

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TECHNOLOGY

----- X

NOVEMBER 2, 2015
Start: 1:00 P.M.
Recess: 1:47 P.M.

HELD AT: COMMITTEE ROOM - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: JAMES VACCA
CHAIRPERSON

COUNCIL MEMBERS:
DAVID GREENFIELD
STEVEN MATTEO
ANNABEL PALMA

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Robert Garfillo
Deputy Commissioner of For Management and
Budget of New York City Department of
Parks and Recreation

Stanley Shore
New York City Department of Information
Technology and Telecommunications

2 CHAIR VACCA: Can I have your attention
3 please.

4 [gavel]

5 Good afternoon my name is James Vacca and
6 I'm Chair on the Committee on Technology and we're
7 here today to discuss Int. No. 428 which is a bill
8 I've sponsored that will evaluate the usability,
9 accessibility and equity of Wi-Fi access in all our
10 Cities Parks across the five Boroughs.

11 This committee has shown its commitment to
12 examining ways to bridge the digital divide and Wi-Fi
13 access in our most cherished public spaces, our
14 parks is yet another area we need to explore.

15 I want to thank the co-sponsors of my
16 bill and I'm eager to hear today's testimony.

17 Most of us are very dependent on our
18 smartphones for a major duration of the day. Using
19 the devices Myriad (sic) capabilities to navigate our
20 jobs and our lives. Data plans, which allow phone
21 users to utilize the Internet via the phone network,
22 can be very costly and many seek Wi-Fi access when it
23 is available. In many cases New Yorkers rely on
24 smartphones as their primary source of Internet
25 access, unable to afford home broadband access.

2 Broadband has become an essential modern living and
3 those who cannot reliably access the Internet are the
4 ones who fall behind.

5 There's currently no single unified
6 public Wi-Fi network but there are pockets of free
7 Wi-Fi throughout the City. One noticeable network is
8 Transit Wireless, which provides cell and Wi-Fi
9 services to over 100 subway stations and should wire
10 all station by 2017. This network will be seamlessly
11 intergraded into the one created by Link New York
12 City under the public pay phone franchise. Link New
13 York City which will be replacing current pay phone
14 info structure with technology hubs that will provide
15 device charging phone service and an extended free
16 Wi-Fi network. This will begin rolling out sometime
17 over the next year. New York Public Library
18 Enightcha (sic) have limited Wi-Fi service available
19 to New Yorkers. All these services are a supplement
20 to Wi-Fi access in New York Cities Parks. There are
21 two types of services in Parks, either free or
22 limited free. Parks with free access provide
23 Internet access that is free and unlimited for all
24 users at all times. All of the AT&T service parks
25 and networks run by partner organizations, such as

2 the Bryant Park Corporation and the Union Square
3 Partnership fall into the free category. In contrast
4 Parks services by Cablevision or Time Warner are
5 limited free. Allowing those who already pay for
6 broadband at home to get free service while non-
7 subscribers must choose between mins of free access,
8 limited to three times every 30 days or paying .99
9 cents for one days access. It is estimated that over
10 100 City Parks and or recreation areas have Wi-Fi
11 access but only 24 of those locations provided
12 completely free Wi-Fi. In the Bronx there are 3, in
13 Brooklyn 4, 12 in Manhattan, 3 in Queens and 2 in
14 Staten Island. There seems to be an unbalanced of
15 resources here and my Int. No. 428 seeks to task do
16 it with the responsibility of taking an exhaustive
17 inventory of the Wi-Fi availability in the City's
18 Parks. How many people are using the various
19 services in each Park and how long people are using
20 it for?

21 Additionally under this legislation the
22 Department of Parks and Recreation would develop a 5-
23 year plan to expand Wi-Fi access in Parks. I would
24 like to see the data behind the availability of Wi-Fi
25 in certain areas of the City. Is the Wi-Fi being

2 used to it's fullest extent? Are there other areas in
3 this City that would make better use of free Wi-Fi if
4 given the opportunity?

5 Since the Mayor is committed to the goal
6 of every resident and business in New York City
7 having affordable access and to high speed broadband
8 by 2025, it's my opinion that Wi-Fi in the Parks is
9 an essential component of that plan and with that I
10 will thank all of you for coming. I want to
11 introduce our member Steve Matteo who's joined me and
12 we will introduce our first panel. Our first panel
13 consists of Stanley Shore, New York City Department
14 of Information Technology and Telecommunications and
15 gentlemen would you introduce yourselves? Oh Robert
16 Garfillo (sic), Robert Garfillo, Deputy Commissioner
17 of For Management and Budget of New York City
18 Department of Parks and Recreation. Ok now I have to
19 swear you in. Do you affirm to tell the truth the
20 whole truth and nothing but the truth in your
21 testimony before this Committee and to respond
22 honestly to Council Member questions?

23 UNKNOWN MALE SPEAKER: I do.

24 UNKNOWN MALE SPEAKER: I do.

2 CHAIR VACCA: Ok thank you. Mr. Shore do
3 you want to begin? Press it in on red.

4 STANLEY SHORE: Ok. Good afternoon Chair
5 Vacca and members of the City's Council Technology
6 Committee, I am Stanley Shore, the Assistant
7 Commissioner for Franchise Administration at the
8 Department of Information Technology and
9 Telecommunications or DO IT. I am pleased to join
10 the Department of Parks and Recreation today to
11 testify on the topic of Parks Wi-Fi and Int. No. 428
12 which would require issuance of a 5 year plan to
13 expand Wi-Fi access in City Parks.

14 Mayor De Blasio and prior to that public
15 advocate De Blasio has long been a vocal proponent of
16 increased access to broadband as a means of obtaining
17 greater equality and inclusion for all New Yorkers.

18 In one of his first major technology
19 addresses as Mayor during internet week and May 2014
20 he echoed this theme; The goal is quite simple, we
21 must have universal affordable high speed internet
22 access throughout this City, it's essential for
23 everything we need to do to be a fair and just City
24 because we can't continue to have a digital divide
25 that holds backs so many of our citizens. The De

2 Blasio administration committed to delivering upon
3 this vision last April in One New York, the plan for
4 a strong and just City to close New York City's
5 digital divide once and for all. One NYC sets forth
6 a goal that every resident and business will have
7 access to affordable, reliable, high speed broadband
8 service everywhere by 2025. To that end the Mayor
9 has committed to a 70 million dollar investment in
10 broadband info structure over the coming years. He
11 has also announced that 10 million dollar program to
12 bring free high-speed service to more than 16,000 New
13 Yorkers and 5 public housing developments in Queens,
14 Brooklyn and the Bronx.

15 The administration goal of broadband
16 everywhere by 2025 also encompasses City Parks as
17 contemplated Int. No. 428. As we work to develop a
18 plan for ubica wired (sic) broadband coverage, Parks
19 and public spaces will figure within the larger
20 framework of a coordinated equitable City Wide roll
21 out. Working closely with Council to the Mayor, Maya
22 Wiley and her staff and partners across the City. DO
23 IT works daily towards the goal of universal
24 broadband through a host of initiatives. These range
25 from promoting competition in the residential and

2 commercial broadband market to investing in networks
3 for free or low cost high speed residential access
4 for low income communities to successful City wide
5 implementation of the Link NYC network which will
6 replace payphone with free high speed Wi-Fi access
7 points in neighborhoods across the 5 Boroughs.

8 The vision for a more digitally inclusive
9 New York City (inaudible) the top levels of the
10 administration is indigutive of the priority that
11 Mayor De Blasio and his leadership team have made the
12 expansion of affordable broadband access and empowers
13 DO It to continue it's multi-year efforts in this
14 regard. Primarily through our role at administering
15 the City telecommunication franchises. The expansion
16 of Wi-Fi in Parks and public spaces is a prominent
17 part of these efforts and one on which we have made
18 substantial progress to date. The vast reliance of
19 mobile devices by many New Yorker indeed by many
20 Americans generally makes availability of Wi-Fi in
21 the City's public spaces and increasing necessity.
22 According to recent pew research center study on the
23 Countries smartphone use, nearly 2/3^s of Americans,
24 64% own a smartphone up from 35% just 4 years earlier

2 and for many of these users, mobile devices serve as
3 a main means of access to the digital world.

4 Furthermore, the study revealed that 10%
5 of Americans own a smartphone but do not have any
6 other means of broadband access aside from their data
7 plan. The study further revealed that certain groups
8 of smart phone dependent at even higher levels 13% of
9 Americans in households earning less than 30% of less
10 than \$30,000 annually against just 1% of those
11 earning more than \$75,000. As well as 12% of African
12 Americans and 13% of Latinos as compared to just 4%
13 of Whites.

14 It was an anticipation of this continuous
15 upward trend that DO IT negotiated for the
16 implementation of Wi-Fi in dozens of City parks as a
17 condition of cable television franchise renewal
18 agreements with Tom Warner Cable and Cablevision in
19 2011. Pursuant to these agreements the companies
20 were to invest 10 Million dollars to install and
21 maintain public Wi-Fi at approximately 32 parks
22 across all 5 Boroughs through 2020. Four years on as
23 these companies complete their build and additional
24 partners, which I will describe below, continue to
25 roll out service in additional parks that number has

2 expanded substantially. Today there are
3 approximately 200 sites and 116 parks equipped for
4 Wi-Fi across all 5 Boroughs with service currently
5 projected to extend to 125 parks overall. Including
6 parks Wi-Fi is part of the City's cable franchise
7 renewal placed the responsibility of designing,
8 building, installing and maintaining these networks
9 with entities with proven track records of doing so.
10 Both in New York City and across the Country. And it
11 did so in at no taxpayer cost without granting
12 Cablevision or Time Warner Cable exclusivity to any
13 section of any park or any group of parks. The Wi-Fi
14 service in these parks is free at all time to
15 Cablevision optimum online and Time Warner Cable
16 broadband subscribers. Non-scribers can connect for
17 three free 10 minutes sessions per month and be on
18 that at any time for .99 cents per day. The Parks
19 Department work closely with DO IT and the
20 franchisees to identify the chosen parks based upon a
21 number of factors including; use potential,
22 viability, build down site, needling of trees and
23 facilities and the access to info structure for back
24 end connectivity. This approach allowed the City to
25 identify and direct installation in parks and

2 communities that have been traditionally underserved.
3 Not just in the most visited or popular parks. Prior
4 to the cable franchise agreement New Yorkers and
5 visitors had Wi-Fi access in more than a dozen parks
6 and public space including Time Square, Union Square
7 Brian Park and City Hall Park. The availability of
8 Wi-Fi in these spaces was made possible by
9 partnership with no profit and private sectors
10 sponsors including business improvement districts.
11 And while available to all these services were
12 predominantly in those heavily traffic parks.

13 Incorporating Wi-Fi provision into our
14 cable franchise agreement allowed the City to build
15 on these previous efforts while effecting more direct
16 allocations of resources to new areas. In addition
17 to bid and cable provided Wi-Fi AT&T also announced
18 in 2011 that it would install free Wi-Fi in City
19 parks as part of a 5-year initiative. That network
20 now spends 27 locations and 21 parks across the City
21 and I will shortly be turning it over to my colleague
22 Robert Garfillo, Deputy Commissioner from Management
23 and Budget at the Parks Department to describe that
24 and other programs in more detail. Thank you for the
25 opportunity to discuss this City's efforts on parks

2 Wi-Fi implementation that's part of the De Blasio
3 administrations commitment to affordable, reliable,
4 high speed broadband service everywhere over the next
5 decade. We look forward to continuing our work with
6 the Council and partners Citi Wide to deliver upon
7 this promise. I will now turn it over to the Parks
8 Department for further remarks, which after which we
9 would both be please to answer any questions you may
10 have.

11 ROBERT: Good afternoon Chairman Vacca and
12 member of the Technology Committee, I'm my name is
13 Robert Garifflo, I'm the Deputy Commissioner for
14 Management Budget for the New York City Department of
15 Parks and Recreation. I'm joined here today by Matt
16 Jury who is our Director of Governmental Relations as
17 well and I want to thank you for giving me the
18 opportunity to testify regarding Int. No. 428 which
19 amends chapter 1 of the title 18 of the
20 administrative code of the City of New York. To
21 begin I would like to say a few words about my role
22 at New York City Parks. As a Deputy Commissioner for
23 Managing Budget and Public Programs I oversee a
24 number of our agencies division. A few of them
25 include or IT and telecommunications units. I also

2 oversee a Pop Park Opportunity Program and our
3 Recreation Public Programs Division, which house over
4 32 computer resource centers. These computer
5 resource centers provide for free digital learning
6 resources for recreation center members and that
7 160,000 members in our recreation centers of all ages
8 and end to increase community technology resources by
9 providing internet access and technology education in
10 New York City Communities.

11 In addition my office oversees the Wi-Fi
12 in the parks deployment and collaboration with New
13 York City Department DO IT. Countless New Yorkers
14 and visitors have come to spend depend on wireless
15 devices to manage many aspects of their lives. The
16 result has been an increase independence on wireless
17 fidelity or Wi-Fi hotspots throughout the City.
18 Since 2011 we've been engaged in a series of Wi-Fi
19 deployment efforts, one with AT&T and the others with
20 Time Warner Cable and Cablevision. Through their
21 franchise commitment negotiated by NYC DO IT. We
22 also have Wi-Fi coverage at several parks provided
23 through partner organizations such as the Downtown
24 Work on Partnership and the Brian Park Corporation.
25 Between both these City projects and the external

2 partnerships we expect to provide Wi-Fi coverage at
3 close to 200 locations within New York City Parks
4 throughout the City. In June 2011, the City and AT&T
5 announced the 5-year agreement to provide free Wi-Fi
6 service at 27 locations in 21 New York City Parks
7 across the 5 Boroughs and Park visitors are currently
8 enjoying free Wi-Fi access at those locations. We're
9 pleased to provide a great amenity to these Parks and
10 appreciate AT&T partnership in this effort. Together
11 working with AT&T they've also provided 28 solar
12 charging station at our Parks and Beaches as well.
13 Also in the summer of 2011 DO IT announced a reign to
14 public benefits associate with renewal of the City's
15 cable television franchise contracts with Time Warner
16 Cable and Cablevision systems worth approximately 60
17 million dollars. One of these benefits was a 10
18 million dollar investment in parks and public spaces
19 across the 5 Boroughs in Wi-Fi service. The project
20 in February 2002 with the initiative initial
21 formulation and surveying of potential sites and we
22 announced the completion of phase one of the project
23 in 2013 with 32 cites covering between both cable
24 providers across the 5 Boroughs. Since the initial
25 launch Cablevision is recently for filled it

2 commitment to establish Wi-Fi with deploying 2022
3 access points across 58 sites within 34 parks. We
4 soon expect completion of Time Warner commitment
5 totaling 408 access points across 103 sites and 65
6 parks by early 2016. The service is completely free
7 to Cablevision and Time Warner cable broadband to
8 subscribers. (inaudible) to the subscriber is able
9 to enjoy three 10-minute Wi-Fi sessions per month for
10 free or access to this service for an entire day of
11 .99 cents. To select the most appropriate park
12 locations for Wi-Fi coverage New York City Parks and
13 DO IT works closely with locally elected officials,
14 community leaders and cable providers to identify
15 potential sites for deployment. And then we
16 developed a target list of site based on a number of
17 factors including; usage potential, viability
18 construction, siting of trees and facilities and
19 access to info structure for back end connectivity.
20 The site selected throughout all 5 Boroughs serve a
21 diversity of communities of park users both
22 geographically and economically. Utilizing the
23 funding from the franchise agreement with Cablevision
24 and Time Warner, the City has been able to target
25 parks sites that would not otherwise be provided for

2 by bids or public private partnerships. The
3 availability of public Wi-Fi in our parks has been
4 well utilized Citywide. In fact in (inaudible) 2014
5 park users made over 8 million connections to
6 networks implemented through the Wi-Fi in the Parks
7 project. Further Cablevision and Time Warner agreed
8 to provide free video service in the vicinity of 28
9 New York City parks facilities that have been
10 designated as emergency evacuation sites, 25
11 recreation center and 3 Borough Headquarters where
12 people may gather in the event of an emergency. The
13 free video service provided by the companies is
14 separated from the Wi-Fi commitment. But since the
15 companies have already installed info structure at
16 these sites the cost to also install Wi-Fi service to
17 these locations was minimal, so we had the companies
18 to install the service.

19 As my colleagues at DO IT have has so
20 helpfully outlined, the administration is committed
21 to increasing access to affordable, reliable, high
22 speed broadband service at public spaces throughout
23 the City including parks. As access to the internet
24 becomes an increasingly important element of our
25 daily lives, a comprehensive City Wide strategy that

2 looks at all the City's public spaces will be the
3 best way to build on these initiatives that we've
4 aligned for you today. In order to fulfill the
5 Mayors goal of closing the digital divide by 2025.
6 We look forward to continue to work with the City
7 Council on this topic and thank you for the
8 opportunity for allowing me to testify before you
9 this afternoon and my Stanley and I and Stanley Shore
10 and I will be happy to answer questions, any
11 questions you may have.

12 CHAIR VACCA: Ok thank you both. Now
13 your agency parks and DO IT have both not articulated
14 the administration position on my legislation. But
15 let me ask you where do you stand on the legislations
16 that's the subject of today's hearing?

17 STANLEY SHORE: Ok so I think we.. we
18 would like to sit down and talk about the legislation
19 to see how we can work together. There's a... a bigger
20 plan that the Mayor's doing as far as broadband
21 access. We're not sure that it makes, we're not sure
22 that we want to do separate planning for the parks
23 as... as part but we want to plan for the whole
24 broadband initiative going forward. So probably it
25 makes best sense to sit down and talk to you about

2 how the planning will go and instead of being just a
3 parks focused discussion.

4 CHAIR VACCA: But my bill indicates that
5 there should be 5-year report rather than a 5-year
6 plan. I'm asking for report, which would based on
7 what we do in 5 years.

8 STANLEY SHORE: Ok. So I think than, I
9 think than we were misunderstanding because it... it
10 appeared on the quick read that you were looking for
11 a plan to get Wi-Fi in every park and.

12 CHAIR VACCA: Well there's pieces to the
13 bill, you understand that.

14 STANLEY SHORE: Ok.

15 CHAIR VACCA: One... one is the plan but
16 the other one is a report. But we want.

17 STANLEY SHORE: On the reporting we have
18 no problem with reporting.

19 CHAIR VACCA: But a plan, but how do you
20 have a report unless we know of a plan? So I did
21 single parks because of my view of it right now Wi-Fi
22 access is weighted toward Manhattan and weighted
23 toward that Borough penalizes Boroughs like my own
24 and others. I look at a map that you have here and
25 the largest park in the City of New York Pelham Bay

2 Park. That's the largest park in the City of New
3 York. That happens to be in my district and we have
4 now Wi-Fi access according to this map. So this
5 administration talks about an equality and inequities
6 and some of them are glaring so if some of them are
7 glaring like that the job of this Council has an
8 oversight body is to have accountability and our
9 mechanism to guarantee accountability is through
10 transparency and reporting and planning. So Mr.
11 Garfillo, so... so first of all I'm not clear on the
12 administration position, I don't hear that the
13 administration is against the bill but usually at
14 these hearing the administration starts off by
15 indicating whether their for or against the bill and
16 I don't hear that. So I'm sure you planned for
17 today's hearing so what is, what is your consensus
18 concerning my bill?

19 ROBERT GARFILLO: Yes I'd just like to
20 say and we should talk to further on this because our
21 understanding is there's two sites in Pelham Bay Park
22 that we have, I know it's a big park, it's a huge
23 park but there are two Wi-Fi sites in... in Pelham Bay
24 Park so we should talk about that and make that to
25 you where it is exactly etc. and that would be

2 important. I mean in terms of what Stanley,
3 Commissioner Shore was talking about in terms of
4 reporting you know a lot of the data, a lot of the
5 statistics we have that information, you know we can
6 make that clear you in terms of where you know where
7 we're going with it. Right now we're seeing a
8 tremendous growth in the use of the Wi-Fi both in
9 terms of the connections and both in terms of an
10 information that is being used by you know New
11 Yorkers throughout the City. Those numbers are going
12 up. I think in 2014 I said it was like 8 million
13 connections and in this part of this year 2015 it
14 going to be well over 10 million connections that
15 were going to have.

16 CHAIR VACCA: All right so in my opening
17 statement I indicated that there were 3 locations in
18 the Bronx for free Wi-Fi. Two in Staten Island, 3 in
19 Queens, 4 in Brooklyn, 12 in Manhattan. So since I'm
20 here with Mr. Matteo right now. What are those 3
21 locations in the Bronx and what are the two locations
22 in Staten Island that have free Wi-Fi completely free
23 Wi-Fi access.

24 ROBERT GARFILLO: In terms of Queens,
25 Historia Park.

2 CHAIR VACCA: No... no... no go into the
3 Bronx and Staten Island first because I have not
4 myself and my colleague are here.

5 ROBERT GARFILLO: Ok. Joyce Tilmer Park
6 in the Bronx, Delvoe Park in the Bronx and Bronx
7 River Hunts Point Riverside Park. Those are the 3
8 that we have.

9 CHAIR VACCA: Ok and in Staten Island.

10 ROBERT GARFILLO: And in Staten Island we
11 have South Beach, we have that and we also have Cove
12 Lakes Park in Staten Island. We have those two
13 parks. Those two facilities right?

14 STANLEY SHORE: Yes.

15 CHAIR VACCA: So I was not incorrect when
16 I stated that there's no free Wi-Fi in Pelham Bay
17 Park. The largest park in the City of New York.
18 Over 3,000 acres in the Bronx has no free Wi-Fi
19 access?

20 ROBERT GARFILLO: You're correct.

21 CHAIR VACCA: OK. Just wanted to clarify
22 that.

23 ROBERT GARFILLO: Ok.

24 CHAIR VACCA: Why? Why and when are they
25 going to get it?

2 ROBERT GARFILLO: In terms of currently
3 we do have you know from Cablevision, Cablevision has
4 put in you know Wi-Fi at Pelham Bay Park, it's not
5 free Wi-Fi it's the, it's what we described as free
6 for the subscribers whether it Time Warner or
7 Cablevision subscribers and then after that it's you
8 know 3 session of 10 minutes a piece per month
9 otherwise it .99 cents.

10 CHAIR VACCA: Why... why are we treated
11 that way and Manhattan is not?

12 ROBERT GARFILLO: Well I think, I mean I
13 think really what it really comes down to is you know
14 we have a franchise agreement with these two
15 organizations and part of that agreement that was
16 included that was negotiated with the City was that...
17 that this would be the structure that it would
18 include in there.

19 CHAIR VACCA: Cablevision certainly
20 charges rates that are pretty high for my
21 constitutes.

22 ROBERT GARFILLO: Correct, they... they
23 charge, there's no question about it.

24 CHAIR VACCA: I would think that
25 providing free Wi-Fi would be something that they

2 would do as part of their outreach to the general
3 public, even if the franchise agreement allowed them
4 to get away with charging. I mean there's not much
5 left to charge people for unless we should start
6 charging for the air we breathe, were charged for
7 everything. You did say in your testimony that you
8 consulted with an elected officials and I was never
9 consulted by anyone so I... I don't know what elected
10 officials did you include in your consultation on
11 page 2 you said that New York City Parks and DO IT
12 worked... worked closely with elected officials to
13 identify sites. I have never been contacted, I'm in
14 the Council what is it now, my god it been 10 years.
15 So who was contacted?

16 ROBERT GARFILLO: We talked to our
17 Boroughs Commissioners and the Borough Commissioners
18 talked to people and gave us recommendations and also
19 we also got recommendations from both Councilman and
20 other Government Officials.

21 CHAIR VACCA: Do you think that I would
22 not recommend a site in my district? If I had the
23 communications with your office to recommend sites
24 I'd think I would recommend sites. I never was
25 communicated with. I did not know that there was

2 this process in place if there not communication how
3 is an elected official to know, so I beg to differ
4 with you, I do not know what elected officials you
5 considered, you consulted. I can ask my colleagues
6 if they were consulted but I think when Mr. Matteo
7 speaks I'm sure he'll go into that. So why don't I
8 do this, let me ask Mr. Matteo to aske several
9 questions and I would like to come back.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Thank you Chair
11 Vacca and for your... your leadership on this issue.
12 You just you said South Beach did just can you
13 clarify do you mean a portion of South Beach? Do you
14 mean the Boardwalk itself? Is the entire Boardwalk
15 covered or are you just talking about the ball fields
16 at South Beach? I mean I have the Boardwalk covers
17 South Beach Midland, so you talking about the
18 Boardwalk or you talking about an access point at
19 South Beach near the ball fields?

20 ROBER GARFILLO: In terms of South Beach
21 we're talking around the restaurant area, outside the
22 restaurant near the Vanderbilt where the Vanderbilt
23 area is in that area. On the Boardwalk

24

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: It just covers
3 that... that small section not the whole entire
4 Boardwalk?

5 ROBERT GARFILLO: Not the entire
6 Boardwalk, no.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: So you know
8 obviously you know I share Chair Vacca concerns you
9 know we are the mothers of the self proclaimed how
10 were the Borough Parks. We have 12,300 acres, 170
11 parks and after answering Chair Vacca, looks like we
12 have 2 parks that has free Wi-Fi service. One the
13 border of my district in Cove Lakes, one little
14 section of South Beach, non in the South Shore and so
15 what is the plan then to expand Wi-Fi and you know,
16 I, I've been in office for a year and a half, I've
17 worked in the Council for 10 years under my
18 predecessor as a Chief of Staff and we've never been
19 spoken to about access, so you know what is the plan?
20 Where... where are we going? Where are we going
21 specifically on Staten Island and you know are you
22 having further consultations with us? Are you going
23 to come out and reach out to the Borough
24 Commissioner? So I'm extremely concerned about the
25 plan moving forward if could elaborate.

2 ROBERT GARFILLO: Well first let me
3 elaborate in terms of South Beaches one, one place in
4 Staten Island and Cove Lakes as we've mentioned, but
5 also we're talking about the Greenbelt and the
6 Greenbelt Rec Center is also covered.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Is that free?

8 ROBERT GARFILLO: It's not free it's
9 through Time Warner and then also we have Melon Beach
10 which is Melon Beach North between Slater Boulevard
11 and Ocean Breeze and Midland Beach South which is
12 between Grilley Avenue and Graham Boulevard.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: But not those
14 aren't free?

15 ROBERT GARFILLO: No there not.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: So are we going to
17 provide that free access there or are you now
18 considering that, that's covered?

19 ROBERT GARFILLO: At this point you know
20 we work, we had a, we had an agreement with AT&T and
21 they provided some sites but they did in the
22 beginning of the process their really finished with
23 their commitment. The did 121 parks, 27 sites and
24 that was it, they're not doing anything more in terms
25 of sites. We you know can talk to them and working

2 with doing in terms of the you know what are the next
3 sites that they would like and where we see there you
4 know places that would justify doing this.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Well you know we
6 have 3 Council districts in Staten Island, Council
7 Member Rose, I'm sure has plenty of locations our
8 Council Member from the 51st district will be win
9 tomorrow with no opponent so there's just 3 of us and
10 I think it huge if the Parks Department to set up a
11 meeting with all 3 of us to discuss where we go
12 forward. I'm... I'm not happy with the progress. We
13 have to move forward. We have over like I said over
14 170 parks you know I, what, we talking about free Wi-
15 Fi access. I appreciate that some others may be
16 covered but you know were looking to expand in our
17 parks, especially with fresh kills coming on board.
18 Do you have a plan with... with that coming on board
19 and during the phased in approach and how were going
20 to provide access there?

21 ROBERT GARFILLO: At the point with fresh
22 kills we don't have a plan yet. We're really in the
23 initial stages with that. We're going to be
24 circulating a RFI for fresh kills, so we're really in
25 the preliminary stages on that.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: So you know what I
3 will take out of this hearing is that we... we
4 certainly need to meet, I ask that you... you contact
5 my office to set up a meeting with my delegation and
6 we move forward because I'm... I'm... I'm very concerned
7 and I appreciate the leadership of Chair Vacca
8 introducing his legislation but also having this
9 discussion because it needs to be had and we have to
10 make sure that this plan moves forwards that benefits
11 not only Staten Island but the rest of 4 Boroughs in
12 the City as a whole so thank you chair Vacca.

13 CHAIR VACCA: Thank you and I would
14 request a similar meeting with my office.

15 ROBERT GARFILLO: Ok.

16 CHAIR VACCA: And I'm sorry, there's the
17 meeting. You call me already? Ok. Have you
18 considered that the City may want to chip in and pay
19 some of the expenses to have Wi-Fi expanded on a more
20 equitable basis? I hear that the cable companies are
21 doing what their required to do but maybe if that.

22 STANELY SHORE: I think the
23 administration.

24 CHAIR VACCA: It's true and it's not
25 enough.

2 STANLEY SHORE: No the administration is
3 looking at where to, where to spend the funds in
4 regards to broadband and I don't have the details for
5 whether they are prepared to spend it in the parks or
6 they want to spend it in various City facilities or
7 other locations, so I aim at personally making that
8 plan but the administration is definitely looking at
9 the possibility of spending some of the
10 administration funds on that.

11 CHAIR VACCA: I think the word has to go
12 back to the administration that the distribution in
13 parks is not equitable and that the Council is not
14 happy at this point and that if the administration
15 cannot get the cable companies to do more, than the
16 City has to include parks in their plan and the City
17 has to allocate money in. Your agencies, your
18 agencies should be advocating for that. No one can
19 tell me that what I see here before me is an
20 equitable distribution of Wi-Fi access in our parks.
21 No one can tell me that. Based on that reality how
22 can we not since we are progressive now I'm told and
23 we believe in equity I'm told. Well here is a
24 classic case that is not progressive and not
25 equitable. And it takes somebody like myself and Mr.

2 Matteo to point these things out I guess but I'm not
3 accepting this. I want to ask you the question as to
4 what criteria did you use in the first place to
5 determine where this Wi-Fi free access went? What
6 was the criteria?

7 ROBERT GARFILLO: When we first, when we
8 first of all there was only you know money in order
9 to do 21 parks within the City. It was not you know
10 something that we did when we got you know the
11 agreement with Time Warner and Cablevision so when we
12 did the Time Warner and Cablevision we really you
13 know tried to really get out to all neighborhoods as
14 much as we could and to move that out and try to
15 diversify that in terms of the 21 sites that we had
16 the 21 parks that 27 sites you know we utilized you
17 know where we thought there was going to be usage.
18 We tried to get into all 5 boroughs with it and we
19 tried to you know have you know look at viability.
20 This is our first time that we were doing this you
21 know type of a project, working closely with AT&T and
22 also looking at you know where this could work you
23 know in the parks, in the system and having the back
24 hall system capability of doing that. So were kind
25 of like working you know for the first time with them

2 and doing that it was like a relatively small project
3 that we're doing in terms of the free Wi-Fi. That was
4 a very small project. Clearly the larger part
5 project which we've been utilize you know we've been
6 working on much more at Time Warner and Cablevision.
7 You know we think we geographically and economically
8 we distributed the Wi-Fi program throughout the City
9 and we tried to be very cognizant of that of trying
10 to hit almost every district through Councilmatic
11 throughout this City. We were pretty good on that we
12 did not hit every place but we came I think very
13 close.

14 CHAIR VACCA: How many parks were you
15 provided free Wi-Fi have a park conservancies?

16 ROBERT GARFILLO: I don't know the answer
17 right now but I could get that for you.

18 CHAIR VACCA: In a consistent problem in
19 the Council speaking about equity and is Essential
20 Park one of the Manhattan Parks that has Wi-Fi
21 service?

22 ROBERT GARFILLO: Yes it does.

23 CHAIR VACCA: How did I know that? I
24 just assumed. Will any link New York City Wi-Fi
25 units be placed in Central, City parks?

2 STANLEY SHORE: No, Link NYC the plan is
3 to replace existing pay phones and to add to the
4 inventory beyond that up to from the minimal of 7,500
5 locations and then up to 10,000 locations, so we have
6 the ability to place them around the City in places
7 where they need to go, there would where there's a
8 pay phone now there it would and it's next to a park
9 that will be replaced by a link and that would be
10 providing the Wi-Fi and we also have we have it for
11 the other locations where may not be a pay phone now
12 they'll be opportunities to put it in Links. We have
13 a different models one especially if's it's in a non-
14 commercial area we have on that have no advertising
15 that can go there. So we will be working with the
16 franchise (inaudible) place these strategically to
17 cover places and parks and plazas and different
18 gathering areas so that the coverage is there.

19 CHAIR VACCA: What are, what are the next
20 parks to get Wi-Fi service on your list, your what
21 are the next parks to get Wi-Fi service and when?

22 ROBERT GARFILLO: We're finishing up the
23 last, the last part of them so there's currently we
24 have 116 sites that have Wi-Fi in the City, we will
25 have another 9 Wi-Fi and I can get that list for you

2 of what the last 9 are that currently Time Warner is
3 working on. Cablevision is pretty much it's finished
4 with their commitment as of now and also AT&T is been
5 finished for a long time but we can get you the list
6 of what the 9 sites are, unless you have it?

7 CHAIR VACCA: So if cablevision is
8 finished the Bronx can expect no more Wi-Fi, free Wi-
9 Fi expansion, Cablevision is finished?

10 ROBERT GARFILLO: Well Cablevision wasn't
11 doing free they were doing partial they were not
12 doing total free Wi-Fi only AT&T was doing it.

13 CHAIR VACCA: AT&T.

14 ROBERT GARFILLO: Yes.

15 CHAIR VACCA: And their finished?

16 ROBERT GARFILLO: As of right now they've
17 finished their commitment.

18 CHAIR VACCA: So the Bronx is finished?

19 ROBERT GARFILLO: I would never say the
20 Bronx is finished.

21 CHAIR VACCA: But you have no plan. There
22 is no plans since there's AT&T has is through so
23 therefore what comes next in the Bronx your basically
24 saying nothing comes next. There done. This is not
25 acceptable.

2 ROBERT GARFILLO: Well I think that's the
3 reason, that's the reason that were talking about
4 putting a plan together and the Mayors talking about
5 a plan together for 2025 [crosstalk]

6 CHAIR VACCA: Yes but I 2025 a lot of
7 people may not be here. I been in this business a
8 long time, I know about City plans and I know that
9 when 2025 comes it may be 2030 were looking at. What
10 are we doing in the foreseeable future to guarantee
11 that Wi-Fi service is made more equitable in this
12 City? This is not something for the backburner this
13 is got to be put on the front burner. I don't see a
14 sense of urgency, I don't see any admission that
15 there's an inequity here. You'll get to the Bronx
16 when you get to it, you'll get to Staten Island when
17 you get to it, I don't, I don't get it.

18 STANLEY SHORE: The... the administration.

19 CHAIR VACCA: How... how many again I'm
20 sorry Stanley.

21 STANLEY SHORE: Yes, the administration
22 is looking at all of this, I mean I think I wasn't
23 part of the announcement for the public housing
24 development that their extending broadband to but I
25 know that... that they made the announcement in the

2 Bronx, they are coming up to the Bronx and they will
3 covering open spaces in addition to people in their
4 homes and nitro facilities and the Mayor is
5 committing 70 million as part of a plan to extend
6 broadband whether it be through Wi-Fi or... or through
7 connection into people's homes. So their looking at
8 all of this. So right now this is, this is great
9 that you're expressing where you would like to see
10 it, this could be all part of a plan but it's going
11 to park of a discussion. We don't want to, the
12 administration is looking to see beyond just parks,
13 where can we get the most bang for the buck to
14 provide broadband.

15 CHAIR VACCA: Your basically telling me
16 not basically your acknowledging to me that at
17 Orchard Beach in the Bronx people can't get free Wi-
18 Fi.

19 STANLEY SHORE: Yes and I can't and.

20 CHAIR VACCA: It's outrageous,
21 outrageous.

22 STANLEY SHORE: Very, it's a very, it's
23 not that we haven't look at and it not that nobody
24 bought it the Borough President did ask that is one

2 of the locations Orchard Beach and it's a million
3 dollars to bring out to Orchard Beach.

4 CHAIR VACCA: It's how much a million
5 dollars?

6 STANLEY SHORE: A million dollars just to
7 bring the conduit out to Orchard Beach.

8 CHAIR VACCA: Ok.

9 ROBERT GARFILLO: It's something that
10 we're very interested in doing. We looked at it, we
11 look at it closely. At that point it was around a
12 million dollars, we think there's may be a way that
13 were getting conduit over to that area, if that the
14 case it going to be a lot less money than that. We
15 would like to get Orchard Beach, we have other
16 beaches, we have South Beach, Midland Beach, the
17 Rockaways and Coney Island. We need Orchard Beach
18 done. We think, we the parks think it's should be
19 done and that would be something we would try to look
20 at and try to figure out a way to do it. Currently
21 we don't have the funding in place right now but it's
22 something that we will be talking with Stanley and
23 with other people.

24 CHAIR VACCA: Is this capital money or
25 expense money?

2 ROBERT GARFILLO: It's been Wi-Fi has
3 been pretty much predominately expense money but
4 there possibility you know if it's a system and it's
5 part of a system and it may be over 35,000 there
6 might be a way to do capital but I would we would
7 really have to talk to the capital attorneys who make
8 those determinations in terms where they can sell
9 bonds in order to do something like that.

10 CHAIR VACCA: So you have no timetable
11 for that? It's just a question of seeking out money
12 and finding out whether it capital or expense but
13 there's no timetable, it's something you'd like to
14 do, you realize that there's issues but you'd like to
15 do it but there's no monies so there's no timetable?
16 I will talk to the Borough President about it as well
17 but I think that there has to be as I said a greater
18 since of urgency about this situation especially in
19 light of what this hearing today is clarifying for
20 the record. Have you received complaints from people
21 about this? That have people called 311 to say that
22 they have no free Wi-Fi service in the parks? Have
23 people called 311 and how many people have called?
24 Can you go over those, those particulars with me?

2 ROBERT GARFILLO: From my perspective we
3 have not gotten that many calls from what I recall.
4 We have at times have gotten inquiries about certain
5 facilities in certain parks and during those times
6 when we did get calls like that and we were working
7 Cablevision or Time Warner at that point we would go
8 out and take a look at the site. We would survey the
9 site, we would get out with the you know the company
10 and try to find out you know come out with you know
11 if we come out with a plan and whether you know there
12 was a viability in terms of doing that particular
13 site. There were limited resources so we would look
14 in terms of you know was there a usage pattern, were
15 there people going to be in the facilities at that
16 time and also do we have the capabilities to do it
17 and what would be the design in terms of trying to
18 put something like that together. So we did get some
19 inquiries about that and people were interested in
20 having Wi-Fi in their parks, there's no question
21 about it.

22 CHAIR VACCA: Now does the parks
23 Department website specify which parks have Wi-Fi
24 service available?

25 ROBERT GARFILLO: Yes it does.

2 CHAIR VACCA: Ok. I have no further
3 questions. Council Matteo any further questions?
4 Ok. I want to thank this panel. Oh I'm sorry
5 Annabel Palma has joined me, my colleague from the
6 Bronx. No... no questions. Ok thank you. Our next
7 panel is Matt Drewey (sic) of Parks, Joesph. [off
8 mic] Joseph Conforty (sic) no. Ok, there we go with
9 you. Ok... ok we have no one else who wishes to
10 testify and there being no other business, this
11 hearing is now adjourned.

12 [gavel]

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 6, 2015