

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

1

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE, JOINTLY WITH,
COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

----- X

May 16, 2017
Start: 10:15 a.m.
Recess: 2:58 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E:

Julissa Ferreras-Copeland
Chairperson

Daniel Dromm
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Steven Matteo
Ben Kallos
Ydanis Rodriguez
Mark Treyger
Margaret Chin
Vanessa Gibson
Deborah Rose
Alan Maisel
Vincent Gentile
Daniel Garodnick
Inez Barron
Brad Lander
Rafael Salamanca
Chaim Deutsch
Corey Johnson

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

Jimmy Van Bramer
Helen Rosenthal
Robert Cornegy
Antonio Reynoso
Mark Levine
I. Daneek Miler

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Borough President Otto

Carmen Farina, Chancellor
Department of Education

Raymond Orlando, Chief Financial Officer
Department of Education

Lucas Taylor, Executive Director
[Inaudible]

Elizabeth Rose, Deputy Commissioner
Department of Education

Lorraine Grillo, President & CEO
School Construction Authority

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Good

morning and welcome to today's Committee Hearing,

Finance Committee. My name is Julissa Ferreras-

Copeland. I am the Chair of the Finance Committee.

I want to acknowledge Borough President Otto who has

joined us in the back. I want to begin by thanking

my co-chair, Chair Danny Dromm, and the members of

Education Committee for joining us today. I also

want to acknowledge members of both committees who

are here with us. We have Minority Leader Matteo,

Council Member Kallos, Rodriguez and Treyger. This

morning the Committee comminutes to look at the

Mayor's Fiscal 2018 Executive Budget with the

Department of Education and the School Construction

Authority. We will hear first from the DOE's

Chancellor Carmen Farina to discuss DOE's expense

budget followed by DOE Deputy Commissioner Elizabeth

Rose and SCA President and CEO Lorraine Grillo to

discuss the capital plan. I will begin with a brief

overview of the Department's budget, DOE's fiscal

2018 budget totals 24.3 billion in increases,

approximately 1.1 billion over Fiscal 2017's adopted

budget. DOE represents nearly 29 percent of the

1
2 city's budget. The department's new needs since a
3 preliminary budget total 103.5 million in the coming
4 fiscal year increasing to 217.7 million by fiscal
5 2021. Significant new investments, which we will
6 discuss in more detail during the hearing, include
7 the transfer the transfer of earn and earned from ACS
8 to DOE as well as 3K for all to provide free full day
9 preschool to three year olds in two districts. The
10 DOE's budget supports a head count of just under 131
11 800 positions turning to the capital budget, the
12 February 2017 proposed amendment to the DOE's five
13 year capital plan total 15.5 million including 5.9
14 billion for capacity projects and approximately 6
15 billion for investments to improve and upgrade
16 existing facilities. There are a number of areas
17 that I hope to touch on in greater detail for today's
18 hearing. To begin with on the expense side, I am
19 concerned about the amount of state foundation aid
20 received by DOE, 165.6 million less than the
21 department had projected it would receive in the
22 preliminary plan. This level of aid fails to meet the
23 state's responsibility under the framework
24 established by the 2006 Campaign For All equity
25 decision. The impact of this adjustment will fall

1 directly on our schools, scraping a plan to increase
2 in their budgets at maintaining the same base level
3 of funding as the prior year. I would like to hear
4 from DOE about how they intend to address this
5 shortfall to provide the proper level of resources to
6 our 1800 public schools. Furthermore, the Council
7 was disappointed to see that the Administration
8 failed to address our call for universal school lunch
9 in this budget. All five borough presidents and 82
10 percent of the city's voter support the elimination
11 of school lunch fees because all students would be
12 eligible to participate if it removes the stigma
13 receiving a free meal at school because no
14 immigration restriction exists for this program
15 children would be able to obtain meals regardless of
16 their immigration status. Universal school lunch is
17 not only the popular thing to do, it is the right
18 thing to do. This Council will continue to push the
19 Administration to include this essential priority in
20 the adopted budget. Finally, as I mentioned, the
21 expense budget includes 20 million to transfer the
22 early learned child care system from ACS to DOE. The
23 goal of this transfer is to better align the city's
24 early childhood education programs and will fund
25

1 social workers and instructional coordinators in
2 early learning programs as well as greater outreach.
3 DOE will fully assume control of early learning in
4 fiscal 2019. The Council applauds this initiative
5 and we believe this provides a crucial opportunity to
6 create pay parity for ACS and DOE educators. On the
7 capital side, back in February, the Finance and
8 Education Committees heard from DOE and SCA regarding
9 the challenges of planning and siting for new
10 capacity. Given the significant overcrowding in our
11 districts, this is particularly prominent issue for
12 Chair Dromm and myself but it is also something
13 experienced by all of us. I want to thank the Speaker
14 for addressing this concern in her State of the City
15 speech and working with us to develop a working group
16 that is exploring reforms to these processes. I
17 would encourage those members of the public who want
18 to provide us with their input on these issues to
19 visit the council's website and submit their
20 comments. This link is available in the report that
21 has been distributed for this hearing. We will
22 welcome the announcement -- while we welcome the
23 announcement of 3K, the extent of the initiatives
24 impact on DOE's capital budget is unclear. The
25

1
2 Department expects that half of the capacity will
3 come from DOE's facilities which may require capital
4 funding to convert existing space for classrooms
5 appropriate for three year old students or to
6 construct additional seats. This could very well
7 worst an existing planning and siting challenges.
8 Finally, I want to address something that is always a
9 critical importance to me as we got through the
10 budget process and that is transparency. In our
11 budget response, we called on the Administration to
12 make changes to the [inaudible 00:06:00] five year
13 capital plan give the side at 15.5 billion and
14 importance of the capital plan, we continue to urge
15 the plans publication format to be more transparent,
16 understandable and detailed for benefits of both the
17 council and the public. I look forward to hearing
18 from these issues and many more today. Before
19 turning it over to my co-chair, I want to thank the
20 Finance staff that helped prepare this hearing:
21 Regina Parada (SP) Ryan, Nathan Tolk (SP), Elisha ??,
22 Katlyn O'Hagan and Eric Bernstein. I will now turn
23 the mic over the Chair Dromm for his opening
24 statement.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much,
3 Chair Ferreras-Copeland and good morning everyone. I
4 am Council Member Danny Dromm and I am the Chair of
5 the Education Committee. Welcome to the Fiscal 2018
6 Executive Budget Hearing on the Department of
7 Education and the School Construction Authority. We
8 will start today by hearing from the DOE's Chancellor
9 Carmen Farina, who will discuss the expense and
10 operating portion of the DOE's executive budget, and
11 then we will hear about the DOE's capital plan from
12 Deputy Chancellor Elizabeth Rose and SCA President
13 and CEO Lorraine Grillo. The Department of
14 Education's Fiscal 2018 Operating Budget totals \$30.8
15 billion including pension and debt service which
16 represents 36 percent of New York City's budget.
17 Education spending is also a significant portion of
18 the capital budget. The DOE's ten year capital
19 strategy is 20.5 billion or 23 percent of the city's
20 capital strategy. DOE's executive budget on the
21 expense side is \$1.1 billion more than the DOE's
22 fiscal 2017 adopted budget and while I support many of
23 the new needs added in their -- this plan there are
24 still unanswered questions that I have about some of
25 the Administration's priorities and spending choices.

1
2 There are two big changes in the DOE's executive
3 budget that reflect this Administration's priorities.
4 The first is the Mayor's recent announcement about
5 extending universal pre-kindergarten to three year
6 olds through a new program called 3K For All. The
7 DOE's fiscal 2018 executive budget commits \$16.5
8 million to begin this in two school districts,
9 District Seven in the South Bronx and District 23 in
10 Brooklyn. The Administration plans to provide free
11 full day pre-school for any three year old that wants
12 it in those two districts by the fall of 2018 which
13 will require an estimated 1,800 seats for three year
14 olds. The budget lays out the Mayor's plan for
15 expansions by adding two school districts every year
16 so that by fiscal 2021. 3K For All will operate in
17 eight school districts at a cost of \$157 million.
18 While I applaud the idea of providing free quality
19 preschool to three year olds, I want to learn more
20 today about the Administration's plans to make this a
21 truly universal program. This is a very expensive
22 endeavor which potentially could cost \$1 billion to
23 provide every three year old and this cannot be
24 supported by the city funding alone. We are the --
25 what are the city's plans to secure additional funds

1 from the state and federal governments to support his
2 and is there any guarantee, especially in this
3 political climate, that New York City will be able to
4 secure funding for this. The Mayor's big
5 announcement which is also reflected in this budget
6 is moving the childcare system known as Early Learn
7 from the Administration for Children Services to DOE.
8 This move consolidates all early education programs
9 under the management of one agency, the DOE, with the
10 aim of creating a consistent system with better
11 alignment between Early Learn and universal pre-
12 kindergarten. This budget reflects this move by
13 creating budget lines for early childhood programs in
14 DOE and the Early Learn contract is recognized in the
15 DOE's budget in fiscal 2019 when we anticipate a new
16 RFP will be released. DOE is also baselined \$20
17 million to support the transfer and ensure alignment
18 between Early Learn and universal pre-kindergarten.
19 Today, I would like to hear from the DOE about how
20 and why they decided to baseline \$20 million for
21 this. I also would like to know or to hear about
22 their vision for managing this new system which will
23 now include providing programs to children ages zero
24 through five incentive based childcare, home based
25

1
2 childcare through family child care networks and head
3 start. DOE has always been a very large agency with
4 a large budget serving over a million students but
5 this transfer adds even more responsibility and money
6 to the DOE. The DOE has been criticized in the past,
7 including by me, about their contracting process and
8 oversight in the contracting process. How can we be
9 assured that the early learned contract can be
10 reissued at DOE without any problem? How can you
11 assure us that DOE has the capacity to properly
12 manage this new system? I understand the desire to
13 align Early Learn and universal pre-kindergarten and
14 I especially hope this makes the day to day practice
15 for providers easier to navigate but I want to ensure
16 this is being done in the best interest of students,
17 parents and teachers. I am disappointed that we did
18 not see a commitment from the DOE to better support
19 LGBT students. While the council funded an LGBT
20 liaison in the fiscal 2016 adopted budget and the DOE
21 baselined that position last year at adoption, the
22 DOE has not made any other financial investments to
23 support LGBT students or the LGBT liaison. I am
24 interested in hearing today what the DOE's commitment
25 and plan is to support the LGBT liaison and LGBT

1 students in the upcoming school year. I am happy to
2 report that after the council called on the
3 Administration to provide air-conditioning in
4 classrooms has been included in the DOE's executive
5 budget. The DOE has committed \$5 million in fiscal
6 2018 and additional funding in the out years to
7 provide for the installation of air-conditioning in
8 all classrooms by 2022. In the fiscal 2017 adopted
9 budget, the council called on DOE to report on air-
10 conditioning in classrooms in a term and condition
11 which helped them strengthen the need for additional
12 air-conditioners in schools. I am thrilled that this
13 term and condition proved to be useful and hoped to
14 see more areas we can work together to create better
15 learning environments for students. The DOE and SCA
16 are still investigating the costs of necessary
17 electrical upgrades in buildings without air-
18 conditioning and additional capital funding may be
19 needed to cover this upgrade. However, in 2017,
20 February 2017, SCA released a \$15.5 billion proposed
21 amendment to the fiscal 2015-19 five year capital
22 plan that included \$50 million to perform work that
23 would facilitate the installation of air-conditioning
24 in instructional classrooms. While the SCA has not
25

1 issued an update to the five year capital plan since
2 the preliminary budget, we look forward to discussing
3 the proposed amendment in further detail given new
4 funding in the DOE's expense budget for air-
5 conditioners and 3K. In addition, this hearing gives
6 us an opportunity to discuss the council's
7 preliminary budget response items related to
8 education capital, building essential school
9 components such as auditoriums, cafeterias and
10 gymnasiums, improving accessibility in public schools
11 and increasing the transparency of the capital plan.
12 Finally, as Chair Ferreras-Copeland mentioned,
13 accounts of working groups to address issues of
14 school planning, siting and overcrowding is taking
15 public feedback through the council's website. The
16 link can be found in the DOE's executive capital
17 budget report. I encourage members of the public to
18 submit comment. Before I conclude, I would like to
19 thank the staff of my committee: Elizabeth Hoffman
20 and Caitlin O'Hagan, our finance analyst, ?? our
21 counsel and Jan Atwell, Joan ??, Kalima Johnson our
22 policy analyst for the committee. I would also like
23 to thank Millie ??. I would also like to introduce
24 my colleagues. I think everybody so far has been
25

1 introduced, if I'm not mistaken, and who have joined
2 us this morning. I'm sorry, Margaret Chin is here.
3 Thank you, Margaret, for being with us as well and
4 thank you again and we welcome to hear the
5 Chancellor's testimony. I think we have to swear her
6 in.
7

8 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Good morning Chairs
9 Ferreras-Copeland and Dromm.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Chancellor, we have
11 to swear you in.

12 [OATH ADMINISTERED]

13 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Good morning Chairs
14 Ferreras-Copeland and Dromm and all members of the
15 Finance and Education Committee here today. Thank
16 you for the opportunity to testify on Mayor de
17 Blasio's Fiscal 2018 Executive Budget as it related
18 to New York City Department of Education. I am
19 joined today by Raymond Orlando, the DOE's Chief
20 Financial Officer. To begin, I would like to thank
21 Speaker Mark-Viverito, Chairs Ferreras-Copeland and
22 Dromm and all the members of the city council for
23 your continued leadership and partnership on behalf
24 of our 1.1 million students. This Administration is
25 committed to ensuring that all students, regardless

1
2 of where they live and where they are from or where
3 their parents are from, have access to an excellent,
4 equitable education and I am proud of what we have
5 accomplished so far on behalf of the city's students.
6 Last year's graduation rate, 72.6 percent is the
7 highest it has ever been while the dropout rate, 8.5
8 percent, is the lowest it has ever been. New York
9 City students also outperformed the rest of the state
10 in the state ELA exam for the first time and our
11 overall improvement outpaced the rest of the state in
12 both ELA and math. However, we still have a lot of
13 work to do. That is why the equity and excellence
14 agenda is crucial. Through equity and excellence we
15 are addressing our students' academic, social and
16 emotional needs starting with our youngest learners
17 until they earn their high school diploma and receive
18 a college acceptance letter. There are at least 800
19 schools with one equity and excellence initiative
20 this year and this initiative will grow over the
21 year. I would like to share some highlights. Our
22 universal literacy initiative has over 100 reading
23 coaches and by the beginning of September will have
24 over 200 coaches and these are called teacher
25 whispers. These are teachers who have been highly

1 vetted. We receive a tremendous amount of
2 applications. We are in the process of interviewing
3 now for September and they work exclusively with the
4 K to 2 teachers in the schools they are assigned to
5 and we are moving from four districts to 14 districts
6 starting in September. Teachers are strengthening
7 their math instruction in over 200 elementary middle
8 and high schools through the Algebra for All. We are
9 starting this work in fifth grade and will ensure
10 that all eighth graders have access to algebra. This
11 is particularly crucial if when they can get to high
12 school they can have a sequential three year math
13 program which we know is a determinate of success in
14 high school and in college. This year we have
15 received over 600 applications for training by
16 teachers in the Algebra for All initiative and we
17 expect this program to be one of our more successful
18 ones in terms of increasing our math training. Our
19 college access role initiative is making college and
20 achievable expectation for all students. In
21 particular we have eliminated the CUNY application
22 fee for low income students. On April 5th, we held
23 the first ever citywide SAT school day when all high
24 school juniors in the city of New York were able to
25

1
2 take the exam in their own schools with their own
3 teachers during the school day. This is a remarkable
4 achievement and the fact that it was free egged it on
5 but was not the most important factor. They did not
6 have to travel to unfamiliar locations, sit with
7 unfamiliar teachers, and by doing it in their own
8 classroom the rate of success and their teachers
9 preparing them was much higher. An antidote I'd like
10 to share is last week I went to Ryker's Island, East
11 River Academy, and one of the teachers of the year
12 was in that situation and the students gave me a card
13 which I will actually save the rest of my life
14 because they told me that this is the first time
15 ever, ever in the history of Ryker's, where they were
16 allowed to take the SATs and the take on this is not
17 just the SATs but they have hope. If you believe in
18 kids and you let them take the unspoken messages, we
19 think you can go to college so it was very touching
20 to see them. They now have a library, they have
21 beanbags, they have other ways of expressing
22 themselves so I see this as a big success. Last year
23 we saw record number of students who took at least
24 one AP class, participation and performance gains
25 were the largest for black and Hispanic students with

1
2 an 18 percent increase in the number of black
3 students passing at least one AP and a 10.8 percent
4 in the number of Hispanic students. Our AP for All
5 initiative which is bringing new AP course to 63 high
6 schools will eventually ensure every high school has
7 access to at least five AP courses. I saw our
8 Councilman Ydanis Rodriguez here before, he's here,
9 okay. One of the reasons I'm saying this is that one
10 of the first schools we did this is one of his pet
11 schools, George Washington High School, and in that
12 campus alone there were very few AP courses and now
13 that the kids can take AP courses in all the schools
14 on that campus, the number of kids accessing this has
15 really tripled, the number of kids who actually take
16 the courses. So you can be in one of the small
17 schools but take a course and it involved those
18 people who know high schools, making the bells
19 schedules equal in all buildings which is nothing
20 short of a miracle so we are very happy with that.
21 The AP for All expansion this year increased the
22 number of AP courses again at Leeman as well and
23 Leeman has been one of the cornerstone model campuses
24 in terms of the things they are doing. Computer
25 Science World initiative will ensure that by 2025,

1 all of the city's public school students will receive
2 high quality computer science education at each
3 school level: elementary, middle and high school. We
4 will be training over 5000 teachers over the next ten
5 years. I recently visited PF62 in Queens where
6 computer science is taught in all grade levels
7 through project based learning and Brooklyn's PS376
8 is integrating computer science esteem at each grade
9 level. I went to visit that school on a day they
10 were sharing what every grade is doing and I had a
11 first grader doing coding and I went over to him to
12 see if I could figure out what it was and I was
13 glazed over by the time he went into his third
14 sentence and he finally looked at me and said,
15 Chancellor, I just think you are too old to learn
16 this, and I take exception but, you know, he's
17 probably right. But, these are schools that we have
18 now made learning partner schools, model schools, and
19 we are sending other people to visit them so we can
20 more rapidly grow the stim program across the city
21 and as I get visitors from across the country, they
22 are amazed with is how much of the stim we have put
23 into our elementary schools because that only raises
24 the bar by the time they get to middle schools and
25

1
2 highs schools. The single shepherd initiative in
3 District Seven in the Bronx and District 23 in
4 Brooklyn is showing promise. This program serves all
5 16,000 students in 50 schools and provides them with
6 a dedicated counselor or social worker who will guide
7 them on the path to success. Guidance counselors are
8 able to spend more time and be proactive. These
9 guidance counselors do not serve a specific grade.
10 They serve a specific family for seven years so this
11 becomes an extra member of your family and as
12 Councilman Dromm heard on Saturday, we are working
13 with someone from CASTLE, which is a national social
14 and emotional learning organization, and what is
15 really important is that every student in our schools
16 have a personal relationship with an adult outside of
17 their own family. It is important that all students
18 feel that there is someone who really cares about
19 them. An antidote on this program. I went to visit
20 one of the programs in District Seven. The principal
21 said he expects this year for the first time ever to
22 have 100 percent teacher retention because of the
23 single Shepard. In this school alone, there are
24 eight people who do nothing but either be social
25 workers or guidance counselors for the students in

1 the building. It's a six to 12 school and he said
2 because teachers now can spend more time on teaching
3 and where all the family, social and emotional issues
4 are handled by somebody who is an expert they feel
5 more comfortable. So that is a whole other point of
6 success. Also with the District Charter Partnership
7 Program, district and charter schools are coming
8 together to share best practices on instruction
9 particularly when it comes to English language
10 learners and math instruction. We know schools
11 throughout the city are making progress. Across
12 renewal high schools, we have seen a seven percent
13 graduation rate increase over the last two years. In
14 addition, all renewal school attendance is up,
15 chronic absenteeism is down and the teachers are
16 developing strong instructional practices. These
17 schools are receiving clear guidance on the progress
18 that they need and one of the things that we see
19 happening in all of the renewal schools stronger
20 parent relationships and student lead conferences
21 becoming the norm where the students actually come to
22 talk to the teachers with their parents and going
23 back, the message is the same to everyone. We are
24 expanding the number of community schools. Last week
25

1 we announced 69 additional schools will become
2 community schools in September. This will bring the
3 total number to 215. We have received the national
4 award which we will be accepting in June as a model
5 city for community schools and one of the things in
6 our community schools that is not often mentioned is
7 the fact that they provide a tremendous amount of
8 health support: mental health, physical health. This
9 is where students get free eyeglasses but it is also
10 where students who are deemed to be in need of extra
11 support either due to depression or other issues,
12 this is where the support comes out of and I believe
13 that our community schools, particularly in
14 neighborhoods where they may not have a lot of other
15 services are crucial. Safety of our students is our
16 highest priority. Every student in new York City has
17 the right to attend a public school and we are
18 committed to protect them and they receive a high
19 quality education. In January and March, we issued
20 guidance and resources to families regarding
21 immigration and protocols and as you may have read
22 this week, we actually went to a school to reinforce
23 at the school that in terms of federal officers they
24 may not enter our buildings, they may announce
25

1 themselves at the front desk but they then wait
2 outside while the principal or whoever is greeting
3 them receives further information and we have been
4 reassured by the agencies that we spoke to that this
5 will indeed be the pattern going forward. The DOE is
6 also partnering with Mayor's Office of Immigrant
7 Affairs and other community organizations to offer a
8 Know Your Rights workshops available during and after
9 school across the city. Generous funding from, city
10 council has enabled us to provide intensive
11 restorative justice programming in 25 schools, all of
12 which has seen a decrease in suspensions. Also with
13 city council funding for the first time, our schools,
14 communities will benefit from the programming and
15 support of a gender equity liaison and I heard you
16 loud and clear Danny and you should know we are
17 working on giving Jared a person to work also with
18 him out of the Family Engagement Office because what
19 we are seeing very clearly in this work is that it is
20 not just about working with teachers and
21 administrators but families are a crucial part of
22 moving forward so part of the training will be under
23 Jared, someone in Yolanda Torres' office to help them
24 with the work. We want to increase civic engagement,
25

1
2 voter registration and participation among high
3 school students and I know for a lot of you that is
4 an initiative and last year we were able to register
5 a lot of high school students and we expect to do
6 that again. We are pleased that our increased
7 emphasis on parent engagement has resulted in
8 significantly more parents attending conferences,
9 parent groups and running for their CECs. We have
10 held native language family engagement conferences in
11 Spanish, Bengali, Arabic and Mandarin. We have also
12 studied grand connections and engagement group for
13 grandparents in December 2015. This is particularly
14 close to my heart because as we go around the city we
15 notice that many more grandparents are raising their
16 children. These are not like me sometimes helping,
17 these are grandparents who have a full responsibility
18 to raise their children and they have asked for
19 special support A, due to their age and health issues
20 but most importantly reengaging with grandchildren
21 after they haven't been in charge of children for
22 many, many years and that is one of the initiatives
23 under the Family Engagement Office. In addition, we
24 are incubating two new initiatives, the Family
25 English Initiates where parents not only learn

1 English with their L students in grades K to 2, but
2 they pick up skills and information to support their
3 learning at home. This year, 75 families from four
4 schools are participating. Second is Space Lab,
5 esteem education training program where parents learn
6 to facilitate robotic activities with teachers in the
7 classroom after school and this has recently received
8 a grant to be able to teach parents more about stim
9 that they can then help in their schools but also
10 perhaps even increase their own job skills. Face Lab
11 is currently in 18 schools with over 80 parents and
12 just last week, we had over 500 parent coordinators
13 attend a professional development at their New York
14 Public Library to prepare themselves for engaging
15 parents to attend Summer in the City work. To better
16 reach the nearly 40 percent of our parents who speak
17 a language other than English at home, we have
18 significantly expanded and improved language access
19 service for our families. Changes include
20 designating and training a language access
21 coordinator in each school, hiring nine new full-time
22 field language coordinators to oversee services in
23 schools and expanding services to CECs and providing
24 schools with direct access to over the phone
25

1 interpretation in over 200 languages 24 hours a day,
2 seven days a week. The change to over the phone
3 services result in schools making over four times the
4 number of calls as before. I remain committed to
5 working to improve educational opportunities for all
6 Ls and ensure they have access to rigorous
7 instruction in full range of educational
8 opportunities within the DOE. We currently have 434
9 bilingual programs across every borough and are
10 adding 68 more this September including the first
11 ever bilingual program in ERDUE ?? and expanding
12 Bengali bilingual programs at elementary and high
13 schools. As a former L myself, this work is very
14 personal and I know how crucial these programs are
15 and the difference they make in the lives of our
16 students. As recently as last week, we hosted two
17 national speakers on dual language and bilingual
18 programs and they shared with us that we are looked
19 at as the model in the country on how to expand more
20 dual language programs. Our commitment to meeting
21 the individual needs of our students with disability
22 remains a focus for the DOE and is evidenced by the
23 growth of our ASD programs and EST programs and ASD
24 Horizon and bilingual special ed programs. This year
25

1 we opened 28 additional NEST and Horizon in district
2 schools, seven new district schools opened NEST or
3 Horizon programs. I would like to highlight our
4 partnership with the Cerebral Palsy Foundation and
5 NYU Medical Center around the Just ?? initiative
6 celebrate the diversity of students with disability
7 and strengthen school communities. This is a program
8 where schools of color are located. District 75,
9 [inaudible 00:29:52] agree to points of intersection
10 on at least five issues: instruction, lunch time and
11 play time and there's one -- parent engagement.
12 These schools with share teachers with each other,
13 they will share instruction facilities and they will
14 work more towards making sure that services are
15 provided equally to both. As an example of this, I
16 went to visit Canarsie High School which is co-
17 located with one district 75 school and one of the
18 points of success is the principal said this year for
19 the first time District 75 students are taking AP
20 courses in one of the other schools. That wasn't
21 available to them because there weren't enough kids
22 in their program by themselves to take the course but
23 by sharing they have access to this. Increasing the
24 diversity of our schools and classrooms is also a top
25

1
2 priority. We will be releasing more information on
3 this work before the end of the school year and I
4 look forward to continuing this important
5 conversation. CTE, Korean technology, also a key
6 part of our strategy to put students on the path to
7 college and careers, to that end we are investing in
8 40 new high quality CTE programs opening this year
9 and across the next school year. We are also
10 strengthening the number of existing programs. In
11 addition, city council funding has allowed us to
12 significantly expand and strengthen work based
13 learning opportunities including paid internships
14 with students enrolled in CTE programs. We also
15 received news that last week the state has approved
16 more certifications for CTE teachers which is crucial
17 for us expanding this work and that also means that
18 many more of our students will be graduating with
19 state endorsed diplomas which will make it easier for
20 them to enter the work world. The 2018 executive
21 budget includes an allocation of approximately 30.8
22 billion including 24.3 billion in operating funds and
23 another 6.5 billion of education related pension and
24 debt service funds in 2018. Our funding is a
25 combination of city, state and federal dollars with

1
2 city tax levy dollars making up the largest share at
3 57 percent, state dollars at 37 percent and federal
4 dollars at six percent. The Mayor's proposed 2018
5 budget for our school builds on this administration's
6 progress and continues the historic investments made
7 in previous years to ensure than students have access
8 to rigorous instruction, nonacademic support to boost
9 student achievement. It also makes additional target
10 investments in all our schools. The recently
11 announced 3K for All initiative builds on the success
12 of Pre-K for All and provides New York City children
13 continuum of early care and education from birth to
14 five years old. 3K for all will begin in the South
15 Bronx District Seven and Brownsville District 23.
16 We're also helping families enroll in existing seats
17 for three year olds across the city. I just want to
18 make a point here that the reasons these, because it
19 answers some of the questions you brought up prior,
20 the reason these two districts are chosen to begin
21 with is that they do have the available space without
22 us having to search for more space in addition to
23 which in many of these two districts they are also
24 single Shepard districts, so we feel that the
25 continuum of service for three year olds for right

1 through high school and into college is -- really
2 makes a lot of consistency possible and really forms
3 a strong foundation in those districts. As part of
4 our ongoing partnership with the Administration for
5 Children Services around supports for all students
6 and particularly their younger students, their Early
7 Learn New York City contracts will be integrated into
8 the division of early childhood to create
9 consistently high quality standards across all of the
10 publicly funded childhood continuum. This is
11 expected to support better transitions to elementary
12 school and we are pleased that the Mayor has
13 contributed 20.1 million in his executive budget to
14 improve the quality of early learned programs. I
15 also want to be very clear that this was not
16 something that we did recklessly or just at the top
17 of our heads, this took involved many years of
18 conversation and also very interesting conversations
19 with the new commissioner who really actually put us
20 to the test of finding our why we were going to do
21 this and we were able to actually satisfy him that
22 our commitment is just a start with kids,
23 particularly with literacy issues as quickly as
24 possible and also helping parents get parenting
25

1 skills even before age four so this is all part of
2 our process and we expect to continue that
3 relationship. This year we are implementing several
4 new initiatives to support the academic and social
5 and emotional needs living in temporary housing. We
6 hired more tenderness teachers and social workers,
7 are implementing literacy programs and shelters and
8 providing school based health services.
9
10 Additionally, the city launched a program to provide
11 yellow bus service to students in grades K to six who
12 reside in Department of Homeless Shelters. Next
13 year's budget provides funding to continue these
14 initiatives including providing social workers and
15 schools with the highest concentration of students in
16 shelter and after school tutoring in the shelters
17 themselves. We are working to ensure that school can
18 remain a constant stabilizing force in these
19 children's lives. Last year for the first time, our
20 summer program served high need second graders. The
21 budget includes funding to expand this program to
22 serve and additional 4400 second graders this year
23 and due to the comments we got from last year, the
24 program will actually run till 5:30 so the parents
25 can see it as a full day program, academic till 2:30

1 and wraparound services from 2:30 to 5:30. This has
2 been done in conjunction with Bill Chong and the
3 Office of Youth Development. Often we have worked in
4 cross purposes and we are combining our resources to
5 make sure that it is one seamless program. We are
6 investing over 16 million to provide better and
7 faster internet service. Internet speeds will
8 improve in all school buildings by the end of 2020
9 school year. Lastly, we are tackling an issue that I
10 know is important to many of you by committing
11 providing air-conditioning in every school that is
12 without one by 2022. Beginning in 2018, I know Mark
13 this is one of your pet projects, I know, I know, in
14 each subsequent year we will see at least an
15 additional 2200 classrooms receive an air-
16 conditioner. Since 2009, the state has not met its
17 court ordered obligations under the Campaign for
18 Physical Equity and in this school year alone, New
19 York City public school students have been
20 shortchanged 1.6 billion in state education funds.
21 Over two years, we raised a citywide average fair
22 student funding from 88 percent to 91 percent. In
23 addition, we are funding all renewal and community
24 schools at 100 percent and no school in New York City
25

1
2 is below 87 percent. We are committed to reaching
3 100 percent for all schools but that accomplishment
4 can only be realized if the state keeps its
5 commitment to fund CFE settlement. While we are
6 confident that we are headed in the right direction,
7 we know that there is a lot more hard work ahead and
8 I look forward to partnering with you in building
9 upon this work alongside our educators and families.
10 I thank you for your time and look forward to
11 answering your questions.

12 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you
13 very much for your testimony, Chancellor. It
14 included a lot of good updates that we have been
15 excited to share some of those victories with you. I
16 am going to ask a first round of questions and then
17 the Chair will ask his questions and then we will
18 have members ask theirs and we will come back for a
19 second round. I want to talk about Early Learn 3K
20 for All. So we understand there is there is
21 transition from ACS to DOE and if you can explain to
22 us why this makes sense, right, I, I just for the
23 record because we understand that it will create like
24 a systematic you come in at three and you're going to
25 have the same type programming so if you can walk us

1 through the thinking between moving from ACS -- the
2 Early Learn Program from ACS to DOE.

3
4 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I think first and
5 foremost it was meant to strengthen both of us. ACS
6 has tremendous amount of responsibility on their
7 plate and one of the things that I think this is
8 going to help them focus on some of the issues
9 particularly in terms of childcare and abuse cases
10 and foster care, whatever those issues are they will
11 be able to devote a lot more to it. The other thing
12 that research shows us and that we have seen
13 certainly with the Pre-K for All is that the earlier
14 we get students in some form of academic setting the
15 earlier we can start working with their parents the
16 more likely they are going to be successful students
17 in our schools. So by being able to pilot in two
18 districts working with three year olds -- the other
19 thing with the three year olds and for any of you who
20 have children, you know, sometimes the most important
21 skill that they are going to develop at that age is
22 verbal ability so we feel that if they are in a
23 public school setting or even offsite that is still
24 directed by the people who are doing Pre-K, their
25 language development is going to be increased

1 substantially so we are even seeing that in schools
2 where they already have a Pre-K but they have
3 available seats we will actually mix the three year
4 olds and four year olds. I know my daughters went to
5 a three four year old program where their vocabulary
6 is enhanced by having older children in the
7 classroom. The other thing is also that we feel that
8 for many of these children, the kind of support we
9 can give that has literacy connected to it that is
10 not strictly babysitting or daycare because this is
11 not going to be daycare all day long is going to be
12 able to also hold the teachers more accountable for
13 the kind of work they do with the students so we
14 expect to be retraining all the teachers that work
15 with three year olds the same way we retrained all
16 the teachers who work with four year olds and we also
17 expect to have the same kind of supervision over the
18 teachers and the programs that we are doing with the
19 Pre-K. We will continue to work closely with ACS on
20 other issues but the idea of having the parenting
21 componing [sic], the student componing [sic] --
22 components and even the family engagement as a whole
23 component, I think makes a tremendous amount of
24 sense.
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And we
3 agree. Is there any agency issues, not agency, but I
4 guess certification issues in the transition, class
5 size? Does 3K require less students, you know, than
6 universal than kindergarten so what are those
7 challenges that --

8 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Those are the things
9 that we are working on one at a time. Yes, class
10 size will be different. The three year olds will be
11 15 students in a class and if they are combined with
12 four years old, we will probably revert back to the
13 15 in those co-located sites. That is mainly because
14 also three year olds need more help in terms of
15 putting on their coats and hats and everything else
16 in the wintertime so that is part of it. I think
17 also in terms of how we -- the youngest children of
18 both DOE and Board of Health in terms of the sites
19 that they need, need more access to bathrooms and,
20 you know, so forth. So that is all the stuff we are
21 looking at which is another reason we started only
22 with two districts so we can get it right and these
23 can become the models for how we move this elsewhere
24 but I think in terms of -- again, more nap time. I
25 mean a three year old doesn't have the same stamina

1
2 that a four year old -- I have a five year old
3 grandson and he is thrilled he is going to a class
4 where he doesn't take naps. He doesn't like naps,
5 doesn't want naps. But, three year olds do and they
6 need a little bit more snacks.

7 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: My three
8 year old doesn't take any naps.

9 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Well I am sorry for
10 you Julissa but --

11 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: I wish he
12 would.

13 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Yeah. But I do think
14 that it is a different -- every grade, every age has
15 a different -- and we are working with it and I think
16 that is one of the things that I really appreciate
17 about Commissioner because he was very clear about
18 what the things he wanted to make sure we were going
19 to do and that again even with the kindergarten when
20 we did four year old we insisted that any teacher who
21 applied to work had to be retrained. They go over
22 the summer because it is not the same thing to get
23 down on your knees and play with the child as it is
24 to stand in front of a classroom and do something
25 else. So I think I can really assure you that on the

1
2 PD, we really have put certain things in place and
3 also working with existing sites that serve three
4 year olds. I mean many of the sites are the same
5 ones that are serving the four year olds so just a
6 matter of instead of working with these two
7 classrooms just walking down and working with these
8 four classrooms. So this will be a work in progress
9 but I am very confident that this is the right way to
10 go. Many years ago when I was a superintendent, one
11 of the programs that we started was meeting with
12 mothers who just gave birth in hospitals and we
13 worked with Literacy Inc., to ensure those mothers
14 went home with books to read aloud to their children
15 that they had a certain guidelines about what to talk
16 to your children about even though they are just
17 born. So I think that this is just our way to say
18 when it comes to learning that there -- it is never
19 too soon to start.

20 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And you
21 mentioned the Health Department. What is the Health
22 Department's role in this transition and I guess the
23 certification is it now the DOE is partnering with
24 the Health Department --

25

1
2 CHANCELLOR FARINA: We are going to
3 follow the same rules that the ACS Services used but
4 it is more the DOE -- the Board of Health role is
5 more in terms of space, how big is the space, access
6 to bathrooms, that is really -- and we did that with
7 the four year olds and I don't anticipate a problem
8 especially since we are starting small enough that we
9 can grow it.

10 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So some
11 of the childcare providers and I never thought I'd be
12 as Chair talking about potty-training but that's
13 where we are, we are working with three year olds
14 now, some of our very young babies are not -- they
15 are babies, toddlers, aren't necessarily potty-
16 trained at three. So does that pose a different
17 challenge with the three year old siting will
18 families have to be -- will children have to be
19 potty-trained to participate in 3K?

20 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Keep in mind that
21 most of the students that will be accepted are
22 already in a school in a setting so it is going to be
23 using the same teachers and that is another reason
24 why you have the 15 versus the 18 class size and also
25

1
2 when you work with three year olds you're expecting
3 that --

4 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND:

5 Everything, yeah.

6 CHANCELLOR FARINA: -- including accidents
7 in the classroom.

8 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Yes.

9 Just wanted to make sure. And how many of the
10 existing Early Learn providers already have contracts
11 with DOE?

12 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I can't answer that.

13 RAY ORLANDO: Hi, Ray Orlando. I'm the
14 Chief Financial Officer. When we looked about 70
15 percent already have UPK contracts so we think that
16 is going to be super helpful in moving the initiative
17 forward.

18 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Great.

19 Commissioner, do you -- Chancellor, I'm sorry, do you
20 foresee how we can begin to resolve or look at, you
21 know, we partnered both Council Member Dromm, myself
22 and other of the very challenged districts that have
23 overcrowding, we are still trying to site universal
24 Pre-K so if we have that as a challenge and just K
25 through 12, so we have challenges siting K through

1
2 12, challenges siting universal and now potentially
3 and we are really excited to hopefully make 3K part
4 of the citywide programming. What can we do starting
5 now to be able to start thinking creatively with the
6 space limitations that we currently have.

7 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I think the reason we
8 picked the first ones is specifically because there
9 was space available and keep in mind that even for
10 the ones we project for the next three years in all
11 of those districts there is not a lot of space like
12 to put in a school but there is certainly enough
13 space to put an additional classroom. I think it is
14 also going to be important to start looking at how
15 space is used, how it is utilized, you know, are the
16 rooms all -- for this particular age group my feeling
17 would be in a school they should be definitely on the
18 first floor or the second floor at the top, you are
19 not going to put these kids on the fifth floor of a
20 building because they can't do that. I think it is
21 really going to be a realignment of existing services
22 and I think it is an opportunity in the districts
23 where there is special need and central Brooklyn is
24 certainly one of them. We have received nothing but
25 overwhelming support from the superintendents, from

1
2 the principals who are eager to do this because they
3 feel it is going to make the kids really have an
4 advantage by the time they get into four years old so
5 any good idea has a lot of challenges and we are
6 certainly meeting this but by doing it in two smaller
7 districts we think we will develop a pattern going
8 forward that is going to resolve the issue that
9 you're talking about.

10 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And also
11 I think it is an opportunity and we are going to be
12 discussing this in the task force that we are doing
13 with FCA and DOE to kind of reevaluate as you
14 mentioned the existing space, like what are we doing
15 with existing spaces, is this the most efficient way
16 and if we are going to need new wings and expansions
17 then we should start working on that now so that by
18 the time we wrap up and have the 700 million that we
19 need, because I know the state is just going to give
20 it to us, they are very eager.

21 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Right, fingers
22 crossed.

23 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So I
24 wanted to transition to immigration and talk about
25 state funding and then I will have the Chair continue

1
2 his questioning and I will come back with the rest of
3 my questions in the second round. A federal
4 immigration agent came to an elementary school last
5 week to question a fourth grader. The agent was not
6 allowed in the school building since DOE has a policy
7 in place to turn away federal agents without
8 warrants. We applaud both the Mayor and yourself for
9 clearly making this decision and how timely and right
10 it was. Unfortunately, it proved itself to work,
11 right? That is probably the one thing you didn't
12 want to see if it worked but it did. What is the
13 school doing to continue to protect the students who
14 ICE wants to questions and what are schools doing to
15 ensure that all students in the school feel safe and
16 how are parents feeling because that was the one
17 thing that right after elections in districts like
18 both the Chair and I it was total panic, parents
19 didn't understand, didn't know and it is kind of a
20 double edged sword, right? It's is great that the
21 child was protected but it also kind of reinvigorated
22 that fear of oh my God they are actually going to
23 come to the school. So how do we communicate for
24 calm and safety?

25

1
2 CHANCELOOR FARINA: I think first of all
3 I want to make the record clear. It was not an ICE
4 agent, wasn't even a Homeland Security agent. It
5 happened to have been an agent who was trying to
6 verify information for special benefits under green
7 cards and still would not have been allowed to go in
8 buildings. So I think that is one of the things that
9 has been miscommunicated. I purposely went to the
10 school yesterday to reassure parents and ask parents
11 how they felt. It was very interesting that most
12 parents do feel the school is a safe place and were
13 comfortable bringing their kids. Where I think we
14 still need to do some work, although I think we've
15 done a lot of it on this, is how do parents feel
16 themselves about leaving their homes and going to
17 other events. One of the things we have been
18 carefully monitoring is parent attendance at evening
19 events. We have now put out Know Your Rights
20 workshops across the city and we move them from
21 mostly at night to some in the afternoon because that
22 seems to be parents rather go to those workshops when
23 they pick up their kids at three o'clock and move
24 into one of those. So I think that is all true but
25 we have really put out enough messages after the

1
2 event that took place last week, we have reinforced
3 by letters to all principals in the city. In the
4 past we are training mostly administrators and now we
5 are training everyone in the building including
6 custodians about what they need to do should this
7 happen again but I understand that we have been
8 reassured and I know Leesha from immigrant affairs
9 has been in touch with the federal government that
10 this was really something very out of the ordinary
11 and that it won't happen again. But I think letting
12 parents know going out in public, I have a town hall
13 meeting tonight in a district that has some of these
14 potential issues and we constantly reassure parents.
15 We take their questions. I think Pace, which is our
16 parent engagement office, has really done a fabulous
17 job on this but there are always going to be parents,
18 depending on their status, who are going to be
19 somewhat leery and on the other hand the single
20 shepherd that we talked about, one of our students
21 who is undocumented just received a four year
22 scholarship to college because of the single shepherd
23 in District 32. So we are seeing a lot of success
24 stories mixed in with some of the obvious, I don't

1
2 know if I would say fear, but unsettlement among some
3 of our parents.

4 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Right.

5 We are still dealing with that and it's that. It's a
6 very wide range of anxiety and just fear.

7 CHANCELOOR FARINA: Right.

8 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Where
9 parents aren't necessarily feeling the safest. So
10 thank you for sharing about the earlier afternoon and
11 it probably feels better to be walking in daylight
12 than at night. It is probably another very important
13 reason why parents are doing that. I wanted to talk
14 about state funding. How can DOE raise the base
15 level of funding in light of the lower than
16 anticipated state funding and how much additional
17 funding is needed to fund all schools at 100 percent
18 of their funding level?

19 CHANCELOOR FARINA: I'm letting my budget
20 person answer this.

21 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay.

22 RAYMOND ORLANDO: Ray Orlando again,
23 Chief Financial Officer. Good morning. SO in the
24 absence of the sufficient additional state aid in the
25 budget this year we are unable to raise the fair

1
2 student funding for this year so it will remain at 87
3 percent in the upcoming year. If those of you with
4 longer memories and financial bents will remember
5 that the first year the floor was at 81 percent and
6 the subsequent year we were able to raise it to 82
7 and then raised it to 87 in the current year where it
8 will unfortunately remain. It would cost, I want to
9 say, three-quarters of a billion dollars or more to
10 bring all schools to 100 percent of fair student
11 funding.

12 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Three-
13 quarters of a billion?

14 RAYMOND ORLANDO: Yes.

15 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: I know
16 this is a smaller percentage but when we are talking
17 about new needs and faced with this challenge, what
18 was your thinking between presenting this list of
19 important we understand new needs as opposed to kind
20 of what was your thinking between doing that as
21 opposed to putting that towards making up for the
22 state funding short?

23 CHANCELOOR FARINA: I think one of the
24 most important things is that we are really finding
25 that the next place to invest our money is embedded

1 teacher preparation. If you have better teachers who
2 can do the kind of work like our literacy coaches, if
3 you have teachers who are working, coaches who are
4 working with all teachers so that all children can
5 read by the end of second grade we have made a major
6 thing and that to me is worth the investment. The
7 same thing with single shepherds. The longer I stay
8 in this job, the more I realize that social,
9 emotional learning is as crucial as academic
10 learning. If we don't invest in that kind of support
11 for students, that is what increases the dropout rate
12 and so I do think having these equity issues and I
13 also want to say this is by far not the answer but we
14 have invested a lot more time and energy in going out
15 for support from the foundations. For example, out
16 science for all, half of it is being funded by
17 private funders. We are looking at a lot more
18 grants. My Brother's Keeper has brought in a lot of
19 money into the city into individual districts to work
20 on the lower achieving minority males in particular.
21 We have looked for funding sources outside the
22 regular parameters and will continue to do that. We
23 have applied for a major grant which we will be
24 finding out soon that is going to help us with a lot
25

1
2 of the other issues so I think we have to be a little
3 bit more creative but I don't ever want to give up
4 professional development for teachers over anything
5 else because that is what impacts better student
6 performance and ultimately allows us to increase our
7 high school graduation rate and college readiness.

8 If the more students that we get into college finish
9 in four years or even five, the better this New York
10 City economy will be and the better we will have done
11 our jobs so that is the reason why the focus is still
12 on growing some of the programs.

13 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And you
14 know there is a very big budget implication when
15 young people are not prepared for college so even if
16 they are graduating, you know, we have the vice-
17 chancellor testify from CUNY and say the level of
18 remedial courses that young people have to -- young
19 adults have to pay for as they are leaving the public
20 school system is alarming so it costs families more
21 because they are not able to immediately invest in
22 college courses but it also creates this anxiety for
23 the students because they don't want to be in college
24 taking remedial courses so I think --

1
2 CHANCELOOR FARINA: You couldn't be more
3 right and I -- Borough President Otto was in the
4 room?

5 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: He just
6 stepped out.

7 CHANCELOOR FARINA: Let me tell you what
8 we are doing in this particular area because you are
9 absolutely right. We need more of a consistency
10 between the colleges and us. For example, the more AP
11 courses you take the less college courses that you
12 have to pay for so we are finding, let's use Leeman
13 and George Washington Campus, many of the students
14 who now graduate this year are going to need one less
15 year of college which is going to save money but they
16 are also going in to prove in successful in doing
17 college level work which wasn't true years ago
18 because we only had the AP courses in certain zip
19 codes. The other thing that Staten Island has done
20 which we are now using as a model for the rest of the
21 city is asking universities to become more fully
22 involved in the high schools themselves. So Staten
23 Island, for example, they have three universities and
24 each of them has taken on one of the high schools and
25 has embedded their professors and their services in

1
2 the high school. In Port Richmond High School, there
3 are guidance counselors from Wagner College living in
4 that school so we need to stop making the separation
5 between high school and college a wide gap but close
6 that gap. We are meeting on almost on a monthly
7 basis now with CUNY but also with private
8 universities. What can you do to help our schools to
9 make sure that as you offer scholarships to the kids
10 or as you help the teachers get them better prepared
11 but also what are you doing at the college level to
12 prepare your teachers to be the kind of teachers that
13 are more interactively working with our students.
14 The days of being Electra at the college level and
15 expecting 300 kids to take notes and respond to your
16 work doesn't make sense. The other piece that we are
17 growing a lot is our CT, Career on Technology, and
18 let me give you an example and I know this is a big,
19 for some of you, we are moving programs such as on
20 the Harbor School on Governors Island so when
21 students leave they have an option. They can go to
22 Maritime Academy, they can also become divers, scuba
23 divers, they can raise oysters. We are getting kids
24 ready to go and join unions if that is what they want
25 or they can go to college but they have an option

1
2 they can work their way through college. I am sure
3 many of you worked your way through college as did I.
4 So how do we make sure kids have options? I think
5 that is the word. Also, whatever option they choose
6 that they will be successful at it. This means that
7 we need to work a lot more strongly with our
8 universities. We actually now have partnerships
9 under Deputy Chancellor Weinberg where we're meeting
10 not only holistically with all CUNY but individually.
11 Queens College in particular, I have to praise, is
12 doing some phenomenal work in working with English
13 language learners and that particular college has
14 taken on leadership in working with My Brother's
15 Keeper and so I think there is lots of work to be
16 done here but my goal is to not start talking
17 graduation rates but college readiness rates and that
18 is the gap that I want to close this year and I think
19 we are on the way with the AP courses and the close
20 up coordination with universities.

21 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay.
22 Thank you very much, Chancellor. We have been joined
23 by Council Members Gibson, Rose, Maisel, Gentile,
24 Garodnick, Barron and Lander and now we will hear
25 from Chair Dromm.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much,
3 Chair Ferreras-Copeland and you're going to laugh but
4 thank you for talking about potty-training because I
5 think it is so important that we realize that are
6 students are human beings and that we have to meet
7 their needs as the come into the school system and I
8 think sometimes our discussions on education are too
9 focused around budget, it's around test scores, it's
10 around everything else but when you have a little
11 three year old walk into the classroom and he's got
12 to go to the bathroom, you have to deal with that
13 first and foremost and I think that goes along with a
14 lot of the work that the Chancellor has been doing.
15 I was fortune on Saturday to attend the conference on
16 social and emotional learning and I was very inspired
17 by the speaker there, Tim Shriver, who talked about
18 meeting the needs of our students as well and if we
19 don't meet them we pay for it later on actually in
20 the classroom so we need to take that time to be able
21 to deal with those emotional needs and the
22 questioning on immigration as well and even the
23 single shepherd are things that I think are really
24 important to discussion about education so that kind
25 of leads me as well to the issue of community schools

1
2 because I am also a believer in community schools and
3 so I have a few questions around that and, you know,
4 the Mayor has announced that, you know, one of his
5 signature initiatives is to transform how schooling
6 is done in New York City and the council of course is
7 very happy with that. How much is the DOE currently
8 spending on community schools and what is the
9 increased cost for the 69 new schools?

10 RAYMOND ORLANDO: Is this on? Can you
11 hear me?

12 CHANELLOR FARINA: Yes.

13 RAYMOND ORLANDO: Great. In the current
14 year the cost of the community school program is \$112
15 million.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: We understand that
17 there were several community schools that existed
18 before the Mayor's initiative was launched. Would
19 the additional of these 69 schools are there still
20 community schools operating outside of the
21 initiative?

22 RAYMOND ORLANDO: Yes. There are a few
23 schools outside of the portfolio that are exploring
24 the strategy and there were about two dozen maybe
25 that were doing community school type work and we're

1
2 sharing capacity and building resource with them and
3 working with them as well.

4 CHANCELLOR: FARINA: Let me just add that
5 one of the things about community schools that we
6 have made universal, the ones that were, the ones
7 that are and the ones that will be, is that they need
8 to be embedded during the school day. This is not an
9 after school program. It is not about the kids who
10 can't do x, y and z. This is about how do you
11 support and that is why the RFPs with community based
12 organizations ask, do you have an academic component
13 to this, do you have a social, emotional component,
14 do you have an art's program? We really want to see
15 that community based organizations bring something
16 else to the table and particularly family counseling
17 has been an important part of this. So I would say
18 that we've done a much better job in making sure that
19 all community schools serves certain things equally
20 no matter whether they were the past of the present.
21 I think the other thing that is important is that
22 depending on the site there are always going to be
23 some unique features to the site. For example, at
24 188, which is right here in downtown, because a large
25 number of homeless and shelter kids one of the things

1 the principal requested and God, she wanted washing
2 machines and dryers in her community school because a
3 lot of the kids do not have access to clean clothes
4 and this was an important part. She has also done
5 something which I can't praise her enough and she is
6 also getting an award in Washington for what she's
7 done as a model community school that her children
8 are involved in community projects to help people in
9 other places so we need to get away from this victim
10 philosophy in our schools or these poor people
11 because I really resent that. I think a lot of our
12 kids in particular are there through no fault of
13 their own so it is about how do we help them become
14 more productive and in this particular school the
15 kids were experimenting with mealworms and they were
16 going to develop recipes to send to other countries
17 to hopefully help them with some of their issues. So
18 I think community schools are resources to the
19 neighborhoods. The other thing is that now
20 principals now get to pick the community service
21 provider they want to work with and our expectation
22 is that the community service provider and the
23 principal together will develop a plan, how do what I
24 do benefit what you do, and we have a whole range of
25

1
2 -- all community schools have an outside support
3 person whether it be Children Aid Society, UFT, there
4 is a whole range. I went to see one called WDECO
5 (SP) in the Bronx, phenomenal work but they also have
6 the ability to go and knock on people's doors. One
7 of the major reasons that we put some of these in our
8 renewal schools is that attendance was an issue and
9 they spent all summer long going to the schools where
10 kids register to go knocking on doors and say we
11 expect to see you there in September. This is not
12 the capacity that a school is ever going to have so I
13 do think by picking them very carefully, making sure
14 it is a right match between the school and the
15 provider and making sure the criteria of services is
16 the same for everyone we will be in a very good place
17 in September.

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Very good. My next
19 question is really around the New York State
20 Community School Grant Initiatives Schools. I think
21 last year we lost about -- 12 schools lost their
22 state funding last year and the DOE assumed the cost
23 for them. The remaining 13 have contracts expiring
24 this year. Are we going to be able to in this budget
25 pick up those 25 schools?

1
2 RAYMOND ORLANDO: I believe that is going
3 to be part of the discussion that we and you and OMB
4 have as we move towards the adopted budget.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Are you separating
6 them out from the pas? Are you dealing with them on
7 two separate issues like because we did provide the
8 additional funding for the 12 last year?

9 RAYMOND ORLANDO: I believe those schools
10 are part of our ongoing discussion.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. Has the first
12 cohort of 12 schools permanently been folded into the
13 city's community school initiative?

14 RAYMOND ORLANDO: Yes, they are receiving
15 the same supports as the other schools in the
16 program, yes.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: But they are not
18 going to be part of the 12 --

19 RAYMOND ORLANDO: The first group, the
20 group we picked up this year yes, have been
21 integrated into the community schools work. The
22 second groups remains to be seen.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And I guess we are
24 going to continue to discuss the cohort two schools?

25 RAYMOND ORLANDO: For sure.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Moving forward, okay.

How many of the 25 schools are also renewal schools?

CHANCELLOR FARINA: All renewal schools get community school support and will continue to do so.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So regardless of whether or not it was the state funded community --

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Yes. The renewal schools all have that, yes. The answer is yes.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. So if we continue to provide contracts or extend contracts for these schools, can the DOE ensure that the CBO in place with remain if both the school and the CBO would like to continue working together?

RAYMOND ORLANDO: As the Chancellor mentioned, the programs will be integrated into the community schools model so if the principal and CBO they are currently working with assuming that between now and when the budget gets adopted that the -- those groups of schools are funded in the upcoming school year, I think we would expect that those relationships would presumably continue assuming both parties are happy.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Can you also answer
3 the same thing with the beacon schools?

4 RAYMOND ORLANDO: I'm sorry I don't --

5 CHANCELLOR FARINA: The beacon.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So I have School 149,
7 149 in Jackson Heights, which was a beacon school,
8 Good Will was the sponsor, they dropped out because
9 they don't believe it's their mission any longer and
10 the principal is now in the process of making a
11 choice about what group to work with and that
12 decision is solely up to the principal?

13 RAYMOND ORLANDO: I'm sorry, I will have
14 to look into it.

15 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Danny, I think, if we
16 -- my feeling is I will look up this particular case,
17 if the principal is not on board with the provider,
18 chances of the program working are reduced
19 substantially so to me having a principal who invites
20 -- one of the things we've asked is that the CBO in
21 all our schools be part of the principal's cabinet
22 that discussions take place simultaneously so I would
23 say I will look into this one but the reality is I
24 expect the principal to play a role in choosing a
25 provider so they can work more closely together.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. Good. So last
3 year the DOE received 28 million in community school
4 foundation aid set aside funding. For Fiscal '18,
5 the DOE stands to receive 60 million in state
6 community aid, an increase of nearly 30 million for
7 the community schools. What did the DOE do with the
8 funding they received last year?

9 RAYMOND ORLANDO: The community schools,
10 the \$28 million, the legislation required us to show
11 the state that we were spending \$28 million on
12 community schools as part of the current year's
13 budget which we were able to show. We expect to be
14 able to again show in the upcoming school year that
15 we are spending that level of resources on the
16 community schools.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: What does the DOE
18 purpose to do with the purposed funding for Fiscal
19 '18? There was an increase on the state level and
20 community school funding of I believe about 50
21 million statewide but we don't know -- do we know how
22 much the city is getting yet?

23 RAYMOND ORLANDO: No, I believe it is
24 competitive so it remains to be seen. I don't think
25 there is any guidance but stay tuned.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Will be applying for
3 that funding?

4 RAYMOND ORLANDO: If eligible, yes.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Can you provide us
6 with some information about the programs that are the
7 mental health programs, the eyeglass foundations, the
8 things that are available in community schools? Do
9 you know who those folks are who are providing some
10 of those services?

11 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Well Warby Parker is
12 the eyeglass provider. They also do the eye exams in
13 the schools and that has been particularly
14 successful. I think also when you think about some
15 of the things that kids lack for becoming better
16 academic students, not being able to see is major
17 especially if you have an eye strain and then you
18 don't like reading because it is too strainful so I
19 do think that has been very productive. I think one
20 of the other things we are seeing some good results
21 on is the Thrive New York initiative in the lower
22 grades in terms of mental health. For parents, this
23 is not -- any of the clinics, particularly the high
24 school clinics, kids can self-recommend themselves if
25 they are feeling depressed or anxious or stressed or

1
2 any one of those. I was just in one of the clinics
3 where the students just have to sign in their name,
4 they say what time they are available and someone
5 sits and talks to them. We are increasing those. We
6 just saw a health clinic, I believe it was at George
7 Washington, is that one of the places we saw the new
8 health clinic there? So I do think having the
9 services at the local level makes a really big
10 difference. I think also having difficult
11 conversations with adults in the buildings, like the
12 teachers, how do you change your teaching strategies.
13 That is one of the things that Tim Shriver said very
14 clearly, you can't teach a lesson without knowing how
15 the students in your class are reacting to the
16 lesson. They are coming with all kinds of things in
17 their backgrounds or whatever so how do you make the
18 classroom a good place for them to be able to be
19 receptive but also for parents, we are getting a lot
20 more parents coming into the school saying I need
21 such and such. Many of our districts are forming
22 closer relationships with their local hospitals. I
23 know District Seven for example has started working
24 with Lincoln Hospital and having a lot of the doctors
25 from Lincoln Hospital come in on a regular basis to

1
2 give lectures and whatever to parents so I do think
3 we are working on all levels and I think it is
4 important particularly in places where there is a lot
5 of trauma to reassure people that school is still the
6 best place to be and the school will provide whatever
7 services they need.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Let's talk a little
9 bit about federal funding. The federal budget
10 reduced Title 2A grants for teaching development.
11 How will this cut affect federal funding the DOE
12 receives through that program and what will be the
13 effect on services and programs supported by this
14 funding?

15 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I want to say
16 personally this is the one place where I really would
17 be upset if the funding became too low. We have been
18 assured that the percentage of -- this funding will
19 not be taken out in its entirety. This is also
20 something that is a national issue so I am hoping
21 that a lot more places other than New York will
22 protest this. As of right now I think we were told
23 12 percent reduction which is not low but is not as
24 bad as it could be and the New York State
25 Commissioner has assured me on Saturday that she is

1 asking for a certain percentage of money in the state
2 budget just for professional development because this
3 is the money that gives us the ability to train
4 teachers and administrators on one of the best
5 pedagogical practices so this would be money that I
6 would fight tooth and nail to retain but I know the
7 Commissioner also feels the same way so I think if we
8 can at least fill in some of the blanks at the state
9 level it would help us.
10

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. So in December
12 of 2015, President Obama signed the Every Student
13 Succeed Act, ESSA. Can you describe to us the
14 elements that ESSA and New York State plan and the
15 New York -- they just came out with a plan at the
16 state level, how, what does that plan look like and
17 what will it mean for us here in New York City?

18 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Well we are still
19 reading the fine print and getting a sense of what it
20 is. To me, the most important thing is that at no
21 point are they stressing that they will be making any
22 curriculum decisions. The curriculum decisions will
23 still be local and we have spent an awful lot of
24 time, energy and monies in developing curriculum over
25 the two years and now we have a stated New York City

1
2 Social Studies curriculum, which everybody is asking
3 for, we have a very heavily professional development
4 around all aspects of literacy. We are coming out
5 with a new program in September, Middle School
6 Literacy, sixth, seventh and eighth grade with all
7 instructions for teachers so I think that the fear I
8 had is we would go back to a more prescribed approach
9 and that doesn't seem to be the case. I think we are
10 looking to see where we have a little bit more
11 ability to make certain decisions would be in terms
12 of our compliance issues, in terms particularly about
13 testing for English language learners. Does it make
14 the most sense to test students the first year that
15 they are in this country or would it make more sense
16 to test them after their second years? So these are
17 the things that we are still looking at, what does it
18 say and where do we have some wiggle room or
19 negotiation room and everything else. I have a
20 committee trying to be much more specific but right
21 now it is so vague that it leaves a lot up to the
22 interpretation.

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: How much funding does
24 New York City anticipate receiving from the ESSA
25 grant?

1
2 RAYMOND ORLANDO: Sorry, I have it in a
3 few pieces but the Title One, Title Two and Title
4 Three are the major pieces of the federal funding and
5 the total of Title One is 650. There is another 85
6 in Title Two and another 36 in Title Three. Sorry, I
7 didn't do the math.

8 CHANCELLOR FARINA: A lot of the Title
9 Three money is going specifically to English language
10 learners which are a major population in New York
11 City and that is also what is helping us with our
12 dual language programs, our new bilingual programs
13 and in particular with some of our summer programs
14 that we are putting in the summer for Richmond for
15 English language learners. I think sometimes we
16 forget because you don't speak English doesn't mean
17 that you're not a gifted student or whatever so I
18 think that is an important part of our initiative.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. Before I turn
20 it over to my colleagues for questions, one of my
21 request and one of the things I was a little bit
22 disappointed about not seeing in the budget was some
23 money to support the tremendous work that Jared is
24 doing and I would really like to see a budget line
25 there for the LGBT liaison so that he can continue to

1
2 do the outreach that he has done so I hope moving
3 forward that will be part of our discussions.

4 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Certainly.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Chair
6 Ferreras?

7 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
8 you, Chair. We will not hear from Council Member
9 Rodriguez followed by Council Member Kallos followed
10 by Council Member Treyger.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you
12 Chairs and Chancellor, thank you for everything and
13 the whole thing like I can say in Lower Manhattan we
14 have witnesses the difference when we have a
15 Chancellor who is an educator and as we know, it is
16 difficult to move our city and move our system.
17 Sometimes we [inaudible 01:15:37] being in classroom
18 teaching high school, I told my students I believe
19 that the percent of Latino with a college degree was
20 like 13 percent and I told my student that in 30 year
21 from now we move that number to 20 and 25. We should
22 celebrate because, you know, to put together the
23 pipeline and be able to say we can make our city a
24 middle class city is not an easy thing to do when
25 three years ago the prior director he say we live in

1 a city where close to average close to 50 percent of
2 New York live on poverty line. No, I remember
3 working together with a colleagues, she used to be a
4 teacher, established in high school and she say when
5 I got to parent's meeting I have to be ready to
6 explain to parents there why their son average is 97
7 and what is my plan to bring that 97 to a hundred but
8 also those parents they ask about what role can you
9 play to accomplish this goal together. So we know
10 that is the difference that is the city where we are,
11 you know, it not only what happen in the classroom,
12 Danny and I both been teachers, it what happen after
13 three p.m. It is the quality of after school
14 program. Any middle class or upper middle class, we
15 live paycheck by paycheck because we invest in
16 whatever is there [inaudible 01:17:14] and robotic in
17 swimming in soccer in anything that make a difference
18 in the child so, you know, it is like when you are
19 the teacher in a school since they are kindergarten
20 they know how to read, of course you will look good
21 because you took like student group population that
22 is not same one you taken ins school that they are in
23 first grade and they have trouble recognizing their
24 names so and that is what we have built as a city for
25

1
2 decades and that reality cannot change and I have
3 seen, I used to Chair the Committee of Higher
4 Education and I always say don't ask me about why we
5 are getting 89 percent of student going to community
6 college taking remedial courses in reading, writing
7 and math, those graduating from New York City public
8 schools. So my approach is about we cannot look at
9 high school unless we have a strong pipeline and
10 everyone recognize. This is not about we advocate
11 for the poor New Yorkers, these are private sectors
12 they should recognize that they need to continue
13 investing more because if we build a stronger middle
14 class it will be good for everyone and I think that
15 is, for me, no doubt that computer for all, UPK for
16 three years old. I remember being in Albany and we
17 were talking about some former assembly member saying
18 we need to get funding for kindergarten for all and
19 they would say you crazy, do you think we can get the
20 funding? So here we are saying, poor child in the
21 South Bronx, in Washington Heights, in some places in
22 Brooklyn, you have the right to be enrolling in UPK
23 and, you know, we should the definition. That's not
24 daycares. Sometimes we look and we talk about what

1
2 is your child going, what he or she be daycare? It's
3 not daycare.

4 CHANCELLOR FARINA: No, it's not.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: That's where
6 real education is happening so again for me, big
7 changes, great investment, high expectation because
8 poverty cannot be the reason or the excuses of why we
9 believe that our children are failing. You know, why
10 those children getting boring, why they cutting
11 classes, why they don't want to go to classroom at
12 8:30 in morning, so those for me are the questions.
13 One thing I would say was once I hope Chancellor that
14 under your legacy we make after school mandated for
15 all elementary children. You know, cannot be we have
16 this program and they are expanding this because we
17 know it again. For me I fight for whatever I know
18 that my children will be fighting for working for and
19 I know that, you know, I used to be in the DOE when
20 it was like in October the principal gonna say we
21 \$20,000 put together after school program so how can
22 we keep improving the quality of the school program
23 and how can we also guarantee that after school
24 program is mandated for all elementary students?

1
2 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Honestly, it comes
3 down to money, very simply so I think in terms how we
4 look at priority we certainly encourage principals
5 and it's interesting because one of the courses that
6 we now put out for principals is how to manage your
7 budget more effectively because there is some money
8 in schools, particularly Title One schools to rethink
9 where you are investing your money and if after
10 school programs make sense and they are a specific
11 programs that are more likely to be part of your
12 schools then that is really something schools can
13 make those decisions. The other thing is also to
14 look at programming. Those of you who are former
15 teachers understand but sometimes you can get money
16 just by the way you program your school. Teachers
17 have to work a certain amount of hours per day but
18 they don't all have to work the same hours so we have
19 been encouraging principals to think about if it
20 makes sense, for example, to have some after school
21 programs at four o'clock because there are some of
22 your teachers that could be programed particularly in
23 middle school and high school to start later in the
24 day without breaking any rules but I think it is
25 about being more creative but I think -- I want to

1
2 pick up on one thing you said. It is all about
3 expectations which is why I sometimes get worried
4 when we use the work poverty. We have to say all
5 students in the City of New York should have the
6 expectation that they could be anything they want to
7 be and if we start with that as a premise and then
8 work backwards, let me just give you an example of
9 more creative thinking. One of the things I've
10 asked, I think Elizabeth will share it later, we have
11 increased the number of PSAL programs in all of our
12 schools particularly in co-located schools. One of
13 the things I asked Eric Holstein, who is fabulous at
14 this, is to start looking at which of the
15 scholarships for college that are not being utilized
16 the way they would be, one of the sports, for
17 example, did you know that one of the sports that
18 many of our colleges offer scholarships for is
19 lacrosse so if we can put in courses that will also
20 bring kids to school because they have something else
21 they can look at, ultimately it is another pathway to
22 college that is part of it so expectations to me is
23 really important and I think also what we need to
24 know is that we now have in every zip code in New
25 York and you know this wasn't true before, master

1 teachers and highly effective teachers. This tended
2 to be sometimes more in some parts of the city than
3 others but we have been able to get teachers to apply
4 to work in certain districts that no one was applying
5 to before. We have a special new teacher center
6 initiative center in the Bronx, across the whole
7 Bronx, to bring in more teachers and also higher
8 teacher retention in areas where in the past they
9 were revolving doors. So expectations are crucial
10 but expectations by everyone: the principal, the
11 teacher, the parents themselves which is why I
12 believe in more parent education so parents know what
13 is appropriate behavior at certain ages and what do
14 they need to be able to support their children. SO
15 we will continue to work on this.

17 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: We have
18 now been joined by Council Members Salamanca,
19 Deutsch, and Johnson. We will now hear from Council
20 Member Kallos followed by Council Member Treyger
21 followed by Council Member Gibson.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you Finance
23 Chair Ferreras-Copeland and Education Chair Dromm for
24 your leadership. Chancellor Farina, I will ask you
25 as always about school seats and lunch. I look

1 forward to no longer asking your those questions as
2 we achieve those victories. A quarter million out of
3 780,000 public school students who are eligible for
4 fare reduced price meals do not participate, school
5 lunch participation rates drop from 81 percent in
6 elementary to 61 percent in middle school to 41 -- 38
7 percent in high school with requests from the
8 Speaker, City Council Budget Response, support from
9 CSA, UFT, ??37 include counts on fully funding
10 universal school lunch with \$20 million to get \$59
11 million from the federal government this year.

13 CHANCELLOR FARINA: This is a
14 conversation that is ongoing and we will continue to
15 have but I want to reassure as I have in other
16 meetings, no child in New York City is deprived of
17 lunch ever. 76 percent are entitled to free lunch
18 and those who may on a given day or week or whatever
19 not have the required money will get food. I will
20 put out a memo [inaudible 01:24:34], which is what I
21 do, to make sure that all principals understand that
22 the cafeteria workers are and should be giving out
23 lunch to any student who needs it. I think and I
24 said this before and I have worked with some of you,
25 you know, in committees, to me the school lunch

1
2 cafeteria environment is as important as some of the
3 other things that we are doing and I know that we
4 have picked seven schools to years ago to be models
5 and we started by redoing the cafeterias and I was
6 just sharing with you that one of the schools in
7 Coney Island have redone the cafeteria, has increased
8 the kind of -- the salad bar and other things and she
9 said she went from 800 students middle school getting
10 lunch to almost 1100, Ashley Marie Bender School, so
11 I am happy to take you to visit this but I will
12 certainly put in writing to all principals that no
13 child at any time should be deprived of lunch as long
14 as they are on the lunch line.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: SO I think just
16 along those lines just making sure that it is an
17 official memo that has contractual binding rights so
18 that local 372 lunch workers are able to provide this
19 and they will not be penalized in any way and I think
20 along the same lines that no member of the school may
21 engage in billing or collection practices for
22 families or children who receive food for free in the
23 cafeteria without paying.

24

25

1
2 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I am going to -- the
3 first one I can do. The second one, I will let you
4 know.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Okay. I think it
6 is just important.

7 CHANCELLOR FARINA: The first one has
8 been in practice -- I was a principal for ten years
9 and this was common practice and was common practice
10 across the whole entire district and when I was
11 superintendent and had 184 schools, common practice.
12 So I will make sure but I will get back to you with
13 whatever we put out on writing by the end of the day.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you. I
15 also want to thank you for agreeing that the Upper
16 East Side needs school seats at the preliminary
17 budget [inaudible 01:26:26] hearing we learned from
18 DOE that there were 900 four year olds that applied
19 for less than 600 seats on the Upper East Side. We
20 had a rally for school seats with Controller Stringer
21 and Public Advocate James, Borough President Brewer,
22 Senator Kruger, Assembly Member Steve Wright and
23 Court, Council Member Garodnick, parents and
24 children. Has Department of Education made any
25

1
2 progress in opening new school seats on the Upper
3 East Side for this coming school year?

4 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Well I was just told
5 there was 700 applicants awarded 500 seats and my
6 feeling is again if you give me another three weeks.
7 Generally what happens is parents on the Upper East
8 Side have safety seats. They think of Pre-K as sort
9 of like college and may apply to more than one place
10 so I think a month from now we can review this and
11 see if those numbers are still there. We can review
12 this and see if those numbers are still there. We
13 will make sure that we do this. We've added 90 seats
14 to the Upper East Side and --

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So how many total
16 seats are we up to?

17 CHANCELLOR FARINA: 497.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So that is less
19 than last year? Last year we --

20 CHANCELLOR FARINA: No, we added -- it
21 went from --

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: We lost seats.
23 We lost seats so when you took away the seats and
24 then added 90 we actually lost 22 seats.

1
2 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Again, I noticed PF6
3 has two additional and they had none when I was
4 principal there so anyway. Go sit over there.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So I think one of
6 the --

7 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I'm going to have to
8 --

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: We are actually
10 losing seats on the East Side this coming year versus
11 gaining them so just whatever we can do to open
12 previously offered seats and then working with
13 community based providers who are willing to provide
14 full day seats and I think we could get another 160
15 seats tomorrow if DOE is willing to say yes to the
16 community based providers and forcing the schools to
17 offer certain seats that were offered previously.

18 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I am going to let my
19 Pre-K expert answer.

20 [OATH ADMINISTERED]

21 LUCAS TAYLOR: I'm Lucas Taylor, I'm the
22 Executive Director for [inaudible 01:25:28].

23 LUCAS TAYLOR: So the 90 seats we've
24 added are since this last April. As you know we have
25 lost the seats at Wagner Middle School which was a

1
2 one year arrangement. This is not yet incorporate
3 the seats that we will eventually gain as we convert
4 class size from 18 to 20 by adding the additional
5 pair professional in each room. We are continuing to
6 work with DSDA to identify any possible space that
7 can be used for additional Pre-K capacity and we will
8 be putting out the RFP in the summer and we would
9 certainly hope to work with any community based
10 providers that are able to provide additional full
11 day seat in the Upper East Side.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So I guess I am
13 just disappointed that there aren't additional seats
14 from where we were before and just I am relying and
15 counting on you Chancellor, please, take care of
16 these four year olds so they don't have to commute
17 down here. It's a 45 minute commute o a very crowded
18 subway and it is just not the right place for four
19 year olds.

20 CHANCELLOR FARINA: We will definitely
21 look into it.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
24 you. We will now hear from Council Member Treyger
25 followed by Council Member Gibson followed by Council

1
2 Member Chin and we have been joined by Majority
3 Leader Van Bramer.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you both
5 Chairs and welcome Chancellor and again I want to
6 begin by commending you and your staff for the
7 commitment for air-conditioners for all classrooms.
8 This has major ramifications for public health for
9 learning even for -- I know it presents testing
10 issues, summer school ramifications and that's a big
11 deal and I appreciate that. Just have some
12 questions, Chancellor. The first topic is I continue
13 to hear feedback from school communities with regard
14 to over the counter students that come on after the
15 October register and they are not particularly
16 English language learner students with IEPs that they
17 are not receiving funding for and this is a practice
18 I remember back in my days of teaching that still
19 existing. Sometimes there is friction between
20 principals and high school admission about this issue
21 but I think the real issue really is that schools
22 welcome the kids but they need to welcome the funding
23 to meet their needs so if you could speak to this to
24 where we're at to make sure that we are providing

1
2 these schools with the resources they need to meet
3 the needs of these students.

4 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I think there are
5 several things that, and maybe the general public
6 doesn't know this, school funding is given on student
7 enrollment by the end of October 31st. So any
8 student that comes into school after October 31st to
9 some degree is non-funded. That doesn't mean that we
10 don't fix it because the other thing is also a lot of
11 students leave as well as students come in but in
12 terms of over the counter students, we are monitoring
13 this much more heavily. We started last year so that
14 every school, particularly high school, gets a fair
15 share of what is happening in that neighborhood and
16 we have been monitoring so closely that I have been
17 very clear with our high school principals that this
18 is not in their hands, more essentially done now than
19 it used to be in the past and we want to make sure
20 that all of our schools have their fair share of
21 English language learners as well as special needs
22 kids. Si think we are monitoring it a lot more
23 carefully. Anyone -- by the way, [inaudible
24 01:31:50] to email me on any of these issues. The
25 schools that were complained the most three years ago

1
2 I think you will find have said okay, things are much
3 better. I will give you an example also that our
4 welcome centers are summer. Welcome centers I have
5 now encouraged principals to actually attend those
6 centers over the summer to recruit students so that
7 it doesn't happen at the end but it is actually part
8 of September so, for example, if Franklin K. Lane
9 reopens a one room enrollment for the summer so as
10 parents come to enroll their kids, the principals in
11 that building, there are five of them, can rotate
12 welcoming them, encouraging them to come. We are
13 looking at other issues of funding, what is the right
14 number, let's say by the end of December, that may
15 generate something else but certainly if you have
16 IEPs or other needs there will be teachers that serve
17 those needs. You want to --

18 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Sure. I just want
19 to add that for students of IEPs we take that
20 snapshot at 12/31 not at 10/31 so for the general ed
21 kids we take the snapshot at 10/31 so --

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: What happens if
23 there --

24 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: If there are kids
25 who show up after January, unless it is a situation

1
2 that Carmen and I are aware of and talking about and
3 pay attention to, we are sensitive to the fact that
4 children with IEPs may show up or their IEP may show
5 up post 12/31.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I have hear for
7 example that some schools have received over 40
8 students since January 1st all English language
9 learners and some of them have --

10 [cross talk]

11 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Mark, in cases like
12 that, really principals should email me directly
13 because we get [inaudible 01:33:25] and there was one
14 school this year there was a big immigration pattern
15 in this particular neighborhood and the challenge for
16 us was that these were kids coming as an uprising in
17 their country and the students were coming with no
18 prior written language at all so these are challenges
19 that we try to face on a case by case basis but when
20 this happens by all means let us know and we try to
21 fix --

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I will be more
23 than happy to follow-up with you and I appreciate
24 that Chancellor. I am going, in the interest of
25 time, am going to get my two last questions in. I

1
2 have more but and then you feel free to respond
3 afterwards. With regards to lunch forms, I know that
4 again while I was teaching many schools relied on and
5 forgive me if the practice has shifted since but
6 schools rely on lunch forms to qualify for Title One
7 funding with this new Administration where people are
8 -- even before this Administration people were
9 concerned about returning those forms in but now it
10 is even worse with the fears and concerns, what is
11 being done to make sure the schools are not being
12 unfairly really hurt because parents and families are
13 afraid to return those forms and the last question I
14 had before the bell rings is teacher recruitment and
15 retention at UPK sites and the future 3K sites.
16 There were some reports about many pf the providers
17 having serious concerns about recruiting teachers
18 with regard to pay issues and salaries and issues
19 which I am sure is still to this day so those are the
20 two questions I have.

21 CHANCELLOR FARINA: We haven't seen a
22 drop in forms. I think parent coordinators in the
23 schools have taken this on as one of their jobs and
24 we have pretty much retained Title One status. The
25 only thing that happens with Title One as you well

1
2 know, it is a federal form -- percentages so we have
3 to watch that very carefully. In terms of teacher
4 retention, it actually has been quite the opposite.
5 We have received a lot of applicants for teaching
6 positions even outside the city so I think we are in
7 a very, very good place. We anticipate this year's
8 teacher retention citywide to be among the highest it
9 has ever been. We received a national award recently
10 for our dropout of teachers is seven percent. It is
11 one of the lowest in the country so I think we are
12 becoming to be more attractive to many people.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: But this is for
14 the UPK sites?

15 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Okay.

17 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Across the board.

18 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Council
19 Member Gibson?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you very
21 much. Good afternoon, Chairs. Thank you, Chancellor
22 to you and your staff for all the work you do. I
23 certainly want to thank you for your commitment. I
24 stood with you and the Mayor a few months ago with
25 school safety to make sure that we affirmed our

1
2 commitment to protecting all students regardless of
3 status and I think in light of the environment it is
4 even more important that everyone is on the same page
5 in terms of teachers and our professionals and other
6 support staff to make sure that we are protecting all
7 students while they are under our supervision so I
8 thank you for that. I just had a few questions and I
9 wanted to ask quickly about the language access and I
10 see that we are expanding Bengali bilingual programs
11 which are incredible because of the diversity across
12 out city. I wanted to specifically ask about
13 District Nine in the Bronx. We have a high
14 population of students that are from West Africa and
15 I have talked to you about that to identify ways in
16 which we can really incorporate more bilingual
17 programs. I think a lot of the bilingual services we
18 get are for many of our Latino students which is
19 great but I also wanted to see what are we doing
20 about students of West African descent?

21 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I think this was the
22 group I was alluding to before that a lot of the West
23 Africans students that are coming in do not have a
24 specific written language and we are looking at how
25 do we do more language acquisitions through visuals.

1
2 I mean, the superintendent there and I have been
3 discussing. One of the programs we have been
4 discussing more oral approaches to teaching of a dual
5 language so I think this is definitely on our radar
6 and now we are seeing another part of the city with
7 some of the same issue but the other thing is we
8 talked about how do we get information to parents,
9 the parents of those students and we actually have
10 someone who is developing a visual message, you know,
11 in terms of using pictures and so I think this is a
12 challenge but we are up for challenges and I am happy
13 to discuss this with you further.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay. Great.

15 CHANCELLOR FARINA: But we do know that
16 challenge exists.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay. Single
18 shepherd, I spoke to the superintendent at District
19 Seven, very proud of the work there. How long do we
20 access the success and measurement of the program
21 before we expand to other school districts? So we
22 are now in D7 and D23 in Brooklyn.

23 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I think this is
24 something that obviously cost factor always comes
25 into it. I think we have a tremendous amount of

1
2 positive antidotal. We are looking to see and also
3 to measure it by does it stop dropout rate, does it
4 improve students who are applying to colleges, not
5 necessarily get but applying and so those are things
6 we should be able to figure out by end of this year,
7 beginning of September and once we get a better idea
8 of what the successes are then I will be able to give
9 you a better --

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay, great. I
11 appreciate your commitment to working with so many
12 students in temporary housing. District Nine has a
13 high concentration. I know we have hired literacy
14 coaches, attendance monitors to reduce absenteeism
15 and to make sure that families are, you know, working
16 with many of the shelter providers and social workers
17 but I also wanted to ask within the shelter
18 population many families are victims of domestic
19 violence so keeping them in their home community may
20 be a concern so how do you identify those particular
21 cases to ensure that students are not traveling an
22 hour to school but making sure their safety is never
23 compromised. How do you work with the shelter
24 providers in that regard?

1
2 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I think to some
3 degree it is parent's choice where they want to send
4 their students to school. I will tell you that one
5 of the highest level of students in temporary housing
6 that we know with domestic violence is in a specific
7 school and we have increased the amount of services
8 in that school particularly to work with the adults
9 but it is also interesting when we offer it as a --
10 sometimes the move out of those shelters, we have
11 offered them other -- those parents all chose to stay
12 within that school because of the welcoming nature of
13 that principal and the teachers. So this is almost
14 like a school by school decision based on that but we
15 have put on more guidance support and we work very
16 closely with domestic violence commission and we work
17 with all the commissioners so as an issue if you have
18 a specific situation I will be happy to look it up.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay, great. And I
20 wanted to ask two questions that focus on suicide
21 prevention as well as the active recruitment to hire
22 make teacher, particularly men of color and where we
23 are with that and then my final question is the
24 renewal school program and as you know in District
25 Nine we are losing junior high school 145 on Teller

1 Avenue and we are working with the superintendent and
2 those parents of sixth and seventh grade but I wanted
3 to make sure the campus itself and the two remaining
4 schools we need support and when I say support I mean
5 money and we need resources and teachers to sure that
6 we uplift those two existing schools within our
7 District Nine.

9 CHANCELLOR FARINA: You gave me a lot of
10 things, let me see if I remember.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Suicide
12 prevention.

13 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Suicide -- a lot of
14 things come by my desk that I could get very upset
15 about but nothing gets me more upset than when a
16 child commits suicide because it is [inaudible
17 01:41:022] and the question we always ask ourselves
18 is what could we have done to prevent it.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Right.

20 CHANCELLOR FARINA: SO we have a
21 curriculum that we now have sent out, it's been a
22 while, but we really have asked teachers to have more
23 discussions on this. We also gave done more training
24 for parents on how to have these kinds of discussions
25 with their children at home so there have been

1
2 workshops for parents on this issue as well and the
3 other and it is a bigger challenge for us when
4 teachers recommend students who they believe are
5 depressed or any number of signs because we do have
6 symptoms to look for that sometimes families are
7 reluctant to take the next step so we have been
8 looking at that as well. But, this is something that
9 is definitely on my radar. It is on the Deputy
10 Chancellor Rose's jurisdiction but it is something
11 she and I talk about a lot based on what is it that
12 causes a child to do this and also to some degree the
13 numbers have stayed steady over the years but one is
14 one too many in my opinion. The male recruitment is
15 under I Teach and Men Mentor. We have 100 males that
16 we anticipate putting in our schools in September
17 that are coming out of this particular training. All
18 minority teachers -- some of them who are coming from
19 other parts of the state of country to work here in
20 New York City they -- we have also out in place which
21 I think the align themselves culturally responsive
22 curriculum to all new teachers particularly in the
23 Bronx across the board as part of the new teacher
24 training so that it is not just what your gender or
25 race is but how do you deal with students when they

1
2 are in front of you and may not be like yourself,
3 whatever the like yourself means. So I think we are
4 trying to do this in multiple ways. We have also
5 started working with the university to see if they
6 can embed some of this work into their teacher
7 training program. We can't all be on our -- some
8 teachers should come to us prepared to deal with some
9 of these issues already so this has been a
10 conversation. We have a working group at CUNY and we
11 are also working with several private universities.
12 I want to say something about the site of 145.
13 Almost every student in that building was on a
14 regular basis with talking to the superintendent has
15 been assigned another place. The other school in the
16 building Bastian Millennium --

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: And Urban
18 Science.

19 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Yeah. Is doing some
20 fabulous work so I assume he will be taking more and
21 we have a plan that we are working on right now for
22 some of the space in that building to deal
23 specifically with District Nine issues which I will
24 be happy to discuss with you later because we are not
25 fully ready yet to make it public but I think it will

1
2 be something that will fit the needs of District Nine
3 in a very special way and that I think you will be
4 very happy with.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay. Thank you
6 very much and thank you Madam Chair. I just want to
7 go on record and add my voice to supporting universal
8 free school lunch in our efforts. So thank you once
9 again, Chancellor, and thank you Chair.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you, Council
11 Member Gibson. We have been joined by Council Member
12 Rosenthal and Council Member Cornegy. And now we will
13 hear questions from Council Member Chin followed by
14 Barron and Rosenthal.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Chair.
16 Good afternoon, Chancellor. First of all, I just
17 wanted to comment again that it really makes a
18 difference to have an educator as Chancellor. The
19 way you have been answering our question and knowing
20 the program, it has just been great and we really
21 appreciate you being there.

22 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I understand it is a
23 new trend in this country to hire educators as
24 superintendents. Flabbergasts me.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: We should follow
3 that trend. I was very excited to hear in your
4 testimony about programs that you are focusing on
5 English language learners especially the new
6 initiative so you started off with 75 family, the
7 Family English Initiative, so my question on that is
8 focused on K to two. What about starting early for
9 Pre-K, right, and when the K3 starts as early as we
10 can I think that is where we should really bring the
11 parents in so if their plan to really start it
12 earlier and also what the plan of really expanding it
13 as quickly as possible?

14 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I mean again I will
15 certainly take it back to, you know, again everything
16 has a money cost. This one not as much but certainly
17 important. Keep in mind, think about yourself as a
18 teenager or even a fourth grader, do you really want
19 your parents sitting in the classroom with you and I
20 am just saying that is one of the things. So we
21 start it young because we think the young kids will
22 love having the parents in the room with them and if
23 a teacher is teaching literacy to an early childhood
24 the parents can be learning right along. This is
25 something I had wanted to do years ago when I was a

1
2 teacher but I am certainly willing to take back the
3 Pre-K idea. I don't know why we didn't start there
4 but I'm happy to get back to you on that.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you. I agree
6 with you start as early as possible. Maybe by second
7 grade might be -- the kids might not want their
8 parents to be there. The other question I have is
9 really like the core nation. I know that you
10 increased the language at this program but you have
11 other programs the universal literacy program for
12 second graders. How are English language learner
13 students also get incorporated into those other
14 programs so that they don't -- they can also take
15 advantage of it especially also when you talked about
16 the stim program and the space lab program and all
17 these wonderful initiatives that you're starting, we
18 just want to make sure that all students will also be
19 able to take advantage of these new initiatives.

20 CHANCELLOR FARINA: There is absolutely
21 no differentiation for literacy coaches in schools
22 across all these programs so all our literacy coaches
23 get some training because they have to go for a two
24 week summer intensive training. They get some
25 training on how to work with L's and they get some

1 training on how to work with special ed so if you
2 have five classes on a second grade, all five classes
3 will receive literacy coaches regardless of whether
4 they ESL classes, L classes or special ed classes. I
5 think that is an important part of the program. I
6 have all the numbers on that because I actually had
7 my office break it down that way and that is one of
8 the reasons we started with the four districts to
9 ensure that we would be able to serve the needs of
10 all kids. As we go to 14 districts it has even been
11 more important but there is no differentiation among
12 the students in terms of getting the literacy
13 coaches. They just have to be trained on how to work
14 with the different student population.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: That's great. The
17 other program that I know you mentioned was the Grand
18 Connection and I think that program itself also has a
19 big connection to English language learners
20 especially in the Asian community a lot of
21 grandparents at the one taking care of the kid and
22 they should be somehow incorporated into the English
23 language learning part too even though they might be
24 grandparents they can still learn English and get
25 involved in that way.

1
2 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Actually the Asian
3 community both in your district and also in Flushing
4 and other parts of Queens have been particularly
5 receptive to the work that we are doing. We asked
6 them what they wanted more help in and they
7 specifically wanted more help on how to do parenting
8 when they themselves might not have done it in the
9 last 20 years. And if you read, there was an article
10 in the New York Times recently about all the things
11 that have changed like do you put your child on their
12 stomach, do you put them on their back, but also what
13 books do you read aloud to children which may not
14 have been what they read to their children so the
15 grandparent connection, the first time we met with
16 them there was about 25 of them and we met with them
17 in a bookstore and we met with them to really hear
18 what some of the issues were and what we are finding
19 is that more of their issues now tend to be around
20 health issues for themselves and how to deal with
21 their children's health issues. So we have bene kind
22 of working a lot more with some of our health
23 providers because it was a very sad experience for
24 me, I had grandparents who --

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I just want to add
3 in my last question. I didn't hear anything about
4 dual language programs so I --

5 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Oh no --

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: -- hope there are
7 still plans on continue to expand because especially
8 kids can learn -- learning a second language at a
9 young age has got to be a priority in our city. You
10 can finish the grandparent part.

11 CHANCELLOR FARINA: We are taking from
12 the grandparents what they want more of and we now
13 have an advisory team of grandparents that [inaudible
14 01:49:39] more of but I want to go back to the dual
15 language. Now that there is some research that it
16 keeps you from having Alzheimer's I think we are
17 getting a lot more traction on this. Our biggest
18 challenge with dual language and it doesn't mean we
19 are backing away from it, is getting certified
20 teachers. You know that. We have discussed it. We
21 want to talk to the China Institute and how they can
22 help us but the reality is that we are asking
23 universities we have also asked the state if they
24 would start considering reciprocal -- if you come
25 from China and you have been a teacher in China, can

1
2 we get reciprocal licensing here in New York. So
3 these are all conversations that we are having but
4 the biggest challenge to increase more dual language
5 continues to be the ability to get teachers who are
6 fluent in two languages so otherwise I would love to
7 grow it. I would love to make New York City a dual
8 language city in its whole.

9 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
10 you, Council Member Chin. We will now hear from
11 Council Member Barron followed by Council Member
12 Rosenthal followed by Council Member Cornegy.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Madam
14 Chair and thank you to your co-chair and thank you to
15 the Chancellor for coming to present the [inaudible
16 01:50:49] of that. Ten questions, I guess that is
17 about 30 seconds per question, in terms of you cited
18 an increase in college readiness among graduate, CUNY
19 has said that there has not been a reduction in
20 students needing developmental courses and that
21 increases the time and cost to those students so
22 there seems to be a disconnect. I have heard you
23 talk about the programs that are -- you are working
24 with in conjunction with CUNY but how are we going to
25 ensure that we get students into colleges

1 particularly interested in black students because we
2 know that the DOE has had a major reduction in black
3 students, I think it is ten black teaching staff, I
4 think it is 10 percent over the last 12 years, the
5 reduction of the number of black teachers that there
6 are and also of course the significant reduction in
7 the number black students who attend the so called
8 elite schools so how are we going to address that?

9
10 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I don't know about
11 the specific numbers. I am happy to review it but I
12 would say that with the addition of the AP courses
13 that we are going to see students that are much
14 better prepared and we are actually have increased AP
15 courses more in minority -- in schools with a large
16 minority population because many of these schools had
17 absolutely no AP courses whatsoever if you look at
18 neighborhoods that in the past may not have these
19 opportunities. I also think that one of the things
20 that we are doing is increasing course work. For
21 example, increasing Algebra for all. By putting
22 Algebra in fifth grade, it is a game changer because
23 we know that Algebra is one of those courses that is
24 more likely to be a predictor of really good ability
25 to get into college and stay there. We are looking

1
2 at other programs that looking backwards say if you
3 take this course, like more writing courses, this
4 year we have increased the amount of writing in our
5 high schools because if you go to college and can't
6 write then that is a problem.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. We
8 know that there is a problem with lead in the water
9 in our schools. I was very alarmed when the deputy
10 chancellor referenced the fact that well it would
11 only impact the student who was at that first sip of
12 water, that first fountain. I thought that was very
13 insensitive and talked to a fact of a part of not
14 understanding we don't want any student to have
15 contaminated water so I think we need to look at
16 that. I was very disappointed that I wasn't able to
17 get from the DOE a printout of schools in my district
18 and what the report was for the lead. I was told it
19 was online, you can go on there and get it. I don't
20 think I should have to scroll through 50 schools to
21 find out which of my 50 schools have lead in the
22 water so I would like to get that as a printout for
23 my district and moving on to the 3K program that is
24 coming forward, do you think that a ratio of one
25 adult to 15 three year olds is appropriate?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Do I think what?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: A ratio of one teacher to 15 students, 15 three year olds is an appropriate ratio?

CHANCELLOR FARINA: They have a para.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: They do have a para?

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

CHANCELLOR FARINA: I will say by the end of the day you will have a list of all your 50 schools.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. The renewal schools as we know were told they would have three years to bring their scores up yet only after about a year and a half of services one of the schools in my district that is a renewal school being closed, two others are losing grades six, seven and eight which like -- which carriers that title of truncation. What are we going to do with those buildings, that particular building, the [inaudible 01:54:36] school that is being closed and parents are told that they can select another school to send their child to and I would say to you since the

1
2 average reading score in District 19 is 19 percent on
3 grade level in reading and 15 percent on grade level
4 in math that we are sending students who are not
5 performing well to another low performing school?

6 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Many questions in
7 one, let me see if I can answer them. First and
8 foremost, you now have a relatively new
9 superintendent who has made his focus instructional
10 leadership. I have gone through this at several of
11 the schools in District 19 and I think they are on
12 the right path. In terms of closing renewal schools
13 we looked at A, what is the potential that they will
14 increase also what is the number of kids in that
15 building, [inaudible 01:55:32] in particular had I
16 think 100 and some odd children left. You can get a
17 good education when you can have the money for a
18 guidance counselor, reading teacher, whatever it is
19 you need so I think the opportunity and by the way
20 all schools that go through closure have an option of
21 three other schools so they have gotten other choices
22 and I am pretty sure that by now they must now where
23 they are going but the last question that you're
24 asking I think is really important. Truncation means
25 that we looked at in K to eight schools, parents who

1
2 have students by the end of fifth grade who are
3 relatively successful will apply to go to a
4 standalone middle school or a middle school that has
5 at least 200 or more kids. What gets left behind in
6 six, seven and eight and we looked at these numbers,
7 you have less than 60 kids across three grades who
8 are probably the kids who are special needs or
9 English language or whatever that nobody wanted so I
10 am just saying the truncation to us is the way to
11 increase the K to five seats or Pre-K, gives us room
12 there, and the other students will be in place where
13 I think they will be better served but we do this on
14 a school by school basis. There is no universal rule
15 on how we merge, consolidate, close, the truncate.
16 This comes out of the superintendent, it comes out of
17 many factors but generally it is how will the
18 children be well served and that is really what I
19 look at.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. What
21 are the plans for the building?

22 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I can tell you but I
23 will have to go back and look at my sheet.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I can expect what
25 the answer will be. I can expect --

1

2

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Don't assume that.

3

We will get back to you.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: If it's not what

5

I assume that it is, I will be shocked.

6

CHANCELLOR FARINA: Okay.

7

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And Madam Chair,

8

your indulgence, in terms of the fair student funding

9

you said that no school is below 87 percent and I

10

read in your report for the renewal schools and

11

community schools it's a hundred percent but there

12

are some schools that are at 91 percent and I wanted

13

to know how we decided which schools would be at 91

14

percent as opposed to 87 percent and if you don't

15

have that that could be forwarded to us, I would

16

appreciate it.

17

CHANCELLOR FARINA: We will get back to

18

you on that.

19

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: thank you. Thank

20

you, Madam Chair. I have other questions but my time

21

is up.

22

[off mic talking]

23

COUNCIL MEMBER ??: Good morning, Madam

24

Chancellor, how are you? I want to start by actually

25

commending you and thanking you for the quick

1
2 response to the request for the implementation of
3 gifted and talented programs in communities of color.
4 I am blessed to have had a gifted and talented third
5 grade last year which appears to be doing well and
6 junior high school starting in the fall. I agree
7 with the third grade implementation as opposed to the
8 kindergarten because it gives us a greater
9 opportunity to assess a child's acumen so I am very
10 happy about that. I did want to talk to you about
11 the specialized high schools and the below average
12 participation of minority students. The Ivy Leagues
13 have a program now where they are doing a cumulative
14 entrance into Ivy programs which is inclusive of the
15 entrance exam but also the past history of the
16 student. So statistically I have been able to gather
17 that if we were to allow every valedictorian and
18 salutatorian into specialized high schools we would
19 double the amount of minority participation in
20 specialized high schools almost overnight. I wanted
21 to know what your thoughts were on that so I know
22 there has been tremendous negative push back as it
23 relates to doing away with the test. I'm not asking
24 that. I'm asking if we could look at the holistic
25 student and if we just took the top ten percentile of

1
2 junior high schools around the city and allowed
3 admittance of minority students it would increase
4 minority participation almost double overnight. I
5 wonder what your thoughts were about that.

6 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I am certainly
7 willing to talk about it and, you know, we can have a
8 one on one the way we have looked at other things.
9 It is certainly one of those things we have discussed
10 in the past. I don't have the specific answer to you
11 right now but we are coming out with something by the
12 end of the school year, June. I do want to say in
13 terms of the -- we started four programs this year in
14 third grade for gifted and talented and I want to
15 reiterate that the reason for doing this is so we
16 could use multiple measures so we had prior teachers'
17 recommendations, we have their homework assignments,
18 we had report cards. We were able to access these
19 kids which would also mean that they are more likely
20 to be successful. The other things that we told
21 every district but you superintendent got a head
22 start on this, that every district that we have
23 opened a gifted and talented in third grade should
24 have a middle school that is going to take those kids
25 by the time the get to sixth grade so we have a whole

1
2 chain that moves it and the same thing that we would
3 have high schools that would then for these kids
4 would have a special ability to get in so we are
5 looking at all that but the other issue I'm happy to
6 contemplate more of and I'm happy to talk to you
7 about it.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ??: So I appreciate that
9 and we worked together again on other things and I
10 would like to work on that but I would also like to
11 look on making sure that for these newly implemented
12 gifted and talented programs, third grade and junior
13 high school that the resources match because some of
14 the parents who are considering gifted and talented
15 in my district are noticing a lack of resources to
16 meet the needs of the gifted and talented program so
17 that is something I would like to talk to you off-
18 line about.

19 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Okay. I think what
20 we need to know is that all the teachers who are now
21 teaching these programs, they are going to more
22 rigorous training. We have also put together an
23 advisory group of all the principals who have taken
24 on these programs, not just the new ones but other
25 ones. Anna Kamtanta (SP) in my office is responsible

1
2 for some of this work and we are looking to see also,
3 we have a partnership now with the New York
4 Historical Society and Hunter College to train the
5 teachers who are going to be the teachers in these
6 programs. In New York City, we have had I think in
7 the last three of four years, the need that teachers
8 who teach in gifted programs must be gifted and
9 talented certified. So our challenge is to make sure
10 we find the teachers who either have that
11 certification or are willing to be trained in that
12 certification so we are working on this. In terms of
13 individual resources, I am happy to discuss further
14 what is missing.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ??: Lastly, in my last 40
16 seconds, in my district we understand that the gifted
17 and talented programs are pipe line programs for a
18 lack of a better term to greater success and what I
19 have done is spent some discretionary funding to
20 partner with the National Society of Black Engineers
21 to get students ready for the exam. My colleagues
22 may not be able to do the same. I would like to see
23 the DOE make that same investment across the board so
24 that we can continue to have a pipeline and that
25 maybe members don't have to do that individually.

1
2 Another thing I would like to talk to you about off-
3 line. There are groups who are willing to help --

4 CHANCELLOR FARINA: We have increased our
5 mentoring programs. We have also working with
6 historically black colleges in more extensive ways,
7 particularly Staten Island. So we are looking at a
8 lot of different ways to do this but the pipe line is
9 there and the other thing that is happening which I
10 think is what we really expected to see also is that
11 for principals who don't want to lose their gifted
12 and talented kids, that they have started putting
13 enrichment programs in their own schools to keep the
14 parents local so I think it really raises the ante
15 for everybody.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ??: Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
18 you, Council Member. We will now hear from Council
19 Member Rosenthal. We have been joined by Council
20 Member Reynoso and [inaudible 02:03:23].

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you so
22 much, Chair. I really appreciate this hearing and
23 Chancellor it is great to see you as always. I do
24 want to start by thanking you, you know, first for
25 the school rezone plans in the southern portion of

1
2 District Three. I've been talking to your staff who
3 are looking at the numbers and it looks like the
4 integration that we are hoping for is going to be --
5 is going to happen which is --

6 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Yes. To have a wait
7 list at 191, not a bad thing to be.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Pretty great,
9 pretty great. So thank you for that. Similarly I
10 want to thank you, we've worked with your office over
11 the last year getting a memorandum of understanding
12 for review of the contracts and we now have a signed
13 letter and I really appreciate that and am looking
14 forward to that playing out with the additional
15 transparency. I think from last year's hearing to
16 this year's, we -- on our side we've seen some real
17 progress and have very much appreciated working with
18 your staff. I am seeing some of them and smiling at
19 them as we speak. Thank you. So that has worked out
20 great and I want to thank you for that. Following up
21 on Council Member Cornegy's point about the gifted
22 and talented programs being so helpful, that was
23 another addition that you came up with for PS191 and
24 that looks like we are having enrollment and that is
25 going to change the whole tenor of the school so I

1
2 guess that turned into a thank you as well. I want
3 to ask you about construction next to schools. I was
4 thinking should I bring this up at the SCA hearing
5 but it is really an expense thing and the reason is
6 because it is not about using the expertise that SCA
7 brings and how to build a school or how to renovate a
8 school, the issue really is when a building is going
9 up next to a school that already exists how do we
10 make sure that the principals know how to -- that the
11 principals can assure the parents that their kids are
12 safe and I am wondering if you invested at all in
13 coming up with a plan to do that. I spoke to the
14 building's commissioner who gave one suggestion that
15 we could require the builder to have a flag person at
16 each and every one of those building site locations
17 to make sure that when the trucks are going in and
18 out kids would be -- someone would pointedly be
19 looking out for the kids from the builders at the
20 builder's expense. He had a couple other ideas as
21 well and I'm wondering in this budget you've invested
22 anything in, you know, putting together information
23 for principals kind of like that.

24 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Well, it's an
25 interesting idea. I know right now -- you're talking

1 about 163, I was just there the other day. There are
2 certain key times of the day when construction and
3 school need to be matched: arrival time, any lunch
4 time activity that takes place in the schoolyard and
5 dismissal time. We have asked construction crews in
6 other parts of the city to be aware of these three
7 times. In additional, testing weeks are crucial. I
8 think by having some specific guidelines Deputy
9 Chancellor Rose has also assigned some people in her
10 facilities team to be the liaison to the principal.
11 The principal shouldn't have to drop everything to
12 discuss anything with a developer but having a
13 liaison we know have that already in our budget plan
14 in terms of the person who will work with that and I
15 know as a principal who had construction around the
16 building just having someone, in my case it was the
17 person in charge of custodian, just to take that load
18 off when they were doing the pointing in the building
19 and putting in air-conditioning and all that so I
20 think we can be clear that New York City is a city on
21 the move but that there are key times in a schools
22 life that are more crucial than other so I think
23 having said what they are and letting the -- whoever
24

1
2 is developing keep an eye on that I think that is
3 important.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Great. I
5 appreciate your support of that and, you know, the
6 parents at 163 have been spectacular about bringing
7 this to all of our attention but I have two other
8 schools that are facing this, PS75 could face it if
9 the developer comes back with a new plan and that
10 would be right across the small street, and now right
11 on the corner of 70th and Amsterdam, a developer has
12 put in plans for basically a 66 story building that
13 would be built about a half block away from PS199 so
14 that is going to be another location where we are
15 going to need help and I really do think that as I
16 talked to my colleagues in other boroughs, you know,
17 we are lucky to have had the parent leaders at 163.
18 I am not sure there are those type parent leaders at
19 other schools that might be undergoing this. Thank
20 you for your consideration.

21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. We have
22 now been joined by Council Member Mark Levine who has
23 questions as well.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, Chair
25 Dromm. Thank you Chair Ferreras-Copeland. Wonderful

1
2 to see you Chancellor. I know you have already
3 spoken some on topic that you and I are both
4 passionate about which is dual language education. I
5 am so appreciative of the strong support you have
6 given to this model which both offers something great
7 for children who are learning English but the
8 opportunity for emersion for children who can learn a
9 new language is also so impactful. You know this.
10 You've been very strong on that. Forgive me if you
11 have already discussed this one angle I want to ask
12 you about but there are additional costs for dual
13 language programs perhaps because you need to acquire
14 materials that are more expensive, may even have to
15 be shipped from abroad for example to get subject
16 matter in a foreign language and sometimes even as
17 translation service is done even of American
18 curriculum into the second language and at least some
19 schools talk about additional staffing needs because
20 to work it out with having an English speaker and
21 someone who can teach the content in a second
22 language depending on the size of the program can
23 require extra staffing and I am wondering if you all
24 have evaluated the cost of dual language programs and
25 whether you generally allocate additional money for

1
2 schools who are starting them and whether there is
3 even a top line system-wide number for what we are
4 spending on this.

5 CHANCELLOR FARINA: First of all, we --
6 when we put out RFPs for schools that want to do dual
7 language, we give them a year planning time. This
8 doesn't get started without any preparation and part
9 of the planning time is more training for the
10 teachers and the principals about what kind of
11 language allocation policy you're going to put in
12 place. Starting in September, I'm asking for a color
13 coded approach to language allocation. When I go
14 into a school, I shouldn't ask whether you have
15 English in the morning, Mandarin Chinese in the
16 afternoon. I should know by the color that is the
17 process you're using. Are you doing two teachers in
18 a classroom parallel teaching, are you doing Mondays
19 in one language, Tuesdays in another. So we need to
20 be very explicit on what we mean by dual language,
21 otherwise a lot of the money could be not used for
22 the process that we plan on so there is a lot of
23 training and most schools go through an entire year
24 of training of their teachers and their principals to
25 understand that programming does matter so that is

1
2 certainly number one. The other thing that we have
3 been very fortunate in is that a lot of our foreign
4 consulates and embassies are very energized around
5 this program so for example for our new program in
6 Williamsburg of Japanese, actually the Japanese
7 government and the first lady came in person to give
8 us a grant to buy materials in the native language.
9 Translating American books into another language is
10 not, in my opinion, the best dual language process.
11 The best dual language process is having the books
12 that are already written in the native language
13 because native language is also about understanding
14 culture. So I don't want to do Dick and Jane
15 American style for kids who are learning Mandarin, I
16 want to do whatever it is that culture thinks is
17 important so that becomes the kind of connection. We
18 have had the French government who actually honors
19 our principals of French every year in Paris and they
20 pay all the expenses and send the materials. They get
21 the French legion of honor. We now have the Italian
22 consulate willing to do things. A lot of our Arabic
23 materials are given to us by the Qatar Foundation
24 because they want to see their culture also so I
25 think in terms of materials we are always struggling

1
2 for more appropriate materials on the right reading
3 level because we are focused on that in our own
4 English literacy but I do think getting the
5 appropriate materials is difficult. I know Margaret
6 Chin invited me to something the Asian Society was
7 doing and I said if they could get more materials
8 written in mandarin that would be child friendly
9 based on some of the things we are using that would
10 be very helpful. So I think we are moving in the
11 right direction and by the way because New York City
12 is doing so much of this, I get letters all the time
13 from publishers, you know, we're willing to come on
14 board, what do we need to do so I just think this is
15 moving in the right direction but I would like to
16 move away because we have lots of translate. I mean,
17 corduroy comes in Spanish. Corduroy is corduroy in
18 English. So I want to see programs, books written in
19 the native language to make sure that the culture is
20 also so.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Well Chair Dromm
22 and I would like to be considered for the delegation
23 to Paris. We are available. In the last few seconds
24 left, is there any budget allocation, is there a line
25

1
2 in your budget for dual language or how do you look
3 at this from a fiscal perspective?

4 CHANCELLOR FARINA: A lot of it comes
5 under Title Three and Title One and someone asked
6 before about the stim. We now actually have stim
7 that is particularly ear marked for out English
8 language learners. We have a special summer program
9 in stim in District 32 that is primarily for English
10 language learners because we find that English
11 language learners learn English more rapidly when
12 they are doing it with hands-on programs rather than
13 -- so stim is a very natural way to do that but there
14 are allocated lines. We can always use more money
15 for the parent component for this but I am pretty
16 happy with the funding sources right now if they
17 don't dry up.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you,
19 Chancellor. Thank you, Mr. Chair and Madam Chair.

20 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
21 you, Council Member. We are now going to begin our
22 second round. This round is a little bit shorter.
23 There is going to be questions between both Chairs
24 that we are not going to be able to ask today so we
25

1
2 ask that you respond to it expeditiously so that we
3 can use them for budget negotiation purposes.

4 CHANCELLOR FARINA: And I will tell you
5 that is what we do at town hall meetings. I get to
6 as many questions as I can. Anything you send to me
7 will get back to you within 48 hours.

8 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Sounds
9 wonderful. ?? has projected savings by incentivizing
10 schools to permanently hire teachers from the absent
11 teacher reserve. You projected 10.9 million in
12 savings for fiscal 2018 growing to 21.9 million in
13 2020. Taking those costs to schools to eventually
14 shift this cost to schools I think after for years.
15 For example, if the teacher was hired from the ATR
16 pool, DOE will pay the salary cost for the first
17 year. In the second year, DOE will cover 50 percent
18 and so on and so forth. This is not the first time
19 the DOE has incentivized schools to hire teachers
20 from the ATR pool. What is different about this plan
21 from the previous plan and how will DOE ensure the
22 projected savings it's generating?

23 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Okay. First of all,
24 let me be very clear, that these are not all ATR
25 teachers. These are select ATR teachers. What is

1
2 different from the past is these are teachers who are
3 filling a vacancy. A principal says I have two
4 vacancies and we have an ATR teacher who has the
5 credentials for that vacancy. A principal key
6 teacher for a year and says wow, this really worked
7 out and we have examples of that throughout the city
8 so by the second year that teacher is filling a
9 vacancy but it is already money that is allocated to
10 that school budget rather than our budget which is
11 what is paying ATR separately. We have been very
12 successful this year and expect to do more of this
13 next year where these teachers are now going back
14 into schools where the principal may have had a
15 vacancy for a year or two so this is also based on
16 principal decision. These teachers have to be rated
17 effective or highly effective in order to be part of
18 this pool so it is not all ATR teachers. It is a
19 select group of ATR teachers who are going to be
20 moving into this and it is also based on principal
21 recommendations and also we hired now the former
22 principal of Brooklyn Tech, Randy Asher, to led this
23 work so he has actually personally interviewed all
24 the teachers that would be in this pool and matched
25 them with schools who have the need for them. It is

1
2 not an add-on person so it is not adding onto the
3 budget it is filling a vacancy that already exists.

4 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: I guess I
5 need to better understand the savings component of it
6 from your perspective.

7 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Right now, we are
8 paying for many of these teachers and they are not
9 necessarily on any school budget. They are on our
10 budget. The intention is to ultimately put them on
11 the school budget because they are actually doing the
12 job of a teacher in that school.

13 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And then
14 the percentage bringing it down is why you see the
15 savings -- okay.

16 [off mic talk]

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So is there an
18 overall reduction in ATR teachers?

19 CHANCELLOR FARINA: There is.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Do you know the
21 number?

22 CHANCELLOR FARINA: It is a floating
23 number but it is moving rather rapidly, yeah. I can
24 give you the exact number though. I want to get the
25

1 latest by Randy Asher and Randy is working on this
2 and this is his only responsibility.

3 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So is the savings
4 somewhat in the fact of attrition then as well that
5 you are losing some of those --

6 CHANCELLOR FARINA: There are three
7 different tracks for the ATRs. Partially what I said
8 filling vacancies, there is also retirement and
9 buyout and a whole bunch of different extras.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yeah, okay. Thank
11 you

12 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
13 you. I wanted to talk about school lunch. As you
14 know we've been asking for this for several years now
15 and in several budget responses now we have all five
16 I believe borough presidents committed, yes, all five
17 of the borough presidents committed to this call, 82
18 percent of voters, New Yorkers, want this. Are you
19 thinking about including this in the plan in the
20 future, what are your thoughts on -- why wasn't this
21 included in the executive --

22 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I think everything
23 can be discussed at some point. I just wanted to
24 again be clear that students are not deprived of
25

1
2 eating lunch because of money. I promise Ben Kallos
3 and I'm going to do it as soon as I go back to the
4 office that we will reiterate to the teachers and
5 principals city-wide. To me the most important thing
6 is making sure -- where we saw a real need is in
7 middle school. The reason we did middle school free
8 lunch is that adolescents, because they are
9 adolescents, make certain decisions, you know, so we
10 thought having the free lunch in the middle school is
11 very successful. What we found in terms of increase
12 are the use of lunch was more or about as equal as
13 the environment as it was about the free lunch and in
14 schools where they don't have cap -- captive lunch is
15 where you're not allowed to go out for lunch and in
16 schools where they have the ability to go out for
17 lunch, that the students were not actually eating
18 lunch in school although it might be part of the
19 school program. I think this is a lot more
20 complicated but I am happy to continue this
21 discussion with your committee or anyone you want.

22 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So we are
23 going to continue to push, we believe in it.

24 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I'm sure.

25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: But also
3 it is interesting that you talk about students being
4 able to go out to lunch. I think if you ask any
5 young person I think they probably prefer to eat out
6 because of the option so --

7 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I was a principal
8 when I first brought the idea of having my, at that
9 time, fifth graders go out to lunch starting in
10 April, not all year long. They weren't mature enough
11 in September. I got a lot of push back from parents
12 but the beauty of having a going out to lunch under
13 very strict rules, I had the police department
14 engaged, I had parent workshops on this is it moves
15 them toward independence and as they go on to the
16 next level of schooling, be it middle school or high
17 school, they are ready to manage their own time and
18 their own behavior but there are a lot of rules and a
19 lot of things put in place and a lot of it the kids
20 split their own lunch. They would sit on the steps
21 of the Metropolitan Museum eating lunch. They
22 weren't necessarily going into the pizza shop, some
23 were and some weren't. It is a matter of how you say
24 may two days a week versus three days a week and it
25 has to be managed but the end goal has to be moving

1 the kids to be more responsible for themselves. They
2 go to the next level of schooling that they have that
3 engrained in them. And many of them, honestly,
4 didn't eat when they went out, they just needed that
5 burst of being on their kind of, independence. Like
6 I said, I am happy to continue this discussion and we
7 have to look at also what is the cultural need about
8 eating. It is not just about the eating. One of the
9 things I was discussing with Ben, how do we look at
10 schools that start lunch at 10:30 in the morning. I
11 was in the school recently where they, in my opinion,
12 were starting lunch too early and half of the
13 lunchroom was empty because they had several schools
14 in the building and I said why can't you have lunch,
15 all ninth graders at the same time no matter what
16 school they are from. So I think lunch has a lot of
17 other issues that we can be talking about to -- are
18 cafeterias attractive places? That was in a school
19 recently where I gave the principal an idea and she
20 talk to my custodian, I talked to the custodian and
21 so we'll have it done by next week. So this is a lot
22 of issues but I am happy to further this discussion.

24 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Yeah, am
25 I agree. I think creating a more comfortable space

1
2 for young people to want to eat. Some buildings will
3 have that luxury. Buildings like PS19 may be in the
4 future with a new wing but right now it is already a
5 challenge of running programs in the cafeteria so
6 there is a lot -- our cafeterias are becoming more
7 about swing space in many cases.

8 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Right. What we call
9 [cross talk]

10 CHANCELLOR FARINA: -- lunch where you
11 have half eating and the other half class. Lunch as
12 a principal was always one of my how do we do this
13 better so I do think sitting down and having this
14 discussion is worth it.

15 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And I
16 think there is something to be said and this is way
17 down the road but there is probably also cultural
18 sensitivity and giving people options of different
19 foods. We work really hard at making sure that our
20 seniors have the proper lunch when they go to the
21 senior center, clearly a much smaller population but
22 as we think about diverse ways of being able to
23 support our young people I think if we give them more
24 options we can see more engagement with --

1
2 CHANCELLOR FARINA: This is actually
3 something that is already on our radar so I am happy
4 to discuss that with you.

5 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND:

6 Excellent. Thank you very much. I just wanted to
7 follow-up on Council Member Barron's point with the
8 water testing. Obviously, this is something very
9 important to all of us for many reasons. Can you --
10 given the uncertainty, how did you reach the
11 conclusion that the fixtures were solely to blame in
12 some of these instances where you were testing where
13 the lead was high in water and that is kind of the
14 response we got that it was the fixtures as opposed
15 to piping or, you know, kind of what -- how did you
16 come to that conclusions?

17 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I think that the
18 experts told us that's the reason for it. I can't
19 reiterate enough though that our water is really
20 safe. Every school has on their website what the
21 latest results were and I am actually going to be
22 given specifics and any of you who want it
23 specifically by your district I am happy to pull it
24 out that way and give it to you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And do
3 you believe that just mitigating the fixtures will be
4 --

5 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I truly believe that,
6 yes.

7 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And by
8 when will you be done with all the fixtures?

9 [off mic talk]

10 CHANCELLOR FARINA: We completed all the
11 testing so as of right now whatever the number is
12 that you have that is the number that it is. Again,
13 Deputy Chancellor Rose will have all the specific
14 numbers when she comes after me.

15 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Right.
16 Okay. Very good. Chair Dromm?

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you, Chair
18 Ferreras. I'd just like to go back for a minute
19 again to the Title Two A grant, teacher development.
20 I understood that Title Two A grant according to a
21 memo that Mr. Orlando sent out last year was
22 basically for class size reduction. Can you explain
23 to me why it is being used the way in which you
24 described it?

1
2 RAYMOND ORLANDO: Sure. Class size
3 reduction is one of the major goals of Title Two A
4 hence the allocation memo. The funds are available
5 to be spent on hiring teachers, training teachers.
6 There are some broad rules around Title Two A. The
7 memo, class size reduction means this is a big basket
8 of things that schools can spend this money on.

9 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Plus the majority
10 goes to that.

11 RAYMOND ORLANDO: Yeah, 97 percent of the
12 money I think when we looked went to class size
13 reduction activities which includes both the hiring
14 of teachers and the PD.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So how many teachers
16 would be needed then in order to reduce class size to
17 level specified in the contracts for excellence?

18 CHANCELLOR FARINA: We'd have to give you
19 that number but the reality also that these kids
20 still involve is the space there and in many cases it
21 is about having two teachers in a classroom or having
22 an additional para. It is more complicated than that
23 but we can certainly discuss that at the next
24 committee meeting.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: SO if we were to hire
3 the teachers that we feel might be needed, do you
4 have type of estimate of what the cost would be for
5 that?

6 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Not at this time.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Let me go to another
8 area of questioning then at this point. So one of
9 the programs that the council has funded is the
10 positive learning collaborative and we've done that
11 with the United Federation of Teachers. Have you had
12 an opportunity to visit any of those schools with the
13 positive learning collaborative model in them? It is
14 a restorative practices model.

15 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I was in one the
16 other day. We have many restorative practice
17 programs. We have overcoming obstacles, we have TBIS
18 (?) so they are all working in terms of lessening
19 suspensions, getting teachers more engaged in working
20 with their students but in terms of one program over
21 the other having better success, we really haven't
22 seen it. It is more about teacher training and
23 having teachers, as Tim Shriver says, look at every
24 child in the classroom as individual so I know that
25 Carmen mentioned to me on Saturday as well but I

1
2 think there is a lot of different programs. We are
3 working with Morningside Heights on some of these
4 issues also so.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: SO one of the things
6 I think is true about the PLC model is that mostly
7 they are in elementary schools whereas the other
8 restorative money that we put in was for the upper
9 grades. Would I be correct in stating that?

10 CHANCELLOR FARINA: No. I think the
11 restorative justice is actually being used equally
12 across the board. I think --

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: In elementary as
14 well?

15 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Yes, because I think
16 the major goal particularly with -- is getting the
17 students to talk about their own opinions and really
18 feel voiced. I think with more of an older group is
19 the Overcoming Obstacle Program that is particularly
20 geared to middle school and high schools but I think
21 also we tend to have a different kind of teacher
22 training in the elementary schools to begin with so
23 it is a combination but I would say all the schools
24 that are in part of this are also requires that
25 principals be heavily invested and that they are

1
2 willing to change some of the culture in their
3 individual schools.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: One of the reasons I
5 brought it up is because I feel that it is
6 particularly important in the elementary schools that
7 we instill those processes by which we can work out
8 the problems before we, you know, go to the classroom
9 and I think that we can do that at a younger age. It
10 is neither more effective if we wait till later on.
11 Enough on that. I want to go to another question on
12 the Early Learn 3K for all. So will there be any
13 additional capacity in the new Early Learn RFP when
14 that comes out for additional students?

15 RAYMOND ORLANDO: That remains to be
16 seen. That is why the money is in '19 for the Early
17 Learn piece. There is a lot of work to be done
18 between now and then,

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Do we know when that
20 RFP will come out?

21 RAYMOND ORLANDO: We do not at this time.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: But obviously within
23 enough time to --

24 RAYMOND ORLANDO: There will certainly be
25 enough time. We are very focused on how best to

1
2 accomplish this. Again meeting all of our sort of
3 new contract policies and procedures we agreed to
4 recently with you all.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Also on that same
6 issue, will it cost any more when we shifted from ACS
7 to DOE will there be additional charges?

8 CHANCELLOR FARINA: No.

9 RAYMOND ORLANDO: I, I --

10 CHANCELLOR FARINA: At this moment we
11 don't anticipate that but we will let you know. I
12 mean the most important thing is that we, we stay
13 focused on the educational component of this and that
14 is something that we are very committed to.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: One of the concerns
16 that has been brought to my attention is the pat
17 equity issue and I would just anticipate that was
18 going to be a higher cost and we are working with the
19 provider community as well as the Office of Labor
20 Relations with the city and ACS around those issues.

21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And I believe and in
22 most cases where you have Early Learn, there are
23 certified teachers who work with an assistant teacher
24 and perhaps an aid in the classroom as well. A
25

1
2 little bit different model than the DOE's model with
3 UPK but nevertheless they are certified teachers?

4 RAYMOND ORLANDO: Yeah. The expectation
5 is that the funding moves along from ACS to us to
6 support the program as envisioned.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much.
8 Thank you, Chair.

9 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
10 you, Chair. We will now hear from Council Member
11 Treyger followed by Council Member Barron and we have
12 been joined Council Member Miller.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you again
14 and Chancellor I wanted to appreciate your pointing
15 out with regards to in the first round of questioning
16 the over the counter student that includes new
17 Americans, immigrant students that come in and
18 certainly areas I represent we welcome and see a
19 great influx of families from other countries and
20 also -- it also includes a practice that I have been
21 very critical of in the past and I hear stories how
22 they continue where certain schools, particular, some
23 not all charter schools, will wait until the October
24 attendance register month is over and then somehow
25 the students get off their register and end up in a

1
2 district public school and the funding does not
3 follow the student and Chancellor, I keep hearing
4 this again and again and again and I just wonder has
5 there been any discussions with school leaders in
6 these particular schools where you see an -- or an
7 examination of this practice and to speak to them
8 directly and say why is it that miraculously or
9 magically students disappear off the register
10 November 1st.

11 CHANCELLOR FARINA: First and foremost,
12 we now have a head of charter schools, Melissa
13 Harris, who now has an actual team that is actually
14 monitoring all this but I have said over and over
15 again to principals, you have to keep a list and then
16 when this has become either rumor or hearsay doesn't
17 help me when if -- I hear a lot about this. I had a
18 principal said to me recently, I said how many kids
19 in your school, oh not in my school I heard it's
20 someone else's school so I have been telling
21 principals when you get students who you know have
22 come from any of these schools keep a list and let us
23 know immediately. There was someone at Melissa
24 Harris' office who actually is keeping these lists so
25 I am happy to follow-up on any of these cases. We

1
2 have also heard rumors that there is more of this
3 just before testing like in January so again letting
4 us know we follow-up immediately but I will say that
5 our relationship with most of the charter schools is
6 actually improving in many different ways. One of
7 the things that we have asked co-located sites is to
8 do more sharing in a building. I will give you
9 another example uncommon charter schools is moving
10 into two of our high school spaces and we have asked
11 them, South Shore being one and ?? King Lane being
12 another, we have asked them to put some money into
13 the pot for the campus as a whole and whatever the
14 other schools want to do they are going to do
15 together. Many of the schools have asked us for more
16 help in working with English language learners so
17 they can take more of their share. We are trying to
18 really work together in as many places as possible.
19 I went to a charter school last week actually where
20 the principal is opening a second school, the
21 Hellenic charter in Brooklyn and to me there are,
22 like public schools, there are people who play to
23 work together and then there are those we have to
24 work with a little bit more seriously in other ways

25

1
2 so I do think this is -- call me, let me know and I
3 think that is the way to go.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I will and just
5 the last question in the matter of time is has there
6 ever been an examination by the DOE with regards to
7 equity across schools with regards to student clubs
8 and activities where certain schools in wealthier
9 neighborhoods have the capacity to raise funds from
10 outside the school budget to provide students for
11 more opportunities like debate teams, chess clubs,
12 other type clubs and activities which really do make
13 a difference in school versus schools in areas that
14 are not very wealthy where they lack that capacity
15 because even air-conditioning issue, we saw PTAs in
16 certain school communities raise private money and
17 get air-conditioners for those schools and schools in
18 my neck of the woods we didn't have that capacity so
19 there has never been an examination of how do we
20 level the playing fields for all schools to provide
21 kids with maximum activity opportunity.

22 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I think in terms of
23 clubs and electives, we have not put together a group
24 of schools that are doing this particularly well. I
25 think if you are a Title One school sometimes it

1
2 balances what parents are raising but particularly in
3 most of our renewal middle schools they have
4 something called MS2I which actually you guys have
5 helped fund has been remarkable, has been I think one
6 of the features of success in most of our middle
7 schools and they as part of their program do debating
8 and we now have in many more of our middle schools
9 debate clubs that we never had before and they tend
10 to be mostly Title One schools. I think in terms of
11 chess and other clubs we just put on our showcase
12 schools 217 in Brooklyn who does one of the best
13 electives I have ever seen in the Title One with over
14 a thousand kids but it is again about programming.
15 How do you -- we are doing training for teachers, how
16 do you take Friday afternoons for example and program
17 your whole school into clubs. It doesn't mean you
18 have to bring in an expert and pay them a lot of
19 money but how do you look at programming as an
20 ability to do this. So I do think there is a lot
21 more work we can do in this. We have actually
22 started putting more schools in our showcase and
23 learning partners and are doing a good job so other
24 principals can go and see how they can do it as well.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you
3 Council Member. Council Member Barron followed by
4 Council Member Rosenthal followed by Council Member
5 Miller.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Madam
7 Chair and Mr. Co-Chair. A few quick questions. In
8 terms of the contract portion of the budget, what
9 amount of money is designated for consultants?

10 RAYMONF ORLANDO: The vast majority of
11 the contract budget is for things like pupil
12 transportation and --

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes.

14 RAYMOND ORLANDO: -- payments that go to
15 [inaudible 02:37:04] and others. I don't believe I
16 brought with me --

17 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Let me just explain
18 what may or may not be a consultant. Many of our
19 schools are working with outside agencies that
20 provide professional staff development that provide
21 in-house training to teachers. They can be listed as
22 consultants but they are not a one person that comes
23 and gives us -- so for example, we have Pam Allen who
24 is working with Lit-something in some of our
25 districts. She is listed as a consultant but it is

1
2 her whole program that she brings into a school to
3 work with teachers.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right.

5 CHANCELLOR FARINA: But if you have
6 specific consultants that you have heard of I am
7 happy to review that but the majority --

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: But we don't have
9 a dollar amount in the budget for consultants?

10 CHANCELLOR FARINA: We can get --

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. I
12 would like that.

13 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I think defining the
14 word consultants is important.

15 COUNCIL MEMEBR BARRON: Yes, I am aware
16 of that. Thank you. Secondly, for students who are
17 living in temporary shelters I believe it is 10.3
18 million in the budget and I think it is just for one
19 year so are there plans to continue that amount of
20 money and is there any consideration of waiting the
21 formula, the fair student formula, to account for
22 those schools that have a high population of students
23 living in shelter. I have a friend who was a
24 principal at a school in District 23, a large number
25 of her students came from the housing that was

1
2 temporary shelter. Two of them in temporary shelter
3 but she got no consideration other than I think it is
4 the \$100 in the McKinney Vento allocation from the
5 feds and she only got that \$100 which was already in
6 her allocation, not an additional money, to be
7 designated for use with those students.

8 RAYMOND ORLANDO: Hi. We have been
9 working on collecting data on students in temporary
10 housing and although we are not planning in the
11 upcoming school year to add a wait for students in
12 temporary housing we are hoping to get better and
13 more data over the next year and we will consider it
14 again when we in the fall when we start developing
15 the waits for the next school that begins next year
16 but we have had trouble collecting the data frankly.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And the DOE is
18 going to be a part of the RFP that is going to be
19 released for the 3K program? My concerns are that we
20 need to make sure that those organizations that have
21 long-standing credibility of being effective in the
22 community are not displaced for those other
23 organizations that can hire grant writers and make an
24 impressive presentation so that is a concern because
25 that has been a policy or a result of the RFP policy

1
2 for the city and lastly I am looking forward to the
3 relocation of the East New York Family Academy as a
4 whole for the next year and for the construction of
5 the brand new East New York Family High School in its
6 entirety, not in sections so I am looking forward to
7 that and I appreciate the work that was done to find
8 the location that could keep them as a whole during
9 this interim time.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Just before we go to
11 the next council member if I may do a follow-up with
12 the 10.3 million. How is that allocated, the costs?
13 My understanding is that not every school that has
14 had an influx of homeless students is receiving those
15 dollars and I am concerned about that and I will tell
16 you selfish, I have School 102 which is next to the
17 Pan-Am Shelter that I don't believe got any funding
18 and it has over 100 students that just came into his
19 school and he's not getting that additional support.

20 RAYMOND ORLANDO: As the initiative
21 develops, it changes as we learn more. Attendance
22 improvement is one of the major goals of the work as
23 well. The population itself as you know is -- moves
24 itself but we try and keep up but I can get you more
25

1
2 information. I didn't bring a whole lot of
3 information about that but the problem persists.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So we have Pan-Am
5 Shelter, 800 new residents mostly all -- it's all
6 families that moved in. One hundred or more students
7 at 102 so I really urge you to look at PS102. Thank
8 you.

9 CHANCELLOR FARINA: You should also know
10 that we started literacy centers off-site and we
11 particularly successful during vacation times where
12 these students come all day and I was just in one
13 Sheltering Arms in Bushwick, and we have more of
14 those throughout the city so not all the work with
15 these students is school specific but it is being
16 done in centers themselves with their families in
17 attendance.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you so
19 much, Chairs. Chancellor, I want to follow-up on
20 Council Member Levine's questions about dual
21 language. How much is in the budget -- how much was
22 in the budget for dual language at adoption last
23 year? How much is in the budget now for dual
24 language?

1
2 CHANCELLOR FARINA: We can get you
3 specifics but our hope was to increase dual language
4 to at least a hundred schools over the next two years
5 so that has been our goal. The problem here continues
6 to be finding the teachers because our goal is to
7 continue the dual language through high school. I
8 can get that --

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I hear you. I
10 hear you. I heard that. I get it. When a publisher
11 sends you a letter saying how can we help, do you ask
12 them to provide the books?

13 CHANCELLOR FARINA: We ask them to
14 produce the right kind of books because I think that
15 is an issue. We also --

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I head you say
17 that too and I heard you say that the embassies with
18 all good intentions wouldn't necessarily be doing
19 what you'd like to see in terms of curricula so when
20 -- what I am trying to get at is it is my
21 understanding that there are books out there that are
22 -- would be appropriate, maybe not in every language
23 but certainly for French dual language for example or
24 Mandarin for example. I mean these are all languages
25 that are taught in other school settings where they

1
2 have great books on this. Why not ask the publishes,
3 if you are tight for money, ask them to supply the
4 books or why not add whatever it takes to the budget
5 for the books? There is a school in my district, the
6 middle school dual language French school that has
7 been having to raise, you know, public school -- the
8 parents have been having to raise, you know, private
9 -- the parents have been having to give the money for
10 the books. I don't understand why the principal
11 would have to -- if it is a dual language school
12 would have to come up with funds to pay for the books
13 that they are not getting and therefore have to cut
14 something else.

15 CHANCELLOR FARINA: All schools receive a
16 book budget that it depends on how the principals
17 chose to spend it and you get your book budget
18 according to the number of students.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Sure but this
20 would be a doubling because now you need the book
21 budget to cover two languages.

22 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I hear that but I do
23 think that one of the things we have put in place we
24 have two annual conferences now that we ask foreign
25 book publishers to help sponsor and present their

1
2 books at those conferences. I may need to do a
3 better job of making that more public and I will look
4 into the resource money but I do know that one time
5 we actually gave libraries to schools. It us about
6 how they use it and maybe as they go up a grade they
7 are not as available. I will check into that.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I appreciate
9 your checking into it. Sounds like there are two
10 hiccups. One hiccup is making sure the principals
11 know that this conference exists but the bigger
12 hiccup is you can't say, you can't say, you know,
13 that they get a book budget when they need a book
14 budget that is twice as big if it is a dual language
15 program. I think that is, you know, I think that is
16 misleading. Thank you so much.

17 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPLEAND: Thank you
18 Council Member. We will hear from Council Member
19 Miller.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you Madam
21 Chair. Mr. Chair over there. Good afternoon
22 Chancellor. I have a few questions and I am sure you
23 have heard most of them already but I want to talk
24 about the CTE's and how do you determine the
25 locations of these schools and let me be forthright

1
2 that I have been having conversations with people
3 within the DOE for a number of years now and they
4 have not yet come to fruition and we would love to
5 see one in the district if we could -- if there could
6 be any assistance in that, we have spoken with some
7 of the experts in the areas and my background and
8 labor and those folks who are willing to give up
9 their talent as well as some of the UFT and CSA folks
10 but we have yet to really have substantive
11 conversation that can make this thing come to
12 fruition.

13 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I will first of all,
14 we have someone who is in charge of our CT programs,
15 John Woodland, and that is the first person to speak
16 to but the other thing is we are increasing our CT
17 programs by 40. The new approach to CTE is also to
18 try to think five, ten years down the line. What are
19 the jobs that are actually going to be paying living
20 wages because a lot of our CT programs from the past
21 are no longer producing professions that are really
22 going to be part of the future so I think that was
23 one of our first challenges. The other thing is CTE
24 programs have to be in places where there are going
25 to be enough kids who want it so we are putting CT

1
2 programs first and foremost in our co-located campus,
3 Springfield Gardens is one. We are looking at Beach
4 Channel for another where the kids across the campus
5 can chose to have a program instead of opening more
6 CTE schools, having programs within existing schools
7 makes sense. What has been clear to us is that the
8 two growing fields is anything in the health careers,
9 geriatric care and also anything that has to do with
10 computer technology, fixing them as well as
11 developing their own programs. So we have embraced
12 the community as a whole for more mentors but if
13 there is a specific school that you think -- we have
14 asked principals that want to do more CT to let us
15 know, our handicap was but now I think has been
16 solved was that we didn't have the certified
17 teachers. If you are going to do a pharmacy program,
18 you need a registered pharmacist to have and that has
19 been a problem. I understand because this is also
20 one of the Chancellor and Betty Rose the Chancellor
21 and Commissioner Elliot initiative so we think as of
22 last week some of these Albany -- you know Albany had
23 to make some of these changes happen but is there a
24 specific school that you are interested in?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Campus Magnet.

1
2 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Okay. I will look at
3 that.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Not far from
5 Springfield Campus but they are two separate
6 districts and serve a different constituency.

7 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I actually think I
8 spoke to your counterpart in Albany about this.
9 Okay.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So we have that.
11 So then school choice broadly defined as school
12 choice but we have -- I have written some letters
13 some years past about specifically not specialized
14 high schools but specialized without the exam,
15 Townsend Harris High School. Three years running I
16 have had several of our top graduating middle school
17 students apply for the school and some of these young
18 people had extraordinary PTAs and were not accepted
19 into the school and had written a letter to the
20 principal and got a very vague response about what
21 their criteria was considering the, the
22 disproportionate amount of African American in that
23 school specifically and it certainly was something of
24 concern and also considering we are sending them the
25 cream of the crop and they weren't really being

1
2 considered. Do you have a respond to that? How do
3 we get that number considering the borough of Queens
4 in the city, how do we stay at six percent, why as
5 educators?

6 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I think our
7 enrollment office is going to be more closely
8 monitoring those enrollment processes for high
9 schools to be continued.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So was that a
11 decision that was made in the school by the school
12 specifically?

13 CHANCELLOR FARINA: in the past, the
14 answer is yes. In the future we are reconsidering
15 how some enrollment is done on the high school
16 levels.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I don't know
18 exactly how to take it but I will roll with it over
19 if we have any problems --

20 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I think it is very
21 good that you brought it up.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I know there was
23 some conversations about the make teachers, about the
24 black male teacher initiatives that were going on and
25 I know that we have also sent about four or five of

1
2 our local mentees to the program and they were not
3 accepted into the program but we will keep sending
4 them. Again, what is -- yes, we have and sat down
5 with the director as well and made sure that the
6 young men were meeting the criteria considering the
7 importance of having these young men in the schools.
8 Is there anything we can do to assist, is there
9 something that we are doing that we are missing to
10 ensure that we are sending you qualified folks and
11 that they are part -- have an opportunity to really
12 be a part of the DOE?

13 CHANCELLOR FARINA: I will be happy to
14 send you the criteria as it is now written and then
15 discuss whatever the gap is between what the student
16 said and us.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay. Thank you
18 so much.

19 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND:
20 Chancellor, we wanted to do some follow-up on the
21 community schools sustainability and I know that you
22 kind of gave us -- we just need a little bit more
23 detail, the information before we start negotiations
24 on exactly what the budget is, the spending, where
25 are we with these 25 community schools?

1
2 CHANCELLOR FARINA: We can get that for
3 you but the most important thing with the community
4 schools once again is that embedded during the school
5 day, extra support for parents and also a variety of
6 after school programs that are not daycare kind of
7 programs so that they all have to have an academic
8 component, they have to have a counseling component
9 wherever possible some form of the arts. It depends
10 on the school and also the selections process is done
11 by the principal in conjunction in many cases with
12 the SLT to meet the needs of the school but
13 specifically in terms of the different components we
14 are happy to get more information.

15 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And I am
16 sorry, I just wanted to kind of -- it was really
17 about the ones that have potential of losing funding
18 because we know that 12 of them --

19 CHANCELLOR FARINA: Ray will send you
20 that information.

21 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay.

22 CHANCELLOR FARINA: By the way, I invite
23 any of you who want to join me on a visit to
24 community schools to see how it is different now than
25

1
2 what it used to be because they really are in a very
3 different place.

4 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Great.

5 As I said earlier, both committees are going to be --
6 have additional questions but we want to get started
7 with SCA also which is the other part of this. Thank
8 you. I started here at ten and we are getting you at
9 one so it wasn't too bad.

10 CHANCELLOR FARINA: it's always a
11 pleasure.

12 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you
13 so much. That concludes the first part of today's
14 budget hearings. I want to thank Chancellor Farina
15 for testifying. As a reminder the public will be
16 invited to testify here on Thursday, May 25th, the
17 last day of budget hearings at approximately one p.m.
18 in this room. We will now take a ten minute break so
19 we can get some lunch. We will be right back with
20 the School Construction Authority.

21 [pause]

22 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: This will
23 now conclude the eighth day of budget hearings with
24 School Construction Authority President and CEO
25 Loraine Grillo and DOE Deputy Chancellor Elizabeth

1
2 Rose. The Finance Committee is then joined by Chair
3 Dromm and the Education Committee. In the interest
4 of time, I will forgo an opening statement and turn
5 it over to my co-chair, Chair Dromm for his opening
6 remarks.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: In the interest of
8 time, I will turn it back over to you and forgo my
9 opening statement as well and ask the council to
10 swear in the witness.

11 [OATH ADMINISTERED]

12 ELIZABETH ROSE: Good afternoon, Chairs
13 Ferreras-Copeland and Dromm and members of the
14 Finance and education Committees here today. My name
15 is Elizabeth Rose, Deputy Chancellor for the Division
16 of Operations at the New York City Department of
17 Education. I am joined by Loraine Grillo, President
18 and CEO of the New York City School Construction
19 Authority. We are pleased to be here today to
20 discuss the proposed February 2017 amendment to the
21 Fiscal 2015-2019 five year capital plan. Since the
22 last time we appeared before you, we have opened 29
23 sites creating almost 5700 new seats for our students
24 and we are on track to open 25 locations next
25 September for an increase of over 8300 seats in the

1
2 2017-2018 school year including new Pre-K sites. We
3 are grateful to the City Council for strong support
4 and generous funding to our schools. The proposed
5 amendment will allow us to site and create new
6 capacity in districts with persistent or projected
7 overcrowding and also continues to fund key
8 administration priorities to create additional high
9 quality full day pre-kindergarten seats, remove all
10 transportable classroom units from the system, and
11 reduce class sizes. Additionally, the plan targets
12 much need improvements for our aging infrastructure.
13 The proposed 15.5 billion capital plan contains over
14 600 million in new funding from the spring 2016
15 adopted amendment. Main program increases include
16 funding for additional pre-k for all seats, Hurricane
17 Sandy reimbursements, city council borough president
18 funding, replacement accessibility and school based
19 health center funding. As you are aware, we testified
20 before the education committee regarding the capital
21 plan in March. While there are no changes from the
22 proposed plan we presented, I welcome the opportunity
23 to revisit that testimony particularly since members
24 of the Finance Committee did not participate in that
25 hearing. The proposed fiscal 2015-2019 capital plan

1
2 amendment is funded by state and city tax levy and
3 783 million in proceeds from the New York State Smart
4 School Bond Act. The DOE's proposed allocation of
5 Smart School Bond Act proceeds known as the Smart
6 School Investment Plan, allocates funds to
7 technology, pre-k for all capacity and removal of
8 TCUs and is available on the DOE's website. The SSIT
9 was submitted to the state for approval. We look
10 forward to hearing back from the Smart School Bond
11 Act review board. As you are aware, we developed an
12 annual amendment process beginning with fiscal 2005-
13 2009 plan. Regularly reviewing out capital plan
14 allows us to identify emerging needs quickly and
15 gives us the opportunity to make changes as
16 necessary. To Track changing needs we conduct an
17 annual building condition assessment survey in which
18 we send architects and engineers to evaluate our
19 approximately 1400 buildings. This survey generates
20 our needs for capital investment projects and
21 maintain our buildings in good repair. We also
22 annually update enrollment projections. These
23 projections incorporate data on birthrates and
24 immigration rates and migration rates from various
25 city agencies. Additional agencies provide

1
2 statistics on housing starts and rezoning efforts
3 using a broad range of sources provides a complete
4 view of potential student demand and annual updates
5 allow us to make timely adjustments when there is a
6 sustained increase in student population in one part
7 of the city or a decline in student population in
8 another. These enrollment projections which are
9 performed on a district and sub district level help
10 inform our needs for new capacity projects. In
11 addition to evaluating our school buildings and
12 student population public feedback plays a crucial
13 role in our capital planning process. Each year we
14 undertake a public review process with community
15 education council, the city council and other elected
16 officials and community groups. We offer ever CEC in
17 the city the opportunity to conduct a public hearing
18 on the plan and we partner with individual council
19 members and CECs to identify local needs. Your
20 insight in this process are essential and we look
21 forward to our continued partnership. The proposed
22 2017 amendment includes \$5.9 billion for capacity, 6
23 billion for capital investment and 3.6 billion for
24 mandated programs. The proposed fiscal 2015-2019 plan
25 amendment creates over 44,000 seats that will address

1 overcrowding as well as two administration
2 priorities: pre-K for all expansion and a class size
3 reduction initiative. Of the 5.9 billion allocated
4 to capacity, 4.5 billion is dedicated to creating
5 more than 44,000 new seats through an estimated 84
6 projects within school districts experiencing the
7 most critical existing and projected overcrowding.
8 Seventeen projects have been identified since the
9 last adopted amendment including a middle school at
10 48th Street in District 30, the Francis Lewis High
11 School Annex and an elementary school at Targee
12 Street in District 31. The proposed 2017 amendment
13 continues to identify a seat need of approximately
14 83,000 seats which is partially attributable to the
15 recommendations of our community partners on the blue
16 book working group who voice long-standing concerns
17 regarding the way school space is used and how
18 capacity is measured and reflected. The amendment
19 also includes \$800 million for pre-k for all seats,
20 an increase of approximately 130 million from the
21 2016 adopted budget which will create more than 8300
22 new seats across the city. In addition, 142 million
23 have been allocated to replace facilities where
24 leases expired during the plan. Finally, 490 million
25

1 is allocated in our class size reduction program to
2 build additions or new buildings that would
3 significantly benefit from additional capacity. This
4 program recognizes the need for targeted investments
5 in areas of the city that may be geographically
6 isolated and have unfunded seat need. Schools in
7 these areas may also have a high rate of utilization
8 and TCUs. Under this program, three projects are
9 currently under design, one each in District 11 in
10 the Bronx, District 19 in Brooklyn and District 29 in
11 Queens. Capital investment. Over 60 percent of the
12 6 billion capital investment allocation which
13 includes Resolution A projects will address the
14 buildings identified in our annual building survey as
15 most in need of repair such as roof and structural
16 repair, safeguarding our buildings against water
17 infiltration and other facility projects. The capital
18 investment category also includes funding for
19 upgrades to fire alarms, public address systems and
20 remove of TCUs. More specifically, 405 million has
21 been allocated to remove TCUs and redevelop the yard
22 space where the TCUs had been located. To date, we
23 have removed a 110 TCUs and have developed plans to
24 remove 108 more leaving a remaining balance of 137
25

1 TCUs not yet slated for removal. It is important to
2 note that the removal schedule is contingent upon
3 capacity constraints within the area and the input of
4 local school communities. The remaining nearly 40
5 percent or 1.5 billion will go towards school
6 enhancement projects. The two main programs in this
7 category are facility enhancements and technology.
8 The proposed 2017 amendment includes approximately
9 875 million for facility enhancements. Some of the
10 highlights of the program include electrical upgrades
11 to facilitate installation of air-conditioners,
12 bathroom upgrades, accessibility projects, upgrades
13 to instructional spaces in existing buildings such as
14 the restructuring of classrooms, creation of health
15 centers in our renewal schools, safety and security
16 upgrades and a program to renovate existing school
17 cafeterias to better align our existing facilities
18 with school food's mission of promoting healthy and
19 attractive food choices to our students. As a part
20 of a broader commitment to support students in
21 temporary housing, nearly 20 million in capital is
22 committed to build health centers at the schools with
23 the highest concentration of homelessness. In order
24 for our students to become college and career ready
25

1
2 in a digital and information age, we will make
3 certain that technology upgrades remain a priority in
4 the proposed amended plan. We are committed to
5 bridging any existing gap in technology in our
6 schools in order to implement the administration's
7 instructional priorities of computer science for all
8 as well as other programs including the software
9 engineering pilot program and advanced placement
10 computer science courses. Specifically, over 75
11 percent of the 654 million of the technology spending
12 under this plan will build on our school buildings
13 for technology infrastructure. This funding allows
14 us to continue to transform our school environments
15 from industrial age to information age schools where
16 learning can be customized to each child's unique
17 needs. Over the course of the plan, essential
18 upgrades and incorporation of next generation
19 broadband, wireless and learning technologies are
20 plans for all school buildings. As part of the
21 technology program, approximately 145 million will be
22 invested in upgrading legacy systems such as student
23 information systems, improving enterprise level
24 learning platforms, developing new data systems and
25 upgrading business operation systems in support of

1 school needs. Lastly, we are committing
2 approximately 29 million in expense funding over the
3 next five years to provide air-conditioning in every
4 classroom that is currently without one. Beginning
5 in fiscal year 2018 with 2000 classrooms, each
6 subsequent year will see at least an additional 2,200
7 classrooms receive an air-conditioner. We know this
8 is an initiative that is very important to many of
9 you. The proposed plan supports the initiative by
10 allocating 50 million for electrical upgrades in some
11 buildings that require additional electrical capacity
12 to facilitate the installation of air-conditioners.
13 Work is already underway to access some of our
14 buildings for electrical upgrades. Mandated
15 programs. The total cost to support the city's
16 effort to remove and replace all polychlorinated
17 biphenyls or PCB containing lighting fixtures
18 throughout the entire school system was \$1 billion,
19 about half of which was covered by the previous five
20 year capital plan. The proposed 2017 allocated
21 amendment allocates 480 million to replace all
22 remaining lighting fixtures in our schools and I am
23 particularly pleased to say that this long term
24 project was completed in December 2016, five years
25

1 ahead of the original schedule. We are grateful to
2 the council for its support in this effort. The
3 mandated program category also includes approximately
4 \$750 million for boiler conversions in approximately
5 110 buildings currently using Number 4 oil. The
6 remaining funds are assigned to cover other required
7 cost, including insurance and completion of projects
8 from the prior plan. We understand that the public
9 school system as a whole continues to experience
10 pockets of overcrowding and we are working to address
11 these concerns through new school construction. We
12 remain focused on remedying these issues and will
13 continue to rely on your feedback and support as we
14 do so. Our annual capital planning process has
15 already benefited significantly from your input and
16 our students have benefited from your generous
17 support of capital projects. With continued
18 collaboration and tens of thousands of seats slated
19 to come on-line over the next five to seven years, we
20 remain confident that the expansion and enhancement
21 of school buildings across the five boroughs will
22 improve the educational experiences for the city's
23 1.1 million school children as well as the teachers
24 and staff who serve them. Thank you again for
25

1
2 allowing us to testify today and we would be happy to
3 answer any questions you may have.

4 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you
5 very much. So we are going to jump right into some
6 questions. Actually, I wanted to follow-up, we had
7 asked Chancellor Farina about the lead in schools and
8 the numbers that were reported and she expressed
9 confidence that it is more so in the actual faucet as
10 opposed to the pipes. Is that something that you
11 remain confident in one and also have all the faucets
12 been replaced or what is the timeline for the
13 replacement of this equipment?

14 ELIZABETH ROSE: So yes. We are
15 confident that the actions we are taking to remediate
16 the fixtures are effective and we know this from
17 evidence. We know that when we replace fixtures that
18 had tested above guidance and retest those same
19 fixtures using the exact same protocol, we are able
20 to get test results that are below guidance showing
21 that we have addressed the issues. We also know that
22 when you test water, we are testing water that has
23 been stagnant in those, in those, in those fixtures
24 and those pipes for at least eight hours and in many
25 cases longer than eight hours. We are taking that

1 first draw sample. We know that after you take that
2 first draw sample, if you let the water run even
3 briefly and take another sample that that second
4 sample tests below the levels of the first draw. So
5 again, that water would have been in the pipes
6 further down the line so we know that it really is
7 from being stagnant for long periods of time that is
8 contributing to the levels we were seeing. We are in
9 the remediation process now. Remediation will
10 continue, will likely continue into the next school
11 year but we know that systemically we have water that
12 is safe to drink and that even if there are some
13 outlets that are out of service until we remediate
14 that there are plenty of outlets in each school that
15 can provide drinking water for our students and
16 staff.

18 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So I
19 guess can you walk me through the priority? You said
20 you were going through this remediation plan. What
21 schools get it first? Is this the ones that had
22 higher lead or, you know, what is the process?

23 ELIZABETH ROSE: So there are a couple
24 different considerations. We do this -- we have
25 teams that are working this on a borough by borough

1
2 basis so within their borough. We are looking at
3 elementary schools and schools that had a higher
4 proportion of their fixtures with high elevations are
5 the buildings that we are addressing first.

6 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And you
7 said this -- you will be -- this remediation will
8 probably last until next fiscal --next year?

9 ELIZABETH ROSE: It will be ongoing over
10 the summer and probably into the new school year.

11 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay. As
12 you can imagine this is something that is a bit
13 alarming to us. It is hard to explain to parents,
14 you know, the first draw that the kids run the water
15 is all very confusing. People hear lead, especially
16 after what happened in Flint, and I think it is an
17 opportunity to also be clear this is not the same
18 thing.

19 ELIZABETH ROSE: It is not the same thing
20 and thank you for saying so and

21 [cross talk]

22 ELIZABETH ROSE: So there are two key
23 differences. The first is the quality of our water
24 source. The New York City water source is among the
25 cleanest best water in the world. Our Department of

1
2 Environmental Protection runs over 500,000 tests of
3 water quality against our water source every year.

4 So we know our water source is good. That is not the
5 case in Flint where their water was very corrosive.

6 The second is that we treat our water, and here I say
7 we, the city, Department of Environmental Protection,
8 treats our water with a food grade additive called
9 orthophosphate and orthophosphate coats the interiors
10 of pipes to help prevent any metals from leeching
11 from pipes or solder into that water. And again, in
12 Flint, there was no treatment of the water so you had
13 corrosive water running through older pipes which in
14 fact accelerated the leeching of metals into the
15 water rather than preventing the leeching of metals
16 in the water. So two very important differences.

17 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So and I
18 guess this goes directly to President Grillo, we have
19 praised you on several occasions on actually
20 expediting building, the actual construction.

21 Members have been incredibly frustrated with other
22 agencies, we are not going to point fingers, we are
23 you're not, I know, but it is incredibly frustrating
24 that many of our projects often times even costing
25 less than what it would cost to build the school

1 don't necessarily get done in an expeditious manner
2 and in a recent briefing with the Mayor, we kind of
3 brought this up and you were once again highlighted
4 as one of the best practices. Why do you think it is
5 -- what are the challenges that maybe you don't have
6 to face as compared to other agencies because we are
7 trying to find the best practices as we move forward
8 to actually getting our capital projects done in a
9 timely manner?
10

11 LORAIN GRILLO: Absolutely and I do
12 appreciate that because the other agencies do face
13 some restrictions that we do not as an authority.
14 For example, we are exempt from the Wick's Law so
15 that when we design a project we don't have to put it
16 into separate bidding packages for each trade. So we
17 have that exemption, other agencies do not. In terms
18 of as we proceed through a project, as change orders
19 occur, we don't have to stop the project and go back
20 to the Office of Management and Budget for additional
21 funding and so they have a review process which they
22 should. We have the ability in those cases to move
23 forward and to do, you know, minimal funding for the
24 contractors so they can continue the project and then
25 come back at the end of the project and negotiate the

1
2 actual cost of the change order and that sort of
3 thing. So there are a lot of different things that
4 we have the ability to do that other agencies do not.
5 I will say this and I, I -- we often and we continue
6 to work with all of the other agencies that handle
7 capital work and, you know, really share best
8 practices so we actually started that initiative over
9 several months.

10 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Good. So
11 you think the largest component of the -- or the
12 largest or the biggest obstacle is within the
13 procurement process kind of right? It's the back and
14 forth, the change orders which end up for example and
15 I can give an example. We had a \$3 million library
16 that was built -- Helen Marshall put in 3 million.
17 It was built -- well hasn't been built yet. We went
18 -- we finally broke ground 13 years later at a cost
19 of 17 million. Same extension. It's not like I
20 built this amazingly different or an idea, you know,
21 something that was different, multi floors, just an
22 extension and it cost \$14 million more all these
23 years later. Do you think that -- I want to be clear
24 that the procurement process is probably --

1
2 LORAIN GRILLO: I think procurement
3 process is part of it. I think the design process as
4 well. I think --

5 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: You have
6 in-house designing?

7 LORAIN GRILLO: We have both actually.
8 We do at least 40 percent of our designs in-house and
9 then the other is consultant design.

10 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And on
11 average how long does it take for --

12 LORAIN GRILLO: For a school for a -- if
13 we were to design a school, it would take
14 approximately 12 to 14 months.

15 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Okay. On
16 average, how many different firms bid for education
17 capital projects? Is there a limit to overall
18 capacity for education construction?

19 LORAIN GRILLO: I wouldn't say that that
20 was the case. There are particular trades. For
21 example, over the last several years, one of the
22 trades that we have a very difficult time finding
23 enough contractors are boiler contractors. Why,
24 because A, Hurricane Sandy happened and B, we are not
25 the only agency bidding on these projects right now.

1
2 NYCHA incurred a great deal of damage during
3 Hurricane Sandy and their boilers were damaged and so
4 we've got a lot of people, you know, needing boilers
5 with a very limited amount of boiler contractors.
6 But generally speaking, from the general contractors,
7 we have literally hundreds of contractors that bid on
8 work.

9 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
10 you. I am sure we are going to be following up with
11 you. We are creating a task force to help really
12 kind of, I don't want to say abends, but abends the
13 process and figuring out how we stay within because
14 we want things to be transparent but we also
15 understand the procurement process is necessary. We
16 are not saying to avoid it but it just seems a
17 certain agencies they are certifying to certify the
18 certification of the certification and we are back at
19 square one.

20 LORAIN GRILLO: The other, as you
21 mentioned that, the other advantage that we have, we
22 pre-qualify our contractors which is a very difficult
23 process but once they are pre-qualified they have the
24 ability to bid on projects and we are very confident
25 that the contractors that we hire have gone through

1
2 all of the vetting that they need to go through
3 before they bid on projects.

4 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank you
5 very much. I have two additional questions and then
6 I will have the Chair ask his question. Three-K For
7 All. I am very excited. I have a three year old at
8 home, you know, full disclosure he won't be taking
9 advantage of this but the reality is that while I am
10 excited both Chair Dromm and I as you know we work
11 very closely on this have incredibly overcrowded
12 school districts and how do you now prioritize?
13 Let's say move fast-forward three years from now we
14 have \$700 million to do the full ramp-up of 3-K. We
15 have issues in citing UPK and we issues in citing K
16 through 12. So what is the priority now when we have
17 this additional, I don't want to say burden, but this
18 additional challenge, I don't know what to call it,
19 strain on the system?

20 ELIZABETH ROSE: So we hear you and we
21 have some of the same concerns and questions. We are
22 working closely with Deputy Chancellor Wallick (SP)
23 who is leading this initiative but the issue that you
24 just raised is exactly why the two districts that we
25 are focusing on initially for expansion of 3K for all

1 are districts that have a available capacity and so I
2 think we will continue that pattern where we will
3 look at districts that have both high needs
4 populations and also have existing capacity and yes
5 there are districts that exist in New York City where
6 we have many underutilized seats and in contrast to
7 some of our districts where we have -- where we are
8 searching as hard as we can for additional seats.

10 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And
11 logically and because we need to prove that this
12 program is going to be a success and that is what I
13 want it for this program to be a success. I almost
14 wish though that we had a cite that was challenged or
15 a district that had these challenges because what you
16 are going to learn from that experience is very
17 different from the one that has 3Ks that are ready to
18 go so it is almost like you are doing the academic
19 test and I get that but you are still going to have
20 this space challenge that is very real and I am not
21 confident that our districts change that much in the
22 next three years where all of a sudden we have this
23 like land mass of discovered unless -- and these are
24 even more challenging because President Grillo you
25 have walked my district, you have walked Danny's

1
2 district and you know that it is not just the space
3 it's, you know, first floor and, you know, these are
4 little, little toddlers so they are going to have
5 even more challenges and the school size, class size
6 are even smaller so it just seems that it is an
7 incredible challenge that you need to be faced with
8 and I don't know how we are going to get there.

9 LORAIN GRILLO: Yes, we hear you. We
10 certainly agree. I also do want to say this, we've
11 had a lot of success, maybe not as much as we'd like,
12 but certainly some success in citing schools and one
13 of the challenges in your particular district is that
14 we are building additions onto 19, PS19 as well as
15 PS143, and the children that were in those
16 transportable classrooms had to be relocated
17 temporarily, taking up space in other schools and
18 it's been shifting over time until we get those
19 additions done. In the meantime, we are opening
20 PS298 this year. We have opened PS315 and so on and
21 so on and so on. I think once those additions are
22 built we will have some relief and then we will go
23 onto the challenges 3K for all. But, in the
24 meantime, it is going to be tight for the next couple
25 years.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Yeah, and
3 for both districts for 24 and 30, we are still --
4 even with building the expansions and building these
5 new schools we are still short seats. So while the
6 relief is -- it is almost like it is not a real
7 relief because you still have to answer the questions
8 to I think it is 1400 seats if I -- somewhere around
9 that even after we build -- it's almost like we need
10 to build two additional schools, not even responding
11 to the need of 3K versus universal. I just feel like
12 we are going to have a real moment where we are going
13 to have to question priorities and when you have
14 three very important but competing interest with very
15 limited space, I would like to understand how you
16 process this, how does the DOE handle this?

17 ELIZABETH ROSE: Well and I also
18 recognize that what we have been able to achieve and
19 what SCA has been able to achieve in siting UPK
20 reflects that the priorities are not exactly
21 competing because the size and scale of a site needed
22 to build a full elementary school is a very different
23 kind of property than the size and scale of a site
24 that will help address UPK or 3K needs. The
25 continued work with the Early Learn sites which are

1 CBOs just like many of our early childhood centers.

2 They are noncompetitive, not the same real estate and
3 so yes, funding for both is going to be important but
4 in terms of the specifics of what property we are
5 looking for, they are less competitive than they
6 might appear.
7

8 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: And is
9 that where you find as we transition to Early Learn
10 programs, right, because they are already in --

11 ELIZABETH ROSE: SO the Early Learn
12 programs will continue. They will continue under the
13 leadership of the Department of Education and Deputy
14 Chancellor Wallack but the programs that already
15 exist for three year olds will continue to exist and
16 we may be able to expand those programs within the
17 organizations that are already serving them.

18 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: I think
19 it is an appropriate time since we are going to be
20 continuing our task force, our task force
21 conversations to be able to put this into 3K so
22 hopefully we can present some remedies to some of the
23 challenges that we have. Chair Dromm?

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you and just to
25 follow-up a little bit on what Chair Copeland was

1
2 saying, are any of the 3K sites going to be in the
3 sites of where Early Learn are now, the same
4 buildings?

5 ELIZABETH ROSE: So --

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Like daycare centers?

7 ELIZABETH ROSE: Early Learn sites do
8 have a three year old program and so in the same way
9 that we have worked with CBOs to offer UPK and
10 upgraded the content and the training or those
11 programs. I anticipate we will be doing that for 3K
12 as well. We will also be offering 3K programs in DOE
13 sites where we have space available.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I used to be a
15 director of a daycare center, Grant Houses Daycare
16 Center, and they were in a NYCHA building and I
17 wonder are we going to open any three year old
18 classrooms in NYCHA buildings?

19 ELIZABETH ROSE: So I -- we don't have any
20 specifics today but this is something that I think we
21 will have more information coming, forthcoming as
22 Deputy Chancellor Wallack and his team digs into what
23 currently is there and what we can do.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: In my experiences
25 working with NYCHA, Chair Grillo, were very difficult

1
2 to get capital improvements done there and so I would
3 encourage that we do that outreach in terms of who is
4 going to be able to do what and what is going to be
5 able to be put forward before we take on that
6 responsibility as well.

7 LORAIN GRILLO: Absolutely.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: it is a very
9 complicated relationship with NYCHA and how you get
10 repairs done in those buildings. Let me go talk a
11 little bit about the SESIS and of course that is the
12 Student Information System for Special Education, and
13 the preliminary budget includes an expense of funding
14 for upgrades to SESIS, I think it was about \$4.4
15 million if I am not mistaken on capital funding,
16 excuse me, and how is that funding for SESIS going to
17 be spent in the capital funding?

18 ELIZABETH ROSE: So it is broken out into
19 three main components about 2.3 million of the
20 capital is for building out a data warehouse so that
21 we will have a central depository for all of the
22 information for students and their IEPs. It is a
23 combination of hardware, professional services, data
24 modeling and that is 2.3 million and then there is
25 another million that is for software licenses for a

1
2 number of users and another 850,000 for effectively
3 performance monitoring to the applications so that we
4 can ensure that the application is functioning well.
5 One of the things that the team has done on an
6 intermediate basis, immediate basis is they have been
7 able to identify where we have seen system failure in
8 SESIS and quickly address those functions that have
9 returned empty pages or have hung-up the systems and
10 significantly reduced errors in the user experience
11 by, you know, tracking and then addressing the
12 highest sources of system failure.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. Thank you and
14 let's talk a little bit about accessibility in the
15 public schools. Have you undertaken a comprehensive
16 assessment of capital repair work needed in schools
17 to provide accessibility?

18 ELIZABETH ROSE: So we have a committee
19 that focuses on accessibility and meets, I believe,
20 biweekly and that is a cross functional team that
21 includes representatives from the school construction
22 authority, from our Office of Space Management, our
23 Office of Student Enrollment, our Division of
24 Specialized Instruction and our legal team and a
25 number of others to assess the current state of

1
2 accessibility and what is needed. We have hired five
3 new staff members across SCA, Division of School
4 Facilities and Space Management to do in-depth work
5 with their respective teams in SCA's case and to go
6 into schools to do assessments of our buildings and
7 identify what we need to upgrade. We are working
8 fairly systematically on a district by district,
9 grade level by grade level to identify where do we
10 need to bring up from the bottom so that we can
11 identify accessibility projects in a very equitable
12 way across our district.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Do you have advocates
14 on that team?

15 ELIZABETH ROSE: We work very closely
16 with a number of parent advocates in developing our
17 new rating survey and school profile so we basically
18 worked with several advocates from CECs on exactly
19 what a questionnaire or survey of buildings would
20 look like and they how we could convert that
21 information to a very parent friendly document so
22 that parents could see and on-line get details of
23 individual school buildings and say okay, this
24 building has accessibility for this variety of
25 classrooms or functions but does not have

1
2 accessibility to the stage, does this work for my
3 child or not. We have surveyed all of our high
4 schools in Manhattan and Staten Island as a first
5 round and a parent friendly visual both accessibility
6 rating and detail will be included in the on-line
7 high school directory this fall for those boroughs so
8 that families will have the information they need
9 without having to go visit a school to determine
10 whether that school is a possibility for their child
11 that would support their child's disabilities.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: you know that --

13 ELIZABETH ROSE: We expect next year to
14 complete that for all of the boroughs.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I just got this by
16 the way so I am going to look at that later on, the
17 accessibility study that you're talking about I
18 think. At the March hearing that we held on School
19 Construction Authority, I think we had advocates that
20 came in and gave very moving testimony about having
21 their child accepted into a school of their choice
22 but then having to choose another school because it
23 was not accessible. So how is the DOE dealing with
24 those issues now?

25

ELIZABETH ROSE: So a couple of ways.

The first is that we do have a contact, a central contact point for any questions from parents on accessibility and we do go out to schools to see if there are accommodations that we can make to enable a child to attend the school of their choice. So to hear from any parent this concern, please ask them to go to our Office of Space Management page on the DOE website, the bottom right-hand corner there will be an email address for any parent questions around accessibility and we encourage families to do that. The second thing we are doing is try to be more transparent with information about accessibility up front so that parents are able to make very informed choices on their applications about where they would like to apply for schools so we try to avoid a disappointment like that. We want to help parents get to the school that will work for their child.

CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Is there any funding set aside for making to school building more accessible?

ELIZABETH ROSE: SO we have \$100 million in this capital plan that we are devoting to accessibility upgrades. We have used that. I think

1
2 we have identified 17 projects significant projects
3 to help bring the level of accessibility in our less
4 accessible districts up and again we will continue
5 bootstrapping as much as we can to get all districts
6 up to the same level.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So I think that is
8 100 million in this year's plan but do we have any
9 money moving forward in the five year plan?

10 ELIZABETH ROSE: So we haven't yet started
11 the developments yet of the 2020-2024 plan and this
12 is certainly a topic that I think we will be looking
13 to continue.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And when we talk --
15 I'm sorry. And when we talk about accessibility we
16 are talking about more than first floor
17 accessibility?

18 ELIZABETH ROSE: So again, we funded
19 about 17 major projects which is more than first
20 floor accessibility. We still have some money left
21 and with a little money that we have left, we are
22 looking at how can we increase first floor
23 accessibility to our school. We have been working
24 very closely with the Mayor's Office of People with
25 Disabilities to understand their priorities. They

1
2 are big proponents of increasing first floor
3 accessibility particularly in buildings where the
4 first floor is the access point for a number of
5 services so auditoriums, cafeterias, gymnasiums, you
6 know, if there are those things plus some classrooms
7 that becomes highly valuable to make that first floor
8 accessible.

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And for things like
10 parent teacher conferences as well for parents who
11 might have accessibility issues, provisions are made
12 for those parents also?

13 ELIZABETH ROSE: Yes. So we do try to
14 make accommodations where they are needed and I
15 certainly heard about some specific schools where
16 there have been requests for can we get a ramp or
17 arrange to meet with the parents in a location that
18 is accessible.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Good. Let me go to
20 air-conditioned schools. So some of the schools
21 identified for capital upgrades related to air-
22 conditioning have working air-conditioning in the
23 majority of classrooms. Why do these buildings need
24 electrical upgrades and is the current electrical
25 load in these schools from the use of the ACs unsafe?

1
2 LORAIN GRILLO: Okay. To answer your
3 questions, in those schools that already have air-
4 conditioners in classrooms, we will examine to see if
5 there is enough additional electrical power to
6 support more air-conditioners but it --

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: In different rooms?

8 LORAIN GRILLO: But it is much more
9 likely that would be the case and there is -- if they
10 have enough power within the building it is
11 absolutely no danger whatsoever.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So which schools can
13 support air-conditioners without capital upgrades?
14 Are there a number of those?

15 ELIZABETH ROSE: There are and there are
16 sort of three components of this program. One is
17 there are buildings that have everything they need,
18 they just need the air-conditioners and so we will be
19 purchasing and installing the air-conditioners for
20 those locations. Then there's a group of schools
21 that need distribution wiring in order to get the
22 power from the panels to the classrooms in order to
23 support the air-conditioners and they will get that
24 wiring plus the unit and then there are schools that
25 need a full electrical upgrade so division school

1 facilities is working very closely with the school
2 construction authority to develop those three
3 buckets, if you will, of schools and so then we
4 create a scheduled to address those needs.
5

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: No idea how long that
7 will take?

8 ELIZABETH ROSE: I expect we will have a
9 preliminary sense of which buildings fall into which
10 category within -- by the end of this school year and
11 we will be moving forward this summer to address some
12 schools that can be addressed quickly.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So the funding that
14 we put in that we are talking about putting in is for
15 the -- none of it is for the repair or replacement of
16 ACs that break? Most of them have a shelf life of
17 about seven years maybe. Is there any plan moving
18 forward to replace those.

19 ELIZABETH ROSE: So there are a few lucky
20 schools that as we surveyed our buildings earlier
21 this year in our work with the administration and OMB
22 on this program, we identified a couple hundred
23 classrooms that have air-conditioners that don't
24 function, those lucky few will get a new air-
25 conditioner as part of this program but going forward

1
2 we are currently funded just for the classrooms that
3 don't have anything and at the moment will still be
4 responsible for replacing their air-conditioners in
5 the future.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Do you ever take out
7 any service contracts or warranties past the seven
8 years?

9 ELIZABETH ROSE: I will have to get back
10 to you on that. We do have our custodial staff
11 perform maintenance on air-conditioning in our school
12 buildings, they check filters, they check for
13 cleanliness to keep our air-conditioners operating in
14 good repair and help them as long as possible.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And staff in school
16 kitchens report that the temperature often reaches
17 about 110 degrees. Are there any temperature
18 controls in school kitchens to ensure decent work
19 conditions?

20 ELIZABETH ROSE: So some of our kitchens
21 probably do, other of our kitchens as you know well,
22 many of our buildings are very old and were developed
23 in a time long before air-conditioning. At the
24 moment, this program is focused on classrooms. We
25 certainly heard inquires and interest in expanding

1
2 that to public assembly spaces and kitchens, et
3 cetera, but for right now we are very excited to do
4 the work on classrooms.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Is there any way they
6 can be provided with fans?

7 ELIZABETH ROSE: I think many of our
8 locations probably do have that but we can follow up
9 on that.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. That was also
11 an issue in the classrooms, we were not allowed to
12 bring fans into the classroom. It is a regulation I
13 believe you're not allowed to have a fan in the
14 classroom. So just on that note, because there was a
15 time when I think we did put some air-conditioners
16 into schools. Not every classroom got it. I don't
17 know how it was designated but I would just caution
18 you because this is a very technical thing, I think
19 the BTUs on those air-conditioners was about 2300
20 BTUs and some of those were not sufficient enough to
21 adequately cool the rooms so I would urge you to make
22 sure the BTUs on these air-conditioners are
23 appropriate for the classroom because many of them
24 have very high ceilings and it's difficult with just
25 a 23,000 BTU unit to cool those classrooms down.

1
2 ELIZABETH ROSE: So we will be with our
3 custodians accessing what is the appropriate level
4 for each of these classrooms as we purchase the air-
5 conditioners and --

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Do you know the BTUs
7 now?

8 ELIZABETH ROSE: Over the past several
9 years, CSS has been very involved with any school
10 that has purchased air-conditioners to ensure that
11 they are both appropriate size, appropriate quality
12 and installed safety so all of those things are
13 things we have been managing centrally for some time.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Is there any
15 regulation to a classroom getting more than one air-
16 conditioner?

17 ELIZABETH ROSE: I think that if we can
18 address a classroom with one in an adequate way
19 that's what we will do.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: It was helpful but if
21 you have 90 degree day and it only brought it down to
22 85 or whatever, it was still very hot in the
23 classroom so I would urge you to however you are
24 going to go about installing these that the BTUs are
25 correct. Thank you.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: I have a
3 quick follow-up. When we did our briefing, we
4 discussed that with the Mayor that is that many of
5 our schools, again because of limited space, are
6 actually giving instruction in non-traditional. They
7 are out of the classroom so in some cases they have
8 classes in auditoriums or they have classes in the
9 cafeteria so in that case I would believe where there
10 are classes being taught that should be looked at an
11 opportunity to put air-conditioning into that space.

12 ELIZABETH ROSE: I certainly --

13 [cross talk]

14 ELIZABETH ROSE: A lot of the work that
15 we are doing on new capacity will hopefully help
16 alleviate those needs as well. The current program
17 is funded for classroom spaces and so we will have to
18 access where we are as we get through air-
19 conditioning all of our classrooms.

20 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: So we are
21 going to be pushing that in negotiations and that is
22 something that is important to this council and
23 speaking to the Mayor he understood that is a
24 challenge and committed to getting us there so I just
25 wanted to kind of put that on your radar that there

1
2 are going to be schools where I am sure you are going
3 to here form principals that my school is one of the
4 spaces where we are using the cafeteria or even the
5 gymnasium in some cases, especially in the older
6 schools, that you actually have the sites separate as
7 opposed to the newer facilities that have air-
8 conditioners one or that have swing space so I wanted
9 to kind of put that on your radar.

10 ELIZABETH ROSE: Thank you, Chair.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Let me talk a little
12 bit about class size reduction and then I will turn
13 it over to other council members that have questions.
14 So the proposed amendment has 490 million for the
15 creation of 4,900 seats through class size reduction
16 projects but only three projects representing 1354
17 have been identified. It has been over a year since
18 class size reduction projects have been identified.
19 Can you describe the exact process for identifying
20 class size reduction process?

21 LORAIN GRILLO: Again, if I may, there
22 is a committee that meets along with space planning
23 and the DOE space planning as well as SCA and
24 enrollment and we review several criteria including
25 the location, the geographical location whether there

1
2 are TCUs in the building and that sort of thing and
3 as a group we decide what schools should move forward
4 with that. The other thing that is necessary too is
5 of course space and in some cases where you have all
6 of those criteria, you may not have space to build so
7 this is an ongoing committee and all of these three
8 projects are in process right now so we are kind of
9 getting ready to review again to see what could
10 possibly be.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Is there a timeline
12 for that?

13 LORAIN GRILLO: there is really no
14 specific timeline.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: It's ongoing?

16 LORAIN GRILLO: We would like to do it
17 within this plan. At least identify those.

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So we will be
19 notified as you move forward on that about additional
20 projects? Do you expect any additional projects
21 before the November '17, you know, midterm mid-
22 budget?

23 LORAIN GRILLO: Hopefully. Certainly
24 again, several people, great minds tend to think
25

1
2 alike on selecting these kinds of projects to move
3 forward.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Thank
5 you, Chair.

6 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
7 you, Chair. We have been joined by Council Members
8 Miller, Chin, Garodnick, Barron and Rosenthal. We
9 will hear from Council Member Rosenthal followed by
10 Council Member Miller.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you so
12 much and thank you, Chair. We have been here all
13 day. Impressive. I am glad you are stepping out to
14 get food occasionally. Good to see you. Thanks for
15 your answers to our questions. I want to start just
16 by confirming the PS191 renovations. I don't know
17 what number that school building is or if you have
18 figured that out but the school at Riverside Center.
19 When do you expect construction to finish? Parents
20 are anxious to do walkthroughs.

21 LORAIN GRILLO: Well that, if I may,
22 that construction is moving along nicely. Certainly
23 we are keeping the contractor and the developers feet
24 to the fire to make sure this project is completed on
25

1
2 time for school. I will venture to guess that it
3 would be late summer.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Late summer,
5 okay. I mean if there are portions that parents
6 could start to do walkthroughs where it is safe we
7 could continue to work together on that. Then I do
8 want to follow-up on the Chair's questions about air-
9 conditioning in the school cafeterias. I have a
10 couple schools that are desperate for that and I have
11 heard from the workers as well, just sounds, you
12 know, miserable work conditions. Do you have a -- do
13 you know which cafeterias don't have air-
14 conditioning?

15 ELIZABETH ROSE: SO we have as part of
16 our principal annual school survey, they survey, we
17 have a reasonable by classroom by area is it air-
18 conditioned yes or no. We do typically go in as we
19 began this project and we did have our custodians go
20 in and do a little bit more in-depth confirming look.
21 So we certainly have a baseline level of indicators.
22 It is directional probably not a hundred percent.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: SO I would
24 love to see draft directional. If you could send
25 over the report sort of telling us how many, you

1
2 know, I know there are a couple in my district but I
3 would be curious to know in everyone's district where
4 we are with air-conditioning in kitchens and where
5 there is not air-conditioning, you know, are these
6 ginormous fans available to the school. I also want
7 to talk about the ADA compliance. Do you know if any
8 of the school assembly areas are better -- I'm asking
9 about hearing loops which is a technology that wipes
10 out the white noise for people who are hard of
11 hearing. What tools do you use for kids who are hard
12 of hearing?

13 ELIZABETH ROSE: So the new survey that we
14 have been doing for these high schools in fact
15 include specific information about hearing loops,
16 whether it is a hearing loop or induction coil and so
17 that --

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Well done.

19 ELIZABETH ROSE: -- that information is in
20 the survey report.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So we will be
22 getting that information back. The survey to ask
23 principals if they have it or do they need it?

24 ELIZABETH ROSE: No, this is a special
25 survey that we are having staff do focused on

1
2 accessibility so that the report that parents can do
3 will give them that level of detail so we will have
4 that for all of the high school --

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I'm not seeing
6 -- are you -- I'm sorry to interrupt. I have a
7 minute left. I'm asking are you finding out which
8 schools have hearing loops or induction loops or are
9 you finding out about the need?

10 ELIZABETH ROSE: We are finding out
11 whether they have hearing loops, induction coils or
12 nothing so that -- we will get that information as
13 part of the surveys that will be published in the
14 high school directory.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Do you know
16 what the demand is?

17 ELIZABETH ROSE: Off the top of my head,
18 I don't have that with me today. We can follow-up
19 and see what we know.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I would really
21 appreciate that information. I had a town hall the
22 other day where we did lay down an induction loop and
23 when I announced that about five people who look
24 younger than me adjusted the t-coil in their hearing
25 aid so I think it is much more prevalent than people

1
2 know and it is certainly not just problem with those
3 of us who are aging and getting increasingly hard of
4 hearing. Do you think there are any schools with
5 induction or hearing loops?

6 ELIZABETH ROSE: I believe there are and
7 certainly some of our newer buildings would
8 absolutely have this.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Would
10 absolutely have it.

11 ELIZABETH ROSE: Yes.

12 [cross talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: -- new PS191
14 have it?

15 ELIZABETH ROSE: Should be.

16 LORAIN GRILLO: I don't know off the top
17 my head but I will follow through on that.

18 ELIZABETH ROSE: And of course we also do
19 have schools where we have specific programs for
20 students with hearing loss of different varieties and
21 they choose what kind of programs they want. We have
22 programs for students who want sign language. We
23 have programs for kids who don't want sign language
24 and prefer to operate within a hearing environment.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yep. Sounds
3 like you -- yep. Those are the issues. I'd enjoy --
4 I'd appreciate hearing more. Thanks so much.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you so much.
6 Before I turn it over to Council Member Miller, I
7 just wanted to ask about I think you were doing
8 surveys on single stall unisex all gender bathrooms.
9 Can you give me an update on that?

10 ELIZABETH ROSE: Sure. The program that
11 we are rolling out is asking every principal to
12 identify a bathroom in their building and this is an
13 existing bathroom that is effectively a single
14 occupant bathroom. Our student bathroom tend to have
15 multiple toilet stalls and/or urinals and what we are
16 looking for is a single occupant bathroom that would
17 enable any child who wants to have additional privacy
18 in the bathroom to go into a bathroom essentially by
19 themselves and receive that level of privacy. Most
20 of our buildings have these bathrooms. They are
21 typically assigned for staff and many of the
22 buildings have multiple of these so that reassigning
23 for student use instead of staff use is easily
24 accommodated within the building. We have just
25 begun rolling this out. We will be doing several

1
2 hundred schools before the end of the school year and
3 then in phases over the course of the summer and into
4 the next school year so that we expect all buildings
5 to have a bathroom identified for all gender student
6 use by the end of the calendar year, January 2018,
7 there will be a small number of schools for whom we
8 have to work closely and come up with a creative
9 solutions but most of our schools will be able to
10 accommodate ??

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Council
12 Member Miller followed by Council Member Barron.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Chair
14 Dromm. Good afternoon. So I want to ask about the
15 TCUs. I know that, that school construction has been
16 absolutely committed to their removal although that
17 has been kind of a snail's pace and I know everybody
18 is doing their due diligence. What is the hold up on
19 that? Is it space or -- I notice that also that you
20 identified one location in 29. Do you know which one
21 that is because we still have several remaining in 29
22 and so we want to speak to that and how we can
23 expedite the removal as well as does it matter
24 indicating that the educational experience for these
25

1
2 children in the TCUs are equal equitable to those in
3 a traditional building?

4 ELIZABETH ROSE: I want to first start
5 with how do we develop a plan because I think in some
6 of the locations that is a challenge. Once we have
7 identified the plan it is a question of ??. In some
8 locations that are currently using those TCUs, the
9 challenge is we have to plan for where will those
10 students be educated to enable us to get those
11 children out of the TCU and demolish that TCU.

12 Sometimes that is we are going to build an addition
13 to that building and so we need to find swing space
14 nearby. As for example in Council Member Barron's
15 district we are doing that in one case. Sometimes it
16 is that the school has simple -- it's enrollment
17 needs to be brought into a range that can be
18 accommodated in the main building so that we can
19 remove those TCUs and that can take from the time you
20 identify the plan to reduce enrollment to perhaps by
21 one section a year, it can take several years before
22 the total enrollment in the building allows for the
23 removal of the TCUs. So we work -- our division
24 space management works very closely with principals,
25 superintendents, and consults with CECs to develop

1
2 the plan for how are we going to no longer need the
3 space in the TCU in an area and once we are able to
4 do that it then goes to the SCA.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So, so, so there
6 is plans for all of the schools that currently house
7 TCUs in my district and throughout the city is what
8 you're saying?

9 ELIZABETH ROSE: SO we have successfully
10 removed a little over a hundred TCUs. The SCA has
11 been able to execute on those. We have plans for
12 removal of I believe about a 109 more and we still
13 have about a 135, 136 where we are developing the
14 plan. We don't yet have it and we need to continue
15 working to develop a plan.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: And is there data
17 that supports that there is equitable education going
18 on experienced holistically for the students in those
19 -- that have been educated in those TCUs as opposed
20 to the traditional buildings?

21 ELIZABETH ROSE: SO I know that our
22 educators are all incredibly committed to ensuring
23 that the education is equitable. Frequently what we
24 see is a single grade level will be in the TCUs so
25 all of the children in that same grade level have the

1
2 same experience and then they all move up and
3 articulate up to the next grade level in the main
4 building.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: But is that any
6 different from children who are being educated in a
7 traditional building maybe in a school across the
8 street in another district? Are they being deprived
9 by being in those TCUs?

10 ELIZABETH ROSE: We don't think they are
11 being deprived but we also know that we think that
12 all students should be in permanent buildings so we
13 are working very hard to achieve that.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: On the bathrooms,
15 I know you have a ?? plan to replace bathrooms and
16 what does that look like? Obviously we have a list
17 of bathrooms in the district that haven't been
18 remodeled as of yet. Also throughout our
19 participatory budgeting, there has been some money
20 allocated towards remodeling bathrooms as well. How
21 do you prioritize that and what does that look like?

22 ELIZABETH ROSE: So we have been doing
23 bathrooms in groups or phases over the past several
24 years. Over time we have evolved in how we are
25 selecting those bathrooms a little bit so that in

1
2 addition to the personal observations of our school
3 facility staff and requests from schools and requests
4 from council members, we are also looking at our
5 biannual school ??. We are literally -- we send
6 assessors into our buildings to rate our buildings
7 for the cleanliness and the fixtures quality and
8 state of repair like bathrooms. It's how we access
9 our custodial staff

10 [cross talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: -- any way of
12 knowing what --

13 ELIZABETH ROSE: -- projected --

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: -- projected
15 timeframe is on those and whether or not -- whether
16 or not it is a wise -- prudent investment to
17 participatory budgeting or Reso A but particularly
18 participatory budgeting for parents to, you know, to
19 invest in those --

20 ELIZABETH ROSE: Invest. So what I would
21 say is we will not, we currently are in the process
22 of doing our fifth phase and our first four phases we
23 were able to -- we completed 532 bathrooms which is
24 almost all of that phase. I think we have three more
25 to go. We are currently in phase five where we are

1
2 working towards 149 additional bathrooms. Our phase
3 six, which we are about to launch which will be
4 completed in this coming fiscal year, as another 272
5 so we are making progress across the system but we
6 will not be able to get to every bathroom in every
7 school that would like an upgrade so yes,
8 participatory budgeting I think this is a positive
9 contribution because we won't be able to get to
10 everything by ourselves. It is I suppose a way to
11 jump to the front of the que if you will. We are
12 working very hard to address the neediest bathrooms
13 to the extent possible.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you and I
15 am sure someone else will question ?? NWBE
16 participation in these programs as well and we are
17 happy to know that we recently registered a bunch of
18 contractors from the district and I got all the phone
19 calls and they are excited about -- I have spoken
20 with SCA and we are looking forward to that as well.
21 Hopefully, it will ?? --

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Council
23 Member Barron?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Mr.
25 Chair. Thank you to the panel for coming. First

1
2 about the lead in the water. You may recall that
3 last time we were together I was quite dismayed by
4 your comment that well it would only be the first
5 child to drink from a fountain that may have been --
6 may have had lead content higher than what is
7 acceptable and did you want to elaborate?

8 ELIZABETH ROSE: Well I would like to say
9 we remember that slightly differently. What we do
10 know is --

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: What is your
12 recollection?

13 ELIZABETH ROSE: The first draw of water
14 that has been stagnant overnight is not
15 representative of what our children normally
16 experience during the day and as soon as that first
17 sample of water, the first water of the morning flows
18 through, we know that the water immediately behind it
19 is clear and clean and is safe for students to drink
20 so while I know that this is not perfect, it is -- if
21 someone is concerned that they are the first user of
22 a fountain the in morning they can flow the water for
23 a little bit and that will reduce any concerns they
24 might have but we do know that our water in our
25 buildings is safe to drink and that it would require

1
2 that first sample every day for a very long time to
3 have any impact.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: My point was that
5 that should not have even been a consideration for an
6 example to have been presented because we don't want
7 any of our children to be exposed to any kind of
8 contamination and that is what I had said at that
9 time. So we heard earlier that it is the faucet and
10 not the pipes and you indicated earlier in your
11 testimony that it is based on other kinds of
12 experiences and collections that are done in other
13 areas. Do you still hold that? Is that what you
14 say? You don't think there are any other problems?

15 ELIZABETH ROSE: So the work that we are
16 doing and the approach we are taking to remediating
17 those fixtures that tested above guidance is
18 effective that when we re-test when we replace those
19 fixtures we do get negative test results, test below
20 guidance and we don't return that fixture to use
21 until we are able to get a test below guidance.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: In terms of the
23 five year capital plan, is it the current five year
24 capital plan? What are the years that are in the
25 current five year capital plan the --

1
2 ELIZABETH ROSE: 2015 to 2019 so we have
3 two more years remaining.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Is the East New
5 York Family Academy in that cycle, 2015-2019?

6 LORAIN GRILLO: Yes, it is. Actually
7 the project is in design as we speak and when the
8 students are moved into their temporary location then
9 we will start construction and that is going to
10 happen September 2018.

11 ELIZABETH ROSE: 2018 and in fact the
12 proposal to relocate those students to be
13 accommodated at Maxwell High School will go before
14 the panel for Education Policy in their June meeting.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So when will we
16 expect that the new facility will be completed in its
17 entirety and not in phases as at one point discussed
18 initially and we said that didn't sound good because
19 things don't always get completed when they are not
20 done in its entirety.

21 LORAIN GRILLO: Correct and we were
22 very, very fortunate to find space planning was
23 terrific at finding space for the entire school for

24 [cross talk]
25

1
2 LORAIN GRILLO: -- swoop and we are
3 looking at a completion in 2021.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And as we are
5 designing this school, will it have a dedicated
6 auditorium, dedicated cafeteria, dedicated gymnasium?

7 LORAIN GRILLO: I know it will have a
8 dedicated gymnasium. I know it will have a dedicated
9 cafeteria and I'm sorry and a swimming pool. In
10 terms of an auditorium, I don't it will have an
11 auditorium dedicated. It will have likely a
12 gymnasium within the building which it can be
13 converted very easily to auditorium space.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Having been
15 principal I know the disadvantages of having a
16 gymnasium as you are calling it before us. That was
17 the construction of the school where I was so it
18 limited what could be done although it did have an
19 advantage because we could fold the wall back and
20 have the whole school there for exceptional programs
21 designed for the whole school. In terms of the class
22 size projects that are in the budget, I think there
23 were only three locations or three projects that were
24 identified. Is that still limited to three?

1
2 LORAIN GRILLO: Yes. As I mentioned to
3 the Chair earlier, we are a committee that works
4 together to decide on the next steps as far as the
5 next schools that would be -- take advantage of this.
6 There are a lot of variables as I said earlier in the
7 case of East New York Family Academy, relocating that
8 school was a challenge and that took quite some time.
9 In other cases it is geography or it is space within
10 itself so there are a lot of things and we have a
11 committee made up of folks from DOE's enrollment
12 office as well as DOE space management group and so
13 on and we continue to get together to find out --
14 move forward with additional sites.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Madam Chair if I
16 could ask one more question. In terms of NWBE, I
17 know you have a mentor program so could you talk
18 about that program briefly and what are the -- how
19 many NWMEs are involved with School Construction
20 Authority and what is the average size of the award
21 from the contractor involved in?

22 LORAIN GRILLO: I am not sure I have
23 every detail. I will tell you that we are extremely
24 proud of our NWBE program. As a matter of fact I
25 think it last year's -- last fiscal year, SCA was

1 responsible for about \$700 million in NWBE contracts
2 so which is probably the largest in the city. In
3 terms of our program, our mentor program really, is a
4 program that takes small emerging contractors and
5 puts them through a training course with the
6 construction manager to teach them the ins and outs
7 of dealing with city agencies and so on. They know
8 their trade certainly but it is working with us.
9 Plus, then they go through that process for a maximum
10 of four years and if they reach a certain skill
11 level, they graduate to the next level which is our
12 graduate mentor program. During that -- at the
13 mentor level, they are able to bid on small projects
14 and when I say small projects, I mean projects valued
15 at up to \$750,000 and that is with the help of a
16 construction management firm supervising them. Then
17 they move on to our graduate mentor program which is
18 projects up to \$1 million. As they begin to grow and
19 reach a level of bidding up to \$4 million for a year
20 they graduate out of it and then they are able to bid
21 on our regular capital improvement programs so they
22 are mentored throughout those first early years until
23 they grow to a certain level. In addition to that we
24 have what we call an opportunity academy where we
25

1
2 have young people from the local community colleges
3 and we provide an internship program training them on
4 how to do back office work or how to mentor
5 contractors and these young people go through intense
6 training plus we intern them into the mentor
7 contractors to help them with their paperwork and
8 this year we had 30 students and 30 of them have full
9 time jobs and they are very, very skilled right now
10 and people are fighting over them so we are getting
11 ready to do our next class.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: How many NWME
13 participants do you have?

14 LORAIN GRILLO: We have hundreds of them
15 in the mentor program right now I believe somewhere
16 in the neighborhood of about 100 and -- I have it
17 right here. There are currently 823 MWLBE firms that
18 do business with us and 111 are participating in our
19 mentor and graduate mentor program.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. Thank
21 you Madam Chair and Mr. Chair.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ??: Thank you Chair
23 Ferreras-Copeland and Chair Dromm for leading this
24 and your support on so many of the things you've been
25 working for from school seats to lead to

1
2 accessibility. I want to start by saying you've got
3 a great team at SCA and I probably know more than
4 most because they are on the phone with my office ??
5 so I would like to touch on school seats, lead and
6 accessibility. At the preliminary budget hearing,
7 Chancellor Farina agreed that the Upper East Side
8 needs more school seats. Following the hearing we
9 learned that we had 900 four year olds apply for less
10 than 600 seats on the Upper East Side. We had a
11 rally for school seats with Controller Stringer,
12 Public Advocate James and Borough President Brewer,
13 Senator Kruger, Assembly Member Seawright and Court,
14 Council Member Garodnick, parents and children
15 following the hearing and the rally the Mayor
16 announced 3K for all which means we have doubled the
17 need for seats on the Upper East Side and at the
18 executive budget briefing the Mayor agreed to my
19 request to begin negotiating with all new large
20 construction projects on the Upper East Side to
21 include new school seats and that all having
22 happened, what progress has SCA made toward building
23 or opening new school seats on the Upper East Side?

24 LORAIN GRILLO: Thank you for the
25 question, Councilman because I have been anxious to

1
2 let you know that over the last couple days we have
3 come to terms with on two projects in the Upper East
4 Side. One of them in Council Member Garodnick's area
5 as well as one large on in your area for Pre-K and we
6 are very excited about it and we are happy to meet
7 with you to give you the particulars on it. It is
8 quite a large project.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ??: That is great news.
10 I guess the overall concern is thank you for the good
11 news. I'm ecstatic. You can hear it in my voice.
12 Sorry I'm not more emotional but very excited about
13 it and I think it is just great work and if we can
14 keep on going is there a commitment to keep finding
15 more space?

16 LORAIN GRILLO: Yep. We actually have
17 two other sites in consideration.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ??: That is fantastic
19 news and I will continue to be your cheerleader on
20 that. I guess I want to turn to lead. I have asked
21 questions about this before. It seems like some of
22 the situations are under control but on April 28th
23 the New York Times reported on "Most New York City
24 Schools have high lead levels, re-test fine." It
25 goes on to say that in the first measuring only one

1
2 percent measured it but then they found that somebody
3 had apparently contacted the Time to indicate that
4 there had been a flushing for two hours which is a
5 concern to me especially since some of my schools were
6 indicated in prior reports and now as of at least
7 what the Times is saying that eight percent of
8 outlets have levels exceeding 15 parts per billion
9 and the vast majority of schools 83 percent at least
10 one outlet with the lead level above the threshold so
11 folks are starting to get a little bit concerned
12 particularly with the Times article I am also
13 concerned about the -- why you chose to the two hours
14 and how we can be sure of future tests [cross talk]
15 and Roosevelt Island and all the schools in my
16 district are and throughout the city are on track and
17 not have this problem.

18 ELIZABETH ROSE: So lots of different
19 things to address there. First and foremost, 92
20 percent of our fixtures tested below guidance so we
21 know that this is not a systemic issue, this is not
22 about our water, this is not about our schools are
23 not safe. Eight percent tested above guidance. That
24 by the way compares very favorably with the rest of
25 the state. We are all required to report to the

1
2 state. Statewide the average is 14 percent of
3 fixtures tested above guidance. Any time we know
4 that in those eight percent that families get
5 concerns let's remember that the average school has
6 over 100 fixtures. So again, let's if you make the
7 math easy, let's say it's 100, 92 of the fixtures are
8 completely safe and eight of them have elevated
9 levels, if it was a drinking fountain or a sink used
10 for cooking water we will have shut them off so that
11 no student can drink from them until it is
12 remediated. Again, there are still 92 fixtures in
13 that school building that are --[cross talk] --

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ??: How often will we be
15 testing and retesting since we obviously had a change
16 between tests?

17 ELIZABETH ROSE: The state requirement is
18 that we test every five years and we are remediating
19 the fixtures from this last round of testing over the
20 course of the summer and into the fall.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ??: Would you be open to
22 doing it more frequently than every five years and
23 perhaps twice -- each semester?

24 ELIZABETH ROSE: So I -- we can have a
25 conversations outside of this testing. What we learn

1
2 from the testing is several ?? one is that it is
3 individual fixtures. It is not a system wide issue
4 and that our remediation is effective and that we do
5 test every fixture that we remediate so that we know
6 that that fixture is below guidance before it comes
7 back on-line so in effect any fixture that has been
8 tested above guidance has been remediated and tested
9 to be below guidance so that should address some of
10 your concerns around frequency. The other thing we
11 know is that flowing water through system and always
12 having fresh water is one of the ways that we can be
13 very effective and ensure that our student have safe
14 clean water to drink. So while we did change the
15 protocol in accordance with the updated state
16 guidance, one of the things that we have evidence
17 that fresh water that we know in our system is clean
18 and you missed Council Member Ferreras-Copeland did
19 ask for what is different between our situation and
20 municipalities that have bene in the news as having
21 real issues and there are very clear differences in
22 the underlying water system and how that water is
23 treated that we know keeps New York City water safe.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ??: I would be interested
25 in learning how much more it would cost to do another

1 test. I have one last question regarding
2 accessibility. The Board of Elections has \$4 million
3 in their budget for storing installing and removing
4 accessible hardware from public schools throughout
5 the city. The Board of Elections is open to
6 installing the equipment permanently at the schools.
7 Will you accept and maintain this equipment for year
8 round accessibility at schools?
9

10 ELIZABETH ROSE: So we work very closely
11 with the Board of Elections. We are happy to work
12 with them and discuss any proposals that they have.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ??: Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank
15 you, Council Member. With that being said, that
16 concludes today's hearing. Don't looks so surprised.
17 Thank you again to Chancellor Farina, Deputy
18 Chancellor Rose and President Grillo. We are going to
19 have additional questions that we are going to send
20 you ?? specifically on accessibility because it is a
21 big issue and some other items so hopefully we can
22 get those answers back to us as soon as possible
23 because we will need them for adoption. I would also
24 like to once again thank my Co-Chair, Chair Dromm,
25 and the members of the Education Committee and again

1
2 remind you that the public will be invited to testify
3 on Thursday, May 25th, the last day of budget
4 hearings at approximately one p.m. in this room. For
5 any member of the public who wishes to testify but
6 cannot make it to the hearing you can submit your
7 testimony to the finance division on the council's
8 website, council.nyc.gov/budget/testimony and the
9 staff will make it a part of the official record.
10 The Finance Committee will resume budget hearings
11 tomorrow in this room at 10 a.m. with the
12 Transportation Committee to hear from the ??, New
13 York City transit followed by Taxi and Limousine
14 Commission and Department of Transportation. With
15 that, this hearing is now adjourned.

16
17 [gavel]
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date June 19, 2017