CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

----- X

May 4, 2016

Start: 12:21 a.m. Recess: 02:08 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E:

DAVID G. GREENFIELD

Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

ANDREW COHEN

ANNABEL PALMA

ANTONIO REYNOSO

BEN KALLOS

BRAD S. LANDER

DANIEL R. GARODNICK

DARLENE MEALY

DEBORAH L. ROSE

DONOVAN J. RICHARDS

INEZ D. BARRON

INEZ E. DICKENS

JUMAANE D. WILLIAMS

MARK TREYGER

PETER A. KOO

RITCHIE J. TORRES

ROSIE MENDEZ

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

COUNCIL MEMBERS: (CONTINUED)

RUBEN WILLS STEPHEN T. LEVIN VINCENT J. GENTILE YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

David Gershwin-Gorlin (sp?) Resident

Bella Ackmeket (sp?) Resident

Kenya Handy Assistant Scheduler Office of New York City Comptroller

Simeon Bankoff Executive Director Historic Districts Council

William Zerker [sp?] Resident

Jennifer Thorpe-Moscon President Southern Brooklyn Democrats

Keith Suber Managing Member 911 Homesavers LLC

Daniel Loannou Volunteer Coney Island History Project

Rob Burstein President Coney Brighton Boardwalk Alliance

Michael Schwartz Artistic Director Coney Art Land Productions

Arlene Brenner President Coney Island Boardwalk Alliance

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Paul King Resident

Ralph Perfetto Founder Coney Island Neighborhood Organization

Mike Gunderson Resident

Christianna Nelson Boardwalk Alliance

Judith Kenapa Friends of Coney Island Brighton Beach Boardwalk

Ida Sanoff Activist

Tricia Vita Blogger Amusing the Zillion

Queenie Hubley Resident

Jeffrey Croft President New York City Park Advocates

1	COMMITTEE ON LAND USE
2	[gavel]
3	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Good afternoon.
4	My name is David Greenfield. I am the council
5	member from the 44 th council district in Brooklyn
6	and I'm privileged to serve as the chair of the
7	Land Use Committee. I want to welcome my esteemed
8	colleagues who are members of the committee,
9	Council Member Palma, Council Member Garodnick,
10	Council Member Mealy, Council Member Mendez,
11	Council Member Koo, Council Member Lander, Council
12	Member Rose, Council Member Richards, Council
13	Member Barron, Council Member Cohen, Council Member
14	Cohen, Council Member Kallos, Council Member
15	Torres, and Council Member Treyger. I want to thank
16	Chair Dickens for the work with the Planning
17	Subcommittee on Monday and Chair Richards for
18	conducting the hearing earlier this morning in the
19	Zoning Subcommittee. I'd also like to thank Chair
20	Koo for his leadership of the Landmarks
21	Subcommittee. The committee will be voting today on

22

23

24

25

morning in the o thank Chair rks Subcommittee. The committee will be voting today on one of the resolutions before you for presentation and vote by the full council. That resolution is Land Use number 358, Socrates Sculpture Park in Queens. This application was submitted by the New

2	York City Department of City Planning and
3	Recreation. Pursuant to Section 197-C and 199 of
4	the New York City Charter and Section 5-430 of the
5	New York City Administrative Code for an amendment
6	to the city map involving the establishment of
7	Socrates Sculpture Park, the establishment of a
8	public place and the elimination, discontinuance,
9	and closing of portions of 31 st Avenue on Broadway.
10	Socrates Sculpture Park is in Long Island City
11	Queens in Council Member Van Bramer's district.
12	Council Member van Bramer spoke at Monday's
13	Planning Subcommittee to express his support for
14	the application. And the Subcommittee recommended a
15	resolution approving this application which we will
16	be voting on today. Do any members have any
17	questions? Socrates Sculpture Park. I'm not quite
18	certain at the origin of the name. However, we are
19	establishing it. It has it has operated
20	informally as a park. We are establishing it as
21	formal parkland. We're also establishing public
22	place. And we're also going to discontinue portions
23	of 31 st Avenue in order to allow for that. And it
24	also involves a swap of some space and air rights.
25	Part of the portion of Socrates Sculpture Park

2.2

2.3

2	belongs to a private owner and that is going to be
3	swapped for a portion of the air rights of $31^{\rm st}$
4	Avenue which will be a public space so that
5	Socrates Sculpture Park can actually exist as an
6	actual park and so that it can be a complete park.
7	Any other questions. Hearing no other questions,
8	I'm going Councilman Mealy, questions, yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Yes, I just want for the record since it will be a park it would be nice if it had a comfort station. Just for the record. And they said they will be looking into it but just for the record I hope they can look into that real soon.

an excellent idea. The problem with comfort stations is that the cost of building of comfort stations in New York City is roughly 4,000 dollars a square foot. That's right, you heard me right. It's roughly 4,000 dollars a square foot while the cost of building standard union construction is 400 dollars a square foot. So due to a variety of ridiculous regulations that require a 1,000 percent increase in the cost of building a comfort station it is challenging to find the funding to build

COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye.

24

25

1	COMMITTEE ON LAND USE	9
2	COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez.	
3	COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.	
4	COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo.	
5	COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.	
6	COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander.	
7	COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.	
8	COMMITTEE CLERK: Rose.	
9	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.	
10	COMMITTEE CLERK: Richards.	
11	COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Permission to	
12	explain my vote? Permission to explain my vote?	
13	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Council Member	
14	[cross-talk] Chair Chair Richards to explain	
15	COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I just wanted	
16	to… [cross-talk]	
17	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD:his vote.	
18	COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Socrates True	
19	knowledge exists in knowing that you know nothing.	
20	I vote aye.	
21	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: So just for the	
22	record Chair Richards do you admit that you know	
23	nothing? Is that what you're saying?	
24	COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: That is what	

Socrates said Sir.

1	COMMITTEE ON LAND USE 10
2	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Oh okay.
3	COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay.
4	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you Chair
5	Richards.
6	COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.
7	COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye.
8	COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.
10	COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Permission to
12	explain my vote? I just want to state that my
13	favorite course in college was a seminar on
14	Socrates so
15	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Did you
16	graduate from college… [cross-talk]
17	COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: When I went to
18	college my one year.
19	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Oh one year.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: It was a
21	freshman honors
22	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: I heard it was
23	a great year for your college.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Yeah. I vote

aye. Thank you.

2	COMMITTEE	CLERK:	Treyger.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: By a vote of 14 in the affirmative, zero in the negative, no abstentions, all items have been adopted.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you. We are going to keep the vote open. And while we keep the vote open to give members the opportunity to vote we're going to take a short informal fiveminute break and then in five minutes or so we will move onto a public hearing on Resolution number 985 which is a resolution sponsored by Council Member Mark Treyger which is a resolution calling upon the New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission to designate the Riegelmann Boardwalk in Coney Island as a scenic landmark. So we're going to give you folks if you like just so that you know for folks who are here, members of the public we're going to ... we're going to give you the opportunity to take a five-minute break because we know some of you have come here early. And for members we're going to keep the vote open and we will continue this hearing in approximately five minutes. Thank you.

[pause]

25

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

2	COMMITTEE CLERK: Continuation vote in
3	Committee on Land Use; Council Member Levin.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I vote aye on
5	all.
6	COMMITTEE CLERK: Vote stands at 15 in
7	the affirmative. Council Member Rodriguez.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.
9	COMMITTEE CLERK: Vote stands at 16 in
10	the affirmative. Council Member Reynoso.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Vote stands at
12	17 in the affirmative.
13	COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Cohen.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.
15	COMMITTEE CLERK: Final vote in the
16	Committee on Land Use 18 in the affirmative, zero
17	in the negative, and no abstentions.
18	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you. That
19	concludes the final vote for the item that we have
20	on the Land Use agenda. And we will now move on to
21	the public hearing on Resolution 985 calling upon
22	the New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission
23	to designate the Riegelmann Boardwalk in Coney
24	Island as a scenic landmark. Just last year we
	_
25	commemorated the 50 th anniversary of the New York

2	City Landmarks Law. The Landmarks Law safeguards
3	the buildings and places that represent New York
4	City's Cultural, Social, economic, political, and
5	architectural history. Landmarks not only foster a
6	civic pride but also strengthen the city's economic
7	economy and enhance the city's attraction of
8	tourists. To be designated a landmark a site must
9	have a special character or a special historical or
10	aesthetic interest or value as part of the
11	development, heritage, or cultural characteristics
12	of the city, state, or nation. Previous scenic
13	landmarks have included Morningside Park and Ocean
14	Parkway. We recognize that preservation is often a
15	grassroots cause driven by communities representing
16	the vast diversity of New York City and we look
17	forward to hearing from such community residents
18	today. As background on the resolution Edward
19	Riegelmann took charge of beautifying Coney Island
20	and sharing public access to the beach and shore
21	while serving as Brooklyn Borough President from
22	1918 to 1924. After the city secured title to
23	property along the beachfront the three-million-
24	dollar beach improvement and boardwalk construction
25	began in 1921. The immense engineering project

2	required 1.7 million cubic yards of sand to add
3	another 2.5 million square feet to the beach area.
4	Construction of the boardwalk made use of 120,000
5	tons of stone, 77 hundred cubic yards of reinforced
6	concrete and 3.6 million feet of Timber including
7	long leaf yellow pine for the flooring. From a
8	height of 14 feet above the beach the 80-foot-wide
9	boardwalk stretch from West 37 th Street to Ocean
10	Parkway and provided easy access to both beach and
11	concessions. The boardwalk opened with great
12	fanfare on May 15 th , 1923 and even since has linked
13	the excitement of Coney's Colorful amusements and
14	the sweeping calm of beach and ocean. It's an
15	enduring symbol of New York City and its most
16	famous playground and certainly warrants
17	recognition as an official New York City scenic
18	landmark. This resolution we are considering today
19	recommends that the Landmark Preservation
20	Commission initiate the process to make the
21	boardwalk a scenic landmark. The council broadly
22	supports this resolution. We have 50 out of 51
23	members who have signed on as co-sponsors as well
24	as the public advocate. The… and the reason that
25	all this is happening is because of the tenacity of

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

one council member who since he has been elected
has been the greatest champion of Coney Island in
that area. And that council member of course is
Councilman Mark Treyger. He's the sponsor of this
legislation. I'd like to ask him to please say a

7 few words on his resolution.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you. Thank you very much Chair Greenfield and as well as to the Land Use Committee and the committee staff. I want to thank all of our residents from Southern Brooklyn and across New York for their... for their patience today. I know... know we got off to a late start and I will say it's not the first time Coney Island interests sometimes get delayed due to some Manhattan issues. But I certainly thank everyone for their patience today. To begin with I'd like to express my tremendous gratitude to all the people whose efforts have brought us here today. Once again to Chair Greenfield for holding this important hearing, his staff, and the Land Use Committee staff to all 50... 50 of my council colleagues in the city council including Council Member Salamanca who was just recently elected and

recently added his voice to the chorus of support

2	and Council Member Deutsch with whom I share the
3	boardwalk and we have bordering districts as well
4	as the public advocate for co-sponsoring the
5	resolution under consideration today to speaker
6	Melissa Mark-Viverito to Brooklyn Borough President
7	Eric Adams, to city Comptroller Scott Stringer,
8	Assembly Member Pamela Harris, State Senator Diane
9	Savino and Congressman Hakeem Jeffries for their
10	public statements in support of the Boardwalk to
11	Charles Denson of the Coney Island History Project
12	and Dick Zigun of Coney Island USA who have lent
13	their tremendous knowledge and expertise to this
14	fight and above all to the community members
15	including Ida Sanoff, Rob Burstein, and Arlene
16	Brenner of the Coney Brighton Boardwalk Alliance
17	and so many others whose tireless advocacy has kept
18	this issue alive. All the people gathered here
19	today recognize how vital the Riegelmann Boardwalk
20	is to the Coney Island and Southern Brooklyn in
21	general serving as the neighborhood's connective
22	tissue unifying attractions, businesses, and
23	residents. However, this resolution is about much
24	more than that. This resolution is about preserving
25	an iconic structure that has historically embodied

2	the American democratic spirit. American cultural
3	icons from Woody Guthrie to Woody Allen have
4	prominently featured Coney Island in their work
5	because its fiery scintillation, its grandiosity,
6	and its essential humanity or the physical
7	embodiment of the American dream. However, Coney's
8	history has not always been so inclusive. During
9	the gilded age and into the early 20 th century much
10	of Coney Island's landscape was dominated by
11	racially and religiously exclusive private hotels,
12	restaurants, and resorts. The city's decision to
13	build the public boardwalk for the enjoyment for
14	all New Yorkers help transform Coney Island into a
15	Mecca of leisure for the masses who flocked in on
16	newly expanded public transportation. While the
17	original Luna Park, Steeplechase Park, Dreamland,
18	and Adventureland captured both American and
19	international imaginations with their glimmering
20	spectacle it was the boardwalk that was accessible
21	to all visitors in Coney Island's hay day when over
22	a million people visited each day. For immigrants
23	the poor and the marginalized Coney Island was the
24	poor man's Riviera, the nickel empire. The 50 cent
25	admission fee to Steeple Chase and Luna may have

2	been out of reach but the five cent subway fare was
3	the only cost of entry to what the New York Time
4	then called the brilliant drama of the melting pot
5	at play. Along the boardwalk sample shows of
6	carnival performances, food vendors, and the
7	possibility of meeting someone new supplied the
8	magic. The unprecedented mixture of our races and
9	classes ethnicities along the boardwalk and even
10	under the boardwalk inspired by Oh Henry Isaac
11	Bashevis Singer, many others In the words of the
12	New York Times it was the most democratic place of
13	assembly in the world anchored by the Riegelmann
14	Boardwalk. The importance of the Riegelmann
15	Boardwalk in American Cultural History should be
16	enough to merit its designation as a landmark,
17	current plans to drastically alter the character
18	and composition of the boardwalk make its
19	designation in exigency. Hobbled by fires and
20	changing demographics Coney Island became a target
21	for ambitious developers and urban planners with
22	autocratic and exclusionary visions for what New
23	York should be in the years following World War II.
24	Many of its spectacular features have been lost in
25	time to remain only in nostalgia. The Riegelmann

2	Boardwalk however remains as a physical reminder of
3	Coney Island's enduring playful democratic spirit
4	and as an active social and recreation hub for the
5	Coney Brighton Community. The desire of distant
6	developers and bureaucrats to impose their designs
7	on Coney Island without seeking community input was
8	unfortunately not limited to the midcentury
9	exploits of Fred Trump and Robert Moses. A
10	similarly outrageous level of Hubertus was on
11	display in 2012 when their notoriously opaque
12	public design commission ignored public outcry and
13	improved a pilot program to replace a segment of
14	the boardwalk with recycled plastic lumber and
15	concrete believing believing their academic
16	expertise to be superior to the living, breathing,
17	vital experiential knowledge of community members.
18	I am not an expert in landmarks. I do however have
19	a basic sense of fairness. The Landmarks
20	Preservation Commission denied our preliminary
21	application finding the boardwalk to be
22	substantially altered from its original structure
23	to be eligible for protection and preservation. To
24	have one city agency deny the historic and
25	community value of the boardwalk because past

arceractions made by the city to the boardwark
failed to prioritize historic preservation or
community desires is nothing short of Kafka-esque.
Our communities and our history deserve better. I
thank my colleagues on the Land Use Committee for
their support of this resolution and for the
dedicated community members who continue to fight
an uphill battle for an earnest commitment to
preserving the backbone of Coney Island. And I'll
close by saying this. I am so proud of my
colleagues we did this without a conservancy. We
did this without lobbyists. We did this without
multi-millionaires. We did this at the old the old
fashion way at the grass roots level. Just because
we don't have a multi-million-dollar conservancy
doesn't mean that our history doesn't matter. We
matter in Southern Brooklyn just like anywhere
else. And I thank the chair for his his support in
having the hearing today.

 $\label{eq:chairperson} \mbox{ CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you very} \\ \mbox{ much and...}$

[applause]

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Folks while we... while we certainly appreciate the enthusiasm and

2	clapping we have a rule here in the city council
3	which is you cannot actually make any noise of any
4	sort. And so if you want to clap we have a council
5	clap which is you can waive your hands like this.
6	And that way we know that you're very excited and
7	thrilled. We're going to have to ask you please not
8	to make any any noise and we certainly appreciate
9	that. And so I… Councilman Treyger I want to thank
10	you for the work that you've done here. It
11	certainly is extraordinary and I actually will say
12	this is the chair, the land use committee and as
13	someone who's very familiar with the landmark
14	regulations in fact this would seem to fall
15	squarely within the administrative code's
16	definition of a scenic landmark which is any
17	feature or aggregate of landscape features any part
18	of which is 30 years or older, which have a
19	special character or special historical or
20	aesthetic interest or value as part of the
21	development, heritage, or cultural characteristics
22	of the city, the state, or the nation. Under every
23	objective reading of the administrative code Coney
24	Island would qualify as a scenic landmark. Other
25	scenic landmarks include Central Park, Varsity

2	Square, Grand Army Plaza, Ocean Parkway,
3	Morningside Park Scenic Landmark, and we… we really
4	have a whole host of scenic landmarks some of which
5	quite frankly would seem to be less important than
6	the iconic status that the boardwalk has on Coney
7	Island. And we are certainly disappointed that the
8	Landmarks Preservation Commission has chosen not to
9	testify at today's hearing however we do appreciate
10	that they sent a representative to hear our
11	concerns and we thank Lauren George for joining us.
12	And we hope that those concerns will be crystal
13	clear that the council 50 out of 51 members of the
14	city council expect that the process to you,
15	landmark, Coney Island's Boardwalk will begin
16	immediately. With that we're going to call our
17	first panel. We're going to ask our first panelist
18	actually we we have limited usage of interpreters
19	today and so we're going to ask for those folks who
20	plan on testifying in the Russian language to
21	please join us first as the first panel and to give
22	your name to the Sergeant of Arms. You can come on
23	up if you plan on testifying in the Russian
24	Language so that way we can utilize our
25	interpretors IF you can give your name we believe

that we have two folks here who have mentioned that
they are going to testify in the Russian language
and that is David Gershan [phonetic] Gershwin-
Gorlin Excellent. Mr. Gershwin-Gorlin if you can
please join us. And Bella Ackmeket if you can
please join us as well. And we're also going to
invite for the first panel a representative from
Comptroller Scott Stringer's Office Kenya Handy.
I'm going to ask Council Member Treyger to say what
I just said in Russian so that for those folks who
may not have understood me to get that message
across which is that we'd like for the Russian
speakers to testify first. Thank you Council Member
Trevaer.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Okay... [speaking Russian]

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Okay we have a tradition at the council that we allow representatives from government agencies to go first as a curtesy so we're going to ask Kenya Handy from New York City Comptroller Scott Stringer's office to go first and then we'll return to the public testimony. Thank you Kenya.

1	COMMITTEE ON LAND USE 24
2	KENYA HANDY: Hello. Thank you. My name
3	is Kenya Handy… [cross-talk]
4	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: And and just
5	KENYA HANDY: Oh.
6	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD:if just to
7	make this clear actually we we at the request of
8	Council Member Treyger we're going to allow for
9	three minutes on the clock for public testimony so
10	if the clerk or the Sergeant at Arms wouldn't mind
11	just turn the clock onto three minutes we'd
12	appreciate that. Kenya it's all yours.
13	KENYA HANDY: Thank you. My name is
14	Kenya Handy. I am Brooklyn Borough Director for
15	Community Affairs in the Office of the City
16	Comptroller and I will be testifying on his behalf.
17	Thank you Chairperson Greenfield for holding this
18	hearing today and to Council Members Treyger and
19	Deutsch for introducing and supporting resolution
20	985 calling on the landmark's preservation
21	commission to designate this historic Coney Island
22	Boardwalk as a scenic landmark. Three and a half
23	years ago Coney Island was devastated by Superstorm
	1

Sandy. Homes were lost, communities were uprooted

and a neighborhood struggled to figure out what

24

25

2	came next. Today, thanks to the leadership of this
3	council, the hard work of neighborhood
4	organizations and the resilience of the people of
5	Coney Island America's playground has been rebuilt
6	and the community is growing stronger every day.
7	Coney Island's economic and cultural heart can be
8	found in its many iconic landmarks. The Coney
9	Island Shore Theatre, the Cyclone, the Wonder
10	Wheel, the Parachute Jump. But when New Yorkers
11	think about Coney Island they probably think about
12	one thing above all else, the historic boardwalk
13	that for generations has been the place where
14	diverse beach goers and residents alike have
15	reveled in the beauty and the possibility of Coney
16	Island. That's why I stand with this council to
17	call upon the LPC to designate the boardwalk as a
18	scenic landmark. Land marking the boardwalk will
19	further the the best interest of the community and
20	the city by allowing the city to pursue its
21	sustainability goals while granting official
22	recognition to this nearly century old icon.
23	Accordingly, I urge council to pass resolution 985
24	and for the Landmark's Preservation Commission to

_	
2	add the Coney Island Boardwalk to Brooklyn's list
3	of scenic landmarks. Thank you.
4	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you very
5	much. We are now going to turn it over to Bella and
6	David. And we're just going to ask and Council
7	Member Treyger if you can just clarify this point
8	as well that they speak in 20 second bursts so that
9	the translator can actually have the ability to
10	translate otherwise she won't be able to translate
11	the entire thing. Thank you.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: [speaking
13	Russian] Thank you.
14	DAVID GERSHWIN-GORLIN: [speaking
15	Russian]
16	TRANSLATOR: I was at a second world war
17	and Paul sent a delegation that for me to speak
18	about Broadway… Boardwalk…
19	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Can we just I
20	apologize can we just get him to identify himself
21	first, please.
22	TRANSLATOR: My name is Majan
23	Nerendaques [phonetic] I'm an interpreter for
24	Accurate Communication.

1	COMMITTEE ON LAND USE 2
2	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you and
3	can we… also can we ask you David can you just
4	identify yourself as well, just for the record?
5	Thank you.
6	DAVID GERSHWIN-GORLIN: My name is David
7	Gershwin-Gorlin.
8	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you.
9	DAVID GERSHWIN-GORLIN: [speaking
10	Russian]
11	TRANSLATOR: The question as whether
12	cement or wood is better for that establishment
13	the… the whole problem is that this is a place of
14	recreation and rest and there are children playing
15	around. And everyone likes to walk around barefoot.
16	DAVID GERSHWIN-GORLIN: [speaking
17	Russian]
18	TRANSLATOR: In order to construct a
19	cement construction, you need metal and the cement
20	itself is a solid matter that needs to be brought
21	into a liquid form and then back into a solid
22	matter.
23	DAVID GERSHWIN-GORLIN: [speaking
24	Russian]

1	COMMITTEE ON LAND USE
2	TRANSLATOR: The structure is metallic.
3	The ocean is made from salt water. Salt degenerates
4	metal and therefore it degenerates cement.
5	DAVID GERSHWIN-GORLIN: [speaking
6	Russian]
7	TRANSLATOR: The problem also is that
8	you would need to repair it also and doing the
9	repairs, all of the particles are turning into
10	dust.
11	DAVID GERSHWIN-GORLIN: [speaking
12	Russian]
13	TRANSLATOR: And that's dust is
14	dangerous for people with breathing disorders.
15	DAVID GERSHWIN-GORLIN: [speaking
16	Russian]
17	TRANSLATOR: And also in in order to
18	clean the service you would need to water it with
19	fresh water and that fresh water from from the
20	cement, it evaporates.
21	DAVID GERSHWIN-GORLIN: [speaking
22	Russian]
23	TRANSLATOR: And to put a construction
24	that needs continuous rain on is not friendly for
25	hroathing

1	COMMITTEE ON LAND USE 25
2	DAVID GERSHWIN-GORLIN: [speaking
3	Russian]
4	TRANSLATOR: And the wooden construction
5	yes you do need to repair, however, in order to
6	save that kind of boardwalk… nature it is
7	healthier.
8	DAVID GERSHWIN-GORLIN: [speaking
9	Russian]
10	TRANSLATOR: Thank you very much for
11	your attention.
12	[applause]
13	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Wave we can
14	waive. Thank you. Thank you. And Bella can you just
15	state your name for us for the record and then you
16	can begin your testimony.
17	BELLA ACKMEKET: [speaking Russian]
18	TRANSLATOR: I live in Brighton and I
19	take care of the candidates for the area. I know
20	everybody who lives in the area. I'm familiar with
21	all of the buildings and all of the people who… who
22	live and and enjoy the boardwalk and I know that
23	everyone is for maintaining the wooden surface of

the boardwalk.

2	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you.
3	Before we continue would you just ask her please to
4	state her name for the record please? Thank you.
5	TRANSLATOR: [speaking Russian]
6	BELLA ACKMEKET: Bella
7	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you very
8	much Bella continue.
9	BELLA ACKMEKET: [speaking Russian]
10	TRANSLATOR: I know many… many names of…
11	of influential people including Mark Treyger if
12	BELLA ACKMEKET: Deutsch… Chaim Deutsch.
13	TRANSLATOR: And Chaim Deutsch and I
14	hope that's if we will be able to obtain a status
15	of a land landmark that would be just about
16	wonderful.
17	BELLA ACKMEKET: [speaking Russian]
18	TRANSLATOR: When they were demolishing
19	parts of the Boardwalk I did make aware [speaking
20	Russian]
21	BELLA ACKMEKET: [speaking Russian]
22	TRANSLATOR: I did make Eric Adams aware
23	that underneath whatever they're taking apart is
24	still a very good quality wood which could be used
25	to repair parts of the Boardwalk that need repairs.

1	COMMITTEE ON LAND USE 3
2	BELLA ACKMEKET: [speaking Russian]
3	TRANSLATOR: If it would be impossible
4	to obtain status of a historical landmark then at
5	least I would I would plead for a part from Ocean
6	Parkway to… to Shore Road to be able to fix and
7	maintain the quality of the boardwalk as it is.
8	BELLA ACKMEKET: [speaking Russian]
9	TRANSLATOR: Thank you very much for
10	your attention and good luck with your decision and
11	we will do everything to be able to support our
12	point of view and if needed to gain signatures
13	obtain signatures.
14	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you very
15	much. Any questions for this panel? Hearing none
16	this panel is dismissed. We're going to call up our
17	next panel and… [cross-talk]
18	COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: [speaking
19	Russian]
20	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Simeon Bankoff,
21	Daniel Loannou, Keith Suber, William Zucker, and
22	Ida Sanoff. And while our panel is coming up I'd
23	like to ask Council Member to say some few words on

this Resolution.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you Chair 3 Greenfield. First of all... [speaking Russian] everyone. I just want to start off by saying that 4 5 when I first ran for office when I began my campaign I started campaigning in no other place 6 than the Boardwalk. It's surrounded by thousands of 8 my constituents as I represent Brighton Beach. So you know I'm sure that in 1921 when the Boardwalk began to be built there were hundreds of ... of 10 11 workers out there and they... they got paid pennies a 12 day. And it wasn't about only... only about putting 13 bread and butter and food on the table and making 14 sure that they could make ends meet, but they put 15 the heart and soul into the boardwalk. It wasn't just a job. It was something that they have done 16 17 because they knew that the boardwalk will be a 18 haven, thousands, millions of people throughout the 19 years. When the Boardwalk was built it instantly 20 became an icon that drew together the entire South 21 Brooklyn shoreline into what the shore line has 2.2 become today. In the early 1900s Brooklyn Borough 2.3 President Edward Riegelmann made this boardwalk his mission. And the substance of what this boardwalk 24

is as it is... as it stands today, it stands for

2	family, for community, for the cultural melting pot
3	that New York City has always been and continues to
4	be. There are untold numbers of people who have
5	literally grown up on this boardwalk. In the summer
6	you have parents there with their new babies,
7	little children on school trips, teenagers who come
8	to the boardwalk with their friends, young couples
9	just starting out their lives together, parents,
10	grandparents, their pets, their friends, their
11	families, folks from here in Brooklyn, tourists
12	from across the world, immigrants, and so much
13	more. Millions of people over the years have made
14	memories on our boardwalk. And it's time for the
15	boardwalk to be recognized as the landmark that it
16	truly is. And even more than that the boardwalk
17	must be maintained. Looking at the state of
18	disrepair that it is in today… there are nails
19	sticking out, boards that are loose. Whole sections
20	that haven't been touched in far too long. The
21	wooden boardwalk does not just belong to the people
22	of Coney Island or Brighton Beach or South
23	Brooklyn. This is New York City's boardwalk. And
24	New York City needs to maintain it. Parks
25	Department is intending to spend millions of

2.2

2.3

dollars moving the bathroom on the boardwalk with
only a couple of hundred of feet away. There's
money for this but not money to preserve our
boardwalk. There is a reason that this resolution
has such widespread support throughout the city is
because this boardwalk means something to each of
the thousands who have signed petitions, tweeted
their supports, spoken up at rallies, and who have
come here today to testify. And I thank you all for
that. The Landmark's Commission has an obligation
to act on behalf of the people of this city and
declare our boardwalk an official landmark today.
Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you

Council Member Deutsch. We'd also like to invite

Jennifer Thorpe-Moscon and I see you've already

joined us so why don't you start us off with your

testimony. Just a reminder that there's three

minutes on the clock. We ask that you please try to

adhere to that. And we'll start from you and then

we'll move our way down. Thank you very much

Jennifer.

JENNIFER THORPE-MASCON: Great. Thank you. My name is Jennifer Thorpe-Moscon and I'm here

2	on behalf of myself and also the organization of
3	which I'm President, Southern Brooklyn Democrats.
4	My organization represents neighborhoods in
5	Brooklyn spanning a large majority of Southern
6	Brooklyn including Coney Island, Graves End,
7	Bensonhurst, Sheepshead Bay, Brighton Beach and a
8	number of other neighborhoods. And we absolutely
9	support the resolution to landmark the boardwalk,
10	the wooden boardwalk. It is a crucial part of our
11	community's culture. It has been a part of my life
12	since I was just a child. Every summer I have so
13	many memories of being there and it was a place
14	where people from all backgrounds could come
15	together and be as one. And that culture and that
16	history must be maintained. It is crucial that we
17	maintain the boardwalk and protect it as it is in
18	its current character for generations to come.
19	Thank you very much.
20	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you. Simeon.

SIMEON BANKOFF: Good afternoon Council
Members. I'm Simeon Bankoff, Executive Director of
the Historic District's Council. I'm also one of
Council Member Deutsch's people who grew up on the

2	Boardwalk. I'm actually was my family lived in
3	Manhattan Beach for 50 years and I went to Junior
4	High School in Coney Island obviously. And I'm
5	thrilled by the way to be here in front of the
6	Council A, testifying in front of the Land Use
7	Committee, a rare pleasure, and B, that the
8	council's taking such a strong stance on
9	preservation and such proactive one. This is
10	fantastic and I applaud this effort and applaud
11	Council Member Treyger for bringing this forward.
12	Obviously the… the Coney… the Riegelmann Boardwalk
13	is a landmark, it should be a landmark. This is
14	self-evident. However, the point is just making it
15	a a landmark is not enough. The city must actually
16	maintain it and actually repair it back to its wood
17	surroundings. It should also frankly take out the
18	sand from underneath it because anyone will tell
19	you that that putting sand underneath a boardwalk
20	will wick up moisture into the into the wood which
21	then causes the the rotting problems.
22	Unfortunately, the landmarks preservation
23	commission of which I am very fond is not a capital
24	agency. This falls firmly on the shoulders of the
25	parks department who has been negligent for decades

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

1516

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

with regards to maintaining it. So I strongly support this resolution and strongly urge the council to tell our agencies to take care of this wonderful landmark for all of us.

WILLIAM ZERKER: My name is William

Zerker. As a lifelong resident of the Brighton Beach community I have found the iconic Coney Island Boardwalk to be an absolute godsend, a facility upon which I can relax for hours in the open air right by the waters of the Atlantic Ocean. I find the environment absolutely salubrious and healthful and this is the feeling of the many who come here from other communities to enjoy and relax over what the boardwalk uniquely has to offer. I would hope that the Parks Department does not go ahead with its plans to replace the wooden walkway with a concrete one as the charm of the facility that has been enjoyed by many for generations would be totally lost becoming like being on an ordinary paved street. Since the Coney Island Boardwalk is an aesthetic and scenic icon, one that is rich in history and that enjoys both local and worldwide fame it should be landmarked in order that it be protected for us now and for future generations to

2.2

2.3

enjoy. I strongly urge the landmark's preservation commission to do so. I respectfully suggest that they show fairness to our community and be more receptive to the evidence of its being highly deserving of this designation as well as to the express desires of the many New Yorkers who have made their voices heard for years now urging that the boardwalk be granted its rightful status. Thank you.

REITH SUBER: Good morning Council. My name is Keith Suber. I'm the president of the Suber Project in Coney Island. It's a grassroots organization. I'm also the co-owner of 911 Home Savers which is a construction company. My fondest memories of the Boardwalk is my grandmother. My grandmother was an employee for the Parks

Departments in the 70s... early 70s and 80s. I'm not going to tell my age but I was born in 66... that makes me 50 years old. And... Most I remember is you know seeing her grandmother on her hands and knees cleaning up the bathrooms. She used to have to go down the stairs to obtain use of the bathrooms in the Coney Island Boardwalk. And she used to get to the... my favorite part was West 5th street... play

nandball because I used to get the I used to get
the chance to sit there and watch the older guys
play handball. And we know that Coney Island is
famous that park is famous for a lot of famous
individuals come out of that area for playing
handball. And you know just under the boardwalk
itself it speaks a lot of volume. Coney Island is
a great place. We we have lost a lot of our icons
because of Hurricane Sandy but we know that a lot
of things still remain. We have we have the short
theatre which would be coming back should be
coming back alive soon. We have the parachute jump.
And and I looked at this hearing as a a a DNA
test. Like like I think the Boardwalk is 99.99
percent the father and I think that we should I'm
definitely in favor of keeping that boardwalk alive
for many years to come. Thank you.

DANIEL LOANNOU: Hi, I'm Daniel Loannou, volunteer at the Coney Island History Project and today I'm making a statement for Charles Denson who's the Executive Director of the Coney Island History Project and also wrote Coney Island lost and found. In December 2014 the staff of the Landmarks Preservation Commission sent a letter to

Council Member Mark Treyger stating that the Coney
Island Boardwalk has no historical or cultural
significance. In the opinion of the staff they
declared the most important period of significance
in the history of Coney Island as a seaside resort
predates the construction of the Boardwalk. For
some reason the LPC staff has decided to downplay a
relevant and significant chapter of Coney Island's
history and they are wrong. During the 1920s
following the closure of the private race tracks
and restrictive hotels Coney Island was resurrected
as the People's Playground. The shore foot was
expanded and reclaimed by the city and open to the
public. The boardwalk became the island's main
street celebrated and legend song. All six of Coney
Island's official city landmarks date from the era
of the boardwalk. Five of them were built after the
boardwalk began construction. Three of them can be
accessed via the boardwalk. And all can be seen
from the boardwalk. The boardwalk attracts the most
diverse crowds in the entire city and in essence
has not changed since it opened in 1923. The
political battle to construct a public beach and
hoardwalk began in the 1890s and remains a

2	momentous achievement in Coney Island's history.
3	Building the boardwalk is an incredibly complicated
4	process that involves a supreme court ruling, the
5	purchase of miles of private beachfront and the
6	invention of new engineering techniques that are
7	still in use today. The structure is constructed on
8	concrete pilings in the ocean surf and the beach
9	was expanded the first time hydraulic pumping has
10	had been used to create a broad accessible beach.
11	Before the boardwalk was built visitors had to pay
12	a fee to access the beach. After the boardwalk
13	opened a million poor immigrants and people of
14	small means were able to flee the stifling
15	sentiments of the city and find free access to the
16	healthy environment of the beach and ocean breezes.
17	New theatres and hotels were constructed, public
18	transfer brought millions to the shore and the new
19	boardwalk free to all was the centerpiece. It
20	remains a popular symbol of Coney Island's
21	resurrection. The boardwalk meets the same
22	requirements as Ocean Parkway, a Brooklyn Scenic
23	Landmark since 1976. The landmark commission has
24	stated to become a scenic landmark an outdoor site
25	must be at least 30 wears old and have a special

character or special historic or aesthetic interest
or value as part of the development, heritage, or
culture characteristics of the city, state, or
nation. The boardwalk meets every one of these
requirements. Its basic structure has not been
significantly altered and is certainly one of the
most scenic and historic locations in New York
City. The city's the city government's historic
battle to reclaim the shorefront of Coney Island,
the engineering breakthrough had enabled it to be
built and the important role it plays in both the
in both the visitors and residents earn disputable
evidence for landmark status. The boardwalk still
serves its original intention and mission as a
scenic promenade, an open space for the people of
New York City, and there is no reason why it should
not be designated a scenic landmark. Thank you.

much. Are there any questions. Hearing none we want to thank the panel for your testimony. We certainly appreciate it. Simeon you mentioned it was rare to come here. We always invite you to come to our... our land use hearings.

Τ	COMMITTEE ON LAND USE 43
2	SIMEON BANKOFF: Usually the Land Use
3	doesn't have public testimony subcommittees do.
4	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Subcommittees
5	do.
6	SIMEON BANKOFF: Right.
7	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Yes, of course.
8	SIMEON BANKOFF:me.
9	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Yes, oh there
10	you go. Excellent. Well we're very pleased to have
11	you Simeon so thank you for thank you for coming.
12	We're going to call our next panel and that's Rob
13	Burstein, Susan Friedman, Michael Schwartz, Arlene
14	Brenner, and Paul King.
15	[background comments]
16	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Is Michael
17	Quinn here as well? You can join us as well. Thank
18	you.
19	UNKNOWN MALE: He may have stepped out
20	for a moment.
21	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: If you can just
22	identify yourself when you begin. Michael we're
23	going to start with you and then we'll go down the

row. Thank you.

2 MICHAEL SCHWARTZ: Okay. Good afternoon. 3 My name's Michael Quinn. I'm a New York City licensed tour guide and I'm the founder of Coney 4 Island Tours. I also serve on Community Board 13. I'm the Chairman of the Transportation Committee. 6 I'd like to thank Council Member Treyger for 8 sponsoring this bill with the support of Council Member Deutsch. I'm here today to ask you to please consider land marking the boardwalk at Coney 10 11 Island, the Riegelmann Boardwalk. Before 1923 12 people had to pay money to use the beach at Coney 13 Island. You had to pay money to use a bath house to 14 have access to a beach. In the 1920s my 15 grandparents who are immigrants were able to use the boardwalk and the beach, could afford to, 10 16 17 years earlier they came to this country they wouldn't be able to afford to use a bath house and 18 19 pay for a bath house... amusement park to use the 20 beach. Here in this setting here at City Hall in 21 the chamber here we strive to create a city that is diverse and inclusive. There is no landmark in this 2.2

city that represents the diversity and

inclusiveness like the Coney Island Boardwalk.

25 Thank you.

2.3

3

4

5

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

ROB BURSTEIN: I'd like to ask the council's indulgence if before we start my time I just wanted to say... My name's Rob Burstein. I'm the president of the Coney Brighton Boardwalk Alliance and the people you've seen waiting for a couple of hours here today, our community members, are only a small fraction of the numbers of people that support this resolution. I think that's apparent to you but I did want to state that for the record. Many of them are Russian speaking as you know and felt inhibited to come here and also our community has a tremendously large population of seniors and similarly they couldn't be here. Having said that I'll ask also at the end if I can have another 15 or 20 seconds, I think I go over by that much. For far too long both the people and the treasures of the Southern Brooklyn Communities of Brighton Beach and Coney Island have been undervalued and unprotected. One casualty of this dismissive treatment accorded our communities throughout most of our mayoral administrations is the Coney Island Boardwalk. For years it has been left to languish with substantial sections in dangerous disrepair. This not only evidence is a lack of concern for

2	safety but it is indicative of a severe
3	misunderstanding or underestimation of the
4	boardwalk's vital importance in the lives of both
5	local residents and indeed all New Yorkers. More
6	recently this this devaluing of a cherished
7	treasure that's an integral part of our communities
8	as well as one of the crown jewels of New York City
9	has been exacerbated as the result of the reflexive
10	dismissal of the application to have the boardwalk
11	be landmarked. The fact that it has been minimally
12	altered since its inception should not bar it from
13	landmark status as it has not bared other far more
14	altered entities from being granted this epilation.
15	Now the New York City Landmark's Preservation
16	Commission defines a landmark as has been said
17	before as a building, property, or object that has
18	a special character or special historic or
19	aesthetic interest or value as part of a
20	development, heritage, or cultural characteristics
21	of the city, state, or nation. By any reasonable
22	measure the Coney Island Boardwalk imminently
23	satisfies each and every aspect of that definition.
24	For example, in contrast with central park which
25	was developed with an elite class in mind that

2	excluded the common man, Coney Island was
3	consciously developed as a place for all classes to
4	come and mingle as they wished. The boardwalk was
5	constructed as an integral aesthetic aspect of this
6	notion of equity through its natural encouragement
7	of the pleasant interactions of all citizens
8	irrespective of social class or economic station.
9	This continues even today where the boardwalk is
10	the spine of our community bringing together and
11	promoting interactions between residents from a
12	wide variety of cultures thus the boardwalk has
13	indeed played an important part in the development
14	as well as in the heritage of our city and it is
15	time to value it as such. There is only one aspect
16	this is only one aspect of its claim to a special
17	historical interest and I won't mention others in
18	honor of time constraints. Certainly the boardwalk
19	qualifies as an entity having a special character
20	in aesthetic interest. It is a unique aesthetic
21	both visually and kinesthetically as well as in the
22	ambience it projects and promotes. Indeed, it's a
23	living landmark, one that numerous people interact
24	with and enjoy on a daily basis and one that adds
25	immeasurably to the life and vitality of our city.

	Architects have commented on the graceful
	simplicity and beauty of its lines and how they
	engage both ones eye and spirit to move forward and
	interact with it. That, it is de facto of scenic
	landmark is evidenced by the fact that it is known
	worldwide. Indeed, it is iconic in visitors from
	all countries that come to visit New York City,
	seek it out for the special enjoyment it provides.
	As a 21-year-old youngster from France testified at
	a design commission hearing quote I've been coming
	here with my father since I was 16 and the first
	thing we like to visit is the Coney Island
	Boardwalk. It is beautiful and gives you a special
	feeling when you are on it. It is so special and I
	hope you protect it. The Landmarks Preservation
	Commission ought to grant the boardwalk the scenic
	landmark status that others inherently understand
	it to have. I respectfully implore the LPC to grant
	the Coney Island Boardwalk its rightful place in
	the history and life of our city by declaring it
	the New York City Landmark. Thank you.
1	

MICHAEL SCHWARTZ: Hello, I'm Michael Schwartz, Artistic Director of Coney Art Land

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you Rob.

2	Productions, an arts and education organization.
3	What will happen to us now that they took away
4	under the boardwalk. We won't be falling in love
5	under the boardwalk, boardwalk. I heard that
6	pushing the sand right up under the boards like
7	that is what causes them to erode and crack. I wish
8	we can have our down by the sea on a blanket with
9	my baby under the boardwalk back. Did you hear that
10	when they filled it in Homeless John the under-
11	talker was buried alive, under the boardwalk?
12	Yesterday I tripped on a broken board and fell on
13	my ear and I swear while I was there I could still
14	hear him talk, if you listen closely you can still
15	hear him talk. First they came for under the
16	boardwalk, then they came for the boardwalk. It
17	started already. Part of the boardwalk's already
18	been paved over even though that's not what the
19	people wanted. And in the middle of the night
20	before it would have been landlocked they bulldozed
21	our beloved original thunderbolt. And they came
22	under darkness in the middle of the night and
23	destroyed our beloved West 8 th Street bridge to the
24	boardwalk that protected us from automobile traffic
25	because we didn't have the power to protect it. If

2	we don't have the power to protect our world famous
3	beloved boardwalk that connects neighborhoods,
4	businesses, and people one day we will wake up and
5	it won't be there. At least not as we know it.
6	Where's the boardwalk? Oh my god, it's a sidewalk.
7	Don't we have enough sidewalks. The historic
8	beloved boardwalk is one of the last walkways in
9	our world that's an oasis from the concrete that
10	hardens our souls and hammers our joints. Also
11	concrete will not absorb water or heat the way wood
12	does and in this apocalyptic time of hurricanes and
13	floods the walkway by the water is wood for
14	practical as well as aesthetic reasons. Coney
15	Island is called the people's park because it's
16	different than those other sanitized corporatized
17	parks. When Coney becomes corporatized such as when
18	the republican nominee's father Fred destroyed
19	Steeplechase they demolished more than just the
20	peoples' parks, they break the peoples' hearts.
21	We've seen too many New York treasures wiped out by
22	corporate greed little by little turning the
23	greatest city in the world into just another
24	impersonal unaffordable clone of any mall USA. We
25	lost the original Penn Station, the 8 th wonder of

1	COMMITTEE ON LAND USE
2	the world because it wasn't landmarked. We saved
3	Grand Central Station because it was landmarked. If
4	we don't landmark the boardwalk we'll lose it,
5	we'll lose ourselves. Thank you.
6	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Beautiful
7	rendition Michael.
8	ARLENE BRENNER: Can I ask where is the
9	Landmark Commission? Here? Are they here? I don't
10	oh they're not in the room?
11	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: There was a
12	representative of the Landmarks Preservation
13	Commission here earlier but and I see her, she's
14	still in the back.
15	ARLENE BRENNER: I just wanted to know
16	who I was talking to. My name is Arlene Brenner.
17	And I'm 70 years old and I've been on this
18	boardwalk for 70 years.
19	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: You look great,
20	Arlene just for the record.
21	ARLENE BRENNER: Oh thank you. You know
22	people come here for the water and the beach but
23	the… that's just during the day. The boardwalk is
24	all the time. The boardwalk I've been on… I'm… I'm

on there maybe 320 days out of the year, days and

nights. It's it's like my history is attached to
the boardwalk, not concrete. Concrete is ugly. It's
hot. The this person said about the dust it's
unaesthetic and it doesn't hold my heart like wood
does. You know when you walk on the boardwalk and
your foot touches down on it the boardwalk comes
and meets you. It's not like concrete. It's a
living thing. It meets your touch. And for those of
you who aren't aware there's a sound when you walk
on the boardwalk there's a sound of the wood as you
touch it, a sound and a smell. That's wood. When
you leave the street and you come onto the
boardwalk you've left the city and you come home to
yourself to relaxation, the sound of the wood, not
the concrete. How dare they put concrete on our
boardwalk. It's foul. And council members, all 50
of you, thank you so much for getting it and Mark
Treyger for advocating for us and Chaim Deutsch
constantly advocating for us.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Alene I just want to note that I'm already more relaxed just in hearing your description...

ARLENE BRENNER: Whoah... whoah... [cross-

25 talk]

1	COMMITTEE ON LAND USE
2	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: I was walking
3	on the boardwalk I I already feel more relaxed
4	just from hearing your description of the boardwalk
5	so thank you for that. But please continue.
6	ARLENE BRENNER: And I feel younger
7	hearing what you said about me. So where's Sara?
8	Listen
9	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: I don't believe
10	you're 70 for the record. I I would like to see
11	some ID at the end of this hearing.
12	ARLENE BRENNER: Thank you. There is 100
13	percent no need for vehicles on the boardwalk
14	except police cars. Sanitation can be on the beach
15	[beeping] Please give me a moment.
16	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: You have a
17	moment. It's okay.
18	ARLENE BRENNER: They can be on the
19	beach where the boardwalk will not be deteriorated
20	and then not funded. The Parks Department does not
21	fund name please fund the boardwalk so we can
22	repair it. No trucks belong on the boardwalk. Oh

please... I better stop because other people need to

talk.

3

25

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you very much. You must be Paul.

PAUL KING: Yeah, that's hard to follow. 4 5 So... I hope I will also be impassioned. So good morning. My name is Paul King. And this morning I'd 6 7 like to speak to you both as someone who's family moved to Coney Island in 1955, I grew up two floors 8 from Charlie Denson, and whose mother still lives one block from the boardwalk as well as a college 10 11 professor from New York City College of technology 12 who teaches architecture and urban planning. To 13 state my position clearly from the start the 14 boardwalk in Coney Island must be landmarked. 15 Growing up in Coney Island in the 60s and 70s time 16 when the neighborhood transitioned from a place where doors were left unlocked to a place where as 17 18 a teenager it made my parents nervous that I was 19 out after dark I have always been and continue to 20 be connected to the boardwalk. It has always served 21 as a lifeline of the community, a communal space 2.2 shared equally by everyone who lived there, a link 2.3 between communities of Brighton Beach, Coney Island and Seagate whose residents went out after... went 24 out for walks from one end to the other. Perhaps my

2	strongest memory as a child is the weekly summer
۷	Scrongest memory as a chira is the weekly summer
3	stroll along the boardwalk with my family on
4	fireworks night, the night that the entire
5	community came out to share in the experience. In
6	the 70s when the crime rate rose the community
7	activity on the boardwalk made it a safe haven for
8	children to walk with their families, for runners
9	to enjoy, and for families to ride their bikes. As
10	an urban planner I can tell you that such spaces
11	are rare not only here in New York but anywhere in
12	the world and they are to be treasured and
13	protected. It is also critical that the boardwalk,
14	the operative word being 'board' remain made of
15	wood. From an experiential perspective it is the
16	soft give of the wood that gives you the feel as
17	you walk that promotes strolling slowly, that makes
18	one take the time to look around and live in the
19	moment. From an urban design perspective cities
20	suffer from urban heat island effect. The increased
21	use of materials such as stone and concrete with
22	high specific heat and the continued loss of open
23	unbuilt and unpaved areas collects and holds the
24	heat of the sun raising the urban temperatures by
25	several degrees. Along the boardwalk as sections of

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

wood have been replaced by concrete the local temperatures in those areas are now higher than the adjacent areas of wood. Additionally, the brighter surface of the concrete as compared to the darker wood has increased the glare one experiences while walking. To counter this the city recognized the issue and has initiated green street's program funded by the DEP that converts paved areas of the city, fills them with trees and shrubs reducing local temperatures and creating areas capable of collecting storm water and reducing flooding. It seems counterintuitive that at the same time the boardwalk continues to be converted to concrete. Coney Island is a micro climate that is the local temperature along the shore, the summer is cooler than the rest of the city. This is why for the last two centuries people have flocked to Coney Island on hot summer days to enjoy cool breezes, to walk along the boards. If the boardwalk continues to be replaced this rare asset will be lost not just to local residents but to our children and the generations that follow and to all of New York and to all those who've traveled here on vacation and always make a trip out to the boardwalk. With my

2	mother still living in Coney Island excuse me, I
3	still view myself as a lifelong resident.
4	Additionally, I now return home several times a
5	week as member of the Coney Island YMCA on 29 th
6	Street on Surf Avenue across from the street where
7	Coney Island Houses where I grew up and I still
8	venture on the boardwalk to run. As a runner you
9	experience the boardwalk in a different way over
10	as over a short period of time you see the entire
11	length and you have the chance to observe the
12	people walking and talking. Since the section of
13	the Boardwalk to the east to the end where Seagate
14	has been replaced with concrete I have noticed a
15	marked change in both my own behavior as well as
16	those walking along the boards, that people turn
17	around when they reach the concrete and head back
18	the other way. While the damage has already been
19	done it is not too late to reverse the tide and
20	return the boardwalk to its former glory. As an
21	urban planner I look at New York and I have seen in
22	recent years the development [cross-talk]
23	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Paul I'm going
24	to ask you to wrap up please.

PAUL KING: Okay.

2.2

2.3

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you.

PAUL KING: Of two linier public laments which serve similar purposes as the boardwalk in Coney Island Brooklyn Bridge Park and the Highline in Manhattan. I just want to point out that they have become vital parts of a community and have spurred on development. So... finish... In addition, the wood being used for this is not from the rainforest but is Black Locust, a species native to North America, which a native fast growing...

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Paul...

PAUL KING: ...environmentally friendly choice.

much for your testimony. We appreciate it. Not quite... not... not quite Arlene's but I did like the board in the boardwalk. I think we should have pins made up Council Member Treyger, keep the board in boardwalk, what do you think. I like those. We're going to work on those pins. Any... any questions for this panel. Seeing none I want to thank you all for your testimony. I'm going to call the next panel. Incidentally is Susan Friedman here? She is not, okay. Ralph Perfedo, Michael Gunderson, Christiana

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Nelson, Judith Kanapa, and Ida Sanoff, our next

panel please. Just slide on over the microphone. We

can start with Ralph please. Thank you.

4 can start with Ralph please. Thank you.

RALPH PERFETTO: Thank you. My name is Ralph Perfetto. In 1964 I was the founder of the Coney Island Neighborhood Improvement Organization and in 1975 I founded the Astola [sp?] Development Corporation that did a lot of housing and new building at Coney Island. In 1906 my maternal grandparents settled in Coney Island and my grandfather was a mechanic for the Lunar Park Amusement Company. In 1912 my mother was born in Coney Island and in 1933 she married my father who was a painter for the Tiguel [sp?] Family in Steeplechase Park including the Parachute Jump. I was born in 1934 in Coney Island. All of my summer jobs were right there in Coney Island including on the Parachute Jump, Wonder Wheel, etcetera. My five children were born in Coney Island and they too ... their summer jobs were in the amusement areas. Very familiar with Coney Island, very active in Coney Island. I've seen Coney Island in its heyday. Unfortunately, I lived through the Coney Island Blight days. I thank god that I'm alive today to

1	COMMITTEE ON LAND USE 6
2	see the rebirth of Coney Island thanks to people
3	like Councilman Mark Treyger and other people who
4	care about Coney Island. I tell you without fear of
5	contradiction that the Coney Island boardwalk was
6	is and will continue to be the landmark of that
7	historic island. I thank you.
8	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you.
9	MIKE GUNDERSON: Hello. My name is Mike
10	Gunderson. I want to thank you all for this
11	hearing. And I I've been living in Brighton Beach
12	you know Coney Island area for I'd say about 32
13	years and I have an apartment that's 10 feet from
14	the boardwalk. I have a terrace that's 10 feet from
15	the boardwalk and about 10 feet higher above the
16	boardwalk. Every single day
17	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Pretty sweet.
18	MIKE GUNDERSON: I I'm blessed, I am
19	blessed, truly blessed.
20	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Do you have any
21	parties… [cross-talk]
22	MIKE GUNDERSON: I'm a retired transit
23	worker.
24	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD:perhaps? Do

you have any parties maybe? [cross-talk] 25

1	COMMITTEE ON LAND USE 6
2	MIKE GUNDERSON:many, many [cross-
3	talk]
4	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Councilman
5	Treyger why you holding out on us on Mike's parties
6	on the Boardwalk.
7	MIKE GUNDERSON: I'm telling you
8	everybody does know
9	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: We expect some
10	invitations, just FYI.
11	MIKE GUNDERSON: It's wonderful.
12	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Okay.
13	MIKE GUNDERSON:to be able to look out
14	my terrace and look at the boardwalk and look at
15	the people walk by. And the wood you know I I've
16	actually seen it go down into disrepair and I have
17	no clue why it's been like that. But the thing is
18	you know my my son has lived there for years, you
19	know coming to visit me and everything and I'm
20	divorced but what I could say is you know it's just
21	a pleasure to see the wood you know, see the people
22	stroll by on the boardwalk and enjoy it. You know
23	every day that I go out there you know I'm out
24	there 'till 11:00 at night in the warm weather and

I would hate to see it turn into concrete, which

1	COMMITTEE ON LAND USE
2	certain sections have turned into concrete and
3	it's it's so you know cold and and but the heat
4	also the heat just emits from the concrete. And
5	what I could say is the trucks that go by I see
6	heavy heavy trucks go by on that boardwalk to
7	really ruin it you know. So all I could say is I'm
8	very grateful for being here and for having a place
9	to live that's so beautiful. Thank you.
10	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you Mike.
11	CHRISTIANNA NELSON: Hi, my name is
12	Christianna Nelson and I work with the Boardwalk
13	Alliance and I love the Coney Island Boardwalk. I
14	think it's the most beautiful, dynamic, romantic
15	place in the world and so much so that my husband
16	when he was trying to figure out where to propose
17	he picked Coney Island. And after I said yes we
18	walked on the boardwalk we took a romantic stroll,
19	we admired the view, and we called our friends and
20	family and and told them the news.
21	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Do you have any
22	pictures.
23	CHRISTIANNA NELSON: Oh yeah, a lot of

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Okay good.

pictures...

CHRISTIANNA NELSON: ...lots and lots.

3 And... and then years later when my daughter was born 4 the Coney Island Boardwalk was the place I was most 5 excited to see her walk. And yes she has walked on the boardwalk and I have pictures of that too. 6 Clearly I have a very personal connection to the Coney Island Boardwalk. But I'm not alone. What 8 I've learned through my work with... with the Boardwalk Alliance is that there are many... many... 10 11 many people out there that have very personal 12 connections to this place and who admire its beauty and its... its scenic views and its unique character. 13 14 We set up a petition to preserve the Coney Island 15 Boardwalk and we got thousands of signatures just 16 by word of mouth and sort of hitting the boards as 17 they say. And I personally spoke with many people 18 on the boardwalk, locals who were... you know walk 19 there every day, some of them pushing baby 20 carriages or ... or wheelchairs. And then tourists who 21 came from as far away as London and... and Germany. There's a woman who said in the comments that she 2.2 2.3 makes a special trip to Coney Island every year from Montreal and always visits the boardwalk, that 24 25 the boardwalk is a vital part of that. Many of the

2	people who I spoke to thought that the boardwalk
3	already was landmarked and were shocked to hear
4	that it wasn't. And when I told them what the plans
5	were for thought it was insane, why would you do
6	that to the beautiful sort of tourist destination,
7	iconic, historical beautiful landmark. All of them
8	thought that it should be landmarked, everyone who
9	I spoke to. I think because it's it's a New
10	York City icon that's successful to everyone that's
11	been talked about a lot, and that people can
12	interact within a very physical way with their
13	family and friends, makes it even more special.
14	It's really unique and special among among New
15	York City destinations. I just want to read from
16	some of the comments some of these sort of
17	personal connections. So a woman, Isabel Raize
18	[sp?] from the Bronx, said at this boardwalk my
19	father brought me over when I was a little girl. He
20	passed away six years ago. It brings me closer to
21	him. I walked on this boardwalk after having dates
22	at Coney Island. It is very romantic. And to walk
23	this long boardwalk to get to know someone and just
24	look up to the moon and the starts the effects is
25	priceless. The feeling is incredible to be out into

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 the ocean without a boat on a warm night at sunset. 3 The breeze, the scent is amazing. There is no other 4 boardwalk like it. Changes everywhere so strong one 5 cannot even explain to the next generation the magic, the beauty without a visual aid. Please 6 7 don't take it away. Keep the Coney Island in its 8 full beauty please. I agree. I would ask that you please... please vote to preserve the peoples' 10 landmark... Landmark Commission, keep it from being 11 destroyed. Please, the most... a place of great 12 beauty and the most scenic place in the world to me 13 and so many people, the Coney Island Boardwalk. And 14 thank you for introducing this resolution and thank 15 you for voting for it.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you. Judith.

JUDITH: Hi, I'm J.K... I'm Judith Kenapa...

JK Kenapa. And I'm with Friends of Coney Island

Brighton Beach Boardwalk. I'm also with the New

York Climate Action Group, Co-founder... co-found a

lot of things. As a child in small town

Pennsylvania I would spread out the Sunday Times

and we'd eat bagels and lox just once a week,

that's all we could get it. I grew up, I knew I was

2	a New Yorker. My father would bring us to the city
3	and he'd show us his New York. And we we climbed
4	the statue of liberty and empire state building but
5	he took us to the fights at Madison Square Garden
6	and he took us to Shacks [sp?] and Ratner's and
7	Grand Concourse, his New York. But most of all
8	Coney Island. Those scary rides, the hotdogs at
9	Nathan's, that ocean that stretched all the way
10	across the world. These were the biggest the sky
11	and the ocean the biggest things in my young life.
12	And the boardwalk, the eternal boardwalk.
13	Intellectually I know it's changed over the… over
14	the decades. I'm a member of the board of
15	Rainforest Relief. We fought that change. The wood
16	started out as Georgia Yellow Pine long, long
17	pine, and then Douglas Fir and then very tragically
18	Ipe Cumaroo from the pristine Amazon Rainforest but
19	it was always the boardwalk and it so it remains
20	mostly except for those parts with the concrete
21	stripe or even worse the wide spread of concrete
22	that hurt my feet. Such an eyesore. My son had an
23	internship with Sideshows by the Seashore. My
24	grandchildren, they come and visit me from Philly,
25	don't ask me why Philly but Philly, and they create

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

2 their own Coney Island memories. My high school

classmates at Pennsylvania Dutch people, they come

4 and they walk the boardwalk. This is our treasure

5 New York and deserves to be landmarked.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Ida.

IDA SANOFF: Ida Sanoff. Thank you for acknowledging the significance of the historic, iconic, wooden Coney Island Boardwalk. It's an international tourist destination. And for those of us who live there it's our backyard. It's our living room. We detour up there as we run our errands around the neighborhood. It ... it's part of us. JK brought up... I wasn't going to talk about this but since JK brought it up... she brought up wood. Now interestingly no one would even think of replacing the wooden walkways of the historic iconic Brooklyn Bridge with concrete, heavens to Betsy, no. And it just so turns out that the Wildlife Conservation Society which runs the New York Aquarium has its very own special carefully managed rainforest somewhere in South America for the specific purpose of growing wood just for the Brooklyn Bridge. So isn't Coney Island Boardwalk also in Brooklyn. And if the Brooklyn bridge is so

2	special that it requires wood and the Wildlife
3	Conservation Society is involved well certainly our
4	boardwalk deserves no less. These concrete sections
5	are abysmal, they crack, they are discolored, they
6	chip. And not only that we have evidence that they
7	exacerbated storm surge impacts during Hurricane
8	Sandy. Arlene Brenner spoke before. Our buildings
9	are back to back. Her building is adjacent to the
10	concrete section, had 15 feet of flood water. My
11	building was adjacent to the wooden section, we had
12	three feet of flood water. In the sections adjacent
13	there was 10 to 15 10 to 15 feet of sand pushed
14	onto the streets. In sections adjacent to the wood
15	there were perhaps inches of sand. So this is
16	something that nobody wants to talk about, nobody
17	wants to acknowledge even though we have pictures.
18	But somebody better take a look at it because
19	you're talking of millions of dollars in future
20	damage. Last but not least if you want to talk
21	about aesthetics, you want to go up there, you want
22	to talk about history you see the vertical sections
23	and that reminds you of the old wooden whicker
24	rolling chairs. You look at the historical pictures
25	of Coney Island. You see these grand ladies and

2		l
	ı	l
	ı	l

4

6

8

10

11

12

13 14

15

16

17 18

19

20

21 2.2

2.3

24

25

gentlemen going down there. The diagonal sections, they draw your eye off into the vista. The vistas are spectacular. Last but not least I'm going to get my Brooklyn going here. If this boardwalk was in Manhattan it would have been landmarked a long long time ago. Surely the people of Brooklyn deserve the same. Thank you and please... please vote for this. And thank you so much for your support.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: We appreciate

your testimony. And thank you all. And I will point out in fact that the overwhelming majority of landmarks in New York City are in Manhattan incidentally. And so certainly would behoove the landmarks preservation commission to pay some more attention to those of us in the far reaches of Brooklyn. Any questions. Hearing none I thank this panel. We'll call our final panel Tricia Vita, Queenie... And is there anybody else who wanted to testify who has not had the chance to testify. This is your final opportunity to do so. If you fill out a slip you can come up and testify sir. Last call for testimony on the historic designation of the Coney Island Boardwalk.

2	TRICIA VITA: My name is Tricia Vita. I
3	write the blog Amusing the Zillion which I've
4	written, it's about Coney Island since 2009. One of
5	the things first of all I'd like to thank
6	Councilman Treyger for his tireless efforts on
7	behalf of the Boardwalk and for the city council
8	for voting for this resolution. The plight of the
9	boardwalk calls to mind the sad saga of the
10	parachute jump for many decades after Steeplechase
11	Park closed. The city tried to demolish it, to sell
12	it, nobody wanted to buy it. Finally, it was
13	landmarked in 1977. But the city's Board of
14	Estimate rejected that. They said we can't afford
15	to keep it up so it was denied. At that time the
16	LPC chair Beverly Moss Spatt, that was the time
17	that she first called it the Eifel Tower of
18	Brooklyn. What foresight that she said that and
19	then finally in 1989 the Parachute Jump was
20	landmarked and now it's lit up it's an considered
21	an icon of Coney Island. Imagine if the city had
22	been successful at demolishing it or selling it.
23	And so I think that we should think about that now
24	where the Boardwalk is so neglected it it really
25	needs to be made a landmark. For my blog one of

2	the… one of the blog posts that I did last year was
3	called boardwalk bump Co. It was about the Milan
4	Expo at which the US pavilion had wood from the
5	Coney Island Boardwalk. It was wood that had been
6	discarded by the city Parks Department and it was
7	bought by by those people who recycle wood. And
8	this brings up the specter of the boards of the
9	boardwalk in the future existing only as like
10	flooring for museums, bars, peoples' homes, and of
11	course these are very elite projects. It's
12	completely antithetical to what the boardwalk
13	really means. Every time I see an like a blog post
14	or an ad for artisanal coasters made out of
15	boardwalk wood or knives with handles made out of
16	boardwalk wood. It's just crazy prices. It it just
17	makes me very angry. It shouldn't it shouldn't be
18	like that. The other thing is whenever it snows
19	when there's the first snow my friend Bruce Handy
20	who lives in Coney Island and is a photographer he
21	always goes out and takes pictures. And he has
22	these incredible, these exquisite photos of the
23	the first snow on the slats of the boardwalk. And
24	these photos will exist only this kind of scene
25	will only exist in archival photos if if the

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

2	boardwalk is made concrete as the… as the Parks
3	Department wishes to do. So thank you and I hope
4	that you landmark the boardwalk.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you very much.

QUEENIE HUBLEY: Thanks to the City Council Land and Use Committee for letting me testify today. My name is Queenie Hubley and I've lived in Coney Island for more than 30 years. I am... I am here today in support of the land marking of Coney Island Boardwalk. In so doing I am calling upon the city administration and the landmark preservation commission to do the right thing and making the process equitable. Coney Island has lost too much already. I can recall the days when my family could not afford a vacation. However, we were able to take a stroll down the boardwalk and feel the fresh breeze from the ocean. There are numerous family in Coney Island that's keeping up the same ritual. Councilman Treyger we are depending upon you to make sure this resolution is designated an official landmark. Thank you for the opportunity to speak to you.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you.

1

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

2	JEFFREY: Good afternoon. My name is
3	Jeffrey Croft. I'm President of New York City Park
4	Advocates. I will be brief. The land marking of
5	this internationally historic icon is a long time
6	coming. I would like to thank all of the people who
7	have come out to support this important
8	legislation. And frankly it's embarrassing that
9	this has not been done earlier as you've heard from
10	many people who have testified this is an important
11	issue, not just for the land marking perspective
12	but in everyday life. And it's been such an iconic
13	part of New York City it's as you mentioned it's
14	not just a… Brooklyn landmark it's an
15	internationally recognized and known land
16	landmark. And it's important that this city
17	designated this. And it's important that this city
18	take this issue very seriously because we have lost
19	so many things in our city's history that have
20	that have been demolished. And you know what's been
21	happening recently with the concreting of the of
22	the boardwalk is is outrageous. The Parks
23	Department in its infinite wisdom has insisted that
24	the boardwalk slowly be turned into a a sidewalk
25	basically. And before this I mean that concrete

2	needs to be removed but before this goes even
3	further we have to landmark this and this is an
4	important piece of legislation. And again I'd like
5	to support not only the elected officials who have
6	tirelessly to enact this but all the advocates.
7	This is not easy work. And it's thankless work. And
8	the people of Brooklyn have risen up and spoken
9	very passionately about it. So thank you very much.
10	CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you
11	Jeffrey. And thank you all for coming out and
12	testifying today. And I think the message has been
13	heard loud and clear by the Landmarks Preservation
14	Commission, I am sure. And we really appreciate it.
15	And we will keep working on this. And I assure you
16	that you cannot ask for a better advocate on your
17	behalf than Council Member Mark Treyger. Earlier
18	today we had a vote on one item of the Land Use
19	Committee. I'm going to ask the council to allow
20	for Council Member Gentile to vote on that item.
21	COMMITTEE CLERK: Continued Roll Call on
22	Land Use item 358. Council Member Gentile.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: I vote aye.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Final vote.

SΕ
١,

COMMITTEE CLERK: Council... is 19 in the affirmative, zero in the negative, and zero abstentions.

much. This concludes the Land Use Committee for the meeting of May 4, 2016. I want to thank all of you for coming out here today. I want to thank you for testifying, want to thank you for participating. I want to thank Council Member Treyger for his very important piece of legislation. And we look forward to continuing to have this conversation in the future. This meeting is hereby adjourned.

[gavel]

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date _____May 26, 2016