefit, and so thank you for that.

20 One of the things that's happening on the
21 ground as your team is out engaging community
22 members, as we are all ready and committed to doing,
23 one of the things that keeps coming up is an
24 opportunity for us in a budget way to think about
25 what the resources are to engage communities that

2 won't necessarily come into a meeting; I'm talking
3 about English language learners, non-English-speaking
4 community members; thinking about youth, and also
5 folks that can't read; a lot of what we're doing in
6 the City Council in this budget is requesting money
7 for adult education classes to teach people literacy,
8 but for those who aren't there yet, we wanna make
9 sure that they engage and they have their important
10 voices, especially on 4th Avenue there's a lot of
11 schools, a lot of PTAs; a lot of parents. So tell us
12 a little bit about this budget, where we can point to
13 that kind of investment; this is very, very important
14 for us in Sunset Park.

15 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well actually,
16 I wanna start with 4th Avenue, and again, thank you,
17 Council Member for your leadership and I think it's
18 been great to see -- it was not an easy decision to
19 take up a capital project that was so far down the
20 road and open it up again, but I think we've gotten a
21 great outpouring of support from elected officials,
22 from the community and we recognize, particularly in
23 Sunset Park, we wanna make sure we're doing more
24 work; we're gonna try and go back and do sessions in
25 multiple languages, particularly in Spanish and

2 Chinese and you know any other languages that we
3 think will be appropriate. We have been trying I
4 think as a city to continually improve our ability to
5 engage in communities throughout the city with
6 different languages; we've created within DOT what we
7 call our Street Ambassadors Program, and some of you
8 may have seen them; they're a wonderful group,
9 they're multilingual and you know, one of the things
10 we learned; it was one of my interesting early
11 insights in this job when we started with Vision Zero
12 -- you may remember, we did town halls and we had an
13 interactive online thing where people could go and
14 click and tell us where they wanted certain
15 interventions in the roadways and then we did our
16 Borough Safety Action Plans, where we actually looked
17 at the crash statistics in each borough, and when we
18 put the two maps side to side, we saw they didn't
19 always match up, because we saw there are certain
20 neighborhoods -- oh I'll mention my own, Park Slope,
21 people are very ready to engage; they're very
22 comfortable with interacting with City government,
23 you know, and we got a lot of input from those
24 neighborhoods, and then there'd be another, you go to
25 central Brooklyn, you go to, you know, parts of the

2 Bronx, where we weren't getting that same level of
3 engagement, even though when we looked at the crash
4 maps we should. And so we recognized we really need
5 to up our game in making sure the communities, for a
6 variety of reasons -- linguistics, cultural; they're
7 busy with their day jobs; they don't trust City
8 government -- they're not necessarily going to come
9 to us, and we need to make sure that we're coming to
10 them. So we have the street ambassadors, we're
11 trying to create a more robust set of translators and
12 we are, again, in Sunset Park in particular, are
13 gonna conduct meetings in several languages, and you
14 can help us with that, so we're sure we get the input
15 from every community in their own language.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you. And
17 we not only like to hear that commitment, but I think
18 budget is a great way to show the priority, and so
19 showing it as a budget line, showing it as an ever-
20 growing commitment where we can see it I think is an
21 important thing; that's the value of participatory
22 budgeting.

23 In my last minute I wanna point to
24 something that's real exciting; it's on its way in
25 phases, June 1st will be the next phase of NYC ferry;

2 where I wanna concentrate on is any kind of budget
3 implications to intersections that are near ferries;
4 we talked earlier about the intersection at Pioneer
5 and Van Brunt, it's a corridor down to the ferry
6 landing and Atlantic Basin; that's already presented
7 us a lot of issues in the last three years; it is
8 something that I and the community have been working
9 together to get some traffic lights on Van Brunt,
10 which is something that we've kinda continually... DOT
11 is -- and I wanna say thank you -- analyzing, but we
12 wanna expedite now; we want something there before
13 June 1st to really anticipate the flow of new people
14 that are gonna be coming onto the ferry. We think
15 it's gonna be a massive success and I think that we
16 wanna make sure that all intersections around ferries
17 across the system are understood and you're
18 anticipating that and the budget is ready to respond.
19 This particular intersection has had 23 reported
20 incidents in the last two years; it's creeping up as
21 a massive possibility for a death; we don't wanna
22 wait for a death; we think it's ready; we're hoping
23 that you can expedite it, but this is all part of the
24 kind of ferry launch [bell]. We're hoping that...
25 [crosstalk]

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE, JOINTLY WITH THE DEPARTMENT OF
TRANSPORTATION 96

2 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well Pioneer
3 and Van Brunt, we've got... and we have been certainly
4 trying to coordinate with EDC in all the places where
5 the new ferry stops are coming in; not only to ensure
6 we have safe pedestrian and cyclist infrastructure,
7 you know working also potentially to think about Bike
8 Share and bike parking and so you know if there are
9 locations we need to take a look at; happy to do
10 that, and you know we are trying to be proactive in
11 that regard, so you know, work with them. If there's
12 a place you think we need to get to, let's make sure
13 that we do it.

14 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Council
15 Member Kallos has ten seconds to say something before
16 we hear from Council Member Rose; followed by Council
17 Member Miller.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you for the
19 transit garden in my district.

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Thank you,
21 Council Member.

22 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: That was
23 it. Council Member Rose. [laughter]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Alright. First,
25 Commissioner, I'd like to thank you and the Mayor for

2 the new ferry named in honor of Sandy Ground, the
3 longest continuous free black settlement in the
4 United States, and for the funding for the lower
5 level boarding at the ferry terminal. And so along
6 that line, I was wondering if you could give me a
7 status report with a timeline of when Staten Island
8 would be added to the five-borough ferry plan.

9 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well first of
10 all, I want to congratulate again on Sandy Ground; I
11 think that's just... it's a wonderful, fitting name for
12 a boat and a tribute to such a special piece, not
13 only of New York history, but of American history,
14 so...

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: thanks for you
17 leadership on this. As I think you've heard the
18 Mayor say on citywide ferry service, you know we've
19 announced the first set of stop, and believe me, we
20 heard loud and clear during Staten Island Week the
21 desire for more stops in Staten Island and I think he
22 said EDC is starting to take a look at what the next
23 phase of citywide ferry would look like; I don't
24 wanna speak for them on... [crosstalk]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Do you know when
3 that phase will begin **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well first, I
5 don't wanna speak for EDC on that; I know they're
6 looking at timetables and I wanna make sure that I
7 give you the right answer. We're sort of the junior
8 partner in that endeavor, but I know that --
9 certainly, we heard during Staten Island Week the
10 desire to bring that service to Staten Island as soon
11 as possible.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. And I
13 think as part of Vision Zero some pedestrian
14 sidewalks were extended out, they were made larger
15 and they sort of extend into the street bed and we
16 have several in my district that if you're not paying
17 attention and you're driving, you could actually hit
18 the curb. Is there any measures put in place to put
19 some kind of marking on it, especially reflective
20 marking so that... [interpose]

21 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I think
22 I'd be happy to have, you know Tom or someone from
23 the staff come and take a look; we can maybe put up
24 delineators or a pole or something, some vertical
25 element that will help alert drivers, so why don't

2 you work with my office; we'll get the locations;
3 we'll go take a look.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And I believe that
5 I heard that you are going to expand the use of speed
6 cameras and I know we heard a lot today about speed
7 humps, especially around schools and I know that in
8 my district that speed cameras have sort of replaced
9 speed humps. Could you sort of give me the rationale
10 behind that?

11 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah. And
12 just to be clear, the City has been up in Albany
13 seeking the ability to deploy more speed cameras; we
14 don't have that authority now, so currently we have
15 authority to deploy speed cameras in 140 school
16 zones. So we would need authorization from Albany
17 for that number to go up, but the City would like
18 that number to go up; we think, when we look at the
19 safety statistics that have happened on our roadways
20 in New York City and again, how we've bucked [sic]
21 the national trend in terms of fatalities; we think
22 speed management and the speed cameras and the new
23 speed limit have all really played a role in that.
24 Now speed cameras and speed humps tend to be deployed
25 in different circumstances. The speed cameras, what

2 we've tried to do, because the State mandates that we
3 use them in school zones, is; we've tried to look at
4 the school zones where we see the highest crash rates
5 and so we're targeting them very much typically on
6 roadways where you're getting some speed and where
7 you're seeing serious crashes. Speed humps actually
8 is a program that tends to be more on local
9 neighborhood streets 'cause you can't put them on big
10 wide streets and you can't put them on streets where
11 you're gonna have trucks and buses, so there are
12 actually two different sets of solutions for traffic
13 calming and speed management.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay. Thank you.

15 And in terms of the street lighting upgrades, where
16 are we, and especially like in Staten Island; are we
17 getting close to the lighting upgrades, the lighting
18 grids?

19 [background comment]

20 REBECCA ZACK: Sorry; we're looking at
21 the... you're talking about the LED update?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Excuse me?

23 REBECCA ZACK: The LED update?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Yes.

2 REBECCA ZACK: I know we're starting in
3 the Bronx soon and I think Staten Island is right
4 after that; I can confirm with you after the hearing
5 though. So I expect... [crosstalk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay, so no work
7 has begun yet though?

8 REBECCA ZACK: No. Correct.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay. And in terms
10 of the timeline for spring road repairs; do you have
11 a timeline for that in like, say my district...

12 [interpose]

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, you know
14 we try and work out our resurfacing schedules for the
15 season, we work with community boards, and we try and
16 make that information available as much ahead of time
17 as we can and happy... you know we tend to have... I'm
18 thinking... someone in your office must... we put out
19 pretty regular emails on what the resurfacing
20 schedule is, so we'll make sure we coordinate that
21 with you if you're not getting that information...

22 [crosstalk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: So within those
24 resurfacing, that timeline, do you take into [bell]

2 consideration repaving with utilities tear up the
3 street; do you go back and repave those?

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean we... you
5 know our goal is... and one thing I hear frustration,
6 is we leave a window, as all of you know, between
7 when we mill and when we pave, and part of the point
8 of leaving that window when the road is opened -- and
9 I know it can be inconvenient -- is to encourage the
10 utilities, if they have work to do, to go in and do
11 it before we resurface. And in a lot of instances
12 they do, but it is -- I'll admit, it's not a perfect
13 system and the utilities do sometimes go back in
14 afterwards; they are required to restore the roadway
15 to its previous condition, and at DOT we've actually
16 just tightened up our regulations about that roadway
17 restoration; we're now requiring anyone who cuts into
18 the roadway to restore the concrete bed as well as
19 the asphalt and I'm hoping that will involve better
20 restorations; we haven't... [crosstalk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Is there any
22 enforcement by DOT if in fact they don't restore it...
23 [interpose]

24 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yes.
25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: and DEP is a
3 chronic violator of that?

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well we have
5 enforcement against the private utilities, but not
6 against our sister agency, so we don't actually
7 enforce DEP... [crosstalk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: They put in the
9 sewer work and they just throw the asphalt on...

10 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I would say
11 this; it's been very good working with Acting
12 Commissioner Sapienza; this is a problem we've heard
13 a lot about and I think our two agencies have tried
14 to sit down. We've actually tried to help them;
15 we've had some of our paving experts work with them
16 to help them purchase better equipment and get better
17 techniques and we're trying in some places to sort of
18 engage in a little more joint ownership of some of
19 these restorations jobs. So we are in active
20 engagement with DEP on doing a better job there and
21 hopefully you'll see some of those results, but
22 certainly we rely on all of you, if you see places
23 where there's a bad restoration, call 311 or call our
24 offices and let us know and we can get whoever's
25 responsible out there to fix it.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: **[inaudible]**...

3 [crosstalk]

4 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you
5 Council Member. I just wanted to inform our Council
6 colleagues that I'm really gonna stick to the time; I
7 know the Commissioner has a prior engagement she has
8 to attend to, but I've also asked the Administration
9 that we need appropriate time to ask the questions.
10 So everyone will have their opportunity to ask their
11 questions; we're just gonna stick without our
12 allotted time.

13 And I wanted to acknowledge that we've
14 been joined by the British Consulate-General of New
15 York, Vice-Consul Matthew Windrum, and Deputy Consul
16 General, Laura Hickey. Thank you and welcome to City
17 Hall.

18 We will now hear from Council Member
19 Miller; followed by Council Member Chin; followed by
20 Council Member Williams.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Madam
22 Chair. I thank... thank you, considering that you put
23 the restriction on me. So very quickly, I just took
24 a look at my app and if I was to leave now to go home
25 in the middle of the day with no traffic, it would

2 take me our hour and eight minutes, the quickest
3 scenario, and that is about ten miles out of the way,
4 taking the Belt Parkway all the way around, and an
5 hour and sixteen minutes if I took the train. What
6 are we doing to coordinate with the other agencies to
7 address the needs of those transportation deserts
8 throughout the city, very specifically? I know
9 Councilman Vacca talked about the express bus, which
10 were antiquated; those routes do not serve; none of
11 them that come from Southeast Queens comes down here
12 to Lower Manhattan where two-thirds of the people
13 work; they don't run beyond 9:00 in the a.m. and 4:00
14 in the p.m. coming out, so the system's antiquated;
15 how do we address that in particular, considering
16 that transportation is the great equalizer; how do we
17 accomplish that?

18 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Well I'm gonna
19 start actually with what I think is, thanks to your
20 efforts and I think the City and others pushing the
21 MTA now to do the City Ticket pilot project, which I
22 think is gonna be, I'm hoping, a tremendous benefit
23 in your part of Queens and in parts of Brooklyn, you
24 know and we're working through the details on that,
25 but that is I think one thing that's gonna offer your

2 constituents, those that are lucky enough to live
3 near the Long Island Railroad; if they can get
4 reduced, you know, if they can get more like a subway
5 type fare and use that service into the city -- as
6 you know, that will take a lot of time off their
7 commute. On the bus service, you and I have talked
8 about it, and look, we're looking to do a select bus
9 service route in your district; talking to you about
10 what might be the best routes. So look, you know
11 we're well aware of the transportation frustrations
12 you have in your district and I think at least now
13 the MTA has come to the table on the City Ticket,
14 which is a great development... [crosstalk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Yeah. So... So
16 long as we have you both in the room, you know I need
17 for Mike and the team to hear that as well, the
18 coordination; the routes that exist are really
19 antiquated and they can be improved. So in terms of
20 creating the slow zone -- not even slow zones, but it
21 was also mentioned about, not necessarily speed
22 bumps, but other mechanisms of safety around parks
23 and schools -- how do we expedite that; is there a
24 particular plan for that or do we have to request
25

2 specific slow zones? We're requesting for every park
3 and school in the district that we create slow zones.

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: I mean I think
5 it helps us when you can prioritize the list and you
6 know, part of our job is to go and take a look at the
7 engineering, to look at the crash statistics, to
8 measure the speeding, but obviously, you know we care
9 deeply about the ones that you all put on your
10 priority list, and so you know, again, our Queens
11 office ready to work with you on that. But again, as
12 you're hearing, you know one of the challenges we're
13 having is a resource challenge and so I wanna make
14 sure the things we get for you are the highest
15 priorities, because if everything's a high priority..
16 [crosstalk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Right.

18 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: then we're
19 back to the two-year list.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: We do agree. Do
21 you know how many miles of road resurfacing have been
22 done in Queens, and if possible, can you identify
23 that by district?

24 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Well I can
25 give you... I can give you the Queens land miles; I

2 think for the district we'll have to break it down.

3 Calendar 16 we did 391 lane miles resurfaced and as

4 of May 6, we're up to 71 miles. So I'll give you

5 this rough rule of thumb -- thanks to the funds from

6 the Council and the Mayor, we will, in the course of

7 about a five-year period, resurface most of the major

8 roads in New York City. So you know this has been,

9 as you all know, a very big, unprecedented effort to

10 catch up on some roads that were really I think in a

11 neglected state; more work to do and we're always

12 looking for what the priority of roadways are, but I

13 have to tell you; when I first came into this job,

14 the elected officials I met, constituents I met;

15 everyone talked about roadway conditions and now at

16 least I'm hearing that the City is starting to make

17 real improvements that people are seeing.. [crosstalk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Oh... so

19 definitely. So finally, as we talk about that, and I

20 know we have some robust Vision Zero plans going on

21 in the district and around the city as well. So my

22 question is; how much emphasis have the town halls

23 that you've had locally been put on those

24 considering, and this is based on experience, that

25 for a number of reasons there's a lack of diversity

2 around the DOT -- whether it is staffing or cultural,
3 we have found that often projects don't reflect those
4 communities that the projects are happening in. For
5 instance, we're doing Vision Zero along Jamaica
6 Avenue there, but the town halls [bell] that were
7 held in Queens were held in Ridgewood and Jackson
8 Heights; what kind of input, what kind of community
9 engagement are we using to ensure that these projects
10 reflect communities, and then finally, follow-up to
11 that, MWBs and the DOT?

12 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: First of all,
13 I'm looking forward to our town hall together; I
14 think it's... I'm seeing now it's scheduled for June
15 19th, and look, we're always striving to try within
16 the agency have a diverse workforce, bring in people
17 from all parts of the city and to try and get to all
18 the neighborhoods. I will readily acknowledge we can
19 always do better, and Council Member, I'd love your
20 help on that; if there are neighborhoods you think we
21 need to get to that we haven't, we will -- you know
22 we are always happy to do town halls or workshops in
23 any neighborhood you want and try and bring, if we
24 have folks who are familiar with the neighborhood,
25 familiar with the issues of the community, and City

2 Hall can often help us with that -- CAU -- to if
3 there are neighborhoods it sounds like if you think
4 in Jamaica we need to do a better job, you know let
5 us circle back with you on that and try and get
6 together. On MWBs, it's a great question; as you
7 know, I'm very proud of the Mayor; he has really I
8 think upped the City's commitment there; we're now
9 committing to, I think it's a 30% goal, and within
10 DOT we are working very, very hard to try and not
11 only increase our numbers, but work particularly with
12 the business; I mean part of the MWBE challenge is
13 making sure that minority and women-owned businesses
14 can have access to agency officials, can understand
15 the City contracting process; that we can help
16 introduce them, in the cases of big construction
17 jobs, to potentially prime firms where they can get
18 subcontracting work, so we're very, very committed to
19 that and it's been terrific in the city. As you
20 know, City Hall has hired Jonnel Doris, who
21 previously did MWBE work for the State. Jonnel and I
22 have been working very closely together; I think he's
23 terrific; he has a lot of great ideas about how
24 agencies can increase participation, and what are
25 some of the legislative hurdles we need to overcome;

2 there are some things we need to do legislatively at
3 the city and the state level, but I think Jonnel has
4 brought a whole new energy to this program and is
5 certainly helping us improve our game. I have some
6 of our numbers here -- we've seen -- I'm looking at
7 FY17; it looks like -- we've gone from... I think we've
8 gone from FY15, committed MWBE percentage 6%; we're
9 doubling by FY17; we're gonna be up to 12% and you
10 know we know we have more ways to go, but I think
11 we're really stepping up at the City Hall level and
12 trying to step as well as much as we can at DOT
13 level.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Well we'd
15 certainly like to work with you at the Council and
16 assist you in that, and obviously, it is important
17 that we raise those numbers.

18 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Right. Look,
19 I would certain say, for all of you who have firms
20 who are interested in doing business with DOT or
21 other City agencies, please let us know; I always
22 have my contracting staff available to meet with
23 firms to help them walk through our process, what our
24 upcoming jobs are, and what might be potential
25 contracting opportunities for them.

2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay,
3 that's what we're not gonna do on time. Council
4 Member Chin; followed by Council Member Williams;
5 followed by Council Member Treyger.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Chair.
7 Good afternoon Commissioner. I have three questions.
8 First, I was disappointed not to see my request for
9 the Lower Manhattan traffic and pedestrian safety
10 study in the Executive Budget. Lower Manhattan is a
11 growing residential population and we have hundreds
12 and hundreds of thousands of workers down here and
13 then all the tourists that's down here and the
14 streets are narrow and we have trucks parking on the
15 sidewalk; we have kids who have to walk out to the
16 street to get to school, and garbage piling up at all
17 these construction sites; not just new construction,
18 but renovation that's going on with converting these
19 office buildings into residential buildings. We need
20 a more comprehensive study, right, 'cause there are
21 studies being done on the **[inaudible]** zone, there are
22 studies done on Water Street, so we are looking at --
23 like, can we really do a comprehensive study? That's
24 one question. The other question; the biggest
25 problem I have down here is placard parking; NYPD,

2 courts, district attorney, everybody is coming here
3 and with a placard, they're parking on bus stops,
4 they're parking on fire hydrants, they're parking
5 sidewalks -- we've gotta put a stop to this, I mean
6 and a lot of them are fake things; some people just
7 even rolled up their jacket or put a little
8 handwritten note, and there are other ones that have
9 their license plate blocked off. Give them all a
10 ticket, okay; if they're on official duty, then let
11 them go fight it. But this has... we have to rein it
12 in, I mean we're... the streets are so narrow; we just
13 don't have space for that and that's why I support
14 the car sharing program, especially for agencies,
15 because even agency takes up like two blocks of
16 parking on Williams Street for the Department of
17 Sanitation. We just don't have the space down here;
18 that's my second question. And the third thing; I
19 saw that there is money in the Executive Budget, \$38
20 million, to deal with reconstruction of damages done
21 at the World Trade Center; I thought the World Trade
22 Center project is winding down, and now residents and
23 visitors, now we still have to deal with fixing up
24 the damages. So if you can explain a little bit
25 about that project. Thank you.

2 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Alright, let
3 me quickly tackle those three. And I apologize; I am
4 due at a press conference with the Mayor in Queens,
5 so I am gonna try and answer quickly, 'cause my boss
6 is also wanting my time today. I know you recently
7 met with our Manhattan Borough Commissioner, Luis
8 Sanchez; we are ready to commit from the DOT end
9 \$500,000 towards a traffic study for Lower Manhattan;
10 it's a very big project though to do all of Lower
11 Manhattan, so I think we're ready to work with you; I
12 think we need some participation on the Council side,
13 but we hear you loud and clear that we need to do
14 some analysis there. I think we are gonna need, in
15 terms of funding, to try and prioritize I think the
16 areas and the issues we most wanna tackle. On the
17 placards, you said.. [crosstalk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Well before, on
19 that, right..

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Yeah.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: it's just that all
22 of a sudden, like DOT, I know they reversed Beaver
23 Street because of the construction that's happening,
24 so it's piecemeal, so we really need to take a
25

2 comprehensive look and see how one [inaudible]...

3 [crosstalk]

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well as I say,
5 the agency is prepared to put some resources on the
6 table, but it's gonna need more resources than
7 \$500,000 to look at all Lower Manhattan, so maybe
8 that's something we can work on together. I like
9 that you said give all the placards tickets; that is
10 not DOT; I do not have ticket-writing authority; that
11 is NYPD. As part of the discussions we have been
12 having on placard abuse, which we certainly know is
13 rampant in Lower Manhattan; it's sort of rampant in
14 every borough, particularly around courthouses, but
15 Lower Manhattan. I think there is a new sensitivity
16 that it's an issue that we need to tackle and
17 Commissioner O'Neill I think has said publicly it's
18 something he wants to look at. It is a big
19 challenge; I'm not gonna lie.

20 I wanna get to what you said about City
21 agencies though. I do want you to know that at New
22 York City DOT, we are big users of car share and
23 there is a centralized initiative from City Hall and
24 DCAS to try and do more care share. So City agencies
25 are committed to trying to use it where they can.

2 But I would also note that you know my inspectors, my
3 engineers who are looking for traffic signals and
4 speed humps, my folks who are working on potholes and
5 other things, they do need to be citywide and they
6 need to respond quickly, so car share works in some
7 context, but I can't promise you that it's a way to
8 get rid of all City vehicles, 'cause I do,
9 particularly for folks who are doing inspection and
10 engineering and things out in the field, going
11 through all five boroughs, I do need to be able to
12 make sure they can get where they need to go in real
13 time. But I think we are committed and one of the
14 things I mention in my testimony is; the City is
15 committed to trying to engage in some citywide
16 reduction in the vehicle fleet, which will hopefully
17 be a small piece of helping to ease congestion,
18 particularly in your district where obviously you
19 have so many City agencies and therefore a lot of
20 City vehicles.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: World Trade Center.

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Oh World Trade
23 Center. Yes, on that project, actually, I may want
24 to let Elisabeth say a word on that. That's a City
25

2 commitment that's going with a much bigger federal
3 commitment.

4 ELISABETH FRANKLIN: [bell] Yes, we have
5 an additional \$153 million from the federal
6 government for the World Trade Center, still
7 reconstructing streets from that around this area,
8 [background comment] and that's an addition of \$38
9 million **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

10 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean you're
11 correct that a lot of work has been done there, but
12 look, it's tragic that after 9/11, you know, there's
13 still work need to be done there. I hear you that... I
14 know we have tried to work with you, and Luis Sanchez
15 has been very involved in trying to minimize the
16 aggravation of all this construction work for local
17 residents, and let's continue to do so, but
18 unfortunately, not all the work around the World
19 Trade Center is done yet.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Can you give us,
21 the Committee, in terms of a report on exactly what
22 does that entail, in terms of the World Trade Center
23 reconstruction project?

24 [background comments]

2 ELISABETH FRANKLIN: We can get

3 **[inaudible]** on that... [crosstalk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yeah, you can...

5 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: get back to us.

7 Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Council
9 Member Williams; followed by Council Member Treyger;
10 followed by Council Member Constantinides. We've
11 been joined by Council Member Levine, Constantinides,
12 Perkins, and Dromm.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you Madam
14 Chair. Thank you Commissioner. And also, I want to
15 shout out Keith Bray and his team from the borough,
16 they're excellent, Deputy Commissioner Claudette is
17 always very responsive, so I just wanna make sure I
18 shout out to that team, and thank you for things
19 you've done in my district.

20 I have one point that I wanna bring up,
21 which is the 25 miles an hour; we've had this
22 conversation before; I was opposed to it then, I'm
23 opposed to it now; I think more and more people are
24 beginning to see how bad it was to rezone the entire
25 city; I don't think we had to rezone the entire city,

2 I think we could have made sure some spots need to
3 flow quicker. It's come up yesterday in Borough Park
4 I think when some people were asking about Ocean Park
5 where I think there are other strips like that, and
6 it's very frustrating to me that we did that; I think
7 it's impractical to drive in certain places at 25
8 miles per hour; in fact, you practically freaking
9 [sic] can't drive at 25 miles per hour on places like
10 Ocean Parkway, so we shouldn't have done a full
11 citywide change. But my question has to do with --
12 one, I think we could've accomplished many of the
13 things we accomplished with Vision Zero, which I
14 think was a good goal, by lower some areas and
15 increasing the enforcement, which is what we did; I
16 think enforcement was more of a problem.

17 I do wanna get a handle on how much money
18 we're getting from these speed cameras, so do you
19 know how much money we've gotten in the past three
20 years from speed cameras?

21 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I've got
22 the speed camera revenue numbers here -- calendar
23 2016, around \$62.6 million; year-to-date, calendar
24 year 2017, \$24.5 million; calendar year 2015 was \$43
25 million. And you know, certainly I was at the

2 Mayor's town hall in Borough Park last night and I
3 will say the largest applause line in the whole night
4 was the discussion of Ocean Parkway and the speed
5 limit, and obviously there's been a lot of good
6 debate on it. I would say about Ocean Parkway; it's
7 a very challenging roadway; it's a roadway a lot of
8 people drive on, but it's also a roadway that a lot
9 of people live on, there are a lot of schools there,
10 there are a lot of seniors there and so trying to
11 balance those two sets of needs is a challenge; it's
12 been the fourth most dangerous roadway in Brooklyn,
13 with a pretty notorious history of fatalities and
14 serious injuries; its fatality rate per mile is
15 actually higher than Queens Boulevard. So it is a
16 roadway where there have been a lot of tragedies,
17 unfortunately, over the years. The challenge with
18 enforcement -- and it's funny; I was just up in
19 Albany; I was lucky that I got to go there with
20 Transportation Chief Thomas Chan -- is for NYPD, and
21 they've done a lot to step up enforcement, they've
22 basically doubled the amount of summonses they're
23 giving out for speeding and failure to yield, but
24 it's not something that's that easy for them to do on
25 a lot of city streets. If someone's speeding on a

2 city street and you're NYPD -- as Chief Chan was
3 saying up in Albany -- if someone's going 40 miles an
4 hour and you're trying to catch them in NYPD, you've
5 gotta go 50 miles an hour, and that brings a safety
6 issue -- you know, to be in hot pursuit of someone
7 speeding on city streets is not an easy thing for
8 NYPD to do; there are lots of streets where there are
9 not easy places for them to pull people over, and
10 it's very, very labor intensive for NYPD, as opposed
11 to, for example, using the cameras. When they pull
12 someone over, it takes time to write the ticket; they
13 often have to go to court, so I think they've been
14 doing a lot to step up enforcement, but it's not
15 practical that the entire... [crosstalk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: So...

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: speeding issue
18 can just be handled I think by NYPD... [crosstalk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Yeah, I'm
20 running out of time, so I'm sorry to interject, but
21 my believe is that Ocean Parkway and Queens Boulevard
22 and other places are a problem because people are
23 speeding, not because the speed limit was what it
24 was. I think people are not following the law, so
25 whether it's the camera or the police officer, I

2 think enforcing the speed limit is what the problem
3 was, and so I think bringing it down to 30,
4 **[inaudible]** 25 was better, and particularly, not
5 bringing it down to 25 in places like Ocean Parkway.
6 I believe that people are being hurt and killed,
7 unfortunately, is because people are speeding,
8 they're going past 25 and they're going past 30. So
9 I would like to see the data of what's happening now
10 in terms of the speeds and.. [interpose]

11 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well I can
12 give you, Council Member, in the time, on Ocean
13 Parkway, since we reduced the speed limit and put in
14 the speed cameras -- 2015 we've seen 41 fewer
15 injuries, so a drop of 39%; 11 fewer pedestrian
16 injuries, and 20... [interpose]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I got it; we
18 could've done that if we had gone to 10 miles per
19 hour also, but I just wanna see what the difference
20 would've been between say 25 or 30; also, we have
21 increased enforcement on those, and so the benefits
22 might've been achieved whether or not you brought it
23 down to 25 miles per hour and that's what my point
24 is, so we have the cameras there and we have the
25 enforcement and I think the enforcement is what we

2 should've focused more on as opposed to bringing it
3 down to 25 miles per hour across the entire city,
4 which is impractical.

5 I wanna continue this, but I know
6 everybody's on a time limit... [crosstalk]

7 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Right, and I
8 think [bell] I'll just add; I don't know that it's an
9 either or; I think we've done both, we've lowered the
10 speed limit and we've increased enforcement and I
11 think that's part of why we've had the three safest
12 years on our roadway in New York City's history and
13 we've bucked the national trend there... [crosstalk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. But
15 if we're going up in collecting fines, that's also a
16 problem also, because that means we're taking money
17 out of people's pockets and [background comment] may
18 not be changing all of the behavior we want. But I
19 can't continue now, but I'd love to continue this
20 **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

21 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Happy to
22 continue the discussion.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
3 you. Council Member Treyger; followed by Council
4 Member Constantinides.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Okay, thank you
6 very much, Chair and in the interest of time, I'm
7 gonna try to get my questions in all at once, so feel
8 free to respond after I get through with them.

9 I just want to first discuss an issue
10 that we haven't probably heard yet today, but the
11 issue of curbs and curb contracts; I find it
12 unconscionable that when we say that we are
13 resurfacing a street or fixing up a street that the
14 City of New York cannot also repair damage done to
15 curbs, and I share this because many of my
16 constituents, particularly in the Bensonhurst, Bath
17 Beach part, they have complained for years about very
18 poor streets; DOT says, okay, we'll work with you to
19 kinda get it resurfaced, but the curbs cannot be
20 repaired and damage is done to curbs when work is
21 done or by other utility companies doing work there,
22 and so residents are asking, rightfully so, why can't
23 we get the curbs repaired and the answer we got from
24 DOT was that, well we have not issued a curb contract

2 in a number of years. And so I would like some
3 follow-up on that.

4 The next issue -- I'll run through the
5 list and so if someone can just take notes on that, I
6 appreciate that -- The next issue, with regards to
7 the Bike Share program, Citi Bike or other forms that
8 your office is exploring, I raised concerns in the
9 Council and I raised them with you, to provide City
10 subsidies to a program that does not reach all
11 corners of the city, I take issue with that. We
12 can't be subsidizing certain things only in certain
13 parts of New York and leave out entire regions of the
14 city. The MTA will hear me afterwards speaking up
15 for southern Brooklyn; I'll speak up for southern
16 Brooklyn on this issue as well. I don't see that
17 program extending to all parts of the city. And when
18 I see people promote that there'll be discounts for
19 NYCHA residents, well in Brooklyn, for example, the
20 heaviest concentrations of NYCHA residents are in
21 Brownsville and Coney Island; I don't think there is
22 Citi Bikes or any type of proposals yet for these
23 neighborhoods. I could be wrong, but I'd be open to
24 hear your thoughts and ideas on that.

2 With regards to also sidewalk violations,
3 we're seeing an uptick of violations being issued to
4 homeowners where the sidewalks have recently been
5 repaired, but some companies doing work on the
6 street, leaving their tools or their supplies on
7 sidewalks, damaging it and later someone comes and
8 gives them a ticket and a violation and the pattern
9 seems to be going on over and over and over again,
10 and especially, also, sometimes when the Parks
11 Department drills those tree pits for planting new
12 trees, they damage the adjacent sidewalk and the
13 homeowner is then hit with a violation, which is
14 really not fair, Commissioner, to the homeowner.

15 Last two items -- I'm trying to get
16 through them all. The development of Coney Island, I
17 don't know about too many parts of the City of New
18 York where over 5,000 units of housing is imminent in
19 terms of development, and we appreciate the
20 investment to fix our sewers, but there is virtually
21 no plan to improve transportation. And I appreciate
22 the fact that you came down to Coney Island with me; we
23 walked around the neighborhood, but Commissioner,
24 this past Easter Sunday... this recent Easter Sunday --
25 and the season already has begun -- the volume is

2 tremendous and the NYPD, the residents, everyone is
3 pleading with us for a better transportation plan.
4 We were left out of the ferry plan, even though we're
5 being told we're being considered for the next round,
6 which again, how do we put thousands of units into
7 already a dense neighborhood and not think about
8 transportation? And there are also some minor tweaks
9 that we've been working with Commissioner Bray on --
10 and I wanna give him a shout-out as well, as Council
11 Member Williams did -- Commissioner Bray has been
12 very responsive to my office.

13 And the last thing, I just wanna give a
14 plug. As you're aware, my office, as well as the
15 offices of Council Members Matteo and Borelli, sent a
16 letter to the DOT in support of renaming one of the
17 Staten Island ferries after Detective Russell
18 Timoshenko, who was a NYPD officer who was brutally
19 murdered, but was a very well respected member of
20 this community and also very well respected leader in
21 the Russian-speaking community, and we'd just like to
22 know where that process is at. And I think I got all
23 my questions in on time **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

24 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: That's a lot
25 of questions and I apologize; I'm not sure I can

2 answer them all here, but whatever we can't do today,
3 we'll get back to you on. But let me take a couple
4 of them. I hear you on the curb issue; it is true,
5 it had not sort of been in the City's capital plan
6 for a long time, but we are working now the EDC on
7 potentially getting a curb contract so we'll be able
8 to come and do some of those repairs. And I would
9 say this; if there are particular spots where you
10 really see an urgency, and this is true also on the
11 sidewalk issues, you know work with Keith Bray, come
12 and tell us and let us see what we can do.

13 Let me jump to the bigger issue though of
14 transportation [bell] in Coney Island. I do actually
15 wanna circle with you back on that one in more
16 detail. You know we did get to walk your district
17 and I know obviously the City has big plans for that
18 area and you know there's ferry-wide service, and I
19 wanna talk about what else we can do, 'cause we
20 recognize that influx of people does require some
21 improvements in infrastructure, so let's make sure we
22 circle back on that.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Alright.
24 Commissioner, good to see you. I know I'm gonna be
25 very, very brief. So the ferry and Citi Bike, I know

2 we're slated in Astoria to see the ferry come in on
3 August 1st; what sort of timetable are we on to sort
4 of dovetail that with Citi Bike to make sure we have
5 a strong connection between both as we're rolling
6 them out?

7 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well and
8 actually, now I realize there was another question I
9 didn't answer of Council Member Treyger, so let me...
10 I'll do... [crosstalk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Oh I'm
12 sorry, **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I'll do the
14 Citi Bike for both of you... [crosstalk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I thought
16 we were done.

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: 'Cause Council
18 Member Treyger, you had said you don't wanna see it
19 subsidized when it doesn't reach the whole city, and
20 you know at the moment it's not subsidized, Citi Bike
21 is... there's no taxpayer dollars going into it; it may
22 have [sic] some DOT staff work on it, but it's a
23 privately run system and I think the question before
24 us and I think there's a real diversity of opinion on
25 the Council amongst your colleagues about whether to

2 put public investment or not and as I've been saying
3 in my testimony, there now are some new lower cost
4 models that are starting to emerge that are dockless
5 bikes and so there may be potentially a way to get
6 much further into the city if not into the whole city
7 without public dollars; I'm not sure yet; we're still
8 investigating all the different systems that are out
9 there, but it is... we certainly hear you and our long-
10 term goal is obviously to minimize taxpayer dollars
11 that would be invested in the system while maximizing
12 the reach of the system, so just so you know on that.

13 Okay, sorry, Council Member

14 Constantinides. So yes, ferry-wide service in
15 Astoria is starting -- what date? [background
16 comment] Yeah, August 1st. [background comment]
17 And I think working with Motivate -- unfortunately,
18 they are being a little... they've had I think some
19 equipment problems; they're a little delayed in when
20 they're installing Citi Bike, so I think they were
21 supposed to actually start in August; it sounds like
22 it's gonna be more like they're starting in
23 September, so I apologize it's not gonna be a perfect
24 match, but hopefully within a couple months we'll
25 have the expanded stations up there.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Alright.

3 And then the second question I have is around Astoria
4 Park and we were able to see a bike lane coming on
5 20th Avenue, a bike lane on Shore Boulevard and on
6 Hoyt Avenue North; all are in, working well; the
7 question I have is around some of the other
8 improvements we were looking for on 19th Street --
9 daylighting, speed bumps, trying to sort of, looking
10 at not only with the bike lanes, which were extremely
11 important to the entire traffic safety plan, but the
12 entire... looking at slow zones in northern Astoria;
13 where are we on those next steps, 'cause we're going
14 into the second summer since Betty Jean DiBiasco was
15 killed and we wanna make sure that, you know going
16 into this summer that we're gonna have a safer
17 Astoria Park area... [crosstalk]

18 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Yeah, let us...
19 Rebecca and I are saying, let us... we're gonna circle
20 back with Commissioner Garcia; I know she's been
21 looking at some of the things... those requests you
22 made, so let's circle back and get back to you
23 quickly on where they stand.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Okay.

2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND:

3 Excellent. He should get whatever he wants; he did
4 that before the five minutes. We are done. That
5 concludes the first part of today's budget hearings;
6 I know the Chair and I will both be getting you
7 questions that we wanted to ask in the second round..
8 [interpose]

9 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: And questions
10 obviously for the members who -- I apologize, since I
11 have to go... [crosstalk]

12 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND:

13 Absolutely.

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: obviously take
15 any other requests and questions.

16 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: We just
17 ask that you respond to this, because we need this
18 for adoption, so we're..

19 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Understood.

20 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: we need
21 those answered immediately. As a reminder to the
22 public, we invite you to testify on Thursday, May
23 25th, the last day of budget hearings; we will now
24 take a five-minute break before we hear from the Taxi
25

2 and Limousine Commission. Thank you again,
3 Commissioner Trottenberg.

4 [pause]

5 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: We will
6 now continue the 9th day of budget hearings with TLC
7 Commissioner Meera Joshi. The Finance Committee is
8 again joined by Chair Rodriguez and the
9 Transportation Committee. In the interest of time, I
10 will forego an opening statement and turn it over to
11 my co-chair, Chair Rodriguez.

12 [pause]

13 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you
14 Commissioner. As everyone knows, the TLC Commission
15 will discuss this budget, which is projected to be
16 \$53.3 million in FY 2018; the Commission will update
17 the Committees on its efforts to improve
18 accessibility **[inaudible]** licenses approved by the
19 State. Also, we would like to hear about the
20 enforcement rule and regulations by the Commission,
21 particularly the enforcement of service and refusal
22 in illegal pickups, specifically focusing on the
23 Midtown and the airport. So with that, we would like
24 to hear **[inaudible]**.

2 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: Good morning...

3 [interpose]

4 [background comment]

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I'm sorry...

6 [background comment]

7 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: Okay.

8 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Sorry.

9 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: It's okay.

10 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell
11 the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth
12 in your testimony before the committee today and to
13 respond honestly to council member questions?

14 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: I do. And I am with
15 Assistant Commissioner Vincent Chin, from our Budget
16 and Finance office, so I assume he'll swear to tell
17 the truth too... [crosstalk]

18 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CHIN: As well.

19 [background comment]

20 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: Thank you. Good
21 afternoon Chair Rodriguez and Chair Ferreras-Copeland
22 and members of the Transportation and Finance
23 Committees. I'm Meera Joshi, Commissioner and Chair
24 of New York City Taxi and Limousine Commission.
25 Thank you for inviting me to present the TLC's

2 proposed Executive Budget for FY 2018. With me
3 today, as I mentioned, is Vincent Chin, our Assistant
4 Commissioner for Finance and Operations.

5 The TLC's proposed budget is \$56.3
6 million, which will help the agency continue to
7 regulate New York City's growing for-hire vehicle
8 industry, ensure accessible for-hire transportation
9 for all New Yorkers, and improve and increase
10 enforcement efforts to better protect customers and
11 our licensed drivers.

12 As background for these important goals,
13 let me give you a quick update on our numbers. The
14 TLC now licenses over 160,000 drivers and over
15 100,000 vehicles; we're on track to receive 50,000
16 new driver license applications by the end of this
17 fiscal year, a 10% increase over the prior fiscal
18 year, and 35,000 new vehicle applications, a 31%
19 increase. We can expect continued high growth in the
20 for-hire vehicle market, even as we've heard from our
21 drivers that it becomes, and it is, increasingly
22 difficult to earn an adequate income driving.

23 At the Preliminary Budget hearing, I told
24 you that the TLC would be holding a public hearing on
25 industry economics on April 6. We did, and we had a

2 packed house for that hearing. We heard from dozens
3 and dozens of drivers and advocates on topics
4 including decreasing incomes, inability to meet
5 medallion loan payments, increasing vehicle expenses,
6 base commissions, and the need for more transparency
7 in driver recruitment and compensation.

8 As part of this process, the TLC is
9 exploring measures to address driver income and the
10 greater need for transparency in base driver
11 transactions. We recently received a petition for a
12 rule requiring car services' bases to allow
13 passengers to tip via their app rather than just in
14 cash and we will propose a rule with that effect this
15 summer. The rule will be subject to approval by our
16 commissioners after a full rulemaking process,
17 including notice and public hearing, but this is only
18 one step and we intend to do much more to ensure
19 earnings income and transparency for all of our
20 drivers.

21 As our new enforcement chief discussed
22 with you in March, the TLC is reviewing and reshaping
23 its enforcement strategies. Our officers are now
24 doing more evening shifts and increasing the number
25 of joint operations with police to cover hot spots

2 for illegal pickups, such as the airport and Midtown
3 hotels. In order to make these actions more
4 effective and in partnership with the Police
5 Department, we've been training and retraining our
6 enforcement officers in topics including car stops,
7 arrest procedures; the use of handheld devices for
8 summonsing. Our officers have also undergone
9 sensitivity training to ensure more productive
10 interactions with drivers and our officers will be
11 meeting with different groups of our licensees to
12 better understand how drivers experience enforcement.

13 Although it is early, we believe that
14 these changes are already making an impact. From the
15 beginning of 2017 through March 7th we conducted 48
16 joint operations with the NYPD and from March 8th
17 through mid-April we conducted an additional 142
18 operations. These 190 operations led to 647 car
19 stops and 957 summonses. As another example, in the
20 first four months of 2017 there has been a fivefold
21 increase in hustling arrests at the airports and a
22 15% increase in joint enforcement operations with the
23 PD.

24 To continue these efforts, we anticipate
25 another cadet class this September, but effective

2 enforcement will always be a challenge in such a
3 large city and as the number of licensed drivers and
4 vehicles increases, our enforcement efforts become
5 even more important.

6 As you may know, new state legislation
7 will permit app-based car services to operate
8 statewide beginning this July. The legislation
9 creates a separate regulatory framework under the
10 State Department of Motor Vehicles for companies and
11 drivers outside of the City. Although the new law
12 does not permit operators not licensed by the TLC to
13 pick up passengers in the City, it does allow them to
14 drop off passengers here and we anticipate an
15 increase in unlicensed for-hire drivers attempting to
16 do illegal pickups within the City. We've reached
17 out to the car service companies and DMV in an effort
18 to better understand how they intend to ensure that
19 these new drivers do not compete illegally within the
20 city.

21 And now I want to review our Executive
22 Budget for FY 2018, which totals \$56.3 million,
23 broken down into \$38.5 million in personal services
24 and \$17.8 million in other than personal services.
25 This total amount is \$1.8 million less than the

2 Preliminary Budget represented to you in March. The
3 decrease is attributable to a delay on on-boarding
4 new safety emissions inspectors; additionally, this
5 revised total budget amount represents a \$14.2
6 million decrease from TLC's FY 2017 budget, with the
7 bulk of that decrease attributable to scheduled
8 decreases in our green grant program.

9 Earlier I discussed our revised approach
10 to enforcement and those priorities are reflected in
11 the Executive Budget, including \$7.5 million in
12 capital funding for a new officer deployment center
13 in the Bronx, which will allow us to continue and
14 intensify our citywide enforcement operations during
15 a necessary rebuild of our Woodside facility. The
16 plan for rebuilt Woodside facility, which was
17 recognized this past week by the Public Design
18 Commission, will further the City's commitment to
19 reducing greenhouse gas emissions, resulting in a
20 building that uses almost 30% less energy.

21 Finally, our projected revenue budget for
22 FY 2018 of \$55.7 million has not changed from the
23 Preliminary Budget. This amount reflects the change
24 made in the Preliminary Plan to defer medallion sales
25 until FY 2019. In partnership with OMB, the TLC

2 continues to monitor market trends, the impact of
3 TLC's expansion of the licensing period from two to
4 three years, and the increased demand for licenses.

5 In this time of continued growth in the
6 industries we regulate, our challenge is to maintain
7 and improve our standards of customer service,
8 accessibility, safety, and accountability. Our best
9 tools to meet this challenge are licensing,
10 inspection and enforcement. We're grateful for our
11 partnership with the Transportation Committee under
12 the leadership of Chairman Rodriguez and so many
13 other Council Members. We look forward to continuing
14 to work with you as we expand and improve customer
15 service and seek to improve conditions for our
16 160,000 licensed drivers.

17 Thank you for the opportunity to testify
18 today and I'm happy to answer any questions you may
19 have.

20 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you
21 very much for your testimony. I had a few questions
22 and then we'll hear from Chair Rodriguez. The
23 Executive Fiscal 2018 budget, as expected, pushes
24 expected revenues from the sale of taxi medallions
25 out by one year so that no revenues from this source

2 are expected in Fiscal 2018; however, it doesn't
3 actually shift the expected amounts to be raised, it
4 just delays it. After what we've seen on the resale
5 market, what are your expectations or your plan? It
6 seem that we've been delayed -- since about 2014
7 we've been pushing this out, and do you plan on any
8 additional auctions in the immediate time?

9 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: The OMB monitor is
10 based on the aftermarket transactions that we
11 authorize and then we publish the sale prices that
12 are reported to us, so they monitor not only the
13 prices of those, but the frequency of those, as well
14 as foreclosures to make determinations about how to
15 time future sales, and their determination at this
16 point is to push it out, as you've mentioned. Our
17 primary goal, and I think the overall City's goal, is
18 about the service; we want to make sure that there
19 are yellow taxis out on the street providing service,
20 and the reason for that is beyond sort of the -- you
21 know, that's what tourists and residents have become
22 accustomed to, but they remain, the yellow taxi
23 sector remains the only publicly available,
24 completely publicly available, accessible, hailable
25 form of transportation with a price-certain fare,

2 because we regulate the meter. So it's important for
3 us to think about how the regulations that we have
4 now affect the ability of the yellow taxi sector to
5 continue, and in that vein, we've worked I think very
6 well with the Transportation Committee to deregulate
7 some of the ownership restrictions that cause a more
8 rigid market and one example being getting rid of the
9 distinction between an independent and a corporate
10 medallion. Another I think seismic change in
11 regulation on our level and on the Council level,
12 where we worked closely together, was to allow the
13 creation of a universal license. Before that, taxi
14 operators were limited to the pool of licensed taxi
15 drivers, which was small and overshadowed by the
16 amount of FHV drivers; that's now one pool, so those
17 160,000 drivers can drive in any sector and I think
18 many taxi fleets and garages and owners have seen
19 some migration with drivers that are driving yellow
20 taxis either for the first time or coming back, and
21 drivers ultimately drive the business; if there's not
22 someone behind the wheel, there will not be service.

23 But we wanna continue working with
24 Council as well as with the industry on ways that we
25 can make sure that regulations and local law are not

2 an impediment to business. But the business is
3 sizable; there have been significant drops in
4 business, but to give you some perspective; in 2016
5 the fare box was \$1.9 billion, and there's hundreds
6 and thousands of trips every day. So there is an
7 incredible opportunity that still exists that I don't
8 think is fully leveraged in the taxi market, and
9 number one; I would point to sort of a marriage
10 between technology and taxi. We've seen some of it
11 and we created the regulatory framework to allow apps
12 to be in taxi and we litigated for years to ensure
13 that they still are there, but I don't think that
14 we've fully seen the capability of those apps in the
15 taxi world. For example, on something like groups
16 rides, which many of the apps can seamlessly plan for
17 passengers now; there's no reason why that benefit
18 can't also be in the taxi space, and we ensure that
19 our regulations, again, are not inhibiting that kind
20 of growth.

21 So we'd love to continue to work with the
22 Council as well as our stakeholders to make sure that
23 we are making those pathways open to new investors
24 and new opportunity so that the taxi market can
25

2 remain a viable service for all our residents and
3 tourists.

4 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So do you
5 have a value present day of what these medallions are
6 valued at now?

7 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: We don't. We report
8 sales transactions and they fluctuate. So we
9 recently had a sale of \$241,000; that's an all-cash
10 sale, so as markets fluctuate, there's corrections
11 that are exaggerated on the high side and some, and
12 many, and I think I tend to agree; the \$1.3 million
13 was an overexaggeration on the high side; we don't
14 know if 241 is an overexaggeration on the low side;
15 is that really reflective of the actual cash flow,
16 given what we know about how much the fare box can
17 generate, and is it really accounting for more of a
18 discount because it's an all-cash sale. What's at
19 the heart of this is nobody wants to lend money on
20 medallions at this moment; that doesn't mean that'll
21 always be that way, but it is the current way and as
22 long as you can't get financing, you're limited in
23 your purchasing power to what you have on hand to pay
24 for something, and you know, look at houses, you know
25 I couldn't buy very much of a house if I couldn't get

2 a loan from a bank for the vast majority of that
3 expense, and that's the situation we are with the
4 medallion. So a lot of the value depends on the
5 ability of people to get financing and we've talked
6 to lots of banks, and especially more recently in the
7 last couple weeks, and I don't know when lending
8 practices will change.

9 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And it
10 comes back to the revenue number that we have that
11 keeps getting pushed out, of about a billion dollars;
12 at what point do you just say and acknowledge, you
13 know, if they can't get mortgages, and this is the
14 third, going on the fourth year that we're having
15 this conversation, at what point do you just -- I
16 don't wanna say admit, because that's not proper, but
17 just adjust the revenue potential for the out years?

18 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: I think... I mean
19 that's a very good question and we do rely heavily on
20 OMB to make those decisions and they look at the
21 numbers that we have, but I don't disagree that over
22 time there are gonna be adjustments to the budget
23 because things are different than they were when
24 those figures were originally set. I think that
25 there is probably a good amount of cautiousness about

2 how to adjust that, given the fact that there's been
3 wild differences in prices, to make sure that you get
4 close to what the right number is and that you also
5 don't send the wrong message by adjusting to a number
6 that isn't accurate. And I don't wanna speak for OMB
7 and I'm certainly not an economist, but I would
8 imagine that in this time they are having difficulty
9 settling on what that number is.

10 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Yeah and
11 I would agree; it just seems that, you know, we are
12 in a very strong fiscal time; we are seeing some
13 slowdown, so if this was the industry that didn't
14 pick up, even when the rest of the City was picking
15 up, it seems to me like that's a very big red flag
16 that there is something wrong within the industry.
17 So to kind of keep pushing out I don't think
18 necessarily helps; we've been kind of on an uptick
19 for a very long extended period of time; at some
20 point the economy is going to turn, and you know,
21 we'll follow up with the OMB director.. [interpose]

22 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: Absolutely. And I
23 imagine that there will be revisions to the budget as
24 they continue to reassess based on sales that we
25 report.

2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: I wanted
3 to pivot to e-hails, which is probably some of the
4 reasoning why we.. [crosstalk]

5 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: Uhm-hm.

6 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: have to
7 push these out to the out years. Over the last few
8 years we have been continuously increase [sic] in the
9 e-hail industry, both in the number of vehicles and
10 drivers; at the Preliminary Budget hearing there was
11 a long discussion between the chair and other
12 members; can you please share with the Committee your
13 recent assessment of the City's e-hail industry and
14 the anticipated impact on the overall taxi industry
15 for the long-term impact?

16 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: So by e-hail, I
17 assume that you're talking about the app services
18 that are in the black car and the livery industries..
19 [crosstalk]

20 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Right.

21 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: We call, when you
22 order a taxi by an app e-hail and we call that
23 something else, but..

24 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay,
25 alright.

2 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: but given that... So
3 what I testified in the beginning is really about
4 this significant increase in drivers and vehicles and
5 this isn't the first time I've sat before the Council
6 and talked about alarming rates of on-boarding
7 vehicles. So at over 100,000 vehicles and at over
8 160,000 drivers, we have tremendous, I think it's
9 fair to say saturation, because the passenger pie has
10 most certainly grown, but it is not infinite, so
11 there will not be, it seems from our vantage point, a
12 continuous stream of fares for each and every one of
13 these vehicles and drivers that are coming on, and
14 many of the drivers, either informally or formally,
15 through testimony or responses to surveys, say that
16 they do regard this as their full-time job, so this
17 isn't something that they're coming in to do for a
18 few hours. And we had a hearing on April 6th that
19 really I think highlighted the crux of what's
20 happening with this growth, and that is that drivers
21 are feeling the pinch. The companies aren't so much
22 feeling the pinch and the passengers are enjoying the
23 competition for lower fares, because they're paying
24 less and less to get around in what, you know
25 transportation experts may say is not the most

2 efficient way; a single-occupancy vehicle in a
3 crowded city, but the drivers are feeling the pinch.
4 And the work that I think is ahead of us that's
5 crucial is understanding how to protect driver
6 earnings, and from that cascades a lot of other
7 effects, but the crux of the matter is; we as a city
8 can't support an industry that is making money off of
9 drivers not being able to earn a fair and livable
10 amount of money, and it's a complex task, so you
11 know, especially when these are not sort of the
12 normal hourly employee wage questions that people
13 look at; it's a completely uncharted territory in
14 some ways. But not exactly for us, 'cause we've done
15 it for tax drivers in the past; when we set a lease
16 cap and we set a fare, we set the minimum amount that
17 a driver can make on a shift, and we say that they,
18 you know they have rights and redress if the owner
19 charges them or overcharges them.

20 So that's a lot of the work that's ahead
21 of us, given that there is no similar mechanism in
22 the FHV sector to cap growth; there is in medallions,
23 there's a certain amount of medallions that we can
24 issue; there are in commuter vans; there are in green
25 taxis... [interpose]

2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Everyone
3 else has it except for this industry.

4 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: Right, and this
5 industry doesn't have it, and the effect is I think
6 on the drivers and their earnings, and that's where
7 our focus has to be.

8 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Well... and
9 I understand that, but all that is real day every day
10 that we experience, especially in East Elmhurst. I
11 am a stone stone's throw away from LaGuardia Airport;
12 I can get any of those e-hail apps -- I don't know if
13 that's a word -- wait; I don't know if... you
14 understand what I mean... [crosstalk]

15 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: Yeah, exactly..

16 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: I can
17 open my phone..

18 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: Yeah.

19 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: and see..

20 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: Exactly.

21 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: and map
22 out, and in my area there will be at any given time
23 30-40 cars on the app..

24 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: Absolutely.
25

2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: that are
3 just driving around or worse, idling, in front of the
4 homes of the people, my constituents, right by
5 LaGuardia Airport; we've asked the e-hail companies
6 to create some type of fencing, geofencing, and
7 nothing has been done; there is a huge problem in the
8 communities, especially those communities that have
9 -- you know, we see it around Citi Field when it's
10 U.S. Open time; you can do the same thing in the
11 park; wherever there's events, all of a sudden this
12 becomes -- because there is no limit to the amount of
13 cars, it just seems that the industry just floods,
14 'cause everyone's looking for a ride; they flood to
15 one location, and it just seems like I can never get
16 a clear answer. And you know I've engaged with your
17 agency before and you'll send out a couple of
18 enforcement guys, and it's almost like -- you send
19 them out one day and then they're right back.

20 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: Yeah, I mean part of
21 it is, and I think I testified to this, you know the
22 City is larger than our enforcement staff can ever
23 actually address, in terms of illegal activity. But
24 what you've described also is people that are in your
25 community that maybe are loitering or they're causing

2 some other kinds of disturbances as they're waiting
3 for different rides to come through. I know you've
4 brought that to our attention in the past, and you
5 know, so graphically as urine bottles in people's
6 front yards, and we do what we can. We have a staff
7 of, you know, about 200 inspectors, so you can
8 imagine how thinly spread we are throughout the city;
9 we tried to raise it with the local precinct, because
10 they are the presence in your community.. [crosstalk]

11 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Right,
12 but I don't want... I...

13 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: but it's difficult
14 to always get that.. [crosstalk]

15 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Right.

16 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: follow-through.

17 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And to be
18 honest with you, I don't want my local precinct to be
19 policing the black cars or the cab industry, right;
20 like I feel that you should have enough of that staff
21 and we should support you in creating an enforcement
22 arm, 'cause clearly, 200 is not enough and it may
23 have been enough when it was just the yellows and you
24 know, a couple of the other mom and pop taxi cabs
25 that were more traditional; it just seems that your

2 agency hasn't kept up to pace with what the e-hail
3 industry is causing in New York City, and when I see
4 that you propose a savings plan that really just
5 delays some hiring that you haven't been able to do,
6 I guess I would want to know; what are those hiring
7 positions that you haven't been able to hire for?

8 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: Well one of the main
9 ones -- and I'll let Vincent give you some more
10 detail -- is that we brought in a new chief of
11 enforcement, which already has made a difference in
12 our effectiveness, and that's by redeploying staff
13 strategically focusing on the hot spots like the
14 airports and surrounding neighborhoods, but also in
15 doing that, recognizing that better training makes a
16 better enforcement, and there are certain major
17 things that our inspectors need to be trained and
18 retrained on. For example, there is a new approach
19 to car stops; all our inspectors do every day is car
20 stops; if they're not trained on what the latest
21 advice and training and counsel is on how to safely
22 conduct a car stop; we're at a disadvantage. And
23 getting that up and running and on par has caused us
24 to delay bringing on the next class a little bit.
25 But I'm gonna let Vincent give you some of the

2 numbers and months, so we're sort of delaying a
3 little bit the hopes of a longer term benefit of a
4 better qualified and larger enforcement force.

5 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CHIN: So the plan
6 that we have now is we will be recruiting a new cadet
7 class; we're hoping for 80 officers, to start in
8 September, rather than at the beginning of the year.
9 So that's what's reflected in the citywide savings
10 plan.

11 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So does
12 this bring your enforcement unit to 280 or is there
13 attrition that you're making up for?

14 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CHIN: We're
15 hoping that it will bring us up to around 250-260.

16 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: And these are people
17 that are on a civil service list, so recruitment is
18 really calling them off of the list.

19 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Right.
20 And ideally -- you're the visionary for the agency;
21 that's your responsibility -- how many enforcement
22 officers would you need, ideally, to be able to man
23 the number of cabs that we license in the city?

24 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: I am not prepared
25 today to give you a number, but I can say what we

2 aspire to is to be as effective as possible. There's
3 a lot of ways you can do enforcement -- I think you
4 mentioned one of them -- that are a lot more
5 effective than boots on the ground -- geofencing, for
6 example. So with the new state law, New York City's
7 carved out, but with people in this business in all
8 of our surrounding counties and knowing that New York
9 City is the passenger-rich density that it is, it is
10 highly attractive for people to come in, drop off a
11 passenger and hang around to work illegally.
12 Geofencing can be applied; any of those companies
13 that are operating statewide can be required to
14 geofence out New York City; they can also be
15 penalized on a company level if any of the drivers
16 associated with their app are found operating
17 illegally in New York City, and these are the kinds
18 of measures that I'd like to focus on, and would love
19 any of your support in those endeavors, because
20 people... boots on the ground will always be helpful,
21 but those are the kind of changes that globally, and
22 with one effort, affect a lot more and send a
23 stronger message I think at the company level, where
24 it needs to be in order to ensure better enforcement
25 and better preservation of the standards that we have

2 held and I think we all believe are very important
3 for safety and consumer protection in New York City.

4 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So are
5 you working at all with the Port Authority? Because
6 as we go through this construction at LaGuardia
7 Airport, this ten-year project, traffic is only
8 getting worse, and one of the large contributors to
9 the conditions of traffic in the surround area and
10 within our area is your industry, either e-hail,
11 black car, limousines, yellow cabs; you name it,
12 they're all kind of going through one entrance,
13 essentially, which is 94th Street, which has two
14 little roads, one that goes in and one that comes out
15 and that's it, and it just seems that we haven't
16 figured out a way to mitigate the impact this is
17 having in the community, and it is both unfair, but
18 it seems that it's not going to get any better. So
19 what is your engagement with the Port Authority in
20 reference to this? And look, it's an issue for my
21 constituents, but it's an issue for everyone's
22 constituent that's trying to get to LaGuardia
23 Airport, because I literally saw people -- and I just
24 told this to the Commissioner -- people got off on
25 Junction Boulevard, on my way home; they were like

2 walking two blocks, from two blocks away just to get
3 to the airport and this was last Thursday.

4 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: We're in regular
5 contact with the Port Authority and acutely aware of
6 the circumstances that you've described, and
7 encourage them to sort of work with us to get better
8 through-put, which is better flow in and out, because
9 what you described is like a bottleneck. One of the
10 ways we can help them is we have trip data, so we can
11 show them the volumes of pickups and drop-offs that
12 are happening at LaGuardia so that there's some sense
13 of how much of a volume that their roadways need to
14 handle, and we'd also like to better coordinate with
15 them and message out to the industry when are the
16 times of high necessity and low necessity so if there
17 are cars going there, they're targeted at the times
18 that passengers really need pickups and drop-offs.
19 So I think I can say that in my time at the TLC we
20 probably have a closer relationship than we've ever
21 had with the Port Authority to try to untangle some
22 of these very difficult problems. But we are in
23 constant contact with them, especially on another
24 sort of quality of life issue that affects, as you
25 say, everybody's constituents who go to the airports,

2 and that's illegal hustlers at the airports,
3 especially at LaGuardia, and the first time that
4 we've had a presence at LaGuardia began in 2016 and
5 it's only increased in 2017 and the arrests that
6 we've done there have been growing every month. So I
7 think it's a combination of working with the data so
8 that they understand what the high points and low
9 points are of our traffic and how to adjust roadways
10 to accommodate that, and also working one what is a
11 nuisance for passengers and for the legal drivers
12 that come in to service those passengers, and that's
13 the illegal operations at the airports.

14 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: I wanted
15 to pivot to accessibility; can you tell us the total
16 number of extensions and waivers that the Commission
17 has issued to date and where are their plans to
18 provide additional extensions and waivers for the
19 future in reference to the wheelchair accessibility
20 of 2020?

21 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: In the yellow cabs?

22 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Yes.

23 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: Today I don't have a
24 figure, but I can absolutely get you that; there's no
25 waivers; everybody who is required to put an

2 accessible vehicle on must put an accessible vehicle
3 on; the waiver is a waiver of instead of putting on
4 the NV200 accessible vehicle, you get a waiver to put
5 on a different kind, like a Toyota Sienna accessible
6 vehicle, so those don't change the requirement that
7 you must. We have always had a rule on our books
8 that individual medallion owners, many of them who
9 are going through hardships, can apply for a hardship
10 extension and then they show us financials of why
11 they're in a hardship situation; for those that
12 driver personally, if there's a medical issue that
13 affects their ability to buy a new car. So our legal
14 division looks at each one of those applications,
15 looks at all the submissions; often asks for
16 additional submissions, and then based on the
17 circumstances presented in the hardship waiver, they
18 may give them an extension for up to a year that they
19 have to bring on a new vehicle. That's, you know,
20 sort of breathing room in a climate where -- as you
21 started with the discussion, these are very difficult
22 times for many medallion owners. So we have got to
23 be able to be empathetic to both situations -- we
24 want to get our accessible vehicles on the road and
25 we're dealing with owners that may not be in the best

2 financial situation at this current moment. But I'm
3 proud to say we have 1,700 -- is that correct? --
4 [background comment] accessible.. 1,700 accessible
5 yellow taxis on the road; we are in complete
6 compliance and somewhat over our 50% accessibility
7 mandate per our settlement, and I think even more
8 than that, we have a system called Citywide Dispatch
9 where -- I'm sorry, it's not Citywide yet; it will
10 be, hopefully by the end of this year, but Manhattan
11 Dispatch, where we dispatch accessible taxis to
12 passengers who need them. That fulfillment rate is
13 at almost 90%, which is a great response rate; that
14 means if you order one, 90% chance one's gonna get
15 there; it's gonna get there in less than 11 minutes,
16 and the uptake of passengers utilizing this service
17 increases every month. It tells us that there's a
18 lot more people out there that need accessible
19 service than we knew about and going forward, it's
20 hard for us to make policy based on sort of perceived
21 demand for this service, because people who have
22 never had the ability to use it; we don't know what
23 their demand is. So I think it's an encouraging sign
24 for the program and I'm excited to roll it out

2 citywide and let the rest of the city get the
3 benefits of this program.

4 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: It just
5 seems that there is a demand and I can totally see
6 that you're gonna see the increase of it, but at what
7 point -- I don't see how the yellow cab industry
8 strengthens itself; I'm not an expert; you might be
9 able to see that.

10 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: Strengthens itself
11 with...

12 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: In the
13 fact that you know that the medallions will be worth
14 more, that people will be able to afford them...

15 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: There are some
16 income streams that come from having an accessible
17 taxi that are not available for a standard taxi. One
18 big one comes from a 30 cent passenger surcharge, so
19 every accessible taxi owner gets \$30,000 towards the
20 purchase of their car and then maintenance of their
21 car over the next four years. There is also a
22 partnership with the MTA and it's still in, you know,
23 its beginning stages; bringing some of the Access-A-
24 Ride customers into taxis, which gives them
25 additional streams of income; those are fares they

2 wouldn't normally get through a street hail; it's a
3 very small-scale now, but at least one of the app
4 vendors has been an active participant and put a lot
5 of time and resources in it, and I think that the
6 initial responses from customers and from the MTA
7 have been very positive, so I'd like to see that
8 grow. So those are ways to add income to the
9 medallion market that maybe are not our traditional
10 thoughts on where money comes for a taxi, but they
11 are certainly needed and they're certainly a resource
12 we have and we only to hope to support those avenues
13 more than ever.

14 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Great.
15 Thank you so much... [crosstalk]

16 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: You're welcome.

17 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Chair
18 Rodriguez.

19 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you
20 Chair. Commissioner, thank you for your leadership
21 in this agency that especially at this time is, you
22 know, has a lot of challenges, because the industry
23 has been going through so many changes. And you
24 know, as New Yorkers, we always welcome the new
25 player to this industry and I know that we are

2 responding to our consumer, one, which is like, they
3 would like to have a... see an improvement in the
4 services that they want. However, no doubt that the
5 improvement of those services cannot be by the
6 traditional taxi services; in this case, the yellow
7 taxi that is the icon of our city, being a process
8 that we can witness for them to be destroyed, and I
9 think that, you know, this is not just a person who
10 owns 1,000 medallions, or whoever owns 500
11 medallions; this is about the 6,000 individual
12 medallion owners who use the value of those
13 medallions to get a mortgage to pay the houses, and
14 when you look at the **[inaudible]** Credit Union and see
15 how fast [sic] their life has been going through
16 right now, because many of those medallions, they've
17 been going... you know, losing value. So... and we... I
18 can say that we've been partners, you know trying to
19 help as much as we can under our responsibility, and
20 you know I have the great opportunity to lead those
21 bills that we passed at the Council that made the
22 transactions or the selling of medallions more easy
23 for an individual to a corporation, and also, we
24 worked together in the bill also that I was able to
25 introduce; we also passed it here at the Council,

2 supported by you and this administration, creating
3 the universal license. But my question... my concern
4 is; we have to do more, you know every day there's a
5 new car, medallion that is parked in a garage and the
6 driver, the owner of the medallion, is not able to
7 see an interest from the market to say there is a
8 number of drivers that they are renting our cars, and
9 I believe that once -- we owe them, we owe it to the
10 yellow taxi industry, because they've been there; we
11 sold them that dream that when they will buy a
12 medallion, they will have exclusive to do a pickup,
13 especially in the Midtown and the airports. And you
14 know we don't control, like technology is there, and
15 I believe that even the coming or the 75 apps
16 companies that... company that we have, unless we have
17 more subscribe in the last couple of months, but that
18 number... that's the one that we usually share; I don't
19 know if there's more -- happy to hear, but focusing
20 on the 75 companies, which is not only Uber, Lyft or
21 Via, but the other 72, you know they have the right
22 to be there, but we have real concern when what we
23 established as a yellow taxi industry to be the one
24 that has exclusive, especially in Midtown and the
25 airport; that's not happening as it was established,

2 and I believe that we have too many, we've been given
3 too many licenses. I don't know if there's a point
4 that we definitely have to put a cap and a cap that
5 will be better for everyone; I think that it will
6 increase the value for those companies; it also will
7 be good even for the livery who is able to drive for
8 12 hours and probably the market will create an
9 interest from the other drivers to say, I would like
10 to rent the other 12 hours. So are we like... are we
11 gonna be, you know keeping working, saying that we
12 should not put a cap or have you had some internal
13 conversation or are we open to have this conversation
14 on how many more are we gonna be... how many more
15 permits and licenses, TLC licenses are gonna be given
16 without looking at, are we having too many cars, more
17 than what we need in the city?

18 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: Like I described,
19 there are these growth mechanisms in other sectors;
20 when it comes to the FHV sector, and this is sort of
21 a flashback to two years ago, the agency, TLC does
22 not have the authority to limit the number of
23 vehicles. Under State Law, that authority lies
24 solely with City Council, so it would be a City
25 Council determination of whether or not to limit

2 vehicles in the FHV sector; it's not something the
3 TLC can do.

4 As far as growth, I think we are
5 concerned, and you mentioned this too, that it's
6 really also how does it affect the drivers that are
7 buying sometimes vehicles to enter this market and
8 now have vehicle payments as well as seeing
9 commissions being raised and fares being lowered, you
10 know, the conflux of those does not economically work
11 out well for them. Out of the -- and this is sort of
12 an impressive and disheartening figure in some ways,
13 but out of the last two years that we've brought on
14 new cars, 10,000 of the 11,000 of the cars brought in
15 2015; 10,000 of the 11,000 brought in in 2016, were
16 brand new cars, so somebody's paying for those cars;
17 if they're about \$25,000 each, that's half a billion
18 dollars worth of new cars. And you know we don't
19 know for certain who paid for those, but we do hear
20 anecdotally from a lot of the drivers that they're in
21 vehicle financing arrangements, so there's some
22 portion of that that's borne by drivers, certainly.
23 And that's of tremendous concern to us as a
24 Commission.

2 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: When it comes
3 to the livery, and I know that you've been also
4 implementing a law that we have produced at the
5 Council, but I also know that we've been having
6 conversations after we passed a law, which is about
7 the one where, in this case, for the livery taxi
8 drivers, those who, after paying a fine, after
9 getting a fine from the Department of Motor Vehicles,
10 they also have the additional fine that we
11 established from the TLC, but the concern is that,
12 you know the additional fine that they pay is too
13 high, and I also know that we've been having
14 conversations too and that you've been open to say we
15 should, you know open to talk about it. But is this
16 something that also we can definitely make some
17 progress to look at those additional fines that a
18 livery taxi pay by the TLC after they already paid
19 from the Motor Vehicles?

20 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: We have been looking
21 at it and you're correct; it's a local law, the
22 Critical Driver Law, and there are fines that are set
23 in the local law; we do offer settlements and we have
24 been open to sort of looking at what the right
25 number, in terms of the amount of penalty paid as a

2 settlement. But I think there's another important
3 change that we made in our rules that affect how many
4 people are paying this fine, because at the end of
5 the day, this is about changing behavior; not
6 collecting money, and we had a rule that said, you
7 get a certain amount of point deductions if you take
8 a defensive driving course within a certain period,
9 but under the old rules, if you got a summons from us
10 saying you met and surpassed the point threshold and
11 you were now subject to penalty; you could not longer
12 go in and take that defensive driving course to
13 reduce the points if you hadn't already. We altered
14 that because we would really prefer people get the
15 benefit of that educational course rather than
16 extracting money, so we now said we're giving you the
17 summons; you've either met or exceeded the point
18 level, you're subject to penalty; if you haven't
19 taken the point reduction course, you still can up
20 until the date of your hearing, and if you give me
21 one second, I can give you a figure that I think
22 illustrates how that has helped people who are facing
23 CD [sic] summonses, or if you don't wanna wait for
24 it, I can always supply it afterwards. But
25 basically, it means thousands of people are taking

2 the course before their hearing and they're no longer
3 subject to the summons or the penalty, but I think
4 the upside for all of us that are interested in
5 Vision Zero is they've gotten that extra education
6 about defensive driving, which goes to the culture
7 change that we would really prefer to see rather than
8 a revenue collection.

9 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: We can, you
10 know, continue this conversation and be able to
11 revise those laws that we have produced or some other
12 rule that TLC already internally you have passed.

13 With the 18,000 borough taxi license for
14 the green taxis, how many have been sold and how many
15 do you have available?

16 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: I'm gonna let
17 Vincent answer that question.

18 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CHIN: So a total
19 of 8,271 have been sold and so that's out of the
20 total of the 18,000.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So there's
22 10,000?

23 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER CHIN: Yes.
24
25

2 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. And is
3 that the case that there's no interest by drivers of
4 the market to buy those additional 10,000?

5 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: The numbers that
6 were set in the State Law were numbers, right? I
7 don't know that they reflected market demand, so what
8 we see now is a reflection of market demand and
9 market interest in there. That there are licenses
10 that are unsold is simply a reflection that people
11 maybe are okay with the number that they have now
12 that are out in service today. So the opportunity's
13 always there to buy more; it's been opened up so that
14 you don't even need to be a license FHV driver in
15 order to buy them. There are some restrictions that
16 make it cumbersome to own them, they're in the State
17 Law; you're limited to only owning one; if you own
18 accessibles, you're limited to only owning five; we
19 see what the rise of apps that the ability to have a
20 significant number of cars managed by one entity is
21 definitely a market advantage, but the green taxi law
22 doesn't make that possible because of the ownership
23 limitations, just like that independent corporate
24 ownership limitations has a stifling effect probably
25 on the medallion market to some extent. So those

2 factors may be a reason why they would dampen
3 interest in the green taxi permits, but on the other
4 hand, it may also be reflected of the actual need out
5 there for green taxis.

6 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But there is
7 10,000 right now that TLC controls?

8 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: Absolutely.

9 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay.

10 Enforcement -- so far how do you compare last year to
11 this year (2016-2017) when it comes to summons that
12 drivers have been getting for illegal street hail or
13 illegal pickup in the JFK, LaGuardia and Midtown?

14 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: So let me speak to
15 JFK and LaGuardia. First of all, I'm proud that we
16 have a presence in LaGuardia; something we did not
17 have two years ago, and we had in 2016 and we have
18 even more today, and if you compare even our numbers
19 of our airport summonsing activity between 2016 and
20 2017, we've increased at least 100 per month in the
21 amount of summonsing that we're doing at the
22 airports, and I gave you the arrest numbers in my
23 testimony; that's in part because we're working more
24 closely with the Port Authority and we're there and
25 we're there at the times that really matter. So

2 changing the way we deploy really affects our ability
3 to get at the times that hustlers are there most
4 often. And overall, in terms of summoning, we've
5 certainly seen an increase in our summoning from
6 2016; we are not quite at the level we were at in
7 2015, but 2015 is a year that predated I think the
8 decision that you're familiar with that really
9 dampened our ability to enforce the Harrell decision,
10 but we are back in the right direction and we have
11 also rolled out a program to work on forfeiture of
12 vehicles, which will be low in number but high in
13 deterrent effect, and as that starts to ramp up, I
14 think that will be an extremely helpful enforcement
15 tool, because under that scenario, we don't just
16 seize a car, we take it and it gets sold and the
17 owner never gets it back.

18 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And I assume
19 [sic], right, that it is for the benefit of all
20 sectors, right, to address illegal street hail, even
21 if it's an app company or say... because I assume if it
22 is an app company, those drivers who do the legal
23 one, they are now providing the additional revenue,
24 because they are not using the app. So when you look
25

2 at those numbers in Midtown, have you compared how
3 many of those are app companies versus other drivers?

4 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: We can definitely
5 get to you the number of summonses that are to
6 licensees that are operating illegally and what basis
7 those licensees' cars are affiliated with; I think
8 that might answer your question. But another tool
9 that Council created is the local law that increased
10 the penalties for people doing that kind of work in
11 Midtown and at the airport, so I think that's a
12 helpful deterrent as well.

13 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I agree and
14 with your support and my colleague here; I am the one
15 who also introduced the law that bring up to \$10,000,
16 the fine for the illegal **[inaudible]** especially in
17 those areas.

18 Entrapment -- as you know, we've been
19 dealing with those situations and there's not -- I'm
20 a bit proponent of Vision Zero and I'll take any
21 recommendation suggestion that I will make will not
22 put in risk the life of pedestrians and cyclists in
23 the City, so even when I talk about revising those
24 fines that drivers are getting by the TLC, that we
25 empower TLC to do it, but also, the period of time

2 that we're talking about revising those, but I also
3 have issue, and we agree, on working, again in
4 conversation, that there's an issue of entrapment in
5 New York City; that the TLC men and women who are
6 sent to go after drivers who do illegal street hails,
7 they should identify drivers who do illegal street
8 hails, but we need to stop the behavior of anyone
9 that works for the TLC that stands on the corner
10 asking a driver for their services and then suddenly
11 giving a ticket to that driver. Is that something
12 that you have identified that TLC; is that something
13 that is happening? You know we would definitely work
14 to stop it.

15 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: We have two things;
16 one, we encourage anybody who experiences something
17 that they believe is entrapment to contact not our
18 enforcement division; they can contact our legal
19 division, where we have a group that looks at our own
20 employees' behavior and disciplines them accordingly
21 if they find out that they're not acting as they
22 should. But as part of our training, two parts that
23 I think are very important are sensitivity training,
24 so that people have an understanding and empathy for
25 the people they are dealing with in the street. But

2 second was on entrapment and what constitutes
3 entrapment, and then the other flip side of that is;
4 what are the pieces to establishing that there has
5 been an illegal street hail. And I think that that
6 training, especially as administered under our new
7 chief, is taken very seriously and that message is
8 brought home to all of our officers. So I'd also
9 encourage you, that if any of your constituents bring
10 that complaint, please forward it directly to me so
11 we can investigate, and we will continue to
12 periodically train and retrain our inspectors on
13 proper conduct in the field.

14 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I think that
15 we should and I will say, again, I'm always open to
16 work with you very closely; we should even consider
17 to give like a refund for drivers this year they can
18 prove that they've been fined by TLC as a result of
19 entrapment. In the last... [crosstalk]

20 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: In most cases... I'm
21 sorry. In most cases, that summons would be
22 withdrawn. If we found that there was anything wrong
23 with the issuance of the summons, it would be
24 withdrawn and that is part of the... yeah, that is
25 part... [crosstalk]

2 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah.

3 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: of the process.

4 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I... I... you know
5 recently we passed a law here at the Council on
6 entrapment happening in the grocery store by those
7 cases where a minor was used to put like a can of
8 beer on top of the desk and throwing the money and
9 the grocery store owner here, he was fined. So just
10 want to be sure, and again, I will be with you 100%
11 when it comes to improving safety, but I want to be
12 sure that the driver... the driver should not be the
13 one that has to prove that that's happening. I just
14 hope that there would be consequence on the TLC if
15 anyone is doing entrapment because he or she wants to
16 make the number, so I... I **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

17 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: Absolutely, we're in
18 complete agreement with you on that. And I just
19 wanna reiterate; please send any complaints that you
20 have of that nature to us so we can deal with them.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And my last
22 one is Access-A-Ride; even though we will hear from
23 MTA, but this is, you know a multimillion dollar fund
24 that we have; what the City also contributes; a lot
25 of complaints by senior citizens, and I think that

2 this is... and I also... we heard from you and the MTA in
3 the past; there have been conversations going on on
4 how you know the City's drivers, they should take...
5 the taxi drivers, from all sectors -- yellow, green,
6 apps; livery -- they should take advantage of Access-
7 A-Ride. So is there any progress in conversations
8 between TLC and the MTA that we can one day wake up
9 and say there's a reform of Access-A-Ride where we
10 are improving and we are also creating opportunity
11 for those drivers who are licensed by the TLC to take
12 advantage of that market?

13 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: There is, there is
14 collaboration between TLC and the MTA and they're
15 currently working with taxi cabs, as well as the
16 black car. I think they've taken a very smart
17 approach to this by doing dispatch through apps only
18 so that that way the MTA can sort of act as the
19 corporate client; it's a lot more seamless for the
20 MTA to administer and for the app companies that work
21 in taxi and the app companies that work in the black
22 car sector and the livery sectors to adapt to. So I
23 am happy to report that those initial testings of
24 this collaboration, the results have been very good;
25 not only has the service been provided, but the

2 passengers are comfortable and happy with the service
3 that's being provided. So I look forward to seeing
4 this grow; I agree with you -- I talked about 100,000
5 vehicles on the road -- there needs to be better
6 utilization of these vehicles, especially those that
7 are able to bring wheelchair passengers from one
8 place to another; there's no reason for the City or
9 the State to spend for additional wheelchair
10 accessible vehicles. So we hope to see this
11 partnership grow and I don't have any indication that
12 it won't.

13 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Well I just
14 hope that from the pilot to a permanent reform of
15 Access-A-Ride all sectors get involved. I believe
16 that there is more... it's the average of half a
17 billion dollars and the senior citizens and
18 individuals with disabilities, they are there and
19 they provide the demand for the services. I just
20 hope that there's no one particular sector that
21 monopolizes that service. I just hope from the pilot
22 to permanent there should be opportunity from the
23 apps, from the livery, from the green, and from the
24 yellow to take advantage of that market.

2 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: I believe that's
3 also a concern of the MTA, so they've opened it up to
4 anyone who wants to participate in this process and I
5 think they have achieved diversity in getting a cross
6 section of industry players to participate.

7 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

8 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: You're welcome.

9 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you
10 Chair. We've been joined by Council Members Chin and
11 Cornegy; now we will hear from Council Member
12 Richards.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you so
14 much Chairs and thank you, Commissioner. Just a few
15 questions on enforcement. So can you just speak to
16 where enforcement looked like, and obviously, my
17 colleague, Council Member Miller, I'm not sure if he
18 was here and raised this already, but -- on dollars
19 vans, which always have been -- at least the illegal
20 vans have always been a headache, not only in our
21 district but in other members' districts as well. So
22 can you speak to enforcement numbers from last year
23 to this year; seizures compared to this year from
24 last fiscal year? And I'm raising this because I
25 think in your testimony you alluded to having more

2 vacancies than anticipated when it came to
3 inspectors, and I'm not sure if this relates to
4 dollar vans, and I'm assuming it does, so I'm trying
5 to understand if you have vacancies and we're not
6 seeing inspector levels that we would love to see in
7 the outer boroughs; why weren't these positions
8 filled in a greater capacity to ensure that we can
9 receive the enforcement that our communities have
10 been calling for?

11 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: We do have
12 vacancies, and as Assistant Commissioner Chin
13 testified, we are bringing on a new class in
14 September, so there's some delay because we wanted to
15 ensure that we had the property training in place,
16 because we can put a lot of people out on the street,
17 but if they're not trained well, they're not
18 effective. But I am happy to report that with some
19 of the changes in management and changes in
20 strategies in enforcement, we have seen an increase
21 in some of the areas that we were very concerned
22 about and I know we've spoken directly about the
23 dollar van issues; not just from our licensees'
24 perspective, because it infringes on their ability to
25 make a livelihood, but from the Vision Zero, the real

2 Vision Zero impacts that illegal dollar vans have on
3 our streets. So in the first four months of this
4 year, if you compare it to 2015 and 2016, we have
5 issued more summonses and done many more joint
6 operations with NYPD. So for example, we've done 73
7 joint operations with NYPD in the first four months
8 of this year; if you compare that to last year, the
9 same four months, it was only 47. I attribute that
10 also to the NYPD's commitment to having community
11 officers; that now that we're working directly with
12 the community officers, they understand the dangers
13 of illegal commuter vans in their communities and
14 there's greater willingness to work with us and
15 commit more time when they can work with us. On top
16 of that, I mentioned forfeiture; one of the real
17 safety targets of the forfeiture program is to get at
18 the illegally operating commuter dollar vans. We've
19 had some success where we've pulled over and made
20 them subject to our seizure and forfeiture
21 proceedings; we hit some stumbling blocks through the
22 OATH process because we have to bring all of those
23 cases to OATH and there's been a lot of confusion I
24 think, despite -- and I'm gonna tout our horn a
25 little bit, our, you know, real sort of training and

2 giving materials and a preliminary look at what this
3 program looks like -- but there has been a lot of
4 confusion with the OATH judges on what the state of
5 the law is and unfortunately, we've seen several vans
6 that we've seized be released, and these are repeat
7 offenders that come in -- you know, we have a record
8 of six, seven times we've brought them in and still
9 they're released because apparently there's not
10 enough proof that these are repeat offenders --
11 confounding, but you know -- it's frustrating, but we
12 haven't given up.. [interpose]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Yeah.

14 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: we're continuing and
15 we have a few cases that will be filed in civil court
16 and we hope that actually permanently taking away
17 some of these vehicles sends the message. But the
18 work with PD I think has been crucial, because it's
19 not work we could do alone, our officers are not
20 armed and a lot of times these situations do get
21 volatile, so knowing that we have the support of the
22 local precinct has been extremely helpful.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay, great and
24 I'll just ask the chairs I guess to most likely if we
25 can probably have, outside of the budget, discussion

2 with OATH, who I'm not sure if they're testifying,
3 and make sure that we can follow up on that issue.

4 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: We would appreciate
5 that... [crosstalk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Yeah.

7 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: 'cause I don't think
8 they quite understand what the reality... [interpose]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Yeah.

10 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: is on the street.

11 And I wanna add; we're also working on decaling and
12 painting uniform colors for our legal vans so that
13 there is customer recognition and passengers start to
14 patronize the legal vans as opposed to the illegal
15 vans, and even today we have vans at our Woodside
16 facility that we are decaling with the help of Small
17 Business Services; we got funds to provide those
18 decals and application free of charge to those van
19 operators.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you so
21 much for your work and continued partnership and I
22 appreciate your frankness and honesty today. Thank
23 you.

24 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you
25 Council Member, and that concludes this part of

2 today's hearings; we will have additional questions
3 that we'll be getting to you; if you can get them
4 back to us, 'cause we're gonna need, especially when
5 it comes to the very specific budget-related ones,
6 we're gonna be needing them before adoption.

7 COMMISSIONER JOSHI: Absolutely. And
8 we'll follow up on the questions that were raised
9 during the hearing. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you
11 very much Commissioner Joshi for testifying today.
12 As a reminder, the public will be invited to testify
13 on Thursday, May 25th, the last day of budget
14 hearings, at approximately 1:00 p.m. We will now
15 take a five-minute break before we hear from the MTA.

16 [pause]

17 [gavel]

18 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: We will
19 now conclude the 9th day of budget hearings with the
20 MTA New York City Transit. The Finance Committee is
21 again joined by Chair Rodriguez and the
22 Transportation Committee. We will hear testimony
23 this afternoon from Douglas Johnson, MTA's Budget
24 Director. I'll begin with a brief overview of MTA's
25 budget.

2 MTA's calendar 2017's operating budget
3 totals approximately \$15.6 billion, \$94.4 billion of
4 which is for New York City's transit. Around \$1
5 billion of the MTA's budget is for city funds. City
6 subsidies fund a number of important programs,
7 including reduced fare for students, the elderly and
8 the disabled and the Paratransit reimbursement. They
9 also fund operations of the Staten Island Railroad
10 and the Long Island Railroad and Metro-North stations
11 located in the City.

12 On the capital side, the Executive Budget
13 includes \$655 million over the plan period for the
14 MTA's 2015-2019 Capital Program, including \$125
15 million in FY 2018. The plan also anticipates an
16 additional City contribution of \$1.8 billion for a
17 total of \$2.5 billion over the plan period. This
18 will fund station rehabilitation, signal
19 improvements, track maintenance, replacement of train
20 cars and buses, and other vital investments.

21 I want to focus on a few areas at today's
22 hearing. First, it is clear to all New Yorkers that
23 as fares continue to go up the quality of service
24 continues to be questionable. Decades of
25 underinvestment in the subway system, combined with

2 decreased ridership, have led to a frequent
3 unreliable system. My colleagues and I have heard
4 frustrations repeatedly from our constituents, yet
5 progress in reducing delays and service outages have
6 been unacceptably slow. I was glad to see that on
7 Monday the MTA took a step in addressing these issues
8 through the announcement of the Six-Point Plan around
9 improving service. I hope to receive more detail
10 about this initiative at today's hearing.

11 Additionally, I want to discuss the
12 impacts of the app-based livery services such as Uber
13 and Lyft on the revenue expected through the
14 collection of taxi surcharges. Currently, medallion
15 taxis collect a 50% surcharge that is earmarked for
16 the MTA; however, app-based services are not subject
17 to this surcharge; instead, collecting and paying
18 sales tax on fares of which MTA receives three-eighths
19 of a percent. As the usage of the taxis continue to
20 decline citywide in favor of these services, MTA tax
21 surcharge receipts will decrease further. How is the
22 MTA planning to address the shortfall; has there been
23 any conversation or discussion with the State on
24 imposing a comparable surcharge for app-based taxi
25 services?

2 Finally, throughout these hearings we
3 have repeatedly highlighted the threat posed by
4 President Trump and the republican Congress on City
5 programs and services. The President proposed a one
6 trillion dollar infrastructure plan, but he has been
7 noncommittal about whether it includes funding for
8 such local projects as the Second Avenue Subway.
9 Furthermore, I would note that President Trump's
10 original budget proposal included significant cuts to
11 the Federal Department of Transportation. While the
12 spending plan recently agreed to by Congress spares
13 many of these cuts, I would urge the MTA to continue
14 to plan carefully, as the MTA's Capital Program in
15 particular relies heavily on federal funds that could
16 be at risk from a future Trump budget.

17 I look forward to hearing about these
18 issues and more at today's hearing. I will now turn
19 it over to my co-chair for his opening remarks.
20 Chair Rodriguez.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
22 Chair Julissa Ferreras. The MTA's calendar year 2017
23 operating expense budget is balanced and includes
24 approximately \$1 billion in City funds. The
25 Authority's proposed 2015-2019 \$29.9 billion Capital

2 Program appears fully funded. The plan includes
3 funding the purchase of 1,000 new subway cars, 1,700
4 new buses and to replace 73 miles of subway track,
5 among other projects. We hope to hear from the MTA
6 on matters of importance to the Committees, including
7 updates on ongoing projects, such as the Second
8 Avenue Subway expansion, East Side Access and the
9 Penn Station Access. We also hope to get more
10 information on the MTA's recently published Six-Point
11 Plan to restructure management and improving system
12 reliability and services. Of course, before we
13 leave, I also would like to hear what is MTA's plan
14 to repair the elevators -- I know that the money has
15 been announced, the money's there; elevators,
16 especially at 168th-Columbia Presbyterian Station,
17 but all the elevators in my community.

18 And before I end, I would like to
19 congratulate my former staff, **[inaudible]** Matta
20 [sp?], who after being my [sic] student, my student,
21 he went to **[inaudible]** Kennedy School of Government
22 and now is the last week that he's attending Cardozo
23 Law School, ready to become a lawyer, so
24 congratulations **[inaudible]**.

2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: You will
3 be sworn in by my counsel and then you could begin
4 your testimony.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell
6 the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth
7 in your testimony before the committee today and to
8 respond honestly to council member questions?

9 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: I do.

10 STEPHANIE DELISLE: I do.

11 [background comment]

12 STEPHANIE DELISLE: I do. I... I... I

13 **[inaudible]** [laughter] I do.

14 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Are we ready to go?

15 [background comment] Yeah, I'm gonna alter the

16 testimony where it says "good morning," I think we're

17 a little past that, so good.. [background comment]

18 [laugh] Good afternoon, Chairpersons Rodriguez and

19 Ferreras-Copeland and members of the City Council. I

20 am Douglas Johnson, the Budget Director for the

21 Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA). Joining

22 me today on my left is Stephanie DeLisle, who's our

23 Director of MTA Capital Funding.

24 We are here today at the Council's

25 invitation to address the Mayor's Fiscal Year 2018

2 Executive Budget as it relates to the City's
3 contribution to the operating and capital budgets of
4 the MTA.

5 As we noted at the Council Transportation
6 Committee's Preliminary Budget hearing in March, the
7 MTA's 2017 operating budget of \$15.6 billion is
8 supported by the City of New York to the tune of
9 approximately \$1 billion, which is close to 7% of our
10 budget. City-sourced funding is used to support the
11 operations of New York City Transit, MTA Bus and the
12 Staten Island Railway, as well as the commuter rail
13 stations located within New York City. These
14 reimbursements from the City continue to represent an
15 essential contribution to our day-to-day operations.

16 An important storyline of the MTA's
17 operating budget continues to be cost-cutting. It
18 began in 2010 and continues -- just as aggressively --
19 - to this day. Company-wide and individual agency
20 initiatives have generated tremendous savings for
21 this organization and that's benefiting our
22 operations and our customers.

23 Thanks to these efforts, we will exceed
24 our 2016 target of \$1.6 billion in annual recurring
25 savings. We also keep raising our savings targets

2 and we expect to reach a total of \$2 billion a year
3 by the year 2020. That's \$2 billion a year more than
4 we have used to add or improve service and to keep
5 fare and toll increases at an average of 2% a year,
6 which has been below the rate of inflation.

7 The next step in our rigorous and ongoing
8 budgeting cycle is the development of the July
9 Financial Plan. This step in our process provides an
10 opportunity to present a revised forecast of the
11 current year's finances, a preliminary presentation
12 of the FY 18 proposed budget, and finally, a three-
13 year reforecast of our out-year finances, so that's a
14 total of five years of planning.

15 With respect to the MTA's capital budget,
16 our March testimony noted that the big story
17 continues to be the full funding of MTA's \$29.5
18 billion 2015-2019 Capital Program -- that's the
19 single largest program in MTA history. The funding
20 for this program includes \$2.5 billion in funding
21 support from the City of New York and \$8.3 billion
22 from the State of New York. This robust five-year
23 Capital Program allocates more than \$16 billion in
24 capital funding for New York City Transit initiatives
25 within city limits.

2 We thank the City for its support for the
3 MTA Capital Program. The funding is more necessary
4 than ever, because as all of you know, ridership is
5 at record levels, and our customers are more
6 dependent than ever on our service. While this
7 record ridership is great news for our economy and
8 our city, it means the MTA network is stretched
9 almost to capacity. Thus, among our priorities is
10 making critical capital investments to expand the
11 system to better accommodate this growing ridership.

12 The completion of the first phase of the
13 Second Avenue Subway earlier this year was the most
14 significant expansion of our subway system in more
15 than half a century. Average weekday ridership on
16 this new line is now more than 170,000 riders,
17 continuing to grow, and that's alleviating crowding
18 at Upper East Side stations along the Lexington
19 Avenue line during morning rush hour. We are also
20 proceeding with the line's second phase into East
21 Harlem and have issued Request for Proposals for the
22 first three contracts, including design, and
23 environmental and community outreach.

24 We are not just expanding the New York
25 City subway system. We have projects underway and on

2 the drawing board that will transform mobility for
3 the entire region. One such example is East Side
4 Access which is bringing the Long Island Railroad
5 directly into Grand Central Station. Another is Penn
6 Access, a project that will add four new Metro-North
7 stations in the Bronx.

8 Expanding our capacity is an important
9 priority, but maintaining a system as large, old and
10 complex as ours is the single greatest challenge and
11 continues to require a heavy investment in what we
12 call "state of good repair." We have a range of
13 safety and reliability projects in the Capital
14 Program that were detailed in our March testimony,
15 including track and switch replacements, signal
16 system upgrades, replacement of our subway cars and
17 buses with modern state-of-the-art fleets. There are
18 numerous replacement projects for infrastructure
19 assets such as electrical substations, pumps and
20 tunnel lighting -- these are projects that are not
21 even visible to our customers, but are key to our
22 ability to continue moving 8.7 million people per day
23 safely and reliably. Safety and reliability projects
24 comprise a full two-thirds of the 2015-2019 Capital
25 Program.

2 We are also investing in the enhancement
3 and modernization of passenger stations through our
4 ongoing Station Renewal and Component Programs, as
5 well as the new Enhanced Station Initiative which is
6 intended to fast-track station renovations at select
7 stations.

8 Our station improvement efforts include
9 making the subway system increasingly accessible to
10 people with disabilities. We have completed 86 of
11 the 100 Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) Key
12 Stations and will complete the remaining 14 over the
13 next few years. We also have 31 accessible non-Key
14 stations, as well as approved funding to make 8 more
15 stations fully accessible. In addition, we are
16 undertaking a system-wide feasibility study to
17 support our goal of making additional stations ADA
18 accessible.

19 We are also investing to modernize our
20 system through communication technology enhancements.
21 We now have cellular connectivity and Wi-Fi
22 capability in our underground stations and are in the
23 process of completing the roll-out of countdown
24 clocks and help-point devices throughout our system.
25 And on our buses, we are installing digital

2 information screens that offer audio and visual route
3 information and display next-stop information,
4 including transfers.

5 As Governor Cuomo's leadership was
6 instrumental in securing the full funding needed for
7 our 2015-2019 Capital Program, he's asked this
8 program bring transformative change to the MTA -- not
9 only in the finished product, but also in its
10 delivery. We are more and more frequently using
11 alternative delivery methods like design-build to
12 foster innovation, collaboration and teamwork between
13 designers and builders; our Enhanced Station
14 Initiative is an example of that approach.

15 We are writing our design-build contracts
16 to offer incentives for early completion and severe
17 penalties for delays, which is an effective incentive
18 to ensure the work gets done on time. As you are all
19 well aware, we are also looking to sometimes close
20 entire stations to get work done faster and more
21 efficiently so that our customers can experience the
22 improvements more quickly.

23 The current Capital Program represents a
24 piece of our long-term plans to modernize the entire
25 MTA network, as well as meet increasing ridership

2 demand that is beginning to tax the system. While
3 the Capital Program provides critical funding to
4 renew, enhance and expand the system by replacing and
5 upgrading infrastructure for the long-term, we also
6 need to address service and its impact on our
7 customers today.

8 That is why earlier this week MTA Interim
9 Executive Director Ronnie Hakim announced a new six-
10 point comprehensive plan that targets short-term,
11 achievable service improvements. We've heard from
12 our customers, understand their frustration, and
13 we're frustrated too. This initiative will address
14 the top causes of subway delays in order to reduce
15 the disruptions that impact service reliability for
16 our customers. Increasing delays are unacceptable
17 which is why we're using all the tools at our
18 disposal to address these immediate problems by
19 tackling the five key causes of subway delays.

20 Thank you for your time and attention
21 today. We're happy to answer any questions that you
22 may have on our budget. Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
24 you. So I want to start off with your very last
25 point in your statement, and that was the six-point

2 plan. I guess if you can walk me through, what will
3 the \$20 million announced for the plan pay for, and
4 what are the five key causes of delays?

5 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Okay. Well right now
6 we've prioritized \$20 million to start looking at
7 what the key issues have been that are causing -- you
8 know the low-hanging fruit on what's causing these
9 delays. So the problems are with track and signals,
10 car maintenance, sick customers, customer loading --
11 those are the primary causes of delays.

12 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: When you
13 say customer loading, that's just customers getting
14 on and off the train?

15 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah, it's areas where
16 you have, you know, very crowded stations and there
17 are delays getting the people in and out of the cars.

18 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So the
19 \$20 million -- I mean I would think if one of the
20 issues is tracks or the track signals...

21 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Uhm-hm.

22 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: and you
23 said the second point was maintenance; right of some...
24 is it some of the track maintenance; is that what it
25 is?

2 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Well you've gotta
3 remember, the Capital Program addresses the major
4 sort of project work that's really gonna tackle a lot
5 of the issues... [crosstalk]

6 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Right.

7 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: but those are already
8 funded and those were part of our ongoing process of
9 operation, so this is sort of a layer on of let's
10 kind of fast-track some things that we know to be
11 problematic where a reasonable expense could actually
12 see, you know, something that works for us.

13 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay. So
14 for example, with customer loading, or what we know
15 as customers coming on and off the train, how would
16 you mitigate that or how is that mitigatable?

17 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Well again, not to punt
18 here, but I am the Budget Director, so I'm not really
19 speaking on behalf of operations, but in the past
20 we've done things where we try to -- we have people
21 on the platforms helping and that sort of thing, and
22 there are also parts of the trains that are less
23 crowded than other parts, but again, I'm not the
24 expert there, so I can't really get into the details
25 of that.

2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Right.

3 And I would just ask to follow up with the Committee;
4 we're gonna get you these questions so that we could
5 better understand, 'cause I understand you're the
6 Budget Director and you don't know the program
7 itself, but it is a budget...

8 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah. Yeah. And we're
9 happy to get those answers to you as soon as we can.

10 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay,
11 great. In addition to some of the administrative
12 changes that has been mentioned, how many additional
13 cleaning and maintenance staff do you plan on hiring
14 with this plan?

15 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: I don't have the
16 details of that.

17 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay. So
18 we'd like to have a follow-up from that. And you
19 know, Council Member Dromm recently announced with --
20 I think it was the Painters Union -- an issue that
21 was brought up on lead paint and this is something
22 that I've asked and inquired about for a long time
23 about painting the Roosevelt Avenue trellis and the
24 maintenance. It seems that because maintenance lags,
25 now there is this exposure of what could be possible

2 lead coming from the train. I don't know if it's the
3 paint itself or if it's the actual structure after it
4 begins to erode because it's not been maintained,
5 it's causing a problem, and we don't necessarily know
6 -- it seems like it takes almost a decade for us to
7 have the proper maintenance that this trellis
8 requires. So what is the plan for those above-ground
9 or what we call elevated trains or the L in your --
10 is it reflected in your Capital Plan that you will
11 provide maintenance sooner...? [crosstalk]

12 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah, again... Yeah. So
13 within our 2015-2019 Capital Program are 3.1 miles at
14 the Flushing line that are funded to be painted, and
15 that's been contracted out.

16 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay. So
17 when could be expecting this to begin, 'cause we're
18 in the last two years of this plan?

19 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: I'll have to get back
20 to you on exact dates on that.

21 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
22 you. And you know dates and locations and where it's
23 gonna happen, you haven't come before me, you know as
24 being... [crosstalk]

2 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah. Like I said, I
3 have sort of... I don't have the detail on that...
4 [interpose]

5 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Right.

6 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: I'd be happy to get you
7 that.

8 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: It just
9 seems that the portion of the train that is right in
10 front of Citi Field is in A-1 condition, and right
11 when you get to 111th Street, it's like two different
12 worlds and I just don't understand why the MTA always
13 seems to find enough funding to address the Citi
14 Field portion of the elevated train and where
15 everyone else lives there seems to always be a lag,
16 and this is the same thing that was told to me in
17 2015, 2016, 2017; now we're going into 2018, and I
18 wish I could've been here with the person who was
19 there before, 'cause I'm like, hey you said this to
20 me before, but now you're someone new, so I'm gonna
21 give you the opportunity to get me a more accurate
22 calendar on when we can finally see some repairs on
23 the trellis.

24 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: We'll get you that
25 schedule.

2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay.

3 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Okay.

4 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: I wanted
5 to talk about how you are preparing for the potential
6 federal risk within your 2015-2019 plan. I know that
7 -- you know there was some talk that it wasn't as bad
8 as we thought, but moving forward, do you have
9 contingency plans or how do you see dealing with the
10 federal impact?

11 STEPHANIE DELISLE: Well at this point,
12 our 15 to 19... [crosstalk]

13 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: I'm
14 sorry; can you just state your name for the record?

15 STEPHANIE DELISLE: Stephanie DeLisle..

16 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Great; go
17 ahead.

18 STEPHANIE DELISLE: and at this point our
19 15-19 Capital Program includes a little over \$6.5
20 billion of federal funds, and at this time we're
21 continuing with our plan; we are very aware of the
22 proposals in Washington, but at this point they are
23 just proposals; we will continue to monitor it and as
24 we get closer and if there continues to be an impact
25 as the budget is enacted, we will, of course,

2 respond. But at this point it is a proposal and we
3 we're continuing with our plans for the program.

4 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So you're
5 beginning to do some contingency plans -- 'cause as a
6 city we're doing that; I mean we won't share the
7 number 'cause we don't want anyone to know that we
8 can, but do we see ourselves at a point where we may
9 have to just cut back on programs that have already
10 been scheduled.. [crosstalk]

11 STEPHANIE DELISLE: Right.

12 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: or
13 projects; not programs, projects?

14 STEPHANIE DELISLE: At this point, no..
15 [crosstalk]

16 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay.

17 STEPHANIE DELISLE: At this point we
18 fully expect to be able to commit the 15-19 program
19 as budgeted, but we continue to keep an eye on what's
20 happening.

21 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay. As
22 I mentioned in my opening testimony, the taxi
23 surcharge revenues -- traditionally medallion taxi
24 services collect a 50 cent surcharge that is
25 earmarked for the MTA; however, as the app-based --

2 and I don't know if you were here when we had..

3 [crosstalk]

4 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah.

5 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: the TLC
6 -- as that industry is taking up more and more of the
7 customers, I would think -- and we're seeing a
8 slowdown in the yellow cabs, are there contingency
9 plans or have you seen a drop in the contribution of
10 that tax revenue?

11 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yes. Yes, we have. So
12 roughly a \$13 million reduction in our collections in
13 that tax; just like you said, just based on the
14 volume, which is somewhat mitigated by, like you
15 said, the sales tax on those rides, which you know,
16 is nowhere near the offset; it's a reduced source of
17 revenue for us; again, we factored that into our
18 financial plan projection, so our budget basically
19 already has that factored in; it's a reduction from
20 prior year forecast when we, you know, hadn't
21 experienced that quite yet, but it is what it is
22 right; you know, that would have to be a legislative
23 issue. So you know, bottom line is; our revenue
24 forecasts accurately grasped that situation and you
25 know, the projections that we see.

2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So is the
3 agency at all engaging with the State from a
4 budgetary perspective to recommend that the e-hails,
5 or you know, the non-yellow cabs have...

6 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: I'm not in a position
7 to answer that... that... [crosstalk]

8 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Well I'm
9 expecting an answer, so we'll... [crosstalk]

10 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Okay.

11 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: send that
12 over with your questions, because you know I think
13 it's... [crosstalk]

14 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Absolutely. No, every...
15 every question you ask...

16 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: as a... as
17 a budget director... [crosstalk]

18 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah.

19 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: or you
20 know, someone who's responsible for the budget, I
21 would think... [crosstalk]

22 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah.

23 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: this
24 would be of interest to the MTA; \$13 million could
25

2 probably be useful, even for your six-point plan, to
3 help further mitigate some of those urgent issues.

4 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: We will certainly get
5 back to you on that.

6 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Great,
7 thank you. Chair Rodriguez and then we'll have our
8 colleagues ask their questions; everyone will be on a
9 five-minute clock, and if we come back for a second
10 round, it will be three-minute clock.

11 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
12 Chair. First of all, thank you to you and Maureen
13 and the rest of the team for being helpful on the
14 Car-Free Day; as we disagree on trying to bring ideas
15 on how to do things better, we also recognize you
16 know that you are responsible, together with the
17 Chairman and the President of the institution, to you
18 know run one of the largest transportation systems in
19 the world. Sometimes we compare with other cities,
20 but we also know that there's other places that they
21 are not 24 hours and that it doesn't go near to cover
22 most of the community where the train system is
23 connected.

24 One, you know, area where... two areas
25 where I can say that we have priority, you know on

2 approaching them together is; one, transportation
3 desert areas in our city, and the second is about our
4 buses. How is the MTA planning to address the
5 problem of transportation deserts in New York City?

6 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: What specific problem?
7 I'm not sure I follow the question.

8 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Well on the
9 transportation deserts is; those communities, that
10 they are not connected with public transportation.
11 So which area have you identified as the MTA where we
12 are dealing with transportation deserts where New
13 Yorkers, they have to be walking ten, fifteen blocks,
14 communities in the city where when you look at your
15 plan, you are looking at the priorities and you have
16 a plan in place on how we will be addressing that
17 situation in the near future.

18 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Again, in my role as
19 budget director, I'm not really authorized or
20 qualified to respond to that question, but we'd be
21 happy to get back to you on that. We're taking all
22 these questions down... [crosstalk]

23 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. And
24 that's why, you know we want to be sure that for the
25 next hearing on Transportation, we want to bring the

2 person in charge of transit for New York City. Like
3 this is not... this is, for me, having a tradition,
4 you're the Budget Director; by working with the
5 chairman -- you know with all my respect, you're
6 looking at the number; in this hearing we have the
7 commissioner for all agencies who can bring the
8 budget director, who can bring other people, but in
9 this hearing, where the City is making so high
10 contributions to the MTA, we should expect to have
11 the transit directors to be the one; not because you
12 cannot compliment, but we're a little bit tired and
13 frustrated on many times we'll get back to that
14 question when we are making this request with enough
15 time for you to come here and be able to respond to
16 those questions. So this is not... you know they have
17 been... The City is not begging for services; the City
18 is not the one that relies on the MTA because you're
19 doing a favor to the City; the City is one of the
20 municipalities, if not the municipality, that makes a
21 major investment to the MTA, so I believe that we
22 deserve to know what is your plan, since we rely on
23 you; since we invest in the MTA on how -- have you
24 identified areas in the city that you know that they
25 are not connected with buses and trains? Do you have

2 a plan to connect those communities? Like you know,
3 those are concerns that we have and I hope that we
4 can address it with you guys.

5 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: No, I think that you've
6 articulated that question very well. We understand
7 your question totally and it's gonna go back and
8 we'll get back to you the best we can on that.

9 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. What
10 about Queens; in Queens those -- and we brought it to
11 your attention last time; I want to bring it again;
12 for me, it is important, and I know that that's a
13 concern for you guys -- we have a situation in Queens
14 where people have to transfer to the bus and then to
15 take a train, so they have to pay two fares to go to
16 work. Has the MTA identified those communities where
17 New Yorkers, they have to pay two fares in order to
18 go to work, when they should be able to get those two
19 transfers from the buses and the train?

20 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: So you... I mean we
21 understand your question; if you wanna be more
22 specific in the question -- I think that we get that
23 question, so we'll get back to you on that one.

24 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Another get
25 back, another one that we expected to, you know, the

2 answer, knowing that there is a plan, like... The L
3 train; as residents in the City, 14th Street in
4 Brooklyn, they will be affected; what is the plan;
5 how much is the MTA expecting to invest to take care
6 of the needs of those New Yorkers that they will not
7 have access to the train for years?

8 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Again, I'll have to get
9 back to you on that; I don't have the answer for
10 that.

11 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I don't know
12 if we should continue the hearing. [background
13 comment] What is the plan for Access-A-Ride?

14 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: For... I'm sorry?

15 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Access-A-Ride.

16 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Access-A-Ride... the plan
17 is to manage that as effectively as we can; we think
18 we're doing a good job with that; we've somewhat
19 reduced the cost by doing a few different things in
20 terms of getting cabs and other businesses involved
21 to reduce the average cost of Access-A-Ride, but
22 again, that's an area that we are paying a large
23 portion of that cost, so it's a drain our budget, but
24 we're managing to do that, so we're managing that as
25 effectively as we can. Just... [crosstalk]

2 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Look, as you...
3 as you explain in your testimony... [crosstalk]

4 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Just... Just... Just so you
5 know, out of a net cash deficit projected of almost
6 \$5 million in 2017, we expect \$142 million to come
7 from New York City and \$356 million directly being
8 reimbursed, being funded by the MTA, which is 72% of
9 that deficit.

10 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah. As you
11 know, like senior citizens; people with disabilities,
12 and we've been hearing that for years... [interpose]

13 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah.

14 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: that level of
15 frustration; the efficiencies that we need to improve
16 in those services, like -- and this is not, okay, \$1
17 or \$2 million; this is like more than half a billion
18 dollars resources, like... and as you say, that... when
19 we talk about that... when you look at the MTA, they
20 always say you're [sic] stretched almost to capacity;
21 I would say that we, for years; even before I became
22 the chairman of this committee, when it comes to
23 Access-A-Ride, there have been so many years of
24 frustration on can we, you know make Access-A-Ride a
25 better experience; can we run the funds of Access-A-

2 Ride more efficiently and increase the productivity
3 on that investment? Like, is the MTA like investing
4 with Human Resources; putting together a plan that
5 you can revise Access-A-Ride and come back and say we
6 are turning Access-A-Ride, you know as... with new
7 changes; better than what we have up to now?

8 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Uhm-hm. Again, we have
9 tried a few things in place and it's marginally
10 reduced that average cost. You know, it's a cost
11 that we have imbedded in our financial plan and you
12 know that is what it is. I don't have the specifics
13 of what they're doing to implement any changes in
14 that area, but like I said; the funding for that
15 program, which we cover almost three-quarters of, is
16 imbedded within our financial plan.

17 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Right. So you
18 spoke about the increase of ridership in our train
19 system, but that's not the same thing when it comes
20 to the buses...

21 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: That's right.

22 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: can we say
23 that the number... we agree still that... what the MTA
24 shared with us in the last hearing is the same thing;
25 that we have seen a reduction of ridership on buses?

2 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: That is true. That is
3 true. Yeah.

4 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. So is
5 the MTA looking at, you know, areas on how we can
6 improve and make the best experience for New Yorkers
7 or tourists to say when we get into the bus we have
8 the best experience in our life?

9 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Again, I'm not here to
10 answer operating questions, but I do know that that's
11 something they look at very heavily; we know that
12 just based on congestion in the area, that slows down
13 the average speed of the buses; we'll get back to you
14 with a more specific answer on all the ramifications
15 and what we're looking at in that regard.

16 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. I just..
17 I will be ending my time now; one recommending that
18 the MTA should put a plan when it comes to
19 transportation deserts; at the New York City Council,
20 we passed a law that the Mayor -- I don't know if
21 that's the one that we signed -- I know that we
22 passed here at the Council that empowered the DOT is
23 signing... sign -- we did pass a law that the Mayor is
24 signing empowering the DOT to do the study on
25

2 transportation desert areas that we have, and I know
3 that the DOT; the MTA, you collaborate in many areas...

4 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Uhm-hm.

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: so what I hope
6 is that as we already passed a law and signed by the
7 Mayor, that you can work together with the DOT and
8 identify those communities where the teacher, he or
9 she has to be thinking twice before taking a job
10 offer in a school in the South Bronx and in Queens
11 because probably that school is fifteen blocks away
12 from when she get out from the train. So those areas
13 where we believe and we talk -- when we are
14 addressing transportation deserts, is connecting not
15 only with a train but also with the buses; connecting
16 with a ferry, so we just hope that the MTA, you know,
17 join the DOT in that study and help the City to put
18 together a plan on how we will be connecting every
19 single New Yorker to our public transportation.

20 The second thing is with our buses; you
21 know, I believe that we have a great opportunity --
22 if we want to leave a legacy in the City because we
23 don't have \$10-15 billion to build a new Second
24 Avenue Subway right now, but I believe that we have
25 the infrastructure with our buses, and we should plan

2 together to turn our bus system in the city as an
3 above-the-ground train system. And in order to make
4 the changes, we need to be realistic and we need to
5 understand that we have the resources there, but
6 still the traffic lighting system that we are using
7 today is not upgraded to prioritize the bus drivers,
8 and in that direction, you already are doing it in
9 5th Avenue; what is the experience that you've been
10 able to share... be able to share with us on how the
11 traffic lighting system that you have installed in
12 the 5th Avenue and working together with DOT allow
13 the MTA to move buses faster than any other area when
14 we don't have the traffic light prioritizing the bus
15 drivers?

16 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Okay; that's something...
17 we will look into that as well.

18 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But you don't
19 have any... right... do you have any information about
20 that?

21 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: I don't have any
22 information on that.

23 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: That's
24 capital.

2 STEPHANIE DELISLE: I'm sorry, sir, I
3 don't, but we will certainly follow up **[inaudible]**
4 detail... [crosstalk]

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Uh no... This is
6 a \$1 trillion entity that we have in front of us, so
7 much resources and this is related to capital. L.A.
8 already has that system and it's not only that... it's
9 not my frustration because you don't have it, but
10 it's because you don't come here prepared to say how
11 much are we investing in capital to put the
12 technology in the buses? Because we know that DOT is
13 ready to be a partner and DOT is ready to say which
14 is the area that you want us to do it and we are
15 ready to upgrade the traffic lighting system; you
16 guys, as an institution, have to be sure that the
17 technologies are installed in those buses.

18 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So I
20 don't think this is gonna get any easier for you,
21 because we were expecting and continue to expect that
22 at a budget hearing we get as much details as
23 possible, so we're gonna open this to additional
24 members, but we need to really be clear of the
25 frustration of both chairs; if it wasn't to give the

2 opportunity to our other colleagues, we would
3 actually wrap up this hearing right now, because the
4 amount of information you're giving us really not
5 even close to what we would be expecting from your
6 caliber of an agency, but we're going to respect our
7 colleagues so they will have an opportunity to ask
8 their questions, but I also forewarn my colleagues,
9 and I would ask you to set your expectations by what
10 we've already heard, which was pretty close to
11 absolutely nothing. So we will now hear from Council
12 Member Lander; followed by Council Member Richards.
13 We've been joined by Council Members Gibson, Miller,
14 Richards, and Menchaca.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Madam
16 Chair. The problem is, I'm gonna have to set my
17 expectations by the expectations that my constituents
18 have for their subway service, and that's what they
19 sent me here to do and you know I let them know that
20 we were having this budget hearing and since
21 yesterday, more than 250 people have written me with
22 a set of questions and a set of challenges that they
23 have been facing that I'm guessing must have made it
24 to the MTA's leadership over the last couple of
25 weeks, because they are barraging me and I have no

2 control over the MTA. So I'm just gonna read you a
3 few of them.

4 Last week alone, I was severely delayed
5 three out of five work days on the C train; the Q,
6 big power outage at the DeKalb on May 9th, all the
7 time, 2, 3, 4, 5, Atlantic and R; almost every day
8 there's a huge delay; I've been commuting 17 years on
9 the F; I'm actually afraid to get on the train
10 anymore; I've always been an F defender until now.
11 Delays on the R train every single day; F line in the
12 past six days I've been significantly delayed four
13 times -- signal problems; last night at midnight --
14 single problems at Delancey Street; the A train
15 around 5:00 p.m. I could go on; in those 250
16 answers, basically every single line comes up for
17 questions; you've surely been hearing some of the
18 same complaints from New Yorkers... [crosstalk]

19 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yes. Yes we have.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: So...

21 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Our Executive Director
22 has acknowledged these complaints and the fact that
23 we wanna do something about it; that's in fact
24 specifically why they came up with a new plan, the
25 six points; they wanna address it directly and as

2 quickly as possible, aside from all the capital work
3 that we have scheduled that will ultimately improve
4 signaling and you know, track and, you know the real,
5 the real... you know we have an aging infrastructure,
6 so that is not done inexpensively, but we are
7 actually funding that. But we recognize that that's
8 just not good enough, so that's why we came up with
9 the six-point plan, **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: So I... which is
11 what I wanna ask some questions about, because...
12 [crosstalk]

13 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: and look, of
15 course it's an aging infrastructure...

16 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: you know you're
18 new, you know, rela... no one got us into this
19 position...

20 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: we got here over
22 a lot of years...

23 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: of delayed
25 maintenance and inadequate investment in the

2 infrastructure, but New Yorkers expect us to change
3 that, so I guess let me start by asking you about
4 signals, since you mentioned them. Tell me about
5 where we are on signals; I didn't see much about them
6 in the six-point plan and yet, as I read in *The Times*
7 and other places, they seem to be a key to actually
8 addressing delays; as I understand it, we've got
9 modern signals on 1 out of 22 lines; how fast are we
10 getting them replaced; if we need more money, how
11 much money is it gonna cost, and where are we looking
12 to get it?

13 STEPHANIE DELISLE: Right. Well I don't
14 have an estimate for the total cost for the whole
15 system, but I can say that the 15-19 Capital Program
16 includes about \$2.75 billion as part of its effort to
17 renew the system for signals, and that's part of that
18 emphasis; 90% of the Capital Program for transit is
19 **[inaudible]** repair-related, and of that, we have that
20 \$2.75 billion **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: So what percent
22 of signals... I'm right that 1 of 22 lines has modern
23 signals; is that right?

24 STEPHANIE DELISLE: I believe that's
25 true... [crosstalk]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Okay, so there's
3 \$2.75 billion; how many lines and which lanes is it
4 gonna get new signals on, and how long will it take?

5 [background comment]

6 STEPHANIE DELISLE: That was billion,
7 \$2.75 billion. Sorry.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Yes.

9 STEPHANIE DELISLE: Yes, sir. Yes. How
10 long will it take? I don't know; we'll get back to
11 you, but that... I don't have that **[inaudible]**...

12 [crosstalk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: And how many
14 lines will it cover?

15 STEPHANIE DELISLE: How many lines it
16 will cover, I'll get back to you as well.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: You don't know...
18 You've got... You're spending \$2.75 billion but you
19 have no idea what lines it will improve the signals
20 on... [crosstalk]

21 STEPHANIE DELISLE: Right.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: what percent of
23 the system signals it will replace or how long it
24 will take...? [crosstalk]

2 STEPHANIE DELISLE: Right. It is known
3 within the MTA, but from a funding perspective, I
4 don't have **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

5 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah, well we're doing
6 communication-based train control on the Queens
7 Boulevard, Culver and 8th Avenue lines, you know so
8 that's a large -- we're modernizing six signal
9 interlockings and we're rolling out Help Point at all
10 the stations, which is somewhat related to what
11 you're asking. But you're talking about significant
12 investments that's difficult work [sic].

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I'm trying to
14 talk... [crosstalk]

15 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: about significant
17 investments... [crosstalk]

18 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: but that's what
20 we need you here for, like I'll be honest, I don't
21 see how New Yorkers could feel like, oh a six-point
22 plan to like restructure the leadership is great when
23 we've got no estimates on what it would actually take
24 to solve the problems or no plan in place; like to
25

2 say we've got a six-point plan that doesn't involve
3 actually... I mean am I wrong that... [crosstalk]

4 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah, no...

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: signals are a big
6 part of the reason for the delays right now?

7 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Well that's right and
8 that's why those are part of the... so those are
9 literally... we're literally replacing antiquated
10 signal systems, which are major improvements. The
11 six-point plan is to let's grab the low-hanging
12 fruit, you know here's some problems that we can
13 actually make a dent right away and that's the point
14 of the six-point plan, to mitigate some of those
15 issues.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: So... I mean... that
17 feels a little to me like [bell] fiddling while Rome
18 burns; it's nice to listen to the music, but if we're
19 not... I just... I mean I really don't mean... look, I
20 don't mean to be yelling at the two of you about it;
21 I don't like doing kinda the grandstanding thing; my
22 constituents believe that the subway system is in
23 crisis; they... and every day they have to try to go to
24 work -- I'll keep reading, you know I'm out of my
25 time, but it both feels that way to an overwhelming

2 number of my constituents that these lines aren't
3 working and the data says that's true, that we've got
4 twice as many delays as we had five years ago, so
5 that's a crisis for the City, and it doesn't feel to
6 me like we are mobilizing to respond to the level of
7 crisis that we're facing and so, yeah, I guess I
8 would have expected that the agency would come and
9 say we have heard all these people saying the subway
10 is in crisis -- I'm sure the MTA got a lot more
11 feedback than I got in my little office -- here's what
12 we are doing and to the extent that that's not enough
13 because it would cost a lot of money, here's what it
14 would cost -- I guess the question I'm gonna leave
15 you get back to me with is -- I mean I would like to
16 know what the \$2.75 billion buys... [crosstalk]

17 STEPHANIE DELISLE: Certainly.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: but more than
19 that, I would like to know what would it actually
20 cost to replace all the signals that are antiquated
21 in our subway system and if we had the resources, how
22 quickly could we do it, like this is the time for us
23 to step up and invest in our infrastructure -- of
24 course that'll take more money and we'll have to
25 figure out how to do it and some of us will have to

2 go back to supporting what the... you know the chair is
3 a big supporter of congesting pricing; some of us
4 said we should raise the millionaires tax or close
5 the carried interest loophole, but a terrible idea is
6 just kinda twiddle our thumbs while our subway system
7 decays.

8 STEPHANIE DELISLE: Of course.

9 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah. I don't think
10 that's an accurate portrayal, but we will get back to
11 you with the specifics of more detail on what's in
12 the Capital Program, which is a substantial amount of
13 money, and we'll address all of your questions.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I appreciate your
15 getting back to us and maybe you came expecting
16 [background comments] different questions from the
17 Council, but given where things are, where they've
18 been in the news, like we are the representatives of
19 the people of the City of New York and even though
20 it's a state entity and so therefore maybe you show
21 up differently for the state, like we represent the
22 people that rely on the system and they're desperate
23 for some answers, so I was hoping for more today;
24 I'll look forward to what you can get us in writing,
25 but... [crosstalk]

2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
3 you.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: the crisis is not
5 going away, even though this hearing will end; we are
6 going to have to find ways to address it.

7 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah. We understand.

8 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you
9 Council Member.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: We will
12 now hear from Council Member Richards; followed by
13 Council Member Miller; followed by Council Member
14 Menchaca.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you
16 chairs and I wanna thank you, first, the MTA for
17 doing two things right, and I know Council Member
18 Miller will talk on this, so first I'll start off
19 with the Q52 extension in the Rockaways, which was
20 major, which is great for my constituents, and then
21 obviously, select bus service coming with that, and
22 then obviously Freedom Ticket, which I'm interested
23 in hearing where we're at with the Freedom Ticket
24 pilot that's gonna occur in Southeast Queens, so
25 those are questions that you can answer after I'm

2 finished, 'cause now I'm gonna go on my three-minute
3 rant. You know, the usual rant that I give every
4 year when the MTA comes here, and I definitely
5 recognize that signaling is important in improving
6 the infrastructure for our train system, but I also
7 find it always interesting when I hear these
8 announcements being touted about Wi-Fi and charging
9 stations in our buses and other things, because I
10 think New Yorkers really wanna get home and while we
11 love these amenities that are always spoken about,
12 you know, we don't wanna spend two hours on a train
13 or bus, you know at least from Southeast Queens and
14 the Rockaways, we would rather have better service
15 than to tout better amenities on a bus, so I think
16 the focus needs to get back into less about amenities
17 -- charging stations and Wi-Fi -- which we
18 appreciate, but the emphasis needs to be put back on
19 ensuring that more services running frequently in
20 transit deserts like Southeast Queens and the
21 Rockaways.

22 My usual rant; I will talk about the A
23 train; it is the most abysmal service in New York
24 City, just about, and I'm very happy to hear about
25 the whatever pilot this is -- you're gonna have

2 people on the platform -- but the bottom is, without
3 quality service, it doesn't matter how many people
4 you have on the platform; there will always be
5 delays, and I find it shameful, you know for those
6 who get up early, who live nearly on the Nassau
7 County border, who wake up early to get to work on
8 time or to get to school on time and to be delayed
9 every morning, it's really shameful. And these
10 individuals, some who are low-income, don't have the
11 luxury of losing their job, so I'm hoping that the
12 MTA is also gonna, you know, consider a proposal I
13 may have in which, you know, maybe there should be
14 some automatic letters being drafted that people can
15 send to their employers when service is abysmal;
16 perhaps if the MTA is hiring -- I think I read this
17 in the newspaper -- you know perhaps some of these
18 people could be hired by the MTA. I'll speak of City
19 Ticket in the Rockaways; the only place in New York
20 City, which is shameful, for the last 20 years we've
21 been talking about the same thing; I look forward to
22 hearing from you on that. Bus service from the Q77,
23 which was rated the slowest like bus in New York
24 City, from the Q22 to the 85 to the Q5 to the 111 to
25 the 114 to the 84 -- our residents don't have the

2 luxury of having a train outside of their door, so
3 they have to take these buses in which, you know,
4 they are overcrowded, big time, could take us an hour
5 on some days to get to Jamaica Station; then to get
6 to Manhattan another hour or so and with delays,
7 you're talking about some days it could be two-and-a-
8 half hours on a train. So I'm goin' on my rant; you
9 don't have to answer all of these things because I'm
10 not sure you have the answers to these things. More
11 frequent express bus service, you know there are
12 individuals, like this young man who lives in my
13 district who's on this committee, poor guy has to
14 take about an hour-and-a-half, two hours. Do you
15 know that you can get to Florida by plane as quick as
16 you can get to Manhattan by train on some days from
17 our district? Just another thing that I love to put
18 out there; I actually timed it, so it's actually very
19 accurate. And then the cleanliness of the E train,
20 you know, there's a lot of issues with homelessness
21 in the city, which we recognize, but the MTA still
22 has a responsibility to make sure they're addressing
23 these quality of life issues so their passengers
24 could actually have some adequate and quality
25 service. So I'm done; my rant is up. I can go on

2 and on and on and on and on, but I would hope that
3 the State is gonna take their responsibility serious
4 for our transit deserts; perhaps -- you know, I think
5 Council Member Lander mentioned the proposal to tax
6 the bridges, which I support, because I don't see
7 where you're coming up with the revenue to truly
8 improve the service. Four seconds left.. you know, I
9 will save the rest of my [bell] breath. Thank you.

10 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: I guess I'll try to
11 respond in order. So we're looking at a pilot, we're
12 gonna do a pilot to try to get LIRR service..
13 [interpose]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Oh and let me
15 just say it, because LIRR service sucks now too.

16 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Right, but..

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: But I
18 appreciate the pilot.

19 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: for city residents,
20 there's gonna be a pilot through Atlantic Terminal to
21 serve some of those areas that happen to be near Long
22 Island Rail Road and again, that's something that's
23 coming up. I think the criticism about doing capital
24 projects that are more amenity-based versus actually
25 impacting the service, in no way were they going to

2 harm -- we're doing all those things that need to be
3 done, we're buying cars, we're doing track work -- I
4 mean we're buying tons and tons of cars; these are
5 the things that are gonna address your issues; the
6 fact that they also will be equipped with certain
7 amenities like Wi-Fi, it's something that's helpful
8 to the customer, but it's not in place of doing the
9 important infrastructure work that you're describing.
10 What were some of the other...

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I was trying to
12 save some breath. You know I have a 1-year-old, so I
13 have to chase him when I get home now. The A train
14 running more frequently to Lefferts Boulevard -- you
15 did an antiquated study; I don't know where these
16 studies come from, when you can stand on the platform
17 and see for every one A train for Rockaway there are
18 three for Lefferts; I don't know if it has to do with
19 something, you know, concerning with class; I have no
20 idea, but these... [interpose]

21 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Okay.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: you know these
23 are some of the things that continue to... [crosstalk]

24 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Well uh... Well we've
25 noted...

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: come up and..

3 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: We noted that question.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Yeah.

5 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you
6 Council Member. We'll hear from Council Member
7 Miller; followed with Council Member Menchaca.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you Madam

9 Chair. Hey Doug, good afternoon; how's everybody?

10 So the last time the MTA testified I believe was back
11 in March, you were not here, and there were not other
12 folks who could answer some of the questions that we
13 put forth and we were hoping that today; certainly --
14 I know that this is about the budget, but certainly
15 operations depend on... they're not mutually exclusive,
16 so we wanna talk about that. But I know that there
17 are some things specifically that you will be able to
18 speak to, so I'm gonna ask those questions, right?

19 And so I'm gonna first kinda piggyback on what

20 Council Member Richards said and just -- and if you
21 can't answer it now, that's one of the things that --

22 What does the roll-out and the implementation of the
23 pilot; what will that look like and when would that
24 occur -- that is first. Second, I wanna know the
25 status of collective bargaining and labor within the

2 MTA and how that impacts this budget, whether or not
3 it has been budget for. Then I wanna ask about the
4 Jamaica Depot property -- what is the status of that?
5 And then finally, we wanna talk about the new fleet
6 of buses and where they are; how many buses have come
7 in -- I know over the past few years they were
8 running a bit late and I know that the MTA designed
9 buses with such intricate demands; the roll-out is
10 difficult, but every time it rains, I'm feeling
11 complaints from constituents because it's raining on
12 their heads inside the buses, then they get new buses
13 and then they filter them throughout the system,
14 which is cruel irony that you wait a decade for
15 buses, you get six months of buses, then the next
16 thing you know, those buses are in Staten Island and
17 you're back to the old buses that you had before.
18 How do we fix that? I think those are things that
19 you can address and just to throw some icing on the
20 cake, I always ask about the MTA's commitment to
21 dedicated funding. Will you commit finally this year
22 to support legislation that supports dedicated
23 funding for the MTA?

24 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: The City Ticket issue,
25 they're studying that right now; I believe they're

2 looking -- I can't say for sure, but for later this
3 year or 2018 maybe, to have something together on
4 that, but it's too premature for me to really...

5 [crosstalk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, I just hope
7 that the community has some input that, you know,
8 doesn't necessarily have to be my office, but
9 certainly, if it's gonna be rolled out, we wanna make
10 sure that the community really has some input that is
11 really reaching the target audience and doing what we
12 hoped it would do.

13 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah. In terms of
14 labor, the MTA and the TW came to a 28-month
15 agreement; their last contract expired in January of
16 2017, so we now are locked in with new rates for 28
17 months from that period; that rate's a number that
18 was very close to the budget... [crosstalk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: What about the
20 other 48 bargaining units?

21 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Pardon me?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: What about the
23 other 48 bargaining units within the MTA?

24

25

2 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Well we believe to have
3 achieved agreement with the Long Island Rail Road..
4 [interpose]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So have you
6 allocated money for pattern contracts?

7 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: That's the assumption,
8 pattern; that's what we're assuming, pattern.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So then those
10 other, how many that's out there, should have
11 contracts mirroring that of TW **[inaudible]**..
12 [crosstalk]

13 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Well until those
14 contracts are signed, you know, we don't know what
15 they're gonna be, but from a budget standpoint, we
16 assume it's pattern... [crosstalk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: But you do assume
18 that people doing the same job should be compensated
19 in the same way; right?

20 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: We're assuming the
21 pattern increases from the prior contract..
22 [crosstalk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay.

24 [background comment]

25

2 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Jamaica Depot -- I'm
3 gonna have to get back to you on that one; I don't
4 have the answer to that.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Is there \$300
6 million still in the budget for that?

7 STEPHANIE DELISLE: Yeah. In the 15-19
8 Capital.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Has there been
10 any work done on it at all, **[inaudible]**?

11 STEPHANIE DELISLE: Don't know the
12 status, but we'll certainly get it.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So here's the
14 problem with that; that that money's been in the
15 budget at least four times in the last 30 years and
16 if it's not used it's gone and we really, really need
17 that depot. Twenty years ago the survey said that it
18 was operating at 75% of capacity to serve the greater
19 Jamaica area and that area has grown tremendously, so
20 we need to get that done... [crosstalk]

21 STEPHANIE DELISLE: Well we can
22 **[inaudible]**. [background comment]

23 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Uhm... [bell]

24 STEPHANIE DELISLE: Buses -- over the
25 past couple of years we've taken delivery of more

2 than 1,100 new buses and we are I believe currently
3 in the process of accepting 1,700 additional buses.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Where are they
5 going and what... and those are placing buses; those
6 aren't new buses; those are replacing buses, so...

7 STEPHANIE DELISLE: Uhm-hm.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: where are they?
9 'Cause what I'm seeing is older buses returning; how
10 is that possible?

11 STEPHANIE DELISLE: We'll certainly get
12 that information to you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you
15 Council Member. Council Member Menchaca.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you to
17 the chairs. So over the weekend the.. I read in
18 newspapers that the MTA was gonna start a new pilot
19 program to reduce the number of workers, and these
20 are essentially cleaners on the R line; one, I'm
21 incredibly upset; we've been in constant contact with
22 the MTA on some closures that we're gonna talk about
23 next, but the fact that we're in constant
24 communication and this kinda just pops up, we're
25 really concerned about the workers, we're really

2 concerned about the hygiene in our stations; we're
3 already seeing some decline in some of these stations
4 already, and this is incredibly concerning on the
5 safety issues, so tell us a little bit about that
6 decision -- whether that's a budget decision; what is
7 this pilot, and how you're gonna address that coming
8 back into the district when I think tonight there's a
9 community board meeting where the MTA's gonna talk
10 about the Prospect Avenue closure on the larger
11 renovations of the stations? I'll pause there to
12 give you an opportunity to answer that.

13 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: I don't have the answer
14 to that; we're gonna have to get back to you on that.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Were you aware
16 that there's a pilot project that's gonna be
17 initiated...? [crosstalk]

18 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Again, that's not...
19 that's not my purview of my job. Yeah... [crosstalk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Got it. Okay.
21 Well I'll just let you know that there is a pilot
22 project and... and so you've... you've already heard
23 multiple kinda angles to this question about what is
24 the MTA doing to resolve the crisis and you're doing
25 work; some of it is mysterious and not be able to be

2 answered now, but there's some really on-the-ground,
3 important things that constituents are bringing to us
4 as a concern that there's no process and ability for
5 us to get to you all, and so you should take that
6 back that that feedback loop is broken, and that is
7 gonna continue to fuel the inability for the MTA to
8 respond effectively to our ground, and we're gonna
9 move beyond crisis and really.. there's gonna be a
10 revolution just based on the fact that they can't..
11 people can't get to work. As much as we tout that
12 New York City is a movable city and we can get in and
13 out, and I know it's warmer now so we're using our
14 bikes and Citi Bike and other modes of
15 transportation; so many people still rely on the R,
16 and I'm speaking for my district right now, and it is
17 continually.. it continues to be impacted by decisions
18 that are harming our constituents, and so you need to
19 understand that in a very real way.

20 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: 'Kay.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Separate and
22 apart from that, the closures are gonna continue and
23 so we have 53rd Street down already in renovation
24 mode, at Prospect Avenue, and then there's another
25 one on the line. We've been asking for shuttle

2 buses, so this is the second time that the MTA has
3 returned before us in the last month and a half or so
4 and we've asked for shuttle buses; does that appear
5 on your radar at all? Is that something that you can
6 speak to? Not just shuttle buses, but an actual
7 review of a 4th Avenue bus line that'll connect Bay
8 Ridge and the depths of Bay Ridge up to the Barclay
9 Center? We are -- actually, I'll stop there. If you
10 can answer the questions about shuttle bus with the
11 temporary closures -- three stations going down on
12 the R -- and then all the closures of the switcher
13 shoes, and the renovations that are happening on top
14 of the renovation of the stations.

15 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Again, I can't answer
16 those questions; we'll get back to you on those.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay, good.
18 'Cause look, this is not the only forum in which
19 we're gonna be engaging you; this is gonna happen in
20 the community board meetings where we're gonna force
21 you to come in and talk to people about what's
22 happening; this is gonna happen on the streets; this
23 is gonna happen through the press; the pressure is
24 gonna continue to rise and all of us are gonna take
25 that accountability and the responsibility of

2 bringing our community's voice to the table, and
3 that's gonna require a real restructuring of how
4 you're actually addressing the issues and so I hope
5 that you not only jot down, but circle and
6 exclamation point shuttle buses and 4th Avenue bus
7 line that can be an opportunity for a new approach to
8 a community that has been continually disserved by
9 the MTA. And so I'm hoping you take that seriously;
10 we're gonna continue to make that very, very clear,
11 and if you can get back to us on this pilot project
12 and what's gonna do to the R line in the middle of
13 all the other things that are happening right now on
14 the renovations.

15 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Duly noted.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay. I'm
17 done. Thank you... [crosstalk]

18
19 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you
20 Council Member. Can you discuss any engagement or
21 conversations that the MTA is having, or budgetary
22 plans, with the Port Authority on the air train --
23 the Willets Point stop has a plan for it to be a
24 major hub I guess or a train stop for LaGuardia
25 Airport a priority of the Governor? Is there

2 anything in your Capital Plan, because it's about
3 connecting the 7 train and adding more ridership from
4 -- 'cause people are supposed to take the 7 or the
5 Long Island Rail Road to the air train, so is
6 anything reflected in your budget to address this
7 coming air train?

8 [background comments]

9 STEPHANIE DELISLE: I'm looking in my
10 documents here, but we will certainly get you a more
11 comprehensive answer, because in terms of those
12 conversations that are being had, we aren't privy to
13 those, but we will certainly get you a status report
14 on those conversations, as well as how much of the
15 Capital Program will be devoted to executing those
16 policies.

17 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: The 7
18 train currently does not have an elevator; the only
19 access is the pedestrian ramp, which the City is
20 investing \$127 million to repair because it is in
21 disrepair; the Long Island Rail Road is actually what
22 goes under this ramp. I have called on the MTA on
23 several occasions to open and make the Long Island
24 Rail Road stop at Willets Point a more frequent one;
25 not just one that's used during game days, both for

2 The Mets or for the U.S. Open, so it's available for
3 those patrons, but not for my constituents to whom we
4 could bring some great, needed.. I guess to alleviate
5 the amount of people that take the 7 train -- 74th
6 Street stop I think is actually dangerous if you go
7 there at peak hours, because people are packed up so
8 tight on this elevated track and I think if we were
9 able to do a City Pass on that Long Island Rail Road
10 we can help mitigate some of the people that are
11 trying to get, you know, back to Flushing or back to
12 Corona or back to our area. So I know that you might
13 not be able to answer this, but I'd like to have a
14 follow-up conversation on this, 'cause I think it is
15 something that could be very resolvable. And it
16 concerns me greatly that we would be adding another
17 burden to that line to help address getting travelers
18 expediently to the airport without taking into
19 consideration the actual riders that live in the
20 area. So it's not just about the travelers; it
21 should be about the immediate people that live in the
22 area that can be burdened.

23 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Thank you. We will
24 bring that back to MTA.

25 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay.

2 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Let me get
3 back, just two more questions. First of all, like as
4 the Budget Director, what is like... when you look back
5 to the year you've been serving in this capacity and
6 knowing that this entity is a like \$1 trillion value,
7 which areas will you like to leave your name and your
8 legacy to say when I leave from the Budget Director,
9 we were able to make these changes to improve
10 transportation to New Yorkers?

11 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: I'm not sure that I'm
12 looking for a legacy, but I will say that in the
13 amount of time I've been at the MTA, the improvement
14 -- which I started in 1983 -- the improvement is
15 dramatic in every measurable category -- mean
16 distance between failure; on-time performance; the
17 amount of service; amenities -- they're vastly
18 superior to when I started; there's no doubt about
19 that.

20 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Well I
21 **[inaudible]** you know the improvements of the MTA, you
22 know taking the 1 train when I came here in '83,
23 without air conditioning, without any heat you know
24 from the Inwood area to work in restaurants in this
25 area, to the trains that we have today that most of

2 them, they have air conditioning and they have heat;
3 no doubt that we were able to make improvements, but
4 also, when you speak to your colleagues, worldwide,
5 and when you look on other train systems, like areas
6 where we can say you know, we are running the train
7 faster; we have improved the efficiencies and the
8 safety of the train system, and again, this is not
9 giving credit for the leadership of those of you
10 running this big institution, but for me it's more,
11 how can we think outside the boxes and look at, when
12 we take the A train from here -- I take the A train
13 from Inwood area and this is the area that we are
14 looking to rezoning; this is the area that we're
15 looking to add the additional 10,000 units in the
16 next 15 years, and in the second stop going downtown
17 **[inaudible]** Street during the rush hour, there is no
18 seat anymore on the A train, and if we want to
19 attract developers, you know, and New Yorkers to say
20 this is a good area where you can live, then we need
21 to be sure that they plan to upgrade the signal
22 system in the A train that is included among those
23 lines; that they are part of the reason why the are
24 running slower than other trains is because they need
25 to upgrade the signal system. Like, are we really

2 ready to say that the A train will have the upgrade
3 signal system so that we can bring more trains more
4 often on that line?

5 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Well your question
6 started out with like my legacy and what I'd like to
7 see. Again, MTA management understands all of these
8 issues and they are prioritizing the needs and
9 they're also looking at, you know, what they can
10 actually manage, and the Capital Program basically
11 chronicles what they think is the best thing that
12 they could do right now with the resources that are
13 available to us, and that's really all I can say on
14 that.

15 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah. The
16 elevators and escalator outages, when they go out of
17 service, does the MTA record those information?
18 Let's say if you go back to your team who collects
19 those data, do you have those numbers, let's say in
20 2015 compared to where we are right now in 2017, how
21 many elevators have been out of order; how many
22 escalators have been malfunctioning **[inaudible]**...
23 [crosstalk]

24

25

2 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah. Yes. Yeah, they
3 keep data on elevator and escalator maintenance or...
4 [interpose]

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay.

6 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: performance
7 **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

8 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Well at the
9 local level, what is the plan for 168th elevator?

10 STEPHANIE DELISLE: I...

11 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: 168, A1 train
12 elevator.

13 STEPHANIE DELISLE: Right. I can say
14 that in the current, the 2015-2019 Capital Program I
15 believe there is 45... \$44.7 million budget for the 12
16 tracks and elevators at 168, 181 and 191st.

17 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I... I just...
18 I've been saying since I joined the Council in 2009,
19 and I hope that the MTA, you send your team to look
20 at the escalator, the stairs in the 1 train at the
21 168 **[inaudible]** station from the elevator to the
22 platform. I know that when you span the **[inaudible]**...
23 that's the stair where we will have to build a ramp
24 in order for individuals in wheelchairs to be able to
25 go down from the elevator to the platform. I also

2 know that you have to comply with federal standards
3 on how long you can put the ramp and how wide you
4 have to do it, but not as an engineering but as
5 someone that uses that station once in a while, I
6 have seen that when -- those of you that are familiar
7 with that station -- when you get down from the
8 elevator to the platform, if you look at the right
9 side, that's long enough to build a ramp so that
10 someone with wheelchair should have able to have
11 access to go down to the 1 train. And I'm just
12 bringing the... you know, in my community we have 198
13 train; a lot of complaints with the elevators there
14 too, but I am focusing also on the 1 train also, 1
15 train at the 181st stop, but the 168, you know, we
16 have one of the major national hospitals there,
17 Columbia Presbyterian, and I know that both the
18 hospital and the MTA, you've also been putting
19 millions of dollars in capital to do some major
20 repairs in the infrastructure, but I hope again that
21 -- and I want to close with the local level -- that
22 together we can do some walk and look at that,
23 especially one of the elevators -- I want to trust
24 you; I want to be sure that we deliver the new
25 elevators at the 168 on time; if we can expedite it,

2 much better, but I would like for us to have a walk
3 -- no media -- yes, only for us to see how we can
4 look at the possibility to build a ramp at the 1
5 train platform... from the elevator to the 1 train
6 platform, because we have thousands of individuals --
7 patients, students, doctors, residents -- of that
8 community that I know that they will benefit if we
9 also make that area accessible.

10 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Duly noted. Thank you...

11 [crosstalk]

12 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank...

13 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah.

14 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thanks.

15 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you
16 Chair. So we have a list of things that you
17 committed to getting back to us, and he's gonna read
18 it because I can't read his handwriting.

19 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Chair, can I
20 just say... one minute before you read it? For the
21 record, I also would like, and if I have different
22 information; more than happy to hear from you, but
23 among the seven MTA districts, New York City is the
24 one that makes the largest contribution to the MTA
25 budget. Is that something that we agree?

2 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: It's not necessarily a
3 direct... the vast majority of monies that come from
4 the MTA district don't come from the counties
5 directly. So the vast majority of the money comes
6 from State taxes collected within the MTA region;
7 only a minor share of the taxes come directly from
8 the counties, and in that instance, of course, New
9 York City Transit's five boroughs are of course, are
10 the largest contributors of that tax.. [crosstalk]

11 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: No, we...

12 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: which is dwarfed by the
13 amount that we receive from New York State.

14 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I don't
15 pretend to say that the budget is balanced with the
16 municipality contribution...

17 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Uhm-hm.

18 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: when New
19 Yorkers sell their property, if it's more than
20 \$500,000... [crosstalk]

21 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: That's right; that's
22 the urban tax.

23 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: that's a
24 contribution that New Yorkers also make to the MTA.

2 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: That goes directly to
3 New York City Transit; that's... [crosstalk]

4 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Exactly.

5 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: that's part of the
6 urban tax.

7 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So we
8 contributed more than... yes, you know the billion
9 dollars that we're saying that the City contributed,
10 but I say aside what the Governor and the..
11 [crosstalk]

12 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Uhm-hm.

13 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: state
14 legislators...

15 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah.

16 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: contribute to
17 the MTA, and besides what...

18 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Uhm-hm.

19 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: the property
20 taxes transaction... [crosstalk]

21 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: That's right.

22 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: also
23 contributions to MTA, when we look at the
24 contribution of each of those cities that also
25 benefit from the MTA because I also have to

2 recognize, New York City also benefits from the MTA
3 by attracting those individuals who live also in
4 those other areas... [crosstalk]

5 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah.

6 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: from Long
7 Island, **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

8 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: But...

9 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: but can se
10 agree that we as a city make a large contribution to
11 the MTA too?

12 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Well you do make a
13 large contribution to the MTA and that urban tax is a
14 tax that other counties don't make, but I also need
15 to point out that MTA is subsidizing \$356 million of
16 paratransit for New York City that it's not doing for
17 the other counties, \$184 million of school fare that
18 it's not doing for the other counties, \$128 million
19 of elderly and disabled, which is about \$670 million
20 that is funding directly New York City, that's
21 subsidizing... [interpose]

22 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: On the
23 elderly and disabled component, I just wanna say...
24 [crosstalk]

25 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yes.

2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: if all
3 your transportation was accessible, perhaps you know
4 we wouldn't have to... So I hear what... what the
5 contributions are... [crosstalk]

6 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: It's...

7 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: but
8 they're kind of in response...

9 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah. Uhm-hm.

10 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: to also
11 mitigating other things that are not provided by MTA...
12 [crosstalk]

13 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah, this... It's a very
14 complex subject matter, because there are so many...
15 you could debate this in so many different ways, you
16 know, 24-hour service vs. not, you know the fact that
17 a sizable percentage of commuter... commute from the
18 suburbs also pay for the subway fare on top of their
19 fare. So anyway, it's very complex; what you said is
20 technically correct, but there's lots of advantages
21 and disadvantages going in both directions, which is
22 I believe why the legislation was formulated the way
23 it was in the first place back in the late 1970s.

24 [background comment] Yeah.

2 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And how much
3 is the debt of the MTA?

4 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: How much what?

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Debt.

6 STEPHANIE DELISLE: Debt.

7 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Debt?

8 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, debt.

9 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: In terms of debt
10 service or?

11 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah.

12 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Uhm... [crosstalk]

13 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Well how much
14 does the MTA right now owe **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

15 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: How much do we owe?
16 About \$36 billion.

17 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: \$35 billion?

18 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yes.

19 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. And is
20 the MTA -- and I'm sorry, Chairman too. In my
21 community we have 38 acres; we have the rail yard..

22 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah.

23 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Does the MTA
24 have a plan to also attract developers to take
25

2 advantage you know when the MTA can say not...

3 [crosstalk]

4 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Wha... What?

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: only... 207 rail
6 yard...

7 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Oh uhm...

8 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: We have a rail
9 yard in Queens; we have a rail yard in the Bronx; I
10 know that they're expensive; we [inaudible] the
11 Hudson Yard...

12 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Uhm-hm.

13 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: they're
14 expensive to build, but is the MTA... does the MTA have
15 the aggressive plan, having conversation with
16 developers saying here we have this opportunity for
17 them to have conversation with you guys and see...

18 [crosstalk]

19 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah, I... I have to
20 bring that back to MTA executives.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Thank
22 you.

23 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah.

24 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
25 you, Chair. Okay, so follow up on the types of

2 delays and plans to address them: How many hires of
3 the new maintenance staff, and I guess this is tied
4 to your six-point plan -- these are the questions
5 that we're expecting answers from, in addition to the
6 ones that we're gonna be sending you -- and when will
7 the painting on the elevated line, the Queens line,
8 the 7 train, commence; a plan for the transportation
9 delays in New York City; having a policy rep at the
10 next hearing for the MTA to address issues and
11 concerns that you have not been able to because it's
12 not within your purview; people have to pay... for
13 riders who have to pay two fare zones, how can we
14 better address that issue; taxi surcharge on app-
15 based, since the MTA has reported a \$13 million loss;
16 the follow-up on Access-A-Ride; is MTA doing research
17 into how to improve bus speeds; traffic signal
18 prioritization for buses; signal repairs, which lines
19 will seek improvement in timelines; cost of replacing
20 all antiquated signals; the air train update and the
21 previous study on the air train; the Jamaica Depot
22 status; the number of new buses and which buses they
23 are going to replace; the 4th Avenue bus line pilot
24 follow-up; the shuttle bus in Sunset Park follow-up;
25 discussion with the Port Authority and the LaGuardia

2 redevelopment follow-up; and also the Willets Point
3 station follow-up.

4 So those are what we just got from our
5 conversations here. We have additional Committee
6 questions that we will be getting to you; it would be
7 greatly appreciate if you can get those answers
8 before our budget adoption, because we'll be using
9 them for negotiation purposes.

10 Can we get... [interpose]

11 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: What is your timeline?

12 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Well
13 it'll be... our latest that we could possibly pass this
14 budget is June 30th; I would think that by the first
15 week of June we should be able to have some responses
16 from you is when it's expected.

17 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah, we'll do our
18 best.

19 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay.

20 [background comments]

21 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Oh, I'm
22 closing; are...

23 [background comments]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you Chair
25 Ferreras-Copeland, as well as Chair Rodriguez.

2 Please run the clock. I wanna thank the MTA New York
3 City Transit for working with me using data,
4 particularly bus time data, to see about service
5 quality, especially in my district, and for the 79
6 new buses, thank you to New York City Transit as well
7 as Governor Cuomo.

8 I guess one key piece is; which is worse,
9 a bus that's -- which is worse, having 100 people
10 waiting for a bus that's 20 minutes late or no one
11 waiting for a bus that's 20 minutes late?

12 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: I'm not gonna answer
13 that.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I would suggest...
15 [crosstalk]

16 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: that it's worse
18 to have... [interpose]

19 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: those 100 people
21 waiting, and I... there's a measure for that called
22 excess wait time and I'm curious about whether or not
23 that's something that the MTA could adopt and what
24 the budget implications would be of using excess wait
25 time as a measure of service quality.

2 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: 'Kay.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Do you think you
4 could get back to me about that?

5 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: We'll talk to our
6 service planning people.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Perfect. And
8 then along the same lines, I've been trying to get a
9 stop on the M15 select bus service at 72nd Street;
10 one of the reasons we have received in a letter from
11 the MTA is a lack of service, lack of number of
12 riders at that location and at the subway system you
13 actually will tell us how many people use each
14 turnstile and every single moment that they do; could
15 that information be shared for the fare box so that
16 we can have a moment by moment account for ridership
17 throughout the city?

18 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Are you saying buses?
19 I'm not sure I follow the question.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: There's a fare
21 box on the buses... [crosstalk]

22 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Yeah.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: and if we could
24 get the information on when somebody swipes...

25 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Okay.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: and then we're
3 able to take that information; we could actually
4 merge it with the bus time data to find out how many
5 people are getting on in real time at every single
6 bus stop.

7 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Okay, we'll look into
8 that.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Okay. And there
10 was one other key measure that I wanted to ask about
11 -- give me one moment. There is a system called Bus
12 Trek; Bus Trek is used by dispatchers to make real-
13 time adjustments to service schedules, and in so
14 doing the MTA has shared that they believe that once
15 the MTA has changed the schedule for that day to
16 account for any unforeseen problems, like a closed
17 street or an accident or things like that that those
18 buses may no longer be considered late; take that as
19 it may be, is it possible to make the Bus Trek
20 deviation schedule public or at least just what the
21 planned Bus Trek schedules are and just have that
22 data exported from Bus Trek so that we can compare it
23 to the planned scheduled and see what that deviation
24 is...? [crosstalk]

2 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Again, so we'll bring
3 these questions to the attention of those people that
4 look at that... [crosstalk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Okay. And for
6 all three of those, just what would be the budget
7 costs and what do you think the anticipated budget
8 savings would be if we were able to measure all of
9 that and use that to improve service, and one of the
10 great things is, when you invest in things, people
11 start riding and so we've already seen an increase in
12 ridership on Flex buses -- the M86 in my district; I
13 look forward to seeing it on the M79 -- and I think
14 that if we could use excess wait time, fare box data
15 and Bus Trek deviation data, we could really
16 streamline things, I think.

17 Last, but certainly not least, we've been
18 able to work with professors at the Center for Urban
19 Studies at NYU; we've been able to use the bus time
20 data to analyze locations in the City where there are
21 choke points, and would the MTA meet with myself, the
22 Department of Transportation and even professors from
23 Center for Urban Studies or other experts to identify
24 each and every bottleneck, particularly in my
25 district and perhaps anywhere else in the city you

2 wish, to prioritize for bus lanes, for prioritization
3 for giving the lights, priority for buses and other
4 technological improvements?

5 DOUGLAS JOHNSON: Okay, duly noted.

6 We'll... We'll look into all that... [crosstalk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you. And
8 thank you, Chair and for all of those who are
9 watching online and did not understand any of what
10 was just said, feel free to email me or tweet me
11 @BenKallos.

12 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you
13 Council Member Kallos. That concludes today's
14 hearing. Thank you again to the MTA for being with
15 us today; I'd also like to once again thank my co-
16 chair, Council Member Rodriguez and the members of
17 the Transportation Committee. Again, a reminder that
18 the public will be invited to testify on Thursday,
19 May 25th, the last day of budget hearings, at
20 approximately 1:00 p.m.; if you'd like to submit your
21 testimony for the record, you can send it to
22 Council.NYC.gov/budget/testimony and the staff will
23 make it a part of the official record.

24 The Finance Committee will resume budget
25 hearings tomorrow in this room at 10:00 a.m. with the

2 Committee of Public Housing [bell] to hear from the
3 New York City Housing Authority. After NYCHA, we
4 will hear from the Department of Information
5 Technology and Telecommunications, followed by the
6 Department of Parks and Recreation.

7 With that, the hearing is now adjourned.

8 [gavel]

9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date June 21, 2017