

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

December 15, 2016
Start: 1:46 p.m.
Recess: 3:45 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: LETITIA JAMES
Pubic Advocate

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO
Speaker for the Council

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Inez D. Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Andrew Cohen
Costa G. Constantinides
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Elizabeth S. Crowley
Laurie A. Cumbo
Chaim M. Deutsch
Inez E. Dickens
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Mathieu Eugene
Julissa Ferreras-Copeland
Daniel R. Garodnick
Vincent J. Gentile
Vanessa L Gibson

David G. Greenfield
Barry S. Grodenchik
Corey D. Johnson
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Peter A. Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory L. Lancman
Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
Darlene Mealy
Carlos Menchaca
Rosie Mendez
I. Daneek Miller
Annabel Palma
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
James Vacca
Paul A. Vallone
James G. Van Bramer
Jumaane D. Williams
Ruben Wills

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Rev. Robert Lewis Foley
Cosmopolitan Church of the Lord Jesus
39 W. 190th St. Bronx N.Y. 10468

1

2

[sound check, pause]

3

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Ladies and gentlemen,

4

your attention, please. We ask you to find a seat.

5

[applause] Could we have quiet in the Chambers,

6

please. Quiet down in the Chambers, Please.

7

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the

8

Chambers, please. [background comments] Could we have

9

quiet.

10

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Could I have your

11

attention, please?

12

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Excuse me. Quiet

13

in the Chambers, please. Quiet down everyone.

14

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Once again, everyone

15

please find a seat. Silence all electronic devices.

16

Thank you. [pause]

17

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Okay, we're going

18

to get started. Matt-Council-Minority Leader Matteo

19

is doing a proc, Moore Catholic High School Maverick

20

Football Team. Come on up, come on up,

21

[cheers/applause] come on up. [background comments]

22

So we're honoring—we're honoring this great team.

23

They have won the Catholic High School Football

24

League A Division Championship. [cheers/applause]

25

1
2 Alright, so I'm going to hand it off to Minority
3 Leader Matteo. [cheers/applause]

4 MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: Thank you, Madam
5 Speaker. I'll wait for everybody to come up.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Oh, I like that
7 trophy. Come on over here. Come on over here. We
8 want to take a look at that.

9 MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: We're bringing
10 it home. [background comments] Come on guys, both
11 sides, both sides. Come on this side, too, guys.
12 Come on this side. [background comments] Come on
13 guys, come in. [background comments] Both sides,
14 guys. There are a lot of-- [background comments]
15 What's that.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright, get
17 going on that.

18 MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: Alright, okay,
19 we'll hold the proc. Thank you, Madam Speaker.
20 Welcome Moore to City Hall. I brought up all my body
21 guards for the Republican Delegation. Guys, as the
22 Speaker said, we want to congratulate Moore on a
23 great Season 8 and to the record for bringing home
24 the championship to Staten Island and the A-Division
25 Crown, beating Council Member King's [background

1
2 comments] Cardinal Spellman of the Bronx in a 32/22
3 victory. It was the schools second CHSFL title, and
4 I just want to just talk about more in general, and
5 just say Moore Catholic is such a great school in our
6 district not only for the success you've had on the
7 sports fields and the football field this year, but
8 just because of how great student athletes you are,
9 and how you make us proud each and every day. So, I
10 want to—on behalf of the Staten Island Delegation we
11 want to congratulate you. I just want to mention a
12 few things on some of the highlights and—and
13 standouts from that title game. We have three
14 seniors on the roster, right? So we have very young
15 team of freshmen running back Justin Lacks at 138
16 yards, 4 TVs in the MVP of the game.
17 [cheers/applause] Nice. We're sorry Miller, the
18 linebacker was named Defensive MVP. Sophomore
19 quarterback Vincinzo Scarola made the big plays when
20 the team needs it converting a critical fourth and
21 two late in the game to seal the win and freshman
22 running defensive back Ian Brown was 13 years old at
23 the start of the season, and was called the toughest
24 kid on the field by Coach Jim Pazzio. So I just want
25 to thank you. Welcome to City Hall. It's well

2 deserved I want to give the coach to- You want to
3 read the proc first?

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Yes, read the
5 proc.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Alright, we're
7 going to read the-the clerk is going to read the proc
8 first, and then we'll have a few words from him, the
9 coach.

10 CLERK: Council City of New York
11 Proclamation.

12 Whereas, the Council of the City of the
13 New York is proud to honor the Moore Catholic High
14 School Mavericks Football team for their outstanding
15 teamwork during the 2016 season; and

16 Whereas, the Mavericks proved their grit
17 and skill when they won the Catholic High School
18 Football League A Division Championship at the
19 Mitchell Field Athletic Complex on November 19, 2016;
20 and

21 Whereas, Moore Catholic High School
22 Mavericks football team has been guided to greater
23 heights this season thanks to the vision and
24 leadership of head coach Nick Giannatasio, and
25 assistant coaches Jim Esposito, Donta-Danta Jackson,

1
2 Nate Ryan, Kareem Mu, Nick Scotto, Joe Scarola,
3 Anthony Curren, Amir Meredith and Kevin Tufaro.
4 Together they helped these young players develop the
5 skills they needed to put their dreams within reach
6 while inspiring them to dream even bigger. As a
7 result, they overcame very challenging opponents to
8 win the 2016 Catholic High School Football League A,
9 Division Championship; and

10 Whereas, Moore Catholic High School
11 Mavericks Football team is comprised of 38 excellent
12 players Ian Brown, Chris Bryant, Justin Bareshi,
13 Anthony Curran, Jr., Mashan Deffi (sp?), Joe
14 Espositom, Cal Felix, Jonathan Ford, David Gonzalez,
15 Zachary Hanson, Dafir (sp?) Harrison, Nicholas Hyman,
16 Cameron Holmers, Mark Horhan, Paige Tyson Senagoli
17 (sp?) Christian Illage (sp?), Davon Jackson, Ted
18 Cushi, Justin Lacks, Nygamar Lawrence, Leon Lowry,
19 Arbon Mara, Zyman Mesakori(sp?), Jonathan Melendez,
20 Nicholas Miller, Tommy Myers, Massari Miller, Arty
21 Padilla, Joe Pellarino, Anthony Perlongo (sp?) Jafar
22 Assani (sp?), Vincenzo Scarola, Brandon Shafferjad
23 (sp?), Craig Serrenti, Lewis Tapia, Michael Tupper,
24 Chris Velazquez, Domick Vinno.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Now, therefore, be it known that the Council of the City of the New York is proud to honor the Moore Catholic High School Mavericks Football team in celebration of their Catholic High School Football League A Division Championship. Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the Entire Council, Steven Matteo, Minority Leader, 50th District Staten Island, Deborah Rose, Council Member 49th District Staten Island, Joseph Borelli, Council Member 51st District Staten Island.

MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: Excellent, great job. [cheers/applause] I also want to personally welcome Gina DeSantis, the principal of Moore, who's doing a great job, and before we hand it off to the coach, just Council Member Borelli on behalf of the Delegation just wants to say a few words.

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: I just wanted to use this opportunity to explain to you guys how great I was at high school football. [laughter] Except-no, no. Unfortunately, I did get to play football at the other-well the other Catholic high schools on the Island, and we never won a championship like this, but we certainly worked very hard for it. So I am-I'm really impressed that you guys were able to do

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

it, and I'm really impressed that you guys were able to do it without the amount of seniors that you had. I-I think that's something that really outside of the-of the high school football community is really not understood of how important that was and-and what that means for next year. Where's Councilman King? Where is he? Because he just-yeah, because he was upset that you guys beat his school, Feldman. [background comments] It's-it's going to be tough next year because [background comments]. [laughs] It's going to be tough next year, but thank you guys. God bless and welcome to City Hall. You earned it.

MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: Thank you. So we're going to introduce the winning coach, a great coach for-from Moore, Coach Giannatasio, and then we're going to bring up one of the student athletes to say a few quick words. So you're up, Coach.

COACH GIANNATASIO: Thank you. It's been-it's been some journey for us starting in-in August with two a day practices and-and really hot weather, and now we're in the City Hall today with a chill outside [laughs] and it's been a great journey. Thank you so much for having us. On behalf of our administration Principal Di Santis, Rose Walsh, and

1
2 Ms. Mikalausk our Athletic Director. I want to say
3 to my coaches and players thank you so much. It's an
4 honor and a privilege, and we're grateful to be here
5 today. Thank you so much. [cheers/applause]

6 MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: Our pleasure.
7 Where's Joe? Alright. Alright, Joe, you're up, bud.
8 [cheers/applause] No pressure. No pressure.
9 [laughter]

10 JOE SCAROLA: I'd like to start off by
11 thanking the New York City Council and City Hall for
12 inviting the 2016 Moore Catholic Champion Team today.
13 Thank you very much. I'd also like to thank Coach
14 Nick Giannatasio, and all the coaching staff for the
15 countless time and effort they put in. Thank you
16 guys for that, but if nobody notices, you can't tell.
17 I'd also like to thank Principal Mrs. Di Santis and
18 all of the faculty members of Moore Catholic High
19 School for supporting and believing in this program,
20 and lastly I'd like to thank my-my football
21 teammates, you know, for the great year
22 [cheers/applause]-for the great year they-for the
23 great year we had together for memories you made. So
24 good luck next year, guys and go Mets.
25 [cheers/applause]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: Thank you, everybody. On behalf of the Speaker thank you Moor Catholic. Great season. We're proud of you on the field, proud of you off the field.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] And we have a gift today.

MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: And a gift. Excellent. Nice.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Yay.

MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: Nice. More Catholic football everyone. [cheers/applause]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright.

MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: Alright. Thank you everyone. [background comments, pause]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright, we only have one more ceremonial. [pause] Can I ask for Council Member Cumbo if you can come up, and any other members. [background comments, pause] Okay, so any other colleagues want to join here? We asked Deb Howard to step up. [cheers/applause] I'm going to pass the mic to the Council Member, but we're recognizing Deb Howard for her outstanding leadership as Executive Director of Impact Brooklyn.

[cheers/applause] There you go.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Ladies and
3 Gentlemen, here's Deb Howard. [laughter] [background
4 comments] [background comments] [cheers/applause]
5 Wow, Deb Howard. Wow. I'm getting emotional myself.
6 [background comments] [cheers/applause] I can't, I
7 can't, no I can't. Ladies and gentlemen, I am so
8 proud to have all of you here today as we celebrate
9 the important critical and amazing work that Deb
10 Howard has done for the city of New York
11 [cheers/applause] for Brooklyn, New York
12 [cheers/applause] and for Fort Greene, Clinton Hill,
13 parts of Crown Heights and parts of Bedford-
14 Stuyvesant--[cheers/applause]--and Bed-Stuy. As you
15 can see, with all of the support that Deb has her
16 today, it's certainly a testimony to the work that
17 she has. It's not often that people can take their
18 talent and combine it with a passion for the
19 betterment of all people. And in the midst of
20 Brooklyn, New York's housing crisis because we have a
21 crises, Deb Howard has been at the forefront fighting
22 on an everyday basis to make sure that people stay in
23 their homes [cheers/applause] that they are not
24 evicted [cheers/applause] that affordable housing
25 remains at the forefront [background comments] of our

1
2 city's agenda. Deb Howard, you are amazing. You are
3 an inspiration. You give of yourself so much and
4 tirelessly and you inspire generations to utilize
5 their voice and their passion to be so much greater
6 for those that don't have a voice. I have watched
7 you in times of challenge, as well as triumphs and
8 through your health issues, through the darkest
9 hours, you continued to remain on the frontlines.
10 I've seen you sing at Lafayette Avenue Presbyterian
11 Church. [cheers/applause] I know that you've starred
12 on Broadway in Hair. Maybe people don't know that.
13 [background comments] [laughter] However, you were
14 the star. As my mom would say, even if I was an
15 extra [laughs] there we go, and we also have a
16 tremendous love on our down time for jewelry. So
17 this-

18 DEB HOWARD: [off mic]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Oh, did you? You
20 got that for me. I'm going to say thank you.
21 [laughs] But Deb is an example of Brooklyn's finest.
22 She represents the very best of what Brooklyn is all
23 about. We thank you for your 26 years of service
24 with impact. We thank you for all the gifts that you
25 have given, and you are truly an example of making

1
2 the world a better place. We thank you for your
3 service. We thank you for your leadership. You will
4 be missed, but you're not going anywhere.
5 [cheers/applause] Thank you.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Read the
7 proclamation.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Oh.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Just ask the
10 clerk to read the proclamation.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: We'd now like to
12 ask the Clerk to read the Proclamation.

13 CLERK: Council City of New York
14 Proclamation.

15 The Council of the City of New York is
16 proud to honor Deb Howard for her outstanding
17 leadership as Executive Director of Impact Brooklyn,
18 and her enduring contributions to the community; and

19 Whereas, Ms. Howard launched her career
20 in 1972 as Vista volunteer for a non-profit CBO in
21 Chicago after graduating as an urban studies major
22 from Knotts College. In 1990, she joined Impact
23 Brooklyn, former Pratt Area Community Council where
24 she worked with tenants, landlords and small
25 homeowners, and later became a certified homeowner

1
2 counselor specializing in foreclosure prevention, and
3 went on to oversee Impact Brooklyn's Management
4 Portfolio and Housing Development; and

5 Whereas, since 2004, Ms. Howard has
6 guided Impact Brooklyn as its visionary Executive
7 Director. Over the course of her 12-year tenure, she
8 has overseen the development and management of 1,000
9 units of affordable housing and the formation of the
10 Fulton Street Business Improvement District. With a
11 budget of \$4.7 million, Impact Brooklyn's 47 staff
12 members provide home buyer, homeowner and financial
13 education and counseling; social services for those
14 in need; and

15 Whereas, Impact Brooklyn also offers an
16 array of activities such as tenant and community
17 organizing, tenant counseling, business retention and
18 attraction activities as well as affordable housing
19 development and asset management. She recently
20 spearheaded the refinancing endeavor for 56 buildings
21 in Bedford-Stuyvesant. [cheers/applause] To ensure
22 that much needed repairs to be made and the low-
23 income residents of 492 apartments could retain 30
24 more years of affordability. As an advocacy
25 organization, Impact Brooklyn has worked to pass

1
2 responsible banking laws and foreclosure protections,
3 Housing Court reform, the renewal of rent
4 stabilization laws and Local Law 1 to end-end lead
5 poisoning; and

6 Whereas, Ms. Howard has proven herself as
7 a great leader committed to lifting up the people and
8 the communities of Brooklyn. Beyond Impact Brooklyn,
9 she served on the boards of the Fulton Street-Fulton
10 Area Business Alliance, and Brooklyn Legal Services.

11 [background comments, laughter] The Community
12 Reinvestment Act and Industrial Business Attention
13 Committees at AMHD, and also helped formed the All-
14 in-One Collaboration that began at the Coalition for
15 the Improvement of Bedford-Stuyvesant.

16 Now, therefore, be it know that the
17 Council of the City of New York gratefully honors Deb
18 Howard for her outstanding career and enduring
19 contributions to the city and the community. Melissa
20 Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the Entire Council, Laurie
21 Cumbo, Council Member 35th District, Brooklyn, and
22 the Entire Brooklyn Delegation. [cheers/applause]

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We'll, let--
24 [cheers/applause] We're going to--obviously, we're
25 going to hear from them, but I have to say this is

1
2 probably one of the more raucous [cheers/applause]
3 ceremonials that we've done, of course and
4 [background comments, laughter] and--and Deb, I-I
5 don't know you in the way that these council members
6 have, but I see the love and the appreciation of all
7 those that are present from members themselves. I
8 see how emotional you get. It's just a testament of
9 really the--the deep level of commitment that you've
10 given to the community and to the city, and so thank
11 you for that, and--and with that I thin you're going
12 say a few words.

13 DEB HOWARD: Oh. [cheers/applause]
14 Alright. Alright, okay. [laughs] You guys. Oh,
15 wow, I'm--I'm--I'm floored, and humbled. I'm very--and
16 surprised, [laughter] very grateful the people who
17 have attended here, my staff, my board and all the
18 many people that I've worked with at NHD, CNA, CNYC
19 and other organizations that have come here, and
20 funders and supporters. Yeah, it's been 26 of--
21 starting in--with a three-person staff back in 1990
22 [laughter] to now what is a 47 staff, and we've been
23 through a lot in terms of growth moving into Crown
24 Heights and our name change, and now new offices. I--
25 I--we couldn't have done it without the support of--of

1
2 the Council and also our board and getting things
3 (sic). So that we're really on a-a good footing now
4 to serve all of Brooklyn. I think personally it's
5 been a-a journey. I did a lot of hands-on work with
6 tenants and homeowners for many years, and that was
7 the grati-that was truly gratifying for me. Being an
8 Executive Director has meant a lot of growth in terms
9 of my learning management, and learning, you know,
10 all the-all that goes with being an ED. And I think,
11 though, that I've-I've relied on and I have a great
12 staff that has carried out that hands-on work, and
13 the vision, and really helped to create the vision
14 that we are today, and I really appreciate everyone
15 here. [laughs] So that's what I'll-I guess I'll
16 have to say, although I am available for being a body
17 in a demonstration. [cheers/applause] I have a
18 feeling we're going to have a lot of demonstration
19 here. [laughter] [background comments] Alright,
20 that ends ceremonials. [background comments, pause]

21 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Can we please clear
22 the floor of the Chambers, please. Please clear the
23 floor of the Chambers. Thank you. [background
24 comments] Quiet on the floor, please. Quiet on the
25 floor, please. [applause]

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet on the
3 floor. Quiet in the chambers.

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: At this time please
5 place all electronic devices, all electronic devices
6 to vibrate. Will all non-Council employees, non-
7 Council employees please leave the main floor of the
8 chambers. There is additional seating upstairs in
9 the balcony. Thank you. Madam Public Advocate, all
10 yours. [gavel] Can we have quiet, please?

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All members
12 please have their seats. Visitors, if you are
13 exiting, please exit the Chambers. Otherwise, please
14 find a seat. We thank all of you for coming.
15 Sergeant-at-Arms, if we can close those back doors.
16 Thank you all. All rise for the Pledge of
17 Allegiance. All rise.

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] All
19 rise.

20 [Pledge of Allegiance]

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.
22 Roll call.

23 CLERK: Barron.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [off mic]
25 Present.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CLERK: Borelli.
COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: [off mic] Here.
CLERK: Cabrera.
COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.
CLERK: Chin.
COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.
CLERK: Cohen.
COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.
CLERK: Constantinides.
COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.
CLERK: Cornegy.
PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
[shushing for quiet]
CLERK: Crowley.
COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Here.
CLERK: Cumbo.
COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye. I mean
present. I'm sorry.
PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs]
CLERK: Thank you. Deutsch.
COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye, present,
here.
CLERK: Dickens.
COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Here.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CLERK: Dromm.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

CLERK: Espinal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.

CLERK: Eugene.

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Present.

CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: [off
mic] Here.

CLERK: Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: off mic] Here.

CLERK: Gentile.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.

CLERK: Gibson.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Here.

CLERK: Greenfield.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Here.

CLERK: Grodenchik.

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: [off mic]
Here.

CLERK: Johnson.

COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Here.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
[shushing for quiet]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CLERK: Kallos.
COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.
CLERK: King.
COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.
CLERK: Koo.
COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.
CLERK: Koslowitz.
COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Present.
CLERK: Borelli.
COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Here.
CLERK: Koslowitz.
COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.
CLERK: Lancman.
COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.
CLERK: Lander.
COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Present.
CLERK: Levin.
PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
[shushing for quiet]
COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.
CLERK: Levine.
COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.
CLERK: Maisel. Mealy. Menchaca.
COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CLERK: Mendez.
COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.
CLERK: Miller.
COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Here.
CLERK: Palma.
COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: [off mic] Here.
CLERK: Reynoso.
COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Here.
CLERK: Richards.
COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.
CLERK: Rodriguez. Rose.
COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.
CLERK: Rosenthal.
COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.
CLERK: Salamanca.
COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: [off mic] Here.
CLERK: Torres.
COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Here.
PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [shushing for
quiet]
SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down, please.
Quiet, please. Quiet, please.
CLERK: Torres. Rodriguez.
CLERK: Treyger.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

CLERK: Ulrich. Vacca.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.

CLERK: Vallone.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

CLERK: Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.

CLERK: Wills. Matteo. Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] Here.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
Chambers.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down, please.
Keep it down.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All right for the
Invocation.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: The Invocation
will be delivered by Reverend Robert Lewis Foley, the
Pastor of Cosmopolitan and Church of the Lord Jesus
Christ in the great borough of the Bronx.

REVEREND ROBERT LEWIS FOLEY: Let us
united in heart, mind and spirit as this Invocation

1
2 is offered. Eternal God, our creator and sustainer,
3 we acknowledge you with sincere gratitude and respect
4 for the privilege granted to us to be included in
5 your will and to live in your world. We think you
6 also for our realizations of the value and the
7 necessity of the beneficent purposes and noble
8 service that can flow from our affirmations and our
9 actions into the lives of others with a view toward
10 their enduring wellbeing. The opportunity for the
11 members of our City Council to serve here in New York
12 City is a wonderful gift. It can empower and enable
13 each Council Member and this Council as a whole to
14 impact the large community in ways that can uplift,
15 and safeguard many persons both now and far into the
16 future that you shall provide. Eternal God, it is
17 our hope, our trust and our plea that each Council
18 Member will be upheld and strengthened by you in
19 their good works and their good endeavors. May they
20 and the people of our city be enormously blessed as a
21 result of their beneficent and honorable service. In
22 your name and for the sake of all concerned we pray.
23 Amen.
24
25

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [off mic] Motion
3 to-[on mic] Motion to spread the Invocation,
4 Reverend Council Member Cabrera.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Motion to spread
6 the Invocation in full upon the record.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
8 [shushing for quiet]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: It's a great
10 pleasure to introduce Reverend Robert Lewis Foley,
11 Sr., Pastor of Cosmopol--Cosmopolitan Church of the
12 Lord Jesus. Over the past 54 years Pastor Foley has
13 served eight congregations in Georgia and New York.
14 As a pastor, he was the founder of the Cosmopolitan
15 Church of the Lord Jesus in 1978, and mind you, when
16 you have the average pastor today, they last only 2.7
17 years. It is an amazing track record to have such a
18 longevity, and for the last--for the past 38 years
19 Pastor Foley has been a major force in meeting
20 numerous community needs in the Bronx including
21 healthcare for these and clergy relations, interfaith
22 collaboration and social justice. We are truly
23 fortunate to Pastor Foley with us today to deliver
24 the Invocation.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you and again, thank you, Pastor. Adoption of Minutes, Council Member Constantinides. [pause]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Okay.

CLERK: Okay. Let's go on.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Adoption of minutes—the motion that the minutes of the Stated Meeting of November 16th be adopted as printed. Messages and papers from the Mayor.

CLERK: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication for City, County and Borough Offices.

CLERK: Preconsidered M463 Transfer funds between agencies.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Finance.

CLERK: Preconsidered M464 Revenue budget reduction.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Finance.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and Communications.

CLERK: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call-Ups.

CLERK: None.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
3 Chambers now as we hear from the Speaker Melissa—oh,
4 before we hear from the Speaker for a vote Council
5 Member Levine.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Madam Public
7 Advocate, with permission I'd like to vote on all
8 coupled general orders.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: I vote aye.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, and
12 now, we would like to hear from the Speaker Melissa
13 Mark-Viverito. Quiet in the Chambers.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madam
15 Public Advocate. So Buenos tardes, good afternoon to
16 everyone, and welcome to our final Stated in 2016.
17 [cheers] This afternoon's Stated Meeting marks an
18 important milestone for the City Council. At the
19 conclusion of today's Stated, the Council will have
20 introduced 1,409 bills and passed 369 nine of them, a
21 record high. [applause] When I first became Speaker,
22 I vowed to make this the most open and collaborative
23 Council in our history. These record levels of
24 productivity reflect the City Council's laser focus
25 on enacting thoughtful policies to uplift all New

1
2 Yorkers across the five boroughs. As we look toward
3 this—the year ahead, I will continue to work with
4 each of you to further improve the lives all New
5 Yorkers. Today is also another milestone, and
6 another last for a member of this session's Council.
7 This will be the last stated meeting for Inez
8 Dickens, our colleague. [cheers] As Inez and I are
9 from the same class, there's a couple of us left, Dan
10 and—and Rosie and couple of others. Now, have—having
11 served 11 years, and moving onto the Assembly, it's
12 been a pleasure to work along your neighboring
13 district colleagues. And so, I know everyone here
14 feels the same way, and we'll be hearing a lot of
15 great words wishing you well, Inez, and good luck in
16 the Assembly and representing us, and representing
17 the City and representing your district and thank you
18 for your service. [applause/cheers]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Thank you, thank
20 you, Madam Speake and yes we do come from the same
21 class, and I could think that some of the hard times,
22 but I think of some of the fun times that we had
23 right here in these Chambers. I want to take this
24 time to officially announce my departure from the
25 Council to become the new representative of the 70th

1
2 Assembly District. I want to thank all of my
3 colleagues past and present for making my time here
4 in the Council some of the most rewarding years of my
5 life. This body has allowed me the opportunity to
6 provide programs and secure much needed services in
7 the areas of healthcare education, employment and
8 affordable housing, and for that, it has given me the
9 greatest since of pride in representing the community
10 I was born and raised in, the only community I've
11 ever known and loved, Harlem. This moment is
12 bittersweet for me for many reasons. I've grown to
13 know and respect all of colleagues by seeing and
14 understanding how they fight for the people they
15 represent by how they take charge of the issues of
16 importance, and how they are willing to seek
17 compromise during highly contested debates, and do so
18 with the overall objective of seeing the task
19 completed. I will miss the respect amongst members
20 whom I've had disagreements with, and although we did
21 not see eye-to-eye, there was always an understanding
22 that as members of this great institution, we must
23 always be cordial because the people of city of New
24 York expect better of us. Where other institutions
25 or agencies have fallen short of their duties and

1
2 obligations, the people sought relief from us. They
3 recognized our ability to produce results in the
4 midst of competing ideas and influences. I will miss
5 the fact that I've served in a time when women ran
6 the City Council. [cheers/applause] I was provide
7 the opportunity of funding for my district, and an
8 incredible amount of funding, enormous amounts of
9 funding, capital and expense, and the amount of
10 funding that we've done to secure our members. None
11 of this exists in Albany today, and under Speaker
12 Melissa Mark-Vivertio I was awarded Chair of the Land
13 Use Subcommittee on Planning, which helped shape our
14 city's affordable home ownership and housing
15 policies, issues that I know we could have achieved
16 far more if it had not been for term limits. But it
17 will be the will of the people that is put in place.
18 I will miss my little crew here Karen Koslowitz, who
19 co-chaired the Slow Walking Members Caucus with me.
20 [laughter] And Annabel Palma and Darlene Mealy co-
21 chairs of the Let's Keep Your Belly Caucus, and Rosie
22 Mendez of Let's Try This New Restaurant Caucus.
23 [laughter] I will miss the person who allowed me to
24 be myself with no repercussions but he had scissors
25 in hand, Ramon Martinez. [laughs] Pigs get fed.

1
2 Hots are slaughtered. I will miss Peg Torro who I
3 know has an entire drawer dedicated to all of my
4 doctor's notes. I will miss Finance who were so
5 generous to me over the years. I really do wish I
6 could take you with me. To my right and left hands
7 and Land Use Amy Leviton and Raju Mann. Thank you so
8 much for understanding my uniqueness. Chuck Davis, I
9 will miss our legal dis-deliberations over Council
10 procedures and rules, and make some of you make some
11 of the very solid arguments. Madam Public Advocate,
12 Tish James my former colleague, I will miss hearing
13 you hit the gavel and say quite, please. I don't want
14 to forget Ms. Phyllis from the Speaker's Office.
15 Thank you for the sneakers and Amelia for your
16 candor, your pushiness and your "Go upstairs
17 everyone." I will miss and I want to thank Ralphie
18 Perez and Gina Sharp and all of the sergeants-of-arms
19 and Josef Montar (sic) for apprising of any district
20 disasters. I want to thank my staff Lemar Mase, Tori
21 Outlaw, Dominic List (sic), Damelia Richards,
22 Evanston Smith, Ron Hudson and Ritchie Agueras (sp?)
23 for phenomenal work and service, long hours and often
24 putting up with my discouraging spirit. Thank you.
25 I've learned that moments like this are really never

1
2 goodbyes, but more like we will see each other soon.
3 I really do hope that is the case. For now, I wish
4 all of you the best of luck in all of your endeavors
5 and I ask that you continue to do all that you can to
6 better the lives of all New Yorkers because that's
7 what we do. Donovan Richards, I could never depart
8 the august chambers without breaking bread with you
9 as we in B&T. Here's Lay's chips. [laughter]
10 [applause] Happy and blessed holidays and happy new
11 hear. Than you. [applause] [pause]

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Again, thank you,
13 Inez, and I'm sure we'll be hearing from a lot of
14 colleagues as—as they send their farewells to you and
15 one sendoffs. So again, only with two weeks left to
16 the New York, I want to wish everyone a happy holiday
17 season and a wonderful New Year as well. So getting
18 onto the agenda for today, today the Council will be
19 voting on a series of Land Use applications, which
20 will provide much needed funding for Hudson River
21 Park. These applications would have the way—would
22 pave the way for the repair and rehabilitation of
23 Pier 40 through the transfer of floor area to a new
24 development across the street on Houston and West
25 Street. The new development will provide desperately

1
2 needed affordable housing in the West Village
3 neighborhood. I'm sorry. Housing in the West
4 Village neighborhood-oriented retail, new open space,
5 and a new rec center for the community and much more.
6 And this development is located in Council Member
7 Corey Johnson's district. I congratulate Council
8 Member Johnson. He put a lot of time into this, over
9 three years, and he has reached—achieved a variety of
10 goals through this development from funding of parks,
11 building affordable housing to balancing preserving
12 with the need to grow as a city. I want to ask him
13 to say a few words, and from the staff side I want to
14 thank Julie Lubin and Liz Lee. Obviously Raju and
15 everyone else in Land Use that helped Council Member
16 Johnson in getting this done today. So Council
17 Member Johnson.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam
19 Speaker. Today we're voting on a Land Use
20 application that I have been working on for more than
21 three years even before I was sworn in as a Council
22 Member. It has presented a lot of challenges and
23 involved a wide range of diverse stakeholders. But
24 the proposal has also had the potential to produce
25 substantial public value for my district, and help us

1
2 achieve many long sought goals. I am extremely proud
3 to say that after a long rigorous process involving
4 much negotiation, detailed and thoughtful from the
5 community and from my colleagues in government, the
6 550 Washington St. John's Terminal project is an all
7 around win-win for the people of my district, and for
8 the city of New York. The main impetus for this
9 project is that Pier 40, one of the largest piers in
10 New York City is collapsing into the river. The
11 pilings are corroding, and the cost to fix those
12 pilings is approximately \$100 million. Through this
13 Land Use application today, the developer is
14 purchasing air rights, and paying \$100 million to the
15 Hudson River Park Trust to save the pier. I want to
16 thank the de Blasio Administration for putting in an
17 addition \$14 million for the pier as well that has
18 emergency needs. This project is going to create
19 nearly 500 units of desperately affordable housing,
20 180 of which will be senior housing on the Lower West
21 Side where it's needed badly. Through this process
22 we're able to achieve a 15,000 square foot in-door
23 public-public recreation space, and we limited most
24 retail spaces to 10,000 square feet eliminating big
25 box retail. We shrunk the parking down from about

1
2 800 parking spaces to 425 spaces. We're getting a
3 new grocery store, and just two days ago, the LPC
4 voted to designate a new history district, the
5 Sullivan Thompson Historic District, which the
6 community board and the community have been fighting
7 for over 10 years. I want to thank the Speaker for
8 her support during this process. I want to thank
9 Chair Donovan Richards and also Chair David
10 Greenfield for their help during this project. I
11 want to thank Mayor de Blasio, Deputy Mayor Glenn,
12 Chair Weisbrod, my fellow elected officials, Assembly
13 Member Glick, State Senator Hoylman, State Senator
14 Squadron, Congressman Nadler and Borough President
15 Brewer. I really want to thank the Hudson River Park
16 Trust President Madilyn Wills who is here today.
17 Thank her for her hard work. I want to thank
18 Community Board 2 former Chair Toby Bergman for his
19 partnership as well as the community members
20 particularly the Pier 40 champions who have been
21 fighting to save this pier for many, many years. And
22 I want to thank the developer for long, difficult,
23 hard negotiations that almost went south many, many
24 times, but in the end we were able to strike a good
25 deal for the community. I am really, really proud of

1
2 this deal I've worked on this every week for three
3 years. I want to thank lastly the staff. Raju Mann,
4 Julie Lubin and Liz Lee worked countless, countless
5 hours on this as well as Louis Cholden-Brown, Eric
6 Boucher (sp?) and Patrice Comerford from my office.
7 I ask my colleagues to please vote in favor of this
8 application. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
10 Council Member. Congratulations. The next item up
11 for a vote comes directly from a commitment I made to
12 residents during the 2016 State of the City Address.
13 When as a city we make a promise to a community, we
14 need to deliver. This is particularly important in
15 the context of large re-zonings because these
16 projects can define the future of a neighborhood.
17 Introduction 1132-A, of which I helped sponsor would
18 require the Administration to establish and maintain
19 a publicly accessible and searchable online list of
20 written commitments made by the Mayor to the Council
21 in connection with large re-zonings. We are creating
22 this database for a very simple reason. When a
23 community is promised a school or a community center
24 they need to understand when this promise will become
25 a reality. By form-formally indexing what the city

1
2 is committing to, we will introduce a new level of
3 accountability to these processes and work to
4 increase the trust between these communities and
5 government. I want to thank Dylan Casey and Jeff
6 Campagna on the staff side, and I want to thank the
7 Public Advocate Letitia James and Council Member
8 Rafael Espinal for their partnership on this bill.
9 The Public Advocate James will say a few words. Then
10 followed by Council Member Espinal.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: I want to thank
12 Mayor de Blasio, Speaker Mark Viverito, Committee
13 Chair Greenfield, Council Member Espinal and all the
14 Council Members who signed on to this common sense
15 bill that would bring transparency to the Land Use
16 process and build public trust. It's a great segue
17 to Council Member Johnson's bill to provide more-to
18 provide more land use for the Hudson Yards. I
19 particularly want to thank the committee staff, Jeff
20 Campagna-Campagna, Dylan Casey and Jason Ferman from
21 my office for their excellent work drafting this bill
22 with my office and helping to negotiate a strong
23 final product. Basically, a promise made must be a
24 promise kept particularly when it comes to public
25 benefits for New Yorkers and for the communities that

1
2 we represent. This bill would require the
3 Administration to establish and update annually a
4 publicly accessible database of all commitments made
5 by the city by the city in connection with the city
6 sponsored land use applications for-on a project
7 involving four blocks or greater. And additional
8 benefit of this bill is that it requires the
9 Administration to update the status of each
10 commitment annually so members of the community can
11 have a better sense of how each commitment is
12 progressing. As a former member of the City Council
13 who represented the Fort Greene community during the
14 whole Atlantic Yard debacle, I can attest to how
15 large a role community pressure plays, and how it's
16 really critically important that at the end of the
17 day we honor our commitments. With major rezoning
18 scheduled to take place all across the city, there is
19 no better time than now to make sure that promises to
20 our communities are not allowed to fail along the
21 wayside based on lack of sunshine. And so, I want to
22 thank the Mayor. I want to thank the Speaker. I
23 want to thank again, Council Member Greenfield,
24 Council Member Espinal, and all of the co-sponsors.
25 Thank you, Madam Speaker.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you.

Council Member Espinal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Thank you, Madam Speaker. As we look to make long-term investments that would build our city and improve its vibrancy, we must ensure proper follow through on these promises. I am proud to be a co-prime sponsor of this legislation an overdue tool ensuring transparency and public accountability for major city projects. Gone must be the days when commitments are not met and communities are left wondering why their government has left crucial work unfinished. We can just look back at the 2005 Williamsburg Rezoning where it took 11 years for the city to finally do right by its promise in purchasing Bushwick and the Park. As the first Council Member to undergo a major rezoning under the de Blasio Administration that has faced a lot of opposition, I can attest that one of the biggest anxieties is whether the Administration will follow up on its commitments. This will serve as a strong tool to hold this and future administrations accountable. I look forward to the efficiency this bill will inspire. I thank my colleagues, the Public Advocate Tish James, our Speaker Mark-Viverito, David

1
2 Greenfield for all his work behind this bill as well,
3 and for the partnership on this issue. Thank you.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
5 Council Member. The next piece of legislation that
6 the Council will be voting on is Intro 1345-A
7 sponsored by myself, which would prohibit donations
8 above \$400 per year from people or entities who are
9 lobbyists, have city contracts or who otherwise do
10 business with the City to political non-governmental
11 organizations controlled by local elected officials.
12 We at the City Council believe that elected officials
13 should be held to the highest ethical standards, and
14 should avoid even the appearance of impropriety. It
15 is not appropriate for political groups controlled by
16 elected officials to accept large donations from
17 people who do business with the city. We won't know
18 for certain what happens with the Campaign for One
19 New York and city investigations into these practices
20 have concluded but we do know that it exposed
21 loopholes in our Election and Ethics Laws that need
22 to be remedied, and we're doing that today. Current
23 law allows unlimited donations to non-government
24 organizations created and run by local elected
25 officials even as the donations offering people with

1
2 business before the office of that official. The
3 permissive regulatory framework for political non-
4 profits stands in sharp contrast to the national-to
5 the nation leading campaign finance system upon which
6 New York City prides itself. We have a Council stand
7 in staunch opposition to the undue influence of money
8 interests in politics and a potential for corruption
9 that this influence can invite. This law will be the
10 strongest of its kind anywhere in the country, and we
11 hope others will follow our lead in ensuring the
12 integrity of our elected officials. I want to thank
13 Rob Newman and David Seitzer—I'm sorry Seitzer for
14 working on this legislation. I also want to thank
15 Council Members Elizabeth Crowley, Brad Lander and
16 Dan—Dan Garodnick for their diligent work on this
17 critical issue. I'm going to ask each of them to say
18 a few words. I'll start with Council Member
19 Garodnick.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK. Thank you very
21 much, Speaker Mark-Viverito, and I am pleased that
22 the Council is voting today on this legislation to
23 reform our city's Campaign Finance Law. As you
24 noted, New York has one of the very best campaign
25 finance systems around, but with our experience we

1
2 can make it stronger and more robust. We propose
3 measures to strengthening and clarify various aspects
4 to the system including procedural timelines and
5 regulations around individuals doing business with
6 the City. This legislative package will do just
7 that. I'm very happy that we are going to be voting
8 on legislation, which the Speaker introduced and that
9 I am a co-sponsor Intro 1545, which establishes
10 limits for individuals doing business with the city
11 looking to make donations to organizations that are
12 affiliated with elected officials. Recent history
13 has brought about a new type of non-profit, those
14 that were set up or are run in some way by an elected
15 official most notably the now defunct Campaign for
16 One New York. The fundraising practices that groups
17 like these raised concerns for many New Yorkers
18 because they allowed people are doing business with
19 the city to deliver unlimited funds to a fund
20 controlled by the Mayor himself. That should not be.
21 From City Hall to the White House, we should
22 eliminate all ethical conflicts, real or just
23 perceived. We are fixing this as we should. I'm
24 also happy to be a co-sponsor of another bill Intro
25 985 by Council Member Ben Kallos that eliminates the

1
2 use of public national funds for contributions
3 bundled by people doing business with the city. This
4 is an important reform that will moderate the
5 influence of lobbyists and other special interests in
6 our elections. It is crucial that we maintain a
7 campaign finance system that encourages scrupulous
8 fundraising practices in order to have an effective
9 and legitimate government. On a much more
10 ministerial note, I also wanted to note that two of
11 the bills that I authored are up for a vote today,
12 13449-A and 1350. 1349-A will require the Campaign
13 Finance Board to help candidates with their state
14 filings. Candidates today have to submit to the
15 City, then submit to the State, but one filing may
16 not satisfy disclosure requirements for the other.
17 It doubles the work for no reason at all. 1350-A
18 will give candidates the right to challenge
19 violations before its tribunal of the Office of
20 Administrative Trials and Hearings, otherwise known
21 as OATH rather than before the CFB itself should they
22 so choose. So I want to thank the Speaker and my
23 colleagues along with the Committee Counsel Brad Reed
24 for doing so much work on this package of bills, and
25

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 46
2 I look forward to passing them all today. Thank you,
3 Madam Speaker.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you.
5 Council Member Crowley.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you, Madam
7 Speaker. I'd like to thank the Speaker and my
8 colleagues who have co-prime sponsored, Council
9 Member Garodnick and Council Member Lander. Today,
10 the Council is addressing real concerns New Yorkers
11 have with non-profits established elected officials.
12 Until now these non-profits have been allowed to
13 collect unlimited contributions from undisclosed
14 individuals. This legislation will change that, and
15 institute real rules and limits on this contribution.
16 This bill not only requires transparency amongst
17 contributions, but it furthers our good government
18 reform. This legislation will give New Yorkers the
19 reassurance that elected officials are working for
20 the public's best interest and not in the best
21 interest of the big donors. Again, I want to thank
22 the Speaker for her leadership and for my colleagues
23 for their support of this bill. Thank you.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
25 Council Member. Council Member Lander.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, Madam
3 Speaker and also to the other co-prime sponsors.
4 This Council has long been at the forefront of
5 aggressive legislation to keep the corrupting
6 influence of money out of our politics. Under then
7 Speaker Vallone and Council Member Ruth Messinger,
8 our Campaign Finance system was established. When it
9 became clear that doing business entities were
10 contributing too much of the money into that system
11 this Council acted to restrict what doing business
12 entities can restrict it to—can contribute within our
13 Campaign Finance System. We've taken actions as far
14 as we can go given what the Supreme Court has done on
15 independent expenditures, and now that this new type
16 of entity has emerged, these political non-profits,
17 we also taking legislation, the first and strongest
18 of its kind in the country to make clear that those
19 who do business with the city cannot give large sums.
20 No more than \$400 to these politically—these
21 political non-profits controlled by an elected
22 official. It will go a long way to making sure there
23 are not loopholes in our Campaign Finance Laws, and
24 that we keep those who have a vested interest by
25 doing business with the city out of government

1
2 through their contributions. I also supported and
3 I'm proud to co-sponsor some of the other legislation
4 in this broad package, which I think strikes just the
5 right balance in strengthening our Campaign Finance
6 Laws by removing areas where those with money might
7 otherwise find a way in with technical fixes to help
8 balance and make this system stronger and more
9 workable. The legislation I'm sponsoring there,
10 Intro 1358, will allow elected officials to use
11 Campaign Finance funds for public, government
12 expenditures. So, for example, today you're allowed
13 to use campaign funds to make robo calls to everyone
14 in your district telling them how great you are, but
15 you can't do the same just to tell them hey tomorrow
16 night there's a town hall meeting on traffic safety.
17 And 1358 will make it possible. So, thank you, Madam
18 Speaker. I want to give a shout out to Rob Newman
19 for his work on this package in its entirety. I look
20 forward to voting on it. Thank you.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank your.
22 Another package that the Council will be voting on
23 today comes after months of research and
24 collaboration between a significant amount of this
25 legislative body. The Council will be voting on 21

1
2 bills from 10 sponsors to establish reforms to the
3 Campaign Finance Board and the public matching
4 program. This is the culmination of many hearings
5 with careful considerations and the relentless work
6 of our Committee on Governmental Operations and
7 Standards and Ethics. I want to invite Government
8 Ops Chair Ben Kallos to start us off. Regarding
9 staff, I want to thank Rob Newman, Brad Reed, David
10 Seitzer and Smita Deshmukh. So again, I want to
11 invite Council Member Ben Kallos, and he has Intro
12 985-A, 986-A, 987-A and 988-A.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: New York City has
14 a model of the public campaign finance system that
15 amplifies the voices of every New Yorker by matching
16 their individual dollars with six dollars of the
17 public. As we strive to improve the system after
18 each election, the New York City Campaign Finance
19 Board issues a post-election report most recently in
20 2014 with recommendations for legislation to
21 continually strengthen the voice of the people with
22 special interest. As Chair of the Committee on
23 Governmental Operations, we considered eight bills,
24 which came from the CFB's 2013 post-election report
25 that I introduced along with my colleagues. Council

1
2 Members Cabrera, King and Williams introduce bills to
3 level the playing fields against non-participants
4 taking funds from political committees outside this
5 city. Opening an 18th Century requirements to drop
6 off and pick up conflicts points by hand, and getting
7 to the bottom of the individuals behind corporations-

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
9 [shushing for quiet]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: --that do
11 business with the city.

12 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
13 down place.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: For my hope—for
15 my part I hope to improve debates to save money and
16 our environment by allowing residents to go green and
17 get voter guides online; expanding engagement in
18 democracy by giving campaigns the public funds they
19 need to communicate with voters earlier in the
20 process, and to stop amplifying the voice of
21 lobbyists by no longer matching contributions they
22 bundle with public dollars. So that our public
23 dollars only empower the voices of our residents.
24 I'd like thank Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito for
25 bringing this legislation to the floor as well as

1
2 Council Members Cabrera, King and Williams for their
3 leadership and support and, of course, Rob Newman,
4 Matt Gewolb, Brad Reed, Smita Deshmukh and everyone
5 in the Legislative Division for all their hard work
6 along with my Legislative Director Paul Westrick.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
8 Council Member. We'll now hear from Majority Leader
9 Jimmy Van Bramer who has Intro 1364-A.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you
11 very much, Madam Speaker. As someone whose first
12 paid political job was on--

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
14 [shushing for quiet]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: --a campaign
16 called Clean Money/Clean Elections, which helped
17 establish the current signing of our Campaign System,
18 I'm thrilled to support all of this great legislation
19 in this package, and I salute the Speaker on her
20 leadership in making sure that it got done. In order
21 for the Campaign Finance Board to do its work, it
22 must be transparent and fair, and that fairness
23 instills more confidence and indeed more
24 participants. To that end, Intro 1364, the bill that
25 I'm proud to be passing today with my colleagues

1
2 makes sure that the process is fair. Right now if
3 the CFB determines that a candidate has violated
4 campaign finance regulations, they determine the fine
5 the candidate will have to pay. In order to make
6 this determination, the CFB hears arguments from both
7 sides. The candidates present—presents their case
8 saying why she believes the violation didn't occur.
9 The Campaign Finance Board staff presents their case,
10 saying why they believe a violation did occur. The
11 Board then votes in a closed door session to make a
12 judgment and impose fines sometime very serious fines
13 for those violations. Oddly, though, high level
14 Campaign Finance Board staff is allowed in this
15 meeting, which doesn't pass the smell test. If the
16 Campaign Finance Board staff has just made a
17 presentation alleging a violation, why should they
18 get to be in the room when the person presenting the
19 other side is excluded and the adjudicatory board
20 should adjudicate with the record presented before
21 them. Imagine in a criminal court, it would
22 certainly be odd if a defense attorney got to sit in
23 on the jury deliberations, but the other side did not
24 . My bill eliminates this unfair practice, and makes
25 the decisions for just for all the parties involved.

1
2 Instead, if the Campaign Finance Board wants expert
3 advice or they have additional questions, they are
4 empowered to hire or retain counsel for the purpose
5 of advising them and liaising within these closed
6 door meetings. This legislation helps make the
7 Campaign Finance Board and its fines and fees and its
8 decisions more fair and transparent and eliminates
9 any appearance of wrong doing, and it show more
10 confidence in the process from all the candidates,
11 those of us who are here today who won their races,
12 and those who didn't win their races. This is very
13 important. To impose such substantial fines and to
14 not have belief in the system in those fines actually
15 prevents those from running. It creates a
16 disincentive to those who might want to run for
17 office when instead our Campaign Finance system is
18 about imploring and encouraging those to run for
19 office. So I'm very proud of this bill, very proud
20 of Intro 1364 and this entire packing which increases
21 fairness and transparency and ultimately the belief
22 in our Campaign Finance system. Thank you very much.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
24 Council Member. Council Member Cabrera has Intro
25 988.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so much, Madam Speaker and for your support. Intro 980 sets forth and imposes the same contributions limits on transitioning in aggravation (sic) entities as a campaign contribution. It also sets for the funding limited categories for specific elected officials by creating uniform contributions limits. Intro 980 safeguards against unintentional mistakes. I believe this legislation will improve our elections, and the transition of processes clarifying contribution limits, and since we have 21 bills, with that I'll close. Thank you.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you.
Council Member King has Intro 990-A.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Good afternoon and thank you, Madam Speaker. As we all attempt to run office, the Campaign Finance Board has a responsibility to give us all access to financing to be-to be able to run for office. Lord knows we've all had our experiences. Lord know we all have had experiences with CFB. But at the end of the day, today's packages are about making responsible decisions and helping the CFB operate at a pace that allows the everyday New Yorker who wants to run for

1
2 office to be able to finance and be able to do that.
3 990-A requires if you're not participating with the
4 CFB that any political tax who want to make a
5 contribution must be registered. We just want to
6 know who's donated. If you want to donate into city
7 politics, we want to know your name and who you are,
8 and if you're unable to register then we're saying
9 that you won't be active in our campaigns. So I
10 think this allows transparency, fairness for all
11 especially for those who want to run for office that
12 might not have access to big money. So again, I want
13 to thank you, Madam Speaker, or the Council--and
14 Council Member Ben Kallos for running this through
15 Government Op Committee. Thank you again. Happy
16 holidays everyone and Inez, God bless you. Oh, with
17 that--

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing]
19 Thank you, Council Member.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: --with that, Public
21 Advocate, can I have permission to vote on items on
22 the calendar today?

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I vote aye on all.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 56
2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Council Member
3 Williams has Intro 1001-A and 1002-A.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you,
5 Madam Speaker for your leadership and all of the
6 colleagues who have parts of this package. I have
7 two bills that I believe really just help clear up
8 some complications that could lead to too many
9 opportunities for unintended violations. Of course,
10 some people could use them to violate on purpose,
11 but, we—we—we feel that closing loopholes. The bills
12 allow for a more streamlined and organized method of
13 tracking using the plans for the board and who is
14 conducting business with the city. One of my bills
15 in particular adds the names of entities with a 10%
16 or greater ownership stake than entities that conduct
17 business with the city who are doing business data
18 base maintained by the city. The other assist with
19 [pause] well would provide the Campaign Finance Board
20 with information on who was reported to COIB. The
21 system will replace the current system, which
22 carriers are required to obtain or receive a
23 compliance from the Conflicts of Interest Board, and
24 to provide such a receipt to the Campaign Board when
25 upon request. I also want to say I know there were

1
2 some questions about how this package came through.
3 We can always have questions about processing and
4 always making things better, but I do want to just
5 address the fact that I think there is no one better
6 who would understand the Campaign Finance Board that
7 those who have gone through it. I think it makes a
8 lot of sense that we would have some expertise, and
9 not just us. There are many candidates who are not
10 elected officials that are going through this
11 process, and they, too, had a lot of problems with
12 figuring it out. And there are some people in this
13 Council who lend many before even becoming a member
14 and that issue. And so I'm glad that we took this
15 on. I think it makes sense that we provide expertise
16 not just to make it easier for ourselves, but to make
17 a-a place where people can feel comfortable that
18 they'll get information. That information will
19 remain the same, and it will provide a better for
20 them to run, and a better place for us to spend our-
21 all of us-our taxpayer dollars. Thank you very much.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
23 Council Member. Council Member Greenfield has 1351-A,
24 1352, 1353-A, 1354-A and 1355-A.

25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you,
3 Madam Speaker, and thank you for your leadership on
4 this issue. I want to thank the Chair of the
5 Government Operations Committee, Chair Kallos, for
6 his steadfast commitments to better campaign finance
7 and, of course, the Chair of Standards and Ethics
8 Council Member and Chair Alan Maisel for his
9 leadership as well in this package of bills. I
10 think, to-to summarize because I do have five bills,
11 the-the package that we're passing today really
12 strengthens the law, and sets higher criteria and
13 makes sure that we have the strictest campaign
14 finance laws in the country. But it also engages in
15 some things that make it a little bit easier for
16 first time candidates in terms of understanding the
17 process especially as it relates to those first time
18 candidates getting matching funds. I would point out
19 for those folks in the press they always are curious
20 about this issue. As incumbents when we refer to
21 first time candidates, we're also referring to the
22 new first time candidates who will be running against
23 us, and we understand that, but it's still the right
24 thing to do. And so yes, we're making it easier for
25 people to run against us, but that's okay, and

1
2 finally what I would say is that we are focusing on
3 efficiency, and we're doing some common sense thing.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
5 [shushing for quiet]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: For example,
7 I have a piece of legislation--

8 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
9 down, please.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: --that would
11 allow you to return a contribution from someone who
12 you later realize is not someone that you want to
13 take a contribution from for whatever kind of reason.
14 I have another piece of legislation that streamlines
15 the process for matching funds and clarifies when you
16 can and cannot do things like fill out forms, and I
17 want to thank once again the District Attorney's
18 Office, Sy Vance, for reaching out to us on that
19 particular piece, 1355. There are five elements to
20 the bill. We had an issue with one element of the
21 bill, and pointed some areas (sic) that we were not
22 aware of. When we found out, we not only changed the
23 legislation, but we also specifically wrote in his
24 concern and made it illegal, which would be to
25 actually change something on a form after that form

1
2 has been signed. And so, I think that this is proof
3 of the robust process, and the final thing I will say
4 is that the fact that we are doing this at this point
5 in time will, in fact, allow for enough time for all
6 these rules to go into effect for those new
7 candidates who will be running in the 2017 election
8 cycle. And so I think in totality these are really a
9 very strong package of legislation that's going to
10 make the campaign finance system even more stringent,
11 even more common sense, and even more efficient, and
12 I do want to thank the Campaign Finance Board for
13 their feedback and their participation and for their
14 constant good work, and we're happy to improve their
15 work as well.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
17 Council Member and last but not least Council Member
18 Salamanca has 1361, 1362-A and 1363-A.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you,
20 Madam Speaker. As some of you may know, I've
21 essentially been in constant campaign cycle this
22 year. I've been on the ballot three times in the
23 last ten months first for my special election in
24 February and then for my primary this September, and
25 finally the general election last month. I will

1
2 potentially have to prepare for two elections next
3 year as well meaning that I will have to have run in
4 five elections prior to beginning my first four-year
5 team on the Council. I believe I'm truly blessed
6 with the people in my district to serve as their
7 Council Member, and do I'm term limited. I will
8 have to have gone through nine elections. As a
9 result, I proposed three bills that are—immediately
10 address three issues that I came across throughout my
11 campaign. First, Intro 1361 pertains to the database
12 compiled regarding people who do business with the
13 city. This bill makes simple changes to the records
14 kept on the database to ensure candidates in the
15 public know exactly when people not only began to do
16 business with the city, but also terminated all
17 business with the city. Secondly, Intro 1362 simply
18 raises the threshold for maximum contributions
19 allowed in a special election. Currently maximum
20 contributions were cut in half for no apparent
21 reason. And third, Intro 1363 allows candidates to
22 opt out of the matching funds program earlier, and in
23 my opinion at a point in which most campaigns to
24 realize whether or not they can abide by the
25 requirements to meet matching funds. Thank you.

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
3 Council Member, and with that, thank-and appreciation
4 to all my colleagues, I end communication from the
5 Speaker.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
7 Discussion of General Orders. Seeing none, Report of
8 Special Committees.

9 CLERK: None.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of
11 Standing Committees.

12 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
13 Finance, Resolution 1323 Expense Budget.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on General
15 Orders.

16 CLERK: Preconsidered LU 540 and Reso
17 1335 through LU 542 and Reso 1337.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on General
19 Orders.

20 CLERK: Preconsidered M463 and Reso 1338
21 Transfer funds between agencies.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
23 General Orders.

24 CLERK: Preconsidered M464 and Reso 1339,
25 Revenue budget reduction.

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
3 General Orders.

4 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
5 Governmental Operations Intro 980-A, Contribution
6 Limits.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
8 coupled on General Orders.

9 CLERK: Intro 985-A Bundled
10 Contributions.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
12 coupled on General Orders.

13 CLERK: Intro 986-A, Early Public Funds
14 Payments.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
16 coupled on General Orders.

17 CLERK: Intro 987-A, Campaign Finance
18 Board Debate.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
20 [shushing for quiet]

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
22 coupled on General Orders.

23 CLERK: Intro 988-A, Voter Guide.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
25 coupled on General Orders.

2 CLERK: Intro 990-A, Non-Registered
3 Political Committees.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
5 coupled on General Orders.

6 CLERK: Intro 1001-A, Disclosure of
7 entities that own entities doing business with the
8 city.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
10 coupled on General Orders.

11 CLERK: Intro 1002-A, Conflict of
12 Interest Law.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
14 coupled on General Orders.

15 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Land
16 Use, Intro 1132-A, Public list of commitments.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
18 coupled on General Orders.

19 CLERK: LU 531 and Reso 1340 and LU 532
20 and Reso 1341 Zoning Amendment.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Motion to
22 disapprove.

23 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
24 Standards and Ethics, Intro 1345-A, Conflict of
25 Interest.

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
3 coupled on General Orders.

4 CLERK: Intro 1349-A, Campaign Finance
5 Board's software.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
7 coupled on General Orders.

8 CLERK: Intro 1350-A, Campaign Finance
9 Violations.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
11 coupled on General Orders.

12 CLERK: Intro 1351-A, Campaign
13 Contributions.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
15 coupled on General Orders.

16 CLERK: Intro 1352, Entities Doing
17 Business with the City.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
19 General Orders.

20 CLERK: Intro 1353-A, Protection
21 Reputational Interests.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
23 coupled on General Orders.

24 CLERK: Intro 1354-A, Statement Reviews.

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
3 coupled on General Orders.

4 CLERK: Intro 1355-A, Documentation for
5 Contributions.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
7 coupled on General Orders.

8 CLERK: Intro 1356, Transfer of Non-
9 Public Campaign Funds.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
11 General Orders.

12 CLERK: Intro 1358, Expenditures of Non-
13 Public Funds.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on General
15 Orders.

16 CLERK: Intro 1361, Doing Business
17 Database.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
19 General Orders.

20 CLERK: Intro 1362-A, Contributions in a
21 Special Election.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
23 coupled on General Orders.

24 CLERK: Intro 1363-A, Matching Funds
25 Program.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: Intro 1364-A, Campaign Finance Board Executive Session.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: On the General Order Calendar LU 506 and Reso 1342 through LU 509 and Reso 1345, Hudson River Park.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Nope, keeping. Land Use 501 through Land Use 511?

CLERK: Up to—excuse me—thank you.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: You're excused.

CLERK: LU 506 and Reso 1342 through LU 511 and Reso 1347, Hudson River Park.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: Resolution Appointing Various Persons Commissioner of Deeds.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on General Orders, and this time I ask for a full call—I mean a full vote on all items on—coupled on the General Order Calendar.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet, in the Chambers, please.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing] And I'm just getting off of today. [laughs]

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down, please. Keep it down.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing] [shushing for quiet]

CLERK: Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I would like to vote aye on all General Orders.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

CLERK: Lancman.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Thank you. I would also like to vote aye on all businesses vote of Council.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

CLERK: Crowley.

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [pause] Thank you. I'd like to vote aye on all calendared items.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: And I'd like to also thank my colleague Inez Dickens for her leadership and her service to the city, and I'm glad that I'll a good friend in Albany. I wish you all the best, and happy holidays to you.

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you.

CLERK: Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. I want to commend the Speaker for the action that will allow us to hold those who make promises to communities as what they will do to hold them to—hold their feet to the fire. Too bad we can't make it retroactive, and I just think that in terms of the package of bills related to campaign finance, it would have been great if we had been able to also require that we always know who an employer is for all of the contributors, but I do want to vote aye on all the bills with the exception of 50-506 through 511, and the accompanying resolutions. Thank you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

CLERK: Vacca.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I ask permission to vote aye on all General Calendar Order freedoms. (sic).

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: And I want to say that I'm going to miss Inez Dickens. I wish her the best.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

CLERK: Borelli.

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all except for Intro 990-A.

CLERK: Cabrera.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye on all, and I want to wish Council Member Inez Dickens the best. You were tremendous in helping me when I first got here, and for all of your support. I could truly say I would never have had the opportunity to have been the Co-Chair of the Black, Latino, Asian Caucus. So I wish you the best, and again I vote aye on all.

CLERK: Chin.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Permission to explain my vote.

1

2

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yeah, first I

wanted to congratulate all my colleagues on passing

their important legislation especially the whole

package to strengthen our Campaign Finance program.

I also wanted to congratulate Council Member Johnson

on the great work on-on Pier 40. I know it's been

tough for three years, right? It will be amazing,

and thank you for your great work there, and I also

wanted to say thank you to Council Member Inez

Dickens. We're part of the Senior Woman's Caucus.

[laughs] We going to miss you, but we wish you all

the best in Albany. We will continue to work with

you, and make sure you help us out here, and I want

to jus wish everyone a happy holiday, and I vote aye

on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

CLERK: Cohen.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Madam Public

Advocate, could I just say congratulations to my

colleague Inez Dickens. I want to thank her for her-

really her sharing all of her leadership and

experience with us-with me over the last three years,

and I think that all New Yorkers should take heart

1
2 that she's on her way to Albany to fix Albany, and I
3 know that we'll be in great hands. So with that, I
4 vote aye on all.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

6 CLERK: Cornegy.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Permission to
8 explain my vote.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I'd like to say
11 Inez Dickens that I have never seen anyone represent
12 Harlem as well as she has, and I'm glad to know that
13 she is going to Albany. So while extend the reach of
14 the BLAC here in the city level and collaborate with
15 the Caucus in Albany, it's great to know there will
16 be a friendly, and somebody I can rely on. So I
17 appreciate you. I vote aye.

18 CLERK: Cumbo.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission to
20 explain my vote:

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I want to
23 congratulate Council Member Corey Johnson. I also
24 want to thank all of my colleagues who have put fort
25 important legislation, strengthening candidates going

1
2 through the CFB process. I also want to congratulate
3 Council Member Inez Dickens for all of your hard
4 work. I knew of you long before I came into the
5 Council as you being a staunch advocate for arts and
6 culture, and I always admired the work that you did
7 in Harlem. I admired how ferociously you would fight
8 for our cultural institutions and for the culture of
9 Harlem, and you have always been known to me even
10 before I even met you as Harlem Royalty. You may be
11 a council member, but they know you as the Queen of
12 Harlem. So thank you so much for your service.
13 Thank you so much for leadership. You are a class
14 act and Harlem is better off because of your
15 leadership. I proudly vote aye.

16 CLERK: Deutsch.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye on all. I
18 just—I want to congratulate Inez Dickens, and I want
19 to thank you for your friendship during my time in the
20 Council, and I congratulate you.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

22 CLERK: Dickens.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: [pause] Dromm.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I want to vote aye
25 and I also want to thank Council Member Dickens as

1
2 well for all that she's done, and for her friendship,
3 and also for the work that she's done LGBT issues.
4 I'm very appreciative of her support, and know that
5 the residents in Harlem as particularly Harlem Pride
6 I love her very much. Thank you.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

8 CLERK: Espinal.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I—I want to vote
10 and I also want to wish a lot of luck to Inez Dickens
11 in Albany. If you're looking for all the best
12 restaurants and Karaoke spots, hit me up. I'll give a
13 lift.

14 CLERK: Eugene.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye and I
16 want to congratulate all my colleagues for their
17 important legislation, and I would like also to thank
18 Inez for her sending things to the City Council, and
19 also to the New Yorkers, and I wish you all the best.
20 God bless you.

21 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: With
23 permission to explain my vote.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: I'd like to congratulate Council Member Inez. She's been such an ally and a friend and an adviser, and when the going gets tough, she never backs down. So we're going to miss you terribly here, and we're very excited to have you as an ally because we need as many ally as we possibly can get in Albany these days, and I vote aye on all. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

CLERK: Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

CLERK: Gentile.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: I vote aye and to Inez Dickens I want to wish her well, and as someone who has served in Albany in the other house, I know what it's like to be there, and so I really, really wish you well, and I advise you to take your boots with you. Thank you.

CLERK: Gibson.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Madam
3 Public Advocate, and I will be voting aye on all and
4 want to congratulate all of my colleagues for passing
5 very important legislation today, and I want to join
6 all of our colleagues in wishing Council Member Inez
7 Dickens Assembly Member Elect an incredible time in
8 Albany serving there for four years. It's a great
9 place. You make a lot of good work happen in Albany,
10 and thank you for your friendship. Being across the
11 bridge in the West Bronx, it's always a pleasure.
12 You've welcomed me to the Village of Harlem with love
13 and support and I appreciate that. So I thank you so
14 much for everything you've done. You have been one
15 of the-

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
17 [shushing for quiet]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: --loudest voices
19 and champions of Harlem, and I appreciate that as a
20 Bronx girl for all the work you've done. So
21 congratulations. We wish you well and may God
22 continue to be your guide in Albany. Congratulations
23 and all the best. Aye on all.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

25 CLERK: Green--Greenfield.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you/
Madam Public Advocate, may I explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you
very much. I vote aye on all. I, too, would like to
take a moment to recognize Chair Dickens for really
outstanding leadership. Very few people understand
the way government works, the way Inez Dickens does.
I learned quite a bit from observing her and sitting
next to her for quite a while back on leadership in
BNT, and she—she really understands how to work the
process and how to get things done for her
constituents, but really for all of New York City,
and we saw that in her work as the Chair of the
Planning Subcommittee. And I will add as well as a
new member when I would ask for advice, I very
quickly learned she had a very good sense of humor.
Usually at my expense, but still a very good sense of
humor nonetheless, and I still have good tales to
tell, but not in the public forum of the Chambers.
And you know she's a great public servant, because
she's going to be driving five hours now in the
freezing cold to do her work for a lot less pay. So
God bless you for your dedication and commitment to

1
2 the people of your community and to the people of New
3 York. I do also want to congratulate Council Member
4 Johnson. I don't think people quite understand what
5 a significant achievement this is and how significant
6 his negotiations were. I'm just going to highlight
7 three important facts. \$114 million in new funding
8 for a pier that desperately needs it and that's
9 utilized by tens of thousands of people. Thirty
10 percent affordable housing as low as 60% of the Area
11 Median Income. And folks, anybody who knows how the
12 system works knows it's not easy to get something
13 landmarked. This is the first time that I can recall
14 in a zoning application that somehow a very smart
15 council member managed to get a very large swath of
16 his community sales and Thompson landmarked as well.
17 So kudos to you and congratulations, Council Member
18 Johnson for an extraordinary deal. And finally, I
19 want to congratulate everyone including the Speaker
20 and Public Advocate and Council Member Espinal for
21 the Commitment Tracker Bill. It's a simple concept.
22 You make a promise, you got to keep your promise.
23 We're not going to hold you accountable. Very happy
24 holidays to all. Thank you.

25 CLERK: Grodenchik.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Permission to
3 explain my vote.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you,
6 Madam Public Advocate. Inez, first off, I want to
7 say thank you for your kindnesses taking them this
8 way with use from Eastern Queens, and helping me
9 through my first year here in the Council. I am
10 certainly going to miss you. I want to direct my
11 colleague Mr. Greenfield it's not five hours to
12 Albany unless you drive like he does. [laughter]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I am the
14 author of the 25 mile an hour speed limit in New York
15 City to be fair.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Well, that
17 wouldn't work in my district, David, but-[laughter]
18 it is only cold, Inez, in Albany through May. I just
19 want you to know that. The good news in Albany is
20 that nothing is more than five minutes away, and that
21 I assure you that the throughway does indeed run both
22 ways. So once you get to Albany all you have to do
23 is turn around, and you'll be home in-in two hours.
24 On a very serious note, I want to thank you for
25 everything that you've done for me personally holding

1
2 my hand through my first few months here, and being
3 absolutely a wise sources of wisdom on everything
4 that I needed to do here. So, thank you. With that,
5 I wish all my colleagues who are celebrating. We
6 have—let's see, we got Hanukkah, Christmas and go
7 onto the New Years before we see you all. I got my
8 25th wedding anniversary on January 5th. So I will
9 [applause] I will be here on January 4th, but you
10 will not see me on January 5th because otherwise
11 there will be a special election in the 23rd District
12 because I will no longer be with you. So, thank you
13 all, and Madam Public Advocate, I waive my last 33
14 seconds and vote aye on all.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

16 CLERK: Johnson.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Congratulations
18 to Inez. I'm going to miss you. Thanks for
19 everything and I vote aye on all.

20 CLERK: Kallos.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I vote aye on all
22 with the exception of Introduction No. 1356.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

24 CLERK: Koo.

25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Permission to
3 explain my vote.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, sir.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: First, I want to
6 congratulate Council Member Inez Dickens for her, you
7 know, wonderful ten years as being this public
8 servant, and we want to wish her a happy journey
9 every time she goes to Albany [laughs] be sure she
10 always remember us. I'm going to vote aye on all
11 except 1358 where I must abstain.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Okay.

14 CLERK: Koslowitz.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: May I please
16 explain my vote?

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quite, please.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
20 [shushing for quiet]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: First of all,
22 I'm not going to miss Inez Dickens because I expect
23 to see her many times. She is not only a colleague,
24 but she is a friend, and Inez, we're going to walk
25 slowly through life. [laughter] I vote aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Than you.

CLERK: Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Can I have permission to explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you.

First, I want to appreciate my colleagues in voting yes on Land Use 531 and 532 to disapprove the application at 14-18 Carroll Street. I don't do this with any joy, but this is a 6,200 square foot piece of manufacturing zoned property in my district in an area where we need light manufacturing and commercial uses There's a-a nursery, doggie day care. We could use--there's a bakery. We could use a bookstore or a warehouse or many other jobs generating uses, and while it was said in some dress reports this, otherwise, this lot is not especially irregular, and it's entirely feasible for the applicant to develop a commercial light manufacturing or a community facility use. If they were including affordable housing in their proposal, it would be a reasonable rezoning, and in that case I would be pleased to recommend to you that we vote yes, but they have made clear despite the fact that they're seeking a

1
2 rezoning to a square footage above the MIH threshold
3 that they intend to know affordable housing and I,
4 therefore, recommend and I appreciate my colleagues
5 are—are joining me in a vote to decline. I'm also
6 going to be abstaining on Land Use Nos. 506 to 511
7 for the Pier 40 application, and the accompanying
8 resolutions. I want to start by giving really big
9 procs and praise to Council Member Johnson. He has
10 negotiated a very strong deal here. Public
11 infrastructure investments, the park and deepened
12 affordability. But in my opinion, if what's
13 necessary to achieve the MIH minimum threshold is
14 some additional public capital to help those piers
15 from collapsing, then we should put the additional
16 public capital in. I want that MIH floor to be a
17 real floor so that people don't seek to go below it,
18 and I'm just abstaining to send that signal to future
19 developers, and well as the Administration. We
20 should make sure we are investing in infrastructure
21 as we did in Brooklyn with the Bushwick Inlet Park,
22 and we shouldn't compromise either our city's
23 infrastructure needs, or the MIH minimum standards.
24 So I'm abstaining on those resolutions with
25 congratulations to Council Member Johnson on the job

1
2 that did there. And finally, I will also just join
3 saying a fond farewell to Council Member, soon
4 Assembly Member Dickens. Thank you for—you're
5 irreplaceable in this body, and we really, really
6 appreciate your time here.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: [off mic] Thank
8 you.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you. Aye
10 on all the rest.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

12 CLERK: Levin.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to
14 explain my vote.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, Madam
17 Public Advocate. First, I want to thank and
18 congratulate Council Member, soon to be Assembly
19 Member Inez Dickens. In the previous term, I chaired
20 the Subcommittee on Dispositions—Planning,
21 Dispositions and Concession, and Council Member
22 Dickens was a member of the committee, but also was
23 exceptionally assiduous with every project that came
24 through that committee. She and her staff went out
25 to every HDSC in her district that was seeking an

1
2 extension of benefits in keeping those properties
3 affordable for co-op owners. And those reports that
4 she and her staff did, went to every apartment. Saw
5 every condition, looked—I mean it was—it was really
6 extraordinary, and it set a very high bar for any
7 Council Member's involvement in—in their local
8 matters in ensuring that affordability is
9 longstanding and maintained. And so, I wan to thank
10 Council Member Dickens for her—for her hard work on
11 behalf of her constituents. We here from the Council
12 really missed her in the Council, but we wish you all
13 the best in the Assembly. I want to congratulate—I
14 want to congratulate Council Member Corey Johnson on
15 the work that he has done on this—on this land use
16 negotiation, and I want to wish everybody a happy
17 holiday season, and with that I vote aye on all.
18 Thank you.

19 CLERK: Maisel.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER: [off mic] He's not here.

21 (sic)

22 CLERK: Menchaca.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to
25 explain my vote.

1

2

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you. If—
and I have to underscore this. If you didn't know
Council Member Inez's and future Assembly Member Inez
Dickens love and support for the LGBTQ community, I
hope she writes a book on it. It's important that
everyone know the importance of allies in our
community, and every time you stood up, and every
time you created new opportunities for people to join
our movement, and so I just want to say thank you.
I—I want to speak on the Land Use items in Corey
Johnson's district. St. John's Place project in the
West Village, you know, represents years of hard work
by Council Member Johnson and the community. Corey
has a lot to be proud of in the results, and so I
join the praise for a long and difficult process. I
fully understand that this project is poised to move
forward. However, as a matter-matter of principle,
I'm casting a no vote on the project's Land Use items
today, 506 through 511, and the related resos. Our
city is in a sustained affordable housing emergency,
and preserving and building new affordable housing
are universally acknowledged as the highest priority
for keeping America or New York's neighborhoods

1
2 intact, and to avoid the homelessness that is
3 plaguing low-income New Yorkers. Initiatives and
4 projects to this end are happening throughout all our
5 city. Though St. John's Place mega project has a
6 significant amount of permanent affordable housing,
7 the AMI calculations in the West Village are just not
8 right, and I'm calling on the City Council and I'm
9 calling on my brother Corey Johnson and all our
10 colleagues here and the Administration and everyone
11 to work better to create more affordable housing at
12 the floors that MIH gave us as tools. There's a lot
13 that we're going to unpack in this project, and I
14 want us all to work together to do that. And so, I
15 join Council Member Lander and others just to make
16 sure that we can follow those—that lead, and bring
17 this conversation to the forefront. So on projects
18 that are small or big, on projects that started a
19 long time ago, or just ten minutes ago, and we're
20 getting those, I hope we can all do better for our
21 communities most in need. Thank you.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Oh, and aye on
24 the rest.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

2 CLERK: Mendez.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote aye on
4 all, and to my sister Inez, I just have to say, you
5 know, we knew each other as district leaders before
6 we came into this body, but now we really know each
7 other, the good, the bad, the ugly. I will miss you
8 dearly, and I will still let you know what
9 restaurants we should be going to down here. I can't
10 tell you anything about Albany, though.

11 CLERK: Miller.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Permission to
13 explain.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Madam
16 Public Advocate. First, I'd like to congratulate my
17 colleagues for in the--the passage of significant
18 reform around CFB. I think we all realize there is
19 much at stake as we move forward. I'd like to also
20 thank the members of the Council, the Public Advocate
21 and others for their support during the passing of my
22 father. It was really important to myself and my
23 family and it meant a great deal.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

25 [shushing for quiet]

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: To my colleague,
3 my friend, my mentor Inez Dickens it has been
4 wonderful working with you. You've been a staunch
5 advocate and public servant. You have been a beacon
6 for all of us. You have been staunch. You have been
7 relentless particularly when it comes to minority and
8 women-owned businesses. They all should applaud you
9 throughout the city of New York and throughout the
10 state of New York. I know you will up to Albany-
11 Albany and continue that. We will continue to seek
12 your guidance and your counsel on that and many other
13 issues. It's been an honor and a privilege to work
14 with you, and I look forward to working with you in
15 Albany. I vote aye on all.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

17 CLERK: Palma.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Inez, well I'll
19 miss seeing you here in these halls and these
20 Chambers, but our friendship is long. You're part of
21 my family now. So, I'll see you on Sunday for diner.
22 I vote aye.

23 CLERK: Reynoso.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: So, Council
25 Member Inez Dickens we're going to miss you

1
2 especially your fear fight in the BLAC for, you know,
3 equality and equity, but thank you for empowering us
4 young members of the BLAC to continue that fight, and
5 we know you're doing to do an amazing job in Albany,
6 and I vote aye on all.

7 CLERK: Richards.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Permission to
9 explain my vote.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: First, I just
12 want to thank Council Member and congratulate Council
13 Member Johnson on a great negotiated project in which
14 the developers themselves are putting up \$100 million
15 in particular to this particular project, and 200
16 units of permanently affordable senior housing, but
17 also something that's near and dear to many
18 communities, and we have a very diverse community his
19 work on ensuring MWBE procurement was in the plan,
20 and also local hiring for NYCHA folk and housing-
21 houses to residents as well. I also wan to
22 congratulate Council Member Espinal on the Tracker
23 and as we go through nearly or at least half dozen
24 re-zonings next year, community re-zonings, this is
25 going to be a critical tool in ensuring that we keep

1
2 commitments that have been given to us by the
3 Administration. Lastly, I want to congratulate the
4 salt of my life, Council Member now Assembly Member
5 Inez Dickens. I just want to thank her for driving
6 up my salt intake with all of the potato chips in
7 every—not just BMC, whatever meeting we were in, she
8 certainly always was a partner in ensuring that—that
9 I had at least some chips to eat. I also want to
10 thank you for driving my blood pressure up as well on
11 many of these days, and I guess it will be lower in
12 BMC now. But seriously, I want to thank you for the
13 work especially citywide around affordable
14 homeownership, which is something so important
15 especially for communities of color, but for
16 everyone. And I know that myself and Council Member
17 Miller share the sentiments. You know, you've helped
18 a lot of families, young families. I've been at a
19 lot of groundbreakings. I really get opportunities to
20 actually live in affordable homeownership. So we
21 thank you for the work that you did in your
22 subcommittees for our communities, and with that, I
23 vote aye.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

25 CLERK: Rose.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Permission to explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: First, I really want to congratulate my colleague in passing legislation that tempers the CSB's reign of terror. I-I really appreciate this legislation, and Land use-

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
[shushing for quiet]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: --items are always arduous, and it's--

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: --very difficult, and so I want to congratulate Council Member Corey Johnson for his tenacity. And last before I vote, I just want to say to Inez Dickens that you leave a very rich legacy here in the City Council, one that's going to be hard to match, and you established the high bard advocacy for your--your constituency.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
[shushing for quiet]

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet down, please.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: So I want to thank you for your compassion in our shared physical

1
2 maladies, and—and I'm really going to miss you. Good
3 luck in Albany. I vote aye on all.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 CLERK: Rosenthal.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Permission to
7 explain my vote.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: First off,
10 Inez, had I known that it's—I ate the potato chips
11 that you brought to BMC. If you would bring some to
12 me today I would have eaten more, but we're really
13 going to miss you, and not push for the potato chips.
14 So good luck, and come back and visit. I—I'm voting
15 aye on all the—oh, and Corey, thank you for knocking
16 that out of the ballpark. You did, however, set the
17 bar too high for the rest of us. So, I mean that's
18 annoying. So, you're welcome. So I just want to say
19 on the CFB bills, thank you to all my colleagues who
20 are thinking of this legislation. Thank you to Alan
21 Maisel for chairing a terrific committee, and I do
22 want to thank the CFB for the work they do. I think
23 it would be worth taking the time to I guess not in
24 time for 2017. Likely we're out of time for 2017,
25 but there's so much that—there are so many

1
2 regulations that are there to correct the mistakes or
3 the—the—the ways people have tried to take advantage
4 of getting public money in the past that we end up
5 hurting ourselves. It's—it's definitely over the
6 top, and the regulations we have in place instead of
7 opening the door—well, while it does to some degree
8 open the door to more candidates because of the
9 matching funds, the regulations are onerous to a very
10 dynamic degree. And I wish we could find a way to
11 achieve our goal, and not put up so many hurdles for
12 people who are just trying to get elected to the City
13 Council. So I vote aye on all. Thank you, Madam
14 Public Advocate.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

16 CLERK: Salamanca.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I would like to
18 congratulate my colleague Corey Johnson on putting
19 together a great deal, and I would like to also wish
20 the Assembly Inez Dickens while in Albany. I vote
21 aye on all.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

23 CLERK: Torres.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I vote aye on
25 all, and I'm going to miss Inez Dickens. I think the

1
2 City Council's loss is the Assembly's gain, and they
3 certainly need a gain. And I want to congratulate my
4 friend Corey Johnson. I think that this negotiation
5 is the latest in a long list of accomplishments that
6 you've been able to put together in the Council. So
7 congratulations.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [shushing for
9 quiet]

10 CLERK: Treyger.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to
12 explain my vote.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: So, I-I, too,
15 want to echo the phrase from my colleague Council
16 Member Corey Johnson for-for negotiating an agreement
17 that I believe does benefit his district, and-and I
18 do want to say that you did fight, and you were
19 successful in fighting for affordable housing for
20 working people in the neighborhood and-and that-that
21 means something. So I want to commend my colleague
22 for that. I also want to commend my colleague
23 Council Member Espinal on his bill that would create
24 better transparency and really ensure that
25 commitments made will be commitments kept to the

1
2 communities, and I think he went through a
3 contentious rezoning, and he made sure that he got a
4 good agreement that benefits his district as well.
5 So I want to commend him on that. And to my
6 colleague and the Chair of Subcommittee Inez Dickens,
7 no one has ever held HPD accountable like Council
8 Member Inez Dickens, and my message to DHCR, you
9 better watch out. So all the best to you. Thank you
10 for your wisdom and your leadership and God bless
11 you. I vote aye on all.

12 CLERK: Ulrich.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Aye on all, and
14 congratulations to Assembly Member Elect Dickens
15 who's been a phenomenal friend to all of us, and a
16 superb public servant here in the City Council. Very
17 sad to see here go. She's a wonderful person, and I
18 know she's going to do a terrific job, and her
19 constituents in Harlem are very lucky to have her.
20 So, long, farewell. We will see you soon. God bless
21 you, and a Merry Christmas, Happy Hanukkah, Happy
22 Kwanzaa and a happy and a healthy New Year. Thank
23 you.

24 CLERK: Vallone.

25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all, and
3 permission to explain my vote, Madam Advocate.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: To my fellow
6 Council Members take these next few days with your
7 family, enjoy them, cherish them. Whatever we
8 celebrate, celebrate the best you can with your
9 hearts. Merry Christmas. David Greenfield, thank
10 you for the Hanukkah delights. I'm a few pounds
11 heavier, but it's always special to share with all of
12 us. And to the Inez, the whole Vallone family I think
13 you have stood with at some point, and we all love
14 you and wish you well, and everyone knows how much I
15 love Christmas. So it is December 15th, so this
16 one's for you. [singing] On the tenth day of
17 Christmas, my true love gave me Inez Dickens in the
18 Assembly.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Oh. [laughter]
20 After you and Merry Christmas everyone. [applause]

21 CLERK: Williams.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Match that.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I will not.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs]
25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I just want to
3 say I'm going to miss you-

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
5 [shushing for quiet]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: --Council
7 Member Dickens and soon to be Assembly Member
8 Dickens, but you are-and you believe in God also
9 known in this-our-our conversation. So thank you.
10 As was mentioned, I think your name is synonymous.
11 It means Harlem, and you've got it before I came
12 here, and you have a track record where folks like me
13 looked up with surprising honor. (sic) So
14 congratulations. I want to speak on Land Use 506 to
15 511, which I will be voting no. To make it clear,
16 this is-I don't want it to appear as if it's a
17 specific vote against Council Member Johnson. You
18 know, I want to just make sure it's known that I
19 believe that he worked hard if not harder than many
20 people in the body on that project based on what is
21 existing. He provided senior housing, landmarks, and
22 they conform to this-a community. My vote is really
23 I've-I've abstained so many times on this kind of
24 vote for the features. This one of the first big
25 projects after the election of Donald Trump, after

1
2 the possible appointment of Ben Carson and a new—I
3 think it's time to step into it now. I vote no on
4 this project, and really push this body and the
5 administration as a collective to do what it is that
6 we say we're going to do. We speak a lot about the
7 homelessness crisis and the affordable housing
8 crisis, and we allow projects to come out of this
9 body that exacerbate that, and I believe make it
10 worse. And then put the onus on very few
11 communities—very few communities to do the job that
12 all of us need to. And so my hope is the
13 conversation will really begin in earnest as a body
14 all of us, not one of us or two of us, but all of us
15 to really take heed to what we said we're going to do
16 in those press conferences that we go to. When we
17 talk about the problems that are going on in the
18 city. So again this no vote is I'm asking the
19 community and any of my colleagues. I congratulate
20 Council Member Johnson for the job that he did, but I
21 think it's time particularly where we are now to
22 really push the conversation a little bit further. I
23 think mixed AMIs are fantastic. So we have to have
24 higher AMIs, but we should not have it without the
25 low ones that are needed. With that, I vote aye on

2 all with the exception of 506 to 511, which I vote no
3 on and accompanying resolutions.

4 CLERK: Matteo.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Thank you. Inez,
6 I want to wish you the best of luck and
7 congratulations to my friend Corey Johnson and the
8 job well done in his district. I want to give a
9 special shout-out to my dad who is home watching.
10 Dad, keep being strong and I love you, and to my
11 colleagues and to all staff and everyone here, Merry
12 Christmas, Happy Hanukkah, Happy Holidays. Let's
13 have a happy and prosperous New Year.

14 CLERK: Van Bramer.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Permission to
16 explain my vote.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: First, I want
19 to start by congratulating Council Member Johnson. I
20 know these are-are-are difficult issues to address as
21 a body, and-and-and, but I do want to say I believe
22 that Council Member Johnson fought very hard and
23 believes in these principles very deeply, and secured
24 an incredibly meaningful deal. I want to give him
25 credit for that. I think it's important to

1
2 acknowledge. Secondly, I want to acknowledge the—the
3 Campaign Finance Board related bill that I passed
4 today. It's the first that my Deputy Chief of Staff
5 and Legislative Director Andreas Vija (sp?) has
6 helped shepherd through, and I want to shout out to
7 Andreas for his work on this. And before I vote aye
8 on all, I just want to say to Inez Dickens there are
9 three moments in particular when I—I think of us. So
10 when I was first name the Chair of the Cultural
11 Affairs in my great committee you took me for a tour
12 of Highland (sic) Cultural Organization, and an
13 amazing lunch, and I—I will never forget that, and I
14 thank you for that. Also, our trip to Israel many
15 years ago, and then you hosted one of the best dinner
16 caucuses ever in the history of the Dinner Caucus
17 with dancing all night, and I—I want to say thank you
18 for all of those moments. But also, the first time
19 that we ever met, you probably don't remember when I
20 was first elected to the State Committee, you were
21 not yet a Council Member, but a very, very important
22 member of the State Committee. And at the Desmond
23 Hotel in Albany, New York. I remember there was
24 contentious issue happening, and I was sitting in the
25 back of the room trying to blend into the woodwork,

1
2 but you were alive and in charge, and I could tell
3 that you were a serious force to be reckoned with.
4 I'll never forget that moment and all of the other
5 moments, but thank you, Council Member and future
6 Assembly Member Dickens for everything, and with
7 that, I vote aye on all.

8 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic]

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Inez,
11 we're certainly going to miss you. I know, I'm going
12 to miss you, and some people that to lead people you
13 must walk inside them, and sometimes in their shoes.
14 You represent the love, the heart, and passion, and
15 the honor of the residents of Harlem. I'm not going
16 to say good-bye. I'll just see you soon. I'll see
17 you at Caucus Weekend. I know you're going to have a
18 fabulous reception. All items on today's General
19 Order Calendar were adopted by a vote of 48 in the
20 affirmative, 0 negative and 0 abstentions—abstentions
21 with the exception of Intro 99-990-A, which was
22 adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative, 1
23 negative and 0 abstentions, and Intro 1356 [pause]
24 Okay. Two amendments.

25 COUNSEL MEMBER MATTEO: There was one.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CLERK: Council Member Matteo

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: I have to change it. Thank you, Madam Public Advocate. I am voting no on 990 and 1358. Aye on the rest.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And we also all say hi to Poppa Matteo who is watching.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Hello to the Matteo Family. Hello Staten Island. [laughs] A Merry Christmas, Happy Hanukkah and Feliz Navidad. [pause] That's okay. Amended vote. All items on today's General Order Calendar were adopted by a vote of 48 in the affirmative, 0 negative and 0 abstentions with the exception of Intro 990-A, which was adopted by a vote of 46 in the affirmative, 2 negatives and 0 abstentions, and Intro 1356, which was adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative, 1 negative and 0 abstentions, and Land Use 506, 507, 508, 509, 510 and 511 with accompanying-with accompanying resolutions, which was adopted by a vote of 44 in the affirmative, 3 negative and 1 abstention and Intro 1358, which was adopted by a vote of 46 in the affirmative, 1 negative, and 1 abstention. Introduction and Reading of Bills.

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All bills are
3 referred to committees as indicated on the agenda.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: No resolutions on
5 the calendar today. We're going to begin general
6 discussions with Assembly Woman Elect, and God is
7 certainly expanding her territory. Ladies and
8 gentlemen, Council Member Inez Dickens.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER INEZ DICKENS: Thank you,
10 Madam Public Advocate. Today, I want to acknowledge
11 the graduate work at the Columbia University who
12 recently concluded a successful campaign among their
13 members to join the Union GWCUAW Local 2110 for the
14 vote of 1602 and 623 be dedicate serve to those to
15 join the ranks of more than 60,000 strong from across
16 the country--

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
18 Keep it down, please.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER INEZ DICKENS: --who--who
20 desire--

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
22 [shushing for quiet]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER INEZ DICKENS: --more
24 political power, better working conditions that
25 increase professional opportunities. This marks a

1
2 major victor for the entire Columbia community with
3 broad scale support for members of Congress, New York
4 elected officials, community leaders, faculty and
5 students. Although the National Labor Relations Board
6 has over the existed allowing the students and
7 graduate workers from unionizing the right to rise.
8 But thanks to the very pervasive arguments, the Board
9 agreed to allow the vote to go forward. Thank you so
10 much Columbia workers, graduate workers and students.
11 And also a today the Mayor (sic) told me that we
12 could congratulate 32BJ--

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
14 [shushing for quiet]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER INEZ DICKENS: --for the
16 airport workers. As of yesterday won their fight.
17 Thank you. God bless and Merry, Merry Christmas, a
18 happy and blessed New Year, Feliz Navidad, a blessed
19 Kwanzaa and Hanukkah. Thank you.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: See you on I-87.
21 Council Member Cornegy.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Madam Public
23 Advocate, I pass.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Okay. Council
25 Member Gibson. [pause] Next. Council Member Barron.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Madam Public Advocate. I just wanted to put my comment on the record. I want to wish my namesake, God's speed, God's protection. Keep your tenacity, keep your bold spirit, keep your outspoken nature, keep fighting for the people, keep getting affordable rents to the community where these developments are going up. I tell people affordable is a dangling participle. You've got to say affordable to whom, and I just want to say also, he's looking for you, he's waiting for you and he will be back. [laughter]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
Council Member Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you very much. On December 9th, we had another construction fatality. Consultants that were working with the Old Domino Sugar factory in Council Member Levin's district, and I will continue to give my—offer condolences and prayers to Wilfredo Enriques' family. I believe that could have been avoided if safety regulations were followed in light of progress and improving safety on the job site. Obviously, we have a long way to go. These are happening too frequently. It's the responsibility of the

1
2 contractors ensure safety of the work site. It's the
3 responsibility of the city to provide proper
4 oversight and effective punishment to insist that
5 this happens. If we cannot just as effectively, we
6 ought to start talking about halts in construction
7 until we can give these a notice. They should not go
8 without government stepping up to do something. On
9 December 14th, it's four years since the Sandy Hills
10 Elementary School shooting took place in Newtown,
11 Connecticut. That was a shocker for many of us, and I
12 actually believe that the massacre of children would
13 allow this country to move in the direction it should
14 be moving. It showed how deeply embedded guns and
15 violence was in this country, but not even that can
16 make us change. Since then, there's been 1,200 mass
17 shootings, and roughly 120,000 Americans have been
18 killed by guns. So as stop and take a moment to one
19 of the young victims, I think we really have to do
20 something to make those numbers really seem as
21 horrible as they are unless they get the same way.
22 (sic) With that, a Happy Malat and Happy to American
23 brothers and sisters, a Happy Hanukkah, Happy
24 Kawanzaa, and Merry Christmas and Happy Festivals to
25 everyone. Thank you.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And our Last
3 speaker for 2016, drum roll, is Council Member
4 Menchaca.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: [Speaking
6 Spanish] and Happy Holidays. Council Members, I call
7 on all of you and our caucuses to sign on and work on
8 to develop a final letter that we got in draft form
9 for the Coalition for Educational Justice. We're
10 really asking the DOE to work with us on a whole
11 bunch of different issues that we have seen spike in
12 our schools after-after the elections. This really
13 calls on us all as community organizations as schools
14 and parents and Council Members to really address the
15 growing harassment and bullying in our schools. This
16 is an opportunity for us to build a plan and commit
17 to bringing the resources that are needed into our
18 schools. I've sat with the-with the Council-with the
19 Chancellor and so many of the superintendents about
20 this issue, and everybody is working really, really
21 hard. I want us to put this on paper. I have a
22 couple letters here on draft form. Let's work
23 together to build something that can actually express
24 the commitment that we have. This will include anti-
25 bias trainings for our principals, parent

1 coordinators and staff. This will include, and is
2 already including that our-know your rights workshops
3 that are already happening right now in our schools.
4 And finally, this is an opportunity to kind of thank
5 all the-the folks in Sunset Park right now that are
6 creating private spaces in their homes, that are
7 opening up their homes to undocumented immigrants,
8 and having Know Your Rights sessions in private homes
9 right now. They're inviting me as a Council Member
10 to talk about the stuff that we're working on here,
11 to talk about the resolution that you heard, the city
12 is a sanctuary city. And I'm just-I want to put this
13 on record that this is happening right now in Sunset
14 Park and it will grow into other communities. And
15 so, if you're out there listening, and you want to
16 host a party, organize a group of people, invite me,
17 invite your local Council Member, we'll bring a
18 lawyer to do the Know Your Rights, and let's really
19 get this information to the hardest to reach people.
20 We know who doesn't come to our rec centers and our
21 parks or our-our schools for these-these events. And
22 so I hope that in 2017, we see a real change, and we
23 can do that together. Thank you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you so much, and now to close the Speaker of the City Council Melissa Mark-Viverito.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madam Public Advocate. Again, to my colleagues thank you for this really productive year and the year to come. Happy Holidays to everyone, and as we keep people in our thoughts and in our prayers, our Budget Director, Latonya McKinney suffered a loss of her mother recently. So please keep her in mind as well, and with that, Happy New Year to everyone, Feliz Navidad, Felix Nuevo, and see you in the next meeting. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And may Auxiliary NYPD Assistance Chief Tony Christo rest in peace.

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date January 5, 2017