

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

----- X

May 5, 2016
Start: 10:45 a.m.
Recess: 11:16 a.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E:

JULISSA FERRERAS-COPELAND
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Ydanis A. Rodriguez
James G. Van Bramer
Vanessa L. Gibson
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Laurie A. Cumbo
Corey D. Johnson
Mark Levine
I. Daneek Miller
Helen K. Rosenthal
Steven Matteo

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Kent A. Garrett
Chairman
Calvary Baptist Senior Housing

1
2 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Good
3 morning and welcome to today's Finance Committee
4 hearing; I'm Council Member Julissa Ferreras-
5 Copeland; I chair the committee. We've been joined
6 by Council Members Matteo, Cornegy, Johnson,
7 Rosenthal, and Van Bramer.

8 Today we have two LU items on the agenda,
9 but before we turn to those items I'd like to take
10 this opportunity to say goodbye and good luck to an
11 integral member of the Finance team, Miss Tanisha
12 Edwards, Chief Counsel of the Finance Division is
13 leaving the Council tomorrow, after over nine years
14 of service. She will be heading to the Governor's
15 Office, where she will be an Assistant Counsel to
16 Governor Cuomo, [background comments] covering the
17 areas of taxation and financial services.

18 During her time at the Council, Tanisha
19 was instrumental in the Finance Division's growth,
20 setting legislative policy for the Council and the
21 City as a whole. Her work includes passage of the
22 Prevailing Wage Act, the Responsible Banking Act and
23 tax lien sale reform. She has drafted over 200
24 pieces of local legislation, [background comment]
25 over 50 pieces of state legislation and to date has

1
2 been the only attorney at the Council to have
3 successfully defended in federal court legislation
4 that was negotiated and drafted by her. [applause]
5 She has spent countless hours advising and developing
6 legislation and policy proposals with council
7 members, their staff and numerous advocates
8 throughout the years, as well as three Finance
9 Committee chairs, two Speakers, the General Counsel's
10 Office and the Legislative Division.

11 On a personal note, Tanisha, your
12 guidance and your friendship over the past several
13 years has been invaluable and you will be sorely
14 missed; although we wish you would stay, you have an
15 amazing opportunity and journey ahead of you and we
16 know that you will sure be successful there as you
17 are here, plus, it never hurts to have a friend in
18 Albany.

19 I hope everyone can join us at 5 p.m.
20 this afternoon at Barleycorn around the corner to
21 toast Tanisha and her sendoff in style. With that
22 said, please let's give Miss Tanisha Edwards another
23 big round of applause.

24 [cheers, applause]
25

1
2 And you have till 4:45 to change your
3 mind.

4 Let's turn to the LU items for today.
5 The first item is 810 River Avenue in the Speaker's
6 district in the Bronx, which is a new construction
7 that will create 134 units of affordable housing for
8 low-income households. Today's resolution would make
9 a technical correction to a resolution passed by the
10 Council in 20... woo, my phone's back... in 2014 granting
11 this HDFC a full 40-year property tax exemption. The
12 2014 resolution referred to the Real Property Tax Law
13 rather than the private... [background comments] shhhh...
14 [background comments] the Private Housing Finance Law
15 and today's resolution would correct that reference.
16 The Speaker supports this action.

17 The second LU item is Calvary Baptist
18 Church Senior Housing in Council Member Wills'
19 district in Queens. This project will preserve 100
20 units of housing for low-income seniors and will
21 receive a full 40-year property tax exemption through
22 the City's HDFC program. Council Member Wills
23 supports this project and has submitted a letter of
24 support to the committee that will be included for
25 the record.

1
2 Are there any particular questions on
3 these LU items? Seeing none, we have someone who's
4 come here to testify, Mr. Kent Garrett; if you can
5 come up. [background comments]

6 Good morning Mr. Garrett.

7 KENT GARRETT: My name is Kent A. Garrett
8 and I represent the Board of Directors at the Calvary
9 Baptist Senior Housing and our tax exempt has been in
10 question, 501(c)3, and we are in the process of
11 upgrading the building and doing the refinance and
12 the refinance companies want to know if we could have
13 a permanent one instead of extended to just the next
14 40 years that it had from the original one; that is
15 what we are seeking to get, a permanent 501(c)3 so
16 that we can proceed with the refinancing.

17 Are there any other questions?

18 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: [laugh]
19 Thank you, Mr. Garrett. Actually, you will be
20 getting a 40-year; that is the maximum amount of time
21 that we are able to authorize a tax exemption; we do
22 it for less, but this property has been granted
23 through this process and we're going to be voting
24 this out today; you're going to get the maximum
25 amount of time, which is 40 years.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

KENT GARRETT: At this point?

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Yes, sir.

KENT GARRETT: Well I'm sure that we could come back at the end of that [sic]... [crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: You come back in 40 years... [laughter] I want you to come back in 40 years and we'll be right here and approve it again; okay...? [crosstalk]

KENT GARRETT: Alright.

[background comments]

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: We'll leave a note for the next Council; that is a good point... [crosstalk]

KENT GARRETT: **[inaudible]**

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Council Member Miller would like to [background comments] also speak.

MALE VOICE: Madame... Madame Chair, I just want you to know... [interpose, background comments] Oh, I'm off the record; [background comments] I'm not speaking about this; I just want you to know that the gentleman who's speaking to you is Mr. Kent Garrett; he is Chairman of the Board for our building but he's also the Chairman of our Deacon Board at our church

1
2 [interpose, background comment] and I want you to
3 know he's 93 years young. [background comments,
4 laughter, applause]

5 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND:

6 [background comment] Council Member Miller. Thank
7 you, sir.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So I would... I
9 just wanna say a little about the Calvary Baptist
10 Grandparent housing program and what it has done for
11 our community over the last few years and the
12 excitement this latest project, their latest building
13 has brought and what it has done for senior housing
14 in our community has been great. Deacon, it is
15 wonderful to see you down here again pass the hall;
16 thank you for coming down and thank you for the work
17 that you're doing within the community among senior
18 housing and grandparent housing; it is unique,
19 obviously there's always some kinds that have to be
20 worked out and the 40 years may be one of them, but I
21 am certainly going to be voting to, along with
22 Council Member Wills and others, to approve this
23 project and I would implore my colleagues to do the
24 same. So thank you so much for coming down...
25 [crosstalk]

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

9

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

KENT GARRETT: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: and I look forward to seeing you guys next Sunday.

KENT GARRETT: Alright, [inaudible]...
[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Thank... thank you, Mr. Garrett. Does any member have any questions or statements? Seeing none. Thank you for coming to testify today.

KENT GARRETT: Okay, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: I will now ask Billy Martin, Committee Clerk, to call the roll.

COMMITTEE CLERK: William Martin, Committee Clerk, roll call vote Committee on Finance. Chair Ferreras-Copeland.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: I vote aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Cornegy.

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Cumbo.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission to make
3 a comment. I just wanna say congratulations to you;
4 it's such an honor to have you here today and it's
5 also very encouraging and exciting to see a
6 development corporation of color working so actively
7 in our community and I thank you all for your service
8 and this work that you're putting in place is going
9 to benefit individuals for generations to come and I
10 like this statement of our "seasoned saints," so I'll
11 be utilizing that. So thank you all so very much
12 and thank you for your presence and the work that you
13 do for the City of New York. I vote aye.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Johnson.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Miller.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I vote aye.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rosenthal.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Matteo.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: I'm voting aye

22 and I just wanna, on a side note to Tanisha, I've had
23 the pleasure of working with you, both as an elected
24 official; more times a staffer, it's been a pleasure;
25 we've always worked well together; it's been my honor

1
2 and I wish you nothing but the best and we're gonna
3 miss you around here and I vote aye.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gibson.

5 [background comments]

6 CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND:

7 **[inaudible]** Miller while you...

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Yes, please.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So I just also
10 wanna take this opportunity to say goodbye, farewell
11 to someone who has done our community **[inaudible]** one
12 of our **[inaudible]** born and bred in Cambria Heights
13 there **[inaudible]**... [crosstalk]

14 FEMALE VOICE: **[inaudible]**

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: and all that good
16 stuff; we are so proud of you moving on; you've done
17 an absolutely fantast... yes she is, [laughter,
18 background comments] yes she is from the district and
19 we are so proud that you will be moving on and
20 achieving greater heights and success in your next
21 endeavors; you've done us really proud down here; not
22 just your community, but the whole city and it has
23 been an absolute pleasure working with you and look
24 forward to working with you as well in your next
25 endeavor. So thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Gibson.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to explain my vote. Thank you so much. So first I too vote aye on all and want to join all of my colleagues in wishing Tanisha Edwards well; it's been an honor and a pleasure working with you during my time here at the City Council and I thank you for doing all the great work you've done; I can truly say women lead and are doing phenomenal things across our city and I know that the City's loss is Albany's gain and so I wish you well in your new position working with our great governor, God bless you and we will definitely miss you and you are irreplaceable; we love you; we appreciate you and thank you for all of your incredible service. I vote aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: The vote stands at 9 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and no abstentions; both items have been adopted.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: We will keep the roll open for an additional 15 minutes, 15 minutes. Council Member Rodriguez's staff, if you can make sure he gets here on that time or before that time, I'd appreciate it. Thank you.

[pause]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

13

COMMITTEE CLERK: Continuation roll call,
the Committee on Finance, Preconsidered Land Use
items. Council Member Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye and thank
you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Final vote in Committee
on Finance now stands at 10 in the affirmative, 0 in
the negative and no abstentions.

CHAIRPERSON FERRERAS-COPELAND: Hearing
is adjourned.

[gavel]

[background comments]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date May 23, 2016