

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

September 28, 2016
Start: 1:24 p.m.
Recess: 3:00 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: LETITIA JAMES
Public Advocate

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO
Speaker for the Council

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Inez D. Barron
Joe Borelli
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Andrew Cohen
Costa G. Constantinides,
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Elizabeth S. Crowley
Laurie A. Cumbo
Chaim M. Deutsch
Inez E. Dickens
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Mathieu Eugene
Julissa Ferreras-Copeland
Daniel R. Garodnick

Vincent J. Gentile
Vanessa L. Gibson
David G. Greenfield
Barry Grodenchik
Corey D. Johnson
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Peter A. Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
Darlene Mealy
Carlos Menchaca
Rosie Mendez
I. Daneek Miller
Annabel Palma
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Rafael Salamanca
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
James Vacca
Paul A. Vallone
James G. Van Bramer
Jumaane D. Williams
Ruben Wills

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Monsignor Sen G. Olgie, Pastor
Our Lady of Mount Parish
13-25 Newton Avenue
Astoria, New York 11102

2 [sound check, pause]

3 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I want to—we're
4 going to get started. People are on their way up.
5 We'll be full in a minute. We have three ceremonials
6 today. I definitely want to thank my colleagues, and
7 we're going to start of with Margaret Chin who is
8 recognizing Mr. Kin Sheung Wong after 50 years of
9 teaching. Oh, my gosh, 50 years of teaching and 18
10 years of service as the Principal of the New York
11 Chinese Language School. Wow, that's pretty
12 impressive. So I'm going to hand it off to Margaret.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Speaker.
14 I would like to invite Principal Wong, Wong-Kin
15 Sheung Wong. That's alright. [applause] And I
16 would like to invite up his family, and the President
17 of CCBA, Chinese Consolidated Benevolent Association,
18 President Shaw to come up, and also the—we also have
19 some teachers from the Chinese School. Principal
20 Wong is the principal of New York Chinese School for
21 18 years, but he also serve as a teacher and the
22 Program Director there for almost 50 years. Now, the
23 New York Chinese School started in 1909 more than 100
24 years ago. It started with 20 students. That was
25 under the Chin Dynasty, and you know that we

2 overturned, you know, overturned the Chin Dynasty in
3 1911, and established the first Republic in China.
4 But now they serve over 3,000 students every year
5 learning Cantonese and Mandarin and they're not all
6 Chinese students. Alright, they have students from
7 all backgrounds because they want to learn Chinese,
8 and we also have adults that are their students. But
9 the interesting fact is that many of the students
10 work for our city. They could be principal of a
11 school or a teacher in a school. One of my staff
12 went to the Chinese School, and we also have a lot of
13 police officers, and also one of the chiefs, right?
14 I think Chief Thomas Chan was also a student at the
15 New York Chinese School. So it is my great honor to
16 present the City Council Proclamation to Principal
17 Wong for his dedication to this community, and for
18 teaching Chinese language and culture for so many
19 generations, and this is a great opportunity for us
20 to really appreciate and thank him for all his great
21 work. So would the clerk please read the
22 Proclamation. Thank you.

23 CLERK: Council, City of New York

24 Proclamation:

25

2 Whereas, the Council of the City of New
3 York is proud to honor Mr. Kin Sheung, Principal of
4 the New York Chinese Language School on the occasion
5 of his retirement after more than 50 years of
6 teaching; and

7 Whereas, for 18 years Mr. Wong has serves
8 as principal of the New York Chinese School, one of
9 the largest Chinese language schools in North
10 America. During that time Mr. Wong has been a
11 visible and welcoming presence to both parents and
12 students; and

13 Whereas, born in Wen Jong, China, and
14 raised in Hong Kong, Mr. Wong attempted Tim Kay
15 University where he studied Chinese literature.
16 After graduating he was invited to teach at the same
17 university. In 1969, Mr. Wong immigrated to the
18 United States, and soon found a job as an—as an
19 internal auditor at Chemical Bank. At the same time,
20 he enrolled in the New York EXCEL program at New York
21 University improving his English language skills
22 while maintaining a strong connection to his native
23 tongue and cultural—cultural heritage; and

24 Whereas, in order to foster and
25 strengthen that connection, Mr. Wong started working

2 at the New York Chinese School as a language teacher
3 inspiring students to develop a lifelong appreciation
4 for the Chinese language and their shared cultural
5 heritage. In 1998, after serving for two years as an
6 interim-in-in an interim capacity, Mr. Wong was
7 formally named principal of the school; and

8 Whereas, throughout his 47 years of
9 dedication to the New York Chinese School, Mr. Wong
10 has worked tirelessly to promote the Chinese language
11 and to preserve cultural values in his adopted
12 country. Upon his retirement he can be proud and
13 know that his work as both a teacher and a scholar of
14 Chinese culture will continue to resonate in the
15 lives of countless students and admirers (sic) for
16 years to come. He has truly excelled in his work,
17 and has earned the highest respect and esteem of his
18 fellow New Yorkers.

19 Now, therefore, be it known that the
20 Council of the City of New York gratefully honors Kim
21 Sheung Wong for the enduring contributions he has
22 made throughout his career, and wishes him the very
23 best on the well-earned occasion of his retirement
24 from teaching. Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speak for the

2 Entire Council, Margaret S. Chin, Council Member
3 First District, Manhattan

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you.

5 [applause/cheers] You know, for the first time in the
6 proclamation we print Mr. Wong's name in Chinese,
7 but it doesn't sound totally correct. I mean like an
8 English pronunciation, but his name in Chinese is
9 inscribed in the Proclamation, Wong [speaking
10 Chinese]. So I'm going to ask Principal Wong to say
11 a few words.

12 PRINCIPAL WONG: Thank you. I teach at
13 that school 47 years. Very long, but school is only
14 part-time students, but I still don't for full-time
15 in the school because the teacher not all the full-
16 time only principals, and lay, too, (sic) that are
17 full-time. So today, I receive this. I want to
18 thank you, and thank you my family and thank you my
19 wife. They take care and the family, and today many
20 teachers come to therapy (sic) and thank you all of
21 them. Thank you.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: [applause] Thank
23 you. So, okay, Mrs. Wong, do you want to come
24 together here? I mean the family and his daughter
25 and his grandson, and his son-in-law come on.

2 Because as Mr. Wong said, even though the position
3 because the school is only after school, and weekends
4 and during the summer, but he worked there long hours
5 every day, and so he thanks—and his daughters all
6 attended the school, and son. [pause] Thank you.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you so
8 much. Thank you.

9 MALE SPEAKER: Thank you so much.
10 [applause] [background comments, pause]

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright, we're
12 going to go onto our second ceremonial. Council
13 Member Williams, I think we're—I think they are here.
14 Council Member Williams will be issuing a
15 Proclamation to Brooklyn Community Pride Center--and
16 the representatives are here—for their work in
17 providing service and support to the LGBT community
18 in Brooklyn since 2008. And all of the council
19 members who want to join us come on up. I'll hand it
20 off to Council Member Williams.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you,
22 Madam Speaker. Is Steve Levin here also? Oh, and
23 the Chief Officer. So today we're here to honor
24 Brooklyn Community Pride Immigration and Equality and
25 the five artists for their hard work and advocacy on

2 behalf of the LGBT Community in Brooklyn. Since
3 2008, Brooklyn Community Pride has provided premier
4 networks— Over here. [pause, background comments]
5 Alright, there's there is a lot for us. [applause/
6 cheers] So, today we are here to honor Brooklyn
7 Community Pride Immigration, Equality and five
8 artists for their hard work and advocacy on behalf of
9 the LGBT community in Brooklyn. Since 2008,
10 Brooklyn, Community Pride has provided a premier
11 network of programs and services for the LGBT
12 community in Brooklyn, a center that has enabled the
13 LGBT community to actively participate in positive
14 life affirming activities. As part of Brooklyn
15 Community Pride with the LBGT community, the New
16 Americans project Rebecca Centeno—I apologize if I
17 butchered that. Wilfred Hernandez, Jackie Yodashkin,
18 Sue-Elise Peebles, and Gabriel Royal have combatted
19 hostile rhetoric with inspirational stories and work
20 that reflect their contributions to the LGBT
21 Americans. Immigration equality has advocated for
22 and represented members of the LGBT community to
23 immigrant community since 1994. They are the only
24 LGBTQ org--organization with a staff of immigration
25 attorneys dedicated to providing legal assistance to

2 the LGBT community and HIV positive immigrants.
3 Myself I've dedicated my life to working for social
4 justice and equality and equity. Because of this,
5 it's my honor to recognize other who, too, have
6 dedicated their lives promoting equality and helping
7 others share their stories and doing the same. So we
8 have a Proclamation for the Center, and we have
9 citations for everyone. [pause] So I just want to
10 ask Steve, who the center in his district facility
11 is.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very
13 much Council Member Williams. Thank you Speaker. So
14 I'm very proud to be able to represent the district
15 where the Brooklyn Community Pride Center calls home.
16 It has for many years. It is good that one of the
17 most inspirational stories of an organization really
18 coming into its own over the last several years, and
19 continuing to grow and you make us all proud as
20 Brooklynites, and we—and we are excited to be
21 partners, and—and be witness to your incredible
22 story, your incredible growth, and we're really happy
23 to be here today with you. Thank you. [pause]

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright, thank
25 you. Sorry. I was just trying to figure out if

2 there's another representative that would speak, but
3 we are going to ask the clerk to read the
4 Proclamation, and thank you all for being here. It
5 really is—it means a lot to us as well.

6 CLERK: Council, City of New York
7 Proclamation.

8 Whereas, the Council of the City of New
9 York is proud to honor the Brooklyn Community Pride
10 Center for its excellent support to Brooklyn's LGBT
11 community; and

12 Whereas, the Brooklyn Community Pride
13 located in Downtown Brooklyn at 4 Metrotech on the
14 ground floor was incorporated in 2008, and granted
15 501(c)(3) status in 2009. Since it opened its door,
16 the Brooklyn Center has developed important original
17 programming to youth, seniors, CGMC, transgender and
18 non—and gender non-conforming individuals and other
19 Brooklynites. In addition to hosting arts and
20 cultural groups and several tall step (sic) and
21 support groups, the Brooklyn Community Pride Center
22 has worked with immigration equality to contribute to
23 the LGBTQ New Americans Project, an all history
24 project focused on LGB—L—LGBTQ immigrants. The LGBTQ
25 New Americans Project was funded by the New York City

2 Department of Cultural Affair in partnership with the
3 New York City Council; and

4 Whereas, the Brooklyn Community Pride
5 Center has greatly expanded its reach by forging
6 meaningful partnerships with the Bushwick Anti-
7 Violence Project, the Brooklyn Public Library;
8 Spencer Wyckoff Hospital, the Door and Puente
9 Bushwick Leadership Center, the Hedrick Martin
10 Institute, Make the Road New York, Red Hook
11 Initiative, South Brooklyn Lead Services another
12 organizations as well as many other non-profits like
13 Appel Foundation, Trevor Park Project, Peace Flag,
14 Lambs and Legal Defense Fund, and GMHC to cite only a
15 few; and

16 Whereas, today the Brooklyn Community
17 Pride Center remains committed to providing the
18 services to the areas that need it most, and now
19 hopes to offer more support to Crown Heights Bedford-
20 Stuyvesant by relocating to the Bedford Union Armory
21 in the next few years.

22 Now, therefore, be it known that the
23 Council of the City of New York is proud to honor the
24 Brooklyn Community Pride Center as a wonderful
25 resource for the LGBT community throughout the

2 borough of Brooklyn. Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker
3 for the Entire Council; Jumaane V. Williams, Council
4 Member, 46th District, Brooklyn; Steven Levin,
5 Council Member, 33rd District, Brooklyn and all seven
6 members of the City Council's LGBT Caucus. [applause]

7 FLOYD RUMOHR: I couldn't have said that
8 better myself. My name is Floyd Rumohr, the
9 Executive Director of the Brooklyn Community Pride
10 Center, and it's my great honor to accept this
11 proclamation on behalf of the beautiful LGBTQ
12 Brooklynites who contribute to our center and are
13 served by it everyday. We experience nearly 7,000
14 door swings annually, and we are growing, as someone
15 mentioned earlier. Soon we'll be relocating to
16 Restoration Plaza, and if luck holds, we'll be
17 expanding into the Bedford Union Armory by 2019-2020.
18 I am so proud of this particular team who in a few
19 short months pulled together one of the most
20 beautiful projects I've ever seen. The artist, Sue-
21 Elise Peebles, Gabriel Royal, Rebecca Centeno, the
22 filmmaker. I'm particularly proud of Wilfredo
23 Hernandez, our arts and culture group leader, and
24 we're very fortunate enough here today to have one of
25 our LGBTQ new Americans here Oliver whose story you

2 can hear right on our website at LGBTbrooklyn.org.

3 It would be remiss of me to forget our collaborating
4 partner in Immigration Equality represented by Aaron
5 Morris, the Executive Director and Jackie Yodashkin,
6 the Communications Director without whom this project
7 would not have gotten off the ground. So thank you
8 once again [applause] and come out to Brooklyn.

9 [applause/cheers]

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright. Thank
11 you so much, and thank you for joining us. It really
12 means a lot. [background comments, pause] Alright,
13 thank you. [applause/cheers] Jumaane, pictures.
14 [background comments, pause] Okay we have one more
15 ceremonial, which is obviously an incredibly
16 important one. I want to ask all of my colleagues to
17 join us. Unfortunately, Council Member Corey Johnson
18 had an unexpected emergency, and he will not able to
19 join us, but this on his behalf. [background
20 comments, pause] As we all know that on September
21 17th, our city particularly on the 23rd Street in
22 Council Member Corey Johnson's district suffered an
23 explosion that was due to the terrorist actions of an
24 individual who thankfully has been caught. We want
25 to take a moment to appreciate and to demonstrate our

2 appreciation to not only our first responders who are
3 critical obviously, but this community really came
4 together as a whole to—to really provide support to
5 each other. So as our first responders were ensuring
6 that everyone was safe, to makes sure that everyone
7 got the assistance they needed, if there was any to
8 be transported to the hospital. We definitely want
9 to thank all of them. There were also local
10 organizations who stepped up, our local—local small
11 local businesses that stepped up. S o Corey had
12 reached out to me, Council Member Johnson, and said
13 that he really wanted to take a moment to demonstrate
14 the appreciation and us a City Council in
15 representation of the city are—are doing this on his
16 behalf. So I would like to ask, we had a lot of
17 proclamations to give, but definitely we want to make
18 sure that we do—we give them—we give them all to—to
19 the first responders and to those that are being
20 recognized today. So we have the Tenth Precinct that
21 obviously we want to thank. It's Captain Paul Lanot
22 or Lanot is here. [applause/cheers] The third—hold
23 on, guys. Let's hold our applause because there's a
24 whole bunch here. The 13th Precinct and Captain
25 Brandon Samoni (sp?) is going represent the 13th

2 Precinct. [applause/cheers] We want to thank the
3 FDNY First Deputy Commissioner Robert Turner
4 Manhattan Division Command; Chief Roger Stackowich
5 and Assistant Chief of the MS Operations Chief
6 Michael Fritten. (sic) Thank you so much for being
7 here. [applause/cheers] We're also—we're also—people
8 had heard the story how the Malibu Diner came to the
9 rescue of Vision, the—the residents that live in the
10 building that is managed and—and by Vision, which is
11 services for the blind and visually impaired. So the
12 owner of Malibu Diner, Jose Collado and Alex Grimpas
13 are here. [applause] Do you want to come on up?
14 And we also have the representative from Vision,
15 Services for the Blind and Visually impaired, Nancy
16 Miller, Executive Director and Glenn Zaab (sp?)
17 [applause] Do we have Glenn? Is Glenn here? Okay,
18 go ahead. Who is a resident—I'm sorry a tenant from
19 Sallas (sp?) Manor. We have Lennox Health,
20 Greenwich Village Emergency Department Medical
21 Director Dr. Eric Cruzen, and also Assistant Nursing
22 Director Peter Lennon. Are they here? Alright, come
23 on up. [applause] And from the New York City Health
24 and Hospitals Bellevue, right, we want to thank the
25 Chief Executive Officer William Hicks; the Chief

2 Nursing Officer Ken Mendez; the Chief of Surgery
3 Division Chief Trauma and Critical Care, Cyrus
4 Prangos (sp?). We also want to thank Assistant
5 Director of Nursing Emergency Department Antoinette
6 Barilla; Staff Nurse of the Emergency Department
7 Arlene Marciano; and Staff Nurse in the Emergency
8 Department Richard Williams. If they could all join
9 us. [applause] Right. So this—this is just again
10 a—a moment. Obviously, we can't have everybody
11 speak. [laughs] We'd be here all day, but no—but I—
12 we really wanted to take a moment from our
13 deliberations and open up the Chamber to each and
14 everyone of you because you just exemplify the best
15 of the city not only in terms of our first
16 responders, what you do each and every day in keeping
17 us safe. And unfortunately, the—we lost—we lost a
18 life yesterday. Someone that again was doing their
19 service in the FDNY, but really to the community
20 members as well that came together and embraced
21 right, each other and supported each other, and—and
22 it just exemplifies what we are all about. So thank
23 you all very, very much for that, and the City
24 Council and our Public Advocate and everyone here
25 wants to give you a great round of applauses

2 [applause/cheers] And-and the-and the last thing-the
3 last thing I'll say because obviously Council Member
4 Johnson, as I indicated, had an emergency. He
5 couldn't be here. You know, his leadership was
6 really unbelievable. Many of you know that. You've
7 been interacting with him on a daily basis, but his
8 constituents really, really have a great
9 representative, someone who was there on the ground.
10 We supported him in whatever way we could, whatever
11 he needed, but that definitely in the coordination.
12 I-I suffered an explosion in my district. As people
13 know, I lost eight lives of constituents about three
14 years ago, and the level of coordination to make
15 sure all the different city agencies, state agencies,
16 federal agencies to ensure that people are getting
17 the proper attention is a lot to coordinate. It's a
18 lot to organize, and Corey has been doing an
19 incredible job. So thank you to him as well on our
20 behalf, and then thank you all very much.

21 [applause/cheers] [background comments, pause]

22 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Ladies and Gentlemen,
23 can I have your attention, please. Can I please have
24 your attention. All quiet on the floor, please.
25 Quiet, please. At this time, please place all

2 electronic devices to vibrate. Will all non-Council
3 employees, non-Council employees please leave the
4 main floor of the Chambers. We have additional
5 seating upstairs in the balcony. Thank you.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
7 Chambers, please. Everyone please have your seat.
8 If you are staff member, have your seat. If you're a
9 visitor, I would ask that you go to the rostrum and
10 take a seat. Everyone please take a seat. Quiet in
11 the Chambers. Quiet in the chambers. We're about to
12 begin. May we please close those doors? Everyone
13 rise for the Pledge of Allegiance. [pause]

14 CLERK: Barron.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.

16 CLERK: Borelli.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Here.

18 CLERK: Cabrera.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

20 CLERK: Chin.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

22 CLERK: Cohen. Constantinides.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [shushing for
25 quiet]

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

21

2 CLERK: Cornegy.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Present.

4 CLERK: Crowley.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Here.

6 CLERK: Cumbo.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Present.

8 CLERK: Deutsch. Dickens.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Here.

10 CLERK: Dromm.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

12 CLERK: Espinal.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.

14 CLERK: Eugene. Ferreras-Copeland.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Here.

16 CLERK: Garodnick.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.

18 CLERK: Gentile.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.

20 CLERK: Gibson.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Here.

22 CLERK: Greenfield.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Here.

24 CLERK: Grodenchik.

25

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

22

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: [off mic]

3 Present.

4 CLERK: Johnson. Kallos.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

6 CLERK: King.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.

8 CLERK: Koo.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

10 CLERK: Koslowitz.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

12 CLERK: Lancman.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.

14 CLERK: Lander.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.

16 CLERK: Levin.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

18 CLERK: Levine.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here

20 CLERK: Maisel.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.

22 CLERK: Mealy.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Here.

24 CLERK: Menchaca.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.

2 CLERK: Mendez. Miller.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.

4 CLERK: Palma. Reynoso.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Here, present.

6 CLERK: Richards.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

8 CLERK: Rodriguez.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [off mic]

10 Present.

11 CLERK: Rose.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

13 CLERK: Rosenthal.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

15 CLERK: Salamanca.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.

17 CLERK: Torres.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Here.

19 CLERK: Treyger.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

21 CLERK: Ulrich.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Present.

23 CLERK: Vacca.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.

25

2 CLERK: Vallone. Williams. Greenfield.
3 Cohen.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

5 CLERK: Wills.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Here.

7 CLERK: Matteo. Van Bramer.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

9 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Here.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [shushing for
12 quiet] Thank you. Quiet in the Chambers. All rise
13 for the invocation.

14 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: That will be
16 delivered by Monsignor Sean Olgle, the Pastor of Our
17 Lady of Mount Carmel Parish in Astoria, Queens.
18 Quiet in the chambers.

19 MONSIGNOR SEAN OLGLE: Let us recall that
20 we dwell always in the presence of the God who knows
21 and loves us. God, our creator, we praise you.
22 Because of your goodness you have given us life and
23 light and have made us in your own image and
24 likeness, which is the source of all human dignity
25 and rights. You call us to serve one another with

2 your same generosity of spirit, and to honor you in
3 how we carry out our duties. Help these leaders in
4 our great city to imitate your generosity in serving
5 the people of our city with honesty, courage and
6 intelligence. Help them provide for the needs of all
7 who live in our city social, educational and
8 material. Make these leaders compassionate servants
9 in your image especially for the most vulnerable
10 among us. Help them to be aware that their role is
11 not a job only, but a vocation, a calling. Hear
12 them--help them to hear your call to respond with
13 your love and to increase that love in our society
14 through their actions here. We make this prayer in
15 hope now and forever. Amen.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.
17 A motion to spread the invocation. Council Member
18 Constantinides. Quiet in the chambers please. Quiet
19 in the chambers.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Madam
21 Public Advocate, I'd like to make a motion to spread
22 the invocation across the entire council, and if you
23 would indulge me, to speak a little bit about our--our
24 Lady of Mount Carmel. They are celebrating their
25 175th—

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
3 Council Member, one minute. May we have quiet in the
4 chambers and re-out of respect for the Council
5 Member, please.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank
7 you.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
9 chambers. I apologize.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: This year
11 they're—they're celebrating their 175th anniversary,
12 our Lady of Mount Carmel is a parish established in
13 1841, served at the base of operations for all
14 Catholic parishes and missions in Queens and Long
15 Island. The founding pastor—

16 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet,
17 please.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [shushing for
19 quiet]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: --Father
21 Michael Curren traveled by horseback and boat from
22 Astoria to everywhere from Flushing to Riverhead.
23 The current church is located on Newtown Avenue and
24 Crescent Street that opened in 1873. Over the years,
25 Our Lady of Mount Carmel has served tens of thousands

2 of Catholics. Many have attended the parish school
3 in our community from 1891 to 2005, and the church
4 continues to serve a diverse and multi-cultural
5 population of our neighborhood with Sunday mass in
6 five different languages: English, Spanish, Italian,
7 Czech, Vietnamese. More than 3,000 people per month
8 receive help and--and services at the parish's food
9 pantry at our--at Saint Martha--Mary Chapel, and
10 Monsignor Olgle, as a native Astorian, has worked in
11 Queens County his entire life as the dean of

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
13 [shushing for quiet]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: --of eight
15 Catholic parishes in Long Island City and Astoria has
16 always someone our communities can count on, and we--
17 we seek his guidance. So today we're proud to have
18 him here giving us his fine invocation.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
20 Council Member, and again we welcome the Monsignor to
21 the House of the People. Thank you. Adoption of
22 minutes.

23 CLERK: None.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Messages and
25 Papers from the Mayor.

2 CLERK: M-440, the Mayor's Management
3 Report.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Received order,
5 printed and filed. [pause]

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication
7 from city, county and borough offices.

8 CLERK: Preconsidered M-441, Expense
9 Budget.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Finance.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and
12 Communications.

13 CLERK: None.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call-
15 ups.

16 CLERK: M-442 through M-448 on page 3,
17 various applications.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on call-
19 up vote, roll call.

20 CLERK: Barron.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.

22 CLERK: Borelli.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye.

24 CLERK: Cabrera.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

29

2 CLERK: Chin.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

4 CLERK: Cohen.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

6 [shushing for quiet]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

8 CLERK: Constantinides.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.

10 CLERK: Cornegy.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.

12 CLERK: Crowley.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye.

14 CLERK: Cumbo.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye.

16 CLERK: Deutsch.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

18 [shushing for quiet]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.

20 CLERK: Dickens.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye.

22 CLERK: Dromm.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

24 CLERK: Espinal.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.

2 CLERK: Eugene.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Can we ask the
5 individuals in the hallway to be quiet, please, and
6 the council members on the left. (sic)

7 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER COPELAND: Aye.

9 CLERK: Garodnick.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

11 CLERK: Gentile.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: I'd to vote aye
13 on all call-ups, and with permission I'd like to vote
14 on all coupled general orders.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: I vote aye.

17 CLERK: Gibson.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Aye.

19 CLERK: Greenfield.

20 [background comments]

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Greenfield.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye.

23 CLERK: Grodenchik.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

25 CLERK: Kallos.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

31

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I'd like to vote
3 aye on all call-ups and with permission I'd like to
4 vote on all coupled general orders.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I vote aye.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

8 CLERK: King.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
10 [shushing for quiet]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye.

12 CLERK: Koo.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

14 CLERK: Koslowitz.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.

16 CLERK: Lancman.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Lancman.

18 CLERK: Lander.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.

20 CLERK: Levin.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.

22 CLERK: Levine.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

24 CLERK: Maisel.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Maisel.

2 CLERK: Mealy. Menchaca. Mendez. Miller.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye.

4 CLERK: Palma.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

6 CLERK: Reynoso.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

8 CLERK: Richards.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

10 CLERK: Rodriguez.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

12 CLERK: Rose.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

14 CLERK: Rosenthal.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye, and I

16 would like to vote aye on all call-ups, and with

17 permission I'd like to vote on all coupled general

18 orders.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I vote aye.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, thank you.

22 CLERK: Salamanca.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: With-with

24 permission I would like to vote on all items on the

25

2 general orders calendar as well as any and all
3 resolutions and land use call-ups. I vote aye-

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
5 yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: --on all.
7 Thank you.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 CLERK: Lancman. Torres. Treyger.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

11 CLERK: Ulrich.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Aye.

13 CLERK: Vacca.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye.

15 CLERK: Vallone.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye.

17 CLERK: Williams.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Williams.

19 Williams.

20 CLERK: Wills.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Aye.

22 CLERK: Matteo.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Aye.

24 CLERK: Van Bramer.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: I vote aye.

2 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

3 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Aye. [pause]

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Today's Land Use
5 Call-Ups were adopted by a vote of 45 in the
6 affirmative, 0 in the negative. Quiet in the
7 chambers, please. Now, we'll hear from the Speaker
8 Melissa Mark-Viverito.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Could I ask my
10 colleagues to just rise for a minute?

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All rise.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [coughs]
13 Yesterday morning, as I indicated earlier the NY
14 Bronx Engine 75 Battalion Chief Michael Fahy was
15 killed in an explosion in the Kingsborough
16 neighborhood of the Bronx. Our emergency personnel
17 are out in the city everyday exhibiting bravery and
18 selflessness while they work to keep us safe. I
19 definitely want to take a moment of silence. We have
20 three children that now are without their father.
21 It's just a constant reminder of what our first
22 responders to each every day on behalf of all of us,
23 on behalf of this wonderful city. So I want to
24 definitely take a moment of silence to honor Chief

25

2 Fahy's extraordinary sacrifice. [moment of silence
3 observed] Thank you, my colleagues.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: On the 17th, we
6 saw another event require the courage of our
7 emergency personnel. When an improvised explosive
8 device—

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
10 [shushing for quiet]

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --went off in
12 Chelsea—

13 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet please.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --our first
15 responders, many of whom we recognize here today were
16 on the scene within minutes reassuring our citizens
17 and securing the area from any further risks. We are
18 grateful for the quick response, and grateful not
19 lives were lost that day. It really cannot be
20 understated how thankful we are for the work that
21 FDNY, NYPD, EMS and all other emergency response
22 teams around the city are doing. So we thank you all
23 for what you do. Also, just to recognize and many of
24 you may have known that one of our staff actually is
25 fine obviously, but one of our staff was also

2 impacted by that incident, and he's doing well. I
3 placed a call to him, but it really has touched many
4 in different ways. On that note I also actually want
5 to take a moment to recognize the passing of Israel
6 Leader Shimon Peres last night. A tireless advocate
7 for peace, Shimon Peres served twice as the Prime
8 Minister of Israel, twice as interim Prime Minister
9 and as a member of 12th Cabinet in a political career
10 spanning over 66 years, which included only recently
11 with his terms as the ninth president of Israel from
12 2007 to 2014. A Nobel Peace Prize Laureate, Peres
13 was visionary and a beloved statements who famously
14 pointed out to the world that optimists and
15 pessimists die the same way. They just live
16 differently. I prefer to live as an optimist. Also,
17 I want to thank Council Member Jumaane Williams for
18 bringing to our attention that we want to also note
19 the passing of Dr. Lamuel Stanislaus, a community
20 activist and former ambassador to the U.N. from
21 Grenada. Dr. Stanislaus was one of the founders of
22 the West Indian day-American Day Carnival, an
23 important part of the New York community for over 50
24 years. So we can them in our thought. And I want to
25 also-like to acknowledge the opening of the

2 Smithsonian African-American Museum in DC this past
3 Saturday. I want to send congratulations to those
4 whose initiative made this treasure a reality. I am
5 pleased to see our nation's capital reflecting the
6 inclusive history that built it. And finally, on
7 that note I want to just to all my colleagues and
8 friends who are celebrating the Jewish New Year,
9 which begins this Sunday evening, and I think we have
10 some cookies that are being shared by one of our
11 members. I want to—I want to thank him, but as we
12 celebrate the Jewish New Year, which begins this
13 Sunday evening, I want to wish a [foreign language]
14 and a happy new year to all.

15 So today, the Council will be voting on
16 legislation that builds on our commitment to making
17 our city greener and more sustainable for all New
18 Yorkers. Biodiesel is a bio-fuel that burns cleaner
19 and costs less than traditional petroleum fuel oil.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
21 [shushing for quiet]

22 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet please. Keep it
23 down.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Introduction 642-
25 A sponsored by Council Member Costa Constantinides

2 will increase the amount of biodiesel in heating oil
3 from 2% to 20% by October 2034. By transitioning to
4 cleaner heating oil, we are sending less carbon
5 monoxide, less particulate matter and fewer unburned
6 hydro carbons to the atmosphere. For the staff I
7 want to thank Bill Murray, Samara Swanston, Jonathan
8 Seltzer for their work on this bill. I want to thank
9 Cost Constantinides for his leadership, and he will
10 say a few words about this bill.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you
12 Madam Speaker. I want to thank you again for your
13 leadership, and your bold vision on the environment,
14 and making sure that New York City is more green and
15 more sustainable and all my colleagues. I rise today
16 to ask my colleagues to support Intro 642, a bill to
17 raise the biofuel standard in New York City home
18 heating oil. Heating oils are a major source of air
19 pollutants in New York City. I think that 70% of
20 emissions come from buildings and home heating oils
21 are responsible for approximately 12% of local
22 emissions of particulate matter. More than vehicle
23 traffic or power plants. Petroleum diesel exhaust is
24 a major source of air pollution and exposure to-to
25 such exhaust and has adverse health effects including

2 increased mortality rates, respiratory diseases,
3 changes in lung function and asthma attacks.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
5 [shushing for quiet]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Links
7 have been documented between air pollution from
8 diesel exhaust and various cardio pulmonary diseases.
9 Compared to using petroleum diesel, using biodiesel
10 and a diesel agent it reduces emissions to
11 particulate matter, sulfates and carbon monoxide.
12 With this bill, we will increase our use of biodiesel
13 from the current tested standard of 2% to 5% by
14 October 2017. That will—then we'll raise that blend
15 up to 20% by 2034 incrementally. This policy reduces
16 the fossil fuel contents of heating oil, expands the
17 use of biofuel in our home heating oil. It will
18 reduce pollution, upgrade air quality, and improve
19 our public health. Biodiesel commit up to 90% fewer
20 greenhouse gases and up to ten times less particulate
21 matter. This increase going from 2% to 5% blend has
22 the environmental impact equivalent to taking 45,000
23 cars off the road every year. Increasing to the 20%
24 blend is the equivalent of taking up to 175,000 cars
25 off the road. This policy is nothing new. Blending

2 biofuel and heating oil has been a citywide practice
3 since 2012 when then Mayor Bloomberg signed into law
4 and required a standard of 2% biodiesel blend.

5 Thanks to our city's commitment to cleaner heating
6 oil standard, the Department of Hospitals estimated
7 there have been 780 fewer deaths, 1,600 fewer emergency
8 visits for asthma, and 460 fewer hospitalizations for
9 respiratory and cardiovascular disease. I also want
10 to take a moment to clear up some of the
11 misconceptions surrounding this bill that have been
12 permeated by big oil, and their motivation is that
13 we'll be burning conservatively 150 million gallons
14 of oil less-

15 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet
16 please.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: --at 20%.
18 First, there is no evidence that biodiesel is more
19 expensive than standard petroleum. Its cost is
20 historically the same or cheaper. Our biofuel comes
21 predominantly from grease recycled from restaurants-

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
23 [shushing for quiet]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: --across
25 the city, and from waste products of soy beans

2 products. Increasing biodiesel will not benefit a
3 few select individuals. It will support green jobs
4 across our city. Restaurants can sell their used
5 cooking grease to the grease collectors that turn
6 into biofuel instead of spending money of having it
7 disposed of. One of the goals of NY-One NYC, which
8 achieved the cleanest air of any city in the country.
9 The biodiesel legislation previously passed, and the
10 market created by the use of biofuel has not only
11 improved our air quality, it has grown jobs and
12 reduced our reliance on fossil fuel. With the
13 legislation being voted on today, we move much closer
14 to the goals of One NYC in reducing our emissions 80%
15 by 2050. I want to thank all of the advocates, the
16 League of New York Conservation Voters who have been
17 strong proponents, the Environmental Defense Fund,
18 Empire Clean Cities, United for Action, and the
19 Teamsters for their strong advocacy and support. And
20 again our Council staff Ed Adkins, Laura Popa, Jeff
21 Baker, Samara Swanston, Bill Murray, John Seltzer and
22 my own Legislative staff Nick Wizowski and John Ben-
23 Benjamin for all their great efforts. In this today,
24 we're taking a huge step forward in making our city

2 more green and sustainable. Thank you, Madam Speaker
3 again for your leadership.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank--thank you,
5 Council Member. I also want to recognize that we
6 have been in the audience sitting here our former
7 colleague Mark Weprin, former Assemblyman, now
8 working with Governor Cuomo. I think he's sitting
9 over here. [applause/cheers] There he is.

10 MARK WEPRIN: [off mic] Thank you.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [laughs] Next,
12 the Council is going to be voting on legislation to
13 bring New York City's Energy Conservation Code in
14 line with--

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
16 [shushing for quiet]

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --recent changes--
18 -

19 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
20 down.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --with recent
22 changes made to the Statewide Code. Under New York
23 State Law, New York City may have its own energy
24 conservation code as long as it is at least
25 asterisked (sic) as the state's own energy

2 conservation code. In August, New York State adopted
3 a revised 2016 supplement to that state code.

4 Introduction 1277-A, sponsored by Council Member
5 Williams, will update and make technical changes to
6 our existing code most of which will focus on minimum
7 efficiency requirements for heating, ventilating and
8 cooling equipment. I want to thank on the staff side
9 here Jim Wilcox, Megan Chan, Guillermo Patino, Jose
10 Conde and Sara Gastelum. Council Member Williams
11 will say a few words about his bill.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I thank you,
13 Madam Speaker. I actually think you covered most of
14 it. It's just the technical fixes, and I thank you
15 for your support.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright, thank
17 you, and finally the Council will be voting on a
18 package of legislation to help reform our city's
19 jails. This is another milestone for the Council in
20 our continuing focus on the City's criminal justice
21 system as we lead the way in our nation's progress in
22 addressing major criminal justice issues.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
24 [shushing for quiet]

25 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: This package-

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet,
3 please.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: This package will
5 require the—the use of progressive techniques in
6 interacting with vulnerable inmates, establish due
7 process in determining admissions to crucial
8 departmental programs, increase transparency for
9 those programs, and streamline procedures for
10 obtaining inmate's important medical records among
11 other efforts to make our city's jail more humane and
12 transparent. I want to thank Brian Crowe, Will
13 Hungat (sp?), Steve Reister (sic) on the staff side,
14 and then this—this is the package, and I'll ask
15 members to speak according to the ones that they
16 sponsored.

17 Introduction 1064-A, sponsored by Council
18 Member Elizabeth Crowley, would require the
19 Department of Corrections to issue a yearly report on
20 inmate programming including vocational training,
21 counseling, cognitive therapy, and drug treatment
22 among others. The reports will be required to
23 include information related to funding, the number of
24 inmates of served, a brief description of each such
25 program and successful completion and compliance

2 rates where applicable. Combined this legislation
3 will help the Council fully examine the effectiveness
4 of DOC's programming efforts, and the rehabilitation
5 of those incarcerated in our jails, and I will ask
6 Council Member Crowley to say a few words.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you. Good
8 afternoon. I am pleased that the Council will vote
9 today on this package of bills related to the
10 Department of Correction for various reform measures
11 to ultimately improve the environment in our city's
12 jails. I'd like to thank our Speaker Melissa Mark-
13 Viverito for her advocacy and her commitment to
14 criminal justice reform. The bill that I sponsored
15 will require the Department of Correction to issue a
16 yearly report on inmate programming, and bring a
17 greater level of transparency to these programs. The
18 City has allocated new funding for inmates to receive
19 up to five hours of programming a day amounting to a
20 \$22 million safe line in the budget. This is up from
21 previous years by 400%. It is important the
22 Department of Correction report on the types of
23 programs it offers, participants taking these
24 programs and the overall effectiveness of the
25 programs. Through this, we can ensure that our City

2 dollars spent [background comments] responsibly and
3 efficiently, and inmates are participating in
4 meaningful activities and receiving real services.
5 Many thanks again to our Speaker and to all my
6 colleagues who have sponsored criminal justice
7 legislation today, City Council Members Gibson,
8 Johnson, Cohen and Cumbo. Thank you.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
10 Council Member. The next bill up for consideration
11 regards trauma-informed care. Trauma-informed care
12 is a method training victims—I'm sorry—of treating
13 victims of trauma that has been developed in part by
14 the Substance Abuse and Mental Health Services
15 Administration of the United States Department of
16 Health and Human Services. Introduction 1144-A
17 sponsored by Council Member Laurie Cumbo requires the
18 training and usage of trauma-informed care, and
19 regular reporting on its implementation. [background
20 comments] This method has been used successfully in
21 a variety of context including in correctional
22 facilities, and involves recognizing the symptoms of
23 trauma, and using trauma specific interventions that
24 may de-escalate volatile situations and help
25 stabilize inmates. This legislation would also

2 require an annual report on the use of trauma-
3 informed care, and is partnered with Introduction
4 1183-A, sponsored by Council Member Andrew Cohen,
5 which relates to the use of trauma-informed care in
6 city correctional facilities. First, the bill would
7 require the NYPD to create a report whenever a person
8 under arrest is treated by a healthcare provider
9 while in police custody. These reports will be
10 transferred to the Department of Health and Mental
11 Hygiene whenever an arrestee is sent to a city jail.
12 Second, the bill would require the Department of
13 Health and Mental Hygiene to screen every arrestee
14 brought to a criminal court arraignment for possible
15 health issues prior to being arraigned. Any health
16 issues found will be documented in a report which the
17 Department of Health and Mental Hygiene would combine
18 with reports created by the NYPD and forward to
19 Correctional Health Services in advance of their
20 first evaluation of an inmate. The bill would also
21 require the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene
22 to create procedures to ensure prompt access to
23 hospital records for those treated while in NYPD
24 custody. Again, these are two bills. Council Member

2 Cumbo, I'll her to say a few words first, then
3 followed by Council Member Cohen.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you Speaker
5 Melissa Mark-Viverito. I am a proud sponsor of Intro
6 1144-A. This bill requires the DOC to utilize
7 trauma-informed care. Trauma-informed care is a
8 method of treating victims of trauma that has been
9 developed in part by the Substance Abuse and Mental
10 Health Services Administration of the United States
11 Department of Health and Human Services. These
12 method-methods have been used in a variety of context
13 including in correctional facilities and involve
14 recognizing the symptoms of trauma and using trauma-
15 specific interventions that may de-escalate violent
16 situations and help stabilize that that have been
17 incarcerated. Many incarcerated women and men have
18 experienced some aspect of trauma-

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
20 [shushing for quiet]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: --often ongoing
22 during their lives--

23 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet,
24 please.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: --and as we know,
3 hurt people hurt people. The majority of women in
4 our criminal justice system have experienced various
5 degrees of trauma, many challenges including sexual
6 violence, rape, assault, childhood sexual abuse,
7 and/or they may have witnessed violence done to
8 others. In order for people to become productive
9 members of society once they are released, it is
10 vital that they are provided effective mental health
11 resources while they are incarcerated. Trauma-
12 informed care helps staff recognize symptoms of
13 trauma and adjust therapy accordingly. Studies have
14 shown that this method resulted in a 62% reduction in
15 staff assaults, and a 54% reduction in inmate
16 assault. There is evidence that trauma-informed care
17 leads to less suicide attempts, disciplinary actions
18 and prison violence. That is why what we are doing
19 today is so important. Research suggests that
20 correctional systems working with women offenders
21 should be designed specifically to meet women's
22 needs. As Chair of the Committee on Women's Issues
23 and Co-Chair of the Women's Caucus, I look forward to
24 changing the correctional approach noted for our
25 communities to be treated in an appropriated manner

2 because the ultimate goal of prison is rehabilitation
3 and I would go further to safe healing. I would like
4 to thank Brian Crowe, the Fire and Criminal Justice
5 Legislative Counsel for working on a comprehensive
6 package of bills, which are intended raise the
7 quality of care [background comments] for our inmates
8 and raise standards, transparency and accountability
9 at our city's correctional facilities. We believe
10 that the need is urgent and to treat and work with
11 those that have been correct-institutionalized that
12 prioritize their needs. So the growth of these
13 individuals is done with dignity and the highest
14 regard to quality. In addition, a huge thank you to
15 my colleagues who have been instrumental in putting
16 this package together including Council Members
17 Crowley, Gibson, Cohen and Johnson. I'd also like to
18 thank Laura Popa and Matt Gewolb for your leadership,
19 and I'd like to thank this entire body for continuing
20 to have a commitment for equality for women wherever
21 they are including our correctional facilities.
22 Thank you.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: While the overall
3 population at Rikers has declined significantly, the
4 population with mental health issues has remained
5 stubbornly high. 1183 will provide for pre-
6 arraignment screening, which will created a record,
7 which will hopefully reduce the chances of the
8 person—the arrestee entering Rikers Island or upon
9 entering Rikers Island making sure that there's a
10 continuity of care, and that they get the treatment
11 that they need and are entitled to. Madam Public
12 Advocate, indulge me for just one second. I do want
13 to express my profound grief over the loss of Chief
14 Fahy, and the explosion in my district yesterday.
15 And I do want to thank the City for a tremendous
16 response. All agencies were on hand and the response
17 was very, very impressive for those people. Thank
18 you.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
20 Council Member. This legislation, the one we just
21 referred to, will go a long way in ensuring
22 continuity of care for inmates and manage the city
23 jails. I'm very proud of that and with similar—with
24 a similar regard for inmate wellbeing, we'll also be
25 voting on Introduction 1014-A sponsored by Council

2 Member Corey Johnson, who is unfortunately not here
3 with us, which deals with annual reporting the number
4 of released inmates who were repeatedly treated for
5 mental illness while in DOC custody. This report
6 would also give us insight into recidivism as it will
7 track the percentage of treated inmates who re-enter
8 DOC custody within one year. Finally, we will be
9 voting on Introduction 899-A sponsored by Public
10 Safety Chair Vanessa Gibson, which established formal
11 procedures for the DOC's Nursery Admission process.
12 The DOC currently operates a 25-bed nursery to house
13 pregnant inmates, and children recently born to
14 female inmates. This nursery has historically
15 operated under capacity. So the bill will codify
16 standards for considering inmate admission. This
17 includes having the warden of the facility make
18 initial admission determinations and providing
19 written decisions to any inmate whose admission is
20 denied. Specifying the reasons for denial and
21 establishing an appellate-appeals process. The bill
22 would also require reporting related to the
23 programming services available, and usage of the
24 nursery as well as the reporting on the placement of
25 children denied admission to the nursesey. This is a

2 great bill. I want to thank Council Member Gibson
3 for her leadership, and she'll say a few words.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you very
5 much, Madam Speaker, Madam Public Advocate. Good
6 afternoon to all of my colleagues. Despite all of

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
8 [shushing for quiet]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: --the investment
10 and intention--

11 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
12 down, please, keep it down, please.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: --that we have
14 given Rikers Island recently, correctional health and
15 women's health in particular continues to be short-
16 changed. Health is an invaluable asset and can make
17 or break a detainee's ability to thrive upon being
18 released from jail. We can and must do better. Women
19 who give birth while they're incarcerated or who have
20 recently given birth proceeding their incarceration
21 have a unique set of needs. Rikers Island is among a
22 handful of jails that offer a nursery program,
23 allowing those mothers to live with their infant
24 children for up to 12 months. For that, I am
25 extremely thankful. Nationally, nurse programs have

2 been proven to decrease recidivism and long-term drug
3 use among mothers who have been admitted. The
4 nursery provides these women with physical and
5 psychological services, education and nutritional
6 classes that they might not otherwise have had access
7 to as well as educational, recreational, and health
8 services for their newborn children. This is a
9 program that is proven to help so many women and
10 preserve their infant's early childhood development.
11 It is simply unacceptable for the Department of
12 Corrections to fail these women and their children
13 and not to take every step possible to reduce
14 recidivism among detainees. This afternoon, this
15 City Council has the opportunity to fundamentally
16 change the Rikers Island Nursery Program by
17 establishing clear procedures and protocol around
18 admission and recordkeeping. Intro 899-A will
19 improve the Nursery Program and restore basic rights
20 to incarcerated mothers and their infants. This
21 legislation will further stipulate that the
22 Department of Corrections consults with the early
23 childhood development experts in both cases where it
24 may not be in the child's best interest to be in the
25 Nursey Program. Finally, this legislation will

2 mandate female detainees are notified of the Nursey
3 Program upon entry to Rikers Island, and also
4 requires information on the nursey to be clearly
5 posted in our clinics. These are common sense
6 measures to mitigate the lasting social-emotional and
7 physical health impacts of needlessly separating
8 infants from their mothers, and require the
9 department to improve basic recordkeeping on the
10 application as well as outcomes of women who apply
11 for this critical program. I am absolutely grateful
12 and thankful to have the co-sponsorship of so many of
13 our colleagues here, but certainly want to recognize
14 our Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito for her leadership
15 and support, our Chair of the Committee on Fire and
16 Criminal Justice Services, Council Member Elizabeth
17 Crowley, fellow Women's Caucus Co-Chair, and Chair of
18 the Women's Issues Committee Council Member Laurie
19 Cumbo, and Council Member Helen Rosenthal. And I
20 also want to thank and recognize the incredible work
21 of the Legal Aid Society, their Prisoner's Rights
22 Project, and the Women's Prison Association for their
23 strong support of this bill. I also want to
24 recognize the staff who worked so tirelessly on this

2 legislation, Laura Popa, Rachel Cordero, Robert
3 Collandra, Brian Crowe [background comments]—

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
5 [shushing for quiet]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: --who did
7 tremendous work.

8 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet please.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: And from my staff
10 Kaitlyn O'Hagan and Dana Wax. I think you all for
11 your support, and urge you to vote in favor of Intro
12 899. Thank you Madam Speaker. Thank you Madam
13 Public Advocate.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Council
15 Member and again thanks to all Council Members. Let
16 me just end with this. You know, I want to just
17 quickly address some of the protests, which have been
18 occurring including from the—our city police (sic)
19 within this Council. We are quite obviously in a
20 difficult moment in our nation's history. The bitter
21 scars of racism-- I—I would appreciate it if I could
22 get attention.

23 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down, please.
24 Keep it down, please.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
3 Chambers, please.

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Can you keep it quiet.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you. So,
6 I'll start again, and I want to just address that
7 some of the protests, which have been occurring
8 including some taking place within this Council. We
9 are quite obviously in a difficult moment in our
10 nation's history. The bitter scars of racism,
11 institutional and otherwise continue to plague us,
12 and systemic issues continue to persist. You just
13 have to listen to the news what's been happening the
14 past several weeks, and the past several months and
15 years. In New York City we have made strides, but
16 clearly there's a lot more work that needs to be
17 done. The hate which has been directed towards
18 Council Member Williams, which we read about the
19 other day is horrific. He has the right to protest.
20 This is his right as a citizen of this country and no
21 one can take that away from him. No one. As some of
22 you may remember, a few years ago—a few years ago I
23 faced similar criticism when my own patriotism and
24 love of this country was questioned when I was
25 running for Speaker, and it continues to be

2 questioned to this day. It was hurtful then and it
3 is hurtful now. These tactics are designed to
4 created otherness and try to set us against one-one
5 another, and we cannot let that happen. It is
6 important to speak out against injustice in all
7 forms. It is important for us to stand up or sit
8 down for what's right and it's important we talk to
9 each other, that we listen each other's experiences
10 and perspectives. That we learn from that, we grow
11 from that, we respect that. Because that is what
12 shapes our frame of reference. As I said in my State
13 of the City in 2015, it is through listening that we
14 being to put aside our own biases. It is through
15 listening that we can start to heal, and as long
16 we're listening and that's active listening not
17 passive listening to really be able to absorb what it
18 is that you're being told. It is only through
19 listening that we can gain a better understanding of
20 one another. So please let's listen to each other
21 and let's reach higher ground that we are striving
22 for, and with that, I end communication from the
23 Speaker.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. On
25 that note, I wanted to recognize Jumaane's mother who

2 was in the balcony, but I do not see her, but we
3 welcome her to the Chambers. [applause] Discussion of
4 General Orders. Seeing none, Report of Special
5 Committees.

6 CLERK: None.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of
8 Standing Committees.

9 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
10 Environmental Protection, Intro 642-A, Clean Heating
11 Oil.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
13 coupled on General Orders.

14 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
15 Finance, Preconsidered Reso 1228, Special Assessment
16 Districts.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
18 [shushing for quiet]

19 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
20 down, please. Keep it down.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
22 General Orders.

23 CLERK: Preconsidered Reso 929,
24 Organization Funding.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

60

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
3 General Orders.

4 CLERK: Preconsidered M-441 and Reso
5 1233, Expense Budget.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
7 General Orders

8 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Fire
9 and Criminal Justice Services, Intro 899-A, Rikers
10 Island Nursery Program.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
12 coupled on General Orders.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
14 [shushing for quiet]

15 CLERK: Intro 1014-A, Report regarding-

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
17 [shushing for quiet]

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
19 down, please. Keep it down, please.

20 CLERK: Report regarding Mentally Ill
21 Inmates

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
23 coupled on General Orders.

24 CLERK: Intro 1064-A, Corrections to the
25 department program.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

61

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
3 coupled on General Orders.

4 CLERK: Intro 1144-A, Trauma Care in
5 Correctional Facilities.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
7 coupled on General Orders.

8 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
9 Housing and Buildings Intro 1277-A, Energy Code.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
11 coupled on General Orders.

12 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Land
13 Use, LU 427 and Reso 1234, UDAP (sic) Manhattan.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
15 General Orders.

16 CLERK: LU 438 and Reso 1235, Zoning
17 Permit.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
19 General Orders.

20 CLERK: LU 454 and Reso 1236 and LU 457
21 through LU 457 and Reso 1239, Property Tax Exemption.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
23 General Orders.

24 CLERK: LU 458 and Reso 1240 Sidewalk
25 Café.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 62

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
3 General Orders.

4 CLERK: LU 467 and Reso 1241 and LU 468
5 and Reso 1242 Queens Public Library.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
7 General Orders.

8 CLERK: Preconsidered LU 469 and Reso
9 1243, Property Tax Exemption.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
11 General Orders.

12 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Mental
13 Health, Developmental Disability, Alcoholism,
14 Substance Abuse and Disability Services, Intro 1183-
15 A, Health Information of Inmates.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
17 coupled on General Orders.

18 CLERK: On the General Order Calendar
19 Resolution Appointing Various Persons Commissioner of
20 Deeds.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
22 General Orders, and at this time I ask for roll call
23 on all items on the Coupled General Order Calendar.

24 CLERK: Barron.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.

2 CLERK: Borelli.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all
4 except 642.

5 CLERK: Cabrera.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.

7 CLERK: Chin.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye on all.

9 CLERK: Cohen.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Cohen.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: [off mic] I vote
12 aye.

13 CLERK: Constantinides.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye on
15 all.

16 CLERK: Cornegy.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye on all.

18 CLERK: Crowley.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye on all.

20 CLERK: Cumbo.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye on all.

22 CLERK: Deutsch.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye on all.

24 CLERK: Dickens.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye.

2 CLERK: Dromm.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

4 CLERK: Espinal.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye on all.

6 CLERK: Eugene.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

8 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland. Garodnick.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

10 CLERK: Gibson.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Aye on all.

12 CLERK: Greenfield.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye.

14 CLERK: Grodenchik.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye on all.

16 CLERK: Cohen.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

18 CLERK: King.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye on all.

20 CLERK: Koo.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

22 CLERK: Koslowitz.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.

24 CLERK: Lancman.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

2 CLERK: Lander.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye on all.

4 CLERK: Levin.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye on all.

6 CLERK: Levine.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye on all.

8 CLERK: Maisel.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

10 CLERK: Mealy.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: May have

12 permission to call on Land Use and General Orders?

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I vote aye on all.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

16 CLERK: Menchaca.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye on all.

18 CLERK: Mendez.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote aye on all

20 and request permission to vote on the Land Use and

21 General Order Calendar.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote aye on all

24 again. Thank you.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

2 CLERK: Miller.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLE: Aye on all.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 CLERK: Palma.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: [off mic] Aye.

7 CLERK: Reynoso.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I vote aye on

9 all.

10 CLERK: Richards.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye on all.

12 CLERK: Rodriguez.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

14 CLERK: Rose.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye on all.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

17 [shushing for quiet]

18 CLERK: Torres.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all.

20 CLERK: Treyger.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

22 CLERK: Ulrich.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Permission to—I'm

24 just kidding. Yes. [laughter] Aye on all. Just

25 kidding. Just kidding. Aye on all except—see, you

2 almost scratched me out. Aye on all except Intro
3 642. Thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 CLERK: Vacca.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye on all.

7 CLERK: Vallone.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all.

9 CLERK: Williams.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Williams.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye on all with
12 the exception of Land Use 438 and the accompanying
13 resolution 1235, which I abstain.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Abstaining. (sic)

15 CLERK: Wills.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Aye on all.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

18 CLERK: Matteo.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: No on 642-A and
20 aye on the rest.

21 CLERK: Van Bramer.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on all.

23 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And we did it.

25 Whoo. For those who are watching, there's not one

2 comment on any bill. Today, a celebration.

3 [laughter]

4 MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO: Let's keep it
5 going, right.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Not. All items on
7 today's General Order Calendar were adopted by a vote
8 of 60 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative, 0
9 abstentions with the exception of Intro 642-A, which
10 was adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative, 3
11 negative and 0 abstentions. Quiet down. And LU 438
12 and Reso 1235, which was adopted by a vote 49 in the
13 affirmative, 0 in negative and 0 abstentions, and the
14 Revised Land Use Call-Ups were adopted by 50 in the
15 affirmative. [pause] Well, for the Land Use Call-Ups
16 and Reso 1235 were adopted by a vote of 49 in the
17 affirmative, 0 negative and 1 abstention. Revised
18 Land Use Call-Ups 50 in the affirmative, 0 negative,
19 and that concludes the report. Introduction and
20 Reading of Bills.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All bills are
22 referred to committees, as indicated in on the
23 agenda.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: There are no
25 resolutions. We will immediately go to General

2 Discussion, the first beginning with Council Member
3 Garodnick, and the clock is now on for two minutes.

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
5 down, please.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you very
7 much, Madam Public Advocated. I wanted to draw my
8 colleagues' attention to a bill that I'm introducing
9 today, Number 1283, that would regulate the sale of
10 liquid detergent pods. Liquid detergent pods whether
11 used in your washing machine or your dishwasher are
12 undoubtedly convenient, particularly for busy
13 parents, but they have one major-

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
15 [shushing for quiet]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: --problem.
17 They pose--

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
19 down, please.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
21 [shushing for quiet] Excuse me Council Member. May
22 we have quiet in the Chambers. We're still in
23 session.

24 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down, please.
25 Can you be quiet, please.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. We
3 apologize, Council Member.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: They pose
5 safety risks for young kids. In the past 2-1/2 years,
6 there have been more than 32,000 calls to poison
7 control centers due to exposure to the highly
8 concentrated chemicals in these pods. And in 2015,
9 Consumer Reports determined that they could no longer
10 recommend liquid laundry pods due to safety concerns.
11 The most common root of exposure is ingestion. Young
12 children are enticed by the pods' bright multi colors
13 and eat them thinking that they are candy. The
14 consequences can be immediate and severe. Two years
15 of data from the National Poison Data System found
16 that 769 children required hospitalization due to
17 injuries sustained from ingesting a liquid detergent
18 packet. These injuries include seizure, vomiting,
19 fluid in the lungs, slow heart beats, gastric burn,
20 respiratory arrest, coma, and at least one case even
21 death. Candy colored and bit size detergent pods
22 pose real dangers to kids, and are accidents waiting
23 to happen. These detergent packets offer a real
24 convenience, but we need to set a standard that makes
25 them less likely to end up in the mouth of a young

2 child. This legislation establishes reasonable
3 safety measures to advance this important goal, and
4 prevent tragedies before they occur. As a father of
5 two young boys, I stand with all parents, as they are
6 common sense consumer protections for the health and
7 safety of our youngest New Yorkers. I urge my
8 colleagues to have a look at this bill, 1283 and to
9 affirm that safety cannot take a back seat to
10 convenience especially when it comes to our children.
11 Thank you and again, I encourage my colleagues to
12 have a look at the bill. Thank you.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
14 Council Member Williams.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.
16 First, I want to add my condolences to Fire Captain
17 that was killed in the Bronx explosion. I also
18 wanted to send my condolences to the family of Dr.
19 Lamuel Stanislaus-

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
21 [shushing for quiet]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: --who was one
23 of the original founders of the Labor Day Parade, and
24 also a union ambassador. He also hails from the
25 Island Grenada. His nice, Milam--that is stressed

2 here. (sic) Also, as the first Grenada-American
3 elected in New York City, his name always rang very
4 loudly when I was growing up. Second, I want to make
5 the comments about my promoter's protests. One, I
6 want to thank Black Latino Asian Caucus for their
7 letter of support, and thank the Speaker for her
8 letter of support. I thank all of my colleagues in
9 this body and beyond for their letters and their
10 Tweets and their special media posts, and
11 particularly those who don't even agree with me, but
12 also sent letters of support. I do want to thank the
13 Council Member Espinal, Barron, Menchaca, Lander,
14 King, Rose and Reynoso for joining not just in
15 support of me, but in support of the cause. And I
16 want to make public note that this is not a surprise
17 any members who decided to that they will continue
18 standing. This is a very personal thing, and I
19 believe that many people have different ways of
20 expressing their angst and their actions and their
21 protests. No one was lesser than the other. We had
22 a press conference earlier with some veterans to help
23 push back on this anti-American and somehow
24 disrespectful. A veteran who won a Purple Heart also
25 talked about the wounds that he received in fighting

2 the right for this kind of protest. You cannot be
3 anti-American if you're asking America to live up to
4 its own ideals. I would also say many of the people
5 who are pushing back on this have not supported any
6 type of protest. I simply sat and prayed peacefully
7 in a Stated Meeting, not at a 9/11 memorial or not a
8 fallen soldier or funerals, a funeral for a fallen
9 soldier or an officer. Yet, I believe the question
10 at some point is do you even believe there is
11 anything to protest at all? Our legislation has
12 pushed back upon, and we began to walk from DC to
13 Staten Island. People were chanting "Get a job."
14 Also chanting that they could impact grief. (sic) So
15 hopefully, as the Speaker said, we can respect each
16 other's journey, and really begin to believe in
17 people's experience and move the conversation
18 forward. Thank you.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

20 Council Member Deutsch. [pause]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you.

22 Sorry for the delay. Today, I'm introducing the bill
23 Intro 1280 that will enable New Yorkers to obtain
24 police reports from a motor vehicle accident via
25 email. Currently when motorists are involved in an

2 accident it can be often stress—be stressful and a
3 time consuming experience to attempt to obtain a
4 police report from the local precinct. It can
5 involve multiple phone calls, a lone waiting period,
6 and generally having to go down to the precinct to
7 pick up the report. For NYPD officers preparing the
8 report, and then coordinating with the involved
9 parties for pickup can also occupy unnecessary,
10 lengthy amount of time. My bill would expedite that
11 process for both the police officer and the drivers
12 involved in the accident with one click of a button.
13 The report can be sent out and received in an
14 expeditious manner. This will free up NYPD resources
15 to focus on crime fighting and other important
16 matters as well as alleviating the stress that so
17 many have to experience when trying to acquire a copy
18 of their accident report. People and residents in
19 our—spend actually 25 years of their lives sleeping,
20 and up to 10 years of their lives waiting in line.
21 Let's not waste any more time. We need to make
22 things easier, and quicker for our constituents, sign
23 onto—and support this bill as a co-sponsor. Thank
24 you.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
3 Council Member Cabrera.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you.
5 Today, I am introducing Resolution 1224 calling upon
6 New York State Legislators—Legislature to pass and
7 the Governor to sign legislation requiring
8 installation and the use of safety motion sensors in
9 the doors of all school buses. Between 2005 and 2015
10 there were 31 reported accidents involving a school
11 bus driving a student because the school bus door
12 closed on the student's limb or backpack. The New
13 York City Office of People Transportation, services
14 over 600,000 students daily not counting field trips.
15 With so many students at possible risk for injury,
16 safety motion sensors in school bus doors should be a
17 requirement. I incur—encourage all my colleagues to
18 sign onto this resolution. Thank you.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
20 Council Member Chin.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you. Good
22 afternoon. I want to draw my colleagues' attention
23 to Intro 1278, legislation introduced by me along
24 with Council Members Koo, Menchaca, Salamanca and
25 Treyger. This bill brings us one step closer to

2 ensure greater transparency for the social adult day
3 care that operates within our community. Social
4 adult day cares provide a vital service for the fun-
5 functional impaired seniors and their caregivers.
6 They offer seniors a safe place to socialize and
7 receive services. They also give unpaid caregivers a
8 much needed break to go to the store or even enjoy a
9 quick movie. There are 266 registered social adult
10 daycares in the city, and too many of them operate
11 with little oversight, and sometimes even deploy
12 illegal tactics to make a quick buck. Some require
13 seniors to take services that they do not need.
14 Other brazenly offer cash to seniors to refer their
15 friends. Intro 1278-

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
17 [shushing for quiet]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: --will require the
19 Department for the Aging to provide social adult
20 daycare to a performance summary card that must be
21 placed in a prominent position-position in the
22 facility. The performance card will include the
23 social adult daycare's compliance to the New York
24 State office for the Aging regulations, the time of
25 operation, capacity, and comparison to other social

2 daycares. I also want to quickly ask for your
3 support for Resos 1225 and 1226. These resolutions
4 will ask the State Legislation—Legislature to give
5 the State Department of Health and the State Long-
6 Term Care Ombudsman's program the support it needs to
7 ensure quality adult care facilities. Wanted to
8 thank Eric Bernstein, Michelle Lee, and Annie Decker
9 for their work on these bills and resolutions, and I
10 ask my colleagues to sign on. Thank you.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
12 Council Member Barron.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Madam
14 Public Advocate. We all know that Rosa Park is known
15 for sitting down and refusing to give up her seat.
16 You might also know that Jackie Robinson, the famed
17 football player, refused to sit at the back of the
18 bus, and for that—

19 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please. Quiet
20 please.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: --he was court
22 martialed. It was eventually overturned, but he also
23 refused to be subject to the racist expressions that
24 this country has. Now, we know that Colin
25 Kaepernick, the football player, is expressing his

2 displeasure with what's happening in our society, and
3 we all remember John Carlos and Tommy Smith at the
4 1968 Olympics expressing their protest to what was
5 going on at that time. We do also want to
6 acknowledge, though, that this body is acknowledge
7 that what they had done was, in fact, commendable and
8 it was this body while Council Member Charles Barron
9 who was here.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
11 [shushing for quiet]

12 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down, please.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. Gave
14 them a proclamation talking about their act. At time
15 when they were under real, real stress and
16 oppression, one of them whose wife committed suicide,
17 there so much stress that she was subjected to. So
18 here we are in 2016. Not much has changed. There's
19 an ongoing assault on black men and black women, and
20 people are only protesting by sitting down or
21 kneeling down or refusing to say the pledge or sing
22 the anthem. I think that it speaks volumes to how
23 far we have yet to go.

24 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down, please.
25 Keep it down.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And I'm glad that
3 our colleague has decided that he would sit and join
4 in that statement of protest. I commend my husband
5 who during the time that he was here also sat during
6 the pledge, and I'm joining in those efforts with
7 those people who are protesting the ongoing
8 conditions, the expanding assaults on black men and
9 women. And I will be sitting down during the salute
10 to the flag. I'm not standing for the anthem as
11 well. Thank you.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
13 Wills.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Good afternoon. I
15 rise to join my fellow co-sponsor, Council Member
16 Miller in urging this body to support Reso 1230.
17 Among the core principles of our nation's founding is
18 the freedom of religious expression, and those ideals
19 will only continue to hold truth so long as people
20 with good character facing the Americans stand
21 together to affirm them. Particularly when the
22 rights and dignity of people of another religion,
23 Islam, are blatantly and continually abridged by
24 those with retaliate. (sic) We are deemed fortunate
25 to live a city, state and country where such rights

2 are lawfully detected, acknowledged and inspected.
3 That a Muslim public school child educated in our
4 city now has an equal opportunity to participate in
5 his or her religious belief as their as their peers
6 underscores this effort. They is avowed discourse
7 exchanged by those typically lurking within the
8 farthest bounds of our society increasingly threatens
9 to desensitize everyday citizens to dehumanizing and
10 venomous slurs, a type of rhetoric that has been
11 channeled as acts of violence, vandalism and even
12 cold blooded murder. Not only against practitioners
13 of Islamic faith, but all those indiscriminately
14 targeted by the willful ignorant like Indians, Sheiks
15 and Bengalis. We have a responsibility to remind the
16 public that people of every religious faith including
17 those without faith possess the constitutional rights
18 to live in accordance with the principles without
19 fear or intimidation. Muslims wear their uniform in
20 defense of community and nation, and constantly give
21 their lives willingly in the course of doing so. It
22 is also worth noting a recently departed member of
23 the Islamic faith, humanitarian and boxing legend
24 Mohammed Ali was a conscientious objector to the
25 Vietnam War. And as I call on the rest of my

2 colleagues to support Reso 1230, I wish to
3 acknowledge the right of each Council Member to
4 express his or her dissatisfaction with the besieged
5 social inequity of justice without being subjected to
6 vicious racial bigotry. I thank Council Member I.
7 Daneek Miller for sponsoring this reso and I urge the
8 rest of the Council to sign on. Thank you.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank your.
10 Council Member Miller.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Madam
12 Public Advocate and thank you Council Member Wills
13 for your passionate representation. I am also rising
14 to—to introduce Reso 1230. This weekend myself and
15 the Public Advocate and Madam Speaker had the
16 opportunity to join many residents in the City of New
17 York in the matter of united Muslim Day Parade.
18 While this celebration has become a tradition, this
19 year is especially meaningful because of the
20 increased rhetoric and attacks against Muslims in the
21 city of New York and throughout the country. That is
22 why I have introduced this resolution resolving New
23 York City's declares its support for the Muslim
24 community. Affirms religious pluralism of the United
25 States and urges all residents to stand together for

2 peace and understanding. According to the Council on
3 American Islamic Relations, in 2015 Islamophobia has
4 increased across the country five times greater than
5 just after 9/11. Just last year, 78 mosques were
6 targeted with vandalism, the highest since this
7 number has been recorded, and began in 2009. Another
8 study showed that in 2014 overall hate crimes were
9 down across the United States, while most crimes
10 against Muslims have risen by 15%. New York City was
11 founded by people who fought for-for-for freedoms and
12 religious freedom, and this body has an obligation
13 ton continue to uphold those ideals and those
14 freedoms. I have been proud to be a part of a
15 Council who has continued to recognize the
16 contributions of the Muslim faith throughout the City
17 of New York and ensured that the rights of our-our
18 young scholars in practicing their religion and their
19 faith and not having to sacrifice that between their
20 educations and these holidays. Also, this week the
21 Administration launched outreach efforts online
22 campaign that said I am Muslim to support the Muslim
23 community. This progress is something that we can
24 all be clearly proud of, but there is certainly much
25 more than can be done. We Quran--

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
3 Council Member, could you bring your comments to a
4 close?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Yes, ma'am, I
6 will the Quran says that we should cooperate with
7 each other in matters of goodness and righteousness
8 and not cooperate with one another in matters of sin
9 and hostility. Unfortunately, this past year we have
10 had to come together many times in violence against
11 Muslims, but each time there was a rabbi, a priest,
12 and members of the community standing with us. This
13 resolution has many sponsors. I ask that you stand
14 with us and stand against Islamophobia, xenophobia,
15 and stand up for freedoms. Thank you and I ask my
16 members to support.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
18 Council Member Cumbo.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. I also
20 want to celebrate the opening of the first African-
21 American Museum on the Smithsonian Mall, and I want
22 to applaud its Executive Director Lonnie Bunch, and
23 people all over the world who have celebrated the
24 history of African-American contributions to our
25 great country. I am proud today to introduce

2 Resolution 1227 to recognize September as Infant
3 Mortality Month in New York City. In 2014, the
4 infant mortality rate for black children was
5 approximately 11.01 per 1,000 live births, more than
6 tripled that of white children which was
7 approximately 2.8% per 1,000 live births. Part of
8 the disparity in infant mortality rates among races
9 can be attributed to a lack of access and education
10 about pre and postnatal care. By recognizing
11 September as Infant Mortality Month in New York City,
12 we will help raise awareness about the causes and
13 solutions for infant mortality especially in
14 communities of color. I urge my fellow council
15 members to sign this resolution so we can utilize
16 September to highlight the truth about infant
17 mortality, thereby encouraging women to seek the
18 necessary health care for themselves and their baby.
19 In fiscal year 2017, \$4 million from the Council and
20 the Administration is supporting the Nurse-Family
21 Partnership, an evidence-based nurse home visiting
22 program that provides support to low-income first
23 time mothers. I want to say that I authored this
24 resolution in memory of my daughter Jade Cumbo Cuello
25 (sp?) that I lost on January 3, 2013 in the six

2 months of my pregnancy. I hope that this resolution
3 will encourage more women to come forward, and to
4 share their experiences and to take the stigma away
5 from infant mortality. Thank you.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
7 Council Member Levin.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very
9 much, Madam Public Advocate. I want to acknowledge
10 and stand with Council Member Cumbo and her support
11 of awareness for infant mortality. We need to do
12 more as a city to address prenatal and postnatal
13 healthcare, mental health services for expectant
14 mothers and new mothers, and look forward to working
15 with Council Member Cumbo on addressing those issues.
16 I also want to acknowledge that they—this week, this
17 Friday is the 40th Anniversary of the Hyde Amendment
18 in the U.S. Congress, and that has been an impediment
19 to comprehensive women's healthcare by preventing
20 women who are seeking abortions from receiving
21 federal funds, except in the case of rape and incest
22 and when likely the mother is at risk. There are
23 actions around the country this week calling for the
24 repeal of the Hyde Amendment, and just this week the
25 Boston City Council passed a resolution that mirrors

2 the New York City Council's resolution from 2013
3 sponsored by our Finance Chair Julissa Ferreras-
4 Copeland, and we want to make sure that that women
5 throughout our country are able to receive
6 comprehensive healthcare without restriction, and-and
7 that particularly low-income women have access to-to
8 all healthcare that they are entitled to. Thank you
9 very much.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
11 Council Member Lander.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Madam
13 Public Advocate. For every New York City Council
14 meeting over the past seven years, I've stood, placed
15 my right hand over my heart and said the Pledge of
16 Allegiance. Today, I remain seated in an act of
17 solidarity and patriotism. At this moment in
18 American history, as we see in our people of color
19 citizens of the republic for which it stands, killed
20 by police officers far too frequently. As we see the
21 consequences of systemic racism in housing,
22 education, criminal justice I believe it's important
23 for white people to see, name, and take
24 responsibility for our privilege and to find ways to
25 act in solidarity with people of color working for

2 justice. For me, there's no better ally in that work
3 than Council Member Williams, but when he sat during
4 the Pledge at our last meeting while I respected his
5 protest, I didn't feel compelled to join him. After
6 reading the racist hate mail he received, however, it
7 became clear to me that it was an important—it was
8 important for me to join him today. But it's not
9 only an act of solidarity. It's also an act of
10 patriotism. Our allegiance to this country is not
11 one of race, ethnicity of skin color. It's not blood
12 or DNA or common ancestry that we share when we
13 pledge allegiance. It's allegiance to a shared
14 commitment to a deep set of democratic goals and
15 practices, and our job as legislators and citizens is
16 to hold this country to those ideals, and asking the
17 fundamental questions about how we're doing is highly
18 patriotic. Where Eric Garner, Michael Brown, Betty
19 Gray, Sandra Bland, Alton Sterling, Fernando Castillo
20 created equal, endowed with unalienable rights, are
21 we to the best of our ability a country with liberty
22 and justice for all? It seems clear to me today that
23 the answer is not yet, and it was in that spirit of
24 forming a more perfect union of what Martin Luther
25 King called the fierce urgency of now that I remain

2 seated. I'm not withdrawing from my pledge of
3 allegiance. I'm taking it as seriously as I know
4 how. I'd also like to give props to Council Member
5 Miller for Resolution 1230, and note that Council-

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
7 Council Member.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: --that local
9 elected officials all around the country through
10 local progress in the Young Elected Officials Network
11 is standing up against Islamophobia, and I'm proud
12 that the City Council is a partner in that work.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
14 Council Member Greenfield.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: [pause] Thank
16 you, Madam Public Advocate. First, I'd also like to
17 associate myself and recognize the importance of what
18 Council Member Cumbo and Council Member Miller have
19 respectively done today. They're speaking about
20 issues that to them are very personal and bringing
21 it to our attention. I certainly will be signing
22 onto those resolutions and encourage my colleagues to
23 do the same. I do also want to express my-my real
24 disappointment and anger at the actions that have
25 been targeted towards Council Member Jumaane

2 Williams. Certainly unacceptable. While we can
3 agree to disagree on issues, we have to do it in an
4 agreeable way, and the rhetoric and the heat that has
5 been sent his way in a certain ironic perspective
6 actually simply reinforces what he has been trying to
7 do with the statement that has been making. I want
8 to thank him for speaking up, and I encourage him to
9 keep at it. And finally, with my final minute, I
10 just wanted to recognize, as the Speaker mentioned
11 earlier today that there was a significant loss
12 today. One of the great statesmen from around the
13 world and that was the former Prime Minister and
14 President of Israel and that person is Shimon Peres.
15 He has spent his life dedicated to founding and
16 starting Israel, and realized that in order for Israel
17 to successfully continue that he needed to lead the
18 way towards a peace process and, in fact, he was fond
19 of saying that there is no alternative to peace. I
20 think it's actually a very important message that
21 when people talk conflict around the world, that
22 there really is no alternative for peace. He was a
23 foreign minister, a defense minister, a finance
24 minister, a prime minister, president and even in his
25 last days--and I was privileged to meet with him on

2 several occasions--even in his last days he was
3 actually quietly trying to restart the peace process
4 by meeting with the passing authority. He was not
5 successful, but his legacy of optimism and hope and
6 [bell] and commitment to the future, a peaceful
7 future endured. So thank you very much.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 Council--and lastly Council Member Menchaca.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you,
11 Madam Public Advocate. I'm also standing today and
12 proud to be introducing a resolution with Council
13 Member Daneek Miller, and others to declare support
14 for our Muslim communities affirming their religious
15 pluralism of the United States and urging all New
16 Yorkers to stand together. We're doing this in
17 solidarity as elected officials from across the
18 country, and leaders in our communities. We stand
19 against hate crimes, against school bullying, against
20 workplace discrimination, against closing of our
21 borders--our borders on the basis of religion and
22 against hate. You know, we're elected
23 representatives, and we say to those who are on the
24 streets right now fighting for lives to matter who
25 hear yourselves described as murderers and rapists

2 like candidates for the nation's highest offices who
3 fear for the safety of their children. We are on
4 your side, and we vow in our positions to stand up
5 against anti-Muslim bigotry, against xenophobia,
6 against hatred and against oppression, and we vow to
7 promote local laws, and policies that advance the
8 equity and the value of diversity, and again also to
9 my brother Jumaane Williams, the Council stands with
10 you in solidarity. We stand with you, and we stand
11 for the future of this city as we continue to discuss
12 race in our city and our neighborhoods and our
13 hearts. Thank you.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
15 Speaker, to close. Speaker Mark-Melissa Mark-
16 Vivertio.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Madam
18 Public Advocate, and—and I want to thank all my
19 colleagues for your words today, and I—I want to
20 thank Laurie for your courage and for the work that
21 you're doing to raise awareness. It's such an
22 important issue. We're going to close and—and
23 Vanessa just brought to my attention that as being
24 reported in the Daily News we have yet another
25 shooting in an elementary school in South Carolina

2 where one is dead, and thankfully, the suspect is in
3 custody, and it's just—seems to be a daily
4 occurrence. We have to do something. We've been
5 talking about that in terms of the National Gun
6 Policies, and we've started to make changes. We
7 don't want to see this becoming our normal. So thank
8 you, everyone. Have a great rest of your day, and
9 with that, I guess we are adjourned.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We stand
11 adjourned. [gavel]

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date October 16, 2016