

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

October 27, 2016
Start: 1:10 p.m.
Recess: 3:22 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: LETITIA JAMES
Public Advocate

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO
Speaker for the Council

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- Inez D. Barron
- Joe Borelli
- Fernando Cabrera
- Margaret S. Chin
- Andrew Cohen
- Costa G. Constantinides,
- Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
- Elizabeth S. Crowley
- Laurie A. Cumbo
- Chaim M. Deutsch
- Inez E. Dickens
- Daniel Dromm
- Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
- Mathieu Eugene
- Julissa Ferreras-Copeland
- Daniel R. Garodnick
- Vincent J. Gentile

Vanessa L. Gibson
David G. Greenfield
Barry Grodenchik
Corey D. Johnson
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Peter A. Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
Darlene Mealy
Carlos Menchaca
Rosie Mendez
I. Daneek Miller
Annabel Palma
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Rafael Salamanca
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
James Vacca
Paul A. Vallone
James G. Van Bramer
Jumaane D. Williams
Ruben Wills

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Pastor Malobe Sampson
Thessalonia Baptist Church
951 Reverend James A Polite Avenue
Bronx, New York

2 [sound check, pause]

3 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: ...for helping
4 to save another man's life at the City Hall, our
5 station in June when the man passed out and fell off
6 the platform. Council Member Menchaca joining us and
7 I will hand the mic over to Council Member Gentile to
8 talk about his very important act of braver.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Right. Thank
10 you, Majority Leader Van Bramer, and certainly we
11 hear a lot about New York values this year, right,
12 and certainly I wan to bring to you someone who
13 embodies what we know to be New York Values, and
14 that's Toronto, who is a-back in June of last year-
15 of-of this year was a resident in my neighborhood
16 in-in Bayridge, but he was-he was taking an unusual
17 trip home on the subway because he normally bikes to
18 work and Council Member Menchaca knows a lot about
19 that, right? He normally bikes to work, but he took
20 the subway home at the City Hall Station right out
21 front on a sunny afternoon in June of this year, and
22 as he was he was waiting for the train, he heard a
23 thud, and-and was alerted to the fact that someone
24 had fallen onto the trucks. And through his good
25 work, and his immediate work, and he's here with his

2 daughter, Ashley today. Yes, come on up Ashley.
3 We'll take the pictures and we'll give you the
4 [laughs]. He saved this gentleman and two other—two
5 other good Samaritans helped him. One of them was a
6 tourist from Europe that—that helped David save this
7 gentleman Ron Washington, and not only did he save
8 him, but he followed up with the gentleman to this
9 day still checks on him to see that he's doing. So
10 it really is my pleasure, our pleasure in the City
11 Council to honor David Tirado for his good work and
12 his bravery, his—his courage. He is an Army veteran
13 and certainly it really is an honor to have you here
14 and to say thank you on behalf of the City Council of
15 the City of New York. Okay. [applause] Let the
16 clerk read the proc.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: [off mic]
18 I've give his own copy.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Oh, his own
20 copy. Okay.

21 CLERK: Council, City of New York
22 Proclamation. The Council of the City of New York is
23 proud to honor David Tirado for saving the life of a
24 fellow New York; and

2 Whereas, on Friday afternoon, June 10,
3 2016, David Tirado, an Army veteran and security
4 officer at a Lower Manhattan securities and
5 investment management firm was on his way back home
6 in Bay Ridge. As he waited for the R-Train at City
7 Hall Station, he heard a woman across the platform
8 scream that a man has just fallen onto the tracks.
9 Without hesitation, Mr. Tirado and two other
10 bystanders leapt in action risking their lives to save
11 the life of a stranger; and

12 Whereas, when these two good Samaritans
13 reached the victim, an unconscious man in his 50s,
14 they knew they had to—they had no time to lose. What
15 began as a medical emergency could quickly escalated
16 any second. While another woman contacted an MTA
17 worker and police, Mr. Tirado realized that the
18 victim had hit his head on the first rail and his arm
19 was stuck. Working together, the courageous trio
20 managed to free the victim and pull him back up on
21 the platform. Fortunately, this time an MTA workers
22 was able to hit the panic button in the toll booth,
23 and alert the conductor to stop the oncoming-oncoming
24 train; and

2 Whereas, employing his previous
3 experience in life saving, Mr. Tirado checked the
4 unconscious man's pulse. After they pulled him onto
5 the platform, the victim began having a seizure.
6 Within minutes, the Transit Police, FDNY and the
7 Paramedics were on the scene and eventually the man
8 came to before Paramedics rushed him to Bellevue for
9 treatments. When the nurses informed the victim of
10 his heart ailment. He had no memory of the subway
11 station, but upon seeing the incident on video, he
12 was extremely grateful; and

13 Whereas, although the MTA riders to
14 signal the train operator or platform managers when-
15 whenever possible instead of taking matters into
16 their own hands, we are forever grateful to Mr.
17 Tirado and two others for their bravery. His rescue
18 reveals remarkable character, selfless courage, and
19 incredible concern for the safety others before his
20 own, and he has earned the esteem of every New
21 Yorker.

22 Now, therefore, be it know that the
23 Council of the City of New York gratefully honors
24 David Tirado for his lifesaving heroism on June 10,
25 2016. Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the Entire

2 Council, Vincent J. Gentile, Council Member 43rd
3 District, Brooklyn; Steven Levin, Council Member,
4 33rd District, Brooklyn; Carlos Menchaca, Council
5 Member 38th District, Brooklyn; Brad Lander Council
6 Member, 39th District, Brooklyn.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: [applause]

8 Alright, and it all happened here at the—the City
9 Hall Station of the R-Train back in June. So, David,
10 why don't you say a few words?

11 DAVID TIRADO: Sure. Thank you for
12 having me here today. It's just cray. This is all
13 mind blowing here. I lost my words here. I'm not
14 one talk a lot. [laughs] But I don't know what else
15 to say. [pause] But thank you. [laughs] I
16 appreciate it very much. Thank you very much.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Thank you so
18 much.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you
20 very much. Mr. Tirado, a big round of applause.
21 Thank you. Let's take a photo. [pause] Thank you
22 very much. Our second ceremonial, Council Member
23 Borelli, Council Member Joe Borelli is honoring
24 Staten Island Mental Health Society, and Illuminart
25 Productions for their anti-bullying efforts, a very,

2 very important issues to me personally, and to so
3 many of us who have experienced bullying. So we are
4 grateful to all of these folks. Is everyone from
5 Staten Island? [background comments] Alright.

6 MALE SPEAKER: Brooklyn.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: We love
8 starting here. When some—some folks go around this
9 side. Is the Minority Leader joining us? Wow, and
10 we're graced with the presence of our Minority Leader
11 Steven Matteo. So we will pass the mic over to
12 Council Member Borelli to talk a little about these
13 very important people who are doing great work, and
14 joined by our Minority Leader Steven Matteo.

15 MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: Thank you, Mr.
16 Majority Leader or Council Member Van Bramer. I want
17 to bring these two groups here today because they
18 have formed what have become an outstanding
19 partnership in combatting bullying on State Island,
20 and not even bullying because we've also done some
21 work together in terms of the Heroin and Opioid
22 addiction crisis. These are two issues that have
23 become on the forefront of Staten Island both in
24 media and in people's everyday lives as more and more
25 children are unfortunately the victim of bullying,

2 and experience that type of behavior in their
3 schools, it's important to realize what Illuminart
4 does. And-and that's basically through and fear and-
5 and visual displays, they take people through the-the
6 lives of someone who is being bullied, someone who is
7 doing the bullying, and the-the impact it has on
8 their family. Like I said, they also do the same
9 thing with-with the Heroin and drug and alcohol
10 crisis that we have in Staten Island and-and not just
11 Staten, though in the rest of the city. So it's-it's
12 wonderful to have them here today at City Hall.
13 It's-it's far too uncommon that we honor some of our
14 great community organizations that-that do things
15 like this. So I want to give them a nice round of
16 applause and say welcome, welcome. It's well
17 deserved. [applause] Steve, do you want to-Steve.

18 MINORITY LEADER MATTEO: Yeah, sure.

19 Thank you, Joe. Joe said with us what-what they
20 all do here is they do yeoman's work for Staten
21 Island when it comes to voting, when it comes to
22 mental health, when it comes to our drug crisis.
23 They're all partners, and they help make sure
24 that Staten Island is a better place, that it's
25 one theater program at a time, one program is

2 dealing with mental health, helping those who
3 need it in terms of drug overdose. So you're
4 there for us you're our unsung heroes on State
5 Island. We can't thank you enough and this is
6 more than well deserved and thanks to the
7 leadership of—of Council Member Borelli for
8 putting this together. So welcome to City Hall.
9 Enjoy this, and if we could all give them a great
10 round of applauses. Thank you. [applause]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you
12 very much Minority Leader Matteo, and with that we
13 will read the proclamation before we hear from some
14 of these distinguished guests.

15 CLERK: Council, City of New York
16 Proclamation.

17 In observance of National Bullying
18 Prevention Month, the Council of the City of New York
19 is proud to honor IlluminArt Productions and the
20 State Island Mental Health Society for their
21 outstanding service combatting bullying and bullying
22 related suicides in our community; and

23 Whereas, bullying is unwanted aggressive
24 behavior, usually among young people that involves a
25 real or perceived power imbalance. This unwanted

2 aggressive behavior is repeated or has the potential
3 to be repeated over time. Whether it occurs in life
4 or online, bullying can scar everyone, those who are
5 bullied, those who bully and those who witness
6 bullying. On this occasion, it is a privilege go pay
7 tribute to two organizations that have made
8 tremendous progress in combatting bullying in Staten
9 Island; and

10 Whereas, IlluminArt Productions, a
11 contracted vendor, with the City—New York City
12 Department of Education since 2009, enables
13 individuals of all ages to use the power of theater
14 to portray and develop solutions for the complex
15 challenges they confront. Guided by Executive
16 Producing Director Arlene Shorken, Illumin—
17 IlluminArt’s performance based education initiatives
18 have empowered and educated students across New York
19 City. One recent event helped Staten Island parents
20 gain a better understanding of the modern bullying
21 that affects children and to learn ways to address it
22 from leading mental health and education
23 professionals throughout the borough. IlluminArt
24 Productions has not only changed how young people

2 view the world, but also how they view themselves;
3 and

4 Whereas, the Staten Island Mental Health
5 Society under the dynamic leadership of President and
6 CEO Fern Zeiger is a non-profit dedicated to
7 improving the quality of life for Staten Island
8 children. Whether the cause was bullying or a
9 natural disaster like Super Storm Sandy, the society
10 staff helps countless traumatized children strengthen
11 their coping skills, develop self-confidence, high
12 self-esteem, and a healthy emotional outlook on life.
13 Each year the Staten Island Mental Health Society
14 serves 1 in 10 Staten Island families. In 2015, its
15 staff treated more than 5,3000 individuals and
16 conducted 173,000 child and family evaluation and
17 treatment sessions. Three hundred profession and
18 support staff delivered critical services at 21 sites
19 with the support of many generous volunteers. The
20 Staten Island Mental Health Society has truly
21 distinguished itself as a friend, voice, advocate and
22 ally for the borough's youth and families.

23 Now, therefore, be it known that the
24 Council of the City of New York gratefully honors the
25 Staten Island Mental Health Society and IlluminArt

2 Productions for their outstanding work combatting
3 bullying and suicide in New York City. Melissa Mark-
4 Viverito, Speaker for the Entire Council; Jimmy Van
5 Bramer, Majority Leader; Joseph Borelli, Council
6 Member 51st District Staten Island; Steven Matteo
7 Minority Leader 50th District Staten Island; Deborah
8 Rose, Council Member 49th District Staten Island.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER:

10 Congratulations to all. A big round of applause,
11 [applause] and I—I don't always get these
12 opportunities, but our City Clerk is a constituent
13 from Woodside. You nailed it. Mike McSweeney.
14 Nailed it, Mike McSweeney. As always, thank you very
15 much. So I think our dynamic and wonderful leader
16 Fern will say a few words before passing on the
17 baton.

18 FERN ZIEGER: [pause] I want to thank
19 everybody for this wonderful, wonderful honor. We're
20 really being honored for something that we do
21 everyday. We're reaching out to families with
22 children, our children with all sorts of issues, with
23 mental health, substance abuse, developmental
24 disabilities, early childhood education. This is
25 what we do, and we just laugh and have the

2 opportunity to reach out to more, and again, thank
3 you for this opportunity.

4 FEMALE SPEAKER: Thank you so much for
5 inviting us here today. We're a much newer
6 organization than the Mental Health Society and this
7 is really our—I think our first chance to really be
8 out there and—and have people know who we are. So
9 it's wonderful, and I can tell you that we would not
10 exist if weren't our amazing City Council people.
11 Councilman Matteo, I think you were the first to fund
12 us and then Debbie Rose and Councilman Borelli. So
13 we're just very happy for their support, and we thank
14 them very, very much, and we hope to just be doing
15 more and more on Staten Island to help people
16 everyday.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER:
18 Congratulations to everyone. Thank you to our great
19 colleagues from Staten Island for bringing this to
20 our attention. We'll take a group photo before we--
21 [background comments, pause]

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright, I'm
23 going to ask all of my colleagues to join me in the
24 front for our last ceremonial. [pause] Alright,
25 you're going to have to give us a second. This

2 technology conversion has been a little bit
3 challenging. [pause] Okay. [laughs] Alright, if
4 any other colleagues would like to join us, and I'm
5 using this Tablet so excuse me while I look down. I
6 wanted to make sure that--yeah, I can do it. I can--I
7 can--we're trying to--this is the first Stated Meeting
8 that we're using Tablets, and getting rid of paper,
9 and it's been a--a bit of an adjustment. So, first I
10 want to welcome--thank you all for being here--I want
11 to welcome Dave Archambault who is the 45th Chairman
12 of the Standing Rock Sioux Tribe. [cheers/applause]
13 We are honored to have the Chairman here with us
14 today, and to present this proclamation in full
15 solidarity with the tribe, who are currently
16 undergoing a great injustice. We thank the Chairman
17 for his courage, and leadership on this issue, and
18 his lifelong commitment to advocating for the needs
19 of Native American tribes, the first Americans. As
20 the only tribal elected official seated on the Tribal
21 Issues Advisory Group to the United States Sentencing
22 Commission, Chairman Archambault works with
23 legislative officials around the country on Native
24 American issues. He is with us today representing
25 the plight of the Standing Rock Sioux Tribe against

2 the infringement on their sacred tribal land and
3 burial grounds by the Dakota Access Pipeline. The
4 Standing Rock Sioux boast 14,000 members of Dakota
5 and Dakota heritage running across 2.3 million acres
6 in North and South Dakota. They are the tribe of
7 leaders Sitting Bull, and have existed among their
8 lands for hundreds of years operating a broad range
9 of programs and exercise of their sovereign authority
10 including education, healthcare, infrastructure and
11 cultural resource programs. But their sovereign is
12 threatened. In July of 2016, the U.S. Army Corps of
13 Engineers were granted authorization to cross a lake
14 neighboring their reservation as part of the
15 construction of a 1,100-mile pipeline that is
16 proposed to carry over half a million barrels of
17 crude oil to Illinois and other states. This was
18 done despite strong objection from the tribe as the,
19 the pipeline was crossed. It exists less than a half
20 a mile from the reservation, and provides much of the
21 water used by the tribe. Should the pipeline
22 rupture, their water quality and, therefore, their
23 very existence in their native area becomes
24 threatened. While the pipeline had initially been
25 re-routed to prevent the very same possibility from

2 happening to residents of nearby Bismarck, no such
3 accommodations were made for the Standing Rock Sioux
4 people. In fact, mention of the tribe were left off
5 initial plans entirely. Despite meeting with
6 officials from the Environmental Protection Agency
7 the Department of the Interior, and the Advisory
8 Council on Historic Preservation, the US Prime Army
9 Corps of Engineers has yet to put a stop to their
10 construction plans. We in New York know something
11 about the fight to protect our water and natural
12 resources. The New York City Council has long fought
13 to protect the Upstate water reservoirs from the
14 risks posed by fracking. Thanks to our successful
15 advocacy in partnership with environmental groups who
16 were able to stop hydro fracking from coming to New
17 York. I present this proclamation to affirm my
18 support, the support this Council, of the people of
19 Standing Rock Sioux Tribe in keeping the Dakota
20 Access Pipeline away from their tribal land. I join
21 more than two dozen other cities who have announced
22 similar support as well as thousands of private
23 individuals across the country who stand in
24 solidarity with this movement. I'm proud to be
25 standing here as we send a clear message that this

2 infringement on Native American sovereignty reflects
3 the worst parts of our history, and cannot to be
4 perpetuated in present day. SO I want to thank you
5 so much for your tireless advocacy, Chairman. You
6 can see all of our colleagues here in support of you,
7 and we would love to have you say a few words. If we
8 could read the proclamation first, and say a few
9 words afterwards.

10 CLERK: Council City of New York
11 Proclamation. The Council of the City of New York is
12 proud to honor Dave Archambault, II for his activism
13 on behalf of the Standing Rock Sioux Nation, and
14 stands in solidarity with their efforts to opposed
15 the Dakota Access Pipeline; and

16 Whereas, the New York City Council has
17 fought for years to protect the upstate water
18 reservoirs from the many risks posed by hydraulic
19 fracturing and other fossil fuel developments, so our
20 five boroughs will have sufficient and safe water for
21 all. While most New Yorkers are aware of our
22 inextricable connection to and dependence on our
23 natural resources, we must also remember that
24 environmental challenges beyond our immediate region

2 can have severe and lasting repercussions across the
3 nation; and

4 Whereas, the proposed Dakota Access
5 Pipeline is a 1,168-mile 30-inch diameter pipeline
6 currently being developed by the Dakota Access LLC, a
7 subsidiary of Energy Transfer Partners, which would
8 carry as much as three—I'm sorry—570,000 barrels per
9 day of fracking crude from Western North Dakota to
10 Illinois. It would run across or beneath 209 rivers,
11 creeks and tributaries including the Missouri River,
12 which provides drinking water and irrigation for
13 agricultural land for communities across the Midwest
14 serving nearly 10 million people; and

15 Whereas, the Dakota Access Pipeline would
16 also run through the ancestral land and waters of the
17 Standing Rock Sioux Tribe, including the Missouri
18 River, burial grounds and grave sites, and other
19 sacred sites of cultural, religious and historical
20 significance. Furthermore, if an oil spill should
21 occur, it would threaten the drinking water of many
22 people; and

23 Whereas, the American Indian Religious
24 Freedom Act of 1978 affirms their need to protect and
25 preserve for American Indians their inherent right of

2 freedom to believe, express and exercise their
3 traditional religions particularly in American Indian
4 sacred places; and

5 Whereas, environmental advocates across
6 the nation believe the Dakota Access Pipeline Project
7 violates the variety of treaties, laws and
8 administrative mandates, and has not gone through
9 adequate environmental review, public input, and
10 consultation with affected native nations.

11 Now, therefore, be it known that the
12 Council of the City of New York is proud to honor
13 David Archambault, II for embracing environmental and
14 social justice, and we stand in solidarity with him
15 and our indigenous brothers and sisters and the
16 Standing Rock Sioux Tribe, and with cities across the
17 nation in opposition to the Dakota Access Pipeline.

18 Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the entire
19 Council; Ritchie Torres, Co-Chair Black Latino and
20 Asian Caucus; Robert Cornegy, Co-Chair of Black,
21 Latino and Asian Caucus; Laurie A. Cumbo, Co-Chair,
22 Women's Caucus; Helen Rosenthal, Co-Chair, Women's
23 Caucus; Rosie Mendez, Chair LGBT Caucus; Mark D.
24 Levine, Chair, Jewish Caucus; Donovan Richards, Co-

2 Chair Progressive Caucus; Antonio Reynoso, Co-Chair
3 of Progressive Caucus. [cheers/applause]

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And I'll let you
5 say a few words?

6 DAVID ARCHAMBAULT: I want to—hello.
7 Okay. I want to thank the Speaker and the Council
8 for your support. I know this is a challenge for us
9 and we—and we feel like there's nothing that we can
10 do, but knowing that there are people behind us,
11 there are—there is support behind us, is encouraging
12 and it—and it keeps moving forward in this fight.
13 This—this whole fight is about water, and to us water
14 is safety. Water is a relative. Water is your life,
15 and when we protect water and despite what we're
16 doing is we're protecting the history. We're
17 protecting our ancestors and what they left for us.
18 We're also protecting life. We're speaking for all
19 creatures, all things that can't speak. We're
20 speaking for those that fall, those that fly, those
21 that swing, but the ones that flower, the plants,
22 we're—we're speaking for them when—when we stand up
23 water, and it's such a simple concept. But we're
24 also speaking for the children who are not yet born.
25 We're—we're protecting their future, and it's—it's

2 easy, simple, and—and it takes courage, though, to
3 stand up for something like this against industries,
4 oil industries, against the federal government and
5 the state government, and something you feel like you
6 don't want to move on. You don't want to go on
7 because the—the deck is stacked against you, but once
8 you have cities like this city in New York standing
9 up and saying we support you, we take the next step.
10 So I want to thank you. [cheers/applause] Thank
11 you. To—to learn more about what we're doing and—and
12 the different angles that we're—we're fighting, we do
13 have a website. And—and it will tell you, and I
14 would say they're shared with these actions that
15 we're taking against the company or the actions that
16 we're—we're doing and working with the federal
17 government, working with state governments. Whatever
18 it is, the camp-- I don't know if you heard about
19 the camp but we have a big camp where people from all
20 over the world are coming, and they ask how can we
21 help. Sometimes we want to help financially. We
22 don't—what I say is follow your heart. But we have
23 information on this—on—no Stand with Standing
24 Rock.net. With Stand with Sioux Rock.net. You could
25 get the information there and learn more about what

2 we're doing, and I--that's--that's, you know, we have
3 some youth that came with us for ten weeks, and the
4 youth are the ones that spoke up. The youth are the
5 ones that said we don't want oil in our water. So
6 when our youth fight the top, I encourage them, and
7 everyone of us should encourage our youth to say what
8 they want to say. Every one of us should encourage
9 our youth to be what they want to be, and that's the
10 movement. That's what's starting us, and so with
11 that, our--our youth are right now in Brooklyn and
12 they're--

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [laughs] We're
14 Brooklynites too.

15 DAVID ARCHAMBAULT: Yeah, so--so they're
16 within there. [cheers/applause] They're--they're
17 outside of Hillary--they're outside of Hillary
18 Clinton's Campaign Headquarters and they're--they're
19 trying to bring this issue to her and have her make a
20 s statement about supporting the tribe, Standing
21 Rock, and all the indigenous peoples in this--in this
22 matter. So we're--I'm really proud of our youth for--
23 for standing up and I just want to thank you guys for
24 taking the time and--and presenting me with this.
25 It's--it's heartfelt, it's meaningful, and if I can, I

2 would—would hug and embrace each and everyone of you
3 for this. [cheers/applause]

4 MALE SPEAKER: We'll pause.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We're on real
6 time.

7 DAVID ARCHAMBAULT: That's all I have to
8 say.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Well, Chairman I—
10 I again want to thank you for your courage, and—and
11 for all those that you represent as well, and it's
12 important that we really become familiar with this
13 issue because the mainstream media is not covering it
14 as extensively as they should, and right now for that
15 independent media that has also been diligent in
16 covering this issue, they've been suffering in terms
17 of their First Amendment Rights as well, and the
18 freedom of being to report on this issues. Some
19 being threatened with imprisonment, et cetera. So
20 this is important, and all struggles are linked. You
21 know we can relate to the struggle of your people,
22 and we stand united in that because there are
23 communities across this country and in other parts as
24 well that are—are—are facing similar challenges. So
25 it is through unity, the coalition building, the

2 solidarity that we can really advance a just cause.

3 So thank you so much for your leadership.

4 [cheers/applause] [background comments]

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I would
6 encourage—I think we—we—the Chairman is available to
7 the media. We're going to have him in the Committee
8 Room for a little bit so that any media that would
9 like to talk to him has the ability to interact. We
10 really would encourage the media to cover this issue
11 so that we can continue to raise the visibility of-of
12 this cause. Thank you. [pause] [background
13 comments]

14 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All non-Council staff
15 please make your way up to the balcony, non-Council
16 staff please make you way up to the balcony.
17 [background comments, pause] Could I have your
18 attention, please. Can I pleas have your attention.
19 Quiet on the floor, please. [applause] Quiet on the
20 floor. At this time, please place-quiet on the
21 floor, please.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet on the
23 floor.

24 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [off mic] Quiet,
25 please.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet on the
3 floor, please. May we have quiet on the floor.
4 Please listen to the sergeant at arms for
5 instructions.

6 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: At this time, please
7 place all electronic devices to vibrate. Will all
8 non-Council employees, non-Council employees please
9 leave the main floor of the Chambers. There's
10 additional seating upstairs in the balcony. Thank
11 you.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [off mic] All
13 rise for the Pledge of Allegiance.

14 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [off mic] [Pledge
16 of Allegiance]

17 EVANGELINE DORINA FIGUEROA: [singing
18 Black National Anthem] [applause]

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: On behalf of the
21 Black, Latino and Asian Caucus, I would like to thank
22 you for joining us to salute the Black National
23 Anthem. Alongside the US Pledge of Allegiance as a
24 symbol of solidarity with communities of color around
25 the country who disproportionately suffer from

2 inequity and institutional racism. We as leaders
3 have a duty to confront bigotry, and we choose to do
4 so-do so through unifying action even in the face of
5 divisive rhetoric. This action is only a small part
6 of the Council's work on these issues, and we are
7 proud to stand here with you all to affirm the
8 dignity and protection of all communities in America.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We would like to
10 thank Evangeline Doring Figueroa, the First Lady of
11 New Life Tabernacle Church for that wonderful
12 rendition. Roll Call.

13 FEMALE SPEAKER: Oh, wait.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Okay. [pause]

15 FEMALE SPEAKER: [Speaking Spanish]

16 FEMALE SPEAKER: [Speaking Chinese]

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Again, we'd like
18 to thank Evangeline Doring Figueroa, the First Lady
19 of New Life Tabernacle Church in the Borough of
20 Brooklyn, and now roll call.

21 CLERK: Barron.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.

23 CLERK: Borelli. Cabrera. Chin.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

25 CLERK: Cohen.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

3 CLERK: Constantinides.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

5 CLERK: Cornegy.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Proudly present.

7 CLERK: Crowley.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [off mic] Here.

9 CLERK: Cumbo.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Present.

11 CLERK: Deutsch.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Though. (sic)

13 CLERK: Dickens.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Thank you, Madam

15 Speaker and present.

16 CLERK: Dromm.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

18 CLERK: Espinal.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.

20 CLERK: Eugene. Ferreras-Copeland.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND:

22 Present.

23 CLERK: Garodnick.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.

25 CLERK: Gentile.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.

3 CLERK: Gibson.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I'm here.

5 CLERK: Greenfield. Grodenchik.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: [off mic] I'm
7 here.

8 CLERK: Johnson.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Here.

10 CLERK: Kallos.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

12 CLERK: King.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [off mic] Present.

14 CLERK: Koo.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

16 CLERK: Koslowitz.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: [off mic]

18 Here.

19 CLERK: Lancman. Lander.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here

21 CLERK: Levin.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

23 CLERK: Levine.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

25 CLERK: Maisel.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.

3 CLERK: Mealy.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Present.

5 CLERK: Menchaca.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.

7 CLERK: Mendez.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

9 [shushing for quiet]

10 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [off mic] Keep it
11 down, please.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Present.

13 CLERK: Miller. Palma. Reynoso.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Present.

15 CLERK: Richards.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

17 CLERK: Rodriguez.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [off mic]

19 Here.

20 CLERK: Rose.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [off mic] Here.

22 CLERK: Rosenthal.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

24 CLERK: Salamanca.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.

2 CLERK: Torres. Treyger.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

4 CLERK: Ulrich. Vacca.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.

6 CLERK: Vallone.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

8 CLERK: Williams.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Wills.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: I'm present. Can
11 somebody come help me with this thing?

12 CLERK: Matteo, Van Bramer.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

14 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] Here.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
17 Chambers please.

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down, please.
19 Keep it down.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All rise for the
21 Invocation delivered by-

22 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise-

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: For the

24 Invocation delivered by Pastor Malobe Sampson of

25 Thessolonia Baptist Church located at 951 Reverend

2 James A. Polite Avenue in the great borough of the
3 Bronx. [applause]

4 PASTOR MALOBE SAMPSON: Let us pray.
5 Gracious and kind Heavenly Father, we come to say
6 thank you for life, health and strength that has been
7 bestowed upon this great body, and upon all who are
8 here. And we pray, oh, God, that you would unite
9 this body to carry out the task, oh, God, of
10 ministering and helping the people of this great city
11 of New York. Comfort us, oh, God. Keep us together.
12 Let not one life be valued above another, but let all
13 be treated equally, oh, God. Now Father, we ask that
14 your presence come upon us even now. Give us
15 compassion, give us love, bring your great joy into
16 this arena that the people would know, oh, God that
17 your presence is here. Bless us now. Unite us as
18 one. In Jesus name we pray. Everyone said amen.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amen. Please be
20 seated. And now a motion to spread the Invocation.
21 Council Member Salamanca.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you,
23 Madam Public Advocate. I'm thrilled that we're
24 joined here today by Pastor Malobe Sampson of the-

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Excuse me,
3 Council Member. May we have quiet in the Chambers,
4 please?

5 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down. Quiet.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
7 Chambers. I apologize Council Member.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you. I
9 am proud that we're here joined today by Pastor
10 Malobe Sampson of the Thessalonia Worship Center in
11 my district of South Bronx.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
13 [shushing for quiet]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Dr. Sampson
15 has been a steadfast of advocate of families in my
16 community, the city and, in fact, the world
17 particularly through his work in eliminating
18 worldwide poverty. Along with his work in the Bronx
19 for over 20 years, Past Sampson has also been working
20 for almost a decade in Africa with over 15 trips in
21 and out of Guyana and over several other West African
22 countries spreading the word of God and helping the
23 less fortunate. Here at home, he has also worked to
24 help-to help those in need, including through soup
25 kitchens, food pantries and other initiatives.

2 Needless to say, Pastor Sampson is rock star, and
3 just recently his church was named the best place to
4 worship in the Bronx. With that said, I am so
5 pleased that we are able to have such a great member
6 of my community to lead us without invocation. Thank
7 you for being here, Dr. Sampson.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
9 Adoption of Minutes, Council Member Ferreras-
10 Copeland.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Motion
12 that the minutes of the Stated Meeting of September
13 28, 2016 be adopted as printed. Thank you.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Messages and
15 Papers from the Mayor.

16 CLERK: Preconsidered M456 submitting
17 Kenneth Mitchell for appointment to the Taxi and
18 Limousine Commission.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I'm still
20 learning this thing. Rules, Privileges and
21 Elections.

22 CLERK: M457, Maritime Lease.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Land Use.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication
25 from City, County and Borough Offices.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

36

2 CLERK: None.

3 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and
4 communications.

5 CLERK: None.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land use Call-
7 Ups. Quiet in the Chambers, please.

8 CLERK: M458 and 459.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Roll call.

10 CLERK: Barron.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [off mic] Yes.

12 CLERK: Borelli.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Permission to
14 vote—to vote on all general items—General Order items
15 and Land Use items.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, Council
17 Member.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

20 CLERK: Cabrera. Chin.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

22 CLERK: Cohen.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I vote aye on all
24 Land Use Call-Ups and with permission, and with
25

2 permission I'd like vote aye on all items on the
3 General Orders Calendar.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes

5 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you. I vote
6 aye on all.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Quiet
8 in the Chambers, please. We're in roll call.

9 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down.

10 CLERK: Constantinides.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.

12 CLERK: Cornegy.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Proudly present.

14 CLERK: Crowley.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye.

16 CLERK: Crowley.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye.

18 CLERK: Cumbo.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye.

20 CLERK: Deutsch.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: [off mic] Aye.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Is
23 your mic on, Council Member? Oh, I'm sorry.

24 CLERK: Dickens.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: [off mic]

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

3 CLERK: Dromm.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

5 CLERK: Espinal.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: [off mic] Aye.

7 CLERK: Eugene.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

9 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Aye.

11 CLERK: Garodnick.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

13 CLERK: Gentile.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye.

15 CLERK: Gibson.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Aye.

17 CLERK: Greenfield.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Yes.

19 CLERK: Grodenchik. Johnson.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I vote aye.

21 CLERK: Kallos.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

23 CLERK: King. Koo.

24

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote aye and Madam
3 Public Advocate with permission I would like to vote
4 on all general orders and land use call-ups.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, council
6 Member.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote aye.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 CLERK: Koslowitz.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.

11 CLERK: Lancman, Lander, Levin.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Levin.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Yes.

14 CLERK: Levine.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

16 CLERK: Maisel. Mealy.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye.

18 CLERK: Menchaca.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.

20 CLERK: Mendez.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

22 CLERK: Miller.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye.

24 CLERK: Palma. Reynoso.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

2 CLERK: Richards.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

4 CLERK: Rodriguez. Rose.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [off mic] Aye.

6 CLERK: Rosenthal.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye.

8 CLERK: Salamanca.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I would like
10 to vote aye on all call-ups and with permission I
11 would like to vote on all call-up general orders and
12 resolutions.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I Vote aye on
15 all. Thank you.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Quiet
17 in the Chambers, please.

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down please.

19 Keep it down.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

21 [shushing for quiet]

22 CLERK: Torres. Treyger.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

24 CLERK: Vacca.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye.

2 CLERK: Vallone.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Madam Advocate,
4 may I have permission to vote aye on all matters on
5 today's calendar, call-ups and general orders.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you very
8 much.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

10 CLERK: Williams. Wills.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Aye.

12 CLERK: Matteo, Van Bramer.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Yes.

14 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I vote aye.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Today's Land Use
17 Call-Ups were adopted by a vote of 48 in the
18 affirmative and 0 in the negative. Quiet in the
19 Chambers, please.

20 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down please.
21 Keep it down.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please keep your
23 conversations to a minimum as we now hear from the
24 Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

25

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madam
3 Public Advocate. No, I think I-I-we're all playing
4 around with these Tablets. I know that people have
5 noticed that one of the major things today is this
6 pilot and there's no paper on our desk. There is
7 minimal paper on our desk, and we're still coming and
8 becoming accustomed to-to these-to these Tablet, but
9 Buenos tardes, good afternoon to everyone. I'm
10 really happy to announce an initiative to both
11 modernize the way this Council works and reduce paper
12 use. At today's State Meeting my colleagues and I
13 will be able to use the surface tablets to view and
14 search documents that typically reach or pass a stack
15 of 50 pages per member per meeting. In the spring,
16 we tested the use of tablets and Q-R codes for
17 documents during one of Council Member Jimmy Vacca's
18 Technology Committee hearings. The integration of
19 Tablets allows us to get feedback from members on how
20 to strengthen their experience with these devices.
21 These tests will also allow us to lay the groundwork
22 for a public experience with hearing and meetings.
23 I'm also pleased to mention that we have digital
24 kiosks for the public in the works, and that you will
25 also see members using tablets at upcoming hearings

2 including at tomorrow's Committee on Sanitation
3 hearing. I would like to thank Microsoft
4 specifically John Paul Farmer. He's here with us
5 today. Thank you, John, for loaning us the tablets
6 and other equipment and making this historic digital
7 Stated Meeting possible. We're really pleased to be
8 working with you, with Microsoft, and looking forward
9 to the progress with regards to—to the use of
10 technology as a way of reducing paper and being
11 environmentally friendly. I also want to recognize
12 the research planning and execution involved in
13 making today's test happen. I want to thank Laurie
14 Quinones, who is actually walking around giving us
15 technical assistance as we are trying to figure this
16 out as well as our public Tech Team, IT Division and
17 Sergeant-at-Arms and Legislative staff. Thank you
18 for all—all your assistance and diligence. This
19 Saturday, October 29th, marks four years since
20 Hurricane Sandy made landfall, and devastated
21 communities across New York City and the Greater
22 Eastern Seaboard. We will never forget the lives
23 lost to the hurricane, or how New Yorkers came
24 together in the days and weeks that followed. Our
25 neighborhoods at Breezy Point, the Rockaways and

2 Coney Island among others are still working to
3 rebuild, and we at the City Council affirm our
4 commitment to aiding that process--

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
6 [shushing for quiet]

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --inasmuch as
8 we're able to including legislation approval today.
9 I would also like to highlight some resolutions and
10 proclamations being addressed today. We have with us
11 today the family of Briana Ojeda. Briana was an 11-
12 year-old Brooklynite who suffered a fatal asthma
13 attack in 2010. An NYPD Officer who was present at
14 the scene was unable to render aid as he was not
15 sufficiently trained in CPR procedure. The
16 unfortunate experience of the Ojeda family prompted
17 by Briana's loss, a measure to require law
18 enforcement officers to receive training, retraining
19 on CPR techniques every two years. While this
20 measure has passed the State Assembly, it has yet to
21 be passed by the New York State Senate. The Council
22 today recognizes the important advocacy of the Ojeda
23 family, and extends our sympathies for their loss as
24 we stand by them in calling on the New York State
25 Legislature to pass and the Governor to sign Brian's

2 Law. I want to thank Deepa Ambekar and Laurie Wenn,
3 Staff that worked on this issued and the advocacy of
4 Council Member Steve Levin who will say a few words.

5 [pause]

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
7 Levin.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Well, he must
9 have stepped out. I guess we can have him say a few
10 words when he returns. Also, I want to—I want to
11 thank my colleagues who were all here. Obviously, we
12 were joined earlier by Chairman Dave Archambault of
13 the Standing Rock Sioux Tribe. I don't know if
14 people noticed, but he got very emotional towards of
15 the end in—in terms of the solidarity that this
16 Council is expressing to him, and his tribe. And the
17 Standing Rock Sioux Tribe, as indicated, the tribe of
18 Standing Bull. The Standing Rock Sioux are not
19 unfamiliar strife. Today, the face an imposition on
20 their land and safety as the federal government
21 fights to route the Dakota Access or a pipeline
22 through their reservation. So the Proclamation
23 deliver to the Chairman today and to the Standing
24 Rock Sioux Tribe reiterates the support than many of
25 us feel regarding their autonomy and keeping this

2 pipeline off of tribal lands. And finally, I don't
3 know did Steve come back.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Okay, but before
6 I say my final words here, if Council Member Steven
7 Levin could speak a little bit to the reso and the
8 family that is here.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, Madam
10 Speaker. I am very pleased that the Council will be
11 voting today on two pieces of legislation in honor of
12 one of my constituents Briana Amarillas Ojeda who
13 passed away in 2010 after suffering an asthma attack.
14 The police officer who accompanied Briana to the
15 hospital did not perform potentially life saving CPR
16 because he did not feel qualified to do so, and
17 that's—that's what he is saying. Last month, Briana
18 would have celebrated her 18th birthday. New York's
19 first responders must have the highest quality life
20 saving certifications. This legislation will
21 increase-increase transparency of our training by
22 requiring the NYPD to publish an annual report on the
23 number of police officers and school safety agents
24 receiving CPR and AED Certification. I want to
25 acknowledge the NYPD for instituting a new basic life

2 support curriculum for first responders in January
3 that includes training involved in instances of CPR
4 and AUD use. This legislation will ensure that the
5 city's first responders will receive--will be
6 receiving consistent and ongoing training. I want to
7 thank the Speaker, Melissa Mark-Viverito and Public
8 Safety Chair Vanessa Gibson for helping move forward
9 these critical bills. The other is a resolution in
10 support of Briana's Law, which would require--

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
12 [shushing for quiet]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: --the ongoing
14 recertification for police officers across New York
15 State is in support with legislation in Albany. Most
16 importantly, I want to acknowledge the family of
17 Briana Ojeda, who are here with us today including
18 her father, her mother, he brother and her
19 grandparents who have done a really incredible job
20 advocating for their daughter's memory ensuring that
21 no family has to go through what you have gone
22 through and you're making a positive impact on our
23 city and our state and I commend you for the work
24 that you continue to do. Thank. [applause]

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Steve,
3 and finally, a few moments ago as this Council came
4 together to sing a portion of Lift Every Voice and
5 Sing, the Black National Anthem, the song written by
6 James Weldon Johnson was also the title of my first
7 State of the City. I commend the Black, Latino,
8 Asian Caucus and leaders Cornegy and Torres for
9 bringing us together in a meaningful way. Johnson
10 was a poet, an activist, and was a member of the
11 Harlem Renaissance. The gorgeous Johnson Center,
12 which is in my district in East Harlem bears his
13 name. His lyrics written more than a century ago,
14 still ring true today, lyrics of hope of struggle and
15 of resilience. We are clearly in a difficult moment
16 in our city and our nation's history, but together,
17 and only together can we build the coalitions to
18 reach the higher ground we know we're capable of. We
19 can and we will change our communities for the
20 better. So I ask members of this Council let us
21 much-march on until victory is run.

22 Moving on, we have a full agenda today,
23 so I want to get started on that. First for Land
24 Use, the Council will vote on a rezoning application
25 to facilitate a new affordable housing project on

2 147th Street between Austin Place and Southern
3 Boulevard in my district. The approval of this
4 application would allow for a developer to construct
5 a building featuring at least 165 units of affordable
6 housing with income and requirements ranging from as
7 low as \$25,000 to \$80,000 per year for a family of
8 four. The Council has modified this application to
9 ensure lower AMI units in order to address the needs
10 of the very low income and more moderate income
11 residents of the community. Applications like these
12 are important steps for neighborhoods like the Mott
13 Haven community of the South Bronx, which has long
14 seen a lack of investment. As a Council Member for
15 this district, I am pleased to see a project that
16 speaks to the needs of our residents. I would like
17 to thank—take a moment to recognize that we are
18 today—hold on a second sorry—and then moving on to—to
19 the date on—on this our last Stated before Election
20 Day we will be voting on two pieces of legislation
21 regarding voter registration forms and absentee
22 ballots. Introduction 796 sponsored by Council
23 Member Cost Constantinides, addressed the decrease in
24 New York City organ donation enrollment by seeking to
25 increase the number of people volunteering for the

2 Organ Donation Registry. Agencies covered under the
3 agency based voter registration law will be required
4 to assist the public in completing the organ donation
5 section of the registration form. And Introduct-
6 Introduction 464-A sponsored by Council Member Ruben
7 Wills enhances a current law requiring the Department
8 of Correction to distribute and provide assistance in
9 complete voter registration forms by further
10 requiring the Department of Corrections to distribute
11 absentee ballot applications, and absentee ballots to
12 registered voters who are incarcerated. The
13 Department would also be required to provide
14 assistance in completing the forms and submitting
15 those to the New York City Board of Elections for any
16 primary, special or general election. First of all,
17 if Council Member Cost Constantinides could speak to
18 his bill.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank
20 you, Madam Speaker and thank you for your leadership.
21 I ask my colleagues today to join me in supporting
22 Intro 796-A. There are over 9,000 in New York City
23 Metropolitan area, and nearly 120,000 total in the
24 United States waiting for a heart, lung, kidney or
25 pancreas. In the State of New York, ever 18 hours

2 someone dies waiting for a life saving organ
3 transplant. Tens of thousands of people are forced
4 to spend to their lives wondering if today is the day
5 that they'll get the call that will save their life,
6 or whether today will be the day to become the next
7 victim of this crisis. This is despite the creation
8 of New York State Donor Life Legislation in 2006 that
9 allows New Yorkers to legally consent to their organ
10 donations. We have consistently had one of the
11 lowest-lowest organ donation rates in the country.
12 According to Live On New York, formerly the New York
13 Organ Donor Network, we're at the bottom, 50 out of
14 50 on the national list. We need all hands on deck
15 to tackle this crisis. That's why 796 is so
16 important. It builds on previous legislation
17 including Local Law 63 of 2014 by friend and
18 colleagues Ben Kallos by explicitly requiring
19 agencies to assist New Yorkers with fill out organ
20 donation applications upon request. At any point
21 that a member of the public interacts with one of our
22 over two dozen agencies, they'll be directed to the
23 Organ Donor form that comes with their voter
24 registration card. Agencies will then be responsible
25 for returning the form to the Board of Elections, and

2 the State Board of Health. Surveys show that 90% of
3 the public supports organ donations, but only 24% of
4 New Yorkers are actually registered. Becoming an
5 organ donor can save lives. I know from experience.
6 Over 16 years ago, my wife suffered renal failure,
7 and she went on the donor list for both a pancreas
8 and a kidney. Thankfully, in 1999, she received a
9 kidney from her mother, and in 2000 a pancreas from a
10 victim of a car accident who graciously signed up to
11 be an organ donor. I have the—the great pleasure now
12 of having a 7-year-old son because of that.

13 [applause] Later, she would tell me the agonizing
14 fear that gripped her as she waited to find out
15 whether that was the day would be the day that she
16 got the phone call to save her life, or whether that
17 would be the day she joined one of the 21 people who
18 died every day waiting for an organ. That's what
19 this bill is all about. Just one organ can save up
20 to eight lives or save or heal up over 100 through
21 tissue donation. It's not often that we have an
22 opportunity to save literally dozens of lives, but by
23 taking the time to fill out this form, we can. I
24 want to thank Live On New York for their strong
25 advocacy. I want to thank our Speaker, my—our—

2 Governmental Operations Chair Ben Kallos, staff
3 Attorney Brad Reed, and all of my Council colleagues
4 for joining me in combatting this health issue.
5 Thank you.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Costa.
7 Thank you for sharing that personal experience and
8 for your leadership on this. It's pretty sad to hear
9 that we're so low on that list in terms of
10 enrollment. I know that on both my license and on
11 Muni ID I am an organ donor. I have enrolled. I
12 hope people will consider that after hearing today we
13 have not done so. It really is important and it does
14 save lives, and—and then the next bill, which also
15 has to do with voting at least in terms of enrollment
16 we have both the co-chairs—I mean the—the co-sponsors
17 of that bill. We have Council Member Wills and
18 Council Member Cornegy who will say a few words.
19 [pause]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Thank you Madam
21 Speaker. In 1974, the United States Supreme Court
22 ruled that any jailed individual awaiting trial or
23 convicted of a misdemeanor is eligible to vote via
24 absentee ballot. Yet, most incarcerated persons are
25 not aware of this constitutional right. Negligence

2 and complacency has condemned these men and women who
3 are mostly of color to what is known as civil death,
4 essentially stripping them of their last vested as
5 members of society and diminishing the probability
6 that they will seek to reintegrate with our
7 community. So I am grateful that the Council will be
8 voting today on the bill that me and others have
9 sponsored, Intro 4224, which will require the
10 Department of Corrections sot promote absentee voting
11 amongst those individuals. This bill would require
12 the DOT to provide absentee ballot applications, and
13 forms to inmates that registered to vote, and forward
14 them completed items it receives to the City Board of
15 Elections within five days. The necessary materials
16 must be provided no later than two weeks prior to any
17 primary, special or general election. The daily
18 absentee voting will begin to change the course of
19 that history, but even that after today more work
20 must be done to enfranchise these citizens when
21 nearly 100,000 of the State of New York who have a
22 felony conviction continue to be deprived of that
23 basic right. I also urge the full body to vote in
24 favor of the bill Reso 870 calling on the State to
25 restore voting rights for felony conviction parolees

2 and those released from custody, which I am product
3 to co-sponsor with Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez
4 and Ben Kallos. I would love to take this
5 opportunity to thank the Speaker, the staff that
6 worked so hard on this, the central staff members,
7 David Seitzer, Tanida Dishmuck, Brad Reed, Rachel
8 Podero, Rod Philandra, Matt Gewolb, Laura Popa, Rob
9 Newman and Ramon Martinez as well as my staff Leslie
10 Patterson, Jihad Roth (sic), my former Legislative
11 Director Tanika Holden and my current director
12 Brandon Clark. Thank you very much, Madam Speaker.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: So just to
14 reiterate and to be very clear, people in jailed,
15 detained while awaiting trial or convicted of a
16 misdemeanor non-disenfranchising felony crime have
17 the right to vote. This bill is supported by
18 respected organizations like Common Core's Legal Aid
19 Society, Citizens Union and New York City Campaign
20 Finance Board, NYPRIG and the NYCLU. Most detainees
21 often do not realize that they have right to vote
22 through this means and, according to the United
23 States Bureau of Justice half the people jailed in
24 2014 were racial or ethnic minorities—

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
3 [shushing for quiet]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: -35% black, 15%
5 Hispanic, and according to the Department of
6 Corrections, on an average day in late 2015, there
7 were 9,830 inmates in New York City jails. Fifty-
8 four percent of them were Black, 34% Hispanics, 7%
9 White, 1.5% Asian, 93% male and 6.4% were female.
10 Thank you.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you. So
12 our next piece of legislation regards a pressing
13 issue in our seaside communities, amendments to the
14 Build-it-Back Disaster Recovery Program. Some owners
15 of homes damaged during Hurricane Sandy have been
16 unable to repair and rebuild because of issues with
17 the permitting process. For example, in many cases
18 owners cannot do repairs until they correct existing
19 issues with their home even if the home is going to
20 be fully demolished and rebuilt. The City Council
21 will vote on legislation to give these homeowners a
22 pathway to immediate restarts of repairs and our
23 relation and a relation worth being.

24 Intro 1341 sponsored by Council Member
25 Mark Treyger would allow full demolitions in

2 elevations of one to four-family dwellings to proceed
3 even where an existing violation or other condition
4 may have delayed such work. The bill applies only
5 where such work is being funded under the Build-it-
6 Back program through a contract held by the
7 Department of Environmental Protection, the
8 Department of Design and Construction or the
9 Department of Housing Preservation and Development.

10 On the staff side I want to really want
11 to thank Malika Diwali, William Murray and John
12 Seltzer. Council Member Mark Treyger has been a real
13 leader on this issue and has held a great oversight
14 hearing. Thank you for that and he'll say a few
15 words about the bill.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you,
17 Speaker, for your leadership and for all of your
18 support. This is a measure that will literally help
19 hundreds of families seek expedited work towards the
20 recovery of their homes and their lives, and for
21 their families and neighborhoods. This measure does
22 a couple of things that are really critical to
23 expedite this recovery. Number one, if moved-if back
24 loads the permitting process so that bureaucracy
25 didn't stand in the way to demolish homes that have

2 been staying dormant really for months, if no years,
3 post-Hurricane Sandy. These are homeowners that are
4 paying a mortgage on a home that they don't live in
5 while shelling out money to pay for rent in a
6 temporary location. These are families that are most
7 vulnerable living check to check. So we are—I am so
8 grateful that we are moving this swiftly to make sure
9 that expedite the demolition of their homes that are
10 already unsafe, and also number 2, if there are—pre-
11 pre-existing violations or open permits on those
12 homes, they'll still have to be resolved, but they'll
13 be resolved at the end of the process, and not be a
14 barrier towards recovery. So I want to thank the
15 Speaker for her leadership. I want to thank Ramon
16 Martinez. I want to thank Gary Altman, Matt Gewold,
17 Ed Atkins, Malika Jabali (sp?), Bill Murray, Jonathan
18 Seltzer, Anna Scathe (sp?) from my office. I also
19 want to thank Mayor de Blasio and his administration
20 for partnering with—partnering with us on this
21 effort, and I ask my colleagues to please support the
22 measure. Thank you.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Mark.

24 Next, the Council will vote on an extensive
25 legislative package to increase oversight of the New

2 York City Foster Care System. This is something that
3 really hasn't been looked at in a while. So I'm
4 really glad that under this Council we're really
5 taking a look at a foster care system—and figure it—a
6 foster care system and figure how we can help the
7 people that are aging out of that system. These
8 bills originated from conversations with young people
9 who have been involved either currently or formerly
10 in a foster care system.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
12 [shushing for quiet]

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: The foster youth
14 Shadow Day in October 2015 gave our council members
15 the opportunity to speak directly with the youth that
16 would be affected by this legislation, and to learn
17 about their specific needs. We are actually joined
18 right now by several former foster youth who
19 participated in the program, and I would like to
20 thank them for their valuable insights on this
21 package of legislation. Are—are you still here? If
22 you're still here, you could stand a moment. Do you
23 want to stand a moment? Thank you. [applause] Thank
24 you for being here, and I know Steve will—will
25 mention who is here with us, and just thank you so

2 much. It really means a lot and know that your
3 advocacy and your engagement is leading to changes,
4 and what we're implementing today is a result of your
5 work. So thank you for that. I want to Tanya Cyrus,
6 Andrew Vasquez, Brittany Morrissey, Aca Schaumberg
7 and Terza Nasser on the staff side, to-to-to thank
8 them for the work that they've done on this. And I
9 want to invite Council Members Levin, Danny Dromm,
10 Donovan Richards, Laurie Cumbo and then our Public
11 Advocate to speak on their respective pieces of
12 legislation for this truly beneficial initiative. I
13 want to start off with Council Member Steven Levin.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very
15 much, Madam Speaker. Today, the Council has the
16 opportunity to pass a legislative package that will
17 include the foster care system for 10,000 children
18 and youth. This legislation would establish strategic
19 feedback systems, implement evidence-base permanency
20 planning, and expand reporting on health, education
21 and housing stability outcomes. I am proud to
22 sponsor this package of bills with my colleagues here
23 in the Council and the Public Advocate especially
24 legislation would require ACS to create three
25 consecutive five-year plans to address systemic areas

2 for placing children and youth with a permanent
3 family. As the Speaker said, one year ago the
4 Council hosted a foster care Shadow Day. Council
5 Members were paired with a young person in foster
6 care who had recently aged out of the system. That
7 experience for many of us was a lasting impression.
8 The insights that the youth share help shape some of
9 this legislation you're voting on today, and led to
10 increased dialogue at the Council about how we can
11 better serve young people who spend time in foster
12 care each year. And I want to acknowledge the
13 Speaker's words on the Young-Young Women's Initiative
14 from a budgetary perspective here at the Council.
15 Ultimately, the purpose of this legislation you're
16 voting on today is through public-through peace
17 public information and transparency improve the
18 outcomes for young people who are in foster care
19 especially those young people who are aging out of
20 the foster care system, and those who have been in
21 care for the longest. The reality is that the young
22 people who have been in care for large stretches of
23 their youth face—they face challenges that many of us
24 cannot truly understand. We have to do everything
25 that we can as a city to support these young people

2 and equip them with the resources that they need to
3 succeed. I sincerely want to thank the young people
4 that shared their stories with us. Their input has
5 been and continues to be critical to improving the
6 foster care system today, and for generations to
7 come. In particular, I would like to thank my
8 wonderful intern who you saw in the balcony, Ivan
9 Mendez and Anna Sanchez, as well as young people that
10 have joined us today, Rosie Williams and Brianna
11 Hayes and Annie Scene, and I also want to acknowledge
12 Donald Fields who—whose idea of the Shadow Day of the
13 Shadow Day started on this important path, and Donald
14 can't be here today because he's working as a
15 corrections officer now. So, thank you, Donald, very
16 much for all that you've done. Many providers and
17 advocates have generously contributed their time,
18 Stephanie Gendell of the Citizens Committee for
19 Children, Dustin Maxwell, the Children's Aid Society,
20 Jim Purcell of CASCA (sic) as well as the Red Hook
21 Horowitz Foundation. And finally, I want to thank
22 the Speaker for her stalwart leadership on this
23 issue. We are grateful to our Council staff who work
24 on this legislation, Andrea Vasquez, Tonya Cyrus,
25 Brittany Morrissey, Julie Barrow, Ed Paulina and

2 Jonathan Buchette. (sp?) I want to urge my
3 colleagues to support this legislative package.
4 Thank you very much, Madam Speaker.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Council
6 Member Levin. Council Member Dromm.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you, Madam
8 Speaker and thank you Chair Levin for helping to
9 advance this package of bills aimed at improving the
10 lives of youth who are experiencing or have
11 experienced foster care. I also want to acknowledge
12 the work of Committee Counsel Andrea Vasquez and
13 Sebastian McGuire. Finally, thanks to the ever
14 vigilant advocates whose analysis of the data
15 precipitated the drafting of Intro 1187-A. In 2014,
16 the Council passed and the Mayor signed into law what
17 would become Local Law 48. Our intention was to have
18 a clear picture of ACS' efforts to help youth
19 preparing to leave foster care specifically around
20 obtaining government issued identification. The law
21 requires reporting the number of youth in foster care
22 ages 17 or older who have obtained ID. However, the
23 law does not require reporting on the overall number
24 of youth in foster care age 17 or older making it
25 impossible to compare the numbers and get a sense of

2 the percentage of youth who were successfully
3 obtaining identification. Intro 1187-A will add the
4 overall number to give necessary context to the data.
5 Obtaining ID is a—is a significant part of preparing
6 youth for adulthood and now IDNYC makes this easier
7 than ever. HRA ,the administrating agency, listens
8 to the voices of the youth, their advocates in my
9 office, and as a result, IDNYC rules on provisions
10 that facilitate the issuance of cards for foster
11 youth age 14 and over. There is no excuse for these
12 youth to not obtain or possibly more forms of
13 government issued identification. To determine how
14 many youth has only form of ID, Intro 1187-A
15 specifies that the report should separate—should
16 separate out this particular category. Finally, to
17 facilitate the analysis of the data across the time,
18 this bill requires that the reports remain on ACS'
19 website permanently. I encourage all my colleagues
20 to vote today for Intro 1187-A and for the entire
21 package.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
23 Council Member Dromm. Council Member Richards.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
25 [shushing for quiet]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Good afternoon,
3 I'm proud to stand here today with Speaker Melissa
4 Mark-Viverito and my colleagues on this important
5 legislation which is essentially the standard applied
6 youth in the foster care system who are often
7 forgotten about. The fact that the bill is aimed at
8 improving the system, and it is a stark reminder that
9 the city of New York hears, and we promise to work
10 tirelessly to ensure that every child has someone
11 caring for them. After I participated in the Foster
12 Shadow Program last year, it became clear that we
13 needed to do more in the city to protect and improve
14 the lives of our foster children. That's why we
15 worked on Intro 11-9-1199-A, which requires all youth
16 in foster care ages 13 and over the opportunity to
17 fill out an anonymous survey about their experience
18 with their foster parents. This survey will help us
19 make sure that the only foster parents in our systems
20 are those who have the best interest of every child
21 in mind. It is truly heartbreaking to hear the
22 stories of foster youth being denied the simple
23 things most children take for granted such as having
24 access to food and clothing, permission to practice
25 their religion, internet and phone access and

2 personal allowances. This bill would ensure that
3 ACS-ACS submits a plan for implementation of this
4 survey within four months of an enactment, and the
5 first survey must be offered within a year. Then,
6 they must submit a semi-annual report of the findings
7 to the Council and post the data on its website. ACS
8 must also list any steps they have taken in response
9 to the data. Once again, I'd like to thank Speaker
10 Melissa Mark-Viverito, Chairman-Councilman Levin,
11 Andrea Vasquez in our Legislative Division, my
12 Director of Legislation Jordan Gibbons and the
13 Administration of Children Services for all of their
14 hard work in crafting this package of bills that will
15 surely go a long way toward the lives of foster
16 children. Thank you.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Council Member,
18 thank you, and Council Member Laurie Cumbo.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. I
20 would like to thank Speaker Melisa Mark-Viverito, co-
21 sponsors, advocates, those who worked on drafting
22 this bill to keep our children and our scholars on
23 pace towards a brighter future. The children in the
24 New York City Foster Care system are not those
25 children or these children, they are our children.

2 They are our responsibility, and graduating from high
3 school and then going off to college should not be a
4 miracle, but it should be a norm. There are
5 thousands of children that are our children in the
6 New York City foster care system. Foster care youth
7 often undergo a lifetime of traumatic experiences
8 within a short period of time, which can alter their
9 mental, emotional or social state. Intro 1285 will
10 enable us to better accept the academic progression
11 of high school aged youth in foster care by requiring
12 a report from ACS on their graduation rate. Each
13 report will disaggregate by age, gender, ethnicity,
14 age upon graduation, type of diploma, certification
15 received and number of years it took to complete high
16 school. The educational advancement of our youth
17 requires an in-depth look into the daily challenges
18 faced by our next generation leaders, thinkers,
19 influencers, entrepreneurs and young professionals.
20 We need to know how to cultivate their natural
21 ability to learn and strive for excellence. It is
22 our responsibility to end the stigma that is
23 associated with the foster care system, and reinforce
24 that every youth irrespective of their social-
25 economic status or background deserves and equal

2 opportunity to succeed as scholars and professionals.
3 With nearly 10,000 children and youth under the care
4 of the Administration of Children's Services, we must
5 ensure that proper resources are in place to support
6 the continued growth and development within and
7 beyond the foster care system. Thank you.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And Public
9 Advocate Letitia James.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. I
11 want to thank the Mayor, the Speaker, the committee
12 Chair Levin, as well as the sponsors of the other
13 bills and, of course, their excellent staff. I also
14 want to thank all of the advocates, the parents and
15 the young adults who have worked so hard on these
16 issues and giving us a better understanding of what I
17 needed to fix the broken system. For far too long,
18 many of our most vulnerable children gotten marked in
19 a system that is meant to protect them. There are
20 12,000 children and youth in foster care in our
21 system, many who are struggling everyday against
22 abuse—against abuse or malnourishment, against the
23 tallest of odds just to make it. Each year nearly
24 1,000 young people age out of foster care only to
25 enter back into City services because they weren't

2 given the tools to succeed, and unfortunately and
3 tragically and shamefully, some do not make it at
4 all. This bill today Intro 1197 aims to expand and
5 improve the reporting mechanisms of ACS, their annual
6 report and better compared the improvements being
7 made by the agencies to protect and share the youth
8 in foster care and youth aging out of the system.
9 Intro 1197 would also expand reporting on the number
10 of youth over 21 years of age who have aged out of
11 care, and who enter a homeless shelter or receive
12 financial assistance such as SNAP benefits. We
13 cannot afford to lose these children not to the cycle
14 of poverty, not to the streets, and as certainly, and
15 certainly not to a premature end and there must be more,
16 there be better, and today we take a step in the
17 right direction. Thank you Madam Speaker and thank
18 you members of the City Council.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Madam
20 Public Advocate, and finally, today the Council will
21 be voting to establish and enhance labor protections
22 for freelance workers. An estimated 1.3 million
23 freelance workers reside in New York City, and many
24 of these individuals routinely face difficulty
25 collecting payment for their services. Intro 1017-C

2 sponsored by Council Member Brad Lander would require
3 a written a contract for freelance services valued at
4 800 or more, \$800 or more, and hiring parties to pay
5 the freelance worker on time and in full according to
6 the terms of the contract or within 30 days of
7 completion of the work. It would also prevent
8 retaliation against freelance workers, and lays out
9 the damages that will result in violations of the
10 law. The bill would also require the Office of Labor
11 Standards to create a navigation program to provide
12 information and resources about the provisions of the
13 global law, and to gather data and report on the
14 effectiveness of the law and improving contracting
15 and payment practices in the freelance economy.

16 I want to thank on the staff side here
17 Labony Raman-Rockman, Wes Jones, Annie Decker, Lisa
18 Cordero, Matt Gewolb. We were laughing a little
19 earlier about the fee. I don't think I've ever seen
20 [laughs] I don't-amended version of a bill that gets
21 to a C, but that lets you know the level of work and
22 engagement. The sponsor of the bill has been a real
23 leader on this issue, and took a lot of input and
24 took time to make sure that we got it right. So

2 Council Member Lander, thank you for that, and with
3 that he'll—he'll say a few words about the bill.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, Madam
5 Speaker and for your support all throughout. Today,
6 by passing Intro 1017-C, the New York City Council
7 will become the first jurisdiction in the country,
8 city, state or federal, to provide strong—strong
9 protection for freelancers and independent
10 contractors against being stiffed, cheated out of
11 money that they're owed and worked hard for. As the
12 Speaker mentioned, there are 1.3 million freelancers
13 in New York City, and unfortunately according to a
14 survey by the Freelancers Union, 70% have experienced
15 theft of payment either not paid in full, forced to
16 accept half of what they are owed or paid months and
17 months later when their rent is due every month. We
18 heard story after story from people from like
19 Elizabeth McKenzie, a freelance film producer,
20 stiffed out of \$2,500 who had to live in the dark and
21 live on bread and water from a pattern maker in the
22 Bronx, and Just Ramona a similar story. Miaris
23 Nieblo was one of a couple of dozen writers and
24 editors cheated by a national publishing company out
25 of \$300,000 and on and on about abuses in the

2 publishing industry in the modeling industry, even
3 court reporters turn out to be freelance workers, and
4 several of them reported getting cheated. This
5 legislation will give them a strong protection
6 against being stiffed

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet
8 please.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: --by establishing
10 double damages.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
12 [shushing for quiet]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: --legal-lawyer's
14 fees and civil penalties, by establishing a complaint
15 procedure the Department of Consumer Affairs by
16 prohibiting retaliation, by requiring a written
17 contract. This law will make sure that all workers
18 can get paid on time and in full for the work that
19 they've done. As the Speaker mentioned, we did a lot
20 of work together. First, we had some great advocates
21 and I really want to shout out freelancers unions
22 that Horowitz, Tate and Peers (sp?), which I believe
23 instills there who brought freelancers together to
24 bring the two on its own. That's just a lot of
25 individual stories. Organized together that's a

2 union working together to make change, and then in
3 this Council with the leadership of the Speaker, with
4 big thanks to Consumer Affairs Committee Chair Rafael
5 Espinal, we listen to a lot of feedback from members,
6 from advocates, from the business community, from the
7 freelance community. There were indeed a lot of
8 changes from the first version the A version to the B
9 version to the C version that I think makes the bill
10 a lot better. I won't enumerate them here, but if
11 people want the list, we made a lot of changes that I
12 think strengthen this. So any time you're doing
13 something that's the first in the country, you've got
14 to think it through, and try to as much as possible
15 make sure that we've thought about all of the
16 consequences that will be there. That means a lot of
17 thank yous. When the Speaker mentioned Matt Gewolb,
18 Annie Decker, Rachel Cordero, Wes Jones and Lobany
19 Rockman, the Committee Chair, they were up late on
20 two aging nights and four versions and lots of
21 thoughtful lawyering. So big, big thanks to them. I
22 want to thank the Progressive Caucus for their
23 support, the Public Advocate for her support, early
24 support from Council Members Levin, Johnson, Cumbo,
25 Chin and many, many others. Advocates, not just the

2 Freelancer's Union, but included the National
3 Employment Law Project, SIEU 32 BJ, Brooklyn Chamber
4 of Commerce, the New York Tech Meet-Up, Make the Road
5 and many others, and in my office a big, big thanks
6 to Annie Levers, my Policy Director, Rachel Goodman,
7 John Schaeffer and my form leg director Ben Smith.
8 We also had a very good experience working with the
9 new DCA Commissioner Lorelei Salas and the new
10 Director of the Office of Labor Standards and Policy
11 with Gladys (sic), Madam Speaker that office has
12 stood up by legislation that you sponsored, and they
13 are going to do a great job of implementing this
14 legislation and making it genuinely makes sure that
15 all workers get paid for the work they've worked hard
16 to do, and that the payment that they deserve. So,
17 thanks very much to all my colleagues.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Brad,
19 and with that I end the communication from the
20 Speaker.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
22 Discussion of General Orders. Council Member Barron.
23 Okay. Seeing none, Report of Special Committees.

24 CLERK: None.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Report of
3 standing committees.

4 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
5 Consumer Affairs, Intro 1017-C, Freelance Workers.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended coupled
7 on General Orders.

8 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
9 Finance, Intro 1242, JFK BID.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
11 General Orders.

12 CLERK: Preconsidered Reso 1259, Queens
13 Plaza BID.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
15 General Orders.

16 CLERK: Preconsidered Reso 1260,
17 Organization Funding.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
19 General Orders.

20 CLERK: Preconsidered LU 504 and Reso
21 1261, Villa Gardens.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
23 General Orders.

24

25

2 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
3 General Welfare, Intro 1187-A, Government Issued
4 Identification for Youth.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Among--Amended
6 and coupled on General Orders.

7 CLERK: Intro 1190-A, Foster Care Report.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
9 coupled on General Orders.

10 CLERK: Intro 1191-A, Five-Year Plan to
11 address barriers to permanency and foster care.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
13 coupled on General Orders.

14 CLERK: Intro 1192-A, Foster Care Task
15 Force.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
17 coupled on General Orders.

18 CLERK: Intro 1197-A, Youth and Foster
19 Care Information.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
21 coupled on General Orders.

22 CLERK: Intro 1199-A, Foster Care
23 Surveys.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
25 coupled on General Orders.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

77

2 CLERK: Intro 1205-A, Graduation Rates of
3 Youth in Foster Care.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
5 coupled on General Orders.

6 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
7 Governmental Operations, Intro 464-A, Absentee Voting
8 Among Jailed Individuals.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
10 coupled on General Orders.

11 CLERK: Intro 796-A, Organ Donors and the
12 Voter Registration Program.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
14 coupled on General Orders.

15 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Land
16 Use, LU 428 and Reso 1263, Property Tax Exemption.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
18 General Orders.

19 CLERK: LU 470 and Reso 1264 Unenclosed
20 sidewalk café.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
22 General Orders.

23 CLERK: LU 471 and Reso 1265, enclosed
24 sidewalk café.

25

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled to be
3 filed pursuant to letter of withdrawal.

4 CLERK: LU 493 and Reso 1266, Landmark
5 designation.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
7 General Orders.

8 CLERK: LU 494 and Reso 1267, Zoning Map
9 Amendment.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
11 General Orders.

12 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Public
13 Safety, Intro 83-A, CPR Reporting.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
15 coupled on General Orders.

16 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
17 Recovery and Resiliency, Preconsidered Intro 1341
18 Build-it-Back Program

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
20 General Orders with a message of necessity.

21 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Rules,
22 Privileges and Elections, M449 and Reso 1268
23 approving the appointment of Laurie Hawkinson, Art
24 Commission.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 79

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
3 General Orders.

4 CLERK: Preconsidered M456 and Reso 1269
5 approving the appointment of Kenneth Mitchell to Taxi
6 and Limousine Commission.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
8 General Orders.

9 CLERK: On the Genera Order Calendar-
10 Calendar, LU 475 and Reso 1270, Mandatory
11 Inclusionary Housing.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
13 General Orders.

14 CLERK: LU 476 and Reso 1271, Zoning Map
15 Amendment.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
17 General Orders.

18 CLERK: LU 489 and Reso 1272, Zoning
19 Resolution Amendment.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
21 General Orders.

22 CLERK: Resolution appointing various
23 persons Commissioner of Deeds.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
25 General Orders, and at this time, I ask for a roll

2 call on all items on the Coupled General Order
3 Calendar>

4 CLERK: Barron.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to
6 explain my vote.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

9 [pause] I couldn't get it from my—from my phone.
10 The new Infill—the new Infill on the SCHIFF (program,
11 NYHOP. This is not to be confused with the Next Gen
12 Infill project of NYCHA. The Blake Hendrix NYHOP is
13 composed of 13 sites scattered in East New York, the
14 lots the city own and will be transformed into nine
15 two-family homes and four three-family homes held in
16 30 units. It was originally designated in 2008 under
17 my predecessor former Council Member Charles Barron.
18 The owners who purchase these homes will commit to
19 remain in their homes for 20 years. The city will
20 provide that the property will be recorded to 0 after
21 20 years of owner occupancy. For most people, the
22 purchase of a home is the most expensive acquisition
23 they will make during their lifetime, and it is a
24 pathway to wealth that can be passed to succeeding
25 generations. I'm pleased to support this project,

2 429 and I just want to share with you what the rates
3 are. A three-family home will be affordable to
4 households earning \$56,000 a year. A six two-family
5 home will be affordable to households earing \$75,000
6 a year, and the three-family homes, four three-family
7 homes-

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
9 [shushing for quiet]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: --will be
11 affordable to households earning approximately
12 \$95,000 a year. This came about with a lot of back
13 and forth and wrangling and arguing, and fighting
14 with the city agencies, but we were able to reach
15 this amicable solution, and I want to thank the
16 following people who worked with several heated
17 discussions: Julie Lubin, Jordan Press, Benny Seitz,
18 Brian Paul, Jan Dobbs, Joyce Barnes, Sarah Dobbs,
19 Artie Pearson, Lynn Zwang, my Chief of Staff Joy
20 Simmons and Assembly Member Charles Barron, who
21 helped negotiated that as you can well imagine. So I
22 want to urge all of you to vote in the affirmative,
23 by voting in the affirmative of all with the
24 exception of 493, on which I'm abstaining. Thank
25 you.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 CLERK: Cabrera

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye on all.

5 CLERK: Chin.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Congratulations to
7 my colleagues on this important legislation. I vote
8 aye on all.

9 CLERK: Constantinides.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye on
11 all.

12 CLERK: Cornegy.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye on all.

14 CLERK: Crowley.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye on all.

16 CLERK: Cumbo.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission to
18 explain my vote.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I want to
21 congratulate Council Member Brad Lander on the
22 passage of Intro 1017, which would make New York City
23 the first in the nation to protect freelancers—

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

25 [shushing for quiet]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: --and independent
3 workers who are often victims of non-payment. This
4 is also going to be tremendous good news for the arts
5 community, our sculptors, our painters, our
6 photographers, our DJs, make-up artists. This is
7 phenomenal legislation that's really going to make a
8 difference in their profession. Thank you and I vote
9 aye.

10 CLERK: Vacca.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I vote aye on all.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

13 CLERK: Deutsch.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye on all.

15 CLERK: Dickens. Dromm.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

17 CLERK: Espinal. With congratulations to
18 Brad Lander for his creativity, ingenuity in getting
19 this bill crafted and passed. I vote aye.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

21 CLERK: Eugene.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

23 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND:

25 Congratulations to all my colleagues. I vote aye.

2 CLERK: Garodnick.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

4 CLERK: Gentile.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: May I be excused
6 to explain my vote?

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Thank you. I
9 want to thank this Council for your support of LU
10 489, Reso 1272 on today's calendar. Your support
11 will help maintain the previous zoning in Brooklyn's
12 Community Board 10 by rescinding their participation
13 in Special Permit Section 72-62 of the Zoning
14 Resolution, which over the years has allowed that
15 zoning to be easily overridden. This action is
16 supported by Councilman Menchaca and also yours
17 truly. So I want to thank Raju Mann and the Land Us
18 staff, Chairman Greenfield and Chairman Richards and
19 I vote aye on all. Thank you.

20 CLERK: Gibson.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to
22 explain my vote.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Madam
25 Public Advocate and I certainly will be voting aye on

2 all and I want to congratulate all of our colleagues
3 who are passing incredibly and important legislation
4 related to foster care, the Build-it-Back program,
5 Voter Registration as well as protecting freelance
6 workers. But specifically, I wanted to commend
7 Council Member Steven Levin. Working with Briana
8 Ojeda's family and our hearing that we held several
9 weeks ago was just really heartfelt and warming to
10 see this strong family through their tragedy just
11 stand tall and—and really focus on advocacy and I was
12 very proud not just as chair, but as someone who
13 served in the Assembly to work with Assembly Member
14 Felix Ortiz, and making sure that this resolution
15 supporting Briana's Law in Albany as well as reports
16 concerning PPR and automated external defibrillator
17 training. Making sure that all police officers are
18 retrained in CPR every two years—

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
20 [shushing for quiet]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: --is absolutely
22 codified in local law, and I, too, want to join our
23 colleagues and Council Member Levin in commending
24 Briana's family, her parents, her siblings, her aunt
25 and uncle, and thank them for being here. Their

2 courage, their strength through such a tumultuous
3 time in their lives is certainly a testament to their
4 commitment, and I pledge to work with them--

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
6 [shushing for quiet]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: --and work with
8 Council Member Levin as the legislative process
9 begins in Albany in January to make sure that we can
10 really get Briana's Law codified in state law. So
11 with that, thank you Steve for your advocacy, for
12 just not--just making sure that this story is heard.
13 But we want to make sure that for the legacy of
14 Briana we do everything possible to make sure that
15 our police officers are equipped, knowledgeable and
16 experienced in administering CPR for the safety of
17 all New Yorkers, and with that I proudly eye on all.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

19 CLERK: Greenfield.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
21 Quiet in the Chambers.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Permission to
23 explain my vote.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes. Quiet in
25 the Chambers for Council Member Greenfield.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you,
3 Madam Public Advocate, and congratulations to all of
4 my colleagues. I vote aye on all with the exception
5 of Resolution 232-A, which I abstain. I want to
6 thank Council Member Lander for taking into serious
7 considerations some of the concerns that many of us
8 here had in making some significant changes that we
9 think improves the legislation. We still have some
10 minor concerns, but hopefully we can work through
11 those as well, and I think that overall it's good
12 legislation. I congratulate him on doing that as
13 well, and I also want to congratulate Laurie
14 Hawkinson, the appointment to the New York city Art
15 Commission. I want to thank her for taking the time
16 to chat with me specifically about our concerns about
17 how the Art Commission has run in the past, and her
18 commitment to more transparency and common sense
19 resolutions, and with that, like I said, I vote aye
20 on all with the exception of Resolution 232-A, which
21 I abstain. Thank you.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you

23 CLERK: Levine.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye on all.

25 CLERK: Grodenchik. Johnson.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye on all.

3 CLERK: Kallos.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: As the past and
5 future freelancer, I vote aye on all.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

7 CLERK: King.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I'd like to
9 congratulate all my colleagues for their own smart
10 legislation to improve the lives of all New Yorkers
11 and I vote on all.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

13 CLERK: Koslowitz.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I vote aye.

15 CLERK: Lancman.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

17 CLERK: Lander.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request
19 permission to explain my vote.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
21 [shushing for quiet] Yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thanks to all my
23 colleagues for their support, and I also just want to
24 join in giving a big shout out to Council Member
25 Levin on both of the things he's leading on today. I

2 remember when Briana died and I give this family
3 enormous credit, and also I thank Gretta for working
4 with them to find some way to bring some sort
5 learning to that for their child. And also not just
6 inviting foster care kids here, but then listening to
7 them and bringing that legislation to the floor is
8 really quite admirable. Thank you, Steve. I vote
9 aye on all.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11 CLERK: Levin.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Permission to
13 explain my vote.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: I want to thank
16 all of my colleagues for their support of these
17 pieces of legislation today, and I also wanted to
18 congratulate Council Member Lander on his work on the
19 Freelancers' bill. I think it's very important
20 legislation that will lead to more equity within our
21 city, and protection for very hard working New
22 Yorkers, who deserve a fair shake. Congratulations
23 Council Member Lander on--on all the hard work that he
24 did, and the Speaker for her leadership on getting

2 that bill passed. With that, I proudly vote aye on
3 all. Thank you very much.

4 CLERK: Maisel. Mealy.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye.

6 CLERK: Menchaca.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye on all.

8 CLERK: Mendez.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

10 CLERK: Miller.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye.

12 CLERK: Palma.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: [off mic] Palma.

14 CLERK: Reynoso.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

16 CLERK: Richards.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Permission to
18 explain my vote.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So for nearly

21 two years my office has been working with local

22 business owners and residents on informing the

23 Greater JFK Business Improvement District that is-

24 it's a complex assembly of private properties. The

25 JFK Airport cargo community is home to more than 600

2 business that provide supports for products and goods
3 going through JFK Airport and other major ports
4 annually. This commerce is not only essential to the
5 city's economy, but also plays a central role in the
6 daily lives of thousands of New Yorkers by also
7 providing a foundation for regional, national and
8 international economies at large. The proposed
9 district seeks to build upon the area's diversity and
10 major economic significance by serving as an
11 advocate—an advocate in providing supplemental
12 services and improvement that support a vision for a
13 strong industrial base, and improve quality of life
14 for all who live, work or visit near the airport. It
15 is a very proud moment for my community—community and
16 my office to finally get to this point, and I'd like
17 to thank the Spring Jam Block Association, UNCA,
18 Community Boards 12 and 13, Council Member Ruben
19 Wills and Chairwoman Julissa Ferreras and her
20 legislative counsel Rebecca Chasen for helping this
21 partnership, and for helping this plan to come
22 together, and with that I vote aye.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

24 CLERK: Thank you. Rodriguez.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] Aye.

2 CLERK: Rose.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye on all.

4 CLERK: Rosenthal.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye on all.

6 CLERK: Torres. Treyger.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: With

8 congratulations to all my colleagues I vote aye on

9 all.

10 CLERK: Ulrich.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Aye on all.

12 CLERK: Williams. Wills.

13 CLERK: Wills.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Aye on all.

15 CLERK: Matteo.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: No on 464, aye on

17 all.

18 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Van Bramer.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on all

20 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I vote aye.

22 [pause]

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All items on

24 today's General Order Calendar were adopted by a vote

25 of 51 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and 0

2 abstentions with the exception of Land Use 493 and
3 Resolution 1266, which was adopted by a vote of 60 in
4 the affirmative, 0 negative and 1 abstention, and
5 Intro 464-A, which was adopted by a vote of 60 in the
6 affirmative, 1 negative, and 1—and 0 abstentions, and
7 the Revised Land Use Call-Ups were adopted by a vote
8 of 61 in the affirmative, 0 negative. Introduction
9 and Reading of Bills.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All bills are
11 referred to committees as indicated on the agenda.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And now, we will
13 do resolutions beginning with Resolution 232-A, an
14 amended resolution calling upon the New York State
15 Legislature to pass and the Governor to sign into law
16 A-9108 and S-6452-A, which would amend the election
17 law to consolidate New York's federal, state and
18 local primaries into one primary, which would take
19 place on the fourth Tuesday of June, and I believe
20 the first speaker is Council Member Ferreras-
21 Copeland. Quiet in the Chambers please for council
22 Member--

23 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Please
24 keep it down.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: --Copeland.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Good
3 afternoon. The damage reducing in conjunction with
4 the Mayor and expansion of the PACE--

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: That's Reso--

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: No, she was
7 talking about general discussions or at the end?

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Seeing no one
9 else on resolution--seeing no one on Resolution 232,
10 all of those in favor say aye.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Yes, hell, yes.

12 [laughter]

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All of those--

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing] Too
15 many elections. Too many primaries.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Any with a hell
17 no? [laughter] Any abstentions? The ayes have it.
18 And now Resolution 281-A, an amended resolution
19 calling upon the Mayor of the City of New York to
20 create an annual student voter registration day, and
21 I believe the speaker is Council Member Rosenthal.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yes, and we--

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And what did you
24 say? And the next one. Okay, and the next
25 resolution she will also speak on is Resolution 695--

2 A, a resolution calling upon the New York State
3 Legislature to pass and the Governor to sign A-2529
4 and Senate 857 allowing 16 and 17-year-olds to pre-
5 register to vote and the floor now belongs to Council
6 Member Rosenthal.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you very
8 much, Madam Public Advocate. The Youth Voter
9 Participation rate reached its lowest level on record
10 in the 2014 election. We expect our public schools
11 to educate our children to be civically engaged.
12 It's a fundamental tenet of our amended constitution.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
14 [shushing for quiet]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Reso 695 calls
16 upon the State to pass and the Governor to sign
17 legislation to allow 16 and 17-year-olds to register
18 to vote, [background comments]

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
20 [shushing for quiet]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: While the
22 current system provides for early registration,
23 eligibility is only established provided the voter
24 will be 18 within the same calendar year. The Board
25 of Elections contents they would need system

2 improvements to permit the tracking of those
3 applicants. The stakes are too high to let imperfect
4 technology hold us back. Surely we can create a
5 system that can signify someone is pending until they
6 reach 18. Reso 281-A calls upon the Mayor to create
7 an annual SBRD. Every year the Department of
8 Education sends out 80,000 diplomas to high school
9 graduates, and with that is a voter registration
10 card. Given how few young people register to vote,
11 my hope is that the cards are at least recycled. For
12 the past two years, the Coalition [background
13 comments] of government agencies, elected officials
14 and non-partisan civic groups have piloted a student
15 voter registration day. Both were very successful.
16 Over 2,500 students registered in the first year.
17 The second year over 8,500 students. By making it a
18 focused effort on a single day and tying it to the
19 civic curriculum, students not only register to vote,
20 they learn why it is critically important that they
21 actually vote. Thank you, my colleagues.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Seeing no other
23 speakers on Resolution 281, all of those in favor say
24 aye. Any opposition? Any abstentions? The ayes

2 have it. And Resolution 695 all of those in favor
3 say aye.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Aye.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All of those—any—
6 any—any—any notes. [laughs] Any abstentions? The
7 ayes have it, and now Resolution 870, a resolution
8 calling upon the State Legislature to pass and the
9 Governor to sign A-7634, which would amend both the
10 New York State Election Law and the Correction Law in
11 relation to voting by convicted felons. Any speakers
12 on that bill, on that resolution. Seeing none, all
13 of those in favor say aye. All of those in
14 opposition say no, and any abstentions. The ayes
15 have it. And now Resolution 1073-A, an amended
16 resolution calling upon the New York State
17 Legislature to pass and the governor to sign
18 legislation that would increase the amount of housing
19 subsidy form \$300 to \$600 per month, and extend the
20 age eligibility from 21 to 24 for youth who have aged
21 out of foster care. Seeing no speakers, all those in
22 favor say aye. Any in the negative? Any
23 abstentions. The ayes have it. And our last
24 resolution is Resolution 1181, an amended Resolution
25 calling upon the New York State Legislature to pass

2 and the Governor to sign Briana's Law requiring all
3 police officers to be retrained in cardiopulmonary
4 resuscitation every two years, and this is in honor
5 of Briana and their family. Any speakers? All of
6 those in favor say loudly aye.

7 COUNCIL MEMBERS: [in unison] Aye.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Any opposition?
9 I dare you, and the abstentions have it. (sic)
10 Congratulations family. [applause] And now—and now
11 general discussion beginning with Council Member
12 Deutsch.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you, Madam
14 Public Advocate. Today, I'm introducing a bill Intro
15 1311, a bill to require New York—the New York City
16 Department of Transportation to notify emergency
17 service providers before street repaving. Throughout
18 the spring, summer and fall New York City Department
19 of Transportation crews are dispatched all over the
20 city to resurface roads. During the days and weeks
21 that road work is being done, the street is closed
22 off. Motorists are diverted to surrounding roads,
23 generally causing--

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
25 [shushing for quiet]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: --traffic
3 delays. For ambulance drivers, police officers, and
4 firefighters, every second counts when they are
5 responding to an emergency. If they are unaware of
6 street work, they must be diverted to a different
7 route, their response time to an emergency could be
8 impacted with drastic life or death consequences. My
9 bill will save emergency services providers valuable
10 time by requiring prior notification of street work
11 from the DOT. This notification would be required no
12 later than five days before the scheduled work is to
13 begin. I encourage all my colleagues to join me--

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
15 [shushing for quiet]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: --as a co-
17 sponsor of this bill by signing on Intro 1311, 1311.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
19 Council Member Gibson.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you,
21 Public Advocate.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: You're welcome.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Colleagues, I'd
24 like to draw your attention to Intro 1317, which is
25 an important part of the Nuisance Abatement Fairness

2 Act as demonstrated by our successful efforts
3 recently to curb the use the distribution of K-2 also
4 known as synthetic Marijuana. The Nuisance Abatement
5 Law is a powerful tool that can swiftly put an end to
6 ongoing illegal activities in our communities.
7 However, it has become clear recently that the wide
8 and disproportionate use of this law has negatively
9 impacted many law abiding New Yorkers and many New
10 Yorkers of color in particular. Intro 1317 would
11 exclude the possession of a controlled substance or
12 Marijuana from the Nuisance Abatement Statute when it
13 is clearly for personal use and not the intent to
14 sell. It would also require that if there four
15 incidents of illegal activity before the NYPD can
16 institute an abatement procedure rather than three.
17 I'm very--

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
19 [shushing for quiet]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: --proud of Intro
21 1317, and really pleased to be part of our ongoing
22 efforts to criminalize distributors and sellers of
23 illegal substances rather than the users. I want to
24 thank the Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito and the City
25 Council on what we've done to restore justice to our

2 justice system. This bill along with several others
3 are a part of an upcoming agenda of the committee
4 next Wednesday, November 2nd at 10:00 a.m. here in
5 the Chambers. I want to thank the Speaker, Council
6 Members Levin, Levine, Salamanca, Torres, Williams,
7 Richards, Grodenchik, Johnson, Koslowitz, and
8 Garodnick--

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
10 [shushing for quiet]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: --for introducing
12 bills that are part of this package. And in
13 addition, I'd like to just say that today--

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
15 [shushing for quiet]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: --is the last
17 Stated for two members of my team. Ellen Eng of the
18 Finance Division has been such a major part of our
19 Public Safety team. She's a brilliant finance
20 analyst and I know she will go on to do great things
21 at the NYPD. So I want to thank Ellen Eng for her
22 work and congratulated her. We're going to miss her,
23 but I know that she's moving on, and I also want to
24 thank my Budget--

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
3 Council Member, can you bring your comments to a
4 close?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: --my Budget
6 Director Kaitlin O'Hagan who is also leaving. I want
7 to thank her for her service as well.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
9 Council Member Garodnick. Quiet in the Chambers.
10 We're still in session. Thank you.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you very
12 much, Madam Public Advocate. I wanted to introduce a
13 bill today and draw my attention—the attention of my
14 colleagues to 1316, which is part of a package of
15 bills intended to increase transparency and
16 responsibility for the New York City Economic
17 Development Corporation through a series of reforms,
18 and the other bills are introduced by Council Members
19 Rosenthal and Johnson. They are 1316, 1322 an 1337.
20 With billions of dollars going towards EDC projects
21 all throughout the five boroughs, it is important
22 that we have proper oversight over the money being
23 spent. The public hearings, online information, and
24 some annual reporting, EDC is already required to
25 shared some information, but we can take this

2 further. Given the large budgets for these projects
3 and their critical role in shaping our city's
4 economy, New Yorkers deserve more transparency in how
5 their money is being spent and what the returns are
6 on that investment. Specifically, the bill that I'm
7 introducing would add either the controller or a
8 representative of the controller to the EDC Board.
9 It would codify the Small Business Service
10 Commissioner's ability to require a public hearing
11 on any EDC project, and it would require a one-time
12 fiscal impact statement including both social and
13 environmental-

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
15 [shushing for quiet]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: --impacts for
17 each EDC project. These reforms would each ensure
18 greater oversight over the finances of all EDC
19 projects, allowing for more accountability on the
20 part of EDC and more information available for the
21 public. We need tools for the city to promote
22 economic development and job growth, and that is why
23 EDC is so important, but it is equally important for
24 us to make sure that EDC is conducting its spending
25 in a responsible and effective and transparent

2 manner. So I encourage my colleagues to take a look
3 a look at these three bills, 1316, 1322, and 1337,
4 which again I'm pleased to sponsor with Council
5 Members Rosenthal and Johnson. Thank you.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
7 Council Member Williams.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.
9 First, I just want to thank our City Council—Saint
10 Louis City Council Member Antonio French. He left
11 already. He was here was here from Ferguson, and
12 gained a lot of attention for his response to the
13 Michael Brown shooting. Also, I'm—today—today is the
14 one-year anniversary of the Fair Chance Act, which
15 bans employers from inquiring about an applicant's
16 criminal record until after a job offer, and I think
17 this Council should be proud and the people it has
18 helped. Unfortunately, we know that there is another
19 questionable death, for a motion to hear (sic) a
20 person under NYPD Deborah Danner. I appreciate that
21 the Mayor and the Commissioner quickly stated and
22 condemned the release (sic) and stated it has a
23 mistake. My hope is that we will follow a
24 transparency and accountability. Those are two
25 things that I think we have a lot of work to do as we

2 move forward. Also, I understand that there are
3 union contracts that prevent different kinds of
4 actions typically, but I do think that the NYPD does
5 have the ability of doing employee based extensions
6 without pay by itself, and should think about using
7 that as a signal where it can. I just want to thank
8 our Speaker for her leadership on the Nuisance
9 Abatement Banish Act, a package of 13 bills that will
10 help cure the abuses, and limit allocations of the
11 Nuisance Abatement Law, and I ask my colleagues to
12 sign up for all of them including the bill I had,
13 Intro No. 1344. And I just want to thank--

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
15 [shushing for quiet]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: --congratulate
17 the BLAC for singing the Black National Anthem at
18 this Stated to show support in social justice issues
19 that black Americans are dealing with across the
20 country. I thank the Speaker and the Co-Chair
21 Ritchie Torres, and Robert Cornegy. Lastly, I also
22 want to say, I'm going to miss Ellen Eng who was the
23 Analyst on the Crisis Management System that was
24 started in this body, and expanded with this body,
25 and the Mayor, and is changing how we deal with

2 public safety, addressing gun violence in a holistic
3 way. She has been great in helping move this
4 forward. Hopefully, anyone who comes after here will
5 have the same passion as she did and I wish her the
6 best. Thank you.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
8 Council Member Menchaca.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you. I
10 am pleased to be proposing four bills for your
11 consideration. Intro 1331 requires that requests for
12 construction work permits include a plan for
13 protecting adjacent properties. As we know, problems
14 often occur in surrounding areas as a result of
15 construction activity, particularly in previously
16 flooded areas where the ground has become unstable.
17 Dealing with construction induced damaged can be
18 costly to homeowners. The possibility of damage to
19 be taken into consideration before a work permit is
20 issued. Second, 1330 Intro, requires immediate
21 access to food and water to communities affected by
22 emergencies. When power went out during and after
23 Super Storm Sandy, many supermarkets, bodegas and
24 food pantries lost perishable food and much of their
25 inventory leaving people without access to food and

2 drinkable water within a reasonable distance.

3 Therefore, I'm proposing that the Commissioner of the
4 office of Emergency Management submit to the Council
5 and post to the OEM website a report containing a
6 list of food and water available in the city for
7 emergency and to update that report within 30 days of
8 any significant change. Third, Intro 1332 requires
9 the Mayor's Management Report to be made available
10 online and in hard copies in the top six foreign
11 languages. These documents let us know if the admin
12 is succeeding or failing to meet its objectives.
13 Valuable information that deserves to be available to
14 as much of New York City population as possible.
15 Currently, it is available only in English. Finally,
16 Resolution 1261 asks the State to require that trucks
17 be equipped with windows on the lower portions of
18 their side doors in order to increase driver
19 visibility around the truck. Trucks account for only
20 3.6% of vehicles in the city, but are responsible for
21 12.3% of pedestrian fatalities, and 32% of bicycle
22 fatalities. Low windows will allow pedestrians and
23 cyclists to be seen.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

25 [shushing for quiet]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I think all the
3 co-primes on these bill, and encourage members to get
4 on them and work with me to get these things passed.
5 Thank you.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
7 Council Member Barron. Quiet in the Chambers. We're
8 still in session.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Madam
10 Public Advocate. My colleagues referenced Deborah
11 Danner, and that killing occurred after our last
12 Stated, and I wanted to draw some attention to that.
13 Once again, we have a police officer who violated
14 procedures. He had the training, but yet went in and
15 killed a 66-year-old woman. But I wanted to
16 personalize her because we hear about these stories
17 often, and Deborah Danner wrote a six-page essay,
18 which she entitled *Living With Schizophrenia*, and she
19 said the generally speaking those who don't suffer
20 believe the worst of us who do. We're treated with
21 suspicions, as liars who can't be trusted to control
22 ourselves. I've felt myself isolated and mostly
23 alone without any company or succor. I was felt—I
24 was left to the tender mercies of a series of doctors
25 and other mental health facilities. Eerily, Danner

2 discussed the need for more mental health training
3 for police officers, and described a deadly scenario,
4 the cop that foreshadowed her own final moments
5 alive. "We all aware of the all too frequent news
6 stories about the mentally ill who come up against
7 law enforcement instead of mental health
8 professionals, and end up dead" she wrote. The
9 example she gave was about Eleanor Bufford, another
10 mentally ill black woman killed in the Bronx in 1984
11 by a cop. Both New York--this is a tragedy in her
12 essay. In her essay, Deborah Danner wrote,
13 "Schizophrenia happened to me when I was almost 30
14 years old late in my life. She thought that her
15 mother would be able to get her help, but she wasn't.
16 Deborah Danner says, "I'm an IT MIS professional.
17 I'm proud of it. I'm very good at what I do,
18 although I lit upon, I can be--it can be a high stress
19 profession. Deadlines have to be met, budgets,
20 problems exist that require specific skill and
21 knowledge. None of my family knows what I do really
22 and never asks. She was a student. She attended
23 college, although she did not graduate, and her
24 family said she read thousands of books. She was
25 always bright, but her mind crossed the line, and

2 finally it says that she was an outspoken person. She
3 could be a little tough, and she said even the smart-
4 "Even the smartest people—persons in the world cannot
5 function in the realm of normalcy with that monkey on
6 their back." She wrote, "What if my medications
7 fail me? I ask myself will I know what it does?
8 Will the illness over a power that's affecting this,
9 one and where? So I just wanted to personalize her.
10 Not jut have her as a person that we see a story
11 about and say that we've got to make sure that police
12 officers are indicted, and when they are convicted
13 they should go to jail. Thank you.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
15 Steve Levin.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very
17 much, Madam Public Advocate. I—I want to apologize
18 for my colleagues. I was outside on a phone call
19 earlier when we sang the Lift Up Your Voice and Sing.
20 So I want to add my voice to the chorus: Lift every
21 voice and sing, to earth and heaven ring, ring with
22 the harmonies of liberty that our rejoicing rise high
23 as the listening skies. Let it resound loud as the
24 rolling sea. Sing a song for the faith that the dark
25 past has taught us. Sing a song for the hope that

2 the present has brought us. Facing the rising sun of
3 our new day begun, let us march on where victor as
4 one.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Madam
6 Speaker to close. Madam Speaker, we love the-
7 laptops, but can the keyboards be in use? (sic)
8 [laughs]

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We know there was
10 conversation about that. [laughter] Again, I want
11 to-I want to thank all my colleagues. Today was a
12 bit of a long stated, and-and emotional with having
13 the Chairman of the Sioux Tribe, and us coming
14 together in collective unity around with governing
15 boards, and I want to thank everyone for
16 participating in that. And I want to thank again
17 Microsoft for their partnership on these Tablets.
18 It's something that we're looking forward to, looking
19 at ways that we can minimize our impact on the
20 environment, and obviously use of technology helps us
21 do that. So I hope everyone has a great wonderful
22 rest of the day, and with that we're adjourned.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And Ms. Danner,
24 rest in peace. We stand adjourned. [gavel]

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

112

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 26, 2016