CITY COUNCIL CITY OF NEW YORK -----Х TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES Of the SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS ----- Х May 2, 2017 Start: 1:32 p.m. Recess: 2:35 p.m. HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Rm. 16th Fl B E F O R E: RAFAEL SALAMANCA, JR. Chairperson COUNCIL MEMBERS: Darlene Mealy Ydanis A. Rodriguez Andrew Cohen Mark Treyger World Wide Dictation 545 Saw Mill River Road - Suite 2C, Ardsley, NY 10502 Phone: 914-964-8500 * 800-442-5993 * Fax: 914-964-8470

1

www.WorldWideDictation.com

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jordan Press, Executive Director Development and Planning, Government Affairs Unit NYC Housing, Preservation and Development, HPD

Gito Subadowski, President Asmat Development Group

Kerry LeBotz, Director Year 15 Program NYC Housing, Preservation and Development, HPD

Samantha Magistro, Principal Bronx Pro

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 4 2 [sound check, pause] [gavel] 3 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright, good 4 morning everyone. I am Council Member Rafael 5 I am the Chair of the Subcommittee on Salamanca. 6 Planning, Dispositions and Concessions. Welcome, 7 everyone to today's hearing. We are joined to day by 8 Council Member Mark Treyger. Alright, so today we'll 9 have nine items on for hearings. For the first four 10 items are applications for tax exemptions under 11 Article 11 of the Private Housing Finance Law, and 12 the last five applications for property tax 13 exemptions under Article 16 of the General Municipal 14 The first item is Conquest Village West, LU 604 Law. 15 in my district. This application for a 40-year tax 16 exemption under Article 11 of the Private Housing Finance Law is related to a previously approved ULURP 17 18 application. The tax exemption will facilitate the 19 development of three multi-family buildings totaling 20 265 units of affordable housing rental housing in the Conquest Village neighborhood of the Bronx. I am now 21 22 opening up the public hearing on LU 604, the Conquest 23 Village West Tax Exemption. So if you could just 24 introduce yourselves.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 5 2 JORDAN PRESS: Good afternoon. My name 3 is Jordan Press. I'm Executive Director for 4 Development and Planning I the Government Affairs 5 Unit at HPD. Land Use-and-and I'm joined today by Gito Sobataski (sp?) from Asmat Development who will 6 7 also provide a summary of the project. Land Use No. 604 consists of proposed Article 11 tax benefits for 8 9 an exemption area known as Concourse Village West, which is presently on land located at 180 East 156th 10 Street. 702 Grand Concourse and 70-741 Concourse 11 12 Village West. The sponsor for Concourse Village West 13 received approval for a zoning text amendment, and 14 establishment of a mandatory inclusionary housing 15 area on November 16, 2016, which was Resolution No. 16 1312. Summarizing the Concourse Village West 17 project, the con-the sponsor will construct three 18 buildings under HPD's mix and match program, and 19 under completion there will be 265 units of mixedincome housing with 42 studios, 114 one-bedrooms, 80 20 2-bedrooms, 29 3-bedrooms with affordability ranging 21 2.2 from 30% to 100% of AMI. The development will also 23 include commercial space, and 176 parking spaces. As mentioned, HPD is before the Council seeking approval 24 of an Article 11 tax exemption for a term of 40 years 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 6 that will coincide with the Regulatory Agreement in 2 3 order to assist with facilitating long-term 4 affordability. [background comments] GITO SUBADOWSKI: Good afternoon. 5 Gito Subadowski, President of Asmat Development. 6 We're 7 the developer for the Concourse Village West project. Thank you, Council Member Salamanca and staff for all 8 9 of your help in getting us to where we are today. Just a little bit of background. Per our discussion 10 11 with respect to the project, as Jordan said, the project will consist of 265 units of mixed-income 12 13 That would include 42 studios, 114 1housing. 14 bedrooms, 82 bedrooms, and 29 3-bedrooms. Per our 15 discussions with respect to affordability, will be 16 including 23 units at 30% of Area Median Income; 13 17 units at 40% of Area Median Income; 13 units at 50% 18 of Median Income; 83 units at 60% of Median income; 19 20 units at 80% of Median Income; 85 units at 90% of Median Income; and 26 units at 100% of Median Income. 20 21 Among some of the other things were discussed, which 2.2 we understand it and agree are a priority, local 23 hiring, it is a priority for our contractors. We do intend to hire qualified workers from Community Board 24 4; from Council District 17 and the entire Bronx will 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 7 continue to report both to the Council and the 2 3 community board with respect to our ongoing hiring 4 efforts. We're in discussions with respect to management companies. So we intend to hire a 5 management company by the name of Cornell Pace. 6 With 7 respect to security, as building owners and operators as security is a concern of ours, all of our 8 9 buildings are going to be well lit. They all include surveillance systems, and all of those are to be 10 11 monitored full time by on-site staff. Parking is 12 another important part of this project. We 13 understand there's great need for parking in this area. The project is to include approximately 176 14 15 accessory parking spaces to be housed along the 16 Concourse Village West buildings. So, thank you for 17 your time.

18 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright, well, 19 thank you gentleman for that brief description of the 20 project. You know, I just want to put this out on 21 the public record why this project is going to be laid over. A few months ago back this-this building, 2.2 23 this particular project went through a ULURP, and in this ULURP, you know, it took months of negotiating 24 with my office, the Land Use Office and HPD, and 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 8 there was an original agreement of 20-of 235 total 2 units, 20 studio, 95 1-bedroom, 84 2-bedroom, and 36 3 4 3-bedroom units. Moving forward so the-the ULURP, 5 the ULURP project was approved. Just recently my office was informed that the-in need of an Article 6 7 11, and that the original developer sold the project 8 over to a new developer, and that the proposed-and that the project has been changed in terms of the-the 9 ULURP sizes going from now-and there was a reduction, 10 the was a 50% reduction in 3-bedroom units and 50% 11 12 reduction in 2-bedroom units, and I question how can 13 this happen after there was an agreement from the-my office and HPD. It came through a-a ULURP process. 14 15 This was discussed in committee, and this voted on, 16 but unfortunately--and I just want my colleagues to 17 be aware of this-unfortunately when a ULURP is 18 approved unless those specifics are put in a 19 resolution in terms of the composition of the unit sizes, once a ULURP is approved they can turn around 20 21 and move the unit sizes around, which I find totally 2.2 unacceptable. So I was willing to-to turn this-this 23 Article 11 down because, you know, my-my community we need unit sizes of 2 and 3-bedroom units. We need 24 25 larger-larger unit sizes, and I find-I found it

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 9 unacceptable that after HPD and my office made a 2 3 negotiation, that they would turn around and just try 4 to change the project around, and what's most interesting is that if this project did not require 5 an Article 11, therefore, if the Article 11 was 6 7 approved simultaneously with the ULURP process-the 8 ULURP application, and then they could have just 9 changed around the-the apartment sizes without having to come through Council. So, you know, Jordan, I 10 11 know I've expressed this to you off the record. I 12 need to express this to you on the record. Because 13 HPD did this, what they just did is that they just put a barrier in terms of lack of trust from my 14 15 office to your office. I'm happy to know that I was able to sit down with the new developer and we spoke 16 17 about it, and we came to an agreement where we 18 brought back the majority of those 2 and 3-bedroom 19 units, and we're building a relationship, but it is 20 important, it's important, Jordan, that HPD keeps its 21 word and keeps its commitment, you know, if-if-if you 2.2 want us to continue to trust, you know this relate-23 ore continue to move forward on this relationship with HPD and the Council. 24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS

10

Thank you for that and I-I 2 JORDAN PRESS: 3 fully agree as I've said privately, and I'm happy to 4 say publicly, we certainly acknowledge the mistake here. I believe it was rare. I have spoken to staff 5 to make every effort to make sure it does not happen 6 7 again with this Council. I'm-I'm also glad that we 8 were able to resolve this, and appreciate working 9 with you on it. I-I think Gito was wanting to mention a couple of items, but I am glad that in the 10 11 end result and-and I hope we can rebuild that trust. 12 That-that part of the end result is additional 13 affordable units for-for your district and for the city, and so I hope that's on the happy side of what 14 15 was an unfortunate mistake on our end, which-which 16 again, I offer our apologies for, and-and we've had 17 conversations to make sure it won't happen again.

18 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: And just so the 19 developer knows, your application will be voted on 20 today, but because HPD is hesitant on adding what we 21 agreed to, on the Resolution, it's going to be rolled 22 back to the next committee meeting that we are going 23 to have. Alright, with that, any-any questions from 24 my committee members? It's Council Member Treyger.

25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS

1

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: So, I-I just 3 want to first of all to-to residents and my 4 colleagues, the Chairman of this committee, you are 5 really fortunate to have someone who was serving the role as a District Manager in his-in his community 6 7 board, and now, moved on to become the Council Member 8 because this is where the nuts and bolts of community 9 work really matter, someone who stays on top of all these things and makes sure that whatever is promised 10 11 to a community has to be kept. And as the-as my 12 colleagues and the Administration knows, there is 13 significant distrust in communities particularly when 14 it comes to develop-developers. In my district, 15 there was a whole documentary on how the city in the 16 past rezoned areas of Coney Island, re-zonings 17 happened and then properties were flipped in the name 18 of profit rather than in the name of trying to help 19 really meet the needs of-of my constituents. So-but 20 when you have the agency itself involved in this, it 21 really does not speak well, but I acknowledge and I 2.2 appreciate the fact that HPD came here today, and 23 acknowledged that they are owning this mistake, but we have to fix it, and whatever was promised the 24 25 people has to be kept. This was-ULURP is a very

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 12 2 sacred process where we engaged the public, as you 3 know, from the community board to Borough Hall to 4 City Planning, you know, to here. So, it's important 5 that's we-that we-we keep-we keep our word. I also want to note as my-as the Chairman mentioned that I 6 7 know the city is in desperate need of affordable 8 housing, but as I said before in previous other types 9 of hearings, people are not sardines. They need quality affordable housing, and they're not robots. 10 11 They are human, they have families and they have 12 needs. So, we need to do all that we can to not just 13 box them into a small little space, but to give them 14 livable space, to place-you know, the same room 15 should not be the same room where they shower, eat and sleep. They should have some rooms for kids and 16 17 family. So, I-I really commend the Chair for really 18 speaking up for his district this way, and also 19 educating us about what could happen when people 20 circumvent the rules and-and here we are telling our 21 residents to trust the process when the process itself has been circumvented here. So, I-I commend 2.2 23 you, Chair, for your leadership for your district, but also educating the entire city of New York about 24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 13 2 what-what happened to you. So, I just want to just 3 publicly say that. 4 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Thank you, Council Member. I just want to recognize that we've 5 been joined by Council Member Darlene Mealy. Thank 6 7 you. Do you want to say a statement? Yes, go ahead. 8 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Yes, I just would 9 like to concur with my colleague here also, and thank you Salamanca for your leadership knowing that we do 10 11 need affordable housing. The trend now is getgetting studio apartments, but our families who still 12 13 live here and hadn't been gentrified still have two and three children. So, we do need the 2 and 3-14 15 bedroom apartments, and some 4-bedrooms apartments. 16 So, I'm glad that you're taking a leadership in this, 17 and just some-put it on hold, and get what was 18 promised to the-your district, and I appreciate your 19 leadership. Thank you. 20 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Thank you, Council Member, and with that, are there any members-21 2.2 --? [background comments] 23 JORDAN PRESS: Yeah, I just wanted to add one thing and, you know, I-I hear and I echo your 24 concerns, Council Member and--and other Council 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 14 2 Members and, you know, I just want to speak to-to 3 this project's credit. You know, we-we certainly 4 acknowledge and realize that this was kind of a unique situation when you have a change of 5 development. The one thing that I can say with 100% 6 7 certainly is that everybody in this room, you know, 8 did act in good faith and did ask with best 9 intentions. I think everybody clearly sees, you know, it's unfortunate you had a situation where you 10 11 had a change of some members of the development team and not in others, and we took everything that we 12 13 were aware of, and that we could be made aware of, and wanted to continue the action because we 14 15 appreciate that ULURP is a sacred process. In this 16 particular case, obviously we went ahead, and we did 17 a technical amendment with City Planning. You know, 18 obviously we make sure-you know, we value the-the 19 fact that there is a significant amount of affordable 20 housing being built in this district and in this 21 project. We understand it needs to be quality 2.2 affordable housing, you know, but again, I-I think 23 we're just glad that we were able to get to a resolution here today, and we look forward to 24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 15 continuing to work with your office, Council Member 2 3 Salamanca and continuing to build that relationship. 4 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Thank you, thank Now, with that said, are there any more members 5 you. of the public who wish to testify? Alright, seeing 6 7 none, I will close the public hearing on LU 604. The second and fourth items on the calendar are the Dream 8 9 Yards and the NEP Application, LU 617 and 619, and these applications are both in the Morrisania 10 11 neighborhood in the Bronx. Article 11 Tax Exemptions 12 for a period of 40 years will facilitate the 13 preservation of a six multi-family building totaling 127 units of affordable rental housing on 168th 14 15 Street, and a six multi-family building totaling 174 16 units of affordable rental housing on University Avenue. These applications are in Council Member 17 Gibson's district and in Council Member Cabreara's 18 19 I am now opening up the public hearing on district. 20 LU 617 and 619, the Dreams-the Dreams Yards NEP 21 Application. 2.2 JORDAN PRESS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. 23 Again, my name is Jordan Press, Executive Director for Development and Planning in HPD's Government 24

Affairs Unit. I am joined by staff from HPD's Year

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 16 15 Program and from the-from the developer. 2 Land Use 3 No. 617 and 619 consists of two six-building portfolios located in two exemption areas. 4 The 5 buildings were originally approved for disposition by the City Council in 1998 and 2002 under HPD's 6 7 Neighborhood Entrepreneur Program or NEP. Land Use No. 617 is currently owned by 168th Street 8 Development, LP, and the locations are 380 East 166th 9 Street; 391 and 393 East 168th Street; 1109 Clay 10 Avenue; 320 East 166th Street; 274 East 168th Street 11 in Bronx Council District 16. These properties 12 received UDAAP approval from the City Council in 13 2002. Land Use No. 619 is currently owned by 14 15 University Avenue, LP, and the locations are 1668 Davidson Avenue; 1691 Davidson Avenue; 1978 16 17 University Avenue; 1696 Nelson Avenue; 30 Buchanan 18 Place; and 201 University Avenue in Bronx Council 19 District 14. These properties received UDAAP Council approval from the City Council in 1998. Currently, 20 the two portfolios will be combined and conveyed to a 21 single entity known as Dream Yard NEP Housing 2.2 23 Development Fund Corporation. The sponsor proposes to refinance and rehabilitate the buildings under 24 HPD's Year 15 Preservation Program. In total, there 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 17 are 301 units of rental housing with very few 2 3 vacancies. There is a mixture of unit types including studios 1, 2, 3 and 4-bedroom apartments. 4 Rents range from \$672 for a studio to \$1,044 for a 4-5 bedroom unit plus a superintendent units. 6 The 7 current land restrictions and income restrictions are at 50%, 60% and 165% of AMI, and will remain in place 8 9 until January 1, 2035, which is when the existing tax credit extended use period expires. After January 1, 10 11 2035, the AMIs for the entire 12-building portfolio will be restricted to 40%, 50%, 60%, 80% and 165% of 12 13 Additionally, 10% of the units will be set AMI. 14 aside for homeless households. The anticipated scope 15 of work includes additional protective membranes on 16 top of all existing roofs, window replacements, door 17 replacements, façade repair, kitchen and bathroom 18 fixture replacements where necessary, common area 19 energy efficient lighting upgrades and replacement of 20 exceeding-existing heating systems. Currently, HPD is before the Council seeking an Article 11 tax 21 exemption that will coincide with the new 40-year 2.2 23 Regulatory Agreement. The tax benefit will help maintain the affordability of the units, and I'd like 24 to add that Council Members Cabrera and Gibson have 25

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 18 |
|----|---|
| 2 | both indicated their support for the project. At |
| 3 | this time, if the Council has any questions, I'd like |
| 4 | to invite my-my colleagues to join. |
| 5 | CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Okay. |
| 6 | JORDAN PRESS: For the purposes of |
| 7 | helping to answer any questions. So, do they have a |
| 8 | statement? |
| 9 | JORDAN PRESS: No. |
| 10 | CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: No. Alright, |
| 11 | thank you. So, Jordan, my-in talking to Land-the |
| 12 | Land Use Division and in talking to my colleagues, |
| 13 | Council Member Cabrera and Council Member Gibson, |
| 14 | there's concerns about the AMIs. You have 32 units |
| 15 | at 50% AMI; 64 units at 60% AMI and 31 units at 165% |
| 16 | AMIs. I know that in your first proposal it was |
| 17 | pretty high, 165, which I think is at market value, |
| 18 | and your second proposal again that HPD is proposing |
| 19 | you have these units at 165% AMI. So that's for |
| 20 | Dream Yards on 168 th Street, and so the question is |
| 21 | why? Why—why are you going so high on the AMI if |
| 22 | there is really no market for it? |
| 23 | KERRY LEBOTZ: Hello, my name is Kerry |
| 24 | LeBotz. I'm the Director of the Year 15 Program at |
| 25 | HD-HPD. Just to respond to your questions, if I'm |
| | |

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 19 able to pitch in after that. So, these two 2 3 portfolios were originally financed under the NEP 4 program. That project-these were proposed 15 years ago with HPD financing the place and with the tax 5 credits at that time. The structure of the NEP 6 7 program allowed a 25% tier at 165% AMI. In part, 8 this was put into place to sort of allow the maximum 9 flexibility across multiple boroughs through multiple rounds of NEP, and the 165 tier was put in place in 10 11 order not to cap any specific project at that time, and help cross-subsidize the lower tier units. 12 Ι 13 will say in this project going forward, and as it 14 exists right now. Well, excuse me. I will say on 15 this project as it exists right now that no tenants 16 currently pay 165% AMI. The highest AMI in place is 17 approximately 80% AMI and all the units are fully 18 occupied. So, tenants receive preferential rents, 19 and upon turnover, there preferential rents and the 20 legal rents will be-the increases will be restricted 21 by RGB increases. In addition, 90% of the units are 2.2 further restricted by home. (sic) So really at the 23 end of the day, right now all we have is kind of 10% tier that may go up to 165, but the rents are in 24 25 place and the tenants that are in place the project

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 20 is not reaching that 165 tier. We've also kind of 2 3 going forward and in negotiations with Bronx Pro added an additional tier of 40% AMI, and you-and this 4 is to speak not only wanting to preserve a lower tier 5 going forward, but I also do want to point out that 6 7 almost 40% of the tenants in place have a 40% rent. 8 The bulk of the-the tenants in place do receive and 9 do have very low preferential rents. 10 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright, well, 11 we've been in conversations with Council Member 12 Cabrera and Council Member Gibson, and they are 13 expressing concerns about the high-the-- high amount 14 of units that can go up to 165% especially with the 15 conversations of the Jerome Avenue rezoning there, 16 and the-and the resistance from community members in 17 terms of wanting deeper affordability. So, it is my 18 understanding that this project, too, is going to be 19 laid over for another date. Is there any-my-my 20 colleagues, do you guys have any questions. 21 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I concur with you. 2.2 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Well, that-23 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Could I ask a question? 24 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: 25 Yes.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 21 2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: You said that they 3 put the cap there of 165 of AMI. They just put it 4 there that since it go across all state and city, that doesn't mean that you have to now put this cap 5 on your project. Is it not true? 6 7 KERRY LEBOTZ: [interposing] Well-COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: You go to 165 AMI 8 9 out. KERRY LEBOTZ: I-I think that there is a 10 11 couple of points to clarify. First that the 165% of 12 AMI will stay in place for the next 15 years. This 13 is a Year 15 project, which would--14 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [interposing] Yes, 15 and that's just a-a place to start justifying and all 16 of a sudden people's rents or they start harassing 17 Not saying it's you, but just for the city out them. 18 here, and that's how you start doing certain things 19 to tenants, and then you, they get out, and once that 20 apartment is available, the rents go up. But, I'm 21 just asking you as a developer or doing this project, 2.2 you really don't have to put this AMI. If you work 23 with the Council Member, that 165 AMI need not to even be here. It was only a standpoint to put there 24 25 like a stopper across the whole state AMI. You said

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 22 |
|----|--|
| 2 | that. So, therefore, it's not necessary that you |
| 3 | have that, and in the Bronx, I know it shouldn't be |
| 4 | that expensive. That's one place I know it shouldn't |
| 5 | be that expensive the AMI. So correct me if I'm |
| 6 | wrong, Chair Salamanca. I feel like the Bronx, the |
| 7 | AMIs is that a good price—a good AMI at least 60 and |
| 8 | no more than 80% or 90. |
| 9 | JORDAN PRESS: [interposing] So, yeah- |
| 10 | COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: 165 is really |
| 11 | high. |
| 12 | SAMANTHA MAGISTRO: Sorry, I—I just want |
| 13 | to speak. My name is Samantha Magistro. I'm a |
| 14 | Principal at Bronx Pro. I'm been involved with these |
| 15 | properties during-even when they were originally |
| 16 | created as affordable housing. You know, where we |
| 17 | were with the 165% if AMI, they do actually serve the |
| 18 | market. The rents are at moderate income, and to |
| 19 | your point, we don't—we can't have moderate, at 165% |
| 20 | of AMI rent supported here. Folks can't pay that, |
| 21 | but what I find that these units do provide is the |
| 22 | flexibility for folks who don't fit into a bucket. |
| 23 | We work with many, many individuals who come into our |
| 24 | doors in the Bronx. We have close-we have 900 units |
| 25 | in this Community Board 5. We know it very well. We |
| | |

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 23 |
|----|--|
| 2 | have 2,500 mostly Overture (sic) financing in the |
| 3 | Bronx and those are folks who don't fall into very a |
| 4 | very specific AMI bucket, and so when I have this |
| 5 | flexibility, and I have a placea family that I |
| 6 | can't place because their income doesn't meet a |
| 7 | certain threshold, these 165% AMI units have been |
| 8 | able to house them, and we don't charge market-rents |
| 9 | that are outside of the market, and that's been our |
| 10 | experience for the last 15 years, and I imagine |
| 11 | that's what they will provide for this community. |
| 12 | COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [off mic] It's |
| 13 | been on those. (sic) |
| 14 | CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright, okay. |
| 15 | Well thank you very much. I guess we will-this-this |
| 16 | item application, too, will be labeled for-for a vote |
| 17 | when we meet again. With that said, are there any |
| 18 | more members of the public who wish to testify? |
| 19 | Alright, seeing none, I will close the public hearing |
| 20 | on LU 617 and 619. The third item on the calendar |
| 21 | for hearing is LU 618 regarding a 40-year property |
| 22 | tax exemption on Article 11 for property located at |
| 23 | 287 West 150^{th} Street in Manhattan. This would |
| 24 | facilitate the preservation of a multi-family |
| 25 | building with 20 units of affordable rental housing |
| | |

CONCESSIONS in Hamilton Heights. This project is in Council 2 3 Member Perkins District, and I am now opening up the public hearing on LU 618, the 287 West 150th Street 4 Application. 5

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND

1

JORDAN PRESS: Good afternoon. Again, my 6 7 name is Jordan Press, Executive Director for Development and Planning in HPD's Government Affairs 8 9 Unit. I'm joined for the purposes of answering any questions by Nelson Chan, who's the Director of our 10 11 third-party transfer program. Land Use No. 618 12 consists of the propose approval of extended Article 11 tax benefits for a Third Party Transfer Program 13 located at 287 West 150th Street. The building 14 consists of five stories with 20 rental units in 15 16 Manhattan Council District 9. Under Round 2 of the 17 Third Party Transfer Program, the Commissioner of 18 Finance included this parcel in an in rem foreclosure 19 action No. 41, which was approved in 2001 by the City 20 Council and transferred to Neighborhood Restore, HDFC. After title transfer of this largely occupied 21 walk-up building, the tenants association informed 2.2 23 HPD that the occupants were too ill and/or too disabled to be checker boarded in the building and 24 live through an in-place renovation. Therefore, 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 25 after much consideration, it was determined that the 2 3 tenants will be permanently relocated into the adjacent building at 285 West 150th Street, which was 4 5 to be conveyed to the same sponsor that owns 287 West 150-West 150th Street. For making that determination 6 7 a number of delays occurred. First the 8 rehabilitation of the adjacent building was delayed 9 because of title issues. Specifically, it was brought to HPD's attention that the adjacent property 10 11 along with two additional buildings shared the same tax lot, requiring a subdivision. 12 Therefore, title transfer of the adjacent property did not occur until 13 December 2007, and the rehabilitation did not 14 15 complete until 2009. Subsequently, the tenants began 16 to move into the adjacent property allowing for the 17 rehabilitation of this property to begin. 287 West 150th has now undergone substantial rehabilitation. 18 19 The work included replacement of all the operating 20 systems including heating, plumbing, electric and water as well as a new roof. The construction loan 21 closing occurred on June, 2013. At this time, the 2.2 23 building is partially occupied with 13 units currently rented. The balance is being marketed and 24 all units are rent stabilized. It's anticipated that 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 26 rents will be between 50% and 90% of AMI. 2 Currently, 3 the sponsor is converting to their permanent loan, 4 and it is necessary to seek a new Article 11 Tax Exemption that will coincide with the new 40-year 5 Regulatory Agreement. Council Member Perkins has 6 7 been briefed and has indicated his support for the 8 project. 9 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Okav. Also, I just want to acknowledge that I did, yeah, last night 10 11 I received a letter from Council Member Perkins in 12 support of the project. I don't-I don't have any 13 questions. Any questions from the committee? No. 14 Alright, so are there-is there anyone from the public 15 who wishes to testify on this application. No. 16 Alright, seeing none, I will now close the public 17 hearing on LU 618. Items 5 through 9 on today's 18 calendar are known as the South Eastern Queens Vacant 19 Homes, NYCHA Cluster 1 through 5. These items LU 620 20 through 624 were reviewed and approved by the Council 21 in September of last year. However, a technical 2.2 correction is required. Originally, the commencement 23 date of the tax exemption was supposed to run from the later of a specific date ore the date that the 24 25 sponsor signed an enforcement mortgage. Rather than

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 27 |
|----|---|
| 2 | an enforcement mortgage, the sponsor will sign |
| 3 | financial documents. The language of our resolution |
| 4 | will be updated to reflect these changes. Cluster 1 |
| 5 | is in Council Member Ferreras-Copeland's district. |
| 6 | Cluster 2 is in Council Member Garodnick's district. |
| 7 | Cluster 3 is in Council Member Lancman's district. |
| 8 | Cluster 4 is in Council Member Miller's district, and |
| 9 | Cluster 5 is in Council Member Richard's district. I |
| 10 | am now opening up the public hearing on LUs 620 |
| 11 | through 624, Southern-Southern Eastern Queens Vacant |
| 12 | Homes NYCHA clusters 1 through 5. |
| 13 | JORDAN PRESS: Good afternoon. My name is |
| 14 | Jordan Press, Executive Director for Planning and |
| 15 | Development in HPD's Government Affairs Unit. I'm |
| 16 | joined for the purposes of answering any questions |
| 17 | you might have by Naja Radcliff from our Small Homes |
| 18 | Program and by Sal Davola from Neighborhood Restored. |
| 19 | Land Use Nos. 620, 621, 622, 623 and 624 consists of |
| 20 | technical corrections to resolutions approved by the |
| 21 | City Council on September 28, 2016, which were |
| 22 | Resolutions No. 1236, 1237, 1238, 1258 and 1239. |
| 23 | HPD's original submission incorrectly indicated tax |
| 24 | benefits would commence either on January 1 st or July |
| 25 | 1 st after the sponsor acquires the exemption area or |
| | |

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 28 enter into an enforcement mortgage with our-with HPD. 2 3 However, the sponsor purchased the properties from 4 the New York City Housing Authority, NYCHA, and not HPD. It was not HPD's intention to include language 5 regarding enforcement mortgages. At this time HPD is 6 7 seeking a technical correction to each item approved on September 28, 2016 that deletes such language from 8 9 the resolutions. All other terms of the original resolutions remain unchanged. Council Members 10 11 Miller, Ferreras-Copeland, Lancman, Grodenchik and Richards have been advised of the need for the 12 13 correction and my understanding is they are 14 supportive. 15 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Thank you, Mr. 16 Press. I don't have any questions. Any questions 17 from the members of the committee? Just want to 18 recognize that we've been joined by Council Member 19 Ydanis Rodriguez. Are there any members of the 20 public who wish to testify? Alright, seeing now, I 21 will now close the public hearing on LUs 620 through 624. We will not move onto a vote to approve 618, 2.2 23 287 West 150th Street, and LU 620 through 624, NYCHA Clusters which are supported by the Council Members 24 in whose district the sites are located. LU 604, 617 25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND 1 CONCESSIONS 29 2 and 619 are being laid over, and with that said, 3 Counsel, please call the vote to approve. 4 LEGAL COUNSEL: Chair Salamanca. 5 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Aye on all. LEGAL COUNSEL: Council Member Mealy. 6 7 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I vote aye. LEGAL COUNSEL: Council Member Rodriguez. 8 9 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye. LEGAL COUNSEL: Council Member Treyger. 10 11 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye. 12 LEGAL COUNSEL: By a vote of 4 in the 13 affirmative, 0 in the negative and 0 abstentions, 14 Land Use Items 618 and 620 through 624 are approved 15 and referred to the full Land Use Committee. 16 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Thank you. Ι 17 would like to recognize that we've been joined by 18 Chair Greenfield. Mr. Chair, do-would you like to 19 say a statement. 20 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: No, I 21 wouldn't. 2.2 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Good, alright. 23 [background comments] Okay, so we are going to keep the vote open for ten minutes. With that, thank you. 24 25 [pause]

| 1 | SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 30 |
|----|--|
| 2 | LEGAL COUNSEL: Continued vote on |
| 3 | Planning Subcommittee, approval of Item-Land Use |
| 4 | Items 618 and 620 through 624. Council Member Cohen. |
| 5 | COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I vote aye. |
| 6 | LEGAL COUNSEL: The final vote stands are |
| 7 | 5 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and 0 |
| 8 | abstentions and all items are referred to the full |
| 9 | Land Use Committee. [gavel] |
| 10 | |
| 11 | |
| 12 | |
| 13 | |
| 14 | |
| 15 | |
| 16 | |
| 17 | |
| 18 | |
| 19 | |
| 20 | |
| 21 | |
| 22 | |
| 23 | |
| 24 | |
| 25 | |
| | ll de la constant de |

CERTIFICATE

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date May 30, 20017