

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

----- X

March 28, 2016
Start: 10:11 a.m.
Recess: 3:03 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- DANIEL R. GARODNICK
- COSTA G. CONSTANTINIDES
- JAMES VACCA
- MARGARET S. CHIN
- STEPHEN T. LEVIN
- DEBORAH L. ROSE
- JAMES G. VAN BRAMER
- DAVID KELLER G. GREENFIELD
- DONOVAN J. RICHARDS
- COSTA G. CONSTANTINIDES
- CARLOS MENCHACA
- I. DANEEK MILLER
- ANTONIO REYNOSO

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Polly Trottenberg
Commissioner of New York City Department of
Transportation

Joseph Jarrin
Executive Deputy Commissioner for Strategic and
Agency Services

Rebecca Zack
Acting Assistant Commissioner of
Intergovernmental and Community Affairs

Michael Chubak
Chief Financial Officer for New York City Transit

David Keller
Senior Deputy Director for MTA Budget

Stephanie DeLisle
Director of MTA Capital Funding

Meera Joshi
Commissioner and Chair of the New York City Taxi
And Limousine Commission

Dianna Pegnetti
Chief of Enforcement

Eric McClure
Executive Director of StreetPAC

Julie Kite
Policy and Research Manager for Transportation
Alternatives

Nick Sifuentes
Deputy Director of the Riders Alliance

Reverend Clayton Brooks
Director of Advocacy at Covenant House

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Melissa Del Valle Ortiz
Tenant Leader of Sunset Parks Project Based
Section 8 Housing for 411

Kiya Vega-Hutchens
Climate Justice Policy Organizer at UPROSE

Rich Conroy
Director of Education at Bike New York

Verna Duberry
Bedford Stuy Restoration

Omar Arias
Supporter of Citi Bike

Shaquana Boykin
New York City Public Housing Resident and Citi
Bike Member

Jeff Orlick
Resident of Queens, New York

David Beier
President of Committee for Taxi Safety

Mark Wiltshire
Community Engagement Associate at Per Scholas

Kweli Campbell
Citi Bike Member from Brooklyn, New York

Joanna Oltman Smith
Safe Streets Advocate in New York

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Good morning everyone and welcome to the city council transportation hearing on the Fiscal Year 2018 Preliminary Budget and FY '17 Mayor's Management Report. My name is Ydanis Rodriguez and I am the Chair of this committee. We are joined by Council Member Vacca and Menchaca. Today we are here to discuss the budget of the Department of... Department of Transportation, the Taxi and Limousine Commission and the Metropolitan Transportation Commission. Through this process, we hope to finish with, with a budget that reflects our New York values, a budget that is progressive, responsible and ensures all New Yorkers have the... an opportunity to succeed regardless of background or beliefs. We know that recent conversations in Washington has sought to humble cities across the country including our own, they aim to cut services to, to our most vulnerable and deprive us of important resources for standing up for hard working immigrants coming here to find a better life. The budget we forward this year must reflect our desire to lift up those in need and bring equity to communities across the five boroughs. I

1 stand ready and committed to support this goal and I
2 know my colleagues in government feel the same
3 especially with the leadership that we have in Mayor
4 DE Blasio and Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.
5 Transportation is unique in its ability to be a
6 social equalizer, the ability for residents to move
7 with ease from... ease from home to work, school, or
8 doctor's office, museums, and more is what sets us
9 apart, apart from cities across the country. We are
10 so fortunate to have networks of roads, rails, bike
11 lanes and soon over our water, water ways easing
12 access to these great services for more New Yorkers
13 can help boost our residents and their ability to
14 compete in a growing economy. I'm eager to hear from
15 our commissioner from the Department of
16 Transportation, later on from Taxi and Limousine
17 Commissioner as well as from the Head of the MTA, New
18 York City Transit about what we are doing and what
19 more we can do to move our New Yorkers in more and
20 faster ways. We will start by hearing testimony from
21 the City's Department of Transportation followed by
22 the MTA, the Taxi and Limousine Commission and the
23 public. The DOT Preliminary Operating Budget is for
24 FY '18 is approximately 957 million along with 2.8
25

1 billion for the Departments Capital Program. We are
2 interested to hear today about the DOT's plans for
3 renovations to, to important infrastructures, the
4 ongoing progress being made with Vision Zero already
5 signed project and how the city is tackling some
6 persistent challenges when it comes to congestion and
7 road repairs. We are also interested in hearing how
8 discussions are going when it comes to expanding the
9 city's bike share program. As has been discussed and
10 majority of the council members are supporting of
11 public funding for a system growing in popularity
12 that brings an affordable efficient and healthy
13 option. In order to keep expanding into more areas
14 underserved by our public transit system. According
15 to a recent report by NYU Rudin Center we have
16 learned that bike share is ride... ridden most, mostly
17 by New Yorkers that is hoped to solve the last mile
18 problem when transit doesn't reach and it is
19 unfortunately remained... and it unfortunately remains
20 mostly concentrated in the city's more affluent areas.
21 Following in the footsteps about every city in
22 America providing public funding for this public good
23 can bring greater equity to the network and expand is
24 reached into more communities across the city. The
25

1
2 DOT has done a great job of growing our city's
3 network of bike lanes including protected bike lanes
4 so that more riders are safer from the speeding
5 drivers. The goal of increasing the number of, of
6 cyclists in our city are important and expanding city
7 bike will go a long way towards achieving them. I
8 urge the administration to get these in the budget
9 this year so that we do not see a pause in plans for
10 expansion. Following the DOT we will hear from the
11 MTA whose operating budget for calling of year 2017
12 its balance and whose recently bought on 2015-2019
13 capital program it stands at 29 billion dollars
14 however we remain concerned that recent changes in
15 the state's proposed budget have removed 67 million
16 dollars originally expected from the state commitment
17 to replace funding for originally supporter by the
18 mandate... amend payroll mobility tax. This important
19 funding could have served to blunt the cost of... to
20 riders from recent fear in increase or account for
21 the uncertainty we face in Washington. We hope to
22 hear from the agency if conversation with the
23 governor's office has been taking place to ensure
24 that this reduction is restored in the final budget
25 as our riders are counting on it. It is my view that

1
2 the MTA can in short take advantage of, of new or
3 improved revenue extremes to ensure a more
4 sustainable budget and to cover the cost of mounting
5 deaths with greater ease. Aside from the move New
6 York Plan... sorry, the MTA can also look to its
7 extensive real estate holding for development.
8 Additionally, I have proposed developing a public
9 private partnership in which private partners can
10 adopt an extension... a station to cover the cost of
11 station maintenance while returning as close safe
12 advertising rights in this space. Other ideas include
13 additional digital advertising and greater oversight
14 of our capital projects to ensure fewer calls and a
15 schedule of runs. We can and must do more to ensure
16 budget and net balance on the backs of riders. I'm
17 glad to hear that the MTA has begun to use this time
18 build on its most recent construction project for
19 station renovations. This is a proper method in
20 saving time and funding and can ensure project that
21 deliver more efficiently. I also hope the state
22 legislature can continue to support this important
23 procurement method and expand their authority to our
24 city agency to use it as well. We are also interested
25 in hearing from plans are coming along with some of

1 the MTA's major projects including Eastside Access
2 Phase two or the 2nd Avenue subway, the train station
3 access project and efforts to open new metro north
4 station in the Bronx. Finally, we would like to hear
5 about plans for a pilot program to modernize a
6 troubled access, access ride program which cost the
7 MTA half a billion dollars per year. I want to
8 reiterate my call for the... to the MTA to ensure that
9 yellow and green cars are considered for this pilot
10 program as they remain the only accessible for hire
11 vehicles on our streets crucial, crucial to our
12 disabled riders who often rely on access ride
13 services. Following the MTA we will hear from the
14 Taxi and Limousine Commission whose preliminary
15 budget sits at 58.2 million dollars for... in FY '18.
16 We hope to hear about plans to implement the citywide
17 accessible dispatch system and how, how efforts to
18 issue a street hail liberate license for the outer
19 boroughs are progressing. We are also interested in
20 the commissions efforts to enforce against illegal...
21 illegally operating vehicles on our streets, a
22 perpetual concern for all TSE licensed drivers. I
23 want to reinforce my earlier statement about the
24 importance for the planned access ride pilots program
25

1
2 under discussion to include accessible TSE licensed
3 vehicle rather than simply relying upon a non-
4 accessible vehicle that will not serve the need of
5 access ride users. Finally, we would like to hear
6 about the commissions progress in getting more
7 accessible vehicles on the road so that no New
8 Yorkers are left behind in our transportation system.
9 Lastly, an issue that has been at the forefront of my
10 policy agenda is ensuring that this budget include
11 funding for what is widely known as Fair right...
12 Fares. This effort to support our poorest residents
13 with a lifeline they need to move about, find work,
14 attend classes and more is not only noble, it is
15 necessary and the city has the opportunity to lead
16 this initiative. We cannot continue to leave our most
17 financially vulnerable residents disconnected from
18 the service they are... they need the most. I know many
19 of my colleagues share this sentiment and I want to
20 work with all of... all of them and as also to work
21 together with our friend, Mayor De Blasio who has
22 said that he believed in the merit of this
23 initiative. Now before we hear from the DOT let me
24 make a, a moment to thank my committee staff, Shema
25 Overture and Brandon Weise from the finance team,

1 Jonathan Mosarano, Emily Rooney as well as my staff
2 Jose Lewis, Chief of Staff Jose Lewis and my
3 legislative communication, Russell Murphy. Thank you.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Do you affirm to tell
5 the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth
6 in your testimony before this committee and to
7 respond honestly to council member questions?

8 POLLY TROTTEBERG: You ready for me?

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: If you don't mind
10 let me also recognize the other members who are here;
11 Lander, Chin and Rose.

12 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Okay, thank you Mr.
13 Chairman. Good morning Chairman Rodriguez and members
14 of the Transportation Committee. I'm Polly
15 Trottenberg, Commissioner of the New York City
16 Department of Transportation. With me today are
17 Joseph Jarrin, Executive Deputy Commissioner for
18 Strategic and Agency Services and Rebecca Zack,
19 Acting Assistant Commissioner of Intergovernmental
20 and Community Affairs. I am pleased to be here today
21 on behalf of Mayor Bill De Blasio testifying on DOT's
22 Fiscal Year 2018 Preliminary Budget and our Ten-Year
23 Capital Strategy. The Mayor's FY '18 Preliminary
24 Budget allocates resources for critical needs such as
25

1
2 protecting public safety, improving schools,
3 increasing housing affordability, and investing in
4 infrastructure. While maintaining unprecedented
5 reserves, this budget makes targeted investments,
6 some of which I will be talking about today. At the
7 same time, the Mayor's Preliminary Budget also
8 identifies 1.1 billion in savings with a goal of 500
9 million more in additional savings for the Executive
10 budget. For DOT this builds on our agency's
11 accomplishments over the last three years. It will
12 enable us to continue executing our core goals of
13 pursuing Vision Zero, enhancing mobility, and
14 maintaining and investing in our infrastructure.
15 While I walk through DOT's proposed budget this
16 morning, I want to highlight our growing list of
17 accomplishments over the past few years, as well as
18 acknowledge the challenges we face as we grow. I'll
19 also discuss our continuing efforts to find
20 efficiencies and make the most out of every taxpayer
21 dollar, whether we're rolling out neighborhood safety
22 improvements or executing major infrastructure
23 projects. DOT's workload is being expanded by two
24 major forces. First, as our city continues to grow we
25 are making historic investments in infrastructure,

1 with a focus on Vision Zero and state of good repair.
2 To do that we're upping our game, both in the sheer
3 volume of capital projects we are delivering and the
4 pace of all our work. For the first time ever we
5 committed over 1.1 billion from our capital plan for
6 two consecutive years. And the city has proposed a
7 10-year capital plan of 17.2 billion for DOT, for a
8 total increase of 7.2 billion under this Mayor. This
9 almost doubles the size of our plan for street
10 reconstruction from 1.7 billion to 3.1 billion,
11 allowing DOT to build out more street safety projects
12 and increases our plan for bridge reconstruction and
13 rehabilitation by 88 percent from 4.9 billion to 9.2
14 billion. And this past year we completed 105 street
15 improvement projects, doubled the pre-Vision Zero
16 annual average, and installed a record 18.5 miles of
17 protected bike lanes, nearly triple the pre-Vision
18 Zero average. The second factor in our growth in this
19 age of social media, with easy to use tools like web
20 forms and increased public engagement, we've seen
21 exponential growth in the number of incoming requests
22 of all kinds from the public and elected officials.
23 As an example, after typically receiving about 1,000
24 to 1,200 signal requests annually in the pre-Vision
25

1
2 Zero years, DOT now receives over 2,300 requests
3 annually, a figure that continues to grow by about
4 five percent each year. Each of these requests
5 necessitates labor-intensive surveys and assessments
6 by our engineering staff. At the same time, other,
7 other public requests, whether they come by 311 or
8 through our correspondence unit, have all grown
9 dramatically as well. When it comes to participatory
10 budgeting, in 2011, when the program began, just four
11 Council Members participated. This year that number
12 had grown to 31. The chance to educate and engage
13 delegates about DOT's process is valuable, and of
14 course we appreciate the public support and funding
15 that projects receive. But here again, while the
16 Participatory Budgeting process has improved every
17 year, the sheer number of projects DOT must now scope
18 and coordinate with delegates and Council Members to
19 place on the ballots has skyrocketed. This year DOT
20 conducted approximately 190 proposed project reviews.
21 DOT operates and manages a transportation network
22 that New Yorkers and visitors use each day; roads,
23 sidewalks, bridges, bike lanes, street signs,
24 signals, streetlighting, and the Staten Island Ferry.
25 As the city's third largest capital agency, DOT's

1
2 proposed 17, 17.2-billion-dollar Capital Plan for
3 Fiscal Year '17 through '27 includes; 9.2 billion for
4 bridge reconstruction and rehabilitation, five
5 billion for street reconstruction and resurfacing,
6 1.3 billion for sidewalk and pedestrian ramp repair
7 and reconstruction, 704 million for the Staten Island
8 Ferry, 668 million for streetlights and signals, and
9 399 million for the facilities and equipment needed
10 to support DOT operations. Additionally, in DOT's FY
11 '18 Expense Budget, the Mayor is proposing 957
12 million for operations, including some critical new
13 funding; 252 million for traffic operations,
14 including signals, streetlights, and parking; 206
15 million for roadway maintenance, 201 million for DOT
16 operations, including sidewalk management and
17 inspection; 104 million for bridge maintenance and
18 inspection, 103 million for transportation planning
19 and management, including installation of street
20 signs and roadway markings, and 91 million for ferry
21 operations and maintenance. I want to thank you
22 Chairman Rodriguez and members of the committee for
23 your leadership and support on Vision Zero. I was
24 proud to stand with you Mr. Chairman and the Mayor at
25 the foot of the Brooklyn Bridge last week as we

1 kicked off the spring construction season. It's hard
2 to believe that three years ago this week, we were
3 hosting the first Vision Zero Town Halls across the
4 City, hearing from our constituents and setting
5 ambitious goals. In the last three years, we've seen
6 a 23 percent in traffic fatalities on our City
7 streets and we're bucking the national trend, where
8 fatalities tragically climbed 14 percent in the same
9 period. New York's progress is a strong indication
10 that our strategy is making a real difference and I'm
11 grateful for our partnership, it has saved lives.
12 DOT's proposed Expense and Capital Budgets include an
13 unprecedented ten-year 2.4-billion-dollar commitment
14 to Vision Zero. This includes 495 million in new
15 capital funds and 7.2 million in new expense funds in
16 the current fiscal year, rising to 21.1 million by
17 fiscal year '21. This funding will enable us to
18 better maintain our street markings, continue our
19 left turn traffic calming initiative, upgrade key
20 intersections in the bike network, and install
21 streetlight enhancements. We are particularly
22 enthusiastic about our funding for street markings
23 growing from the current level of 28 million all the
24 way to 43 million in fiscal year '21. With this
25

1 funding, DOT will implement a new high visibility
2 crosswalk standard city-wide and refresh our markings
3 an average of every four and a half years, up from
4 six, while continuing our ambitious pace of safety
5 projects. We will also continue crucial street
6 reconstruction this year including two new phases of
7 our Vision Zero Great Streets Program; Phase Three of
8 the Grand Concourse, from East 171st Street to East
9 175th Street; and Phase One of Atlantic Avenue, from
10 Georgia Avenue to Conduit Boulevard. And of course,
11 the transformation of Queens Boulevard continues, the
12 next phase of this Great Streets project will be
13 implemented using temporary materials this year.
14 Thanks to the Mayor for contributing the needed
15 funds, we will be initiating capital construction
16 along this corridor soon. The first phase of this
17 work is currently in design at DOC. As I have told
18 this committee, our speed-camera program has
19 demonstrated clear results and has proven to be an
20 important way to consistently change driver behavior.
21 Mayor De Blasio and DOT strongly support legislation
22 that will allow us to expand our data-driven program
23 to more school zones and ensure that we're able to
24 enforce speed limits at the most dangerous times of
25

1 day and in the highest crash locations. The Council's
2 support is invaluable as we push to reauthorize and
3 expand the program this session in Albany. As the
4 city grows, so do the demands on our streets. DOT
5 remains focused on balancing the needs of all street
6 users, while at the same time maximizing the
7 efficiency of our streets to carry the most people
8 and goods possible. When it comes to keeping New
9 Yorkers moving and expanding mobility for all,
10 whether they're walking, biking, driving, taking
11 transit or ferries, we have an exciting year ahead.
12 The Mayor continues his remarkable record of
13 investment in roadway repair in this budget. We are
14 on... we are on track to pave 1,300 lane miles in
15 fiscal year '17 and we, we plan to continue the pace
16 by paving another 1,300 lane miles in fiscal year
17 '18. Under Mayor De Blasio's leadership, from fiscal
18 year '16 through '19 we will pave over 5,000 lane
19 miles of our more... most poorly rated streets, more
20 than a quarter of all the city's nearly 20,000 lane
21 miles. And I'm happy to report that all these newly
22 paved streets have contributed to a dramatic decrease
23 in the number of potholes that DOT has had to fill.
24 Pothole complaints have declined by 40 percent from
25

1
2 2014 to 2016 and year to date DOT has had to fill 72
3 percent fewer potholes compared to the same period in
4 2014. When it comes to transit, Mayor De Blasio has
5 made a historic commitment of 2.5 million to the
6 MTA's capital plan and working with our partners at
7 MTA we've more than doubled the pace of rolling out
8 new select bus service routes. This year we plan to
9 add three more routes along 79th Street in Manhattan,
10 across the South Bronx, and along Woodhaven Boulevard
11 to increase bus speed, reliability, and pedestrian
12 safety. By the end of 2017, we expect that SBS will
13 carry over 380,000 daily riders or more than 15
14 percent of New York's 2.5 million average weekday bus
15 ridership. We're also committed to working with the
16 MTA to improve bus service throughout the system
17 through additional bus lanes, queue jumps, traffic
18 signal priority, contactless payment, and all-door
19 boarding. And DOT is engaged over the last couple of
20 months with New Yorkers to plan for future transit
21 investments. Through our Citywide Transit Plan, which
22 we were required... which we were required to undertake
23 in part by legislation championed by Council Member
24 Lander, we hope to identify underserved corridors and
25 places where ridership is expected to grow and

1
2 evaluate potential modes that might work best to meet
3 those needs. At the same time, we'll be looking at
4 how improvements to our pedestrian and bicycle
5 infrastructure can further broaden transit markets.
6 We're collecting public input online through the
7 first week in April, so please, encourage your
8 constituents to take our survey to give us the
9 clearest picture of transportation needs in your
10 district. And we'd also be happy to host Town Halls
11 with interested Council Members in the coming weeks.
12 Turning to our bike network, after a year in which we
13 installed a record 18.5 miles of protected bike lanes
14 and 45 miles of additional bike lanes, New Yorkers
15 now enjoy a bike network of 1,125 miles in total.
16 With the completion of the Chrystie Street bike lane
17 last fall, cyclists can now ride from downtown
18 Brooklyn to the Bronx on nine miles of continues
19 protected bike lanes. And we have exciting plans this
20 year including a new protected bike lane on 4th
21 Avenue in Brooklyn. In the coming weeks, we'll embark
22 on a series of community discussions about making
23 changes to our original design for 4th Avenue with
24 the addition of protected bike lanes for four miles,
25 all the way from Boerum Hill to Bay Ridge. And we'll

1
2 be bringing a much overdue bike lane right, right
3 here to Park Row to provide a safe connection to the
4 Brooklyn Bridge. And our bikeshare network continues
5 to grow. With expansions planned this year further
6 into Harlem, into Astoria, Prospect Heights, and
7 Crown Heights, Citi Bike will reach 12,000 bikes and
8 approximately 750 stations by the end of 2017,
9 making our network the largest in North America and
10 on par with leading systems around the globe. When it
11 comes to ferries, we are working with our partners at
12 EDC on the rollout of the new citywide ferry service
13 this summer while continuing to invest in the Staten
14 Island Ferry, where ridership continues to grow. In
15 February, we registered a 251-million-dollar contract
16 for the three new Ollis class vessels. We are
17 designing these state-of-the-art 4,500 passenger
18 ferries with resiliency in mind; they will be able to
19 operate in varying weather conditions and dock at a
20 broader range of locations during emergencies and
21 they will be environmentally friendly, meeting US EPA
22 Tier IV emissions standards. And finally, along with
23 our plaza program, our crosswalk enhancements and our
24 many safety improvement projects, we are increasing
25 our resources to upgrade important parts of our

1 pedestrian infrastructure such as pedestrian ramps
2 and sidewalks. The Mayor's Preliminary Capital Plan
3 proposes to add 480 million to DOT's pedestrian ramps
4 program over seven additional years. This includes a
5 20 million annual commitment to installing new ramps
6 and baselines a new program to upgrade existing ramps
7 throughout the city. And we've increased sidewalk
8 repairs for NYCHA developments. Since 2014 we've done
9 7.3 million in sidewalk work at 42 developments as
10 compared to 4.4 million at 20 developments in the
11 last term of the previous administration. And as you
12 know we're looking forward to launching our car share
13 pilot this year. We appreciate the legislation the
14 council passed codifying this effort, now known as
15 Local Laws 47 and 50 of 2017, which the Mayor signed
16 just last week. We will encourage New Yorkers to have
17 an open mind. We've seen in other cities that car
18 share has resulted in people giving up their cars,
19 making it easier, not harder, to find a spot for
20 those who still need or choose to own cars and park
21 on the street. Finally, the city is continuing with
22 its own new rapid transit project, the BQX. Working
23 with our partners at EDC we continue to plan for the
24 route which will run along the Brooklyn-Queens
25

1 waterfront. We will be releasing our next study this
2 spring, which will present further details on
3 alignment and project features incorporating public
4 outreach that DOT and EDC have undertaken over the
5 past year. Now I want to discuss state of good repair
6 for our transportation infrastructure and our efforts
7 to improve project delivery. From the four East River
8 crosses to over 780 other bridges, large and small,
9 across the city, these important links require
10 ongoing capital investment. A key highlight of Mayor
11 De Blasio's budget is a commitment of 621 million in
12 additional capital funds to ensure a state of good
13 repair on our bridges through fiscal year '25. And as
14 I've said, DOT is doing more capital projects than
15 ever before. This level of increased investment can
16 only be achieved through our focused efforts and
17 ability to manage our growth. So far, we've risen to
18 the challenge, though there's always room to improve.
19 Last year, we committed an impressive 83 percent of
20 our fiscal year '16 Capital Plan and a record amount
21 in contract dollars. We're working with our partners
22 in the administration and retooling our own internal
23 procedures to streamline procurements and register
24 more contracts on time. And as we strive to manage a
25

1
2 substantial increase in both the pace and scale of
3 project... of capital project delivery, we're committed
4 to pursuing the City's goals for awarding contracts
5 to minority and women owned business enterprises.
6 We're working closely with Deputy Mayor Richard Buery
7 and Jennel Doris, the Senior Advisor for the City's
8 M/WBE program, as well as our colleagues at SBS and
9 MOCS. As you know, the Mayor set an ambitious goal in
10 OneNYC to award a minimum of 16 billion in city
11 contract dollars over the next ten years to M/WBE's
12 and recently set a new goal of awarding 30 percent of
13 all city contracts to M/WBE's. to contribute to that
14 goal, DOT awarded nearly 43 million to M/WBE's in
15 2015 and nearly 82 million in 2016. As you can see
16 we've nearly doubled our contract awards because
17 we're now using a three-pronged approach to
18 increasing M/WBE contracts; we're taking steps to
19 increase access for M/WBE's, we're enhancing training
20 and our own internal procedures, and we're increasing
21 our outreach efforts. Turning to several large bridge
22 projects that will be getting underway in the
23 upcoming year, in the next few months we will
24 register a contract to reconstruct Unionport Bridge
25 in the Bronx, which carries an average of 63,000

1
2 vehicles daily over the... on the Bruckner Expressway
3 over Westchester Creek. The Unionport Bridge will
4 have a long-life span and a widened structure which
5 will include a five-foot sidewalk and for the first
6 time a ten-foot bike lane. And we will continue work
7 on our iconic East River Bridges with two contracts
8 scheduled for FY '18 registration. The next contract
9 for the Queensboro Bridge is focused on replacement
10 of the Upper Deck roadway. And for the Manhattan
11 Bridge we'll be painting the south side of the bridge
12 and the towers and rehabilitating or replacing
13 numerous components of the bridge structure and
14 anchorage as well as the south upper roadway. The
15 discussion of bridges brings us to design build, as
16 you mentioned Mr. Chairman, which would be a much-
17 needed project delivery innovation, saving time and
18 potentially millions of taxpayer dollars. For the
19 last several years the city has worked closely with a
20 coalition of stakeholders including the business
21 community, organized labor, and industry, to advocate
22 for state authorization for the city to use design-
23 build. I was up in Albany just last week discussing
24 our design-build legislation and I hope that the
25 council will lend their voice to our effort. The

1 Mayor and the Council have challenged city agencies
2 to identify ways to reduce expenses and build
3 recurring savings as a safeguard against the future
4 economic downturn. As we know this is even more
5 important at a time of uncertainty about Federal
6 funding. Here at DOT, we found significant savings in
7 this expense budget from changes in our operations.
8 New York's drivers have surely taken note of our new
9 ParkNYC program that allows motorists to pay by cell.
10 As you know, rollout of this new program began in
11 December in Manhattan. I am happy to report that over
12 50,000 drivers have already downloaded the smartphone
13 app and the number is continuing to grow. As we
14 speak, ParkNYC, I believe installation was just
15 completed in the Bronx and we will be rolling out to
16 the rest of the city through the summer. We expect to
17 save about 1.7 million dollars in personnel costs and
18 credit-card processing payments through the
19 efficiencies of this program. And the replacement of
20 a movable bridge with a fixed bridge to carry the
21 Belt Parkway over Mill Basin will produce operational
22 savings and eliminate traffic delays caused by bridge
23 openings, while still maintaining maritime access.
24 The 75-year-old bridge has outlived its useful life
25

1
2 and we are nearing completion on the new structure
3 one year ahead of schedule. By eliminating the need
4 for bridge operations... bridge operators at this
5 location, DOT will realize over 300,000 dollars in
6 savings annually. While we pursue these savings and
7 efficiencies in our expense budget, we will continue
8 to find other ways to be the most effective stewards
9 of taxpayer dollars, including better project
10 delivery of our capital program. I want to again
11 thank you, Chairman Rodriguez, and this entire
12 committee for your strong support. As you have heard,
13 we are very excited to move ahead with our important
14 work in the year ahead. I look forward to partnering
15 with you and all the Members of Council, and other
16 stakeholders with all of these efforts as we endeavor
17 to keep New Yorkers safe and moving. I'd be happy to
18 take your questions.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you
20 Commissioner, I have many questions but I'm only
21 going to be asking a few because I also know that my
22 colleagues they also have questions to ask. I would
23 like also to recognize Council Member Van Bramer and
24 also thank our lawyer here, the staff for her
25 contribution in this committee. And before asking a

1
2 question I'd also like to thank you and, and the
3 Mayor and especially the great team from the DOT for
4 everything that you do in planning with us for
5 everything and I know that we will get good news in
6 the next couple of days by the contribution by your
7 team has been amazing as we are getting close for
8 Saturday April 22nd where we're going to... going to be
9 doing our second car free day. My first question is
10 about how much is the city in this case DOT in having
11 the great, you know opportunity to have you as a
12 commissioner we are a lot of years serving from DC
13 and living with, with a lot of uncertainty on how
14 federal cut will have an impact in the DOT seeing it
15 is good percentage of the funding for many projects
16 that we've been doing and DOT also relies on federal
17 government?

18 POLLY TROTTENBERG: Yeah, no it's a... it's
19 a very good question Mr. Chairman and obviously
20 something that's on all of our minds, you and the
21 council and, and the Mayor and, and all us
22 commissioners as well and look I think we, we've all
23 discussed the fact that it's a very uncertain climate
24 in Washington, you know the latest efforts to, you
25 know penalize sanctuary cities I think is a very big

1
2 unknown although I think the Mayor feels very
3 confident about the, the city having a strong legal
4 stance there. The president's budget made some
5 specific proposed cuts on the transportation front,
6 which are worth discussing. Two programs that are of
7 particular importance I think to big cities like New
8 York, the first one is what's called the Capital
9 Investments Grant or the New Starts Program which is
10 funds for new transit projects at a time as, as we
11 all know and cities are growing and there is such a
12 growing demand to invest in transit this is a program
13 that has been crucial for efforts like 2nd Avenue
14 subway and so many of the projects in this city in
15 this region. The, the projects that would be seeking
16 funding in this program and you've heard them
17 enumerated before, the next phase of 2nd Avenue
18 subway, the Gateway Tunnel between New York and New
19 Jersey, our own local buildout of our capital project
20 for the Woodhaven select bus service routes. So, these
21 are some major projects that would certainly, you
22 know be in some jeopardy if this program is
23 eliminated. The other program, the other
24 transportation program the president has proposed to
25 zero out is the Tiger Grant Program, which is one I

1 was very intimately involved in when I was at USDOT
2 and the city has taken great advantage of that
3 program as well. The city has won six Tiger Grants
4 over a period of about seven years, we've used them
5 for Vision Zero projects, for all kinds of terrific
6 projects; Fordham Plaza, a bunch of things all over
7 the city. I will say though that what the Mayor has
8 said and I think it's true is the president has
9 proposed these budget cuts but it's, it's start of a
10 long process up in... down in congress they will
11 probably be wrangling over the budget for a number of
12 months to come, the Mayor has pledged that he is
13 going to work with his allies, other mayors and I
14 know council members have, have also been speaking to
15 their counterparts around the country to, to be
16 united in working with our delegation senator Schumer
17 and others down in Washington to fight these cuts.
18 So, so we will see how it plays out but clearly, you
19 know the transportation cuts and obviously, the cuts
20 in other areas; social services and housing if they
21 go forward there, they're tremendously damaging for,
22 for cities like New York that are growing and you
23 know we've certainly relied on the federal government
24 to help us with that growth.
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, again since
3 you were in... serving out the national level of
4 Department of Transportation can we expect that... the
5 same thing to happen to the Obamacare where, you know
6 republican in the sunny state also they come in front
7 also a... against the new plan that the president
8 wanted to bring to the... to the house, to the floor
9 that... are they... are the... are the Department of
10 Transportation can we some expectation that
11 republicans on the city also will... can be unified
12 with some democrat from places as our city because
13 any cut of the Department of Transportation will not
14 only will hurt a city as New York but it also hurts
15 some municipality which also is an important
16 republican base?

17 POLLY TROTTEBERG: It, it's a good
18 question and, and traditionally transit funding
19 particularly the New Starts Program it's focused more
20 on urban areas but in recent years a lot of smaller
21 jurisdictions have started to use some of those funds
22 and so it enjoys fairly broad bipartisan support and,
23 and if you've looked at some of the comments of
24 elected officials on both sides of the aisle I think
25 there has been already some stated opposition to

1
2 eliminating it but look I think there, there's going
3 to be a tough budget debate down there, the president
4 has proposed cuts in a lot of different areas and you
5 know I presume they'll be some, some give and take.
6 Again, I think that, that we will be the city
7 certainly and again all elected officials of the city
8 we will be working very hard with our allies to send
9 the message that we think these programs are crucial.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. So, have
11 you started conversations with some of the members of
12 the Department of Transportation on the... at the
13 federal level?

14 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Well the Mayor... the
15 Mayor has been talking with his counterparts in the
16 US Conference of Mayors and I think starting to line
17 up certainly talking to members of our delegation and
18 you know maybe beginning some of those discussions
19 with the... with officials in the Trump administration
20 and you know and I think... again you've, you've heard
21 the Mayor on this, I think there's going to be quite
22 a determined group of elected officials throughout
23 the country and I do believe Mayors and elected
24 officials on both sides of the aisle who work
25 together to oppose these cuts.

1
2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. My second
3 question is about congestion in Midtown, I think that
4 you want a, you know the perfect person or, or
5 commissioner to take us to understand what is... and,
6 and we also heard that the Mayor's also working to,
7 to put together a plan or... on, on congestion but for,
8 for any information that you can share with us in
9 your role in this case how the DOT Commissioner but
10 also the leader together with Chief Chan and others
11 when it comes to Vision Zero what I heard from
12 experts in the field of transportation, some
13 professors that only by doing better on enforcement
14 we can reduce congestion by 10 or 15 percent, is it
15 DOT, you know as a leader, leader in an entity not
16 only working with Chief Chan and other, with Vision
17 Zero but also in, in your role really signing some
18 area in the congestion... Midtown, what is your plan,
19 what can we expect to see, you know we will... we are
20 addressing congestion in our city?

21 POLLY TROTTEBERG: There's no secret if
22 you... if you look... we're, we're lucky now we have a
23 lot of good data both date we get from taxi's and
24 from buses about speeds and we can see that certainly
25 travel speeds have been slowing in recent years in

1
2 Midtown and you know the, the administration has done
3 some analysis of this, looked at what are the
4 different factors and, and it turns out one of the
5 largest factors is actually the good news story of
6 what's happening in New York City and we've seen
7 tremendous population growth, tremendous economic
8 growth, we've added half a million jobs over the past
9 five years, we're seeing record tourism numbers. So
10 that has been... it turns out those have been some of
11 the largest contributing factors in congestion in
12 Midtown and I would say there's of course no easy
13 silver bullets, you are correct Mr. Chairman and one
14 of the things that we have been talking about is to
15 step up enforcement but to do it in a strategic way,
16 to particularly look at enforcement and keep
17 corridors and key hot spots and to try and work with
18 NYPD to deploy enforcement forces where they can be
19 the most useful. We're also looking at are there
20 things we can do in terms of changing curbside uses,
21 loading zones, looking at delivery policy, looking at
22 parking policy. So, you've heard of talk about some
23 of these things we'll be rolling some of it out in
24 more detail. I don't know whether through sheer
25 enforcement alone you can reduce congestion by 10 to

1
2 15 percent, I think we'll have to see as we roll it
3 out, I think there will be some trial and error but,
4 but I think there's no question that some bundle of
5 these factors can help do something to reduce
6 congestion. Again, against the backdrop of a city
7 that does, I think something we're all very happy
8 about continuing to grow and thrive economically.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: What about no
10 delivering during rush hour?

11 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Well I think one
12 thing we're going to do is take a look at delivery
13 policy and how we can perhaps make it smarter. I
14 think we want to be sensitive and careful when we
15 talk about Midtown Manhattan or other key commercial
16 areas around the city. We want to reduce congestion
17 but we also want to make sure our businesses can get
18 the goods they need and can, can thrive, it's already
19 very expensive and complicated to do business in New
20 York so I think part of this will be working with the
21 business community, with the delivery industries to
22 see if we can come up with some more rational
23 policies and it's not only in commercial districts.
24 One thing.. you know we know now with the rise
25 particularly this is phenomena perhaps with the

1
2 millennial generation and the rise of Amazon and, and
3 Peapod and FreshDirect, we're seeing a lot more
4 deliveries in residential areas as well and you know
5 at least in commercial areas we often have loans...
6 loading zones and commercial parking but now that
7 we're seeing a big rise in deliveries in residential
8 areas that are also causing congestion it's a new...
9 it's a relatively new phenomenon that we're also
10 starting to, to do some analysis and see if we can
11 put in some good policies.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. I have
13 other questions but I will now call my colleague,
14 Council Member Vacca.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you
16 Commissioner and Mr. Chair. I want to talk about
17 congestion, not just in Manhattan, come to the Bronx,
18 come to Brooklyn and come to Queens and I know your
19 testimony did not touch on that Commissioner but if
20 you drive your car in the outer boroughs and try to
21 go from one borough to another you're in a virtual
22 parking lot, I mean the ultimate parking lot is the
23 cross-Bronx Expressway, it is the worst highway in
24 the country, sited in national surveys. The FDR drive
25 every day is a disaster, the Brooklyn Queens

1
2 Expressway is another problem, it, it has... it, it
3 encourages you to use mass transit but the reality is
4 we have people who have to use their cars and there's
5 never a discussion about what are we going to do
6 about gridlock in this city and the gridlock is just
7 not in Manhattan, the gridlock is in outer boroughs
8 trying to go from one part of the borough to another,
9 you cannot go on the cross Bronx Expressway from one
10 part of the borough to another, you cannot get... I had
11 to drive... I had a meeting yesterday morning, early
12 and I had to go to speak about technology which is my
13 committee to Staten Island, two and a half hours from
14 the Bronx to Staten Island. The FDR Drive I've given
15 up on, I take the train and that takes me an hour but
16 the FDR Drive I've given up on but I think that we
17 have some type of an attitude where we don't even
18 have a discussion about what we're doing here, what...
19 I... have we just thrown our hands up in the air and
20 said this is going to be the way of life in this city
21 because I refuse to do that, I'm looking for a plan,
22 I'm looking for a pro-act... not... I shouldn't be
23 proactive, the situation's been a disaster for years
24 but I'm looking for some type of plan that people can

1
2 say we are looking at relief, we are looking at
3 something and I don't see that.

4 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Well and I, I, I...
5 it's a good question and the, the Chairman was
6 focused on Midtown Manhattan but I think the Mayor
7 has made it clear that the congestion proposals that
8 we're going to roll out we will be looking at a, a
9 five borough plan although I think there's been a lot
10 of discussion about what we need to do in Midtown I
11 think for the other four boroughs I want to make sure
12 that we get a lot of input from local elected
13 officials from businesses etcetera, hit... you know
14 pick the key areas where we want to focus. It's
15 interesting you mentioned the Cross Bronx because as
16 you know the Mayor has described that I believe as...
17 that he is like captain Ahab and that is his white
18 whale. He... it is a state highway and as you know
19 it's, it's, it's a Moses era highway that, that
20 connects to the, the George Washington Bridge, it, it
21 is notorious for being one of the most difficult
22 routes in the city and you know right now is as you
23 know unlike in some other places we don't have some
24 of the traditional tools that we might use to address
25 congestion which might be something like pricing so

1
2 we have to tackle it best we can which again is going
3 to be a combination of enforcement, of technology, of
4 hopefully working with businesses to see what we can
5 do about deliveries and doing everything we can to
6 try an ease back congestion.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: We, we seem to
8 talk... we, we, we talk the talk but we're not walking
9 the walk, to be honest we talk about transit deserts
10 and my community is a transit desert, you have to
11 take a car to the train or a bus to the train and
12 this leads me to my next discussion, we talk about
13 that how these neighborhoods are underserved yet when
14 it comes to ferry service the predominance of ferry
15 service in this borough... in, in this city and you've
16 talked about ferry service in your testimony, the
17 predominance of ferry service in this city is based
18 in communities in close proximity to Manhattan anyway
19 who have access to several trains to get to
20 Manhattan. So, in the previous administration what
21 was done is that ferry stops all around those
22 neighborhoods were set up giving them even better
23 access and then we want to know why we are having
24 gentrification or what are we going to do about
25 affordable housing, the real... the reality is it

1
2 exacerbated by making the neighborhoods even more
3 attractive. When I asked for ferry service in Throggs
4 Neck, New York a transit desert I'm told maybe
5 tomorrow, maybe tomorrow which could be years away,
6 there's no study on the books that, that the city has
7 done that, that's, that's been... that's being
8 implemented, I have EDC is working with DOT on ferry
9 service but luckily the Bronx now has no ferry
10 service, we're getting one stop..

11 POLLY TROTTEBERG: You're getting
12 Soundview.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: We're getting
14 Soundview, we're getting one stop, talk about
15 inequality, talk about inequality, my community is a
16 waterfront area, my community is bordered by water
17 and north of my community is Co-op City, why we don't
18 have access and I, I want that put on the front
19 burner, I want to know when are we going to get ferry
20 service.

21 POLLY TROTTEBERG: So we are, as I
22 mentioned in my testimony we are right now doing our
23 citywide transit study and we are certainly part of
24 the focus of that transit study and something this
25 committees talked about, the Chairman's focus is on..

1
2 is transit deserts and so really need to get that
3 input from all of you and your constituents, we've
4 heard a lot from Council Member Landers constituents...
5 [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: You've heard a lot
7 from me over the years... [cross-talk]

8 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...I know... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I've been all over
10 on this... [cross-talk]

11 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...I'd like to... [cross-
12 talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: ...we've heard a
14 lot, the issue is... [cross-talk]

15 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...I think I'd like to
16 hear... [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: ...when are we going
18 to do something... [cross-talk]

19 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...I think I'd like to
20 hear from your constituents as well and look you know
21 the challenge we have in terms of big transit
22 investments, the city has put some money on the table
23 to do some transit vamps, we also need to work with
24 the MTA. Again, we've invested now 2.5 billion in
25 their next five-year capital plan and part of that

1
2 has been to direct them to start to take more of the
3 city's needs into account as they build out the next
4 generation of their transit system. Unfortunately, I
5 will say now I think the federal climate being a
6 little uncertain for them we'll have to see what
7 their next generation of transit investments is going
8 to look like... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Well if I can say...
10 let me conclude quickly, I don't think the money with
11 the ferry service in the Bronx being denied, I don't
12 think the issue is money I just don't think the city
13 had the, the, the desire to do it and, and I think
14 that our community was passed up. Lastly I want to
15 ask you about Shore Road in my district, Shore Road
16 was left out of the capital budget and this goes from
17 the Bronx Westchester line to City Island Road, it is
18 falling apart, it's in desperate need of capital
19 improvement and, and I want to know why it was left
20 out and I want to ask you to reconsider before we
21 have a permanent... the final city budget, before the
22 executive budget is released and ask for a
23 reconsideration because of the flooding and surface
24 conditions there and the whole contour of that road
25 is extremely dangerous.

1
2 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Now, look I'm
3 familiar, familiar with that road as you know that is
4 one where we need also to work with DEP because there
5 are major... there would have to be major drainage and
6 sewer infrastructure and I think the challenge there
7 is just it's an immensely costly and complicated
8 project but certainly one we're reviewing, we're,
9 we're very familiar with it.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, I'd
11 like to remind the rest of my colleagues please stay
12 at their five minutes since we also have MTA and we
13 also TLC. Council Member Vacca... Menchaca.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you Chair
15 and thank you commissioner and your team for being
16 here today. I'm going to start off with the 4th
17 Avenue project and, and really again just commending
18 the, the, the incredible work you all did to hear the
19 community, take a pause, review everything and then
20 come back with a, a better plan. That's something
21 that I think we always need to highlight as, as a
22 good moment of good government and so I just want to
23 say thank you to that. I know there's a lot of work
24 to go back to the communities with this re-thought
25 and, and, and making it safer so I just want to say

1
2 that we... we're going to work with you to make sure
3 that everybody gets the information and, and move
4 forward. I think this is... this is an incredible
5 opportunity for us. For the 4th Avenue design I think
6 there's a lot of questions about the budget, what's
7 the impact of this and I think it'd be important for
8 you to kind of talk to the community right now about
9 what, what that impact is?

10 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Yeah and I'm going to
11 have Joe Jarrin get into the details but, but I want
12 to thank you and, and Council Member Lander and just
13 say look it was... it was definitely a big decision to
14 take a project that was fairly, you know well along
15 in its planning and, and make a big change to it but
16 as, as I have said publicly, you know having heard
17 from so many members of the community and having seen
18 particularly as cycling has continued to just grow
19 exponentially in Brooklyn and knowing that when we
20 did this capital project we would live with it for
21 generations to come, 50, 60, 70 years, I think we
22 concluded even though it's going to take some time
23 and retooling and obviously working closely with the
24 community and elected officials to work through
25 everybody's questions that we, we really needed to

1
2 make this change. I'm, I'm happy to say since we've
3 announced it at least I have gotten a lot of good
4 feedback, there was a lot of good questions but you
5 know a general feeling like this was the right
6 decision so maybe Joe can walk you through and he has
7 been the one as, as our budget expert who was
8 definitely agonized a bit about making the changes
9 through this decision and working through the numbers
10 and the time table and what it means.

11 JOSEPH JARRIN: Council Member we're
12 actually currently finalizing the, the scope of the
13 revised design and, and going back to DDC to move
14 forward with the revised design. On the cost side, we
15 have estimated that we can probably do the project
16 with the same... close to the same amount of funding
17 that we already had but we're actually still
18 reviewing some of those details of the scope really
19 has to do with what we plan to do in the median of
20 the... of the Avenue but... and then also as you probably
21 know we, we had only been funded for phases one and
22 two which is certain sections of 4th Avenue, we're
23 now striving to do the entire stretch. So, thanks to
24 Mayor De Blasio's funding for Vision Zero that we got
25 as part of this January plan, we actually now have

1
2 some additional funding that we could also use to be
3 able to do the, the, the full stretch. So, we'll have
4 a decision soon on, on the final scope and, and we'll
5 be briefing the DDC and the Commissioner and, and,
6 and move forward with the project as soon as
7 possible. As, as you know because of this revised
8 design we had to put the design on hold, we
9 originally planning to have construction start next
10 year but now there will be a slight delay,
11 postponement to, to basically do this improved
12 design.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay, I only
14 have two more minutes here so I'm going to just hit
15 you with a couple, couple questions then we can... we
16 can move through them. The first is the BQX and the
17 spring study, there's a lot of conversations and
18 concerns that I've had with the BQX, I'm hoping... I'm,
19 I'm, I'm hoping for some answers in the spring study
20 including how we juxtapose other options not the BQX
21 in solving some of the transportation issues, the
22 ferry's going to be an interesting one, two for Red
23 Hook that is a transit desert as well, the questions
24 around buses and there's, there's some work that
25 you're doing in SBS and some other bus, bus options,

1
2 I want to kind of hear DOT's response to possible Red
3 Hook solutions for, for buses and where, where
4 you're... where the spring study might be looking at
5 that and then outside of the BQX on 3rd Avenue where
6 the BQX is thinking about wanting to be in Sunset
7 Park there are a lot of issues there as well. And so,
8 thinking about how budget and, and, and little pilot
9 projects like under the El at 36th Street and 3rd
10 Avenue have made a big splash. A lot of folks are
11 looking at that, I think we need to do a better job
12 to get the word out about what that was, everyone's
13 kind of associating it with Industry City, this is a...
14 is a... this is a DOT project and what that means for
15 the entire corridor; lighting, parking, meters,
16 there's a lot of ideas that are, are kind of
17 circulating from the community and the community
18 board, I want to kind of get a sense from you about
19 what that looks like for your BQE work in Sunset Park
20 and then... and then finally the double parking issue
21 on 5th Avenue has been a conundrum for us and that
22 line, the 63 line, this is an MTA questions but DOT
23 how do we think about double parking and the safety
24 of our riders are, are... there's a... there's a shared
25 bike lane there, there are commercial... there's a

1 massive commercial truck issue and what, what is DOT
2 thinking about that as, as a holistic and, and is, is
3 this present in the budget?
4

5 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Okay, that's a lot of
6 questions, I hope I can... [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yeah, well it...
8 [cross-talk]

9 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...I hope I can
10 remember... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: ...I only got two
12 minutes... [cross-talk]

13 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...them all and answer...
14 [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: ...there you go...
16 [cross-talk]

17 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...them. Let... I'll
18 start with... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: ...and you can
20 take it... your... you can take your time with the
21 answers... [cross-talk]

22 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...I'll start with the
23 BQX and, and hopefully get to the rest. Look and you
24 know certainly the discussion of the BQX has I think
25 spurned a useful discussion, you know about that

1 project specifically but also are there other things
2 that can be done in the areas and then look as, as
3 we're hearing from Council Member Vacca, what else do
4 we need to do in this growing city, a lot of
5 frustration about we need to be making big
6 transportation investments all over the city and I, I
7 think on that we can all agree, how we get there and
8 where we find the funds and where we go obviously
9 that's the... that's what we need to work through. So
10 yeah, I think when we come back in the spring we're
11 going to have a more refined proposal to talk through
12 kind of getting closer to looking at potential
13 alignments and certainly grappling with some of the
14 issues that I think particularly apply to sunset park
15 about how well does this project work there, you know
16 how... where would it run and what would be the
17 benefits. I think it will also be partially a
18 discussion of are there other improvements that we
19 can potentially do and that certainly when you look
20 at Red Hook and other areas that's a very good
21 question. Talking about... so hopefully again we're
22 going to have that out in the next couple of months
23 and I think that will spur a very good discussion
24 both about the BQX but obviously fair enough about
25

1
2 some of the larger transportation questions that
3 we're grappling with around the city and what are the
4 best places to make investments, how do we decide in
5 an age of limited resources where we prioritize,
6 where we're going to invest and making sure that the
7 community gets a full airing of what is our latest
8 thinking and analysis and, and we hear from them. On,
9 on 5th Avenue, it's funny you mentioned part of why
10 we... you know we knew we had to do 4th Avenue is
11 because 5th Avenue is a challenging place, that bike
12 lane there, you know it is a busy commercial
13 corridor, there is a lot of double parking and you
14 know look we can always work with PD on enforcement
15 but I think, you know the good news if we... if we get
16 community buy in and we get our, our 4th Avenue
17 operational project up this summer then hopefully
18 that will be... you know that will be a terrific now
19 protected stretch that perhaps can help end the
20 aggravation of trying to bike on 5th Ave.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: 3rd Avenue?

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member...

23 [cross-talk]

24 POLLY TROTTENBERG: Yeah... [cross-talk]

1
2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Lander following
3 by Council Member Chin.

4 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I apologize, tell me
5 again what your... the 3rd Avenue question, so many
6 avenues?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Under the El.

8 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Oh yes... so, so I'm
9 happy to say and I think you're right, perhaps we
10 didn't do quite as, as good a job as we should of in
11 getting the word out that we, we have actually
12 launched I think a very exciting effort called under
13 the El to do lighting and artistic and public safety
14 improvements under the elevated spaces around the
15 city and particularly we, we... you mentioned 3rd
16 Avenue, we're focusing on corridors where obviously
17 there, they're busy, pedestrian and cycling corridors
18 and we're going to be doing more of those treatments
19 throughout the city, we're also looking at something
20 that I've heard from a lot of council members about
21 just in general how do we improve lighting and public
22 safety under elevated highways and the elevated
23 subway structures, it's something that we have been
24 talking to the MTA a lot about and we're going to be
25 rolling out some good ideas there. So something we're

1
2 happy I think to partner with Council Members on,
3 areas where they want us to come do some of these
4 treatments and, and how we can get better public
5 attention on them because you're right I think it's,
6 it's perhaps not quite gotten the focus that it
7 should but we're very excited about it, it's sort of
8 one of the last frontiers in the city of areas that
9 are just in a lot of neighborhoods, dark and gloomy
10 and, and screaming out for, for better lighting, you
11 know artistic improvements and, and a feeling of
12 better public safety.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And Council
14 Member Lander followed by Council Member Chin, I
15 would like also to recognize Council Member Miller
16 and Reynoso who are here with us.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Mr.
18 Chair, thank you Commissioner. I, I have sort of a, a
19 list of thank yous first, things that you guys are
20 doing in ways that I feel good about so on the
21 citywide transit plan which comes from legislation
22 this council passed but that was just about a bus
23 rapid transit plan and you guys took it and made it a
24 full citywide transit plan which is great and I just
25 want to urge my colleagues and the public to engage

1
2 with it, we... this council, it's true that I'm the
3 sponsor but this council passed a bill requiring them
4 to and they expanded on doing real good transit
5 planning of where we need it and so I would just urge
6 people, transit plan dot NYC, you still got a couple
7 of weeks to give your input, it's an encouraging
8 planning process and I would urge people to... [cross-
9 talk]

10 POLLY TROTTEBERG: And, and we will...

11 [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...take advantage
13 of it... [cross-talk]

14 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...do Town Halls if
15 anyone would like to, to, to... you know to have an
16 actual engaged discussion with your constituents.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I want to thank
18 you for the continued investments in Vision Zero, all
19 of the capital ones here but I had a chance to go to
20 a smaller expense one, the Vision Zero Youth Council
21 a couple of weeks ago which was just a wonderful
22 outreach and education event and I would urge others
23 to try to bring it to their districts as well and it
24 was really... that meeting talking to these high school
25 kids trying to save the lives of their classmates

1 that I felt it was urgent to speak out against the
2 state senate's effort to overrule our speed limit,
3 another bill this council passed that has saved lives
4 and the fact that Albany road by road is going to
5 take the really outrageous and dangerous effort to
6 try to increase the speed limit in the budget, it's
7 ashonda [sp?]. Anyway, so I thank you for standing up
8 on it and I encourage people to meet the Vision Zero
9 Youth Council. I'm going to echo Council Member
10 Menchaca's comments on 4th Avenue which... you know
11 though I felt some investment in the work that we had
12 done several years ago this is the right plan, I
13 appreciate you taking the time to put it on the
14 table, its big and bold, it's going to take a lot of
15 work in the community but I'm glad to support it and
16 I appreciate your pushing forward on it. And on Car
17 Share, I know we were encouraged to kind of register
18 our interest in letters but I'm registering my
19 interest publicly here at this hearing, I think it's
20 an exciting opportunity, I think it will actually
21 address some of our parking issues, I already see it
22 in our neighborhood where people are starting to use
23 car to go and zip car in those ways and I think
24 moving that forward as public policy is smart and,
25

1
2 and I hope we can... we can get to it. I have two
3 questions, first I'm enthusiastic about the street
4 markings increase which I know is a big issue to my
5 constituents, small, not at the level of street
6 reconstructions but I just wonder what you track on
7 that because I know I get it and I don't even know
8 how to evaluate where we don't have them or how long
9 we go without them, when they're needed so it's great
10 to increase the money, what is it that we're
11 reporting on in how that gets spent and... [cross-talk]

12 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Yeah... no and I
13 really... I want to thank the Mayor for this because
14 right... it seems like kind of a, a small issue but one
15 that clearly is of such importance and it, it's sort
16 of important in two ways which is maintaining the
17 markings of our existing infrastructure and then
18 continuing to do markings as we build out our Vision
19 Zero Project, our bus lanes, I mean we... the city is
20 now very in earnest in the markings business and like
21 any other piece of infrastructure you have to
22 maintain it and you know we had a couple of
23 challenges. Our average time for refreshing markings
24 is about six years... [cross-talk]

25 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Six years?

1 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Six years, yep.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Alright, seems
3 like... [cross-talk]
4

5 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...and... [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...we could reduce
7 that.

8 POLLY TROTTEBERG: And... well we're get...
9 well the good news is the funding in this budget will
10 get that down to four and a half years, now that's an
11 average, in some places we're doing... some places...
12 markings can be very interesting, in some places they
13 can wear out a lot more quickly than in other places
14 and in some places, they're very crucial in terms of
15 safety and busy intersections, some places... but we're
16 also very proud that one thing we've announced in
17 this budget we're now going to be going to what's
18 called the high visibility crosswalk, that's going to
19 be our standard around the city which is the
20 crosswalk you've seen, very enhanced with the
21 hatching which you know we've seen when we've looked
22 at studies around the country really has proven
23 results in terms of pedestrian safety. So, this is
24 going to be for us a big new investment in markings
25 and something that we're very enthusiastic about. I

1 will just one... add one other thing although marking
2 seems like a small area. The contracts are fairly
3 complicated to manage, it's work all over the city
4 and you want to make sure that its done to high
5 quality so we're also going to be increasing our team
6 of inspectors to make sure that we're keeping on top
7 of the work. I will say we certainly rely on hearing
8 from you all and from 311, you know things in the
9 city particularly markings that are always changing,
10 they're getting rubbed out. So, it is certainly
11 something where we always need public input to make
12 sure we're staying on top of it... [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Alright, thank
15 you and then my last question and the conversation
16 around 4th Avenue and I want to thank you, you had a
17 good conversation with me about some of my
18 frustrations about longstanding capital projects and
19 the challenges getting them built on time and on a
20 reasonable budget and you mentioned some of those or
21 alluded to them in your testimony this is an issue
22 that Finance Chair Ferreras and I and other members
23 of the council feel very strongly about and this is
24 not just DOT, obviously DDC, Parks, DEP, there is
25 urgent need for capital projects management reform

1
2 and we are working hard to try to elevate that in the
3 council, make sure that the budget director and the
4 Mayor understand it and of course that would be a big
5 process but I just wonder if you have any reflections
6 on the things you know from your colleagues around
7 the country or your time in Washington and did... you
8 said design build so you can... you can say that one
9 but that can't be it, we can't only say Albany please
10 bail us out, do you have any thoughts on some things...
11 it's a big question but just teasers maybe on things
12 we could do to improve capital projects management?

13 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I certainly do and I...
14 look I, I, I said this before when I first came back
15 to New York from my time at the national level, I, I
16 think I can safely say that the... New York City is one
17 of the most complicated capital delivery processes in
18 the country if not the world. So, a certain of that
19 comes from the state and from the feds but a certain
20 amount frankly is, is self-inflicted and look it's,
21 it's grown up out of a history of a big city that's...
22 we're an old city and you know every time anything
23 has gone wrong with capital projects, any type of a
24 skin that we've sort of added another layer of review
25 and oversight and process and I think now we've got a

1 process which is very, very challenging. I, I... Joe
2 and his team once put together basically an enormous
3 kind of gant shart [sp?] of what we have to do to get
4 a capital project done, the, the steps we have to
5 take, the oversight we have, the different agencies
6 and groups that have to sign off on things, I mean it
7 was as big as that, you know painting of, of George
8 Washington in a nine-point font, I mean it was just
9 immensely, immensely complicated. And I think the
10 truth is to, to really chip away at some of that and
11 Albany can't totally save us so the design build
12 would make a big difference, it is the state of the
13 art, all over the country and all over the world now
14 but I think to sort of rationalize our complicated
15 capital delivery process it does require really
16 rolling up our sleeves and really taking a hard look
17 at some of those steps and saying do we really need
18 this step, does it add value and letting go of some
19 of those steps and I think that's harder than it
20 sounds but something I can tell you we have tried to
21 do internally in the administration but would love to
22 partner with the council and I, I, I definitely feel
23 your frustration and the frustration of, of council
24 members about how long it takes to deliver projects
25

1
2 and it's, it's not... it doesn't serve our constituents
3 well. We happily announce we've gotten the funds to
4 do this project and then they don't see the project
5 for seven years and of course everybody feels
6 frustrated at that point, I think we can do better.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, I
8 won't ask any more questions but I will associate
9 myself with the Chair's future questions about city
10 bike expansion and how we get a robust citywide
11 network and that if we need public resources to do it
12 to have an equitable system we should, the Chair will
13 ask you about that later I'm sure.

14 POLLY TROTTENBERG: So, so noted.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

17 Alright and I would also like to recognize Council
18 Member Richards and Greenfield is here, now Council
19 Member Chin and Council Member Rose.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I'd like to thank
21 Council Member Chin for, for relinquishing... letting
22 me go before her, I'm needed for a corium in land... in
23 land use but first I'd like to say I would love to
24 have a Town Hall and if you'd put us on the list and
25 I have a couple of questions and I'm really happy to

1
2 know that the ferry contract has been registered, do
3 you have an idea of when the completion date will be
4 and will all three be delivered at the same time and,
5 and then if, if that answer's short then I can go
6 onto the other question?

7 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I, I will be short,
8 the ferries will not be delivered at the same time,
9 we'll get them one at a time approximately three to
10 six months between them. The first one should be
11 coming end of 2019 if all goes well but let's see if
12 all goes well on through 2020.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: So and then the
14 first one 2019 and then three or six months... [cross-
15 talk]

16 POLLY TROTTEBERG: The next two... [cross-
17 talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: ...between... [cross-
19 talk]

20 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...in 2020 if all goes
21 well but I, I'll reserve the right to keep you posted
22 as, as, as you just... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: ...okay... [cross-talk]

24 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...saw the... you know as
25 the, the city's new citywide ferry got stuck in the

1
2 mud in Florida for a couple of days so we'll... and...
3 we're... ours are being built down in Florida as well.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Yes, I, I saw that.
5 And, and that brings me to the citywide ferry, you
6 know we had the conversation about citywide bikes and
7 you know the fact that Staten Island is a part of the
8 city and you know I really want... I want you to
9 consider Staten Island as a... with a ferry site to
10 Brooklyn and we've been able to secure a reasonable
11 conversation with a private entity that is willing to
12 build the dock and so with that taken into
13 consideration would that facilitate the conversation,
14 a real conversation about Staten Island being a part
15 of the citywide ferry plan with a ferry to Brooklyn?

16 POLLY TROTTENBERG: Look I think on the
17 citywide ferry plan and again we're, we're helping
18 EDC but it's mainly an EDC program but I know the
19 Mayor has said in answer to Staten Island and other
20 parts of the city that, you know we've rolled out...
21 we're rolling out the first two phases but that he's
22 open to continued discussions about where other
23 routes could be. As you know we're also undertaking a
24 study at the... at the request of the, the borough
25 president to look at other Staten Island potential

1
2 ferry routes particularly Midtown Manhattan but we
3 can also consider Brooklyn as well so... look we
4 certainly agree that there is... you know that there is
5 a very good reason to start looking at what we can do
6 to enhance ferry service.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: So... but we don't
8 have an idea of when that would become sort of a
9 capital reality?

10 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Not yet... not yet but
11 I... but I, I think at least our ferry... our ferry study
12 I think I'm looking over Joe, I think we're hoping to
13 have it done this year, am I correct about that?
14 Okay, so that, that'll give us some sense of
15 potential cost structures, what the capital needs
16 might be and what the operating needs might be.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I'm very concerned
18 about the streetlights and LED light replacements and
19 the Mayor started about... more than a year ago a pilot
20 program where he put auxiliary lighting in several
21 NYCHA facilities so I'm, I'm wondering are NYCHA
22 facilities on the list or on a priority list to get
23 the, the new lighting to be a part of the new LED
24 lighting and if not why not?

1
2 POLLY TROTTEBERG: You know the, the.. I
3 think the NYCHA lighting is done separately from our
4 DOT roadway lighting but that said there is now a
5 working group that is run out of the office... the
6 office of... Mayor's office of, I think it's Criminal
7 Justice looking at... or Public Safety, looking at what
8 we can do in terms of better lighting and public
9 safety improvements around NYCHA developments. DOT
10 and NYPD and NYCHA so we are, I think, all trying to
11 work together. I know the NYPD brought in their very...
12 [cross-talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Right... [cross-talk]

14 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...bright sort of klieg
15 lights which in some places I think people have liked
16 and in some places, they're too bright and not what
17 they're looking for but it's certainly a problem
18 we're trying now to look at collectively... [cross-
19 talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: ...and it was
21 supposed to only be a, a six-month pilot and it has
22 now gone beyond that?

23 POLLY TROTTEBERG: It... and I will say if
24 there are particular, particular areas that you want
25

1
2 to talk to us about that we can take a quick look at,
3 I'd be happy to do that as well.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Great and, and just
5 along with the lighting you're, you're only
6 addressing under overpasses and, and highway lighting
7 and not street grid lighting?

8 POLLY TROTTEBERG: No, we're, we're
9 doing... we're doing all street lighting, the, the
10 city... and it's, it's a... it's a multiple year process
11 to change out all of the city street lights to more
12 energy efficient LED lights. We are in addition to
13 that as, as I... as I mentioned to, to Council Member
14 Menchaca starting to... for our agency to look at what
15 we can do working with the MTA and the state in some
16 cases to improve lighting under elevated structures,
17 less of an issue in Staten Island but certainly in
18 the Bronx and other parts of the city are a real
19 challenging issue.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: So there is a, a, a
21 plan because I'm not seeing it happen in my district
22 so... [cross-talk]

23 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...It... we haven't...
24 [cross-talk]

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: ...I'm... [cross-talk]

1
2 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...gotten to... right, we
3 haven't gotten to Staten Island yet, we are coming in
4 the course of this year.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay, thank you.

6 POLLY TROTTEBERG: And, and I, I will
7 just mention if there, you know we're, we're going
8 borough by borough if there are particular priorities
9 in a given borough happy to talk about, you know
10 where it... my... to get started so happy to talk to you
11 about it.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And just for the
13 record I'd like you to, to know that we're supporting
14 the naming of a ferry for Sandy Ground so I hope that
15 that actually happens. Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you and
17 for... to the rest of my colleagues no offense to no
18 one but please see that we have... also have MTA and we
19 have five more five minutes each a half an hour let's
20 keep it on time so that we can take them to MTA and
21 TLC.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Okay. Thank you
23 Chair, thank you Commissioner. First I wanted to
24 thank you for all the safety measures that you have
25 implemented in my district especially on Canal Street

1
2 and one of my questions is that we have, you know
3 requested a Lower Manhattan pedestrian traffic safety
4 and mobility study and we have put forth that in our
5 budget response to the Mayor's Preliminary Budget and
6 we hope that you would support that because right
7 here in Lower Manhattan and you... you know your office
8 is down here, I live down here and you... we see, you
9 know the, the boom and... in the residential
10 population, hundreds of thousands of people work down
11 here, you know tens of millions of tourists visit
12 down here so we have all these tour bus, you know
13 going up and down, rolling billboard tour bus and we
14 have garbage piling up worst of all we have a lot of
15 cars parking on the sidewalk and of course the
16 biggest, you know problem with placard parking then,
17 then we have agency parking taking up, you know a
18 whole block or two blocks of the sidewalk so... and
19 the, the street down here Colonial Street, back in
20 the days where there weren't that many people or cars
21 and now it's totally changed and did you know that
22 community board one out of 59 community board, it's
23 the 4th worst... has the 4th worst air quality so..
24 because any given day there's over 75 construction
25 projects going on so with all these different

1
2 elements coming together we really need to have a
3 comprehensive view of what we can do down here. I
4 know the last summer you know you test out the shared
5 street program where cars were going five miles per
6 hour and, and you know we had to share the street
7 which I think was quite helpful but every day we use
8 shared streets down here. So, I think that... one thing
9 that we're hoping that we can get DOT to really do
10 this study of Lower Manhattan and how we can tackle
11 all these issues.

12 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Look, happy to take a
13 look at that and as you know we are working at least
14 on some of those different pieces including the
15 discussion we had and what we can do to improve the
16 situation with Park Row and the access into
17 Chinatown, we're also doing a traffic study now
18 around the Holland Tunnel and all those surrounding
19 streets to see what we can do to improve congestion,
20 that's certainly another area where it's an air
21 quality issue. So, doing some pieces of that but
22 happy to talk about what a more comprehensive study
23 could look like.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yeah, I think we...
25 you know I mean we have community board, the borough

1 president is also working with us and then we have a
2 financial district neighborhood association which is
3 very interested in that because it's really an
4 interagency but we're hoping that DOT would be the
5 agency to really take the, the lead in looking at
6 this, we're, we're talking about shared street, we're
7 talking about parking, we're talking about garbage
8 and pedestrian flow, I mean there's so many good
9 public transportation here, do we really need all
10 that car traffic and the Chair earlier... or somebody
11 was earlier was talking about, you know all the
12 delivery, you know all the FreshDirect and all, all
13 the delivery people are getting, it just kind of adds
14 more to the congestion and then on top of that the E-
15 Hail, you know what I mean, people like... they won't
16 even like go down the block to get a taxi, they want
17 someone to come pick them up right in front of their
18 house or office, it just creates a really big mess
19 and we really need to look at doing the study because
20 I know that in the FY '18 budget you allocated 1.5
21 million over two years to do a study on Pier 40
22 development, a traffic study so DOT... [cross-talk]

24 POLLY TROTTEBERG: That's the... that's
25 the study around the Holland... around Holland Tunnel.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yeah, so I think
3 that's something that we really urge you to take a
4 look at the whole Lower Manhattan and really have a,
5 a comprehensive view on that. So, we could definitely
6 continue discussions see if you can, you know put
7 forth some funding so that we could start in this,
8 you know next fiscal year and get it going, I got 41
9 seconds. My other question is that when we were
10 talking about capital projects the Plaza on top of
11 Manhattan Bridge we're still waiting for that to get
12 going, I mean it was avoided one of the plaza
13 projects but it still hasn't, you know moved and
14 that's really critical for the community and flowing
15 down from that on Forsyth Street we also want to see
16 if we can extend the Plaza really have one on the
17 ground where... along Division Street and Forsyth
18 Street, we can really utilize as a Town Square for
19 the community there so that's something that we want
20 to continue to work with DOT on.

21 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Let... I'm going to
22 check on the, the, the status of the Plaza, I think I
23 am happy certainly at least we got this year to make,
24 I think some terrific pedestrian improvements around
25 the Bridge and I'm happy to say I think we're seeing...

1
2 getting good feedback from pedestrians and cyclists
3 and motorists too that that project is working well
4 and let us come back to you on the, the progress on
5 the plaza.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, thank
7 you Chair.

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Commissioner
9 before I call on my colleague and probably you're not
10 ready to answer the question but I, I need to ask the
11 question... ask it to you which is about a Fair Fare,
12 all editorial bore from the Daily News, New York
13 Times they have thrown their support to these
14 important initiatives. Seattle already has a Fair
15 Fare and large numbers of my colleagues also have
16 signed letters of support, as a leader of the
17 transportation system that we have in this city like
18 what can we do to follow Seattle when it comes to
19 provide an important discount on transportation for
20 those New Yorkers who live on the poverty lines?

21 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Look Fair Fare is...
22 and I, I know some of you have heard the Mayor speak
23 about it, there's... [cross-talk]

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And I... the same
25 question is going to be to the MTA, they coming after

1
2 so I understand that we should get the state to be
3 the one responsible so it... I understand the part, I
4 hope that we get something from the MTA but from the
5 city for us to be the same seeing the state all
6 others are not doing it, we are the city, I lead in
7 this too.

8 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Right and I'm, I'm
9 glad you'll also talk to the MTA about it look I
10 think the Mayor has said publicly he certainly thinks
11 the proposal is very worthwhile and understands of
12 course that, you know providing more affordable
13 transit fares for low income New Yorkers would be a
14 tremendous benefit, I don't... I don't think there's
15 really any dispute about that. The challenge is it's
16 a costly proposal and it would be over 200 million
17 dollars per year, I think if you look at the history
18 of things like, like Access-A-Ride or senior fares or
19 student fares the numbers go up so that would mean in
20 a five year period you're, you're going to be over a
21 billion dollars and this would be an ongoing
22 commitment and I think what the mayor has said is at
23 the moment he just doesn't feel like he wants to add
24 that, you know large new commitment to the city's
25 budget but he... I think he's, you know the MTA is a

1
2 state agency and I think he remains open to having
3 that discussion with the state but it is just a
4 question I think at this time in the city's budget
5 about whether we're prepared to take on, you know an
6 open-ended commitment of that magnitude and at least
7 while certainly seeing all the merits in the proposal
8 the Mayor has not yet been willing to commit to that.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I, I just hope
10 that we can again as we're in the middle of this
11 budget negotiation that we even can look at some
12 portion of that plan because we can provide metro
13 card for one group, we can choose let's say a student
14 at community college, 38 million dollars we provide
15 free metro cards towards students going to community
16 college, we can take a group of those who get public
17 assistance so even though I support the whole plan
18 but I hope again that... and I know that we're in the
19 middle of the conversation that we also can look at
20 this even as a pilot project... might start it with
21 something... [cross-talk]

22 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Right and look
23 obviously, we're, we're well aware of that so many...
24 so many council members have had an interest in this
25 and so many groups, you know that are... that the Mayor

1
2 is big supporters of and, you know the city just... I
3 mean for some background as we all know and in
4 partnership with you all the city is making a lot of
5 investments right now in housing, in health care and
6 education to try an increase a quality of reduced
7 poverty, the city has made an... a very large
8 commitment to the MTA capital plan, 2.5 billion so I
9 mean I do think in a lot of ways the city is trying
10 to step up and tackle some of these issues but
11 understood that this will certainly be a, a topic of
12 ongoing discussion and negotiation.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I as, as he
14 already his check on UPK after school for all,
15 computer time for all, basic day, that also we can
16 see, you know is name on leading one of the most
17 progressive causes to see, to serve the disadvantaged
18 New Yorkers for them to move, go to look for jobs or
19 taking their children to a museum. Thank you, Council
20 Member Van Bramer.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you.
22 So, I know we're all being encouraged to be brief
23 and, and respect the fact that the MTA is here so
24 I'll try and do that. First of all I just want to say
25 thank you for the partnership that we've had, you

1
2 were just out on Northern Boulevard with me freezing
3 yet again because you and I only have press
4 conferences if it's about 10 degrees or below and I
5 also want to say your testimony when you referred to
6 the terrific capital investment in the Bridge that we
7 all know and love as the Queensboro Bridge, not the
8 59th Street Bridge or the even it's more full, fully
9 encompassing name so whoever helped write the
10 testimony... [cross-talk]

11 POLLY TROTTEBERG: They should have
12 called it Queensboro, sorry.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: I want to
14 say... no, you, you called it by its right name then...
15 and the... and the name that we appreciate so you had
16 me at Queensboro Bridge Commissioner, let me just say
17 that. You also mentioned the first phase of the
18 Queens Boulevard project which I'm so proud that
19 we've worked together on and the timeline, what is
20 exactly the timeline on when we might expect capital
21 construction to commence on the Queens Boulevard..
22 [cross-talk]

23 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I have... I, I will..
24 [cross-talk]

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

76

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER:

...infrastructure... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...have Deputy

Commissioner Jarrin pull that out for us. I think we're starting next year, aren't we? Okay, go ahead, go.

JOSEPH JARRIN: Council Member the design for Queens Boulevard phase one is starting now and so it should be in... we have it in construction for fiscal year '19 so it should be in the next... by that time.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: So fiscal year '19... [cross-talk]

JOSEPH JARRIN: That's two years from now.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Capital construction... [cross-talk]

JOSEPH JARRIN: ...will start... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: ...starts in two years.

JOSEPH JARRIN: It's, it's now the, the design phase that, that needs to go through with DDC notwithstanding earlier comments on moving these projects quicker but, but we, we hope to make it

1
2 happen in fiscal '18, if we can accelerate that
3 schedule but it's moving forward for, for... definitely
4 for fiscal '19.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Well I
6 looking forward to doing so obviously it's been a
7 remarkable success story, Queens Boulevard formally
8 the Queens Boulevard of death with now zero
9 pedestrian fatalities for, what is it two and a half
10 years now going on which is incredible, I'm really
11 proud of the work that we've all done together and I
12 think when we see the capital permanent, a
13 manifestation of that plan it'll be just so much
14 greater and I'm sure you and I will cut a ribbon or
15 break ground in about five degrees and a snow
16 blizzard when we do that Commissioner...

17 JOSEPH JARRIN: Do you guys work in the
18 spring at all?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: We have not,
20 we have really done several press conferences and it
21 has been absolutely freezing every single time
22 including our walk through of Queens Boulevard.

23 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Citi Bike was warm.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: That's right...

25 [cross-talk]

1
2 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...we did that in the
3 spring.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: ...yeah, that
5 would have been odd if we were riding our bikes in
6 12-degree weather. I want to talk to you about select
7 bus service because you talked very importantly about
8 the select bus service and the funding there and, and
9 I know that the MTA is in the room so I'm, I'm kind
10 of talking to, to both of you at once with the influx
11 in population in Long Island City that is already
12 happened and that is anticipated including the Mayor
13 proposing, rezoning of the core of Long Island City I
14 think its imperative now for both agencies to be
15 talking about and the Mayor investing in select bus
16 service in and around Western Queens in particular so
17 I wanted to ask if, if you are already at the table
18 of the rezoning discussions and if this is part of
19 that discussion?

20 POLLY TROTTEBERG: We, we are part of
21 those discussions and you know one of the mandates
22 actually of the citywide transit study that we're now
23 undertaking was particularly to look at what is going
24 to be the next phase of select bus service routes so...
25 clearly Long Island City and areas all of the city

1
2 are going to be in the mix and, and obviously, we'll
3 be taking input about what the next set of routes
4 should look like.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Yes and I
6 know this goes all the way to the top but obviously,
7 the addition of a, a... an infusion of additional
8 transportation options in Western Queens is
9 absolutely imperative for the future of, of Western
10 Queens and in my mind to any future potential
11 rezoning in Long Island City.

12 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I, I would... I would
13 say that I, I do feel like DOT and city planning and,
14 and the MTA as well have really tried in, in the
15 Mayors new set of rezonings to work together much
16 more closely and try an anticipate I think in a much
17 better way than perhaps was done in the past, how are
18 we going to have all the infrastructure that's
19 needed, the housing, the schools and the
20 transportation.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Absolutely
22 and look forward to continuing those discussions and,
23 and my last 15 seconds I want to thank you also, I
24 mean we're very proud that we're going to be getting
25 additional ferry service in Western Queens and just

1
2 to point out that we are anticipating several
3 thousand new units of housing in the next year or two
4 alone and I had a meeting today that includes
5 thousands of units of affordable housing. So even
6 though we already have a ferry stop in Long Island
7 City it's actually imperative that we continue that
8 progress so those investments are worthy and well
9 placed in Western Queens, you can't do enough in
10 terms of transportation in terms of the growth of
11 Western Queens. I want to thank you again
12 Commissioner for being an exceptional partner with us
13 in all the progress that's happening in my district
14 and in Western Queens and the city of New York.

15 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
17 Council Member Miller followed by Council Member
18 Reynoso.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you Mr.
20 Chair. Good morning Commissioner you and your team.

21 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Good morning.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So I'd like to
23 talk about some of the things that we've been talking
24 about over the past three years as we kind of grow
25 this movement and, and figure out what this vision

1 looks like and, and... we... what we've been talking
2 about where the transportation deserts that were
3 throughout the city as my colleagues mentioned
4 earlier in particular we're interested in Southeast
5 Queens but we're also interested in district... the
6 equitable distribution of those services whether...
7 and, and what that looks like throughout the city. It
8 was also mentioned that we... there were mention of the
9 recent planning Town Halls that have taken place
10 throughout the city needless to say there was not one
11 in Southeast Queens that was disappointed, the two
12 that occurred in, in the borough of Queens was in, I
13 believe Jackson Heights and, and Ridgewood, we
14 certainly requested and I have encouraged all
15 constituency to participate as best as possible so
16 the... although we were out last Monday for the Jamaica
17 Now Plan which is... encompasses a very small portion
18 of the greater Jamaica area outside of the downtown
19 Jamaica community and the, the, the constituency was
20 very concerned about that but what I did notice is a
21 lot of the input that has occurred over the past few
22 years were not a part of that plan and so people come
23 out there very discouraged when they have really
24 personal experiences and viable options around
25

1
2 transportation planning and, and we're not seeing
3 that. So, one of the things I'd like to encourage is
4 to, to come out and really have a Town Hall, myself
5 and Council Member Richards would, would, would
6 really love to do that now that we have the MTA here
7 just, just so you know we would like for you to be a
8 part of that as well. So, and, and then of course
9 it's about coordination of agencies, we're doing the..
10 I know that two.. the Jamaica Avenue was partially
11 done from the city line to Francis Lewis Boulevard
12 and I know DDC was involved and the.. and the rest
13 going in from 168... from Francis Lewis to 168th Street
14 but there's also a Vision Zero Project that DOT is
15 involved in does that include resurfacing of the
16 roadways?

17 POLLY TROTTEBERG: We're... which portion,
18 I'm going to make sure I'm... we're checking... [cross-
19 talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Jamaica Avenue..
21 [cross-talk]

22 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...the right... [cross-
23 talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...going... [cross-
25 talk]

1 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...Jamaica Avenue...

2 [cross-talk]

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...west from
4 Francis Lewis Boulevard to 168th Street.

5 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Okay. Yeah, let us...
6 let us check on that... [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...Eastbound was
8 done already... [cross-talk]

9 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...but check on
10 Westbound... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: ...so... what I also
12 I have a flyer here that was distributed stating
13 that, that the Vision Zero project which would
14 increase the... would include additional mediums and
15 safety methods also repaving so if... I, I just want
16 you to clarify that and give me a timeline on that,
17 that is a, a, a big project that is going on but
18 also, I'd like to... we've heard over the last few
19 years about coordination between the agencies in
20 particular the MTA and what we noticed is that
21 particularly around bus operations and planning that
22 there have not been, that we have not seen what we've
23 asked for which is East, West, North, South
24 transportation opportunities. Not only are we not
25

1
2 connected to the rest of the city, we're not
3 connected to the borough. In order for... we're, we're...
4 our borough is like... our, our districts are right
5 next to each other but everything in the greater
6 Jamaica area forces you to go into downtown Jamaica
7 and take a bus back out to someone that's ten blocks
8 away or a mile away and, and that's something that's
9 so antiquated that we should be able to address that,
10 we've been talking about that and some other issues
11 we hope that collectively we could get to resolve
12 some of those issues and so as we... is there any
13 insight on the Jamaica Avenue plan and while you're
14 at it could we talk about the pedestrian way at
15 Parsons Boulevard?

16 POLLY TROTTENBERG: Well, well let me say
17 first of all we would certainly welcome Council
18 Members the chance to do Town Halls and we... let's try
19 and set those up as quickly as we can, we'd love to
20 have a discussion with your constituents, you know to
21 get obviously some firsthand understanding and we
22 know there are a lot of challenges in, in actually
23 both your districts in terms of transportation, we
24 recognize that, I mean one of the, the good things
25 we've been working through with the MTA, select bus

1
2 service, going out to the Rockaways and also now
3 doing a pilot project on the city ticket to hopefully
4 start to at least bring city constituents who live
5 near Long Island Railroad Stations the chance to use
6 Long Island Railroad at reduced fair so happy again
7 to have that Town Hall and jump into some of these
8 issues in more detail.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: That is great and
10 finally coordination of the, the, the cameras in the
11 bus lanes obviously you know we passed legislation
12 around commuter van, we're very thankful for the
13 assistance around that but the cameras in the bus
14 lanes are outside of the target area and we spoke
15 about that a few months ago and, and hopefully
16 there's a plan to put them where they need to be so
17 that they can really have an impact in easing the
18 congestion and illegal commuter van traffic that we
19 see in the downtown Jamaica area.

20 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Okay, let us... I want
21 to follow up with you again on the... on the camera
22 issue.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you so
24 much.

25 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Thank you.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you for
3 coming out.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member
5 Reynoso followed by Council Member Richards.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Hello
7 Commissioner and thank you for all you do for North
8 Brooklyn, I really feel that we've made a lot of
9 progress when it comes to the safety of our
10 pedestrians, bicyclist and motorists across the board
11 because of the great work that you do. I wanted to
12 ask about the L train shutdown is coming, we have a
13 study in I just want to know if in this budget, it's
14 reflected... or if you've reflected any increase in
15 funding for the possible bodark of a much more
16 complicated gratuity for example and if not how are
17 we supposed to accomplish that, is the MTA paying for
18 it and so forth?

19 POLLY TROTTEBERG: We will be... we're
20 working very closely with the MTA. As you know we've,
21 we've done a lot of public outreach, met with a lot
22 elected officials and we're hoping basically in the
23 next couple of months to come back first to the
24 elected officials with I think a more detailed set of
25 plans and what we're looking for in terms of ferry

1
2 service, bus service, treatments we're going to do on
3 14th Street, treatments we may be doing on Grand
4 Street etcetera. I don't think we... we're, we're still
5 I think in a stage of doing some negotiations with
6 the MTA on exactly what those are going to look like
7 bringing them out to the elected officials and the
8 public, achieving some consensus and then pricing
9 different elements of it so it won't be in the budget
10 this year, it will certainly be teed up for next and,
11 and look we're talking to the MTA about how much will
12 be covered under the grants, the federal grants and
13 funds that they're putting towards this project and
14 what, what might be the city's piece and I don't
15 think we've resolved those discussions yet but we're
16 starting to piece through the numbers.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: And then my last
18 question is regarding bike infrastructure and so
19 forth I see that we get some of that money from the
20 federal government I just wanted to ask are you
21 concerned about losing any funding from the federal
22 government on any of these issues outside of... not
23 only biking but specifically biking I... [cross-talk]

24 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I mean look we, we
25 have used the Tiger Grant Program to make some

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

88

investments in Vision Zero upgrades which have helped with biking safety as well. Luckily for us the, the Tiger Grant Program is an important program but over a six year period the city has gotten about 58 million dollars so it's, it's been a good boost to our resources but certainly the city will continue it's, it's bike and pedestrian safety work, you know regardless of whether that program is around or not although it has been... it has been a source of funds for us.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you, keep up the good work.

POLLY TROTTENBERG: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Reynoso left me two minutes, do I get seven... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member Richards... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: No, I want... I want those two minutes... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: ...following Council... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: 7:43... [cross-talk]

1
2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: ...Member... [cross-
3 talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: ...I went 7:43...
5 [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: The MTA needs to...
7 they... [cross-talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Alright, let me
9 go because I think my time is starting now. Thank
10 you, Chairman, and thank you to the Commissioner and
11 I thank Council Member Miller squarely put what, what
12 I wanted to focus on today. So, I want to thank you
13 first of all for your leadership and partnership on
14 the extension and both the MTA, the extension of the
15 52 and also Select Bus Service for the 52 and 53 and
16 also ferry service and, and, and whatever more we're
17 going to do together I guess in terms of streetscape
18 work this year in, in my district as well. A few
19 issues that I wanted to bring up. So, median upkeep
20 which is a huge issue, sanitation department, DOT
21 always point at each other when it comes to
22 maintaining medians in our district and I'm sure
23 across other parts of Queens and other parts of the
24 city they are going through the same thing. It's a
25 big issue in our district because it causes flooding,

1
2 you know when DEP puts green infrastructure in its
3 put in to sort of soak up rainwater and, and help
4 with, with, with water overflow. The issue we're
5 having in our community is the lack of investment and
6 upkeep on, on a lot of these medians, there's no curb
7 cuts around them so I'm interested in hearing are you
8 budgeting any money to make sure that this issue is
9 finally addressed?

10 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I mean you, you are
11 right Council Member its certainly an issue I hear
12 about all over the city and you know one where I
13 think we're doing our best to work with local elected
14 to prioritize those areas where we can target
15 investments. Now happily in, in Southeastern Queens
16 obviously we're going to be... the city, DOT and DEP
17 are going to be working together on a lot of major
18 roadway and, and water and sewer infrastructure which
19 I think will do a lot to improve some of those areas
20 over all but if there are particular median areas you
21 want us to take a look at let us come take a look, as
22 I say I mean at this point admittedly we do... we have
23 to prioritize given that it is some... [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And also just
25 keeping them clean so I hear that we have to call 311

1
2 but the upkeep of this infrastructure is disastrous
3 and there needs to be more of an emphasis on upkeep
4 as well so can you speak to that as well?

5 POLLY TROTTENBERG: I mean again we work
6 with... we work with sanitation on that and you know if
7 there are places that unfortunately are being I think
8 particularly not as well cared for as they should
9 let's try and work together and focus on those.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay, alright.
11 Traffic studies so we work very closely with your
12 Queens office and I'm very happy at... with the
13 progress that we have made but I feel there's a lot
14 more progress that could be made if we had more
15 traffic study engineers out there, is there any money
16 in the budget to make sure... because this is the
17 number one issue at least in Southeast Queens;
18 speeding cars and I'm sure across the city there are
19 many other people with the same challenges but one of
20 the issues we find is the lack of engineers that we
21 have or the, the little bit we have we can't maximize
22 on opportunities that I feel we can move through to
23 make sure a lot of these traffic studies move a
24 little faster.

1
2 POLLY TROTTEBERG: As, as, as I had I
3 think said in my opening testament look a challenge I
4 think a lot of city agencies are seeing, we have, you
5 know all of you and, and you constituents come to us
6 with... for example requests for, for traffic signals
7 and we have seen in recent years the number of
8 requests we're getting for those types of studies has
9 doubled and each of those studies requires engineers
10 to go out and you all, many of you are familiar with
11 this, requires engineers to go out in the field and
12 do analysis and traffic counts. So, I, I'm... I want to
13 be grateful to the Mayor, he has given me resources
14 and we have increased the number of traffic engineers
15 and teams we have out there doing this study but it's
16 also true that the demand in a growing city
17 understandably is also continuing to grow. So, you
18 know particularly we're seeking to prioritize best we
19 can and you know happy to talk if there are areas
20 where you're feeling frustrated that we're not
21 getting to them but we are certainly I think having
22 some growing pains in terms of the incoming... [cross-
23 talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...yes... [cross-
25 talk]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...volume of, of study requests we're getting.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay, city ticket any update on city ticket actually happening in Far Rockaway and I know the MTA is here as well and we've been having this same discussion for the last I feel like 15, 20 years so do you have any updates on... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTEBERG: Well we... we're making some progress and I know the MTA will, will speak about this in more detail, I mean they have proposed along with our... the last time we looked at fares and tolls to do a pilot project to pick certain... to pick certain... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: No, I get that... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTEBERG: Yeah... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I get the freedom... [cross-talk]

POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...you want... you... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...ticket but I'm... [cross-talk]

2 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...want... you want to
3 fix... [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...talking about...
5 [cross-talk]

6 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...the Rockaways...
7 [cross-talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...city ticket in
9 which Far Rockaway is the only... [cross-talk]

10 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...right, yeah... [cross-
11 talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...station...
13 [cross-talk]

14 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...is the only station...
15 [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...in New York
17 City... [cross-talk]

18 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...that doesn't get it...
19 [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: ...that doesn't
21 have city ticket... [cross-talk]

22 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I know it was on the
23 MTA's list of things they were considering and so I
24 guess I'll, I'll let them give you the final answer
25 on that one.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Alright...

3 [cross-talk]

4 POLLY TROTTEBERG: We are certainly
5 supportive of it.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Since I have 17
7 seconds I will direct all of the rest of my testimony
8 to the MTA because I have to step out for a meeting
9 but I am disgusted with the MTA's communication with
10 my community and I was recently informed that the MTA
11 is no longer doing community meetings and I just find
12 that disturbing and disgusting, you know I think for
13 New Yorkers across the city who paid their fare, I
14 just paid mine this morning, they deserve to hear
15 from the MTA on issues that are happening in their
16 communities while I appreciate the freedom ticket
17 pilot I will give you kudos for that but on city
18 ticket on the A train which is dismal service our
19 community deserves answers and we're not going to
20 stop lobbying to ensure that there's better service
21 not only in the Rockaways but Southeast Queens is a
22 whole... we are being give third world service in terms
23 of bus service, in terms of train service and it's
24 just disgusting that we have to continuously have the
25 same discussion and then be told that we don't do

1
2 community meetings and I have a problem with that and
3 my constituents have a problem with that and they
4 deserve to hear directly from the MTA so I'm hoping
5 after this meeting, you know I will definitely hear
6 from the MTA on this policy that I think is nonsense
7 and, and a policy that does not serve the public
8 well. So, I'm sorry I'm a little angry about it but
9 my constituents deserve better and this city deserves
10 better. Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member
12 Greenfield.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you Mr.
14 Chairman. Welcome back Commissioner, how are you
15 today? I can't hear you, I'm sorry, is the mic off?

16 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I'm well, thank you
17 Council Member.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Is that an
19 off the record comment?

20 POLLY TROTTEBERG: No, no, it was on the
21 record... [cross-talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: First of all
23 I, I'm noticing a Queens bias over, all that you... you
24 keep visiting all the Queens members, I haven't seen
25 you in my district in a while, can we get you to come

1
2 visit, is it possible or do you just go to the Queens
3 portions of... [cross-talk]

4 POLLY TROTTEBERG: No, I'm in... I'm in
5 five boroughs... [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...the cities...
7 [cross-talk]

8 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...would be happy to...
9 [cross-talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...yes... [cross-
11 talk]

12 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...do a visit with you
13 in your district.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Oh wonderful,
15 so I'm looking forward to that just a little council
16 member jealousy there. So, I, I would like to focus
17 first on some... because it is a budget hearing, I'll
18 focus first on some of the budget items and then
19 I'll, I'll leave some of the other stuff for the end.
20 I also want to add my voice as a, a strong supporter
21 of the Fair Fares movement and certainly whatever can
22 be done in that regard, I think you may have heard my
23 comments in the last hearing even though you weren't
24 here, you sent one of your trusted advisors and I'm
25 sure he dutifully reported back my passionate

1
2 feelings on this subject. That being said I'm going
3 to move on to some of the budget related issues. Last
4 time we were chatting you said that you guys had some
5 struggles with the bus time and the bus shelter
6 contracts, have you fixed those problems?

7 POLLY TROTTEBERG: We have fixed them
8 and look I, I, I do want to apologize we, we did have
9 some struggles, we had both contracting struggles and
10 then it took us more time than it should have to
11 ensure that we were doing the proper accessibility
12 for the visually impaired. So, I have to apologize to
13 Council Members, we had promised we would get that
14 out, up and running sooner than we did but we are on
15 track now this year in this spring we're going to be
16 rolling out the funds that were allocated fiscal year
17 '13 and fiscal year '15 so we're hoping to get about
18 225 up this year and the rest in the next year.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Are my... are
20 my bus lines included in that?

21 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I believe you're...
22 what year was your allocation?

23 REBECCA ZACK: '16... [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: What's that?
25

2 REBECCA ZACK: I think your allocation
3 was in FY '16.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Was it in '16
5 I thought it was... [cross-talk]

6 REBECCA ZACK: I think so.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I thought it
8 was '15... [cross-talk]

9 POLLY TROTTEBERG: We, we have the
10 chart, we'll double check, we're, we're going to be
11 doing '13 and '15 this year and '16 and '17 next year
12 and, and again I, I... [cross-talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Okay, what
14 about... [cross-talk]

15 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...I'll admit... [cross-
16 talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...what about
18 the bus shelters, I know we had some drama with those
19 as well so that's for the bus time, right?

20 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Right.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: What about
22 the bus shelters?

23 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I mean the, the...
24 putting in the new bus shelters... [cross-talk]

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Yeah... [cross-
3 talk]

4 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...we have you know a
5 contract with JC Decaux which has been the city's
6 contractor on all the bus shelters and you know the
7 contract we originally had with them had had a fixed
8 number of shelters we've been in some discussion
9 about how we might expand that program, I have to
10 admit so far, we have not I think reached... [cross-
11 talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: So you
13 haven't had any success with that?

14 POLLY TROTTEBERG: We have not had any
15 success yet in reaching a resolution... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Well
17 disappointing to here. I'm, I'm just simply
18 responding to you based on the information that I see
19 here as we're going through a participatory budgeting
20 process and the number one request was new bus
21 shelters but we couldn't put the funding in because
22 we knew that it wouldn't go anywhere so... I certainly
23 would encourage you to look at that model. What about
24 in lei of bus shelters in the meanwhile can we get
25 some benches in maybe instead of bus shelters, we

1 don't need full shelters if you have the ability to
2 install benches at bus stops for those elderly folks,
3 I know you're young but you know for them older folks
4 it's difficult for them to stand and wait for the bus
5 and they don't even know when it's coming because the
6 bus time clocks were supposed to be there years ago
7 still haven't been installed.. [cross-talk]

9 POLLY TROTTEBERG: They will be coming..

10 [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...yet so..

12 [cross-talk]

13 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...the bus time clocks,
14 I'm happy to.. I'm happy to look at locations.. [cross-
15 talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...I mean at
17 least.. [cross-talk]

18 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...for benches.. [cross-
19 talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...my thought
21 is if they knew that the bus time.. when the bus was
22 coming maybe they would sort of steal themselves and
23 sort of say oh the bus is coming in a few minutes but
24 now they have to stand there and hope and wait and so
25 if at least we give them some seats perhaps we'd make

1
2 their lives a little bit better and they are elderly,
3 some of them are sick.

4 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Yeah, happy to look
5 at locations for benches and, and fair point to
6 continue to wrestle though what has turned out to be
7 complicated in terms of expanding the contracts to do
8 new bus shelters.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: But you
10 definitely could do benches?

11 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Okay. Let's
13 chat a little bit about snow cleaning, whose
14 responsible for snow cleaning of the bus stops, in
15 the last storm I know we were... we thought it was
16 going to be the Armageddon but it wasn't in the end,
17 it was six, seven, eight inches and it took in some
18 cases three, four days to clear the, the bus stops,
19 right, I'm not talking about the shelters, I'm
20 talking about a regular bus stop where people would
21 just sit there and wait, I mean I actually literally
22 saw people trying to get off the bus tripping over
23 mounds of snow, whose job is that and why haven't
24 they been doing it?

2 POLLY TROTTEBERG: The shelters... the,
3 the... [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Not the
5 shelters... I get the shelters are... [cross-talk]

6 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...the, the... [cross-
7 talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...under
9 contract... [cross-talk]

10 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...bus stops... [cross-
11 talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...the regular
13 good old fashioned... [cross-talk]

14 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...right, right...
15 [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...bus stops...
17 [cross-talk]

18 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...well I mean... [cross-
19 talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...like the
21 poles with those little signs.

22 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Right, right, DOT
23 works with sanitation on those and look one, one
24 challenge we had this particular snow storm is some
25 of those areas got cleaned and then re-plowed again

1
2 and then sometimes what got re-plowed got frozen into
3 a state that really required actually people to come
4 out with shovels and pick it open but... look I think
5 we always have lesson learns in every storm about how
6 we can do things better and we always do a... sort of
7 an after action where we look at where we got
8 complaints and weren't... things weren't done as well
9 as they could have been and try and be shrewder about
10 how to redeploy our resources for the coming storms.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFEILD: Final
12 question because I'm out of time, you mentioned my
13 funding for sidewalks the sidewalk funding will... what
14 is that going to go for so for example I've got a lot
15 of broken sidewalks, parks have broken sidewalks in
16 my district, the police department have broken
17 sidewalks in my district, is that separate pots of
18 funding or is that part of the funding that you're
19 referring to in terms of the sidewalk repairs and
20 good luck getting the parks department to... or the
21 police department to actually fix their sidewalk?

22 POLLY TROTTEBERG: It, it is a separate
23 pot, we have been for example in the case of NYCHA
24 using some of our sidewalk funds to help fix
25 sidewalks around NYCHA because there's been such a

1
2 pent-up need there, if you're seeing other areas
3 where there's real neglect of sidewalks we should
4 talk about that and, and see if there's something we
5 can do to work together with those agencies.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I look
7 forward to welcoming you in the 44th council district
8 and perhaps you and I will take a stroll along my
9 favorite... [cross-talk]

10 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Your favorite
11 parkway... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...Boulevard,
13 Busch... [cross-talk]

14 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...I'd be happy to do
15 that... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...Parkway,
17 absolutely, it's a date. Thank you Commissioner.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member
19 Constantinides has one question.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES:
21 Commissioner always good to see you. I was outside
22 this morning with James, ABC we had... looking forward
23 to ferry launch. So, my question relates to Steinway
24 Street, you know many of the merchants have
25 approached me and, and really... it could be a bad

1
2 experience moving forward, you know I can buy a phone
3 online, I can buy a sweater online so shopping is
4 going to become the experience on the block and how
5 we can support our local store to go from the Gap to
6 Children's Place just equally distanced across the
7 street because there are no midblock crossings on
8 Steinway it's an extra 1,000 feet. It doesn't make it
9 convenient to get across, we've had 95 pedestrian
10 injuries and, and 243 traffic injuries on Steinway so
11 we're looking for more LPI's and then looking for a,
12 a, a town square or place to light a holiday tree, a
13 place to have a concert or place to have a town
14 meeting so I, I spoke to Nicole whose been great but
15 we definitely need your support in helping us think
16 through how we think about 21st... Steinway in the 21st
17 century and supporting the beating heart commercial
18 strip of our neighborhood.

19 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I mean Commissioner
20 Garcia has filled me in on your conversations with
21 her, something that she I know is enthusiastic about
22 and would love to sit down and actually maybe take
23 another walking trip through and then talk about what
24 we can do to help you there, we, we think we could do
25 some really great work there.

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION 107

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I'd, I'd
3 love to invite you to come do that, I mean... [cross-
4 talk]

5 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Okay and we'll... and
6 we'll do it.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you
8 Commissioner.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Commissioner I
10 have like two or three more questions on... to
11 summarize; one is on... and this is like one of the
12 concerns Council Member Miller had which is when DOT
13 is doing road repair do you or can you work to put
14 this information online so that members of the
15 community they know what they should expect in their
16 local community?

17 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I mean we, we try and
18 do as, as good a job as we can I think in getting the
19 word out and we put it online, we send announcements
20 to all the community boards, the local precincts, I
21 usually see that the local papers around the city
22 will print our resurfacing schedule for the week. if
23 you've... if you've... and I know this is something that
24 Council Member Deutsch had mentioned the last time I
25 testified if there are places where we think there's

1
2 some failure in communication let us know and we'll,
3 we'll try and improve it, it's certainly... we want
4 everybody to know our schedule ahead of time so that
5 they can obviously plan for it.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: You do put it
7 online?

8 POLLY TROTTEBERG: We put it online, we
9 send it out to the papers, the community boards, the
10 precincts, I mean I think we... I'm looking over at my
11 communications crew, I think we try and get the word
12 out best we can all over the, the internet.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, that's
14 good. And, and with the bus shelter in Council Member
15 Miller... I mean Greenfield had started this question,
16 it's very frustrating to see how those private
17 contractors they are not living to their
18 responsibility, it's too much and, and what's going
19 on like when can we expect that when we have a new
20 snow in our streets the bus shelter will be clean
21 like ice... I to... and I, I can... I know like in the past
22 I have sent photos to you guys so that you can see
23 and this is not about please let her know which bus
24 shelter are in that condition, this is about... you
25 know are we... are they reporting, how we put in this

1
2 information online. So, I saw people like three days
3 after the, the snow that got in the city being in the
4 middle of the street because the bus shelter was full
5 of snow like what... how are we making those private
6 contractors accountable for them to clean not in
7 particular area but in all bus shelters that we have
8 in the city?

9 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Mr. Chairman this is
10 obviously a topic that we've discussed before and I,
11 I think this past year we actually had a sit down
12 with, with JC Decaux and you to try and talk through
13 some of the issues, you know we are now looking at
14 them to clear the 3,500 bus stops every time there's
15 a storm and I think one thing we, we did... when I, I
16 spoke to you and I did look into what was happening,
17 you called me about some stops in your district and
18 obviously there was some other members who had
19 tweeted about it and we, we sat back down with them
20 and I think one of the challenges we saw and we're
21 going to be I think working through this and
22 obviously maybe your staff can be a part of the
23 discussions is one of the things we require them to
24 do is get in and clear the stops kind of on the same
25 time table that we have homeowners clear the

1 sidewalks but the one key difference is when a
2 homeowner clears their sidewalks they're clear, when
3 JC Decaux is... has their... has their contractors come
4 out and clear the bus stops unfortunately what, what
5 did happen this last time is in a lot of cases
6 sanitation came through and plowed the snow back in
7 again. So, we're going to try I think and sit down
8 and see if there is a... and then once that happens
9 then they'll complaints and then it takes them a
10 while to get back out and clear them again. So, I
11 think we're going to love to have your staff
12 participate, sit down and see do we need to have a
13 smarter protocol in the contract that will ensure
14 that by the time they clear the stop that it stays
15 clear and we're also going to bring sanitation into
16 that discussion to see... so at the very least we don't
17 re-plow back the stops that... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I, I... [cross-
20 talk]

21 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...that the contractor
22 has just dug out because that is clearly something
23 that's happened and that's not the only issue but
24 that is one that certainly when I looked at some
25

1 cases that people were calling in about that was one
2 of the problems we saw.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, I
5 understand that again and, and I know that you're
6 working hard the agency and... you know we had that
7 experience with Cemusa in the past now it can be with
8 the new one JC, it's about thousands of New Yorkers
9 relied to take the bus especially senior citizens and
10 we know that, we know that probably they go and clean
11 once or twice a day and then sanitation they have to
12 do their work and they plow the snow inside the bus
13 shelter but we have to find a solution because, you
14 know... [cross-talk]

15 POLLY TROTTEBERG: ...yes... [cross-talk]

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: ...people cannot be
17 waiting in the street or not to having a space to..
18 especially senior citizens.

19 POLLY TROTTEBERG: We, we agree, we're,
20 we're going to re-circle and, and see if there's a
21 smarter protocol we can do for, for next winter's
22 storms.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah and, and my
24 other question is on... and it's more with the interest
25 to know will the DOT work with intersection, we have

1
2 seen an expansion of more advertising in the sidewalk
3 is that a pilot project that you're doing with this
4 section or the contracts are ready for them to be
5 advertising and, and is that advertising that we see
6 in the sidewalk an agreement where also the city
7 benefits... [cross-talk]

8 POLLY TROTTEMBERG: Do, do you mean the,
9 the link NYC... [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yes... [cross-talk]

11 POLLY TROTTEMBERG: ...kiosk... [cross-talk]

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: ...uh-huh... [cross-
13 talk]

14 POLLY TROTTEMBERG: That's really a
15 program that's being run out of City Hall, out of..
16 out of DoITT, the, the Mayor's Technology Office, I
17 mean DOT we're... we sort of play a supporting role in
18 helping as those kiosks go up and making sure they
19 have the electrical connections and the permits they
20 need but we're, we're not the lead agency on those,
21 its, it's DoITT.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Who is the lead
23 agency?

24 POLLY TROTTEMBERG: DoITT and roast, the,
25 the, the Department of Technology... I don't know what...

1
2 even what... Information Technology, I apologize I'm
3 not even sure of the answer... [cross-talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And, and again
5 for me I, I see as a good move for us to take
6 advantage of, you know the sidewalk but I'm more
7 thinking on how if their... that agreement with the
8 city and, and the private entity are we also using it
9 for... do some educational Vision Zero for the city?

10 POLLY TROTTEBERG: Yeah, I, I know that
11 they.. a certain amount of that advertising is
12 provided for, for public service announcements and I
13 think we have been talking to them about doing a
14 series of Vision Zero messages.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And SBS and BRT,
16 how... what are the challenges and again like it's good
17 to go with... transition for here for you leaving then
18 MTA coming on board and I know that making more BRT,
19 bringing more buses, bringing more technology from
20 the MTA but also when it comes to really signing our
21 sidewalk and also working with the... with the light
22 signal so for the buses to be moving quickly like how
23 are we... I mean and, and we saw the jump of New
24 Yorkers using buses in the last two years so... and it
25 should be our business to take... to bring back those

1
2 New Yorkers, we can argue that you know those close
3 to two million who are not using buses anymore they
4 are doing it because they are using app services
5 because they... we have the ferry transportation, I get
6 that part in the argument but I also believe that
7 there's another reason on why New Yorkers has say...
8 I'm not taking the M3 bus in Washington Heights
9 because I can get to my destination faster if I walk
10 than if I get into the bus and here we have good
11 experience with it be... SBA and the BRT and I see...
12 like SBS I take it... why do we turn that SBS as a BRT
13 so that we really send a sidewalk that we bring all
14 the tools that is part of the BRT to that SBS and do
15 we have another SBS throughout the city that also we
16 can bring anything that we have, any tools that they
17 need to provide those New Yorkers a better experience
18 for them to get to their destination quickly?

19 POLLY TROTTEBERG: I think... it's, it's
20 good to sort of distinguish between... I think the
21 three different things you're, you're talking about
22 Mr. Chairman BRT, Bus Rapid Transit which is
23 basically the highest level where you're, you know
24 you're potentially re-construction, redesigning the
25 street, putting in a lot of passenger infrastructure...

1 Woodhaven Boulevard was one of the places that we
2 really want to do that and I'll, I'll talk a bit
3 about some of the challenges we faced there then kind
4 of the next level which is what we I think have done
5 in great partnership with the MTA which is Select Bus
6 Service which is not as much of an elaborate capital
7 project, what... but what has enabled us to put
8 projects up all over the city relatively quickly and
9 relatively low cost, you know in the... in the ten to
10 20 million dollar range as opposed to capital
11 projects which in this city as we all know can often
12 cost hundreds of millions and we've... I think I'm
13 proud to say tripled the rate working with our
14 partners at the MTA in which we're doing those Select
15 Bus Service projects but they are time consuming,
16 they do require I think appropriately so a lot of
17 community outreach and a lot of working really
18 closely at a very glandular level with local
19 merchants and buildings and other, you know users on
20 the curb and making sure that as we speed our bus
21 speeds of... as we have done with Select Bus Service
22 that we're keeping the other parts of the street
23 functioning well. You also mentioned something that's
24 another area where we want to do more with the MTA
25

1 and actually where I'm happy to say the MTA board has
2 been really having a robust discussion, what can we
3 do to improve bus service all over the city even on
4 routes that are not Select Bus Service routes and you
5 know we know the toolbox of things. One is dedicated
6 bus lanes which in some parts of the city have
7 honestly proved more popular than in other parts of
8 the city. Doing transit signal prioritization which
9 requires both the city and the MTA to... the city needs
10 to, to put electronic components in its signal
11 system, the MTA needs to have some electronic
12 components in their buses and we've got a few routes
13 with transit signal priority, I think both agencies
14 agree we'd like to pick up the pace on that. It, it
15 does do a lot to speed bus speeds. The MTA is also
16 now in the midst of their procurement as a lot of us
17 know for their next generation of fare medium, moving
18 from the metro card to whatever is going to come next
19 and I, I think I've said before this is a very, very
20 important procurement something everyone in the city
21 should care about, this is kind of a once in a
22 generation change in fare median, I think the city
23 has certainly encouraged the MTA to look at something
24 that is contactless, something that can particularly
25

1
2 for buses be done perhaps off board because one of
3 the things you see particularly on busy bus routes,
4 cross town routes in Manhattan a lot of the time that
5 the bus is dwelling it's dwelling while people get on
6 the bus and swipe their metro cards and if you can
7 have that happen as we do with SBS off board that can
8 speed up the travel time tremendously. There are
9 technological issues to work through there and the
10 MTA... and they'll... I'm sure they'll speak about it,
11 wants to make sure it's not going to lead to, to a
12 ramp in fare evasion although it hasn't in the case
13 of Select Bus Service. So, I think there's all three
14 levels of challenge. Woodhaven Boulevard is a project
15 where we would like to do something more robust like
16 a more BRT treatment with a big capital plan, you
17 know we are going to be putting in this year the
18 operational project, it's no secret it's been pretty
19 controversial, I'm hoping when that's in the ground
20 and it works well people will see the benefits of it
21 and then we can move on to the next bigger level of
22 the project and that's something that I think will be
23 a good showcase for other parts of the city to see.

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: You know for me I
25 look at not only... I, I see as important need to move

1 quick in that direction because we cannot attract
2 teachers let's say to go and teach in a school where
3 they don't have access to mass transportation. Now
4 there's a school in places in the Bronx and Brooklyn
5 that people got to be walking like they... the closest
6 thing that they have to go to the school and teach is
7 a bus because the train is like 20 blocks away from
8 there and this is probably one of the great access
9 that we have today because its less expensive than
10 building us a new train and it doesn't take as long
11 as making a new train and I just thought that we as a
12 city working together, DOT and the MTA, you know we'd
13 make this as a priority, we need to improve the
14 efficiencies and the safety of the bus system in New
15 York City. We have been behind other cities in the
16 world and, and I know that other places they only run
17 buses up to ten p.m. or 12 p.m. and we can say our
18 buses are there 24 hours but for many New Yorkers
19 this is the only access to transportation that they
20 have so I'm happy to hear that you're working on that
21 and with that thank you for your participation and
22 now we're going to be welcoming... [cross-talk]

24 POLLY TROTTENBERG: Thank you... [cross-
25 talk]

1
2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: the MTA. Thank
3 you.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, let's
5 continue. So, as I said before now we will have the
6 MTA institution which entity has a value of one
7 trillion dollars responsible for running one of the
8 most important mass transportation not in the nation
9 but also in the world and, and I think that the
10 conversation here as it all happened before is coming
11 from the place of how much more can we do. The MTA is
12 refusing to go to community to be a community board,
13 yes they did in my district and, and that's something
14 that... you know like I only see as a benefit for us to
15 engage in conversation to listen and how can we do
16 better and, and, and I just hope that if by any
17 chance that's not a general policy that we learn from
18 those experiences and you will hear from all the
19 council member as I say in my own district, I have a,
20 a Town Hall meeting with public advocate and myself
21 with more than 200 residents sitting on Northern
22 Manhattan to talk about... and the only thing that they
23 came was to grow the suggestion on the condition of
24 the elevator, how to improve it and I don't know why
25 that we got like the last minute of conference for

1 nobody in that... in that Town Hall meeting but I hope
2 again that this is not a general decision of the MTA
3 and we can work together because everyone here is
4 responsible to move and not only the 8.5 million New
5 Yorkers but also more than 55 million tourists that
6 come to our city so with that I welcome the MTA.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right
9 hand, do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole
10 truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony
11 before this committee and to respond honestly to
12 council member questions?

13 [dialogue of affirmatives]

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

15 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Good afternoon Chairman
16 Rodriguez, can you tell me if Chairwoman Ferreras-
17 Copeland is here today too? I thought this was a
18 joint hearing with her committee? If not I'm backing
19 off and I'm starting again... [cross-talk]

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: This is a
21 preliminary budget this chair is organized by the
22 Committee of Finance but is run by each committee and
23 therefor this is Committee of Transportation.

24 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Okay. Good afternoon
25 Chairman Rodriguez and members of the city council. I

1 am Michael Chubak, Chief Financial Officer for New
2 York City Transit. Joining me today are David Keller,
3 Senior Deputy Director for MTA Budget and Stephanie
4 DeLisle, the Director of MTA Capital Funding. We are
5 here today at the Council's invitation to discuss the
6 Mayor's Fiscal Year 2018 Preliminary Budget,
7 particularly as it relates to the City's contribution
8 to the operating and capital budgets of the
9 Metropolitan Transportation Authority. The MTA is
10 pleased to have a fully funded 29.5 billion dollars
11 2015 through 2019 capital program which includes 2.5
12 billion dollars in funding support from the City of
13 New York and 8.3 billion from the State of New York.
14 this is the single largest capital program in the MTA
15 history and a major accomplishment towards our
16 efforts to transform, renew, enhance and expand the
17 system. Overall, the MTA's current five-year capital
18 program, approved last spring allocates more than 16
19 billion dollars in capital funding for New York City
20 Transit initiatives to improve and expand the system.
21 The city has also contributed one billion dollars, or
22 nearly seven percent, of our annual 15.6-billion-
23 dollar budget to support day to day operations of New
24 York City Transit, MTA Bus, and Staten Island
25

1
2 Railway, as well as the maintenance of the commuter
3 rail stations within New York City. The MTA is
4 working hard to be a prudent steward of the funds
5 targeted for mass transit. In our February financial
6 plan, MTA increased its savings targets by 50 million
7 dollars per year and expects to achieve annual
8 recurring savings of two billion dollars per year by
9 the year 2020. This cost cutting effort is the most
10 aggressive in the MTA's history and the savings we
11 are realizing are benefitting our operations and our
12 customers in countless ways. Most notably, it has
13 allowed us to keep fare and toll increases at an
14 average of two percent per year, below the rate of
15 inflation. In fact, this year's increase is the
16 smallest increase since 2009. NYC Transit is also
17 committed to continually identifying innovative, cost
18 effective solutions for long standing operational
19 challenges, and addressing concerns created by the
20 very high ridership and capacity constraints our
21 system is experiencing. As many of you know, we are
22 seeing record high ridership, the heaviest ridership
23 we have experienced since the years following World
24 War II. On the subway system alone we serve close to
25 six million riders on 8,000 daily trips across 472

1 stations. Our capital program seeks to renew and
2 enhance the system to accommodate this growing
3 ridership. We took a big step toward that goal with
4 completion of the first phase of the Second Avenue
5 Subway earlier this year, marking New York City's
6 first new subway line in over 60 years. With three
7 brand new fully accessible stations at the 72nd
8 Street, 86th Street and 96th Street, Q train service
9 now links the Upper East Side to Midtown and the West
10 Side. Second Avenue Subway ridership is continuing to
11 grow and is already alleviating crowding at Upper
12 East Side stations along the Lexington Avenue line
13 during morning rush hour by an average of 46 percent.
14 We are also making substantial investments to
15 modernize the signal system. Much of the subway's
16 signal system was built in the 1930's, and roughly 30
17 percent of the signal system was installed before
18 1965 and has never been rehabilitated. Signal
19 failures are a major cause of subway delays. This is
20 why we are spending 2.75 billion dollars in the
21 current capital program to modernize our signal
22 system, including more than one billion dollars to
23 install Communications Based Train Control, CBTC,
24 which will allow trains to run more closely together
25

1 and more reliably. We are working to install CBTC on
2 the EFM and R lines in Queens, the AC and E lines in
3 Manhattan, and the F line in Brooklyn. CBTC is
4 already fully in place on the L line and is nearing
5 completion on the 7 line where we are spending 774
6 million dollars to complete the work on the Flushing
7 line by the end of this year. We are also spending
8 1.8 billion dollars to replace 72 miles of track and
9 127 switches. This work will improve reliability on
10 line segments and reduce defects and failures, as
11 well as reduce impacts to service. And, we are
12 investing billions on new subway cars, including new
13 open ended connecting cars, with wider doors and more
14 space near the doors to add capacity. This
15 configuration will allow customers to distribute more
16 evenly in the train, thereby helping to reduce dwell
17 time and delays. The MTA is also investing heavily to
18 improve the passenger station environment. The MTA
19 has accelerated cellular connectivity in underground
20 stations, as well as Wi-Fi capability to meet the
21 demand of our customers for underground
22 communications and connectivity. As of January, cell
23 phone coverage and Wi-Fi are available in all
24 underground subway stations a full two years ahead of
25

1
2 schedule. Our "Enhanced Station Initiative" is
3 revamping the design guidelines for more than 30
4 stations system wide to completely overhaul these
5 stations in the most efficient way possible. In order
6 to fast track the renovations, the stations will be
7 temporarily closed, enabling the contractor to get
8 in, get the work done, and get out quickly.

9 Contractors are incentivized to keep closures as
10 short as possible. When they are reopened, stations
11 will have improved signage for easier navigation,
12 including digital, real time service updates at
13 subway entrances before customers even enter the
14 station, as well as countdown clocks, and new art
15 that considers the architectural legacy of each
16 station. NYC Transit is fully committed to making the
17 subway system increasingly accessible to customers
18 with disabilities. We have completed 86 of the 100
19 Americans with Disabilities Act, ADA Key Stations
20 designated via our agreements with the Federal
21 Transit Administration and New York State. All of the
22 remaining 14 key stations are scheduled to be
23 complete by July 2020, consistent with these
24 agreements. Elevators are also installed in an
25 additional 31 non-key stations. We are also

1
2 accelerating the implementation of countdown clocks
3 to the entire system on a line by line basis. The
4 exact timeframes will be announced for each line,
5 with the goal of having all lines completed by the
6 end of this year. This effort will provide real time
7 train arrival information to customers awaiting
8 trains on station platforms. The new clocks rely on
9 technology that is straightforward, cost effective to
10 deploy, and does not require major construction; it
11 utilizes the existing wireless network in the
12 stations in conjunction with cloud computing and
13 Bluetooth devices located along the platforms of each
14 station to accommodate, to... excuse me, to communicate
15 with Bluetooth devices installed in the first and
16 last cars of every train operating on the line. We
17 are also expanding and renewing our bus operation.
18 The first of 83 new busses equipped with Wi-Fi
19 service and USB ports have arrived in the Bronx. The
20 first 43 new SBS buses have also arrived in the Bronx
21 and Queens. The new arrivals are part of the
22 Governor's initiative to revitalize the MTA's bus
23 operations with over 2,000 state of the art buses
24 joining the fleet over the course of five years. The
25 new buses will replace nearly 40 percent of the MTA's

1
2 current fleet and represent a 1.3-billion-dollar
3 investment of Capital Program resources. The MTA is
4 also working closely with the New York City
5 Department of Transportation to cut bus travel times
6 by converting additional routes to Select Bus
7 Service. In addition, the MTA has installed digital
8 information screens on 131 buses as a pilot on the
9 M15 SBS, B46 SBS and S79 SBS routes, with the aim of
10 rolling out digital screens to 3,600 buses. The
11 digital screens will offer audio and visual route and
12 next stop information, including transfer points.
13 Beginning this year, all new buses delivered to the
14 MTA will come with digital information screens and
15 all buses that are not earmarked to be replaced over
16 the next five years will be retrofitted with the
17 screens. These are just a few highlights from a
18 diverse and robust program that invests in nearly
19 every aspect of our operations and infrastructure,
20 modernizing, enhancing, replacing and bringing
21 essential system components to a state of good repair
22 for the record ridership we experience... excuse me, we
23 expect to experience for the foreseeable future. The
24 City's investment in the MTA yields tremendous
25 dividends, as subway, bus and commuter rail

1 operations are critical to the day to day functioning
2 of New York City and provide the foundation for the
3 economic well-being of the City and the region. Our
4 capital program is creating hundreds of thousands of
5 jobs, in New York City and the region, and will
6 continue to fuel our region's thriving economy for
7 decades to come. We thank the City for partnering
8 with us financially and otherwise to deliver safe,
9 reliable service to New Yorkers. My colleagues and I
10 will now respond to any questions you may have with
11 respect to our testimony. Thank you.
12

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. I
14 would like to start with bus service as you heard
15 sitting back there, this is something that many of us
16 we have a concern as also many New Yorkers which is
17 the decrease on New Yorkers using buses like have the
18 MTA done some study or trying to figure out why is
19 that we have seen a major decrease of New Yorkers
20 giving up from using our public buses?

21 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So we... [clears throat]
22 excuse me, the decline in bus ridership actually is
23 a, a long-term trend that's been going on for many
24 years. There was a time after the introduction of
25 Metro card when ridership picked up on buses but

1 since 2009 or so the historical decline has resumed.
2 One of the major reasons we believe is competition,
3 essentially the subway has improved over the last 20
4 or so years and so it provides an alternative to bus...
5 to bus riders and we've noticed one fact which is
6 that on routes that parallel... excuse me, bus routes
7 that parallel subway lines ridership is declining
8 more. I should also point out that the, the ridership
9 decline on buses is not uniform, it's been pronounced
10 in Manhattan and less so in Brooklyn but in the other
11 three boroughs; the Bronx, Staten Island and Queens
12 ridership has basically been holding steady for the
13 past few years. One of the obvious problems is
14 traffic and congestion which reduces bus speeds and
15 we're convinced that higher speed speeds can help
16 encourage ridership and in fact our experience with
17 SBS confirms this, as the, the package of
18 improvements that we've implemented in conjunction
19 with the New York City DOT for SBS has resulted in
20 faster speeds and also better ridership results for
21 those lines.
22

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I, I would like
24 to say that, you know that the main factor of the
25 reduction is the competition but I also agree with

1 many New Yorkers say we've been leaving negative
2 experience. We get to destinations faster if we walk
3 than we take a bus and because of traffic and because
4 so many factors. So how is... and like I say like M3 in
5 my district like I heard the complaint from hundreds
6 of New Yorkers like... and what are we doing like... you
7 know like are we... is MTA working with the DOT to say
8 like you know this is not only because we had the
9 apps company, this is not because people are
10 switching more to, to prearrange a car but being
11 realistic and say like our buses are running slow,
12 you know...

14 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So we're looking at a... I
15 mentioned SBS, we're also looking at improvements
16 other than SBS again in conjunction with DOT, the two
17 most notable would be to install bus lanes
18 independent of SBS, we're very hopeful for that as
19 well as to reconsider the spacing of bus stops to
20 improve speeds but, but it's, it's a difficult
21 challenge. There's obviously a lot of congestion out
22 there.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I just hope... I
24 just hope you know that we can decide to leave a
25 legacy because you... no, we're, we're going to be

1
2 doing business as usual, we will one day leave our
3 role and somebody else will take him... that will come
4 and take it and the buses will continue running as it
5 is today and I think that we had a potential, we have
6 a ceiling to grow when it comes to bringing like a
7 major problem, providing a better experience for
8 people because for some people let's say Manhattan
9 sometimes we had choices but someone who is a teacher
10 as I said before in a school in the Bronx and the
11 only modern transportation that they have is to take
12 a bus to get close to their school and the time of
13 waiting and the time for them to go from destination
14 A to B is taking so long like that's not the best way
15 of how we can recruit teachers to say I would like to
16 go and teach in that school but now that same
17 experience for a parent who also is saying I would
18 like to take my child... my children to a after school
19 program or a cultural event like... and again we can...
20 we don't have the billions of dollars to build a new
21 train in those areas, the only thing that we have in
22 our hand is our buses and I believe... and you are the
23 experts on that, I think it'd take less money if we
24 work together in this case led by you guys and be
25 sure that we can move our buses quickly in, in our

1 city. The second question is on the CBTC again I
2 represent a district that we cover A train in
3 Washington Heights but the A train, you know is not
4 only... is very important not only for residents of
5 Northern Manhattan but for many New Yorkers coming
6 from Queens and then going to Northern Manhattan and
7 the train again is a... it's a long road, a route
8 however it's a slow train and what we heard from you
9 guys and others from your team is that if the CBTC...
10 you know when the CBTC is complete it will help the
11 train to come quickly to the train station how are
12 we... I mean and you mentioned in your testimony the
13 whole plan but what is the deadline, when are you
14 planning to complete all the new work that you're
15 doing with the CBTC?

17 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So the... it will take a
18 good number of years to be honest to, to convert to
19 CBTC the entire system. The... in my testimony I
20 mentioned and... the improvements we're planning in
21 this capital program on the AC and E line and you
22 mentioned the A train so I can say that that, that
23 project is expected to be awarded towards the end of
24 this capital program which is to say 2019 and it will
25 cover the, the piece of... the section of the line,

1
2 excuse me, from 59th Street to J Street. I know you
3 mentioned Washington Heights but the truth is the
4 improvement from the central section, from 59th
5 Street and J Street will really improve the operation
6 on the entire line and then... so I would say that
7 that's the time frame at least for the A train.

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: My next question
9 is about the possibility of a, 67 million dollars
10 being reduced to the MTA by... the state budget, is the
11 MTA ready to get the 67 million dollars from other
12 sources or are you confident that the end of this
13 budget, the 67 million dollars will be put back to
14 the MTA?

15 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So the, the 67 million
16 dollars which some people call 65 million dollars is
17 only one element in a very large package of subsidies
18 that we get from state sources that package totals in
19 the vicinity of 4.5 billion dollars annually and
20 while that particular item has in fact gone down by
21 65 million dollars the total package is going up by
22 30 million dollars from last year's budget to this
23 year's budget and so I as a budget guy and, and
24 bottom line oriented and so we're focusing on the
25 improvement of the 30 million dollars and our

1 financial plan, the latest version of which was
2 presented in February includes the latest information
3 with regard to expected state... excuse me, state
4 subsidies and so in fact we do believe that we can
5 and will accommodate the new state budget.
6

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Access-A-
8 Ride what is the plan, are... is the MTA ready to work
9 or any discussion of the MTA to work with the TLC
10 since we have thousands of cars sitting in park... at
11 parking garages and we heard that they were some
12 conversation on doing some pilot project with an
13 entity that they could supplement the demand for the
14 Access-A-Ride, is there any possibility to use the
15 green... the city borough taxi, green taxi and, and the
16 green taxi medallions also to be included as
17 providers for Access-A-Ride?

18 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Yes, we have as you
19 mentioned been doing a pilot and we are now ready to
20 proceed to the next step which is to develop a... an
21 agreement for what we call E-Hail which is a program
22 that, that TLC is sponsoring and, and we are hopeful
23 that we'll be able to incorporate E-Hail vehicles
24 which isn't just yellow and green taxis, it's also
25 some other providers as well but we are looking

1 forward to including that because the truth is our
2 objective is to develop as many different channels,
3 as many different means of accommodating paratransit
4 customers as we possibly can because with more
5 choices we're able to choose the right one for any
6 individual trip and thereby keep our costs down as
7 well as improve the service we provide.
8

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Right. My last
10 one before calling my colleague is about elevators
11 and this is going to be very local. This is about my
12 district, 168 A train and 120 station and C train
13 like you know we have one of the major New York City
14 hospital there and Columbia Medical School and
15 thousands of residents live in this area and the
16 elevators are out of order... out of service, one train
17 doesn't stop at 168 therefore it keep going to 181st
18 and 181st... is it like a domino effect because at 181st
19 we only have two elevators where there's not any
20 stairs there and we have a negative impact at 181st
21 as also it doesn't allow patients or family going to
22 visit any patients or students or residents in this
23 community and while... I heard that, you know the money
24 is there but can the MTA work you know in a plan to
25

1
2 expedite the process to address the situation with
3 those elevators at 168th?

4 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So we're familiar with
5 the situation and while our elevator service and
6 escalator service around the city we think does very
7 well. We acknowledge that at 168th Street there have
8 been some problems. We've responded to that by
9 assigning maintenance employees to be on site at the
10 station during the a.m. and p.m. rush hour every day
11 in order to respond to any problems that might arise
12 and we've also put in place a procedure whereby if
13 something goes wrong and the station platform starts
14 getting crowded to the point of becoming dangerous we
15 then would inform transportation management that
16 trains need to skip the station which I understand
17 from what you said is, is not the best solution but
18 we are concerned with safety. Ultimately the solution
19 for the elevators at 168th Street is to replace them
20 with new ones and in fact we have a project in our
21 current capital program that will rehabilitate, well
22 it's actually 12 elevators at three stations but it
23 includes all four elevators at the 168th Street
24 station and that project is being designed right now
25 and we expect to award it next year. So that

1
2 hopefully will be the ultimate solution to this
3 problem.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, I also
5 would like to bring to your attention to look at the
6 elevators at 191st A train too, I have also heard
7 some... a concern from some residents for that area of
8 that one of those elevators are being out of service
9 very often so I had not been there personally but I...
10 this is a complaint also or a concern that I also
11 heard from some resident about the A train a, at
12 191st elevator.

13 MICHAEL CHUBAK: We will do that, thank
14 you.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
16 Council Member Vacca.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you Mr.
18 Chair. The Chair touched on the elevator escalator
19 issue, I have to touch on that as well. We have very
20 few elevator, escalators in the Bronx, very few in my
21 district, the ne we have at Pelham Bay Station is
22 constantly breaking down, it was out again last week,
23 we never know when it's out, how long it's going to
24 be out until the MTA post a sign but my question is
25 we can't have all these outages constantly when we

1
2 have disabled people who depend on these elevators
3 and escalators and without them getting to where they
4 want to go becomes really almost impossible situation
5 so my question for you is when do we... well how much
6 money do we have in the budget to repair elevator,
7 escalators or replace them when they age and do we
8 have a hard time getting parts for these elevators
9 and escalators because I was told two years ago when
10 I had the elevator out at Pelham Bay Station that
11 parts had to be sent for and that it would... and that
12 it took months so do we have... can you answer these
13 questions for me please?

14 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So I will say that some
15 of our machines; elevators and escalators are in fact
16 more than 20 years old and in situations like that it
17 is possible that it is difficult to get parts, that's
18 a fact, I can't speak to the Pelham Bay Station in
19 particular, I'm not really familiar with that one, I
20 can also say that we are working through the capital
21 program to replace elevators and escalators on a
22 consistent basis. In fact, in the current capital
23 program we will for the first time be replacing many
24 of the elevators that were added for ADA purposes
25 originally in the program, it's now reached a point

1
2 where those elevators are now scheduled for
3 replacement. So, we are in fact allocating sufficient
4 money in order to maintain a regular replacement
5 schedule for those units but I, I honestly don't know
6 enough about the, the Pelham Bay Station in
7 particular to speak to, to that issue.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Well I'd like you
9 to look into it, we have constant outages. Those are
10 the original escalator, elevators so these, these are
11 the originals basically I think they were built in
12 the late 80's and if, if we have to replace more than
13 parts and get new updated... [cross-talk]

14 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: ...elevators and
16 escalators I want the public to be served in that way
17 and I'd like someone to get back to me to tell me..
18 [cross-talk]

19 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I, I understand and we
20 will get back to you on that.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Okay. You
22 mentioned signal stations, I'm going quickly but we
23 have time... you know time issues, you mentioned the
24 signal stations they're very important signal
25 stations because of course updating them allows

1
2 trains to move quicker but I noticed in your
3 testimony on page two all... we have no signal
4 modernization plans in the Bronx, we have Queens, we
5 have Manhattan, we have nothing in the Bronx...
6 Brooklyn, we have nothing in the Bronx in so much as
7 updating our signal stations and I'm a strap hanger,
8 I'm on the 4, 5, 6 train and if you can see how
9 overcrowded it is the fact that signal stations being
10 old and antiquated hurts the mobility that we could
11 have if they were updated.

12 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So in fact the, the
13 Bronx has had its signals rehabilitated, they, they
14 basically had their signals rehabilitated really just
15 before the advent of CBTC. So, while the signals in
16 the Bronx are not CBCC they're sort of our prior
17 technology, they are in fact new, the Pelham Line,
18 the Jerome Line, the White Plains Road Line, those
19 have all been completed probably in the last 15
20 years... [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: The last... the, the
22 Pelham Bay Line's been updated?

23 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Yes.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Well then, I have
25 to tell you that even with these updates I... then I

1
2 want other neighborhoods not to hold out hope because
3 the, the overcrowding is just tremendous on many of
4 our trains. The, the, the timing and the overcrowding
5 is tremendous and I know we're getting more
6 passengers but we don't have enough capacity for what
7 we're getting to be honest with you and I, I'm, I'm
8 thrilled that the Second Avenue Subway opened and
9 that the Governor was able to get it so quickly but
10 that did help some but we have to look at ways to
11 help further address the overcrowding issue if you
12 can.

13 MICHAEL CHUBAK: We will.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Also Middletown
15 Road Station was rehabbed and I think there was a
16 lawsuit because the Middletown Road Station was not
17 rehabbed with an elevator, escalator there was.. the,
18 the advocates filed a lawsuit on that, are you aware
19 of that and I wanted to know if you were what the
20 status was?

21 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I'm aware of the issue
22 but I don't know what the current status is. It has
23 not been resolved I can tell you that.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I'm just concerned
25 and I know there's a price tag to it but we're, we're

1
2 renovating new... we're renovating stations and not
3 including handicap accessibility and that's what
4 happened at Middletown Road and I know there was a
5 lawsuit so if someone can get back to me to, to let
6 me know about that I would appreciate it.

7 MICHAEL CHUBAK: We will.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member
10 Chin followed by Council Member Miller.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you Chair,
12 good afternoon. I wanted to start off first with a
13 compliment about opening up the J Line on Broad
14 Street in the weekend that has been great, I've seen
15 a lot of ridership at that station especially on the
16 weekend and after hours because in the past they
17 closed at seven and it was closed on the weekend. So
18 that... I think that's a, a wonderful addition
19 especially with the growing population in Lower
20 Manhattan, I ride the J Train but one of the things
21 though is causing a lot of confusion is in the folds
22 and transit help with the signage's often time people
23 gets on the wrong J Train, they wanted to go to
24 Queens and they ended up on Broad Street the last
25 stop and they all... they get out of the train and they

1
2 got to go up and they got back to the other side and
3 so I think there should be some better signage at
4 Fulton Street to really help guide people to the
5 right train, that's one thing. The other thing I
6 wanted to follow up on is the, the question about the
7 paratransit, the Access-A-Ride. I chair the Committee
8 on Aging and often time the biggest complaint we hear
9 from seniors is how unreliable Access-A-Ride is. So,
10 I'm glad that you are, you know trying out a new
11 program and I'm looking at that you are reflecting an
12 annual saving about 280 million dollars in terms of
13 these paratransit spending, I just wanted to make
14 sure that there is sufficient... that you're using
15 enough funding to really improve this program.

16 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I'm not really familiar
17 with that savings estimate but I can assure you that
18 we are allocating sufficient funds in the budget to
19 meet our paratransit obligations.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Can you give us
21 some more information in terms of how many riders
22 that have Access-A-Ride and they are using the other
23 program that you offer like the, the low-cost voucher
24 and taxi?
25

1
2 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So I don't have those
3 numbers off hand, no I'm, I'm, I'm not really sure of
4 the... of the breakdown between the various... between
5 the various modes so I can't give you that
6 information but... [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Well if you could
8 follow it and give it to us because it would be good
9 to really see if, you know if seniors and, and people
10 with disability are taking advantage of these
11 programs and then they do see that their improvement
12 in sight, if they are not happy with Access-A-Ride,
13 if they have this... you know they're able to take
14 taxis and... or other, other forms of transportation to
15 get them where they need to go I think that is really
16 critical and we also want to make sure that, that you
17 sort of expand this program because you talked about
18 early in... that there is an agreement with the E-Hail
19 industry, with the yellow and green and other
20 options?

21 MICHAEL CHUBAK: No, there's no agreement
22 yet we're working towards that.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: You're working
24 towards that?

25 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Yes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Okay, how far... how
3 soon can you get it going?

4 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I can't answer that
5 question because I don't know, it's... [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Can you get back to
7 us?

8 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Yes... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: ...because it
10 sounded... [cross-talk]

11 MICHAEL CHUBAK: ...of course... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: ...great, right, I
13 mean that... there's going to be more option out there
14 for our seniors, I mean even though not everybody use
15 the computer and to be able to take advantage but the
16 one that... who actually have the skill and can utilize
17 it, it would be great.

18 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Yes, well we're very
19 hopeful but I'll have to get you that information.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Okay. Yeah because
21 I just wanted to stress the point that Access-A-Ride
22 has been problematic and we just want to make sure
23 that resources are put in to improve the transit
24 options for our seniors. Okay, so we'll look forward
25 to getting that information. The other question I

1
2 have is that a couple of weeks ago, a month ago there
3 were... the F Train wasn't running over the weekend and
4 we heard that there were some issues about fixing the
5 tunnel and that in the future that might happen even
6 more often?

7 MICHAEL CHUBAK: This was the... [cross-
8 talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Is that part of
10 your capital project?

11 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I... it probably was... did
12 you say the F Train?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: The F Line, yes.

14 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Which portion of the... of
15 the line was out of service, do you know?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Coming in to from
17 Brooklyn.

18 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Uh-huh. I, I don't know
19 the particulars, undoubtable was a capital project..

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: If you can get back
21 to us we just wanted to see if there was some future
22 planning on the F Line, you know with the tunnel,
23 repair issues, we want to make sure that the
24 community are informed that we could, you know work
25 on preparation before that.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MICHAEL CHUBAK: We will do that.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, thank you Chair.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member Miller and also, we've been joined by Council Member Deutsch.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you Mr. Chair, good afternoon. So, I'm... I, I have tons of questions here so I, I want to get through them really quickly but more, more importantly if we can't finish I do want to kind of just verify whether or not there is a new policy around community, community engagement for the MTA, are you or are you not participating in community Town Hall and other meetings?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: I'm not sure about the terminology Town Hall but I can say that we do participate with community boards at their meetings.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aside from community boards.

MICHAEL CHUBAK: I'm not sure then.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Is somebody there sure?

1
2 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I, I don't have the
3 answer.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Come on... come on,
5 we need answer like you know New York City makes
6 major contributions and, and we have a great level of
7 collaboration and, and I think again if that has not
8 been happening we need to fix it, okay, if that is
9 not happening, is that a commitment that the MTA, you
10 know you have a governmental relation team always
11 with whom we have great access and we have to weigh,
12 we know... we continue developing the great working
13 relationship or you know we take it like everything
14 public and we go after you guys.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So, so... yeah,
16 that, that... you know first of all I've, I've spent 27
17 years in the MTA family spearheading many of these
18 such meetings and, and so they have been done in the
19 past up until a few months ago that's why I asked if
20 it was a new policy and whether or not... so, so this
21 is very important that we be able to engage the
22 community as to some of these projects that are going
23 on. So, I... so I just want to keep going and, and if
24 not perhaps we can have this conversation in the
25 district. So, from looking at your budget on the... on

1
2 the collective bargaining agreement that is reflected
3 with the past TWU collective bargaining agreement is
4 there money set aside for that pattern to be
5 continued with the outstanding bargaining units?

6 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Yes, we... once the
7 collective bargaining agreement was reached with TWU
8 we made any necessary change to our financial plan to
9 reflect that as the pattern for other unions going
10 forward.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So I do happen to
12 know that there are other locals out there who, who,
13 who have been out without a contract since 2012 who
14 are looking to have the same pattern and, and, and I
15 hope we can take you at... for your word that this will
16 certainly occur but I'm not going to be-label that
17 either. In terms of, we talked about state funding
18 and subsidies that exist I know in the past the, the
19 MTA has not taken a favorable position in supporting
20 dedicated funding legislation those are hundreds of
21 millions of dollars that are obviously earmarked for
22 the MTA but we're not seeing what is the current MTA
23 position on that?

24 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I don't believe it's
25 changed.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: It doesn't change
3 so when folks are, are paying recording fees and,
4 and, and whatever surcharges that, that clearly say
5 that this is for the MTA it's okay that that money
6 doesn't go back to those communities?

7 MICHAEL CHUBAK: To my knowledge
8 dedicated taxes that are earmarked for the MTA do go
9 to the MTA.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: They go directly
11 to the MTA and not into the stake office?

12 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Do you want to weigh in?

13 DAVID KELLER: That varies actually by
14 type of tax, the mortgage recording tax for example
15 which you stated actually is collected by the county
16 clerk's offices and transmitted directly to the MTA,
17 there are other taxes that are collected by the state
18 and then they... then they send them to... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: How, how, how
20 much... how much... how much would you say that are
21 dedicated MTA funds that, that, that are allocated
22 annually then how much of would you say are
23 collected?

24 DAVID KELLER: I do not have the answer
25 to that, we'd have to look into that for you.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, we'll,
3 we'll, we'll get back to that one. The capital plan,
4 Jamaica Depot what is... what is the status of, of that
5 location, have they purchased all the adjacent...
6 adjoining properties, is it ready to go, I see on
7 here 2019 what is the actual status of that?

8 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I'm not sure if the.. all
9 the property has been sort of assembled but the
10 capital program continues to include that job and,
11 and so we're hopeful.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So that money is
13 still in the capital budget earmarked for, for
14 Jamaica Depot?

15 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Yes, it is.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, I'm, I'm
17 sorry and I know I did have an additional few seconds
18 there. What, what is... what is the current age of the
19 fleet of buses and what is the current... do you have
20 outstanding orders to purchase buses and, and what
21 are we looking throughout the city, I know when we
22 met last year at this time we were... we were woefully
23 insufficient and had not received... we were on a back
24 log?

1
2 MICHAEL CHUBAK: There was a period in
3 fact when bus purchases weren't keeping pace and so
4 the average age of the fleet had been rising however
5 we have been catching up on that regard. The current
6 capital program includes 1,400 buses and there are
7 other buses still not yet delivered from the prior
8 capital program. So, we are in fact making good
9 progress.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Commuter equity,
11 some might call it the freedom ticket that is where
12 there is an adjustment in the fare in, in certain
13 communities wherever metro North or Long Island
14 Railroad, stops in the city of New York, we'd be able
15 to access it of those communities where it is
16 currently cost prohibited such as Southeast Queens
17 where I represent somewhere where it takes me an
18 average of one hour and 40 minutes where I live 4.2
19 miles from the subway and then take the subway from
20 the first to the last stop and it cost ten dollars
21 one way and then I have to pay 2.75 but for those
22 whose average commute is... there has been a proposal,
23 there has been a suggestion that there will be a
24 pilot, do you have any update on that?

1
2 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So the MTA board has
3 authorized a field study of the, the Freedom Ticket
4 ideal and the MTA staff is working on putting that
5 together, so yes, we will in fact be looking.. and
6 when I say field study I mean an actual limited
7 implementation... [cross-talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Right... [cross-
9 talk]

10 MICHAEL CHUBAK: ...not just a study on
11 paper.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So do you have
13 any information on that?

14 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I don't have the timing
15 but I know that it's being worked on.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, so that
17 would also.. it.. that would also help to alleviate
18 obviously overcrowding on lines such as the E, the F,
19 the J, the number 7 because there's no additional
20 room for capacity, right so that is kind of a win,
21 win for, for not just for those who are currently
22 cost prohibited but alleviating the, the overcrowding
23 on some of those lines as well. I, I thank you, I
24 have a lot of questions but... for operations... can I
25 just one more question. So, there was a question

1 about enforcement of cameras in bus lanes and so
2 forth for the department of buses and to my knowledge
3 does the... does the superintendents and the Department
4 of Bus... buses still have the ability to write
5 summonses?
6

7 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I don't know, I know
8 they used to but I, I'm not 100... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Could you turn
10 and ask someone who knows?

11 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Does anybody? Yeah... not
12 100 percent but we believe they do still have that
13 authority.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So we... because
15 we, we have this tremendous problem in enforcement,
16 we passed four bills around illegal commuter vans
17 throughout the city but no one's enforcing that, we
18 can't get TLC and so forth and the buses cannot pull
19 into a bus lane which has cameras, which is a
20 dedicated bus lane because there are hundreds of
21 illegal vans out there and, and there is a method
22 already in place because bus superintendents have the
23 ability to write summonses, could we get the MTA to...
24 [cross-talk]

1
2 MICHAEL CHUBAK: We'll, we'll try to
3 confirm that for you.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay, thank you
5 so much for your time.

6 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Thank you... [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you Chair.

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Before I call on
9 my colleague... the... one is related to the... to the area
10 in Queens where they had to take two buses and then
11 to take a train is the MTA trying to look at those
12 areas and provide opportunity for those New Yorkers
13 in areas such as in Queens that have to deal with
14 that reality to be able to say we can transfer from
15 the two buses to a train?

16 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I know that there are a
17 limited number of locations in the city where an
18 extra transfer privilege is provided, I would need to
19 know the specific routes or the location that you
20 have in mind.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, I, I just...
22 that's... at least you know we can... I can bring it to
23 your attention but some of my colleagues they have
24 brought to my attention that there's some area...
25 that's there's some area that... you know that's,

1 that's a reality that people they have to take two
2 buses and they take a train and I think that if we
3 can look at it and see if anything that the MTA can
4 do to address that... those... you know... my only thing
5 is... my other thing is about New Yorkers who take the
6 bus and they pay cash when they get a transfer they
7 cannot transfer from there to the train.
8

9 MICHAEL CHUBAK: That's true.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: How can we... how
11 can we... [cross-talk]

12 MICHAEL CHUBAK: The simple solution is
13 to buy a metro card... [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, but...
15 [cross-talk]

16 MICHAEL CHUBAK: That was a deliberate
17 decision that was made when metro card was first
18 introduced as a way of encouraging metro card
19 utilization.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: No, I'm 100
21 percent on board but in our city we have close to 50
22 to 70 New Yorkers who live on the poverty line, you
23 know like and that's a reality so I remember myself
24 when I was a student at city college sometime I
25 walked, many times from 174th Sherman Avenue Inwood

1
2 to City college not because I thought that walking
3 health... walking was very good for my health which I
4 realize it today but it was because I didn't have the
5 money and that's a reality for 100,000 of New Yorkers
6 so I understand the rational but how can we also
7 understand that there's people out there they don't
8 have the money to buy a week metro card.

9 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I didn't say a weekly
10 metro card; any metro card will give you a transfer
11 privilege to the bus and if you're... if you're desire
12 is take the bus and then transfer to the subway you
13 will need a metro card to get on the subway.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: but don't you
15 think that those who pay cash is like the poorest New
16 Yorkers that they don't have the money to buy the
17 metro card?

18 MICHAEL CHUBAK: But it's the same price,
19 it's the same 2.75... [cross-talk]

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: ...but it isn't
21 fair after I pay my... pay my fare in bus cash that I
22 cannot get it transferred to take a train so I have
23 to pay another fare in a train.

24 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Right but if you have a
25 metro card you won't have to do that, so the 2.75

1 will cover the whole trip and, and, and as a subway
2 rider there's no issue of the metro card being
3 available or not, it, it's... [cross-talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But we, we, we do
5 agree that there's a group of New Yorkers that they
6 don't have money to buy the metro card.
7

8 MICHAEL CHUBAK: If you don't have the
9 money to buy the metro card you don't have the money
10 to drop in the bus.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: It's not true, we
12 have a percentage of people that they have limited
13 cash all they have is like just say whatever is equal
14 for that fare at that moment, we have homeless people
15 and I don't expect answer if you don't have the
16 answer okay I just wanted to bring it to your
17 attention to know that, you know like let's look at
18 the number, how many of those groups... and, and I'm
19 for bringing more incentive for, for people to buy
20 the metro card but also we have to realize that
21 there's that group of New Yorkers that they live on
22 the poverty line, that sometimes they don't have the
23 money to buy the metro card or they have the cash
24 there and that's all they have to use but they have
25 to transfer from the bus to a train.

1
2 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I hear what you're
3 saying, I'm not sure what the answer is.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, Fair-Fare
5 do you think that we should provide 50 percent
6 discount for people who live on the poverty line?

7 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So there's no doubt that
8 the Fair-Fare Proposal would provide a valuable
9 benefit to low income New Yorkers but it's really a
10 social services question, we don't think it's a, a
11 decision for the MTA to make, it's really a, a
12 question of social policy and would need to be
13 decided upon by New York City or the Regional
14 counties and municipalities for their riders as well.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Council
16 Member Greenfield.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you Mr.
18 Chairman, welcome back Mr. Chubak. I noticed a new
19 title, Chief Financial Officer is that new?

20 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Since October.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD:
22 Congratulations.

23 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Thank you.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I appreciate
25 your decades of service to MTA and New York City

1
2 Transit. A few quick questions for you, F Express my
3 favorite topic as... you know something I've been
4 fighting for since I... since before I was elected to
5 the city council, do you have an update for us on
6 that, last year there was a recommendation to move
7 forward with the F Express and then I know there was
8 some... I know it's shocking but there was some
9 politics involved and it seems like that the analysis
10 may have slowed down; do you know where we're at on
11 that?

12 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So it is true that the,
13 the recommendation last year was in favor of the F
14 Express but we mentioned at that time that we
15 couldn't do... couldn't take any immediate action
16 because of scheduled capital work that was taking
17 place on the line. The immediate project at that time
18 was station renewals that are still taking place and
19 so with that still the case we don't have any new
20 news to give you but I can tell you that the matter
21 is under review within MTA.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS GREENFIELD:
23 Okay, good I encourage you to move towards six more
24 positive steps, I can tell you that in that section
25 of Southern Brooklyn it's... as you know it's veritable

1 transit desert, folks who are getting into Manhattan
2 and as you further down the line the significant
3 economic disparity partially because of the fact that
4 they don't have the same transit options that other
5 folks have so it'd be very important to give folks
6 that slight benefit that they used to have as you
7 know until it was taken away some 30 odd years ago.
8 Thank you for that. The train times and I'm also
9 going to focus a little bit locally for a moment then
10 I'll go back to some of the global questions. On the
11 F, D, and Q Lines when do you expect that to, to
12 come?
13

14 MICHAEL CHUBAK: That would be by the end
15 of this year, we're, we're aiming for.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Okay, great.
17 Any plans to get Wi-Fi on the trains themselves and
18 congratulations on getting them on the underground
19 stations. I certainly appreciate it, just so you know
20 every time I pull into the underground stations I get
21 my little e-mail updates.

22 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So do I but we have no
23 plans to do Wi-Fi on trains, no.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Okay.
25

1
2 MICHAEL CHUBAK: At least not at the
3 moment.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: The Q Line in
5 particular heavily trafficked line has seen a
6 significant increase in ridership and honestly even
7 in the non-peak rush hours very congested line, have
8 you folks look at maybe adding some service on that
9 line?

10 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So we have... [clears
11 throat] excuse me, we have... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I'm referring
13 of course to the Brooklyn just to be clear as..
14 [cross-talk]

15 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I understand, we, we
16 have... [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...the Brooklyn
18 to Manhattan line during the rush hour in the
19 morning.

20 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So we have what we call
21 our loading guidelines which is essentially a set of
22 standards that matches service to the ridership on
23 the line so if in fact as, as you're suggesting
24 ridership has increased on the Q then we would be
25 able to see that in our statistics on ridership and

1
2 if it's not during the peak period when we are
3 capacity constrained then that would translate
4 potentially into an increase in service.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: If you could
6 take a look at it I'd appreciate it, you have a
7 loading guidelines I'd refer this... I'd refer to that
8 line as fully loaded, it's beyond standing room only
9 even past sort of the peak, you know seven or eight
10 a.m., folks taking it even later tell me, you know
11 nine, ten o'clock it's still very full in the
12 mornings so I'd appreciate you taking a look at that.
13 I'm curious one of the issues that we've discussed
14 for quite a while here in the council and its
15 certainly my personal pet peeve is the issue of bus
16 bunching's, you know this is phenomenon where several
17 buses at a time pull into a bus station, it's very
18 frustrating for people because you've waited a while
19 and you realize that if you miss those several buses
20 you're not going to wait a further while, I've heard
21 all the answers as to why this happens and you know I
22 know... I trust that it's not a conspiracy by the MTA
23 to intentionally delay the riders but it seems like
24 in 2017 with all the technology that we have out
25 there, there must be a way especially considering GPS

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

tracking of buses which you currently have of adjusting that schedule so that doesn't happen because it's perhaps one of the most frustrating things for bus riders, have you studied that, do you have a solution for that, are you cognizant of the fact that this is a very important and frustrating issue for literally hundreds of thousands of New Yorkers?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: So I've not studied it personally... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Well I, I wasn't suggesting that... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL CHUBAK: I, I can tell you... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...Mr. Chubak... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL CHUBAK: ...I can tell you that... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...I mean has the MTA studied the issue?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: Right... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Yes, I don't expect you to study every issue personally.

1
2 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Thank you. I can tell
3 that with the advent of bus time and now that the bus
4 time has been rolled out to the entire fleet we do in
5 fact have access to information that we never used to
6 have and it is possible that that might be a
7 potential mechanism for doing... for undoing bus
8 bunching, let me put it that way but... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Sure. So,
10 I've, I've heard... [cross-talk]

11 MICHAEL CHUBAK: ...I'm speaking only...
12 [cross-talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...that...
14 [cross-talk]

15 MICHAEL CHUBAK: ...conceptionally..

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I've heard
17 that before and we, we brought it up in past
18 hearings, I think it was Lois who I believe has since
19 retired, right, good for her, I hope she's enjoying
20 wherever she's watching this from on her live feed
21 but I do think it's an important point because we've
22 raised it in the past as... if the technology exists it
23 is a very worthwhile investment and I would ask that
24 because this is a budget hearing that you follow up
25 and send us what the costs involved would be to in

1 fact implement that technology because you have the
2 technology to actually implement it to make sure that
3 the bus bunching doesn't occur because I can tell you
4 that it is certainly the most frustrating feature for
5 one of... for any one of your riders which is to either
6 notice that you've waited for an hour and then three
7 buses show up or to run to the bus station and notice
8 that three buses have just left and realize you will
9 now have to wait for another hour and once again I
10 trust that there isn't a vast conspiracy among the
11 drivers as some of my constituents actually believe,
12 I'm, I'm, I'm saying that's not the case but I
13 certainly think that if we have the technology if you
14 could price at... cost it for us and tell us what it
15 would cost to actually do that and how we can do that
16 I think that would be very helpful.

18 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So I, I don't what to
19 belabor this topic too long but I, I think... [cross-
20 talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: No, no it's
22 worth discussing... [cross-talk]

23 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I, I think... [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...I promise
25 you the... [cross-talk]

1
2 MICHAEL CHUBAK: ...you're, you're making
3 a... [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...right now in
5 New York City there are thousands of people sitting
6 there and angry because a bus or two or three have
7 pulled up all at the same time so this is worth
8 discussing I assure you.

9 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So I, I think you're
10 making a leap in, in presuming that there's simply a
11 question of how much will it cost to use the
12 technology to solve the problem, we don't know in
13 fact that it can be done, what we would need to do is
14 in effect experiment with that. What I would like to
15 add though is that while customers may still be
16 subject to bus bunching now that we have bus time
17 data there at least is information in their hands to
18 let them know when the bus is coming.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: That's fair,
20 I would just point out though and actually this
21 directly relates to and I'll wrap up Mr. Chairman,
22 thank you, this directly relates to my last
23 conversation which you may have heard with the DOT
24 Commissioner which is that many of my constituents
25 especially the elderly they don't have access to that

1
2 technology, right, so they don't have the smart
3 phones or even the cell phones at all and especially
4 in some of the lower income folks so I, I appreciate
5 that and its certainly an improvement but you'd be
6 surprised at how many folks in this city actually
7 don't have access to that technology and are still
8 frustrated and even if you do have access to
9 technology the fact that you know that the... it's
10 still pretty frustrating. So, anything you can do in
11 that regard if it is a cost issue if you can just
12 update us on that I think that would be an important
13 service... improvement that doesn't involve the other
14 issues that you mentioned like you know regulating
15 traffic or things like that just... [cross-talk]

16 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: ...something
18 that perhaps you folks may have the power to do and
19 if it's a cost issue we're happy to help with that as
20 well. Thank you very much and congratulations on...
21 again on your ascension to CFO and with that the
22 privilege of coming to lustrous bodies like ours to
23 engage in this friendly back and forth and I'm sure
24 that was a coveted part of the promotion as well.

25 MICHAEL CHUBAK: It's my pleasure.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Good afternoon so I, I... I'm also I'm going to focus on some local issues which definitely would appreciate some follow through on. This is now my fourth year in office and I'm asking pretty much the same questions every year. So, I'm going to ask my question yet again this year and hope that there's a different answer. So, the elevator that's supposed to be placed, there's not one elevator on the N Q Line in, in Queens, on the Queens portion, we've been promised the elevator on the Astoria Boulevard stop, what is our time... what is our hard time table for getting the elevator installed?

MICHAEL CHUBAK: If you could give me a minute to check my notes I might be able to give you an answer.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: That would be great.

MICHAEL CHUBAK: Okay, so Astoria Boulevard is in fact one of our 100 key stations...
[cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Okay...
[cross-talk]

1
2 MICHAEL CHUBAK: ...which means that we are
3 committed to delivering that elevator by July of
4 2020.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Is there
6 somewhere in between now and July 2020 that I can
7 tell my constituents it will be coming?

8 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So I... the answer is
9 maybe but I'll have to get that information for you.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Okay and
11 as well we've had the students at PS85 who have been
12 promised that there are going to be track amendments
13 so that every time a train goes, goes by these
14 students don't have to stop their learning, I know
15 this very well because this tells the students to
16 stop talking because A trains about to roll by and
17 there's supposed to be a changing of the track bed so
18 is there a timetable, hard deadline that that's going
19 to be actually done?

20 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I believe the project to
21 replace switches and track will take place this
22 summer.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: This
24 summer, that's fantastic. Alright, so I can be able
25 to tell my constituents that... this summer. The

1
2 renovations of our stations, I know we're scheduled
3 to set our reservations, what is the plan for
4 implementing these construction projects, will it be
5 two stations in a row, how will this be done to make
6 sure that we still have access to mass transit
7 service while these, these renovations are going on?

8 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I don't believe the
9 exact staging plan has been worked out but I can tell
10 you that we would not do two stations in a row..

11 [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Okay..

13 [cross-talk]

14 MICHAEL CHUBAK: ...we, we might do 39th and
15 Broadway at one time and then 36th and 30th at a
16 different time but it would not be two consecutive
17 stations going out.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES:

19 Fantastic, so I can assure my residents that there
20 may be one station that's, that's closed for a short
21 period of time but it will not be Astoria Boulevard
22 and 30th Avenue back to back?

23 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Correct.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Alright,
25 that's great to hear. Last I know that we're

1
2 purchasing new subway cars, I have noticed since the
3 advent of the Second Avenue Subway which is a huge
4 win for the entire city but in my particular neck of
5 the woods we've seen a lot of the older trains,
6 trains that I used to ride on in the 90's return back
7 to the, the... back to my line on the... of the, the Q
8 and, and N Line when will these older... that we've
9 seen a lot more delays, a lot more issues with these
10 particular trains, issues on the line in general, I'm
11 getting lots of e-mails, more e-mails than I've
12 gotten ever in my time in office since the Second
13 Avenue Subway's gone online that we're having delays
14 on the line so when are we getting the new technology
15 brought back to the N and W Line?

16 MICHAEL CHUBAK: It may not be for a
17 while, we... the current capital program is approved
18 last year included approximately 1,000 cars that
19 would be used to replace some of the older cars in
20 the system that particular contract is under
21 negotiation right now but I mean even if it were
22 approved tomorrow it takes probably two to three
23 years before a significant number of trains begin
24 rolling off the assembly line.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINEDES: As we were... you know I had no complaints on, on the actual cars prior to January and we've seen a huge influx of the old... again I... you know I grew up in the neighborhood I remember these trains from the 90's so I'm wondering how we got stuck getting back these older particular cars without the digital digitalization of what stop we're at, about... you know without a lot of amenities that we used.. the, the residents have been accustomed to and frankly the line ran better when we had them and now again 2nd Avenue subway's a great thing but we got the older subway cars back so I hope to see them cycled back through.

MICHAEL CHUBAK: Its possible, I, I don't make the car allocation decisions to be honest and..

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Well I mean there's, there's other people there who do.

MICHAEL CHUBAK: Right so we'll try to get... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: ...you're just the guy whose taking... whose, who's taking the questions and I appreciate that.

1
2 MICHAEL CHUBAK: We'll try to get you an
3 answer.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Okay,
5 wonderful. And my, my colleague... oh I'm out of time
6 so I guess I can't ask the question for him but thank
7 you.

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member
9 Menchaca.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you Chair
11 and Mr. Chubak, is that right, did I say that right?

12 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Close enough.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Well thank you
14 for being here today and I understand that you are a
15 budget guy and this is your budget team but you're
16 going to hear from us because you have a large... your
17 part of a larger family of conversations that are
18 happening within the MTA and you need to hear how,
19 how the MTA has failed this community that I
20 represent in Sunset Park. Well we believe this is not
21 a... this is not an isolated incident this is a
22 pattern, we want to break this pattern in a very real
23 way. Our communities across the city are
24 multilingual, immigrant, people of color and they
25 deserve the kind of respect that I'm going to ask

1 specifically about the budget. And specifically, what
2 I want to think about is the billions of dollars that
3 you've presented in your testimony about the
4 improvements both of the stations, there's some
5 elevators that are going to get installed in Red..
6 specifically in Sunset Park along 4th Avenue come
7 with a lot of responsibilities about community
8 engagement. So, as the numbers guy can you tell us a
9 little bit about how much you're investing in
10 community engagement for simple things like
11 communication, translation, we've asked for Arabic,
12 we, we have yet to get it in, in Sunset Park. We
13 have... we have a big Jewish community, it would be
14 great to have some, some Hebrew signs in the
15 neighborhood for other things that are happening.
16 Tell us a little bit about how the budget is impacted
17 with community engagement for this massive
18 multibillion dollar infrastructure work in our city
19 and then I have some other projects... or questions
20 about the shuttle bus response to our service line
21 disruption in Sunset Park, actually I'm going to wait
22 for that but I want you to answer that question and
23 then I'll have the second question for, for you in
24 the next two minutes?
25

1
2 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So we have a multi-
3 billion-dollar capital program and part of having
4 that program is to make sure that we have sufficient
5 resources to do community engagement... [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: what does that
7 look like and can you give us a sense about what
8 that... what those numbers are because we're not... we're
9 not feeling that, that, that budget part that you're...
10 that you're claiming that is part of your community
11 engagement?

12 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I'm, I'm not sure about
13 what your specific complaints have been but we have
14 a, a... we'll call it a division of government and
15 community relations whose mission is to engage
16 stakeholders throughout the city and their focus is
17 not only on the, the capital program but it is really
18 a primary part of the work they do that when projects
19 come along that will affect the communities they
20 engage with the, the elected officials and with the
21 community boards to make sure that they know that
22 that's going to be happening.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: So I guess the
24 main... my main point is that the system is failing
25 here, they're failing a community that needs to get

1 correct... connected to and communicated to in
2 different languages and so we want to follow up with
3 you about what you're spending, how you're spending
4 it on just the community engagement piece. The second
5 piece I want to talk about is the shuttle bus program
6 that you've... and I don't know if... it'd be great if
7 you can talk to us a little bit about what's
8 happening on 53rd Street because this is going to
9 happen across the entire system but right now the
10 solution from MTA is not to bring shuttle service on
11 4th Avenue where the line is going down they're
12 instead pushing people into the 3rd Avenue B37 and
13 the 63 Line and adding shuttle service so there's a
14 picture here of a... there's two buses here, the first
15 bus is the shuttle bus, it's off, it doesn't have
16 any... it doesn't have any, any lighting mechanism that
17 shows what it is, it's confusing for, for folks and
18 it's not moving. What we're about is that you're
19 using funds... funding to, to provide a solution that
20 doesn't work, we want it on 4th, you're putting it on
21 other avenues that, that aren't, aren't going to be
22 the solution and so we're, we're trying to understand
23 what's the efficiency of your funding streams for the
24
25

1
2 service that you're cutting during these renovations
3 of this multi-billion-dollar project?

4 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So I'll say this when we
5 do a station closure and we've been doing station
6 closures for a while we evaluate the availability of
7 alternative transportation options for the people who
8 are affected and in cases where we don't believe that
9 a dedicated shuttle bus is required then we won't run
10 a dedicated shuttle bus as is the case at 53rd Street
11 where there is a parallel bus, a regular route on 3rd
12 Avenue and a regular route on 5th Avenue as well as
13 the fact that it's a relatively short distance from
14 53rd Street to the 59th Street station and to the 45th
15 Street station. I'm, I'm confused really by the
16 picture that you were showing because you said it was
17 a picture of a shuttle bus but as we both know we're
18 not running shuttle buses so I'm not sure... it may
19 simply have been a bus that was out of service and
20 parked somewhere and isn't... [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Here's, here's
22 my main... my main point is that the, the solution is
23 to add another, another bus on a current line and I
24 think your key word was relative, it's relatively not
25 far is, is the MTA's kind of response to everything,

1
2 it's relative to all of you but we're... what we're
3 saying is your... the MTA continues to be disrespectful
4 to communities of color, immigrant communities about
5 communication and offering solutions that are not
6 going to work for our community, we want a larger
7 plan that connects Bay Ridge to, to Barclays Center
8 on the 4th Avenue Line that's going to have massive
9 impacts across the line itself, we have yet to see a
10 budget allocation that fulfills that necessity and as
11 the numbers guy... because we're dealing with your
12 inner gov folks, as a numbers guy you need to
13 understand how important that is to our community and
14 the relativity question is that we are telling you
15 that that is not enough, your current... your current
16 operations and your current responses are not enough.
17 On the communications side and then the alternative
18 service disruption response with buses. So, I'm
19 calling it shuttle, I'm telling you that, that, that
20 the, the current solution is, is not enough and it's
21 incredibly disrespectful and I'm hoping that you can...
22 we can get your numbers team to figure out how we
23 actually have a solution that's, that's respectful.
24 End of story so look this is... this is an important
25 conversation for all the teams to get together, you

2 heard it here and it's an important thing for us to
3 communicate with the rest of your team. Okay, you
4 heard it... [cross-talk]

5 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I've, I've heard what
6 you said, my belief is, is that we do a good job of
7 communicating with the community and if in fact...
8 [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And, and you do
10 a good job of communicating the fare hikes, that's
11 everywhere, that's in every language that we can...
12 [cross-talk]

13 MICHAEL CHUBAK: No, not just the ferry..
14 [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: ...even languages
16 we are not speaking right now in, in, in the city of
17 New York what we're failing is when those.. when these
18 stations go down you're asking us to celebrate this
19 work which we should be celebrating and instead we're
20 trying to kick your pattern off the bad track of not
21 engaging our communities of color, our immigrant
22 communities and that we think that it might be a
23 budget issue which is why we're talking to you about
24 it right now in the budget hearing, so help us here,
25

1
2 help us connect the dots and bring a respectable
3 response, thank you so much.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I understand that
5 definitely we need to find a way on how we establish
6 the best channel of communication. Again, now on the
7 governmental relation, the direct person Mr. Marino
8 who also is there who is accessible to all but you
9 heard loud and clear there has been some concern. I
10 think that New York City made major contributions to
11 the MTA and when we look on all the municipality the
12 benefit from this great one trillion access system of
13 transportation, it's not only what the state brings
14 to the... to the... to the MTA is that when we look over
15 all the city from Long Island to Westchester to
16 Yonker to Connecticut like... and that's a question to
17 me like do you have the breakdown, the contribution
18 of each municipality?

19 MICHAEL CHUBAK: That information...

20 [cross-talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: ...and what is the
22 rank of New York City?

23 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Maybe you should tell
24 us?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I don't...

1
2 MICHAEL CHUBAK: We don't have that
3 information on municipality by municipality bases but
4 we probably can look into it for you.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah because
6 sometimes like you know what we get from some of you
7 guys like a level of arrogance when it comes to how
8 we engaging... planning together from the city... at the
9 city level and not a personal level but it is the
10 energy that we get sometimes and like we're supposed
11 to have here the director of the New York City
12 Transit, what is the person, all commissioner or
13 director be here and I have all the respect, you know
14 but to come to a budget hearing the preliminary one
15 and not sending from the MTA as an agency the person
16 who is in charge in you city transit.

17 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I've been to several of
18 these and we've never done that.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Excuse me?

20 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I'm not... I don't want
21 to... I don't want to have to... I'm not sure how to
22 respond...

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah and... so the
24 city expects a lot, you know it's not only what you
25 can compare from the 26 billion dollars if you say

1 margin one billion contribution the city's made but
2 when we do selling real estate there's a percentage
3 that goes to the MTA so it's not only... we've got to
4 see all the contribution that we made and, and I
5 think that it is time for us to say, you know the
6 city deserves more respect from the MTA and in this
7 case we as a body also deserve more respect. I have a
8 question, when was the last time that the MTA was
9 audited?
10

11 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Do you know that?

12 DAVID KELLER: You know I... actually this
13 is a question that was given to us I looked into this
14 yesterday and I spoke to the MTA general, the state
15 of New York has not audited the MTA finances however
16 on an annual basis we do have our finances audited by
17 the independent firm, the most recently completed
18 audit was conducted by Deloitte and Touche for the
19 fiscal year ending December 31st, 2015 and Deloitte
20 and Touche is in the process right now of completing
21 their audit for the fiscal year ending December 31st,
22 2016.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And the last
24 time... the last time that the state audited the MTA?
25

1
2 DAVID KELLER: The state has not audited
3 the MTA on... on authority wide financial basis.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, what is the
5 debt of the MTA right now?

6 DAVID KELLER: The MTA's current
7 outstanding debt is 36.3 billion dollars.

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Do you think that
9 if we continue balancing budget then getting into
10 debt that we can reach a place... a point where we
11 cannot be able to pay that debt?

12 DAVID KELLER: I actually don't know the
13 answer to that, that would be a question for, for the
14 MTA finance department but we can post it... postulate
15 it to them if you'd like.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great, with that
17 thank you for your participation, I will call on the
18 TLC.

19 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Thank you.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you Chair. I
21 just wanted talk to you for a moment about, I know
22 you may have brought it up in your testimony the El
23 train Canarsie tube repairs, I represent Williamsburg
24 around the Bedford stop which is likely to have
25 significant economic impact can you tell us what your

1
2 plan is for the next six months and, and beyond
3 before the, the, the shutdown to, to engage with the
4 community on, on mitigating the, the negative impacts
5 that the community is going to be seeing?

6 MICHAEL CHUBAK: So the question of
7 mitigating impacts obviously is very important...
8 [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...Uh-huh... [cross-
10 talk]

11 MICHAEL CHUBAK: ...and we have been
12 working with New York City specifically with the
13 Department of Transportation and with the Economic
14 Development Corporation on those questions. We've
15 also been doing a fair amount of outreach with all
16 the affected communities on both sides of the river
17 and our intention is to continue studying the issues
18 in conjunction with the city agencies and to continue
19 engaging with the, the communities and our objective
20 is to have a, a plan in place as to how we'll
21 mitigate the, the disruption during construction by
22 the end of this year. I do want to point out that
23 the, the contract that we've negotiated, it's not yet
24 been approved by the... by our board but we expect it
25 to be approved soon we're able to reduce the duration

1
2 of the shut down from 18 months to 15 months which
3 may actually be a very good mitigation in its own
4 right.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, in terms of
6 how it's going to be affecting commuters I think that
7 it's fair for and I said this before, for the MTA to
8 be looking at this and saying nobody is going to see
9 an extension of their commute by more than 20
10 minutes, I think that the general public can accept
11 20 minutes more on their commute each way to work
12 every day more than that I think is, is going to be a
13 problem and so I believe that throughout the system
14 working with the Department of Transportation,
15 working with DDC on the ferry system that there's a...
16 there's an... I think that, that it's possible to
17 achieve that with different redundancies throughout
18 the line but it's going to cost money so what I would
19 like to see from the MTA and I would like you to
20 commit to that now is that you're going to... so the
21 MTA is going to be approaching the mitigation to
22 commuters primarily on... you know with the primary
23 focus being how do we... how do we lessen the burden on
24 them and their daily lives instead of what's it going
25 to cost the MTA another words the cost should be a

1 secondary concern and the, the, the relief to
2 commuters should be the primary concern, is that
3 fair?
4

5 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Yes, it is fair although
6 I won't go... as a budget person I won't go to the
7 point of saying that cost is irrelevant...

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: It's not
9 irrelevant it should be secondary though, I think
10 that, that it should... it should not be the primary...
11 another words when we're... when we... when we talk in
12 six months or whenever MTA is going to come out with
13 the mitigation plan what I don't want to hear from
14 the MTA is well we considered that but it was going
15 to cost too much money.

16 MICHAEL CHUBAK: I believe that that's
17 really the point of the study that's being done right
18 now is to determine the best possible solutions.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Do you think if
20 cost were not a concern that you would be able to
21 find a way working with the other agencies to ensure
22 that nobody's commute either way was extended by more
23 than 20 minutes?

24 MICHAEL CHUBAK: It's a very specific
25 number and I'm not equipped to comment on that.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I think it's... I
3 think it's possible and it's something that I think
4 that, that we should be aiming for.

5 MICHAEL CHUBAK: We'll know more as, as
6 the work progresses.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, thank you.

8 MICHAEL CHUBAK: Thank you...

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you for your
10 time.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you... thank
12 you for coming and thank you for your service. Now
13 we'll go to the TLC to, to be the next agency. Thank
14 you, thank you Commissioner and as, as you know
15 you've been in the leadership of this agency of very
16 challenging for your time for the taxi industry and I
17 know that your leadership has also been very
18 important in the effort to level the playing field
19 for the sector that plays a role in the TLC so we
20 will be going to do the swearing.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right
22 hand, do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole
23 truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony
24 today and to answer council member questions
25 honestly?

1
2 MEERA JOSHI: I do.

3 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

4 MEERA JOSHI: Good afternoon everyone. I
5 want to first just introduce the people to my right
6 and left; Midori Valdivia, who's our Deputy
7 Commissioner of Administration and Finance and
8 Operations and Dianna Pegnetti who is new to the TLC
9 who's our new Chief of Enforcement. Good afternoon,
10 Chair Rodriguez and members of the Finance and
11 Transportation Committees. I am Meera Joshi,
12 Commissioner and Chair of New York City Taxi and
13 Limousine Commission. Thank you for the opportunity
14 to preview TLC's Fiscal Year 2018 Preliminary Budget.
15 To update you on the continued growth of, of the
16 industry we regulate, let me begin with some numbers.
17 In the five years... in five years, the number of TLC
18 licensed vehicles has gone from 41,000 to 107,000 and
19 the number of TLC licensed drivers has increased from
20 110,000 to 160,000. As council is aware, the largest
21 increase in licensed vehicles is in the black car
22 sector. This increase in licensed drivers and
23 vehicles has made our enforcement team more important
24 than ever. Our uniformed personnel protect passengers
25 and drivers and the general public by enforcement

1
2 against bad actors in the for-hire industry,
3 including unlicensed drivers who operate unsafely or
4 pick up passengers illegally depriving customers of
5 their right to a safe ride and professional drivers
6 of their income. As you know only yellow taxis are
7 authorized to pick up street hails throughout the
8 city while green borough taxis can pick up street
9 hails only in defined areas. There are other drivers,
10 however, who do not have this right and nonetheless
11 pick up illegally. Unfortunately, some of the
12 individuals picking up street hails are licensed by
13 TLC but there are also many unlicensed or so called
14 straight plate operators. These operators in
15 particular present serious safety risks to New
16 Yorkers. Their vehicles have not been inspected for
17 safety, they do not carry the proper commercial
18 insurance, and the drivers have not been subjected to
19 our background checks, including criminal and DMV
20 record checks, as well as ongoing drug testing. As I
21 testified last year, the TLC lost its best
22 enforcement tool, the ability under section 19-506 of
23 the Ad Code to seize vehicles used for illegal pick-
24 ups, in October 2015, when a federal judge ruled that
25 seizing the vehicles was unconstitutional in certain

1
2 circumstances. To illustrate the importance of TLC
3 seizures, in Calendar Year 2015, before the court
4 decision, we seized over 6,100 illegally operating
5 cars and vans. The court's decision was of limited
6 scope, focusing only on first time offenders. So, in
7 accordance with local law, we've developed a program
8 to identify and seize unlicensed vehicles that have
9 been used repeatedly for illegal activity. And for
10 those vehicles we're able to seek forfeiture. We have
11 begun this program and alongside with this program we
12 are working with DMV to ensure that the underlying
13 DMV drivers licenses and vehicle registrations of
14 illegal operators are suspended and revoked but both
15 of these efforts although very effective can be
16 undermined by the easily employed delayed tactics
17 allowed in current law. An illegal operator can undo
18 a suspension or revocation by simply asking for a new
19 hearing without any requirement that he or she show
20 proof of why they failed to appear for the first
21 hearing. Moreover, OATH judges do not demand an
22 explanation and they do not make any findings as to
23 the adequacy of any explanation should it be
24 proffered. This is made worse by the extremely long
25 period of time that licensees have that's two years

1 to reopen any default judgement against them. both
2 the lack of the cause requirement and the two year
3 reopen period are unique to TLC administrative cases,
4 but more importantly they deprive the public of the
5 finality needed to get dangerous repeat offenders off
6 the streets. we urge the council to amend the
7 Administrative Code and require drivers and owners to
8 make a credible showing of legitimate cause for their
9 failure to appear at a prior proceeding and shorten
10 the time period for reopening defaults to six months
11 or less. And I'm happy to provide the council with
12 stats on the impact of this loophole after the
13 hearing. TLC's Enforcement personnel play a vital
14 role in Mayor De Blasio's Vision Zero program, as do
15 External Affairs staff who do education and outreach
16 on key safety initiatives. Since 2015, both taxi and
17 FHV drivers required to take a 24-hour pre-licensure
18 course, including instruction on Vision Zero, which
19 we developed with the Department of Transportation.
20 The Vision Zero curriculum provides instruction on
21 road features like protected bike lanes, high risk
22 driving behaviors that lead to crashes, and the
23 important role professional drivers play in promoting
24 the culture of safe driving. In 2016 alone, over
25

1
2 37,000 TLC licensed drivers took this course, an
3 average of almost 3,000 drivers a month. TLC
4 Enforcement officers, including a dedicated safety
5 squad, place a high priority on traffic violations
6 among TLC licensed vehicles such as traffic sign and
7 speeding violations. In 2016, we doubled the number
8 of the agency's Enforcement officers trained by PD to
9 use LIDAR guns, a decisive tool in enforcing our
10 city's speed limits. We've also focused on ensuring
11 commuter van safety for both passengers and other
12 street users. In 2016, our squads paired with the
13 NYPD for 195 joint enforcement operations to combat
14 dangerous unlicensed commuter vans throughout the
15 city, it's resulted in over 1,000 summonses for
16 illegal operation. And I note in those joint
17 operations PD often has several arrests that occur as
18 part of the operation. Our Vision Zero outreach to
19 drivers continues, and as of this month we've held
20 over 450 meetings with drivers to discuss traffic
21 safety rules and safer driving practices. In
22 addition, the TLC provided enhanced support and
23 materials to business owners to improve their
24 drivers' safety records. In 2016, we recognized 378
25 TLC licensed drivers at our third annual Honor Roll

1 ceremony for their strong driving history of no
2 crashes involving fatality or injury, no traffic
3 violations, and no TLC violations for safety related
4 rules for four or more years and that's incredible
5 given the number of miles they drive every day. We're
6 grateful to joined then by Rodriguez... Councilmember
7 Rodriguez, Gibson and Dromm and we welcome you all to
8 join us at our next Honor Roll event celebrating our
9 safest drivers in this, this fall. And while we're on
10 the subject of safety I want to address a topic of
11 driver fatigue. Most people are aware of the dangers
12 of drinking and driving but don't realize that drowsy
13 driving can be just as dangerous. Last month the
14 Commission approved new rules to combat fatigue
15 driving across all sectors. TLC developed the rules
16 based on a review of scientific research on fatigued
17 driving, best practices and an analysis of our own
18 data. The new rules will reduce serious safety risks
19 of both acute and chronic fatigue through daily and
20 weekly hour limits. This spring we're doing extensive
21 outreach and education on the new rules and our goal
22 is to reduce risky driving behavior and give all
23 drivers and bases adequate time and information to
24 stay within the limits and keep all street users
25

1 safe. One of our core functions is processing license
2 applications for drivers, vehicles and bases so that
3 drivers can get on the road and start earning money.
4 As I said at the beginning, our numbers tell us that
5 we have more drivers and vehicles than ever and
6 demand continues to be steady. For example, in the
7 last five Calendar Years, the annual amount of driver
8 license applications has gone from 71,000 to 114,000
9 and in the same period the amount of vehicles license
10 has grown from 23,000 to 53,000. To address this high
11 demand, we continue to prioritize licensing
12 efficiencies and customer service and after
13 legislation sponsored by Council Member Rodriguez, we
14 now offer one universal license for all drivers and
15 we began issuing them this fiscal year. We've moved
16 more application processes online, including new and
17 renewal applications and allow applicants to submit
18 more documents online from their computer or from
19 their phone which saves them a trip to our
20 facilities. We've extended the driver's license term
21 from two to three years which reduces the amount of
22 time spent on renewals and we've moved fingerprinting
23 to an offsite vendor rather than in our offices which
24 allows applicants to go to 12 different sites that
25

1 are open well beyond our normal office hours. We look
2 forward... looking forward, we're developing a program
3 to allow self-scheduling of vehicle inspections
4 which... to allow vehicle licensees who've met all
5 other requirements for licensure to select a date and
6 time that best fits within their busy schedule. In
7 addition to changes that licensing has made to
8 personalize our communications for individual
9 applicants and drivers our External Affairs unit has
10 launched several large-scale driver and base related
11 campaigns including sharing taxi about... including
12 sharing information about the TLC Driver's License,
13 about driver's school redesign, off site
14 fingerprinting and our online services. External
15 Affairs communicates with driver and base communities
16 in languages that most reflect the industry and
17 through the expansion of our translation services and
18 internal review protocol, drivers and bases receive
19 important information in their preferred languages;
20 Spanish, Russian, Mandarin Chinese, Urdu, Bengali and
21 Arabic. The agency continues to refine the ways we
22 communicate with drivers by assessing the
23 communication channels that work best for them.
24 before discussing the preliminary budget there's two
25

1 additional issues I'd like to address; industry wide
2 accessibility and the economic health of our licensed
3 drivers. The TLC continues to advance Mayor, Mayor De
4 Blasio's vision that every passenger in New York City
5 have meaningful choice when seeking an accessible
6 ride. Because yellow and green fares are set by the
7 TLC, these operators have less flexibility to absorb
8 costs related to providing accessible service. So, to
9 achieve the city's goal of 50 percent accessible
10 yellow taxi fleet, the costs of conversion for yellow
11 vehicles... for vehicle owners and drivers are defrayed
12 in part by a 30 cent per ride taxi improvement
13 surcharge on all yellow and green taxi street hailed
14 trips. The surcharge is used for two programs, one to
15 compensate drivers and another to compensate yellow
16 wheelchair accessible taxi owners. We are in the
17 process of rolling out the same program or a similar
18 program for the green taxi fleet for green accessible
19 taxis. We've sold over 7,500 green taxi permits and
20 1,900 of them are for accessible taxis. In January,
21 we expanded our green taxi grant program to give
22 green taxi owners and drivers some of the same
23 benefits that yellow taxi owners and drivers are now
24 receiving and that means up to 30,000 dollars over
25

1 four years. These efforts are crucial to our
2 Accessible Dispatch Program citywide and we are happy
3 that we have the new rules in place which will allow
4 us to expand the Accessible Dispatch program from
5 Manhattan to the entire city later this year. While
6 there are accessibility mandates in yellow and green
7 taxi sectors, there is still work to be done to
8 bringing true accessibility to the FHV sector.
9 Passengers with disabilities cannot patronize this
10 sector and are thus denied the full range of choice
11 available in the for-hire industry. We believe that
12 the best approach is a requirement that each base
13 dispatch a set percentage of trips accessible
14 vehicles and we look forward to continued discussions
15 with the council on the best way to ensure that all
16 passengers have an equal opportunity to get an
17 accessible ride, whether by street hail, telephone or
18 mobile application. The rapid and sustained growth of
19 for hire industry has uncertain implications for
20 drivers and other industry stakeholders and the TLC
21 has begun reviewing how industry economics have
22 shifted in the past few years. We will be giving the
23 public an opportunity to address changing industry
24 economics at our next commission meeting on April
25

1
2 6th. We are required to hold a hearing every two
3 years on medallion lease costs and fares, which
4 includes a review of several factors affecting driver
5 income and expenses. Because we now have just one
6 license type for medallion and FHV drivers, and
7 because of the demonstrably large growth in the
8 number of FHV drivers, we are going to open up the
9 hearing to the entire industry, including yellow and
10 greens, but also traditional black cars and liveries
11 and also app-based drivers. We hope to learn even
12 more about the industry's economics, but this is just
13 one phase of a longer process, and we would welcome
14 testimony and insight from Councilmembers. I'd like
15 to now preview the TLC's Preliminary Budget for
16 Fiscal Year 2018, which is 58.2 million dollars,
17 broken down into 40.4 million dollars in personal
18 services and 17.8 million dollars in other than
19 personal services. Our Preliminary Budget for Fiscal
20 Year 2018 represents a 12.4-million-dollar difference
21 from Fiscal Year 2017. The budget includes 7.2
22 million dollars in grant issuance for Green Boro taxi
23 permit holders to bring more wheelchair accessible
24 taxis into service. The grant amount is a decrease of
25 13.8 million dollars from Fiscal Year 2017 and it is

1 partially offset by an increase for our new cadets.
2 As I mentioned, we swore in 36 new cadets for Field
3 Enforcement this January, but the need for more
4 enforcement personnel continues, so the Preliminary
5 Budget restores the TLC's personnel spending to prior
6 levels, which will enable us to start recruiting
7 another Cadet Class dedicated to field enforcement in
8 our Uniformed Services Bureau. In November, as part
9 of the Fiscal Year 2017 budget, we received funding
10 to improve our enforcement operations by
11 participating in Mayor De Blasio's initiative to make
12 administrative summoning more efficient and
13 consistent through a uniformed summons. To support
14 this initiative, the TLC will be upgrading our
15 officers' electronic handheld devices to streamline
16 our summoning process. The upgraded electronic
17 summoning system allows for enhanced features and
18 greater mobility, which is critical to our officers
19 who conduct almost all of their enforcement
20 activities in the field. We continue to prioritize
21 ongoing projects such as Vision Zero, dedicating
22 funds to enforce safe driving for our licensee
23 population, including through TLC's Safety Squads,
24 who use LIDAR equipment to reduce speeding in
25

1 critical areas across the five boroughs. Finally, the
2 Preliminary Budget reflects efficiencies that the TLC
3 has made to support the city's overall savings plan,
4 primarily by efficiencies attributable to improving
5 the automation of our inspection system at the
6 Woodside Safety and Emissions facility. The TLC's
7 projected Fiscal Year 2018 revenue budget is 55.7
8 million dollars. This is a decrease from Fiscal Year
9 2017, which is attributable to the recent extension
10 of the license period from two years to three and the
11 related increase in the license fee to cover this
12 longer period. This Preliminary Budget does not
13 include revenue from any medallion sales, which have
14 been deferred into Fiscal Year 2019. I note that new
15 legislation sponsored by Chair Rodriguez and signed
16 into law last week will address potential barriers in
17 the medallion market by reducing the medallion
18 transfer tax and eliminating the, the distinction
19 between Individual and Corporate medallions. In the
20 midst of a greatly transformed for hire vehicle
21 industry, the TLC continues to advance our key goals;
22 safety, consumer protection, driver welfare and
23 accessibility. I am grateful to our partnership with
24 the council, which helps achieve these goals for all
25

1
2 New Yorkers. Thank you for the opportunity to speak
3 today and I'd be happy to answer any questions you
4 have.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you
6 Commissioner and now my colleague here Council
7 Member, Council Menchaca has a few questions and I'll
8 give him the opportunity first and then come back and
9 ask my question.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you Chair
11 and thank you Commissioner for coming, coming today
12 and you have some really great updates on, on not
13 only the, the work that we're doing on the drivers
14 and all the Vision Zero stuff. I... I'm interested in
15 really understanding the impact around adult
16 education, this is a theme that we've been talking a
17 lot about in the city but also with your agency as
18 well. So the city of New York is really poised in
19 this next budget to make some big commitments around
20 educating our adults and one of those workforce
21 entities are, are TLC drivers, these are
22 predominately immigrant community members so what I
23 want to do is work with all of you and if you can
24 talk to us a little bit about the budget how, how can
25 you... how can you under... how can we understand through

1
2 your perspective what TLC needs in terms of kind of
3 full commitment to educating our drivers and give us
4 a sense about what that need is so that one I can
5 fight for it on a larger scope but also just what the
6 actual need is for our TLC drivers on the ground?

7 MEERA JOSHI: Yeah, we have done
8 something extremely different in the last three years
9 with our drivers. Historically the only drivers that
10 got training were those that drove yellow medallion
11 taxis and beginning in about 2014, 2015 we started
12 phasing in school for everybody and it's a 24-hour
13 training curriculum, I think we have trained about
14 55,000 drivers by now but what it also creates for
15 the larger city and for... to advance initiatives that
16 are important to many of the people who become TLC
17 drivers is it gives an opportunity or a forum for
18 some messaging to be provided. So, it's not just
19 Vision Zero information that we're giving them in the
20 24-hour curriculum there's also some human rights
21 information about what their rights are and, and how
22 they should handle it should they be violated, about
23 customer service, about financial empowerment.
24 There's lots of opportunity within the 24 hours. Now
25 there's always a balance because we've got to keep

1
2 our crucial lessons in there, which are what is... you
3 know geography and how to handle TLC regulations but
4 I do think you've identified a, a good spot to
5 message some of the things that would be beneficial
6 to our licensee population.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Well thank you
8 for that and, and I think this is the more
9 comprehensive conversation and I'm glad you're the
10 one before I could get there about know your rights
11 workshops that are happening right now in our
12 communities. We need to... we need to bring that to our
13 workforce and so I'm really... you are just light,
14 light years ahead of the panel that was here before,
15 the MTA in really understanding how to engage
16 communities, communities of color and immigrant
17 communities and maybe you two should talk and give
18 him some, some tips but I think... I think that's... that
19 says a lot that you were already thinking about it in
20 the last three years, you've really kind of re-
21 shifted the focus. So we want to partner up with you
22 and, and, and really I think what, what I'm trying to
23 do in build my immigration agenda through the
24 committee is really bring all the different agencies
25 that impact immigrants to the table to talk about how

1
2 each agency is really impacting the immigration
3 budget portfolio and I think you just give... you've
4 given us an opportunity to maybe, maybe next year
5 bring you in to that discussion and right now we have
6 Moya, we have HRA and DYCD but I think this is a
7 larger impact and your insight can really help other
8 agencies that are trying to tackle this in a
9 different perspective, you bring the workforce in a
10 very important workforce for us in the city of New
11 York that are really generating a lot of economic
12 power for our immigrant communities and so are you...
13 are you open to, to working with me to figure out
14 maybe next year to come to an... [cross-talk]

15 MEERA JOSHI: Yeah... no, we'd... [cross-
16 talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: ...budget
18 hearing... [cross-talk]

19 MEERA JOSHI: ...look forward to that. I
20 think about 98 percent of our drivers were born in a
21 country other than the United States so... and that
22 population is growing.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Exactly. And,
24 and, and so tell me a little bit next about, about
25 the, the impact of the, the license, the kind of one

1
2 license and one... how's that impacted maybe the
3 budget, maybe there is no impact but is it... is it
4 cause any savings, this is something that the Chair
5 really pushed and, and we kind of negotiated the
6 final... the final bill can you tell us a little bit
7 about, about that?

8 MEERA JOSHI: I think from the driver's
9 perspective it brings a level of simplicity. We had
10 two licensing classes before... actually we had more
11 like four, four or five with a different set of rules
12 and sometimes people held two licenses and they'd be
13 in a different point on one license than they were on
14 the other. So, there I think was some unnecessary
15 confusion that was caused by having multiple license
16 classes. It was a real recognition that the drivers
17 were doing the same job, they're safely transporting
18 passengers for hire. What it's done for us
19 administratively is created a lot of efficiencies,
20 it... you know we were duplicating work essentially and
21 now each driver has only one license and I think it's
22 streamlined it for those that are coming into the
23 business they're not choosing which they have to
24 drive for they just get a license and can make that
25 decision at any point. So, it's been a boon for us

1
2 and I, I hope that it's been a boon for drivers and
3 so far, the feedback we get is that it has been.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Good and, and I
5 think... I think that's, that's what we're hearing too
6 but we want to make sure that we get a good sense and
7 have, have good touch points on the ground for, for
8 that feedback since it was... it was a pretty major
9 change but it really helped a lot of... a lot of the
10 mechanisms work better. I do want to mention that we
11 have... we have some folks in, in the audience here
12 from Sunset Park who are going to be testifying in,
13 in some panels in the future; Melissa and we have
14 UPROSE and community board seven... Sunset from
15 community board seven and they are going to talk a
16 little bit about the MTA issues that we have but I
17 just wanted to give them a shout out that I have the
18 mic and thank you and thank them for being here. I
19 know we're, we're a little bit late in, in our... in
20 our timing. Now that the Chairs back I'm going to
21 hand it right, right back over to him. Thanks Chair.

22 MEERA JOSHI: Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Well
24 Access-A-Ride how can MTA say that they were open to
25 work and I don't know if they've been working with

1
2 you and conversation and how does thousands of green...
3 an opportunity that we have to have vehicles from the
4 green cars and yellow taxis can take advantage of
5 that huge resources of half a million dollars... half a
6 billion dollars that is part of the Access-A-Ride?

7 MEERA JOSHI: We have been working very
8 closely with the MTA on piloting or testing how to
9 integrate TLC licensed vehicles into the Access-A-
10 Ride program and I really commend the MTA for
11 launching this project starting with the technology.
12 So how we're testing it with them is dispatching
13 Access-A-Ride rides through the hailing apps that are
14 now available on the FHV side and on the taxi side
15 and I think that's a huge efficiency right, right
16 then and there and we've also worked with them to
17 make sure that our wheelchair accessible taxis are
18 part of this testing and that customers are able to
19 have on demand accessible service through Access-A-
20 Ride by using those taxis and that has been... made
21 very good progress on the customers that don't need
22 an accessible vehicle there's been a tremendous
23 number of app based bases that have provided that
24 service in the testing environment and the customer
25 surveys that have come back in that regard have been

1
2 positive. So, so far there, they're doing I think
3 what is prudent, testing it, there is a big
4 difference in for hire and taxi culture and Access-A-
5 Ride culture because the customer driver dynamic can
6 be slightly different and the pay, you know it's a
7 set 2.75 dollars versus the meter or a dispatched
8 amount but they've, they've been very prudent about
9 testing this to make sure that we've overcome that
10 and I look forward to working with them to bring that
11 to a broader range of vehicles and a larger testing
12 environment like a pilot. So, I think we've made good
13 progress but there's still more to come.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay and in, in
15 that direction my interest... well I would say from my
16 end and to be short that the yellow and the green
17 should be the one leading the opportunity in that
18 pilot project not just being part of it because we
19 also know that there is... I... first of all I, I think
20 that we live in a city of opportunity, we live in a
21 market economic... economy and everyone should be able
22 to invest and get their return but... I believe that we
23 have a responsibility to keep working this chaotic
24 city with those sectors that they been... we know and
25 we... and this is something that we had shared, there's

1
2 like a thousand of those out that are available and..
3 [cross-talk]

4 MEERA JOSHI: Yeah, I think... I'm taking,
5 taking full advantage of the accessible vehicles that
6 are currently on the road would be tremendous
7 customer service benefit for Access-A-Ride riders but
8 also a cost saving for the city and the state and it
9 would be an income stream for the drivers of those
10 vehicles... [cross-talk]

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: ...but are we... I
12 would... listen in this pilot project like does... is the
13 MTA that let's say the last word of which sector will
14 be part of this pilot project because...

15 MEERA JOSHI: It's a... [cross-talk]

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: ...if they just..
17 [cross-talk]

18 MEERA JOSHI: ...it's basically a
19 competition... not a competition, it is basically an
20 opportunity so anybody who has an app based dispatch
21 service there's two of them in the yellow and green
22 industry and then any of the app based and FHV can
23 put a proposal together and MTA will give them an
24 opportunity to test their technology and the, the
25 results of that so far have been very positive, there

1
2 has been some... an app based service in the yellow
3 industry, green industry that's doing very, very well
4 as well as in the FHV.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So you think that
6 there's opportunity for all sectors?

7 MEERA JOSHI: There is opportunity for
8 all sectors, it's a matter of who wants to come to
9 the table and, and try to get that work.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Right, so you
11 have someone in your team, new on your team that has
12 a lot of expertise of enforcement and, and how are we
13 doing on enforcement when it comes to knowing that
14 Access-A-Ride talk about it right now in Midtown, I'm
15 talking about the JFK, LaGuardia what is the number
16 like when we think about... what is the number of
17 drivers that they got fined because they were doing
18 illegal and street hails in those areas?

19 MEERA JOSHI: So I'm going to give you
20 some general numbers but I also want to give Dianna
21 an opportunity to speak about strategy because as you
22 know we have limited personnel and it is a very large
23 city so a lot... a lot of what we do depends on how
24 well we do it not necessarily the numbers that we
25 have but in 2016 we issued almost 19,000 summonses

1
2 for illegal activity and year to date 2017 over
3 14,000. There has been a, a... I'd say more than half
4 of them in each year have been in what we call hot
5 spots that'd be Manhattan central business district
6 as well as the airports and the penalties for those
7 that are... occur in those two hot spots have recently
8 increased and that's attributable to a local law that
9 you sponsored that was signed into law which raised
10 the penalties for illegal activity in those areas.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And, and I'm
12 sorry with that number how would... how, how are those
13 numbers in 2016 compared to 2016... I'm... and those
14 numbers from 2016 compared to the previous year,
15 2015, 2014?

16 MEERA JOSHI: They... 2016 will be... I'll,
17 I'll get you the 2015 number but I know from the top
18 of my head that it is going to be lower than 2015,
19 2015 at the end of the year is when we got our horal
20 decision which was the decision that caused us to
21 sort of stop and have to rethink a lot of our
22 enforcement initiatives and it did have an effect on
23 our summonsing levels.

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay.

25

1
2 DIANNA PEGNETTI: Good afternoon, it's
3 very nice to be here today. So, I know the Chair
4 wanted me to talk to you about some different
5 strategies that we've employed because we are a bit
6 understaffed and still when fully staffed would have
7 a large area to cover we have made a great effort to
8 work with the NYPD and the PAPD in areas of joint
9 enforcement. The Chair and I recently met with the
10 police commissioner who has already provided great
11 support in commuter van operations and illegal
12 operator operations but has since also committed
13 dedicated officers throughout the precincts to work
14 with us on, on a more regular basis and this will
15 allow us to deploy more people consistently for
16 better results. In addition, I've met with the PAPD
17 and we've... although the label... we've also has a good
18 working relationship with them since we started
19 operations at JFK in 2016 and then... or 2015 and then
20 LaGuardia in 2016 we have begun joint operations
21 specifically targeting hustlers in addition to the
22 illegal street hails. So... and we have boots on the
23 ground at JFK and then hope to do the same at
24 LaGuardia once construction is complete but the
25 foundation of the enforcement really rests in two

1 areas in my mind, training and the community. In the
2 area of training because we've had some changes in
3 operations due to litigation and due to new rules and
4 regulations we've increased training and this enables
5 more officers within our department to take part in
6 different types of operations as opposed to being
7 specialized. So, we've kind of decentralized the
8 special units and put more people out into the field
9 but with the community we've gone through great
10 community outreach to meet with the industry so that
11 we can get their input on their concerns because in
12 addition to protecting the public by providing a safe
13 transportation system through taxi and limousine we
14 also want to protect the industry. We have a lot of
15 law abiding drivers and owners that are trying to do
16 the right thing for, for New York and we're trying to
17 do the right thing for them. So with that we've met
18 with them and we're actually getting daily input from
19 members of the community with their specific hot
20 spots so that... they're kind of like helping us with
21 our net, we have our traditional law enforcement
22 initiatives where we gather intelligence, we gather
23 information, we look at complaints, we look at the
24 different hot spots but by bringing in the community
25

1
2 we're getting it right from the people and that
3 enables us to respond and, and have a better
4 communication and relationship with the public.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: We need to be
6 clear zero tolerance for illegal street hail at the
7 JFK and the Midtown area. I think that this is too
8 much and we are overdue, I... and, and again there's
9 not going to be any person in our city that will
10 advocate stronger for our working class New Yorkers
11 than myself and I believe everyone deserves to make
12 the living and, and I was one of those who had
13 started washing dishes, working in restaurant, I
14 drove a delivery taxi but I believe also that there's
15 6,000 independent medallions owners as I said before
16 in other hearings that they were relying on the value
17 of their medallions to get a mortgage, to... for their
18 house and to send their kids to college and we sold
19 those individuals the dream that they would be the
20 only one that had the right to do a street hail and
21 there has to be some corruption going on at the JFK
22 like you know when, when you see a... if we lander at
23 JFK... especially JFK, he seen people soliciting
24 passengers still today, I will take you hear like we
25 declare that JFK is closer for the yellow taxi, we

1
2 say that and... unless prearrangement is made and I
3 think that... the same thing in the Midtown area, you
4 know those individuals that now they are dealing with
5 tough times, they thought that when they purchased
6 the medallion they were only be... they would be the
7 only one that we have the right to do a, a street
8 hail and, and I believe that they are... the city
9 provide the opportunity for everyone, we have the
10 green taxi, I think that there's even more
11 flexibility in some area in the outer borough but
12 when it comes to the Midtown where it is a hard core
13 of the 55 million tourists that came to our city,
14 opportunity is there for everyone and I just hope
15 that, you know we see the urgency because every day
16 there's another medallion owner that is parking his
17 car in the garage and, and this is too much and... I
18 understand this isn't too much to you guys but it is
19 too much for us as a city on how we have seen this
20 grouping failing day by day like I've been getting
21 phone calls, I got so much... someone has called me she
22 say my husband used to own this medallion now he's
23 dealing... through... in a tough situation, the only
24 thing that we have for our retirement was his
25 medallion and no one... we don't have anyone that's

1 interested in buying this medallion and this is the
2 reality of thousands and thousands of New Yorkers.
3 So, I believe that we... it's not the only solution, I
4 would like to hear also from the Commissioner on
5 what... you know it's a tough time where we are when it
6 comes to this industry, do you have any perspective
7 or how do you see the future of the yellow taxi
8 industry?
9

10 MEERA JOSHI: Well I think enforcement is
11 key, one of the issues at, at, at JFK and LaGuardia
12 especially is that even when we arrest hustlers
13 they're back out pretty quickly because the charges
14 that they are arrested for result in usually a desk
15 appearance ticket, there's no real severe penalty
16 with them. so that is one thing... one area where we
17 can continue do, do the work but the, the, the low
18 penalty continues to undermine the good work that we
19 do and we see repeat offenders regularly. As far as
20 the medallion industry it is completely accurate,
21 trips are down in yellow taxis and it is in part
22 there's a huge culture change, there's new
23 competition which wasn't around about four or five
24 years ago and there's a new passenger base,
25 passengers that are very much accustomed to using

1
2 their telephone to get for hire service and, and
3 maybe for younger passengers that's their
4 introduction to for hire service now is their
5 telephone rather than the traditional yellow taxi.
6 What that means for the industry and I applaud the
7 industry these are very difficult times but using
8 that new technology to integrate it with the existing
9 vehicles and so there are now apps that are available
10 to hail yellow taxis and I think that that is where
11 the focus is going to have to be in order to respond
12 to competition and keep the sectors... keep vitality in
13 all of the sectors. There are also some regulations
14 regarding medallion transfers that make the market
15 frozen and, and you sponsored one important piece
16 that undid some of that work and so we'll see what
17 affect that has in the coming months on transactions
18 within the market.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So thank you and
20 with that is part is, is done and we will go now to
21 the public section. Thank you. Kate Slevin, Eric
22 McClure, Julia Kite, Nick Sifuentes, Clayton Brooks.
23 We will put the clock on two minutes so if your
24 testimony is too long please summarize and you may
25 start.

ERIC MCCLURE: Thank you, good afternoon.

On behalf of StreetsPAC I'd like to thank you for the opportunity to weigh in on the Mayor's Preliminary Transportation Budget for Fiscal Year 2018. The additional 400 million dollars for Vision Zero that Mayor De Blasio announced in January provides a major boost for safety on city streets. While those funds will be spent over several years, they'll begin to have an effect right away, especially on critical initiatives like the replacement and refurbishment of street markings. The Mayor's capital budget... the, the Mayor... the Mayor's capital commitment to shortening the replacement cycle for crosswalks and bike lanes and the Department of Transportation's improved ability to handle restriping, is vital to better street safety. Likewise, more spending on crossing guards, additional funding for implementation of hardened center lines for left turns, enhanced street lights... lighting, and upgrades for intersections along the bike network will similarly have an immediate effect in improving safety for vulnerable street users. We applaud this commitment to Vision Zero spending. This commitment is especially important in light of a brand-new Health Department

1 report that reveals that pedestrian fatality rates in
2 poor neighborhoods are triple those in wealthy
3 communities. It should be a moral imperative that we
4 prioritize Vision Zero spending in high poverty
5 areas, which would be very much in keeping with the
6 Mayor's goals of addressing inequality. It's also
7 critical that we get lifesaving infrastructure
8 upgrades in the ground quickly, and unfortunately,
9 that's not frequently the case with the Department of
10 Design and Construction. The Department of
11 Transportation is nimble with paint and plastic, but
12 those things can't stop a speeding car. We need to
13 make sure that DDC implements Vision Zero work in a
14 much more timely manner. While this increased
15 spending on Vision Zero initiatives is laudable,
16 there are some areas in which we believe the proposed
17 budget is deficient. Citi Bike will complete its
18 planned phase II expansion by the end of this year,
19 and at this juncture, no concrete plans exist for
20 further growth of the bike share system. While... will
21 we top out at 12,000 bikes? Or will Citi Bike
22 continue to grow to serve even more New Yorkers,
23 delivering the convenience and efficiency of bike
24 share to neighborhoods hungry for this reliable low
25

1 cost transit option? The original white paper drafted
2 by the Department of City Planning eight years ago,
3 which laid out the potential for bike share in New
4 York City envisioned a 49,000-bike system serving
5 significant portions of four boroughs. Such a robust
6 system would cover all high and mid density
7 neighborhoods with a projected capital cost of 200
8 million dollars and an annual operating cost of 100
9 million dollars, the latter fully offset by
10 membership and user fees and sponsorship. Widespread
11 support exists in the council for public funding of
12 the capital cost necessary to expand Citi Bike and we
13 strongly urge the administration to commit to working
14 with the council to earmark the funds necessary for
15 full Phase III expansion of... outlined by City
16 Planning in 2009.

17
18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Summarize, ten
19 seconds.

20 ERIC MCCLURE: Okay. We also would like
21 to express our support the Fair Fares initiative
22 proposed by our friends at Riders Alliance. We urge
23 the Mayor and the council to find funding for
24 expansion of the public space, the pedestrian and
25 bike lanes on the Brooklyn Bridge, which is an idea

1
2 that was first loaded by Council Members Lander and
3 Levin and Chin several years ago and lastly, we urge
4 the council and the administration to take a very
5 hard look at parking policy. The underpricing of
6 curbside space in New York City contributes greatly
7 to congestion which in turn harms productivity and
8 constrains economic activity. Given the negative
9 externalities of private automobile use, our failure
10 to properly price parking has societal consequences
11 beyond the legitimate revenue that we're leaving on
12 the table. Great, thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

14 JULIA KITE: Council Member Rodriguez and
15 members of the committee, thank you for calling this
16 hearing. My name is Julia Kite and I'm the Policy and
17 Research Manager for Transportation Alternatives.
18 We'd like to offer our profound gratitude to Mayor De
19 Blasio for the increase in funding for Vision Zero
20 projects set forth in the Preliminary Budget. This
21 400-million-dollar investment over five years is
22 essential to moving New York City closer to zero
23 deaths and injuries because it will allow for the
24 redesigned and reconstruction of some of New York
25 City's most dangerous streets. as we've observed

1 through the success of Queens Boulevard this funding
2 is not only the difference between life and death but
3 it also changes arterial roads from barriers into
4 opportunities to reclaim public space for New Yorkers
5 to live their fullest lives. We are mindful that
6 Vision Zero projects will only save lives if they
7 create high quality complete streets that put
8 pedestrian and cyclist safety above driver
9 convenience. With the inclusion of elements like
10 protected bike lanes, widened sidewalks, signal
11 protected pedestrian crossings, dedicated transit
12 facilities we can more than help injuries on some
13 streets as we've seen already. As demonstrated in the
14 Transportation Alternatives Vision Zero Street Design
15 Standard, we do have the opportunity to create world
16 class safe streets using tools already available in
17 the DOT Street Design Manual. And the opportunity we
18 have now, with this investment, is too great to not
19 do the job properly. Twenty-Two Council Members, most
20 recently Julissa Ferreras of the Committee on Finance
21 have signed onto our letter to the Mayor urging that
22 this funding must be used for comprehensive, best
23 practice street redesign. And while capital projects
24 are absolutely essential they can take several years
25

1
2 to complete fortunately this... there are city's...
3 steps... there are steps the cities could take to
4 integrate street safety improvements through the
5 routine resurfacing program and we would urge more of
6 that as well. The December 2016 Court of Appeals
7 ruling in Tuturro v. City of New York, which found
8 the city partially liable for nearly ten million
9 dollars for a crash on a dangerous street that did
10 not receive traffic calming, adds urgency and a
11 fiscal responsibility argument to the need to
12 redesign these streets sooner not later. We also urge
13 the department to swiftly overrule the objections of
14 obstructionist community boards because the city has
15 a Vision Zero mandate to do whatever it takes to
16 redesign blatantly dangerous streets. Finally, we'd
17 like to lend our support for direct funding of Citi
18 Bike. Bike share has been an undeniable success in
19 the neighborhoods where stations are located,
20 encouraging New Yorkers to pursue active
21 transportation. We need a five-borough bike share for
22 equity and for... in order to reach... sorry, one second,
23 in order to reach our 80 by 50 emissions goals and in
24 conclusion I'd like to thank the Department of
25 Transportation for 18.5 miles of protected bike lanes

1
2 achieved last year and we know that going forward we
3 can reach our Vision Zero goals. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

5 NICK SIFUENTES: Thank you for the
6 opportunity to speak today and thank you to Chairman
7 Rodriguez for leading the fight for Fair-Fares in the
8 city council. I'm Nick Sifuentes, the Deputy Director
9 of the Riders Alliance. We're New York's grassroots
10 organization of subway and bus riders fighting for
11 better transit and more affordable fares. As we all
12 know, fares just increased yet again for public
13 transit riders in the five boroughs. For many New
14 Yorkers, the fare increases are merely an
15 inconvenience but for hundreds of thousands living in
16 poverty, fare increases, which can eat up as much as
17 ten percent of a poor family's annual budget, can
18 force a cascade of impossible decisions; pay rent or
19 get to work, buy groceries or go to the doctor with
20 your kid, and no one should have to make those kinds
21 of decisions. The end result of course, is that we
22 either limit economic and social mobility for many of
23 our fellow residents, or people resort to fare
24 beating, risking arrest just to access opportunity.
25 Because the reality is that virtually no one is

1
2 jumping turnstiles for fun; they're doing it because
3 the system has essentially locked them out. And while
4 good jobs and affordable housing are key city
5 priorities and for good reason, it's just as
6 important that the public transit that binds the two
7 together is affordable as well. After all, if you and
8 your family can't get from your affordable apartment
9 to a good job, the entire edifice falls apart. At
10 this point, the city already provides discount fares
11 for students and the elderly and also passed the
12 sweeping Commuter Benefits legislation that saves
13 middle class New Yorkers an average of 450 dollars a
14 year. While we are of course proud supporters of
15 Commuter Benefits, the reality is that the only folks
16 left out of those benefits are low income New Yorkers
17 who make too little to take advantage of the tax
18 savings. In effect, New York City subsidizes everyone
19 but working age, poverty level New Yorkers.
20 Unfortunately, the current city administration is
21 turning a blind eye to the needs of those New Yorkers
22 calling Fair-Fares quote, "a noble idea," but quote,
23 "the states responsibility. I'd argue that creating a
24 pathway for poor New Yorkers to access good jobs, to
25 actually lift themselves up, to improve their lives,

1
2 is very much the city's responsibility and exactly
3 what the Mayor stands for. Public transit must remain
4 affordable for every member of the public, not just
5 those who are fortunate enough to never have to think
6 about the cost of a Metro Card swipe. So, we look to
7 you. I'm here today to thank City Council for your
8 support, we've proud to have well over a majority of
9 the council supporting Fair Fares and ask you to
10 ensure that Fair Fares is included in the council
11 budget response. Hundreds of thousands of New Yorkers
12 are counting on you. Thank you.

13 CLAYTON BROOKS: Good afternoon Chair
14 Rodriguez, Council Member Menchaca, thank you. my
15 name is Reverend Clayton Brooks, I'm the Director of
16 Advocacy at Covenant House. Covenant House has served
17 the homeless youth of New York City since 1972 now
18 having expanded to 30 cities throughout the world,
19 serving 50,000 young people every year. Here in New
20 York we serve... we've housed 1,744 youth this last
21 year many from... come from your districts and so we
22 are grateful to continue doing that work moving
23 forward but I come here today to talk to you about a
24 major issue facing many of our young people and it
25 was alluded to earlier with questions from both of

1
2 you namely accessing the subway system. A significant
3 number of our young people do what any New Yorker
4 does when they need to get to their job or they need
5 to get to a homeless shelter or they need to go to an
6 interview and they don't have the money to afford a
7 subway ticket, which is to have to turnstile. Metro
8 cards are a, a crucial element of the everyday lives
9 of almost every New Yorker but in particular those
10 who have fallen through the city's safety net, the
11 youth that we serve and these youths who cannot
12 afford metro cards continue racking up fine after
13 fine and escalating consequences without any ability
14 to pay. Those who are lucky enough to make it into
15 shelter obviously can access cards through a, a, a
16 homeless service providers but that also is a burden
17 on the budgets of those service providers and is
18 often not included in the contracts, explicitly
19 included in the contracts that they receive from the
20 city that funds them. and so, I, I guess my ask is
21 twofold gentlemen, one we are incredibly supportive
22 of the Fair Fares campaign. I'd like to amend a
23 statement by my colleague which is that those who hop
24 the turnstiles do not just do so for fun, they do so
25 for survival, that is the reality for the youth that

1 we serve. We thank you for supporting that but my
2 second ask is to work with Covenant House and other
3 providers to think about introducing a resolution
4 before the council to push the MTA to offer
5 additional options beyond just a monetary fine for
6 those individuals who hop the turnstile. We've pushed
7 for possibly community service but have been told
8 that that is currently not an option available to the
9 transit adjudication bureau. So, would love to work
10 with your offices if that is something of interest to
11 either of you. thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, the
14 next group two residents from Sunset Park; Kiya Vega-
15 Hutchens and Melissa Del Valle Ortiz, we're going to
16 be also calling Verna DuBerry and Richard Conroy. We
17 will get the residents from Sunset Park first since
18 they are testifying on a particular issue and then we
19 get to the other two members of the public.

20 MELISSA DEL VALLE ORTIZ: Can you hear me
21 now, oh you can hear me now. Say it again, bring it
22 closer, can you hear me now? Okay. Alright. So, good
23 morning members of the committee, city council. My
24 name is Melissa del Valle Ortiz and I'm a tenant
25 leader and 25-year resident of Sunset Parks Project

1
2 Based Section 8 Housing. My development is comprised
3 of families including seniors and disabled and youth,
4 many who go to school and work outside of Sunset
5 Park. While walking a few extra blocks may not prove
6 to be a hardship for most, it is a hardship for some
7 of us and that's who I'm here to speak on behalf of.
8 During our press conference organized by our City
9 Council Member Carlos Menchaca, I mentioned how not
10 having a 4th Avenue shuttle bus during the station
11 shutdown would impact persons with physical
12 disabilities, breathing conditions and who walk with
13 assistance like canes and walkers, only to receive a
14 call from a couple later that afternoon that you'll
15 hear from in a recording. These eight extra blocks
16 can take them up to an extra eight minutes per block
17 to walk. I can only imagine what they will experience
18 during the sweltering summer months, during the
19 slippery rain and snow filled winter. I also failed
20 to mention persons with mental disabilities including
21 autism whose commute becomes confusing when given
22 extra instructions or being rerouted away from their
23 routine commute. I also feel very strongly that it's
24 a direct violation of the American with Disabilities
25 Act, by not providing them with uninterrupted service

1 for their routine along 4th Avenue. Additionally, we
2 have many staff at NYU Lutheran, Brooklyn Army
3 Terminal and hundreds of businesses on 4th and 2nd and
4 3rd Avenues. Their walk... their work time will now be
5 significantly impacted by having to accommodate the
6 extra walk on top of the potential and routine delays
7 that we already experience. To be without a subway
8 station is one thing but to be without direct access
9 to the nearest one is something else. I'd also like
10 to point out that the MTA on their website posted
11 public hearings for, for closures on the J Train
12 Broad Street but Sunset Park never was given that
13 opportunity. I would also like to take this moment to
14 remind the MTA that while we are in a low-income
15 community, many of the families in these communities
16 work as do many of the families in subsidized
17 housing. We all pay our fares to get there on time,
18 our bosses don't want to hear the excuses as to why
19 there are delays and would sooner fire you if it
20 happens one too many times. As... is that it? Oh I can
21 keep going. As a tenant leader in HUD subsidized
22 housing I would also like to remind the MTA of their
23 commitment to the community... to the commuters from
24 NYCHA Development and the outskirts of Brooklyn such
25

1 as Canarsie and Red Hook. Residents of Canarsie in
2 Bayview Houses where I grew up, whether seniors or
3 disabled will be hugely impacted by Broadway Junction
4 transfer point on the L Line during the Canarsie
5 tunnel repair. They deserve an express bus to the
6 nearest handicap accessible station at Utica Avenue,
7 without having to be forced to take an extra eight to
8 ten-minute non-accessible walking transfer at
9 Broadway Junction. In addition, the NYCHA residents
10 of Red Hook Houses need increased and dedicated
11 shuttle to subway station bus service. While it may
12 not be the case, it seems that the MTA is not giving
13 any consideration for the working poor whose jobs
14 become expendable, when they are experiencing
15 repeated routine and extended MTA delays.

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Sorry, can you
18 please summarize because...

19 MELISSA DEL VALLE ORTIZ: Wrapping it up.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Wrap it up, five
21 seconds.

22 MELISSA DEL VALLE ORTIZ: The working
23 poor cannot afford these, these delays to, to lose
24 their jobs while the MTA is under construction. The
25 extended lack of consideration for accommodation to

1
2 the seniors and disabled as part of the fabric of New
3 York is clear and obvious and needs to be rectified,
4 we need a 4th Avenue shuttle bus.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great, thank you.

6 KIYA VEGA-HUTCHENS: Good afternoon
7 members of the committee. My name is Kiya Vega-
8 Hutchens and I'm a Climate Justice Policy Organizer
9 at UPROSE. We are an environmental and justice...
10 environmental and social justice organization based
11 in Sunset Park. We have a long history of working for
12 transportation justice in our community, from
13 restoring mass cuts, cuts to mass transit to
14 improving pedestrian infrastructure. We have known
15 for some time about the... that the 3rd... that the 53rd
16 Street subway station would be affected by the
17 governors MTA plans. However, the exact dates of this
18 closure were not brought to the community's attention
19 until very recently. Moreover, the communications
20 came only in the form of limited signage in the
21 station, all in English only. Sunset Park is a
22 predominately immigrant community, where over half of
23 our residents are foreign born and half face
24 linguistic isolation. Aside from English, prominent
25 languages in our community include Spanish, Chinese

1 and Arabic. It is not acceptable that community... that
2 the communications target only half of the community
3 and in limited scope at that. About 7,500... I'm sorry,
4 7,500 people use the 53rd Street subway station
5 during weekdays. This number is even higher on the
6 weekend. The R train is a lifeline for our community,
7 serving our small businesses, students, institutions,
8 elders, and community based organizations. Moreover,
9 the R train is part of an economic hub that connects...
10 that connects Sunset Park to similar communities in
11 Queens. The abrupt shutdown of the 53rd Street
12 station will disrupt thousands of community members
13 daily. It is not feasible that the MTA expects
14 community members to walk to 3rd or 5th Avenue, take a
15 bus parallel to the R line, then walk back to 4th
16 Avenue to the next subway station. We need the MTA to
17 consider public shuttle services to fill this transit
18 gap that now exists in our community. We honestly
19 believe that Sunset Park that were Sunset Park a more
20 affluent community this failure to communicate would
21 not have occurred and that the MTA would be open to
22 exploring alternative transportation options. We look
23 forward to having a conversation with the MTA and all
24 relevant agencies to determine how to best serve the
25

1
2 community. I thank you very much for your time and
3 consideration and for your work.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

5 KIYA VEGA-HUTCHENS: Uh-huh.

6 RICH CONROY: Good afternoon members of
7 the city council Transportation Committee. I'm Rich
8 Conroy, the Director of Education at Bike New York.
9 Bike New York provides free bicycle education
10 programs for adults and children throughout the city.
11 In the last two years, we've reached 17,000 adults
12 and children each year with a variety of programs and
13 Council Member Rodriguez I want to thank you
14 personally for just discretionary funding that you
15 allocated to us for a bicycle education center in
16 Inwood Hill Park, it's been very successful for both
17 public programs and our youth programs. My comments
18 today are focused on calling for public financing to
19 expand Citi Bike, 2017 is the last year of planned
20 expansion for the Citi Bike system and it's been
21 wildly successful with tens of millions of rides and
22 tens of millions of miles. I think the payoff has
23 been huge in terms of cleaner air for New York City
24 as well as promoting healthy active transportation
25 for New Yorkers but its only covering a small area of

1
2 the city. Bike share is exploding across the United
3 States and across the world even into small towns and
4 small communities. Our system is one of the few that
5 is entirely privately financed but really if you
6 think about it it's a type of public transportation.
7 A subsidy of less than .0025 percent of the city's
8 73.8 billion budget would infuse nearly 18.5 million
9 dollars into Citi Bike. Like existing public transit
10 option, Citi Bike brings people together and bridges
11 gaps. If subways, buses and ferries were private
12 entities with no public assistance as Citi Bike is
13 those systems would be forced to charge more money
14 than most New Yorkers could afford or they would
15 cease to exist. It is time to put the city in Citi
16 Bike. Thank you.

17 VERNA DUBERRY: Good afternoon, on behalf
18 of the New York... on behalf of Bedford Stuyvesant
19 Restoration Corporation I'd like to thank the New
20 York City council and Chairman Rodriguez for this
21 opportunity to speak on this budget hearing today. My
22 name is Verna DuBerry and as you consider the 2018
23 budget I want to urge you to support Citi Bike with
24 city funding as a five-borough affordable
25 transportation option in the face of the current

1 transportation affordability crisis impacting low
2 income communities. As you may know restoration is
3 the nation's first community development corporation
4 and we have a long history and a long track record.
5 Programs foster economic self-sufficiency, enhance
6 family stability, promote the arts and culture and
7 transform neighborhoods into safe, vibrant, and
8 livable spaces. We serve over 50,000 people annually.
9 As a community development corporation, we know that
10 transportation is the key economic mobility.
11 Residents need to be able to get to work, to look for
12 employment, to go to school and to travel to
13 essential services. The average clients we serve
14 spends 200 dollars a month in transportation. For a
15 community where the median income is less than 24,000
16 dollars, this is a lot. This monthly expense is an
17 outlay that is unaffordable. The price of... a, a 30
18 dollar... the, the metro card is ten percent average..
19 is ten percent of the household average income. Many
20 low... no... many low income New Yorkers are forced to
21 choose between necessities of food and medicine and,
22 and, and transportation. Many resort to begging for
23 swipes or... I'm sorry, or avoiding the fare altogether
24 as we heard earlier. Over 52,000 New Yorkers were
25

1
2 stopped for fare evasion in 2016. This underscores
3 the needs. In central Brooklyn, Northern Bed Stuy is
4 a transportation desert. In addition to having
5 pronounced economic education on health disparities
6 this is why Citi Bike and bike share is essential.
7 Public housing residents are eligible for up to 60...
8 to pay 60 dollars a year and five dollars a week... a
9 month. Clients of selected credit unions in... and
10 restoration also have a discounted rate. Citi Bike
11 membership has increased over... in Bed Stuy over 56
12 percent in the past year and that's 5,500 more active
13 members in the past year alone. We just want to, to
14 ask you to support Citi Bike and bike share
15 throughout the boroughs that really needs it.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great, thank you.
17 Council Member Menchaca:

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you Chair
19 and again I just want to highlight the leadership of,
20 of this chair, Ydanis Rodriguez, Council Member for
21 your incredible leadership on this... on these issues
22 that we are facing right now in our community both on
23 the Fair Fares and the immigrant communities that
24 need to get respected, I just can't thank you enough.
25 Second I just want to thank Sunset Park for being

1 here, for representing in a big way our community. I
2 know some members couldn't come today for many, many
3 reasons; fear, immigration issues, disability issues,
4 people who are home taking care of, of children who
5 are... who are... who, who are representing and I, I
6 don't know if there's any other way that you were
7 able to kind of bring your testimony with us today.

9 MELISSA DEL VALLE ORTIZ: Well actually I
10 mentioned that we had a, a video... not a video
11 recording but an audio recording if we could... if I
12 could play it.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yeah, there's
14 like ten seconds you can play with us that would be
15 great but I just want to say thank you for bringing
16 that voice here to the city council and bringing the
17 MTA into an accountability that we need with, with
18 every, every force of nature so if you have... you can
19 just play ten seconds of it that'd be great and tell
20 us who this is.

21 MELISSA DEL VALLE ORTIZ: Oh my god, give
22 me one second, I'm so sorry. This is Marilyn Coma,
23 they live on 52nd Street and they're a senior citizen
24 couple that were impacted by... they were impacted... I,
25 I can't play it now.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: That's okay, so
3 they're... just, just give a ten second bit because
4 these are the voices that need to be in the city
5 council and you're doing that with, with every,
6 every, every intention if you will.

7 MELISSA DEL VALLE ORTIZ: It's literally
8 not... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: So what was
10 their issue if you can... [cross-talk]

11 MELISSA DEL VALLE ORTIZ: Their issue was
12 just that the, the grandma has asthma, the
13 grandfather has recent stroke and they actually had
14 to walk and couldn't and they have... they both have
15 weak knees and weren't able to make it to the train
16 station. I... [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you.

18 MELISSA DEL VALLE ORTIZ: Yeah, thank
19 you.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, I'm
21 sorry we're a little bit rushed. We are going to be
22 calling now the next panel. Tracey Capers, Omar
23 Arias, Chris Fulong, Jeff Orlick and Shaquana Boykin,
24 Boykin.

1
2 MELISSA DEL VALLE ORTIZ: I should have
3 mentioned that I was standing in for Tracey Capers.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. Everybody
5 stay here, I think that we have one more seat, what
6 is your name? Joanna, go. Please help us here and
7 stay with two minutes and if you know that it is
8 taking longer just summarize when you... when you are
9 getting close to the two minutes.

10 JOANNA OLTMAN SMITH: Good afternoon, my
11 name's Joanna Oltman Smith, I'm a long time safe
12 streets advocate in New York and I wanted to thank
13 the council for the opportunity to discuss these
14 budgets that so directly affect our everyday lives as
15 we move around our city. Like all New Yorkers, I also
16 am grateful for the additional Vision Zero funding
17 that we're seeing in this budget but as I am
18 unaffiliated with any organization I would like to
19 point out some areas where I think that we are
20 falling short starting by just noting that the DOT's
21 entire budget is only 1.1 percent of the city's
22 overall budget and I believe that the agency that's
23 charged with the responsibility for our mobility and
24 productivity and basic well-being and safety deserves
25 a lot more than one percent of the city budget. The

1
2 impact of this chronic underfunding at the city level
3 will only be felt more as our streets bear the strain
4 of our new federal administration that is maliciously
5 targeting urban transportation needs such as transit
6 funding and the cutting of the Tiger Grants that the
7 DOT mentioned. We all know that active transportation
8 projects yield the largest return on investment, they
9 are the least expensive to implement while reducing
10 health costs and environmental impacts and at the
11 same time increasing our overall transportation
12 system efficiency and safety for all street users.
13 So, I'm curious, I was going through the DOT's report
14 why the total number of bike lane miles that we're
15 targeting to build in the next fiscal year is
16 dramatically less than in past years. Fiscal year '14
17 we were building 70 miles, fiscal year '18 we're only
18 building 50. Our bike network is still far from
19 complete and we also should be very cautious about
20 putting all of our funding needs in the federal
21 basket which is already shown to be faulty. I'm going
22 to try and summarize because I see my time is almost
23 done. I just think our city funded transportation
24 vision needs to be a lot bolder. I would also like to
25 see us improving an intersection for every person who

1
2 has been killed on our streets each year. Right now,
3 we're budgeted to improve 20 intersections a year, we
4 lost over 150 bikers and pedestrians last year, let's
5 fix an intersection for each of them.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great, thank you.

7 OMAR ARIAS: Thank you council. I'm here
8 today to support the inclusion of public funding of
9 Citi Bike... [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Sorry, can, can
11 you say your name please?

12 OMAR ARIAS: Sorry, my name is Omar
13 Arias. I'm here to support the inclusion of public
14 funding of Citi Bike for the city's transportation
15 budget for 2018. My experience with New York City
16 bike share has been one of social mobility,
17 opportunity and advocacy. I began my journey as one
18 of over 100,000 Citi Bike users and coming from a
19 historically black and Hispanic neighborhood in
20 Harlem. Citi Bike was 26 blocks away from my home
21 when I first joined through the NYCHA discount. Last
22 summer I joined the NYCHA community champions program
23 where I reached out to other NYCHA residents about
24 the benefits of bike share. I was given the
25 opportunity to address the New York City Council at a

1
2 public hearing last November and again in January at
3 a press, press conference. I gained employment from
4 Bed-Stuy Restoration as an Active Living Coordinator,
5 working alongside Better Bike Share partners, working
6 to engage communities of low income and color. I was
7 interviewed for the citywide NYCHA journal about bike
8 share and sat at the same table with the General
9 Manager, Manager of Citi Bike to speak about jobs for
10 local residents. The reason I share this with you
11 today is because it is the opinion by some that
12 people like me from neighborhoods like mine will be
13 shut out of such a bike, bike share system and it
14 will harm more than benefit us. To the contrary, my,
15 my voice has been heard countless times and moved..
16 and I moved my way up. Not everyone will follow the
17 same path I have but the takeaway is that there is a
18 path to gain leadership positions and to have a say
19 in the process. Citi Bike is for someone like me but
20 like many I'd like to see an increase in membership
21 and ridership amongst communities of color and low
22 income. In order to do so we need the system present
23 in our neighborhoods. Along with expansion, we need
24 biking infrastructure, increased access to bike
25 education and safety classes and local residents like

1
2 myself to have a say. Still in order for all
3 neighborhoods to experience the same transportation,
4 physical activity and economic benefits of bike
5 share. It is necessary to publicly fund the expansion
6 of Citi Bike into more neighborhoods beyond the
7 current plan. Public funding will help close the gap
8 between existing transportation deserts and allow for
9 an alternative and convenient transportation option
10 for New Yorkers. Thank you.

11 SHAQUANA BOYKIN: Hi, thank you. my name
12 is Shaquana Boykin, I am a New York City Public
13 Housing Citi Bike member in favor of public funding
14 for Citi Bike expansion. Without Citi Bike
15 membership, I could not get to work, college, my
16 internship at Legal Aid Society and back home. I am
17 able to cut my travel time to five to 15 minutes a
18 trip. I have lost three dress sizes, no longer a
19 diabetic and get to community meetings and Fort
20 Greene and Clinton Hill quickly. Citi Bike can change
21 New Yorkers lives, saving us money, travel time and
22 regulating our health. Fund Citi Bike, bike share
23 works. Thank you.

24 JEFF ORLICK: My name is Jeff Orlick. I'm
25 coming here today as a... as a car driver, as a subway

1 rider, a Citi Bike user and a resident of Queens who
2 commutes five days a week to Hell's Kitchen. I also
3 work with new immigrants mostly in Queens. I just
4 came here to say how disappointed I am actually with
5 the state of bike share in Queens and also the public
6 funding but more so for Queens. As it is now Queens
7 has the same number of bike share stations as Fargo,
8 North Dakota, a city of 100,000 people even... we...
9 Queens has two and a half million people and we are
10 well below any city even close to that size in the
11 amount of support and structure of a bike share
12 system. As it is Manhattan is wonderful for bike
13 share, they've done a great job but I feel like
14 Manhattan is the reason why Queens is such a... has
15 such a small share of the bike share. Now if we're a
16 city of our own... of our own we'd have a network of
17 hundreds but it's only tens, it's 11 right now and
18 the expansion is for maybe 40, not that much. So, I
19 guess I'm just asking... I guess why shouldn't we be
20 benefiting from Manhattan, the, the financial center
21 of the world, shouldn't Queens be getting more
22 amenities like this. We... I feel like we may have to
23 go through a route of Jersey City and have our own
24 system cooperating but I don't know, it's just a
25

1
2 question of why isn't Queens treated the same and why
3 don't we have the same amount. That's it, thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Next, next panel;
5 David Beier, Beier, Mark Wiltshire, Tom Glendening,
6 Tom Murphy, Kweli Campbell. So, we have one... no,
7 nobody else from the public.

8 DAVID KELLER BEIER: My name is David
9 Beier and I am President of the Committee for Taxi
10 Safety which is comprised of licensed lease agents
11 which manage approximately 20 percent of New York
12 City taxi medallions and the drivers of those
13 medallions. Together we work to provide
14 transportation to 400,000 people every day. The city
15 holds preliminary budget for fiscal year 2018,
16 provide for the next medallion auction in 2019. In
17 2015, City Hall initially released figures showing
18 that it expected to collect 1.266 billion dollars by
19 auctioning off taxi medallions between fiscal years
20 2015 and '19 but just months later the Mayor's 2016
21 fiscal year executive budget revised that revenue
22 projection indicating that the city should only
23 anticipate realizing 731 million dollars from the
24 sales, a reduction of 500 million dollars. It is
25 commonly assumed that it was solely the introduction

1 of app based technologies such as Uber that was the
2 primary reason that created a diminished marketplace
3 for taxi medallions but that is not true and we would
4 like to address the contributing factors as to why
5 the taxi medallion prices are falling and the
6 industry suffering. When the Uber taxi app initially
7 launched in New York City drivers did not leave the
8 taxi industry to drive for Uber, rather the
9 industry's loss of drivers instead coincided with the
10 accessible vehicle mandate imposed only on the taxi
11 industry and the taxi of tomorrow program which the
12 program took away the Camry Hybrid as an option for
13 taxi drivers and mandated the use of the Nissan taxi
14 of tomorrow. In contrast, 65 percent of Uber vehicles
15 are Camry Hybrids and neighborhood cars are almost
16 exclusively Camry Hybrids. Both the accessible taxi
17 and the taxi of tomorrow vehicles proved to be wildly
18 unpopular with the drivers because neither of the
19 vehicles were fuel efficient nor economical in other
20 ways resulting in less driver income. Drivers have
21 rejected these vehicles and let the taxi segment of
22 the industry to drive their vehicle of choice.
23 Additionally, taxis are also now not allowed to
24 experiment with any new or improved technology. The
25

1
2 TLC has limited only two companies to control all
3 taxi technology and taxis are given adhesion
4 contracts which control everything from the T-Pep to
5 GPS to taxi apps. As an example, the TLC requires E-
6 Hail apps for taxi vehicles to be integrated with a
7 meter rather than allowing for separate charges, one
8 for the metered fare and one for the E-Hail fee. This
9 requirement has prevented app makers from coming into
10 the New York City marketplace. If the council is
11 serious about allowing the taxi industry to remain
12 viable it needs to change the regulatory practices
13 that prevent it from competing. We need to discuss
14 and address the barriers to true competition. In
15 conclusion, the city of New York will only be able to
16 hold auctions in 2019 if the imbalance and
17 regulations is addressed. We cannot compete unless we
18 have an even playing field. Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

20 MARK WILTSHIRE: My name is Mark, thank
21 you for your time today. My... I'm a Community
22 Engagement Associate at Per Scholas. Per Scholas is a
23 New York based nonprofit leading the charge by
24 providing free technology training and job placement
25 assistance for individuals from often overlooked

1 communities. We have two locations, one in the South
2 Bronx and one in Bedford Stuyvesant Brooklyn. We
3 train more than 500 adults every year and more than
4 90 percent of our students are people of color and
5 all of them live in households under 200 percent of
6 federal poverty, poverty guidelines. Our Brooklyn
7 students enjoy having access to Citi Bike as it
8 enables them to travel to class at a much lower cost
9 than taking the bus or train. We have a Citi Bike
10 dock right outside of our location in Bed Stuy and
11 its actively used. We are also working on an effort
12 led by Bedford Stuyvesant Restoration Corporation to
13 make Citi Bike inclusive and accessible to everyone
14 through community bike rides and bike safety
15 education. Our students in the Bronx don't have the
16 access to the bikes that our Brooklyn students do and
17 there are significantly less bike lanes installed in
18 the Bronx than other boroughs as we... most of us know
19 according to the... according to the Department of
20 Transportation. Many of the longest, easiest to ride
21 lanes extend through parks and roads in the North,
22 North Bronx such as Mosholu and Pelham Parkway. There
23 are a few dedicated lanes in the South Bronx and
24 riding in the South Bronx can feel very dangerous for
25

1 residents. And there are no... and for that reason
2 there are, are no Citi Bike docks in the Bronx. By
3 improving bike safety in the South Bronx and
4 expanding Citi Bike to our home borough, you will
5 enable more students to reach Per Scholas every day,
6 which will in turn lead to life changing jobs in
7 technology. You will also improve the health and
8 reduce congestion on trains and buses. Finally, you
9 will enable more residents of the Bronx to access
10 recreation on Randall's Island and in Manhattan via
11 the new Randall's Island connector. At Per Scholas,
12 we firmly believe that biking would benefit the
13 Bronx. Please don't underestimate the interest you
14 would find in the Bronx for more bike lanes and a
15 program like Citi Bike. We hope you will consider
16 expansion to our home borough.

18 KWELI CAMPBELL: Hi, good afternoon. My
19 name is Kweli Campbell and I am a Citi Bike member
20 from Brooklyn, New York. I am here to testify in
21 support of public funding of the Citi Bike program. I
22 moved back to Brooklyn three years ago and brought my
23 bike... my vehicle with me, I quickly realized that I
24 would be unable to drive any and everywhere between
25 traffic and parking even for short trips to the

1 grocery store became long and stressful experiences.
2 One day I passed a Citi Bike stand around the corner
3 from my home and decided to look into it. The pricing
4 was affordable in my opinion. I had a coupon that
5 allowed for an annual membership of 130 dollars. I
6 started riding everywhere within a ten-block radius
7 which quickly expanded to riding to work in downtown
8 Brooklyn. Citi Bike has transformed my transportation
9 experience in New York City. Today not only am I able
10 to ride stress free, I get 30, 30 minutes of cardio
11 daily, I share my Citi Bike experience with family
12 and friends, my car is parked most of the time and
13 I've extended my rides to other neighborhoods in
14 Brooklyn and beyond. In my spare time thanks to the
15 better bike partnership and collaboration with Bed
16 Stuy Restoration I have served as a Citi Bike
17 ambassador where I lead monthly rides during the
18 March through October bike season. I enjoy inviting
19 new bike riders to take rides on Citi Bike to
20 different locations in Brooklyn, recently I held my
21 first ride where I had attendees from the South Bronx
22 as well as East New York where they don't have Citi
23 Bike.
24
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So thank you and thank you everyone who came to testify and the agency that also came today. We have some written testimony which we'll read right now.

COMMITTEE CLERK: The following testimony was submitted for the record, Financial District Neighborhood Association, American Council of Engineering Companies of New York. Gary Brown from the Sunset Park Redevelopment Committee. S. Mckenzie, Duane Jonathon Parnell, Margaret Pemberton, E. Crandon, Pamela Guigili, and Cesar Zuniga.

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you and with that this hear... this hearing is adjourned.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

April 24, 2017