CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

November 29, 2016 Start: 1:43 p.m. Recess: 3:26 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: LETITIA JAMES

Pubic Advocate

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO Speaker for the Council

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Inez D. Barron

Joseph C. Borelli Fernando Cabrera Margaret S. Chin Andrew Cohen

Costa G. Constantinides Robert E. Cornegy, Jr. Elizabeth S. Crowley

Laurie A. Cumbo Chaim M. Deutsch Inez E. Dickens Daniel Dromm

Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.

Mathieu Eugene

Julissa Ferreras-Copeland

Daniel R. Garodnick Vincent J. Gentile Vanessa L Gibson

David G. Greenfield Barry S. Grodenchik Corey D. Johnson Ben Kallos Andy L. King Peter A. Koo Karen Koslowitz Rory L. Lancman Brad S. Lander Stephen T. Levin Mark Levine Alan N. Maisel Steven Matteo Darlene Mealy Carlos Menchaca Rosie Mendez I. Daneek Miller Annabel Palma Antonio Reynoso Donovan J. Richards Ydanis A. Rodriguez Deborah L. Rose Helen K. Rosenthal Rafael Salamanca, Jr. Ritchie J. Torres Mark Treyger Eric A. Ulrich James Vacca Paul A. Vallone James G. Van Bramer Jumaane D. Williams Ruben Wills

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Reverend Dr. Baker, Senior Pastor St. Pillips Baptist Church 77 Bennett Street, Staten Island, NY 10302

2

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

[sound check, pause]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright, we're going to get started with our ceremonials. welcome everybody to our chambers. We would like to ask all the representatives for the Campaign for Fiscal Equiby-Equity to come and join us. [pause] Alright. Oh, Campaign for Fiscal Equity recently, right, marched up to [cheers/applause] again. former colleague Robert Jackson. It's great to see you. Oh and AQE, Alliance for Quality Education is here as well. [cheers] So thank you, and we have our wonderful Advocate and Chair over Education Committee Danny Dromm, who will say a few words, and we want to thank you all for what you're doing to ensure that we get our share of the funding, right? We're going to demand that we get our share of education funding. I will pass it off to our Chair of Education Danny Dromm.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you, Madam

Speaker and let me also start off by thanking Millie

Bonilla, who's holding the proclamation for pulling

[cheers/applause] this together, and my staff Michael

Mallon and Sebastian McGuire and Normal Young as

well. So I'm so glad to have the opportunity, Madam

2

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Speaker, to recognize the Ed Walkers the extraordinary group of parents, students, educators and other advocates who stand before us today. Please join me in welcoming Mindy Rozier. [cheers/applause] Joanna Garcia. [cheers/applause] Lydia Hampton[cheers/applause] Dionne McNeil, Maria Baltista, and Anthony Delorve (sp?) and I want to give a specially warm welcome to my former colleague New York City Council Education Committee Chairperson Robert Jackson [cheers/applause] who's here with us as well who has fought long and hard for kids over the years and laid the foundation for this movement. For those who are not aware, in 1993, Robert Jackson and other New York City parents filed a lawsuit known today as the Campaign for Fiscal Equity. parents wanted to hold the Senate and the State, the Legislature accountable for its severe underfunding of public schools in low-income communities and in communities of color. In 2006, New York's highest court ruled the state failed to provide a basic education to our kids. The court ordered the state to add billions of dollars to city schools. however, this mandate has not been and continues to

be-this mandate was ignored and continues to be

25

A decade later, our children still have not 2 3 received the dollars they so desperately need, and it's in the are of \$4 billion still owed to our 4 students. That ain't right. That ain't right. On October 2, 2016, the Ed Walkers together 6 [laughs] 7 with the Alliance for Quality Education launched a 8 150-mile walk from New York City to Albany to demand a \$3.9 billion in funding owed to public schools. The Ed Walkers got enthusiastic support across the 10 11 90 organizations ranging from the New York state. 12 State Parent Teacher Association, to the Brooklyn 13 YWCA endorsed the walk. This effort successfully captured the public's attention and the attention of 14 15 legislators across New York. I applaud this amazing 16 group of men and women for literally walking the walk 17 for our kids, and I want to say I also think it takes 18 a special brand of courage and commitment because 19 they did not do this for themselves. They did this 20 for their children and for future generations of 21 children [cheers/applause] in New York City. By 2.2 taking action, they helped advance a full fledged 2.3 campaign to challenge New York's education legacy. Their hard work has inspired so many others to roll 24

up their sleeves, and fight for the wellbeing of our

2.2

2.3

public schools. Thank you Ed Walkers for all you have done [cheers/applause] and continue to do for our children, and with that, I'm going to ask the Clerk to read the Proclamation.

CLERK: Council City of New York Proclamation.

The Council of the City of New York is proud to honor the Ed Walkers, who walked from New York City to Albany to raise awareness for the need to fully fund public education in our state; and

Whereas, over a decade ago, a group of concerned parents of New York public school children took the State of New York to court. These parents charged the state with failing to provide public school students with an adequate education. In 2006, the highest court of New York ruled in favor of the parents, and found the State in violation of the students' constitutional right to a sound and basic education by underfunding schools in Black, Latino, and low-income communities; and

Whereas, although that historic trial known as the Campaign for Fiscal Equity should have guaranteed targeted funding for New York City, it has not. The Ed Walkers, a determined group of 20

2

3

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

parents, students and educators, as well as 16 New
Yorkers with the Alliance for Quality Education were

4 determined to remedy the problem. Together, they set

5 off on a 150-mile walk from New York City to Albany

6 where they demanded that Governor Andrew Cuomo and

7 State Senate Majority provide a two-year phase-in of

8 the full \$3.9 billion CFE funds owed including the

9 \$1.9 billion owed to the City of New York; and

Whereas, keenly aware of the transformative impact \$3.9 billion would have on public education in New York the Ed Walkers diligently built relationships with school districts all across New York State. From the start they kept the CFE at the forefront of State budget negotiations and mobilized the public to ensure that their elected leaders kept their promise to our children and fund the CFE. The Ed Walkers never waivered from the admirable goal, and brought much needed visibility to this historic movement.

Now, therefore, be it known that the Council of the City of New York gratefully recognizes the Ed Walkers for working tirelessly to ensure that each and every New York public school student received a quality education they need and deserve.

[cheers/applause]

1

2

3

4

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the Entire

Council, Daniel Dromm, Council Member 25<sup>th</sup> District

Queens.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Alright
6 [cheers/applause] and now—now we're going to hear
7 from Joanna Garcia who continues to work in education
8 fighting for those children with dyslexia. Joanna.

JOANNA GARCIA: Thank you. Thank you. [background comments] It is a truly emotional moment, not just because I kind of feel like I'm coming back home, [laughter] but it is—it is tremendous to have walked and have so many moments during that walk knowing that there is a cause that is bigger than all There were times that were very difficult. It was one step at a time, and I think that that's very representative of what we do when we advocate, and when we speak for those that cannot speak for themselves. I am truly and deeply grateful on behalf of all the Ed Walkers--who are my new brothers and sisters-for this recognition. This recognition represents that our voices are reaching all corners of the chambers of advocacy. It means that we are that much closer to making sure that the Capital in

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Albany hears our call, and our steps and makes sure that this CFE is fully funded. Thank you.

[cheers/applause]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright, our great co-former colleague Robert Jackson is not going to say anything, but it's always alright, alright, alright. [cheers/applause] Alright, Robert here you go. [background comments] [cheers/applause]

ROBERT JACKSON: Madam Speaker, alright. [laughter] No, it's important to know that I was there supporting all of the Ed Walkers who have never walked before, an as someone that walked 150 miles 13 years ago, it was important for me to be their foundation to give them the spirit and drive in order to continue, and I say to you some people said that this was not really for our children that this was something else. When people go to the emergency room for hairline fractures, with swollen ankles and swollen knees, and blisters, not one but three and four on one foot, in order to do what's right for our children, I say to you they deserve all the praise because they are the ones who walked [cheers/applause] and I was there with them walking to give them the support that they need, and so, they

2.2

2.3

called me Robert Jackson. Not Robert, but Robert

Jackson, and I was their drummer. Basically, I was

drumming on a plastic what is it?

FEMALE SPEAKER: A bucket.

ROBERT JACKSON: A bucket all the way to Albany. The average today about 18 to 20 miles a day. The bottom line is they deserve all the praise. AQE deserves the praise for fighting for our children, \$3.9 billion. Just imagine what we can do for our children if they had those additional funds. Thank you City Council [cheers/applause] the Speaker, Danny Dromm and all of the members of the City Council.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Always great to see you, Robert. Welcome back and to John as well. So thank you all very much. [cheers/applause]
Alright our—oh. [background comments, pause]
Alright, I think the next ceremonial is by Council
Member Williams [pause] and it's for—for recognition of retiring Brooklyn Parks Commission Kevin Jeffrey.
[cheers/applause] If Kevin is here. Commission
Jeffrey, we ask him to join us. [pause] All the
Brooklyn members that are here join us.

[cheers/applause] [background comments] I'm going to

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

hand it over to Jumaane. Well, let me just say that, you know, as—as former Parks Committee Chair, you know, thank you for all you did, all you've done, for your years of service. Worked alongside the Parks Commissioner and the—at the local level and the Parks Commissioner of the agency, and you do incredible work to maintain our parks. So thank you for all your years of service, and I'll hand it off to Jumaane.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you very I want to make sure you know I just happened much. to get it in first. There's a lot of people who wanted to make sure that you got recognized today. It's very rare that you find a public servant that can serve the way that Kevin Jeffrey has in Brooklyn. [cheers/applause] [laughter] I'm not going to mention any names, but I do hear complaints from other boroughs about their borough commissioner, and we've never had that complaint. Brooklyn is a diverse array of people with diverse needs, and under his leadership he serviced all of them, and everybody in Brooklyn only had nice things to say about him, and that's a testament to who he is, and it's very rare that you can find and we just want to say thank

- 2 | you so much. We're sad to see you go.
- 3 [cheers/applause] He's been in public service for 32
- 4 | years, five years a state commissioner and ten years
- 5 as the Borough of Brooklyn Commissioner. We just
- 6 want to say thank you and wish you all the best in
- 7 | your new endeavors. We're sad to see you go, but I'm
- 8 happy that you and your family get to enjoy your
- 9 company now, but thank you, thank you, thank you.
- 10 [cheers/applause]
- 11 MALE SPEAKER: You forgot mention the
- 12 | State's proclamation we gave him for retiring.
- 13 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Oh, please read
- 14 -read the Proc.
- 15 CLERK: Council, City of New York
- 16 | Proclamation.
- 17 Whereas, the Council of the City of New
- 18 | York is proud to honor Brooklyn Borough Commissioner
- 19 Kevin Jeffrey upon his retirement from New York
- 20 Department of Parks and Recreation for his
- 21 extraordinary service to the City and to the
- 22 community at large; and
- 23 Whereas, Mr. Jeffrey was raised in Crown
- 24 Heights, Brooklyn where he continues to live today.
- 25 [cheers] After attending Brooklyn Friends School and

2.2

2.3

Syracuse University, he joined the City's Department of Parks and Recreation in May 1979 in the first class or urban park rangers. Throughout his distinguished career in Parks he honed his expertise in wide range of roles. In addition to supervising the Mounted Rangers Unit, he served as Executive Director of the Parks Enforcement Control, Chief of Operations of Brooklyn's Prospect Park, Brooklyn's Chief of Recreation, Deputy Commissioner for Public Programs; and

Whereas, Mr. Jeffrey left Parks for a time to serve as Deputy Commissioner of Recreation programs, and services with the State Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, and was later appointed Regional Director of State Parks Holdings; and

Whereas, in 1997 he returned to Brooklyn as Executive Director of the Bedford-Stuyvesant YMCA where he spearheaded its revitalization efforts. He also served as trainer and coordinator in the design and implementation of Total Quality Management programs within both the New York City Department of Parks and Recreation and National Park Services; and

2.2

wasn't me.

everybody.

Whereas, since becoming Brooklyn Borough Commissioner in 2010, Mr. Jeffrey has been an effective champion for extended recreational, educational and athletic opportunities for all New Yorkers. Upon his retirement, he could be proud knowing that his legacy of service has not only greatly enhanced Brooklyn's parks and public spaces, but has also enhanced the lives of countless New Yorkers and visitors alike.

Now, therefore, be it known that the

Council of the City of New York including all members
of its Brooklyn Delegation honors Kevin Jeffrey for
his outstanding career and enduring contributions to
the city and to the community. Melissa Mark-Viverito
Speaker for the Enter Council, Jumaane D. Williams,
Council Member 45<sup>th</sup> District, Vincent J. Gentile,
Council Member 43<sup>rd</sup> District and the rest of the
Brooklyn Delegation. [cheers/applause]

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Hey, that

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: It's everybody,

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Alright, alright. Steve-Steven Levin, Council Member 33<sup>rd</sup>

District, Antonio Reynoso, Council Member 34<sup>th</sup> 2 District [cheers], Laurie A. Cumbo, Council Member 3 35<sup>th</sup> District, [cheers] Robert Cornegy, Council 4 Member 36<sup>th</sup> District, Rafael Espinal, Council Member 5 37<sup>th</sup> District, Carlos Menchaca, Council Member 38<sup>th</sup> 6 District, Brad Lander, Council Member 39th District, 7 Mathieu Eugene, Council Member 40<sup>th</sup> District, 8 Darlene Mealy, Council Member 41<sup>st</sup> District, Inez D. 9 Barron, Council Member 42<sup>nd</sup> District, David G. 10 Greenfield, Council Member 45<sup>th</sup> District [cheers], 11 Alan Maisel, Council Member 46<sup>th</sup> District, Mark 12 Trevger, Council Member  $47^{\rm th}$  District and Chaim 13 Deutsch, Council Member 48<sup>th</sup> District. The entire 14 Brooklyn and a still wannabe council member Public 15 Advocate Tish James. [cheers/applause] [laughter] 16 17 KEVIN JFFFREY: Wow, I am totally for it. Thank you, thank you, thank you, and thank you for 18 19 using a sustainable material on the frame. [laughter] They make good wood frames, but this is 20 much better. I love our trees. Just a warm thank 21 you. It's funny. I haven't been in the Chambers in 22 23 a while, and it's actually nice. I was watching some of you. This has been a home for you, and despite 24

all we've done together with the parents, and I-and I

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

have to say I left this position with \$16 million worth of parks contracts. [cheers/applause] And that is-that is thanks to most of you, most of the Council and the Administration. I get a lot accolades on that list of things I've accomplished for one and all, but none of that could have been done with your help here, and it's-it's much more than just the financial help here. It's the political support. You all are partnered as individuals, you know. I'm not going to around, but each and every one of you I have partnered with. Jumaane taught me a lot. Jumaane taught me about basketball courts, and it's funning. [laughter] I'm building a basketball in my back yard for my kid. So he's 15 years old and I never knew he wanted a basketball in our back yard, and I've been building them for all of you. So I get a chance to do that. [background comments] Well, you know what [laughter] I have to tell you it's much cheaper. sure it's not going to be as adorable. I'm going to add this onto the back board. [laughter] I can go with the lowest bidder. But you all have taught me It's truly an honor, and it's an honor to so much. get this, and it's more than an honor to have worked with Council. You all have taught me so much about

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

participation, and I've grown here. I've really
grown up here, and thank you all for this tremendous
gift. [cheers/applause]

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I want to say it's the sponsor's privilege we started getting up here?

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [background Yes. comments] [cheers/applause]. Okay. [background comments, pause] Alright, the last ceremonial and it's by Council Member Kallos, but it involves me a little bit as well. I want to thank him for-for doing this ceremonial. We're going to be giving it to Fire Fighters who responded to a fire In Council Member Kallos' district, and as we know with our first responders, whenever there is an emergency we usually have several firehouses or several precincts that respond, and since Kallos borders my district, and a lot of my firehouses responded-come on up you guys. The firehouses in my district responded [applause]. So, I'm going to hand it off to him, but I want to thank them all for your service. Those of you that are representing the firehouses north of  $96^{\rm th}$  Street and East Harlem, I thank you. I know we have the El Barrios bravest here Engine 53, Ladder

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

[pause]

43. I know Ladder 26 also responded on 112<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup>
Avenue, and Engine 91 [laughs] So, being woken up
many times at night just to have a firehouse on my
block, I thank you guys very much for your service.

I'm going to hand it off to Council Member Kallos and
thank him for conducting the ceremony here today.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Good afternoon. I'm Council Member Ben Kallos, and it's not everyday that we get to recognize heroes, but we're fortunate that is one of those days that we get to recognize real life heroes. On behalf of City Council Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito, our Fire and Criminal Justice Chair, Elizabeth Crowley and myself, today we honor members of the Fire Department for doing what they do every single day. We thank them for their bravery, for their quick thinking and for rising their safety to save the lives of New Yorkers who need them. October 27<sup>th</sup> at 3:30 a.m. while many of us were sleeping, just down the block from District Office at 327 East 93<sup>rd</sup> Street, one of the five residential buildings erupted into an inferno threatening the lives of dozens of people including 81-year-old Jimmy Duffy. Over 200 of New York City's bravest did what

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

they always do, and 15 companies responded to the first alarm, which are being honored today in this Proclamation. Three of the companies who responded to the first alarm are here today. Ladder 26 at East 112<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue, [laughter] Ladder 43 at East 102 and 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue., and Rescue 1 housed at West 43<sup>rd</sup> Street between 10<sup>th</sup> and 11<sup>th</sup>, which made it all the way to the Upper East Side to perform a daring rescue. Now, one thing to keep in mind is none of these firefighters knew each other before this rescue, but they all have one mission, which is to save lives and although the flames would raise well into the morning's training, hours and hours of training, an retraining, kicked into gear as they joined together, complete strangers in a daring rope rescue there the last one happened five years ago, an act of last resort, but they train everyday. And where some of us might ask is this going to be on the test, they don't-they keep training so that they are ready for times like this, and they saved the life of Jimmy Duffy and he calls the Miracle on 93<sup>rd</sup> Street. Here today to accept the Proclamation on collective thank you are Manhattan Borough Commissioner Chief Michael Gala, Peter McMahan, Lieutenant Ryan

2.2

2.3

proclamation.

MacDougal and firefighters Jimmy Lee, Francis Rush, Walter Gilroy, Andy Hawkins, William McGary, Joseph Moore, and we're also joined by representatives of the Uniform Fire Officers Association with Jimmy McCarthy, their Treasurer and many of their members, as well as the Uniformed Firefighters Association, and if I could now direct the Clerk to read the

CLERK: Council City of New York

Proclamation. The Council of the City of New York is

proud to honor the valiant FDNY firefighters who

battled the Yorkville blaze on October 27, 2016; and

Whereas, the FDNY is the largest fire department in the nation, and universally recognized as the world's busiest and most highly skilled emergency response agency. Each year the FDNY not only responds to more a million emergencies every year, it is a privilege to honor these heroes and heroines for one of those emergencies on this occasion; and

Whereas, around 3:30 a.m. on October 27, 2016, a fire broke out on the ground floor of 324

East 93<sup>rd</sup> Street, worked way up the five floors, and erupted into a massive six-alarm blaze. Fortunately,

2.2

2.3

working alarms and detectors alerted people in the unit where the fire started, but as the fire quickly climbed from the first floor, it trapped other residents trying to flee. The blaze soon spread to two adjacent buildings. Over the course of the next hours, 250 courageous men and women from Engine 53, Engine 91, Engine 58, Engine 76, Engine 44, Ladder 43, Ladder 26, Ladder 22, Ladder 16, Ladder 13, Battalion 11, Battalion 10, Squad 41, Rescue Squad 01, Division Commando 3 worked tirelessly to tame the blaze while also running into the burning building to save lives. With flames shooting out form the building's windows, firefighters worked diligently to rescue everyone, and keep each other safe throughout the effort; and

Whereas, in one courageous rescue firefighters needed save an 81-year-old man from the top of the building by lowering-lowering him down on a rope. This lifeline was set ablaze and obliterated just moments after the elderly resident reached the ground. The heroic firefighters who participated in that rescue included Jimmy Lee, Andy Hawkins, Joseph Moore, Francis Rush, Steven Janicki (sp?), Walter Gilroy, William McGarry and Peter McMahan; and

2.2

Whereas, throughout that harrowing night, all 250 firefighters worked together to extinguish the fire, save lives and secure the scene. While the conflagration resulted in the death of one resident, injuries suffered by five civilians and 11 heroic firefighters, and the complete destruction of the five-story building, the toll would have been extremely worse without the courage and skills of New York's bravest. The men and women of the FDNY have truly distinguished themselves and their service to our city, and have earned the gratitude of all New Yorkers.

Now, therefore, be it known that the

Council of the City of New York gratefully honors the

FDNY's Engine 53 Engine 91, Engine 58, Engine 76,

Engine 44, Ladder 43, Ladder 26, Ladder 22, Ladder

16, Ladder 13, Battalion 11, Battalion 10, Squad 41,

Rescue Squad 01 and Division Commando 3 for their

extraordinary heroism in Yorkville on October 27,

2016. Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the Entire

Council, ben Kallos, Council Member 5<sup>th</sup> District

Manhattan, Elizabeth Crowley, Chair, Fire and

Criminal Justice Committee.

2.2

2.3

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Again, thank you so much. [cheers/applause] and as our—as our first responders the history in this Chamber is that when on them mic, you don't say much. You say that it's in your line of work, and that's what you're meant to do. I thank you all very much, but we have one brave representative who will speak on behalf of all of the firefighters, and again, told the union reps and everyone that is here to support, we thank you deeply for the bottom of our heart for what you do each and every day on behalf of our City. I'll hand it over. [applause]

MIKE GALA: Good afternoon. My name is
Mike Gala. I'm the Deputy of Manhattan Borough
Commander. Speaker Viverito, Public Advocate Tish
James, Crowley, Councilman Kallos, what we do know is
I know my members here are humbled, probably a little
embarrassed after they're recognized today. I
couldn't be more proud of them today. We had Mr.
Duffy who was probably 60 seconds from either burning
to death or jumping to his death when firefighters—
where is my firefighters Lee—was loaded off to the
side of building. It was a team effort with the
members of Rescue 1, Ladder 43 and Ladder 26. We

couldn't be prouder that they saved the life. As he
was lowered to the ground, the rope did burn away,
but again, more than that in my rise in the FDNY,
I've seen our Council Members, I've seen Council
Speaker Viverito, Tish James, Council Member Crowley,
and the rest of you. In my career in Brooklyn and
Manhattan our Council Members are not afraid to get
out of bed at 3 o'clock in the morning, and I see
them at the Command Post when we're coming out of
burning buildings, and I know you have our back, and
I know you support us each and every [applause/
cheers] day, and for that our members are eternally
grateful. Thank you.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you so much. Again, thanks. [pause]

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet on the floor, please, quiet on the floor. Can I have your attention, please. Can I have your attention please. At this time, please place all electronic devices, all electronic devices to vibrate. Will all non-council employees please leave the main floor of the Chambers. There is additional seating upstairs in the balcony. Thank you. [pause]

CLERK: Constantinides. 24

2.3

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES:

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED M	EETING 2	27
2	CLERK: Co	ornegy.	
3	COUNCIL ME	EMBER CORNEGY: Present.	
4	CLERK: C1	cowley.	
5	COUNCIL ME	EMBER CROWLEY: Here.	
6	CLERK: Cı	umbo.	
7	COUNCIL ME	EMBER CUMBO: I'm present.	
8	Present.		
9	CLERK: De	eutsch.	
10	COUNCIL ME	EMBER DEUTSCH: Here.	
11	CLERK: Di	ckens.	
12	COUNCIL ME	EMBER DICKENS: Here.	
13	CLERK: Di	comm.	
14	COUNCIL ME	EMBER DROMM: Here.	
15	CLERK: Es	spinal.	
16	COUNCIL ME	EMBER ESPINAL: Here.	
17	CLERK: E1	igene.	
18	COUNCIL ME	EMBER EUGENE: Present.	
19	CLERK: Fe	erreras-Copeland. Garodnick.	
20	COUNCIL ME	EMBER GARODNICK: Here.	
21	CLERK: Ge	entile.	
22	COUNCIL ME	EMBER GENTILE: Here.	
23	CLERK: G	bson. Greenfield.	
24	COUNCIL ME	EMBER GREENFIELD: Here.	

CLERK: Grodenchik.

25

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING	28
2	COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.	
3	CLERK: Johnson. Kallos. King.	
4	COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.	
5	CLERK: Koo.	
6	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.	
7	CLERK: Koslowitz.	
8	COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.	
9	CLERK: Lancman.	
10	COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.	
11	CLERK: Lander. Levin.	
12	COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.	
13	CLERK: Levine.	
14	COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.	
15	CLERK: Maisel.	
16	COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.	
17	CLERK: Mealy.	
18	COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Present.	
19	CLERK: Menchaca.	
20	COUNCIL MEMBER Presente.	
21	CLERK: Mendez.	
22	COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.	
23	CLERK: Miller. Palma.	
24	COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Here.	
25	CLERK: Reynoso.	

$\sim$	$\sim$
/	ч

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED N	MEETING	29
2	COUNCIL M	MEMBER REYNOSO: Here.	
3	CLERK: R	richards. Rodriguez. Rose.	
4	COUNCIL M	IEMBER ROSE: Here.	
5	CLERK: R	cosenthal.	
6	COUNCIL M	IEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.	
7	CLERK: S	salamanca.	
8	COUNCIL M	IEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.	
9	CLERK: T	orres. Treyger.	
10	COUNCIL M	EMBER TREYGER: Here.	
11	CLERK: U	Ilrich. Vacca.	
12	COUNCIL M	IEMBER VACCA: Here.	
13	CLERK: V	allone.	
14	COUNCIL M	MEMBER VALLONE: Here.	
15	CLERK: W	Villiams.	
16	COUNCIL M	MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.	
17	CLERK: W	ills.	
18	COUNCIL M	MEMBER WILLS: Present.	
19	CLERK: M	latteo. Van Bramer.	
20	COUNCIL M	IEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.	
21	CLERK: R	cichards.	
22	COUNCIL M	MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.	
23	CLERK: K	Callos.	
24	COUNCIL M	MEMBER KALLOS: Here.	
25	CLERK: S	peaker Mark-Viverito.	

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Here.

3 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the

4 Chambers, please. May we all rise for the Invocation.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: The Invocation will be delivered by Reverend Dr. Tony Baker, the Senior Pastor of St. Phillips Baptist Church in the great Borough of Staten Island.

REVEREND DR. TONY BAKER: Shall we pray. Eternal God, our Father, thank you for this day and for all who are gathered here in this place of historical significance to the people of New York. Thank you for the many blessings and for life itself. Thank you for the measure of health we need to fulfill our calling and for sustenance and friendships that we have garnered by way of our associations. Thank you for the ability to be involved in useful work that benefits all of us, and for the honor of bearing appropriate responsibilities for one another. Thank you for the freedom to embrace you or to reject you. Thank you for loving us even so from your boundlessness and graciousness. And the scriptures you have said that we are to obey the government authorities over us, and since you

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

have established those very authorities to promote peace, order and justice, I pray for our Mayor who leads our great city, for the various levels of city officials and in particular for the assembled Council this afternoon. I pray you will graciously grant them the wisdom go govern amid the conflicting interests and issues of our times, a sense of welfare and true need of our people, first for justice and righteousness, give them confidence in what is good and fitting and give them the ability to work together in harmony even when there is honest disagreement, and then God, given them personal peace in their lives, and joy in their assignments. for agenda set before them today. I pray that you would give them an assurance of what would please you, and what would benefit those of us who live and work in and around this great city of New York. This, God, I pray this afternoon in the name that's above every many, in Jesus name I pray. PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amen. Please be seated. [coughs] A motion to spread the Invocation.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Motion to spread the Invocation in full upon the record, and I want to

Council Member Debbie Rose.

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

say that I am indeed proud and happy to welcome my friend and religious leader Reverend Tony Baker who is here with today. Reverend Dr. Baker is a native of Bedford-Stuyvesant [cheers] although in Staten Island we try to claim him, you know, but he is a native of Bedford-Stuyvesant--

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing] [shushing for quiet]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: --a veteran and a former educator. Reverend Dr. Baker has served as the Pastor of St. Phillips Baptist Church in Port Richmond, Staten Island for more than 20 years, which is the church of my grandparents and my parents. There has—there he has built and grown nearly a dozen new ministries including a strong and active youth ministry and Staten Island's first and only drumline comprised of neighborhood young people. About six years ago when members of our Mexican-American community were being attacked and robbed, Reverend Baker was instrumental in bringing the community together and ending these attacks. To this day, he hosts a monthly friendship dinner that brings together diverse communities for an evening of dialogue and fellowship. He is a strong advocate for

social justice, and he opens his church every night
for the homeless. Among the many local boards he
serves on, is Richmond University Medical Center to
which it is much appreciation that the Speaker and my
Staten Island Colleagues dedicated a combined \$13.5
million in this fiscal year toward the construction
of a new emergency department. Reverend Baker is a
strong religious leader, and true community leader.
His church is a sanctuary for all people, and I am so
proud to call him my friend, and to have him here
today and with that, I move to spread the Invocation.
Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you so much. Thank you Pastor Baker for what you have done. Adoption of Minutes. Council Member Gentile.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Motion that the minutes of the Stated Meeting of October 27, 2016 be adopted as printed.

 $\label{eq:public_advocate_james:} \mbox{ Thank you.}$  Messages and Papers from the Mayor.

CLERK: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication from City, County and Borough Offices.

1	CITI COUNCIL STATED MEETING 54
2	CLERK: M-460 recommending Rosanna Vargas
3	for re-appointment to the Board of Elections
4	SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Rules, Privileges
5	and Elections.
6	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and
7	Communications.
8	CLERK: None.
9	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call-
10	ups.
11	CLERK: None.
12	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And now for a
13	vote, Council Member Koslowitz.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Thank you, I
15	vote aye on General Coupled Orders.
16	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Than you.
17	Council Member Palma for a vote.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Thank you Madam
19	Public Advocate, I vote aye on today's General
20	Orders.
21	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
22	Cabrera.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I vote aye on

25

23

24 all. Thank you so much.

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 35
2	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
3	Borelli.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: I vote aye on
5	all. Thank you very much.
6	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
7	Vacca.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I vote aye on all
9	General Calendar Orders-Calendar. Whatever it is, I
LO	vote aye.
L1	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs] Seeing
L2	none other Now, quiet in the Chamber, please.
L3	Quiet in the Chambers. Council Member Vallone.
L4	COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you Madam
L5	Advocate, permission to vote aye on all matters on
L6	today's calendar.
L7	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.
L8	COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you.
L9	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, and
20	now we'll hear from the Speaker Melissa Mark-
21	Viverito. Quiet in the Chambers, please.
22	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet in the Chambers,
23	please.
2.4	SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Before we begin I

want to acknowledge the recent passing of Council

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Member Daneek Miller's father, the Reverend James Miller. We extend our deepest condolences on his loss, and the thoughts of this Council are with him and his family at this time. So we could keep him and the family in our prayers and share our thoughts would be appreciated. I also before we begin, want to acknowledge that Council Member Menchaca has his mother and his sister who are visiting us today. [cheers/applause] Welcome. [speaking Spanish] And it's wonderful to see you here today. So moving onto the legislative agenda, as it gets colder and we move closer to the first snowfall of the year, we begin today with Introduction 300-A, sponsored by Council Member Andy King, which clarifies the bounds of the area our property owners are required to clear of snow around fire hydrants. This legislation will make it clear that the fire hydrant itself must also be cleared by narrowing the area to a size that is more closely in line with what the Fire Department needs for access to the hydrant, and specifying that property owners are not required to clear snow and other material from the street itself. This measure is intended to clear up any confusion among property owners regarding their responsibilities for snow

2.2

2.3

removal. On staff we really want to thank Collin

Howell for their help, and I ask Council Member King

the lead sponsor of this bill to say a few words.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Good afternoon, and I will say a few words. Happy holidays to everyone. I want to thank everyone in the Council, the Council helped—

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing] [shushing for quiet]

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: --put this legislation together.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet down.

Member Antonio Reynoso, the Chair of the Sanitation

Committee as well as Madam Speaker. I thank everyone

for—who helped and sat in the committee meetings, but

this legislation came about because there were a

number of fires that have occurred during the winter

season when snow came down on some of our New York

residents to get that fire hydrants need to be clear,

and not packed up and, you know, used as a base for a

snowman. So, in order for us to make sure that FDNY

has access for fire hydrants, we want to make sure

that we as New Yorkers, make sure when it does snow,

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

that we keep them free and clean so we can protect

the safety in the city of New York. So again, thank

4 you everybody. I'm looking forward to everyone to

5 vote yes on this piece of legislation. Thank you.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Council Member King. Next, the Council will be voting on legislation regarding public housing. Intro 1213-A, 1214-A sponsored by Council Member Ritchie Torres would establish procedures for reporting on the results of services and programs offered to residents of public housing. Intro 1213-A would require an agency or office designated by the Mayor to publish an annual report on the outcomes of services including those related to employment, financial counseling and adult education. Intro 1214-A would require the Center for Economic Opportunity to submit to the City Council, the Mayor and the Controller a review of the Jobs Plus program, and recommendations for expanding the program for public housing residents throughout the city. I would like to note as this this first legislation from the Public Housing Committee that the Council will be passing, and we are excited to see the results that come from the review of our programming outreach for public

2.2

2.3

housing residents. Staff, we want to thank Guillermo

Patino, Deepa Ambekar and Robert Calandra, and

Council Member Torres to say a few words. If not,

5 you don't have to.

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Thank you. Yes,

I've been informed these are the first bills within
the Public Housing—

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing]
Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: --that the City

Council has ever enacted, so I'm proud of that. I'm

particularly proud that we are requiring the city to

create a plan of action for the expansion of Jobs

Plus, which I consider to be the most successful

model of Workforce Development in public housing.

It's been shown to achieve sustained and substantial

improvements in the earning power of public housing

residents. It combines Workforce Development with

financial empowerment and community support for work.

We have successful pilots in—in Brownsville, in South

Bronx, and so the City should think long and hard

about how can in East Harlem where there are heavy

concentrations of public housing, and so how do we

scale up what has been proven to be a workable model

2

3

4

6

7

8

not only here in New York City, but throughout the country, and then also collect data about programs that are specifically tailored toward public housing residents. Are those programs working? What are the needs of our public housing residents? I thin, now more than ever the city will have more information about residents living in NYCHA. I'm proud to be the

sponsor, and I encourage my colleagues to support

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

these bills.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you and-and true the Jobs Plus was originally piloted in Jefferson Houses in my district. It is extremely successful and also employers find it to be very helpful. So definitely something we should see expanded beyond these few development sites. So thank you for that Council Member. Our last piece of legislation today is Intro 1147-A sponsored by myself and Council Member Laurie Cumbo, as well as Public Safety Chair Vanessa Gibson. This legislation will create an Office of Crime Victim Services, which will be headed by a coordinated charged with managing service providers engaged in outreach to crime victims, and the annual publishing of a director of providers. I want to really thank our staff Deepa

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Ambekar, Beth Golub and Casey Addison, and I will ask

Council Member Cumbo to say a few words, then

followed by Council Member Gibson.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you Speaker Mark-Viverito. I want to thank you for your leadership. I also want to thank Council Member Vanessa L. Gibson for passing this legislation through the Committee on Public Safety today as well as Deepa Ambekar, the counsel for Public Safety Committee and drafting attorney. I am so excited that today the New York City Council will pass Intro 1147, a bill that introduced which will establish an office of crime victim services. After surviving a traumatic experience, it can be challenging for crime victims to navigate through our city's agencies and not-for-profit partners in such search of immediate assistance. Imagine being the victim of domestic violence, sexual assault, rape, sexual abuse, and having to sort through all of the different city agencies and not-for-profit partners in order to find solutions and services. While there are several city agencies and not-for-profits that provide service, there is no centralized point of contact where a victim can go to be connected with the various

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

services available in the city. That is no longer going to be the case. From the Mayor's Office to Combat Domestic Violence to organizations such Safe Horizon, our city has some of most incredible advocates and agencies that are committed to providing supportive services such as transitional or permanent housing, financial assistance, counseling and criminal justice. Through my legislation we will see the dedicated office that can connect New Yorkers directly to the vast network of city agencies and service providers that will support their recovery. It is vital that we can embrace victims and their families in safe space where they can empower themselves with the necessary guidance and resources to become survivors as they rebuild their lives. one should have to feel as if they are going through any stage of their road towards recovery alone, and as First Lady Michelle Obama has stated, When they go low, we go high, and we go high with legislation. This is going to be an epic piece of legislation that's going to change the recovery process particularly for so many women as well as children, and I want to thank Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito who spoke about this incredible piece of legislation at

2.2

2.3

her State of the City, and she's certainly making goo on it today. Thank you so much for your leadership and thank you to my colleagues for your support.

much, Madam Public Advocate, Madam Speaker. Good afternoon to all of my colleagues. It's truly a great honor to work with our Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito and Council Member Laurie Cumbo--

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
[shushing for quiet]

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: --on passage of
Intro 1147-A. Following any crime in this city a
victim may need services that range from trauma
counseling to healthcare to housing relocation. Many
victims are often unaware of the level of services
available to them, and if they are, they're easily
distracted and discouraged by the red tape that
prevents them from getting the services that they
truly need. I am very proud of the investments we
have made as a Council to provide a range of services
for many crime victims, but for far too long they
have remained in a silo in individual agencies. The
sad truth is the victim of a crime doesn't just
impact one part of a person's life, but it can have a

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

rippling effect on their family, their friends, and their entire community. I am proud to say that today we are taking a very bold step to ensuring that all victims of any crime in this city will receive the necessary support and resources they need for strength, healing and restoration. Thanks to the incredible leadership of our Speaker, who earlier this year in her State of the City Address talked about this bill and the Chair of the Committee on Women's Issues as well as our Co-Chair of the Women's Caucus, Council Member Laurie Cumbo, New Yorkers in need will soon be able to turn to a coordinated Office of Crime Victims Services during their time of need. This new office will allow an easier coordination and integration of services for individuals and their families to get real help in real time with real results. We will be able to make it easier to heal, and to go from victim to victor. As Public Safety Chair, I want to thank everyone for their efforts, all of the members of the Public Safety Committee who supported this legislation. am very thankful that this gap in our overall efforts to promote criminal justice reform, public safety and create safer communities in our city will now be

very important bill.

2.2

2.3

filled. Once again, I want to thank our Speaker
Melissa Mark-Viverito, Council Member Laurie Cumbo
for their incredible leadership. Thank you to all of
the bill's sponsors that joined on, and I want to
recognize the staff, our legislative counsel Deepa
Ambekar and Beth Golub, Rachel Cordero, Laura Popa,
Matt Gewolb, Casey Addison and my Chief of Staff Dana
Wax. Thank you once again, and I look forward to all
of my colleagues voting in the affirmative on this

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you.

Moving onto Land Use items, we have four major

projects up for a vote today. The first is Lexington

Gardens II is located in the East Harlem--

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing] [shushing for quiet]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --El Barrio

neighborhood of my district. Lexington Gardens will

be a fully affordable development and after extensive

negotiations between my office and the developing

team, it will serve incomes as low as 36% of AMI.

The development will contain 390 units and over

38,000 square feet of community space. This

community space will house two local non-profits,

including the new headquarters of the Northside
Center for Child Development, and the Union (sic)
Settlement Association. We're very pleased to be
increasing the affordable housing stock in the city.
I look forward to passing this vote and beginning
construction on a valuable new asset to the East
Harlem El Barrio Neighborhood. This project is a
boon for the community, and our collaboration ensures
that the Lexington Gardens project will benefit the
sizable population that already exists in El Barrio.
As the Council continues to work on expanding
affordable housing opportunities for our city, we
will also continue to meet with neighborhood
residents, community groups and all relevant
stakeholder to ensure we are securing the best
possible for our existing residents. As many of you
know, we spent ten months conducting extensive
outreach throughout my district to develop the East
Harlem Neighborhood Plan. A blueprint of
recommendations for the upcoming East Harlem
Rezoning. As we prepare for City Planning's final
recommendations to come before the Council, we remain
committed to making sure that this an open and

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 inclusive process that is responsive to the needs of 3 the majority of El Barrio East Harlem residents.

The Land Use item we will be considering is the redevelopment of the Lambert Houses. Lambert Houses are a currently existing affordable housing complex in the West Harlem neighborhood of the Bronx. The Council will be voting on a measure to approve the demolition of the existing facilities and the construction of a new development. Having been built in the early 1970s, the current site has created safety and operation issues for the managing corporation and existing residents. This proposal would rectify those issues, and nearly double the number of affordable residential units. It would also increase the amount of available retail space and provide the neighborhood with a new public elementary school. This is in Council Member Ritchie Torres' district. I commend him for his leadership on this matter and he will say a few words. [pause]

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Thank you, Madam Speaker. The wave of housing and infrastructure investments coming to West Farms over the next ten years will represent more than a half a billion dollars of investment in one of the city's poorest

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

At the heart of those investments is neighborhoods. the redevelopment of Lambert Houses, which is like to-likely to be the single largest housing development in the Mayors Ten-Year Housing Plan, 1,665 units of affordable housing. We will have permanent affordability, deep affordability, and mixed income housing. West Farms will see somewhere between \$660 million of investment in affordable housing, the creation of two schools, one on the site of Lambert Houses, about \$100 million investment, \$12 million investment in safer streets because West Farms has some of the most dangerous intersections in the Bronx, and on the subject of parks, Phipps Houses, the private developer has agreed to invest \$300,000 in a local river park and establish a Friends of River Park, but the redevelopment of Lambert Houses is not only about affordable housing, it's also about public safety. Lambert Houses as structured has 42 means of egress, making it impossible to maintain and secure. It is hardly an accident the Lambert Houses due to its infrastructure has been a persistent hotbed of gang violence. zoning change will develop Lambert to allow for greater safety, ground floor retail and an active

2.2

2.3

street life all in keeping with the planning ideals of Jane Jacobs. And so I'm proud to recommend approval for a zoning change that I believe will lay the foundation for the revitalization of West Bronx.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,

Council Member, and the last two Land Use items are
in both in Council Member Salamanca's district.

First, Second Farm is a fully affordable proposed
mixed-use development to be located--

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing] [shushing for quiet]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --in the West Farms neighborhood of the Bronx.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down, please.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: It is expected to contain 290 dwelling units all at an AMI of 60% or below as well as space for Pre-K classrooms. The planned development Melrose Commons North is a fully affordable proposed mixed-use development to be located in the Morrisania neighborhood of the Bronx. The facility is expected to contain 305 dwelling units, and will house the new permanent home of the Bronx Music Heritage Center. So I invite Council

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 Member Salamanca to say a few words about these two 3 projects in his district.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Today is another great day for the South Bronx, and in particular the 17<sup>th</sup> Council District as we approve an additional 581 units of quality affordable housing in two different neighborhood. There's actually 213 units the Council approved last wee with the Concourse Village West project, and 990 unites the Council also approved this fall with that-that project. In total it equates to 1,786 units approved since October. Today, we are first approving Melrose's Common project in Melrose, which will provide housing for families making 30% of to 130% of AMI. Additionally, we are approving the Second Farms Brian Avenue Development in West Farms, which will accommodate families making between 30 to 80% of AMI. When these project submissions became before the Council, both already had the makings of a great project, but the range of AMI simply wasn't wide enough for both projects. With Melrose Commons, I had strong concerns surrounding the use of our space component, which allocates units priced at 30% AMI for families in the shelter system. While we

want to help these families find permanent housing,	
it shouldn't come at the expense of non-shelter	
families in the 30% AMI bracket, who also need	
housing opportunities. So I voiced those concerns	·I
voiced those concerns to HPD as well as my belief	
that in the future HPD should work more closely with	L
the Council to determine a fair ratio of Our Space	
units to non-Our Space units priced at 30% of AMI	
depending on the needs of a particular area and	
development. Like many of my colleagues, not a day	
passes in which one of my constituents has been	
contacting my office regarding a housing issue or	
seeking assistance find an apartment, and these call	
aren't just for those in the 30% AMI bracket, but	
across the board. That is why it is important to	
have a mix of incomes in these developments so we ca	n
keep all families in searching of housing in the	
Bronx as we continue to move our communities forward	l .
I would like to thank both the development teams	
Wellco (sp?) for Melrose Commons and a particular	
Catholic Charity-Charities for Second Farms for thei	.r
generosity in working with my team to make these	
developments work. I would also like to thank HPD	

2.2

2.3

and—and also the counsel the Land Use for their hard work as well. Thank you.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,

Council Member and before I conclude, Gina, come over here. Gina, come on. Gina. Come on, come on Gina.

Come over here. Our Sergeant-at-Arms Gina is retiring after 16 years. [cheers/applause] [laughter]

COUNCIL MEMBER: Good job, good job.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Yeah, so.

COUNCIL MEMBER: Good job.

[cheers/applause]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Hey, but obviously by their reaction we all know how much we've come to—to Gina, and she's endeared herself to us all, and always welcoming one with a big smile, right, and her lipstick always present. [laughter] Oh, we're going to miss you. I know I don't see you as much as when I was Council Member but, you know, you're deeply appreciated and we value everything you've done here for the Council after 16 years. [cheers/applause] [laughter] And with that, I end Communication from the Speaker.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We're going to miss Gina. Gina, we're all going to have a hot flash

## CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

1	CITT COONCIL SIMILD MEDITING
2	on your behalf. [laughter] That's-that's how I know
3	Gina. You, too? Council Member Corey Johnson, hot
4	flash.
5	SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Some of us are
6	already there, you know. [laughs]
7	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Discussion of
8	General Orders. Seeing none, Report of-
9	SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing]
10	Alright.
11	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:Report of
12	Special Committees.
13	CLERK: None.
14	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of
15	Standing Committees.
16	CLERK: Report of the Committee on
17	Finance, Preconsidered Reso 1291, Dumbo Business
18	Improvement District.
19	SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
20	General Orders.
21	CLERK: Preconsidered LU 528 and Reso
22	1295 and LU 529 and Reso 1296.
23	SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on

24

General Orders.

25

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 54
2	CLERK: Report of the Committee on Land
3	Use, LU 479 and Reso 1297 Zoning Map Amendment.
4	SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Approved with
5	modification and Coupled on General Orders.
6	CLERK: LU-[coughs] excuse. LU 482 to LU
7	488 Lambert Houses.
8	SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Approved and
9	modifications and referred to the City Planning
10	Commission pursuant to Rule 11.70(b) of the Rules of
11	the Council and Section 197-d of the New York City
12	Charter.
13	CLERK: LU 502 and Reso 1298, UDAAP
14	Manhattan.
15	SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
16	General Orders.
17	CLERK: LU 503 and Reso 1299, Property
18	Tax Exemptions.
19	SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
20	General Orders.
21	CLERK: LU 515 through LU 519, Lex-
22	Lexington Gardens.
23	SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Approved and

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Approved and modifications and referred to the City Planning Commission pursuant to Rule 1170-b of the Rules of

## CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

1	CITI COUNCIL STATED MEETING 33
2	the Council and Section 197-b of the New York City
3	Charter.
4	CLERK: LU 522 and Reso 1300 through LU
5	526 and Reso 1303, Property Tax Exemptions.
6	SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
7	General Orders.
8	CLERK: LU 527 and Reso 1304, UDAAP
9	Bronx.
10	SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
11	General Orders.
12	CLERK: Report of the Committee on Public
13	Housing, Intro 1213-A, Public Housing Services.
14	SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
15	coupled on General Orders.
16	CLERK: Intro 1214-A, Jobs Plus Program.
17	SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
18	coupled on General Orders.
19	CLERK: Report of the Committee on Public
20	Safety, Intro 1147-A, Office of Crime Victim
21	Services.
22	SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
23	coupled on General Orders.

1	CITY COUN	10
2		
3	Sanitati	0
4	Removal	0
5		
6	coupled	0
7		

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CLERK: Report of the Committee on ion and Solid Waste Management, Intro 300-A,

Removal of Snow and Ice from Fire Hydrants.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: On the General Order Calendar, LU 482 and Reso 1305 through LU 488 and Reso 1311 on page 9, Lambert Houses.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: LU 497 and Reso 1312 through LU 500 and Reso 1350 Second Farms Neighborhood.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: LU 515 and Reso 1316 through LU 519 and Reso 1320 Lexington Gardens.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on General Orders.

CLERK: Resolution Appointing Various
Persons Commissioner of Deeds.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on

General Orders and at this time I ask for a roll call

on all the items on the Coupled General Order

Calendar.

2.2 CLERK: Cumbo.

2.3 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission to

explain my vote? 24

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:

2.2

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I also join in thanking and congratulation Council Member Salamanca, as well as Council Member Torres for pushing forward and beyond to get greater AMIs in their district to create truly affordable housing in the Bronx. I also want to thank Council member—

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
[shushing for quiet]

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: --Vanessa Gibson for all of her support today on bill—Intro 1147 with me as well as Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito, and I also thank and love and honor Gina. She is beacon of light when you come into the City Council everyday. She always greets us with something wonderful to say and asks how we are doing, and—and what the day holds for us. So, you will be missed. I thank you. I love your fashion sense, and I just love the warm energy that you brought to the Council, and I proudly vote aye.

CLERK: Deutsch.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I vote age on all, and I want to congratulate Gina, and I do have photos with Gina over the last three plus years, and waiting for this day just so I could cherish those

2.2

2.3

photos, and I want to congratulate her and wish her
all the best of what—on all her future endeavors.

CLERK: Dickens.

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Thank you so much, Gina, for the work that you have done, and the support that you've given to each of us over the years. God bless you that you will continue to have great health and I vote aye.

CLERK: Dromm.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: With much love to Gina, and congratulations to my colleagues, I vote aye.

CLERK: Espinal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Gina, you'll be missed especially when I leave my wallet at home. But [laughter] but I—I want to congratulate my colleagues, Laurie Cumber on—on her bill, Ritchie Torres and Salamanca on being rock stars and making sure we have more affordable housing in the city and in the borough. Thank you and I vote age on all.

CLERK: Eugene.

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I want to congratulate Gina, and thank her for her service to all of us, and to the entire City Council, and Gina,

## CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

2.2

2.3

good luck and best, and all the blessings of God to
you, and I vote age on all.

CLERK: Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Age.

CLERK: Gentile.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: With hearty congratulations to all my colleagues, I vote aye on all.

CLERK: Gibson.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: With my warmest congratulations to the Speaker, Council Member Cumbo, Council Member Salamanca and Council Member Torres, and I want to wish the best of success to Miss Gina. There is life after—after the Council, and there is a greater life in retirement. So God bless you and I vote aye on all.

CLERK: Greenfield.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you.

May I explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you very much. I want to congratulate my colleagues, especially Council Member Cumbo for her historic legislation looking out for the victims of crimes.

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

you.

also want to congratulate Council Member King and I especially want to congratulate Council Member Torres and Council Member Salamanca respectively. Their negotiations on these deals are great examples of how you can successfully negotiate deals. In Council Member Torres' case, significant infrastructure improvements to the overall deals. In Council Member Salamanca's case, specific-specific improvement in the range of AMIs to reflect his community's diversity and needs, and finally it's actually going to be sad for me because some days, the only person that I actually see smiling in the whole building is, in fact, Gina. And so, I hope some of us are going to pick up the slack now that she's going to be gone. Thank you. God bless you and continued success. Take care, and I vote aye on all. You almost got me there. I know you were like uh. Aye on all.

CLERK: Grodenchik.

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you. I want to say goodbye to Gina also. I know her from a previous life. Hey, listen, you—you had the chance. [laughter] I know her from a previous life when I was a lobbyist here, and indeed she is a smiling beacon,

2.2

2.3

and she will be missed. I think I confused her a little when I became a councilman. She used to look at me and I knew that guy. [laughter] But I'm happy for her, and indeed there is life after the Council. I don't want to find out any time soon, but I do want to vote aye on all. Thank you.

CLERK: Johnson.

COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Oh, Grodenchik, he's done it again. I want to vote aye on all, and I also want to say that it's very nice to only have visitors here at the Council and at 250 Broadway that Gina has always been a welcoming sweet effervescent presence for anyone who comes here regardless of who they are, and her personality, one of which is sweetness and friendly, I think is going to be one that we all miss. So, I—I know that she suffered some loss over the past year, and I'm glad that she's going to be able to spend some more time with her family and—and we're going to miss her. So thank you for your service, your many, many years of service.

CLERK: Kallos.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [off mic] Yes.

2.3

63 1 2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Congratulations 3 to Council Member Cumbo, and thank you Gina for being warm and recognizing that even elected officials can 4 be shy sometimes, and for always being welcoming, and one of the brighter parts of all of our days and I 6 7 vote aye on all. 8 King. CLERK: 9 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I vote aye on all and Gina, enjoy your road trip. 10 11 CLERK: Koo. 12 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote ave on all, 13 and I want to say thanks to Gina. I wish her the 14 best, and I also want to congratulate Council Members 15 Cumbo, Torres and King and Salamanca for their very 16 important bills. Thank you. 17 CLERK: Lancman. 18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye, and Gina, I 19 wish you all the best. 20 CLERK: Lander. 21 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request 2.2 permission to explain my vote.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Alright,

everything has been said, but not everyone has said 25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:

Yes.

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

24

25

First of all, Gina, I-I thought, you know--and I think this goes to that, you know--we really just had an individual personal special bond, [laughs] and it is pretty special to see that everybody in the Council feels that way. That really, really says something. You are a special presence in the City Council. Huh? [background comments] No, I thought she just loved me, but it turns out [laughter] she's just a wonderful warm nice person. Anyway, we're going to miss you a lot, and as you can tell, we really, really feel it. I also just wanted to add a big shout-out to Council Member Cumbo for this great bill, which I think will make a long-a big difference for a long time to come, and to Council Member Torres, and you-you have not only put the first piece of legislation forward on public housing, but elevated the work of that committee in a way that matters to the hundreds of thousand of residents living there, and really elevates this Council's on [off mic] the importance of them all. [on mic] Aye on all.

23 CLERK: Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to explain my vote.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you Madam

Public Advocate. So, I get to say that my

relationship with Gina is special because Gina is my

constituent, and I'm here Council Member.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Oh

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: And—so that makes me very lucky because I get to see Gina, you know, from time to time now on into the future, but I could say that deeply and honestly that one of my favorite parts of this job is being able to see Gina sharp every day when I come in, and she always has kind words, but also a deep desire to know what's going on with everybody that she sees, and everybody's life, and likes to know what's going on with their children and their parents and their siblings. And that'sthat's really what it's all about is making that personal connection, and she's really just truly a wonderful-wonderful and decent and kind and loving person, and Gina I wish you the best. I-I-I extend my gratitude to you, and I hope you look forward to spending some time with your son, and-and your extended family, and—and we thank you so much for being part of hearts. (sic) Thank you. Aye on all.

remember that, and I vote aye on all. PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

CLERK: Menchaca.

2.2

2.3

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to explain my vote.

2.2

2.3

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I want to thank the Speaker for welcoming my mother and my sister Mary. They have been such beautiful, amazing and fierce women in my life. My mother but also my sister raised—raised me. These last few days have—have given us an opportunity to reconnect. They're—they're in Texas and they traveled all the way on an—on an Amtrak train almost four days. My mother doesn't like to fly. [laughs] So every time she comes it's a blessing, and it's great that sister for the first time is coming here and watching us in action. It's a proud moment for me, and I just want to say I love you, mom.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I also want to send my love to Gina. She—even as a staffer was—was someone that was always welcoming, and I wish you and your family lots of love in your—in your post—Council days. My sister Laurie Cumbo and my brothers

Salamanca and Torres congratulations. When we—when hear 30% and echoing in this room, we've done something right, and I look forward to continuing to

2.2

2.3

2 champion that in my district, and you just made that 3 even easier. I vote age on all.

CLERK: Mendez.

all, and a special farewell to my friend Gina. I met you 16 years ago when I started working for my member, and you've been here a long time always supporting me and listening to me, and apparently listening to everybody else, but that's okay. That's what makes you so special. Thank you very much.

CLERK: Reynoso.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Permission to explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I want to congratulate Council Member King for passing the bill on the Sanitation, and for all the members of the Sanitation Committee that preceded without me being there because I was in the big house. I really appreciate [laughter] the work you did especially Costa Constantinidies for chairing it. And to Gina, I just want to say I really appreciate all those swipes you gave when I left my ID card at home, breaking protocol because you had my back.

2.2

2.3

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
[shushing for quiet]

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I thought I was your favorite, but it seems like everyone—you're—you're everyone's favorite. So I really appreciate all the work that you did in the City Council, and really felt like you were part of the family, and you made that a point. So thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, Inmate Number 9. [laughter]

CLERK: Richards.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Permission to explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I'm just a little perturbed now that I found out Gina was actually breaking protocol for Reynoso with his ID card because Gina would say to me, Richard, don't forget that ID Card tomorrow or I'm not letting you in. [laughter] But [laughs] so I fond out Reynoso is more special than me today, but thank you, Gina, for your service. Thirteen years I've been here, and -and you've always been a-a joy to-to walk into with that phenomenal excellent voice you have, and always

2.2

2.3

a great spirit. So congratulations on your
retirement. I also want to congratulate our Speaker
Council Member Salamanca, Council Member Torres on
some great Land Use victories. It made a record show
because we often hear the Council is not doing enough
to reach those at 30 AMI that all of these projects
reach 30 AMI. So, congratulations to all of you on
these great bills. Thank you. I vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

CLERK: Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Cumbo, Torres and Salamanca and Gina, my father and my daughter, we will make it. (sic) You always be nice to her when she comes in. Thank you for your service. I vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Okay.

CLERK: Rose.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Madam Public

Advocate, I make a motion that we not allow Gina to

leave. [laughter] All in favor aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Aye. [laughs]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Gina, I absolutely adore you and I really don't want you to leave, but enjoy. I—I hope you get all that life has to give

you, and I'd just like to congratulate CM Salamanca and Torres and Sister Diva (sic) Cumbo on their-

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs]

 $\label{eq:council_member_rose:} \mbox{ --their legislation,}$  and I vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

CLERK: Rosenthal.

 $\begin{tabular}{ll} \begin{tabular}{ll} \be$ 

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

too, want to congratulate Council Members Cumbo,
Torres and Salamanca. Gina, I, too, want to thank
you for being so kind and patient about all those
times I forgot my ID, and really you let me in with
no problem whatsoever. You were—I didn't realize it
was a problem to just slide. So I—I don't know how I
will get into 250 with your departure, but
[background comments] thank you so much for your
kindness to the Council Members. Appreciate it. Oh,
I vote aye on all.

CLERK: Salamanca.

1	CIII COUNCIL STATED MEETING 72
2	COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you. I
3	would like to wish Gina well on her retirement and I
4	vote aye on all.
5	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
6	CLERK: Torres.
7	COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Permission to
8	explain my vote. I just want to say I'm going to
9	miss Gina. This job can be tough at times, and so I
10	could always count on Gina to put a smile on my face
11	and I felt like if everyone is as kind and gracious
12	as Gina, we'd be in a much happier world because
13	happiness could be contagious. So I wish you a
14	great—a great retirement that you deserve.
15	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: How do you vote?
16	COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I vote aye, I
17	guess.
18	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
19	CLERK: Treyger.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to
21	briefly explain my vote.
22	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I just want to

again also congratulate all my colleagues on their

legislation, and also on their very important  ${\tt Land}$ 

24

25

2.2

use agreements that will improve their districts in
our city. And Gina, just like Councilman Lander, I
thought that smile was just for me, but apparently
there—there is a lot of love—a lot of love in this
room for you, and I wish you good health. Health is
number one, health and happiness. Enjoy this time
with your family. You've earned it. You worked for
it. God bless you and thank you. I vote aye on all

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

CLERK: Ulrich.

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Yes.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

CLERK: Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I be

16 excused to explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you to all my colleagues being Torres, Salamanca and Cumbo especially for the Land Use items. I do want to give a special shout-out to Council Member Cumbo, and—and her bill. There was a recent survey of people who were victims of crimes, and the number one thing above everything reading (sic) how much time someone

2.2

2.3

got was the lack of responses they received from the government and assistance needed.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing] [shushing for quiet]

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: So I think this bill is right on time and deals directly with what victims, not what people say, but victims say, but what they themselves say they need to get past the tragedy that happened. And for Gina, I just want to say I—I, too, am just surprised at how special you made everybody feel. That makes you an extra special person, and even what I assumed was some was some of your darkest days, you had the brightest smile. So we're going to miss that, and congratulations on everything you do. Thank you. I vote aye on all with the exception of Land Use 523 and Reso 1301 and Land Use 524 and Reso 1302 on which I abstain.

CLERK: Wills.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: A moment to explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: I would like to congratulate Gina. We're going to miss you brightening up 250 and the 18<sup>th</sup> Floor and the great

## CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

2.2

2.3

2	conversations you gave each and everyone of us. I
3	also want to congratulate my colleagues King, Torres
1	and Salamanca on their legislation especially Laura
5	Cumbo. We look forward to the impact your
ó	legislation will have on the City. I vote aye on
7	all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

CLERK: Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. I vote age on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

CLERK: Matteo.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Aye on all.

CLERK: Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Permission to briefly explain my vote. I just want to congratulate all of our colleagues, and join in and say to Gina we had a few very, very special and unique moments a few years ago inspired by my colleague Eric Ulrich. I wore some bow ties. I'm not sure I pulled it off that well, but Gina told me I looked amazing, and for two years asked me to keep wearing bow ties every Tuesday. She knows that's true. I also want to thank—a lot of people have talked about how nice she

is, and she is incredibly nice. She's also a lot of fun, and at least once we talked about our shared loved of men, and I remember that conversation very

5 well.

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs]

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: [laughs] I

hope I'm not giving up any secrets there, but-

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs]

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: So thank you very much, Gina, for the laughs and for the love and for all of your work on behalf of all of us. So with that, I vote age on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

CLERK: Richards.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: So I thank all my colleagues for—I think, you know, some people forget that I'm also a Council Member and you've been giving—except for Donovan. He acknowledged it. So I will take by extension all the congratulations that have been given to Salamanca and Torres to me as well, [laughter] for the Land Use item in my district

2.2

2.3

[applause] that brought 390 units of affordable housing. Thank you. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: So, so again, I vote age on all, and—and, Gina, you definitely will be missed. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. So,
Gina, based upon what everyone has said, the bottom
line is wherever you go, Gina, whatever the weather
is you always bring your own sunshine. May God
continue to bless you. Thank you. All items on
today's General Order Calendar were adopted by a vote
of 49 in the affirmative, 0 negative and 0
abstentions with the exception of Land Use 523 and
Resolution 1301, which was adopted by a vote of 48 in
the affirmative, 0 negative and 0 abstentions; and—
what—and 1 abstention; and Land Use 524 and
Resolution 1302, which was adopted by a vote of 48 in
the affirmative, 0 negative and 1 abstention. And I
forgot say happy birthday to Danny Dromm.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Oh, that's right.
[background comments]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And-

2.2

2.3

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing] And 3 tonight. He has an event tonight. Yes.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Right and DC3 right? Exactly. Introduction and reading of bills.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All bills are referred to committees as indicated on the agenda.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Seeing no resolutions, we will—we will now go to general discussion beginning with the Birthday Boy Danny Dromm.

much, Madam Public Advocate, and I'd like to join my colleagues' attention to Resolution 1287, which calls for the passage of the Federal Equal—Equality Act.

This measure would ensure the inclusion of sexual orientation and gender identity in the Civil Rights Acts of 1964 and '68. Despite significant progress, the Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgender community remains uncovered by basic civil rights protections throughout much of the country. In 29 states a gay man can be fired for being married to another man.

In 29 states a Lesbian couple can be asked to leave a restaurant for kissing. In 38 states a transgender individual can be kicked out of their home for not

2.2

conforming to a landlord's vivid personal notions
about gender. Such discrimination is anathema to
what our country stands for, and now that we will
have an administration in Washington largely hostile
to civil rights, our city has a chance to make a
powerful statement that our country should continue-
should continue to uphold its promise of equality and
justice for all. I encourage my colleagues to
support the LGBT community during these challenging
times, and sign onto Resolution 1287. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

Council Member Rosenthal.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
[shushing for quiet] We—we're still in session.
Council Member Rosenthal has the floor.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you so much Public Advocate. I encourage my colleagues to sign onto Resolution 1192, which calls on the State to simplify the process by which a victim of domestic violence can break their lease. It's critical because even when a victim of domestic violence has made the difficult decision to leave an abuse

relationship, logistical concerns like breaking an
apartment lease all too often act as barriers to
leaving an abusive environment. As lawmakers and as
everyday bystanders it is our responsibility to work
whenever possible to remove those barriers. I'm
proud to introduce this resolution and to include it
as part of the first ever Women's Caucus legislative
and equality package. And. I'm very appreciative of
the advocates like Mary Haviland with the New York
City Alliance Against Sexual Assault, the Honorable
Judy Harris Kluger of Sanctuary for Families, and
Christopher Bromson of the Crime Treatment Center
Victims Unit, and Marti Weithman of MFY Legal
Services, who work day in and day out to remove those
barriers one person at a time. Secondly, I would
encourage my colleagues to sign onto Intro 1376, a
detailed reporting bill on the commercial rent tax
that burdens all Manhattan businesses, especially our
local and independently owned small businesses. They
deserve relief in this incredibly increasingly
competitive environment, and this supporting bill
will lay a path to our city's relieving their burden.
Thank you very much.

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

Council Member Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you very much, Madam Public Advocate. I rise today to express my gratitude for a really great public servant, Genevieve Michael who is my Chief of Staff, and has been a member of my team for over five years. Genevieve has been with me through thick and thin. She has been to every corner of every borough although until this month, not all of them on the same day. She has challenged me to be a better person as a public servant, and also better as a creature existing in a political world. She is smart. She is able, and the sky is the limit for her. It is not everyday that someone of her caliber comes along, and I wanted to take a moment to recognize that on the floor of these Council Chambers because sadly tomorrow is her last day in my office as she moves on to new and exciting challenges. today I wanted to say to Genevieve thank you, thank you, thank you. You will be missed, but your partnership over these years was a great gift that I will never forget. Thank you.

Williams.

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13 14

15

16

17

18

19 20

21 2.2

2.3

24

25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, Genevieve for your service. [applause] Council Member

> COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.

First, I just want to congratulate the Girls Volleyball Team at Middle High School. They made a historic win on November 22<sup>nd</sup>, winning the first ever Public Schools Athletic League A title. Also, today is Giving Tuesday. Let's remember to give those who need assistance, give to those. Also, I assume that in most of cases of government, there will be no mention of the death of Fidel Castro. I understand that it is a very controversial issue, and I understand, and this is not to excuse any atrocities, that may have-that may have happened, but I am confused about is that he is a-a leader in this world. There are many who looked to many of things that he does, and there are many leaders who have committed even more atrocities that are celebrated. This government has been friends with many dictators. They supported people in Haiti. They still support and are friends with Saudi Arabia while recognizing human rights atrocities-or human problems there. This country itself allows thirty people—a thousand

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

people to be murdered every single year with qun violence and not do anything about it. And we are four percent of the population with 25% of the prison population, which—which means one in four people in prison in this world are in this country alone. do not understand how we can pick and choose which atrocities are recognized, which we don't, with that for the good things that he has done. I would say that represents a higher state. There was an attack yesterday, and I'm going to continue some prayers for peace and comfort for the 11 people injured and that entire community. Lastly, on Saturday, December 3rd, will be the anniversary of Officer Pantaleo's nonindictment calling on the Mayor and the Administration to release his records of discipline and please move forward to getting him prosecuted. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Council Member Levin.

much, Madam Public Advocate. First, I want to bring everybody's attention to, and I—I was remiss in not talking about this at the last stated, the passing last month of Leslie Lewis at the age of 90. Leslie

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

was the-the President of the 84<sup>th</sup> Precinct Community Council in Brooklyn where he held that position since 1993. Leslie served as a Corporal in the U.S. Army in World War II, and worked for 30 years with the Greyhound Exposition Company where he developed exhibits for the 1964 Worlds Fair, and the Expo '67 in Montreal. He built the model kitchen that Khruschev and Nixon had their quote, unquote "kitchen debate" and also had the distinction of creating the first ever job fair. Leslie was a wonderful guy to everybody that knew him, always concerned with the goings on in his neighborhood, and for what was happening with anybody who would walk into his life, and he is survived by his wife Miriam and his sons Mark and Robert. As Leslie used to say, He was a good guy no matter they said. Also, my colleagues, this morning our President-Elect Donald Trump Tweeted out "Nobody should be allowed to burn the American flag. If they do, there must be consequences. Perhaps loos of citizenship or a year in jail." 140 characters President-Elect Donald Trump managed to express support for two violations of the United States Constitution. I don't support the burning of the flag, but the Supreme ruled in 1990 with Justices

2.2

2.3

Anthony and Scalia in the majority that flag burning—was protected under the First Amendment. Just as importantly, the Supreme Court ruled in 1967 that stripping of citizenship was a violation of the U.S. Constitution and the Eighth Amendment. I anticipate that there will be many opportunities over the next four years to challenge statements and actions by the President-Elect, but we need to call it out each and every time that he advocates dismantling our Bill of Rights, and that's what I am doing here today. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. May Mr. Lewis rest in peace. Council Member Barron.

Public Advocate. I just want to add my voice to those that I've heard expressing best wishes to Gina as she moves forward in whatever it is that she decides she wants to plant her feet or rest herself, and just enjoy life's pleasures. She's been a great friend to me. She's always been pleasant. She's always been able to lift spirits, and she's that way with everybody. I've never seen her down. We know that she's suffered a great loss, but she has rebounded and she's here, and we just want to wish

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

you all the best and acknowledge the great work that you've done, and hope that you'll come back to visit if you have such a mind. And I also want to add my voice to my colleagues regarding the passing of Fidel I want to call attention to the fact that he gave great technical assistance, financial aid, and sent workers to the African nation that were fighting for their liberation, from the oppression and Colonialism, and he sent aid in that regard. He sent aid also to Grenada, as they were building the International Airport, and he also gave aid to the Latin American countries. And he offered aid, which was not received by this country, for our people who were suffering from the after affects of Katrina. he was offering to do what our country had not done for its own people living here, and we want to acknowledge that. And also that they have an outstanding medical school in Cuba, and it's open to any person who would like to come. The only requirement is that is hat you're willing to watch that. (sic) So I just want to add my voice to that. Thank you so much.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Council Member Wills.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: I rise to ask my
colleagues to vote to adopt Resolution 1294 calling
on the Congress and the President to sign House
Resolution 5695, also known as the Veterans Visa and
Protection Act of 2016 introduced by Congressman Raul
Grijalva. According to the National Immigration
Forum, there are more than 500,000 foreign born
veterans living in the U.S. as well as 12,000 non-
citizen active duty service members. This proposal
would require the DHS Secretary to crate a program
that would allow eligible armed services, non-citizer
veterans to return to the U.S. and immigrants who
will be granted legal permanent residence. Given the
opportunity to apply for a change for a status and
receive the medical benefits they rightfully earned.
We often vow that our veterans are to be treasured
and taken care, but within our nation's current laws,
is the glaring contradiction to the pledge. One that
has impacted countless service members and their
families. Over 20 years ago, Congress enacted a
series of laws that brought malicious aggravated
felony laws such a theft, fraud, perjury and forgery
under which non-citizens could be detained and
deported while on active status. These laws remain

2.2

2.3

in effect and continue to unjustly impact those individuals who chose to wear their uniform in defense of this country only to be misled about the residual benefits of becoming a naturalize citizens. Under the House Bill the only kinds of violence are those jeopardizing national security will make a service member ineligible for its provisions. Most of these immigrant veterans are forced to leave their families behind upon deportation. Worse still, they receive no legal representation during their proceedings, and they are denied medical benefits they would be eligible to receive otherwise. Today, I am pleased to be joined by Chairs Menchaca and Ulrich in offering this resolution for the Council's consideration. Thank you very much.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

Council Member Richards.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I just wanted to wish my son, who may be watching at home, a happy birthday. His first birthday and I—I wanted to really thank my colleagues Ulrich, Ferreras who have always given me advice. But, you know, I want to thank all of you for your warm support, my community, my staff and really, you know, having a son now

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

really puts in a lot of—a better perspective and a sharper perspective on everything we do here in the Council whether it's criminal justice avocation, climate change, and affordable housing, it really takes on a different context when you have that—that have a son or a child and—and I just want to thank everybody for their support during this first year. So happy birthday, Diedrick. I love you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Happy birthday, Diedrick. Council Member Cumbo.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. I also rise to express my condolences to the people of Cuba as well as throughout the Africa Diaspora who are recognizing the passing of Fidel Castro. During the Haitian Earthquake Fidel Castro sent a brigade of 1,200 Cuban doctors, nurses and other health professions in order to help those that had been impacted by earthquake in Haiti. Over 250,000 have been killed, and since 1998, Cuba has trained 550 Haitian doctors for free. There's certainly been a great impact through his leadership and much to be I also want to celebrate today the Women's learned. Caucus Equality Package Rally today that happened. want to thank my Co-Chair Helen Rosenthal and all the

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

members of the Women's Caucus for braving this morning's weather to announce our historic legislative package to promote equality. People have looked to New York City as a model. It's our role to continue to fight for the rights of our neighbors here and across the country especially after a presidential campaign that featured hateful and divisive rhetoric from the President-Elect. This passage-package represents a vision for an inclusive and progressive approach to local government to protect and advance the cause of gender equality here in New York City. When heard much of the divisive language, we of the Women's Caucus wanted to respond with legislation, and when we heard so much from President-Elect Trump, those comments that are almost so inappropriate to even mention here. He said, I just kiss. I don't even wait and when you're a star, they let you do anything. You can even grab them by the pussy. And that language is inappropriate for the City Council, but that is now-he is leader of our nation and that type of language has given a certain normalcy to sexual assault, to rape culture, and to so many other news. So that someone who feels that they have power or they influence can do whatever

## CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

2.2

2.3

2	they want to women. So we're responding with a
3	package of legislation, and as this Council and this
1	hody

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
6 Council Member.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: -- we will continue to do so.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much,

Public Advocate.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

Council Member Menchaca.

much, Public Advocate, and I rise to speak on a Reso that I am joining both with Council Member Ulrich and Wills. This reso is calling on Congress to pass and the President to sign HRA 5695, the Veterans Visa, the Protection Act of 2016, De Helva's (sp?) Law. This would require the Department of Homeland Security to establish a program that would permit eligible reported non-citizen veterans to enter the United States, and would also allow eligible non-citizen veterans in the United States to change their status to that of a non-citizen lawfully admitted for

2.2

2.3

permanent residence, and it would cancel the removal of eligible non-citizen veterans, and enable them to adjust their legal status. According to the National Immigration Forum there are over 500,000 foreign born veterans living in the United States as well as 12,000 non-citizen active duty members. I take great pride in joining my Council Member—my Council Member brothers because my brother is also a veteran, and just did two tours, one in Iraq and one in Afghanistan, and so this is for him, his brothers and sisters that he fought next to and all of those that were under this law be granted citizenship. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We thank him for his service to all of us, and lastly Council Member Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I would like to express my condolences, too, to the people of Cuba for the loss of their President Fidel Castro, a leader that regardless of your—if you agreed of disagreed with him, you have to recognize that he made Cuba the country and the region, probably one in the world with the best healthcare system and the best education assistance. So I know that they say

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

there was more of a transition in Cuba, and the
United States restored that relationship, but I know
that Cuba is for very capital leadership even though
again, we cannot agree or disagree with him. He made
a lot of progress, he also made Cuba a role model in
many countries.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you and lastly Council Member Ulrich.

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you, Madam Public Advocate. I rise today to join my colleagues, as was mentioned previously in supporting Resolution 1294, calling on Congress to pass and the President to sign and enact the Veterans Visa and Protection Act of 2016. As the Chair of the Veterans Committee, I-I get to learn a lot of interesting things that I think a lot of us aren't even aware of. I think that many people aren't aware that there are, in fact, non-citizens serving in one of the branches of the Armed Services currently, and yes, sometimes those individuals, those men and women when they are done serving-serving our country and discharged honorably, in some rare instances some of them because of their immigration status, they are, in fact, deported. I can't believe that we live in a country where

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

people sign up to serve our county, put their lives on the line to defect—defend our country, and take an oath to serve our country that when are done serving our country, in the most honorable, that we send them back to their original country of origin against their wishes. And so, there is a bill in Congress that I think we all should be supporting in this body, which I think would provide some relief and some measure of justice for those veterans who are non-citizens who are serving the Unites States of America, and put them on the path to citizenship. We're not giving them automatic citizenship, but we are giving them permanent resident status, which would make them eligible for obtaining U.S. citizenship. So in the absence of a comprehensive immigration reform bill, which I would hope that the next Congress and the next president would take up. Although that's something that's out of our control, I think this is something that both Democrats and Republicans can agree on that people who serve this country in the Army, the Navy the Marines, the Coast Guard or even the National Guard or the Reserves that when they are done serving honorably. As long as they have committed no felony or serious crimes that

_	_
$\cap$	$\overline{}$
ч	$\neg$

1	CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 95
2	we at least allow them to get on the path to
3	citizenship and become full citizens of the country
4	that they fought to protect and the freedoms and the
5	liberties that you and I so often take for granted.
6	Thank you very much.
7	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you Council
8	Member for your leadership, and now to close, the
9	Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.
10	SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Just have a great
11	afternoon, everybody, and again I know he's gone, but
12	happy birthday to our colleague Danny Droom and D3.
13	Have a great afternoon everybody.
14	PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. We
15	stand adjourned. [gavel]
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 23, 2016