CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS

----- X

March 9, 2017

Start: 1:21 p.m. Recess: 2:23 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Rm.

16th Fl

B E F O R E: RAFAEL SALAMANCA, JR.

Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Darlene Mealy

Ydanis A. Rodriguez

Andrew Cohen Mark Treyger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jordan Press, Executive Director
Planning and Development
Government Affairs Unit
NYC Department of Housing Preservation & Development

David Wallace, Executive Vice President External Affairs
Brooklyn Public Library

Jay Marcus, Director Housing Development Fifth Avenue Committee

Wanda Logan, Director Center Against Domestic Violence

Juan Valazquez

Tamika Covington, Turning Point

Leonard Goodstein

Justin Collins, Director Strategic Partnerships and Development Southwest Brooklyn Industrial Development Corp.

Darlene Martinez

[sound check, pause]

1

2

3 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright. [gavel] 4 Alright. Good morning everyone. I am Council 5 Member-I'm sorry, good afternoon. I'm Council Member 6 Rafael Salamanca. I'm the chair of the Subcommittee on Planning, Dispositions and Concessions. Welcome 8 to everyone here today at this hearing. We are 9 joined by Council Member Andy Cohen. We're also joined by Council Ydanis Rodriguez, and Council 10 11 Member Carlos Menchaca. We have one item on our 12 calendar today for hearing and a vote, LU 584, 585 13 and 586, the Sunset Park Library. In this 14 application HPD is seeking an approval of a 15 disposition of the City-owned site of the Sunset Park Library and Urban Development Action Area Project for 16 17 the site, and an acquisition of property. 18 approvals will facilitate the development of an 8-19 story building with a new library, 49 units of 20 affordable housing reserved for families making 21 between 30 and 80% of area median income. The site 2.2 will be disposed to the developer, Fifth Avenue 23 Committee who would develop the site under the 24 condition that it conveyed the new library space back 25 to the city once completed. This site is located

2.2

2.3

Council Member Menchaca's district. So now, I am opening up the hearing on this item, and I'm calling

up the advocates. Mr. Jordan Press from HPD, Mr. Dan

5 Moran from HPD, Jay Marcus of Fifth Avenue Committee,

6 and David Wallace from the Brooklyn Public Library.

[background comments, pause] Alright, if you can please introduce yourselves before speaking.

JORDAN PRESS: Good afternoon. My name is Jordan Press. I'm Executive Director for Planning and Development in HPD's Government Affairs Unit.

Thank you for having us, and welcome Chairman

Salamanca. Congratulations on your appointment.

We've had the pleasure to work with you on projects in your district and—and it's a pleasure to see in the chair. Congratulations and I also want to offer our thanks to Council Member Menchaca for all of his good questions, and—and leadership as we've been discussing this project. Land Use Nos. 584, 585 and 586 are related ULURP actions pertaining to a project located at 5108 Fourth Avenue in Brooklyn Council District 38, and it's known as Sunset Park Library.

Land Use No. 584 seeks approval of UDAAP designation project approval and disposition of the

2.2

2.3

2 city-owned site under Article 11 of the General
3 Municipal Law.

Land Use No. 585 pertains to disposition approval pursuant to Section 197-C of the New York City Charter. This action duplicates disposition authority and, therefore, is deemed withdrawn. We have submitted to the Council a copy of that request letter—of the request letter that was submitted to the Department of City—City Planning to this effect.

Land Use No. 586 will permit the acquisition of the city-owned site in order to facilitate redevelopment for the Sunset Park Library. This project is being developed under HPD's Extremely Low and Low-Income Affordability Program ELLA. The sponsor is proposing to construct an eight-story mixed-used building with 50 affordable resident units including a superintendent's apartment. The building will also contain approximately 20,755 square feet of community facility space on the cellar through second floor levels from which the library will operate upon completion. The proposed library will be more than twice the size of the existing facility at the site so as to better serve the Sunset Park community. The residential portion of the building will provide a

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

mixture of unit types including 11 studios, 13 onebedroom, 13 two-bedroom and 12-three-bedroom apartments plus one two-bedroom super's apartment. Under ELLA the targeted household incomes will range from 30% to 80% of Area Median Income. The project is subject to the Voluntary Inclusionary Housing Program, which requires that 20% of the units or ten will be permanently affordable. Additionally, HPD will requiring-will be requiring and additional 15% of the units to be permanently affordable for a total of 35% of the units. Some additional amenities planned for the residents of the building include a community room with a kitchenette, office and laundry room, as well as a roof terrace. The building will also incorporate green features such as energy efficient lighting, water conserving plumbing fixtures, and high performance thermal windows and In order to facilitate development of the doors. Sunset Park Library, HPD is before the Council seeking approval of Land Use Nos. 584 and 586. you. [pause]

DAVID WALLACE: Good afternoon, Mr.

Chairman and Chairman Greenfield as well who just
walked in. So I'm David Wallace. I'm the Executive

Vice President for External Affairs from Brooklyn 2 3 Public Library, and I want to take you through the 4 library portion of the project. The projects starts with the library and we have a great branch library 5 in Sunset Park. Our head librarian at that branch 6 7 Roxana Benavides is here in the audience as well as 8 some of her staff. It is a beloved library. It's beloved because of the way the neighborhood uses it, and the staff in the library. It is not beloved 10 11 because of the building. The building has presented lots of challenges for us, and first and foremost the 12 13 infrastructure within the building has-has not been replaced in years, and we've begun to pay the price 14 15 for it. The air conditioning system broke down two 16 years ago, and you can see on the left of the page 17 the temporary chillers we've had to put-to put in 18 place. The roof is leaking. The building needs-the library needs an elevator. Essentially all the major 19 infrastructure in the library needs to be replaced. 20 21 At the same time, this library is too small for the 2.2 neighborhood it serves. We have 60 branches in the 2.3 Brooklyn Public Library system. This is one of the five busiest libraries within those 60 branches, but 24 it's an average size library at 12,000 square. 25

need a modernized library. We need a library with 2 3 infrastructure that works, and we need a bigger 4 library. But the challenge for us-you can just to the next slide-is that we don't have the funding to 5 do so. So the map shows you Brooklyn and our 60 6 7 branches throughout the borough. The overall 8 challenge for us is that we have 60 branches about a million square feet of space in those branches with \$300 million, now down to \$280 million of unfunded 10 11 capital needs. On the other hand, we get about \$15 12 to \$20 million to capital from the city every year. 13 So you can see that those numbers don't add up, and 14 we keep falling further and further behind. So we 15 have not had the luxury of being able to build newer and bigger branches where we need them. So, this 16 17 project gives us a unique opportunity. Working with 18 the Fifth Avenue Committee who is going to build a 19 new structure with a library at its base, and 50 20 units of affordable housing on top is essentially 21 going to pay for the core and shell of a new library 2.2 for us. So, if we were building a library on our 2.3 own, it would probably cost about \$20 million. That's just money we don't have. We're going to be 24 25 able to get a brand new library at a cost of about

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

project.

half of that about \$10 million that we're going to 2 3 put in with proceeds from the Brooklyn Heights 4 Project and this project is going to pay for the core 5 and shell, the frame of that new library, and it's an opportunity that were it not for this kind of 6 7 approach, we would not have. I'm now going to turn 8 it over to Jay Marcus from the Fifth Avenue Committee who will take you through the housing portion of the 9

I'm Jay Marcus. JAY MARCUS: Thanks. I'm the Director of Housing Development for the Fifth Avenue Committee. We're a 38-year-old non-profit community development organization dedicated to addressing social inequities and inequalities, and we raise-I do a variety of programs related to affordable housing development to job training, education and advocacy. So the project, which we're very excited about this being the first time 100% affordable housing is being built over a public library in New York. We think it's an important It's a model we hope that with the leadership of Council Members we'll be able to replicate it around the city, and we certainly want to thank the Council Member. I think without his leadership this

project would not have been viable or would have 2 3 happened, and certainly wouldn't have had the level 4 of both affordability and a lot of the amenities and mix as the community wanted without his leaderships on this project. So, as David mentioned, this is 6 7 going to be 8-story building, 85 stories high-84 feet So it will have the five extra feet that DQA 8 thanks to City Council enables to have-which enables us to have a high-ceiling heights that a library 10 11 needs on the first floor to eight stories in the 85 The library will be 20,755 feet. As Jordan 12 13 had mentioned, on the first and second floor that 14 came out of a lot of community input that they wanted 15 some classroom space on the second floor. So we put 16 aside some space there for that, and residential will be about 51,000 square feet. It's going to be a 17 18 mix of 11 studios, 13 one-bedrooms, 13 two-bedrooms 19 and 12 three-bedrooms. Again, another case where 20 initially we had more units slightly smaller. community board came back and as well as Carlos' 21 2.2 office, and indicated this is a priority. Give us 2.3 more two and three-bedrooms, and-and that mix was made. We also made sure we fit the rents to be 24 affordable to the AMIs the median income for this 25

neighborhood, not necessarily for the region. 2 the rents here—so even though they're 30, 40, 50, 60 3 4 and 80 that actually means given that the median income is just slightly over 60% of this-the region's 5 median income. It's 100% for the neighborhood. 6 7 we really set these rents to be affordable to 8 neighborhood residents, and these residents definitely need it. I think we've all seen the-the studies and Furman Report that said this is one of 10 11 the fastest gentrifying neighborhoods, and because 12 almost half the housing stock is unregulated two to 13 four family homes, the renters are feeling it-feeling that burden the most, and this is the first 14 15 affordable family housing in said park, Sunset Park in many years. We did the distribution at 30, 40, 16 17 and 50 and 60% because you may hear this from your 18 constituents, but for us when we do this rent up, it's always a frustration when someone's income is 19 \$10 too high or \$10 too low, and they can't get in. 20 21 So we set if for a very broad range of affordability. 2.2 We're fortunate to have gotten the subsidies, the 9% 2.3 tax credit from New York State and that's with the ELLA program. So it's deep enough subsidies that we 24 25 set these very low average rents, but again also

25

spread over a whole range. FAC is dedicated to 2 3 permanent affordability. We were the first non-4 profit agency to pose premier affordability. It was back in I believe it's 2007 when we proposed the 5 Gowanus Green project, and we have done that for all 6 7 of our projects since then the city, of course will, as-as Jordan mentioned, require 35% permanent 8 affordability but we are going to guarantee 100% permanent affordability because it's our mission and 10 11 because we know it's what the neighborhood need as it 12 gentrifies not only over the next 10 and 20 years but 13 over the next 50 years and beyond. The rent ranges 14 are going to be, as I mentioned, for this 15 neighborhood. So for studios and ones, for all but 16 the 80% of median income units, they're \$500 to \$900 17 except for two and three-bedrooms, they're \$700 and 18 \$1,300 for the under 60. For those 10 units that 19 will be at the 80%, it's \$1,100 to \$1,750 20 approximately. We-we are also very dedicated. 21 you may know, we did the first LEED GOLD affordable 2.2 housing project in Brooklyn. It was Atlantic Terrace 2.3 and so this project is also going to have a high level of green, and community appeal. One of the 24 first things we did as we waked around the

25

neighborhood with historic organization and our 2 3 architect and BPL, and we pointed out some of the 4 elements from the neighborhood that we wanted to make sure we included in the exterior of the building here 5 and are included, and you can see a couple of views 6 7 of it both in front of it for the library, as well as 8 the longer view down Fourth Avenue. The green features are going to range from what's very typical in terms of no VOC-VOC paint to all LED fixtures to 10 11 something more innovative. We're going to be doing 12 rain water for toilet water for example. A lot of 13 non-profits, you may hear the challenge. Our water and sewer costs now exceed our heating costs in a lot 14 15 of our buildings because of the huge increases over 16 the last eight years or so to pay for the third 17 tunnel from Upstate in water and sewer. So we're 18 looking for new featured not just on saving heating 19 and electric, but now also water as well. We're also 20 dedicated to making sure community residents know 21 about this, and are prepared about it. So we're 2.2 going to be starting our training sessions for the 2.3 Housing Lottery under Housing Connect Early, and we're going to emphasize getting people into credit 24

counseling for those who do not have good enough

2.2

2.3

David.

credit scores, and also because this is a -a high

percentage income population help people to get their

I-10s as well so that they will be eligible. That is

a requirement unfortunately for apply for the

affordable housing in New York. Again we are very

excited about this model because it is another model

for us of the permanent affordability, and it is the

first time of 100% affordable housing over a library

DAVID WALLACE: Similarly on—on the outreach front, we have a great opportunity now for the library. We—we normally don't have a chance to build a library from the ground up like—like we will have here, and we've now begun to work with stakeholders in the neighborhood to get feedback from them about what they want to see in their new library. We have a blank slate. We're starting from scratch, and it's a great opportunity to build a new library that will really meet the needs of the community. We are working with a group called the Hester Street Collaborative that's done a lot of community engagement work around the city, and

and it's one that we hope will be done elsewhere in

the city. And I'm going to turn it over-back over to

they've begun to help us with that-with that process 2 3 that will be undergoing over-over-over the next few 4 months working with the Councilmen, working with Community Board 7, working with as many community 5 stakeholders as possible to get that—to get that 6 7 input. I'll just go to the next slide. The-the 8 other thing that we are focused on right now is an issue that came up very early in the process. councilman focused on it as did other did 10 11 stakeholders. When this construction project begins, there was a lot of concern about the library being 12 closed, and we made a commitment early on that we 13 14 would identify and set up an interim library during 15 the duration of the construction. And with help-help 16 of the city, and the Police Department we've gotten 17 space in the-the old courthouse on Fourth Avenue. 18 It's about eight blocks from the current location, 19 and we're in the process of designing and then later 20 this year building-building out that-that interim-21 interim library space. So if we jump to the next 2.2 slide, and look at the schedule, we are going to not 2.3 close the-the current branch and begin the construction until the—the interim library is ready 24 25 to be handed over-handed over to use so we can-so we

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

can move into it. That-that process will take about 2 3 two to three weeks. At the Councilman's urging, 4 we've begun to think through services that we can provide during that two to three-week period between 5 when the interim library is handed over to us, and we 6 7 begin that move from the old library to the-to the 8 interim library. Looking at the schedule, construction would begin later this year and the new library would open at the beginning of 2020, and I 10

answer any questions.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright, well thank you. Thank you for that. We're going to start with questions from the committee, but before we do I just want to recognize Council Member Greenfield who has joined us today as well. So I guess we'll start with Council Member Carlos Menchaca.

think now we're-we're all available to answer-to

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you—thank you, Chair, and I also want to thank you for coming out today, and I know this has been a long process.

I want to ask—ask a few questions about the different pieces that have really kind of created a lot of concern with some real responses, but I just want to walk through some of them. The first one is really

2 thinking

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

thinking a little bit about the—the kind of decision to create that spread of AMI. Can you tell us a little bit about what the experience has been in previous instances. This is really for the family community, and other communities and—and how this is—maybe a little bit different. How—how different is this project after a long time kind of community builder of affordable housing?

JAY MARCUS: Yeah, it's-it's a good question. The-the concept of doing 30, 40, 50, 60 and 80 really came out of our experience of the frustration of people whose incomes are a few dollars too high or too low to be eligible. The typical scenario is to really set things that to be honest it's usually closer to the 60 because that's the maximum income where you get the 9% tax credit, which is the major financing for all of these affordable housing projects. So, it's a little more complicated in terms of the-having many different levels versus just having the one or two simple levels, but again our experience kind of dictated it made sense. addition, the concept of setting the AMI average toto something that's affordable to the neighborhood versus the citywide average is something we heard

our mission as well.

2.2

2.3

from the community board and your office, of course,

but more importantly it's part of our mission. So,

we also set it up knowing we're going to have to get

deep subsidies even though that takes us an extra

year or so to package all the financing. So again, a

lot of it—a lot of this is more unique, but I think

though this is what the community wants and what's

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I don't know if

HPD can come and chime in a little bit about how—how

the financing and the packaging that came into this

project. One is—is how unique—how actually unique is

this as—as a project, but also how—how is it

preparing HPD for other—other projects across the

city?

JORDAN PRESS: so HPD has several different term sheets that guide how we finance our project, and those terms sheets dictate the different AMI levels, Area Median Income levels that can be served. This program—this project is being developed under our ELLA program, which is our lowest affordability program, and these—the AMI levels that—that the developer is committed to are actually a little bit below the—the maximum that we—that we

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

would allow for meaning that they're achieving even 2 deeper affordability than—than our term sheet would 3 4 permit for. There-there are a few I think just 5 important to note there are few nuances to the project that have allowed for this that there'll 6 7 allow for it on the vast majority of our projects. The fact that it's public land, the fact that there 8 is this transfer of funds from-from the Brooklyn Heights deal, the-the developer has-has agreed to-to 10 11 defer their developer fees. They've done well on 12 competitive financing. So I think a lot of the stars 13 have aligned to make this what I would say, you know, 14 one of the-one of the deeper affordability levels of 15 the projects that we finance.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And as a follow up, to the affordability piece, how are we locking in that deeper affordability that ELLA, you know, is—is kind of studying, but the developer and the unique circumstances have allowed. How—how are we setting that?

JORDAN PRESS: Right. So at the time of closing, we will sign a regulatory agreement with—with the developer. That regulatory agreement trans—follows the land. So even if this—this developer

were, in fact intends to own it, and own it in the long term, and we're confident in their ability to do so, but should any—anything happen where the property were to be transferred these requirements transfer with the land. It's a recorded regulatory agreement that can be found publicly on ACRIS, and—and those

income tiers will be recorded there.

council Member Menchaca: And finally, one of the other big questions, and this is a—this is a real concern I guess across the entire city as we think about public land, and what happens to public land when we engage in partnership with non-governmental entities like a non-profit like Fifth—Fifth Avenue Committee. How are we securing the longevity for a library to remain a library, to remain a publicly owned and used library? Where does

remain a publicly owned and used library? Where does that fit?

JAY MARCUS: I'll turn that over to theto the Library.

2.2

2.3

DAVID WALLACE: Yeah, I mean the—the agreement that we've entered into with FAC ensures that the library—that the space remains a library in—in perpetuity even if something would happen—that happened in the Fifth Avenue Committee that—that—that

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DISPOSITIONS AND CONCESSIONS 22
2	the library needs to be main-maintained at that low-
3	at that location.
4	JAY MARCUS: [off mic] And just
5	COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: [interposing]
6	Can you-can you guys just describe the process of
7	what you're
8	JAY MARCUS: Yeah, if I can just add.
9	So
10	COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Sure.
11	JAY MARCUS: When we convey the land,

JAY MARCUS: When we convey the land, there will be a land disposition agreement that—that is signed and-and it-it is a public document and that will be the agreement between the owner and the city of New York that establishes the terms of the disposition including the requirement of the construction of the library space as a condition of conveying the land.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you and I think it was-I think the Chair had some questions on jobs as well, but I-I'll-I'll pause here. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Thank you, Councilman Menchaca. We have our Council Cohen. Do you have some questions?

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

2.2

2.3

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you, Chair Salamanca. Just so I—the library is going to be a condominium is that—-?

JAY MARCUS: Correct.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: And the rest of the building is going to be rent-the apartments are going to be rental units, and who is going to own the—the underlying land?

JAY MARCUS: The condo Association. So officially this will be a two-unit condo. One of the units will be the library. That will be owned by the city before the library used generally (sic) and the other one will be owned by an affiliated of the Fifth Avenue Committee that will own the housing portion of it. So the land will be owned by the condo association, which is made up of its new condo owners.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I—I don't know.

It's possible. I just didn't see it. Was there any discussion of the real estate taxes? Are there real estate taxes on the property? What will be the status of that?

JAY MARCUS: It does. I mean this is going to be giving a 420-C because it's a low-income

2.2

2.3

tax credit deal. So for projects in over 75%, if I
remember correctly, below 60% AMI and have low-income
housing tax credits, we get a tax abatement so we'll
be having that on the housing portion, and then
obviously the city-owned land will also not be taxed.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you very much, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright, thank you. We have some questions from Council Member Greenfield.

very much. Actually, I didn't have any questions. I just wanted to take the quick opportunity to congratulate Chair Salamanca as the new Chair of this committee. In the very short time that he's been in the City Council he's show his proficiency and expertise in navigating a whole variety of land use issues including some very complicated issues, and his committee involved—in his community involving affordable housing and he's done a very impressive job, and I'm just very excited to be working with him. I want to congratulate him on his ascension to chair and his great work, his leadership and certainly congratulate all of you on what I'm sure

25 1 CONCESSIONS what's been a lot of hard work, and time. 2 I quess my 3 only question would be how long have you been working 4 on this project? 5 JORDAN PRESS: I quess it's about—about two-two and a half-two and a half years I think. 6 7

JAY MARCUS: Yeah, I think we—I think if I remember correctly it's October of 2014--

JAY MARCUS: [interposing] Yes.

JAY MARCUS: --that we approached the library about the idea. In December of that year we applied for the State—the tax credits from the state as well as Project Based Section 8s for the 30% units, and actually a special fund that's helping to fund the library as well with the investment fund of the state, and we go that funding about six months later, and so that's when we became more active to initiate ULURP, and that took a long time.

DAVID WALLACE: And like just to add, we-we spent a-a large portion of-of the 2-1/2 years at-at Councilman-Council Member Menchaca's urging having a lot of dialogue with-with folks-folks in the neighborhood--

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: [interposing]

25 Sure.

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

1 CONCESSIONS 26 DAVID WALLACE: --which I think has made 2 the project much, much stronger. 3 4 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: And so Jordan aside from the standard ELLA an other funding. 5 there any additional funding that's being provided at 6 7 HPD for this project? [pause] 8 JORDAN PRESS: No, no there isn't. 9 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Okay, great. Thank you all so much. 10 11 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Thank you, Council Member. I have a few questions. 12 13 zoning 49 units. Are any of these units or is this building going to participate in the Our Space 14 15 program? JORDAN PRESS: There-three are project 16 17 based vouchers, but they're coming from New York State because it-18 19 DAVID WALLACE: [off mic] Because that's-20 that's eight units. (sic) 21 JORDAN PRESS: Yes, there are eight, eight of the units will be specifically for victims 2.2 2.3 of domestic violence coming out of shelter.

25 conjunction with a Community Board 7 area shelter.

24

Actually, they'll be testifying shortly but that's in

So yes there will be, and just-just to clarify to 2 3 4 5 6 7 8

1

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

make-to make the distinctions. So the HPD's Our Space Program increases the subsidy per unit in exchange for the developer agreeing to accept referrals from the shelter system. In this case they're not-it's not our space where they're getting additional subsidy, but rather there—there will be federal Section 8 vouchers that are attached to those units to cover the difference between what the tenant can pay and what the rent is charged.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright. My other question is how will the community be notified in terms of when the applicate-when you're-you're beginning to take applications?

JAY MARCUS: As I mentioned earlier, actually we're going to start early because we know a lot of people have credit issues just from experience, and also in this neighborhood we want to make sure particularly in the current environment we're helping people to get their I-10s. So they know if they can get an I-10 that they are eligible. So we're starting early. We anticipate actually this summer doing early workshops for people separately because of another project we're doing. Where we

1 going into the four senior centers in the area to 2 3 4 5 6 7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

train seniors to sign up, and we're going to work with the Immigration Committee of the community board, and that was a community board request that we're very pleased and very excited to be doing to work with them to do a lot of the outreach for people to come to come to the early sessions. And again, we'll follow up. What we typically do what's like two-hour sessions on both the project and he will have to emphasize it's still two years away from being rented up. But we'll also then get people to enroll in job training, help them to get their I-10s and start that that actually starting this summer, and then we'll start again. Typically it's about six to nine months before rent up that we then start the

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Okay, can you speak a little bit about local hiring? How-how is that going to work?

process with advertising and the lottery.

JAY MARCUS: We selected our GC to the expansion is a prelude. We selected our GC in part based on their-their ability to do local hiring, and also as you may know, Fifth Avenue Committee has an affiliate Brooklyn Workforce Innovation and a very

2	close partner who will be testifying later today,
3	South Brooklyn Industrial Development Corporation who
4	do job training and job placement. So, we're going
5	to be working with the CG Galaxy early on. They have
6	a history doing this well. They're doing it right
7	now with the example of Saint Nick's for the local
8	hiring because they also do job training and they're
9	a non-profit developer. So, we're going to be
10	working with them to try to make sure the jobs go to-
11	to the local people. They estimate that there will
12	be between 50 and 60 construction jobs. Probably
13	about a third to a little more will be the lowest
14	skilled, which unfortunately they're close the \$15
15	wage range, and then the rest will be skilled to
16	semi-skilled \$25 to \$30 wage range and we're going to
17	make sure we do the job training for both. They've
18	guaranteed us that they'll meet what their averages
19	is, 15%, but we're going to push them to be higher. I
20	should mention we also chose them, although this is
21	an agency initiative. It wasn't necessarily a
22	question because we believe also in MWBE, and they
23	have a history of greatly exceeding the 30% minimum

that's typical on these projects on that as well.

24

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA:

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12 13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright, and then

go up in cost is helpful.

my-my-my final question is the temporary library how

something I find very interesting in this project you that you mentioned that you're going to use rain

JAY MARCUS: It's expensive, and if it

Alright,

water for your toilet water. How is that going to

work?

were not for the member item we would not be able to do in all honestly. It is-it is expensive because we have to do a whole separate plumbing system and the water actually does have to be even for toilet water, it has to be somewhat clean. So it's going to be adding about \$400 to \$500,000, which is close to \$10,000 a unit. It's a lot. It's definitely not economical even though it will save us somewhat on our water and sewer. It will save us maybe \$10,000 a year is what we heard, but again, we're looking long term. Long term we anticipate water and sewer will continue to go up, and-and again it has been all of a sudden. It merged over the last eight years as a major expense. So knowing that there is a-a base percentage of our water usage that won't necessarily

is the community going to be notified where-where the

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15 16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

temporary library will be located?

DAVID WALLACE: Yeah, I'm going to-it's a good question. I mean so part of the-the process we're going to be going through over the next few months to get feedback for the permanent library will give us an opportunity to communicate with-with neighborhood stakeholders, but it's also something we're going to be working with councilmen and other elected officials and the community board to help get that-get that word-get that word-word out.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright, thank you. Are there any other questions? No, alright well I thank you, gentlemen for your-for your presentation. So we're going to-we're going to call up the- Alright, so we're going to call up the speakers. We have Mr. Juan Valazquez, Miss Tina Logan, Leonard Goodstein, Justin Collin, and Tamika Covington. I hope I didn't screw that up. [background comments] Alright, thank you. [background comments, pause] So again, that's have Tamika Covington, Justin Collins, Leonard Good-Goodstein, [background comments] Goodson. I'm sorry. Goodston-Goodston, Tina Logan and Juan Valazquez. [pause]

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Aright, so I'm going to ask—we're going to start from the right. Before you begin your statement, if you can just introduce yourselves, and we're going to give you about two minutes each for your statement.

So, we'll start with you.

TINA LOGAN: My name is Tina Logan. would like to take this opportunity to thank the chair of the subcommittee for hearing my testimony. Good afternoon. I'm a Director of the Center Against Domestic Violence. Forty years ago, the center began in Sunset opening their very first domestic violence shelter in New York State where we continue to offer services to 48 people at a time who are in 16 families. Domestic violence includes physical violence and physical domestic violence is one of the very few crimes that have not decreased in New York in the past three years. For the last ten years, the number of domestic violence homicides have remained steady. Families fleeing to safety can only stay in an emergency shelter for 180 days. In those 180 days, you're competing for affordable subsidized and supported housing with people who are in regular homeless system, and stay in that system in transitional housing until they find permanent

2	housing. The housing crisis is such that three years
3	ago the governor increased the allowable winter stay
4	and emergency domestic violence shelters from 135 to
5	180 days, and then two years ago HRA said that they
6	were going to increase the winter stay from 180 days
7	because we no longer-because we can no longer allow
8	you to discharge from these—these shelters into
9	transitional homeless shelter because they are backed
10	up. So we're thrilled that there are units of
11	housing that will be available to place people in a
12	proposed development. We're thrilled for a number o
13	reasons because families will find permanent housing
14	They'll be able to stay in Sunset Park, and we're
15	close enough in our confidential location that the
16	kids will be able to continue to attend schools they
17	were attending while in shelter. All of the people
18	who come out of residential programs can voluntarily
19	[bell] access case management. Thank you.
20	CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright, thank
21	you.
22	JUAN VALAZQUEZ: Hi, I'm Juan Valazquez.

I'm—I'm new to the east coast. I'm from Little Hilo,
Hawaii where I'm a recent graduate of selfengineering and I'm here in pursuit of my career. I

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

left Hawaii with little more than-a little-little savings, my backpack and my-and my laptop, very little and getting started wasn't-wasn't always easy, but the library in Sunset Park has been my back-towork center, and a great resource to help me, help me get on my-get on my feet, and while I've been there, the things that I've seen are a lot of people, a lot of diversity, a small facility. At 3:00 p.m. Monday through-Monday through Saturday you can see seven dozen, eight dozen people in that one little structure, people lined up to use the one tiny bathroom, a dozen baby strollers parked densely right next to a little pad where younger children play, a little tiny 10 x 12 pad for younger children. Every seat in the house taken. Teenagers lined up to use the printer, all the computers taken. So, it can certainly use an expansion. Thank you.

TAMIKA COVINGTON: Hi. My name is Tamika Covington. I'm here in support of Turning Point. So with this project we basically all feel in favor of it because it's both useful not only to work but to the kids for the computers in the programs that they do have, which I myself have went to one program recently, which was Learning Turney's (sic)

Calligraphy. Also how it helps is the fact that the 2 3 kids need the programs and the computers as well as 4 the young adults that come from the homeless shelters, which I currently live in as well. 5 think it's a great idea because it proposed for the 6 7 community to be able to come together and make 8 something different, and to bring up the community with, you know, a different idea of being able to expand something that they really need, and also 10 11 helping with those who need the affordable housing 12 for those who are homeless, and those who, you know, 13 are looking for somewhere else that afford them to 14 live. Also think about ahead for the next generation 15 for them to be able to have affordable housing for 16 those who send their kids off to school and they come 17 back, and they may need somewhere to stay. would need a lot to us because we use the-the library 18 19 and the computers and the programs that they have as 20 well, and at the same time we do need the affordable 21 housing. So we're in favor with the project, and I think it would be a great idea for the community to 2.2 2.3 come together and make something, you know, better than what it is that they already have, and to make 24 25 things better.

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

1

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright, thank

3 you.

LEONARD GOODSTEIN: My name is Leonard Goodstein. I'm a tenant on the Fifth Avenue Committee people, and I've seen the amazing projects they've done. This project is amazing because it's a mixed project, and to show this can be done can go on and show more projects can be done jut like this. hasn't been done before. So we need to do this. also-I'm a disabled vet. We need veteran programs for housing. Guys are homeless still, and—and I thin that these people should really-I'm trying to get Jay involved with some federal people to put together housing also for veterans besides for people that are homeless. And these joint ventures are necessary in the city at this time because this something they can show as-that could through the whole city. I'm-I'm very proud of these people from Sunset Park. have a lot of guts. Thank you very much.

JUSTIN COLLINS: [off mic] Good

afternoon[on mic] Good afternoon. Thanks for the

opportunity to speak. My name is Justin Collins and

I am the Director of Strategic Partnerships and

Development for the Southwest Brooklyn Industrial

25

Development Corporation. We're a local economic 2 3 development and workforce organization. We've been 4 serving local businesses, and res and residents of Southwest Brooklyn for lose to 40 years. We strongly 5 support the plans to develop 49 units of affordable 6 7 housing on top of the brand new library in Sunset Park. It's clear that Fifth Avenue Committee has 8 made immense effort to ensure that the project is affordable to live-to people living in Community 10 11 Board 7. They're pricing units based the area median 12 income as opposed to the citywide median income, 13 which would be significantly higher. The project 14 also reflects the need for affordable housing built 15 for families, 12 units of three bedrooms, 13 units of 16 two bedrooms, and it's really inclusive of a wide 17 range of demographics particularly local residents. 18 Fifty percent of the units are allocated to folks 19 living in Community Board 7, ten percent for folks 20 who are physically disabled, 9 units reserved for victims of domestic violence, and these units are 21 2.2 required to remain affordable in perpetuity 2.3 regardless of what may happen to Fifth Avenue Committee in the future, and that's a really 24

important point. You know, my organization sees

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

dozens of local job seekers on a daily basis, and the 2 3 folks who come to our office looking for work are 4 more often than not rent burdened sometimes facing issues of housing insecurity or even homelessness. 5 The neighborhood of Sunset Park really needs 6 7 affordable housing as this community has been and we 8 hope will continue to be a walk to work community for people seeking good industrial paying-good paying industrial jobs on the industrial waterfront. And we 10 11 know the relationship between affordable housing and 12 workforce development. So, you know, thank you for 13 the opportunity. We strongly support this project. 14 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Thank you. 15

[bell] Are there any questions from members of the committee? Do you have any questions for the panel?

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yeah, I have—I have one—one—one kind of bigger kind of grand—grander question about what's happening today, and I know that there's—there's a lot of conversation in the city about gentrification, and there's a lot of fear about what's happening right now in our communities. And so is there anything that anybody would say to—to folks that—that might not necessarily be completely connected to all—all the intricacies of this project.

There's so many different tax (sic) for the programs 2 3 that are coming in. This thing was-the whole process 4 started in 2014. It took a while to get her. There's a lot of minds that were-were working, a lot 5 of presentations in the community. Is there anything 6 7 that you want-anybody wants to say in this panel 8 because this is a pretty supportive panel to folks that might-might not be supportive for whatever Is there anything that you want-you want to 10 reason? 11 tell them today about-about how you understand this? 12 I mean I know you already spoke to it, but is there 13 anything new specifically to folks in the-in the city that are just afraid right now about anything that's 14 15 happening where you have-you have these multi-sectors 16 working together? 17 JUSTIN COLLINS: I mean I-I could say one 18 thing, you know, a lot of housing, you know, 19 different developments that people are worried about 20 with regard to, you know, potential for

gentrification. There are affordable units mixed in
with, you know, market rate units and, you know, the
level "affordability" is not entirely affordable for
the people who already live in a particular
neighborhood. The way that this project is being

1 CONCESS:

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

done and the way that the units are being allocated based on incomes that are, you know, below the median income of the immediate community board that it serves really, you know, protects against some of these concerns I think.

LEONARD GOODSTEIN: As you can see around the city, the way things are going the average guy is making \$40, \$50,000 a year. The housing market is nuts. It's-it's out of control, and even with-withwith housing like this, because this is a basic need for this city for people who have lived here, who grew up here, who come here to live and they're the working class. They make this city work, and they need this. With these people we don't have anything because the people that have money they're richer Housing \$3,000. There's a place where I people. know \$5,300 a month for two bedrooms. It's fully So basically what you're doing is a class insane. act. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright, well thank you very much for coming out and speaking. We have one more speaker, Ms. Darlene Martinez.

24 | [background comments, pause]

DARLENE MARTINEZ: Yes.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Just press the 3 button--

DARLENE MARTINEZ: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: --and then just introduce yourself and the--

DARLENE MARTINEZ: This one?

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Yes.

DARLENE MARTINEZ: I'm Darlene Martinez and I'm residents—a resident actually of Boreham Hill, but I go to Sunset Park because it's really the only place where we can resources in Spanish, and I'm support-in support of the program. I was there at the library just this week, and the community has exploded. They-we were there for a king of like reading books to babies and a play time, and we couldn't accept—the organ—the library couldn't—had to turn people away because there just wasn't enough room, and it breaks my heart. I mean there's so many mothers who made it out there for one hour, and then you can't even get it, and I almost gave my ticket away, but I've been twice and couldn't get in. was like I've got to get into one of these. So, anyway, I just-I'm-I'm definitely in support of program. I think we need—I think it's crazy that

2

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

given the community throughout [baby crying] Brooklyn that's not more easily accessible, but I think growth is definitely the right direction, and that's it.

5 Thank you. [baby crying]

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Thank you. Thank you. Is there anyone else from the public who needs to speak? No. Alright, so with that we are going to close the—the public hearing, and we are going to go to our Council Member Menchaca for a—for a statement.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you Chair Salamanca, and I want to thank everybody who testified on-on this application, a series of applications today, and actually everybody who came out for us throughout this entire process. This has been a long time coming for this community, and we are-we are in-in so many ways smarter as a community. We are in so many more way more prepared for future projects, and so I just want to thank everybody who put their time and effort into teaching not only me as a council member, but everybody around that has really decided to engage. Especially to the mother who just spoke during. I want to make sure, and I'm talking to BPL and Hester Street to talk to her specifically. I want to make sure that she is part

of that conversation about what-even the transition 2 3 plan, and we've been talking a lot about what this 4 transition plan is going to be. I want to make sure that mothers like her are part of that transition so 5 that she is felt heard. And it sounds like she lives 6 7 in Boreham Hill, but she's not a unique person. 8 is-this the constituency of this-of this community, the library community that is really citywide in so many ways, and-and I-I quess what I want to say it 10 11 reminded me of just my own experience for the first I 12 was in the library when-when my mom dropped off for a 13 Head Start program with my local library. where I learned how to speak English, and so 14 15 libraries for me are so-so-so personal in the impact 16 that it has to a family, a single mom, immigrant 17 mother who is making sure that her son spoke English 18 and was able to kind of get into the education That's what libraries do. 19 process. They transform. 20 But not only do we have an incredible library program 21 or a system with BPL, we have an incredible librarian-librarian with a team. Roxanna is here 2.2 2.3 who's always, always speaking truth to power about what kind of services are needed and what kind of 24 responses they need from the city getting the words 25

from so many different sides for her deep, deep work 2 3 and commitment. So I just have to say thank you to 4 Roxanna and her team that's here today. [applause] 5 Aplausos. So, really quick. The New York City Charter gives the City Council the power to approve 6 7 or disprove any disposition or acquisition of the 8 land by the city of New York. As a council member I take this responsibility very seriously. Any potential proposal or development of public land must 10 11 be carefully analyzed and vetted to ensure the public 12 interest is being protected both in the short term 13 and in the future generations. I believe that this proposal by HPD, which you heard today, BPL, which 14 15 you heard today and the Fifth Avenue Committee who 16 testified today clearly offers greater public benefit than the standalone 12,000 square foot library that 17 18 occupies the site today. You heard about that site. 19 You heard about its-its shortcomings. First, our 20 community will gain a brand new library. Nearly 21 21,000 square feet owned by the city of New York. 2.2 This new library will be one of the largest branches 2.3 in the system equipped with the latest technology. With the current library busting at the seams and-and 24 demand for library programming growing each month, 25

this expanded and updated library will be an 2 3 important asset for the future of this community. On 4 top of the new library, we are set to gain 49 new affordable housing units for a neighborhood where the 5 median asking rents are now nearly at \$2,000 a month 6 far out of reach of any average Sunset Park family. 7 When we hear affordable, we also have to ask, and 8 this community has been asking over and over and over again to who, affordable to who? And in this case 10 11 the depth and the breadth of affordability is truly 12 remarkable. This project includes units at 30, 40, 13 50, 60 and 80% AMI. I have to read that again. 30, 40, 50, 60 and 80% AMI. The studios are actually 3914 15 of the units in this project will be at or below 60% 16 AMI with rents lower than the \$1,300 a month. 17 studios will be available for as low as \$328 a month 18 and three-bedroom apartments for families as low as 19 \$582 a month. That's what we're talking about when 20 we talk about affordability. The guarantees. Okay. 21 So although I trust the intent of the Fifth Avenue 2.2 Committee, and the Brooklyn Public Library to deliver 2.3 the project that they have presented, I have been very clear about this from the start that these 24 25 promises must be memorialized in legal documents that

protect the public's interest. After taking close 2 3 examination, I am satisfied that the public's 4 interest in ensuring permanent and improved and enlarged library space and truly affordable housing 5 is protected. Now, the legal documents that are-that 6 accompany this ULURP application make it absolutely 7 8 certain that the developer, the Fifth Avenue Committee or any other successor of the entity, and we hope that the family committees here for a long, 10 11 long, long time must construct a 20,755 square foot 12 space for the library that will be conveyed back to 13 the city of New York and-and be-sorry-and required to remain a library in perpetuity. The Land Disposition 14 15 Agreement requires the developer to construct a 16 20,755 square foot library space within 48 months of 17 contract closing. One the construction is complete, 18 the developer must sell the 20,755 square foot 19 condominium unit to the city of New York for the 20 nominal price of \$1.00. If a developer fails to do 21 this, the City has right to repossess the property. We fought hard for this ironclad requirement to be 2.2 2.3 included in the agreement, and I believe that it sets a new standard for safeguarding our public interest 24 in this-in the disposition of public assets. Now, 25

this is something that other council members are—are 2 3 listening to, and I'm hoping that they really kind of 4 take this on and bring this to other-other parts of the city. The DNA that we've constructed here should 5 go farther thank just Sunset Park. But there are 6 7 additional levers that will helped. Well, before 8 that, actually the affordability—the affordable housing 20% of the units are required to be permanently affordable the terms of the inclusionary 10 11 zoning and an additional 15% will be permanently 12 affordable as part of the regulatory agreement by 13 HPD. The remaining 65% of the units will be subject 14 to a 60-year regulatory agreement, but there are 15 additional levers that we will help-that will help 16 ensure that the remaining 65% will almost certainly 17 remain affordable in perpetuity beyond 60 years. The 18 regulatory agreement requires the owner of the 19 development will be incorporated as an HDFC that 20 cannot sell or transfer the property without prior 21 written approval from HPD. The laws governing HDFCs require that all rental units owned by the HDFC 2.2 2.3 remain in affordability. The Regulatory Agreement also requires that all units remain subject to rent 24 stabilization laws both during and after any 25

potential expiration of their agreement. 2 3 addition, the financing of this development is 4 structured so that a balloon payment is due at the time that the Regulatory Agreement expires. 5 these conditions create a powerful-powerful incentive 6 7 for the developer to negotiate a new extended 8 agreement to ensure affordability beyond 60 years. On top of all of these like legal-legal safeguards, the Fifth Avenue Committee, a local not-for-profit 10 11 development organization that has decades long, 12 decades long record of community work in this part of 13 Brooklyn, has pledged to maintain the affordable 14 housing at this site in perpetuity. And not only 15 that, you also heard that Family Committee is going out early to make sure that we train people to 16 17 understand how to make these applications possible so 18 everybody no matter your immigration status, 19 everybody has the opportunity to apply, and you 20 better believe that CB7 Sunset Park residents are 21 going to flood this application process-this 2.2 application process. So in conclusion where today we 2.3 have a 12,000 square foot library in less than four years we will nearly have a 21,000 square foot state-24 of-the-art library along with the 49 apartments 25

way. Thank you. Muchas gracias.

1	CONCESSIO

affordable for families that will otherwise not have
an opportunity to stay in Sunset Park. This project
clearly takes an exciting public asset or an
existing. It is excited, too. An existing public
asset and expands the public benefit, a win-win for
both the community and the city, and will also have
an incredibly happy staff with Roxanna leading the

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Alright, well thank you [applause]. Thank you Council Member Menchaca and congratulations on our great project for your community. Now, we will move onto a vote to approve LU 584 and 586, and approve a motion file LU 585. This last item, and Disposition Approval for the site was withdrawn by HPD after it was determined that the action was unnecessary. We are approving the disposition of the site as part of the UDAAP approval in LU 584. Counsel, please call the role on a vote to approve LU 584 and 585 and approve the motion to file LU 585.

LEGAL COUNSEL: Chair Salamanca.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Aye.

LEGAL COUNSEL: Council Member Rodriguez.

2.2

2.3

50 1 CONCESSIONS 2 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Well, we are 3 still debating. I will be--be vote, but--4 We'll wait. [laughter] LEGAL COUNSEL: 5 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: No, first of all, congratulations Chairman Salamanca and 6 7 congratulations also Menchaca for this great project. I hope that, you know, HPD learn a lot so that as we 8 are moving conversation on building the new library in Inwood, this is only the—this should be only the 10 11 beginning, you know, of the expectation that we have for our community, but one area that I would to 12 13 highlight because it doesn't matter if the project is 14 happening in Brooklyn, Staten Island, Bronx or Queens 15 or Manhattan, it's please guys. Libraries do better 16 in technology. You know, STEM is one of those areas 17 where we've been living females and people of color 18 behind. The number of-of females and black and 19 Latino, it doesn't match when it comes to Google, 20 Facebook, Apple, and we are-the number is so low, and 21 that's why last year the corporation, the tech 2.2 company they had to bring 95,000 immigrants to work 2.3 in the tech company because we as a nation are not

producing the numbers that we need. So I believe it

is important, you know, for all of us to do our part

24

25

2.2

2.3

not to have 20 computers in the room. It's about hands-on. It's about we're starting earlier exposing our—all children when it comes to a STEM. Yes, that's happening throughout the city. The problem is that the group program is only happening depending of the circuit (sic) where individual, and I think that we can live in New York City for all, but we have to do much better when it comes to STEM in all places, but especially in our public library. Thank you and with that, I vote aye.

LEGAL COUNSEL: Council Member Cohen.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I just want to say congratulations to Chair Salamanca for an excellent first meeting, and I want to say congratulations to Council Menchaca for really a profound and very, very admirable project, and with that, I vote aye.

LEGAL COUNSEL: With a vote of 3 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and 0 abstentions,

Land Use Items 584 and 586 are approved, and the Land

Use Item 585 is a motion to file is—is approved on that item, and all items are referred to the Full

Land Use Committee.

CHAIRPERSON SALAMANCA: Awesome. So I would like to thank the members of the public, my colleagues, Council and Land Use staff for attending today's hearing. This—this meeting is hereby adjourned. [gavel]

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date March 31, 2017