

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

----- X

January 25, 2016
Start: 1:15 p.m.
Recess: 3:33 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E: DANIEL DROMM
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Vincent J. Gentile
Daniel R. Garodnick
Margaret S. Chin
Stephen T. Levin
Deborah L. Rose
Jumaane D. Williams
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Inez D. Barron
Chaim M. Deutsch
Mark Levine
Alan N. Maisel
Antonio Reynoso
Mark Treyger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Elizabeth Rose, Deputy Chancellor
Division of Operations and Office of School Food
NYC Department of Education

Eric Goldstein, Chief Executive Officer
Office of School Support Services and
Office of School Food
NYC Department of Education

Liz Accles, Executive Director
Community Food Advocates

Shulamit May Warren, Director Policy
Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer
Appearing for Gale Brewer

Janet Poppendieck
CUNY School of Public Health
Author: Free for All: Fixing School Food in America

David Young, Risk Director
City Harvest

Joel Berg, Executive Director
New York City Coalition Against Hunger

Pam Stewart, Co-President
Citywide Council on Special Education

Ariel Savransky, Policy Associate
Food and Economic Security
Citizens Committee for Children of New York

Kelly Moltzen, Program Manager
Creating Healthy Schools and Communities Program
Bronx Health Agency for Family Health

2 [sound check, pause]

3 [gavel]

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, good afternoon
6 everyone. My name is Daniel Dromm and I'm Chair of
7 the Council's Committee on Education. Today, we're
8 here to hear Proposed Intro No. 773-A, which is a
9 Local Law to amend the Administrative Code of the
10 City of New York in relation to requiring the
11 Department of Education to provide data related to
12 student participation in free meals in school. And
13 this is an issue of major importance to me and to the
14 Council as well because last year we provided funding
15 for additional school lunches and for breakfast in
16 the classroom as well. And Council Member Kallos has
17 been a strong advocate for food in our schools. This
18 piece of legislation would be a transparency bill,
19 which would provide us with numbers of student
20 participation. And, hopefully, from that information
21 that we gather and collect, we would then be able to
22 use it to determine future policies, and to hopefully
23 increase student participation in school lunch and
24 breakfast meals. So I want to thank everybody for
25 coming in today on this snowy day, this day after the

2 first day back to work after the storm. I
3 congratulate the DOE for getting up and running, and
4 for being here with us today, this tight scheduled.
5 I know that the Deputy Chancellor has been on
6 television and work with the Mayor closely on getting
7 details out about the opening of schools. So we
8 appreciated your presence here very, very much today
9 as well, and with that, I'm going to ask Council
10 Member Kallos to provide some opening remarks.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you, Chair
12 Dromm as well as y co-prime sponsor on this
13 legislation, Stephen Levin, and good morning to
14 Deputy Chancellor Rose. According to the New York
15 City Coalition Against Hunger, one-quarter of New
16 York City children are food insecure, meaning they
17 lack the reliable access to nutritious meals. For
18 too many kids breakfast of any kind, let alone a
19 nutritious one, isn't available at home. School
20 breakfast is their best and often only chance to
21 start their day with a full stomach. Yet, a 2015
22 survey by the Food Research and Action Center
23 revealed that New York City ranks second to last
24 among 62 large school districts in effectiveness in
25 reaching children eligible for free breakfast. Two

2 months ago, the organizations surveyed over 100
3 secondary school principals in 31 states who were
4 implementing alternative breakfast service models
5 like Breakfast After the Bell and breakfast from Grab
6 N Go Carts. Eighty-two percent of the principals
7 measured found an increase in participation in
8 breakfast after introducing the program and believed
9 other principals should explore implementing these
10 options in other schools. Among the positive
11 outcomes noted by principals were improved student
12 attentiveness, fewer visits to the school nurse,
13 fewer occurrences of absenteeism, fewer dysentery
14 referrals, improved reading and elevated math test
15 scores. Though it may not be a panacea, it seems
16 like there was a lot of different improvements that
17 we could use here. So, I know these programs,
18 particularly when coupled with after school snacks
19 reduced child hunger and increased student
20 performance. The City invested \$17.9 million to
21 expand Breakfast After the Bell to 77,000 students at
22 141 elementary schools this fiscal year with a goal
23 of reaching 339,000 children at 530 elementary school
24 by the fall of 2017. Free salad bars in schools have
25 seen continued expansion from 1,068 in 2012 to 1,452

2 in 2015 as reported in the New York City Food Policy
3 and Food Metrics Report. So we're making progress.
4 This legislation aims to provide clarity for parents,
5 students and elected officials on what kinds of food
6 we're serving to our children in city schools; what
7 department food programs are available at which
8 schools; and what Department of Education plan is to
9 maximize participation in these excellent programs.
10 Specifically, we're looking for information on the
11 total number of students served breakfast both before
12 and after the bell. The total number of schools that
13 the salad bar in their cafeteria, the total number of
14 students served after-school snacks. The total
15 number of students served after school supper and the
16 food items offered including the most frequently
17 offered items for each of these programs.

18 I want to live in a city where no child
19 goes hungry. I want to live in a city where every
20 single public school child has access to three square
21 meals a day, and I think that this is something we
22 can achieve. I encourage anyone to go toward the
23 different schools in the district. In my time, I got
24 to visit about 18 different schools, and what I
25 discovered is that school food is not created equal.

2 Where you have principals who are willing to work
3 with school food on a very close basis, you have
4 amazing fresh produce, fresh salad bars with options
5 that rival just salad, and yet for some of the
6 principals where their food access-their focus is not
7 food, you can end up with salad bar with canned
8 goods. So, we're hoping that between the goals, the
9 reporting and participation rates, I can fulfill my
10 campaign pledge from first grade, which is to make
11 school lunch better, and school breakfast better and
12 school food better. Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: You're using a
14 campaign pledge from first grade.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Yes, sir. When I
16 ran for class president in first grade, I ran on
17 improving school food, and I intend to keep all my
18 campaign promises.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: That's a good one.
20 That's a winning one for sure. Before I introduce
21 the council members here, I'd also like to thank Asia
22 Schaumburg (sp?), my senior counsel; Jan Hatlo (sp?),
23 the Senior Policy Analyst; Joan Povolny, Senior
24 Policy Analyst; and Elizabeth Hoffman, Senior Finance
25 Analyst for the work that they've done in preparing

2 for today's hearing, and we've been joined by Council
3 Member Chaim Deutsch, who is the Chair of the
4 Committee on non-public schools. We've been joined
5 by Council Member Margaret Chin from Manhattan and,
6 of course, Council Member Ben Kallos, and I know that
7 other council members will be joining us later on.
8 And so with that I am going to ask Deputy Chancellor
9 Rose and Chief Executive Officer Eric Goldstein to
10 raise your hands as I swear you in. Do you solemnly
11 swear to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing
12 but the truth and to answer council member questions
13 honestly?

14 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: I do.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much,
16 and Deputy Chancellor, would you like to begin.

17 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Yes, please.

18 Good afternoon, Chair Dromm and members of the
19 Education Committee. My name is Elizabeth Rose and I
20 am Deputy Chancellor for the Division of Operations,
21 which includes the Office of School Food. Joining me
22 today Eric Goldstein, Chief Executive Officer of the
23 Office of School Support Services, who oversees the
24 Office of School Food. Thank you for inviting us to
25 discuss Proposed Intro No. 773-A, which requires the

2 Department of Education to provide data regarding
3 student participation in programs providing free
4 meals at our schools. I would like to begin by thank
5 Speaker Mark-Viverito, Chair Dromm and the entire
6 Council for your leadership commitment to smart and
7 sustainable food policy throughout the city,
8 particularly with regard to school food.
9 Specifically, I would like to thank the Council for
10 your support of our Breakfast in the Classroom
11 Program, which helps to ensure that students are well
12 nourished when they begin their school day and of our
13 initiative to provide free lunch for students in 6th
14 through 8th grade stand-alone middle schools, the
15 Middle School Lunch Program. We are proud of the
16 innovative work being done by our over 8,500
17 dedicated employees working out of 1,300 school
18 kitchens. We serve more than 900,000 meals per day
19 to students attending over 2,000 schools including
20 charter schools and non-public schools. We also have
21 over 1,400 salad bars, as Council Member Kallos just
22 mentioned in over 1,100 buildings throughout the
23 city, the most of any school district in the nation.
24 During Fiscal Year 15 we served on average 219,000
25 breakfasts and 605,000 lunches per day. School food

2 is committed to offering students healthy, delicious
3 and satisfying food choices that meet high
4 nutritional standards. School foods' menus, which
5 are available in nine languages and are posted on our
6 website, are carefully planned by our team of
7 professional chefs. Our free breakfast, school
8 lunch, after school and Saturday menus offer tasty
9 nutrient rich options that appeal to students of all
10 age and diverse backgrounds. We have also take steps
11 to improve our communication regarding menus to
12 students and parents via new visual menus, and we
13 have some samples to show today. And I would like to
14 remind the committee that our updated School Food
15 mobile app provides parents, families and students
16 access to menus across every school grade. In
17 addition to school lunch, we also offer students with
18 breakfast options as well as summer meal offerings.
19 Each day, School Food makes free breakfast available
20 to every student. We also started with the Council's
21 support an In The Classroom Breakfast Program as
22 another alternative to help ensure that students
23 start the day with a healthy and nutritious meal. We
24 know that students who eat a healthy breakfast pay
25 closer attention in class, and have lower rates of

2 tardiness and absenteeism. We currently have 344
3 elementary schools participating in this program,
4 which currently serves approximately 30,000
5 breakfasts per day. By the end of the 2017-2018
6 school year, this program will expand to include 530
7 buildings serving 339,000 students. Further, as the
8 committee is most likely aware, lunch is now free for
9 all students in 6th through 8th grades stand-alone
10 middle schools. This service started in the 2014-
11 2015 school year as part of the administration's
12 efforts to improve the atmosphere and experience for
13 all our students in our cafeteria, and to reduce the
14 stigma of qualifying for free meals. We are grateful
15 for the Council's continuing support for this
16 program. In Fiscal Year 15 the average daily lunch
17 participation at middle schools offering free lunch
18 for everyone was 63.9%, an increase of about 6.5%
19 over the prior year. During the months when school
20 is not in session, we administer the largest Summer
21 Meals Program in the country. In the summer of 2015
22 we served a record 8.1 million meals at over a
23 thousand locations including many local parks, pools,
24 libraries and NYCHA sites. We do not require
25 registration, documentation or ID to receive a free

2 summer breakfast or lunch. We are also proud to
3 offer mobile food truck service, which sees food
4 trucks deployed to beaches, parks and playgrounds
5 throughout the city to hand out free lunches to all
6 children 18 years old or younger. Our Summer Meal
7 menu continues to reflect our commitments to the
8 highest standard of nutrition while offering fresh
9 and appetizing foods. Further, to increase our local
10 sourcing, we are working closely with the New York
11 State Commissioner of Agriculture to develop
12 relationships with the Upstate farming industry. We
13 already source locally grown and/or process food
14 items such as the 35 million New York State grown
15 apples, seven million gallons of New York State
16 produced milk, and other local products that School
17 Food purchases annually. To further our support for
18 locally sustained products, locally sourced products,
19 we have also created New York Thursdays where school
20 food highlights locally sourced and produced New York
21 State products in each breakfast and lunch menu on
22 Thursdays. Procuring local products has the added
23 benefit of supporting New York State's economy while
24 at the same time reducing our environmental
25 footprint. To that end, I would also like to remind

2 the committee of the Garden to Cafe Program, a
3 partnership with Grow to Learn New York City that
4 connects school and community gardens with our school
5 food chefs. Students at the 109 participating
6 schools not only have the unique opportunity to taste
7 what they have grown, but can also take part in
8 harvest events and learn about gardening and the
9 local food system. The program also has the benefit
10 of increasing student consumption of more fresh and
11 locally grown produce. Nationally, we remember the
12 Urban School Food Alliance, which was created by
13 school food professionals in 2012 to leverage the
14 unique needs of the nation's largest school
15 districts. The alliance allows participating
16 districts to share best practices, and leverage their
17 purchasing power to continue to drive quality up and
18 costs down all while incorporate sound environmental
19 practices. The six founding cities, New York, Los
20 Angeles, Chicago, Miami, Dallas and Orlando together
21 support over 4,500 schools servicing 2.8 million
22 students daily. This translates to over 469 million
23 meals each year.

24 One of our first major initiatives was
25 designing a new compostable plate to replace

2 polystyrene trays that were dumped in landfills
3 throughout the region. In May 2015, New York City
4 schools started using these compostable plates that
5 are made of a pre-consumer recycled paper, and are
6 designed to resemble the regular plate a child would
7 eat from at home. It's easy for students to handle.
8 It's environmentally sound. Further, we are also
9 excited to announce that we recently selected a
10 vendor for compostable utensils in our cafeterias,
11 and look forward to the product rollout next fall.

12 Another example of the success of our national
13 collaboration has been the implementation of our plan
14 to shift to serving antibiotic-free chicken.

15 Together, we are making our cafeterias and our food
16 more sustainable and healthier for millions of
17 children. We serve a big city with a very diverse
18 palate. In an effort to gain meaningful feedback
19 from our students, we are proud of a program that is
20 opening our school food headquarters in Long Island
21 City to class visits, which allow for taste testing
22 by our student focus groups. This innovative pilot
23 program began in May of 2014, and we expect to have
24 2,000 students visit every school year. I am happy
25 to report that school food also conducts regular

2 stakeholder meetings at individual schools, which
3 allow for students, staff and parents to engage with
4 the school food team. Posting these personalized
5 meetings allows school food staff to hear student and
6 administration opinions, which further enables us to
7 incorporate their feedback and enhance our school
8 food programs. To this end, I'd like to remind the
9 committee that our nutritional standards are always
10 meet and many times exceed United States Department
11 of Agriculture Guidelines. We have reduced the
12 sodium, fat and cholesterol in our menu items, and
13 are now working towards eliminating high fructose
14 corn syrup. School Food also prohibits the use of
15 trans fats, artificial flavors, colors, sweeteners,
16 palm oil, BHA, BHT and MSG.

17 Regarding the bill before you today,
18 Intro No. 773-A, we welcome the opportunity to share
19 the success of our School Food Program with the
20 Council, and to provide our school communities,
21 advocates, elected officials and other stakeholders
22 with additional information regarding school meals.
23 While we generally support the goal of the
24 legislation, we do have concerns about the
25 qualitative reporting requirements, and we look

2 forward to further conversations with the Council.
3 Before I close, I want to thank all the dedicated
4 school food staff who are serving meals at their
5 schools as we speak, and particularly Chair Dromm,
6 thank you for acknowledging the weather that is also
7 impacting all of our students, schools and staff. We
8 have been able to provide all of our students
9 healthy, delicious and satisfying food choices that
10 meet high nutritional standards thanks to the
11 tremendous hard work, innovation and creativity that
12 School Food Team has brought to bear. We look
13 forward to the Council's continued support and
14 cooperation in this effort. Thank you and we look
15 forward to answering any questions you may have.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well, thank you very
17 much, and yes, let's just acknowledge all of the
18 school personnel who came in today despite these very
19 hard and difficult conditions to get into work, but
20 particularly our school cafeteria workers and our
21 custodians, who had to show up for work so early this
22 morning to make sure everything was ready by the time
23 our students got there. But, of course, our
24 teachers, and our professional school secretaries,

2 everybody in the system for making that effort come
3 into school today.

4 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Thank you very
5 much.

6 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: A couple of questions
7 I have regarding Breakfast After the Bell. How is
8 the implementation of that going, and the timeline?
9 Where do we fit into that now? I know that you were
10 going to do it in various phases.

11 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Right. So this
12 program is rolling out over a three-year period so
13 that we are doing it very slowly. Only a small
14 number of schools are being added each week. This
15 allows us time to spend time with each school to help
16 get them ready for the rollout of the program in the
17 school. We have 150 buildings who are adding this
18 program this calendar year or this school year,
19 another 183 next year, and 177 the following year. I
20 think about 50 of the 150 scheduled for this year
21 have already implemented.

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So in terms of
23 getting ready, I've been visiting some of my schools
24 in the district, and I think that the principals have
25 been provided a handbook. Am I right about that?

2 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Yes, an assortment of
3 materials, and we're continuing to work with
4 principals as--as we roll out. This is very much an
5 iterative in the learning process. So, yes, we have
6 some support materials out there, and that we are
7 again--this is a dynamic process in terms of the
8 implementation and the learnings, and as we go
9 forward more things will be produced.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: In many ways it
11 changes the culture or mindset of breakfast in the
12 morning. So principals have expressed some concerns
13 to me about how they're going to go about
14 implementing this, the ones who haven't actually yet
15 started, and I've seen the handbook. Is there like a
16 work stop--a workshop session or a one-on-one, or a
17 person-to-person type training that they can go--that
18 they can go to other than just the support materials?

19 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Yes. School Food is
20 working on that in terms of engaging the principals,
21 and the PTA groups as well. We have some principals
22 who do it exceptionally well, and we want to, with
23 their cooperation, use them as champions to show how
24 it can be done. You're right, it is--is a change.
25 Breakfast in the Classroom offers a lot of

2 opportunity for mindful eating, and it certainly
3 increases the participation rates for children eating
4 breakfast, but we have to do so in a way that the
5 schools are comfortable. That's why we chose under
6 the leadership of Elizabeth and our Chancellor to do
7 so, to roll it on in--in a soft, slow deliberative
8 manner.

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So the 150 schools
10 that are doing it now, did they opt into the program
11 or were they asked to be in the program? How did
12 that work?

13 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So the schools
14 the--the total of 510 buildings that we're rolling
15 these out to over the next three years, this is being
16 mandated because we've--well, we've offered this
17 program as a voluntary program for many years. What
18 we've ultimately learned is that there was a certain
19 level of schools that voluntarily opted in and the--
20 the growth of the program really stalled. We know
21 that to--in order to increase the program, the best
22 way to do it is to make mandatory as has already been
23 done in Los Angeles, Chicago and other major markets.

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So beyond the three-
3 year period that you're talking about, are there
4 plans to implement it in the remaining schools?

5 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So the next
6 three years I think is a--is a pretty long horizon,
7 and let's continue to work with the--these schools
8 over the next three years, and then we will assess
9 how we can go on from there.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So I believe that the
11 Council allocated about \$17 million or was it \$17
12 million in the budget for this program? Are you
13 finding that that cost is sufficient? That that
14 money is sufficient to meet the cost of the program?

15 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: I--I believe so. I mean
16 there's a lot of infrastructure work that needs to be
17 done to schools and equipment, electricity and
18 freezers and refrigerators and all these type of
19 things, but I believe so.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Because one of the
21 issues that's come up has been the issue of
22 custodians and how the food will be collected after
23 the children get to the classroom. How have you
24 dealt with that issue specifically?

2 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Again, you know, we've
3 been doing Breakfast in the Classroom in, you know,
4 one manner or another for at least seven years or so
5 approximately in the city. There are schools that
6 chose to do it for one classroom or one grade or one
7 wing of the school or a few schools did the whole
8 school. So we have a very rich cumulative experience
9 of having to dispose of the waste from breakfast in
10 the classroom. So when they rolled it out in this
11 mandated way just recently, it's the same process
12 where, you know, the--the trash is collected and
13 given to the custodian. So again, this isn't
14 something entirely new for us. Other cities as
15 Deputy Chancellor Rose mentioned in Newark and Los
16 Angeles and Chicago have been doing it in
17 environments that are not all too dissimilar. So
18 again, we've been doing it for awhile. They do it,
19 and the real change here is as we grow the program a
20 little bit, how we can sort of manage it going
21 forward.

22 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: I--I would like
23 to just add most of the work of picking up the
24 leftovers or trash from the classroom, bringing it
25 back downstairs, sorting the trash is actually not

2 done by the custodial staff. It is done by the
3 school food staff.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Has that required any
5 type of change in their hours, or their duties
6 specifically?

7 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: For?

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: For the--the school
9 cafeteria workers can now come to the classrooms
10 themselves to pick up the--I would assume big black
11 garbage bags or whatever it is--

12 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: [interposing] Yeah, but--
13 -

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: --or whatever it is
15 that they give them.

16 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: --they get put in--they
17 put in the garbage bags and they're transported.
18 Yeah, we've added hours. We've added significant
19 hours to our--our school food staff.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And what about
21 liquids in the classroom? How are you doing with
22 that because usually in the cafeteria you'll see, you
23 know, a bucket where children will pour the remainder
24 of whatever it is, liquid juice or milk into those
25 buckets. How are you doing with that?

2 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: And it's milk we're
3 primarily talking about. Yeah, the same--same manner
4 that we dispose of it in the cafeteria. Sometimes in
5 buckets. Sometimes in--it goes in the bags itself
6 that they're transported.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And how, what has the
8 teacher action been to this also?

9 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: We--we conduct a--a
10 survey that goes out once a month to get feedback and
11 by and large the feedback has been very, very
12 positive. You know, Breakfast in the Classroom is a
13 unique tool. So not only does it serve the purpose
14 of getting children to eat, and we're seeing much,
15 much higher participation rates. It also--the
16 classroom is a very different environment from the
17 cafeteria. You know, it's--it's mindful eating. You
18 know, you're eating with the teacher present. You
19 know, one can argue, and we think of it this way
20 certainly at DOE that, you know, lunch and breakfast
21 are opportunities really to learn. So a teacher can,
22 if she--is she wants to really leverage that time,
23 and we want to keep the time limited. We're very
24 sensitive to that. We know about that argument and
25 we have to manage that and work with the teachers and

2 the principals, but it's an opportunity to be mindful
3 about the eating experience that can be really
4 beneficial not only in terms of nutrition to the
5 kids, but also in terms of their sort of socio
6 emotional growth.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well, is there--do
8 you have a breakdown in terms of the schools that you
9 mentioned 150? Are they elementary schools, high
10 schools or junior high schools.

11 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So all of the
12 schools that are rolling out in this particular
13 program are elementary schools.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So I think there
15 would be different challenges in terms of the high
16 school. As well, do you have separate implementation
17 guidelines to how to roll it out for the high school?
18 And I'm thinking in an--in an elementary school in a--
19 -where you have the--you have the self-contained
20 classroom all day, it may be easier for that teacher
21 than it is for the junior high or the high school
22 teachers.

23 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Yeah, it's
24 absolutely a consideration in how we chose to roll
25 this out to elementary schools first, and that--that

2 is a challenge for high schools in that students are
3 attending a different class each day, or in some case
4 if they are attending the same class each day, that
5 means only one subjects teacher is impacted and not
6 all. So, that's something that we need to work on.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Do you know--and this
8 is a very detailed question--if it affects
9 preparation periods? Because some teachers may have
10 a preparation period in the morning. Is it then the
11 duty of the cluster teacher to work with the lunch?

12 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: I don't know the answer
13 to that off the top of my head.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Just that often times
15 cluster teachers can push into the classroom, you
16 know, the first period, and it's not necessarily the
17 homeroom teacher. I'll get some anecdotal
18 information on that as well. Just my final question
19 before I turn it over to Council Member Kallos is
20 some people had concerns about the lunch being a cold
21 lunch rather than a hot--I mean breakfast. Excuse
22 me. A cold breakfast rather than a hot breakfast.
23 What--what is your reaction to that? There are some
24 parents who have come to me and said, you know, that
25 they usually get a pancake and sausage or something

2 in the morning, and now they're getting an apple and
3 a bagel.

4 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Yes. So breakfast in
5 the classroom right now is cold. We are starting to
6 experiment with about five schools on a hot breakfast
7 on that delivery mechanism. Again, taking a learning
8 from what the City of Chicago has done, but we've
9 heard that and we're responding to that, and
10 hopefully the test will go well so we can offer that
11 hot option. But the one thing I do want to point out
12 is when breakfast was just in the cafeteria, not many
13 kids showed up. So we are seeing really huge
14 differences between the number of children eating
15 breakfast with Breakfast in the Classroom versus just
16 offering breakfast in the cafeteria, but we are
17 responding. Again, we're going to rollout a program,
18 and see if it works and build on it to bring some hot
19 food into the classroom.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well, the numbers
21 that you presented today are quite interesting and
22 almost a million meals a day are being provided by
23 the Department of Education. That's just quite eye-
24 opening, too, when you think about it. There is
25 probably no other food service provider large--food

2 service provider in the world that provides that much
3 food. So, good luck with that, and I'm going to turn
4 it over now to Council Member Kallos. [laughter]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you very
6 much. I--I think my small goal is to get us from
7 that million mark to that 3.3 million mark, which
8 would make three meals a day for all of our kids.
9 Thank you for coming out, and thank you for your
10 general support for the legislation. I hope you do
11 get the opportunity shortly to share the success of
12 the School Food Program. Do you mind going into some
13 of your concerns about the qualitative reporting
14 requirements?

15 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Well, I think
16 most--most of that we can discuss offline. We
17 definitely have a little concern about how do we
18 report the frequency of items, and actually this is
19 my cue. I'd like to share the visual menus that we
20 have started creating for our schools to help show
21 them--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: [interposing]
23 Yes.

24 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: --what the menu
25 will be, how they can think ahead.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: [interposing]

3 Today is grilled cheese sandwich day. [laughter]

4 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: You know, and so
5 we're-we're sort of talking through and sorting
6 through how could we provide this information in a
7 way that doesn't go into sort of minute detail. For
8 example, can we simply provide you with all of the
9 menus for a school year? Things like that-that we'd
10 be happy to discuss offline.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Sure.

12 Absolutely. Thank you. That is great. I think, um,
13 just for--for record as software developer and
14 engineer, there's tremendous opportunity to link the
15 schools ordering tools--

16 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: [interposing]

17 Uh-huh.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: --and delivery
19 tools and other items that they're using for tracking
20 things on a regular basis, and have that turn into a-
21 -turn into this report that doesn't even actually
22 need to be annually. It could just be daily of like
23 this is how many meals we ordered today for grilled
24 cheese day. So we ordered this many thousand slices
25 of bread, the many thousand slices of cheese, and

2 thrown up in open data, and let the open data folks
3 do what they wish with it.

4 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So it would
5 actually give us an opportunity to plug of point of
6 systems--

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: [interposing]
8 Uh-huh.

9 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: --which actually
10 do automate and computerize a lot of that
11 information, but I would--we need to point that that
12 is not installed in all of our schools. We still do
13 have schools where a lot of data like that is
14 manually tracked, and so we are continuing to work to
15 roll out the computerized systems, it is a capital
16 investment. We have limited ability to invest in our
17 own systems. So we'd love to get there with you, but
18 we're not there yet and so, therefore, some of the
19 things you are asking for in the bill can be a
20 challenge for us.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you. Any
22 idea on your timeline for that? Is it part of this
23 year's budget, or what is the total do you think to
24 upgrade our tracking system so that this all becomes
25 a lot easier?

2 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Yeah, it's multi-year
3 rollout composing of both front of the house system
4 and back of the house system, and ultimately what
5 you're really referring to I think is the back of the
6 house stuff. So, we're--that's going to happen over
7 the three to five years.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Great. With
9 regards to communications, which I think this--this
10 is a great example of the Feed Your Mind app is also
11 a great example of downloaded on the Android or
12 iTunes Store, Feed Your Mind.

13 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: I did not pay
14 him for this, but thank you. [laughter]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: But how are you
16 communicating with teachers, parents, students and
17 our workers and--and those who represent them in
18 their labor unions in advance of Breakfast in the
19 Classroom outreach and selecting the various methods
20 that you might be using whether it's service in the
21 classroom or Grab N Go Carts?

22 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Oh, there's been
23 countless and endless rounds of meetings and
24 communications both with centrally and at various
25 schools, and look, it's an iterative process. We're

2 going from a situation where it didn't exist to a
3 situation where it exists and the future state is
4 really important for us because ultimately children
5 eat breakfast, and you mentioned--you referenced,
6 Council Member, the--the FRAC (sic) table. The only
7 way to get to the top of that table is with Breakfast
8 in the Classroom. That is the only really effective
9 way to increase breakfast participation. So, you
10 know, we've been doing a tremendous amount of work.
11 There's always much, much more to be done in terms of
12 meeting and communicating and working through the
13 details and adjusting. And, you know, we look
14 forward to having--continuing those conversations.

15 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: We--we--we would
16 be happy to share with you the rollout schedule for
17 the remainder of the year if you--if you don't have
18 it already.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: That would be
20 great and as well as any information that's being
21 requested for the bill if you're able to share that
22 ahead of time. On a particular area. So we have
23 Office of School Food. We also have Office of School
24 Wellness and other divisions of DOE to equip the
25 school community in addressing food concerns and to

2 provide education on nutrition and the benefits of
3 fresh food. I was curious about how those efforts
4 are coordinating and making sure that the Wellness
5 Teams are working School Food and the individual
6 schools to acquaint kids with some of the healthier
7 options that they are now having access to.
8 Specifically, do we designate sustainability
9 coordinators in every school, but not wellness
10 coordinators even though wellness policies are a
11 requirement to participating in the USDA School Meal
12 Program. Why isn't each school required to designate
13 a wellness coordinate who would be responsible for
14 liaison with the Office of School Food to address
15 concerns that arise through School Wellness Councils?

16 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Well, the office
17 of School Wellness is also part of the Division of
18 Operations, and so we as colleagues do our best to
19 try to ensure that we are aware of all of the
20 activities and coordinate as best we can. We do try
21 to offer incentives to schools to develop wellness
22 councils in the form of grants to help support the
23 development of the School Wellness Council. The
24 Wellness Councils actually can take different areas
25 of focus. Some of them focus on food and nutrition.

2 Others take a greater focus on exercise. And so, we
3 do try to create incentives to support what schools
4 are most interested in focusing on.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: If--if you're
6 able to get us specific information on the plan to
7 better integrate that, it would be amazing. One key
8 piece, which is a little unrelated. It's just--well
9 not unrelated. So, we're doing a lot more with
10 Renewal Schools. Renewal Schools means more after
11 school programming. After school programming means
12 qualification for federal funds for dinner. What's
13 included in our legislation, but slightly missing
14 from the testimony. Do you have any information you
15 can share us with about after school snacks and after
16 school supper?

17 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Yeah, we, um--Well,
18 what--what information are you after in particular?
19 I mean that's a very important component of our food
20 program?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Is every Renewal
22 School getting after school supper? Are there
23 schools outside the Renewal Program that get it? Is
24 it something where we could feasibly be rolling it
25 out?

2 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Certainly schools
3 outside the Renewal School set do get it. If all of
4 the Renewal Schools get it, I'll have to come back to
5 you with that answers, but it's certainly widely
6 available.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: And in your
8 testimony, you mentioned that your nutritional
9 standards are trying to exceed the USDA, which is
10 huge. The reason I'm focused on this is tomorrow
11 we're doing a hearing on one of the symptoms of
12 hunger, which is much against common sense, obesity.
13 And as we try to reduce the amounts of obesity, some
14 of the folks who are being regulated such as
15 McDonald's feel that their meals might be healthier
16 than our school meals, which I would like to disagree
17 with. Is it possible for you guys to share right
18 now, or at to tomorrow's hearing what your school
19 food standards are for sodium, fat, cholesterol and
20 calories are versus USDA?

21 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Sure that's--it's on our
22 website. We can tell you that information certainly.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Perfect. Thank
24 you very much to Chair Dromm, and before I forget, I
25 just want to thank my Food Policy Directors. We

2 started Amanda Melpelder (sic) who is now at New York
3 City Coalition Against Hunger; Leah Even (sic) who is
4 now at United Way, and we are lucky to still have
5 Debbie Visnuski (sp?). Throughout this--throughout
6 that whole process, we've had Legislative Director
7 Paul Westrick, who helped me to be able to do the
8 amazing things that we do.

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much,
10 and we've been joined by Council Member Vincent
11 Gentile from Brooklyn; Council Member Steve Levin,
12 Brooklyn; and Council Member Antonio Reynoso from
13 Brooklyn and Queens; Council Member Mark Levine from
14 Manhattan; Council Member Mark Treyger from Brooklyn
15 as well, and the others I've introduced. And with
16 that, I'm going to turn it over to Council Member
17 Chaim Deutsch followed, Chin, Levine, Levin and
18 Gentile.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you,
20 Chair. I actually just have a comment. I want to--I
21 have to confess I didn't have breakfast this morning
22 but after your testimony, I--I have to run and go get
23 something to eat. [laughter] Really that was really
24 a delicious testimony, and I don't mean to butter you
25 up, but your office--literally, your office has been

2 very responsive, Deputy--Deputy Chancellor, and--and
3 especially also I would like to give a shout out to
4 Eric Goldstein. Both--both the office have been
5 phenomenal and very responsive to my constituents.
6 So thank you so much for that.

7 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Council Member Chin.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you. It's
10 really great to see the menu. It looks like there's
11 a lot of good options, but I guess one of the
12 questions I had from looking at the menu is that are
13 there any choices? If a kid doesn't like what is
14 being offered, are there any other alternatives?
15 Especially I guess in the lunch menu?

16 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: There are alternatives.
17 I mean we do have sandwich options as well. We have
18 salad bar, and we have our menu, which cycles that we
19 pay very close attention to, and as the Deputy
20 Chancellor said, it's student testing. So there are--
21 --there are a bunch of--of choices that are available.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: So the--the--the
23 item that you highlighted today that's the special?

24 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Yeah, the item we
25 highlighted today--

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: [interposing] Today
3 it's grilled cheese?

4 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: So if they don't
6 like cheese?

7 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Well, there's the option
8 of salad bar. There's the option of peanut butter
9 and jelly. What we try to do is create a menu. At
10 any given we acknowledge, at any given moment the
11 menu is not going to appeal to every single child
12 that goes to school. So there's the option of the
13 lunch from home if a child wants, which is certainly
14 a viable option for some children if that works for
15 them. We pay very--as I mentioned, very close
16 attention to our menu to things that are very popular
17 with children. Of course, we have a very strong goal
18 in making sure it's all very healthy, but we also
19 acknowledge that we want the children to eat the
20 foods. We pay a lot of attention to that. So, on
21 balance, what we try to do is make the menu as
22 attractive to a broad spectrum as child as possible
23 as possible.

24

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: So is the--is the
3 paper version giving to--given out in the school to
4 the kids--to the parents?

5 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: We--we post that online.
6 We post that, um, in the school building itself.
7 Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Okay, so but
9 individual parents could request individual copies I
10 guess from the school.

11 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Probably online is the
12 best place to get it.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Okay, but there--
14 there are parents who don't--who don't have computers
15 and don't go online, but I assume it could be
16 available--

17 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: [interposing] Yes.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: --in the school
19 itself.

20 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: We--we could work with
21 the schools on that from--from parent requests.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Okay, my question
23 is that one of the schools in my district, the new
24 school on Peck Slip, they were chosen as one of the
25 schools to implement a pilot program called Universal

2 Cold Breakfast in Classroom. Is that the same as the
3 Breakfast After the Bell Program.

4 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Yes, that is.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: But why is it given
6 a different name? [laughs]

7 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: I'm not sure about the
8 confusion, but Breakfast in the Classroom also is
9 called synonymously Breakfast After the Bell. It's
10 the same thing, and Peck Slip does currently have
11 Breakfast in the Classroom or Breakfast After the
12 Bell.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: But as you said
14 earlier in the testimony that right now the breakfast
15 is only a--it's a cold breakfast from what you have
16 here.

17 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Yes.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: So some of the
19 parents were concerned that in terms of the options
20 that might not be the best because some of them are
21 still like has a lot of sugar similar to Pop Tarts
22 that they have seen from their kids. So how are you
23 dealing with that to make sure that we do get, you
24 know, nutritious food and not these sugary drinks.

2 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Let's be clear. We
3 don't--we don't serve Pop Tarts in our school--

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: [interposing] Well,
5 I think it was similar to it.

6 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Really, the children
7 like them. (sic)

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: It looks like it.

9 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Well, I--I don't--I
10 disagree. I don't think it--it looks like it or--or
11 it is a Pop Tart or anything like that, and we don't
12 serve that stuff at all. We have worked very closely
13 with Peck--Peck Slip. I know our team was out there
14 on Friday to meet with the Principal and concerned
15 parents to deal with menu choices and menu items, and
16 we certainly will continue that conversation with
17 them. But we do--are very much focused on how could
18 we get kids eating? Because otherwise without
19 Breakfast in the Classroom largely speaking, you just
20 see lower participation rates, and that's something
21 that concerns us.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: And on the menu it
23 looks pretty good. I mean you do have, you know

24 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: [interposing] I think
25 it's great.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: --actually better
3 Options on here.

4
5 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: I'd like to
6 emphasize that in the schools where we are rolling
7 out Breakfast in the Classroom, we are seeing the
8 participation double as compared to breakfast before
9 school, which was, of course, completely optional for
10 families to attend. So we are seeing tremendous
11 growth and participation with the Breakfast in the
12 Classroom program.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Now, that--I mean
14 that's what we want to see, and I guess ultimately we
15 have to, you know, work on creating better options
16 and even like a hot breakfast option that will be
17 even better for the kids.

18 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Yes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: So, if you are
21 doubling the breakfast in 2015, you had 2--the
22 219,000 breakfasts served in Fiscal Year 15. You're
23 estimating that's double that now?

24 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: In the schools
25 it's--I wouldn't say it's double that.

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: All right.

3 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: In the schools
4 where we did not have Breakfast in the Classroom last
5 year, we are rolling out Breakfast in the Classroom.
6 We are seeing the participation rates in those
7 schools double.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Uh-huh. Okay, I got
9 it. All right, we're going to go to Council Member
10 Mark Levine.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: [off mic] Thank
12 you, Mr. Chair. [on mic] Thank you, Mr. Chair.
13 Great to see you both.

14 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Thank you.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Following up o
16 that. So there's 30,000 breakfasts being served in
17 344 schools currently. Is that right, um, Breakfast
18 After the Bell, sorry. is that right.

19 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: That's right.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: That's what you
21 said in your testimony. So that's about 90 or so per
22 school. Unless these are just particularly small
23 schools that strikes me as a very low number relative
24 to how many students I would imagine are at the
25 schools.

2 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So remember that
3 that number includes about 270 some odd schools that
4 had voluntarily chosen to provide Breakfast in the
5 Classroom, and those schools may be serving it in
6 only a portion of their school or all of their
7 school.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Understood. Now,
9 you describe yourselves in class--in Classroom
10 Breakfast being an alternative to help students
11 throughout their day. Does that mean that the pre-
12 school warm breakfast is still being served in all
13 those buildings?

14 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So in the
15 schools where we are implementing this new program
16 mandating Breakfast in the Classroom now in the
17 elementary schools, Breakfast in the Classroom is the
18 only breakfast served. We--it is an alternative in
19 that we still welcome schools that are not scheduled
20 for the rollout to voluntarily join the Breakfast in
21 the Classroom Program. We would be delighted for
22 additional schools to sign up and say yes we would
23 like to serve Breakfast in the Classroom.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Okay, sorry, you
25 covered this ground earlier, I think when we were

2 passing this legislation we hadn't grappled with that
3 implication, and for the young children whose parents
4 are worried about childcare, adjusting the drop-off
5 time by half an hour, could actually be a hardship.
6 And the reason why you had to do that is because
7 otherwise the budget implications will just be too
8 significant to continue the staff during the pre-
9 school hours?

10 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: It's a number of
11 things including staffing costs, but also complexity.
12 How do you track who is eating before they get to the
13 classroom and then who--who is eligible to eat once
14 they're in the classroom? How do you manage that
15 trait--that hand-off? So there's a number of
16 challenges to it. We are aware that this is
17 something that schools and families are concerned
18 about, and as Eric was saying, you know, we are doing
19 a relatively slow rollout so that we can learn from
20 it, and we can attempt to figure out strategies to
21 help address that particular concern.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: So might those
23 include both opening for pre-school breakfast and
24 serving in the classroom?

2 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, we're--we're
3 considering how can we address the needs of families
4 who do drop off their children earlier, and is there
5 something that we can do there? We have a solution--

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: [interposing]
7 Okay, so could we--

8 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: --yet, but we
9 are certainly aware of the concern and considering
10 what we would do--

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: [interposing] That
12 might include a non-meal activity, but before school
13 so that time is covered potentially.

14 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: That's right.
15 (sic)

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Well, we'll be
17 very excited to follow your--your developments on
18 that. On the related matter that you spoke about in
19 your remarks, the Summer Food Program, which I'm
20 looking at the numbers from last summer. It seems
21 like it was an incredible success with the number of
22 meals served. Was it--was it over a million. I know
23 it was--it was very impressive.

24 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: It's over eight
25 million.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: There you go over
3 eight million. Right now, there's not a kosher or
4 Halal option for the summer food. Is that correct?

5 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: There is a small--for
6 one week we've been doing this program with grant
7 money to serve non-meat. So it's tuna fish or
8 cheese, kosher options in two neighborhoods in
9 Brooklyn. The school food part is paid as School
10 Food pays, but the--the difference, and there's a
11 significant difference of almost--almost \$3.50 a meal
12 is paid for by private grant money. So for that one
13 week, for the non-meat options, there is that kosher
14 bid, but that's a relatively small privately
15 subsidized program that exists, but other than that,
16 no.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: So, you're
18 doubling the cost roughly per meal for the kosher
19 certification?

20 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: More than double. You
21 know, it's like three--three almost four times more
22 expensive.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: My goodness.
24 Maybe could shop around for a better price on that.
25 And for Halal dietary restrictions, which I'm--I'm a

2 little bit less familiar with, is there any
3 accommodation there in the summer?

4 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Well, we--again, we--we
5 don't do meat. So for the non-meat to the best of my
6 understanding there are vegetarian--well, I know
7 there are vegetarian options or cheese options, but
8 they're--they're all non-meat.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: So all the summer
10 food is non-meat or dairy.

11 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: But for--for the kosher
12 stuff it's non-meat, and for someone who is very
13 interested or needs Halal, we have non-meat and
14 vegetarian options as well.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Okay, I can
16 imagine this demand for Halal year round including in
17 the schools. I'm sure you're grappling with that
18 understanding that vegetarian food may comply with
19 those dietary requirements. The summer especially on
20 the kosher front because you have a whole population
21 of kids who are not in public schools during the
22 year, but who are a potential market for them, many
23 of whom--a disproportionately large number of whom
24 come from low-income or moderate income backgrounds
25 in contrast to public perception. I'm sure you know

2 that, but just for the record stating that. So
3 anything that you can do to advance the use of
4 partnerships or other means, expansion of that in the
5 summer I think would be very welcome.

6 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Okay.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Council
9 Member Levin.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, Chair
11 Dromm.

12 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Good afternoon.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Good afternoon,
14 everybody. Thank you very much for your testimony
15 and for--for rolling this out. I guess my first
16 question would be what have been the biggest
17 challenges that you have seen since the rollout--
18 since the expanded rollout of Breakfast in the
19 Classroom since--in October?

20 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Well, you know, change
21 is--is always--is always difficult--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [interposing] Uh-
23 huh.

24 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: --and it does take time
25 to become acclimated and adjusted to it. Um, you

2 know, the issues that come up are, um, some issues
3 relating to drop-offs in the schedule as we heard
4 from Council Member, issues relating to some of the
5 custodians have come up, issues relating to classroom
6 time. But, these are the same issues that have come
7 up in other places in Newark, in Chicago and Los
8 Angeles.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Right.

10 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: They're able to get
11 through it and be successful, and as a result, the
12 majority of the children in those cities eat
13 breakfast. When you eat breakfast good things can
14 happen, and the question I think for us is as we roll
15 this out relatively slowly--

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [interposing] Uh-
17 huh.

18 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: --and in an iterative
19 dynamic way is to make sure we learn, work together
20 and adjust to make sure we can get our kids eating.
21 Um, so there are lessons. There will continue to be
22 lessons, and I suppose it's what we can do
23 collectively to make sure that we can get through it.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: So the experience
25 so far scaling up from the voluntary model before to

2 now having, you know, all the free-standing
3 elementary schools doing it, has that experience so
4 far encouraged you guys that this something that is--
5 that you can scale up from here? Or, have you been
6 discouraged that it's like not as workable as you
7 thought it might be? Because it's--just to be clear,
8 we've been talking about this for a long time, and we
9 knew that there were going to be--we knew there were
10 going to be a lot of challenges. I mean there were
11 things that we had identified beforehand of kind of
12 like things to look out for?

13 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: We're New Yorkers.
14 We're not discouraged.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, so--All
16 right good. That--that--that's encouraging. Um, do
17 you have a sense of, um, when you might think about
18 scaling it up further in--in terms of, um, you know
19 the mandatory application of it?

20 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: So, as I said earlier I
21 think let's continue to go with our rollout. We are
22 learning a lot about how we need to work with schools
23 to get the teachers on board to do taste testing for
24 the communities, for parents to help them buy into
25 the program. And I think we're--we're improving--

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [interposing] Uh-
3 huh.

4 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: --that rollout
5 experience for schools through all of the feedback
6 that we've been getting. There is substantial
7 capital work that needs to happen in these buildings
8 over the next two years to support the additional
9 refrigeration and equipment that's required to do
10 Breakfast in the Classroom. So there are challenges
11 above and beyond just the let's--let's provide the
12 food.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [interposing] Uh-
14 huh.

15 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So I think we
16 are committed to this three-year plan, and as we sort
17 of get through the second year of it, I think that's
18 the right time to begin assessing what's next.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Um, and in the
20 schools that--that are participating the before
21 school cafeteria option is no longer available, is
22 that right?

23 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Correct.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Are you--are you
25 seeing an issue around kids getting this--like kids

2 that used to be getting to school on time to go early
3 are now not coming on time or vice versa? Are you
4 seeing more students getting this--less tardiness
5 because everyone's, you know, arriving? That it's
6 an--it's an incentive to get there on time to be able
7 to participate in the--in Breakfast in the Classroom?

8 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: I don't think
9 we've actually looked at lateness--

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [interposing] Uh-
11 huh.

12 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: --percentages in
13 these schools. It's a great suggestion and--and we
14 will take a look at that. We are clearly hearing
15 concerns from schools, and from some parents about
16 the students who are getting dropped off at that
17 earlier time--

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [interposing]
19 Right.

20 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: --and families
21 continuing to use that earlier pre-bell time. And so
22 that's something that--that as Council Member Levine
23 raised that we are considering how can we help
24 support and ensure that those students are occupied,
25 perhaps are not waiting--

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

54

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [interposing] Uh-
3 huh.

4 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: --for breakfast,
5 but to ensure that they're having a good experience.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: And it wouldn't
7 make sense to have the in-cafeteria option available,
8 or is that just a lot of work that won't be utilized?
9 Or, is it--yeah, I mean, how--what's--what's the
10 approach there?

11 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Um, well one,
12 it's very, very expensive to have both--

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [interposing]
14 Okay.

15 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: --and also when
16 you have the cafeteria option available it just
17 wasn't used that much. It was used--

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [interposing]
19 Right.

20 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: --but not--not
21 that much. You didn't see the same level of
22 participation.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Uh-huh. When--so
24 I--I--I-I noted in your testimony that your--New York
25 City is a member of the Urban Food Alliance, and a

2 lot of other cities have implemented a Breakfast in
3 the Classroom model district wide, you know, for--
4 going back several years. So, you know, that's--we--
5 we still have a low participation rate at 35.4%
6 according to the Food Research In Action Center's
7 report this year compared to L.A. at 102%, Des Moines
8 at 93.4%, Newark at 89.4% so on and so forth. How
9 often are--are we in touch with those cities
10 especially the bigger ones, Houston, L.A., Chicago to
11 seek their advice on--on how they were able--you know
12 how they were able to, um, overcome some of these
13 hurdles that--that we're seeing right now? How often
14 are we talking to them?

15 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: We speak to them all the
16 time. I mean weekly I would say.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay.

18 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Yeah.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: And is it
20 instructive? I mean are they--are we getting good
21 ideas from them?

22 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Oh, yeah. I mean in
23 terms of solving the hot issue that's an idea that
24 we're lifting from Chicago. I mean it works in
25 Chicago. We're going to try it in New York, which is

2 to see again how we can bring in some of the hot
3 foods in the cafeteria, and hopefully that will work.
4 So in that sense there's no point in reinventing the
5 wheel.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Uh-huh.

7 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: But yeah, there is some
8 great learnings to go on from some of these other
9 large cities that have done this now for many, many
10 years with great success.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: In terms of like
12 from a health perspective, um, how do our--our
13 Breakfast in the Classroom compare to--to other big
14 cities? In other words, like in terms of fresh food,
15 in terms of the--the quality of--you know, the--
16 nutritional quality of the food? Is there--is there
17 a deviation at all? Are we better? Are we worse?
18 Are we the same?

19 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: In my humble opinion
20 representing the amazing people who work at School
21 Food, I think we lead the nation in what we do.
22 Certainly for a large urban area, but even--even not
23 I think that we should as a city be exceptionally
24 proud of what the folks at School Food have done to

2 the Food Program here in our city over the last
3 several years.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: So I would love to
5 continue to work with you guys on, you know, helping
6 bring together organizations, advocacy organizations.
7 As--as you know, there are numerous advocacy
8 organizations that have been focused on this for a
9 long time, and I think keeping up that that dialogue
10 would be really great. And making sure that--that we
11 are addressing any of the hiccups that will
12 inevitably come from an expansion of a program of
13 this size, and this--this scope. And so, I really
14 hope that--that we can continue to have that--that
15 dialogue and make sure that we're addressing things
16 before they become bigger issues if that's fair.

17 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Absolutely.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Great. Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. So, just
20 before I turn it over to Council Member Gentile, I
21 am--just I'm not clear how does the breakfast get to
22 the classroom?

23 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: It's brought up in
24 transport bags by School Food Office.

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Like what you would
3 take on a school trip?

4 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Yes.

5 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Insulated bags?

6 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Yes.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yep.

8 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Yes.

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And I was reading
10 through the testimony that UFT will provide later and
11 some of the issues that they are raising have been
12 spoken--Yeah, that's for the record. For the record,
13 some of the issues that they have raised have already
14 been questioned and have already been asked. But one
15 of them and which I think is pretty legitimate is
16 what about cleanup? I mean if you're going to deal
17 with juice and syrup maybe or something like, how
18 does that happen, and who's responsible for that?

19 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Yeah, so, um, I--I don't
20 believe we have syrup on the Breakfast in the
21 Classroom menu--

22 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: [interposing] Maybe
23 not.

24 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: --just for this type of
25 reason, but, you know, milk there's milk and milk can

2 spill. Every now and then certainly it's going to
3 happen, and, you know, depending on the level of the
4 spill sometimes it does require the custodian to come
5 in not that--I don't think that often, but it does
6 happen from time to time. But there's--there's
7 general cleanup that happens, and all the waste is
8 put in back into these garbage bags or put back into
9 transports that are taken back to the cafeteria and
10 then given over to the custodian.

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: The concern there
12 remains that it takes a lot of time especially with
13 the little ones because you have to open the carton
14 of milk for them or, you know, help them out, and I
15 can see that there may be some issues around that as
16 well. So long as teachers are no longer being held
17 to 10-minute mini-lessons, I think that can be
18 overcome, but remember there was a day when the first
19 10 minutes of your class was timed. And if the
20 principal walked in and saw you doing anything but
21 teaching for those first 10 minutes, you were written
22 up. Fortunately, we're--we're beyond that at this
23 point, but--

24 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: [interposing] I
25 could just get that.

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: --just hope that it
3 doesn't have to come back.

4 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: I've actually--I
5 visited earlier this year one of our schools that
6 voluntarily has been doing Breakfast in the Classroom
7 for some time. And in each individual classroom the
8 teacher made choices about how to incorporate
9 breakfast into the day. And so, in some classrooms
10 it was the first thing in the morning. In some
11 classrooms it was after a 10 or 15-minute do now. In
12 other classrooms it was after, you know, 20 minutes
13 and was part of the independent reading time. So, we
14 support teachers figuring out what is the best way to
15 incorporate breakfast in their classroom for their--
16 for them and their--their students.

17 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Very good. Okay,
18 Council Member Gentile.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Thank you, Mr.
20 Chairman. Suppose a five or six-year old said to the
21 teacher, "I eat breakfast at home with mommy and
22 daddy." What do you do in that case?

23 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: The child doesn't take a
24 meal. In--in that--that case the child doesn't have
25 to eat. You don't have to eat to eat breakfast.

2 It's just available as an option for those that want
3 it.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Okay, so, um, so
5 that child would sit in the classroom while everyone
6 else is eating?

7 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Yeah, that's--that's
8 happened. The same thing in the cafeteria if you
9 have lunch period, not everyone eats lunch. Um, so
10 it's no different in that respect, but yeah, your
11 child doesn't have to eat. The food isn't forced on
12 anyone, but it's made as an option.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: So--okay, so I
14 understand that. If we are concerned about the kind
15 of breakfast that students are eating, if that's our
16 concern, how is it that we're okay with a cold
17 breakfast as opposed to the--to a hot a breakfast in
18 the cafeteria?

19 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So this is one
20 of the trade-offs that was discussed extensively
21 before we made the decision to roll this program out.
22 That we recognized that there was a trade-off between
23 the hot meal in the cafeteria or a cold meal served
24 in the classroom. And there was a lot of discussion
25 about this. Ultimately, the decision was made that

2 it is better to ensure that children have breakfast
3 than to offer a hot breakfast that was not being
4 widely eaten. And, we have, in fact, seen that the
5 participation rates, the number of children eating
6 breakfast under this program is roughly double in the
7 schools where we have rolled it out so far. It's
8 roughly double the number of students who are eating
9 breakfast in the cafeteria. So no question it's a
10 trade-off, but ultimately the decision was the more
11 important of the two values is to ensure that
12 children have breakfast.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: So, if that
14 being the case, the food is--the food is brought in,
15 right? It's not--it's not made in the cafeteria.
16 It's brought in?

17 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Um, yeah for the most
18 part. I mean it--we have a lot of things that happen
19 in the cafeteria in the kitchen, but we bring in a
20 lot of food, if that's what you're saying. Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Okay, and do
22 these same students then go to the cafeteria and have
23 a hot lunch?

24

25

2 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: If they want certainly
3 lunch is available as an option, and we do want and
4 encourage the students to eat with us.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Okay, and--and
6 you have obviously a hot lunch in the cafeteria?

7 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Yeah.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Right.

9 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: They--they can elect to
10 have a sandwich if they want like a peanut butter and
11 jelly or a cheese sandwich, but yes, there are hot
12 options.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Okay. You may
14 have mentioned this before, but there--there are
15 plans eventually to--to provide some hot breakfasts
16 in the classroom?

17 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: That's right. We're
18 going to sort of do a little program with about five
19 or six schools to see how it works from a logistical
20 and operation point of view, and then hopefully if
21 it's successful, we'll look to roll it out on a
22 larger scale.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Now, there have
24 been some schools, have there not, that have asked
25

2 for this Breakfast in the Classroom program to be put
3 on hold at their schools?

4 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Um, certainly
5 there have been schools that are less excited about
6 the rollout. We are doing our best to work with
7 them, work with the families, um, to make them aware
8 of the food choices, and to support them in how do
9 you actually schedule the time.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: What--what were
11 the issues that caused them to make that request of--
12 of your office?

13 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, a--a couple
14 of examples. One school felt that because they have
15 a very low percentage of students who qualify for
16 free or reduced price breakfast--free or reduced
17 price meals, that it wasn't needed in their school.
18 So that is one of the factors that has been raised to
19 us.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Are you meaning
21 students ate at home before they got to school?

22 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Exactly. That
23 is--that's what the school's perspective was.

24

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Why was school
3 like that chosen as the--the first--first round of
4 schools?

5 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: There were a mix of
6 schools chosen. So what we're looking for is, you
7 know, to have different rollouts in different parts
8 of the city with different schools. So there are a
9 whole--a whole bunch of schools that were chosen.

10 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: But more
11 specifically the first year of the rollout is
12 primarily schools that required very minimal physical
13 upgrades in order to support the additional equipment
14 that's need for the Breakfast in the Classroom. So,
15 this was a school that is actually in a brand new
16 building. And so it had the full electrical
17 capacity, the full refrigeration capacity and so
18 forth, and needed no additional capital investment to
19 make the building able to support Breakfast in the
20 Classroom.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Have you granted
22 every school that has--that has requested a temporary
23 hold on the program?

24

25

2 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Um, we are
3 working with those schools to support the
4 implementation.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Okay, so, so they
6 are on hold then I would imagine.

7 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: No, we are--we
8 are continuing to provide Breakfast in the Classroom.
9 We have not reverted in those schools to breakfast in
10 the cafeteria, but we're trying to work closely with
11 them to support the transition. And, and one of the
12 things that--that we do see is the--as Eric said,
13 change is hard. And so this--what we find is as we
14 work with schools, they're sort of vague. A couple
15 weeks in, it becomes part of the routine. It becomes
16 something that is the new normal, and we find that we
17 get good acceptance of the program. But there's
18 definitely a transition period that's a challenge.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: And those
20 complaints about the time, as the Chairman said the
21 time that it actually takes to roll this program out
22 during the day, it's not 10 or 15 minutes. It's more
23 like a half an hour or better by the time the food is
24 served, by the time it's eaten, and then the cleanup
25 tends to be from what I've been told by teachers and

2 principals that--that custodians have to come into
3 the classroom now and clean the classroom as opposed
4 to cleaning a--a cafeteria.

5 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: I don't think that's the
6 experience across the board. I mean there could be
7 pockets of that, and what we're looking to do is
8 partner up the schools that do it exceptionally well
9 with those schools that need a little help. And I
10 think that's probably the best way for these schools
11 to learn how to, and--and we'll continue to work with
12 them how to implement this program in a way that is
13 the most effective and efficient and works the best
14 for the best for the school.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: So ultimately no
16 school can opt out? Ultimately down the road?

17 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So we are in
18 this program that is intended to roll this out to all
19 stand-alone elementary schools over the course of
20 three years. As we've said, we are continuing to
21 learn from this process, and working with teachers
22 and principals to do--make this program as strong as
23 it can be. And we continue to assess how is it going
24 all along. What can we do to improve it? What can
25 we do to support schools better, and we will continue

2 to do that, and assess the program each step of the
3 way. We have not made any changes fundamentally in
4 the plans for the program, but we are listening. We
5 are working with schools. We are working with our
6 colleagues at the UFT and the CSA to support this
7 program as best we can.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: So I guess what
9 I'm asking is that it's made--it will be mandatory
10 for all schools at some point?

11 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Again, this
12 program is three years, and it is focused entirely on
13 stand-alone elementary schools. There has not been
14 any decision about expansion to all other schools.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON EUGENE: Thank you, Council
17 Member Gentile, and Deputy Chancellor Rose, it's true
18 that there's not Title 1 qualification necessary for
19 the breakfast program. Am I right?

20 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: That is correct.
21 We offer breakfast free for all students regardless
22 of--

23 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: [interposing] Every
24 student can get it. Yeah, just to be clear on that.
25 And then males, I would just say from my own personal

2 experiences, you know, we never have Breakfast in the
3 Classroom, but often times I would come back from
4 trips and we had, you know, food in the classroom.
5 We ate in the classroom.

6 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: [interposing]
7 Right.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: If the classroom is
9 well run, and children know their purpose in the
10 classroom, they know where to go about to throw their
11 stuff into the garbage, what to do with spill, et
12 cetera, so forth and so on. So it's--it is very
13 possible and likely and good that this can happen. I
14 think it's just a matter of changing that culture,
15 and working with people to get them to understand how
16 it can be implemented in a--in a good fashion. So I
17 didn't want to come across as not being supportive of
18 the program, but, um, you know, recognizing that
19 there are those challenges, but they're--they're
20 overcome I think once--once people see it in action
21 actually. Council Member Reynoso.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Hello, good
23 afternoon.

24 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Good afternoon.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: So just a couple
3 of questions. The principals in my district--I won't
4 say which one to try to keep them safe, but there is
5 one district that is universally against this. So
6 far that I've had to meet with all the principals
7 that--

8 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: [interposing]
9 The whole district?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: The whole
11 district in which you're implementing the--the--the
12 Breakfast in the Classroom and the superintendant is
13 supporting the principals as well in their concerns I
14 guess. I think change is difficult, and I think
15 that's the biggest problem. So I try to--I try to
16 take it knowing that change is difficult for them.
17 Their concern is that for most of them they're
18 starting it in February, and they're saying that
19 they've built a routine with the students, and it's
20 very hard to do it at elementary level. And that
21 instead of beginning the program in September when
22 the school year starts so that they can start the
23 process, they're doing it mid-year after they have
24 the discipline--and after they have the routine, and--
25 --and the kids are disciplined into knowing how

2 exactly they're supposed to be moving around. I
3 wanted to ask why is it that we chose mid-year as
4 opposed to the beginning of the year?

5 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Well, I--

6 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: [interposing] Or
7 did we choose?

8 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: I will--I will
9 answer part of that, and the I'd like Eric to also
10 address this. We did not choose mid-year over
11 beginning of the year. We chose a slow rollout where
12 we are rolling out to five additional schools each
13 week. And we chose to do that in order to ensure
14 that we have the time to work with individual schools
15 and principals and bring in the local school for the
16 district manager to come into the school, and work
17 with the teach--the principal and the teachers on how
18 to implement this program. So the decision was
19 around how do we bring schools along on a more
20 personalized basis. And I'm certainly not saying we
21 have done a perfect job at that, and there's lots
22 that we can do to strengthen that. But that was the
23 decision. It was not a let's start in the middle of
24 the year.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Oh, so now you
3 know that it's a school that's being in February.
4 That's unfortunate.

5 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Okay.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: If I would have
7 known that before, I--I would have come--

8 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: [interposing] I
9 can go back again--

10 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I'm getting them
11 a good--

12 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: --and pore over
13 the schedule in detail.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Yes. Don't--
15 don't--don't be upset at my schools. They're good.
16 They're good schools, and the principals have good
17 intentions, by the way. I think that they're used to
18 the same--they have their routine as well, and I
19 think that just like the kids have their routine,
20 they have theirs, and to break them off of it, it's
21 something that they're not a fan of. The other thing
22 is they're concerned about who is supposed to take
23 the food into the classrooms. For them, some of our
24 staff in the cafeteria, you know, might--it poses
25 challenges to them in being able to--having to bring

2 food up and down the stairs. So much so that again,
3 I'm not--I'm not going to let which school, but some
4 schools are using children and custodial staff to do
5 the work. I'm not a fan of either of that--either of
6 those unless custodial staff is supposed to do it, or
7 they're a part of the team that's supposed to make
8 this happen. I just want to know--they need it up
9 and down, you know, bags and bags, and we're talking
10 about in some cases, you know, many children in many
11 classrooms. Can you explain to me who is in charge
12 of bringing this food into the classroom?

13 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: It should be the School
14 Food cafeteria staff, but we could take a look at
15 that.

16 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, you've--
17 you've not--you haven't--you've had no trouble so far
18 with custodial staff that has brought it?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: So you've--
20 you've not--you haven't--you've had no trouble so far
21 with custodial staff that has brought it? I mean I'm
22 sorry. With school food staff from--you haven't
23 heard that that's been an issue, the physical work
24 that needs to be done to make that happen?

2 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: In our--in our meetings
3 it has--it has come up in some cases. Like I said,
4 we adjust hours and staff levels to accommodate for
5 that, but with any particular school if there's an
6 issue, we're certainly happy to jump on that right
7 away.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Okay, so I
9 might--I might give you guys a call. I would like to
10 sit down with you and maybe bring you to the
11 district, because this is not one school, it's--I
12 think they're--they're working together too--to
13 really maybe getting organizes. And an organized
14 school district is tough to handle. I guess another
15 thing is it the cleanup the custodial--

16 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: [interposing] We
17 would appreciate your help and support in--

18 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: [interposing]
19 I'm supportive of the program. I believe in it. I
20 think it's extremely important.

21 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: [interposing]
22 Thank you for the support.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: --but when you
24 have all the principals, well a lot of the principals
25 and so--and the superintendant they just have

2 concerns. And I think if you address the concerns,
3 they'll be on board. I don't think that that--I
4 don't think they're bad intentioned. (sic) I think
5 if we deal with the problems they have, they'll be
6 fine, but those are two issues. Also, can students
7 and custodial staff bring the food up and down in
8 schools or is that something that you discourage?

9 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: You know, sometimes like
10 for instance in Los Angeles they have student
11 captains that do it to teach responsibility--

12 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: [interposing]
13 Yes.

14 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: --this that, and the
15 other thing. Generally speaking, we discourage that
16 and, you know, it's a job for the cafeteria workers.
17 But, yeah, if there's any issue in any particular
18 schools, we'll certainly take a look at that.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Okay. Now, so
20 Intro 773-A, right now you're saying that you have
21 issues with documentation because you do it--you
22 write it in still in some cases that the--the
23 technology age hasn't hit some of these schools. By
24 when do you think we'll get to a place for schools
25 are practically doing everything on computers?

2 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: About--about five years.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Five years?

4 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Yeah.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Okay. Until we
6 get there, do you feel like you wouldn't be able to
7 do this reporting data efficiently? Or, do you feel
8 that you're capable now to do this type of work if we
9 were to ask you?

10 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Yeah, I think we could
11 represent the data, you know, very, very. I mean I
12 think we can, yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Okay, and the
14 data is very specific as to what they're asking for.
15 You know, I was--I was reading it myself, and after
16 school snacks, after school supper, Breakfast After
17 the Bell, Grab N Go Carts. The total number of
18 students served Breakfast After the Bell
19 disaggregated by the total number of students served
20 in the classroom, and the total number of students
21 serve via Grab N Go, this is very specific. Are you--
22 -these--are the kids going to have, you know, like
23 supermarket scanners so that you can know when it is
24 that they did what they did? It's very specific, and
25 unless you're going to have a teacher or a student

2 self report, I just want to know the--the logistics
3 as to how you feel that you guys can get there.

4 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Well, it's laborious,
5 that's for sure. I mean I think if there was an
6 opportunity, as the Deputy Chancellor said, to
7 discuss some of that that would be--

8 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: [interposing]
9 Okay.

10 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: --that would be really,
11 really helpful.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Okay, I would--I
13 would just press that. Just the logistics of it I
14 would like to get to know what that looks like so
15 that you're doing this reporting the right way, and
16 we're getting the real information that's important
17 to us, and not--you guys are not just, you know,
18 rushing to just get us information that might not be
19 as accurate as we want it to be.

20 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: We're happy to
21 have that discussion.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Okay, and I will
23 be calling you to come to talk to me, and help my
24 principals get on board.

2 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Look forward to it.
3 Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: But just to be clear,
5 though, some of that information is already
6 collected, right? I mean for reporting purposes and
7 for reimbursement purpose, lunch and perhaps after
8 school snacks and stuff like that. It's really the
9 Breakfast After the Bell that may not be recorded
10 exactly according to each student who grabs a bag in
11 the classroom.

12 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Yeah, a lot of data that
13 we have to report to the federal government. So that
14 data is collected, yes.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: It's just a matter of
16 trying to collate it all. Okay. Council Member
17 Treyger.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you, Chair
19 and welcome Deputy Chancellor, and forgive me in
20 advance because this is the old teacher coming out of
21 me now and asking some questions. But with regards
22 to just--just for clarity, breakfast is also offered
23 beyond just elementary and middle school, right? I
24 came from a high school where all that was offered
25 there as well. Is that clear? Is that right?

2 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Yes, we offer
3 breakfast to every student everyday.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: And forgive me
5 if this was asked before, but I think it's just needs
6 further clarity. You mentioned before that someone
7 comes up with the breakfast, is that correct, to give
8 it to classroom?

9 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Yeah.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: What if--what
11 happens when comes late? If a child comes late to
12 school are they still given a breakfast? What--what
13 happens in that situation?

14 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: It depends how late the
15 child is coming, but there's always going to be
16 something available for a child in the cafeteria.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: So they would
18 have to travel to the cafeteria?

19 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Well, it depends how
20 late the child gets to school, but--and we never will
21 let anyone go hungry.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Okay, I just want
23 to echo one of the concerns raised by my colleague
24 Council Reynoso, and add my thing here is that--and I
25 think the Deputy Chancellor would agree with me on

2 this that educators and school--school families work
3 very hard at developing routines in schools. That is
4 a very big part of building an effective school
5 culture, routines. I--I just want to make sure that,
6 you know, educators and those I speak to are always
7 making sure that their classrooms are ready. A part
8 of the frameworks that they're being told classroom
9 environments is one of them. If I just paint you a
10 scenario where an educator is in the classroom, kids
11 are eating breakfast or--and a superintendant walks
12 in--

13 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Uh-huh.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: --and they find,
15 you know, a milk carton that fell on the floor, is
16 that--is that now being held against them in their
17 Danielson Framework that the environment is not--the
18 classroom is dirty? I mean I just--I know people are
19 asking these questions and making sure that--and
20 that's where the concerns that we're hearing from our
21 school districts. That on top of the paperwork that
22 I'm sure you understand how much they have to do, and
23 the accountability from the federal and state
24 government that now making sure that, you know, no
25 banana peel is on the floor, making sure that kids'

2 Cheerios are on the--on the desk. I also wanted to
3 say this: I think the Chancellor and I agree on this
4 that having the meal is a socialization event.

5 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Uh-huh.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: It should be a
7 time where children should be able to, yes,
8 socialize. I know that's a--that's a taboo word for
9 some people, but yes socialize, and be able to
10 communicate. But we're kind of trying to send
11 conflicting messages where each--but instruction is
12 important at the same time. How can you speak to
13 this issue, Deputy Chancellor?

14 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Well, as--as we
15 said, schools do implement this in very different
16 ways, and to different teachers in--even within the
17 same school are able to implement this in a way that
18 they feel works best for the classroom and for their
19 students. So I have seen some classrooms where it is
20 very much a community event and there, you know, a do
21 now up on the board when you walk in, and you get
22 your breakfast. The child goes and picks up their
23 breakfast, and does a specific routine, and everybody
24 is doing this at the same time. I also have seen
25 other classrooms where eating breakfast is part of

2 their independent reading first thing in the morning,
3 and it's more of a solitary thing. We can't
4 necessarily achieve all goals at the same time. It
5 is--it is a complex system, but we do think that
6 there are very effective ways that children can both
7 eat and have their meal in the classroom while it
8 also being either social or learning or routine time
9 for that class. You asked earlier about well, do
10 children get breakfast made available to them if they
11 come late? And remember that in the caf--when
12 breakfast is served in the cafeteria, that was served
13 between a fixed period of time. So children coming
14 to school for the regular on time would not, in fact,
15 have access to breakfast when it was served in the
16 cafeteria because the breakfast would have been
17 served only the half hour before that time. So in
18 fact Breakfast in the Classroom expands that
19 opportunity as well to ensure that even children who
20 come late have an opportunity to eat.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: So does the DOE
22 provide any type of guidance or guidelines to schools
23 on how to implement this program? Is there anything
24 in writing or it's sort of you're on your own. Do it
25 by a school by school basis?

2 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: No, we do, in
3 fact, have a toolkit that we provide to the
4 principals. We have school food managers, our
5 district managers are able and willing and interested
6 in going out and meeting with principals before it is
7 rolled out in their school. They're willing to go
8 and do a Monday Professional Development for all of
9 the staff in the school to support them. We also
10 have what we call our Ambassador Principals who are
11 already doing this extremely well, and we are
12 connecting them with principals that have questions
13 about the implementation. Because we think that
14 principal to principal perspective can be extremely
15 helpful for schools. So we have a variety of ways
16 that we can support our principals. We--we are
17 continuing to develop more as we've gone through the
18 learning process. School Food has started doing
19 taste testing. They have come out and done
20 presentations, and provide opportunities to taste the
21 food at community district's town halls and PTA
22 meetings. So that's helps the parents understand
23 what's being served, and that helps with the
24 acceptance of the program as well. So lots that we

2 are trying to do. We--we can always continue to do
3 more, and we are very appreciative of suggestions.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Yeah, I'll be--I
5 think guidance or recommendations would be helpful
6 because you just explained how some schools implement
7 it one way, which might--sounds good, and other
8 schools have different ideas.

9 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Uh-huh.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I think that if
11 schools could share best prac--I know this is DOE
12 term of shared best practices, and--but I'm not sure
13 if all schools are getting--getting that information.
14 And I think that it also--one of the things I've
15 learned very quickly is that if it's really not in
16 writing it becomes--it gets very messy because
17 different--the application gets--varies. So I--I
18 think that providing schools crystal clear clarity,
19 something with the Chancellor's name on it that says
20 these are recommendations. This is guidance from the
21 DOE and how best to implement this program. So that
22 when someone comes in-- I mean, look, I--I was taught
23 that everything is observable except for lunch. I
24 went to school to get my administration license, and
25 if this is--becomes now observable--

2 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: [interposing]

3 Uh-huh.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: --I think
5 educators and people in the building want to make
6 sure that they're following the rules, but they--they
7 have a right to know what the rules are. So this is
8 the old--UFT delegate in me right now. A question
9 about the--the quality of the food and the
10 availability. It is my understanding that in the
11 prior administration, and this might have continued
12 with this administration, there was a partnership
13 with Whole Foods and the DOE in the past about
14 certain schools getting certain salad bars or food
15 from Whole Foods. Is that correct? Can you speak to
16 that?

17 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Yeah, there--yeah, there
18 was program several years where they donated some
19 money that we spent on some salad bars.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: And that money
21 has run out? Is that--that's not being used any
22 more?

23 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Yeah, it was a
24 one-time grant just to--to buy some salad bars.

25 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Right.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Because the
3 question I have is that you mentioned you have these
4 salad bars and these healthy food options across. Do
5 they all look the same, or do certain schools have
6 nicer salad bars and nicer option that they--than
7 others?

8 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: There's a difference
9 between salad bars of a high school level--

10 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: [interposing]
11 Right.

12 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: --and at the lower
13 school level, which really sometimes in the size of
14 the salad bar is 36 inches versus 30, 31 inches. At
15 the high school level you more of compound salads,
16 corn confetti salad, tomato and onion salad in a--in
17 a vinaigrette. At the elementary school level it
18 tends to be things are isolated. You'll have
19 carrots, you'll have cucumbers, you'll have tomatoes
20 separately. A lot of those kids don't like those
21 foods to touch. The foods should be relatively
22 uniform across the salad bars. There's an
23 opportunity for some of our staff to add their own
24 particular designs to it, but it should be relatively
25 uniform across--across our--our system.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Because one--one
3 concern I've heard from some advocates and some
4 parents is that some--some of our public schools
5 offer for example organic milk and organic food
6 options and some don't. Do any of our schools offer
7 organic milk or food products?

8 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: We have some organic
9 yogurt that we serve. We can't afford it all the
10 time, that we have, but that's--

11 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: [interposing]
12 Where do you serve that?

13 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: In every school. So
14 when it's on the menu, it's across every school.
15 It's not one particular school or another particular
16 school. That I could tell you doesn't happen. We
17 have very, very limited access to that because of the
18 expense, but like I said, we do have a yogurt option
19 that we bring out every now and then, and that's
20 across all of our schools.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Yes.

22 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: If I could just--
23 --as Eric was describing some of the compound salads
24 and the high school menu, I'd like to put in a plug.
25 School Food did a top chef competition, and one of

2 the winning dishes was a kale and strawberry salad in
3 balsamic vinaigrette. It's delicious. We're happy
4 to share the recipe.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Well, I'll--I'll
6 tell you when I visited one of the high schools in my
7 district John Dooley, they greeted me with a student
8 made apple tart, which was pretty good as well. So,
9 I--I do agree. I just want to make sure, though,
10 that we are equitably distributing these types of
11 healthy food options because-- And the question I
12 had is that if a school has let's say for example a
13 very active PTA base, and they could raise private,
14 you know, private dollars, could they supplement the
15 school's food options, and provide those children and
16 that school with, you know, organic more fancier
17 meals in other schools? I'm just asking that
18 question.

19 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: No, we--we--our kitchens
20 are very much controlled from a point of view of
21 safety, but also from an equity point of view. So we
22 don't allow that. In the past, I could say before we
23 moved to the compostable plate, we did allow that for
24 the plate. There were some districts and some
25 schools, I should say, that did pay the difference to

2 allow for compostable. But, what we did with the
3 help of Urban School for Alliance is we put out a
4 very large bid for compostable plates. And we moved
5 from a polystyrene tray to a round compostable plate,
6 which was a really big and important addition to our
7 food service because the meal was literally built
8 from the plate up. But yeah, the equity issue is
9 very, very important to us, and we make sure that
10 there's a level playing field for all of our schools.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: So, just to be
12 clear, just so I'm clear, so no school offers organic
13 milk or organic food--meals items right now?

14 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: If it's not coming
15 through us and they're doing it, it's--I would say
16 it's a bit rogue. So I'd like to know what school
17 that is, yeah.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Okay, just--

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: [interposing] We're
20 going to move on.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Yeah, yeah, I
22 just--I just want to--I thank--I thank the chair.
23 Just one quick thing in the end is that I had a bill,
24 a resolution as well for some parents who have
25 children who can't have gluten. I don't know what

2 types of accommodations can be made for some of these
3 families that do have, you know, Celiac and certain
4 types of conditions, and I think that, you know, we
5 just need to kind of work together making sure that
6 we meet the needs of all of our kids. And I thank
7 the Chair for his time today.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you and I go
9 along with that because my mother has Celiac's too.
10 So, yes. All right, we're going to do a three-minute
11 round for the second round here now. Council Member--
12 -Council Member Barron first, Council Member Kallos,
13 and Council Member Levin.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Mr.
15 Chair. I want to thank the panel for coming. You
16 may know that I spent 36 years with the Board of
17 Education, and many of those years about--I guess
18 about 25 of them were in the classroom. And when I
19 taught--I think one of the last years that I was
20 teaching 8th grade, I realized that many of my
21 children were hungry. They were coming to school
22 hungry, and we decided that every other Friday we
23 would have breakfast in the classroom. And I would
24 bring my waffle iron and I would bring my hot skillet
25 plate, and we would fix the breakfast in the

2 classroom, and it was a collaborative effort.
3 Children early on those Fridays, even those students
4 who often times were late, they would come early
5 because they were involved. And as my colleague has
6 said a very important time for socialization. So,
7 they actually enjoyed it. We tried to do the healthy
8 meals, you know, the soup to go along with that, and
9 the healthy cereals, the whole grain cereals as well.
10 The oatmeal didn't go over well. So we didn't do
11 much of that. But it does take time. It is time
12 consuming and in--in the testimony that we have here
13 from the United Federation of Teachers it brings to
14 bear a point that I was not aware of. It said that
15 schools participating in the Breakfast in the
16 Classroom program have lost the ability to provide
17 hot breakfasts to the children who are dropped off at
18 school early. That's because schools in the program
19 are no longer allowed to serve hot meals in the
20 cafeteria before the students are allowed up to the
21 classrooms. Is that accurate?

22 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: So, yes, we
23 discuss this earlier.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I'm sorry, I
25 didn't understand. (sic)

2 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: In the buildings
3 that--where we are rolling out this program, we've
4 had to make an either/or choice. And, that that was
5 one of the main considerations before we implemented
6 the Breakfast in the Classroom program in these
7 buildings that we can't have both breakfast in the
8 cafeteria before the bell, and also Breakfast in the
9 Classroom after. So we do have a pilot where we are
10 working on some hot menu items that would be able to
11 be served in the classroom, and we're hoping to
12 recess that--how that's going so that we can
13 incorporate more hot food in the Breakfast in the
14 Classroom program as well

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I think that's
16 important especially during the colder months. You
17 know, when it's chilly outside, and children are
18 trudging through the snow to get to school that they
19 do have a hot meal. Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: One thing that was
21 said earlier as well was that that--even with the
22 cold breakfast option, it's doubled the numbers of
23 kids who are actually getting the food. So there's a
24 give and take in that situation as well. So, we were
25 concerned about that.

2 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Yeah, definitely.

3 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Council Member
4 Kallos.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you very
6 much. I was--I'm surprised by how interested
7 everyone is on this. This is a huge topic. I want
8 to again thank our co-prime on this legislation,
9 Steve Levin. Some key things that I just want to
10 highlight is first you're giving great answers to the
11 questions. Two of my colleagues just told me they
12 will sign onto the bill based on your responses. I'm
13 hoping everyone on this committee will sign on as a
14 sponsor. I think a key piece is by nature of our
15 jobs. So you've rolled it out to 141 elementary
16 schools. We've heard from two members that at least
17 two schools in the city have complained, but we
18 haven't heard from the other 139 about how great it
19 is. If it is possible for the Office of School Food
20 to really activate the schools, and get some of the
21 77,000 children who are now eating healthy meals to
22 just reach out and let us know. So that we--we have
23 those examples, and then also one of the things I
24 learned from my own district is if you're able to get
25 the principals who have engaged in it, to be

2 ambassadors to the other schools, that would make a
3 lot of difference, and sharing the best practices and
4 toolkits with the City Council Members. Would that
5 be something you'd be open to doing?

6 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Uh-huh.

7 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Huh-huh.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: And for the
9 schools that--for the members who are having
10 difficulties with certain schools or principals or
11 even teachers is it possible--would you--would you be
12 willing to with a promise of no retribution or
13 anything else, come and address some of the problems,
14 and see what best practices they can use?

15 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Of course.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Great. One thing
17 that I think we've noticed, whether it's--it's
18 breakfast or lunch is just to focus on the
19 elementary, but we--we live in a world where in spite
20 of everything kids get bullied, and the older they
21 get, the more the bullying tends to happen. A lot of
22 these efforts are around well you don't want to be
23 one of the poor kids. So when I went to high school,
24 you didn't want to be one of the poor kids who had to
25 show up early to school so you could go to breakfast.

2 And so this is one of those places where the stigma
3 disappears and everyone gets to eat breakfast.
4 Similarly for lunch nobody wanted to be the poor kid
5 who had to eat lunch on the free or reduced lunch
6 ticket. So, that there was a class distinction
7 between the kids who can afford to buy their meal
8 versus the kids could not. Similarly, for supper are
9 you the poor kid who has to stay after and get made
10 fun of for that, or are you the kid who gets to go
11 home and have pizza with the rest of the kids on the
12 way home. Can we expand these from elementary to
13 early childhood, middle school, junior high school
14 and high school?

15 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Yes, so
16 philosophically we are all equally committed to how
17 do we ensured that all of our students eat and
18 particularly our students who may not have
19 alternatives for getting the meals and the nutrition
20 that they have. You know, expansion to beyond--of
21 any of these programs is a funding question. I mean
22 we do have to work through the funding priorities.
23 There are real costs here. We are looking forward to
24 continuing to assess the success of these programs.

2 [bell] but ultimately, this also does require
3 resources.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: If you can get
5 back to us with the funding that the City would need
6 to outlay and the federal reimbursement that would
7 great. Thank you Chair Dromm.

8 CHAIRPERSON EUGENE: Thank you and last,
9 but definitely not least Council Member Levin.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, Chair
11 Dromm. I just have a quick statement following up on
12 some of the points that were raised before around
13 routine. I think that one thing that we have seen
14 from other cities have expanded this, and also for
15 schools that are doing it here in New York is that
16 this becomes part of the routine.

17 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Okay.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: And so while it
19 might be disruptive for, you know, the first few
20 weeks or maybe even the first few months, it might
21 feel disruptive that eventually it does become part
22 of that school's routine. And it's my firm believe
23 that in a year or two, you know, those schools will
24 look back and say, you know, it was really that big
25 of a, you know, a hurdle, and--and it's actually

2 become part of their daily routine. So I just wanted
3 to put that on the record. Thanks.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. Well, thank
5 you very much. It's clear that you are committed to
6 this program and we look forward to hearing more in
7 the future about its implementation, and hopefully
8 expanding it in future years as well. So I want to
9 thank you for coming in, and I appreciate your time
10 and effort. Thank you very much.

11 DEPUTY CHANCELLOR ROSE: Thank you very
12 much.

13 ERIC GOLDSTEIN: Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: [background comments,
15 pause]. Okay, our next panel is Shulamit Warren on
16 behalf of Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer.
17 Janet Poppendieck, CUNY School of Public Health; Liz
18 Accles, Community Food Advocates, and David Young,
19 the City Harvest. [pause] Okay, this committee will
20 be swearing everybody in. So I'm going to ask you to
21 raise your right hand. Do you solemnly swear or
22 affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth, and
23 nothing but the truth and to answer council member's
24 questions honestly?

25 PANEL MEMBERS: (in unison) I do.

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you and who
3 would like to begin? Liz. [pause]

4 LIZ ACCLES: Liz Accles, Executive
5 Director Community Food Advocates. Thank you,
6 Councilman Dromm, Councilman Kallos and members of
7 the committee. I appreciate the opportunity to
8 testify today about Intro 773. I'm going to keep it
9 brief. Just to say for us an organization what is
10 promising about this bill is the attention and the
11 kind of what's built up over the last few years in
12 attention and interest from the Council. From the
13 Public Advocate as well as from the Mayor's Office on
14 the importance of school food, and making sure that
15 children are participating and trying to maximize
16 that participation. I--in my written testimony
17 you'll see a few suggestions both the strength of the
18 bill and a few suggestions for changes. I don't need
19 to go into the details here other than to say we're
20 very supportive of the notion of having in their
21 reports on steps that the Department of Education is
22 specifically taking to increase participation in the
23 breakfast program, and other special initiatives.
24 And the reports on--although earlier discussed the
25 complications of some breaking down on how reports on

2 breakfast participation depending on the type
3 breakfast. We think that being able to break it down
4 by Breakfast After the Bell is from other breakfast
5 participation is helpful as we've learned in--as it
6 relates to lunch in being able to identify what's
7 working, what are the barriers and what are best
8 practices. Again, some of the--the recommended
9 changes related to some wording just making sure that
10 the--it's not the number of meals, but the number of
11 children meals per day are--because that's--you can--
12 as it relates to participation that's an important
13 thing when you're getting these numbers. And, as
14 mentioned earlier that the menus are available on
15 line. So, two other quick things. Am I okay with
16 time? In terms of the salad bars, there are salad
17 bars in most of the schools. Some of them are quite
18 amazing, some of the less so. I think there are a
19 lot of variables. So just capturing the number of
20 salad bars is--we can get those numbers and that's
21 important but the--the quality and freshness in
22 ingredients and that may be a staffing issue along
23 with other--other issues. Just for consideration
24 measuring participation in the after school lunch and
25 dinner programs, those--some of those programs are

2 not run by the Department of Education. School Food
3 provides the food, but that actually--what's the
4 word? Delivering it.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: It would be DYCD?

6 LIZ ACCLES: I think it's a mix. I don't
7 know the exact answer to that question, but I think
8 it's a little bit more complicated, and you don't--

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: [interposing] If
10 you can get--if you can get us that answer.

11 LIZ ACCLES: Yeah, DYCD and, you know,
12 there are bunch of non-profits running after school
13 programs, too. So I don't know the details, but
14 that's just something to be mindful of. Um, also to
15 our knowledge the food program is not disaggregated
16 by race or ethnicity. So, I'm going to say that's--
17 that's where we are. Since we're in front of you,
18 and I know we're not talking about lunch today,
19 although it's come up a bunch of times. I'm just
20 going to say a few things. I know there's a
21 technical thing with another bill. So I--I--but just
22 to say information that we're interested in having is
23 reports on initiatives to increase participation in
24 schools with community eligibility provision. That's
25 something we have not been able to get, and reports

2 on impact, if any, on Title 1 allocations among
3 schools in the middle schools. I will also just take
4 one second--this is not the subject of the hearing--
5 to say that within the testimony we've added two--two
6 pages of analysis about benefits and costs of
7 expanding universal school lunch to all students,
8 and--as well as a Q&A about Title 1 issues. So I
9 thank you for the opportunity to speak today.

10 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. Shulamit.

11 SHULAMIT WARREN: My name is Shulamit
12 Warren. I'm the Director Policy for Manhattan
13 Borough President Gale Brewer, and I'll be delivering
14 remarks on her behalf. My name is Gale A. Brewer,
15 and I'm the Manhattan Borough President. Thank you
16 to Chair Dromm and to the members of the Committee on
17 Education for the opportunity to testify. Today, I
18 would like to voice my support of Intro 773-A, which
19 would require the New York City Department of
20 Education to submit an annual report to the Speaker
21 of City Council regarding the provision of free meals
22 to public schools. According Feeding America's map
23 for meal gap in a 2015 study, 15.3% of New York
24 County population of 1.6 million struggle with food
25 insecurity. With 71% living below the 200% poverty

2 line, a majority of Manhattanites are likely eligible
3 for federal nutrition assistance including free
4 school meals. The Department of Education is making
5 real strides in improving the school food experience,
6 and I know they had to leave a little earlier, but I
7 think Barbara Turk and Molly Hartman from the Mayor's
8 Office of Food Policy really deserve to share in some
9 of that credit as well. I'm advocate of increased
10 agency procurement of local resource products. I'm
11 especially a big fan of New York Thursdays, which
12 highlights New York City produce and dairy. In
13 addition, the Council and Administration deserves
14 much credit for funding the expansion of the
15 Universal School Meal Program in middle schools.
16 Simply put, when children are hungry, they cannot
17 learn. USM is registered (sic) to assess the
18 increasing numbers of children eating at school, and
19 it's essential, and it's essential for New York City
20 to expand this program in all schools to narrow the
21 meal gap that persists throughout the five boroughs.
22 As a sponsor of the city's Open Data Law, I'm a firm
23 believer in the importance of data transparency and
24 the essential role that data plays in helping
25 electives, academics, advocates and stakeholders in

2 shaping informed and engaged public policy. The
3 report mandated in Intro 773-A would provide insight
4 in to the success for bridging food access as well as
5 identifying the challenges left over time. I would
6 like to recommend the be bill be amended to also
7 include participation in the Summer Food Service
8 Program. While the summers meal sites are not
9 exclusively located in school buildings, the program
10 is operated for the DOE, and therefore, shouldn't be
11 a hardship to also include information for the sites
12 located NYCHA developments, parks, recreation
13 centers, and pools, and also the mobile units.
14 Related I request that the Education Committee
15 consider Intro 461 of 2014, which I am proud to
16 introduce with my friend and colleague Council Member
17 Jimmy Vacca. This bill will require the New York
18 City Department of Education to widely publicize
19 summer meals site information by June 1st of each
20 year. Many of the advocates here today who ware
21 tireless in their efforts will tell you that one of
22 the main reasons parents routinely identify for not
23 participating in the completely free summer meal
24 program is that they don't where to go with their
25 children. For the past two years, my office has

2 designed and distributed the colorful flyers with
3 specific meal site information. for each Manhattan
4 community school district. You will find examples of
5 these attached to the testimony. These flyers are in
6 English, Spanish, Chinese and Arabic were then
7 distributed to schools, libraries, parks, NYCHA
8 developments and senior centers from my staff and
9 volunteers and also in partnership with many of the
10 advocacy groups that are here today [bell] while
11 school is still in session. Two years ago, the DOE
12 released this information during the first week of
13 June, but subsequently, the information was released
14 frankly speaking too little and too late. Thank you
15 for the opportunity to testify before you today.

16 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, Janet.

17 JAN POPPENDIECK: Okay. I'm Jan
18 Poppendieck and I'm here this afternoon on behalf of
19 the CUNY School of Public Health. [background
20 comments] Thank you. Okay. Now, I have the mic,
21 and I'm just say for the record that I am the author
22 of *Free for All: Fixing School Food in America*. You
23 have my written testimony. So now I'm just going to
24 tell you what's in there, and the first point I want
25 to make is that participation is indeed the key to

2 the success of school food programs. It's key to the
3 financial integrity because the more kids who
4 participate, the lower the unit cost of delivering
5 the meal, and the more wiggle room we have to invest
6 in healthier and better food. But, of course, it's
7 also key from the perspective of the child because
8 not only does school food deliver healthy meals, but
9 it also displaces the unhealthy foods that many of
10 our kids are surrounded with and go through a
11 gauntlet of unhealthy foods on their way to school.
12 So participation is indeed key and so, of course, it
13 makes sense to measure it and to report it. In that
14 reporting I understand that there was an issue of
15 Council protocol that meant that lunch got excluded
16 from the discussion of or reporting on this. But
17 clearly lunch is also crucial. Kids are in school
18 during the during the day through a long period.
19 They need to eat lunch. We need to know how they're
20 doing, and we need to know how well the initiatives
21 to increase participation in lunch are--are faring.
22 Some of the data that is asked for in the--the bill,
23 is already available and I think a number of people
24 have pointed that out, and I trust you are--are
25 dealing with that. So our advice is just proceed

2 with caution in terms of reporting requirements. We
3 support the bill, but we think you need to--to be
4 careful about the burden that's imposed. But for us
5 the most useful part of this bill would be the
6 requirement that the participation rate be made
7 readily available at the school level, the
8 neighborhood you mentioned. In the bill it says the
9 Council District level or the school district level,
10 community districts they might be in. (sic) But, but
11 to me this data--this data exists, but it's not easy
12 to tease about. We have just been just been doing
13 some documentation of the changing food scape of East
14 Harlem, and we found it very difficult to get the
15 data at that level. Getting--making data available,
16 readily available at the individual school level, and
17 at the neighborhood level allows community groups to
18 take an interest in participation in the schools, to
19 assess how their school is doing based with the other
20 schools. And so, it really is an empowerment. We
21 are also very interested in the part of the bill that
22 asks for--for reporting by DOE on the special
23 initiatives what the plans [bell] are for--for
24 encouraging participation. With the salad bar data
25 that you're asking for, we wanted to proposed that

2 you think about the use of documentary photographs.
3 There's been a lot of interesting public health
4 research done lately with using photographs in
5 schools with research. And finally, we wanted to
6 suggest that another approach. It's two metrics that
7 might have a more profound effect would be to add
8 participation in the School Food Programs to the
9 metrics on which principles are evaluated. You know,
10 the--what measures you get--get is what gets done.
11 It's certainly part underlies the bill, but let's try
12 and hold principals accountable for--for
13 participation in their schools. I, too, want to
14 commend the sponsors of this bill and this committee
15 for finally making school food part of school in New
16 York City. It's really very gratifying to see the
17 Council dealing with it.

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you, and now
19 Mr. David Young.

20 DAVID YOUNG: Good afternoon. Thank you,
21 Chairperson Dromm and Council Member Kallos. Thank
22 you for this. I'm going to be brief because most of
23 what I have in my written testimony you can see are
24 many of the points that were brought up by your
25 colleagues and--and my peers here. The things that

2 are really coming up for me, of course, the lunch
3 issue, and thinking about what it takes for lunch,
4 the increases in lunch participation to matter. I
5 know that we heard from the Administration last year
6 that there were mixed results around the increase. I
7 think we heard today it was 6.5% of an increase in
8 stand-alone middle school lunch through a Universal
9 Program increasing the participation. We heard today
10 that double the participation in Breakfast in the
11 Classroom. So maybe it takes, you know, or it takes
12 double the amount was to get it to be impressive.
13 That's one thing to think about as we think about
14 lunch and moving forward. The other is how is the
15 data going to be collected? That's something that
16 people have brought up here. Is this going to be on
17 the teacher? Is it going to be on the principal, or
18 other people within the school who already have a--a
19 large educational piece to their--their day,
20 behavior, et cetera. How is this data going to be
21 collected? And the other piece is to think about the
22 Food Metrics Report. I don't know if you saw the
23 most recent one. It had some great graphical
24 displays, but this--many of the things--the--the
25 intent and the--the aspects of this bill could be

2 folded into that, and it could an opportunity to see
3 many of the information that's in there side-by-side
4 with more detailed school food data. And the last
5 thing that I--that I want to say is that the--the
6 questions in the bill around messaging, strategies
7 for communication with parents, teachers, advocates,
8 et cetera for increasing participation in these
9 programs I think is really important. What is DOE
10 doing around this? And if--if it's double from
11 breakfast, what do we need to do to have it double in
12 Universal Free School Lunch in middle schools? Thank
13 you.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well, thank you.
15 Thank you to all of the members of the panel. I,
16 too, have some concerns about the data collection.
17 There was a day when I was teaching when teachers had
18 to collect and count the lunch money. Right? Then
19 we go that taken care of, and then it was the aids I
20 guess who in the building who would used to have to
21 count lunch money, you know, and it was really labor
22 intensive process. But I couldn't imagine that there
23 would be a system in the classrooms especially in
24 elementary schools where you could have even children
25 check off as they take a lunch or something like

2 that. And then that could be transferred down to an
3 aid who is--was doing the counting in the morning
4 anyway as the kids would come in to accept their
5 breakfast in--in the cafeteria. So I think there are
6 some creative ways that that could be done without
7 really forcing teachers to take extra time to do that
8 data collection. So you have any statements? (sic)

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you for the
10 Beacon piece about making sure. I think DYCD
11 administers the funding to the Beacons, which means
12 we will need to need to amend this to make that
13 whichever block grant is providing the funding for
14 after--for the program that runs the after school
15 meals will be required to do that. So thank you.
16 You hinted at something, freshness, which is
17 something I hadn't figure out how to really measure
18 until just now, and looking at the New York Post
19 articles and items like that, would you support a--a
20 requirement for including the--the expiration dates
21 on some of the ingredients being served? Is there
22 another measure for when we're dealing with farm to
23 table, where those expiration dates fall into quality
24 and freshness--freshness?

2 LIZ ACCLES: [off mic] I mean [on mic]
3 I'll just start and say that I mean I think that
4 probably the biggest challenge, you know, when we
5 talk about school lunch and the--where they- you know
6 people refer to it as the healthiness. It's mostly
7 about appeal. So, you now, there are very strict
8 health requirements that need to be met, and I--I
9 actually don't--I would hazard to guess--I'm not
10 there in the cafeterias knowing this that we're not
11 talking about expiration dates. I think it's--I
12 don't know if it's what Jan is getting at. I--I mean
13 that's interesting.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: [interposing]
15 That's my next question.

16 LIZ ACCLES: An interesting concept is
17 that certain things you can capture that was
18 appealing and not another--others not. I mean, you
19 know, school food does meet very stringent standards
20 both health and nutrition requirements. So, it's
21 really separating those pieces out because they--they
22 do meet those requirements, but I think it may--I
23 don't know--take other kinds of creative ways of
24 looking at that.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Okay, I--I know
3 that there reports about certain foods being--
4 pancakes being expired when they were being served,
5 and having an idea where we are with expiration dates
6 I think might be helpful. And then with photographs
7 of--of food, I--I--it sounds interesting. I'm just
8 curious because you are the advocate. So, does mean
9 you're sitting there multiply times 1,400 schools
10 looking at 1,400 photos of 1,400 salad bars going
11 through 365 days. So that's 365,000--Sorry--

12 LIZ ACCLES: [laughs] It's all right, do
13 it.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: --it's--it's--
15 it's half a million pictures you have to look for--
16 through in doing a study. Is that something that
17 would actually be valuable to you?

18 LIZ ACCLES: No. [laughter] All right,
19 but what I think I was trying to get at is that there
20 were lists of what's served every day. You--that
21 would also create a data fog. When I started to
22 think about the photographs, I was really trying to
23 think of whether there's something we can do to give
24 the School Food personnel an incentive to try a

2 little harder to make the salad bars fresh and
3 appealing.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: [interposing] Uh-
5 huh.

6 LIZ ACCLES: Despite what--what Mr.
7 Goldstein said earlier today, I, too, had the strong
8 impression that salad bar quality appealing this
9 really varies from location to location, and I think
10 it varies depending on whether there's a champion
11 there. And so, can we--can we propagate champions?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: And I think that
13 was clear from the council members, and from School
14 Food, and my question for Shulamit Warren for Gale
15 Brewer is do you believe that this legislation would
16 benefit from a requirement that the report be posted
17 in Open Data format?

18 SHULAMIT WARREN: Yes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you.

20 [pause]

21 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much,
22 and thank you to the panel. We appreciate you coming
23 in. Thank you.

24 DAVID YOUNG: Thank you.

25

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay, our next panel
3 is Neuberg. I mean Joel Berg. Excuse me, the New
4 York City Coalition Against Hunger; Ariel Savransky
5 from Citizens Committee for Children; Pamela Stewart,
6 Citywide Council on Special Education; and Kelly
7 Moltzen from the Bronx Health Reach Institute Family
8 Health--of Family Health. [pause]

9 JOEL BERG: Thank you, Mr. Chair. It's
10 an honor to testify before this--

11 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: [interposing] I have
12 to swear you in. I'm sorry.

13 JOEL BERG: I'm sorry.

14 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Would all raise your
15 right hand. Do you solemnly swear or affirm to tell
16 the whole truth, and nothing but the truth and
17 answer council member questions honestly?

18 JOEL BERG: Yes.

19 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Okay. Thank you.
20 Thank you, Joel. Go ahead.

21 JOEL BERG: I am Joel Berg, Executive
22 Director of the New York City Coalition Against
23 Hunger. I want to say it's an honor to testify
24 before the star of In Jackson Heights, which I sat
25 through the entire thing, and thank you, Chairman.

2 Thank you Councilman Kallos, and Levin for your
3 unwavering support of in-classroom breakfast. I just
4 wan to return to the basics. We--we support the
5 bill. We agree we've made the technical suggestions
6 made by our colleagues. Wee hope the Council can
7 work out an understanding with the city, but I think
8 let's get back to the basics. There are more than
9 400,000 children in this city without enough food.
10 One in five children in New York City are facing
11 hunger. So with all due respect, for some
12 administrators being worried about their schedules
13 changing or routine changing, I hope we can focus on
14 what really matters. It's almost like I'm sitting
15 here in the middle of a hurricane and some, you know,
16 supervisors with a response are worried that their
17 boots are worried that their boots are getting wet.
18 You know, I think it's absolutely vital for the DOE
19 to do a better job communicating with the unions and
20 the workers, and--and parents to get the word out to
21 make sure that the workers are fairly compensated. I
22 hope the City makes good on its promise to move at
23 least up to \$15 an hour rapidly. It's important that
24 the work hours fit in, that if they need to hire more
25 people they do not just add on hours to the existing

2 employees. If some employees have a physical
3 difficulty getting up to a second or third or fourth
4 floor, the City has got to accommodate that. That
5 being said, is this program reducing hunger? Yes. I
6 visited a school in the Bronx a few weeks ago that
7 used serve 200 kids a day, PS 81. Now, it's serving
8 500. What DOE said is true. It's doubled. At that
9 one school, they're going to serve 50,000 more meals
10 a day to hungry kids and low-income kids than they
11 were before. I actually support the compromise of--
12 of cold meals. I grew up eating cold meals. There
13 was no nutritional difference, but there's the
14 difference between the feelings that something is
15 warm versus not eating at all. And even the kids who
16 are eating, they're eating at the bodega spending
17 scarce of their family dollars at the bodega on the
18 way there. This is much better nutritionally.
19 Change is difficult, but the exact same complaints
20 were raised in Houston. They were raised in L.A.
21 They were raised in Chicago when this happened, and
22 it worked. This is smart public policy. This is
23 good educational policy. A school I visited used to
24 have 55 kids coming to school late. Now, it's five
25 kids--five kids a day coming. This makes so much

2 sense and, you know-- As you know, Mr. Chair, we've
3 been coming here complaining for years that the city
4 hasn't been doing this, and our organization forum
5 is going to have the City's back when they're finally
6 doing the right thing. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Well, I remember
8 Joel, the previous administration saying that it was
9 going to contribute to obesity.

10 JOEL BERG: Well, the previous mayor and
11 what I'm interested to see really its machinations,
12 but he basically didn't believe there was hunger in
13 New York City and the people around him didn't know
14 like there was hunger in New York City. And,
15 therefore, they made the conclusion the one and only
16 problem is--is obesity, and they just never
17 understood that hunger and obesity are flip sides of
18 the same malnutrition point. And so, you know, before
19 this move, understand we were dead last or second to
20 last out of all big cities in the United States.
21 I've said before losing to Chicago or Philadelphia in
22 basketball is horrible enough, but feeding them--
23 losing them in feeding our hungry kids is
24 unacceptable. So again, I thank the Council for
25 their leadership.

2 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much.
3 Next please.

4 PAM STEWART: Hi. My name is Pam
5 Stewart. I am Co-President of the Citywide Council
6 on Special Education, but I'm also a mom of seven.
7 And I want to read you something that I think is very
8 timely. *The function of education is teach one to*
9 *think intensely and to think critically.*
10 *Intelligence plus character that is the goal of true*
11 *education.* That came from Martin Luther King. We
12 just celebrated his birthday. Dr. King's hope and
13 desire is for every parent, educator and child to
14 have access to education and to be able utilize it,
15 and it's very difficult when you have children who
16 are not getting three meals a day. Now, I--I came
17 here to discuss free school lunch, and the reason
18 that I'm--I'm going to stick to that topic right now
19 I think breakfast is great, and I think Breakfast in
20 the Classroom is awesome. But I'm going to speak--
21 I'm going to speak to free lunch because when I look
22 at the stats that I provided in front of you, and I
23 look at Brooklyn, where about 85% of the parent--
24 people in Brooklyn, residents live in multi-unit
25 structures, and the median income is \$46,000

2 approximately, and they are paying about \$32,000
3 approximately in rent every year. That leaves them
4 with about \$13,000 a year. That's about \$1,129.
5 Now, when you look into the fact that they have other
6 expenses, and this doesn't include the payroll taxes,
7 the insurance that are taken out of the pay checks,
8 food, clothing, cleaning expenses, transportation,
9 utilities. And then you tackle on that the parents
10 have to pay for school lunch as well, and if they
11 can't pay they have to figure out some other way for
12 their children to go to lunch. Go to the corner
13 store and get them a bag of potato chips, or
14 something that isn't really fundamental for them to
15 eat in class, you know, or on the side. I--I think
16 there's a problem with that, and in those schools
17 where they do feed the children, but the parents
18 can't pay, they have to deal with the bill that they
19 can't pay. Every month it comes to them, and the
20 embarrassment of going to the school is enough, and--
21 and I mean in order to qualify for free lunch, you
22 have to be making under \$31,000 based off of the
23 website that I saw on the DOE. So, I'm urging
24 everyone to consider free school lunch because our
25 parents in the city really need the extra break, and

2 that's all I have to say on that matter. My
3 information is below. I hope you consider that.

4 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you. We've been
5 strong advocates of free school lunch for everybody.
6 We're not at that point yet, but we did put a lot
7 into getting free school lunch for most middle
8 schoolers. We then would like to see it across the
9 board for all middle schoolers. So we stand in
10 support for much of what it is that you said. Thank
11 you. Next please.

12 ARIEL SAVRANSKY: Good afternoon. My
13 name is Ariel Savransky, and I am the Policy
14 Associate for Food and Economic Security at the
15 Citizens Committee for Children of New York. Thank
16 you, Chair Dromm and the members of the Council
17 Committee on Education for holding today's hearing.
18 Thank you Council Member Kallos and the co-sponsors
19 of this bill. We are grateful for the Council's
20 ongoing efforts to increase participation in school
21 meals, which are vital in the fight against childhood
22 hunger and obesity, and we are very supportive of the
23 goal of this bill as well. We echo some of my
24 colleague's concerns in terms of the average daily
25 number of students being a more useful metric because

2 that will indicate trends, and we'll be able to use
3 that to increase participation in schools. We're
4 also echoing their concerns really that the data
5 that's already publicly available. So maybe think
6 about removing some of the requirements of this bill
7 so that we can really focus on it with the goal of
8 increasing participation as opposed to some of the
9 other metrics that are going to be required right
10 now. There is also a lot of opportunity to work on
11 making meals, in fact, more accessible as well as
12 healthier and more appealing, and this has been a
13 topic that's come up throughout the previous panels
14 as well. It's clear that the DOE is doing a lot to
15 ensure that the Breakfast After the Bell program is
16 being rolled out successfully, and really working
17 with individual schools to make sure that kids are
18 really getting breakfast. But we recommend that we
19 also consider expanding the program to--to middle
20 schools and high schools, and they're also--it's also
21 important that they eat breakfast. In terms of salad
22 bars, we know that there's been a lot of work done to
23 increase the quality of school food, but we think
24 that there really needs to be a lot more attention
25 paid to the appeal of school food. As was mentioned

2 before, it's clear that there's big discrepancies
3 between different schools, and it's important that we
4 address those. In terms of lunch, as you were saying
5 before, we were very disappointed that Universal
6 Lunch is not included in the preliminary budget, but
7 we look forward to continuing to partner with the
8 City Council. We know that this is a big priority of
9 yours to make lunch universally free for all New York
10 City public school students in this coming budget
11 cycle. And lastly, as was also mentioned before, we
12 urge the Council to work with DYCD and the CBOs that
13 provide after school programming and play an
14 important role in increasing participation in the
15 snack and supper programs, as the second fall of
16 fully the DOE. (sic) My testimony goes into a lot
17 more detail, but those are the highlights.

18 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Thank you very much.
19 Next, please.

20 KELLY MOLTZEN: Good afternoon. My name
21 is Kelly Moltzen. I'm the Program Manager for
22 Creating Healthy Schools and Communities Program at
23 Bronx Health Agency for Family Health. Thank you for
24 the opportunity to testify today before the council
25 members who are sponsoring, co-sponsoring this bill.

2 We know that the data linking student achievement and
3 health is linked. Students have higher cognitive
4 function, test grades and school attendance when
5 they're consuming breakfast, fruits, vegetables and a
6 variety of foods. We support getting data about the
7 participation in the meals because we believe that it
8 helps with understanding the consumption of the--of
9 the meals. However, in its current form, the bill
10 does not incorporate participation in school lunch
11 entrees beyond salad bars, communication about
12 nutrient of food quality with students, staff or
13 parents, and measure actual student consumption of
14 foods that are served. Because participation in
15 school meals does not actually measure food
16 consumption, participation may include students
17 accepting a food and then throwing that food in the
18 trash. It is our understanding the school meal
19 participation and consumption is related to student
20 perception of food quality. And in some cases when
21 the students are educated about nutrition, also
22 connected to student awareness of the food's
23 nutritional quality. Student ability to engage with
24 school food staff is not communicated well within
25 many schools. As a result, many students feel

2 powerless to enact change. This is true especially
3 in school buildings with satellite kitchens where
4 frozen foods are reheated and served to students
5 because the school lacks the kitchen facilities in
6 order for the staff to prepare more fresh foods.

7 Therefore, we suggest adding language about reporting
8 on the number of school food partnership meetings
9 that occur in each school. Which schools have
10 active--which schools have active school wellness
11 councils that meet on a monthly basis, and which
12 schools have full modified or satellite kitchens, and
13 which types of food preparation is able to be done in
14 each type of kitchen. Nutrition information and
15 opportunities for student involvement in many
16 preparation and taste testing needs to be offered in
17 order for the majority of students to accept many of
18 the fresher options, which could be made available to
19 them through the alternative menu, and other Farm to
20 School initiatives such as Garden to Cafe. Student
21 participation in a school meal program that includes
22 fresh and appealing food can increase student
23 consumption of much needed nutritious foods for the
24 students' health and ability to do well academically.
25 But data about meal preparation is not enough.

2 Students, staff and parents needed increased
3 opportunities for learning about nutrition
4 information, and providing input into the process of
5 collaborating with the Office of School Food. So
6 that fresher and more culturally diverse foods can be
7 provided in schools. Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Than you very much.
9 Council Member Kallos.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I want to thank
11 all he advocates for coming out for today's hearing.
12 With your feedback I hope to have a much better feel.
13 Joel, I just have to thank you for your passion. I--
14 I was--I--I shared your thoughts as I was listening
15 to folks' concerns, and thank you for bringing
16 numbers like the fact that it isn't even it just
17 double, but at PS 18 it actually went from 200 out of
18 600, one-third to 500 out of 600, which is absolutely
19 huge. Thank you all for your advocacy on this for
20 years and years before I even got onto the City
21 Council. So, thank you for that. I would like to
22 just say that I--I think that given some of the
23 questions and testimony, it is important that we add
24 the communications piece, and measuring what types of
25 communications are being done. And I guess two

2 questions that I have are just around food waste and
3 food quality. So, I think Hunter had touched on it a
4 little bit maybe suggesting some photos. Maybe if we
5 can get some specifics on maybe it's one photo once a
6 week. Maybe it's once--let's figure out how we
7 measure. So I guess does anyone on this panel have
8 an idea on how to measure quality, and also how to
9 measure waste? Is it just how many pounds were the
10 garbage bags when we threw them away that day or
11 something like that?

12 JOEL BERG: Well, I'll just say two
13 things about that, Council Member, and thank you for
14 your leadership. In fact, my first time I ever
15 testified before the New York City Council, I worked
16 for USDA, and there was a hearing on--on the food
17 waste. So one of the points I want to reiterate is
18 under federal law anything that the city can use it
19 is legally allowed to donate to the food bank or City
20 Harvest, et cetera. Some schools still have the
21 mistaken belief that they cannot. It's got to be
22 healthy food and not plate, you know, plate waste,
23 and I will actually to the--a slight correction.
24 There's only one entity in the country that serves
25 more meals than DOE each day and that's the Pentagon,

2 the Department of Defense. But it's massive
3 undertaking I'm sure. Given your time in politics
4 you've been to some large banquets at some very,
5 very, very nice banquet halls, and when were serving
6 500 people, it's really tough to have a really tasty
7 meal. And when you're serving 900,000 meals a day,
8 it's really tough. And to serve meals that are both
9 tasty, and with the USDA Guidelines and the City
10 Guidelines, and the kids will eat and are nutritious
11 is a very, very difficult balance. Because that's
12 the problems I focus a lot about that challenging,
13 you know, balance. And I think actually even in the
14 years when I don't think DOE was doing a great job on
15 access, they were doing a pretty good job on--on food
16 quality. It can also be improved. Perception is
17 important. Obviously, some parents perceived
18 something was like a Pop Tart, and DOE, you know,
19 obviously heatedly disputed that, and I do know the
20 meals are in compliance with the USDA Guidelines,
21 which are tougher because of federal law. And it's
22 important we don't let conservative in Congress undue
23 the improved Federal Guidelines. But I--I think it's
24 helpful to get more parents involved, and also to

2 have focus groups of kids because they are ultimately
3 the consumers.

4 ARIEL SAVRANSKY: I would just add I
5 think that the program where the DOE bring students
6 to facilities and really lets them taste test some of
7 the new meals that could be a really interesting
8 forum to get the students' opinions about the appeal
9 of school food. And also as was mentioned before, I
10 believe Jan said this from Hunter College that having
11 a champion in the school to really promote school
12 food is some important because the whole image of
13 school food is something that I think that I think
14 really needs to be kind of reformatted. So, if
15 there's a champion in the school that's really
16 helping to promote school food and the nutrition, and
17 I mean adding nutrition education. I think all those
18 factors really come together to kind of change the
19 image. So I think that's another important component
20 as well.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Who--who is that
22 champion? So I think for the Council members you've
23 heard that it's often the principals. Is it a
24 wellness coordinator or who--who fills that role that
25 already exists within the school system?

2 ARIEL SAVRANSKY: I mean I would think
3 the principal would really have to be on board to
4 really get that off the ground. I think the wellness
5 coordinator could probably have a really big impact
6 as well, but I mean I think as long as there's
7 someone in the school, I think that there is a
8 greater chance of success.

9 PAM STEWART: I think the champion could
10 also be someone from the Parent Association. Also,
11 students as well, and I think that tasting should be
12 in one borough. I think it should be in each borough
13 they have a tasting location to make it easier for
14 the parents and the students to participate in it.

15 KELLY MOLTZEN: My understanding of the
16 original School Food Partnership Program is that the
17 school food managers would have an opportunity to
18 speak directly to the students, and maybe there are
19 some other people like the parents that could
20 participate in the tasting in the school. That was
21 supposed to be the point of the School Food
22 Partnership meetings. I think because of
23 constraints, they wound up cutting down the number of
24 meetings that were happening, and like as of this
25 point I don't even know if they are like recorded how

2 many are actually happening in each school. And
3 that's why I included the recommendation about
4 reporting on the number of school food partnership
5 meetings. Because that really is the best way that--
6 I believe that you can get the student perception of
7 the appeal and quality of the food, which ultimately
8 is going to drive the participation. In terms of the
9 food waste, and I think that this also goes into just
10 the--the point about, you know, how there's a
11 sustainability coordinator that's designated in every
12 school. But there's not a wellness coordinator
13 that's designated. So perhaps part of the
14 sustainability coordinator's position could be
15 expanded to include something around food waste and
16 educating the kids about food and composting and, you
17 know, how it's better to eat the food than to throw
18 it out in the first place, and some other aspects of
19 food and nutrition. I mean ideally, it wouldn't all
20 be put on one person. That's why there's also the
21 Wellness Council that's supposed to be in place.
22 But, again, there's no requirement that each school
23 has a wellness council even though the whole point of
24 having wellness policies came about because it's for
25 all school districts that participate in the USDA

2 School Meal Program have to have a school wellness
3 policy in place. But that's not actually driven down
4 to the building level, which is why we see such
5 miscommunication about school food. So I think if
6 there was somebody designated at the school level to
7 focus on food issues, food and nutrition issues,
8 whether it's senior facility coordinator (sic) or
9 have a designated wellness coordinator that liaises
10 with the Office of School Food. I think that would
11 really help to decrease the miscommunication about
12 school food.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: A follow-up
14 question for NYCAH, for Joel, on food waste, do you
15 know if Food Bank NYC or City Harvest if we ended up
16 handing them a bunch of boxes of milk or juice or
17 uneaten apple slices that are still in their
18 packaging, would they do the--would they count that
19 for us or would they just take it and--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: [interposing] I
21 would--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I could also ask
23 Liz Kruger but I figured you might know.

24 ARIEL SAVRANSKY: Yeah, I--I would let
25 any organization speak for themselves, but in--in

2 general when, you know, a Feeding America affiliates
3 that such as City Harvest and the Food Bank pick up
4 food they have very detailed in counting and
5 accounting measures and much of that is often
6 automated. So I don't think that would be a problem.
7 In--in general the issue is is the volume of the food
8 in a particular location big enough for some entity
9 to--to--to pick up to send a truck across town for
10 five, you know, slices isn't going to work. However,
11 there's a way, and we'd be glad to help, you know,
12 for schools that have this regularly is--is donate
13 this to local soup kitchens or food pantries that are
14 closer. The problem is much of this by its nature
15 is--is seasonal. So just hypothetically, if schools
16 is in on a day where there's been a snowstorm and
17 there's less participation than there was, no one
18 planned that in advance. So it's really hard to
19 coordinate that, and that's when most of the waste is
20 when there are unexpected large numbers of absences.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: One last question
22 for Kelly Moltzen at Bronx Health Care REACH
23 Institute for Family Health. Do you have any
24 suggestions for how school food and nutrition
25 education could be linked together more effectively?

2 KELLY MOLTZEN: Yes, so I believe that we
3 can train teachers to incorporate food and nutrition
4 education into the various curricular subjects that
5 they teach. And the education could be linked to
6 school food menus. So students could connect their
7 learning to the food made available to them through
8 the School--School Meal Program. Also, school lunch
9 aids could be trained to encourage students to eat a
10 wider variety of fresh food, and information about
11 nutrition and ways that changes could be made to
12 school food options could be included as an
13 orientation for parents for parent coordinators and
14 parent leaders.

15 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Before I let this
16 panel go, Joel mentioned by starring role in *In*
17 *Jackson Heights*, the film, and I'll take this moment
18 for a little self-promotion. I was able to accept
19 the award for best documentary for 2015 from the New
20 York Film Critics Circle for Frederick Wiseman, and I
21 was very happy to do that. I got it from Susan
22 Sarandon, and the movie is showing at the Museum of
23 the Moving Image in Astoria. So it will be there
24 until the end of the month, and if you haven't seen

2 it yet, go and see *In Jackson Heights*. It's a great
3 film.

4 JOEL BERG: And also it not only shows
5 what Council people do, it shows your staff on the
6 phone very realistically, answering complaints from
7 constituents, which the American people really should
8 see.

9 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: And answering
10 complaints about the opening of a homeless shelter.

11 JOEL BERG: Yes.

12 CHAIRPERSON DROMM: Yes. So thank you,
13 Joel. Thank you for that opportunity. Thank you to
14 the panel, and I guess with that, we are about to
15 adjourn. Thank you very much. [gavel]

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date January 29, 2016