

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON HEALTH

----- X

December 7, 2016  
Start: 1:09 p.m.  
Recess: 3:10 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Rm.  
16<sup>th</sup> Fl.

B E F O R E: COREY D. JOHNSON  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Rosie Mendez  
Mathieu Eugene  
Peter A. Koo  
James Vacca  
James G. Van Bramer  
Inez D. Barron  
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.  
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Dr. Deborah Kaplan, Assistant Commissioner  
Bureau of Maternal, Infant and Reproductive Health  
NYC Department of Health and Mental Hygiene

Dr. Jane Zucker, Assistant Commissioner  
Bureau of Immunization

Elizabeth Holtzman

Sang Hwang, Project Director  
Choices in Childbirth

Elizabeth Adams, Director  
Government Relations  
Planned Parenthood of New York City

Diana Christian, Senior Policy Associate  
Community Healthcare Network

Danielle Castaldi-Micca, Director  
Political and Government Affairs  
National Institute for Reproductive Health,  
NARAL Pro-Choice New York

2 [sound check, pause]

3 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: Good afternoon,  
4 everyone. I am Council Member Corey Johnson, Chair  
5 of the New York City Council's Committee on Health.  
6 I want to thank you all for joining us for today's  
7 hearing where we're going to hear three bills:  
8 Introductions Nos. 1161, 1162 and 1172. All three  
9 bills were introduced by my friend Council Member  
10 Elizabeth Crowley and would—would require reporting  
11 from the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene.  
12 The first Bill Introduction 1161 would require  
13 reporting by the city on HPV vaccination rates. HPV  
14 vaccines protecting its many strains of Human  
15 Papillomavirus, and can prevent many instances of  
16 cervical cancer, anal cancer, vulva cancer and  
17 vaginal cancer. This—this vaccine is recommended by  
18 the World Health Organization, the Center for Disease  
19 Control, and other medical experts for pre-teen and  
20 teenage girls and boys as well as some older men who  
21 have sex with men, and people with compromised immune  
22 systems. The Department of Health and Mental Hygiene  
23 collects immunization data through the Citywide  
24 Immunization Registry Citywide Immunization Registry,  
25 and I believe that this anonymized data should be

2 publicly available to see how we're promoting  
3 vaccination rates. Getting an HPV vaccination rate  
4 annually, as this bill would require, would be a good  
5 start.

6           The second bill Introduction 1162 would  
7 require reporting by the city on the use of Long-  
8 Acting Reversible Contraceptives such as  
9 intrauterine devices. Long-Acting Reversible  
10 Contraceptives, also known as LARCs, are considered  
11 by many to be a convenient form of birth control and  
12 have lower failure rates than other common methods of  
13 contraception such as oral contraceptives and  
14 condoms. The Affordable Care Act requires most  
15 private insurers to cover contraceptives including  
16 LARCs without a co-pay. Awareness of LARCs has been  
17 promoted recently by the Department of Health and  
18 Mental Hygiene as part of its Maybe The IUD campaign,  
19 which aims to increase awareness of IUDs to inform  
20 discussions between women and their doctors. This  
21 bill would require the Department of Health and  
22 Mental Hygiene to collect data on LARC usage, and to  
23 report this data to the City Council to monitor the  
24 effectiveness of this campaign and other efforts to

2 increase awareness on this effective method of  
3 contraception.

4           And finally, Introduction 1172 would  
5 require reporting by the city on maternal mortality.  
6 New York City's maternal mortality rate improved  
7 significantly between the years 2001 and 2010, the  
8 latest year analyzed. However, New York City still  
9 has vast disparities in pregnancy associated  
10 mortality. Black, non-Hispanic women are  
11 approximately 12 times more likely to die from  
12 pregnancy related causes as White non-Hispanic women.  
13 The Department of Health and Mental Hygiene already  
14 collects data on maternal mortality, and has  
15 published studies analyzing this data in the past,  
16 most recently last year. This bill would require  
17 annual reporting so the Council and others can  
18 monitor the city's progress in lowering maternal  
19 mortality rates and disparities in this area. I look  
20 forward to hearing from the department and others on  
21 these bills today. I want to say that we've been  
22 joined by Council Member Jimmy Vacca who is a member  
23 of this committee. I want to acknowledge the staff  
24 that helped make today happen. David Seitzer the  
25 Committee Counsel, Crystal Pond, the Policy Analyst

2 for the Committee, and Louis Cholden-Brown, my  
3 Legislative Director, and before I turn it over to  
4 Council Member Crowley for a statement, I want to  
5 thank a friend of mine, Elizabeth Holtzman is here  
6 today, and is and who is a trailblazer in many ways,  
7 elected official in this city, and just a leading  
8 advocate on progress women's causes and I-I just am  
9 really glad she's here. She's going to testify after  
10 the department testifies, and I know she's been in  
11 touch with both me as Chair of the Committee, and  
12 also Council Member Crowley on some of these efforts,  
13 and she has some bigger ideas that she's going to  
14 talk about today as well. So with that, I'm going to  
15 turn it over to my friend and colleague Council  
16 Member Elizabeth Crowley.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Good afternoon.  
18 Thank you, a big thank you to my colleague the Chair,  
19 Council Member Corey Johnson for hearing this package  
20 of legislation today, and for his efforts in  
21 advancing equal opportunity, and for being a strong,  
22 strong advocate for women's health. This legislation  
23 will further improve the health of girls and women  
24 throughout New York City. HPV is a cancer causing  
25 sexually transmitted disease that is so common that

2 according to the Center for Disease Control and  
3 Prevention, nearly all sexually active men and women  
4 will get at some point in their lives HPV. HPV often  
5 goes away on its own, but sometimes it doesn't and  
6 can linger without any symptoms and lead to many  
7 forms of cancer. This is a vaccination that is  
8 available for HPV prevention, which is common for  
9 girls and boys to receive at ages 11 and 12. The  
10 vaccination is administered in two to three doses  
11 over a period of six months, and is highly effective  
12 at preventing diseases caused by HPV. I believe that  
13 the number of HPV infections could be reduced if  
14 vaccination rates were made public, and more people  
15 were aware of these numbers. I have, therefore,  
16 introduced 1161-A to require the Department of Health  
17 to publish vaccination rates annually. Data  
18 collected pursuant to this bill can be used to  
19 determine how effectively DOHMH is reaching targeted  
20 groups and determine where early prevention resources  
21 are most needed throughout the city.

22 Long-Acting Reversible Contraceptive or  
23 LARCs are among the most effective means of birth  
24 control. LARCs can be in the form of intrauterine  
25 devices or implants, and depending on the type of

2 device can last from three to twelve years. Despite  
3 the availability of this effective means to prevent  
4 unintended pregnancies, research reports have  
5 concluded that women are often unfamiliar with LARCs.  
6 I have, therefore, introduce 1162, which would  
7 require the Department of Health to report on LARC  
8 usage rates as part of its annual community health  
9 survey. The data collected pursuant to this bill can  
10 be used to direct outreach efforts made to inform  
11 women about the availability of birth control methods  
12 so that they can make the best choices to suit their  
13 own lifestyles.

14 Maternal mortality here and—here at home  
15 and in other—sorry. Maternal mortality here at home  
16 is another issues we must take a hard look at. All  
17 over the world maternal mortality rates are decrease.  
18 Studies show that global—global death rates fell by  
19 more than one-third from 2000 to 2015, but the United  
20 States as a whole is one of the few countries with an  
21 increasing number, and in New York City specifically  
22 our rates are 5% higher than they national rate. We  
23 must make sure that as a place with the best  
24 healthcare institutions in the entire world that we  
25 do more to decrease maternal mortality rates. The



2 Mayor's Management Report does not report any data on  
3 the rates of maternal mortality. Rather, the  
4 Department of Health issues a report every five  
5 years. This leaves us with an unclear picture on  
6 exactly where we are when it comes to maternal  
7 mortality, and exactly what we need to do to tackle  
8 these problems. I believe that by having data  
9 disaggregated by race, age and other demographic  
10 indicators showing the number of pregnancy related  
11 deaths that occur on an annual basis along with the  
12 information about the leading causes of such deaths  
13 and recommendations that local governments can take  
14 to prevent these types of deaths need to be made  
15 annually. I, therefore, introduce Local 1172 to  
16 require such disclosures. I look forward to hearing  
17 from the Administration and from all other advocates  
18 who are here today to testify, and also before I turn  
19 it back to the Chair, I'd like to thank Liz Holtzman  
20 for being here today, for her leadership for women  
21 and the—the city and I look forward to hearing her  
22 testimony. Thank you, Chair.

23 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: Thank you, Council  
24 Member Crowley. We've been joined by Council Member  
25 Peter Koo who is a member of this committee from

2 Queens. We are going to now hear from Deborah Kaplan  
3 from the New York City Department of Health and  
4 Mental Hygiene and Jane Zucker from the department as  
5 well. Before they being their testimony, I'm going  
6 to have the committee counsel swear you in.

7                   LEGAL COUNSEL: Please raise your right  
8 hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole  
9 truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony  
10 today, and to answer Council Member questions  
11 honestly?

12                   I do. Thank you.

13                   CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: Thank you very  
14 much. Just make sure the mic is close to you, and  
15 great you may begin.

16                   ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: Good  
17 morning Chair Johnson and members of the committee.  
18 I'm Dr. Deborah Kaplan, Assistant Commissioner of the  
19 Bureau of Maternal, Infant and Reproductive Health at  
20 the New York City Department of Health and Mental  
21 Hygiene, and I'm joined by my colleague Dr. Jane  
22 Zucker, Assistant Commissioner of the Bureau of  
23 Immunization. I will note and I apologize for my  
24 voice. I have a bad cold, and surrounded by things  
25 to keep me going, and Dr. Zucker has an injury. So

2 her leg is raised, but here in full [laughter]  
3 ability to respond—to testify and respond to  
4 questions.

5 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: The Best public  
6 health department in the world.

7 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: [laughs]  
8 We're limping here, but ready to go.

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: Nothing  
10 will stop us.

11 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: [laughs]  
12 On behalf of Commissioner Bassett, I want to thank  
13 you for the opportunity to testify on these important  
14 issues. [coughs] I'd also like to recognize member—  
15 Council Member Crowley and the Women's Caucus for  
16 championing women's rights in this city, and to thank  
17 Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito. I know she's not here  
18 today, but we wanted to thank her for her leadership,  
19 and for courageously using her story to reduce stigma  
20 surrounding HPD, and to encourage more New Yorkers to  
21 get vaccinated. The mission of the department is to  
22 improve the health of all New Yorkers and to  
23 eliminate health inequities, which are rooted in  
24 historical and contemporary injustices and  
25 discrimination including racism. It's through this

2 lens that we focus our work related to maternal,  
3 sexual and reproductive health. [coughs] Starting  
4 in 20014, the department began a five-year initiative  
5 to increase awareness of and access to a full  
6 continuum of sexual and reproductive health and  
7 related services including the full range of  
8 contraceptive methods so that all people can make  
9 informed decisions about their sexual and  
10 reproductive health, and act on those decisions. We  
11 adopted a Sexual and Reproductive Justice framework,  
12 which promotes individual choice in body autonomy  
13 within the context of our nation's history of  
14 reproductive oppression and coercion directed at  
15 women of color low-income women. Sexual and  
16 Reproductive Justice exists when all people have the  
17 power and resources to make healthy decisions about  
18 their bodies, sexuality and reproduction.  
19 Reproductive Justice is a term coined by women of  
20 color in 1994, and from which emerged a framework and  
21 a collective sister song led by and for indigenous  
22 women and women of color, and Reproductive Justice is  
23 the human right to decide if and when you will have a  
24 child, and the conditions under which you will give  
25 birth or create a family; decide if you will not have

2 a child and your options for preventing or ending a  
3 pregnancy; parent the child or children you want or  
4 already have with the necessary social supports and  
5 safe environments and healthy communities, and  
6 without threat of harm from individuals,  
7 organizations or institutions of the state, and  
8 bodily autonomy from any form of sexual or  
9 reproductive oppression. As part of this approach,  
10 we regularly convene a group of community leaders,  
11 activists and non-profit organizations known as the  
12 Sexual and Reproduction Justice Community Engagement  
13 Group where we jointly plan and implement activities.  
14 Last fall, we launched a citywide public awareness  
15 campaign Maybe The IUD that provided information  
16 about the IUD among the full range of birth control  
17 options. Stressing the importance of assuring that  
18 women who want birth control are supported to choose  
19 the contraceptive that best meets their needs.  
20 Additionally, we work with local hospitals on a  
21 learning collaborative to implement best clinical  
22 practices for the provision of contraceptive services  
23 postpartum, post-abortion, and in a primary care  
24 setting ensuring that reproductive decisions are made  
25 with complete information and free of coercion.

2 [coughs] A key issue that affects sexual and  
3 reproductive framework seeks to address the  
4 disparities in reproductive health outcomes, which  
5 includes maternal mortality. Addressing these  
6 disparities is a top priority of the department.  
7 Complementing this work are the ongoing efforts of  
8 the department to provide clinical services for all  
9 New Yorkers at eight STD clinics. Our work focuses  
10 on New Yorkers at highest risk of negative sexual  
11 health outcomes who face obstacles to accessing  
12 needed services elsewhere. In addition, the  
13 department has a multi-pronged approach toward  
14 prevention of the Human Papillomavirus infection  
15 otherwise known as HPV. The most effective way stop  
16 HPV is to vaccinate eligible people. In accordance  
17 with CDC recommend—CDC recommendations, we strongly  
18 encourage vaccination for pre-teens and for teens and  
19 young adults who were not previously vaccinated. HPV  
20 vaccines are up to 99% effective in preventing  
21 cervical, vaginal, and vulva infections, which could  
22 develop into cancer if left untreated. The vaccines  
23 can also prevent anal cancer precursor lesions and  
24 likely penile and oro-oropharyngeal cancers. In  
25 regard to the bills being heard today, Intro 1161,

2 [coughs] the Administration supports the intent of  
3 Intro 1-1161, which would require the department to  
4 report data on New Yorkers' immunization rates for  
5 HPD. The department collects data regarding  
6 immunization rates by gender and number of doses  
7 received through the Citywide Immunization Registry,  
8 and we'd be happy to work with the Council to  
9 determine the most appropriate way for this  
10 information to be shared.

11 In New York City, HPV vaccine is admin-  
12 administered by a broad range of pediatric care  
13 providers including public clinics, private  
14 practitioners, school-based health centers, and the  
15 department's Immunization Clinic. Throughout the  
16 Citywide Immunization Registry—through the Citywide  
17 Immunization Registry, providers can identify  
18 patients who have not received HPV vaccines, and  
19 those needing to complete the series and generate  
20 follow-up letters or list of patients to call for  
21 follow up. To further facilitate HPV vaccinations,  
22 the department released a new text messaging recall  
23 service, which providers can use without charge.

24 In New York City as of September 30,  
25 2016, 73% of females and 67% of males age 13 to 17

2 had at least one dose of HP vaccine, and 50% of  
3 females and 42% of males have received all three  
4 doses. While we're proud of the progress we've made,  
5 we are still far from achieving the national target  
6 of 80% coverage by 2020. Nationwide Latinos and  
7 lower-income groups have the highest coverage level  
8 while Whites in the higher income groups have the  
9 lowest coverage. In New York City we find similar  
10 disparities in HPV vaccination among people who  
11 attend the department's clinics that treat sexually  
12 transmitted infections. Geographically, HPV vaccine  
13 coverage is highest in the Southern Bronx and  
14 Northern Manhattan. It is lowest in Staten Island,  
15 Central and Southern Brooklyn and Greenpoint,  
16 Williamsburg. The department has undertaken a number  
17 of activities to increase coverage citywide and to  
18 target practices in low coverage neighborhoods in  
19 particular.

20 Intro 1162: The administration supports  
21 the intent of Intro 1162, and supports gathering and  
22 sharing information about the use of a comprehensive  
23 range of contraceptive methods. We're happy to share  
24 the available data when it is collected via the  
25 Community Health Survey in an appropriate manner and



2 look forward to discussing this further with the  
3 Council. The department conducts the New York City  
4 Community Health Survey annually to gather data on  
5 the health of New Yorkers including neighborhood,  
6 borough and city estimates on a broad range of  
7 chronic diseases and behavioral risk factors. The  
8 Community Health Survey is a timely surveillance  
9 instrument that is able to inform up-to-date agency  
10 priorities, and we determine the list of questions  
11 based on their ability to serve this purpose.

12 In 2013, 2014 and 2016, Community Health  
13 Survey collected data regarding contraceptive methods  
14 used by women 18 to 44 who had vaginal sex in the  
15 prior 12 months, and includes condoms, birth control  
16 pills, Depo-Provera, the birth control pill or-sorry,  
17 the birth control patch or ring, emergency  
18 contraception, IUDs or intrauterine devices.  
19 Contraceptive implants, a combination of methods or  
20 not method. We know from the Community Survey-Health  
21 Survey that among those women who use birth control  
22 the most popular methods were condoms in 34.6% of  
23 women, and the pill, 23.5% of women. About 8.3% of  
24 women using birth control used IUDs or contraceptive  
25 implants. Both are also known as Long-Acting

2 Reversible Contraception. We further note—know that  
3 in 2014 58.5% of adult female New Yorkers having  
4 vaginal sex who did not use any form of contraception  
5 did not intend to become pregnant at the time of  
6 their last intercourse. Additionally in 2013, almost  
7 6 in 10 known pregnancies among New York City women  
8 were reported as unintended. That's 58%. These data  
9 suggest that more can be done to educate women about  
10 the range of available birth control options, and  
11 ensure that they have easy access to all options. In  
12 accordance with the Sexual and Reproductive Justice  
13 framework, we do not recommend reporting solely on  
14 one specific contraceptive methods. Our goal is not  
15 to promote one particular method over another.  
16 Rather our goal is to increase access to all birth  
17 control methods and support New Yorkers in making the  
18 contraceptive choice that's best for them.

19 Intro 1172: The administration supports  
20 the intent of Intro 1172 to share data regarding  
21 maternal mortality in New York City, and we look  
22 forward to working with the Council to share non-  
23 identifiable data as it becomes available. The  
24 department currently collects this information  
25 through death certificate data and addition

2 surveillance by pregnancy associated—of pregnancy  
3 associated deaths—associated deaths. The department  
4 has issued two reports as noted previously:  
5 Unenhanced Surveillance of Pregnancy Associated,  
6 which are the deaths during pregnancy or within one  
7 year of pregnancy from anyone (sic) and pregnancy  
8 related mortality, which is a subset of these deaths  
9 that are casually related to pregnancy based on data  
10 from 2001 to 2005 and 2006 to 2010, and we've  
11 provided the most recent report to each of you. A  
12 similar analysis of pregnancy associated mortal—  
13 mortality data from 2011 to 2015 is currently  
14 underway. Additionally, the department conducts  
15 routine surveillance on maternal deaths within 42  
16 days of delivery. In 2014, the last date—the last  
17 year we have data, there were 23 maternal deaths, and  
18 I just brought a copy, and it's available online of  
19 our summary of vital statistics, which is usually  
20 about two years behind, and on page 39, Table No. 22,  
21 reports on the 2014 data. The data shows decreasing  
22 maternal deaths, which is consistent with the  
23 decreasing pregnancy related mortality ratio, which  
24 decreased 48% in New York City from 2001 to 2010.  
25 Both reports highlight the unacceptable racial

2 disparity in pregnancy related mortality in New York  
3 City. From 2006 to 2010, Black women, as Council  
4 Member Johnson mentioned, were 12 times more likely  
5 to die from a pregnancy related cause than white  
6 women. Pregnancy related mortality also  
7 disproportionately impacts Asian Pacific Islander and  
8 Latino women, although not to the same extent as for  
9 Black women. Pregnancy mortality-related mortality  
10 is associated with obesity, underlying chronic  
11 disease and poverty that also disproportionately New  
12 Yorkers' Black population. The chronic stress of  
13 racism and social inequality contributes to pregnancy  
14 related mortality along with racial disparities and  
15 other outcomes including infant mortality, pre-term  
16 birth and low birth weight outcomes. This past  
17 August, the department released a report on the first  
18 ever Citywide Severe Maternal Morbidity Surveillance  
19 System in the United States, and we also have copy of  
20 that report. Severe Maternal Morbidity is defined as  
21 a life threatening complication during child birth.  
22 Examples include heavy bleeding, kidney failure,  
23 stroke or heart attack during delivery. Our  
24 surveillance found that the rate of Severe Maternal  
25 Morbidity in New York City was higher than the

2 national Severe Maternal Morbidity rate, and that  
3 nearly 3,000 women experienced life threatening  
4 complications during pregnancy in 2012. Like  
5 maternal mortality we found stark disparities. The  
6 Severe Maternal Morbidity rate among Black women was  
7 three times that of White women. The department  
8 recognizes that improving women's health before  
9 pregnancy is critical to reducing maternal and infant  
10 mortality, and addressing the unexpected-unacceptable  
11 racial and ethnic disparities in birth outcomes. It  
12 is our belief that achieving this also requires a  
13 particular focus in those neighborhoods most  
14 impacted, neighborhoods with high concentrations of  
15 people of color and poverty. Furthermore, it  
16 requires an understanding of unwillingness to name  
17 and address racism and other structural factors past  
18 and present, which contribute to negative birth  
19 outcomes. Engaging community members and  
20 organizations in meaningful dialogue is essential for  
21 developing an effective strategy for improving sexual  
22 and reproductive health outcomes, and achieving  
23 health equity in our city. Thank you again for the  
24 opportunity to testify and we're happy to answer any  
25 questions.

2 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: Thank you very  
3 much. We have been joined by Council Member Robert  
4 Cornegy, a member of the committee from Brooklyn as  
5 well as Council Member Inez Barron, a member of the  
6 committee from Brooklyn. Council Member Crowley, do  
7 you have some questions?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Sure.

9 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: Okay. I'm going to  
10 turn it over to Council Member Crowley. We're  
11 hearing three of her bills.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Okay, I will  
13 start with HPV's vaccination. So I-I know that we've  
14 come a long way since the vaccination. What years  
15 did they—we start? I know when I was younger, it  
16 wasn't there most it right?

17 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: The  
18 vaccine was first licensed in 2006.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: 2006. So we're  
20 doing it for 10 years?

21 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: Correct.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Okay, and—but  
23 your guess is about half of—half of the teams are not  
24 fully vaccinated?

2 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: Well,  
3 that's fully with three doses of vaccine.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: And that's what  
5 you need in order for it to work?

6 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: Right.  
7 So the ACIP, which is the Advisory Committee on  
8 Immunization Processes, just changed the  
9 recommendation for adolescents who are between 9 and  
10 15 years of age, and they now recommend a two-dose  
11 schedule if there's a minimum of five months between  
12 those two doses. So that's good. That's going to  
13 give us a bit more flexibility in terms of getting  
14 kids fully vaccinated. Adolescents aren't usually  
15 going to the doctor as often, and so I think it—  
16 again, it evidences that it should provide us good  
17 protection.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Now, I—I see  
19 that we administer the vaccination in school health  
20 clinics when we have health clinics in schools. Is  
21 there a way to recommend this as part of the  
22 vaccinations recommended before—before entering high  
23 school? It has—and is it—and—and—and what ones are?

24 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: Okay. So  
25 HPD vaccine is not required for a school attendance.

2 The other adolescent vaccines that are the  
3 meningococcal vaccines. This year there's a  
4 requirement for 7th grade and 12<sup>th</sup> grade and also the  
5 Tdap vaccine, which is Tetanus, Diphtheria and  
6 Pertussis. Those are required for school. HPV is  
7 not. That would require a change to Public Health  
8 LAW 2164.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: State Law.

10 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: State Law  
11 to include—to include it as a requirement.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: And do you think  
13 there would be opposition to such?

14 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: I think  
15 that would be something we'd need to—it would be  
16 worth further discussion.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Right, because  
18 it's—it's used, and there are a lot of teens not  
19 getting the vaccination, and if it's—there's no  
20 downside to the vaccination.

21 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: Right,  
22 the vaccine has proven to be very safe and all of the  
23 early data shows how effective it is.

24

25



2 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: And—and so maybe  
3 it's the messaging. Maybe it's to be called the  
4 anti-cancer vaccination?

5 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: Yes,  
6 that's what it is. That's what we've been promoting.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Right.

8 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: You know,  
9 you can see this in examples, you know, of our  
10 toolkit. It's all about cancer prevention. We  
11 recommend that doctors are not focused on sex. The  
12 minute that that comes up as a conversation we get a  
13 negative response from parents, especially when  
14 they're talking about their 11-year-old. Often the—  
15 the provider isn't really willing to have that  
16 discussion nor is the—is the parent. We've done  
17 focus groups of parents. We've done in-depth  
18 interviews with providers as well. So examples in the  
19 toolkit are, in fact, how do you have that  
20 conversation? You know, what we want you to do is a  
21 child is in front of you in office, and you say so  
22 and so is due for three vaccines today. We're going  
23 to give you, you know, Tdap, meningococcal and HPD,  
24 and move on, you know, and not— It's the same way  
25 they do with childhood vaccines. They don't say you

2 need this, and oh this one is option. We'll wait,  
3 but it is not required for school, and we know that  
4 happens. It's why we've been working very hard on  
5 the messaging with providers.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Are you holding  
7 providers accountable, or do you have an idea if one  
8 provider has more of the higher vaccination rate  
9 versus another?

10 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: So the-  
11 all providers, pediatric care providers in the city  
12 get a report from us twice a year on their adolescent  
13 coverage, and we tell them how well they're doing on  
14 HPD vaccine coverage, and we tell them how well  
15 they're doing against their peers. So their  
16 percentile ranking, and we also do what-these  
17 assessment visits in doctor's offices. We go to  
18 about a quarter of all pediatric care providers  
19 across the city, and we give doctors very specific  
20 feedback on their vaccine coverage, what they're  
21 doing well, what they're doing wrong, and give them-  
22 we give them a toolkit and we give them guidance on  
23 how to improve their workflows to increase HPV  
24 vaccine uptake in coverage.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: And a child can  
3 get the vaccination without the parent present if  
4 they want to?

5 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: So the-  
6 it's in the context of sexual-getting sexual  
7 reproductive care, and-and that's been where some of  
8 the confusion happens, but fore most pediatric  
9 practices the-you know, I think it's up to the  
10 practice what they're-what they're doing and whether  
11 a child is in for a routine visit. It's a rough one.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [interposing]  
13 But you have all the information, right?

14 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Providers have  
16 to provide the information when they provide this  
17 vaccine?

18 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER:  
19 Absolutely. We get everything reported from the  
20 register.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: So-so then you  
22 would-so once we get the numbers we'll be able to see  
23 if there are certain zip codes and there are certain  
24 doctors within the zip codes. We had a falling  
25 shore. (sic)

2 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: Right, of  
3 course, and we know that. I mean I think we've—yeah,  
4 there was a question on that.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I didn't see  
6 that, no.

7 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: Yeah, so  
8 we can—these are from the community health profiles  
9 and this atlas was part of it.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Of higher rate  
11 sections.(sic)

12 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: Right, so  
13 we do know where the higher coverage neighborhood  
14 are. We know where the lower coverage neighborhoods  
15 are and, in fact that's how we've targeted our  
16 outreach efforts. Clear back in 2015, e actually did  
17 nurse-led provider visits. So that was really  
18 designed to have a sort of peer-to-peer education  
19 among the healthcare staff, working with them to  
20 educate the staff why—why HPD vaccine was so  
21 important. How to deliver effective messages, and  
22 tell them how to improve again, you know, workflows  
23 to increase coverage and, in fact, we saw a 28%  
24 increase in vaccination in those practices.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Right.

2 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: We think  
3 those are tremendous so the self--

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Is it--is it the  
5 parents do you think are the reason that these kids  
6 are not getting vaccinated?

7 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER:  
8 [interposing] It's a--honestly, it's a combination.  
9 It's a combination of a--of the parent. You know  
10 it's anecdotal. I've been in our own immunization  
11 clinic where an adolescent was telling her mom she  
12 wanted the vaccine, and the mom was, No. I mean and  
13 I--I couldn't even reason with the--with the mom to get  
14 the child vaccinated and, you know, we've also we did  
15 in-depth interviews with providers and, you know, the  
16 truth is that there are many providers who have maybe  
17 not the most up-to-date or their own misinformation  
18 about the vaccine.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Right.

20 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: We're  
21 very pleased that we got a new grant from the Center  
22 for Disease Control and, in fact, it's going to allow  
23 us to fund more nurse-led visits. We've shown that  
24 they were effective, and it's a--it's going to allow  
25 us to fund more peer-to-peer education. So it's

2 going to be physician to physician, education to try  
3 to counter a lot of these misconceptions that we've  
4 seen.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: So you have—you  
6 say that the department has enough money to get the  
7 message out there to—to get better results in that  
8 area?

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER:  
10 [interposing] So I—I do have money for the—you know,  
11 we did—we have done effective media campaigns. I  
12 think they're—you know that can be a follow-up  
13 conversation also in terms of what the, you know,  
14 what we can do in addition if there was additional  
15 funding.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Okay. So if you  
17 had additional funding you could use it?

18 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: Right.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I'm going to go  
20 into questions about the LARC. In your testimony you  
21 said 58% of I mean of pregnancies are unintended.

22 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: Uh-huh.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: How do you get  
24 that type of information? I'm surprised that you  
25 know. We have such a strong handle on the data.

2 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: Well,  
3 it's a--the calculation around unintended pregnancy  
4 takes--takes into--it's based on survey data where  
5 women are asked whether the pregnancy that women are  
6 asked through our planned survey, which is  
7 surveillance, too, for all--it represents women who  
8 give birth in New York City and they're asked if the--  
9 if the pregnancy occurred sooner than they wanted, at  
10 the right time, later than--or did they not want to be  
11 pregnant? It's set to their side of questions to  
12 assess whether this was a planned pregnancy or not,  
13 and we--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [interposing]  
15 And do you know what that percentage for those  
16 pregnancies that go full term?

17 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: We--we  
18 actually have that data for women who give birth as  
19 well.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: And do you know  
21 what that is?

22 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: I can't  
23 tell that, but we can get back to you on that.

24

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: So--so you know--  
3 from the 58% do you know how many were using LARCs?  
4 I know you said you have a--

5 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN:  
6 [interposing] No, we don't have it broken up that  
7 way, but what we did have, which I think was an  
8 interesting specific, which I'll restate. Give me  
9 one second. So, 58.5--50--about 59% of adult females  
10 who were having vaginal sex who did not use any birth  
11 control didn't--stated that they did not intend to be  
12 pregnant at that time. So they had that. There were  
13 at risk of getting pregnant because they had vaginal  
14 sex and, you know, we wanted to pull out women who  
15 were trying to get pregnant. So for women who did  
16 not intend to get pregnant, over half of those women  
17 did not use birth control.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Okay.

19 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: Which to  
20 us is a good way of trying to understand if we pull  
21 out really the women who don't--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [interposing]  
23 Right.

24

25



2 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: --want to  
3 be pregnant, what percent are actually using birth  
4 control.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Are you aware of  
6 Colorado's are doing it or a program that is  
7 administered, focused heavily on a campaign to  
8 install the LARC--

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN:  
10 [interposing] Uh-huh.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: --in women and  
12 that they saw their rates of unintended pregnancies  
13 drop 40% in only a few years.

14 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: Yes, we  
15 are familiar with that study and other studies, and  
16 as we've been looking out of New York we also know  
17 that, you know, those were--that's very important  
18 work, and we know that there have been many barriers  
19 to IUDs and implants or LARCs, and that there's been  
20 much success when it--when costs and other factors are  
21 removed. But we also know that sometimes there are  
22 people who are self-selecting themselves into studies  
23 like that, and so--and what we--we--we look at data in  
24 New York City, and in providers where we know every  
25 method is available, and that there are no barriers.

2 Some of our partner providers who—who operate with  
3 really good practices around access, and we're not  
4 seeing anything near 80%. We're seeing more like 30  
5 or 40%. I think what we're very concerned and I  
6 stated this in my testimony is that we—because of the  
7 history of coercion around contraception particularly  
8 for women of color, the fact that we know that birth  
9 control has been used to—as population control. We  
10 know that there is a very tragic history even in this  
11 country of women being sterilized without their  
12 consent, including Mexican-American women in  
13 California, and we know that in Puerto Rico many  
14 women were sterilized without their consent. And  
15 even as recently as 15 or 20 years ago, welfare  
16 reform in some states was tied to women using birth  
17 control and having fewer benefits if they—if they did  
18 have another child, and—and—and we know from many  
19 conversations with partners in the community and  
20 organizations led by women of color nationally that  
21 there's been a lot of concern about the way LARC  
22 methods have been promoted, and that instead of  
23 centering women, putting women in the center and  
24 women's choices, let's put LARC in the center. And I  
25 think one thing we've—we've heard from our partners,

2 and actually we heard it when we did our Maybe The  
3 IUD campaign. Women in the community reached out to  
4 us, and it's what led to us forming our Sexual  
5 Reproductive Justice Community Engagement group.  
6 That—while IUDs we have to remove all barriers to  
7 IUDs and, in fact, we—our Health Department played a  
8 major role in working with the state to get IUDs  
9 available immediately following delivery, and to have  
10 a carve-out for that benefit. We feel very strongly  
11 that we need to center women, and then make all those  
12 methods available. One thing we've heard from women  
13 is that not all women and particularly women of color  
14 who were concerned about coercion and bias, don't  
15 necessarily trust the messaging from their providers.  
16 They believe that providers offer certain methods  
17 based on their race and ethnicity, and they feel—and  
18 they feel that sometimes providers say something  
19 different depending on their race and ethnicity. So  
20 we feel—and that effectiveness isn't the only  
21 criteria. Some women want a method they can control,  
22 and they can't control IUDs. And so—and there's been  
23 issues of women not being able to get them removed,  
24 and so I want to be clear. I fully support and we're  
25 working very hard to removed barriers to IUDs and

2 implants, but we think it's critical that when we  
3 talk about it, we talk about it in the context of all  
4 contraceptive methods, and report all methods not  
5 just IUDs because it--it privileges one method over  
6 another when for many women that's not the main part-  
7 -part.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [interposing] Is  
9 it difficult to remove one? Can the woman go to go a  
10 Planned Parenthood or a local clinic?

11 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN:

12 [interposing] It's not--

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: --to get that  
14 removed?

15 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: --

16 difficult technically to remove an IUD, but I don't  
17 think that's what you meant, but in terms of access,  
18 if someone loses her insurance and frankly--I mean  
19 I'm sure you've heard in the papers of women who are  
20 now this large--rapid increase recently in women going  
21 to Planned Parenthood for IUDs since the elections,  
22 and I think people are afraid if they lose their  
23 insurance--what if they lose their insurance, and  
24 they're not able to go and get it removed? That was a  
25 legitimate concern.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I was under the  
3 impression that with Planned Parenthood and other  
4 public health institutions in the city that we would  
5 offer all types of birth control to those who may not  
6 have insurance or are under-insured?

7 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: Right.  
8 Yes, so in New York City we're very fortunate in New  
9 York States that we have federal funding to--right now  
10 Title 10 funding.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Should we have  
12 people fear that--that--if--if they were to install  
13 something like this that they could not do a reversal  
14 because we don't know the future of healthcare  
15 agencies?

16 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: Well, I--I  
17 think it--I'm not worried in New York City. I'm  
18 telling you--I guess what I was getting at--

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [interposing]  
20 Our focus is on New York City?

21 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: Yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I just want to  
23 other people on the line>

24 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN:  
25 [interposing] In New York--No, you could--yes, in New

2 York City, we are—we are a beacon of reproductive  
3 rights in New York City and New York State, and we  
4 feel very confident. Our Mayor had said that very  
5 publicly that we will assure that nobody loses their  
6 benefits. I was speaking to concerns women have  
7 whether--

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [interposing]  
9 Yeah.

10 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: --whether  
11 that will come to class or not.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Okay, and now  
13 the last known year that you have data on maternal  
14 mortality is from 2014. Is that where you said we  
15 had 23?

16 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: Yes, and  
17 that needs to be clear. The report that you referred  
18 to earlier. So we have reports that do what's called  
19 enhanced surveillance, and that has much more in-  
20 depth information and it goes to a year following  
21 pregnancy, following delivery--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [interposing]  
23 And I propose to make sure that that's an accurate  
24 number because even in our city we're collecting I  
25 don't know, compare it to construction fatalities,

2 but there was just an article saying that there are  
3 actually a third more than the number that the City  
4 actually has because they didn't calculate OSHA  
5 related deaths or where. (sic) It's not a question.  
6 I mean it was just a—I just want to make sure that  
7 that's that the real number.

8 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: Well--  
9 well, so what I want to say is the--

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [interposing]  
11 Yeah.

12 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: --the  
13 number that I stated for 2014 that is routinely  
14 surveillance and it's based on a check-off box on the  
15 death certificate that says that the woman was  
16 pregnant. So we—and it is the reason we know that  
17 doesn't get at every death--

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [interposing]  
19 Right.

20 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: --and--and  
21 one, someone could just forget to check off the box.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: So as a—a  
23 professional working for the city, you—you realize  
24 this is probably not the accurate number, and--and  
25 there's probably--

2 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN:

3 [interposing] Well, that's why we do enhanced  
4 surveillance. So that's--the reports that I referred  
5 to and that you have a copy of, which take longer to  
6 do--

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [interposing]  
8 Yes.

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: --is  
10 where we have an obstetrician and gynecologist who  
11 reviews every chart. We look at the Office of the  
12 Medical--Medical Examiner. We look at hospital  
13 discharge data and actually if you compare the data  
14 and vital statistics to what we get in our enhanced  
15 report, our numbers are higher, and we also don't  
16 just look at pregnancy related deaths. We look at  
17 deaths for example if a woman dies from homicide  
18 during her year after pregnancy that's something that  
19 can inform issues or concerns potentially around  
20 domestic violence. So we--we feel it's critical to go  
21 beyond what we can do from the death certificate.  
22 What's good about that is we can get data out sooner.  
23 We've now committed because of this--these findings  
24 and the major disparity, we've realigned the staffing  
25 in my bureau, and we now have a full-time person who



2 started two months ago. Her full job is Maternal  
3 Morbidity and Severe Maternal Morbidity Surveillance.  
4 And so we feel we're going to move forward in a way  
5 to have more rapid for that.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [interposing]  
7 I'll probably circle back later, but I know that the  
8 Chair and others have questions. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: Thank you, Council  
10 Member Crowley. [coughs] Before I got to Council  
11 Member Barron—before I go to Council Member Barron, I  
12 had a few questions to follow up on Council Member  
13 Crowley's questions. So you mentioned that the HPV  
14 vaccination rates are currently lowest but improving  
15 on Staten Island Central and Southern Brooklyn, and  
16 Greenpoint in Williamsburg. Why do those communities  
17 have the lowest vaccination rates?

18 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: Well, I  
19 think that's a good question. I thin kit tracks  
20 racial and ethnic disparities that we see, which, in  
21 fact, are reversed disparities for this vaccine.  
22 When we [coughs] did our interviews with the  
23 providers we were very surprised that the providers  
24 were sort of cherry picking their adolescents. I  
25 didn't have practices in place to routinely vaccinate

2 every child. So we have, you know, in the registry  
3 part of what we offer, our physician support so that  
4 if a physician doesn't make a decision about which  
5 child needs what vaccine, if there's 11-year-old who  
6 comes in, you know, gets an HPD vaccine. But, in  
7 fact, there was a lot of cherry picking. You know,  
8 this--this girl needs it now. You know, this boy can  
9 wait [coughs] and it's not best practice, and so  
10 that's the kind of education that we provided. There  
11 could also be some underreporting. We get better  
12 vaccine reporting from lower income neighborhoods  
13 because they get the vaccines--for children's vaccines  
14 given to them for free and for accountability. They  
15 need to report better. So some of the--there may be  
16 some again difference in reporting as well. We do  
17 hear from some of the communities you mentioned.  
18 There are some additional--whether it's religious or--  
19 or cultural beliefs, we are talking about sex at that  
20 early of an age as somewhat of a taboo, and not part  
21 of the routine sort of provider patient interaction.  
22 It's part of what we hope to address with the  
23 physician to physician peer education that I--that I  
24 mentioned.

2 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: Does any of this  
3 have to do with religious objection?

4 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: Not  
5 religious exemption per se. I think it's in part and  
6 we sort of more--

7 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: [interposing] Not  
8 exemption, objection.

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: Objection,  
10 no--no I would--

11 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: When I saw that  
12 the--that the--one of the neighborhoods with the low--  
13 I'm not trying stereotype here--

14 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: Yeah, I  
15 know that.

16 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: One of the  
17 neighborhoods with the lowest vaccination rates is  
18 Borough Park, and so I'm wondering is that their rent  
19 20% of the population there is reported as not being  
20 vaccinated. Does that have anything to do with any  
21 sort of cultural or religious differences?

22 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: Well,  
23 see, yes, I didn't mean object--exemption. It's more  
24 of a--it's not religious as much as philosophical as  
25 much as not talking about having those conversations

2 about sex with a--with a young child or having--or  
3 thinking, you know, there's more of a thought. Well,  
4 this child is adolescent. They can have sex until  
5 [coughs] until they're married, and they don't need  
6 the vaccine yet. So, you know, so they can wait.  
7 You know, one of the physicians that we're hiring for  
8 our peer-to-peer education is actually--actually from  
9 the community, and we hope we can do better sort of  
10 education that way. They can be better accepted, and  
11 we can find better culturally appropriate messages.

12 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: So you mentioned to  
13 Council Member Crowley that the state law would not  
14 be changed for the--the school based requirement on  
15 HPD vaccinations. Does the city stand in support of  
16 changing state law? Does the city have a--have a  
17 position on that?

18 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: Well, the  
19 city does not have an official position on that.  
20 [off mic] We'll have to deal with it.

21 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: We should have--

22 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER:

23 [interposing] I think we--

24 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: --we should have  
25 apposition on it.

2 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: We  
3 should. I mean I think we would—I think we can bring  
4 it up for—for a discussion officially.

5 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: Okay. [coughs] And  
6 has there been any progress in investigating whether  
7 the HPD vaccination is as effective and in two does  
8 as-as well as, you know, you're supposed to get three  
9 doses as well as, you know, you're supposed to get  
10 three doses. But what is the sort of success rate if  
11 you get two doses? How-how-how good is that?

12 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: Yeah, so  
13 the evidence for that looks good. So that  
14 recommendation was changed in October by the Advisory  
15 Committee on Immunization Processes, and so that's  
16 now the recommendation from 9 to up to the 15<sup>th</sup>  
17 birthday. Those adolescents can get two doses as  
18 long as they're five months apart, and we're actually  
19 making those changes on the Immunization Registry for  
20 the decision support, and we've sent notification to  
21 all providers after that October vote to let them  
22 know about the change. [coughing] In fact, our  
23 phone rang off the hook the next day because  
24 providers are really quite excited about that change.

2 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: We've been joined  
3 by Council Member Majority Leader Jimmy Van Bramer  
4 who is a member of the committee. So, in the—in the  
5 testimony you presented to us, Dr. Kaplan, you had  
6 said that the Community Health Survey that 34% of  
7 women and the most population method for  
8 contraception was condoms. The pill was 23.5%, and  
9 about 8% of women using birth control used IU—IUDs or  
10 contraceptive implants. So is 8.3% considered low if  
11 we look at other municipalities, other cities, other  
12 states is that a low number?

13 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: [off mic]  
14 I think [on mic] I think based on looking at other  
15 areas it has got increased. I'd say with full access  
16 and based on even looking at other providers where we  
17 look at when there's full access, the number is  
18 usually higher. So I would say that this likely  
19 reflects barriers—still barriers to this option.

20 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: And is there a  
21 target goal of what that number should be?

22 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: We don't  
23 feel comfortable setting a target for a contraceptive  
24 methods because that certainly---

2 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: [interposing] It's  
3 a personal choice.

4 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: Exactly,  
5 and also, you know, from a—from a government agency  
6 but from anyone setting a target can lead to a  
7 provider behavior that feels like okay we have to  
8 meet our targets as opposed to really guiding—being  
9 guided by what the woman's needs are.

10 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: It's a coercion  
11 fear--

12 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: Yes.

13 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: --that providers  
14 will be coercing women to--

15 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN:  
16 [interposing] Well--

17 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: --take a certain  
18 path.

19 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: Or—or be—  
20 feel motivated to prioritize or, you know, privilege  
21 a particular method as opposed to saying, you know,  
22 what's starting with the woman, what is your  
23 lifestyle? What is going on? I mean we've always in  
24 New York City prided ourselves on reproductive  
25 choice, and the idea behind that is no matter how

2 great the method, we think medically that we—we start  
3 from what a woman's needs are, and make sure—many  
4 times women will come in with misinformation about  
5 IUDs or other methods and we want to clear that up  
6 and make—and it's why we did the Maybe The ID—IUD  
7 campaign was a playful campaign to help people go oh,  
8 what is that, and then—but then when they go to our  
9 website, they see all the methods, and we want—we  
10 want to remove this. We want to remove financial  
11 barriers, but we don't want to have a target.

12 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: How much does the  
13 City spend on—not on the campaign but on IUD access?  
14 So put the campaign—put the media campaign aside, how  
15 much do we spend on contraceptive access?

16 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: So I'd  
17 have to—so there are two major areas where we're  
18 doing this work, and I'm going to probably have to  
19 get back to you with the amount, but one is that we  
20 have \$250,000 a year for a five-year campaign, but  
21 campaign in the broader—broader sense, not just maybe  
22 the IUD. This is what we've been used to form our  
23 sexually protective justice community engagement  
24 group, which has over 35 community-based organization  
25 working with us to develop a campaign, and it's



2 actually a way—a new way of working that we have  
3 never worked before certainly in my bureau. It's  
4 really guided by Dr. Bassett's message around how we  
5 engage community, but we're not going in and saying  
6 this is what we're going to do. We have shared  
7 leadership and joint decision making, and actually we  
8 launched a Sexually Protective Justice video, which  
9 is available on our website. It's a four-minute long  
10 very powerful video that we've gotten some great  
11 feedback on. So that's—the \$250,000 includes  
12 consultants and training. We had community  
13 consultations, all of that are gathering information  
14 from over 250 women in 10 locations around the end  
15 man, around the city and transgender men and women  
16 around issues related to reproductive justice and  
17 contraction and other issues. So that's one piece.  
18 The other is our Quality Improvement Network for  
19 Contraceptive Access where we currently work with ten  
20 hospitals to implement the ten best practices around  
21 access to contraception postpartum, post-abortion,  
22 and primary care. And that is approximately for the—  
23 paying a consultant it's about \$200,000 a year.  
24 There's also all the in—the staff time and other  
25 materials. So between the two, I'd say we're close

2 to half a million, and maybe there's somewhat more,  
3 but that's about what I would estimate right now with  
4 these things. (sic)

5 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: And [coughs] does  
6 State Medicaid pay for IUDs for qualifying women? Is  
7 that covered?

8 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: Yes, and  
9 with the Affordable Care Act, basically it's a—it's a  
10 core preventive service. There's no co-pay. If you  
11 have insurance through the Affordable Care Act there  
12 is no pay-co-pay for women's healthcare including any  
13 contraceptive method that's been approved by-by the  
14 FDA, which includes IUDs.

15 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: So the city's  
16 Department of Health and Mental Hygiene's STD clinics  
17 when a woman goes to an STD clinic to get a test or  
18 get a vaccination, can they request an IUD at that  
19 vaccine—at that STD clinic and receive one?

20 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: So  
21 currently at the STD clinics the only method of  
22 contraception that you can receive is emergency  
23 contraception, which is a method—an oral method that  
24 is really post-coital after someone has sex, and  
25

2 within 120 hours they can use this to help prevent a  
3 pregnancy. If they had on a particular--

4 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: [interposing] How  
5 come that I--how come that IUDs?

6 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: That  
7 right now that is the only method available through  
8 STD clinics. I mean we--that's--that's--the focus has  
9 been on STDs, and one--the one method has been IUD.  
10 I'm sorry, emergency contraception. However, we have  
11 a wide range of family planning clinics and providers  
12 throughout the city where the STD clinics would refer  
13 women who want the other methods, and we've developed  
14 the Teams in New York City apps that makes it very  
15 easy for young people and we're working on an adult  
16 one called Doing it in New York City that will help  
17 people find where they can go for free or local  
18 options for birth control.

19 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: I understand but--  
20 but if we're going to talk about sexual health  
21 holistically, and if someone got an STD and is going  
22 to get treated, and during the course of their  
23 examination with the medical provider, they're  
24 talking about their sexual history, wouldn't it be  
25 good instead of making them go an additional step to

2 go to an additional provider, a referral? Wouldn't  
3 it be good to actually sort of offer the services  
4 there?

5 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: I think  
6 your point is very well taken. I can't—we don't have  
7 that right now. I think it's something that I—we  
8 will bring back to the department and talk with—with  
9 folks there about.

10 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: Because we want to  
11 ensure especially I would think that in some of the  
12 areas where the STD clinics exist, Upper Manhattan,  
13 Central Brooklyn and other places, where some of the  
14 community health survey data shows disparities,  
15 racial disparities to create an additional step  
16 instead of working to fight those disparities. Where  
17 they're interacting with the city, I think would make  
18 sense.

19 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: Uh-huh,  
20 and I think it's a very good point. I think we'll  
21 need that further discussion about, and CHAIRPERSON  
22 JOHNSON:

23 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: Okay. Lastly, and  
24 then I'm going to go to Council Member Barron. So,  
25 in a health committee hearing in November of 2013

2 before I was here at the Council, you, Dr. Kaplan I'm  
3 told stated that the department planned to assess the  
4 effectiveness of an outreach effort to clinicians to  
5 prevent maternal deaths due to hemorrhage. Has that  
6 assessment been completed?

7 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: So in-not  
8 quite in the way it was describe, but it is—we have  
9 worked on it. So just to—I remember that testimony,  
10 and we were sharing information on seeing the numbers  
11 around hemorrhage as a cause of maternal death, and  
12 knowing that often that is a cause of death that is  
13 preventable. And we developed posters. We worked  
14 with training with providers. We worked with a  
15 number of OBGYN providers at all of the maternity  
16 hospitals. Since then, we have partnered with the  
17 American Congress of Obstetricians and Gynecologists,  
18 which is the professional organization that  
19 represents all obstetricians and gynecologists in the  
20 city, and they implement something called the Safe  
21 Motherhood Initiative, SMI, and through different  
22 funding streams have developed what they call  
23 bundles, which are preventive measures to take during  
24 delivery around the most common causes of material  
25 death, and one of those is hemorrhage. And so we are

2 partnering with them on the Safe Motherhood  
3 Initiative. They now have 33 of the 40 New York City  
4 Maternity Hospitals, and I can provide you with a  
5 list of which ones. We were involved in implementing  
6 these bundles, which are evidenced based approaches  
7 to treating a hemorrhage to reduce the risk of a  
8 woman dying from hemorrhage. So, our follow up has  
9 really been through partnership with a cog that took  
10 this on as major part of their work.

11 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: So you mentioned it  
12 in your testimony, but I think it's worth repeating,  
13 and Dr. Bassett has talked a lot about the  
14 institutional systematic racism that exists in our  
15 healthcare system, and the importance of, you know,  
16 culturally competent healthcare that's provided to  
17 specific demographics and populations. The numbers I  
18 think are stark and appalling that the severe  
19 maternal morbidity rate among black women was three  
20 times that of white women, which is like horrifying.  
21 And that the black women were 12 times more likely to  
22 die from pregnancy related causes. I mean it's like—  
23 it's horrifying.

24 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: Yes.

2 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: So, has the rise in  
3 health insurance coverage due to the Affordable Care  
4 Act has this impacted maternal morbidity or mortality  
5 in any way? Do we know?

6 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: We—we  
7 know and I wasn't able to—we know that many more  
8 women of reproductive age are covered by health  
9 insurance, which means they have access to both  
10 contraception and prevention of a—of an unplanned  
11 pregnancy or if they don't want to be pregnant and  
12 access to primary care. We don't—and we—we looked  
13 into that because thankfully you did share that  
14 question ahead, and we did not—we're going to  
15 continue to look at it. We were not able to find  
16 data at this point that could indicate whether that—  
17 we know that it's increased the women who we would be  
18 concerned about being enrolled and being covered.  
19 But I—I think it's important to note that in New York  
20 City we have a long history of women who are pregnant  
21 being able to be covered by Medicaid regardless of  
22 immigration status. So, you are pregnant, you are  
23 able to get Medicaid, and you continue to be covered,  
24 and it's up to 200% of poverty unlike regular  
25 Medicaid, which is not 200% of poverty. So it's a

2 wider net, and it's regardless of immigration status,  
3 which as we know isn't true for Medicaid when you're  
4 not pregnant. So almost all women in New York City  
5 who give birth are—have insurance and that was true  
6 before the Affordable Care Act.

7 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: And do we know what  
8 the maternal mortality rate [coughs] excuse me—do we  
9 know what the maternal mortality race disparities are  
10 when chronic conditions and insurance coverage are  
11 controlled for?

12 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: We don't  
13 have data in that manner. What we do is look at  
14 chronic illness and the association between having a  
15 chronic illness, and that's in our—actually included  
16 in the reports that we shared with you, and—and found  
17 that if you are obese, if you have one or more  
18 chronic condition including Diabetes and  
19 hypertension, you're at much greater risk of severe  
20 maternal morbidity or mortality, and if you're a  
21 black women, you are much more likely to have what we  
22 call these co-morbidities that put you at risk of a  
23 very serious complication or even death.

24 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: And then [coughs]  
25 you mentioned the Quality Improvement Network for



2 Contraceptive—Contraceptive Access QINCA. It's the  
3 [coughs] the local hospitals that participate.  
4 [coughs] Right now there are ten?

5 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: Yes.

6 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: Are there plans to  
7 expand that to beyond ten?

8 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: Yes, we  
9 have a second cohort that we call them cohorts that  
10 are starting in January. We have definitely—it's an  
11 application process because we need the CO of the  
12 hospital to approve it, but you really need  
13 leadership buy-in to make this happen, and—and we now  
14 have six. Hopefully two more will join, and we're  
15 hoping to have a least eight. We can take up to ten  
16 hospitals to work with us, and they sign onto work on  
17 ten best practices that and, which include— And I  
18 think it's important to stress given what we're  
19 talking about at that bias and—and institutional  
20 racism that part of their training is on ensuring  
21 that reproductive decisions are made free of coercion  
22 and they have to agree to that. And actually, today  
23 at Brookdale Hospital, which is one of the hospitals  
24 working with us and as you know located in  
25 Brownsville, serving a population that often has some

2 of the worst outcomes around birth outcomes. Dr. Lyn  
3 Roberts who is part of our community engagement group  
4 for Sexual and Reproductive Justice is doing the  
5 grand rounds on Sexual and Reproductive Justice.  
6 It's not just about contraception. So we're actually  
7 trying to make it normative that we talk about issues  
8 around the impact of bias and coercion on the care,  
9 and people comfort going to their provider and  
10 feeling like they can get good care. So we see that  
11 as part of this work.

12 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: And participating  
13 hospitals are both hospitals and the Health and  
14 Hospitals Network, our public hospital system and  
15 non-public hospitals?

16 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: Yes, we  
17 made it a point, and we know that they way all-all  
18 hospitals serve low-income families. We've tried to  
19 focus on hospitals that have a higher percent of  
20 families of color and low-income families. But yes,  
21 like Brookdale is a good example.

22 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: And is-is-do we  
23 have hospitals participating in all five boroughs?

24 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: We-in the  
25 first cohort, we do not. I don't-we haven't made

2 selections for the second cohort, and like our breast  
3 feed-our Baby Friendly Hospital Learning  
4 Collaborative, which is another collaborative we have  
5 both Staten Island hospitals participating. So far  
6 we do not have a Staten Island in our first cohort,  
7 and I have to get back to you on whether they applied  
8 for the second, but we reach out to all hospitals.

9 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: We should try to  
10 get them in the second cohort.

11 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: I agree.

12 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: Okay. I want to  
13 turn it over to Council Member Barron.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Mr.  
15 Chair. Thank you to the panel for coming. My mic  
16 has got a little reverberation in it. So if you  
17 could clear that up, I would appreciate it. Thank  
18 you so much. I'm very concerned about the racial  
19 disparities that exist when we talk about healthcare,  
20 and I'm very concerned about the fact that African-  
21 Americans know that historically we have been used in  
22 experimentation, and we've been not-we have not given  
23 consent. We've been uninformed, and as recently as  
24 1972, which is when the Tuskegee Syphilis experiment  
25 concluded, we were being used as guinea pigs. We

2 were not told. We were not even given treatment,  
3 which had been proven to be effective in addressing  
4 the issue of Syphilis, Penicillin. It's  
5 unconscionable that that happened. We can go back  
6 beyond that, and we talk about Harriet Lack, who is  
7 the origin of the HeLa cells, which has led to so  
8 much of the medical work that has been done trying to  
9 address the issue of cancer. She was not informed of  
10 the fact that her cells were going to be used. She  
11 did not give consent in that regard, and we can go  
12 back to the more than I think 30 women, who were  
13 subjected to the tortuous experiments of Dr. Marion  
14 Simms, J. Marion Sims called the father of  
15 gynecology. Women on whom he experimented without  
16 their consent. They were enslaved Africans, so they  
17 didn't give their consent, and were subjected to  
18 tortuous experiments without the benefit of  
19 anesthesia even though it was coming into vogue, and  
20 even though when he used his procedures on white  
21 women, he used anesthesia. So there's a history in  
22 my community of not trusting medical people. It's  
23 not the doctor that we knew. It's not the doctor  
24 that we have any confidence in. So that's certainly  
25 is a huge hurdle that needs to be addressed as we

2 talk about going forward and trying to get this  
3 vaccine approved. I have not recommended—I  
4 understanding medically, you know, I majored in  
5 physiology so I've got a little bit of a science  
6 background even though it's very ancient now. But  
7 people who come and will question how—how safe is  
8 this, and are we being used as guinea pigs, and how  
9 do we know for sure that this is not something again?  
10 How do we know that the vaccines that are coming in  
11 our community are of the same caliber or strength or  
12 meet with qualifications that exist in other  
13 communities? So it's a real issue, and I know that  
14 in report, I looked in your report and East New York  
15 is rated I think the fifth highest of pre-terms  
16 births, births that occur before 37 weeks, and  
17 there's a real concern. There's a real issue.  
18 There's a—a gap between the—the services that we get,  
19 the conditions that we endure, and any faith that  
20 exists with the community, with the—the medical  
21 community at large, and I'm glad you mentioned  
22 Brookdale. That's one of the hospitals that's in my  
23 district, and we're working with them and trying to  
24 develop a program with them that meets those kinds of  
25 needs. But how do we address this historic

2 documented incidents of African-American women and  
3 men being used in experiments, and not getting the  
4 adequate care that they are entitled to.

5 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: Well,  
6 thank you so much for your statement and questions,  
7 and I'll start and I don't know if Zucker might want  
8 to add specifically to HPD, but that's exactly why we  
9 in—in my bureau on Maternal, Infant and Reproductive  
10 Health and with Dr. Bassett's support and leadership  
11 adopted the Sexual and Reproductive Justice framework  
12 because we literally had women of color from the  
13 community as well as from national organizations like  
14 an organization called Sister Song, Women of Color  
15 Collective for Reproduction Justice coming to us and  
16 saying we can't talk about contraception for example  
17 without acknowledging the history of reproductive  
18 oppression, and the continued bias that women of  
19 color and particularly black women and Latino women  
20 face when they receive care. And so we really went  
21 on a journey that started about a year and a half ago  
22 where brought partners together to talk about what  
23 does that mean, and how do we make that part of our  
24 work, and incorporate that. Because we know there's  
25 mistrust, and understandably so since governments

2 have to acknowledge the role that government actually  
3 played in whether it was Tuskegee or sterilizations  
4 that happened, you know, previously without knowledge  
5 and other experimentation. So we feel we have to  
6 speak openly and honestly about that, and acknowledge  
7 it, and then work with in the diverse group of—that  
8 represents women in the community, national leaders,  
9 and that's exactly what we've been doing. We  
10 developed—one of our first steps we decided was to  
11 develop this video call on Sexual and Reproductive  
12 Justice which is on our website. It was just  
13 launched last month, and what it does is it's women's  
14 stories in our group about what happened to them,  
15 their experiences of getting a C-section with nobody  
16 telling them anything about why it was happening.  
17 About having—being assaulted sexually, and self-  
18 medicating because—about learning, getting sick and  
19 never seeing someone who looked like them, a black  
20 woman who's a lesbian and never seeing a picture or  
21 any image of women in love. So all these stories  
22 where women don't see themselves, and that  
23 particularly women of color become invisible. So  
24 that is how we're now framing our work. We're using  
25 that framework, and I think it's—the other thing I

2 want to say is we're now launching our Neighborhood  
3 Health Action Centers in North and Central Brooklyn,  
4 in East and Central Harlem, and in the South Bronx,  
5 and as a part of that, we are opening women's health  
6 suites. 311 is already working and operating in East  
7 Harlem, and we're looking for those to be a place of-  
8 of hopefully sanctuary for women to go to for a  
9 space, and-but also for activities and support and  
10 linking women to services. Those are in development,  
11 and we see partnering with community partners in  
12 Brownsville and other communities where Neighborhood  
13 Health Action Centers are to move the work forward.  
14 So I-I couldn't agree more with what you just said,  
15 and it's exactly how we're moving forward in how  
16 we're doing this work now, which is a real change  
17 from previously in terms of how we're engaging this  
18 community to speak openly about these issues, and  
19 making that part of the conversation as we move  
20 forward.

21 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER ZUCKER: Yeah,  
22 I'll just address the first part of your comments  
23 about vaccine safety. We get a lot of questions. I  
24 think that's general around vaccine safety. Perhaps  
25 more with the HPV vaccine. There's-there's still



2 some sense that it's new even though it's been around  
3 for—for ten years. More than 60 million doses have  
4 been administered. It has a long track record and we  
5 know the vaccine is safe. In the toolkit that we had  
6 distributed, there's also information for parents to  
7 learn about the vaccine that it's effective. What it  
8 does, how it works, and about vaccine safety,  
9 resources where they get additional materials.  
10 There's also a health bulletin that we developed to  
11 talk about HPV vaccine. All of those materials have  
12 been made available to all pediatric care providers  
13 as well as to the school based centers. All of the  
14 materials are available in—in English, but also in  
15 the nine additional DOE languages to make sure that  
16 people have access to it. So I think, you know, we  
17 need to really educate both the providers, and the  
18 providers have unfortunately the same questions that,  
19 you know, many of the parents have, and so we have to  
20 educate providers so they can give them very clear  
21 answers and recommendations to, you know, to their  
22 parents. You know, I—I got phone call from a  
23 provider recently, and this just exemplifies the—the  
24 kind of problems. They had a patient. The parent  
25 didn't want to give the child her HPV vaccine, and

2 she Googled something found from 2009, and said  
3 here's an example of why there's a problem with the  
4 vaccine, and she said, well, do I respond to this?  
5 And, of course, it--there were a lot of problems with  
6 the information. It was--it was old, it was false,  
7 and so forth. But, you know, then we just there's  
8 just a lot of misinformation out there, and we have  
9 to constantly be--be providing up-to-date materials,  
10 and help providers answer these kinds of questions  
11 and make sure they're prepared.

12 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: I'm  
13 sorry. I just want to add one other thing about  
14 Brookdale. I went on a site visit to Brookdale  
15 because they're one of our partners in the Quality  
16 Improvement Network. If you haven't gone yet around  
17 this specific program, around access to  
18 contraception, they--I was blown away by what an  
19 amazing job they've done. It's really a wonderful  
20 program, and they've met every of our ten steps  
21 around postpartum, post-abortion and primary care in  
22 terms of incorporating reproductive health services,  
23 and the other is a lot of the information that I was  
24 sharing if you go to the government, general

2 government website and put SRJ, you can find a lot of  
3 what we're working on now around this framework.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON. Thank you. I  
5 just wanted to say that I thought I heard in a part  
6 of your testimony that well we can just include it  
7 in—in the round of vaccines that are being given. I  
8 may have misunderstood or misinterpreted. I think it  
9 needs to be very clearly stated that this is  
10 optional. You don't have to do it, and it needs to  
11 be very clearly stated what the intention of the  
12 vaccine is so that once again we don't get into a  
13 cloud and a mis-misinterpretation and mistrust. It  
14 needs to be very clearly identified as what the  
15 vaccine is supposed to do. Not just say okay, here's  
16 what we're doing today without pointing it out, and  
17 as you talk about the—the Health Action Centers that  
18 you want to establish or that are being established,  
19 I would—I would want to echo the comments of the  
20 chair that we need people who are culturally  
21 sensitive in these establishments, and we need  
22 doctors and nurses and caregivers there who look like  
23 the people they are servicing so that they can have  
24 that level of expectation, comfort and connection.  
25 Thank you very much. Thank you to the Chair.

2 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: Thank you.

3 [coughs] Majority Leader Van Bramer.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you  
5 very much, Mr. Chair and my colleague for important  
6 legislation. I just wanted to—to say because I went  
7 through this entire pamphlet of the community health  
8 profiles, every single page, and—and I'm sure each  
9 and every one of us feels the same way. You're just—  
10 you're not shocked, but—but it's still incredibly  
11 sobering to see page after page where the health  
12 outcomes, life expectancy and infant mortality—it's—  
13 it's the Bronx. It's Northern Manhattan. It's parts  
14 of Southeast Queens, parts of—of Brooklyn, and we  
15 know the intersectionality of racism and—and poverty,  
16 and other factor lead to those outcomes. But they're  
17 unacceptable from a—from a—from a human perspective,  
18 right, from—from a city that—that people of color,  
19 poor people have—have those outcomes, and are  
20 experiencing those outcomes. I know that you're  
21 committed to—to addressing that. So are a lot of the  
22 folks in the audience, right? None of us want this.  
23 I question is because this would get really sad when  
24 you see it time and time, right? Are you seeing  
25 improvements, right? I mean I understand, you know,

2 if you look at the—your life expectancy for example  
3 from the worst or lowest life expectancy to the  
4 highest, a ten year difference between what  
5 neighborhood you're living in. But are you seeing  
6 because I'm assuming that there is targeted  
7 resources, targeted programs. You know, some of the  
8 things that Council Member Barron was talking about.  
9 Are we doing any better in—in making sure that—that  
10 how you live or how you live isn't defined by what  
11 neighborhood you—you live in and what zip code you  
12 have. And I realize that's a big question but—but I  
13 just couldn't look through this—and—and—I know you  
14 folks prepared these, and it's important information,  
15 but it's—it's—it's—I kept looking at this thing. You  
16 know we should all be really angry, right. We should  
17 all be really angry at—at what this says.

18 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: Well,  
19 I'll start. Yeah, thank you for saying that. I  
20 think we are in agreement. I think, you know, our  
21 commissioner has really made I think her legacy and  
22 her leadership about health equity undoing injustice,  
23 speaking out about structural racism. In a way I've,  
24 you know, been under about three commissioners, and I  
25 mean this has been really very strong and her

2 expectation that we work in a different way that  
3 really works with other city agencies because the  
4 Health Department alone isn't going to be able to  
5 address structural factors, social determinants of  
6 health. But we know that inequities are driven by  
7 many factors including racism, residential  
8 segregation, housing quality, education, poverty, and  
9 we see it all the time. My staff are going on home  
10 visits in communities, and seeing what people, their  
11 lives are like, and they leave trying to help around  
12 breast feeding and environmental, and leave and see  
13 they're leaving like, you know. And they—they're not  
14 going to be able to fix everything because they made  
15 a home visit obviously. But they are giving someone  
16 a sense that they matter, and if we always talk about  
17 how important that is that they're going in and  
18 they're saying, you—we know you're here and you  
19 matter, and we're going to try to connect you. But  
20 the big—the problem is not going to be solved on an  
21 individual level. It's important the individual  
22 services. I think that is the commitment of our  
23 commissioner. It's why she created the Center for  
24 Health Equity. It's why we reframed our Take Care  
25 New York document around equity goals in a—in a way

2 that's different from our previous version, and we're  
3 holding ourselves to doing things to change to do  
4 those efforts. We've been partnering in some of our  
5 work in my bureau with the Department of Social  
6 Services, now the Homeless Services as well as ACS,  
7 and some of the other government agencies to— Well,  
8 HRA is the other one I meant to say, and others to  
9 really look at what is the role across government  
10 agencies, because that's where we touch many people  
11 in different ways that can get at some of the  
12 structural issues. But I will say to date while the  
13 infant mortality rate for example, which is believed  
14 to be one of the most sensitive measures of the  
15 health of the community. In 2014, we were at an all-  
16 time low of 4.2 deaths per thousand. That's much  
17 better than the CDC Healthy People 2020, or the U.S.  
18 rate. That's remarkable, but we have not see one—any  
19 change in the racial disparity. It has hoverer  
20 around 2-1/2 to 3 times greater risk of a black baby  
21 dying than whites for more than 10 years. We have  
22 not seen a reduction pre-term birth, and we believe  
23 that is because we know that babies are living  
24 longer, and technology still keeps more babies alive.  
25 But we have not been able—we—it will—it is a multi-

2 year all across the board struggle and effort, and I  
3 think that's what I heard from Commissioner, and it  
4 has to happen both at the level of policy, at the  
5 agency level and across many agencies, and I know  
6 it's a commitment of our Mayor who ran his campaign  
7 on Tale of Two Cities, and it also has to happen at  
8 the community level from the ground up. And the  
9 ideal of the Neighborhood Health Action Centers,  
10 which are really just getting off the ground has been  
11 to change-re-re-imagine and change how the District  
12 Public Health Officers are working for the same  
13 neighborhoods. But now we're co-locating primary  
14 care services, homeless services, kitchens to do  
15 cooking and greenhouse activities all in one building  
16 that's builds on something that happened 100 years  
17 ago. We're going back to something that worked then  
18 that allows a partnership across different efforts to  
19 hopefully move the needle, but it's going to take a  
20 multi-year effort, and focus. So I-I agree with you.  
21 I think that's the--where our commissioner and where  
22 many other commissioners are going. We're not going  
23 to see results quickly, but we need to keep chipping  
24 away at it.



2 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Yeah. No, I  
3 mean it's obviously not specific to your  
4 administration--

5 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN:  
6 [interposing] No, I know.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: --and, you  
8 know, and--and no doubts the Mayor's commitment to  
9 addressing these very important disparities and--and  
10 everyone is committed to it. I know the Chair is--is--  
11 cares a great deal about these things. We all care a  
12 great deal about these things. It's just--it's  
13 frustrating and--and no more so for than you, the  
14 professionals who are in charge, right, that--that if  
15 you're saying that, you know, we're not seeing some  
16 of these things being chipped away as quickly as we  
17 would like them. I mean look at the obesity rates,  
18 you know, and then the--the life expectancy rates, and  
19 obviously there's a--there's a correlation in some of  
20 those--those numbers. You know, I--I just--it's--it's  
21 frustrating, right? This is something that is so  
22 important and, you know, we should never see maps  
23 that are color coded like that, that are obviously  
24 reflecting who's living where and--and--and how they're  
25 living.

2 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER KAPLAN: I totally  
3 agree, and just I mean the op—on the optimism side I  
4 feel like we're doing some of the things we need to  
5 do to move the needle. I know I do think if it's  
6 entrenched and longstanding the inequities and—but I  
7 do—we have to be—keep reminded by the maps, but I  
8 also feel that some of what the city is doing, and I  
9 can just speak specifically for my agency. But some  
10 of the partnerships we have with fellow agencies like  
11 ACS around safe sleep and housing quality we're  
12 moving forward on a campaign, yeah are different in  
13 the way in my experience over the 16 years I've been  
14 at the Health Department, and before where we're  
15 truly trying to address some of the structural issues  
16 with other agents, with our sister agencies. So I  
17 feel hopeful even in the midst of seeing that things  
18 haven't moved as much as we'd like them to.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: Thank you, Majority  
21 Leader Van Bramer. Thank you very much for  
22 testifying. We're going to call up the our panel—  
23 next panel Elizabeth Holtzman, Sang Hwang from  
24 Choices in Childbirth, and Elizabeth Adams from  
25 Planned Parenthood New York City. [pause] And then

2 after this panel we have Diana Christian from  
3 Community Healthcare Network in the following panel  
4 and Danielle Castaldi-Micca from the National  
5 Institute for Reproductive Health. Good to see you,  
6 Danielle. If there is anyone else that wishes to  
7 testify, they can sign up with the sergeant. [pause]  
8 Okay, do you want to start us off, Liz? Please make  
9 sure the mic—here we go. Yep.

10 ELIZABETH HOLTZMAN: Thank you very much,  
11 Mr. Chairman and members of the Committee on Health.  
12 I want to thank you very much for the opportunity to  
13 testify you—before you on Intro 1162. You can ask me  
14 questions on the other intros, but I—I just want to  
15 specify my focus on this. I want to begin by  
16 congratulating Corey Johnson, the Chair of this  
17 Committee for his leadership in scheduling this  
18 hearing on this important subject. Let me also  
19 congratulate Council Member Elizabeth Crowley for her  
20 extraordinary leadership in introducing Intro No.  
21 1162 as well as the other bills, and the 11 other  
22 Council Members who co-sponsored it. 1162 seems to  
23 be a modest bill. What it calls for is requiring the  
24 New York City Department of Health to collect data  
25 and publicly report annually on the utilization rates

2 of long-acting reversible contraceptives. But what  
3 is really at stake here is not modest at all. The  
4 bill actually is trying to make New York, the City  
5 Health Department deal effectively with the rates of  
6 teen-age pregnancy in our city, and if progress can  
7 be made on that front through this bill, then this  
8 bill packs a huge whollup. As we all know, rates of  
9 ten pregnancy are way too high in the United States,  
10 and New York City is no exception. In fact, U.S.  
11 rate is substantially higher than that in other  
12 industrialized countries around the world. The  
13 consequences of teen pregnancy are extremely harmful.  
14 According to the Department of Health, the U.S.  
15 Department of Health's Office of Adolescent Health  
16 children of teen mothers suffer "poor educational  
17 behavior and health problems throughout their lives  
18 compared with children born to older parents."  
19 According to the Center for Disease Control, the cost  
20 of teen pregnancy to the taxpayers has been estimated  
21 at about \$9 billion, and affects the teen mothers  
22 negatively as well as their children. The problem  
23 has been difficult to correct, but we now know a  
24 solution. Recently the State of Colorado began a  
25 pilot program funded by a foundation to provide long-

2 acting reversible contraceptives such as IUDs to the  
3 state's teenage population. The results, although  
4 predictable, are still astonishing. Colorado saw a  
5 reduction of about 45% in the rate of teen pregnancy.  
6 The Colorado program is one recognition across the  
7 United States, and there are relatively few instances  
8 to respond to the concerns of Council Member Van  
9 Bramer in which we have such dramatic results from a  
10 single program, and is remarkable and proven results.  
11 Despite these results, New York City has been sitting  
12 on the sidelines on providing teen-agers with  
13 reversible long-lasting contraceptives. The State of  
14 New York has also been sitting on the sidelines.  
15 This is inexcusable. The State and the City should  
16 be leaders in the country on reducing the rate of  
17 teenage pregnancy. Sorry. Any political figure  
18 concerned about inequality or poverty should be  
19 leaping on the bandwagon of replicating the Colorado  
20 program here, but that hasn't happened. This bill  
21 force the City to track and publicize what is  
22 happening on the provision of long-term reversible  
23 contraception and thereby will allow the press and  
24 the public, not to mention the City Council, to  
25 monitor whether the city has embraced the Colorado

2        exampled or continues to ignore. Whether it has  
3        seriously tried to give young women the tools to take  
4        control of their lives or not. Whether it really  
5        cares about alleviating poverty and inequality that  
6        is the direct consequences of teen pregnancy or is  
7        indifferent to these problems. Again, I thank  
8        Council Member Johnson and Council Member Crowley for  
9        their leadership, and I hope this legislation and  
10       this hearing will push New York both city and state  
11       into the forefront of remedying the problem of  
12       teenage pregnancy. Given the Colorado example, the  
13       city and state have tremendous opportunity to put a  
14       real dent in this problem, and I certainly hope they  
15       take up the challenge to do this. Thank you very  
16       much, Mr. Chair.

17                   CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: Thank you very  
18       much. [pause]

19                   SANG HWANG: Good afternoon, Chairman  
20       Johnson and City Council Members. My name is Sang  
21       Hwang, and I am the Project Director of Choices in  
22       Childbirth, a non-profit organization working to  
23       ensure that all families can access childbirth  
24       related care that is healthy, safe, equitable and  
25       empowering. Our mission is to promote evidence-based

2 family centered childbirth options through public  
3 education, advocacy and policy reform. Previous to  
4 this role, I served as Project Director of the Health  
5 Department's first surveillance of severe maternal  
6 morbidity. So I'm very pleased to submit this  
7 testimony in support of the City Council's proposed  
8 local law to amend the Administrative Code of the  
9 City of New York in relation to requiring the  
10 Department of Health and Mental Hygiene to issue an  
11 annual report on maternal mortality. Despite  
12 significant global progress in reducing maternal  
13 mortality in recent years, the United States is one  
14 of the few countries in the world where the maternal  
15 mortality ratio is on the rise. With an MMR of 14  
16 deaths for every 100,000 live births, the United  
17 States is currently ranked 46 out of 184 countries  
18 worldwide. From 2000 to 2014, the estimated-  
19 estimated MMR in the U.S. increased by 27% for four  
20 to eight states and the District of Columbia. With  
21 approximately 120,000 births each year within 42  
22 states nationwide, New York City is in a unique  
23 position to convene their own maternal mortality  
24 surveillance. We would like to recognize the  
25 leadership that New York City Department of Health

2 and Mental Hygiene has shown by becoming one of the  
3 only cities in the United States to conduct an  
4 ongoing maternal mortality surveillance process. In  
5 2015, as you've all heard, the New York City  
6 Department of Health and Mental Hygiene found that  
7 pregnancy related mortality was higher in New York  
8 City than in the United States for every year from  
9 2001 to 2010. However, while pregnancy related  
10 mortality decreased from 33.9 deaths per 100,000 live  
11 births in 2001, to 17.6 deaths per 100,000 live  
12 births in 2010, significant disparities by race and  
13 ethnicity were present (sic) within the data. Black  
14 non-Hispanic women in New York City were 12 times  
15 more likely than white non-Hispanic women to die from  
16 pregnancy related causes between 2006 and 2010.  
17 Whereas the mortality risk was seven times greater  
18 from 2001 to 2005. Other women of color also face  
19 greater risks. Asian Pacific Islander women were  
20 more than four times as likely, and Hispanic women  
21 were more than three times as likely as white non-  
22 Hispanic women to die from pregnancy related causes.  
23 The causes of maternal mortality are complex, but a  
24 number of factors contribute tot these poor outcomes,  
25 which include that in New York City 59% of pregnancy



2 related deaths between 2006 and 2010 occurred in  
3 women with a pre-existing chronic condition with  
4 obesity being the most common condition. Delayed  
5 childbearing can also lead to more complications  
6 during pregnancy and child birth. The pregnancy  
7 related mortality rate was highest among women age 40  
8 and older in New York City. Older women are at  
9 greater risk of entering pregnancy with pre-existing  
10 chronic conditions that add to the risk of  
11 complications or death during pregnancy and birth.  
12 Diabetes, hypertension, hearth conditions, and  
13 obesity are among the factors contributing to  
14 worsening maternal health. Medical interventions  
15 that are beneficial in particular circumstances are  
16 being used routinely in situations where the risk may  
17 outweigh their benefits, and no risk, low tech  
18 solutions are being underutilized. While cesarean  
19 births can be lifesaving, the increase in primary  
20 cesarean birth rates has not resulted in the  
21 reduction of either maternal or infant mortality.  
22 Cesarean rates are now widely recognized as well  
23 beyond what is needed or appropriate. Lastly, as  
24 we've all discussed, place matters can cause  
25 significant disparities by place of residence exists

2 in maternal health. Residents of low-income  
3 communities and communities of color face  
4 disproportionate rates of poor maternal and infant  
5 health outcomes. Dr. Elizabeth Howell recently  
6 published findings showing that black mothers are  
7 more likely to deliver at poor performing hospitals  
8 than white mothers, and this discrepancy contributes  
9 to the disparities. Poverty and its attended  
10 factors along with racism, chronic stress and  
11 disparities in access to and utilization of care also  
12 play a role in who suffers serious complications with  
13 pregnancy and childbirth. Routine systematic  
14 surveillance of maternal mortality is a core public  
15 health function and a first step in identifying the  
16 causes and potential strategies for reducing maternal  
17 mortality. The City Council's proposed Local Law to  
18 require the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene  
19 to issue annual findings on maternal mortality will  
20 ensure the proper--the regular collection, analysis  
21 and distribution of this information on a routine  
22 basis so that it can be used to improve maternal  
23 health, eliminate health disparities and reduce  
24 deaths for the people of New York City. The  
25 inclusion of Section 112.1 before the provision

2 requiring the issuance of recommendations regarding  
3 strategies to improve maternal health and reduce  
4 disparities provides some critical opportunity to  
5 ensure that the data are used to inform system  
6 changes that can in turn improve health outcomes.

7 The requirement to issue recommendations also creates  
8 an opportunity for the Health Department to not only  
9 provide guidance on how to reduce maternal mortality,  
10 but to convene stakeholders that can help

11 operationalize the recommendations into actionable  
12 steps and implement them to effect change. Thus,

13 Choices in Childbirth supports the City's Council-

14 Council's proposed Local Law to require the Health

15 Department to issue regularly timed reports on

16 maternal mortality, and develop recommendations to

17 improve maternal health, eliminate health disparities

18 and reduce maternal death. Choices in Childbirth is

19 committed to working with the Health Department and

20 the larger maternal health community to move data to

21 action to effect meaningful change in New York City.

22 We thank the Health Department for its commitment to

23 ongoing surveillance of maternal mortality and

24 morbidity, and to improving maternal health. We also

25 thank the City Council for shining a light on this

2 critical by often overlooked issue. Any maternal  
3 death is one too many, but this law will ensure that  
4 lessons are learned, and then allow future losses to  
5 be prevented. Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: Thanks. [pause]

7 ELIZABETH ADAMS: Good afternoon. My  
8 name is Elizabeth Adams. I'm the Director of  
9 Government Relations at Planned Parenthood of New  
10 York City. I'm pleased to be here to testify on  
11 Intros 1161, 1162 and 1172 today. Thank you to  
12 Council Member Elizabeth Crowley, Council Member  
13 Corey Johnson, and the entire Health Committee here  
14 today. PPNYC serves more than 64,000 patients  
15 annually and provides the full range of  
16 contraception, STD treatment, prep, GYN care,  
17 abortion, as well as PAP screenings, HIV vaccine, and  
18 colposcopies to help prevent and diagnose HPV related  
19 cancers. We support Intro 1161, which would require  
20 DOHMH to report on the current HPV vaccination rates  
21 for New York City. HPV is the most common sexually  
22 transmitted infection in the U.S. and can lead to  
23 serious health problems including cervical cancer and  
24 genital warts. Yet, HPV related cancers are largely  
25 preventable with the CDC estimating that regular

2 screening and vaccination rates could prevent up 93%  
3 of cervical cancers nationwide. However, vaccination  
4 rates are shockingly low, and many patients are not  
5 receiving the full dose of series. Public reports on  
6 dosage, and also broken down by gender would help to  
7 provide insight into barriers and opportunities for  
8 improvements. We respectfully recommend to the  
9 Council that the required data also be broken down by  
10 age to assess specific access barriers that young  
11 people may face. Until recently, minors could not  
12 consent on their own, which will likely contribute to  
13 low vaccination rates. We hope this policy change  
14 will raise public awareness of the benefits of the  
15 vaccine and enable more young people to obtain care  
16 on their own. A PPNYC, we are committed to a  
17 patient-centered approach and offer the full range of  
18 contraceptive methods so their patients may choose  
19 the one that is best for them based on benefits side  
20 effects and considerations of each method. We  
21 support Intro 1162, and data collection on LARC  
22 usage. LARCs are highly effective reverse-reversible  
23 contraceptive methods that prevent pregnancy and last  
24 for several years. While we support this bill, it is  
25 imperative that Citywide LARC metrics do not leave

2 providers and public health officials to promote one  
3 method over another. To this end, we respectfully  
4 recommend the Council extend the reporting  
5 requirements to all forms of contraception so that we  
6 have a more accurate picture of contraception usage.  
7 We also recommend adding a breakdown by both borough  
8 and age. A patient-centered approach necessitates  
9 that an individual's own reproductive health needs,  
10 goals and priorities are valued, and that public  
11 health interests do not supersede a patient's  
12 interests. PPNYC acknowledges that a long history of  
13 reproductive coercion and oppression of marginalized  
14 communities cannot be separated out from current-  
15 current public health practices. And that practices  
16 such as forced sterilization of women of color must  
17 be-must inform our current provision of care. It is  
18 incumbent on us as providers to support our patients'  
19 reproductive decisions without judgment or bias, but  
20 with trust and information. Lastly, we are proud to  
21 support Intro 1172, which would require annual  
22 reports on maternal mortality. While overall rates  
23 are decreasing citywide, as we know, the racial  
24 disparity has dramatically increased indicating an  
25 urgent need to address the social determinants of

2 heath. The city needs informed and innovative  
3 approaches to combat the current rates of pregnancy  
4 related deaths particular among women of color, and  
5 we support this step in identifying gaps in  
6 recommendations. In addition to reporting, however,  
7 New York City must directly engage community experts  
8 and patient centered models of care in efforts to  
9 reduce rates of maternal mortality. Citywide  
10 programs often serve women once they become pregnant,  
11 but few specifically address a woman's health needs  
12 before and between pregnancies, and engage community  
13 members most directly in policy solutions. We urge  
14 the Council to pass the legislation proposed today to  
15 better meet the health needs of our communities.

16 Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: Thank you all very  
18 much. Thank God for Planned Parenthood in this dark  
19 time that we're in. Congratulations on your  
20 anniversary, and thanks for all the work you guys  
21 have done. I want to ask Liz Holtzman a question  
22 about you—you were here for the Department of Health  
23 and Mental Hygiene's testimony on their access to  
24 contraceptives long-acting contraceptives. I know  
25 that you have focused, of course, the success in

2 Colorado in driving unwanted pregnancies down to I  
3 think it was zero in the--in the data. Could you talk  
4 a little bit about what you think the Health  
5 Department should be focused on in this area?

6 LIZ HOLTZMAN: I'm not a public health  
7 expert despite the implications in the Chair's  
8 question, but I do want to say that we ought to be--  
9 this--I think collecting data is one thing, but I  
10 think the real and--and I think you and Council Member  
11 Crowley and Mr. Van Bramer have reached this point.  
12 What are we going to do about these problems? It's  
13 one thing to have the information, and you can't do  
14 something unless you have the information, but what's  
15 the plan of action? What's the remedy? What are we  
16 going to do, and are we goals of--I mean I--I think the  
17 concerns about the past with regard to coercion are  
18 very serious, but that can't stymie us from  
19 appropriate action now. We've got to figure out how  
20 to-- So I think the Chair's suggestion for example  
21 about providing information that the existing health--  
22 city health facilities is an excellent one. There  
23 may be other similar areas. How do you--how do you  
24 begin to educate a young--how do you begin to educate  
25 people about long-term and contraception, and--and



2 their availability? Why is it that there's such a  
3 small percentage of people using it. It's not just  
4 in-in New York City. It's not just an issue of cost,  
5 although that obviously is a factor because in  
6 Colorado, they gave it to girls for free. That made  
7 a big difference. They used it. So I think cost is  
8 an issue, but I think education is really important.  
9 What are they doing about this? I mean I didn't hear  
10 anybody talking about something called community  
11 health workers. Community health workers are people  
12 who come from a community and they can communicate  
13 with people in the community. I mean that's what  
14 they're doing. That's what they did in Colombia to  
15 deal with the Zika problem. What are we doing to use  
16 people like that here? So it seems to me that  
17 people—the City of New York Department of Health and  
18 the State ought to be thinking about not just what  
19 the problem, but what the solutions are. And some of  
20 them may be radical and dramatic like Colorado, but  
21 some of them may be small in agreement, but not just  
22 to sit there and say isn't terrible. It is terrible.  
23 It's been terrible for a long time. It's shocking  
24 and—and women's health, I mean we're talking about  
25 it. Half the population of this city is comprised of

2 women, and we're just ignoring this problem. I  
3 wouldn't say ignoring, but we're not devoting the  
4 same attention to it. I mean the Mayor sat there  
5 every day talking about traffic deaths. I know  
6 that's really important, but this is really  
7 important, too, and who's out there everyday giving  
8 that message? I mean I-I-so I think that strategies--  
9 PR strategies, education strategies. I think the  
10 question you raised about should the public--should  
11 the city have a position on whether the--the vaccine  
12 is required? I mean what have they been doing all  
13 these years sitting around? They don't have a  
14 position it. It's not--that's what I'm saying.  
15 People have to be moved off the dime, and develop  
16 strategies. I'm sure that you could work with them  
17 about it, but that's--that's not just saying that  
18 they're not willing and they're not well intentioned,  
19 but maybe they're not an action agency, and they need  
20 to be one.

21 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: Thank you. Council  
22 Member Crowley.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: An interesting  
24 comparison. Last year in Fiscal Year 2016, which  
25 ended in June, there were 236 traffic fatalities. So

2 there is lot. The—the number is almost 50% of what  
3 it used to be because of what the City has done, and  
4 I think the number we heard was over 30 for each year  
5 a women—a woman is dying because of complications to-  
6 to pregnancy. So, in comparison we haven't broke  
7 that number down really, and from the testimony I  
8 heard we as a country are doing—faring much worse  
9 than other countries if there's—we're—we're coming in  
10 as number 46 when—when we should be coming at the top  
11 because we do have the best healthcare, and so we  
12 need to be focusing more attention, more resources.  
13 Because here's a question for you. Do you think and—  
14 and there are some folks here.(sic) Do you think if—  
15 if these problems pertain more to men? You know, we  
16 heard that 120 odd thousand births a year, and I'm  
17 not sure how many of those are unplanned, but if  
18 almost 60% of pregnancies are unplanned, and that was  
19 a situation that happened to a man, do you think that  
20 we would be focusing more on prevention and planning,  
21 and I mean ability?

22 ELIZABETH HOLTZMAN: Yeah, well if men—if  
23 men got pregnant, I don't think Planned Parenthood  
24 would have the problem [laughs] as to the safety  
25 first (sic). So, yeah, I—I—I think your answer—your

2 questions answers itself, but I think that—that  
3 you're right, the—the numbers are—are staggering  
4 here, and we talk about the numbers with regard to  
5 unplanned pregnancies, and New Start (sic) are  
6 heading that, and—and maternal mortality rates and  
7 then these other rates. I mean obviously it's a big  
8 problem, and it's been pushed under the rug. It's  
9 been a—a footnote in the public health world. I mean  
10 not the public health people. I'm sure they care a  
11 lot about it, but to the people who can make changes  
12 and that's where you come in, and I—I applaud my—my  
13 colleagues on this panel for the important work  
14 they've done. But I think that we need strategies  
15 for change.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Well, first my  
17 last question is I—I didn't hear any statistics  
18 today, but I saw a report in the New York Times about  
19 the different types of birth control, and they said  
20 for women who are on birth control whether they're  
21 using contraception that is oral, or the IUD or  
22 traditional condoms, I—I think they meant there is  
23 also a hormone—a hormonal type, but—but they said  
24 that the—the form that works the best is the LARC.  
25 But it doesn't seem like that education is getting

2 out there, and it seems as if the providers that  
3 could—that do provide it and even the Department of  
4 Health it's a—it's a complicated situation in terms  
5 of pushing one form versus another, but at least to  
6 be making sure that people are educated about the  
7 effectiveness of each form. It seems to be very—it  
8 should be more apparent other than—other the—the ad  
9 that maybe this could work for you but do you know  
10 which works most effectively I think would be a good—  
11 -

12 ELIZABETH HOLTZMAN: Well, just to add to  
13 your point, which I think is a really important  
14 point. We talking about coercion, but you think  
15 about teenage girls, what kind of choice sometimes do  
16 they have? And sometimes they are—the man or the  
17 teenage boy does not want to wear a condom, and then  
18 what? So, in some cases this does give girls  
19 particularly some more control. So I think that it's  
20 really important not to shy away. I mean the answer  
21 we got from the Health Department was oh, my  
22 goodness, women are concerned about using IUDs  
23 because maybe they won't be able to get them out, but  
24 then it turns out, of course, in New York City that's  
25 not an issues. So I—I hope that the—that the reasons

2 that are—that are really affecting the distribution  
3 of information and of the—of the reproductive methods  
4 themselves, I mean the—the contraceptives themselves  
5 are—are accurate.

6 ELIZABETH ADAMS: Just to quickly add to  
7 that, and I think when it's important to also  
8 recognize that LARCs do not protect against STDs and  
9 for young people being important to always using a  
10 condom. But in terms of the—the education piece I do  
11 think it's important to—to your earlier point, too,  
12 in terms of how this breaks down by gender. These—  
13 these recent numbers show that in New York City under  
14 the—the Youth Risk Behavior Survey, that high school  
15 students in New York City have a—a much higher rates  
16 than nationally of not using more effective methods.  
17 We have a higher rate of using condoms, but—but—but  
18 we use—but New York City students use the pill, the  
19 patch, you know, an implant kind of the different  
20 more effective methods at a much lower rate. Which I  
21 think really gets to the importance of education, of  
22 comprehensive sex education and that we're teaching  
23 our young people about what services are available,  
24 and where they can go to get them, and that services  
25 are confidential, and that places like Planned

2 Parenthood will provide you with care. I also just  
3 to Council Member to your point about from the  
4 provider's side is I-I think the approach that-that  
5 we've really taken, and just to underscore Dr.  
6 Kaplan's point of really seeing this as-as part of,  
7 you know, the full range of the methods that we  
8 provide. But, we do also really see the importance  
9 of access as-as-as foremost kind of one of the most  
10 important things. So with that, we have, you know,  
11 in this this past year through the Speaker's Office  
12 secured a new mission of two funds long after the  
13 reversible contraceptives that we provide to our  
14 patients regardless of immigration status, regardless  
15 of income. So that if someone comes in and doesn't  
16 have insurance, which, you know, our family planning  
17 dollars cover folks who do have insurance. But for  
18 folks that don't have insurance or may not want to  
19 use that because of confidentiality reasons or a  
20 whole host of reasons, that we are able to provide  
21 LARCs as a method, as a-as an affordable method, and  
22 that it doesn't-it's not cost prohibitive, and with  
23 that also, that initiative amount funding covers  
24 removal. So that people-we-we know that about 20% of  
25 people choose to remove an IUD before the time that

2 it necessarily needs to be, and so how critical that  
3 funding to make sure that if someone wants that  
4 removed that it's—it's not prohibitive as well. So I  
5 think for us from Planned Parenthood we really work  
6 to make sure that access to all methods and LARCs is  
7 one of them. And information about how—the  
8 effectiveness of LARCs and that it is—is front and  
9 center and that it's—that there are restrictions in  
10 terms of kind of your insurance status or how much  
11 you make. I think that's our approach.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [off mic] Thank  
13 you.

14 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: Thank you and—and I  
15 don't mean to—I'm going to get beaten up by Ms.  
16 Holtzman for saying this because she's going to think  
17 that I'm trying to embarrass her, but for the folks  
18 that are here today, especially the women I guess  
19 who—who may not know about her really trailblazing  
20 career, you know, she was the youngest woman elected  
21 to congress at the age of 31. She beat a 50-year  
22 incumbent, the longest serving member of the House at  
23 the time, and held that record for 42 years. The  
24 first woman elected Controller in New York City. The  
25 first woman elected DA in Kings County in Brooklyn,



2 and, you know, I—she is a role model not just for  
3 women but for men for having a long sustained career  
4 during elective office and after elective office of  
5 continuing to press on important issues. And so for  
6 her to take time out of her schedule, and be here  
7 with us today, and talk to Council Member Crowley and  
8 myself is really, really—I'm full of gratitude for  
9 your friendship and for your support, and I'm glad  
10 you're still hard at work here in New York City  
11 trying to make our city better. So thank you very  
12 much.

13 ELIZABETH HOLTZMAN: Thank you very much.  
14 Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: I want to call up  
16 the final panel. Diana Christian from Community  
17 Healthcare Network and Danielle from NARAL. Thank  
18 you. [background comments, pause] Okay, you may  
19 begin. Whatever order you'd like.

20 DIANA CHRISTIAN: Hello. Thank you  
21 Chairman Johnson and members of the Committee for the  
22 opportunity to speak this afternoon, and particularly  
23 thank you to Councilwoman Crowley for introducing  
24 these very important bills. My name is Diana  
25 Christian, and I am the Senior Policy Associate of

2 the Community Healthcare Network. CHN is a network  
3 of 11 federally qualified health centers plus to  
4 mobile medical vans, and a school-based health  
5 center. We provide affordable primary care, dental,  
6 behavioral health and social services for 85,000 New  
7 Yorkers annually in four boroughs especially in the  
8 Bronx, the Northern end of Manhattan, Queens and  
9 Brooklyn, both across the bridge and in East New  
10 York. On behalf of CHN, we fully support the New  
11 York City Council in passing the bills before you.  
12 We are encouraged by the strides that the city is  
13 making to improve the reporting and monitoring of  
14 sexual and reproductive health issues, and urge the  
15 Council to recognize how critical it is for  
16 organizations like ours, which Ms. Holtzman so kindly  
17 mentioned, to have access to reliable, consistent and  
18 reported data. With this, we can address pockets of  
19 need with culturally competent care that is specific  
20 to our communities. As a provider of comprehensive  
21 healthcare services in underserved communities for  
22 over three decades, CHN has extensive experience in  
23 identifying gaps in service and healthcare needs  
24 within communities, and then develop implementing-  
25 developing and implementing systems and programs to

2 address those needs. We are continuously evaluating  
3 patient needs through patient surveys, focus groups,  
4 and most notably through community surveillance of  
5 local data. It is considered best practices to  
6 utilize evidence simply in programs. Public health  
7 priorities cannot be determined without appropriate  
8 information about where to focus and on what. We  
9 currently have a robust sexual and reproductive  
10 health program in which we provide clinical and  
11 educational services, comprehensive education about  
12 how to prevent sexually transmitted infections,  
13 testing for STIs and HIV, treatment and counseling,  
14 and many different types of birth control including  
15 implants, injections and intrauterine-intrauterine  
16 devices at low or no cost. So far in 2016, our  
17 providers have provided 820 HPV vaccinations,  
18 inserted 1,043 long-acting reversible contraceptives,  
19 and given prenatal care to 1,724 women. We often use  
20 city reported data to inform decisions on how to  
21 prioritize our efforts. For example, we recently  
22 implemented new maternal health programs at two-our  
23 two health centers in Jamaica, Queens. After looking  
24 at citywide and neighborhood specific data, we found  
25 that despite a decrease in infant mortality across

2 the city, Jamaica and Hollis have the highest infant  
3 mortality rate in the city at 9 per 1,000 live  
4 births, and nearly double the average rates for  
5 Queens and for all of NYC. The neighborhood also had  
6 higher rates of pre-term births, teen births,  
7 individuals lacking health insurance, and of late or  
8 no prenatal care. In response to the identified  
9 population health need, CHN applied for and received  
10 funding to implement a new program model, which  
11 targets mothers and their infants on safe sleep,  
12 breast feeding, women's health, family planning and  
13 toxic stress and trauma. Families are reached via  
14 two levels: Individually through personalized  
15 telephone calls, and in-person visits and in group  
16 settings. Both levels require conducting group  
17 education sessions and targeted support groups. In  
18 addition to the new programs, we use surveillance  
19 data to create a baseline for our own services.  
20 Recently, we have used city data to evaluate  
21 colonoscopy numbers, STD testing and treatment and  
22 HIV viral load suppression and other methods of HIV  
23 quality. As an example, with the new data, we would  
24 be able to see the average percentage of individuals  
25 in the city who are receiving HPV vaccinations, and

2 evaluate if our patients are receiving less HPV  
3 vaccinations than that. If so, CHN can direct more  
4 resource-resources to ensure that we meet or exceed  
5 these numbers. Without this, we will be less able to  
6 plan programs and monitor our levels of care. In  
7 closing, I strongly encourage the New York City  
8 Council to pass these three bills, which will enforce  
9 the reporting and monitoring of HPV vaccination  
10 rates, LARC utilization, and maternal mortality  
11 rates. Thereby enabling New Yorkers to lead sexually  
12 healthy and responsible lives. Thank you again for  
13 holding this hearing today.

14 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: Thank you.

15 DANIELLE CASTALDI-MICCA: Good afternoon.  
16 Thank you, Chair Johnson, Council Member Crowley, the  
17 members of the committee. It is very cold up here.

18 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: You're freezing in  
19 there.

20 DANIELLE CASTALDI-MICCA: It's colder up  
21 here than it is in that corner, Chair. It's very  
22 cold up here. [coughs] My name is Danielle  
23 Castaldi-Micca. I'm the Director of Political and  
24 Government Affairs at the National Institute for  
25 Reproductive Health formally known as NARAL Pro-

2 Choice New York. We work in New York State and  
3 across the country to ensure that every woman has the  
4 right and ability to make the reproductive health  
5 decisions that are best for her life and her family.  
6 That includes preventing unintended pregnancy,  
7 bearing healthy children and choosing safe and legal  
8 abortion. Each of the bills before you address  
9 important public health matters, and our written  
10 testimony indicates our support for all three.  
11 However, in the interest of time today, I'm only  
12 going to address Intro 1162, which directs the DOH to  
13 collect data on usage for LARCs including IUDs and  
14 implants. Although LARCs are the most effective form  
15 of contracept—some of the most effective forms of  
16 contraception, uptake in the U.S. is relatively low  
17 compared to other western countries. This is due to  
18 several factors including lack of awareness as a  
19 method, persistent myths about their dangers among  
20 school patients and providers, and that's I think the  
21 one that I hear the most is people asking if IUDs are  
22 safe, insufficient training on insertion and removal;  
23 the high cost of the device, which right now is less  
24 of an issue, but a year into this new administration  
25 it may become more of an issue depending on what

2 happens at the ACA, and operational challenges just  
3 associated with the offering. The National Institute  
4 has collaborated with the Department of Health here  
5 on a lot of LARC related projects including  
6 developing maybe the IUD campaign, the Reproductive  
7 Justice could mandated to improve, and the New York  
8 City LARC Access Taskforce. And we really appreciate  
9 the DOH and the City Council's recognition of LARCs  
10 as an important form of contraception for women  
11 across the city. We also, however, join with some of  
12 our colleagues in cautioning against the inadvertent  
13 Promotion of LARCs as the best form of contraception  
14 for all women. It's important to note that there  
15 have been movement to deny access to contraception as  
16 well as a long history of government and other  
17 institutions using contraception as a means of  
18 oppressing women in particular women of color.  
19 Contraception is a deeply personal decision, and data  
20 collection prescribed by this bill shouldn't be  
21 misconstrued or misunderstood as encouraging medical  
22 providers to increase LARC use by their patients.  
23 More data can be helpful to advocates for sure, and  
24 government agencies as we work with diverse  
25 populations around the city on matter of

2 contraceptive access, but there should be no  
3 implication of a hierarchy amongst contraceptive  
4 types. The ultimate goal of all of our work on  
5 contraceptive access is, and only should be, to  
6 ensure that all people have an understanding of the  
7 full range of methods available to them, and are able  
8 to determine and access the method that is the best  
9 fit for them. With that, I want to thank the Council  
10 and the Committee for casting light on these three  
11 important issues, and the National Institute of  
12 Reproductive Health supports all three bills, and  
13 urges the Council to pass them.

14 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: Council Member  
15 Crowley.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: The first  
17 question is for Danielle. Do you find that people  
18 have come to you, and some have providers could be  
19 discouraging of LARCs?

20 DANIELLE CASTALDI-MICCA: Yes, but less  
21 in recent years, and I have found that it's  
22 primarily—and this is so anecdotal. This is just  
23 amongst like my own conversations. I've found—I've  
24 heard more discouraging comments from people hearing  
25 them from their providers if they are older. So the



2 young people that I've spoken to rarely say that.

3 It's usually women in their like mid to late 20s, and  
4 the doctor is saying do you really want something  
5 that last for five to ten years, and I think that is  
6 more about implications of when women are expected to  
7 have children and less to do with the method of  
8 contraception, but again, purely anecdotal.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: And then is the—  
10 the Health Department and the City giving you enough  
11 resources? Are they doing enough? Is there more we  
12 could do as a city to reduce the percentages of  
13 unplanned pregnancies and reduce the spread of STD—  
14 STDs?

15 DANIELLE CASTALDI-MICCA: [laughs] All  
16 of them. Reduce the spread of everything. I—I think  
17 certainly the DOH does a very good job, and we work  
18 really closely with them, and consider them really  
19 trusted partners. In doing this work I would be  
20 remiss if I didn't echo my friends from Planned  
21 Parenthood and say that one of the ways the city  
22 could do a lot better in reducing STIs and unintended  
23 pregnancies is through comprehensive sex ed in New  
24 York City schools, which does not currently exist,

2 and I think that would be a tremendous step although  
3 one slightly less out of DOH's hands.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: But if we—we  
5 have the schools not providing the service, what  
6 other means of communication can we use to get the  
7 word out to educate?

8 DANIELLE CASTALDI-MICCA: If the schools  
9 aren't doing it?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: That's right.

11 DANIELLE CASTALDI-MICCA: You know, I  
12 think that there is a host of pretty innovative  
13 things that have been presented here today that are  
14 happening. Communication around public health in New  
15 York City is always a challenge. We have here from  
16 Humes (sic) you know how many languages are spoken  
17 here even in terms of language access is often a  
18 challenge, but I think that a lot of the provider  
19 education that's been happening and is continuing to  
20 happen through DOH, is a really key component to  
21 that. [background comments]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Are we doing  
23 enough as a city or what ways could we utilize  
24 communication to—to educate the public about  
25 different forms of birth control or the importance of

2 the immunization, and—and the general overall health  
3 to reduce the risk of maternal mortality? What we  
4 could do more as a city? Well, certainly we could  
5 try to find more in the city budget.

6 DANIELLE CASTALDI-MICCA: Right. I was  
7 going to say we all—everybody needs more money.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Yes.

9 DANIELLE CASTALDI-MICCA: I think DOH  
10 needs more money. I think all of the agencies want  
11 more money, but that is sort of the endless booth  
12 (sic) of need more money. But I also think that we  
13 need to continue and expand programs like the  
14 Community Engagement Group that we're doing around  
15 Reproductive Justice with the DOH. It's a really  
16 innovative approach and really important in a city as  
17 diverse as ours that an agency is making such a  
18 concerted effort to ensure that the voices of people  
19 who represent communities that have the least access  
20 are front and center at the table. And I think  
21 increased and continuing and increasing programs like  
22 that not just for public health, but also for things  
23 like education can really go a long way.

24 DIANA CHRISTIAN: So I would just say  
25 from the FQHC perspective I think in trying to

2 generate new patients and new things like that, there  
3 is a big disconnect between our availability and  
4 other places like schools, et cetera pushing people  
5 who are in need of healthcare providers towards  
6 existing facilities. And we work with a lot of our  
7 partnering organizations in trying to get our  
8 materials out there and things, but broadly people  
9 don't really know what Federally Qualified Health  
10 Centers are, and they don't know that they exist, and  
11 they don't know that they provide these services.  
12 And we're—the majority of our patients are  
13 Millennials like the—a large majority are  
14 Millennials, and we have been—we went into school-  
15 based health center. We're expanding into another  
16 school-based health center to try to get the  
17 information directly to them, but perhaps some sort  
18 of, you know, always like an awareness campaign or  
19 something like that in terms of generating a linkage  
20 between the—the need for care and where you can  
21 actually access care, which I don't think is very—is  
22 really happening right now.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [off mic] Thank  
24 you, thank you. [coughs]

2 CHAIRPERSON JOHNSON: Thank you both very  
3 much. Thank you all for this hearing today. Thank  
4 you to Council Member Crowley for introducing these  
5 bills, and thanks again to the committee staff. With  
6 that that, this hearing is adjourned. [gavel]

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 29, 2016