

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

February 1, 2017
Start: 1:50 p.m.
Recess: 3:03 p.m.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E:
MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO
Speaker

COUNCIL MEMBERS:
INEZ D. BARRON
JOSEPH C. BORELLI
FERNANDO CABRERA
MARGARET S. CHIN
ANDREW COHEN
COSTA G. CONSTANTINIDES
ROBERT E. CORNEGY, JR.
ELIZABETH S. CROWLEY
LAURIE A. COMBO
CHAIM M. DEUTSCH
DANIEL DROMM
RAFAEL L. ESPINAL, JR.
MATHIEU EUGENE
JULISSA FERRERAS-COPELAND
DANIEL R. GARODNICK
VINCENT J. GENTILE

APPEARANCES (CONTINUED)

VANESSA L. GIBSON
DAVID G. GREENFIELD
BARRY S. GRODENCHIK
COREY D. JOHNSON
BEN KALLOS
ANDY L. KING
PETER A. KOO
KAREN KOSLOWITZ
RORY I. LANCMAN
BRAD S. LANDER
STEPHEN T. LEVIN
MARK LEVINE
ALAN N. MAISEL
STEVEN MATTEO
DARLENE MEALY
CARLOS MENCHACA
ROSIE MENDEZ
I. DANEEK MILLER
ANNABEL PALMA
ANTONIO REYNOSO
DONOVAN J. RICHARDS
YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ
DEBORAH L. ROSE
HELEN K. ROSENTHAL
RAFAEL SALAMANCA, JR.
RITCHIE J. TORRES
MARK TREYGER
ERIC A. ULRICH
JAMES VACCA
PAUL A. VALLONE
JAMES G. VAN BRAMER
JUMAANE D. WILLIAMS
RUBEN WILLS

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Ron Naclerio
Basketball Coach at Benjamin N. Cardoza High

Reverend Joel A. Gibson
Director of Faith Based Initiative at the
Federation of Protestant Welfare Agencies

Reverend Wendy Calderon-Payne
Executive Director of BronxConnect
Bronx

[gavel]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: First Council Member Grodenchik is having his ceremonial, we'd ask all of those involved to please come up. Ron Naclerio is being honored as head coach of Benjamin Cardozo High school basketball becoming he winningest coach in both New York City and New York State public school history, congratulations that's a big deal.

[applause]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: So, I'm going to have to step out to take a phone call so I don't want you to think I'm being rude but congratulations. I know that we'll hear the proclamation and, and Barry will say a few words but I see some of you are students here that.. your players, I'm not a big sports person so I say the.. they're students but they are.. yes, you're players who I'm sure are all proud of, of this and congratulations on your recognition and Barry I'll hand it off to you.

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you Speaker. Thank you all for being here today. It's quite an honor for me this is my first ceremonial

1
2 and so I'm very picky coach I want you to know
3 that.

4 COACH NACLERIO: [off mic] Thank you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: It's
6 especially important for me today because you can
7 see I've got the Cardozo hat and this hat was worn
8 by my son David who is now a student at Oneonta but
9 he was a varsity athlete, he was a football player
10 and he was also a JV baseball player so we're very
11 excited as a Cardozo alum parent to be here with
12 you coach and we are joined by Mr. Carnegie who was
13 mentioned several times by the coach. I just want
14 you to know coach, coach has been at Cardozo 36
15 years now as head coach. He literally started
16 coaching there at 21, if I'm correct and is also
17 accoated [phonetic] to this, his father is a... was a
18 surgeon and I have a letter in my hand, I'm not
19 going to read it but the letter... I'll read a little
20 bit; ever since leaving New York I've been
21 intending to write you, I hope you have received
22 our gift by now, he was a surgeon who operated on a
23 very, very famous American, I think we all just
24 celebrated what would have been his 88th birthday,
25 he saved Doctor King's life, his father so...

[applause]

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: That's a tremendous legacy that he has. Coach this is the first time I've done this so I don't know if, if the, if you're going to read it and then we're going to let the coach speak. Okay so the Clerk of, of the city of New York is going to read this, Mr. Mcsweeney go ahead.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Council, city of New York proclamation. The council of the city of New York is proud to honor Ron Naclario for his extraordinary achievements as the distinguished basketball coach at Benjamin N. Cardozo High School. And whereas Mr. Naclario has led the Cardoza High School basketball team since 1981 when he began as an assistant coach. Over the course of the last 36 seasons nearly 100 of the players he has coached have gone on to play in division one programs. He also led the team to city championships in 1999 and 2014. In December, 2016 his 755th win officially made him the winningest public school coach in the history of New York State and whereas the son of renowned heart and lung surgeon Dr. Emil Naclerio. Ron Naclario also

1
2 attended Cardozo High School where he was an all-
3 city baseball and all Queens basketball player. As
4 a Saint John's University student, he played junior
5 varsity basketball and varsity baseball and led
6 Saint John's to the 1978 college world series. The
7 next year he was drafted by the Chicago White Sox
8 and spent three seasons in the minor leagues and
9 spring training in a major-league camp before
10 leaving in 1982. And whereas Mr. Naclerio is also
11 an accomplished writer whose articles have
12 published in magazines and journals around the
13 globe. In 1990 Mr. Naclerio co-authored a book with
14 John Valenti entitled "Swee' Pea and Other
15 Playground Legends: Tales of Drugs, Violence, and
16 Basketball" which has been included in the
17 basketball hall of fame library. He is currently
18 the associate editor of "Hoop Scoop" online, the
19 former co-host of its weekly radio show and the
20 subject of the documentary Naclario 723 which
21 highlighted his PSAL record. And whereas in 2002
22 Mr. Naclerio was recognized as the National
23 Association of Basketball Coaches, Guardians of the
24 Game service award and he is the only high school
25 coach to receive a Guardian of the Game award. In

1
2 2005 the Saint Louis Post Dispatch included him on
3 the list of Power 50 who's who among college
4 basketball. And whereas in 2016 the Brooklyn Nets
5 honored him for breaking the record for most wins
6 in the public school athletic leagues history the
7 same year he was selected to coach the national
8 team in the capital classic all American game in
9 Washington D.C. Now therefore be it known that the
10 council of the city of New York proudly honors New
11 York's winningest public school coach Ron Naclerio
12 and we wish him continued success both on and off
13 the basketball court in the years ahead.

14 [applaud]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Coach I
16 want...

17 [applaud]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: I just want
19 to let everybody know that almost 100 young people
20 have gone on to play division one ball at a
21 national level that this coach has coached and four
22 of them have made it to the NBA but the most
23 important statistic is he's one of my constituents
24 so... without any further ado I give you the
25

1
2 winningest basketball coach in New York State
3 public school history Ron Naclerio.

4 [applause]

5 COACH NACLERIO: Thank you. This, this
6 is an honor to be here because when City Hall calls
7 you know you've done something good or you've done
8 something bad and I know I've done something good.
9 I've been blessed, I've had great people at Cardoza
10 administrators, I've had great assistant coaches, I
11 have my principal over here, I have my athletic
12 director, my assistant principal but I wouldn't be
13 here if it weren't for young men like these that
14 would play for me because as good of a coach as I
15 like to think I am and I think I'm very, very good
16 without players that are average that let me push
17 them up the ladder or players that are very good
18 that let me push them up the ladder to greatness I
19 would never be here. So, I, I want my players to be
20 honored.

21 [applause]

22 COACH NACLERIO: You know 36 years I
23 have no, I have no idea how much longer I'm going
24 to go but I still have the love, I hope God blesses
25 me to go several more years and I think the reason

1
2 why I'm here is because of my father. My father as
3 you heard was a heart and lung surgeon who save
4 Doctor Martin Luther King's life in '58 when he got
5 stabbed, he expertly removed two ribs from the side
6 because it was too dangerous to remove it from the
7 front because if he would of coughed or sneezed as
8 Doctor King said in his own speech he would of
9 drowned in his own blood. I was lucky that Doctor
10 King's oldest son came to Cardoza of October 23rd,
11 2014 to thank me in front of a packed auditorium.
12 And I'm just honored to be here, it's hitting me
13 now more because people that I want to help New
14 York City, make New York City great are honoring me
15 so they might think that I have something positive
16 inside that'll help make their job. So, I really,
17 really appreciate it Barry.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: [off mic]

19 Thank you.

20 [applause]

21 [background dialogue]

22 COACH NACLERIO: Well a couple of... do
23 you want me to read the letter? On stationary, it
24 says Martin Luther King Junior 454 Dexter Avenue
25 Dexter Baptist Church, Montgomery, Alabama. The

1
2 letter is dated January 6th, 1959. Dear Dr.
3 Naclerio ever since leaving New York I have been
4 intending to write you at least a note to express
5 my great appreciation to you for all that you did
6 to preserve life. Your skilled surgery coupled with
7 your genuine concern to me as a patient combined to
8 bring me from a very low ebb in my life to blooming
9 health again. Please know that I will remember your
10 gestures of good will so long as the cords of
11 memory shall lent it. I hope you have received our
12 gift by now, it is simply a little way to express
13 our gratitude to you for all that you did to ease
14 the load of a difficult period in our life. With
15 best wishes to you and yours to health and
16 happiness in 1959 I am sincerely yours; Doctor
17 Martin Luther King Junior.

18 [applause]

19 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: [off mic] That's
20 a nice letter.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you
22 coach. Thank you Principal Colby and thank you all
23 for being here today and thank you Speaker and all
24 my colleagues and, and the players are from...

25 COACH NACLERIO: They started from 31...

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: They're
from all over Queens. Thank you very much.

[background dialogue]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright, so
congratulations again to the coach. We have one
more ceremonial. Good luck to you guys, thank you
for being here. We're going to have Council Member
Richards who is recognizing Reverend Joel A.
Gibson, Director of Faith Based Initiatives at the
Federation of Protestant Welfare Agencies upon his
retirement after 40 years of ministry. So, Donovan.
Anybody that's affiliated or associated with this
ceremonial please come up.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you
Madame Speaker as we await the man of the hour.
Come on up.

[background dialogue]

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay, well I
want to thank everybody for coming out as we
recognize a, a... come on up, come on Reverend Brady..
as we recognize a young man...

REVEREND GIBSON: [off mic] Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Whose done so
much work for our city, for my district, for

1 Southeast Queens, Reverend Joel Gibson. And I'll
2 just give some fun facts about him. Reverend Gibson
3 did his undergraduate college education at Ohio
4 State University where he studied... the Ohio State
5 University where he studied anthropology,
6 sociology, and psychology and also, he received a
7 degree in business, administration from Franklin
8 University. And... I'll also give another good fun
9 fact in opposition to the war in Vietnam Reverend
10 Gibson became a conscientious objector in 1969 and
11 his work as founder of inner city community center,
12 the Council of South Garfield Square in Columbus he
13 met his wife Nora who's joined us today, a musician
14 and educator and whom he married in 1970. In 1972
15 Joel and Nora moved to Washington D.C. where he
16 began his seminary training working with Reverend
17 John Fletcher and Reverend James Forbes at
18 Interfaith Metropolitan Seminary providing the
19 foundation for his life's work bringing together
20 people of all faiths and cultures to effect
21 positive change. Reverend Gibson arrived back in
22 New York City in 2007 when he accepted the position
23 of Director of Faith Based Services at FPWA. Since
24 his arrival at FPWA Reverend Gibson has
25

1 significantly grown the number of Faith Based
2 members and has established the Advocacy Academy in
3 Faith... in the Faith and Justice Fellowship.
4 Congregants, colleagues and those he has married,
5 he's married can all attest to his ability to
6 listen compassionately, he never passes an
7 opportunity to help someone solve a problem, solve
8 a problem on a dilemma or provide empathetic
9 advice. Post his retirement from FWPA he's looking
10 forward to mostly spending time with his wife, Nora
11 as they celebrate their 47th year of marriage.

12 [applause]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: He has three
14 children and six incredible grandchildren and today
15 I really... we wanted to pay homage to you. I want to
16 thank you for the work you've done citywide but in
17 our district, he's really strengthen... and this
18 organization has really strengthened the Faith
19 Based community and I know we have member items in
20 the council and because of his work Daneek you know
21 more of our churches are coming to us for funding.
22 So, we want to thank you for that but in all
23 honesty we are grateful for the work you've done to
24 really build the Faith Based community in which
25

1
2 builds our communities and makes our communities
3 better, your work on homelessness, on food
4 pantries, on building capacity for our pastors is
5 paramount to, to the mission we strive to, to reach
6 every day here in the city council. So, we thank
7 you and just wanted to pay... give you a small token
8 of appreciation for the work that you've done over
9 the past 40 umpteen years, I wasn't born yet but we
10 thank you for obviously helping our generation and
11 helping us... paving the way for us here in the city
12 and in our communities so thank you Reverend
13 Gibson. So now I will go to... we will now go to the
14 clerk to read the proclamation, I have not done
15 this believe it or not since I've been elected so
16 we'll ask the clerk to read the proc...

17 COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Council,
18 council city of New York proclamation. Whereas the
19 council of the city of New York is proud to honor
20 Revered Joel A. Gibson upon his retirement as
21 Director of Faith Based Initiatives for the
22 Federation of Protestant Welfare Agencies for his
23 enduring contributions to the community. And
24 whereas Reverend Gibson's work for the Federation
25 of Protestant Welfare Agencies is the culmination

1
2 of 40 years in ministry. He began his Faith Based
3 Advocacy while still in college when he founded an
4 inner-city community center, the Council of South
5 Garfield Square in Columbus, Ohio. He cemented the
6 foundation for his life's work with seminary
7 training at Interfaith Metropolitan Seminary in
8 Washington D.C. where he brought together people of
9 all faiths and cultures to affect positive change.
10 After serving Ascension church in Silver Springs,
11 Maryland Reverent Gibson went to Trinity Wall
12 Street and founded a Drop Inn Center for the
13 homeless. Later he served as sub-dean of the
14 Cathedral of Saint John the Devine where he also
15 established the Parish of Saint Saviour and served
16 on the boards of the Partnership for the Homeless
17 and Trinity School. And whereas Reverend Gibson
18 also served the communities of Minneapolis for ten
19 years in several... including Dean of Saint Mark's
20 Cathedral, Founding Executive Director of Spiritual
21 Opportunities for Life and Executive Director of
22 the Institute for New Americans. And whereas since
23 2007 Reverend Gibson has excelled as the Director
24 of Faith Based Initiatives for the Federation of
25 Protestant Welfare Agencies an organization that

1
2 promotes the social and economic well-being of
3 greater New York's most vulnerable by strengthening
4 human service organizations and advocating for
5 public policies. The federation serves
6 approximately 300 member agencies and churches
7 through management assistance, grants, and social
8 services and policy advocacy and research. By
9 working together with a number of non-profits and
10 foster care agencies to senior service providers in
11 settlement houses. The federation strengthens the
12 lives of roughly two million New Yorkers. And
13 whereas during Reverend Gibson's tenure the
14 federation has seen a significant increase in the
15 number of Faith Based members. He also established
16 the advocacy and the Faith and Justice Fellowship.
17 Although he is retiring from his position at the
18 federation he will continue to be an outspoken and
19 enter influential champion for social justice. Now
20 therefore be it known that the council of the city
21 of New York is proud to honor Reverend Joel A.
22 Gibson for his outstanding service to the
23 Federation of Protestant Welfare Agencies and his
24 enduring contributions to the community at large.
25 Mellissa Mark-Viverito speaker for the entire

1
2 council, Donovan Richards, Council Member 31st
3 District Queens.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Well that was
5 great, thank you for all the work you've done
6 Reverend Gibson, you have my good friend Reverend
7 Royal here from... that we've gotten to know each
8 other so you're in good company and everyone else
9 that is here to support you. I'm glad that we're
10 giving you this recognition and with that allow you
11 to say a few words.

12 REVEREND GIBSON: Thank you very much
13 Madame Speaker, Council Member Richards, Public
14 Advocate, excuse my back and friends. I, I just
15 want to say how grateful I am for all of the people
16 who I've worked with other the years of my ministry
17 and community action. It actually began for me when
18 I met this lady standing next to me who is my wife
19 as an 18 year old and a 22 year old we had a dream
20 that people can make a difference if they work
21 together in a community of other people for people
22 and so she said yes and I said yes and here we are.
23 You've heard all of the, the stuff that goes with
24 that, the most important part is the continuation
25 as much as I love working at FPWA and under

1
2 Jennifer Jones Austin's leadership and with my
3 colleagues right here I now have all the time I
4 need to do what I need to do to continue to make a
5 difference. I know that the city council
6 understands the importance of the relationship
7 between Faith Based community and the council and
8 the other agencies that work across the city and
9 part of what I'm committed to do until the good
10 lord decides to do something else with me is make
11 sure that those relationships work, that they work
12 as, as well as they can and that together we are
13 partners in making this city better. So for this
14 proclamation and for your support and all that I
15 thank you very much.

16 [applause]

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: That ends
18 ceremonials.

19 [background dialogue]

20 [gavel]

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Everyone please
22 have a seat. Quite in the chambers. Everyone please
23 take their seat. Thank you. all rise for the Pledge
24 of Allegiance.

25 [audience recites pledge]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated, roll call.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Borelli?
Cabrerera? Chin?

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Cohen?

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: [off mic] Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY:
Constantinides?

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Cornegy?

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Present.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Crowley?

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Cumbo?
Deutsch?

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Dromm?

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Espinal?

COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: [off mic]
Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Eugene?
Ferrereras-Copeland?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

21

COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: [off mic] Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Garodnick?

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: [off mic] Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Gentile?

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: [off mic] Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Gibson?

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: [off mic] Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Greenfield?

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: [off mic] Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Grodenchik?

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: [off mic] Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Johnson?

COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Kallos?

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: King? Koo?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Koslowitz?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: [off mic]
Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Lancman?
COUNCIL MEMBER LANCOUNCIL MEMBER AN:
[off mic] Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Lander?
COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Levin?
COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Levine?
COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: [off mic] Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Maisel?
Eugene?
COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: [off mic] Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Mealy?
COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: [off mic] Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Menchaca?
COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: [speaking
Spanish]
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Mendez?
COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Miller?
COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [off mic] Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Palma?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: [off mic] Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Reynoso?
Richards?
COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Rodriguez?
COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [off mic]
Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Rose?
Rosenthal?
COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [off mic]
Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Salamanca?
COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Barron?
COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [off mic]
Present.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Torres?
Treyger?
COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Maisel?
COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: [off mic] Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Ulrich?
COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Here.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Vacca?

STATED MEETING

24

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: [off mic] Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Vallone?

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Williams?

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [off mic]

Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Wills?

Matteo?

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: [off mic] Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Van Bramer?

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Speaker

Mark-Viverito?

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] Here.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Borelli?

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Borelli?

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Here.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quite in the

chambers. All rise for the invocation. The

invocation will be delivered by Reverend Wendy

Calderon-Payne the Executive Director of

BronxConnect in the borough of the Bronx. Quite in

the chambers.

1
2 REVEREND CALDERON-PAYNE: God our
3 father, maker of heaven and earth, creator of all,
4 giver of all good things. We come to you this day
5 acknowledging your greatness and our need for you.
6 by the word of your power you created all things,
7 nothing has been created that you did not create
8 including our great city. Your thoughts and your
9 understandings are perfect, they have been perfect
10 from eternity past and they will be perfect for
11 eternity to come. It is to you the only wise God we
12 come today, we come to seek you based on your
13 promise that if we acknowledge you in all our ways
14 you will direct our paths. When we consider the
15 heavens, the work of your fingers, the moon and the
16 stars which you have ordained what is man that you
17 are mindful of him, the son of man that you visit
18 him. We ask that you would visit the city council
19 that you have ordained grant these elected
20 officials the wisdom to lead and govern
21 righteously, give them wise solutions to the
22 problems we face today, give them ears to hear and
23 a willingness to work together for the better of
24 our great city. Lord heal the broken hearted of our
25 city and bind up their wounds, forgive us where we

1
2 have fallen short and help us forgive those who
3 have trespassed against us. Lord help us be like
4 you gracious and full of compassion, slow to anger
5 and full of mercy. It is a difficult season in our
6 country and in our city, many are afraid yet we
7 know that yours is not the spirit of fear, you
8 promise power, love, and a sound mind to all who
9 seek you. help us push through this fear to love
10 one another and to see your wisdom and direction
11 for all that we face. Make New York City a just
12 city that protects the widow, the orphan, the
13 prisoner, the voiceless, and the fatherless. Bless
14 our city that we might prosper and offer shelter
15 and good lives to the many that live here. Thank
16 you for our growing season of peace and a reduction
17 of violence. Blessed are the peace makers of this
18 city for they will be called children of god. Lord
19 bless the educators for our future leaders are in
20 their hands. Lord bless those who heal both body
21 and mind in our city. Lord bless who toil with
22 their hands for they build our city. Your name is a
23 strong and mighty tower and that name which is
24 above all names we commit this council in New York
25 City to you.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amen. Please be
3 seated. Motion to spread the invocation, the
4 Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito?

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you
6 Madame Public Advocate. Reverend Wendy Calderon-
7 Payne is a criminal justice and youth advocate
8 working in the Bronx part of my district. She has
9 served as the executive director of the Urban Youth
10 Alliance International also known as BronxConnect
11 since 1994. We are proud to partner with
12 BronxConnect in offering school based programing as
13 part of the council's crisis management anti-gun
14 violence initiative in the 40th precinct. The
15 initiative including the Cure Violence Program
16 operated by SOS South Bronx is seeing incredible
17 results in reducing the number of shootings in the
18 area and I want to thank Reverend Payne... Calderon-
19 Payne for her incredible work and as a side note I
20 know her brother who I did... when I was a producer
21 at WBAI non-commercial radio many, many, many years
22 ago, was a co-producer alongside me so we have
23 connections in many different ways. Thank you for
24 your service and with that I move to spread the
25 invocation of full up on the record.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

adoption of minutes, Council Member Lanceman?

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCEMAN: Oh boy...

motion at the minutes of the stated meeting of
December 15th, 2016 be adopted as prints... as
printed.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

messages and papers from the mayor?

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: [clears

throat} excuse me. M467 through M474 preliminary
expense contract and capital budgets and supporting
schedules.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I'm sorry. Yes,

finance?

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: M475 city

debt and reserves.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Finance... I'm

sorry, received prints... order printed and filed.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: M46... 76

submitting Jeffrey Freedlander for appointment to
the conflict of interest board.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Rules,

privileges and elections communications from city,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

county, and borough office may we have quite in the chambers please. Everyone please settle down.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and communications?

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land use call ups?

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: M477

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Roll call

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Barron? Borelli? Cabrera? Chin?

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Cohen?

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: With permission I would like to vote aye on all land use call ups and all items on the general orders calendar?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Constantinides?

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Cornegy?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: [off mic] Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Crowley?

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [off mic] Aye

on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Cumbo?

Deutsch? Dromm?

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: With permission

I'd like to vote on all land use and general order
call ups?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Espinal?

COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: [off mic] I

vote aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Eugene?

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Ferreras-

Copeland?

COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: With

permission I'd like to vote on all call ups and
general orders?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND:
Thank you.
PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Garodnick?
COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Gentile?
COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Gibson?
COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: [off mic] Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Greenfield?
Grodenchik?
COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: [off mic]
Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Johnson?
COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.
PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Kallos?
COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: King?
COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [off mic] Aye.
PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Koo?
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Koo?
COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye on all.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Koslowitz?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Lancman?

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCOUNCIL MEMBERAN: I would like to vote aye on all call ups and with permission I'd like to vote aye on all coupled general orders?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes. You vote...

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Lander?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes? Thank you...

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCOUNCIL MEMBERAN: Yes, I asked for permission to vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCOUNCIL MEMBERAN: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Lander?

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Levin?

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I'd like to vote aye on all call ups and with permission I'd like to vote on all coupled, coupled general orders?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Levine?

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: I would also like to vote aye on all call ups and general order items?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, I vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Maisel?

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: [off mic] Yes.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Mealy?
Barron?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Menchaca?

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Mendez?

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Miller?

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Palma?

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: With permission I'd like to vote aye on all land use call ups and... today and all items on today's general order calendar?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: I vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Reynoso?

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I vote aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Richards?

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Rodriguez?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Rodriguez?

Rodriguez?

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye and I would like permission to vote on all general order?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Rosenthal?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Rosenthal?

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Salamanca?

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I would like to vote aye on all coupled... call ups and with permission I would like to vote on all coupled general orders?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I vote aye,
3 thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres? Treyger?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I vote aye and
7 with permission I'd like to vote aye on all coupled
8 general orders items... general calendar items?

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Vacca?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I would like
14 permission to vote aye on all call ups and with
15 permission I'd like to vote on all coupled general
16 orders?

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I vote aye.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Vallone?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Williams?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [off mic]

25 Aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Van Bramer?

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Speaker

Mark-Viverito?

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] Aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

today's land use call ups were adopted by a vote of 40 in the affirmative, zero negative... quite in the chambers please... all quiet. As we now hear from the speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Madame Public Advocate. If I could ask my colleagues to rise please.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All rise.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Before we begin I want to acknowledge the deaths of the six people who were fatally shot in a Quebec City mosque last Sunday. They were fathers, professors, and proud members of their society simply murdered because of their religion and nationalities. In the last two weeks, we witnessed how the Trump administration is trying to instill fear and division in our country and clearly, it's not staying within these boundaries. From attacking our sanctuary cities to

1
2 preventing our Muslim brothers and sisters from
3 entering our nation their agenda is set to rip our
4 country apart, to counter our core values but I
5 find hope when I see the brave faces of the
6 resistance. I actually just got back from
7 celebrating World Hijab day where I stood in
8 solidarity with my Muslim sisters and reaffirmed
9 our commitment to stand together against hate as
10 many of you did in this room. So yes, it makes me
11 proud to see how our city is defying the Trump
12 administration out there on the streets at JFK
13 Airport or in these very chambers. It also makes me
14 proud to announce that today marks the beginning of
15 black history month yet another reminder of the
16 importance of resistance in the face of injustice
17 because of every step New Yorkers take as they
18 rally against hate, with every chant we make as we
19 call for justice and with every piece of
20 legislation this council defends we're honoring Dr.
21 Kings legacy and the legacy of all those who have
22 advocated for a unified world. So, with that I
23 would like to... us to just remember those lives that
24 have been lost. Thank you. Before we begin with the
25 agenda also I do want to, to all of my colleagues

1
2 and... in here and beyond I hope that last week
3 everyone had a great Lunar New Year. And so, diving
4 right into our docket the council's going to be
5 voting on several items today. The first piece of
6 legislation being voted on authorizes a cure period
7 for certain item pricing violations in
8 supermarkets, groceries, and bodegas. Introduction
9 436A would allow store owners to cure first time
10 item pricing violations rather than paying civil
11 penalties. Staff I want to thank Balkeese Mierreg
12 [phonetic], Esau Martinez, Aliya Ali and Rachel
13 Cordero. This measure was sponsored by Council
14 Member Raphael Espinal who serves as Chair of the
15 Committee on Consumer Affairs so invite him to say
16 a few words.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Thank you
18 Madame Speaker. My bill what it does is it requires
19 for DCA to cure violations from supermarkets on
20 item pricing violations. In the past... back in the
21 90's there was actually a bill that was passed in
22 the city council that required supermarkets to
23 price every single item and if the DCA found that
24 one or... you know a couple items were missing the
25 item pricing that they would get fine. So, this

1
2 would give them the opportunity to actually fix
3 that violation without getting the fine and It
4 would educate not only the employees in the stores
5 but also the business itself and, and in the future
6 they won't have to fall victims to those, those
7 fines. Thank you.

8 SPEAKER MARK VIVERITO: Thank you. The
9 next item the council will be voting on concerns
10 reporting requirements for fire related fatalities.
11 Earlier this month we announced the completion of
12 the GetAlarmedNYC Initiative which sought over
13 100,000 combination smoke and carbon monoxide
14 alarms distributed to residents across the five
15 boroughs. The city council is happy to have
16 contributed over one million dollars toward that
17 initiative an investment that has already paid off
18 as the New York City Fire Department recently
19 declared 2016 as featuring the lowest number of
20 fire related deaths in 100 years. Introduction
21 1294A takes our commitment to preventing future
22 fire related fatalities even further by requiring
23 the FDNY to publish an annual report regarding the
24 use of smoke detectors in civilian fire related
25 deaths including noting the technology used by

1
2 these detectors. This information would also be
3 disaggregated by the cause of death to examine
4 possible correlations between the use of certain
5 types of smoke detectors and certain types of fire
6 related death. I want to thank on the staff side
7 here Brian Crowe, Will Hungach and Jin Lee, Council
8 Member Liz Crowley Chair of the Committee on Fire
9 and Criminal Justice Services was prime sponsor of
10 the bill and I would invite her to say a few words
11 on this essential piece of legislation.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you to
13 our Speaker, Melissa Mark-Viverito for your
14 commitment to fire safety and for prioritizing the
15 Get Alarm Program which has put superior fire
16 alarms in thousands of New Yorker's homes. Fire
17 fatalities are at an all-time low but one fire
18 fatality is still one too many. Last year the city
19 had 48, we have a responsibility to do all we can
20 to save as many lives as possible and since the
21 majority of fire related deaths are caused by smoke
22 inhalation having the right type of smoke alarm can
23 make the difference when saving lives. The bill
24 would require the fire department to collect
25 information about the smoke alarms found in fatal

1
2 fires as well as information from the Chief Medical
3 Examiner's office about the cause of death. This
4 data will then be disclosed to the public and
5 policy makers so we can see how certain deaths
6 correlate with the use of certain types of smoke
7 alarms. The type of smoke alarm matters and this
8 bill when passed will confirm that and again I
9 thank our Speaker for her leadership on this bill.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Liz.

11 The next item the council will be voting on
12 involves that the senior citizen rent increases
13 exemption and disability rent increase exemption
14 programs. Intro 1309 extends the revised income
15 eligibility requirements for this great entry
16 programs through 2020 providing assistance for
17 individuals who earn between 29,000 and 50,000 a
18 year. Intro 1024A would supplement the efforts made
19 by the Department of Finance and require other city
20 agencies to disseminate information about SCRIE. I
21 want to thank on the staff side here Alex
22 Paulenoff, Emily Rooney, Dohini Sompura, Jonathon
23 Seltzer, Isha Schaumberg [phonetic]. These bills
24 were sponsored by Council Member's Margaret Chin,
25 Andrew Cohen and Fernando Cabrera. I invite them to

1
2 give remarks on this package, we can start out with
3 Margaret followed by Cohen and followed by Cabrera.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you Madame
5 Speaker and I also wanted to wish all my colleagues
6 a happy Lunar New Year, year of the rooster and
7 come and join the parade on Sunday in Chinatown.
8 Good afternoon, we will vote on Intro 1309 today,
9 legislation that will extend the New York City rent
10 freeze program to allow seniors to stay in the
11 neighborhoods they helped build. At the
12 affordability crisis steepens throughout New York
13 City we will need every tool available to keep the
14 most vulnerable New Yorkers in their homes. The New
15 York City rent freeze program allows seniors and
16 people with disabilities living in rent regulated
17 stabilized housing who make less than 50,000
18 dollars a year and pay over one third of their
19 income for rent in order to freeze their rent.
20 Intro 1309 will extend these benefits into year
21 2020 allowing seniors and people with disability to
22 keep their rent frozen, afford their homes and make
23 it through the affordability crisis. I want to
24 thank Council Member Cohen for his partnership on
25 this legislation, I also want to thank the mayor,

1
2 our speaker and finance chair Julissa Ferreras-
3 Copeland for their support throughout the process
4 and I also want to thank the staff who work on this
5 legislation; Ramone Martinez, Alex Paulenoff, Emily
6 Rooney and Dohini Sompura and I also want to urge
7 all my colleagues to vote for Intro 1309, thank
8 you.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Any of the
10 other sponsors? Okay. Next the council will be
11 voting to grant land mark designations to 12
12 buildings in the greater East Midtown District. The
13 buildings being celebrated include the historic
14 Graybar Building which houses several tracks
15 original to Grand Central Terminal, the Beverly
16 Hotel a favorite subject of many great American
17 artists of the 1920's and the former Citicorp
18 Center which will become the youngest building in
19 New York City to receive landmark status. Council
20 Member Dan Garodnick whose district encompasses the
21 bounds of greater East Midtown has worked
22 tirelessly on this initiative so I invite him to
23 speak on this cultural recognition for the
24 neighborhood. Council Member Garodnick?

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you
3 very much and I wanted to take a moment to speak on
4 today's vote of 12 landmarks in East Midtown which
5 of course is in my district. I'm delighted to see
6 that these important pieces of New York history are
7 finally getting their due. I also wanted to briefly
8 say a few words about the process that brought them
9 before the city council. As many of you may recall
10 when the Bloomberg administration sought to rezone
11 East Midtown in 2013 one of the objections that we
12 had was that the rezoning sought to build our
13 future without sufficient regard for our past. That
14 plan would of encouraged development of new
15 buildings without properly protecting the historic
16 buildings in the area. Subsequently we formed the
17 East Midtown Steering Committee which I had the
18 privilege of co-chairing along with Manhattan
19 borough President Gale Brewer. The Steering
20 Committee comprised all the local stakeholders,
21 representatives from community boards, real estate
22 interest, land marks advocates, urban planning
23 advocates and we work closely with the relevant
24 city agencies. As part of the steering committees
25 work we encouraged the land marks preservation

1
2 commission to first review the area for buildings
3 that deserve preserving and to designate them
4 before any new rezoning plan was put on the table
5 and they did to their great credit. Landmarks
6 commission put in a tremendous amount of work and
7 now these 12 beautiful historically important
8 buildings will join the ranks of the historic
9 resources of which our city is rightly so proud.
10 I'm not going to... get it already in the committee
11 so I'm not going to go through the details of some
12 of the highlights of that group but it, it suffices
13 to say that these landmarks will keep us connected
14 to East Midtown's rich history. The process here
15 where we honor our past even as we plan our future
16 is how we should do planning in our city. Today's
17 vote represents a record number of individual
18 designations on a signal day for the city council
19 and I'm very proud of that and I'm also proud to
20 have been part of the thoughtful planning process
21 that brought them here and I hope that it serves as
22 a model for future landmarking and rezoning efforts
23 and again Madame Speaker thank you for the
24 opportunity and I encourage my colleagues to vote
25 yes.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Dan.

The final package of legislation on the... that the council will be voting on today involves extending protections to residents of three quarter housing throughout New York City. Three quarters houses are one and two family homes, larger apartment buildings, and other structures that are run by operators who rent beds to single adults. Intro 1166A sponsored by Council Member Donovan Richards would require the mayor's office of operations to publish a quarterly report on its website detailing the findings of the Mayor's three quarter housing task force. Can we please keep it quiet, thank you.

Introduction 1164A sponsored by Council Member Corey Johnson would require the human resources administration to provide rental subsidy recipients with a written statement explaining eviction protections and procedures. Intro 1167A sponsored by Council Member Ritchie Torres would remove the time limitation for applying to the Department of Housing Preservation and Development for relocation assistance following the issuance of a vacate order. It would also make clear that any tenant who moves out while a vacate order is in effect is

1
2 entitled to appropriate relocation assistance.
3 Intro 1171A sponsored by Council Member Jumaane
4 Williams would allow tenants to verify their
5 occupancy at a building which received a vacate
6 order by at minimum submitting a lease or two forms
7 of certain alternative documentation. And finally
8 Intro 1168A sponsored by Council Member Ritchie
9 Torres will prohibit landlords from mandating
10 medical treatment as a condition of occupancy. This
11 bill would also provide a cause of action to
12 tenants who face such a mandate allowing them to
13 receive damages and reasonable attorney's fees and
14 court costs. On staff, I want to thank Andrea
15 Vazquez, Megan Zhang, Jhero Vatino [phonetic], Jose
16 Conde, Tonya Cyrus, Namira Newsot [phonetic], and
17 Sarah Gastelum. I would invite all the Council
18 Members that are sponsoring legislation to speak.
19 Let's start off with Council Member Richards
20 followed by Council Member Torres, Council, Council
21 Member Johnson, and then Council Member Williams.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you
23 Madame Speaker and I'm proud to be a part of this
24 package on three quarter housing with my
25 colleagues. My bill Intro 1166 will require the

1
2 city's three quarters housing task force to submit
3 quarterly reports on the number of violations
4 issued, the number of beds at each building
5 inspected, the number of rent payments stopped and
6 the number of people relocated from a three
7 quarters residence. Packing vulnerable New Yorkers
8 in small rooms is an abomination and the existence
9 of these houses says that we need to do a lot more
10 in the city and the state to ensure that they have
11 a safe and secure place to lay their head at night.
12 The living conditions many of these individuals
13 deal with are not the productive environments that
14 they need to help them transition into a stable...
15 These landlords need to be held accountable and we
16 need to step up as a city to ensure that government
17 benefits are not exploited for personal profit.
18 Three quarter house industry is a wet... widespread
19 problem that will not be solved simply by these
20 bills but it is necessary to track the extent of
21 the problem and the city's response in order to
22 evaluate existing efforts and formulate new ones.
23 I'd like to thank Andrea Vazquez in our legislative
24 division, my legislative director Jordan Gibbons
25 MFY legal services of three quarter house, houses

1
2 tenant organizing project, Kim Barker from the
3 Times and all of the advocates who helped us keep
4 the focus on these individuals who are forced to
5 endure these despicable living conditions. I would
6 also like to acknowledge... I've been joined today...
7 we've been joined by my intern Nina Duran today,
8 it's her first time at a stated meeting so thank
9 you for being here. Thank you.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Who's next, who
11 did I say? Go ahead Richards... I'm sorry, Torres, go
12 ahead, Ritchie.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Thank you
14 Madame Speaker, I want to thank the Speaker, the
15 housing chair Jumaane Williams, my colleagues,
16 Council Member Johnson, Council Member Richards and
17 I'm proud to be part of a package that cracks down
18 on these predatory operators of three quarter
19 housing whom I consider the scum of the earth. I
20 have two bill that are about to pass one would
21 remove HPD's arbitrary time limit on relocation
22 services for vulnerable tenants which includes
23 tenants of three quarters housing and the second
24 would prevent and prohibit discrimination and
25 harassment based on medical status. So, if you are

1
2 a tenant who has been coerced by your landlord into
3 medical treatment and substance abuse you will now
4 have under local law a private right of action
5 against an operator of three quarter housing which
6 I consider a game changer so I'm proud to be part
7 of this historic package.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] Thank
9 you, alright.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you
11 Madame Speaker. Too often we see landlords of three
12 quarter houses manipulate their tenants into
13 accepting substandard conditions, rob them of
14 crucial money reserved for health care and then
15 harass and intimidate them into vacating their
16 homes. With this package of bills before us today
17 we are saying enough is enough, it is time for our
18 city to stand up for these tenants and have their
19 back. As part of this package to restore justice to
20 three quarter house tenants I've introduced
21 Introduction 1164A which ensures that all tenants
22 who receive rental subsidies from HRA are, are
23 given clear information regarding their rights
24 about illegal eviction. Unfortunately, we find that
25 many tenants are not aware that they are legally

1
2 entitled to a proper court proceeding when they
3 face eviction. Having this information readily
4 available makes a world of difference for the
5 housing prospects of these tenants. Simply put too
6 many New Yorkers have vacated their homes
7 prematurely because they were scared, they were
8 intimidated and they didn't know their rights. As a
9 tenant having your day in court is a basic right
10 and it's not always common knowledge that's what
11 this bill is going to remedy. It's been an honor to
12 join with Council Member's Jumaane Williams,
13 Donovan Richards, Ritchie Torres, and all the
14 members of the three quarter house coalition on the
15 separate I thank them for their outstanding work
16 and lastly, these days with the press coming in...
17 coming under a lot of attack a lot of this wouldn't
18 have come to light if it wasn't for Kim Barker's
19 investigatory pieces in the Times which shed light
20 on this in which I think prompted legislative
21 action so I'm grateful for her work and for
22 bringing this forward so that we could take
23 official action. Thank you very much.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. I
25 want to thank the Speaker for her leadership in

1
2 this issue and as I mentioned downstairs although
3 this won't... may not be the most exciting things
4 people remember from today I do think there's a
5 great package of legislation and has showed the
6 best our institutions of what can happen when they
7 work together as my colleague just mentioned the
8 New York Times and Kim Barker really did a lot to
9 expose what was happening; the tenant organizing
10 project and the advocates played their part in
11 pushing us and giving us ideas and making the
12 tenants who were involved have a voice and the city
13 council played their part in making sure that we
14 provided legislation to help protect them. These
15 bills reflect a lot of thinking through this
16 because it was more difficult than it sounded, we
17 had to pass legislation that gave them tools to
18 protect themselves but we want to make sure we
19 didn't unduly take away the housing that they so
20 desperately needed. My bill 1171A provides for
21 additional documentation to provide proof of
22 occupancy and as many people may know after 30 days
23 your tenant should not be evicted without going
24 through court, this was often illegally done and
25 very often tenants had trouble providing that they

1
2 actually.. providing.. showing that they actually
3 lived there. This piece of legislation will give
4 more tools for that I think combined with the other
5 pieces of legislation we found the perfect balance
6 to protect people who needed the most of protection
7 but were the most vulnerable. So again, I do want
8 to thank the Speaker, thank Council Member Levin,
9 Torres, Johnson, and Richards, Megan Zhang, Jhero
10 Vatino, Jose Conde, Sarah Gastelum, Laura Popa,
11 Matt DeWald, Jeff Baker, Ed Atkin, Jen Wilcox, and
12 Nick, Nick Smith and again the Times and the
13 advocates who attended and organized the project.
14 Thank you.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you
16 Jumaane and I want to thank the Public Advocate for
17 bringing to my attention that definitely before I
18 close out my speaker time that we also do recognize
19 that we have unfortunately lost one of our first
20 responders to, to cancer as a result of, of
21 responding to 9/11. Deputy Chief James Molloy died
22 Monday night at Good Samaritan Hospital in West
23 Islip Long Island. Roy Richter, head of the
24 captains endowment association indicated that he is
25 a courageous guy as you can find, he had led the

1
2 search efforts tirelessly at ground zero and with
3 that we definitely want to keep him in our thoughts
4 and thank him and his family for his sacrifice and
5 with that I end communication from the speaker.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

7 Discussion of general orders, seeing none. Reported
8 special committees?

9 COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: None.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of
11 standing committees?

12 COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Report of
13 the committee on aging Intro 1024A SCRIE
14 information?

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
16 coupled on general orders.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Intro 1309
18 rent freeze program?

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
20 general orders.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Report of
22 the committee on consumer affairs Intro 436A cure
23 period for pricing violations?

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
25 coupled on general orders.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Report of
the committee on finance preconsidered Reso 1356
expense budget funding?

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled,
coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY:
Preconsidered Reso 1357 new door business
improvement district?

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: LU543 and
Reso 1359 Penn South?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Coupled on
general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Report of
the committee on fire and criminal justice services
Intro 1294A fire department report?

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Report of
the committee on general welfare Intro 1164A
unlawful evictions?

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
coupled on general orders.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Intro 1166A
three quarter housing?

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Report of
the committee oh housing and buildings Intro 1167A
vacate orders?

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Intro 1168A
occupancy based on medical treatment?

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Intro 1171A
verification of occupancy for relocation services?

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Report of
the committee on land use LU546 and Reso 1360
property tax exemption?

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY:
Preconsidered LU547 and Reso 1361 through

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

57

preconsidered LU558 and 13... Reso 1372 on page seven
landmark designations?

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: On the
general order calendar resolution appointing
various person's commissioner of deeds?

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
general orders and at this time I ask for a role
call on all items on the couple general order
calendar.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quite in the
chambers please.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Barron?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Borelli?

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: I'd like to
vote aye on all and I on all land use call ups?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Chin?

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY:

Constantinides?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye on
all.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Cornegy?

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Permission to
explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I'm especially
excited about today's street co-naming that's being
presented. Jackie Berrien was the former Chairwoman
of the Equal Opportunity Commission and a civil
rights lawyer who served with the ACLU and NAACP's
legal defense and educational fund. Jackie was so
much more than her resume, she was a wife to her
husband Peter Williams and a friend of mine and so
many others fortunate enough to know her. Today's
co-naming honors someone that has dedicated their
entire...

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: ...Sorry...

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: ...lives...

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: ...colleague,
Council Member it... the, the co-naming's are not
today, it's actually in the next stated.

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Yes, okay,
sorry.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: No, no that's okay I think we... there might have been miscommunication that we were doing it today but it'll be at the next stated meeting that we're doing street co naming.

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Okay, thanks.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: You're welcome. But... I'm sorry, thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: How do you vote even though Jackie Berrien is fabulous and... and she's in our thoughts and prayers, Council Member your vote? General orders, your vote Council Member?

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye I guess.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Crowley?

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I vote aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Cumbo?

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I vote aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Deutsch?

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Espinal?

COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I vote aye on all.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Eugene?
COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Garodnick?
COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: [off mic]

Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Gentile?
COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: I vote aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Gibson?
COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: [off mic] Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Greenfield?
COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye.
COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Grodenchik?
COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: [off mic]

Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Johnson?
COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Permission to

explain my vote:

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you

Madame Public Advocate. I'd like to take my time to
briefly thank the finance committee for this
morning passing LU-543 through committee. This is a
land use application of my district that extends
property tax exemptions at Penn South, a 2820-unit

1
2 cooperative that has been the beacon of affordable
3 home ownership in Chelsea for over 50 years, 5,000
4 of my constituents live in these buildings.
5 Shareholders at Penn South are consistently voted
6 to extend this exemption over the years because to
7 them Penn South is their home, it is the place
8 where they have raised their family and it is the
9 place where they wish to retire with dignity. In
10 return these residents have truly been the backbone
11 of the Chelsea community for generations. As this
12 council seeks any and all ways to maintain
13 affordability and keep New Yorkers in their homes
14 we have a great opportunity to do that with this
15 application. For thousands of Penn South residents
16 many of whom are retirees the first naturally
17 occurring retirement community in the United States
18 of America. Extending this exemption gives them the
19 opportunity to stay in their homes and continue to
20 be members of the community that they helped build.
21 For these reasons, I encourage us to pass land use
22 item 543 today. Many people have participated in
23 this effort to maintain affordability at Penn South
24 and I want to acknowledge the Penn South board of
25 directors led by Morris Benjamin and their

1
2 treasurer Walter Mankoff, it's general manager
3 Brendan Keany, U.S. Senate minority leader Chuck
4 Schumer, and Congressman Jerry Nadler who helped a
5 lot with HUD, state senator Brad Hoylman, Assembly
6 Member Deborah... Assembly Member Richard Gottfried,
7 and Manhattan borough President Gale Brewer. I just
8 want to say that Penn South the residents there
9 four times have had the opportunity to vote to
10 privatize and they probably would of made a lot of
11 money if they did it some of the most expensive
12 property in the city of New York is in Chelsea and
13 four times in a row they voted to keep it a limited
14 equity co-op and keep it affordable, they voted a
15 month ago and it passed with 89 percent, 89 percent
16 of the people that live there voted to maintain
17 affordability. I'm really grateful to my district
18 and I ask my colleagues to vote in favor of this
19 today. On everything else I vote aye.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Kallos?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: King?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye on all.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Koo?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Koslowitz?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Lander?

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request
permission to explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I vote aye on
all. I want to especially say congratulations to
the Council Members who are sponsors of three
quarter housing package which is a really critical
package so thank you to Council Member's Richards
and Johnson and also Williams and Corey those Penn
South folks are really like New York City heroes of
affordable housing and it's great of you to give
them the shout out we all appreciate, there are
plenty of other cases in New York City
unfortunately where folks have made the opposite
decision which you can surely understand and the
city has lost thousands... tens of thousands of units
of affordable housing as a result so... thank you,
aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Maisel?

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: [off mic] Yes.

STATED MEETING

64

1
2 COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Mealy?
3 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye on all.
4 COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Menchaca?
5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye on all.
6 COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Mendez?
7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye on all.
8 COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Miller?
9 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I vote aye.
10 COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Reynoso?
11 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I vote aye on
12 all.
13 COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Richards?
14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I have to
15 vote... I vote aye.
16 COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Rosenthal?
17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [off mic] I
18 vote aye. All general orders and call ups, thank
19 you.
20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: All general
22 orders and call ups.
23 COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Torres?
24 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all.
25 COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Ulrich?

STATED MEETING

65

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I ask for
3 permission to vote on land use items as well?

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you, I
6 vote aye on all and all items on the general order
7 calendar.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Vallone?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: [off mic] Aye
11 on all.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Williams?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [off mic]
14 Aye.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Matteo?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: I'd like to
17 vote aye on all general orders and land use calls?

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Van Bramer?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK MCSWEENEY: Speaker
22 Mark-Viverito?

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO MARK-VIVERITO:
24 [off mic] Aye.
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

Okay. All items on today's general order calendar were adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative, zero negative and zero abstentions. Revised land use call ups were adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative and zero negative. Introduction and reading of bills?

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All bills are referred to committee as indicated on the agenda.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, there are no resolutions this, this afternoon. We will begin with general discussions and we will lead off with Council Member Karen Koslowitz.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Thank you. Today I am introducing a bill that will grade food cards, they will have the same grades as restaurants; A, B, or C or grade painted. I think this is a very good consumer bill that will help people to determine what card they want to go to. I've gotten good feedback from the industry, they even like it, they feel that business would be better and I think they are right so I urge everybody to please support this bill. Thank you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

Council Member Williams?

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.

today is the first day of black history month. One day I hope that that month won't be need to be described that way but since it is my hope is that we will use this month to talk about more than just black inventors and use it to really be inspired by their existence that hopefully it can. Today I brought with me my capinit phonetic jersey as I believe we can use this as help to inspire us. I defy anybody to now discuss what he was doing and how it was wrong and discuss how he was pointing out the hypocrisies that were in many of the words and people who followed him. I want to thank my colleague Council Member Menchaca who joined us on inauguration day for our civil disobedience protest, I was very glad to see my colleagues at JFK last Saturday. I want to thank the Speaker for using the power of her voice and her position and many of the colleagues for speaking up against what's going on today. I feel many times that the KKK or Nazi regime has taken over our government and I don't mean that in a hyperbolic sense. I...

1
2 like Congressman Hakeem Jeffries said, I cannot say
3 that everybody voted for him was a racist, I can
4 feel confident in saying that every racist in this
5 country voted for him and that would include any
6 xenophobe and any misogynist voted for him and that
7 says something. We are now dealing with I believe
8 fascist narcissist. The Reuters editor and chief
9 Steve Adler recently giving instructions to his
10 reporters on how to cover this administration,
11 cited countries like Iraq, Yemen, and China. This
12 is not hyperbole comparing them to fascist and
13 narcissism is not, all of those things started this
14 way. So, my hope is that we will push ourselves out
15 of the comfort zone, I'm not saying we shouldn't be
16 fearful we are human, I'm saying hopefully we can
17 meet that fear with courage even in all that we are
18 doing if we are comfortable in our responses I
19 believe we should push more until we are not. Thank
20 you.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
22 Cumbo?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you Public
24 Advocate Latisha James. I start off by saying today
25 is World Hijab Day. Today was an honor to spend

1
2 with so many of my colleagues and this was the
3 largest turnout for World Hijab today and I was so
4 proud to stand with my brothers and sisters
5 worldwide to express my love and support for all
6 people who practiced their religion and expressed
7 themselves in manners that allow them to fulfill
8 their spiritual destiny. I also want to take this
9 time today to salute Sally Yates for her courage in
10 following her moral competence for peace, justice,
11 and equality. Sally Yates who had served as Deputy
12 Attorney General under President Obama and now
13 acting interim attorney general was accused of
14 betraying the Trump administration by announcing
15 that justice department lawyers would not defend
16 Mr. Trump's executive order against legal
17 challenges. According to reports Miss Yates and
18 other senior government officials questioned how to
19 respond to the executive order and early Monday a
20 termination was handed to Miss Yates to be replaced
21 that evening. I salute her for her courage, for
22 standing up in the face of adversity, and allowing
23 her moral compass to guide her decision. I also
24 want to salute so many of the New Yorkers that
25 appeared at JFK Airport and all throughout the

1
2 county because that expressed the very best of what
3 America is all about and I'm so proud of all my
4 colleagues that came out for the women's march not
5 only here in New York and Washington D.C. but all
6 over the country as far as Antarctica. Women are
7 leading the way, we are demonstrating our power and
8 we are coming together in a force that has never
9 been seen before in this country. So, thank you to
10 all the dynamic nasty women who came out to
11 represent ourselves all across the nation and all
12 of the dynamic men who recognized that their
13 manhood does not lie in the oppression of women.
14 Thank you.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
16 Council Member Greenfield?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you
18 Madame Public Advocate. I would like to talk a
19 little bit about legislation I'm introducing today,
20 Intro 1455 or as I like to lovingly call it I
21 failed my New Year's resolution law. Today I'm
22 introducing legislation that will prevent
23 businesses from automatically renewing
24 subscriptions or membership without first obtaining
25 explicit permission of the customer. I myself had a

1
2 gym membership for three years, I attended once, I
3 tried on multiple occasions to actually... I did,
4 it's a true story, I tried on multiple occasions to
5 actually cancel said gym membership, almost
6 impossible. Went into the gym, you're at the wrong
7 gym, you got to call corporate office, maybe you
8 should come back and what you realize is that in,
9 in, in the end of the day it doesn't make sense why
10 you should be stuck with a contract for life. So,
11 what Intro 1455 does is very simple, once a year
12 the gym or any other company that's doing automatic
13 renewals, people who offer services or things on
14 the internet or gift packages or boxes or things
15 like that will simply have to ask you and say hey
16 Mr. Greenfield do you plan on coming back to the
17 gym and I would of said no. As a post script
18 because Council Member Richards was laughing with
19 me just so that you know I gave up the gym, I
20 bought a pair of running shoes and now I run 15
21 miles a week. Please sign onto Intro 1455 so we can
22 save people money and so that you can get out of
23 your New Year's resolution with some dignity. Thank
24 you very much.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
3 Council Member Lander?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you
5 Madame Public Advocate. I want to echo the
6 statements of Council Member Cumbo and Council
7 Member Williams. First just appreciate what a great
8 showing from this council, there was a JFK on
9 Saturday if you haven't read it I urge reading the
10 New York magazine Tick Tock on what, what really
11 happened there that features our members of
12 congress and Council Member Menchaca, you know
13 these, these are very dangerous times for our
14 country and obviously an enormous amount of harm
15 and pain is being felt but the organizing that the
16 people of New York are doing is quite extraordinary
17 and is nothing like being called to remember what
18 the most fundamental ideals of the country are
19 about and I just want to appreciate my colleagues
20 and all the folks who are doing that organizing,
21 it, it feels everyday like you know just trying to
22 help save both our republic and our sanity and I
23 appreciate everybody doing it from the sublime to
24 the perhaps ridiculous I will remind people that on
25 February 15th barring action in Albany, New York

1
2 will adopt our single use bag fee. There are many
3 wonderful reusable bags available and if you have
4 not already been in touch with the Department of
5 Sanitation whether you support or oppose the fee I
6 urge you to help make sure that all New Yorkers in
7 your district; seniors, low-income folks have the
8 reusable bags they need, there are excellent ones
9 like this that you can get that just fold up so
10 neatly in this little tiny pouch. If you'd like
11 help making sure you have them, your constituents
12 who need them have them, look at that, see and just
13 really not so hard to bring a reusable bag with you
14 when you go shopping. Thank you very much.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
16 Barron?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you
18 Madame Public Advocate. I also want to invite all
19 of the colleagues to join in acknowledging and
20 celebrating black history month so that we can look
21 at the culture of African Americans in its totality
22 and not just looking at individuals. And secondly
23 in terms of the issue of the ban on Muslim
24 immigrants I want to first say that less we forget
25 the indigenous people of this country are the

1
2 Native Americans and I'm so glad that we had them
3 here that we were able to acknowledge the work that
4 they do and the stance that they take. So, the
5 Europeans who came were in fact initially looking
6 to expand their economic interest because they were
7 looking to find a shorter way to get to India which
8 is why they call them Indians the people that they
9 found here. So, noting that fact unless you're
10 Native American or have that heritage we're all
11 immigrants whether by force such as during the
12 enslavement period or by voluntary those who come
13 seeking whatever it is that they want to find here
14 in this country. So, remembering that the Europeans
15 who came here almost annihilated the Native
16 Americans for their economic interest of the
17 Europeans we need to be very mindful that this is a
18 country that has now at this point have a president
19 that in such a hypercritic manner is looking to ban
20 Muslims from coming in. So, we've got to remain
21 vigilant, we've got to organize our belief is that
22 you've got to organize where you live in your
23 local, in your block and be able to make your
24 voices heard so that we maintain the power that we
25 have as individuals and as people and as a

1
2 collective. And finally, I want to say that I'm so
3 pleased to announce that we were able to save Green
4 Valley Garden, it was a garden that had been
5 targeted for sale and we were able to save... the
6 individuals that came together were successful and
7 that garden will stay intact in its entirety and
8 continue to provide fresh fruits and vegetables to
9 the community which had such a high incident of
10 diabetes. Thank you.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
12 Seeing no one else the Speaker Melissa Mark-
13 Viverito for closing remarks.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you
15 Madame Public Advocate. Thank you to all my
16 colleagues. All the comments that have been made in
17 particular those that are reflecting at the moment
18 in time that we find ourselves and the way that
19 people in a very peaceful way are expressing their
20 frustration and pushing back and resisting a
21 reactionary administration that really does not
22 respect the views of the majority in this country.
23 So, thank you for all that are a part of that in
24 raising your voices in unity. I look forward to the

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATED MEETING

work ahead so thank you all, have a great afternoon
and with that we are adjourned.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date February 6, 2017