

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

----- X

November 28, 2016  
Start: 11:17 a.m.  
Recess: 3:00 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E:

YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Daniel R. Garodnick  
James Vacca  
Margaret S. Chin  
Stephen T. Levin  
Deborah L. Rose  
James G. Van Bramer  
David G. Greenfield  
Costa G. Constantinides  
Carlos Menchaca  
I. Daneek Miller  
Antonio Reynoso  
Donovan J. Richards  
Brad S. Lander  
Helen K. Rosenthal

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Polly Trottenberg  
Commissioner  
NYC Department of Transportation

Michelle Craven  
Senior Executive Director  
Cityscape and Franchises  
NYC Department of Transportation

Jeff Lynch  
Assistant Commissioner  
Intergovernmental and Community Affairs  
NYC Department of Transportation

Jay Walder  
President & CEO  
Motivate

Jules Flynn  
General Manager  
Citi Bike

Dani Simons  
Director of Communications  
Motivate

Paul Steely White  
Executive Director  
Transportation Alternatives

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Tracey Capers  
Executive Vice President  
Programs  
Bedford Stuyvesant Restoration  
Corporation

Christopher DeCicco  
Representative  
Staten Island Borough President  
James S. Oddo

Tom Lucania  
Representative  
Bronx Borough President  
Ruben Diaz, Jr.

Rich Conroy  
Director of Education  
Bike New York

Eric McClure  
Executive Director  
StreetsPAC

Sarah Kaufman  
Assistant Director  
NYU Rudin Center for Transportation

Adrienne Downey  
Representative  
Pratt Center for Community Development

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Nicholas Bedell  
Director of Education  
TWU Local 100

Kate Fillin-Yeh  
Director of Bike Share Initiative  
NACTO

Alfie Palao  
Representative  
Kickstarter

Edith Prentiss  
President, 504 Democratic Club  
Chair, Taxis For All Campaign

Kweli Campbell  
Citi Bike Member

Shaquana Boykin  
NYCHA Citi Bike Member

Benjamin Gonzalez  
Associate Director  
Grants Management  
Interfaith Medical Center

Jhamile Archibald  
Senior Human Resources Coordinator  
UncommonGoods

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Ken Lim  
Benefit Operations Associate  
Justworks Employment Group LLC

Omar Arias  
NYCHA Citi Bike Member

David Greaves  
Publisher  
*Our Time Press*

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

6

[sound check]

[pause]

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Good morning everyone and thank you all for coming to today's Transportation Committee hearing looking at the present and future of Citi Bike in New York City.

My name is Ydanis Rodriguez and I am the Chair of this committee. We are joined today by my colleagues, Council Members Vacca, Chin, Menchaca, and Rose.

I would like to express my deepest condolences to Council Member Daneek Miller and his family upon the loss of his father. My prayers are with him and I regret not being able to attend the funeral this morning.

Just two years ago this committee held a hearing to discuss the precarious position of the New York City bike share program at the time. With questions about insolvency and sustainability, we were unsure that Citi Bike would make it to today. I am glad to say that now there is no doubt that Citi Bike is not only healthy but has taken off. This is thanks to the great partnership between the Mayor,

1  
2 Commissioner Trottenberg, Motivate CEO Jay Walder and  
3 their team, who together got the program back on its  
4 feet.

5 This October, we saw record-breaking  
6 ridership, not only surpassing 2015's total ridership  
7 within ten months, but on October 19 the system saw  
8 over 69,500 single trips. Citi Bike has become the  
9 largest bike share network in America, with over  
10 12,000 bikes so far, concentrated in Lower Manhattan,  
11 northern Brooklyn and western Queens.

12 Citi Bike has also been expanding outward  
13 from its initial footprint. We will soon see blue  
14 bikes in Harlem, Astoria and Crown Heights, creating  
15 more opportunities for residents in these areas, as  
16 well as for tourists eager to see more than Times  
17 Square and the Empire State Building.

18 Over the past five years Citi Bike has  
19 become an integral part of our diverse transportation  
20 network, often doing more than traditional transit to  
21 close transportation deserts in areas like the Far  
22 East Side of Manhattan, Red Hook and the Brooklyn-  
23 Queens waterfront. It is an excellent example of  
24 both a local transportation system, a quick way to  
25 get around your local neighborhood in a more

1  
2 widespread commuter network, with residents capable  
3 of getting to work even if they live many  
4 neighborhoods away. And it has also solved the "last  
5 mile" problem for residents living some distance from  
6 a subway stop.

7           One of the most celebrated parts of Citi  
8 Bike is that the network has done all of this without  
9 any direct public financing. The one concern about  
10 this, however, is that the network has expanded to  
11 predominantly affluent areas, with concerns that to  
12 do otherwise would be financially unsustainable.

13           As Citi Bike is largely concentrated in  
14 the central business district and areas with higher  
15 property values, it has unfortunately come to be  
16 viewed by some as an amenity more than a public good;  
17 a sign of gentrification more than one of  
18 opportunity. If we can change the reality that too  
19 many communities remain disconnected from Citi Bike,  
20 we can quickly change this perception. That's why  
21 today we will be looking at what we as a city can do  
22 to support the continued growth of Citi Bike into  
23 more communities, providing more of our city's  
24 residents with this great resource.



1  
2 To start, I am calling for city dollars  
3 to be earmarked in the FY18 budget to fund a  
4 Phase III expansion aimed at delivering Citi Bike to  
5 the Bronx and in Staten Island while pushing further  
6 north in Manhattan and deeper in Brooklyn and Queens.

7 I am setting a goal today that Citi Bike  
8 should be available in every single community board  
9 in the City of New York by 2020. I am ready to work  
10 with everyone to achieve this goal, from our Speaker  
11 Melissa Mark-Viverito and my colleagues, to Mayor de  
12 Blasio and DOT Commissioner Trottenberg and everyone  
13 on her team, to the private sector partners who have  
14 proven so valuable. It means that we should all  
15 increase our contributions with public and private  
16 capital and expense dollars so that New York City can  
17 be an example to others with bike share in every  
18 neighborhood -- working, middle and upper class New  
19 Yorkers should have access to Citi Bike.

20 It is wonderful that Mayor de Blasio is  
21 committed to bringing Citi Bike citywide and I look  
22 forward to seeing a plan and will work with him to  
23 secure the funding to get it done.

24 The benefits of cycling are clear and are  
25 why this committee has sought to make cycling in New

1  
2 York City safer and more accessible to more New  
3 Yorkers. From the impact on personal health to its  
4 more positive effect on the environment, from its  
5 ability to increase traffic to local small businesses  
6 while decreasing car traffic on our streets,  
7 encouraging cycling is one of the most positive  
8 policies we as a city can promote.

9 Commissioner Trottenberg, yourself and  
10 the DOT have been excellent leaders and partners with  
11 the Council in this effort and I thank you and the  
12 Mayor for your commitment to building out the bike  
13 lane network. I know you, more than most, are  
14 interested in seeing Citi Bike expand beyond its  
15 current borders and we as a committee are interested  
16 in hearing from you about what the next few years of  
17 bike share look like.

18 It is imperative that we turn Citi Bike  
19 fully into a public good, a resource for our lowest  
20 income communities too, and opportunity for growth  
21 and human capital development. It's important that  
22 our students attending every CUNY campus in the city  
23 can get to class on a Citi Bike. It is important  
24 that residents living in some of the poorest  
25 communities, like those in the Bronx and Brownsville,

1  
2 can connect with jobs in other places, even if they  
3 can't afford the soon-to-be even more expensive  
4 subway or bus fares. And it's important that  
5 residents in Staten Island can move about without  
6 relying so heavily on their cars, opening up  
7 opportunities beyond buses and the Staten Island  
8 Railroad. And we should capitalize on prioritizing  
9 locations near subways, ferries and other transit to  
10 ensure quick access to all seeking to move beyond the  
11 transit network. Citi Bike has a distinct ability to  
12 create and grow new business hubs through more  
13 accessible transportation which can lead to more jobs  
14 and more resilient small business.

15 We as a city can get this done and it is  
16 important that we do it this year so that there is no  
17 lag in expansion. Already we have community groups  
18 on the ground looking to increase ridership among  
19 lower-income New Yorkers. In Bed-Stuy, the Bedford-  
20 Stuyvesant Restoration Corporation is working with  
21 local residents to highlight the opportunity Citi  
22 Bike provides as a transportation option, and  
23 memberships have jumped.

24 Citi Bike offers discounts for NYCHA  
25 residents, NYC ID holders and more, and the

1  
2 opportunity to expand this program to drive new  
3 ridership is great. Today I want to issue a call for  
4 city subsidy discount for New Yorkers receiving  
5 public assistance as well to expand access to those  
6 most in need.

7 I am eager to hear not only from the  
8 Administration, but from the many who know bike share  
9 to be an important part of expanding transportation  
10 to disadvantaged communities. I am eager to hear how  
11 we can get this done and how we can get it done as  
12 soon as possible.

13 Before we begin, I would like to thank my  
14 committee staff, Counsel Kelly Taylor, Policy  
15 Analysts Jonathan Masserano, Gafar Zaaloff and Emily  
16 Rooney, and my Chief of Staff Rosa Murphy, and I  
17 welcome Commissioner Trottenberg to the opportunity  
18 to testify and thank her for being with us this  
19 morning.

20 I ask you Committee Counsel Kelly Taylor  
21 to please administer the affirmation.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Will you please raise  
23 your right hand? Do you affirm to tell the truth,  
24 the whole truth and nothing but the truth in your  
25

1 testimony before the committee today and to respond  
2 honestly to council member questions?

3  
4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: We [sic] do.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you.

6 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Alright, thank  
7 you. Shall I get started? Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

8 Good morning and good morning to members of the  
9 Transportation Committee. I am Polly Trottenberg,  
10 Commissioner of the New York City Department of  
11 Transportation. I am joined today by Michelle  
12 Craven, Senior Executive Director of Cityscape and  
13 Franchises and Jeff Lynch, our Assistant Commissioner  
14 of Intergovernmental and Community Affairs. I want  
15 to thank you for bringing us together today to  
16 discuss the current state of New York City's bike  
17 share system and its potential expansion.

18 Mayor de Blasio has laid out a bold goal  
19 of doubling cycling by 2020 and reducing carbon  
20 emissions by 80% by 2050. Today, two and a half  
21 percent of all commuting residents ride a bike to  
22 work or school and 1.6 million New Yorkers ride a  
23 bike regularly. But to achieve the Mayor's vision on  
24 biking and sustainability (one I know many members of  
25 the Council share), we have to continue to up our

1  
2 game and aggressively expand our bike infrastructure  
3 to encourage greater ridership.

4 Right now, the City's growing bike  
5 network includes nearly 1,100 miles of bike lanes,  
6 with 160 miles, including 36 miles of protected  
7 lanes, added since Mayor de Blasio took office. As  
8 you know, DOT is also focused on making our streets  
9 safer for all users with our Vision Zero efforts,  
10 including improved street lighting that makes  
11 cyclists and pedestrians more visible, safety  
12 improvement projects to redesign dangerous  
13 intersections and corridors, adding signs to alert  
14 drivers to the lower 25 mile an hour speed limit, and  
15 speed camera enforcement.

16 Currently, Citi Bike has nearly 120,000  
17 active annual members and plays a critical role in  
18 getting more people on bikes. As the number of  
19 riders within the service area has increased, we  
20 found that the streets are safer for cyclists -- a  
21 fact that has been shown in many studies. These two  
22 factors form a virtuous circle: making cycling safer  
23 and easier encourages more people to cycle, leading  
24 in turn to further safety benefits.

1  
2 Citi Bike has proved to be a remarkable  
3 success (as you noted Mr. Chairman) and has become an  
4 integral part of our transportation network since its  
5 launch only three years ago. But we cannot take this  
6 success for granted -- DOT has worked diligently with  
7 Motivate (and under leadership of Jay Walder) because  
8 we know that bike share systems need constant  
9 improvement and maintenance to operate well.

10 When Mayor de Blasio took office, the  
11 previous operator, Alta Bicycle Share, was facing  
12 significant operational, financial and technical  
13 challenges, and we focused quickly on fixing this  
14 broken system. The City committed to work with the  
15 new operator, Motivate, to turn around the bike share  
16 program and make it a world-class system, all while  
17 keeping the system privately funded.

18 The City took a fresh approach to  
19 renegotiate a new performance-based contract, where  
20 we let the private sector innovate while also meeting  
21 certain standards. This new contract brought in a  
22 more capable operator and vastly improved the system  
23 for riders by guaranteeing a \$30 million investment  
24 by the end of 2017.

1  
2           Since then, as you noted Mr. Chairman, we  
3 have seen a significant improvement to the system  
4 including new equipment and software, better customer  
5 service, stable operations, and a rapidly expanding  
6 service area that will double the original system  
7 size by the end of next year. Since the de Blasio  
8 Administration brought on Motivate, we have reversed  
9 the trend of declining membership and, in fact, have  
10 seen an increase in membership of 42 percent over the  
11 last two years.

12           Working with many members of the Council  
13 over the past two years, DOT and Motivate expanded  
14 the program to Queens for the first time into Long  
15 Island City, and further into Brooklyn and Manhattan.  
16 The program now covers the neighborhoods of  
17 Williamsburg, Greenpoint, Bed-Stuy, Park Slope,  
18 Carroll Gardens, Boerum Hill, Red Hook, and Gowanus,  
19 and the Upper West and Upper East Sides up to 110th  
20 Street. In 2017, we will finish expanding the system  
21 in this phase into even more neighborhoods: Harlem as  
22 far north as 130th Street, Prospect Heights, Crown  
23 Heights, and Astoria.

24

25



1  
2 But that brings us to the question, what  
3 is the full potential of New York City's bike share  
4 system? Where do we go from here?

5 With 10,000 bikes and 610 stations (as  
6 you noted Mr. Chairman), our bike share system is now  
7 the largest in North America. New York City's system  
8 is expected to reach 12,000 bikes and 750 stations by  
9 the end of 2017, putting our system on par with  
10 London and making our program one of the largest in  
11 the world.

12 With the rollout to more neighborhoods,  
13 Citi Bike has recently seen peak ridership of nearly  
14 70,000 rides. Most weekdays this past September and  
15 October saw over 60,000 rides.

16 To put these numbers in perspective, the  
17 number of Citi Bike trips is nearly as high now as  
18 the number of daily Staten Island ferry trips and  
19 more than the number of daily green borough taxi  
20 trips. These growing numbers show how the Citi Bike  
21 network has become a key component to efficiently  
22 moving a growing number of residents, workers and  
23 tourists on our streets.

24 As a transportation system, bike share  
25 works best when one station is just a quick walk away

1 from the next, and stations are sited in highly  
2 visible, safe and accessible locations near  
3 intersections, subway stations and other transit  
4 connections, and major destinations. Laying out  
5 stations in a dense, evenly spaced network is  
6 essential to creating a convenient bike share system  
7 which ensures riders will never have to walk more  
8 than a few minutes to reach any residence, business  
9 or attraction within the service area.  
10

11 At the same time, we face numerous siting  
12 constraints on our city's densely packed streets.  
13 When siting, DOT considers current curb and sidewalk  
14 uses such as fire hydrants, bus stops and other  
15 street furniture, as well as existing travel  
16 patterns, utility locations and building entrances.

17 As part of our siting process, DOT  
18 conducts extensive community engagement that collects  
19 key local input on station locations. We host hands-  
20 on community planning workshops in each new area, and  
21 engage in a thorough dialogue with elected officials,  
22 local leaders, community boards, and other  
23 stakeholders. But we recognize it is hard to reach  
24 everyone and we know we can always do better. We  
25

1  
2 look forward to continuing our work with the Council  
3 on this.

4           New York City streets are always  
5 evolving, and we know that our responsibility to  
6 manage the bike share program does not end when the  
7 stations are installed. DOT's Bike Share unit and  
8 Borough Commissioner Office have put in countless  
9 hours working in established program neighborhoods to  
10 address changing conditions and community concerns as  
11 they arise to ensure the bike share network adapts  
12 but remains strong.

13           We are also working closely with Motivate  
14 and the Council to better serve a more diverse range  
15 of New Yorkers who are under-represented among  
16 cyclists, including immigrants, low-income New  
17 Yorkers, and woman.

18           As part of this effort, NYCHA residents  
19 and members of some credit unions can enjoy a  
20 discounted \$60 annual membership paid in \$5.00  
21 installments each month, which amounts to just two  
22 swipes on a MetroCard. This discount provides a  
23 great benefit because these members can save money on  
24 their overall transportation budget. To date,  
25 Motivate has increased these memberships by 68% in

1  
2 the last year, with now over 1,000 NYCHA members and  
3 nearly 1,000 Community Development Credit Union  
4 members. But clearly, we want to continue to be  
5 creative in promoting and recruiting for these  
6 memberships.

7 In addition, as part of Mayor de Blasio's  
8 effort to promote IDNYC, DOT and Motivate have  
9 implemented a 15% discount on new annual memberships  
10 for IDNYC cardholders. We are proud to offer this  
11 benefit to New Yorkers who have signed up for IDNYC,  
12 and hope this will help increase membership for a  
13 diverse range of residents, especially in the  
14 immigrant community.

15 But even without the discounts, bike  
16 share represents a great transportation value. A  
17 full-priced 12-month membership costs less than two  
18 months of unlimited MetroCards, and the \$15 monthly  
19 charge pays for itself in as few as six forgone  
20 MetroCard swipes.

21 With assistance from a grant from the  
22 national Better Bike Share Partnership, DOT and the  
23 Motivate are partnering with Bedford-Stuyvesant  
24 Restoration Corporation and the NYC Department of  
25 Health to increase Citi Bike use and biking more

1  
2 broadly in Bed-Stuy. Bedford-Stuyvesant Restoration  
3 Corporation has conducted extensive surveys and focus  
4 groups and had conversations with stakeholders to  
5 identify concerns, and then worked systematically  
6 with partners to remove those barriers to cycling.  
7 As Bedford-Stuyvesant Restoration Corporation will  
8 tell you later today, the visible participation of  
9 elected officials and other community leadership in  
10 rides and events has been an essential part of their  
11 work.

12           Towards the goal of growing Citi Bike  
13 memberships in all communities, DOT and Motivate have  
14 already started working with Council Members on  
15 promoting the bike share program through events,  
16 social media and newsletters, and we look forward to  
17 increasing this work with the council in the coming  
18 months.

19           Now, I would like to turn to the  
20 discussion of the future of Citi Bike.

21           First, we want to be clear that we still  
22 have lots of work to do to finish and fine tune the  
23 current Phase II expansion, so that we can lay the  
24 proper foundation for the future of the program.

25

1  
2 As we look at the completion of Phase II  
3 of Citi Bike next fall, we know there is significant  
4 demand to expand to additional neighborhoods, and  
5 given this demand, the City and Motivate have started  
6 preliminary discussions to consider a potential  
7 Phase III expansion.

8 When the Citi Bike program began in 2013,  
9 we started in the densest parts of the central  
10 business district, where it would be easiest to  
11 enroll large numbers of quickly and also benefit from  
12 tourists purchasing day passes. The density of the  
13 central business district provided great revenue  
14 potential from the high annual rider membership, day  
15 pass sales and advertising that really helped kick  
16 start the program with no public funding.

17 We have since expanded well beyond those  
18 core areas with even more to come next year. But  
19 with each new area does come new challenges and DOT  
20 and Motivate are still learning how the system  
21 functions in these neighborhoods, in terms of  
22 membership, ridership patterns, and finances. Like  
23 many other bike share systems, we have found the  
24 central challenge of operating the system is the  
25 rebalancing of the bikes. Motivate needs to keep

1  
2 enough bikes on the street, in good working order,  
3 and exactly where and when riders want them.

4           Since New York is a heavily congested  
5 city of islands and waterways, this does present real  
6 rebalancing challenges. The tremendous flow of Citi  
7 Bikes into Midtown and Lower Manhattan during the  
8 morning rush means stations in neighborhoods in the  
9 Upper East and Upper West Sides and Park Slope often  
10 sit empty until bikes return in the evening. Some of  
11 the busiest commuter hubs, like Penn Station, also  
12 present challenges because meeting the demand there  
13 could take up the majority of bikes in the entire  
14 system. And I know from personal experience, for  
15 example, the docks next to Prospect Park are so  
16 popular that they are hard to keep full.

17           In some ways this is a good problem to  
18 have because it shows how incredibly popular the  
19 system is with New Yorkers, and DOT and Motivate are  
20 firmly committed to meeting these rebalancing demands  
21 and further improving the system as we move forward.

22           We all agree that the City's interest is  
23 in having a well-operated and affordable bike share  
24 system benefiting as many New Yorkers as possible  
25 while retaining the system's financial viability.

1 Motivate and the City are both interested in  
2 expanding the network even further and all aspects of  
3 how to do so are part of our ongoing discussions.  
4

5 The model for Citi Bike thus far -- a  
6 public-private partnership with corporate sponsorship  
7 and no public subsidy -- does have advantages and  
8 limitations. If we move forward with a Phase III  
9 expansion into less dense neighborhoods throughout  
10 the five boroughs, it is likely that some public  
11 funds will be necessary and we must determine the  
12 appropriate level of public investment for this  
13 privately run transportation system.

14 We know the Council is particularly  
15 interested in the question of public subsidy to the  
16 bike share system. Changing the contractual model  
17 from one that is entirely privately funded to one  
18 that includes public funds does raise questions.  
19 Having a system run by private sector experts allows  
20 them to bring their unique strengths including an  
21 entrepreneurial and creative approach and we need to  
22 assess how public funding would change that  
23 relationship.

24 As we consider Phase III, we are weighing  
25 the questions of cost, geographic spread, equity,



1  
2 pace of expansion, community interest, presence or  
3 installation of bicycle infrastructure, and potential  
4 ridership, while also acknowledging that we want  
5 Motivate to be financially viable. We also want to  
6 be sure that the three different phases each receive  
7 equal operational treatment, which is complicated by  
8 these factors.

9           There will also be challenges in the  
10 contract administration if we modify the contract to  
11 include public funding. Many program factors, such  
12 as the ownership of equipment, funding sources,  
13 percentage of revenue share, siting and maintenance,  
14 will need to be carefully considered and negotiated  
15 as part of any new agreement.

16           Nonetheless, we are excited of the future  
17 possibilities of Citi Bike; we look forward to  
18 working with our partner Motivate, elected officials  
19 including each of you on the Council, and community  
20 groups to continue to maximize the benefits of Citi  
21 Bike for as many New Yorkers as possible.

22           Thank you for the chance to testify today  
23 and look forward to your questions.

24           CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you  
25 Commissioner. I also would like to recognize Council

1  
2 Members Lander, Garodnick, Van Bramer, and Reynoso.

3 I have a few questions, and my colleagues, they also  
4 have other questions.

5 Let me start out with the -- if you can  
6 elaborate a little bit more -- to the end of your  
7 testimony where you said that there will be  
8 challenges in contract administration if we modify  
9 the contract to include public funding. First of  
10 all, for me this conversation is taking place with  
11 individuals and leaders that you are open [sic]; that  
12 you are committed to understand that Citi Bike should  
13 be aimed as a mode of transportation where working  
14 class, they should also have access to, and unless we  
15 are able to bring some public dollars, it is  
16 impossible to believe that all the neighborhoods in  
17 our city, especially those New Yorkers living on the  
18 poverty line who live in transportation desert areas  
19 that could benefit with Citi Bike, they will have  
20 access to unless we are able to, at least to discuss  
21 and explore the possibility on bringing public  
22 dollars. So can you elaborate a little bit more  
23 about what are the challenges and how open is the  
24 Administration to continue this conversation with the  
25 other stakeholders also?

1  
2                   COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Yeah, and  
3 again, as I mentioned in my testimony, New York City  
4 bike system is really unique; I think it's the only  
5 one that I know of that does not involve public  
6 subsidy, and that's the decision that the previous  
7 administration made when they started the system and  
8 one that the de Blasio Administration has continued,  
9 but that does put some limitations on how the system  
10 expands. All city bike systems sort of follow the  
11 same principal, which is they want to be in dense  
12 areas and they want to be in contiguous areas. If  
13 you have satellites of bikes that aren't connected to  
14 the whole system, that's not going to work  
15 operationally. So we are certainly, as we have done  
16 in Phase II, looked to build out all around what was  
17 basically the initial core of the dense part of  
18 Manhattan and a small part of Brooklyn; we're now  
19 continuing to build out. But as you correctly point  
20 out, Mr. Chairman, the further the system gets out,  
21 to some ways you're going to have more complexity in  
22 terms of number of riders you're going to get,  
23 potential for advertising revenue, you know, tourist  
24 dollars; some of the things that I think have helped  
25 so far make this a privately funded model.

1  
2 As I said in my testimony, the  
3 Administration and Motivate have certainly been  
4 talking about potentially what the next phase could  
5 look like and you know, how we might alter this  
6 public-private partnership and what role public  
7 dollars might play, and obviously that's a  
8 conversation we're going to need to have very closely  
9 with the Council; I don't think we've completely  
10 resolved that yet, but we're certainly open to those  
11 discussions and starting to talk to Motivate about  
12 that.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. So in  
14 summary, the Administration is open to continue  
15 conversation with Motivate to be open with a deal  
16 [sic], explore whatever has to be addressed and  
17 looking **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

18 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: And again,  
19 that very much requires the Council to be a part of  
20 that discussion.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. And I  
22 just want to move from there to go answered [sic] and  
23 leave the door open and we should continue  
24 conversations. But my point is; inequality is real  
25 in New York City, you know and there's something that

1  
2 we should learn from the previous presidential  
3 election nationwide is that we as a city also have  
4 our own challenges and I would like to see as many of  
5 the 8.5 million New Yorkers to be moved to be part of  
6 the middle class and the upper class, so the way how  
7 I see Citi Bike is a mode of transportation that was  
8 structured basically to serve New Yorkers who live in  
9 the financial area; it was not intended to be a  
10 citywide mode of transportation. I think that under  
11 your leadership and Jay Walder and the whole team,  
12 you were able to rescue, because from my end, with  
13 the information that we were able to get, you know  
14 Citi Bike was almost ready to disappear because  
15 financially it didn't make sense, and you were able  
16 to work and the Mayor and yourself and the whole  
17 other team [sic] to put this plan together. But my  
18 thing is, without those public dollars, many New  
19 Yorkers who live in the south Bronx, in other places  
20 that they don't have access to a bus or the train,  
21 probably Citi Bike will become a mode of  
22 transportation that they can use -- for a principal  
23 or someone working in the school district to be able  
24 to move through different schools on a bike without  
25 waiting for the bus or the train or walking like ten

1  
2 blocks or take a bus, so you know I just hope that we  
3 can continue that conversation, exploring the public  
4 dollars. How is the program funded right now?

5 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean right  
6 now, again, this... right now, again -- I think my  
7 microphone has gone dead on me here. Hang on  
8 **[inaudible]**. Right now, as I've said, you know we  
9 have a public-private partnership model in which the  
10 City does not put in public funds, Motivate has  
11 generated revenue through sponsorship, and now the  
12 revenue that's coming in from membership, and you  
13 know so far I think it has proved a robust financial  
14 model and you know obviously you're hear more from  
15 Jay to give you more detail on Motivate's finances,  
16 but I think so far it's proved a good arrangement;  
17 there's no question as we move into a phase where for  
18 example we'd be putting in public dollars, we'd have  
19 to figure out how to integrate that into what right  
20 now is a public-private partnership in which there  
21 are not public dollars being invested.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: How do you see,  
23 from your own end, the expansion of Citi Bike in the  
24 short- and the long-term?

1  
2                   COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well as I  
3 said, you know talking about Phase II -- which we are  
4 well into, although we'll be still getting to a few  
5 more neighborhoods next year, I think Prospect  
6 Heights and Crown Heights and up into Astoria -- you  
7 know, as I said in my testimony, I think it's been  
8 wildly successful and the membership numbers have  
9 been great, but rebalancing is a challenge and one,  
10 again, that all bike share systems grapple with but  
11 one that I think we need to make sure we've really  
12 got right for Phase II, and as you add new  
13 neighborhoods, we're discovering that then travel  
14 patterns change as well, so it's very much an  
15 iterative system. You know as we continue to expand  
16 the neighborhood, figuring out how to make sure we  
17 can get the bikes where they need to be for our  
18 riders I think is going to be absolutely key. And  
19 you know look, New York City is a city of islands and  
20 certainly, particularly in our congested areas -- I  
21 know Jay will probably talk about it -- they  
22 certainly have their challenges storing bikes, moving  
23 them around; getting them repaired, that is actually  
24 I think probably the most complicated factor in the  
25 continued expansion.

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. Let me  
3 call on my other colleagues who also have questions;  
4 then I'll come back to other questions. Council  
5 Member Chin.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you Chair.  
7 Thank you for the testimony. It's great to see, you  
8 know Citi Bike doing well from the beginning and  
9 we're talking about expansion and I know that a lot  
10 of residents in my district, especially in Lower  
11 Manhattan, do use Citi Bike, I mean we have stations  
12 everywhere, including in front of NYCHA developments,  
13 which is great for everyone, and I also see a lot of  
14 immigrant families taking advantage of this program.  
15 How do you continue to do outreach to these  
16 neighborhoods, in terms of NYCHA residents and -- I  
17 know you offer discounts -- but how are you working  
18 with NYCHA to make sure people know about these  
19 programs and also, in immigrant communities, where  
20 they don't... I mean where they speak other languages;  
21 are there like outreach materials in different  
22 languages to really encourage more people to take  
23 advantage of the program?

24 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yes, we've  
25 actually been doing a lot of promotion of Citi Bike,



1  
2 and I was actually this summer at an event with the  
3 Speaker in some of her NYCHA projects in Upper  
4 Manhattan; we put materials out in multiple  
5 languages; we have -- both DOT and Motivate folks can  
6 talk about that -- set up tables and we have people  
7 who are multilingual, and we're doing a lot to really  
8 promote that discounted fair; we're also trying to  
9 organize rides and other events, but again, this is  
10 an area where I think Council Members can play such a  
11 crucial role in helping to get the work out, I mean  
12 it really -- when you think about, again, just the  
13 cost of two swipes of a MetroCard you're out over  
14 \$5.00; for \$5.00 a month unlimited rides, I mean it  
15 really is terrific bargain and we would love to  
16 continue to work with you all; we've done our best to  
17 do a lot of promotional efforts, but I clearly think  
18 there's room for us to do a lot more.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Well I think all my  
20 colleagues, we all want to work with you to really do  
21 that expansion. So when you choose a neighborhood  
22 that you're going to expand to, how do you kind of  
23 get engaged with that neighborhood to make sure that  
24 the stations are put in the right place and -- I know  
25 in the beginning there were a lot of surveys done

1  
2 online to identify different neighborhoods, but are  
3 you doing the same thing, in terms of new  
4 neighborhoods that you are going into?

5           COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I mean when we  
6 go into a neighborhood, we have a pretty extensive  
7 process and look, and as I testified, I think we have  
8 an extensive process -- I won't say that it's a  
9 perfect process and I think we're looking always for  
10 more ways to get the word out -- I mean we announce  
11 when we're going into the neighborhood, we have  
12 workshops where we work with community board and  
13 electeds to have local residents come in and put on  
14 the map where they think they want stations; we have  
15 to look at our own siting criteria for stations, and  
16 this is something that can be very complicated;  
17 Manhattan is a great example where you have a lot of  
18 things on the street -- fire hydrants, loading zones,  
19 building entrances -- trying to find those key places  
20 where you can fit the stations, we do the best we can  
21 to minimize parking loss; to minimize inconvenience,  
22 and I think we've tried our hardest there. You know  
23 once we pick the locations, we publicize that. But  
24 look, there's certainly a phenomenon where not  
25 everyone is following everything we're doing and you

1  
2 know we certainly hear -- when the systems first come  
3 in, people have a lot of questions -- I'm happy to  
4 say and I'm just -- I live myself in a neighborhood  
5 that just got it this summer -- my Council Member's  
6 giving a happy sign -- and certainly when we put the  
7 stations in there are a lot of people who said oh, I  
8 wish I had known more about this. But I think now  
9 that the system's taking hold, you know membership is  
10 growing there and people are really, really loving  
11 the system. That said, and I know we worked with  
12 you, Council Member Chin, for example, on Elizabeth  
13 Street; if there are stations that are particular  
14 problems we're always willing to talk to Council  
15 Members and community boards and you know make  
16 adjustments as needed, with the caveat that we can't  
17 always be moving everything around; we have to keep a  
18 system that's going to work in terms of spacing and  
19 convenience, but where there are particular hot spots  
20 -- we know this is a system that evolves and uses on  
21 the street have also -- you know again, our  
22 commitment is always to try and work best we can when  
23 there are areas where we're having really big  
24 problems... [interpose]

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: No, I do appreciate  
3 that; I mean that was going to be one of my next  
4 questions -- if a community doesn't like the station,  
5 how do you work with them to remove it. I think the  
6 one on Elizabeth Street makes sense; after a couple  
7 of years, and I really thank DOT for working with us,  
8 because it got moved to another street, on Grand  
9 Street, right next to a protected bike lane, which is  
10 a perfect location, but you know, Grand Street was  
11 under reconstruction so it took a longer time, but  
12 the other station in my district, right now it's on  
13 Petrosino Square, on a plaza where it's supposed to  
14 be designed for public art, and the community doesn't  
15 want it there and when I scout out the area, you can  
16 actually put a station just a block north of there on  
17 Lafayette Street. So we really want to work with DOT  
18 to make sure that we don't take away public spaces  
19 that are important to the community. But the other  
20 consideration is that -- like my colleague has talked  
21 about -- is really looking at stations where they're  
22 not close to public transportation; I think that's  
23 something that's key in terms of expansion because we  
24 do want people to be able to use this mode of  
25 transportation to get to work to visit family when

1  
2 they're not that close to the subway station or they  
3 have to take like two buses to get to the subway. So  
4 those are the neighborhoods I think we really need to  
5 look at to take priority as public good that we need  
6 to really work on those and uh... [interpose]

7           COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well thank  
8 you. And again, I mean we're always interested in  
9 public input and input from elected officials and  
10 again, sometimes people have made great suggestions  
11 that cause us to move the station; you know again I  
12 will just have to caution, I mean, I don't know that  
13 there is ever going to be a perfect location where  
14 everybody is happy, so you know we have to balance  
15 trying to maximize the efficiency of the system, the  
16 coverage, putting it in places where we know people  
17 will use it, sort of making the maximum number of  
18 people happy; I don't know that I can promise  
19 everywhere all the time we will make everybody happy,  
20 unfortunately.

21           COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: But we'll work on  
22 it.

23           COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: We will  
24 continue to work on it.

25           COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you Chair.

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So next Council  
3 Member Menchaca, and I'm sorry, but we're going to be  
4 putting five minutes. Sorry.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay; we've got  
6 it. Thank you, Chair. No worries; I've got five  
7 minutes, Commissioner.

8 So I wanted to first really underscore  
9 something you mentioned about this public-private  
10 partnership and I understand the analysis that went  
11 with the previous administration on the necessity for  
12 such a thing, but I want to challenge you on one of  
13 those pieces, which is that this is essentially not  
14 going to work unless it's a contiguous system, so the  
15 expansions are really going to be under one kind of  
16 premise. What is preventing us from -- and then I'll  
17 insert one of my pieces of legislation that really  
18 looks at parks, for example, as closed network  
19 systems; we're going to be pushing you to do that and  
20 DOT said no, and I know that's not on today's docket,  
21 but there are some cases that are going to be made in  
22 today's testimony; we're going to hear from a union  
23 and we're going to hear from a whole bunch of  
24 different advocates about rethinking that. What is  
25 preventing us from actually analyzing a possible

1  
2 closed system outside of the areas? And if you can  
3 just kind of hit that really quick and I have some  
4 other questions as well.

5 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: No, and look,  
6 obviously I'm interested -- we'll hear today what the  
7 testimony is -- I just think thus far it has been the  
8 custom in bike share systems to try and keep it  
9 contiguous, and I will confess; even now a bike share  
10 system that is Manhattan -- you know, still a modest  
11 sliver of Queens and a decent section of Brooklyn,  
12 we're having our challenge keeping the bikes  
13 appropriate balanced. So I think the fear is if you  
14 do a far-flung sort of disconnected piece of the  
15 system, you're sort of describing it as closed, but  
16 there's probably nothing stopping it from not -- you  
17 know, suppose you put it in a park and then everybody  
18 bikes to Downtown Brooklyn and then getting the bikes  
19 back to that far-flung place, it's just more costly  
20 and difficult. I'll be interested to hear what  
21 everyone has to say today, but I just want to be I  
22 think sort of honest about the fact that rebalancing  
23 is the key to a good city bike system; if all the  
24 bikes flow out of one area in the morning and then  
25 they're not available during the day and they don't

1  
2 come back till the night; that's not the optimal  
3 system I think; we want a system where bikes are  
4 generally available in all parts of the system on a  
5 pretty regular basis, and achieving that, even in a  
6 contiguous area, we're still fine tuning that. So  
7 you know, moving to sort of disconnected far-flung  
8 places, you do have to think through how the  
9 logistics of that would work.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And I'm hoping  
11 that we go and review those logistics together; I  
12 think that there's some things that will flow out of  
13 that, including public health questions and some of  
14 the questions around including infrastructure that's  
15 closed can actually add new layers of need for  
16 communities that need public health programs that can  
17 use the Citi Bike for health concerns rather than a  
18 commuter A to B location. And so does DOT have plans  
19 in really creating a public health initiative that's  
20 connected to Citi Bike rather than the kind of first  
21 impetus of tourists can get around the city to shop?  
22 Could there be a public health program that's on its  
23 way...? [crosstalk]

24 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well I... I... I  
25 think the first impetus for the system, and certainly



1  
2 it is the priority of this administration, it is not  
3 for tourists to shop; it's for regular New Yorkers to  
4 get to destinations and that is the majority of what  
5 the system is used for. Tourists definitely provide  
6 a piece of the revenue, but they're not the bulk of  
7 the system. I think the problem is... I know where  
8 you're sort of going -- can we have more bikes around  
9 parks or things like that -- but I don't know how you  
10 make that self-contained; if someone's a Citi Bike  
11 member, then I assume we would want them to be able  
12 to ride the bikes to any Citi Bike station. Again, I  
13 think we're interested to explore some of these ideas  
14 with you; I don't mean to shut them down; I just want  
15 to sort of talk about, again, rebalancing I think is  
16 the key to doing this well and I'd hate to have us be  
17 in far-flung areas and we can never get the bikes  
18 there and people aren't getting the quality of  
19 service that we want them to have.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you and  
21 we'll follow up with that as well.

22 And finally, it's no secret that Citi  
23 Bike is now becoming a symbol of gentrification;  
24 we're just months after Red Hook getting its new  
25 expansion, and so I'm listening to people and I think

1  
2 that's a real issue and when I think about NYCHA, Red  
3 Hook, east and west, and I think about the things  
4 that we could be doing to connect people and  
5 pipelines to work, what's the role for DOT in really  
6 addressing the gentrification issue and connecting  
7 people to jobs, connecting people to the real  
8 stories, and there's some folks from Sunset Park here  
9 today that said look, I know that Motivate is hiring  
10 locally, I see them on my block, but that can't be  
11 the only way people get the full understanding that  
12 there's a real pipeline for jobs, and especially  
13 since the union has come in there's been real  
14 dedicated opportunities for high-wage jobs. So tell  
15 me a little bit about your role and your  
16 responsibility as DOT.

17 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Right. And  
18 look, I think one of the things that we are proud  
19 about when we renegotiated the contract with Motivate  
20 is that they did put their headquarters here in New  
21 York in Sunset Park, and I'll give Jay and his team  
22 credit; they've worked hard to hire locally, to do  
23 training, and right, to pay real living wages and  
24 good benefits and so [bell] I think they've been a  
25

1  
2 tremendous asset to the City in that regard in  
3 helping providing some really decent jobs.

4           You know I certainly know that there is a  
5 belief **[inaudible]** we get it as we're continuing to  
6 build out our bike lanes, but there is a strong  
7 correlation between bicycle usage and gentrification  
8 and I think that's something -- look, we need to work  
9 closely with you all on that. One of the, basically,  
10 the truisms in transportation (and there have been a  
11 lot of studies that have bore this out); for low-  
12 income people, the more jobs they can connect to in a  
13 reasonable commute time is a tremendous indicator of  
14 social and economic mobility and progress and that's  
15 something that's been going on in Harvard studies and  
16 NYU studies, and so particularly, for example, in a  
17 neighborhood like Red Hook where it's very hard to  
18 connect to the subway; where it's long distances to  
19 connect to the job centers, having another  
20 transportation mode can be a really key piece of that  
21 economic puzzle. You know and again, I hope we can  
22 work with you all on this. I mean look, this is not  
23 just true in New York, I used to live in Washington,  
24 D.C.; there was a big belief there was a strong  
25 correlation between bikes and gentrification and I

1  
2 really hope people will view Citi Bike as something  
3 much more utilitarian, as really a tool to help you  
4 connect to the subway, to connect to jobs; not just  
5 as a sign of gentrification.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member  
8 Rose.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you, Chair  
10 and good morning, Commissioner. And frankly, I'm  
11 envious of my colleagues' problems, because I don't  
12 know if everyone here knows; I'm a Council Member  
13 from Staten Island and we don't have any Citi Bikes.

14 So I was just wondering, how will the  
15 expansion of locations be determined and is there a  
16 plan to expand to Staten Island, and has there been a  
17 survey done that indicates that Citi Bike is viable  
18 or not viable, because we haven't seen any? And then  
19 I have a question about other contributing factors.

20 We are a burgeoning waterfront community  
21 now and there seems to be quite a bit of opportunity  
22 and so I'm not quite sure what the metrics were in  
23 determining that Staten Island wouldn't even have one  
24 or sort of a pilot program. So I'm wondering, you  
25 know, are there plans to expand to Staten Island?

1  
2 What are you looking at in terms of locations?

3 What's needed and how soon?

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Thank you for  
5 the questions. As I had testified, the Mayor has  
6 said that he wants a five-borough system and that  
7 would include Staten Island. Typically, when we're  
8 looking to expand the system we're looking  
9 particularly in terms of what the density of the  
10 neighborhood looks like; we also like to take into  
11 consideration what the bike infrastructure looks  
12 like, what the bike lanes on the ground are, 'cause  
13 obviously, one of the things we're so pleased and  
14 proud of with Citi Bike is that it has had a  
15 tremendous safety record so far -- thank heavens;  
16 I'll knock on wood for that -- and that's in part  
17 because I think we've done an excellent job of siting  
18 stations near the existing bike network. I think as  
19 we look to Staten Island, certainly the area that  
20 would be under consideration as you district would be  
21 the north shore as the place where you have the most  
22 density and obviously a lot of new development coming  
23 in and you know, potential real interest and  
24 excitement in membership. You know, as I am saying,  
25 we're still just I think in the.. you know, not the..

1 we're still in somewhat early phases of the  
2 discussions, but that would be the logical place to  
3 start on Staten Island. And that does potentially,  
4 you know, sort of raise the question that Council  
5 Member Menchaca asked -- would that be basically its  
6 own standalone system; would folks perhaps take the  
7 bikes on the ferry and go to other -- it probably  
8 doesn't make sense; you'd probably just drop your  
9 bike off at St. George, get on the ferry and then  
10 pick one up at White Hall. So we'd have to work  
11 through those logistical details, but Staten Island  
12 probably would be an example of likely its own  
13 system, unless we can at some point prevail upon the  
14 MTA to put a bike lane on the Verrazano Bridge and  
15 then you would have that connection.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I know that, you  
18 know, to much resistance, we adopted bike lanes and  
19 it just seems counterintuitive to not have Citi Bike  
20 and to have bike lanes, and I wouldn't want it only  
21 to be insulated to just the waterfront; I really do  
22 see this much as Council Member Menchaca, as a mode  
23 of transportation for communities that need to get to  
24 the ferry terminal.

1  
2           So originally, was it that sidewalk space  
3 is an issue or the crowding of sidewalks and do we  
4 sort of share the space with pedestrians and you  
5 know, do you see this as an obstacle not only to  
6 Staten Island, where we tend not to have large  
7 sidewalk spaces, but also in Manhattan, do you see  
8 sidewalk space and shared space as a problem in terms  
9 of the expansion plan?

10           COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: It is  
11 certainly -- one of the challenges we face is siting  
12 of the stations, they are generally three places we  
13 can put them -- we can put them in the roadway, which  
14 oftentimes, not always, but oftentimes means we have  
15 to take out some parking; we can put them on the  
16 sidewalk, and wherever we can put them on the  
17 sidewalk we will, but for example, in a lot of parts  
18 of Manhattan the sidewalks are just too crowded, it  
19 is very difficult to accommodate bike share stations  
20 there. We can also sometimes put them in locations  
21 which are neither plazas, other places like that, and  
22 we're certainly interested, particularly perhaps if  
23 we want to do more stations [bell] in Midtown  
24 Manhattan, seeing if we can use some of the POPS,  
25 some of the privately owned public spaces there;

1  
2 those might be good places to put bikes where we  
3 don't have to take out either sidewalk space or  
4 roadway space. But that is certainly a question;  
5 when we come to your neighborhood, you know, folks  
6 have to sort of help be part of that decision about  
7 are we giving up sidewalks or are we giving up  
8 roadways; how do we do it in a way that we can get  
9 adequate space for the stations and minimize the  
10 disruption.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And I know my time  
12 is up -- I just want to know; is there like a time a  
13 time frame for this to happen?

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I can't yet  
15 give you a time frame; again, we're in discussions..  
16 [crosstalk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay, Commissioner,  
18 we've been part of the five boroughs now for..  
19 [crosstalk]

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I know. I  
21 know, well...

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: a very long time.

23 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: As I say, we  
24 are still working our way through Phase II, and  
25



1 again, I think it's a tremendous **[inaudible]**...

2 [crosstalk]

3  
4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And we're not part  
5 of Phase II.

6 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: No, no, but  
7 I'm just saying, in terms of the timeline, we're  
8 still in the middle of Phase II, we haven't even  
9 gotten through it yet, so we are starting Phase III  
10 discussions, but I can't yet give you a timeline for  
11 Phase III.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay. Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Commissioner,  
14 before I call on the next Council Member, can we  
15 agree that the view, the way of how we are trying to  
16 look at Citi Bike today is -- or based on your  
17 experience as someone new taking responsibility to  
18 overseeing Citi Bike, working with the private  
19 sector, as someone that you and your team were  
20 working with a new phase, **[inaudible]** also with Citi  
21 Bike and be able to rescue Citi Bike from the  
22 financial difficulty? At the beginning, you know  
23 Citi Bike was mainly in the financial district; most  
24 New Yorkers who were using Citi Bike, they didn't  
25 have to walk many blocks to get into the train, so it

1  
2 didn't come as a mode of transportation to compliment  
3 the train or the buses, and now we are... but our  
4 approach at the Council today is, can Citi Bike serve  
5 as the additional mode of transportation in  
6 transportation desert communities where we know that  
7 we will not be building a 2nd Avenue subway; that we  
8 will not be able to expend you know like \$10-15  
9 billion, but there are areas -- do we recognize... and  
10 I know that... we've been working together on this  
11 issue; I know that you've been doing the best you can  
12 to connect isolated communities with the buses and  
13 trains, and the Mayor also with the BQX streetcar,  
14 you know he also took that approach; he said, let me  
15 think outside the box and think about other sources  
16 of transportation that I can connect the Brooklyn  
17 community... [crosstalk]

18 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: And ferries as  
19 well.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Exactly. So  
21 today, when we're thinking about Citi Bike -- and I  
22 just want to know if we are on the same page -- we  
23 are looking at Citi Bike as the additional mode of  
24 transportation that also should be expanded to all  
25 community boards in New York City. We know that the

1  
2 private sector, they will not be able to do it by  
3 themselves, because it's not enough to say there is a  
4 Citi Bike station in a particular area where the rest  
5 of New Yorkers, they can take the bike from there to  
6 other locations if there is not a movement of people  
7 renting back and forth from the location. So are we  
8 -- based on the experience that you had with  
9 negotiating the Citi Bike, trying to make it more  
10 healthy; do we recognize that the approach that we  
11 are trying to bring to Citi Bike today is different  
12 from what Citi Bike was intended to be or it was  
13 mainly in the financial district?

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: I think you  
15 absolutely put your finger on it, Mr. Chairman; we're  
16 clearly contemplating a different operating model for  
17 the future phases of Citi Bike. I think the initial  
18 goal was to get a system that was up and running that  
19 would be self-sustaining. And look, I think there  
20 are actually parts of Manhattan, you know, far east  
21 and far west sides, where this did really help  
22 connect folks to the subway; I don't want to say that  
23 none of that happened, but obviously, relatively  
24 speaking, there are certainly parts of the city that  
25 are much bigger transit deserts. But again, as we

1  
2 shift into that model -- and we, you know, we  
3 certainly appreciate the notion of the model of  
4 getting those transit deserts, of helping people who  
5 really don't have good connections to jobs and  
6 opportunities, that this can be a piece of that.

7           But I think it's worth maybe -- I'll take  
8 a minute just to talk a little bit about the numbers,  
9 to help kind of put this in scale. I think we found  
10 -- and Jay may testify about this as well --  
11 operationally we've been able, between DOT and  
12 Motivate, to put in about 2,000 bikes a year; that's  
13 what it's taken us in terms of doing the mapping, the  
14 very important public engagement, the siting on the  
15 streets, the equipment ordering, the installation, to  
16 getting the operational piece **[inaudible]**. So and  
17 estimations are -- and this is a very rough number,  
18 so please take it with a grain of salt, but the price  
19 tag for doing that is around \$12 million for all the  
20 installation; there is an operating cost on top of  
21 that that I have to admit, I think we don't have a  
22 totally good handle on because the system is still  
23 pretty new. So I don't... if I had to take a guess on  
24 how many bikes we would need to cover the whole city  
25 -- I don't know; maybe Motivate will have a thought

1 about that, but I mean it's probably 60,000, I don't  
2 know; something like that. I'm looking over at our  
3 experts here -- no, he's saying even higher -- 70-  
4 80,000. So just to give us a sense of the scale of  
5 what basically the capital investment would be -- and  
6 then there's an operational piece on top of that that  
7 I think we're still... you know again, we even have  
8 this expanded system; big parts of it have only been  
9 up and running for a couple of months, so I don't  
10 know that we yet even have a full grasp of what the  
11 operational costs are going to look like. So again,  
12 to work out at what rate -- if we're going to put  
13 public dollars in -- at what rate the Mayor and the  
14 Council are prepared to do that; what rate of  
15 operational subsidy we're willing to put in  
16 essentially in perpetuity; how the private sector,  
17 you know what piece of this will they be able to  
18 monetize and see as revenue. I think -- you know  
19 those are big questions that we're still working  
20 through, so that's just, for us, grappling with the  
21 numbers, that's what it looks like.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And I think that,  
24 you know it is important to share that in the last --  
25 when we were discussing the 2017 budget, we had

1  
2 conversations; you know, myself, Council Member  
3 Lander and others, we expressed our commitment to put  
4 the money where our mouth was and it was saying, we  
5 are ready to bring, from our own Council Members'  
6 individual investment in capital, at least \$25  
7 million, and this is about Council Members who are  
8 saying -- myself, Council Member Lander and others --  
9 together we say we are committed to put \$2 million,  
10 \$3 million to see that expansion and that was even  
11 aside what we with the Speak will be able to get from  
12 the citywide capital funding, and I think that -- of  
13 course, I know that this is not only about capital;  
14 this is about also spending too [sic] and that's what  
15 probably is the more critical one because the capital  
16 can be one tiny investment; the question is: can Citi  
17 Bike get their own return to satisfy the investors'  
18 expectation when it comes to get a return, so and  
19 that's why I think it is important to continue  
20 talking and addressing -- I am happy again how open  
21 you are to this conversation, but knowing that also a  
22 group of Council Members, we are ready to say if that  
23 conversation is moving forward and we have progress;  
24 we are ready to say we will put in our own capital



COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you

Mr. Chair and thank you for convening this important hearing; it's encouraging to be here and I think a lot of work got us here, so I just want to honor some of that; the courage to launch the system in the beginning in the prior administration, Motivate's coming in to bail out and restructure the system -- and I don't know if I'll get to stick around for when they're here, so I really want to say thank you for that -- to your work to keep moving expansion forward, even when sometimes it's been difficult; I am also thrilled about the union, so that the jobs are good and local and expand, and I appreciate the Chair and his work and the work of our colleagues, and the advocates as well. It's taken all of that to get Citi Bike to my neighborhood, our neighborhood, which I am thrilled with; you know, I use it, my family uses it; my neighbors use it, and even though there has been some of the anxiety, resistance, backlash when they hit the ground, I just don't think there's any doubt, if you watch what's happening in our neighborhoods, what a success it is and how important it is in ways that are going to grow over time. You know we were talking, I was talking to



1  
2 Council Member Menchaca about Red Hook, where we need  
3 some of that same outreach that's been happening in  
4 Bed-Stuy; I know that when that happens the number of  
5 people that are going to discover it as a critical  
6 transit option is just going to grow in extraordinary  
7 ways. So I have a lot of appreciation for what's  
8 gotten the system here and for your work and  
9 Motivate's work to make sure it's an equitable system  
10 as well, and we were patient in Park Slope so Crown  
11 Heights could get it before we did and we're thrilled  
12 to make sure it, you know have it happen at the same  
13 time it did in Red Hook.

14           And while I share -- and you know, the  
15 Chair is right to flag that I had helped organize an  
16 effort to say if necessary, we'll put up public  
17 dollars; I do want to be clear that the goal is of  
18 course not to put public subsidy into the system; the  
19 goal is a citywide equitable expansion that achieves  
20 those goals for many more neighborhoods, and my hunch  
21 -- and I think it's in what you said -- is that just  
22 since we've already built the dense Manhattan, higher  
23 income neighborhoods into the model, that version of  
24 cross-subsidy just isn't going to get us the  
25 expansion that we need and that we therefore probably

1  
2 -- and you haven't objected to this -- that we  
3 therefore probably will need some form of public  
4 subsidy. Now, I don't want you to negotiate in  
5 public; it's your job to negotiate... [interpose]

6 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Thank you.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: with them -- and  
8 you know, it's your job to negotiate with them and  
9 get the best deal on the people's behalf and that's  
10 going to take some real hard work and rolling up of  
11 sleeves and I don't think there should be a number  
12 out there today of how much that is; you should  
13 understand that what we want is that robust,  
14 equitable, citywide system that can continue to  
15 invest in equitable expansion, reach the  
16 neighborhoods we're talking about, reach the people  
17 we're talking about, and if that takes some public  
18 dollars, you should know that this Council supports  
19 that while you go engage in those negotiations with  
20 Motivate.

21 So one, I wanted to just make sure you  
22 hear that from all of us, which I think you do, and I  
23 guess the question I would just ask is; it does seem  
24 like a really interesting public-private contract to  
25 negotiate; it needs to be flexible enough for

1  
2 stations to be moved, for the upside, if there is  
3 one, to be shared with the public, but in those cases  
4 where it doesn't go quite as planned, for there to be  
5 some flexibility to Motivate so that they can take  
6 some risk and achieve expansion as well. And I guess  
7 my questions are just -- what do you like and not  
8 like about the current system; what needs to be  
9 changed; what needs to be kept, and what models are  
10 you looking to to achieve the right framework for  
11 such an agreement for the next phase?

12                   COMMISSIONER TROTTEMBERG: Well I have to  
13 say; I like -- part because I helped negotiate it --  
14 I like the current... I like the current contract  
15 better than the last one, and it's trying to -- one  
16 thing I've learned -- I oversee several big, what we  
17 would call in city parlance, performance contracts --  
18 Citi Bike is the biggest one, but there is also  
19 Cemusa (now JCDecaux) and you know, we've been  
20 working on what we will be rolling out -- I think  
21 we're in the process of rolling it out now -- pay by  
22 cell. I would say in general those are very  
23 complicated contracts to manage, and here's why. If  
24 I'm procuring microphones, I just buy them and you  
25 deliver them; I don't care whether you're a

1 functioning, ongoing concern; I'm not in your books;  
2 I'm not in your management structure, I just want you  
3 to deliver your product and if your product works  
4 well; we've had a good transaction. Performance  
5 contracts are much more complex; I'm in a much deeper  
6 relationship with you, and one which you're providing  
7 a daily service, something that impacts New York City  
8 citizens very closely and you know in some ways we  
9 have to have a closer relationship, and you know one  
10 of the... I think the challenges we had with Alta; it  
11 was interesting, [bell] you know their performance  
12 was poor and we were getting, you know, advocates and  
13 others criticizing us, saying why aren't you fining  
14 them and holding them, you know their feet to fire in  
15 their performance con... the problem was; they were  
16 going bankrupt and so I could fine them, but then  
17 what; then I just hastened their bankruptcy. So you  
18 know performance contracts where you're working with  
19 a private entity, you want them to be successful and  
20 financially viable; you have to be thoughtful about  
21 the leverage you use, and I won't lie, they're not  
22 always easy contracts to manage, you know, Jay runs a  
23 private company; he has his own proprietary  
24 information, his own things that he wants to keep  
25

1 confidential as part of how they run their business,  
2 so I think there's perhaps a good creative tension  
3 there. We have tried best we can in this current  
4 contract to not be sort of typical New York City  
5 micromanagey [sic], but to again, as I said in my  
6 testimony, let Motivate innovate and bring their own  
7 solutions to the table; I think they've done an  
8 incredible job of that; I think that has worked very  
9 well. But you know, one thing to think about -- if  
10 we start to put in affirmative City dollars (and  
11 again, thank you and the Council for offering that),  
12 then you will rightly expect a much higher level of  
13 oversight and potentially sort of management of how  
14 Jay conducts his business, and that -- I won't lie to  
15 you, I think that will be challenging, particularly  
16 because we'll have part of the system that'll sort of  
17 be private and then part that potentially isn't; how  
18 do we integrate those together, you know, continue  
19 for Jay and his team to have sort of a, you know a  
20 profit motive and allow them to be entrepreneurial  
21 while protecting public dollars. I think that's  
22 going to be a definite challenge.

23  
24 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: My time is up,  
25 but I don't think I'm going to be able to stick

1  
2 around, but I hope colleagues will ask some of the  
3 same questions of Motivate and the union; I think  
4 helping these negotiations go smoothly will be  
5 productive for all of us, so.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And I just want  
9 to say that the question right now for me is not if  
10 the Council is ready to put the money, while we heard  
11 that based on what Citi Bike having a structure to be  
12 financially healthy, it was more relying on the  
13 number of customers, mainly from the financial  
14 district, and more the middle class and upper class  
15 community, that in order to expand this model through  
16 the city, through all the communities, including the  
17 working-class and poor community, New Yorkers living  
18 under the poverty line. So you know as you will  
19 continue conversations with the other side of the  
20 team, to have it in mind that this is not just about  
21 if the Council will put the money; we're expecting  
22 the conversation the administration should be having  
23 their own negotiation and look on the possibility for  
24 the City to put some money in order to make Citi Bike  
25 affordable for all working-class New Yorkers too.

1  
2                   COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG:  And I would  
3 just say, I think the initial model, again, which  
4 you're correct, Mr. Chairman, focused a lot on  
5 Manhattan and a part of Brooklyn, you know certainly  
6 higher income area, but also, bigger revenue  
7 possibilities in terms of sponsorships and  
8 advertising, that's the other thing; when you get  
9 into the densest parts of the city, obviously  
10 sponsors and advertisers are willing to pay more of a  
11 premium to get their brand out in those areas, just  
12 because more people are going to see them.

13                   CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ:  Yeah.  Council  
14 Member Garodnick.

15                   COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK:  Thank you  
16 Mr. Chairman and Commissioner, thank you for your  
17 testimony today.  I just wanted to put our current  
18 situation in the context of other city bikes that  
19 have expanded.  You noted that we are now the largest  
20 one in North America, but surely we're not the first  
21 one to have to think about moving from a privately  
22 funded or privately operated context to the  
23 possibility of adding more public dollars for  
24 expansion.  Can you tell us how that has worked... what  
25 the closest precedent is and how it has worked?

1  
2                   COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: I'm going to  
3 cast my eyes out to the many experts in the audience  
4 -- I think we are the only system that has been  
5 completely privately funded. New York is unique in  
6 that regard, all other systems, at least the ones  
7 that I know about in the United States -- I think  
8 this is true in Canada and Europe as well; I'm not  
9 familiar with the Chinese model -- they're publicly  
10 subsidized. Now in a lot of those cases they do give  
11 the private sector operator some opportunity to bring  
12 in revenues, but I don't think there is a precedent;  
13 we would probably be the first to try and create some  
14 sort of a hybrid model. It's not to say we can't  
15 learn lessons from our sister cities, but as we are  
16 in so many things, New York City is unique in its  
17 approach on this.

18                   COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: So when we  
19 think about the Phase III potential expansion areas,  
20 you know I'm sure we will find that some areas will  
21 be more suited for, more interested in, more needing  
22 this service than others. How do we evaluate? How  
23 does DOT evaluate a successful Citi Bike station? Is  
24 it when a certain percentage of the bikes are taken  
25 out a certain number of times per hour or day? Is



1  
2 it... you were describing how a lot of stations become  
3 completely empty because they are used so regularly;  
4 how do we evaluate the success or even potential for  
5 success when we're thinking about where and how to  
6 expand?

7                   COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: That's a good  
8 question and one I think that Jay will also want to  
9 expound on, 'cause they've done a lot of analysis. I  
10 mean the first measure of success, right, is how  
11 often are the bikes being used, and in this regard,  
12 again, New York has proved a remarkable outlier; in  
13 our busiest stations and our busiest days, some of  
14 the bikes are used for as many as eight trips a day,  
15 which is pretty remarkable, not many systems can  
16 boast that. One of the other things we look at --  
17 and it's funny, 'cause Council Member Chin mentioned  
18 Petrosino Square -- one of the other sort of positive  
19 is when you can -- that's a station that gets a lot  
20 of use, but also naturally rebalances itself. Penn  
21 Station does not naturally rebound itself and it  
22 turns out; neither does Grand Army Plaza in Brooklyn,  
23 so some stations tend to be very heavily one-way  
24 traffic, based on commuting; some, it's more  
25 neighborhood destinations and as people come, other

1  
2 people go. You know I'll let Jay talk a little bit  
3 more; you obviously want to have the mix; you want to  
4 make sure you're serving those important  
5 destinations, but it's interesting; one thing he  
6 talked about, for example, in London, they've  
7 evidently pulled their bike share stations away from  
8 the big train stations, 'cause they just couldn't  
9 supply them with bikes fast enough and they decided  
10 it was draining too much away from the other parts of  
11 the system and they wanted -- you know and that's a  
12 question for us; are we focused on commuters coming  
13 into Penn Station or do we want to make sure we have  
14 more of the bikes circulating in Brooklyn? I don't  
15 know that we know the answer to that question; it's  
16 somewhat of a subjective issue, but certainly one, as  
17 we continue now to see Phase II roll out and see the  
18 rebalancing challenges we're having that we're  
19 asking, how do we maximize the goal, again, which is  
20 to get the most number of bikes in the most number of  
21 places where the most number of people want to use  
22 them?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Obviously a  
24 complicated question and one that we'll look forward  
25 to having with you. The last question that I have --

1 with less than a minute to go in my time -- is the  
2 sponsorship versus the membership breakdown in order  
3 to allow for the operation of the system today; I  
4 think what you had said earlier in your testimony was  
5 that most of the revenue was generated through,  
6 initially through sponsorship, but then membership  
7 has caught up; could you say a little bit more about  
8 how that breaks down...? [sic] [crosstalk]

10 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well actually,  
11 I think I'm going to defer to Motivate on answering  
12 the revenue question... [interpose]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay, so then  
14 let's then fast forward to a Phase III context. The  
15 bikes, they have sponsorship all over them; there,  
16 presumably, is not more opportunity for sponsorship  
17 or is there?

18 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: There could be  
19 opportunity for advertising. Some of the bikes are  
20 branded [bell] with different types of advertising;  
21 we have panels on the wayfinding kiosks, so I think  
22 creatively there could be potential ways to bring in  
23 revenue. And again, I think as part of this  
24 negotiation, that's one of the things it behooves us  
25 to do is think creatively -- are there other

1  
2 potential, sort of private side revenue-generating  
3 opportunities and you know, maybe Jay will have some  
4 thoughts on that.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member  
7 Van Bramer.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you  
9 very much. Commissioner, I just want to say, 'cause  
10 I think it's important to say on the record; the  
11 little bit of blue there that's in Queens that  
12 currently has bike share, I never received one  
13 complaint about any of the dock locations..

14 [interpose]

15 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Wow.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: it's  
17 important to put that on the record.. [crosstalk]

18 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Council Member  
19 Lander is now jealous of you. [laughter]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: That... I just  
21 thought of it as I looked at that; I've never  
22 received one complaint; it's going extremely well in  
23 Long Island City. Needless to say, we're thrilled  
24 with the little orange to the north, which has a  
25 little bit of my district and my colleague to the

1 north, Council Member Constantinides, much of his  
2 district. But even more exciting is the potential  
3 Phase III, and I just wanted to know, that little  
4 yellow area, is that area that you've targeted or is  
5 that just for illustrative purposes only?

7 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well on the  
8 map here, just relevant to both of you, that orange  
9 area, I guess a part of it, or I guess that entire  
10 orange area, which is Dutch Kills-Astoria, we'll be  
11 doing next year...

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Right. And  
13 then the yellow... [interpose]

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: in the summer,  
15 although our goal... we're urging Citi Bike to do it as  
16 quickly as they can; they have to get their  
17 equipment, but so... [crosstalk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Yeah, they've  
19 been doing...

20 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: come this  
21 summer there'll be a bigger chunk of Queens that is  
22 solid blue.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Right. No,  
24 they're doing great and we worked with Danny and Rami  
25 [sp?] and the entire team; both of your times have

1  
2 been great, along with Costa and CB1. And then to  
3 the east is the yellow and that would be a potential  
4 Phase III.

5 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Correct.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: And so the  
7 yellow area that you have outlined there is a  
8 potential Phase III for Queens?

9 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: And it's a  
10 notional half moon of potential Phase III.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Right. Look,  
12 I... [interpose]

13 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: And certainly,  
14 obviously, if we all come together on some kind of a  
15 funding and operational agreement on Phase III, input  
16 from you all would be essential to helping us decide  
17 where to go next, but I think we can probably all  
18 think in our minds what would potentially be some  
19 logical neighborhoods that flow from where Phase II  
20 is going to be.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: That's very  
22 exciting, 'cause right now within that yellow portion  
23 is certainly Sunnyside, Woodside, parts of Costa's  
24 district and my [sic] district; maybe go even [sic]  
25 east, maybe you've got Jackson Heights and Elmhurst

1  
2 and Corona in there as well, which is great, we can't  
3 have that happen fast enough; as far as I'm  
4 concerned, having bike share in every neighborhood in  
5 the city is so important.

6 I wanted to just talk very briefly in my  
7 time about the cost, and I was one of those Council  
8 Members who's very willing and even eager to put  
9 money into this program if it meant an expansion into  
10 my district, and you said it's about \$6,000 per  
11 station, including the bikes, although somehow  
12 crazily, the bikes are not capital eligible, which  
13 obviously I... [interpose, background comments]

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: That's  
16 correct. So by my [background comments] estimation,  
17 if I allocated a million dollars in capital, we might  
18 get, you know, somewhere close to 200, maybe a little  
19 bit less, stations and bikes and... does that sound  
20 right to you, Commissioner, roughly speaking, if  
21 we're...

22 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Alright. I'm  
23 sorry, give me that... we're doing our own math over  
24 here for some reason; I'm just double-checking it --

1  
2 \$6,000, yeah, it's basically the all inclusive, the  
3 bike and the... [interpose]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Right.

5 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: the docking  
6 station.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: And if I  
8 allocated a million... [crosstalk]

9 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yeah, per  
10 bike. Yeah, yeah, per bike.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: And if I  
12 allocated a million in capital, right; that would get  
13 us, you know, not quite 200 stations or docking  
14 stations and bikes, but it would be... Let me just say  
15 this; if I thought... [interpose, background comments]

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Right; we're  
17 having a... \$6,000 is one bike; one dock...

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Right.

19 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: so if you're  
20 building out a station, you could have whatever, 20,  
21 30 bikes and docks...

22 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Right.

23 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: So yeah...  
24 [interpose]



1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: So it's a  
3 little bit more, but if I... [crosstalk]

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Yes, if they  
5 create... You sort of have to probably multiply it by...  
6 [interpose]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Yeah. Yeah.

8 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: 10, the cost,  
9 to get a full... basically a full... as we would call it,  
10 a full station.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: But putting a  
12 few million dollars in capital into this program, if  
13 I thought it was going to get all of Sunnyside and  
14 all of Woodside a bike share, I would do it in a  
15 heartbeat, I think it's that important, it's that  
16 desired and it's that meaningful, particularly in  
17 parts of Queens where all we have is the 7 train --  
18 you as an MTA board member know this -- if all you've  
19 got is the 7 train, you need a little bit more of  
20 hope to get to work sometimes in the morning, and so  
21 we need more transportation options and obviously we  
22 want an equitable citywide system, and obviously  
23 you've got to work out your deal, but I want you to  
24 know that I am one of those members who believes in  
25 this so much and I desperately want this in every

1  
2 corner of my district, if not Queens, and I think  
3 that's a good investment of a public dollars [bell]  
4 to make sure that we have every single neighborhood  
5 covered by Citi Bike as soon as possible.

6 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well thank  
7 you, and again, thanks to all the Council Members  
8 who've been wonderful supporters and shown great  
9 leadership and helped us in our rolling out of Phase  
10 I and Phase II. But then again, just to sort of  
11 relay the questions to grapple with -- so capital  
12 dollars from the Council, there's still at least now,  
13 unless we can somehow negotiate this, 25% of that  
14 cost would have to be spent as well as ongoing  
15 operating, and right now I think that the two teams  
16 together have the capacity of putting in about 2,000  
17 bikes a year; that's... again, to do it right, to do  
18 the community process, to do the proper siting, the  
19 engineering, the purchasing of the equipment; the  
20 installation. So just to bear in mind, that's kind  
21 of -- unless we're dramatically changing our model,  
22 and I don't know that we'll have the wherewithal to  
23 do that; that's kind of the pace, just so people have  
24 a bit of a sense of... you know, to build out very far  
25 into the city, let alone the whole city, we're

1  
2 talking some number of years; it's not something we  
3 could easily do in a year or two.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Well I look  
5 forward to working with you to expand Citi Bike all  
6 over Queens.

7 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And you know  
9 **[inaudible]** that this is good timing on having this  
10 conversation, again, leaving any details about what  
11 you can agree or disagree with the leadership of  
12 Motivate, at the end of the day this is about the  
13 final project; we want to see the expansion, but what  
14 I hope is that, as you have expressed, you know, the  
15 Administration is open that as we continue  
16 conversations, and probably by the beginning of the  
17 year, we will be getting some information about what  
18 the 2018 budget is going to be; we just hope that  
19 this should be one of those areas that, especially  
20 someone that Mayor de Blasio, you know believing that  
21 Vision Zero, so **[inaudible]** and also a great  
22 supporter of the work that you've been doing for the  
23 Commissioner and therefore as an extension, you've  
24 been working with us very close addressing how to  
25 expand Citi Bike throughout the city, but again, this

1  
2 is more than capital; this also includes is it  
3 sustainable, is the expansion, the sustainability of  
4 a new mode of transportation that can make a  
5 difference in areas where we are dealing with  
6 transportation deserts. Council Member Reynoso.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you,  
8 Chair. Hello DOT. Again, one of my favorite  
9 agencies in the entire City of New York; the work you  
10 guys do is remarkable, it's inspiring at times, so  
11 thank you so much for what you do.

12 To the Deputy Commissioner, I was  
13 actually in your district eating at Travesias [sic],  
14 a restaurant, I think; a very good restaurant, if it  
15 had Citi Bike it might have been more convenient to  
16 get there. It's in Hunts Point in the south Bronx,  
17 so we're working on it, hopefully you're working on  
18 it to get there.

19 I guess I want to say a couple of things.  
20 I want to say that I think the work that Motivate has  
21 done over the last couple of years has been  
22 remarkable to really move the system to a place where  
23 it is financially feasible and makes sense here in  
24 the City of New York all on their own somewhat is  
25 something that I want to thank them for and

1  
2 congratulate them on making that happen. But I do  
3 think that having the motivation -- no pun intended  
4 -- to make it profitable I think allowed for that to  
5 happen and this private-public partnership  
6 opportunity that we're talking about with the  
7 investment of City dollars and the need for  
8 oversight, just how we do that would be very  
9 important to me to keep Motivate motivated to  
10 continue to do their work, so I want to say that  
11 first.

12           The second thing I want to say is, in  
13 Queens, I just want to say I have Ridgewood in Queens  
14 that I care about deeply, but in Queens I know that  
15 the majority of people that ride bikes in Queens come  
16 from districts that are in Council Member Ferreras-  
17 Copeland's district and Council Member Jimmy Van  
18 Bramer, and I don't know all the Queens Council  
19 Members' places, but I guess what I'm saying is, in  
20 highly dense Latino districts, and if that's where  
21 the bike riders are, I would just assume that there  
22 would be some kind of conversation to be had  
23 regarding the market in those areas. So I just  
24 really want you guys to look at that; I know we did a  
25 study in Brooklyn; it's the same thing -- Latinos are

1  
2 riding bikes at a high level, it's more affordable  
3 than taking the subway, so it's really more of a  
4 money situation, a financial situation than it is  
5 anything else. But what I do want to ask though, in  
6 your contract with Motivate now, and Citibank, I  
7 guess, that has sponsored it, how long does that  
8 last; when is there an opportunity to reassess  
9 sponsorship?

10 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Here, actually  
11 I'm going to... Well I'm going to let the lawyers... We  
12 have the contract and then some potential options for  
13 renewal, so I'm going to let Michelle Craven answer  
14 that one.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Okay.

16 MICHELLE CRAVEN: Okay. So the original  
17 contract with Motivate, the initial expiration date  
18 was 2019, but with 10,000 bikes, we expanded that to  
19 2024, and assuming that they reach the 12,000 bike  
20 level that they're supposed to next year; then it  
21 will be extended till 2029. The Citibank sponsorship  
22 contract is a separate contract from the contract  
23 that we have with Motivate..

24 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Right.

1  
2 MICHELLE CRAVEN: but it is a ten-year  
3 sponsorship agreement and it covers the first 12,000  
4 bikes in the system, in terms of their station  
5 function... [crosstalk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Right. So how  
7 long... How far along the ten years are we with  
8 Citibank...

9 MICHELLE CRAVEN: We're...

10 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: six years;  
11 seven?

12 MICHELLE CRAVEN: We started in 2013?  
13 [background comment] So three years in.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: We're three  
15 years in. Okay. But it only accounts for 12,000  
16 bikes?

17 MICHELLE CRAVEN: Yeah, for the stations  
18 associated with the first 12,000 bicycles...  
19 [crosstalk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: The next... The  
21 next...

22 MICHELLE CRAVEN: and then they get  
23 **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: ones we expand  
25 and market as we see fit and Motivate could work to...

1  
2 they won't be Citi Bikes anymore, they'll be... they  
3 could be something else?

4 [background comment]

5 MICHELLE CRAVEN: The bikes will still be  
6 Citi Bikes, but the stations that are painted blue  
7 now... [crosstalk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: So they have the  
9 rights to every single bike through this system..

10 MICHELLE CRAVEN: Correct.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: for ten years?

12 MICHELLE CRAVEN: Uhm-hm. And then all  
13 of the stations in the Phase I and Phase II areas..  
14 [crosstalk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: But they don't..

16 MICHELLE CRAVEN: but not the Phase III  
17 stations.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: The more bikes  
19 you put out; do you get more money for them or is it  
20 one set contract? I guess these are Motivate  
21 questions. I guess what I'm trying to see -- I'm  
22 just trying to figure out how the contract works so  
23 that we can get different sponsorship in different  
24 areas. To be honest, we have very little Citibanks  
25 let's say in Bushwick; there is no Citibank; why they



1  
2 would be used there, Citibank would be promoting  
3 there, I don't necessarily see it for them or for  
4 Bushwick; I don't think there's a good relationship  
5 there, a synergy there. But another bank or another  
6 organization or another company might want to  
7 advertise there and I just wanted to know what the  
8 opportunities are for them outside of just a kiosk or  
9 the stations, but actual bikes.

10 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Right. And I  
11 do think we want Motivate... I mean again, part of what  
12 we think is good about bringing in the private sector  
13 partner; that's the kind of thing they have a lot of  
14 expertise in, finding where those potential revenue  
15 opportunities are, seeing what the local business  
16 climate is in a given neighborhood; you're right,  
17 maybe Bushwick, there is some other partner that  
18 would want to come to the table and help support the  
19 system [bell], and I know they have, for example,  
20 talked in some cases to individual employers or real  
21 estate developers and they might have interest in  
22 contributing to parts of the system, so I think Jay  
23 can probably expound on that in greater detail.

24

25

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Yeah, I just  
3 hope we didn't lock ourselves in too tightly. But  
4 thank you. Thank you, Chair.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.  
6 Council Member Rosenthal.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you so  
8 much, Chair. Sorry; I have to move my chair.

9 Hi Commissioner, thank you so much for  
10 all your work; as always, it's great and I'm a huge  
11 fan of Citi Bike, as you know, and feel very lucky,  
12 after this discussion, hearing from my colleagues,  
13 that we've enjoyed it on the Upper West side for  
14 longer and it has been a success, 100%. So I fully  
15 support it and I fully support it going citywide.  
16 Over Thanksgiving -- turns out I have a cousin who  
17 lives in Ridgewood, Queens, which I don't even know  
18 where that is, but she said, "Whatever you can do to  
19 get Citi Bike out to Ridgewood, you know make that  
20 happen," so I'm all for it, and not just because my  
21 cousin wants it. But my concern is; I'm not at all  
22 convinced we need to put in City dollars and I would  
23 not recommend that we start the conversation that way  
24 at all. You know, from what I've heard in just this  
25 hearing, it sounds like there are opportunities for

1  
2 revenue-generating, so you know whether it be in a  
3 park, where we don't have Citi Bike now, or it sounds  
4 like perhaps the DOT has contracts with other  
5 providers; I mean, why not put it... you know it just  
6 strikes me that before we put in any City funds, no  
7 matter whose side of the hall it comes from, you  
8 know, why wouldn't we try to make it work with a  
9 private entity?

10 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: We... look... and  
11 again, thank you for your leadership, all our work on  
12 the Upper West Side, it's been great. Look we agree,  
13 obviously I think we've been... you know we inherited  
14 the model from the last administration of public-  
15 private partnership and obviously Mayor de Blasio  
16 embraced that and I think so far it has worked out  
17 very well and obviously in our discussions with  
18 Motivate we are asking those very questions -- are  
19 there other ways that we can find potential revenue  
20 sources? And you know I think the discussion we're  
21 hearing today, some of your colleagues are very  
22 excited about putting in public dollars; I understand  
23 your point of view -- let's make sure we've exhausted  
24 all other possibilities for revenue generation before  
25 we do that. And again, I'm not here today to say

1 that we've come down on a particular approach; I  
2 think that's an iterative discussion with Motivate  
3 and obviously with all of you. You know again, we  
4 are in New York... I think we are the only system right  
5 now that is not taking public dollars, that I know  
6 of, so I believe at some point there will probably be  
7 a limit to what we can do in terms of revenue  
8 generation; I'm with you, I don't know whether we've  
9 found that limit yet; there may be some other  
10 creative possibilities and that's part of what I  
11 think what is great about having a private section  
12 player at the table; they are really the experts in  
13 finding those possibilities, and I'm sure Jay will  
14 share his thoughts on that; as the public sector  
15 side, it's probably not our greatest expertise.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Well I mean  
18 when you think about the use of public dollars and  
19 especially at a time where we don't know whether or  
20 not there will be cuts to our federal revenue  
21 streams, cuts to public housing, you know, cuts to  
22 our education dollars; you know, I'm not ready to  
23 open the door to subsidizing a new service and  
24 calling it now a public service because there are  
25 City dollars in it. And I would... despite what one of

1  
2 my colleagues said here today, I would push back very  
3 strongly on the City dedicating funds to make this a  
4 more public model, and I would just urge you to  
5 resist that temptation at all costs. My cousin from  
6 Ridgewood also complained about all the potholes that  
7 are in the outer boroughs that... you know the City  
8 definitely has responsibility for maintaining our  
9 roads and making sure that drivers can drive on roads  
10 without running their suspension systems. I mean  
11 those are things that I think as a whole and the City  
12 we've all agreed that's a [bell] public priority. I  
13 have no indication that there's 100% agreement that  
14 City funds should go into Citi Bike and at the same  
15 time, when I'm holding these two things in my hand, I  
16 am equally convinced we have to get Citi Bike  
17 throughout all five boroughs.

18 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: I mean clearly  
19 this is a discussion... obviously, you all are the  
20 elected officials here on the Council and with the  
21 Mayor; you're certainly correct, obviously the City  
22 has a lot of competing priorities above and beyond  
23 just Citi Bike; we have a bunch of competing  
24 priorities in transportation and in other areas,  
25 housing and other things that we care deeply about.

1  
2 It is a fair point that I would say certainly the  
3 federal picture in terms of what kind of aid we'll be  
4 getting in the City is a big question mark at this  
5 point. You know all I can say is we are right now  
6 fleshing out I think what the best possible  
7 approaches would be, talking to Motivate; we'll  
8 obviously be talking to you all and I think it'll be  
9 up to this body and the Mayor to reach a final  
10 decision on what will serve the City the best in  
11 terms of a potential public investment.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.  
13 Commissioner, thank you and we will continue  
14 conversations with you and also with my colleagues  
15 here. There is a whole coalition right now asking  
16 for the MTA to review their fares, especially to New  
17 Yorkers living on the poverty line. We don't have  
18 much control on the MTA, but when we look at even the  
19 annual membership that people making \$12,000 a year  
20 or \$13,000 a year, they cannot afford to pay; I think  
21 that we should be open to everything. I hope that we  
22 will explore for motivating... and as you will continue  
23 conversations with them, the possibility to bring  
24 other additional revenue, but this is about how we  
25 make Citi Bike more than a mode of transportation for

1 middle class and upper class. How do we make this  
2 transportation also to working class? And I think it  
3 is important for us to be open to anything that we  
4 can do to be able to say that you know inequality is  
5 real in the city; sometimes things happen to that  
6 beyond the border where we live, where people in some  
7 places in the Bronx and Brooklyn, they cannot afford  
8 to pay this type of membership, even though I agree  
9 with Antonio in the sense that, I was born and raised  
10 in a Caribbean island where my father's mode of  
11 transportation was a bike; the new millennia, they  
12 are not into cars; now we are also dealing with a  
13 city where we have a lot of those more than 35 New  
14 Yorkers born in another place that bike was the mode  
15 of transportation and when they came here, a car  
16 became a symbol and here we have places in the Bronx  
17 -- ask someone who is doing a school renewal in the  
18 Bronx that they have to go and visit in three and  
19 four schools and they don't have enough A train or  
20 the bus close to the school, how different it would  
21 be if there is a Citi Bike close to those locations.  
22 So I think that this is... you know, I am happy that we  
23 are open, that we're exploring other venue and I  
24  
25

1 think that this is a good way of how to and your  
2 participation.  
3

4 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Thank you,  
5 Mr. Chair.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Now  
7 **[inaudible]** Jay Walder from Motivate. [background  
8 comment]

9 [pause]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...it's actually  
11 about safety. How do bicycle accidents get... crashes...  
12 thank you... well when a bicycle... get reported by... is  
13 it the... How do you get crash data?

14 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: We get our  
15 crash data from NYPD.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: And does NYPD  
17 differentiate between a Citi Bike and any other bike?

18 COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: They have not,  
19 but, and yet that said, I know we do have... we have  
20 sort of Citi Bike safety data -- so I don't know if  
21 anyone wants to opine on that -- and it's been very  
22 good; there has so far to date not been a bicycle  
23 fatality involving a Citi Bike, so we're very pleased  
24 about that. I always touch wood when I say that.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: So...



1  
2                   COMMISSIONER TROTTENBERG: Yeah and  
3 actually... I think Jay is actually the person who can  
4 give more fine grain detail [background comment] on  
5 Citi Bike safety. But again, you know it's been safe  
6 and there's been theories as to why the... the bikes  
7 are big, they're visible, they're kind of slow, they  
8 have flashing lights, and we have tried very much to,  
9 where we can, locate them near bike infrastructure  
10 bike lanes to try and give folks using them, you  
11 know, good protected or bike lane way to get around  
12 the city, so so far it's been... that's one thing we've  
13 been very glad about; it's worked very well in that  
14 regard, and I think that's been true, from what I  
15 understand, other bike share systems in other cities.  
16 You know there was a lot of fear, and I know in New  
17 York when it came in, that tourists would be  
18 careening around and it would be very dangerous; it's  
19 not proved to be so far, thank goodness.

20                   COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yeah, I just...  
21 I've heard many stories about the NYPD not capturing  
22 the fact that somebody was on a Citi Bike as opposed  
23 to just any other bike and certainly, from a hospital  
24 perspective, they're seeing injuries where they don't  
25 know, they don't know if the person is on a Citi Bike

1  
2 or another bike. I agree with you that the safety  
3 precautions are terrific and that makes a lot of  
4 sense. I just wonder how we would know if there was  
5 underreporting... so... [interpose]

6 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: Well I think  
7 Motivate can speak to that, but I... [interpose]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yeah, thank  
9 you... [crosstalk]

10 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: I think in  
11 general... it appears, again, for the reasons, which as  
12 I state them again, it seems sort of logical; they've  
13 proved probably safer than the general sort of  
14 cycling population. Again, I think... [interpose]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yeah.

16 COMMISSIONER TROTTEBERG: helped a lot  
17 by their visibility and to some degree, a little bit  
18 of their slowness.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. Thank  
21 you. [background comment] Now the next panel,  
22 Council Member... I mean Jay Walder.

23 [pause]

24 JAY WALDER: ...I'll try again... now it's  
25 better.

1  
2 Good afternoon everyone. I really want  
3 to thank Transportation Chair Rodriguez for calling  
4 this hearing for the Committee for inviting us to  
5 testify today. And thanks also to Commissioner  
6 Trottenberg and her whole team at DOT; this really  
7 has been a real partnership between our teams and  
8 working together we have really worked to ensure Citi  
9 Bike succeeds. I am heartened and humbled by the  
10 very kind words from the members of the Committee  
11 about the change at Citi Bike; we very much  
12 appreciate it.

13 Let me introduce two people sitting next  
14 to me; first, to my left, Jules Flynn, the General  
15 Manager of Citi Bike. Jules runs the day-to-day  
16 operations, and I would say there is probably nobody  
17 who has been more integral in helping transform Citi  
18 Bike over the past two years. Dani Simons, to my  
19 right, the Director of Communications for Motivate  
20 probably needs no introduction to this committee, but  
21 she is indeed to my right and my right hand person.

22 When I first took the helm at Motivate, I  
23 heard one thing over and over again from people; they  
24 said, "I love Citi Bike..." and then they paused and  
25 they said, "but," and their point was that the

1  
2 program had huge potential, but it wasn't meeting  
3 their objectives. Frankly, the program was plagued  
4 by software that simply did not work, it was plagued  
5 by equipment that wasn't being properly maintained,  
6 and it was plagued by an under-staffed operation that  
7 couldn't keep up.

8           So our first priority when we came in  
9 (just over two years ago) was simple -- fix Citi  
10 Bike. Our company committed \$30 million to do it.  
11 We spent \$9 million of that in 2015 to completely  
12 change the software, we ripped it all out, and we  
13 retrofit every piece of hardware that powers Citi  
14 Bike. We overhauled all of the 6,000 bicycles that  
15 we had at the time. We staffed up and we put in  
16 place an experienced and competent management team.

17           Two years later, people still reach out  
18 to say "I love Citi Bike," but I'm happy to say  
19 without the caveat that used to follow. Today Citi  
20 Bike is working and people are using it in record  
21 numbers. We broke 60,000 trips a day 23 times this  
22 past year, and as the Chair mentioned in his remarks,  
23 we set a new North American Bike Share record of  
24 nearly 70,000 trips, city bike trips, in a single day  
25 on bicycles in New York City. Who could've imagined

1 just a few years ago that that would be the case?

2 And today, as we've been talking about, Citi Bike is  
3 no longer just the Central Business District Bike  
4 Share. We've added 4,000 bikes and today the program  
5 stretches from Harlem to Red Hook and next year it  
6 will go further in Manhattan to about 130th Street,  
7 and it will reach neighborhoods like Astoria,  
8 Prospect Heights and Crown Heights.  
9

10 As Citi Bike has expanded into Queens and  
11 Brooklyn, the de Blasio Administration has ensured  
12 that we maintain the same density and the same levels  
13 of services as we do in Manhattan.

14 Simply put, there is one Citi Bike for  
15 New York and the neighborhoods we serve are treated  
16 equally, regardless of geography or income.

17 Now we could not have done all of this  
18 without our incredible workforce.

19 During the peak season we employ about  
20 450 people -- bike mechanics, station technicians,  
21 drivers, re-balancers, customer service specialists,  
22 outreach ambassadors and more. We recruit in  
23 partnership with community-based organizations to  
24 ensure that our employees reflect the diversity of  
25 New York. And again, I will repeat, these are good

1 union jobs that pay above New York City's living wage  
2 and every one of those jobs come with benefits. We  
3 do this because we know that each employee is a  
4 critical part of our success; they're helping us to  
5 run a program that is safe, provides good service to  
6 our members, and operates 24-hours a day, 365 days a  
7 year.

8  
9 We have also relocated our global  
10 headquarters from Portland, Oregon to Sunset Park,  
11 Brooklyn, and I'm happy to tell you that we will be  
12 staying in Sunset Park. Our corporate team has added  
13 positions in technology, marketing, finance, product  
14 design, and supply chain over the past two years.

15 But the benefits of Citi Bike go beyond  
16 just record ridership and good jobs.

17 The Citi Bike program has generated over  
18 \$3.5 million in sales tax since Motivate took over  
19 operations, creating a much-needed source of  
20 additional revenue for the City.

21 And the program has significant health  
22 benefits. Citi Bike riders take on average 120 trips  
23 per year; that's thousands; indeed millions of  
24 minutes of healthy activity that helps to prevent  
25 disease.

1  
2 We're also helping to build a more  
3 dynamic and connected New York City for all. We are  
4 proud of the 15% discount that we offer on membership  
5 for IDNYC cardholders, has been noted; we offer a  
6 \$5.00 per month membership for all NYCHA residents  
7 and members in our Community Development Credit Union  
8 partners. Participation in our affordability program  
9 has doubled in the past year; we now have about 2,000  
10 members and we'd like to see it continue to double  
11 again.

12 But we also recognize that to make Citi  
13 Bike work for lower-income New Yorkers and people of  
14 color that it will take more than just a discount  
15 program. This is really about making sure that  
16 community members feel that Citi Bike is for them as  
17 part of a well-balanced transportation network that  
18 provides affordable, useful options for all  
19 residents.

20 To that end, and again, as the Committee  
21 Chair mentioned in his remarks, we've been partnering  
22 with community-based organizations like Bed-Stuy  
23 Restoration to encourage participation among lower-  
24 income residents and people of color. Over the past  
25 two years, Bedford Stuyvesant Restoration has

1  
2 convened Motivate, City agencies, local organizations  
3 and businesses to find creative ways to make this  
4 happen. The result -- it's working: membership in  
5 Bed-Stuy is up over 50% since the partnership began.

6 We're also finding other ways to get  
7 people involved in underserved communities engaged  
8 with Citi Bike. We've piloted a new program this  
9 year called Citi Bike for Youth, which enrolls youth  
10 from Red Hook, East Williamsburg, Harlem and Bed-Stuy  
11 in Citi Bike and it provides them with a free Citi  
12 Bike membership and safety classes so they can ride  
13 to school, they can ride to after-school activities,  
14 to work, or to just have fun.

15 Under the de Blasio Administration's  
16 leadership, Citi Bike has become one of the most  
17 successful public-private partnerships in New York's  
18 history. The DOT and Motivate have worked together  
19 to design and deliver an incredible new transit  
20 system. The partnership has leveraged over \$116  
21 million in private sponsorship and millions more in  
22 private investment to do it at no cost to the  
23 taxpayer.

24 This has created a financially  
25 sustainable model for the system we have today and



1  
2 for the expansion we will to 12,000 bicycles in  
3 communities well beyond Midtown and without public  
4 subsidy. The high ridership and demand for casual  
5 passes in the Manhattan core help to cover what is to  
6 date lower ridership in the expansion areas.

7 This model has provided a system that  
8 will have nearly 14 million trips this year and more  
9 the year after.

10 This model has created good jobs and it's  
11 provided affordable memberships to people who need  
12 access to healthy, convenience transportation.

13 This model will allow us to create the  
14 largest bike share program in North America, and it  
15 stands as an example for bike share programs all  
16 around the world.

17 It's an incredible credit to this  
18 administration and the City Council, as well as to  
19 non-governmental partners. We are very grateful to  
20 have had the opportunity to work with all of you to  
21 continue to provide an outstanding bike share  
22 program.

23 We know that you have questions; Jules  
24 and Dani and I would be very, very pleased to answer  
25 any questions that you have and again, we thank you

1  
2 for the opportunity to engage with you today. Thank  
3 you.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Well I know that  
5 Carlos has some questions -- I don't know if other  
6 Council Members have -- but before I call on them, I  
7 have a question on -- how critical is it for Motivate  
8 to get public funding in order to expand, as you call  
9 it, the new transit system through all the five  
10 boroughs, through all the communities?

11 JAY WALDER: As I said, I think we should  
12 be very, very proud of the model that has been  
13 created that has worked to date. It has stabilized  
14 Citi Bike on an operating basis; it has brought in  
15 private capital, both from our investors and from  
16 sponsorship. The sponsorship we receive from City is  
17 by far the largest sponsorship deal that exists  
18 anywhere in the United States or anywhere in the  
19 world for bike share; it provides \$111 million,  
20 running out from now until 2024, and I think those  
21 pieces come together, with the cross-subsidization  
22 that's implied in it, to be able to build out the  
23 system, that we have all agreed, to 12,000 bicycles  
24 -- 10,000 are already on the ground right now; 2,000  
25 more to come next year.

1  
2           Having said that, I do not believe that  
3 you can look to a major expansion of Citi Bike on the  
4 same model that we have today without some degree of  
5 public support, and I think if the objectives that  
6 I've listened to from the Council are clear, in which  
7 you want to make sure that Citi Bike in fact is in  
8 many more communities in New York, you want to ensure  
9 that it is affordable (even more affordable for  
10 people to be able to access it in the City), that you  
11 want a high-quality service in every community that  
12 Citi Bike comes to; I think we have to accept the  
13 fact that there will need to be public support to be  
14 able to do this.

15           This should not surprise us. First off,  
16 every other bike share system in the United States of  
17 America has some degree of public support; the models  
18 do differ, but there are no other bike share systems  
19 that are done without public support. Second, we  
20 know the transportation in our own city, and indeed  
21 the transportation modes in our city have public  
22 support as well. I think we should feel good about  
23 what we have accomplished right now; I think we  
24 should feel very good about what we have accomplished  
25 right now; I think we should feel very good about the

1  
2 system that we will build out to 12,000 bicycles, but  
3 to achieve the goals that have been articulated at  
4 the Council today, cannot be done without public  
5 support.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Which other  
7 source of raising revenue do you think that Motivate  
8 can be looking at; as what we believe we should be  
9 talking is, how to increase the public and private  
10 contributions. So from the private side, which other  
11 sources do you see as possibility for the company to  
12 raise more money?

13 JAY WALDER: So as I said, Citi has  
14 already committed \$111 million to this program; all  
15 of the bicycles in he City of New York will be  
16 branded, as part of the agreement, Citi Bike if they  
17 are part of a bike share program. The stations  
18 themselves would have the opportunity to sell  
19 advertising; I would again caution to some extent  
20 that the highest value advertising, of course, is in  
21 the densest parts of the city and some of the areas  
22 we'd be moving out to are not the densest parts of  
23 the city, so we'd be looking at that. I think there  
24 are opportunities to try to connect with local  
25 businesses to support Citi Bike in local communities

1 to be able to do that, and we have worked as well  
2 with developers in certain areas to be able to  
3 support bike share in specific areas to be able to do  
4 this. Having said that, I'm not sure that any of  
5 those or that the sum of those come close to meeting  
6 the aggregate need that we're talking about to have a  
7 large scale expansion of Citi Bike. In being able to  
8 do it, I think we should certainly have the  
9 opportunity and the challenge to bring more into  
10 this, but I think we have to do it in a context in  
11 which we believe that public support will be part of  
12 that as well.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: As you heard DOT  
15 Commissioner Trottenberg, she expressed that the  
16 Administration is open to conversation on exploring  
17 ways of how the City can put some public funding.  
18 Have you been engaged in any conversation or is this  
19 the first time that you hear that they are open to  
20 bring additional public funds?

21 JAY WALDER: As the Commissioner  
22 expressed, we have been engaged in conversation with  
23 DOT; she expressed the sense that there are a lot of  
24 open questions still to be worked out between the  
25 organizations; I would agree with her point, Chair,

1  
2 that this should not be a discussion between us that  
3 takes in public, but should be a private discussion  
4 in terms of being able to do that, but it is an  
5 ongoing discussion that is taking place. I think the  
6 capital costs of operating or purchasing equipment  
7 are well understood, as the Commissioner has said.  
8 The operating costs are indeed much more related to  
9 the system, and the size and the scale and the pace  
10 at which the City would like to go forth has to do  
11 with the membership take-up in different areas that  
12 would be there; we'll have to deal with the  
13 objectives around rebalancing and dealing with pieces  
14 like that. And also I think programs, as you've  
15 talked about, for affordability programs that might  
16 be there or connections to the community in terms of  
17 doing it so that we can build out deep ground roots  
18 connections in individual communities to try to make  
19 Citi Bike successful in each community that it goes  
20 into. All of that is still part of an ongoing  
21 discussion with DOT, which we're continuing to have.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I would like to  
23 recognize Council Member Greenfield; also, we were  
24 joined by Council Member Constantinides and now we  
25 have questions from Council Member Menchaca.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you,  
3 Chair.

4 And welcome, Mr. Walder, from Motivate  
5 and your team, thank you so much. I know we've been  
6 working hand in hand in so many different ways in  
7 Sunset Park, so I want to focus on a couple different  
8 areas that I already started with the Commissioner,  
9 and one of those areas is really understanding this  
10 public-private partnership and that reality that this  
11 is a fully privately funded project and you had  
12 mentioned in your testimony that you're hearing from  
13 many members about this on both sides. So I guess I  
14 kind of want to understand a little bit about what  
15 happens when we reach a limit in this current  
16 negotiated world -- contract -- where we hit a limit  
17 on where we're going to expand to; what happens in  
18 this world where this is a fully privately funded  
19 project, initiative with the City and understanding  
20 the flexibility of this kind of contract?

21 JAY WALDER: So the contract that we have  
22 agreed with the City is very clear in our  
23 obligations. We are obligated to provide a bike  
24 share system of 12,000 bicycles; it is explicit in  
25 terms of the neighborhoods that we are going to, so

1  
2 10,000 of those bicycles are already on the streets  
3 of New York; 2,000 more to come next year in Harlem,  
4 Astoria, Crown Heights, and Prospect Heights. The  
5 specific locations for those will be chosen during  
6 the year, as part of a process done jointly with DOT;  
7 with the community, to be able to find the siting of  
8 those stations. We have obligations in terms of the  
9 operations of the system. For example, every bike is  
10 checked every month, for reasons you would expect, we  
11 have obligations to clean stations, we have  
12 obligations in terms of many other things that go  
13 with that. If we reach the end of this and there is  
14 a decision not to go forward with Phase III; we would  
15 operate the system that we have right now and we  
16 would continue, as I believe we are trying to do  
17 right now, to operate an absolutely first-class bike  
18 share program in the areas that we would be there.  
19 We... [interpose]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And let me stop  
21 you there in saying, essentially if we hit the wall  
22 and we stop and analyze and say we can't move  
23 forward, essentially you wouldn't be able to move  
24 forward, and I think that's an important point that I  
25 think we're all trying to make here is that there



1  
2 needs to be a couple of other scenarios that we need  
3 to start developing out and get some information  
4 about what it's going to take. What is the gap? You  
5 mentioned in your testimony that you would be open to  
6 public funding from the City of New York; what is  
7 that gap and are you prepared to talk a little bit  
8 about how much are we looking to, from this point  
9 where we are right now, at the expansion levels?

10 JAY WALDER: So I cannot provide at this  
11 point specifics on that; it depends a lot on this  
12 discussion and dialogue that's taking place with the  
13 City, and as the Commissioner said prior to me, there  
14 are many things that need to be discussed and worked  
15 out and thought about in order to be able to refine  
16 that in a way that we would feel comfortable with  
17 that.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Understood.  
19 Okay. Secondly, I want to go into your numbers on  
20 the 50% increase since the partnership began on the  
21 Bed-Stuy project. What were the original numbers and  
22 what are we talking -- 50% of what, from what to  
23 what?

24 JAY WALDER: Do you know that number?  
25

1  
2 DANI SIMONS: We would need to... I don't  
3 have that in my notes, but I can get back to you.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay, it'd be  
5 good; only because I want to understand what success  
6 is. So if we moved 50% from ten people, that's one  
7 thing, but if we're talking about thousands of  
8 people, we've got to understand exactly what... we  
9 can't celebrate a 50% increase if we don't know  
10 exactly what we're talking about.

11 JAY WALDER: Fair enough.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And then you  
13 mentioned there are 2,000 members right now under the  
14 affordability program, and I'm assuming that that's  
15 NYCHA as well, so it's like a public housing NYCHA  
16 program affordability. What other affordability  
17 programs are you capturing under the 2,000 members?

18 JAY WALDER: That captures two programs;  
19 it captures the NYCHA program and it captures a  
20 program with certain community-based credit unions  
21 and members of those credit unions.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Members of  
23 credit unions. Okay. And you're at 2,000?

24 JAY WALDER: Correct.  
25

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay. And  
3 next, I kind of want to move over into jobs and the  
4 union. And can you tell us a little bit about the  
5 impacts the union has had on just how Motivate is  
6 thinking about expanding into local job markets like  
7 Sunset Park and tell us a little bit about what has  
8 happened and what you are planning to do to really  
9 bring those numbers, and if you can share the numbers  
10 it'd be great to figure out what the local hiring has  
11 been for the neighborhood and the borough and the  
12 city itself on hiring local workforce.

13 JAY WALDER: I will speak generally to  
14 it; I don't know that I have the specific numbers in  
15 doing that; Jules may have more, but... [interpose]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Is that... Are  
17 those numbers that you can have at another time or is  
18 that just something that you don't track?

19 JAY WALDER: I don't know that we track  
20 it by community that way, but... [interpose, background  
21 comments]

22 DANI SIMONS: We have it by the... we have  
23 it by people living in the five boroughs, and the  
24 last I checked, it was **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

25

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Sorry; can you...  
3 thanks Dani.

4 DANI SIMONS: Do you want to... The last  
5 that I had checked, we had... over 95% of our workforce  
6 came from the five boroughs; I don't know that we  
7 track it specifically at the council district or  
8 community board district, but we could look into it  
9 for you and see what we could pull from our HR  
10 system.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Great.

12 JAY WALDER: Do either of you want to  
13 speak to what we have done in terms of opening --  
14 we're working with the community to be able to open  
15 up jobs, to have job fares and be able to recruit and  
16 doing that; do you want to speak to that?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: This is your  
18 chance to do this. I mean this is an opportunity for  
19 you to talk about the good work that Citi Bike is  
20 doing or Motivate is doing.

21 JULES FLYNN: Certainly. So just to  
22 speak to that a little bit, we do prioritize hiring  
23 locally and from within the community; we work with  
24 work... [crosstalk]

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Can you bring  
3 your mic closer to you really quick? Thank you.

4 JULES FLYNN: Sure. So we do prioritize  
5 hiring from within the community and we work with  
6 various partners to make that happen on an ongoing  
7 basis, including Workforce1 is an important partner  
8 for us in identifying candidates for work with Citi  
9 Bike.

10 JAY WALDER: But let me add to that. I  
11 mean if you were at our offices, I think it was a  
12 year ago, and you know where our offices are, because  
13 you've been there, you would have seen a line of  
14 people coming in because we had open job days in  
15 which we advertised jobs that we had available, jobs  
16 that did not require specific skills where we said we  
17 would train people to be able to come into the  
18 workforce to do that. We trained people to be  
19 bicycle mechanics, we trained them to be valets, we  
20 trained them to be ambassadors; we trained them to be  
21 call center agents in doing this, and we work with  
22 people in doing that and when they come into our  
23 workforce, they come into the union, every job pays  
24 above New York City living wage; every job contains  
25 benefits that are associated with that as well. What

1  
2 you would recognize of course is that we run a  
3 seasonal business; we have many more people in the  
4 summer than we have in the winter, so one of the  
5 things that we seek to do as we come out into the new  
6 year is work with local elected officials, community  
7 organizations and the like toward the hiring that  
8 we'll be doing for next spring; in March of next year  
9 we will be staffing and training up more people again  
10 so that these people can in fact join our workforce  
11 and when we get into the peak season, as the weather  
12 grows warmer, we have a fully formed, experienced  
13 workforce to be able to deal with that.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And just to  
15 that note, I think it's an important thing to talk  
16 about more and more -- the face of Citi Bike cannot  
17 be what I think we're seeing right now in our press;  
18 it's the face of gentrification; it's a sign of a  
19 changing neighborhood, and I think what you have --  
20 and haven't seen the numbers yet; we're going to get  
21 those numbers, we're going to figure out how to do  
22 this -- this is something we're asking every employer  
23 in the district, especially in Sunset Park, that  
24 wants development in some way -- expansion -- to give  
25 us the numbers; it's not enough to say we're doing it

1  
2 and that we're working with Workforce1, those days  
3 are gone; we need data to tell us exactly how you're  
4 doing it, and to actually try to do better. And I  
5 think there's going to be a lot of testimony here,  
6 and I hope your staff stays for that testimony;  
7 there's going to be ideas about how to do that in our  
8 schools, to get pipelines ready for young people to  
9 get excited about Citi Bike. If all of us are  
10 aligned right now, and I think we are; we want to see  
11 Citi Bike at every corner; that's going to expand --  
12 and so what we want to know is, the analysis of that  
13 gap for public funding to be able to get us there,  
14 from Staten Island to the Rockaways, we have a robust  
15 Citi Bike bike share program in play, which means  
16 that what you have right now is going to double, I'm  
17 assuming more jobs, but having that in place today,  
18 at the level that we are today, is going to be the  
19 most critical thing and we need to see that. If you  
20 want our support, if you want to stay in the city;  
21 that's going to have to be something that we measure  
22 and pull data around, and so that's the big message  
23 for us today.

24 And the last thing is public health, and  
25 what does Motivate think about, not just on the money

1  
2 piece, 'cause we get the contiguous communication,  
3 but what about programs like public health programs;  
4 what's the role of Motivate to develop those programs  
5 with community members and the Council Members and  
6 the City to figure out how Motivate changes their own  
7 business plan for a public health purpose rather than  
8 just a kind of for-profit model that we're seeing and  
9 hearing and feeling and experiencing today?

10 JAY WALDER: I'm actually very happy to  
11 hear you raise the question of public health.  
12 Recently there was an article put out by  
13 PricewaterhouseCoopers about our company and the  
14 title of article was "Motivate the Accidental  
15 Wellness Company." I think your point is incredibly  
16 well taken; that the public health benefits that come  
17 from people actually exercising in this way and  
18 utilizing bicycles in this way are very, very  
19 significant. The most important part of that, of  
20 course, is getting people into the program, getting  
21 people on bikes, getting people using it and all the  
22 health benefits that come from being able to do that.  
23 And again, I think that goes a lot to the role of  
24 working with community in doing that. I hope you'll  
25 have time, and I know she's here, to hear from Tracey



1  
2 Capers from Bedford Stuyvesant Restoration, because  
3 she speaks much more eloquently than I do, frankly,  
4 about this, and I've heard her speak about it, but  
5 she speaks from personal experience and she speaks  
6 from the way in which it matters. One of your  
7 colleagues earlier today, who I had not seen for a  
8 long time, since I was the chair of the MTA, said to  
9 me that -- he said, "Wow, you look like you've lost  
10 weight." I have to tell you, the most exercise I'm  
11 getting now is riding a bicycle. [background  
12 comment] Yeah.

13 DANI SIMONS: Can I... [crosstalk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Oh go ahead.

15 DANI SIMONS: Council Member; can I add  
16 one more thing? I'd just like to say also that this  
17 year, for the first time, United Healthcare, under  
18 their Oxford Health Plan, will be offering  
19 reimbursements for Citi Bike membership in the same  
20 way they offer reimbursements for gym memberships and  
21 things like that, and I think that that's another  
22 promising avenue that we would love to work with you  
23 and your colleagues on; getting more health insurance  
24 companies to provide that as a benefit, which makes  
25 Citi Bike more affordable to all residents and makes

1  
2 them really think of this in the way of public health  
3 and makes them think of it as something they can do  
4 to improve their personal health on a day-to-day  
5 basis through their daily activity without having to  
6 go to the gym, but while getting this reimbursement  
7 from their health insurance company, so I think  
8 that's really positive as well and we'd love to work  
9 with you to try to figure out ways to expand that.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And my final  
11 point on the health piece, and really, everything  
12 we've been talking about, we've got to move away from  
13 this concept of accidental benefits and it's like oh  
14 wow, look, people are more healthy and really create  
15 intentional programs and initiatives and investment  
16 in these places where we can actually measure our  
17 success, and that's what I'm hoping to hear more from  
18 you, not just today, but beyond and from people that  
19 are going to be testifying today; I think there are  
20 some steps that we can take, and they're going to  
21 just require investment, money, money from public,  
22 money from you all, restructuring potentially third-  
23 party revenues. Is that a priority for you as you  
24 think about expansion?

1  
2 JAY WALDER: It is. I think though the  
3 point Dani was making... [crosstalk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: How is it a  
5 priority?

6 JAY WALDER: Excuse me?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And how is it...  
8 So if it is a... [crosstalk]

9 JAY WALDER: Right.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: if it is a  
11 priority; how...? [crosstalk]

12 JAY WALDER: Look, I... I think our  
13 obligation in all of this is to show that we can  
14 deliver and continue to have a first-rate bike share  
15 program that we can seek and reap all the benefits  
16 that come with that, and as what was mentioned by the  
17 Commissioner, that we continue to bring ingenuity and  
18 creativity in the way in which we're able to do that,  
19 both for running the system and to be able to raise  
20 revenues and do it.

21 We don't shy away from that in doing  
22 that. I think my point again to you, Council Member,  
23 is that the objectives laid out by the Council today  
24 are broad; they're strong. I'm usually supportive of  
25 them; don't misunderstand me. I want to see us work

1  
2 together to be able to find the ways to be able to  
3 achieve that, which I think will require thinking  
4 beyond the model that we have today; not abandoning  
5 it, but thinking about how to be able to evolve it in  
6 a way that still continued to have responsibility and  
7 thought about bringing creativity and ingenuity into  
8 this; that continues to look for the health benefits  
9 and other things that are there, but that recognizes  
10 to be able to bring some of the broader objectives  
11 that are outlined will require us to evolve that  
12 model.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Good; I'm  
14 looking forward to working with you on that. Thank  
15 you, Chair.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. So  
17 when you look at the data, most memberships are  
18 residents of the city or tourists?

19 JAY WALDER: Oh most membership is  
20 residents of the city, by far.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And most New  
22 Yorkers like who use their Citi Bike to go to work,  
23 do you think that they are... how far do they live from  
24 the place where they rent the bike to the work site?  
25

1  
2 JAY WALDER: So the average member takes  
3 120 trips a year, some take many, many more than  
4 that; some take fewer, but on average, people take  
5 120 trips a year; on average, the distance of each  
6 trip is about a mile and a half; is that correct? So  
7 about a mile and a half for each trip on average.  
8 The purposes and why people take trips and where they  
9 are going and what they are doing is as vast as you  
10 could possibly imagine -- some of it is going to  
11 work, as you say; some of it is connecting in a  
12 better way to the traditional transit system and  
13 making the linkages that are there in doing that.  
14 The way in which it's filled in what we might call  
15 transit deserts have been very, very important in  
16 doing it; some people are using it for pleasure; some  
17 people are finding that it's just a better way to be  
18 able to get around and it's quicker and easier to be  
19 able to do that. The beauty of it is that you don't  
20 have to choose; you use it when it fits like it works  
21 for you, it's there, it's in your pocket, it's in  
22 front of you and you do it and when you don't want to  
23 use it or when it doesn't fit for you on a particular  
24 day, you don't have to, there's no obligation that's  
25 associated with it in doing that. But we're happy to

1  
2 say that we will have close to 14 million trips this  
3 year from people making a choice, going out every day  
4 and saying hey, I want to use this.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Can we say that  
6 most people who use it are middle class and upper  
7 class?

8 JAY WALDER: I don't know that I have  
9 stats on that, but broad.. I don't know the.. broadly  
10 that may be correct.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah. Because  
12 again, like as you addressed in your testimony, DOT,  
13 as you say, DOT and yourself and your team, you're  
14 working together to design and deliver an incredible  
15 new transit system, so.. and as I said before too, I  
16 hope to see the 8.8 million New Yorkers be middle  
17 class, but when we opened in the budget season and  
18 the budget director, he came here and testified that  
19 could close to 50% of New Yorkers, they live on the  
20 poverty line; they are our neighbors who live few  
21 neighbors from we live. So I think that I see Citi  
22 Bike having a great future sustaining by itself and  
23 the private investment if Citi Bike is only designed  
24 to be in the area where you are covering today. The  
25 question is going to be the volume; how will Citi

1  
2 Bike be able to sustain itself as a company when you  
3 don't have the same volume of ridership of people who  
4 live in some places in the Bronx, in Brooklyn, in  
5 Queens that... you know, that's my concern when it  
6 comes to -- do we... it is sustainable to say that we  
7 can expand Citi Bike to other communities only with  
8 private sponsorship?

9 JAY WALDER: I do not believe that we can  
10 do what you are describing with just private  
11 sponsorship. I also believe that there's a huge  
12 opportunity in the diversity of New York in the  
13 different communities to be able to bring Citi Bike  
14 to many, many more communities. I'm encouraged by  
15 what we see about building up from the grassroots; I  
16 think it's an important part of being able to bring  
17 Citi Bike, and I think when you talk about the change  
18 that can take place, I think we have to look at this  
19 as a multi-year process in which we're building it,  
20 in which it's growing stronger, in which more and  
21 more people are using it, in which the word of mouth  
22 in the community says this is a good way to be able  
23 to travel and get around, and as more and more people  
24 become aware of it, it becomes a stronger and

1  
2 stronger part of the community that is there, and  
3 saving people money.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: The challenge  
5 again that I see from my end, and you are the one  
6 overseeing the whole operation, is that people who  
7 use it in the Midtown area or in the area where we  
8 have Citi Bike right now in Queens or Brooklyn, they  
9 are... you know, those are great New Yorkers who can  
10 afford; my thing is, what about the other 50% who  
11 cannot afford? And I don't see Citi Bike as a mode  
12 of transportation for someone who lives in the south  
13 Bronx to come to work here or go to work an hour and  
14 a half; I see as a, you know in a day where you want  
15 to get to your family, you can take for pleasure  
16 getting to the bike, but if we want to expand Citi  
17 Bike for people to go to work or travel around their  
18 neighborhood, you know, this is not going to be easy  
19 -- I just see the same approach as having Citi Bike  
20 in the Midtown area. You know people who use it here  
21 in an average day is not someone that has a  
22 membership and they're renting a bike on 14th Street  
23 and they go to work to Columbia Presbyterian, like  
24 they usually work in the same neighborhood. So if we  
25 are looking to expand it as a great new transit



1  
2 system, so we also have to look and to the study on  
3 what is the market that we have for people to use it  
4 just to be traveling around the same neighborhood  
5 where they live; they are not going to be coming here  
6 to Midtown where we have 53 million tourists that  
7 they also are part of the market.

8 JAY WALDER: I think that's very well  
9 put. I think Citi Bike, as it continues to expand,  
10 will be more community-based; will be moving in  
11 different patterns. Look, we also know that the  
12 traditional transit system, and New York has one of  
13 the greatest subways in the world, was built with the  
14 idea that we were taking people from the outer  
15 boroughs to Manhattan to jobs. Today the location of  
16 jobs, the way in which we move around the city, the  
17 way in which people commute is fundamentally  
18 different than it was 100 years ago when everything  
19 was concentrated in Lower Manhattan. I think one of  
20 the beauties that we're seeing about Citi Bike is it  
21 actually allows movement across communities in a way  
22 that the traditional transit system doesn't  
23 facilitate quite as well, and that's one of the other  
24 benefits that we have of seeing Citi Bike in outer  
25 areas.

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Now  
3 we're going to be calling the next panel. Paul  
4 Steely from Transportation Alternatives, Tracey  
5 Capers from Bedford Stuyvesant, Christopher DeCicco  
6 from Staten Island Borough President, and Thomas  
7 Lucania from Bronx Borough President. ...in three  
8 minutes, so if you can summarize if the testimony is  
9 too long, you can do that.

10 PAUL STEELY WHITE: Thank you Chairman.  
11 I'm Paul Steely White, Executive Director of  
12 Transportation Alternatives. In my written testimony  
13 you will find some -- we cover a number of issues  
14 that have already arisen today including the need to  
15 make the system more accessible and equitable and  
16 celebrating the success that the system has enjoyed  
17 since the recent investment in leadership.

18 I'd like to focus my remarks on safety,  
19 however. Twice we saw the Commissioner touch wood  
20 [knocks on table] when mentioning the stellar safety  
21 record that Citi Bike has enjoyed. I think she also  
22 made reference to the fact that the bikes themselves  
23 are slow and maybe more conducive to safe riding; I'm  
24 not sure if that's true necessarily, but one factor  
25 that the Commissioner did not mention with regard to

1  
2 safety is that the current Citi Bike service area has  
3 a lot of protected bike lanes in it; it's great  
4 coverage. The expansion area, however, has a dearth  
5 of safe, protected bike lanes. What do exist in the  
6 expansion area are a number of Vision Zero priority  
7 corridors that have not been fixed. There are in  
8 fact almost twice as many Vision Zero priority  
9 corridors -- read dangerous deadly streets -- than  
10 protected bike lanes in the expansion area.

11 I think there is a fair amount of  
12 complacency about the safety record that Citi Bike  
13 has enjoyed and I'm just here finally to sound the  
14 alarm that the DOT must commit more resources to  
15 fixing those dangerous streets that they have deemed  
16 dangerous in the expansion area and that of course  
17 has budget implications, but it's an investment that  
18 the City should take. Thank you.

19 TRACEY CAPERS: Hello, I'm Tracey Capers;  
20 I'm Executive Vice President for Programs...  
21 [background comment] Good morning. I'm Tracey  
22 Capers; I'm Executive Vice President for Programs.

23 First of all, I want to thank the Council  
24 for this opportunity, particularly Council Member  
25

1  
2 Rodriguez; it was a pleasure to meet you last week  
3 and serve on a panel about the future of Citi Bike.

4 I am here as a proud Citi Bike member;  
5 I'm here as Executive Vice President of Bed-Stuy  
6 Restoration; I'm here as part of a national movement  
7 that is actually promoting bike share across the  
8 country. There are a number of organizations and  
9 cities across the country that are struggling and  
10 working on the same issue about how do we get bike  
11 share to low-income communities and people of color,  
12 so I'm part of a national cohort, and I'm also a  
13 proud partner with many people who are here to  
14 testify; I'm here with Citi Bike, Department of  
15 Transportation and Department of Health and  
16 Interfaith Hospital, MARP, Woodhull Hospital and  
17 community residents. What we've been doing over the  
18 last year and a half is really trying to lead a  
19 collective impact model really looking at how do we  
20 increase ridership among people of color and low-  
21 income populations in the community of Bed-Stuy.

22 So what I want to focus on, just a few  
23 things, just to pull out some pieces from my  
24 testimony. You know what's interesting is;  
25 Restoration got involved in March of 2015, at a time

1 when Citi Bike was expanding; it was in its second  
2 wave of expansion into Bed-Stuy, and we got involved  
3 at a time, of course, when the neighborhood was going  
4 through considerable gentrification and there was,  
5 you know, quite a lot of skepticism about bike share  
6 as a gentrification harbinger. Also, there was a lot  
7 of skepticism about the loss of parking spaces. But  
8 what we decided to do, as this collective impact  
9 model, was to really get involved to see, as a  
10 community leader, could we take the steps to change  
11 the conversation, and how powerful could it be if we  
12 could change the conversation from it not being a  
13 gentrifying tool, but to it being a tool for the  
14 residents as a health tool, a transportation tool;  
15 economic mobility tool, so that's what we've set out  
16 to do and we've been doing that through having a  
17 monthly meetings, sharing data, reinforcing each  
18 other's activities, and the results have been  
19 enormous.  
20

21 So you know, a couple of things that I  
22 want to highlight that Jay referred to is: (1) that  
23 over the last year and a half there has been an  
24 increase of membership, over 50% and you know, [bell]  
25 if my data is correct, there was about 3,700 members

1  
2 a year ago and now there are close to 5,000 members  
3 today, so that's a tremendous increase. And what  
4 we've done, you know specifically, is a number of  
5 things and what we've really tried to do is bring  
6 together community organizations and community  
7 residents to really showcase to the community that  
8 the bike share system is for them. So what we've  
9 done is conducted a regular advertising campaign,  
10 marketing campaign, including regular bike rides led  
11 by community residents who are here -- Kweli,  
12 Shaquana -- also we've had Council Member Cornegy and  
13 others lead regular rides to really show the  
14 residents that the bike share system is for them.

15 A couple other things that we've done  
16 that will be highlighted is really that we're really  
17 tried to push policy and practice change among the  
18 agencies, so for example, as a public health  
19 intervention, what we've done is, we've leveraged  
20 funding that we've gotten from the Department of  
21 Health to bring other partners onboard. For example,  
22 we brought Interfaith and Woodhull onboard to -- what  
23 they've done is embrace Citi Bike as a corporate  
24 wellness tool for their employees and so Interfaith  
25 and Woodhull are the first hospitals that are making

1  
2 the Citi Bike membership available to their  
3 employees, and even more so what's really exciting  
4 and interesting is; a number of initiatives have  
5 grown out of the project, including a prescriber bike  
6 program that Interfaith Hospital has started in  
7 partnership with Department of Health. So we really  
8 see it as a key public health intervention tool. And  
9 I think -- I'm probably out of my time -- but I think  
10 the last thing that I want to say is that I really  
11 see that it is necessary, for a bike share to work,  
12 for it to be expanded across all neighborhoods and  
13 for people to embrace it they need to see it in all  
14 the neighborhoods and we have to increase the  
15 normative value of bike share in communities around  
16 the city. So if I live in East New York but I work  
17 in Bed-Stuy, it is important to have the bike share  
18 system in communities nearby.

19           So I think -- I mean I think what I want  
20 to say personally that I've found is that it -- I  
21 ride Citi Bike; I did not believe in Citi Bike  
22 initially; I took it on because I thought it was  
23 important as a community-based leader to take it on;  
24 now I ride the bike and it allows me to get across a  
25 neighborhood where there are transit deserts; I get

1  
2 across Bed-Stuy; I get downtown much more  
3 effectively. You know Shaquana, who is our poster  
4 child of public housing and Myrtle Avenue, she's  
5 ridden the bike 600 times in the last year and that  
6 equated to nine cents a ride, because she got the  
7 membership as a public housing resident. So there  
8 are more and more examples that you will hear, and  
9 I'll stop there.

10 CHRIS DECICCO: Good afternoon

11 Mr. Chairman. My name is Chris DeCicco; I'm here  
12 representing Borough President James Oddo from Staten  
13 Island. You have our written testimony; I'm not  
14 going to read it; I'll go through a few highlights of  
15 it and I'll be brief.

16 We just want to say that we support the  
17 idea of Citi Bike as a five-borough system and that  
18 means Staten Island should be a part of it. We've  
19 been thinking long and hard about the initial foray  
20 into Staten Island, where that can go and the North  
21 Shore corridor seems to be the most logical place.  
22 More than a billion dollars in private investment is  
23 coming to that area, with new housing, new amenities.

24 At the back of our testimony we put  
25 together a little map of what we've been thinking of,



1  
2 roughly bounded by Snug Harbor on the west and Alice  
3 Austen House on the eastern part.

4           The universe of riders for Citi Bike  
5 would be diverse; we're looking at tourists who  
6 finally discovered Staten Island and are coming off  
7 of the ferry; we're also looking at new residents who  
8 are calling the North Shore home. For example, those  
9 living in the new Urby development would use it as  
10 part of their daily commute to Manhattan; they would  
11 actually save money using it 'cause now they wouldn't  
12 have to take the train to the ferry anymore; they  
13 would take Citi Bike to the ferry, and that \$155  
14 membership for the year is much better than the train  
15 fare.

16           Ultimately, when we consider Citi Bike's  
17 future, we need to decide the role we wish Citi Bike  
18 to play in our city -- Is it an important part of our  
19 public transportation infrastructure? If the answer  
20 is yes, then the idea of subsidizing Citi Bike with  
21 public funds does not seem crazy or farfetched, since  
22 all the other public transportation is subsidized.  
23 And if it is public transportation, it simply must be  
24 expanded into Staten Island. Staten Island has a  
25 notorious lack of public transportation options based

1  
2 on decisions that were made decades ago. We cannot  
3 be left out of this one as well.

4 The Borough President is committed to  
5 working with Mr. Walder, DOT and the Administration  
6 to design a workable Citi Bike solution on Staten  
7 Island. We know that challenges exist, but we feel  
8 that we have the outlines of a plan that could work  
9 with the right support and the right combination of  
10 public and private funding.

11 And just to be clear, the beauty of this  
12 form of transportation is that it's flexible and it  
13 adapts to a community, so admittedly, it will look  
14 different in the North Shore of Staten Island than it  
15 looks in Downtown Manhattan or in Times Square and  
16 that's okay; you know we're ready to work together  
17 with the Administration on making it happen. Thank  
18 you.

19 TOM LUCANIA: Good afternoon. My name is  
20 Tom Lucania and I am here representing Bronx Borough  
21 President Ruben Diaz, Jr. I am here today to discuss  
22 the potential expansion of Citi Bike to all five  
23 boroughs and the need to create new revenue streams  
24 to drive that expansion forward.

1  
2 Over the past eight years, my borough has  
3 seen tremendous new investment. Not only have we  
4 attracted new businesses and built thousands of new  
5 housing units of all types, we have brought record  
6 infrastructure spending to the Bronx as well.

7 The Grand Concourse is undergoing major  
8 renovations, and many of our subway stations have  
9 seen complete overhauls. Most significantly, we have  
10 secured the nearly \$1 billion in funding for the  
11 long-awaited East Bronx Metro North Expansion, thanks  
12 to strong partnerships with Governor Andrew Cuomo and  
13 the MTA.

14 Despite such record investment, transit  
15 equity continues to elude us in a very high-profile  
16 way.

17 Citi Bike is nowhere to be found in the  
18 Bronx, and that must change.

19 In August 2015, I was shocked when Citi  
20 Bike announced that they had expanded to, of all  
21 places, Jersey City. How could Citi Bike go to New  
22 Jersey before it goes to all five boroughs? The City  
23 in Citi Bike has to mean something. Since then, I  
24 have heard from my constituents over and over again  
25

1  
2 that they feel slighted by the lack of a Bronx bike  
3 sharing option. We have an opportunity to fix that.

4 With transit fares set to rise, it is  
5 incumbent upon the City to do what it can to provide  
6 more options for affordable transportation throughout  
7 not only the Bronx, but across the five boroughs.

8 A Citi Bike membership -- at just \$155  
9 per year -- is not only a cost-effective means of  
10 transportation, but can also help remove cars from  
11 our roads and ease congestion on other mass transit  
12 options.

13 Citi Bike has always endeavored to be a  
14 five-borough entity, and to serve as an essential  
15 part of our transit system. Bike sharing, we are  
16 told, works best not as an alternative to buses and  
17 subways, but as a piece of the total transit puzzle  
18 -- an integrated part of our existing public transit  
19 system. Right now, Citi Bike is funded entirely  
20 through private funds and revenues generated by  
21 memberships. Though taxpayer assets such as street  
22 space have been used to further its expansion, not a  
23 penny of direct taxpayer funding has been granted to  
24 the program.

1  
2 Contrast that with other forms of public  
3 transportation, which are publicly subsidized. And  
4 this is how we have to view Citi Bike, as an  
5 important part of our public transportation  
6 infrastructure and network.

7 To that end, City Hall must consider  
8 providing Citi Bike with an infusion of taxpayer  
9 funds. This funding, when combined with existing and  
10 new private revenue, can accelerate the expansion of  
11 bike sharing to all five boroughs.

12 The Mayor has stated public that Citi  
13 Bike must be expanded to the Bronx. To make that  
14 happen, the City must allocate funding to expand bike  
15 sharing across all five boroughs. With a strong  
16 public financing commitment, new sponsors can be  
17 brought to the program. A commitment from the City  
18 would undoubtedly lead to an even better commitment  
19 from private partners.

20 My office is committed to working with  
21 City Hall to develop a plan to expand Citi Bike to  
22 the Bronx.

23 With an infusion of public funding, we  
24 can make such an expansion a reality.

25 Thank you.

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: First of all,  
3 thank you for your contribution in the debate, and  
4 others; I think it was important, both to highlight  
5 the safety issue and also knowing that this is going  
6 to be critical as we will continue a conversation on  
7 our budget for 2018.

8 Have the borough presidents -- and if you  
9 don't have information, that's fine -- but have the  
10 borough presidents also made any decisions if they  
11 are ready to put also some of their own capital  
12 dollars if -- as you heard from the Council Members,  
13 we are asking the Mayor for City Hall to be part of  
14 investing here, but also we are saying, from the own  
15 capital dollars that we have, there are a number of  
16 Council Members that we also are committed to say we  
17 are ready to share our investment here. Is it  
18 something that you have talked or not?

19 CHRIS DECICCO: Haven't...

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay.

21 CHRIS DECICCO: Haven't discussed it

22 **[inaudible]**.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. Thank  
24 you. [background comments] Eric McClure, from  
25 StreetsPAC, Sarah Kaufman, from NYU Rudin Center for

1  
2 Transportation, [background comments] and Adrienne  
3 Downey from Pratt Center for Community Development.

4 [pause]

5 [background comments]

6 RICH CONROY: Good afternoon. I am Rich  
7 Conroy, the Director of Education at Bike New York;  
8 our President Ken Podziba asked me to represent Bike  
9 New York at this hearing. I would like to thank the  
10 Transportation Committee for holding this important  
11 hearing on the future of Citi Bike.

12 I will just emphasize two points: one is  
13 that we regard Citi Bike as a type of public  
14 transportation; it's become a vital part of New York  
15 City's transportation mix. As other speakers have  
16 pointed out, it fills in gaps; it allows people  
17 flexibility to get to places quickly, maybe where  
18 buses or subways would be more slow for them. As  
19 such, we think that Citi Bike ought to receive some  
20 public funding and we are very glad to see that being  
21 considered and discussed in this hearing. Two years  
22 ago, our CEO, Ken Podziba, published an op-ed piece,  
23 I believe in the *New York Times*, advocating that Citi  
24 Bike or bike share in New York City receive public  
25 funding.

1  
2           The second piece I want to emphasize is  
3 the question of safety. Safety certainly has a lot  
4 to do with what the street looks like and how it's  
5 designed, but it also has a lot to do with how people  
6 use it, use the streets, what they know and what they  
7 do, and what they choose to do. Bike New York has  
8 partnered with Citi Bike to offer Citi Bike Street  
9 Skills classes and these classes teach people how to  
10 use the Citi Bike system in terms of signing up,  
11 using the Citi Bike stations, using their cards,  
12 using the bikes, and putting them back. It also  
13 teaches people how to use the streets safely. To  
14 that end, in four years we have offered 85 classes,  
15 reaching more than 1,200 cyclists, and I'm actually  
16 not satisfied with those numbers, but I think the  
17 classes are a good way to reach people who don't  
18 necessarily think of themselves as cyclists or who  
19 may be afraid of cycling. We have also partnered  
20 with Citi Bike and the Department of Health to offer  
21 six-hour skills and knowledge classes for the Citi  
22 Bike to School and the Citi Bike for Youth programs.

23           I want to give a shout-out to Motivate  
24 staff Ann Krasner [sp?] and Dani Simons, who have  
25 helped us with these programs and have included us in



1  
2 them [bell] and to Councilman Ben Kallos, who has  
3 hosted some of the classes. And that concludes my  
4 remarks.

5 ERIC MCCLURE: Good afternoon. On behalf  
6 of StreetsPAC, I'd like to thank you, Chair Rodriguez  
7 for convening this oversight hearing today.

8 The first couple years of Citi Bike's  
9 struggles were well documented, but there's little  
10 dispute now that the bike share system is clearly on  
11 a roll -- more than 12 and a half million rides  
12 already this year -- that's a 25% increase from the  
13 total of 2015 -- 120,000 annual members; expansion  
14 into several new districts this past summer, hitting  
15 almost 70,000 rides on a number of occasions last  
16 month; and next spring Citi Bike will roll out  
17 further into Harlem, Queens and Brooklyn.

18 While the present is bright for Citi  
19 Bike, however, its future is a little less clear. No  
20 concrete public plans exist for further growth of the  
21 system once Phase II expansion is complete in 2017.  
22 Will Citi Bike top out at 12,000 bikes? Or will it  
23 continue to grow to serve even more New Yorkers,  
24 delivering the convenience and efficiency of bike  
25

1  
2 share to neighborhoods thirsting for reliable, low-  
3 cost transit options?

4 This committee, and the City Council as a  
5 whole, has a key role to play in shaping that future.

6 It's well documented that a successful  
7 bike share system is geographically contiguous, with  
8 dense station placements. That being the case, to  
9 properly serve as a viable transportation option in  
10 neighborhoods served poorly by existing transit, Citi  
11 Bike needs to continue to grow robustly. That kind  
12 of growth will only come with a public funding  
13 component.

14 Additionally, the City must find a way to  
15 extend the NYCHA discount to other low-income  
16 communities. As Tracey Capers said two weeks ago at  
17 a recent Rudin Center forum on Citi Bike, "NYCHA is  
18 not the proxy for poor." We need to get creative in  
19 making the system accessible to all New Yorkers,  
20 economically as well as geographically.

21 We currently subsidize suburban railroad  
22 riders to the tune of several dollars a ride, while  
23 the subsidy for some of our ferry routes is two to  
24 three times that much. A meaningful public  
25 contribution to bike share expansion would require a

1  
2 tiny fraction of that. A number of Council Members  
3 have already indicated a willingness to contribute  
4 discretionary funds to Citi Bike operation, and now  
5 is the moment to begin figuring out what shape that  
6 public support should take.

7 StreetsPAC began running an online poll  
8 last week, in anticipation of today's hearing, asking  
9 people if they think the City should contribute  
10 public funds to bike share. While the poll is  
11 unscientific, to be sure, more than 96% of  
12 respondents have answered yes.

13 Bike share is a relatively low-cost,  
14 high-return, on-demand transit option that's healthy  
15 for users, to boot. We need to begin planning now  
16 for the third phase of expansion, addressing equity  
17 and operational issues to ensure New York City Bike  
18 Share's long-term success. Let's make sure we keep  
19 Citi Bike rolling into the future by making smart  
20 decisions beginning today. Thank you.

21 SARAH KAUFMAN: Good afternoon. My name  
22 is Sarah Kaufman; I'm the Assistant Director of the  
23 NYU Rudin Center for Transportation.

24 Citi Bike is essential to New York City.  
25 Riders take up to 70,000 rides per day, more than any

1  
2 bus route in the city. The program is on track to  
3 exceed 14 million rides in 2016, almost matching the  
4 Staten Island Ferry.

5           There are 614 Citi Bike stations in New  
6 York City, or about one every 1,000 feet in the  
7 service area, providing a density that is convenient  
8 and key to its success.

9           It's a first/last mile solution, bringing  
10 people from areas lacking sufficient subway access,  
11 like the far west side of Manhattan, to subway  
12 stations. Nearly a quarter of Citi Bike trips are  
13 less than ten minutes long, and the busiest times are  
14 during the morning and evening rush hours. Seventy-  
15 two percent of stations are within a quarter-mile of  
16 a subway station entrance. So Citi Bike is a  
17 convenient way to connect with areas and connect  
18 areas underserved by subways.

19           In fact, commuters are frequently  
20 connecting between transit and Citi Bike -- the Citi  
21 Bike stations near Penn Station, Grand Central and  
22 the Port Authority Bus Terminal are three of the  
23 most-used stations every weekday, with approximately  
24 36,000 trips every month originating from those  
25 stations.

1  
2 Oftentimes Citi Bike is an alternative  
3 for transit. After Superstorm Sandy but before Citi  
4 Bike launched, 30,000 people commuted to work by  
5 bicycle when the subway was not functioning. It's a  
6 highly climate-resistant transportation mode. We  
7 estimate that in 2019, when the L train is closed for  
8 repairs, tens of thousands additional Citi Bike trips  
9 will occur.

10 A challenge for Citi Bike is its lack of  
11 diverse ridership. In the Rudin Center report  
12 looking at Citi Bike's first two years, we found that  
13 80% of trips were taken by men. Women often cite a  
14 lack of safe riding conditions as a reason for not  
15 biking. However, an expansion of Citi Bike to the  
16 residential streets of areas like Harlem, Bed-Stuy  
17 and Astoria will help to even out this imbalance. In  
18 addition, installing protected bike lanes will be  
19 essential to the success of Citi Bike growth.

20 To increase membership among lower-income  
21 New Yorkers, Citi Bike offers low-cost plans, like a  
22 \$5.00 per month membership plan for all NYCHA  
23 residents. Now, more than 2,000 active affordability  
24 members are registered.

1  
2 Citi Bike has quickly become an integral  
3 part of the city's transportation network, and I look  
4 forward to seeing it expand for all New Yorkers. I  
5 commend the City Council Transportation Committee for  
6 focusing on the public policies essential to expand  
7 Citi Bike to low-income neighborhoods throughout the  
8 city. Thank you.

9 ADRIENNE DOWNEY: Good afternoon. My  
10 name is Adrienne Downey and I'm delivering testimony  
11 on behalf of the Pratt Center.

12 Chair Rodriguez; Council Members, thank  
13 you for the opportunity to testify today. Pratt  
14 Center for Community Development works for a more  
15 just, equitable and sustainable New York City by  
16 supporting low- and moderate-income communities to  
17 plan for and realize their futures, and transportation  
18 equity is one of the core areas in which we work.

19 As the future of the system is considered  
20 for Citi Bike to reach its potential, if we wish to  
21 enhance transportation equity and support public  
22 health and environmental objectives, we wish to  
23 emphasize a few considerations.

24 First, Citi Bike must be accessible to  
25 those who need it most. Citi Bike cannot assist with

1  
2 economic mobility if potential users are too poor to  
3 access the system. It is essential that lower-income  
4 residents and residents without access to credit have  
5 the opportunity to participate in the program.

6 To be serious about accessibility,  
7 targets for the numbers of low-income users should be  
8 set and progress against these goals should be  
9 measured and reviewed.

10 Second, we recommend that bike share be  
11 planned for explicitly in a way that integrates  
12 transit planning and environmental justice  
13 considerations.

14 Specifically, the upcoming bus rapid  
15 transit planning process, mandated by Int. 1118 and  
16 slated to take place over the next year, is an  
17 opportunity to integrate bike share planning.

18 Furthermore, describing, planning for,  
19 and measuring the public health goals and health and  
20 environmental impacts of expanding Citi Bike access  
21 are essential steps to ensuring bike share meets its  
22 full potential.

23 And data on Citi Bike users should be  
24 made public.

1  
2 Third, partnership with community-based  
3 organizations in low-income and communities of color  
4 should be developed and resourced. We heard  
5 excellent testimony to that regard this afternoon.

6 Fourth, public financial support for bike  
7 share, where such support directly aligns with public  
8 policy goals, should be explored.

9 As a private entity, it is not reasonable  
10 to expect that Citi Bike alone has the capacity --  
11 let alone the motivation -- to meet the public policy  
12 goals that the New York City Council would desire  
13 from a bike share program. Over the next year, the  
14 City has the opportunity to define its goals more  
15 clearly, consider the benefits and the extent of  
16 public funding to support them, and co-design the  
17 future of the program.

18 With that, to conclude my remarks you  
19 have a copy of our written testimony and we thank you  
20 for the opportunity to testify and work together on  
21 these issues.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: The next panel --  
23 Nicholas Bedell, from TWU Local 100; Edith Prentiss,  
24 Kate Fillin from NACTO, [background comment] and



1 Alfie [background comment] Palao [background comment]  
2 from Kickstarter.

3 [pause]

4  
5 NICHOLAS BEDELL: Good morning and thank  
6 you for providing the union the opportunity to  
7 testify today. I just want to take a second and look  
8 at the history of how the Bike Share New York City  
9 became unionized. We were contacted by workers who  
10 had a variety of complaints about their working  
11 conditions, safety being the biggest, their  
12 contingent scheduling and lack of job security, and  
13 finally, their wages and we ended up, in exploring  
14 these issues, finding that the primary reason that  
15 New York City Bike Share employees wanted to  
16 unionized was because they were seeing the bike share  
17 crumble and they were seeing that it wasn't working  
18 and that it was being managed poorly and that the  
19 investment wasn't being made necessary to carry out  
20 the mission, and they were advocates of the bike  
21 share. And not only did they end up joining together  
22 and forming a union in New York City, but similarly,  
23 bike shares in Washington, D.C., Boston and Chicago  
24 came to us and unionized in the slip stream of New  
25 York City's effort, and I think there are a couple of

1 things that come out of this. The union's interest  
2 in getting involved in this industry has been --  
3 we're a transportation union -- and we were watching  
4 a new modality of transportation take shape and we're  
5 very concerned that as part of the green economy we  
6 were going to build a new system and build it on the  
7 backs of low-paid, low-wage workers who had no  
8 benefits and did not have a stake in the industry's  
9 development in a way that we thought was necessary.  
10 So since then we've managed to reach agreement with  
11 Motivate and their subsidiary bike chairs in the five  
12 other cities and have a union contract that governs  
13 terms and conditions of employment and the bike  
14 shares have started to improve in all those cities,  
15 and we believe it's largely because of the collective  
16 efforts of the unionized members to rationalize the  
17 way work is done and to improve the quality of the  
18 bike share.

20 Some interesting things come out of that.  
21 One of the ironies -- in Chicago, for example, they  
22 have a program for low-wage folks called Divvy for  
23 All, which is a \$5.00 membership, and in order to  
24 quality you have to be quite low-income. And it  
25 turned out that when the union arrived in Chicago,

1  
2 95% of the employees qualified for their low-income  
3 card. So what we really want to emphasize is that  
4 not only do we support the idea of equity in a bike  
5 share across an entire city and for everyone, but you  
6 need to build into this new industry equity in terms  
7 of the terms and conditions of the people who work,  
8 and what we're most excited about is supporting --  
9 and the union supports all the things that have been  
10 covered here -- we support public investment into the  
11 bike share; if we had our druthers, the MTA would  
12 have run it and it would've been just an extension of  
13 the public sector union [bell] members that we  
14 represent in the MTA, and we support the growth of  
15 the bike share to all five boroughs; the vast  
16 majority of folks who work for the bike share do not  
17 live in areas that have the bike share and it seems  
18 like an odd irony.

19 So we support all those things and mostly  
20 we would like to see the bike share cast as not only  
21 a service for folks in neighborhoods throughout the  
22 city, but as a place where it is providing high-  
23 quality, unionized, benefit-laden jobs for New York  
24 City residents.

25 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

1  
2           NICHOLAS BEDELL: You're welcome.

3           KATE FILLIN-YEH: Hello. My name is Kate  
4 Fillin-Yeh; I'm the Director of the Bike Share  
5 Initiative at NACTO, which is the National  
6 Association of City Transportation Officials. Prior  
7 to NACTO, I oversaw the creation of the Citi Bike  
8 system for New York City DOT; I wrote the 2009 City  
9 Planning Bike Share Feasibility Study for the City of  
10 New York, and through NACTO and the Better Bike Share  
11 Partnership, I have written extensively on best  
12 practices for creating equitable bike share systems.

13           The things that make bike share systems  
14 strong and healthy are also the things that make them  
15 equitable. These are: a political and technical  
16 commitment to a convenient, dense station network  
17 spread over a large, contiguous area; the commitment  
18 of City resources to match the bike share area with  
19 protected bike lanes; funding, from both the City and  
20 the operator, for partnerships with local groups,  
21 targeted marketing campaigns, and employment  
22 programs, and to this end, Citi Bike's very strong  
23 work with Bedford Stuyvesant Restoration and Recycle-  
24 A-Bicycle are a roadmap for the future; and fourth,  
25 pricing options that recognize that bike share is the

1  
2 cheapest form of transit available, while also  
3 expanding access to those at the lowest income  
4 levels. And I would point here to Philadelphia's  
5 very successful Access Pass, which offers a \$5.00 a  
6 month membership to everyone who has an EBT card.

7           But by these metrics, and in comparison  
8 to every other bike share system in the United States  
9 and the world, Citi Bike is an unqualified success.

10           NACTO's research shows that when stations  
11 are closer together, more people ride. New York  
12 City's target station density of 28 stations per  
13 square mile is the reason why half of all of the bike  
14 share trips in the United States since 2010 were made  
15 on a Citi Bike.

16           In contrast, experiments with satellite  
17 systems in San Francisco have failed spectacularly  
18 and are being scrapped. New York's commitment to  
19 contiguity and station density -- providing New  
20 Yorkers the same access to bike share in Bed-Stuy as  
21 in Tribeca -- is the foundation from which all equity  
22 efforts can grow.

23           With a look to the future, I want to  
24 conclude by encouraging the Council to take a look at  
25 the size of the proposed bike share system laid out

1  
2 in the 2009 City Planning study. Most of you need no  
3 encouragement to think about the need to expand bike  
4 share, but I want to offer some thoughts about how  
5 big and where.

6           The City Planning study found that bike  
7 share systems focused on neighborhoods with 30,000  
8 people per square mile or more were likely to be  
9 heavily used and profitable. In New York City, that  
10 would translate to a system of 49,000 bicycles or  
11 more. It would cover the majority of the city --  
12 creating east-west connections in Harlem and in the  
13 Bronx, making it easier to get to the E train from  
14 Elmhurst or to Prospect Park from East Flatbush; it  
15 would be transportation for the vast majority of New  
16 Yorkers.

17           While the specific findings of the study  
18 should be tested against Citi Bike's financials and  
19 their experience, and tempered by the reality that  
20 New York City's protected bike lane network is still  
21 incomplete, I urge the Council to embrace this  
22 comprehensive, bold, equitable vision of what bike  
23 share can be in New York and offer to New Yorkers.

24           And I thank the Council for this  
25 opportunity to testify.

1  
2 ALFIE PALAO: Alright. Thank you. My  
3 name is Alfie; I work at Kickstarter; I'm happy to be  
4 here. Like a lot of other people who are here today,  
5 I am a native New Yorker, I grew up in Queens, I went  
6 to school in the Bronx; I worked in Bay Ridge, so a  
7 lot of my life is commuting. And you know I'm happy  
8 to speak on behalf of Kickstarter and how our company  
9 has benefited from Citi Bike, a program that we have  
10 for our employees. I point out a few bullet points.

11 We're located in Greenpoint in Brooklyn,  
12 and we found out by adding a Citi Bike commuting  
13 option for our employees, people have more choices in  
14 how they get to and from work. A lot of people are  
15 big fans of it (myself included). You know, it can  
16 stand in on days when other transportation isn't  
17 running smoothly, and for some, it's become a healthy  
18 and convenient way to get to work every day.

19 We have nearly 50% of our staff signed up  
20 for it at the moment, and we've made it available  
21 across the board for employees to use -- and  
22 basically, like there are a lot of positive  
23 sentiments behind it in terms of like health benefit  
24 and just environmental impact.

25

1  
2 As an employer based in the neighborhood,  
3 we're glad to offer this benefit as a part of our  
4 employee benefits package -- it's a great way to  
5 support green commuting, encourage health and  
6 wellness and invest in local infrastructure all at  
7 the same time. From an employer perspective, it's  
8 low cost for all those positive rewards, and from an  
9 employee perspective, it's convenient and unique,  
10 which makes it appealing.

11 We love that Citi Bike connects us to  
12 other neighborhoods -- reducing our reliance on taxis  
13 and trains to get to and from meetings throughout the  
14 work week. It's a very convenient option to get to  
15 and from other less accessible areas, which is often  
16 where artists and other creative types that we want  
17 to connect with are located.

18 We're grateful for Citi Bike to be  
19 available and we've enjoyed our interactions with  
20 them.

21 EDITH PRENTISS: Sorry to be raining on  
22 your parade. My name is Edith Prentiss; I'm the  
23 President of the 504 Dems, the Chair of the Taxis for  
24 All Campaign and the Vice President for Legislative  
25 Affairs of Disabled in Action.



1  
2 Citi Bike should be called Uber Bike. In  
3 the three years it has grown dramatically, it has not  
4 a single accessible bike option in its fleet -- a  
5 clear violation of federal and city human rights law  
6 -- I'm not quite sure about the state one; we're  
7 still investigating that.

8 I think it's really important to notice  
9 that despite this wonderful, inclusive, equitable,  
10 etc. -- where the hell are we? We're not in any of  
11 this. Transportation desert -- sweetie, with less  
12 than 200 subway stations accessible, you better  
13 believe transportation deserts. This is ridiculous.  
14 Everyone is wonderful, happy; Motivate... Motivate has  
15 not a single accessible bike in its entire system.

16 There is another company known as Zagster  
17 -- Z A G S T E R -- that actually is inclusive. The  
18 City of Portland, Oregon, where Motivate has come  
19 from, is struggling with trying to develop an  
20 accessible program; trying to include quad, hand  
21 cranks and trikes. It's a little ridiculous for  
22 everyone to be sitting here talking about how  
23 wonderful this program is when you're not serving --  
24 sorry your artists are being left out, but so are we;  
25 it's ridiculous. You know you're talking about

1  
2 putting money into it, City money; we want service as  
3 well. Portland is doing an interesting thing;  
4 Portland is actually looking to, in their Biketown,  
5 purchase the bikes and have them put into bike shops  
6 and be rented by the bike shop. The problem with the  
7 entire Citi Bike scheme-up is: how am I going to get  
8 to the dock, manipulate the dock; where am I going to  
9 leave my chair? Do we not deserve recreation and  
10 exercise? Renting a bike or renting a quad bike or a  
11 trike are all options that we can often use from  
12 private bike shops. One of my favorite bike shops is  
13 on 15th Street and 6th Avenue; now if I am renting a  
14 bike from there, [bell] a hand cycle, I've got to  
15 wheel up 6th Avenue through traffic to Central Park;  
16 it's low, it's big, it's bulky; it certainly is not  
17 going to fit in my apartment. It's a little  
18 ridiculous to have this wonderful, happy -- it's just  
19 almost like sitting here talking about accessible  
20 taxis, which I have done way too many times, with no  
21 fruition. Yeah, we won the settlement, but we're  
22 being totally undercut by Uber and we're not getting  
23 support from the Council. I feel that this is going  
24 to be another example of where the disability  
25 community is so totally left out of the discussion

1  
2 that -- you know, it's like why are we paying taxes;  
3 what are we getting from it? We're certainly not  
4 being included in any of these happy programs, which  
5 we deserve as much as any other New Yorker. Thank  
6 you.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you  
8 everybody, especially Edith, for being an important  
9 voice for the community of disability and one of my  
10 constituents. I think that you are bringing an  
11 important approach and Motivate is here; they are  
12 taking notes. The good thing is that you know this  
13 conversation is about the future of Citi Bike, so  
14 what I hope is that you can put in a positive context  
15 of suggestions and recommendations that we should  
16 explore... [crosstalk]

17 EDITH PRENTISS: And... Yeah and the plan  
18 that was written in 2009, was there any inclusion of  
19 disability? I don't remember it.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Well but that's  
21 what I'm saying; almost... Citi Bike only went through  
22 bankrupt and it was rescued when a few years ago they  
23 were having a new team that was put in place; now  
24 what we are addressing -- what is the future of this  
25 mode of transportation, what I am saying that you are

1  
2 bringing good recommendations; we will be listening  
3 to your recommendations and definitely you will be  
4 part of the voice of the community of disability.

5 Thanks. Council Member Menchaca.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you,  
7 Chair. And thank you to the panel for your multiple  
8 and I think very important perspectives on the gaps I  
9 think that we're all talking about, and so everything  
10 from, specifically our kind of accessibility  
11 questions around bike share is important, but also  
12 the access to jobs. And so my first question is to  
13 Nick, and the union really; what can we do as a City  
14 Council to help you connect more people to the job  
15 opportunities that you're talking about and you  
16 testified about today?

17 NICHOLAS BEDELL: So I think there's a  
18 couple places that we could start thinking about  
19 trying to build a stable pipeline between schools.  
20 For example, you know one of the things that has  
21 occurred to us is: why not have a high school program  
22 that brings people into the bike business and has a  
23 job at the end of their training into Motivate. Why  
24 not think about an apprenticeship program? You know  
25 the thing that's interesting about the bicycle out

1  
2 there that is used by the bike share is it's a  
3 unique... it's sort of a unicorn; no mechanic in a  
4 normal bike shop knows how to fix this thing, and  
5 it's a very specialized skill and it faces very  
6 specialized challenges because of its heavy usage.  
7 And so I think that we could train specifically to  
8 this bike and to bike share bikes, which are a  
9 different animal, and provide a pipeline into the  
10 bike shops that Motivate is setting up. One of the  
11 things that Chairman Walder talked about was the  
12 seasonality of the system, and that is a good way to  
13 think about building apprenticeships into Citi Bike.  
14 There is no doubt that they have to hire on seasonal  
15 people as ridership levels rise in the warm weather  
16 -- and if global warming continues, we won't have  
17 this problem, but for the time being we do -- and  
18 then they let seasonal people go in the colder months  
19 where ridership is lower, and we argue with them  
20 about how many people should be year-round; we, of  
21 course, want significantly more; they want  
22 significantly less, and that's an ongoing battle.  
23 But that notwithstanding, I think there is an  
24 opportunity to train in people into the seasonal jobs  
25 and then make that a pipeline into full-time work,

1  
2 and as it expands, there should be significantly more  
3 opportunities in both bike mechanics, station techs  
4 and rebalancers; the answer, which is, as Polly  
5 pointed out multiple times, is the biggest issue; one  
6 of the solutions is more people.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you Nick  
8 for that, and I love the idea, and I think it's an  
9 idea that's percolating in Sunset Park, for example,  
10 for other job-generating, promising enterprises...

11 NICHOLAS BEDELL: Right.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: and so what  
13 role... do you have a specific sense about how the  
14 Council can play a specific role in achieving that  
15 goal?

16 NICHOLAS BEDELL: I think mostly that  
17 would... I mean I would like... I've talked... we have made  
18 contact with the Consortium for Worker Education --  
19 my former employer -- and funded, I believe,  
20 partially by the Council and the Job To Build  
21 program, and to try to initiate a training program  
22 and in order to do that, you kind of have to line up  
23 New York City Bike share, the union, the trainer, and  
24 have a job at the end... one of the worst things that  
25 you can do is train somebody to a job that doesn't

1  
2 exist -- it's sort of a Trump University version of  
3 job training. And I think that you want to train  
4 people into jobs that are going to be there, so we  
5 would need a commitment from Motivate that they would  
6 hire out of this training program and then connect  
7 the Consortium for Worker Education or the Workforce  
8 Development Institute or some of the other publicly  
9 funded job training programs to build that pipeline.  
10 And certainly it would seem -- at Sunset Park High  
11 School would seem, you know the logical graduating  
12 class right to... [crosstalk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: We're on the  
14 same page on...

15 NICHOLAS BEDELL: Yeah, right.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: on so many  
17 level... [crosstalk]

18 NICHOLAS BEDELL: I'm looking the look at  
19 that one.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Well and so  
21 now, going back to the union's role; what role would  
22 the union play in assisting the bike share program in  
23 training? What would you role... So again... [crosstalk]

24 NICHOLAS BEDELL: **[inaudible]**...

25

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: we have the  
3 concept...

4 NICHOLAS BEDELL: Yeah.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: what's your  
6 role?

7 NICHOLAS BEDELL: Yeah. So I think  
8 there's a couple. One; we would like to be at the  
9 table negotiating how that pipeline works and you  
10 know how you're compensated along the way, but also,  
11 you know there's 45 full-time mechanics right now at  
12 the New York City Bike Share; they're the only ones  
13 in New York City who know how to do this job, and so  
14 they're ultimately going to have to be the people who  
15 train new folks coming in. You know the management  
16 staff of Motivate doesn't know how to fix the bikes;  
17 the unionized staff does. And so I think that's the  
18 second piece. We'd like to see an apprenticeship to  
19 a fully experienced senior mechanic, to see people  
20 come through a journeyman stage and get to the point...  
21 and this is both for the... I mentioned mechanics, but  
22 also the station itself is a unique electronic entity  
23 which has very specific and very specialized skills  
24 that go along with the repair maintenance [sic] of  
25



1  
2 that. So there's many ways to bring people in, I  
3 think.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you for  
5 sharing that and I think we want to explore that a  
6 little bit more.

7 I have a question for Kickstarter. What  
8 role did Motivate play in your -- it sounds like a  
9 very successful kind of capture of people onto the  
10 program; did they play a big role in you building  
11 that kind of incentive within the company itself?

12 ALFIE PALAO: Did Motivate? I am not...  
13 [interpose]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Or anybody.  
15 Who helped you do this... [crosstalk]

16 ALFIE PALAO: We...

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Did you all  
18 just do it yourself?

19 ALFIE PALAO: It was through Citi Bike;  
20 it was like a partnership that we have with Citi Bike  
21 and... yeah and that was... I believe how we went  
22 through.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: So they kind of  
24 helped you build this -- they sat down with you; they  
25

1  
2 worked with you; they sat down with your HR teams and  
3 built this... all **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

4 ALFIE PALAO: Yeah, so we have... We have a  
5 few like benefits for employees and one of them was...  
6 it's kind of like we have a bike **[inaudible]**, 'cause  
7 we do a lot to like encourage people to like, you  
8 know, be proactive and healthy in the lifestyle, and  
9 I think -- yeah, we've been around for like six or  
10 seven years; Citi Bike, we first started... that  
11 partnership came about like about a year and a half  
12 ago, almost two years, and it was just like, you  
13 know, it seemed like a good benefit to extend to our  
14 employees.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And how  
16 critical was their involvement in this successful  
17 push? [interpose]

18 ALFIE PALAO: I mean it's kind of like  
19 half and half. You know, it's critical to the point  
20 of making that partnership happen; I think beyond  
21 that, in terms of like our team, it was just HR kind  
22 of being like hey, this is a new thing; it was pretty  
23 easy to set up, and you know, this is how you do it,  
24 and then again, 50% of our employees signed up.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: So it sounds  
3 like there's a lot of need in leadership at the  
4 company level to take this on and say we want to make  
5 this work and Motivate brings their pieces, but  
6 really, if it wasn't for you at the leadership level  
7 to make that a priority; it wouldn't necessarily  
8 happen.

9 ALFIE PALAO: I mean maybe; I don't know.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay. I'm just  
11 curious about how we expand the model.

12 ALFIE PALAO: Oh, sure, yeah.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And  
14 Miss Prentiss, a question for you. What do you see  
15 as a possible next step for the Council to help and  
16 members of this Committee and the Chair to really  
17 push that question about accessibility in bikes?  
18 What do you see as the next step and what we can take  
19 to help that question move forward with actual  
20 response that would be acceptable?

21 EDITH PRENTISS: I think you're going to  
22 have to be continuing to fund the nonprofits, the  
23 United Spinal, etc, which have programs --  
24 unfortunately, there are programs in which you end up  
25 going to a park and you ride around a track; it's

1 very... it's next to impossible in a city like New York  
2 to do much more than that, unless you're going to  
3 have a bike share entity in the park and you're going  
4 to make that park -- it's probably going to be -- or  
5 it's going to be like Flushing Meadows -- god help us  
6 -- which are a nightmare to get to, but people can  
7 go. As of now, all we can do is basically be  
8 inconvenienced [sic] by bike share bikes on  
9 sidewalks blocking us. You know, I'm sorry; the  
10 reality is, every time you put -- like Councilwoman  
11 Chin said, you know they put a bike share dock on a  
12 plaza that's for public art. Excuse me; it had a  
13 purpose before bike share existed and I think we need  
14 to respect other entities. But when we start looking  
15 at all of these options, I mean the bottom line is, I  
16 would never ride a hand crank up 6th Avenue to get to  
17 the park. If there were a bike share on the edge of  
18 Central Park or in the edge of Flushing Meadows or  
19 wherever; those would be appropriate options. We  
20 cannot use bike shares for the first and the last  
21 mile. I am not leaving my wheelchair sitting on a  
22 sidewalk while I go bicycle riding..

23  
24 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Got it.  
25

1  
2 EDITH PRENTISS: and if you've ever seen  
3 these things, unless you can put a top on it and make  
4 it your coffee table, it doesn't have much space in  
5 your apartment.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Understood.  
7 And again, I think what... and we can continue this  
8 conversation, but really trying to understand exactly  
9 what the need is, what the gap is; how we can take...  
10 [crosstalk]

11 EDITH PRENTISS: The need is recreation  
12 and exercise, bottom line.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Good. And you  
14 know that I'm pushing for that and there's a bill  
15 that we're... [interpose]

16 EDITH PRENTISS: Right.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: we're really  
18 trying to -- that we heard, but really trying to  
19 understand the issues that DOT has and really  
20 understanding a kind of park concept with recreation  
21 and health... [interpose]

22 EDITH PRENTISS: I would suggest you look  
23 at Bureau of Transportation whatever; Portland,  
24 Oregon has an incredible page -- they haven't moved  
25 their part of Biketown yet, but it's really

1 interesting and what I found most surprising was, the  
2 utilization of bikes for kids in safe street  
3 programs. So for example, children with  
4 developmental disabilities -- remember, disabilities  
5 are not just people in wheelchairs; we're talking  
6 about tandem bikes for people with vision issues,  
7 we're talking about all sorts of things, and they  
8 have a really good integrated program, with the  
9 exception of wheelchair users. But it's impressive  
10 and it certainly blows New York City Department of  
11 Transportation out of the water.

12  
13 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you for  
14 that. And it sounds like we're going to follow up on  
15 that as well. Thank you so much for your testimony..  
16 [crosstalk]

17 EDITH PRENTISS: And you should also look  
18 at Zagster, Z A... it's in my testimony.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yep. Yes, I  
20 saw that... [crosstalk]

21 EDITH PRENTISS: They actually have a..  
22 there are a number of universities and small cities  
23 that have inclusive rideshare, and one of them is I  
24 believe Carmel, Indiana and there's an actual report

25

1  
2 on that program, although it doesn't include the  
3 accessibility part... okay.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank...

7 [crosstalk]

8 EDITH PRENTISS: Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, Carlos  
10 and as I said, Motivate is here; we would like to  
11 continue having your voice in this conversation.

12 The next panel -- Jhamile Archibald,  
13 Benjamin Gonzalez, Shaquana Boykin, and Joseph  
14 Ferrara, [background comment] Kweli Campbell, Ken  
15 Lim. Can see the chair, those over [sic] there, that  
16 one. Omar Arias and David Graves. [background  
17 comments] It doesn't matter.

18 KWELI CAMPBELL: Hello. I'm Kweli  
19 Campbell; I'm a Citi Bike member from Brooklyn, New  
20 York. I was born and raised in Brooklyn and I left  
21 for suburban New Jersey about; I acquired a car and  
22 drove everywhere -- short distances and long. I  
23 moved back to Brooklyn about three years ago and  
24 brought my vehicle with me; I quickly realized that I  
25 would be unable to drive any and everywhere. Between

1  
2 traffic and parking, even for short trips to the  
3 grocery store, these often became long and stressful  
4 experiences. One day I passed a Citi Bike stand  
5 around the corner from my house and decided to look  
6 into it. The pricing was affordable, in my opinion  
7 -- I had a coupon that allowed for an annual  
8 membership of \$130. I started riding everywhere  
9 within a ten-block radius of my home. Shortly  
10 thereafter, I got a job in Downtown Brooklyn and was  
11 able to extend my riding to and from work. Citi Bike  
12 has transformed my transportation experience in New  
13 York City. Today, not only am I able to ride stress-  
14 free, I get 30 minutes of cardio daily, I share my  
15 Citi Bike experience with my family and friends, my  
16 car is parked most of the time and I have extended my  
17 rides to other neighborhoods in Brooklyn and beyond.

18 To share a recent commute: I needed to  
19 get from LaGuardia Airport to the World Trade Center  
20 in Lower Manhattan on a Saturday morning with limited  
21 train service on major trains. I made it to Delancey  
22 Street after taking three trains and a bus. I was  
23 able to make the last leg of the trip on Citi Bike  
24 taking the Battery Greenway from around Delancey to  
25 the World Trade Center.



1  
2                   SHAQUANA BOYKIN: Hello. My name is  
3 Shaquana Boykin; I am a NYCHA... [interpose, background  
4 comment] I am a NYCHA subsidized member of Citi Bike;  
5 on my second year. I remember my first time on a  
6 Citi Bike; I was working for my current employer,  
7 MARP, who was hosing community bike rides in Fort  
8 Green Clinton Hill. On my first day of work, was at  
9 Bed-Stuy Restoration, where we had a meeting; they  
10 were learning from other organizations working with  
11 Citi Bike and introduced my supervisor and myself to  
12 Citi Bike discounted corporate membership, and I have  
13 been biking since. I did not own a bike before Citi  
14 Bike, nor did I ride a bike as an adult. Being a  
15 full-time program manager managing a City Harvest  
16 mobile market, Farm Share, convening with seniors in  
17 my district or helping NYCHA Gardeners can become  
18 time consuming; if I rely on one mode of  
19 transportation, it's not happening. I attend college  
20 full-time and bike to and from work; biking to  
21 meetings and events at work or even biking from work  
22 to classes in-between a work day, using a Citi Bike  
23 has made commuting easier, faster, cheaper, and gets  
24 me physically active. As of July 2016, I have made  
25 610 trips; I have rode 77 hours which equals to 581.3

1  
2 miles in one year. I see more of the city and biking  
3 has been a stress reliever from the day. With a busy  
4 schedule working and in school, I save time biking,  
5 especially days where I am at work and have class in  
6 the middle of the day, I bike to class and back to  
7 work and I save money on transportation. Citi Bike  
8 isn't an amenity; it's a key, integrated component of  
9 our city transit network. I use Citi Bike to connect  
10 with other modes of transit when I babysit, I use it  
11 daily to make short trips within my neighborhood,  
12 like bike to Target or Stop & Shop, meetings from one  
13 part of Myrtle Avenue to the other or any community  
14 meetings within Citi Bike station or out of the  
15 station that best works to connecting with people,  
16 having short conversations, sharing biking tips and  
17 biking trends. Personally, growing up on Crown  
18 Heights I remember biking from Rogers and Park Place  
19 to Brower Park, I was happy. Now as an adult in a  
20 studio apartment, I cannot purchase a bike and store  
21 it at home. With Citi Bike, I unlock a bike, ride  
22 and lock it back, worry-free. I am happy again,  
23 biking in the city. Who would have thought at over  
24 250 pounds I would bike? [bell]



1  
2 District No. 35, represented by Council Member Laurie  
3 A. Cumbo, and Council District No. 36, represented by  
4 Council Member Robert Cornegy. According to the New  
5 York City Community Health Profiles, Central Brooklyn  
6 residents have an average life expectancy of 75  
7 years, which is five years less than the more  
8 affluent neighboring communities like Park Slope, and  
9 in fact, Brownsville has the lowest average life  
10 expectancy in their city, where residents' lives are  
11 cut short by more than a decade, compared to those  
12 living in Manhattan's Financial District. Not only  
13 are the good people of Central Brooklyn living  
14 shorter lives, they're living lower quality lives,  
15 owing to the multiple social determinants of health  
16 and disease disparities, for example, Crown Heights  
17 and Prospect Heights, Bed-Stuy and Brownsville have  
18 the second, fifth and sixth highest rates of diabetes  
19 in New York City -- these neighborhoods are all also  
20 in the hospital's primary service area.

21 In light of these health issues, the  
22 hospital recognizes that medically underserved and  
23 economically disenfranchised populations' health can  
24 be significantly improved through public health  
25

1  
2 interventions and community supports that encourage  
3 physical activity and mobility.

4           As such, Interfaith accepted the  
5 invitation from Bed-Stuy Restoration Corporation to  
6 participate as a neighborhood contractor in the  
7 Partnership for a Healthier Brooklyn to promote bike  
8 share in underserved populations in Central Brooklyn.  
9 The invitation to participate in the Partnership for  
10 a Healthier Brooklyn defined responsibilities and  
11 goals; some of these success measures included  
12 enrollment of employees into the Citi Bike Corporate  
13 Enrollment program, as well as complimentary bike-  
14 related services, such as bike safety classes or  
15 training, increasing ridership among low-income  
16 populations and people of color, encouraging  
17 equitable use of bike share, mitigating health  
18 disparities through providing opportunities for  
19 physical activity and establishing a base of early  
20 adopters among a network of diverse community  
21 stakeholders. We committed to a goal of 55 partial  
22 subsidy enrollees and 20 full subsidy enrollees in  
23 year one of the hospital's subsidy program. We  
24 succeeded our goal for the full subsidy program and  
25 we managed to exceed our goal as well for outreach of

1  
2 300 employees by reaching out to more than 2,500  
3 employees and community residents with bike share  
4 programming. Nine community bike rides were hosted  
5 in the evening and lunch hours during the first and  
6 last Wednesdays of the months, from May to October  
7 2016. [bell]

8           Because we provide all employees with a  
9 livable wage, an equity target for low-income  
10 populations could not be met exactly, but the  
11 hospital reached the other important equity target  
12 and population: approximately 71% of Interfaith Citi  
13 Bike Subsidy Program enrollees are riders of color.

14           Employees have responded enthusiastically  
15 about the subsidy program. At our second community  
16 bike ride, an employee who lives in Bed-Stuy started  
17 pedaling and laughing, saying, "It's been more than  
18 20 years since I've been on a bike." The last time  
19 she was exposed to biking was when she taught her  
20 children. She has gone on to attend almost all our  
21 community bike rides, as well as those hosted by  
22 other community partners and has been an avid Citi  
23 Bike user since winning a free subsidy through a  
24 raffle sponsored by the hospital.

1  
2 I'd also like to briefly touch on the  
3 Prescribe-a-Bike program that was mentioned earlier  
4 today by several of our partners. We worked with  
5 Tracey Capers at Bed-Stuy Restoration, Maggie Veatch  
6 and Philip Noyes, in particular, at the Brooklyn  
7 District Public Health office to meet and decide how  
8 can we leverage existing and planned health and  
9 transportation infrastructure to have a public health  
10 intervention that would provide the most vulnerable  
11 New Yorkers with an option to: (1) ride for free  
12 through a one-year Citi Bike membership, along with a  
13 clinician who is attached to them as well, who  
14 themselves also has an employee sponsored subsidy so  
15 that they can provide not only the clinical but also  
16 the role model, kind of like walk a dock, but with  
17 biking, and we look forward to expanding the best  
18 practices that we are generating and learning at  
19 future convenings and also at other clinical sites so  
20 it's not just an Interfaith Medical Center and  
21 Brooklyn program, but a borough-wide program.

22 JHAMILE ARCHIBALD: I turned it on.

23 Okay, there we go. Thank you for this opportunity to  
24 testify about the future of Citi Bike and why it  
25 matters to us at UncommonGoods. My name is Jhamile

1 Archibald; I am the Senior Human Resource Coordinator  
2 at UncommonGoods, which just means that I actually am  
3 in charge of all of the recruiting and onboarding of  
4 our entire staff. UncommonGoods, we are actually an  
5 online and catalog retailer based in Brooklyn, in the  
6 Brooklyn Army Terminal in Sunset Park. We were  
7 founded in 1999 and we've been in Sunset Park for  
8 almost ten years now. We're also a founding B  
9 Corporation, which just means that we meet a rigorous  
10 set of requirements for social and environmental  
11 impact, including our starting wage, which is  
12 \$14/hour. We currently have over 100 year-round team  
13 members and employ a hundred more seasonal team  
14 members that work in our warehouse and call center.  
15 We are supporting Citi Bike; one, because we believe  
16 that it is definitely beneficial for the community  
17 and it's a good environmental solution to transit --  
18 and you know the transit, I guess issues you can say  
19 that we have here in New York City. So the two  
20 supporting reasons I have are: (1) for us at  
21 UncommonGoods, in Sunset Park it's really going to  
22 improve our quality of life, just the team members  
23 that work in the area, and we also think it's a cost-  
24 effective, healthy and safe solution as well.  
25



1  
2           So in regards to quality of life, I  
3 mentioned that we've been in Sunset Park for nearly  
4 ten years now; roughly about 10% of our team members  
5 commute to work on their bike currently. We actually  
6 promote the use of transportation that is  
7 environmentally friendly and we offer incentives to  
8 our team for choosing to ride a bike to work.

9 Actually also, our CEO rides his bike actually from  
10 the Lower East Side; he goes from Lower East Side to  
11 Sunset Park, so he's a huge advocate on bike riding.

12           The Brooklyn Army Terminal, it's in an  
13 industrial location, it's fairly distant from the  
14 subway and food options and you know the residential  
15 neighborhoods. Our team has already expressed an  
16 interest that we as a company provide some sort of  
17 bike sharing program and what we decided to do was  
18 look into other options, which is, when we came into  
19 creating some sort of discount program for team  
20 members to join Citi Bike, if they want to ride to  
21 work, but naturally, the turnout for that wasn't as  
22 high as we hoped, 'cause there's no Citi Bike in  
23 Sunset Park, so it's kind of hard to argue use Citi  
24 Bike to ride to work when there's no Citi Bike there.  
25 We also have team members that live in Sunset Park as

1 well and that currently walk to work 'cause it's  
2 quicker than taking a train, but would be even better  
3 if they could ride a bike to work as well.

4  
5 A number of our team members actually  
6 would like to be able to just supplement some of  
7 their route, like maybe riding a bike to the train or  
8 from the train to get to the office; it's not  
9 realistic for us to say that it will supplement their  
10 entire route, but it definitely would help them save  
11 15-30 minutes out of their day coming to work.

12 Additionally, just being in Sunset Park  
13 and being [bell] a little far away from the eateries  
14 and things like that, it would be a lot more  
15 convenient to ride a bike to the new Bush Terminal  
16 Park or restaurants and places in the area.

17 In terms of being a cost-effective  
18 solution as well as healthy and safe, so my CEO David  
19 Bolotsky actually was on a task force learning about  
20 the BQX, which was supposed to be a proposed transit  
21 option, and so just in his words of what he would say  
22 is just that building the BQX is likely a far more  
23 expensive option to the area and it also will  
24 contribute to rapid gentrification, ultimately  
25 driving out industrial employers and lower-income

1  
2 residents; he thinks that Citi Bike is a far more  
3 organic solution to the neighborhoods and that'll be  
4 far less disruptive and shouldn't contribute to any  
5 increase in property tax or real estate values, as  
6 well, of course, encouraging residents to exercise on  
7 their commute, just improving their quality of life  
8 and serve to reduce the public health costs. Adding  
9 this transportation option, particularly in  
10 conjunction with expansion... [crosstalk]

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Sorry; can you  
12 just summarize, please?

13 JHAMILE ARCHIBALD: Oh, sorry. So I  
14 guess just getting to the conclusion, we just believe  
15 that the alternative commuting option is crucial to  
16 New York City, especially in the areas that are  
17 further out from city center, where I think that  
18 options like this would be better served, so we  
19 definitely support the expansion and just hope that  
20 the Council will as well. Thank you.

21 KEN LIM: Good afternoon. My name is Ken  
22 Lim; I'm speaking on behalf of Justworks, we're a  
23 payroll, benefits compliance and HR company servicing  
24 small businesses in New York and across the country.

25

1  
2 I'm currently working as the Benefits  
3 Operations Associate and deal with daily requests for  
4 Citi Bike memberships from our customers and  
5 employees. Justworks started in New York City and  
6 has been in operation since late 2012; we service  
7 over 1,000 small businesses, most of them based in  
8 New York and more 10,000 employees of small  
9 businesses.

10 In May of 2015, we struck a partnership  
11 with Citi Bike to make it easier for small businesses  
12 to offer Citi Bike to their employees, and in less  
13 than two years into the partnership we have over 85  
14 businesses offering Citi Bike and our partnering  
15 customers are paying the full cost of the membership  
16 on behalf of their employees. Over the past two  
17 years we have over 400 employees that have signed up  
18 for Citi Bike and have told us that they consider  
19 Citi Bike an integral part of their commute and their  
20 New York City experience.

21 Our partnership with Citi Bike has been  
22 so successful that we are currently considering bike  
23 share programs in Washington, D.C. and San Francisco  
24 as well, and we believe that Citi Bike memberships  
25 have resonated deeply with our user base and we're

1  
2 happy to work with Citi Bike as a partner. Thank  
3 you.

4 OMAR ARIAS: Good afternoon, Council. My  
5 name is Omar; I am here today to share my experience  
6 working with Citi Bike and as a participant in its  
7 discounted membership program for NYCHA residents. I  
8 signed up for a Citi Bike membership this summer and  
9 I have taken full advantage of the benefits of bike  
10 sharing. I have become more active through bike  
11 riding and it has become a key transportation  
12 alternative. Since the summer I've ridden over 480  
13 miles and went on 222 rides using a City Bike.

14 I am part of the Inaugural City Bike  
15 NYCHA Community Champions program in partnership with  
16 Bed-Stuy Restoration Corporation, working closely  
17 with Annie and Tracey. As a Community Champion, my  
18 aim was to reach out directly to NYCHA residents and  
19 share awareness of Citi Bike's efforts to have them  
20 participate in the bike sharing program through a  
21 discounted membership. I believe for such a large  
22 bike sharing program that is working towards  
23 including low-income neighborhoods and communities of  
24 color that a great starting point is through outreach  
25 efforts within NYCHA communities, like the one I grew

1  
2 up in. As a Community Champion, I have met New  
3 Yorkers that have seen the Citi Bikes around but  
4 still weren't sure how it all worked and I have met  
5 members of a community who were experiencing Citi  
6 Bike in their neighborhoods for the first time. I've  
7 had the joy to demonstrate to these people that New  
8 York City Bike Share is an inclusive program and as a  
9 NYCHA resident I've proved to many residents that  
10 being part of Citi Bike was not only affordable but  
11 practical, healthy and fun.

12 I spent time visiting neighborhoods in  
13 East Harlem where Citi Bike expanded to this summer.  
14 I saw many NYCHA residents of all ages enthusiastic  
15 and optimistic about the opportunity to get started  
16 with Citi Bike. During a NYCHA community event, I  
17 met a mother that was so excited to begin exercising  
18 and exploring the city through bike riding that she  
19 signed up, she signed up her son, and convinced her  
20 friend to sign up to come bike riding along with her.  
21 Bike sharing works in New York City because being a  
22 New Yorker is sometimes sharing a common activity.  
23 We have record number of rides every month and a part  
24 of those statistics are and will continue to be NYCHA

25

1  
2 residents because it is an option that we are excited  
3 about.

4 Certain outreach efforts that I  
5 participated in include a community group ride,  
6 speaking directly to NYCHA resident and tenant  
7 association meetings and participating in  
8 **[inaudible]**. Thank you.

9 DAVID GREAVES: Thank you. My name is  
10 David Greaves and I publish *Our Time Press*, a weekly  
11 newspaper in Brooklyn and I'd like to thank you for  
12 this opportunity to speak about my experiences with  
13 the Citi Bike program.

14 I joined Citi Bike when I had injured an  
15 Achilles tendon and could not walk as much as I was  
16 used to; I became a member on July 18 of this year  
17 and as of yesterday, I've logged 156 rides and I  
18 truly enjoy the experience.

19 I am in a great location for bike  
20 locations; at my office there's a station one short  
21 block to the north and one two short blocks to the  
22 south; at my home, which itself is a few blocks from  
23 my office, there's a station at the far corner of the  
24 block. I go to the bank on Citi Bike, I shop at  
25 Atlantic Center and Staples in Park Slope; I use it

1  
2 for appointments, I go to the post office and to make  
3 mass transit connections at Atlantic Terminal. And  
4 when you layer on the mass transit infrastructure in  
5 Central Brooklyn and then include my Uber Zipcar and  
6 Budget Rental account, I find I don't actually need  
7 to own a car.

8 I have two helmets, although I don't  
9 actually wear them all the time, but I always carry a  
10 hand sanitizer with me to use before and after the  
11 ride; I've even attached Velcro to my helmet and to a  
12 bottle of hand sanitizer; that way I always have it  
13 with me, particularly -- I think this is important --  
14 particularly now in flu season.

15 I see the Citi Bike program as another  
16 marker of a convenience for changing the neighborhood  
17 because the economy is changing and the work patterns  
18 are changing. It is useful not just to commute, but  
19 to accommodate flexible businesses with flexible work  
20 environments and flexible workers, people who can be  
21 perfectly effective at their home, office or at the  
22 local café. I believe if we start to see a lot of  
23 coffee shops appearing; Citi Bikes can't be far  
24 behind.



1  
2 We have a multi-ethnic, digital neighbor  
3 workforce that is growing in Brooklyn; I'm a lifelong  
4 resident who used to hitch rides on the back of the  
5 electric trolleys with their overhead power lines;  
6 now we have Uber, Airbnb, Zipcar, Citi Bikes, and a  
7 downtown full of skyscrapers; things are changing, as  
8 they always have, it's just that everything happens  
9 quicker now and that's just the way it is. I find  
10 Citi Bike to be one of the changes for the better,  
11 and I thank you for this opportunity today.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member  
13 Menchaca.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you,  
15 Chair. And since everyone is talking about their  
16 membership and their own rides... [interpose,  
17 background comment]

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I want to be sure  
19 that I didn't leave anyone out from the public.  
20 There was someone, Joseph Ferrara, I called before; I  
21 want to be sure that that person is **[inaudible]**.  
22 Thanks.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Sounds like  
24 this is the last panel. And again, I just want to  
25

1  
2 thank the panel for your amazing work and your  
3 testimony.

4           So I just looked at the app -- I didn't  
5 know that it tracked this, but -- so I have 76 rides  
6 since my membership in September, when Red Hook  
7 became an official bike share neighborhood, 76 rides,  
8 34 hours, 99 miles, and I have burned 4,274 calories  
9 -- okay, it's great, thanks for tracking that.

10           So anyway, I'm with you and so my  
11 question for Ms. Boykin or Ms. Campbell or Mr. Arias  
12 is, what was that one thing that moved you from  
13 learning mode or maybe I'm interested or -- from a  
14 maybe to a yes? Because I think the testimony shows  
15 something came -- I want to know what that was -- and  
16 then all of a sudden you're engaged, you're fully  
17 engaged, you're embedding it into your lifestyle, and  
18 I mean you spoke for yourselves, incredibly  
19 impressive. Can one of you tell me that one thing  
20 that kind of moved you from I'll learn a little more  
21 about it -- which is where I feel like a lot of my  
22 constituents are; it's not for them -- and that was a  
23 question that we keep on coming back to, it's like  
24 this is not for me, this is not a thing for me,  
25 whatever it is; what made you, you know, become a

1  
2 committed member of this bike share program?

3 Ms. Boykin.

4           SHAQUANA BOYKIN: Yes. I always have  
5 this conversation because I'm always on a bike in  
6 Fort Green; you can ask anybody in Fort Green,  
7 they're like, that's Shaquana [laugh]. But what  
8 moved me from membership to actually, like, well  
9 actually getting a membership and riding was that  
10 same thing that happened, like I woke up one day and  
11 there was a bike station in front of my building -- I  
12 live in NYCHA -- and I was like, hmmm, what is this?  
13 I thought it was like a tourist thing, because I  
14 didn't know anything about it. So what made me get  
15 on the bike is actually having the talk, going to a  
16 meeting about Citi Bike at Bed-Stuy Restoration and  
17 them telling us like, no, it's bike share, it's for  
18 anyone and I didn't know because I didn't even go up  
19 to the kiosk, I just seen it and walked away.

20           COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And for anyone  
21 else or Ms. Boykin, does it matter who tells you  
22 about this program? Would it matter who was  
23 conducting the meeting, who was inviting you to this  
24 conversation; didn't matter...

1  
2 SHAQUANA BOYKIN: The knowledge, it was  
3 just having that knowledge... [crosstalk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: It was just the  
5 knowledge; having the knowledge is enough. Okay.  
6 Mr. Arias.

7 OMAR ARIAS: To answer your second  
8 question first. I feel like what I've done with  
9 Community Champions; it didn't matter who was telling  
10 them, because it's one thing to just promote a \$5.00  
11 membership, but it's another one to say look, someone  
12 living as a NYCHA resident can afford this, you can  
13 use it; they have been using it. So in a way, yes,  
14 that helps get to like a more personal level. And  
15 your first question -- I remember, like I would hang  
16 out with my friend around 86th Street, east side, and  
17 I would always go home after that, but I would wait  
18 for the bus that takes maybe like 30 minutes at night  
19 and this summer Citi Bike expanded from 86th up to  
20 110th and it did it in increments, maybe like 90th  
21 Street and 100th Street, and I would use that bike as  
22 far as I could just to get home, closer and closer,  
23 and I realized like for \$5.00 I could just be  
24 skipping this whole bus time wait, and then other  
25 benefits just came after, like I can bike around

1  
2 Central Park, just stay active, because that's  
3 another thing that... I just wanted to find a way to  
4 get out of the house in a positive manner, I guess  
5 and bike riding is one way.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you for  
7 that. And Ms. Campbell.

8 KWELI CAMPBELL: Yeah, I'm going to agree  
9 about education as being key, because I didn't  
10 realize... I mean I saw the stations all over and I  
11 knew very little about how much they cost; I mean I  
12 was told, oh daily it's like \$15 and so I was under  
13 the impression that it was really a tourist thing.  
14 And so at the point that I -- I said let me look into  
15 this a little bit more, 'cause I was just... it was out  
16 of frustration that I really wanted to kind of see  
17 what other options were available to me and so when I  
18 saw the cost options and I kind of weighed in on the  
19 affordability of it and it was only -- well I had a  
20 coupon, I received a coupon somewhere and it was only  
21 \$130 for a year and I was like wow, and once I  
22 understood the rules of engagement, as he alluded to,  
23 then I realized you know what, this is a no-brainer.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you for  
25 that. And I think the main point that I'm taking

1  
2 away from this panel too is, is it does matter who  
3 comes and talks to you, it sounds like if neighbors  
4 can talk to neighbors; that that education will be  
5 met with a little bit more understanding and trust,  
6 and then also, really thinking about the education  
7 itself; that needs to get out. And so the question  
8 I'm leaving with right now is: who's responsible for  
9 that; is that the City of New York; should we use  
10 taxpayer dollars to get that information out? Is  
11 that something that Citi Bike should be investing in  
12 themselves as part of the private -- and I know that  
13 it's happening, but should that go up? And so these  
14 are the things that I know I want to take back to the  
15 district where we have partial in Sunset Park -- and  
16 thank you for UncommonGoods being here, because I  
17 know that they've been a partner in so many things  
18 right now on the ground as an employer, but also just  
19 a good B business. And so I think -- I just want to  
20 say thank you, but these questions we have to figure  
21 out together and I'm glad that you're here and we can  
22 call upon you to help us develop those things in  
23 NYCHA, in our companies; in our neighborhoods as we  
24 push for expansion and get ready for expansion, and I  
25 know that even places like Sunset Park that are not

1  
2 in current Phase II even, and we're not even Phase  
3 III yet, we can actually push this in a way that you  
4 all can feel empowered to ask us to do as your  
5 representatives and so thank you for being here and  
6 I'm going to want to especially work on the district  
7 stuff with UncommonGoods and our NYCHA residents. So  
8 thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I would like to  
10 say that it is nice that we are ending with you in  
11 this hearing because you represent you know some of  
12 those New Yorkers that have not been part of this new  
13 mode of transportation. You know and any particular  
14 school can be the worst school; you get a  
15 valedictorian student who gets into Harvard, Yale,  
16 Columbia, but it doesn't mean that 99.9% of the  
17 students are making it to an Ivy League college. So  
18 it is nice to know that we have the voice of the  
19 voiceless when it comes to knowing that when it comes  
20 to bikes, we need to change the culture. You know a  
21 bike was, for my family, born and raised in the  
22 Caribbean, a symbol of poverty and still today, for  
23 working-class New Yorkers, is still, for many of  
24 them, a symbol of poverty; a car was a symbol of  
25 progress. So we are changing that narrative, we are

1  
2 changing that experience and the reality is that when  
3 we drive by or pass by, down 59th Street, most people  
4 who go to work or a lot of people, they use bikes to  
5 go to work, so I think that we have to be the  
6 spokesperson for our diverse community and diverse  
7 city because we are part of those communities, you  
8 know we can make it, we can say here we are using the  
9 bike; how many family members; how many friends; how  
10 many neighbors understand you know the healthy  
11 benefits of getting into the bike. I remember  
12 bringing China **[inaudible]** 23 years ago and the first  
13 advice that I got was, get 300 Yuan and go out and  
14 buy a bike. So my father did not pass the value when  
15 he used to have a bike in the 1960s and the 1970s to  
16 the new generation that he brought to America,  
17 because again, bike was a symbol of poverty, it was  
18 -- and I think that we have to learn, all of us  
19 together, the middle class who got the benefit, who  
20 saw the benefit; it's not a luxury, it's a healthy,  
21 it's a safety, it's a more convenient mode of  
22 transportation. So again, like we... Citi Bike, the  
23 Administration, the Council, we are committed you  
24 know to make Citi Bike an experience for all sectors



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

-- upper class, middle class and working-class. With  
that, this hearing comes to an end.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 28, 2016