

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

----- X

October 20, 2016
Start: 11:44 a.m.
Recess: 12:10 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Rm
14th Fl.

B E F O R E: DAVID G. GREENFIELD

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Vincent J. Gentile
Annabel Palma
Inez E. Dickens
Daniel R. Garodnick
Darlene Mealy
Rosie Mendez
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Peter A. Koo
Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Jumaane D. Williams
Ruben Wills
Deborah L. Rose
Donovan J. Richards
Inez D. Barron
Andrew Cohen
Ben Kallos
Antonio Reynoso
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

2 [sound check, pause] [gavel]

3 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Good morning.

4 My name is David Greenfield. I'm the Council Member
5 from the 44th Council District in Brooklyn, and I'm
6 privileged to serve as the Chair of the Land Use
7 Committee. I want to welcome my esteemed colleagues
8 who are members of the committee Council Member
9 Gentile, Council Member Garodnick, Council Member
10 Koo, Council Member Lander, Council Member Levin,
11 Council Member Rose, Council Member Williams, Council
12 Member Wills, Council Member Barron, Council Member
13 Cohen, and Council Member Kallos. I want to thank
14 and, of course, a grand entrance by our Zoning Chair,
15 Council Member Donovan Richards. Just for the
16 record, he was—he was actually waiting outside until
17 we started so he could make that entrance.

18 [laughter] I want to thank Chair Richards for his
19 service as our Zoning Subcommittee Chair. I want to
20 thank Chair Dickens for her service at the Planning
21 Subcommittee, and Chair Koo as always for his
22 leadership on the Landmarks Subcommittee. This
23 committee will be voting on resolutions that are
24 before you for presentation and vote by the full
25

2 Council. We're going to start off with some of my
3 personal favorites, and those are the sidewalk cafes.

4 LU 470, Reef Café, an application for an
5 unenclosed sidewalk café located at 108-7272nd Avenue
6 in Council Member Koslowitz's district.

7 LU 471, Happy Cooking Bistro, an
8 application for an unenclosed sidewalk café located
9 at 322 Spring Street in Council Member—okay,
10 apparently counsel tells me it's an enclosed sidewalk
11 café. They like to throw these things in just to
12 keep me on my toes. An application—let's do this
13 again—LU 471, Happy Cooking Bistro, an application
14 for an enclosed sidewalk café located at 322 Spring
15 Street in Council Member Johnson's district in
16 Manhattan. This application was withdrawn and is
17 subject to a motion to file.

18 LU 494, 16154 Williamsbridge Road, an
19 application for a zoning map amendment to permit
20 exist commercial uses on approximately 11 buildings
21 located in Council Member Vacca's district.

22 LU 493, Williamsburg Trust Company,
23 proposed designation of the Williamsburg Trust
24 Company building as an historic landmark located on
25 the corner of South 5th Street adjacent to the

2 Williamsburg Bridge. The Williamsburg Trust Company
3 building was completed in 1906 and is in Council
4 Member Reynoso's district. This item has been under
5 consideration by the Landmarks Preservation
6 Commission for literally 40 years, and thanks once
7 again to Chair Koo and myself legislation, this item
8 is finally being voted on and is being designated. I
9 will note for Council Member Ben Kallos, in fact,
10 thanks to the legislation that was sponsored by Chair
11 Koo and myself, we now have more landmarks designated
12 than ever before in the history of New York City.
13 Thank you very much.

14 LU No. 428 Blake and Hendrix. HPD is
15 seeking a UDAAP project approval, a property tax
16 exemption of the properties in the Brooklyn's
17 Community District 5. These actions will facilitate
18 the development of nine two-family and four three-
19 family homes containing up to 30 units in total.
20 This application is in Council Member Barron's
21 district. All of the members are in support of these
22 applications. Do any members have any questions or
23 remarks that they would like make? Council Member is
24 recognized to make some remark.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Mr.
3 Chair. I want to speak about the project that's on
4 today's calendar 428, the New Infill Homeownership
5 Program, NIHOP. The New Infill Homeownership
6 Opportunities Program, NIHOP, is not to be confused
7 with the Next Gen Infill project of NYCHA. The Blake
8 Hendrix NIHOP is composed of 13 separate sites
9 scattered located in the East New York section of
10 Brooklyn on Blake Avenue, Cleveland Street, Warwick
11 Street, Hinsdale Street, Dumont Avenue and Linden
12 Street, and yes, all of these sites are for
13 homeownership. These city-owned lots will be
14 transformed into nine two-family and four-three
15 family homes totaling 30 units. This NIHOP Program
16 was initially designated through HPD's New Foundation
17 Program in 2007, but stalled due to the economic
18 depression of 2008 and 2009. The people who
19 purchaser these homes will commit to remain in them
20 as the primary resident for at least 20 years. The
21 price difference between the appraised value of the
22 property, and the purchase price, and the amount of
23 the construction financing provided by the City, will
24 be recorded to the property to zero after 20 years of
25 owner occupancy. There will be community-based

2 seminar on financing and down payment assistance
3 programs, credit ratings and sessions on the
4 importance of regular home maintenance. Owners will
5 be selected via lottery. For most people, the
6 purchase of a home is the most expensive acquisition
7 they will make during their lifetime. For most,
8 homeownership is the pathway to wealth that can be
9 passed onto succeeding generations. I am pleased to
10 support this project because it considers the median
11 income of Community Board 5, which is approximately
12 \$33,000, and it offers a long-term solution to the
13 current crisis of the housing needs of people in
14 Community Board 5. It is yes affordable to those who
15 live in the community, and are looking to invest in
16 homeownership. Sales prices will be targeted at the
17 following income levels: Hold your seats, everybody.
18 Two-family homes affordable to households earning
19 \$56,000, and two-family homes affordable to
20 households earning \$75,000, and three-family homes
21 affordable to households earning approximately
22 \$95,000. Homes will be built to Energy Conservation
23 Code of the City. HPD will monitor construction, and
24 will—there will be no TCOs. Each purchaser will
25 receive a Certificate of Occupancy. I would like to

2 thank the following people who work through several
3 very heated discussions, and various iterations of
4 the project to achieve this result. Raju Mann, the
5 Director of Land Use; Julie Lubin, Counsel of Land
6 Use; Jordan Press, Government Affairs of HPD, Lenny
7 Seif, Director of New Homes, HPD, Brian Paul, Land
8 Use Counsel, Joy Kwan, Project Director of HPD; Sarah
9 Dabbs, HPD's New Construction; Artie Pearson, HPD
10 Government Relations; Mim Zang, HPD Director, my
11 Chief of Staff Joy Simmons, and predecessor who was
12 involved in these discussions and now Assembly Member
13 Charles Barron. Thank you so much, and I urge all of
14 my colleagues to vote in the affirmative.

15 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you very
16 much and because my colleagues have asked just for
17 the record these income targets on these units are
18 going to be between--household between 80% and 130% of
19 AMI. Do any members have any other questions or
20 remarks? Hearing none, I will ask the clerk to
21 please call the roll.

22 CLERK: William Martin, Committee Clerk
23 roll call vote committee on Land Use. Chair
24 Greenfield.

25 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Aye on all.

2 CLERK: Gentile.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye on all.

4 CLERK: Garodnick.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: [off mic] Aye.

6 CLERK: Mealy.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: May I explain my
8 votes?

9 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Council Member
10 Mealy to explain her vote.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I just want to
12 congratulate my colleagues, Council Member Barron,
13 for real affordable housing in a community that
14 really needs it, and that is homeownership is the
15 pathway to wealth. So congratulations. I vote aye
16 on all.

17 CLERK: Mendez.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: [off mic] Aye.

19 CLERK: Koo.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

21 CLERK: Lander.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: [off mic] Aye on
23 all.

24 CLERK: Levin.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye on all.

2 CLERK: Rose.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

4 CLERK: Williams.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [off mic] Aye.

6 CLERK: Wills.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: I also want to
8 echo my congratulations to Council Member Barron.
9 Aye on all.

10 CLERK: Richards.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I want to
12 congratulate Council Member Barron on a great
13 project, affordable homeownership. You know, in a
14 day and age where it seems to be—we seem to be so
15 focused on rental apartments, rental apartments,
16 rental apartment. It's very important that we
17 continue this conversation on affordable
18 homeownership. So I want to congratulate you on
19 that. I vote aye on all.

20 CLERK: Barron.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to
22 explain my vote.

23 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Council Member
24 Barron to explain her vote.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

11

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, once again I
3 do want to thank the committee that worked so hard,
4 the team that put this together because at the
5 outset, all 13 homes were set at \$95,000 to \$103,000.
6 That was the starting point. So we worked from
7 there. I do want to once again commend the team for
8 their creativity, and their willingness to go back
9 and re-examine it, and see how they could make that
10 happen, and I vote aye on all with the exception of
11 Land Use 494 of which I am abstaining because I am
12 concerned about any undue hardships that might be
13 facing the church as it becomes landmarked. Thank
14 you.

15 CLERK: Cohen.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I vote aye.

17 CLERK: Kallos.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Congratulations
19 to Council Member Barron, and I vote aye on all.

20 CLERK: Dickens.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: [off mic] Aye on
22 all, and congratulations to Council Member Barron.

23 CLERK: All items on today's Land Use
24 agenda has—have been adopted by a vote of 16 in the
25 affirmative, 0 in the negative and no abstentions.

1 COMMITTEE ON LAND USE 12

2 With Land Use Item 494 being adopted by a vote of 15
3 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and 1
4 abstention.

5 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you. The
6 Chair recognizes Council Member Steven Levin for some
7 remarks.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, Mr.
9 Chair. I was remiss in not congratulating Council
10 Member Barron. Congratulations on your SETA Res.
11 It's a first in my opinion.

12 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: As is our
13 practice, we are going to keep the roll open for the
14 next 15 minutes, and we have been adjourned. [pause]
15 Council Member Barron.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [off mic] Yes. I
17 have voted on, it too. [off mic] Requesting
18 permission to correct my abstention. It is regarding
19 the church, but the Land Use items 493 not 494.
20 Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Some are. Thank
22 you. [pause]

23 CLERK: Continuation of roll call, the
24 Committee on Land Use. Council Member Reynoso.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

13

2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I vote aye.

3 [pause]

4 CLERK: Continuation roll call, the
5 Committee on Land Use. Council Member Torres.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I vote aye.

7 [pause]

8 CLERK: Continuation roll call, the
9 Committee on Land Use. Council Member Rodriguez.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

11 [pause] [background comments]

12 CLERK: Continuation roll call, the
13 Committee on Land Use. Council Member Treyger.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I vote aye.

15 CLERK: Revised and final vote now in
16 Committee on Land Use, all items have been adopted by
17 a vote of 20 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative
18 and no abstentions. With Land Use Item 493, being
19 adopted by a vote of 19 in the affirmative, 0 in the
20 negative and 1 abstention. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: This concludes
22 the Land Use Committee for the meeting of October 20,
23 2016. This meeting is hereby adjourned. [gavel]

24

25

1 COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

14

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date October 31, 2016