

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

----- X

April 4, 2016
Start: 10:00 a.m.
Recess: 12:56 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway - Committee Rm.
14th Fl

B E F O R E: YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Daniel R. Garodnick
James Vacca
Margaret S. Chin
Stephen T. Levin
Deborah L. Rose
James G. Van Bramer
David G. Greenfield
Costa G. Constantinides
Carlos Menchaca
I. Daneek Miller
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Eric L. Adams
Brooklyn Borough President

Ryan Russo, Deputy Commissioner
Transportation Planning and Management
NYC Department of Transportation, DOT

Jeff Lynch, Assistant Commissioner
Intergovernmental Affairs
NYC Department of Transportation, DOT

Dennis Fulton, Inspector
Transportation Bureau
New York City Police Department, NYPD

Yatim Yatamu (sp?)
New York League of Conservation Voters

Dani Simons
Motivate the Operators of Citi Bike

Ken Podziba, President and CEO
Bike New York

Rich Wener, Professor
Environmental Psychology
NYU Tandon, Brooklyn

Hector Rios, CBS News

Peter McGowan, News Operations Manager
WCBS Channel 2 News

Eric McClure, Executive Director
StreetsPAC

Michelle McLaren
Families for Safe Streets

Joseph Cutrufo, Communications Director
Tri-State Transportation Campaign

Ellie Levy, Architect
Perkins Eastman Architects
Appearing for Jonathan Cohen

Alex Slack
Triple A Northeast

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

4

2 [sound check, pause]

3 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Because of his
4 schedule, I would like to first [AUDIO CUT OUT]
5 today, but before we even hear from the Brooklyn
6 Borough President, I would like for everyone to have
7 the opportunity to see how one of the, you know, many
8 great partners of this coalition has embraced this,
9 and one of them decided to make this 30-second ad on
10 Car-Free Day. [AUDIO CUT OUT] [background comments,
11 pause, sound check]

12 MALE SPEAKER: Councilman.

13 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: I ask you all to find
14 seats, please. Everyone find a seat. Could you find
15 a seat, please? Thank you. [background music,
16 pause]

17 ANNOUNCER: A day where we drastically
18 limit the number of the cars on New York City streets
19 by encouraging residents and commuters to choose one
20 of the many other forms of transportation that New
21 York offers This April 22nd, join Car-Free Day NYC.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. So let us
23 now hear Brooklyn Borough President [AUDIO CUT OUT]

24 ERIC ADAMS: The Council--[off mic] I am
25 here today. I am President Eric Adams (sic) where we

2 face the music for that very a remarkable of
3 industries, a program vision for (sic) [on mic] many
4 of you are partners, and those who have co-sponsored
5 this initiative. And I look at some of the names
6 that you have assembled together. It's really a--a--
7 I have to [AUDIO CUT OUT] issue that is so important.
8 I'm a routine--I routinely use Metro--the Metro
9 system here. I'm a Metro Card holder as well as Citi
10 Bike, and new member as well, and I believe that
11 often times, yeah, we need to find alternative means
12 to transportation how we move about our day, and how
13 do we create an environment where we don't--and we
14 are not just dependent on--on cars. I think that we
15 should use this opportunity of the Car-Free Day to
16 also look at transportation equity. How are we
17 assuring that those persons with physical
18 disabilities are able to move about the city, and
19 ensure that we have elevators at many of our transit
20 hubs. [AUDIO CUT OUT]--versus my community in
21 Canarsie. So it's important that we start looking at
22 all of our boroughs. When you look at the
23 transportation system, and my colleague out in Staten
24 Island Jim Oddo [AUDIO CUT OUT]--bring this together,
25 one city and one form of transportation, and I think

2 that your initiative is going [AUDIO CUT OUT]--
3 structure that really support mass transit, and
4 really supports the ability to move around the city
5 without a car. We cannot be dependent on cars. We
6 must understand that Mother Earth needs us to
7 preserve the environment for our children to come,
8 and that is not just a way of romanticizing the
9 importance of the climate that we live in, but it is
10 a reality. Global warming is here and it is
11 something that we can do something about merely by
12 changing or modifying how we move--move around the
13 city. I am all-in. I stated I am challenging my
14 borough presidents throughout the boroughs to see who
15 can sign up the number of [AUDIO CUT OUT]--already
16 made the mental adjustment. Now, it's time to make
17 the--make the physical adjustment. We are not
18 dependent on this [AUDIO CUT OUT]--as a city to--to--
19 to lead the nation. So I want to thank you and I
20 want to thank your Council colleagues for [AUDIO CUT
21 OUT].

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thanks. Let--
23 let--let's give DOT [applause] [AUDIO CUT OUT]
24 [background comments, pause] [AUDIO CUT OUT]--the New
25 York City Council's Transportation Committee. I am

2 Ydanis Rodriguez, Chair of the Committee and I am
3 joined--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--here, three bills. So
4 there's two additional bills besides our resolution
5 on Car-Free Day. And one resolution, that resolution
6 is directed toward improving safety and efficiency of
7 New York City streets. With again with the
8 resolution, I am proud to have sponsored Reso 1013
9 that would designate Earth Day in our City Car-Free
10 Day. Centered around our initiative, I am now late
11 last--[AUDIO CUT OUT]. This is something I and many
12 others especially Mayor de Blasio and his
13 Administration are about being a great partner with
14 us as we've been working toward this initiative.
15 Speaker Melissa Mark--[AUDIO CUT OUT].

16 I want to especially again thank the de
17 Blasio Administration, the Speaker, the MTA and the
18 Borough Coalition who have taken up this cause as
19 their own. We are faced with a very stark reality in
20 2016. Our sea levels are rising. We have faced
21 record highs in global temperatures in consecal--
22 consecutive years, and the effect of this fact can be
23 heard. [AUDIO CUT OUT]--we have seen in our
24 generation in the last 15 years. Environment [AUDIO
25 CUT OUT]--Paul Francis himself made this point very

2 clearly: We don't know if we even have the time left
3 to save our planet from ourselves. Well, as New
4 Yorkers, we will do the best we can for us and for
5 the future generations. Car-Free NYC is an idea that
6 we hope will spark--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--around the world
7 than ever before as this initiative started in the
8 1990s in Europe, spreading through Asia and Latin
9 America. The concept behind this idea is simple: If
10 you can avoid driving on Earth Day this year, please
11 do so. We are fortunate to live in a city with so
12 many other options to move around, from walking to
13 biking to our sub--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--but I will leave
14 the car home on Earth Day this year as I did it this
15 morning, too, as I left it in my community because we
16 must start considering the--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--city.
17 For those unable to take this step, do it to endure
18 hardships or because of our many transit deserts, we
19 understand are specifically thinking about your
20 credit (sic) commence after the incorporation into
21 this initiative. We want to highlight--to highlight--
22 --[AUDIO CUT OUT]--that enables jobs, education,
23 group help (sic) and social living. And even those
24 that may have transit options, sometimes the time it
25 takes to get where one needs to go makes the trip

2 preventative in the first place. This calls for a
3 prescription of substantial investment in mass
4 transit over the coming years filling in the holes on
5 our subways map and moving more of our 1.4 million
6 car owners onto bikes, trains, or buses instead. I'm
7 proud to have the support of nearly a hundred groups
8 many of which stood outside with me moments ago to
9 show their support for this important initiative. I
10 also want to thank the vast majority of my colleagues
11 for their support in his effort. We are driving the
12 conversation when it comes to the impact of our
13 choices on the environment--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--city
14 coming from vehicles. Also, when it comes to public
15 space and land use as parking lots and gas stations
16 can be repurposed into schools and housing more
17 suitable to an urban future. While we continue to
18 reclaim misused spaces to make them safer for all
19 street users with the continued expansion of our
20 Plaza Program, and protected bike lanes. Car-Free
21 NYC is a strong first step, and while we know that
22 2016 is an effort to get the movement off the ground,
23 future years will see growth in awareness,
24 interesting and excitement because these are goals we
25 can all get around regardless of background,

2 political views, socio-economic status and/or
3 otherwise. We will also hear three other bills
4 today. The first Intro 997 is sponsored by our
5 public advocate Letitia James aims to expand the
6 right of a pedestrian in a crosswalk protecting them
7 under the law from the time they leave the corners to
8 the time they reach the other side regardless of
9 whether--[AUDIO CUT OUT] The pedestrians only have
10 the right-of-way so long as the countdown clock shows
11 a white walk signals--signal. The right-of-way is
12 then lost as the orange hand begins to flash with a
13 correspond countdown. I support this bill
14 wholeheartedly because we must--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--
15 special bill by myself will require the DOT to
16 implement--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--the right to park the car
17 when they are covering a story. We will hear that--
18 I'm sorry. That's Intro 779, which that will allow
19 members of the press to park in area otherwise not
20 permitted for public parking if they are covering
21 breaking news over a crossing for a legal parking
22 spot. Members of the press sever the public interest
23 in disseminating important information in a timely
24 manner. I do not believe they should be penalized
25 given that some set aside for press parking are often

2 filled by official city vehicles or private cars that
3 go unenforced. I have heard many voices in
4 opposition to this bill in many ways, and ideally--
5 and ideally--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--parking is there for
6 people as this will further incentive car users.
7 However, members of the press do a special job, and
8 it can be--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--public. I will say this,
9 however, parking abuse regardless whether--who
10 commits this abuse remains rampant in New York City
11 particularly among those without valid permits who
12 flaunt rules or use fake placards to secure a spot.
13 This is--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--heard early this year
14 requiring its count--its countable--its countable
15 barcode to easily check on a placard validity. It is
16 also why included in this bill is the strict language
17 that a member of the press must be covering a story
18 if they are to park in--in otherwise restricted
19 space. We must clamp down on abusers of parking in
20 New York City for all vehicles including official
21 city vehicles as well. These ideas are more--[AUDIO
22 CUT OUT]--array of issues important to many New
23 Yorkers. I hope--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--first about Car-
24 Free Day, and with that, I would like to offer our
25 Public Advocate, who is here, right. Sorry. Our--

2 our Public Advocate an opportunity to speak-[AUDIO
3 CUT OUT]

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Rodriguez and his
5 staff for holding today's hearing. I am the prime
6 sponsor of Intro 9--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--that will enable
7 the city to more easily and effectively punish
8 reckless drivers who injure or kill pedestrians. At
9 the outset of his term, the Mayor announced his
10 Vision Zero Plan, a plan to end traffic fatalities
11 completely in New York City. In the roughly 2-1/2
12 years since the start of the Mayor's term, the Mayor
13 and this Council have devoted significant focus and
14 energy towards to seeing that promise through. Among
15 the many initiatives related to Vision Zero with the
16 increased enforcement of dangerous behavior behind
17 the wheel including failing to yield to pedestrians,
18 NYPD and TLC in particular have devoted more
19 resources to punishing those who fail to properly
20 yield to pedestrians. And this Council has focused
21 on right-of-way violations making it a misdemeanor
22 and increasing fines for a driver that injures a
23 pedestrian by failing to yield the right-of way. But
24 it has come to my attention that there is a fatal
25 flaw in this formula of imposing--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--

2 for determining whether and when a crossing
3 pedestrian has the right-of way--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--
4 Ask any New Yorker, and they'll likely tell you that
5 they have the right of way until the countdown clock
6 reaches zero, or there is a steady don't walk signal.
7 [AUDIO CUT OUT] of a walk signal or a blinking don't
8 walk signal or the countdown clock has not yet
9 reached zero. The pedestrian should have the right
10 of way, and despite the clear logic of that, bright
11 line rule, that is simply not the rule and/or the
12 case or the law. [AUDIO CUT OUT] As long as he or
13 she enters the crosswalk before the don't walk signal
14 begins blinking. Imagine for one moment that you are
15 a police officer who arrives at the scene of a crash
16 where a pedestrian walking the crosswalk has been hit
17 by a car and is seriously injured. How can you
18 reasonably expect to determine if the wounded--
19 wounded pedestrian--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--a flashing Don't
20 Walk. The answer simply is nearly impossible to
21 determine, but perhaps the more troubling question in
22 this circumstance is why doesn't the pedestrian have
23 the right of way until the crossing signals--signal
24 cycle ends. As far as I can tell, there are no good
25 reasons to either of these questions, and at time

2 when I--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--an obvious and important way
3 to make meaningful progress, and that's what we are
4 attempting to do by clarifying the law. [AUDIO CUT
5 OUT]--have the right-of-way until the crossing signal
6 shows a steady Don't Walk signal. [AUDIO CUT OUT]--
7 signal permits them to cross, and law enforcement
8 officers will more--more easily hold drivers
9 accountable when they violate the law. As an aside,
10 I am pleased to note that my office has spoken to
11 representatives of DOT and several advocates who have
12 shared helpful and constructive input to improve this
13 legislation, and while the bill draft will be heard
14 today, it does not reflect any of those recommended
15 changes. And so, let me reiterate the bill that you
16 have before you will change, and it will incorporate
17 the recommendations by advocates and DOT, and we are
18 optimistic that our collective vision--[AUDIO CUT
19 OUT]--to thank Council Member--Chair Rodriguez and
20 all the members of this committee for holding this
21 hearing including this legislation. Let me also
22 congratulate the Chair for Car-Free NYC. I look
23 forward--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --implement a
25 practice known as daylighting on the five most

2 dangerous intersections in each borough. This means
3 construction curb extensions on dangerous corners so
4 that drivers making turns have more vision, and a
5 better sense of the activity occurring at an
6 intersection. Allowing them--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--
7 lights. Daylighting has proven effective tools and
8 the DOT already use it with regular--regular--regular
9 latitude with good results. [AUDIO CUT OUT] With
10 that, now I would like to call the Council.
11 Administer the oath.

12 LEGAL COUNSEL: Would you please raise--
13 [AUDIO CUT OUT]--and to respond honestly to council
14 questions. Thank you. [AUDIO CUT OUT]

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RUSSO: Good morning,
16 Chair Rodriguez and members of the Transportation
17 Committee. I'm Ryan Russo, the Deputy Commissioner
18 for Transportation Planning and Management for the
19 New York City Department of Transportation. I'm here
20 on behalf of Commissioner Trottenberg to discuss
21 making our streets safer. I'm joined by Jeff Lynch,
22 Assistant Commissioner--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--to our
23 Vision Zero efforts, and the tools that DOT uses to
24 improve safety for all of the city streets--[AUDIO
25 CUT OUT]--together we've been able to accomplish so

2 much for our city. In fact, 2015 was the safest
3 year--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--on Earth Day Friday, April
4 22nd. We've been working with the Council to open
5 several streets to pedestrians on Earth Day at select
6 locations around the city. We hope this and other
7 initiatives created under the leadership of Chairman
8 Rodriguez will inspire a broader conversation about
9 how we keep our growing city moving. First, I'd like
10 to discuss Intro 1197, which relates to pedestrian--
11 [AUDIO CUT OUT]--the original law establishing the
12 right-of-way for pedestrians in crosswalks at
13 signalized intersections was enacted the State
14 Legislature back in 1959. Since then, the substance
15 has remained the same, and does not reflect new
16 technologies such as pedestrian countdown signals.
17 Under the existing law, pedestrians crossing at
18 signalized intersections only have the right-of-way
19 if they step off the curb during the walking person
20 phase of the signal. Pedestrians who step off during
21 the flashing red hand phase typically accompanied by
22 the countdown clock, do not have the right-of-way.
23 And as currently written, a turning motorist must
24 yield the right-of-way to a pedestrian who stepped
25 off the curb during the walk--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--

2 Standing on the north side of East 78th Street
3 waiting to cross Third Avenue on the Upper East Side
4 heading home from the store. The crossing distance
5 here is 70 feet. She faces a steady red hand, which
6 is the pedestrian equivalent of the red light for the
7 drivers who are also waiting to enter the inter--
8 [AUDIO CUT OUT]--traffic turns green. The pedestrian
9 and driver--drivers both now have the right-of-way to
10 proceed through the intersection crossing Third
11 Avenue traveling parallel with one another. This is
12 fine if--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--using the crosswalk. The
13 relationship between the traffic and pedestrian
14 signal timing in the current law makes this situation
15 complicated. As you can see from our chart, while
16 the traffic signal is still green, the pedestrian
17 signal turns to a flashing red hand, the pedestrian
18 equivalent of a yellow light. This flashing red
19 light typically accompanies a countdown clock to let
20 the pedestrians know how much time they have to
21 complete their crossing. This technology was not in
22 use when the law establishing the right-of-way was
23 written, but is now installed--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--phase
24 of the pedestrian signal is much longer than the
25 yellow phase for drivers. And pedestrians unlike

2 cars move at a very range of speeds. The countdown,
3 19 seconds in this case, is calculate--[AUDIO CUT
4 OUT]--Now imagine another pedestrian, an everyday
5 commuter walking at a speed of about seven or even
6 eight feet per second, which can happen in New York
7 City. This commuter approaches the same intersection
8 and sees a flashing red hand and countdown signal.
9 The commuter decides to proceed and catches up with
10 my mother who is already in the crosswalk. A driver
11 who approaches the intersection to turn left sees two
12 pedestrians in the exact same location in the
13 crosswalk. Under current law, one pedestrian has the
14 right of way while the other does not. In practice,
15 when turning, responsible drivers yield the right-of-
16 way to all pedestrians in the crosswalk while they're
17 turning. It is unreasonable to expect drivers to
18 determine whether pedestrians step off--stepped off
19 the curb during the walking person phase or during
20 the flashing red hand countdown phase. Accordingly,
21 we are supportive of the goals in Intro 997, which
22 will align the law with the acknowledge reality on--
23 [AUDIO CUT OUT]--implementation of five curb
24 extensions per borough per year. This is bill is
25 problematic for DOT--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--in problem-

2 solving approaches we currently use. To get into
3 this, allow me to outline how we--[AUDIO CUTS OUT--
4 added by our Vision Zero Borough Pedestrian Safety
5 Action Plans, which we--we released last year. These
6 plans analyze the unique conditions of each borough
7 and identified characteristics of pedestrian
8 fatalities and injuries on each borough's streets.
9 By combining community input from our 28 Vision Zero
10 Town Halls and hands-on workshops with this data, we
11 developed a comprehensive and data-driven work plan,
12 which focuses DOT and NYPD resources at the most
13 crash-prone locations in each borough. We identified
14 Vision Zero priority corridors, intersections in
15 areas, which dispro--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--to make the
16 most significant safety gains. Since the law into
17 Vision Zero we've completed 102 Vision Zero safety
18 engineering projects in these geographies. In 2015,
19 we completed 60 of these priority projects doubling
20 of our pre-Vision Zero pace. One--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--
21 traffic created safer, shorter pedestrian cross--
22 crossing by reconfiguring a complex intersection,
23 installing a center median, narrowing vehicular
24 travel lanes, and adding crosswalks, a pedestrian
25 safety island and traffic signals. You can see the

2 changes over my right shoulder here. [AUDIO CUT OUT]-
3 -and 57th Street. We added pedestrian spaces,
4 increased pedestrian crossing time, and reduced
5 conflicts with turning vehicles while creating a
6 block-long bus boarding island. This--this project
7 also added a bus stop at a high demand location where
8 bus service could not stop because of the traffic in
9 the location and the configuration.

10 An additional strategy from our Borough
11 Plans, it's to dramatically in--increase in the
12 installation--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--on a second head start
13 when entering an intersection. LPIs improve safety
14 during a vehicle's turn through the crosswalk by
15 giving pedestrians conflict free crossing time,
16 enhancing the vil--visibility of pedestrians in the
17 intersection. In 2015, DOT installed 417 lead-in
18 pedestrian intervals. Before Vision Zero, we
19 installed about 16 on average each year. And now a
20 new Vision Zero strategy is our focus on left turns,
21 which are particularly dangerous. Pedestrians and
22 bicyclists are three times as likely to be killed or
23 severely injured in--in these crashes as compared to
24 crashes with right turns. As Mayor de Blasio
25 announced in January, DOT is testing a series of

2 treatment so make left turns safer. These treatments
3 will be evaluated to determine if they increase
4 motorist compliance, slow vehicle turns, improve
5 safety and are scalable to additional sites--[AUDIO
6 CUT OUT]--staff use their professional expertise and
7 judgment to study the crash history, survey existing
8 conditions, consult with members of the community and
9 accordingly develop the most appropriate and
10 effective design--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--and robust toolbox
11 of safety engineering treatments that DOT continues
12 to expand and improve. These tools include corridor
13 redesigns, road dyads, protected bike lanes,
14 exclusive bus lanes and intersection treatments such
15 as new crosswalks, pedestrian islands and turn
16 signals, and also systemic treatments like LED
17 lighting, countdown signals and high visibility
18 crosswalks.

19 As you can see--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--
20 extension may not address the specific issues
21 contributing to crashes at a particular location, and
22 they are rarely the most cost or time-effective
23 option due to the complexity of our underground
24 infrastructure including the potential need for re--
25 relocation of catch basins and other utilities and

2 changes to grading of the roadway for both drainage
3 and acceptability. As such, cost and delays can
4 quick--quickly escalate with curb extension projects.
5 These are just a few of the factors that must be
6 addressed before curb extension can be installed.
7 [AUDIO CUT OUT]--and the formula proposed in the
8 bill. This would inhibit our ability to use our
9 engineering expertise in a data-driven approach to
10 ensure the City receives the greatest safety benefit
11 possible from every dollar and every hour we have
12 available to deliver safety improvements.
13 Accordingly, we--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--testify today, and
14 I'm now happy to answer questions you may have, and I
15 think I'm actually passing it to Inspector Fulton.

16 INSPECTOR FULTON: Good--good morning,
17 Chair Rodriguez. [AUDIO CUT OUT] As you know, as
18 part of the Vision Zero Initiative, there's an
19 intense and comprehensive focus within the
20 Administration. [AUDIO CUT OUT]--here on record for
21 pedestrians on New York City streets with significant
22 decreases in traffic and pedestrian fatalities since
23 2013 before this initiative was launched. Going
24 forward, the Police--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--for the
25 agencies, advocates, community stakeholders and the

2 Council to make our streets safe for all. [AUDIO CUT
3 OUT] --these for the press to park where parking or
4 standing is otherwise prohibited, except where
5 standing or stopping is prohibited--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--
6 like if another vehicle is actually engaged in the
7 coverage--covering of a news event or a matter of
8 public concern. Lastly, the bill states that where
9 any city agency has granted by sign any parking or
10 driving privileges to vehicle with NYPD license
11 plates, such privileges are extended only to press
12 vehicles and on-duty emergency vehicles. While we
13 recognize the need for members of the press to, at
14 times, use a motor vehicle in the gathering of news,
15 the Administration respectfully opposes Intro 779 as
16 currently drafted either to--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--and in
17 the field after having observed a vehicle parked in a
18 prohibited space or with an expired meter to
19 determine whether vehicle is covering a legitimate
20 news event or matter of public concern, and is thus
21 parked legally. The bill provides no defining
22 criteria as to what this term means. While some
23 news--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--subtle and it is unclear how a
24 police officer or a TAA--TEA would be alerted of such
25 an event and know not to ticket a specific vehicle.

2 Furthermore, the bill goes beyond pressing news
3 events to coverage of any matter of public concern,
4 potentially encouraging the disregard of parking laws
5 and meters even in situations where they do not pose
6 an obstacle to coverage. The bill, as drafted, does
7 not seem to provide for restriction of press vehicles
8 from certain locations where emergency vehicles are
9 permitted potentially creating situations in which
10 the press could be in danger or could impeded public
11 safety or emergency response. Lastly, the expansive
12 exemption that Intro 779 provides has the potential
13 to lead to abuses by those who seek to obtain
14 unlimited parking privileges while on personal
15 business. Additionally, the bill provides no
16 guidance on what it means for a member of the press
17 to be actually engaged in the covering of a news
18 event or matter of public concern. For example,
19 whether it would include working on a story from the
20 press member's office or home or a task like
21 conducting a phone interview or researching an issue,
22 in many instances a police officer or TEA would
23 likely have no way of confirming whether a press
24 vehicle--[AUDIO CUT OUT]-- This would present
25 difficulties for police officers, TEAs and members of

2 the press themselves who would also have to assess
3 where they are--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--compliant with the
4 law. The notion that press vehicles should be
5 allowed some kind of reasonable accommodation in
6 order to perform their duty--duties is not a
7 legitimate one, which is why as practical matter--
8 [AUDIO CUT OUT]--inform, however. Intro 779 raises
9 many concerns and poses practical and operational
10 challenges for the Police Department. Intro 997
11 would give pedestrians the right-of-way--[AUDIO CUT
12 OUT]-- The Police Department is supportive of this
13 idea. The current law that Intro 997 would update
14 was put in place before the use of pedestrian
15 countdown signals. The bill recognizes that who has
16 the right-of-way can be unclear for both pedestrians
17 and motorists, and that our current laws and rules do
18 not account for pedestrians who are safely and
19 appropriately crossing the street during a countdown.
20 This legislation has been the subject of robust
21 discussions between the Administration the Public
22 Advocate and the Council, and we believe that a
23 consensus has been reached that represents a
24 thoughtful means to protect pedestrian safety while
25 also ensuring fair enforcement of right-of-way laws

2 and rules. We look forward to continuing that
3 dialogue as well as supporting a version of the bill
4 that reflects this consensus. Thank you for the
5 opportunity to--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

7 Before I ask a few questions and my colleagues, too,
8 I'd like to recognize council members who are here.
9 They've been here, and they've been going to other
10 hearings. Council Member Rose, Van Bramer, Menchaca
11 and Reynoso. It is a surprise to me--first of all,
12 I'm happy that, you know, that with the press parking
13 bill while you're saying we oppose the bill as it is,
14 it mean that, you know, that we will con--that you're
15 open to continue conversation. [AUDIO CUT OUT].

16 DENNIS FULTON: --so you had, but as the
17 bill is currently written, we oppose it.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Right. Because I
19 think that, you know, I can tell you of the abuse
20 coming from many sides. The last--the last three
21 weeks I've been getting two tickets for an area where
22 I'm allowed to park. I know where I'm allowed to
23 park, and I know where I'm not allowed to park. I
24 know that I'm not allowed to park where it's saying
25 no parking at any time. I know that I'm not allowed

2 to park where it say no parking, where there's a no
3 parking that's a vehicle commercial. Those two and
4 meters. So when during my time at work, and I know
5 that I'm allowed to park there, and my car has been
6 towed. [AUDIO CUT OUT] In the three weeks, three
7 members who are doing the enforcement, and I don't
8 know for what reason, when I have my plaque in my
9 cart abusing their right, giving tickets for whatever
10 reason for someone who is a council member. So, when
11 we keep talking about, you know, the abuse it's not,
12 you know, you like who can abuse? I can say that,
13 you know, we have the good and the bad apple
14 everywhere, and I think that definitely whatever bill
15 we can come with--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--that they're doing
16 the jobs. Second, you know, for me that argument,
17 which is it creates some challenges for the NYPD when
18 they're doing the job. The bill doesn't say that
19 anyone can park in double parking. The bill only say
20 that people will be allowed when they're covering the
21 story in the same area as a non-parking--[AUDIO CUT
22 OUT]--area that no one is allowed to get in. Not
23 even elected officials are allowed to get in, and we
24 respect it--[AUDIO CUT OUT]. You're saying the
25 conversation can continue. I second that argument,

2 which is about it creates challenges for NYPD. What
3 are the challenges that they create?

4 DENNIS FULTON: Well, as I mentioned, a
5 news event or a matter of public concern is a vague
6 term, and the TAs and the police officers that issues
7 summonses, we wouldn't--we wouldn't know. I mean in--
8 -in a--in a highly obvious emergency situation yes,
9 but in situations that are less obvious we wouldn't.
10 The TA or the police officer who are doing good work
11 by issuing summonses and--and the circumstances you
12 brought up, you--and I'll bring it back to our--our
13 supervisors in the Traffic Enforcement District to--
14 to educate them and train them better at--you know,
15 so that doesn't happen again, but I do apologize for
16 a summons that you got that wasn't warranted. But
17 that--that's the main concern. Another thing with
18 the bill is that it--it--the language basically gives
19 carte blanche to the press. Even if there's legal
20 parking, they can park illegally, and that's one of--
21 one of--other concerns that we have. So--

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] --with
23 the level of working relationship that we have with
24 this administration for especially DOT, you know, big
25 time, and NYPD when it comes to Vision Zero. But

2 when it comes to the press parking, right--[AUDIO CUT
3 OUT]--and--and media--a member of the press. So this
4 is like--or if you can clarify--

5 DENNIS FULTON: [interposing] Again--

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --was the
7 decision or rid--of--of getting rid of the parking
8 for teachers and many members of the press was a
9 result or any assessment, and what was the assessment
10 or the study?

11 DENNIS FULTON: With regard to the press,
12 they already--already issued through the--the state--
13 [AUDIO CUT OUT]--the parking placard. So it's a fight
14 that's redundant, and--and--and it's--there's always
15 an administrative cost on our end, and we felt that
16 it was a redundancy since they already are given NYPD
17 plates through the State, and that's why we disbanded
18 it.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But teachers
20 don't have a state plaque. I used to be a teacher
21 for 13 year.

22 DENNIS FULTON: Right, I have to--

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, you know, the
24 rationale was really--

2 DENNIS FULTON: [interposing] I have--
3 [AUDIO CUT OUT].

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --millions in New
5 Yorkers that own cars like my self to want millions.
6 I'm not saying that we should bring more incentive
7 for people to have cars. But what I'm saying is if
8 we are saying we're building, we're addressing--
9 [AUDIO CUT OUT]--of the city, you know, and I hope
10 that one day we will get there, but when it comes to
11 a particular sector--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--it doesn't call
12 for a lot of people in the media to go and park the
13 car, you know, interrupting--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--

14 DENNIS FULTON: --and I've been to crime
15 scenes and--and emergency situations. We have--
16 [AUDIO CUT OUT]--five and--and, of course, we
17 understand the necessity for the press to have access
18 through--not into the inner crime scene or to an
19 emergency if they don't, but so they can do their
20 job. So we have afforded the through discretion a,
21 you know, parking--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--for that, as I
22 cited in--in my opening statement, but we do work
23 with them, and we do afford them discretion at these
24 scenes, and--and I personally can talk about, you
25 know, an open communication with them and--and with

2 the communication that's helpful at a scene because
3 if we do have to move the crime scene of the
4 emergency lines back, I know who I spoke you, and I
5 could take and move the van back. In planned events,
6 we actually make accommodations. Say there's a
7 parade, we actually discuss with the press before
8 hand and set up with barriers different spots that
9 they can set up their equipment realizing the
10 necessity and the important--importance of their
11 work.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But again, I, you
13 know, this is not about--this is about restoring the
14 rights of member of the press that all used to have,
15 that the previous administration they also got rid of
16 the teachers' parking around the same period of time
17 that they also got rid of the press parking. Which
18 is the area that is in your concern--[AUDIO CUT OUT]-
19 -in which area do you have issues for them not to be
20 allowed to park? Because I will assume that we're
21 going to have issues, and members of the press who is
22 covering the story, they will be allowed to park
23 where it say no parking, with them--for them to be
24 allowed on meters. So, in which area do you have,

2 that the NYPD has a major obstacle or--[AUDIO CUT
3 OUT]--

4 DENNIS FULTON: --What the bill means
5 and--and--and how we can extend their parking
6 privileges--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--park and--and where they
7 can't park, and what regard. And another thing is
8 with the [coughs] with the outside states with the,
9 you know, Connecticut, and New Jersey, and we
10 understand also that their press is important because
11 it's a Tri-State area, and--and we want to work with
12 them, too, and--and like I said, we have a certain
13 discretion that we would afford to them, but as the
14 bill is written I--from my standpoint I don't
15 completely understand, you know, how the TEA or the
16 police officers would understand exactly how their
17 vehicles would be identified and--and where they
18 would be allowed to be parking as the bill is
19 written.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. I just
21 hope that, you know, as--as someone--[AUDIO CUT OUT]-
22 -and I know that we will continue working in that
23 direction. I just hope that, you know, that again we
24 will we con--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--council member go you
25 can park in double parking. This is about parking at

2 meters. It's about parking at the no parking area.
3 You know, certain areas that, you know, what they
4 should be allowed to park the car when they're
5 covering the story--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--let's afford it.
6 So--so--so, you know, this is important for the
7 majority of the Council and, again, I--even though,
8 you know, it--I've been asking those questions, but I
9 also, you know, I know that we are in a good place at
10 least when--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--area is about with--with
11 the daylighting for DOT. Isn't it true that you can
12 daylight an intersection without actually extending
13 the curve, such as by prohibiting parking near the
14 crosswalk, and then so (sic) and that make it easier
15 to do?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RUSSO: Sure. Well,
17 daylighting typically is the, yes, putting up a no
18 standing any time sign. That's what--which would
19 prohibit the parking on the approach. The--the bill
20 that we are--testified did--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--
21 responding to.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] So what
23 I [on mic] hope is again as we say in the previous
24 bill that this is something that we can continue
25 conversation in--on this matter, is that?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RUSSO: Sure. Yeah,
3 we--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--and we have to work together to-
4 -to really move toward Vision Zero.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. And my
6 last one is first of all, thank you. I'd like to
7 thank, you know, as I said, no the Mayor but DOT
8 Commissioner Polly, in the is case Jeff for being
9 like a great partner as we've been working and having
10 a conversation, and planning on the Car-Free Day.
11 And I would like to, you know, to hear some--even
12 though this is something that I've been behind, but
13 there's a whole borough coalition here. As you know,
14 there's a major push. We will have Citi Bike
15 providing free rides that day. Madison Square Garden
16 they're going to be advertising in the facility from
17 here to the 22, clear channel the one KPU and some
18 screen time in Times Square. They're also going to be
19 promoting in that--in that area. They are saying to
20 Columbia, NYU to everyone, they're--they are ready
21 to, you know, like--they've been already work
22 advertising, encourage employees. So this is
23 something that we can say--and this would not be
24 possible without the level of support that we've

2 already been getting from DOT. So if you can also
3 elaborate a little more--[AUDIO CUT OUT].

4 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER LYNCH: --the last
5 month, month and a half to make Car-Free, you know,
6 NYC Day a reality, and we're happy to be working with
7 you on--on--on closing stretches of Broad--a small
8 stretch of Broadway from 17th to 23rd Streets,
9 Wadsworth in--in Northern Manhattan, and--and some
10 streets around NYU for--for programming around this
11 important day, and we look forward to continuing to
12 work with you. There's--there's a--a lot of work we
13 have to do between now and the--the 22nd, and I
14 think, you know, Deputy Commissioner Russo can
15 certainly talk to some of our--our broader efforts.
16 It's certainly when you--when you look at your--your
17 Car-Free--[AUDIO CUT OUT].

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RUSSO: --about the
19 timing of the April 22nd, the Earth Day is that it's
20 really when we're beginning to ramp up our
21 implementation of our projects, which are so
22 important to keeping the city moving--[AUDIO CUT
23 OUT]--projects and--and street redesigns and safety
24 and bus projects that we are embarking on. [AUDIO CUT
25 OUT] We think maybe we can even tie in more sort of

2 highlighting the--the infrastructure that's coming
3 that people have the op--[AUDIO CUT OUT].

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: It started with
5 an increase of 15 made that, which is a big, you
6 know, big, too, I would say for everyone. That is a
7 major event organized by the Governor and--and other
8 folks. So, that--and that's one of the reasons why,
9 you know, some of the colleagues, you know, that they
10 are also been attending that big rally. So Council
11 Member Menchaca.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you,
13 Chair and thank you for your testimony, all--all of
14 your testimony on today's bills. Just to kind of
15 quickly talk a little bit about Car-Free New York
16 City under and the leadership, our Chair and Vision
17 Zero advocates. I--I really can't wait to see some
18 of [AUDIO CUT OUT]--how we can create more Car-Free
19 spaces. It's really, really exciting, and the
20 momentum only continues to grow. So with my short
21 time, I want to focus on Intro 779, and Inspector
22 Fulton, if you can tell me a little bit--you--you
23 kind of hinted at the--the concept of--of this piece
24 of legislation not allowing for us to fully
25 understand who is press even if you're--[AUDIO CUT

2 OUT]--roads being covered. Have you--have you
3 thought about how to--how to solve that? I think I
4 heard that that is an issue of the bill, and then
5 second, have you convened any conversation with the
6 press in any way, and kind of organized the press to
7 have conversations--or can you plan to do that?

8 DENNIS FULTON: [AUDIO CUT OUT] This is a
9 public admin--administration. We haven't had a lot
10 of complaints from the press that says--they're
11 saying that this--of course, I think anybody would
12 want their parking privilege extended, but there
13 hasn't been a major uptick in complaints in the last
14 couple of years with-- You know, this--this has been
15 a--[crashing sound/laughter] [AUDIO CUT OUT]--that
16 the press would agree that they--the papers are being
17 filled with stories. So they're getting some access.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: [AUDIO CUT OUT]-
19 -but I--I think that that questions kind of lingers
20 in the room right now, and--and I think what--I guess
21 the only thing I want to say is that it's an
22 important thing to have conversations, and so if
23 you're not getting that--I know we have--[AUDIO CUT
24 OUT]--it would be great if--if we can hear from you
25 today that you will commit to having a direct

2 conversation and a direct line to the press, and
3 organize. They--they will organize, I believe, and
4 connect with you in whatever languages and--and I'm
5 talking even about our ethnic press., and our--our
6 immigrant community--[AUDIO CUT OUT]. All of that is
7 to say will you and--and can you really commit to
8 opening up that line of commun--conversation, and
9 understanding that, and posing that question to them
10 about how they might like to be identified and get
11 some answers and questions, and ideas from them.

12 DENNIS FULTON: I--I think like I said
13 we're open to further discussion. The language in
14 the bill, like I said, in certain circumstances make
15 it impossible for our--through out job operationally
16 and--and getting back to what I was saying that at
17 the major events we already provide, you know,
18 accommodations to the press. We go above and beyond
19 to help them out, and then it seems anecdotally I can
20 speak specifically to events that I've been at that
21 they press has come to me and asked to park
22 illegally, which I give in discretion, and I've done
23 it, and I'm sure it's done by many of my colleagues.
24 That's it. I mean, you know, as far--[AUDIO CUT
25 OUT]--their parking privileges extended, and the

2 current form as it works does work for the NYPD. I
3 mean the press obviously they just demonstrated that
4 they're--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--all times.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And in advance
6 when we started this conversation, and as co-sponsor
7 of this bill, I--I want to make sure that we--we--we--
8 --we honor the process of legislation making the--and--
9 --and really make sure that whatever--[AUDIO CUT OUT]-
10 --really an opportunity for the core concept of press
11 being able to take information and quickly
12 disseminate it out into--into the world, and these
13 are--these are our partners that we both use in--in
14 cases of emergency and crisis.

15 DENNIS FULTON: Well, well, I--I agree. I
16 think that the press has a--a job to do, and--and I
17 think the Police Department is always to work with
18 them, and--and gave accommodations to them. And
19 again, we'll act in a professional manner, you know,
20 when--when certain circumstances--circumstances
21 dictate, and we will--[AUDIO CUT OUT]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --a solvable
23 problem. I--I really do believe that, and as long as
24 everything is on the table, I think we can get to a--
25 --a good solution, a fair solution. So just really,

2 last--last question on--for DOT, and we're thinking
3 about curb ex--extensions, and--and you're not too
4 excited about some of the other pieces of
5 legislation, and--and kind of point to the fact that
6 you have a larger tool kit and this legislation to
7 kind of mandate borough by borough--we put a number
8 on it about the curb extensions, and that's just not--
9 -[AUDIO CUT OUT]--commit to making those kind of curb
10 extensions where they make sense, but build them,
11 and--and still use the other toolkits, and
12 potentially then create other pieces of legislation
13 to--to kind of mandate those other pieces just to
14 accelerate the infrastructure for Vision Zero in our
15 streets. Tell me what--what makes sense.

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RUSSO: [AUDIO CUT
17 OUT]--complexity versus effectiveness scale, it
18 doesn't put--it doesn't rank at the highest. It
19 pretty much involves--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: [interposing]
21 Let me just hear that again. The curb extensions are
22 the most complex things you have--

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RUSSO: [interposing]
24 They--

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --in your
3 toolkit.

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RUSSO: They--they
5 are--they're one of the most complex things we have
6 in our toolkit, and then when you compare them to
7 their sort of benefit and effectiveness, it's, you
8 know, it's--it's not the--[AUDIO CUT OUT]. To
9 implement it, it's pretty much a depart--a DDC/DOT
10 partnership to do that, and where we've been doing it
11 most is the--our Priority School Initiative, our Safe
12 Routes to School Initiative, which has been a long-
13 term multi-year capital project to--at sort of
14 regular intersections around schools shortening
15 crossing distances, building--building out those--
16 those intersections. As I alluded to in my
17 testimony, you know, the street--people think of the
18 street as in--in two dimensions. It's really a
19 three-dimensional thing. There's a slope from the
20 doorway of your building down the sidewalk. It has
21 to get all the water off the sidewalk. There's a
22 crown to the roadway that has to get the water from
23 the road down to the curb. It has to get into catch
24 basins. We have to give people ramps to--for the
25 crossings. They have to be at ADA--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--

2 re-grading, redesign survey, and then you get
3 involved with what's underground, not just
4 potentially the catch basin. I mean you took--but
5 other utilities and [AUDIO CUT OUT]--anything, you
6 know, major contractors for a smaller theoretically
7 inexpensive job, but then you're, you know, you're
8 relocating and rerouting utilities. You're--you're
9 re-grading. So you--you--the design involved so that
10 the--the--that the planning, the design, the
11 outreach, everything--[AUDIO CUT OUT] so--and--and
12 we're learning more and more about how--the how, the
13 where, the why crashes happen, and that's a pretty
14 dynamic process. We're studying it. We have the
15 Left Turn Initiative that we're coming out, and for
16 example, one of the things curb extension seeks to
17 mitigate is to try to slow the turn of a vehicle sort
18 of going across the crosswalk. We are finding more
19 and more that those crashes, as we comb through crash
20 reports that those turning crashes don't happen on
21 the smaller crossings, but when you turn off a small
22 side street on a very big street. So, we've had some
23 tragedies such as Northern Boulevard and 61st Street
24 and West End Avenue and 97th Street. The drivers
25 were driving on the small street, and turning onto

2 the big street [AUDIO CUT OUT]--and putting in center
3 medians, which changed the path of the turn. We see
4 as more effective. So it's really, you know, not a
5 cross cost (sic) but an opportunity cost that we
6 have. So [AUDIO CUT OUT]--or do we go forward and
7 explain, you know, that approach is--it works.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Great and--and--
9 -and that's my final though, and--and I think that if
10 we can bring that down to the community board level,
11 and have those conversations. I'm--I'm hearing a
12 really strong case for curb extension. It's just a
13 popular thing because you see that in a real way, and
14 our community has--is kind of connected to the--
15 [AUDIO CUT OUT]--you see that the--the effects. I
16 think that's what people are asking for. So it would
17 be great to continue that engagement on the ground,
18 and it would be great to work with you all and your
19 teams and our community boards. Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And I would like
21 to be clear. First of all with the name. That name
22 for me it's--this is not about privilege. You know
23 as we move conversations--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--privilege
24 at all. This is about being sure that the men and
25 women who are covering the story that the public

2 expects they will be informed. To be able to have
3 the tools they need. So, you know, let's be--let's
4 be clear on this one that we're not talking about
5 privilege. We're talking about a right that we would
6 like to, you know, to be restored. Because as far as
7 we know---[applause]

8 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down. No
9 applause. [applause]

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] Thank
11 you. I met the goal. (sic) As far--as far as I know
12 I don't think it's different unless there's different
13 information. I don't think that the previous
14 administration did a study about this before getting
15 later of this parking--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--for the media
16 to have a plaque.

17 DENNIS FULTON: Well, I--I think that,
18 like I said, it was more of a--and--and it was part
19 of an overall policy to reduce the placards, but with
20 regard to the press it--there was a redundancy issue.
21 They were already getting state issued plates. So
22 the--I think the administration felt--and--and--that
23 having both the placards--

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]
25 And what about--what about teachers?

2 DENNIS FULTON: Excuse me.

3 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: What about
4 teachers?

5 DENNIS FULTON: I--I have the--I don't
6 really--I--I--I--[AUDIO CUT OUT]

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --tell you that
8 as witness, we didn't have a state block. So--but
9 and again the question on this current administration
10 my question is did the administration--the previous
11 administration conduct any study and, therefore, as a
12 result they make it a decision to get rid of--of--of
13 [AUDIO CUT OUT]--

14 DENNIS FULTON: I'd have to get back to
15 you. What did--what their level of analysis was I
16 don't know, and I'd--I'd have to get back to you on
17 that.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. Thank
19 you. Council Member Reynoso.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you guys
21 for being here. Extremely excited by Car-Free NYC,
22 and I'll get to that in a few seconds, but
23 Commissioner you said two things that I wanted to get
24 a--a response to. Now you said that the NYPD
25 wouldn't be able to function operationally if these

2 placards, the way--the way currently as we're in--
3 [AUDIO CUT OUT]--to--to a certain extent. I just
4 want to know the difference between now and then.

5 DENNIS FULTON: Um--

6 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: [interposing] Or
7 then and what would happen under this law that would
8 be different?

9 DENNIS FULTON: I would say that they--
10 there was a fix there, and operationally it probably
11 was imperfect then, and--and--and maybe they fixed
12 it. Again, I'm supposing a little bit, but regard--I
13 can specifically answer this bill, and I can give you
14 an example. If I was a traffic agent and I came upon
15 a--a vehicle with--[AUDIO CUT OUT] or if there was--
16 in many circumstances whether there was a news event
17 or a matter of public concern going on. So that
18 operationally how would the traffic agent or police
19 officer know--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--they--they could issue
20 the summons incorrectly or not issue the summons when
21 they should have.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Okay, I--I
23 wanted to wanted to ask another one. You said that
24 the previous administration felt the need to move the
25 placards. I just want to say I don't think the

2 previous administration felt very much. They might
3 have believed something, but felt no so much. They
4 do everything, I believe, the way Council Member
5 Ydanis talked about through some type of study.
6 There had to be some type of evidence, some type of
7 data to support the need to remove placards in
8 general whether they're-- Right now, we have
9 information regarding fake placards, and--and the
10 work that we have to do to--to fix that. I mean
11 actual information that lets us know that that's a
12 big problem. We just really want to start to working
13 on information that--that is real. We need data to
14 support any--any case that you might have against
15 them, and [AUDIO CUT OUT]-- and changes in the
16 language that you would support it. Is that what I'm
17 hearing? That way--

18 DENNIS FULTON: [interposing] I--I think
19 that--I think we're in agreement that the press has
20 an important job to do. So we would consider, you
21 know, anything that was presented that we could work
22 with operationally.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Okay, so I'm--
24 I'm excited to see that conversation happen. If the
25 dialogue happens we could get--so would start moving

2 forward. Obviously, you have concerns as I--it is in
3 right now, as the law written right now, but given
4 some conversations, we could get to a point where--

5 DENNIS FULTON: [interposing] That's
6 possible. Yes.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Okay because
8 the--the NYPD, by the way, has supported zero pieces
9 of legislation from--in regards to any changes that
10 we would like to make here in the City Council ever,
11 ever. It's been three years since somebody from the
12 NYPD stood here and said we support this legislation.

13 DENNIS FULTON: Well, I think we just--we
14 just right away well we just--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--

15 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Well, thank you.
16 I--I think that that's a traffic--a traffic related
17 piece of legislation. What I'm talking is
18 operationally how the NYPD was to--to work. I don't
19 have any down there until--[AUDIO CUT OUT]. Vehicles
20 are going to continue to be out in the streets. Can
21 you tell me what a private vehicle is? Real long
22 cabs is what I'm asking to continue to operate during
23 Car-Free NYC.

24 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER LYNCH: On--there
25 are--there are select limited street closings that

2 we've worked with the Chairman Rodriguez on. That
3 would be on Broadway from 17th Street to 23rd Street
4 in a three or four-block section of Wadsworth and
5 several blocks near NYU where those will be
6 completely closed to traffic.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: [AUDIO CUT OUT]
8 --and I definitely think it's a--it's a goal that we
9 should be working to get to together. I think it's
10 going to send a clear message that we have the
11 infrastructure in place in the city of New York to
12 allow for this happen on a regular basis--[AUDIO CUT
13 OUT] --the city doing currently to encourage its--
14 its several employees not to use vehicles, and to
15 walk--what--what is--what action are being or what
16 message is being sent from the administration to its
17 civil employees, if any have taken part yet?

18 DENNIS FULTON: Well, we're--[AUDIO CUT
19 OUT]--

20 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER LYNCH: I mean and
21 again I, you know, I know that a number of DOT--
22 [AUDIO CUT OUT]--that's a conference today, and the--
23 and the hearing today, I think the message is
24 beginning to get out about Car-Free NYC.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Okay, I really
3 want to make sure that we give our--we--we send the
4 message very clearly to our civil employees that we
5 [AUDIO CUT OUT]--we want to get a clear understanding
6 of what non-essential means. So we're--we're clear
7 about what vehicles we're going to get off the
8 streets that day.

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER LYNCH: We can
10 provide you a--a better description of what that is.
11 [AUDIO CUT OUT] --hire the--the car--car usage and--
12 and those who had--would--would still be able to use
13 them, but then there's--there's plenty that do not.
14 Just like you used the example and--and those would,
15 you know, we're--we're encouraging folks to not use
16 their vehicles on that day.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Great. Thank
18 you guys. I appreciate it. Thank you, Chair.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Great. So
20 we just closing of the panel. Do we have any
21 questions or are you fine? Okay. So, thank you
22 again, and, you know, we are in the best place than
23 we used to be before, and the good thing is that the
24 conversation will continue and I hope that, you know,
25 everything goes well that we are--we are not in the

2 same place right now. Though, we know that we will
3 continue working, and thank you again, DOT especially
4 Jeff for being the person that lead--[AUDIO CUT OUT].
5 Kathy (sic) Institute for Rational and Urban
6 Mobility; Dani Simons and Citi Bike; Ken Podziba from
7 Bike New York; Jacquelyn for the League of
8 Conservation Voters, and Richard Wener, NYU School of
9 Engineer. [background comments] [AUDIO CUT OUT] And
10 you will have three minutes each. So, yes.

11 YATIM YATAMU: Good morning. Hello. Am
12 I on? Okay, great. Good morning [AUDIO CUT OUT]
13 Yatim Yatamu (sp?) with the New York League of
14 Conservation Voters. I'm not going to read our--our
15 testimony [AUDIO CUT OUT]--seven. I think we've
16 heard from the Public Advocate and the council member
17 and [AUDIO CUT OUT]. We believe that it is a very
18 important tool to achieving Vision Zero. Vision Zero
19 requires all hands on deck. So that's education.
20 That's awareness. That's changing our street design,
21 changing the culture, changing behavior, and also
22 laws and [AUDIO CUT OUT] pedestrians have the right-
23 of-way when they're in the crosswalk until the
24 signal, you know, completely changes, period. So we
25 are here to show our support, and we thank you,

2 Chair, for your leadership on Vision Zero and
3 certainly Car-Free NYC as well. Thank you.

4 DANI SIMONS: Hello. I'm Dani Simons.
5 I'm here representing Motivate the Operators of Citi
6 Bike. We'd like to thank Council Member Rodriguez,
7 Chairman Rodriguez and his colleagues for their
8 support of the idea of a Car-Free NYC, and Citi Bike
9 is proud to be a supporter of this and a support with
10 our partners at the City Council and New York City
11 [AUDIO CUT OUT]--in 2013 and we've served over 25
12 million trips since then providing a convenient and
13 healthy and sustainable way to [AUDIO CUT OUT]. We
14 really want biking to be accessible to all New
15 Yorkers, young and old. Whether you are, you know,
16 into fitness or just trying to get to work, Citi Bike
17 is something for you. And it's--and it's really
18 changed the way that New Yorkers think about
19 bicycling and how they get around, and that's great
20 news. More people on bikes means cleaner air,
21 healthier New Yorkers and frankly happier New
22 Yorkers, too. And don't just take my word for it
23 [AUDIO CUT OUT]--while our passes is part of Car-Free
24 Earth Day on April 22nd. People will be able to
25 [AUDIO CUT OUT] When bicycling a station easy it's

2 provides a real alternative for New Yorkers. In New
3 York City [AUDIO CUT OUT] 56% are under three miles,
4 but the distance is really easily served by bicycles.
5 So we're proud of the part that we play in helping
6 get more New Yorkers on bikes and get more people out
7 of cars for those kinds of unnecessary short trips.
8 We're also pleased to announced that we've taken
9 steps to green our own operations, and reduce the
10 number of vehicles that we used as part of the Citi
11 Bike program. We use 36% fewer vehicles now to do
12 rebalancing that's moving bikes from stations that
13 are empty to stations--stations that are too full to
14 stations that are too empty than we did when we
15 launched. So again, thank you to all that you do.
16 Thank you to our partners at DOT for helping make the
17 street safer and even better for bicycling and we
18 look forward to seeing hundreds of thousands of New
19 Yorkers out on bikes walking taking transit on Car-
20 Free Earth Day.

21 KEN PODZIBA: Good morning. I'm Ken
22 Podziba. I'm the President and CEO Bike New York,
23 and I'm here to give our full support to Resolution
24 1013, which calls upon the City of New York to make
25 Earth Day 2016 a Car-Free day for private and non-

2 essential vehicles. I think Car-Free Day is
3 something that many of us in this room have dreamed
4 for a long time, and although it's not going to look
5 like Bogata or Paris in year one, it's taking a giant
6 leap forward, and I--we can't thank enough Council
7 Member Rodriguez. I've been in city government just
8 about my whole career. I know how difficult it is to
9 get things done. It takes a lot of courage. There's
10 a lot of obstacles. So just thank you so much for
11 taking this stand, and to the Progressive Caucus, and
12 for the Transportation Committee. I can't think of a
13 better way to celebrate the Mayor's committed to
14 Vision Zero, and for sustainable, cleaner, more
15 active transportation than a car-free New York City.
16 So thank you. Car-Free NYC is about making an
17 important--important statement that less cars in the
18 city of New York is better for the vast majority of
19 [AUDIO CUT OUT]. Bike New York is excited and
20 honored to be part of this Car-Free NYC Day. We
21 teach over 17,000 New Yorkers bike education and
22 safety skills each year. We target mostly
23 underserved kids through our under--through our after
24 school and summer camp programs, and we will be
25 teaching kids how to ride bikes in Washington Heights

2 in Council Member Rodriguez's district like we've
3 done before on--on streets that are reserved
4 ordinarily for cars. And once we teach kids and
5 adults how to ride safe--safely the whole city
6 becomes their playground, and people who ride their
7 bikes, or should I say people who don't drive their
8 cars on a regular basis are better off physically,
9 mentally, emotionally and socially. Car-Free NYC
10 will make a powerful connection with Earth Day, the
11 largest secular holiday in the world with more than
12 200 million from 141 countries coming together to
13 promote environmental protection globally. It will
14 enable New Yorkers to celebrate in a much more
15 personable--personal and meaningful way with fewer
16 cars as we come together and look at new ways to
17 achieve a healthier more [AUDIO CUT OUT]. More car-
18 free with more street closures, and more education
19 and encouraging more people who regularly use cars to
20 begin to see the value of using more environmentally
21 friendly transportation alternatives, walking, public
22 trans--biking, of course, and having these folks see
23 for themselves that these other modes of
24 transportation will [AUDIO CUT OUT]-- Going back in
25 time we're given a second change because in 1970 we

2 had a very progressive mayor [AUDIO CUT OUT]--the
3 park was closed and it was wonderful and it--it--over
4 a million people celebrated, but we need to learn the
5 lesson that we need to keep the momentum alive and
6 keep it going because when Council Member Rodriguez
7 is no longer here, and the Mayor is no longer here,
8 we need to make sure that the powers that be
9 understand the value of Car-Free Day and giving
10 people back the streets of New York City. Thank you.

11 RICH WENER: Hi. My name is Rich Wener.
12 I'm a Professor of Environmental Psychology at NYU
13 Tandon in Brooklyn, and I'm here to support the Car-
14 Free Day, and I want to thank you again. I want to
15 add my voice to that in thank you Councilperson
16 Rodriguez for your efforts in this. We got involved
17 and interested in Car-Free Day over a year ago. A
18 colleague and friend of mine organized the Parents'
19 Car-Free Day, and one of my students, Segari Davis
20 (sp?) [AUDIO CUT OUT]--trying to make some context
21 about how that could happen, and found out at that
22 point that Councilperson Rodriguez was actually
23 [AUDIO CUT OUT]--he supports this, and we're doing
24 what we can on two campuses in Manhattan and Brooklyn
25 to be supportive of that, and the students are--are

2 involved in several projects. So let me just say
3 very quickly, in my academic research, I studied
4 commuter stress. I can say that it's very clear that
5 cars are the most stressful way to commute, the most
6 stressful way to get to work. The--and that's just
7 one of the many ways in which driving cars are
8 unhealthy for the driver as well as everybody else
9 around them. Mass transit is much less stressful
10 [AUDIO CUT OUT]--the healthiest and the least
11 stressful and actually the most positives ways of--of
12 commuting. There's a new study that just was re--
13 [AUDIO CUT OUT]-- bike type programs like the one
14 we're running here, there have been no deaths from
15 people using these--these--these Citi Bikes in
16 various places, which is--I think was quite a
17 surprise to a lot of people, maybe not to the folks
18 that were organizing the programs. It's just another
19 demonstration that this is a way of making the city
20 safety. I think one of the ways to view what's going
21 on right now is that cars are supposed to be tools,
22 and tools for transportation, and the tools shouldn't
23 take over your city. And that's what's happened in
24 cities all over the country that the--that that city
25 streets become owned by the cars instead of by the

2 people on--on feet or on bicycles getting around, and
3 we need to put cars in a proper place. And I think if
4 any city can do that, New York City can do that. So
5 we support the Car-Free Day. We think it's one first
6 step to get there in there in New York City, and
7 again congratulate the--the Council on--on its
8 efforts in this regard.

9 [background comments, pause]

10 MALE SPEAKER: Good morning, Ydanis and
11 members of the Council. [AUDIO CUT OUT]--a non--a
12 New York City based non-profit concerned with
13 reducing motor vehicle use and improving the
14 livability of dense urban areas. We certainly
15 commend the Council for holding this hearing, and
16 fully support the designation of April 22nd as Car-
17 Free Day. I'm going to [AUDIO CUT OUT]--to adopt an
18 even more ambitious agenda, establishing a four-year
19 goal of reducing vehicle miles of travel by 20% in
20 the core [AUDIO CUT OUT]-- instead of carrot and
21 stick strategies for better transit reduced car use
22 and more car-free space [AUDIO CUT OUT]-- The DOT has
23 been able to reclaim leftover scraps of street space,
24 and allocate them [AUDIO CUT OUT]--much further and
25 allocate street space among all street users in a

2 more equitable man--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--and do an auto-
3 free light rail boulevard, and that has fallen on
4 deaf ears. Hopefully, the DOT will change its view,
5 and will advance a plan that more added--allocate --
6 equitably allocates street space to pedestrians and
7 one of the most crowded streets in the nation [AUDIO
8 CUT OUT]--that during Earth Week in 1990, 99--91 and
9 92 the Dinkins Administration closed the busiest
10 section of 42nd Street to traffic on a weekday.
11 [AUDIO CUT OUT]--and the news clips that occurred on
12 that occasion. If we could do it then, if Dinkins
13 could do it then, so could our current Mayor. As
14 part of its Earth Day efforts, the Council should
15 call [AUDIO CUT OUT]--Department and the DOT, prepare
16 a comprehensive street use plan for the Manhattan
17 Central Business District--District that equitably
18 allocates street space, the city's most valuable real
19 estate and develop a VMT reduction for the entire
20 city. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you and
22 before you leave I would like to say--I would like to
23 say that--I'm sorry. I would like to say and then,
24 of course, Council Member Menchaca has a question,
25 too, but just because you believe in this idea [AUDIO

2 CUT OUT] in the city. You know, my colleagues most
3 of them they are on board--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--and just
4 recently it was like Senator Schumer he has re-Tweet.
5 You know, the press conference and the meeting that
6 we already have with him, and the same with the
7 Office of Ocean Anatomy (sic) with the Environmental
8 Unit. Also they are on board. So they are--we are
9 getting more and more support [AUDIO CUT OUT]--in the
10 school. At CUNY they are all working together as
11 part of this [AUDIO CUT OUT]--he's--he's on board,
12 and the Catholic Charities doing all the advertising
13 to the Catholic Charities. So, you know, like--and
14 as you will see, this more--you will see more--[AUDIO
15 CUT OUT]-- We share the level of ownership. So for
16 us this is only a beginning, and you are among the
17 other members of the panel that we will speak about
18 it, but knowing that you five are like a--the key
19 institution who started with these plus others that
20 will be testifying in order that I am not here. You
21 know, we should make this happy knowing that yes we
22 will make our city the first one in the nation, and I
23 think this will be a great successful initiative.
24 So, with that, Council Member Menchaca.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you,
3 Chair, and I really enjoyed this panel and the
4 conversations from the League and the work. You've
5 kind of engaged our private sector. [AUDIO CUT OUT].
6 My question and maybe I'll start with--with the
7 League and Yatim, and the work that you're doing.
8 [AUDIO CUT OUT]--and this and some of the ideas here
9 and even Vision Zero when we first really started
10 working together with the Mayor and advocates. I
11 believe that there's a gap with our immigrant
12 community, and--and I--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--that are
13 growing and the dynamic nature of that community can
14 really be a catalyst in this conversation, and I'm
15 wonder if there's any bold ideas that you are already
16 engaging that we don't know about, or that we can
17 tell public [AUDIO CUT OUT]--to--to take this on
18 and--and make it their own, and if there's anything--
19 if there's anything that kind of pops out, I want to
20 hear about it. But I think until that happens, I--I
21 think we're still going to stay within the realms
22 that we are right now in our classrooms, and I think
23 we need to get it out into the streets. And there's
24 nothing like the immigrant community that--that takes
25 something, and takes an idea, puts entrepreneurial

2 spirit into it, and makes it bold and big, and felt
3 in the city. The city was built by immigrants, and
4 so I'm just kind of wondering if there's anybody in
5 the panel who wants to speak to that?

6 YATIM YATAMU: Council Member Menchaca,
7 thank you so much I mean for bringing up that point.
8 It's a really important issue that you raise, and I
9 think for me and, of course I love it. I'm an
10 immigrant myself. I think that [AUDIO CUT OUT]
11 Voters we are very much committed to continuing what
12 we've been calling sort of civic engagement
13 campaigns. Part of our mission is to engage and
14 [AUDIO CUT OUT--and sitting down with local
15 organizations. There is already an awareness and
16 understanding that people may not just have the time
17 to come and sit here at Council hearings and testify
18 and all that stuff because they're busy with just the
19 day-to-day. But I--I do believe that people are
20 aware very much of like what's important to their
21 community. What's the sustainability means to every
22 community and neighborhood, and I think it behooves
23 some of our citywide organizations with a similar
24 mission to make an effort to [AUDIO CUT OUT]-- We try
25 to help local organizations advance a particular sort

2 of agenda that they may have that really is for
3 sustainability. So, certainly when it comes to Car-
4 Free NYC, I mean we'd be [AUDIO CUT OUT] resources to
5 help spread that message.

6 DANI SIMONS: I would say for Citi Bike's
7 part we have done a lot of work over the last few
8 years with our education and outreach partnering with
9 Bike New York and other community organizations
10 around the city to try to engage more New Yorkers in
11 bike share and try to open doors and invite more New
12 Yorkers in. One partnership that we're very proud of
13 is a very deep partnership we have with the Bed-Stuy
14 Restoration [AUDIO CUT OUT] to lower-income
15 households and communities of color in Bed-Stuy to
16 try to engage them in bike share and there's a whole
17 program where they've haired outreach ambassadors.
18 We've done a series of events with them in Bed-Stuy,
19 and that's a--that's a program that we'd like to
20 figure out how to grow to--to other districts in the
21 city to make sure that we're really working with
22 community based organizations and--and getting in
23 deeper so it's not just, you know, advertising on a,
24 you know, the side of bus or advertising on Facebook.
25 But that we're really recognizing that this work

2 takes time, and that there are cultural challengers,
3 and there everyday challenges like Yatim said like
4 sometimes it's not your first thing that you're
5 thinking about to use Bike Share when you're just
6 trying to figure out like how to get a job, and how
7 to get to work on time, and how to make ends meet.
8 But we're really trying to work and with our
9 partnerships with Bed-Study Restoration they've
10 actually built some of that information into their
11 financial counseling information, into their job
12 training information. And then really helping people
13 think about how to use Bike Share as something that
14 can be convenient [AUDIO CUT OUT] probably a little
15 bit easier for New Yorkers Thank you for your
16 question.

17 KEN PODZIBA: Thank you for that question
18 Council Member Menchaca. Bike New York is--is making
19 a concerted effort to go after new Americans. We
20 teach a lot of our classes in Spanish now for our
21 Learn to Ride. Many, many people [AUDIO CUT OUT] had
22 said that we could attract more underserved people
23 and more new Americans, and we plan on teaching
24 [AUDIO CUT OUT]--we plan to work with whoever wants
25 to work with us, the Mayor's Office of Immigrant

2 Affairs and others, but we want to do a better
3 outreach job. My mom is Cuban, and I'm proud of it,
4 and I just want more--more new Americans [AUDIO CUT
5 OUT].

6 RICH WENER: I--I don't have much to add
7 to that other than to support the question actually.
8 I mean one--one of the things we [AUDIO CUT OUT] list
9 on the poorest in the city, and that, you know,
10 environmental justice issues are very real. So that
11 even though environmental and sustainable issues--
12 sustainability issues are often seen as--as
13 resonating less in those communities, you know, it's--
14 -it's an [AUDIO CUT OUT]--is really important as we
15 go forward with this kind of thing. So thank you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Well, thank
17 you, and my final thought is--is really thinking
18 about even something that just ended yesterday, Vote
19 Week for participatory budgeting and that's one of
20 the biggest things that we do in the Council right
21 now to engage directly in everybody, and everybody
22 can engage and--in different language [AUDIO CUT OUT]
23 --engage with us on that, and just get in front of
24 people and get them to know you, and you get to know
25 them, and a lot of stuff happens in those--in those

2 moments where you're asking someone for a vote to
3 decide on \$2 million--the vote for me was \$2 million
4 of budget capital money. But those are magical
5 moments, and I'm hoping that you can think about Car-
6 Free and--and your work that we're doing for Earth
7 Day and really making everyday Earth Day in--in
8 programs like that. So thank you so much for your
9 time.

10 KEN PODZIBA: Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And another
12 colleague she has a question, but first I would like
13 to recognize Council Member Vacca, who was here,
14 Constantinides, Levin and Miller [AUDIO CUT OUT]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Chair.
16 First of all, we want to thank the panel for all
17 their great work [AUDIO CUT OUT], you know Bike Share
18 or Bike New York, the Council a lot of us [AUDIO CUT
19 OUT] we have--I think Bike New York is there teaching
20 kids how to ride bikes. I know you also teach
21 adults. I will--I will sign up one of these days.
22 [laughs]

23 KEN PODZIBA: [off mic] You do that at
24 our office. [laughs]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: But I think that we
3 are, you know, giving out helmets and--and exchanging
4 bicycles for--for young kids to really start them
5 young that riding bicycles, they should learn how to
6 ride safely, and so I think that kind of answer we
7 [AUDIO CUT OUT] So in terms of carpooling I mean one
8 of the things in the immigrant community we have
9 commuter vans. [AUDIO CUT OUT] community. It took
10 us a very long time just to fight for our a stand for
11 them so that they can pro--[AUDIO CUT OUT] very
12 essential service in transporting people across the
13 borough in a very quick way, an efficient way, but
14 they don't have the support and maybe if we're down
15 in the future and we're looking at electric cars or
16 whatever, we got to figure a way of helping these
17 commuter van business to make sure that they can
18 continue to improve and continue to survive in the
19 city because they do provide [AUDIO CUT OUT] but I
20 think with even Car-Free NYC we should also engage
21 them so that they can--the people who don't want to
22 drive that day can get also, you know, take a
23 commuter van and be able to get to work. So I think
24 going--you know going forward I also urge you to sort
25 of think about how to work with that sector about

2 communities because they often are the ones that are
3 serving the immigrant population. [AUDIO CUT OUT]

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Come now and
5 testify before this group leaves because then we go
6 back to the next panel. It's going to be on the
7 press parking be also, but I would like for Paul to
8 testify now.

9 PAUL: Okay.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: You can stay
11 there. There are additional chairs, if you don't
12 mind.

13 PAUL: It's a big panel. Thank you,
14 Chair Rodriguez. I will [AUDIO CUT OUT] Deputy
15 Commissioner Russo. First acknowledge I think
16 efficacy of curb extensions, but then said due to
17 constrained resources, opportunity costs I think he
18 said that they [AUDIO CUT OUT] bureau we need all the
19 tools in the toolbox, and the DOT's own research
20 shows that fewer than one percent of city
21 intersections we're seeing about 15% of the
22 casualties. So a small number of intersections are
23 killing an inordinate number of New Yorkers. So we
24 need all of those safety measures applied, and to say
25 that instead of curb extensions we want to do better

2 crosswalks or better signal timing that's not the
3 answer we need. It's all of the above. It's [AUDIO
4 CUT OUT] a little intensive. The DOT is very good at
5 doing curb extensions on the cheap, and I didn't hear
6 that discussed. So I think as this moves forward, we
7 should look at reminding the DOT that they can do
8 curb extensions [AUDIO CUT OUT] so expensive. So we
9 support the bill, Intro 912. We do want to go
10 further. We also support Intro 997, Pedestrian
11 Countdown Signals. In my written testimony we
12 mention a few clarifications of related laws [AUDIO
13 CUT OUT] street and doesn't have the right-of-way,
14 that motorist still legally responsible to yield and
15 avoid hitting person, and I think that's really very
16 important because we see it everyday, all of us
17 walking in New York City. Pedestrians being bullied
18 by motorists in the crosswalk and attempting to be
19 cowed into submission [AUDIO CUT OUT]. Press parking
20 placards I think this issue of placards we have a
21 long history of [AUDIO CUT OUT] crosswalks on
22 sidewalks, and those kinds of safety hazards are
23 rampant with--with legitimate and illegitimate
24 placard usage. So really there's a larger issue here
25 that the Council needs to address with respect to

2 [AUDIO CUT OUT]. It's not okay for press to park in
3 crosswalks on sidewalks, in front of hydrants in bus
4 [AUDIO CUT OUT]. Finally, we support Car-Free NYC.
5 Thank you. [bell]

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] Thank
7 you. So now let's call the next panel. [AUDIO CUT
8 OUT] Cutrufo (sic), Peter McGowan, Hector [AUDIO CUT
9 OUT]. [Speaking Spanish] He knows what you're
10 doing. (sic) [background comments, pause] Not yet,
11 the next one, please. [AUDIO CUT OUT] You may begin.
12 [pause]

13 MALE SPEAKER: Oh, okay. [AUDIO CUT OUT]
14 and press photographers and broadcast vehicle
15 placards for members of the media allowing them to
16 park at news stories, a privilege we had routinely
17 since 1946. We received no hearing [AUDIO CUT OUT]
18 city, but the media was the only group to have 100%
19 of its placards taken away. These vehicle cards
20 allowed still and video cameramen and radio reporters
21 to park while covering news stories, and commercial
22 parking and no parking zones in the city. We did not
23 have the right to park in no-standing specially
24 designated areas like handicap and taxi zones or at
25 fire hydrants and crosswalks. Over time because of

2 the need for the NYPD to expand these vehicle permits
3 to certain members of the writing press as well. We
4 understand that the city did not by law have to
5 provide these placards, but we believe we should have
6 at least been provided with some [AUDIO CUT OUT]
7 issued after review of the applicant's credentials by
8 the state, which under current law only allows [AUDIO
9 CUT OUT] workable because often other vehicles that
10 have no legal right to park in these zones, and there
11 is little to no enforcement. More importantly, NYP
12 zones rarely have anything to do with where news
13 stories are [AUDIO CUT OUT] doesn't made the location
14 for more than a mile. Since the elimination of the
15 vehicle cards, media vehicles covering news stories
16 across the city have had to rely on the discretion of
17 the NYPD and its agent to allow us to park at
18 important events. It is basically at an officer's
19 whim if a media vehicle is subject to ticket and tow.
20 There are very little traces beyond finding [AUDIO
21 CUT OUT] an additional impediment to news gathering
22 and exorcism--exercising First Amendment freedoms.
23 [AUDIO CUT OUT] covering news. Our ability to get to
24 news events is dependent up on our vehicles. Our
25 vehicles are our mobile offices and carry tens of

2 thousands of dollars in equipment. Television trucks
3 can be valued up to half a million dollars in gear,
4 and it is almost always necessary to be parked at or
5 [AUDIO CUT OUT]. The media industry is the only
6 business in New York City, which cannot park as a
7 commercial vehicle. Federal Express or Amazon have
8 more rights to park their vehicles than do ABC, NBC,
9 The Daily [AUDIO CUT OUT] but press vehicles are
10 denied this privilege. You may ask why not just
11 change [bell] change NY [AUDIO CUT OUT] and there are
12 insurance issues involved that would complicate the--
13 the matter. Furthermore, media would then not be able
14 to use the many highways in the area that-that ban
15 commercial plates from the roadway limiting it in a
16 different way our ability to freely gather news. We
17 are asking for commercial parking to be extended to
18 press vehicles to park while on assignment. We want
19 to stress that we understand that this is privilege
20 and it is not--that this is not parking for going to
21 lunch, visiting a museum with the family or [AUDIO
22 CUT OUT] of abuses were identified we took action to
23 stop such abuse. We fully expect that if this bill
24 is passed we can work again with the departments to
25 prevent abuse and adjudicate fairly any ticket that

2 might be issued in error. We understand that the
3 vehicle cards in the past and the NYPD parking under
4 this bill have the potential to be abused. This is
5 the case with any privilege granted by the city. In
6 the past, we believe abuse was very, very rare, and
7 we are absolutely committed in preventing it in the
8 future. Currently, the many placards issued by the
9 City agencies are subject to the same abuse pressures
10 [AUDIO CUT OUT] thousand permits. Our impact in this
11 total picture is like a grain of sand in a gallon
12 jug. [coughs] We understand there may be some
13 concern that this bill would increase vehicle
14 traffic. This is [AUDIO CUT OUT] difficult to obtain
15 a press card than seven years ago, and the card is a
16 requirement for obtaining NYPD plates on a private
17 vehicle, and only vehicles owned by stations and
18 news--news organizations can qualify without it. In
19 the--in the five boroughs to get it [AUDIO CUT OUT]
20 owned by news organizations have become far and fewer
21 as a result--result of budget cuts. As a result of
22 these changes, we believe that there is substantially
23 fewer NYP plates in the metropolitan area. It is
24 important to stress whether or not this bill is
25 passed it will not impact the number of NYP vehicles

2 working in this--in New York City. It only forces
3 the media organizations to rely on the discretion and
4 good will of the NYPD as a duty and obligation to
5 cover the news and most of us [AUDIO CUT OUT] they
6 can legally or not. The proposed legislation will
7 gives us the legal right to do what we have already
8 been doing. In addition, there is a financial impact
9 on many of our self-employed members because of
10 changes in the industry. Most of those photographers
11 are no longer staff, but independent small business
12 owners struggling to make ends meet as freelance or
13 contract photographers. Often they make a flat rate
14 expenses are not paid [AUDIO CUT OUT] their job can
15 cut their income in half of a given day. In summary,
16 I believe we have a First Amendment [AUDIO CUT OUT]
17 should not be up to law enforcement to decide whether
18 a news event is legitimate. We urge the City Council
19 to support the work of an unfettered free press that
20 is vital to our city and our future. I want to thank
21 Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez and for introducing
22 the bill and Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito, and the
23 rest of the Council for their consideration today.

24 [background comment] [AUDIO CUT OUT]

2 MALE SPEAKER: --our Press Club and today
3 I speak on behalf of the thousands of men and women
4 who make up the New York City Press Corps. We come
5 from all platforms of journalism, print journalism
6 [AUDIO CUT OUT] and many of these fine journalists
7 are in this room today. For many journalist [AUDIO
8 CUT OUT] let's go to where the news is breaking, but
9 it is becoming increasingly difficult for us to do
10 our jobs. The number of NYP parking spaces reserved
11 for working journalists is dwindling. There are
12 simply fewer and fewer press parking spaces
13 available. Intro 779 can help. Allowing NYP plated
14 vehicles to park in available commercial zoned spaces
15 would allow working journalists to better do our
16 jobs, which is to tell stories that are important to
17 the public. Mr. Chairman, let me make it clear our
18 members [AUDIO CUT OUT] about a perk. This is about
19 allowing working journalists to more efficient relay
20 information to the people of New York City
21 potentially saving lives. We can't do that if we're
22 circling the block looking for a place to park.
23 Allowing NYP plated [AUDIO CUT OUT]. Mr. Chairman,
24 it's ironic I think that a working journalist rolling
25 up to a breaking news story, a story of [AUDIO CUT

2 OUT] a story of [AUDIO CUT OUT] unclogging a sink
3 across the street can. Now, journalists like
4 plumbers are professional [AUDIO CUT OUT] so do
5 journalists. So, Mr. Chairman and members of the
6 City Council on behalf of the New York Press Club and
7 the [AUDIO CUT OUT] jobs by advancing Intro 779, and
8 Mr. Chairman, I thank you, sir, for your leadership
9 on this issue.

10 HECTOR RIOS: Hello, how are you. I'm
11 Hector Rios and I'm from CBS News. I'm the [AUDIO
12 CUT OUT] Chair Rodriguez and Council Member Menchaca
13 for having us today. Really, I hoped also--that the
14 Car-Free NYC is awesome. I think it's a great--I
15 hope we can cover it because I hope we get some
16 vehicles in there, and some in from--from our side
17 and--and cover the news. It is a shame also, though,
18 that--that the officer left. I think he would have
19 been able to hear all of our concerns right here and
20 would have been able to bring--bring that back to his
21 superiors, and it's really unfortunate that he left--
22 and--and I hope we can actually create a dialogue
23 with them. But if that's an indication, I--I--I hope
24 it's not an indication, but I hope we can actually
25 come to some sort of agreement with them. I just

2 wanted to come in as--as--as CBS News here. We
3 represent, you know, the CBS this morning. CBS
4 Evening News Scott Pelley, the 60 Minutes, 48 hours,
5 the Saturday Morning Show and the Weekend News.
6 That's the kind of organization that we have and that
7 we represent, and often times, as I was talking to my
8 photographer here, Rob Smallenoff (sp?) that it's
9 just nearly impossible, you know, to find parking in-
10 -in the city. As it is right now, he's parking--he's
11 just hoping he doesn't get a ticket just being here
12 advocating on behalf of CBS News. And it's--that's
13 the kind of reality that we have, and like I said
14 before, it's--it's impeding our ability to cover the
15 news considering also that we have, like we said,
16 half a million, a quarter of a million dollars worth
17 of equipment in--in our vehicles if that ever gets
18 towed [AUDIO CUT OUT] vehicles that we do have in the
19 city that's going to impede our ability to further
20 cover that news stories--those news stories that are
21 up and coming. So, you know, it's an excellent
22 speech on behalf of my two predecessors here. I'm
23 not even going to the First Amendment and all those
24 things, but I think it's absolutely important and
25 tantamount to this--to this particular convening

2 right now that--that we have to protect that, and I
3 think this--and I think you're--you're helping us in-
4 -in--in a large part by--by allowing us to--to
5 entertain the thought of--of--or bid this bill to--to
6 increase our--our privileges for the press. Thank
7 you.

8 PETER MCGOWAN: You drove?

9 HECTOR RIOS: No, I took the subway.

10 PETER MCGOWAN: Oh, yeah, I took the
11 subway.

12 HECTOR RIOS: [interposing] Yeah, I
13 didn't know when--

14 PETER MCGOWAN: I-- didn't want to get a
15 ticket.

16 HECTOR RIOS: I--I do.

17 PETER MCGOWAN: Good afternoon. Peter
18 McGowan, News Operations Manager of W-CBS Channel 2
19 News. I'm the guy in charge of the news vans, among
20 other things. [AUDIO CUT OUT] --but--but I know how
21 to cover breaking news in particular. A couple or
22 three, four years ago it's typical we get a
23 notification at 9:00 in the morning. I get up to the
24 Bronx. It's 11 o'clock. NYPD is locked up. A
25 serial predator, a rapist, they got him off him of

2 the street. There's going to be a news conference at
3 11:00. They'll have a photo opportunity. They'll
4 move the suspect. You guys get it done at noon. Get
5 up here. So we get up there and our folks they cover
6 it. They go inside. They do the news conference and
7 they get the photo, et cetera. We get outside, the
8 vehicle is gone. Got towed and we lost our
9 opportunity to get that information out to the public
10 as quickly as we should. Now, that's not anything on
11 the order of some of the other things obviously we've
12 covered here, but that's really the crux of what our
13 problem is. On the big jobs, the crane collapses and
14 all the other stuff, there are enough people from
15 Police Plaza and people that we know on a regular
16 basis when we get together and we work, but that's
17 not what the issue is here. The issue is routine
18 covering of the routine stories. The very Police
19 Department that asked us to come and cover that
20 rapist off the street, which is an important story.
21 We get his photo out there. You get the information
22 out there. [AUDIO CUT OUT] towed us, and we could
23 not cover our story, and I had to go and I had to go
24 to the pound and get the vehicle out and it's six,
25 seven hours of--of work that I couldn't do otherwise.

2 So while I understand the Inspector's concerns about
3 possible abuses, there's--there's got to be a happy
4 medium, and I'm encouraged and--and I think the
5 Committee that they're willing to advance this and--
6 and have those open discussions. I agree with my
7 colleague, Hector here that I wish the Inspector had
8 stayed to hear us [AUDIO CUT OUT] table and--and have
9 that conversation. There is a way to do this, but
10 right now the way is we're getting hit with
11 summonses. We're getting hit with boots. We're
12 hitting with tows, and it's not to take our families
13 to dinner. It's to get the information out to the
14 public, and that is being dead stopped in some cases,
15 in a lot of cases. Thank you.

16 [AUDIO CUT OUT]

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: It's not about
18 privilege. It's about right and--and when and--and
19 you know, I'm happy to hear even from the
20 Transportation Alternative [AUDIO CUT OUT] that we
21 have in the city. So I think that those things that
22 Paul highlight--[AUDIO CUT OUT] they're doing their
23 job and we're talking about parking specific
24 locations. This is not parking what other people
25 want, and I think that, you know, hearing from the

2 Administration at least even though they didn't come
3 with full support, and I personally don't agree with
4 the argument that they may, but at least I think that
5 we can see some of those [AUDIO CUT OUT] what the
6 Administration and---and all of us should be able to
7 say we can work with you. A question. On--on--
8 before I ask the question, Paul Maseo--Masso (sp?)
9 is here, or no? You're covering because I call you,
10 right? If you want to take some time--[AUDIO CUT
11 OUT]-- Your members were doing the jobs. Were you
12 part engaged in our conversation? Are you aware of
13 any study done by the previous administration before
14 they made that decision?

15 PETER MCGOWAN: If--if I may--it was word
16 of mouth basically. We were [AUDIO CUT OUT] in terms
17 of fire hydrants and bus stops. There's some self-
18 policing that goes on there for two reasons. One, if
19 we part in a fire hydrant or a bus stop or a
20 crosswalk, we might actually cause a worse story than
21 the one we're there to cover [AUDIO CUT OUT] and
22 something burns, trust me, we'll be all over Twitter
23 in a really bad way. So that just--just to address
24 that point. It's a valid concern, but it's not
25 something that we're not, you know, aware of and

2 concerned about at all times, but in terms of how we
3 found out and my colleagues can jump in here, but it
4 was never formal. [AUDIO CUT OUT]

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Base--based--
6 based on your knowledge there was not--you don't have
7 any copy of any study done or--

8 PETER MCGOWAN: It was out [AUDIO CUT
9 OUT] it was even for police officers and the ones
10 that come from out of town or, you know, live in the
11 subways or what have you, and they would put placards
12 onto park-outs--[AUDIO CUT OUT] got caught up in it.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great.

14 MALE SPEAKER: There--there was never any
15 consultation with us. They just--they said, oh,
16 we're going to get--we're going to get to it. We
17 have a lawsuit that we're dealing with, and that was
18 total baloney. Had nothing to do with the placards.
19 The Mayor decided we're going to get rid of placards,
20 and he decided we're going to get rid of some of
21 these--some of these, but we're going get rid of all
22 [AUDIO CUT OUT] plates only entitle you to park in an
23 NYP zone. There is no other legality to park
24 anywhere else. [background comments]

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I'm sorry. Any
3 other council members have any questions? Guys?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you,
5 Chair, and thank you to the panel. I--I guess I--I--
6 [AUDIO CUT OUT] and the work that we're trying to do
7 here, and legislate this very important topic and
8 clearly it's broken. Whatever we're doing that is
9 broken. You heard the Inspector talk about engaging.
10 Have--have you ever engaged in the--with the NYPD in
11 a productive way either through the club, the Press
12 Club or--or individually in an organized fashion?
13 Tell me that's happened in the past.

14 MALE SPEAKER: The last time we had a
15 meeting with them was a year and a half ago.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And them being
17 the administration of the--

18 MALE SPEAKER: With Steven Davis, Deputy
19 Commissioner of Public Information.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay.

21 MALE SPEAKER: With Gene White and I
22 think there was one other press person in there.

23 [AUDIO CUT OUT]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Right.

2 MALE SPEAKER: He was--he was his boss.
3 Right.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: What--what was
5 the date of that? What...?

6 MALE SPEAKER: That [AUDIO CUT OUT] Onto
7 the Police Department from the NYPPA. I've been
8 asking them just for a meeting for myself--

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: [interposing]
10 Okay.

11 MALE SPEAKER: To talk about these
12 variety of issues, and the answer is [AUDIO CUT OUT]
13 --is the things that we think are wrong with this
14 bill, but wait a second, but you're a little late to
15 begin, aren't you? We have this bill. We've been
16 asking to talk to you, but they refused us. It's
17 very disappointing.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Right, but
19 under the leadership of--of the Chair--

20 MALE SPEAKER: [interposing] And--and
21 mind you, I have a very good relationship with the
22 police. I work with them day in, day out. Anybody
23 that knows me I'm at all the mayhem. That's what I
24 do. So I'm there, wherever it is. They know me. I
25 have a great relationship [AUDIO CUT OUT] talk.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Got it. So
3 noted, noted, and I think the--the--the question is--
4 the question here is and--and really again under the
5 leadership of the Chair, and just the--the City
6 Council we want to remove those jams of
7 communication. I think when--when we can remove those
8 jams of communication for whatever--whatever reason,
9 nothing is--there's no--there's never a good reason
10 to stop communicating it you want to get and resolve
11 a problem. So I think--I think as a member of the--of
12 the Transportation Committee and working with the
13 Chair, see if we can fix that and get--get a room
14 together and have a real conversation, and so we're
15 committed to that. Second, on Car-Free NYC, I know
16 [AUDIO CUT OUT] and I challenge you all as the press
17 to think about your vehicles and then think about
18 non-vehicular coverage in a place where you can plan
19 it, and actually [AUDIO CUT OUT] bicycle coverage.
20 And--and [laughs] maybe think about mobile ways,
21 non-vehicle ways to go and cover places. Is there a
22 technology issue? And--and really create these Car-
23 Free [AUDIO CUT OUT] with the--with the whole set-up
24 [laughs]. Well, what--what do you got? What you got?

2 PETER MCGOWAN: From--from, if--if I may,
3 from a broadcast TV standpoint that's a technological
4 conversation that we don't have time for here.

5 [AUDIO CUT OUT]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I didn't
7 completely hear that. What did you say? That...

8 PETER MCGOWAN: From a broadcast TV
9 standpoint particularly with the standards of today,
10 the short [AUDIO CUT OUT]. First of all, news is not
11 planned. You know, we need to be able to go like
12 that, and our viewers want--

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: But--but Car
14 NY--[AUDIO CUT OUT] I'm talking about crisis. I'm
15 not talking about what happened.

16 PETER MCGOWAN: But even--but even--but
17 even this, the goal is to make sure that you get the
18 best possible product on TV, and--and again it's--it
19 is a technological discussion that Hector and I
20 particularly live and breathe all day that--that--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: [interposing] I
22 think we want to be--be conveyed that.

23 PETER MCGOWAN: --we can tell you more
24 about, but it is--there's a clock behind you there
25 that's clicking three minutes [laughs] so.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Wonderful and--
3 and I don't want to talk about it necessarily
4 complete here, but let's--let's--I'm excited about
5 the idea of getting more information out, and I get
6 broadcasts--

7 PETER MCGOWAN: [interposing] I'm glad
8 that you do that.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: The quality is
10 important, but Periscope and other ways, our iPhones
11 can get information out, and--and even the clarity of
12 things. People are less concerned about the quality
13 sometimes if they can get the content, and this is
14 good content we need to get to all our communities.
15 I talked about immigrant community getting in their
16 languages. So, let's--let's think differently.
17 Let's challenge ourselves here both to open up the
18 lines of community with NYPD, and then think about
19 these concepts and changing the way you do what you
20 do. [AUDIO CUT OUT]

21 MALE SPEAKER: What I just want to show
22 you is this is the inside of my vehicle. This is
23 just driver's seat.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: What--what are
25 we looking at? Can--can you--

2 MALE SPEAKER: [off mic] This is my
3 vehicle. (sic)

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Okay, got it.
5 Okay, I see a steering wheel. I see a laptop. I
6 see--okay. Got it. This is your car? This is the
7 vehicle?

8 MALE SPEAKER: [off mic] Yes. I hope
9 everybody is seeing that [AUDIO CUT OUT]--

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --mic so we can
11 all hear it.

12 MALE SPEAKER: [off mic] These up there.

13 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Well, you speak on the
14 mic.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: If you can go
16 back to your mic, that way we can all hear it.

17 MALE SPEAKER: [off mic] Okay.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you so
19 much.

20 MALE SPEAKER: You'd also see the inside
21 of the trunk is a--and--and that's--that's also
22 [AUDIO CUT OUT] show up with one or two cameras.
23 Sometimes just I--I keep four in my car because if
24 something goes wrong with my equipment, I have to be
25 able to go to something else, and so do they. They--

2 so they--they have one camera? No, how many cameras
3 do you have in your car?

4 MALE SPEAKER: I can't remember.

5 MALE SPEAKER: [laughs] [AUDIO CUT OUT]--
6 day that somebody and--and said well, what's in your
7 vehicle? What do--what do you carry that--that you
8 need to drive around? Well, that is it. Now, as for
9 Car-Free New York City, I love the concept. It's
10 great. I'm--yeah, we need to reduce the number of
11 vehicles in this city. There are people that are
12 going to the--to the theater and going to the park
13 and--and they're driving and they're [AUDIO CUT OUT].
14 So, that's what they do. Yeah, it would be better if
15 more people could drive--if few people were driving
16 to the city to--to do this. We have days where you
17 shouldn't be driving at all. Go--go try to drive
18 around during the New York City Marathon. You're
19 never going to be able to do that, or during the--the
20 Five Borough Bike Tour. I--I try not to go anywhere
21 when that's going on except to where I need to go to
22 cover my stories. Most of us are doing more than
23 just Car-Free New York City that day, though. I'm
24 going to go and cover a homicide in the morning and
25 then later on the fire, and then I'm going to go to

2 maybe the city and cover Car-Free New York City, and-
3 -and do that, and I'm doing another story after that.
4 It's multiple, multiple things that go on, and we're
5 carrying a lot of gear, and we're--and we--it's--it's
6 very difficult to-- Some people actually do use the
7 trains. [AUDIO CUT OUT] ways to work that out, but
8 most of us we have to have that vehicle to be mobile
9 and to do the [AUDIO CUT OUT]

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member
11 Chin.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Chair.
13 I'm--I'm glad we're finally [AUDIO CUT OUT] heard
14 from a lot of, you know, reporters who are covering
15 that they lost the [AUDIO CUT OUT] saying that
16 although we set up specific area just for the--the
17 media, can you--can you address that in terms of like
18 the--the area that they set aside for the NYP Zone?
19 How effective it is and is it really helpful or not?

20 PETER MCGOWAN: Yeah, we'll--we'll try to
21 make this quick but it's--there--there are grades of
22 stories, and it's kind of what I was talking about
23 before. If you have, for lack of a better, a big job
24 going on, yeah that--that happens. I think it's all
25 know what to do. The crane collapse is a good

2 example. Every gets we have to go. You know the
3 emergency response develops to figure out what it is,
4 and DCPI comes down and we know those folks and they
5 start to set things up and they work with us, and
6 they're terrific. One--one person in particular I
7 mentioned before Lieutenant Gene White when he's
8 there from my experiences it goes great. He knows
9 what we need. I know what [AUDIO CUT OUT] seven
10 tickets I get a week on routine stories, and a lot of
11 them are commercial no standing, and if the Coca-Cola
12 truck can be there without getting a summons, how
13 come I can't be? Nothing against Coca-Cola. It is
14 vital to the life blood of--of many a business, but
15 they're not in the emergency business, and we are.
16 So, in terms of--and--and then something else that
17 was discussed before about the press plates, the
18 press plates don't do very much. They allow you to
19 park in NYP zones, and as well all know the news
20 happens. 99.99% of the time nowhere near an NYP
21 Zone. The NYP Plate that Albany gives us is actually
22 great for getting access in--in extreme
23 circumstances. Like 9/11 for example the only plates
24 that were getting into the city were NYP plates. So
25 they are vital. I'm not playing those down, but in

2 terms of the routine day-to-day being--needing to
3 like for what I said before out the South Bronx and
4 that--that police press conference that should have
5 allowed us trouble free to cover that story and it
6 did not. So that's--that's the best answer I can
7 give you. They're not--the big jobs got it. We're
8 all--but they're not all big jobs. That's the issue.
9 [bell]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you.

11 PETER MCGOWAN: Anybody else?

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: We just hope
13 again that [AUDIO CUT OUT] a city where we can say
14 there's no other sector that they don't have a
15 placard. We do and I can tell you that those of us
16 at the Council that we have the plaque. We know
17 exactly where we can park --[AUDIO CUT OUT]--big on
18 NYPD. They have to give a number of tickets. They
19 give the ticket regardless. [AUDIO CUT OUT]--for us
20 nothing can be done more than now that we have to be
21 wasting the time. [AUDIO CUT OUT]--whether you by
22 any chance, any council member will park a car where
23 it say [AUDIO CUT OUT]--the station say can oh, can
24 we try to see what we can do because we are not
25 allowed to park--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--press in the city

2 who do the job covering a story that sometimes we
3 like, sometimes we don't, but it is a right of New
4 Yorkers to be informed, and there's places in Queens
5 or Brooklyn that people got to walk 10, 15, 20 blocks
6 from [AUDIO CUT OUT]--a story in those locations.
7 There we had a situation where he or she doesn't have
8 the tools to go and do the job. So, thank you for
9 your leadership, and we will continue working
10 together with you.

11 PETER MCGOWAN: Thank you.

12 HECTOR RIOS: Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

14 HECTOR RIOS: One more thing. I'm sorry.

15 I--I just want--I'm just curious how many people here
16 are from the press today? [background comments] Okay.

17 PETER MCGOWAN: We've got the whole
18 crowd.

19 HECTOR RIOS: I just wanted to just kind
20 of thank you so much for coming today, and--and--and
21 I guess a lot of this is--a lot of freelancers I'm
22 assuming as well, and their lifeline depends on
23 these--I mean this parking privilege. So thank you
24 very much.

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] Thank
3 you.

4 PETER MCGOWAN: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [on mic] We have
6 three more panels, and because of the timing we also
7 have another hearing coming at 1:00. Please come as
8 quick as you can. Eric McClure, Ken Bandes (sp?),
9 Michelle McLaren, Steve Vacca, Joseph Cutrufo--
10 Cutrufo (sp?) [background comments] If--if you're
11 written testimony takes so long please just [AUDIO
12 CUT OUT] [background comments, pause]

13 ERIC MCCLURE: Good afternoon and thank
14 you, Chair Rodriguez for the opportunity to testify
15 today. My name is Eric McClure. I'm the Executive
16 Director of StreetsPAC. We're here to offer our
17 strong support for Intro 912, which would establish a
18 curb extensions program, and require curb extensions
19 at dangerous intersections. The bottom line is that
20 daylighting can save lives by increasing visibility
21 at corners for all street users, and curb extensions
22 can be accomplished at low cost using temporary
23 materials on an interim basis before being fully
24 built out. We do, however, believe the number of
25 annual curb extension projects called for in this

2 legislation, a minimum of five per borough is
3 woefully inadequate. [AUDIO CUT OUT] helping
4 achieve Vision Zero. Saving lives is well worth the
5 cost of a few corner parking spaces. We also offer
6 our strong support for Intro 997, which would correct
7 a terrible flaw in the Administrative Code that robs
8 pedestrians of their right-of-way in crosswalks.
9 With automated signals counting seconds or flashing a
10 red hand. Far too many intersections around the city
11 give pedestrians on a few seconds of walk signal
12 before beginning a countdown that might last four or
13 five times as long as the steady green. A
14 substantial number of user yawning expanses of
15 asphalt such as the exceedingly dangerous [AUDIO CUT
16 OUT] cross such intersections without acceding their
17 legal right-of-way. Clearly, it was not the intent
18 of the law to make pedestrians legally culpable for
19 their injuries or worse deaths when crossing a street
20 with a signal in a crosswalk. This bill would fix
21 that flaw [AUDIO CUT OUT]--the City of New York to
22 make Earth Day 2016 a Car-Free Day for private and
23 non-essential city vehicles. While such a measure
24 would be symbolic, it's exactly the right type of
25 symbolism. New Yorkers have embraced the Summer

2 Streets Program [AUDIO CUT OUT]-- It's clear that New
3 York City's future is not live with more auto--
4 automobile trips and Chair Rodriguez has articulated
5 a laudable goal [bell] with significantly reducing
6 private vehicle ownership. We urge that April 22nd
7 2016 be the first annual Car-Free Earth Day, and that
8 for future earth days we rapidly and substantially
9 expand the miles of city streets [AUDIO CUT OUT]--
10 obey parking rules in no way hampers the ability of
11 press photographers or camera people to do their
12 jobs. This committee and the Council should be
13 engaged in seeking ways to reduce official parking
14 privileges and abuse of placards not in giving away
15 more curb space. There should be no way--there would
16 be no way for a traffic enforcement agent or a police
17 officer to be concerned if a press vehicle was parked
18 for the purpose of coverage of a news event. So this
19 proposed rule would also be ripe for abuse. It's--
20 it's ironic for us [AUDIO CUT OUT]--

21 MALE SPEAKER: Thank you, Chairman
22 Rodriguez and the Committee for the opportunity to
23 speak and--and many thanks to Public Advocate Letitia
24 James for introducing Intro 997, which I strongly
25 support. [AUDIO CUT OUT] New York City. You know,

2 you often hear, especially from the DOT that the
3 pedestrian is king or queen of our streets when it
4 comes to traffic design and planning, but when you
5 look at the reality, in fact, pedestrians are second
6 class citizens. Okay, because while a pedestrian
7 under the current [AUDIO CUT OUT] through the
8 intersection on that initial five to ten-second phase
9 during the remainder of what's the green phase for
10 vehicles, which can last up to 30 seconds and even on
11 a yellow sign, which are the final seconds before
12 that signal turns. Motorists and others can enter
13 the ped--the intersection, but not pedestrians. So
14 that's not pedestrians as--as royalty or our street
15 traffic. That's pedestrians as second class
16 citizens, and this bill is needed in order to change
17 it. When you think about the logic of having a
18 countdown. The countdown is there to tell people
19 when the important event is supposed to begin. When
20 their behavior is supposed to change. If you're at
21 the Grand Prix in Le Mans, the--the countdown signals
22 when the race is about to begin, and when you're in
23 Times Square of New Years Eve, the ball doesn't drop
24 when the countdown begins. It's when it ends. So
25 pedestrians rightfully expect when a countdown is

2 counting down, and--and it's over, that's when they
3 should stop--you know, change their behavior. So
4 let's put the law in sense with this--in--in keeping
5 with this common sense [AUDIO CUT OUT--the effort and
6 [bell] and--and Public Advocate James mentioned that
7 there were changes to the initial draft of the
8 legislation that had been proposed by the DOT and
9 others. I have seen those changes. I strongly
10 support them. I think the bill as originally drafted
11 has some problems, some confusion. It refers to
12 green pedestrian walk signals, which I don't think
13 exist in New York City any more. So please get it
14 right. We'll avoid any litigation and we'll have a
15 clear common sense rule for regulating pedestrian
16 traffic in our streets.

17 MICHELLE MCLAREN: [off mic] My name is
18 McLaren. I'm a member of Families for Safe--

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] Turn on
20 your mic.

21 MICHELLE MCLAREN: [on mic] Oh, sorry.
22 My name is Michelle McLaren. I'm a member of
23 Families for Safe Streets, a group comprised of those
24 who have either lost loved ones or have been severely
25 injured due to traffic violence. I am here to share

2 with you today my story, and urge you to support the
3 proposed legislation on pedestrian countdown signals
4 [coughs] Intro No. 997. On the morning of February
5 11, 2013 while crossing on the crosswalk on my way to
6 work, I was struck by a multi-ton car driven by an
7 aggressive and reckless driver. The morning of my
8 crash has come to be the day my life forever changed.
9 [AUDIO CUT OUT]--my pelvis was crushed and I
10 sustained several herniated discs. I have not been
11 able to return to work, nor can I [AUDIO CUT OUT]--
12 it's not [coughs] the only challenge I have had to
13 face. I navigate New York City streets each day with
14 fear and dread. [AUDIO CUT OUT]--to protect the
15 right-of-way for every pedestrian crossing the
16 street. Each person's life has meaning. It has
17 meaning when a driver yields to pedestrians in the
18 crosswalk. It has meaning when a driver doesn't
19 speed. It has meaning [AUDIO CUT OUT] [crying]
20 because of this my deepest desire is just to change--
21 change that value to each life [AUDIO CUT OUT]--pain.
22 This legislation is an important step toward changing
23 the culture of driving [bell] on our streets. We are
24 not just a statistics. I am a face. My pain may not
25 be evident as I am before you today, but it is with

2 me each and every day. I stand before you today
3 representing the 140 people injured in traffic every
4 single day in New York City, and because of this I
5 matter. Please do everything in your power to make
6 sure we make New York City streets safer.

7 [AUDIO CUT OUT]

8 KEN BANDES: [off mic] Hello. [on mic]
9 Hello. My name is Ken Bandes. I'm a member of
10 Families for Safe Streets. Thank you for allowing me
11 to speak today in support of Intro 997. In January
12 2013, our daughter Ella, then 23, was struck and
13 killed by a bus while walking across Myrtle Avenue in
14 Queens. I have no words to express the anguish and
15 heartache my [AUDIO CUT OUT]-- Families for Safe
16 Street to try and prevent others from suffering as we
17 have. We know all too well that a person on foot or
18 on a bike is no match for a vehicle whether it be a
19 two-ton car [AUDIO CUT OUT]--any doubt that a driver
20 must respect the pedestrian's right-of-way whether or
21 not these cautions are flashing. We need to remove
22 that doubt. Intro 997 will make it clear beyond any
23 doubt or excuse that this is the case, and I urge the
24 Council to pass it. Thank you.

25 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

2 JOSEPH CUTRUFO: My name is Joseph
3 Cutrufo and the Communications Director with the Tri-
4 State Transportation Campaign, a non-profit
5 organization working towards a more balanced transit
6 friendly and equitable transportation network in New
7 York, New Jersey and Connecticut. Thank for the
8 opportunity to submit testimony today. Tri-State
9 works with policymakers throughout the region to make
10 streets safer for pedestrians, and we're strong
11 supporters here in New York of Vision Zero. The
12 provision of pedestrian countdown signals at
13 intersection and mid-block crossing we believe is
14 part of the reason we have seen pedestrian deaths
15 fall during the Vision Zero era. We understand that
16 the outdated law that exists to this day says that
17 the pedestrian right-of way--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--
18 frankly, it defies common sense, and is out of step
19 with how people actually walk in New York City or
20 really anywhere. We believe that the law must
21 reflect the intention of life saving interventions
22 such as pedestrian countdown signals, and for that
23 reason I think, you know, we ought to do whatever we
24 can to protect the right-of-way for people walking,
25 the most vulnerable--vulnerable users of our streets.

2 So, for this reason Tri-State offers its support for
3 Introduction 997. Tri-State also as well as anybody
4 understands that New York City streets are not just
5 for the movement of motor vehicles, and we offer our
6 full support for Resolution 1013 calling upon the
7 city to make Earth Day a Car-Free Day. New York City
8 is the only city in America--in America where the
9 majority of households do not [AUDIO CUT OUT]--ready
10 to reclaim our streets for people, highlight the many
11 multi-modal options we have here, and bring about an
12 end to decades and decades of a deference to the
13 auto--automobile. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] Thank
15 you. [on mic] The next panel Michael Dalton, Joel
16 [pause] Mancino (sp?), Greg Ru--Raddo (sp?), Jay
17 Nicholas, Jonathan Cohen. [AUDIO CUT OUT]

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Sure you
19 can. [background comments] [AUDIO CUT OUT]

20 ELLIE LEVY: Should I start?

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yes.

22 ELLIE LEVY: Hi. My name is Ellie Levy.

23 I'm an architect. I'm sitting in for Jonathan Cohen
24 today. We are architects from Perkins Eastman

25 Architects, and we are here to propose something that

2 takes--goes one step further. Before, the Councilman
3 was asking for bold ideas, and I believe we have a
4 wonderful bold [AUDIO CUT OUT]--Fifth and Broadway
5 between 14th Street and actually 16th Street and 23rd
6 Street [AUDIO CUT OUT]--and Earth Day as becoming
7 permanently closed to car traffic going forward. In-
8 -on January 10, 2016, Jonathan Cohen wrote an Op-Ed
9 for Daily News about the Green Line, which is a
10 proposal that we have similar to High Line or the Low
11 Line, which would envision Broadway becoming one day
12 a new type of Urban Park, a street that becomes a
13 park, and just visually as you understand Broadway is
14 a diagonal on an otherwise perfect grid with
15 perpendicular streets to each other. It's extra. Our
16 research has yielded that it wasn't part of the
17 original New York City Grid, and one day we'd like to
18 see this designed and taken away from the normal
19 circulation of traffic for which it is not--[AUDIO
20 CUT OUT]--zoned down from--from Central Park,
21 Columbus Circle all the way down to Union Square one
22 day. You can read all about our proposal in DZ
23 Magazine or in the Daily News. Jonathan Cohen and
24 John Blue (sic) did the research. [bell] It's a

2 beautiful project, and we hope one day that this will
3 come to fruition. Thank you.

4 MALE SPEAKER: Hi, thank--[AUDIO CUT
5 OUT]--of our journalists and I want to thank
6 Councilman Rodriguez, Councilwoman Chin and the rest
7 of the committee. I'm going to boil it down a little
8 bit. We've had some good testimony from our other---
9 other members of the press, and on just a couple of
10 points on the--the--the issue of abuse has come up a
11 number of times from various people who have
12 testified, and I'd like to say that [AUDIO CUT OUT]--
13 where they've proven they're a bona fide member of
14 the press, they've worked--it's--it's--it's an
15 application process. They--they get these plates and
16 it's not an easy thing to do, and they're really
17 used, they're really meant to be specific--
18 specifically for--for working, and as--as far as
19 parking in press zones, it's not always possible to
20 use the press zones because of others who abuse them
21 that aren't using actually NPD plates. But, given
22 that problem, if there was an ability for traffic
23 agents-- And by the way, and my experience with
24 traffic agents is that they're working in a
25 particular area. They're in contact with vehicles

2 very quickly. [AUDIO CUT OUT]--a car that's been
3 there or it hasn't been there. So I think there is
4 some--I think they have a--a better observation of
5 their--of their areas than we might think. But a
6 good for instance would be in--in the wake of the--of
7 the terror [AUDIO CUT OUT]--I'm sorry. The NYPD
8 Commissioner and the Mayor's Office called a press
9 conference or a precedent at Times Square, and it was
10 really something to sort of set solidarity for the
11 city in--in the wake of the issue, but the point is,
12 is that for everyone to get there and for everyone to
13 park there, it would have probably have taken [bell]
14 NYP plates to be in places that normally they would
15 not be an NYP zone. It would have been the only way
16 to cover that event, and this is just one small
17 example. And this perhaps goes to the small versus
18 the bigger stories, but there are just times when we
19 need places to park, and commercial zones would be a
20 perfect one, and having an NYP plate, which has been
21 issued by the State of New York to me signifies this
22 is an official vehicle. Thanks very much.

23 MALE SPEAKER: [AUDIO CUT OUT]--for a New
24 York City. I'd like to just draw the Committee's
25 attention to the bigger picture as it were. Most of

2 the time the police are partners with the press in
3 terms of facilitating access to a story, but on many
4 occasions that is not the case. On many occasions
5 the police are downright hostile to members of the
6 press, and it is this hostility to which I wish to
7 draw attention. [AUDIO CUT OUT] given their hostility
8 particularly with respect to breaking news events.
9 Chairman Rodriguez, you yourself personally witnessed
10 this during the eviction of Zuccotti Park protestors
11 when you and other members of the press were not
12 allowed through a police line in order to witness
13 first hand the events occurring in [AUDIO CUT OUT]--
14 or ask, whatever tem you choose, photographers to
15 delete pictures. On other occasions members of the
16 NYPD have assaulted and fabricated charges against
17 members of the press. This occurred under
18 Commissioner Kelly and continues to occur. I would
19 just like to draw the Council's attention to that.
20 Thank you.

21 MALE SPEAKER: [AUDIO CUT OUT] Until
22 December of last year I was a staff photographer at
23 the Daily News. I'm a freelancer now, and I was also
24 a weekend assignment editor there, and to speak to
25 the previous point made by Councilman Menchaca, the--

2 the [AUDIO CUT OUT]--is something that's already been
3 going on. I--I made it a priority when assigning a
4 photographer to a new--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--and
5 photographer who's on for one shift, and you may have
6 to move him from Washington Heights to Staten Island
7 because there's a breaking news event. The claims--
8 the opposition to the intro on the part of the New
9 York City Police Department is dubious, if not
10 uninformed. The operational functionality of the New
11 York City Police Department is not affected by this
12 bill. You--it is not emboldening people--[AUDIO CUT
13 OUT]--it's a substantial financial punitive burden
14 otherwise self-employed people who are losing 80% of
15 their day rate, which is what they work for. They
16 work for a day rate with a \$165 parking ticket for
17 going to an event that the--you here in the City
18 Council may very well invite us to. In places like
19 East New York or Jamaica, Queens where there are no
20 NYP zones, where there's no press parking, and the
21 integrity of use issue is also kind of bogus because
22 quite frankly I don't see the New York City Police
23 Department calling for the City Council to audit,
24 review or otherwise, you know, look into, study the
25 [AUDIO CUT OUT]--photographers, otherwise self-

2 employed journalists at a financial disadvantage the
3 way they are is simply uncalled for, and it is not
4 grounds for opposition to this intro. Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] Thank
6 you. I am now calling the last panel. [on mic]
7 Alex Bagley, Bertha Ladrie (sp?), Frank Checkby (sp?)
8 Mark Magic--Mattic, Roland Lewis. I know Roland is
9 not here, though. [background comments] Marco
10 Dalton. If there's anybody else that signed in that
11 we didn't call. If not, this is the last [AUDIO CUT
12 OUT]

13 FEMALE SPEAKER: Hello. My name is
14 [AUDIO CUT OUT]--and safety on the west side of
15 Manhattan. So we applaud Chair Rodriguez Resolution
16 to make Earth Day a Car-Free New York and New York
17 City. Our communities of Chelsea and Hell's Kitchen
18 have one of the worst air qualities in the city due
19 to the consent idling of thousand of Lincoln Tunnel
20 bound vehicles. Traffic makes us sick literally, and
21 any day without vehicles is a small toward [AUDIO CUT
22 OUT]--three, reduces the rights of pedestrians
23 compared to state law especially the most vulnerable.
24 If you can start crossing with a--the walk light and
25 blinking [AUDIO CUT OUT]--what happens to older

2 persons who walk slowly, the pedestrian would be
3 considered not having the right-of-way in paragraph
4 3. And until all the intersections are equipped with
5 countdown [AUDIO CUT OUT]--within the blinking phase,
6 our seniors should not be put at risk by uncertainty
7 of the likes of the blinking signals. So I urge you
8 to revise paragraph 3 to protect our most vulnerable
9 [AUDIO CUT OUT]. On Intro 19-192-curb extension, we
10 applaud this initiative with one suggestion. Today,
11 DDC continues to construct street and avenues with a
12 design that will make it very expensive to install
13 more curb extensions in [AUDIO CUT OUT]--and it's the
14 same with the water tunnel project. And this--this
15 [bell] bill would be transformative if it mandated
16 DOT, DDC and DEP to immediately change their design
17 and locate all catch basins along the curb 20 feet
18 away from each intersection for all projects either
19 new or underway.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] Thank
21 you.

22 ALEX SLACK: Good afternoon, everyone.
23 My name is Alex Slack. I'm here representing Triple
24 A Northeast, which services over 570,000 members in
25 the five boroughs IN New York City. My [AUDIO CUT

2 OUT]--with 912, I think we largely concur with what
3 the DOT said before about, you know, we want to make
4 sure that there's the engineering basis for the curb
5 extension [AUDIO CUT OUT]--about the left turn
6 initiative at the--the 100 intersections of their
7 pilot program. So we're very excited about that. In
8 terms of 997, the current rules were designed [AUDIO
9 CUT OUT]--it's like at the end of the light cycle,
10 and that, you know, any intersection in Manhattan or
11 most of the intersections where those countdown
12 clocks are in effect that clearly hasn't happened and
13 we can respond in three ways. We could enforce it
14 against pedestrians who step out even a second after
15 the countdown clock starts, which is absurd. We
16 could leave it as the status quo, but the problem
17 with the status quo is that we can enforce right-of-
18 way law, which doesn't make sense, and we tell our
19 members and the people who take our defensive driving
20 classes again--[AUDIO CUT OUT]---what their timing
21 is. You're always supposed to yield the right-of-way
22 to pedestrians when you're turning even when you have
23 a green--[AUDIO CUT OUT]--is maybe older or disabled.
24 I know--I can think of, you know, a tragedy I think
25 in Council Member Chin's district where something

2 like that happened. You're supposed to be open (sic)
3 right away at all times, and that's something that we
4 tell our members. In terms of Car-Free Day, I think
5 you've been messaging, Chairman Rodriguez the Car-
6 Free Day appropriately. [bell] I want to caution you
7 and the rest of the Council away from [AUDIO CUT
8 OUT]--to do it, and I think you--you're having
9 appropriate messaging, you know, consider a car, a
10 taxi, a bike, rail, bus and subway and walking. And
11 then maybe that Earth Day is a good time to try
12 something new out, but I--I am glad to see the
13 messaging that this is something we want New Yorkers
14 to--to try out. It's not that car drivers are bad.
15 So, thank you for the opportunity to comment.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And--and with
17 that, that's exactly where we are going. I--you
18 know, we have created a--a condition for everyone to
19 be part [AUDIO CUT OUT]. That's why we've been able
20 to bring a--a sponsor of this big coalition. It grew
21 from Uber to the yellow taxi to Lyft to Via to
22 Madison Square Garden to all the universities that's
23 in our city, for Columbia, NYU, CUNY and the school,
24 Catholic Charities or-- I think that it's all about,
25 you now, bringing the message that we can make in New

2 York City, and it's all about creating that day, a
3 day where we should use alternative transportation,
4 but you know, as I said there's 1.4 million New
5 Yorkers who own cars [AUDIO CUT OUT]--whoever the bad
6 guys is those own cars, whether there's--that there's
7 people and places in Queens and Brooklyn that they
8 have transportation deserts that we need to connect
9 those areas with mass transportation. So this is
10 again--this is, you know, holding conversations--

11 ALEX SLACK: [interposing] Yes.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --looking for the
13 future, but I also hope that, you know, the--with
14 that definition also we can get your support, too.

15 ALEX SLACK: Uh-huh, and we--

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]
17 Thank you.

18 ALEX SLACK: --we appreciate that
19 message.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. [AUDIO
21 CUT OUT]

22

23

24

25

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

113

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date April 30, 2016