

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

----- X

December 5, 2016  
Start: 1:49 p.m.  
Recess: 2:10 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E: Daniel Dromm  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Vincent J. Gentile  
Daniel R. Garodnick  
Margaret S. Chin  
Stephen T. Levin  
Deborah L. Rose  
Ben Kallos  
Andy L. King  
Inez D. Barron  
Chaim M. Deutsch  
Mark Levine  
Alan M. Maisal  
Rosie Mendez  
Antonio Reynoso  
Ydanis A. Rodriguez  
Helen K. Rosenthal  
Mark Treyger  
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2

3 [sound check, pause]

4 [background comments, pause]

5 [gavel]

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Alright, good

7 afternoon. Today the Education Committee will vote  
8 on two bills, Proposed Intro Number 1099A is  
9 sponsored by Council Member Treyger and Proposed  
10 Intro Number 1193A sponsored by Council Members  
11 Levine and Menchaca. These bills will provide much  
12 needed information on two areas of great importance,  
13 career and technical education and computer science  
14 education.

15 Proposed Intro 1099A would require the  
16 Department of Education to submit to the Council and  
17 post on the DOE's website an annual report by April  
18 30th of each year with information on career and  
19 technical education programs in New York City schools  
20 from the preceding school year. The report required  
21 by Proposed Intro 1099A would include information on  
22 the number and types of CTE programs available to  
23 city students as well as the number of students  
24 enrolled in CTE programs at each high school and  
25 graduation rates in CTE designated high schools among  
other data. This is basic information that the

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 public<sup>2</sup> has a right to know about, and these are  
3 critical programs that prepare students for college  
4 and careers.

5 Proposed Intro 1193A would require the  
6 DOE to submit to the Council and post on the DOE's  
7 website an annual report by April 30th of each year  
8 with information on computer science education in New  
9 York City schools from the preceding school year.  
10 Some of the data to be provided includes the number  
11 and type of computer science programs offered, the  
12 number and percentages of students enrolled in such  
13 programs, and the number of teachers providing  
14 computer science instruction. The report would also  
15 require reporting on the available bandwidth at each  
16 school building. This information is especially  
17 important to establish a baseline against which we  
18 can measure DOE progress and expanding computer  
19 science under the Computer Science For All initiative  
20 being phased in through 2025. I fully support both  
21 of these important pieces of legislation and urge  
22 Committee members to vote in favor of both Proposed  
23 Intro 1099A and Proposed Intro 1193A.

24 And just before I turn it over to my  
25 colleagues to speak, let me just state for the record

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 who is there. We have been joined by Council Member  
3 Vinnie Gentile, Council Member Mark Treyger, Council  
4 Member Mark Levine, Council Member Antonio Reynoso,  
5 Council Member Rosie Mendez, Council Member Margaret  
6 Chin, Council Member Ynez Barron, Council Member  
7 Chaim Deutsch, Council Member Ben Kallos, Council  
8 Member Rafael Salamanca and Council Member Steve  
9 Levin and Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez is also  
10 here. And with that I'd now like to turn it over to  
11 my colleague Mark Treyger for his remarks on Proposed  
12 Intro 1099A.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you, Chair.  
14 Colleagues I encourage you to vote in favor of Intro  
15 1099A, a local law which would require the Department  
16 of Education to report data about the availability  
17 and usage of high quality career and technical  
18 education instruction in our high schools. Dedicated  
19 CT high schools, CT programs and certified CT  
20 instructors all provide vital educational flexibility  
21 for our high school students. While growing numbers  
22 of students choose to pursue four-year post-secondary  
23 degrees, we also need to support the educational  
24 goals of students who may not see a four-year college  
25 as part of their immediate post-secondary career in

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

5

2 educational plans, particularly given the  
3 increasingly prohibitive costs of college tuition.  
4 Following the input of advocates at the bill's  
5 initial hearing, it has been expanded to include  
6 greater demographic desegregation as well as  
7 information on professional development resources  
8 accessed by CTE faculty.

9           The annual reported mandated by Intro  
10 1099A will enable us to better understand the  
11 landscape of career and technical education in our  
12 city and will help us better target our resources  
13 towards programs that provide high school students  
14 with meaningful skills and pathways to high wage in  
15 demand careers, and really the goal is to use the  
16 data as a starting point for further advocacy to  
17 better connect our students with real world career  
18 skills and opportunities.

19           I'd like to thank Speaker Melissa Mark-  
20 Viverito for her leadership on this, Chair Dromm for  
21 hearing and being a strong supporter of this bill,  
22 and all of the Education Committee staff for their  
23 assistance, particularly Committee Counsel Smita  
24 Deshmukh. I'd like to thank my staff Anna Scafe and  
25 Ethan Westeg as well as the UFT, Jobs First, NYC and

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 the many advocates and partners whose feedback and  
3 insights have shaped this bill. I respectfully urge  
4 all of my colleagues to vote in favor of Intro 1099A.  
5 Thank you, Chair.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much,  
7 and before we go to Council Member Levin, I'd like to  
8 give my colleague, Council Member Steve Levin an  
9 opportunity to vote on the legislation.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Levin.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, Chair.

12 I vote Aye on all. Congratulations to those  
13 sponsors. Sorry, I have a doctor's appointment,  
14 thanks.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And I'd also like to  
16 say that we've been joined by Council Member Dan  
17 Garodnick and Council Member Alan Maisel. Okay, and  
18 with that I'd like to call on Council Member Levine  
19 to make a statement on Proposed Into 1193A.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, Mr.  
21 Chair. I will briefly say a few words on behalf of  
22 this resolution, the tech industry that New York City  
23 is building. Estimates as many as 300,000 jobs in  
24 the sector now, but far, far, far too many of those  
25 jobs are going to people who are moving to New York

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

7

2 City from other places and we're glad that they are  
3 here, we welcome them, but it is truly a lost  
4 opportunity for the young men and women of this city.  
5 We know the talent is out there. We know there are  
6 thousands and thousands of young people who, if given  
7 the chance to develop their skills in tech, would be  
8 entering these jobs in droves and succeeding. We  
9 have got to give them a chance in the public schools  
10 to develop skills in tech and IT and coding the same  
11 way we give them training in chemistry and earth  
12 science. The skills of tomorrow demand that young  
13 people have fluency in technology. To the Mayor's  
14 credit, he has launched an initiative to get us in  
15 the next 10 years to the place where every child gets  
16 some computer science, and this bill will back that  
17 up by reporting to us in the public on the progress  
18 we are making towards that important goal.

19 Please let the bills come to a vote today  
20 and I urge my colleagues to support it. Thank you,  
21 Mr. Chair.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you very  
23 much, and with that I'd like to ask Clerk William  
24 Martin to call the vote.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2

3 COMMITTEE CLERK: William Martin,  
4 Committee Clerk. Roll call vote Committee on  
5 Education. Items are coupled. Chair Dromm?

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: I vote Aye.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Congratulations  
9 to both my colleagues. I vote Aye.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Chin?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. Proud  
18 to be a sponsor on both these bills.

19 Congratulations. I vote Aye.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Deutsch?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Levine?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Maisel?

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

a

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

3 COMMITTEE CLERK: Reynoso?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Treyger?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: With gratitude to  
7 my colleagues, I vote Aye.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Salamanca?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: By a vote of 14 in the  
11 affirmative, zero in the negative and no abstentions,  
12 both items have been adopted.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Okay, thank you  
14 very much. And with that, I'm going to ask that we  
15 keep the vote open for a few more minutes so that  
16 some members can come in to vote. Some of them were  
17 at other hearings. So we'll keep it open for about  
18 15 minutes.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Continuation of roll  
20 call, the Committee on Education. Council Member  
21 Rosenthal?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you so  
23 much. You know for sure [gavel] may I explain my  
24 vote? For sure I'm very pleased to vote Yes on both  
25 of these bills, and thank you, Members, for bringing

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

10

2 them to the floor. I do want to say that at some  
3 point while I too am one of the biggest advocates of  
4 reporting bills because there is information that we  
5 desperately need to see in order to do our jobs in  
6 oversight capacity. At some point I think we need to  
7 start thinking about what impact these reporting  
8 bills have on the administration, on the  
9 professionals in the agencies who we count on to do  
10 their jobs. Certainly wouldn't want to distract from  
11 that and balancing it with not overloading the city's  
12 headcount to hire new people to do the reporting that  
13 is so desperately needed. So with that in mind, I'm  
14 proud to be on this Committee and I'm proud to vote  
15 Yes on both. Thank you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you, Council  
17 Member Rosenthal, and actually probably one of my  
18 biggest frustrations has been not being able to write  
19 legislation directly to hold the Department  
20 accountable so we rely heavily on these types of  
21 reporting bills, but I will say from my own  
22 experience with the special education reporting bill  
23 that we passed, for the very first time we were able  
24 to get numbers, although anecdotally we knew that not  
25 all students were being provided special education

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

11

2 services, but when that first report came out we  
3 found out that 60 percent of students were getting  
4 the services they were entitled to, 35 percent were  
5 only getting partial services, and 5 percent were not  
6 getting anything at all. So it has been good to have  
7 those numbers to continue to advocate for the full  
8 implementation of the special education services to  
9 students. I'm committed to that and on these other  
10 pieces of legislation I will remain committed to  
11 implement recommendations and work with advocates to  
12 see some changes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I'm with you  
14 100 percent, and similarly the diversity report has  
15 been critical.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes, absolutely.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you,  
18 Chair.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Final vote Committee of  
21 Education, both Introductions have been adopted by a  
22 vote of 15 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative, and  
23 no abstentions.

24 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And this meeting is  
25 adjourned at 2:10 in the afternoon.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

12

2

3 [gavel]

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 20, 2016