

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

October 29, 2015  
Start: 1:29 p.m.  
Recess: 3:03 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: LATISHA JAMES  
Public Advocate

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO  
Speaker for the City Council

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Maria Del Carmen Arroyo  
Inez D. Barron  
Fernando Cabrera  
Margaret S. Chin  
Andrew Cohen  
Costa Constantinides  
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.  
Elizabeth S. Crowley  
Laurie A. Cumbo  
Chaim M. Deutsch  
Inez E. Dickens  
Daniel Dromm  
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.  
Mathieu Eugene  
Julissa Ferreras-Copeland

Daniel R. Garodnick  
Vincent J. Gentile  
Vanessa L. Gibson  
David G. Greenfield  
Vincent Ignizio  
Corey D. Johnson  
Ben Kallos  
Andy L. King  
Peter A. Koo  
Karen Koslowitz  
Rory I. Lancman  
Brad S. Lander  
Stephen T. Levin  
Mark Levine  
Alan N. Maisel  
Steven Matteo  
Darlene Mealy  
Carlos Menchaca  
Rosie Mendez  
I. Daneek Miller  
Annabel Palma  
Antonio Reynoso  
Donovan J. Richards  
Ydanis A. Rodriguez  
Deborah L. Rose  
Helen K. Rosenthal  
Ritchie J. Torres  
Mark Treyger  
Eric A. Ulrich  
James Vacca  
Paul A. Vallone  
James G. Van Bramer  
Mark S. Weprin  
Jumaane D. Williams  
Ruben Wills

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

2 [sound check, pause]

3 [background comments]

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] All  
5 right. [on mic] Good afternoon. Okay, good  
6 afternoon to everybody. We're going to start our  
7 ceremonials. Today we have three ceremonials. We're  
8 going to start off with Council Member Maisel, who  
9 and myself jointly--I'll ask Alan to say a few words--  
10 -we have-- Is he here?

11 FEMALE SPEAKER: Uh-huh.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Ethan Kusknerik.

13 FEMALE SPEAKER: Raise your hand.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Come on, Ethan,  
15 come on up. If his parents are here and want to  
16 join. So come on up. Come on up, parents.  
17 (applause) If the whole family wants to join as well,  
18 come on up. It's a great photo. (laughs) So Ethan  
19 is 12 years old, and Ethan has become the Brooklyn  
20 fencing champ chosen to be on Team USA, and has  
21 played in tournaments around the world. So that is  
22 very impressive, Ethan, and we're really happy to be  
23 able to celebrate that. (applause) I'm going to ask  
24 Council Member Maisel to say a few words, and--and

25

2 congratulations to the family as well. Hold on one  
3 second.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Thank you very  
5 much. I know this for a fact. It's un--it's actually  
6 true. He is the best fencing person we have in my  
7 district. Before this absolutely--not necessarily  
8 the world, but you're getting there, but I actually  
9 know Ethan since he was a little boy, and he has  
10 really done a tremendous thing and he's made America  
11 proud, made the City of New York proud, Brooklyn. So  
12 I'm very happy for him to be here receiving this  
13 proclamation. He's very modest, and that's a good  
14 thing. So, congratulations. Congratulations to the  
15 person. So, Vadim this is not the time for you to  
16 take pictures.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: (laughs) Well, if  
18 there's a picture I'll take it--

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: [interposing]  
20 Yeah.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --and one of the  
22 family.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yeah, okay, So--

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Okay, no, the--  
25 the clerk can read the proclamation.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Okay.

3 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All right. So we  
4 can hear all the great things about Ethan.

5 CLERK: Council City of New York  
6 Proclamation.

7 Whereas, while many people are aware of  
8 fencing through the stories of Zorro and the Three  
9 Musketeers, it is one of the world's oldest sports,  
10 one practiced in Ancient Egypt, and one of only four  
11 sports that has been in every modern Olympic games.  
12 Fencing is also referred to as a physical chess for  
13 it is a challenging sport for both the body and the  
14 mind. It is a sport for men and women of all ages to  
15 attempt a tactical masterpiece of prowess and grace.  
16 An expert fencer has improved his skills not only by  
17 becoming stronger and more flexible, but by  
18 developing their coordination, speed, focus and  
19 concentration. Ethan Kushnerik is truly such an  
20 individual; and

21 Whereas, Ethan, age 12, lives in New  
22 (sic) Island, Brooklyn with his parents. Dr. Vadim  
23 Kushnerik and Karina Kushnerik, his younger sister  
24 Isabella and his older brothers Brandon and Gabriel.  
25 When Ethan is not at home or studying at York

2 Preparatory School, he is most often at the New York  
3 Fencing Academy in Coney Island where he trains hard  
4 six days a week; and

5           Whereas, in 2013, at the age of 10,  
6 Ethan's dedication took him to Wroclaw where he  
7 competed at the 37th, Annual International Children's  
8 Fencing Tournament Challenge. Among the top scoring  
9 fencer--young fencers from 272 clubs and 31 countries.  
10 Ethan played against many of the world's best fencers  
11 and shocked many by becoming a finalist while fencing  
12 his way to the Gold Medal in the Y11 Men's epee  
13 category, Ethan did not lose a single match; and

14           Whereas, even before starting his first  
15 year of middle school, Ethan won the gold at the  
16 World Championship in Poland and competed for Team  
17 USA and earned a Bronze Medal at the Pan American  
18 Championship in Santa Cruz, Aruba. Since then, he  
19 has also brought home both a Silver and a Bronze  
20 Medal the North American Cup; and

21           Whereas, in August 2015, Ethan  
22 represented Team USA in Lima, Peru at the Youth and  
23 Veteran Pan American Fencing Championship, a premier  
24 tournament for the very best fencers from North  
25 Central and South America and the Caribbean to

2 compete to become fencing champion of the Western  
3 Hemisphere. This year, the United States Fencing  
4 Association ranked Ethan number two, and also chose  
5 him to represent Team USA in Youth B Men's epee; and

6           Whereas, author Anais Nin once wrote that  
7 life shrinks or expands in proportion to one's  
8 courage. If this is true, we are confident that  
9 Ethan's life will continue to expand greatly with  
10 even more extraordinary opportunities and  
11 achievements in the years ahead.

12           Now, therefore, be it known that the  
13 Council of the City of New York is proud to salute  
14 Ethan Kushnerik for his outstanding achievements in  
15 fencing. Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the  
16 Entire Council. Alan Maisel, Council Member, 46th  
17 District, Brooklyn.

18           SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: So again, let me--  
19 -let me remind people I was--he's 12 years old, and  
20 talking to mom right here I just asked her well, you  
21 know, we heard that he is practicing about six days a  
22 week. So how many hours a day? She said when he  
23 comes--he goes from school directly to practice and  
24 he doesn't come home until like 9:00 or 10 o'clock at  
25 night. That is commitment. That is dedication.



2 Ethan, we would love you to say a few words. I have  
3 a question for you, and maybe you can answer and let  
4 us know who is here with you. How did you become  
5 interested in fencing, and tell us how you feel about  
6 what you're doing.

7 ETHAN KUSHNERIK: I started fencing three  
8 years ago when I was nine, and I got interested in it  
9 because I wasn't interested in any other sports. I  
10 liked them, but when I tried fencing, that was the  
11 sport that I liked the most.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: It was something  
13 that was offered in school?

14 ETHAN KUSHNERIK: Well, um, no.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: You saw it on TV  
16 or--?

17 ETHAN KUSHNERIK: My dad found it.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Ah, okay, thanks  
19 to dad. All right, well thank you so much, and so  
20 congratulations to the family. Good luck in your  
21 endeavors.

22 ETHAN KUSHNERIK: Thank you.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: You're welcome.  
24 (applause, background comments while taking photos,  
25 applause) Okay, the next Council Members are Mark

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 10  
2 Levine and Margaret Chin. (background comments) So  
3 we--so Council Members Levine and Chin are doing a  
4 proc for Hostelling International New York City on  
5 its 25th Anniversary. Prior to Mark Levine, I  
6 represented the Hostel on Amsterdam Avenue and 104th  
7 Street. It's a great, great institution, a great  
8 community partner, and so really it's wonderful that  
9 we can be here to celebrate that. So I will hand it  
10 off to Council Members Levine and Chin.

11 (background comments)

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All right.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Okay, we are so  
14 pleased to pay tribute to this wonderful institution.

15 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down, please.  
16 Keep it down.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: You know, tourism  
18 is boom in New York City, but if you want to book a  
19 hotel room you better be ready to pay \$200, \$300,  
20 \$400 a night, and we want this to be a place where  
21 people of all backgrounds and all means can come and  
22 enjoy this amazing city. And we're so lucky that we  
23 have an institution like Hostelling International  
24 that is making that possible for thousands and  
25 thousands of visitors to come to our city every year.

2 And they do it in one of the most beautiful buildings  
3 you'll ever see, an historic structure in my district  
4 formerly the Speaker's district on 104th Street and  
5 Amsterdam where throughout the year hundreds of  
6 visitors from around the world can come and enjoy all  
7 the city has to offer. Can connect to our local  
8 community, support our local businesses, get to know  
9 neighbors, and generally make it a stronger place.  
10 It wouldn't be possible without the work of this  
11 incredible non-profit organization 25 years counting.  
12 We're so happy to acknowledge an your anniversary  
13 today. I'm going to pass the mic to my colleague  
14 Council Member Margaret Chin.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you. I was  
16 so impressed when I came to visit. It was such a  
17 beautiful facility, but seeing all the young people  
18 from around the world gathering together and you even  
19 have a facility where they can cook their own meals.  
20 And also, interacting with the community. It's just  
21 a wonderful, wonderful program, and when we heard  
22 that it was your 25th Anniversary, we said that we  
23 would have to bring you down to City Hall. And so,  
24 we really wanted to congratulate you, and wish you  
25 the best of success, and hopefully--And they were

2 tell me it's not just young people. They also have  
3 seniors, right, (laughs) who also utilize that also.  
4 So can we have the clerk read the proc. Thank you.

5 CLERK: Council City of New York  
6 Proclamation.

7 Whereas, the Council of the City of New  
8 York is proud to honor Hostelling International New  
9 York City upon its 25th Anniversary for promoting  
10 dynamic global communities, greater understanding of  
11 cultures, and innovative ideas through travel from  
12 its headquarters on the Upper West Side; and

13 Whereas, Hostelling International New  
14 York City, or HINYC, represents a sterling example  
15 for opening up cultural and travel opportunities for  
16 all innovating the hostel industry to provide  
17 affordable hospitality and quality programming while  
18 contributing to efforts--while contributing to  
19 efforts to help all, especially the young gain a  
20 greater understanding of the world through  
21 hostelling; and

22 Whereas, American Youth Hostel or AYH  
23 staff and volunteers collaborated with local  
24 neighborhood groups to transform an historic building  
25 designed by legendary architect Richard Morris Hunt

2 into New York City's first official hostel. This  
3 transformation saw previously dilapidated former  
4 charity home of the Association for the Relief of  
5 Respectable Age Indigent Females flourish once again  
6 as Hostelling International New York City Hostel, the  
7 flagship resident--residents of AYH and one of the  
8 largest and most renown hostels in the world; and

9           Whereas, since opening in 1990 as a  
10 501(c) (3) not--non-profit organization, HINYC has  
11 opened it's doors to over a million travelers  
12 greeting droves of mostly young people of succeeding  
13 generations with supremely high quality and  
14 affordable hospitality and housing; and

15           Whereas, HINYC was founded on an enduring  
16 belief in the power of travel to foster a deeper  
17 understanding of people, places and culture to  
18 promote a more tolerant world. It has thoughtfully  
19 constructed programming that offers various windows  
20 into the Upper West Side Area where it exists,  
21 providing unique walking tours of the neighborhood,  
22 exuberant musical events, and community celebrations  
23 as well as a wonderful cultural sporting and travel  
24 events that bring people together from all walks of  
25 life; and

2           Whereas, HINYC planted deep roots in the  
3 community by graciously welcoming neighborhood  
4 residents and volunteers from across the city to  
5 participate in its programs and use its common spaces  
6 for important public gatherings to build a vibrant  
7 community of global citizens who have the compassion  
8 to make the world a better place for all; and

9           Whereas, it is clear that HINYC as well  
10 as AYH have graciously provided countless travels--  
11 travelers from abroad the--the opportunity to stay  
12 comfortably in New York City and participate in the  
13 terrific cultural exchange that facilitates cross-  
14 cultural understanding.

15           Now, therefore, be it known that the  
16 Council of the City of New York is proud to honor  
17 Hostelling International New York City in its  
18 celebration of its 25th Anniversary. Melissa Mark-  
19 Viverito, Speaker for the Entire Council, Mark D.  
20 Levine, Council Member, 7th, District Manhattan,  
21 Margaret S. Chin, Council Member, 1st District  
22 Manhattan.

23           COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: All right.  
24 (applause, background comments) And now to say a few  
25 words on behalf of Hostelling International New York

2 City I'm pleased to introduce I believe the immediate  
3 Past Chair, Janet Thompson. (cheers and applause)

4 JANET THOMPSON: Thank you. Thank you.

5 Um, our relationship with City Council is wonderful  
6 today, but was grand when we first started this  
7 project because without the City Council there would  
8 be no Hostel on 103rd and Amsterdam. We worked  
9 closely with the city government right from the very  
10 beginning over the--Ruth Messenger and Gale Brewer  
11 and now all of you, Margaret Chin, Mark Levine and  
12 others to make this place a place that is welcoming  
13 to 70,000 visitors a year who stay an average of  
14 three nights. So we are doing 200,000 overnights a  
15 year, which is how we measure business in the hotel  
16 industry. And it's--it has been a wonderful,  
17 wonderful thing for that neighborhood and for the  
18 City of New York. We have brought in young people  
19 who can enjoy the city who could not otherwise afford  
20 it. But beyond being able to afford it, there is a  
21 jolliness and a camaraderie in the building that just  
22 replaces all thoughts of I can't wait to get home.  
23 People want to stay here and it's just wonderful, and  
24 we thank the City Council for its 25 years of  
25 support.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: All right.

3 JANET THOMPSON: Thank you.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: It's a pleasure.

5 Congratulations. (applause)

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Again, congrats  
7 and the last thing I'll say is also the partnership  
8 with the community. How many hundreds of community  
9 meetings do they host? How many community board  
10 meetings? How many events in events in general? So  
11 it's not just about the service that it provides to  
12 those coming in, but also the relationship that it  
13 builds for the surrounding communities. So thank you  
14 for that and congratulations on your 25 years.  
15 (background comments, applause, pause) Okay, we have  
16 one more proclamation, if we can, and this is very,  
17 very exciting. I want to thank Council Members Levin  
18 and Eugene. This is the first year and I was just  
19 went to the--to the lunch that was being hosted--that  
20 was being held for these young people before. I'm  
21 very excited to hear about this. This is in  
22 recognition of the Fostering Youth Success Alliance  
23 that this year the City Council engaged on a Foster  
24 Youth Shadow Day. So, all of he young people that  
25 are here are being mentored for the day by members of



2 the General Welfare and Youth or is it just the  
3 General Welfare Committee?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: And Youth.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And Youth  
6 Committees. The members, they have about 15 members  
7 that have mentored a young person today. So they  
8 have been shadowing them, learning about city  
9 government and engaging in a dialogue so that we can  
10 hear from them about their experience about what  
11 they've liked. And, you know, again when we as  
12 legislators do our job, it really is in true  
13 partnership with communities that we represent. We  
14 need to hear from all, including our young people  
15 about what the challenges are that we face each and  
16 every day, and what are the solutions that we can  
17 come--arrive at to make this city a better place for  
18 everyone. So, I'm very excited that the City Council  
19 did this for the first time this year. I said that  
20 (applause, cheers) hopefully next year, yeah. To  
21 those colleagues that do not sit on the Youth or  
22 General Welfare Committees, we would love to open  
23 this up to everyone next year so that we can have  
24 more young people thought--being mentored by us, and  
25 staff as well that have participated in this day. It

2 really has been a wonderful experience. I'm so  
3 excited and look forward to continuing moving  
4 forward, and I will ask Council Member Levin and--  
5 yeah, I know, and Council Member Eugene to maybe just  
6 say a few words before we read the proclamation.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, Madam  
8 Speaker. So this is a wonderful day, and I want to  
9 just read some acknowledgements from the Speaker's  
10 staff, Jenny Berger (sp?) Fiza Ali, Doheny Sompura,  
11 Brittany Morrissey, Andreas Vasquez, Tanya Cyrus,  
12 Jessica Dodson, Jessica Maxwell and the Fostering  
13 Youth Success Alliance, Children's Aid Society,  
14 Office of Public Policy, the Redlich Horwitz  
15 Foundation for helping sponsor today. Donald Fields  
16 is a young man who came to me with this idea back in  
17 May. This is really in large part his  
18 (applause/cheers) And--and ladies and gentlemen,  
19 these young people that are here today, that are  
20 joining us at the City Council are--they are our  
21 future and they are so inspiring with their  
22 perseverance, with their strength. They have  
23 overcome obstacles. They are moving on to great,  
24 great things, higher education, great careers. We  
25 just met with them. They gave us wonderful ideas for

2 policy proposals. It is an inspiration to be with  
3 you all today. Thank you so much for sharing your  
4 stories with us. Your stories and your voices are  
5 important. We need to hear them, and we look forward  
6 to working with you for many years to come on  
7 improving public policy here in New York City. So  
8 thank you, thank you so much. (applause/cheers)  
9 Really inspiring.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you so very  
11 much and let me first and foremost thank the Speaker  
12 for her leadership on this very important issue.  
13 Also for bringing us from the City Council together  
14 to address the issues that affect all the members,  
15 all the visitors of New York City especially those  
16 who need more attention. And I want to commend also  
17 my colleague Steven Levin and all of you for coming  
18 together to do this wonderful, wonderful program.  
19 This morning, you know, listening to the young people  
20 it was touching and inspiring. And as I said before,  
21 we will be in a better position to address the issues  
22 when we hear from you because you are the people who  
23 are going through what you are going through. And  
24 also it is very important we should see you, you  
25 know, not at the position you are at, but what you

2 can be, where you can be. And I thank all of the  
3 department. This is a wonderful thing but because of  
4 what you say, we City Council members we are going to  
5 continue to work together to better the system and to  
6 ensure that should become the future of the good City  
7 of New York. Thank you so much. Thank you.

8 (applause/cheers)

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: So again, thank  
10 you all young people who have participated. We are  
11 going to read the proclamation, and then we're going  
12 to ask representatives from the Alliance to say a few  
13 words after we read the proclamation. So if the  
14 clerk can read the proc.

15 CLERK: Council City of New York  
16 Proclamation.

17 Whereas, the Council of the City of New  
18 York is proud to partner with the Foster--the Foster  
19 Youth Success Alliance in our efforts of improving  
20 the foster care system on behalf of more than 11,000  
21 children and youth in New York City; and

22 Whereas, in 2014, a 11,554 children were  
23 in foster care, which represents a continuation of  
24 the consistent downward trend of the number of  
25 children in foster care over the past decade.

2 However, despite this steady decline, the largest  
3 group of young people in care, 40% continues to be  
4 youth 12 years and older. Youth may remain in foster  
5 care until they are 21, at which time they will age  
6 out of care and may not find a permanent family; and

7           Whereas, many youth who age out of the  
8 foster care system often do so without the basic  
9 tools they need to transition to adulthood  
10 successfully. They face enormous challenges in  
11 securing stable housing and employment and lack  
12 academic credentials and a permanent connection with  
13 supportive adults; and

14           Whereas, the Fostering Youth Success  
15 Alliance is a statewide group of advocates determined  
16 to help youth in and aging out of care realize their  
17 potential by focusing on improving their socio-  
18 economic health, housing and educational outcomes  
19 through collaborative advocacy for effective  
20 policies; and

21           Whereas, on this occasion the Fostering  
22 Youth Success Alliance in partnership with the New  
23 York City Council welcomes foster youth and alumni to  
24 share their experiences and recommendations for  
25 significant improvements to the foster care system in

2 new York City. Working together we can strengthen  
3 the foster care system to ensure that our city's  
4 youth are provided the opportunities and support  
5 necessary to succeed in the years ahead.

6 Now, therefore, be it known that the  
7 Council of the City of New York is proud to honor and  
8 support the Fostering Youth Success Alliance, and we  
9 hereby declare this 29th day of October to be the  
10 first New York City Youth--New York City Foster Youth  
11 Shadow Day. (applause) Melissa Mark-Viverito,  
12 Speaker for the Entire Council. Steven Levin, Chair,  
13 General Welfare Committee, Mathieu Eugene, Chair  
14 Youth Services Committee.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All right.  
16 (applause/cheers) So the reps are going to say a few  
17 words and speak on behalf of the--and also should we  
18 do this again next year. (applause/cheers) All  
19 right. Well, you have our commitment and we're  
20 hoping to grow it. So if the reps from your--Jessica  
21 and Don, Donald. Yes.

22 JESSICA: Well, thank you, Speaker  
23 Viverito and the City Council for partnering with us  
24 on this initiative, and it's definitely a historic  
25 day in New York City, and an historic day for these

2 young people here that are representing the foster  
3 care system, and alumni in the foster care system. I  
4 also just want to thank Council Member Levin and  
5 Council Member Eugene for their leadership and really  
6 championing this issue for these young people. But  
7 most importantly, I want to talk about the young  
8 people. The Fostering Youth Success Alliance aims to  
9 improve the lives of young people that are in the  
10 foster care system, and leaving the system through  
11 policies. And we are led by the Children's Aid  
12 Society, but without these young people here, without  
13 their stories and their courage and their strengths  
14 to come and share their experiences and use that to  
15 improve the system nothing will happen. So most  
16 importantly thank you all--

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All right.

18 (applause)

19 JESSICA: --and give yourselves a round  
20 of applause. (applause)

21 DONALD: Than you all and first I would  
22 like to say thank you to--I want to Speaker--

23 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet  
24 please.

2 DONALD: --the Speaker of the House,  
3 Melissa Mark-Viverito, Council Member Stephen Levin  
4 and Council Member Eugene Mathieu, as well as Jess, I  
5 am an advocate first and foremost, but I would like  
6 to say thank you to everybody that has come out today  
7 especially the young people. You was an inspiration  
8 for trying to get this to happen so that you can  
9 understand that children's voices does matter, and  
10 that it does hold a lot of influence. And I just  
11 want you all to know that great beyond even  
12 understanding and with more work like this we can  
13 continue to right some of the things that has  
14 happened, but also strengthen connections and  
15 strengthen relationships between the city and the  
16 foster youth so that we can have better outcomes for  
17 our young people. Thank you.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you.  
19 (applause/cheers) [off mic] Did you get a couple--  
20 did you guys get enough photos. All right, Bill got  
21 enough photos. Again, thank you. This has been  
22 really inspiring for me, too. I really enjoyed  
23 having you all here. I know that you're going to be  
24 sitting with us, right? And you're going to speak on  
25 behalf of the member that you're with. (background



2 comments) All right, thank you. That ends  
3 ceremonials. (background comments, pause)

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All right, women,  
5 the women of the Council. (gavel) (background  
6 comments)

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [off mic] Quiet  
8 please.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Although I'm more  
10 than happy to give my--so someone in pink. I'm more  
11 than happy to have one of our male colleagues wear my  
12 pink shirt (background comments) and join us up--all  
13 right, we can do it. We can do it. Hey, who wants  
14 pink shirts? I'm going to give it to--I'm going to  
15 give it to--to Jeremy who's--who's--I've got to get  
16 one. Where do we get the shirts. (background  
17 comments) Oh, Jeremy is going to do it for me.  
18 (laughs) He's representing all the male colleagues.  
19 So if the women in the Council come come up--  
20 (background comments)

21 [gavel]

22 CLERK: Ladies and gentlemen, can I have  
23 your attention, please. Quiet on the floor, please.  
24 Quiet on the floor, please. Quiet on the floor,  
25 please. At this time, please place all electronic

2 devices, all electronic devices to vibrate.

3 (background comments/noise) Will all non-Council  
4 employees, all non-Council employees [gave] please  
5 leave the main floor of the Chambers.

6 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [off mic] Quiet,  
7 please. Quiet please.

8 CLERK: Thank you.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Everyone please  
10 have their seat. Members, please have your seats.  
11 Staff, please clear the aisles. Quiet in the  
12 Chambers as we all rise for the Pledge of Allegiance.

13 [Pledge of Allegiance]

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Be please be  
15 seated. Roll call.

16 CLERK: Arroyo.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: [off mic] Here.

18 CLERK: Barron.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.

20 CLERK: Cabrera.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

22 [shushing for quiet]

23 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down, please.

24 [background comments]

25 CLERK: Chin.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

3 CLERK: Cohen.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

5 CLERK: Constantinides.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

7 CLERK: Cornegy.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Present.

9 CLERK: Crowley.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Here.

11 CLERK: Cumbo.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Here.

13 CLERK: Deutsch. Dickens. Dromm.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

15 CLERK: Espinal

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

17 [shushing for quiet]

18 CLERK: Eugene.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Present.

20 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND:

22 Present.

23 CLERK: Garodnick.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.

25 CLERK: Gentile.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: [off mic] Here.

3 CLERK: Gibson.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Here.

5 CLERK: Greenfield.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Here.

7 CLERK: Johnson.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Here.

9 CLERK: Kallos.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

11 CLERK: King.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.

13 CLERK: Koo.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

15 CLERK: Koslowitz.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: [off mic]

17 Here.

18 CLERK: Lancman.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.

20 CLERK: Lander. Levin.

21 [background comments]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

23 CLERK: Levine. Maisel.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.

25

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
3 [shushing for quiet]

4 CLERK: Mealy. Menchaca.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Here.  
6 Presente. (laughs)

7 CLERK: Mendez.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.

9 CLERK: Miller.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.

11 CLERK: Palma.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Here.

13 CLERK: Reynoso. Richards.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

15 CLERK: Rodriguez.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [off mic]  
17 Here.

18 CLERK: Rose.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [off mic] Here.

20 CLERK: Rosenthal.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [off mic]  
22 Here.

23 CLERK: Torres.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Here.

25 CLERK: Treyger.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

3 CLERK: Ulrich. Vacca.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.

5 CLERK: Vallone.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

7 CLERK: Williams.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [off mic] Here.

9 CLERK: Wills.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: [off mic] Present.

11 CLERK: Matteo. Van Bramer.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

13 CLERK: Speaker Mark Viverito.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] Here.

15 CLERK: Thank you.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [on mic] Here.

17 CLERK: Thank you.

18 [background comments]

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the  
20 Chambers. Please rise for the Invocation, which will  
21 be delivered by Reverend Elizabeth G. Maxwell, the  
22 Church of the Ascension, 12 West 11th Street in the  
23 Borough of Manhattan. Quiet in the Chambers.

24 REVEREND ELIZABETH MAXWELL: Let us pray.

25 Gracious God, we know you through many names, and we

2 follow you by many paths, but always you call us to  
3 love justice, to care for our neighbors, and to walk  
4 with integrity. We thank you for the gorgeous  
5 diversity of our city, and for the many communities  
6 and peoples that you've called us to serve. Bless  
7 the members of this Council that they may be a  
8 blessing. Fill them with courage and compassion with  
9 wisdom and inspiration, and grant that they may  
10 always care especially for the most vulnerable among  
11 and build up the common good. We pray in your many  
12 names. Amen.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amen. Please be  
14 seated. Motion to spread the invocation in full upon  
15 the record? Council Member Corey Johnson.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam  
17 Public Advocate. I make a motion to spread--

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Excuse me,  
19 Council Member. Quiet in the Chambers, please.

20 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: May we have it quiet,  
21 please.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the  
23 Chambers. We apologize, Council Member.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam  
25 Public Advocate. I make a motion to spread the

2 Invocation in full upon the record, and I would like  
3 to just say a few words about--

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
5 [shushing for quiet]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: --Reverend  
7 Elizabeth G. Maxwell. She is relatively new to this  
8 church, the Church of Ascension on 5th Avenue in  
9 Greenwich Village. She is not new to my district,  
10 and is not new to the west side of Manhattan.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
12 [shushing for quiet]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: She has lived  
14 and worked in this borough for 25 years, and for the  
15 last many years she was the Associate Rector of the  
16 Church of Holy Apostles in Chelsea, and I believe you  
17 were actually there, Madam Public Advocate. That's  
18 where my inauguration was, and this actually the  
19 busiest soup kitchen in New York City, and one of the  
20 busiest soup kitchens on the East Coast of the United  
21 States of America. And Reverend Maxwell was the  
22 Program Director at that soup kitchen and helped make  
23 it such a shiny success. So I am grateful for her  
24 service to the community, and I am grateful that she



2 is here today to give the invocation the City  
3 Council. Thank you very much Reverend Maxwell.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,  
5 Council Member. Adoption of Minutes, Council Member  
6 Levin.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I move that the  
8 minutes of the Stated Meeting of September 30, 2015  
9 be adopted as printed.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Messages and  
11 papers from the Mayor.

12 CLERK: None.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication  
14 from City, County and Borough Offices.

15 CLERK: Preconsidered M 343 submitting  
16 Orlando Marin for appointment to the City Planning  
17 Commission.

18 SHELDON EDWARDS: Rules, Privileges and  
19 Elections.

20 CLERK: Preconsidered M 344, Transfer  
21 funds between agencies.

22 MALE SPEAKER: Finance.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and  
24 Communications.

25 CLERK: None.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call-  
3 Ups.

4 CLERK: M 345.

5 SHELDON EDWARDS: Roll call.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Roll call.

7 CLERK: Arroyo.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: [off mic] Aye.

9 CLERK: Barron.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.

11 CLERK: Cabrera.

12 CLERK: Chin.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

14 CLERK: Cohen.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I vote aye, and  
16 with permission I vote aye on all General Orders.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you. Aye.

19 CLERK: Constanti--Constantinides.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Madam

21 Public Advocate, I'd like to vote aye on all Land Use  
22 Call-Ups, and with permission I'd like to vote aye on  
23 all General Order Calendars.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

25

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 35

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank

3 you.

4 CLERK: Cornegy.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member

6 Cornegy.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.

8 CLERK: Crowley.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [off mic] Yes.

10 CLERK: Cumbo.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member

12 Cumbo.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

15 CLERK: Dromm.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

17 CLERK: Espinal. Eugene.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.

19 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: I vote

21 aye.

22 CLERK: Garodnick.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

24 CLERK: Gentile.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye on all.

2 CLERK: Gibson.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Aye.

4 CLERK: Greenfield.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: My assistant  
6 today, Rihanna Hayes will vote on my behalf.

7 RIHANNA HAYES: Aye.

8 CLERK: Johnson.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.

10 CLERK: Kallos.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

12 CLERK: King.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye.

14 CLERK: Koo.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote aye and with  
16 permission I'd like to vote aye on all General  
17 Orders.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: [off mic] And I also  
20 want to take this opportunity to--

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

22 Your mic, sir.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Your mic. Put  
24 your mic on.

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I want to just take  
3 this opportunity to welcome three visitors from Seoul  
4 Korea. They are from the Seoul Metropolitan Council  
5 Budget Division and Public Information--Information  
6 and Legislative Division. They are sitting in the  
7 balcony. So, let's give them a real welcome.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We welcome you.  
9 [applause] We welcome you to the City Council.  
10 Welcome here. We welcome you and thank you for  
11 visiting us from Seoul, Korea. Everyone give them a  
12 round of applause. [applause] Continue with roll  
13 call.

14 CLERK: Deutsch.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.

16 CLERK: Koslowitz.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I vote aye and  
18 ask permission to vote on all General Orders.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I vote aye.

21 CLERK: Lancman.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: [off mic] Aye.

23 CLERK: Lander. Levin.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I vote aye on all.

25 CLERK: Levine.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

3 CLERK: Maisel.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: [off mic] Aye on  
5 all.

6 CLERK: Mealy. Menchaca.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: [off mic] Aye.

8 CLERK: Mendez.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

10 CLERK: Miller.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye on all.

12 CLERK: Palma.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

14 CLERK: Reynoso.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

16 CLERK: Richards.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

18 CLERK: Rodriguez.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye and I  
20 would like to vote aye on all General Order.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

23 CLERK: Rose.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [off mic] Aye.

25 CLERK: Rosenthal.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

39

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [off mic] Aye.

3 CLERK: Torres.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all.

5 CLERK: Treyger.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

7 CLERK: Vacca.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I vote aye and I  
9 ask permission to vote aye on all General Calendar  
10 Orders.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you.

13 CLERK: Vallone.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye, and Madam  
15 Advocate, may I have permission to vote aye on all  
16 matters on today's calendar?

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, sir.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: I vote aye.

19 Thank you.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

21 CLERK: Williams.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye.

23 CLERK: Wills.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Madam Advocate--

25 Public Advocate, I would like vote aye on all Call-

2 Ups with permission, and aye on all coupled General  
3 Orders, but I would like 30 seconds--

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

5 Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: --because I have  
7 to leave. Thank you. I vote aye on all. I wanted  
8 to make mention that Tony Turner, who is here today  
9 with us--

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

11 [shushing for quiet]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: --he's a Youth  
13 Ambassador for New Yorkers for Children, and my  
14 second comment is that I wanted to thank the Speaker  
15 and Council Member Donovan Richards in which--in the  
16 way that they represented this Council yesterday at  
17 the funeral for our fallen hero. The way the Speaker  
18 represented us and the words that Council Member  
19 Richards spoke of Blue lives matter and Black lives  
20 matter has encapsulated the work that we have done,  
21 and I just think that we should just thank them for  
22 the way they represented us. Thank you.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

24 CLERK: Matteo.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: [off mic] Aye.



2 CLERK: Van Bramer.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: I vote aye.

4 CLERK: Speaker Mark Viverito.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [By proxy] I vote  
6 aye on all.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Today's Land Use  
8 Call-Ups were adopted by a vote of 43 in the  
9 affirmative and 0 in the negative. Discussion of  
10 General Orders. Seeing none. Reports of Special  
11 Committee.

12 CLERK: None.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And now,  
14 Communication from the Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madam  
16 Public Advocate. (coughs) Before we begin today, so  
17 it's obviously since the last time we met, we had an  
18 unfortunate tragedy. I want to ask my colleagues to  
19 please stand--

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
21 Everyone rise.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --as we  
23 acknowledge the passing of Officer Randolph Holder.  
24 Detective Holder was senselessly killed last week  
25 while bravely serving in the line of duty, and it is

2 a reminder every day of the courageous men and women  
3 of the NYPD who selflessly serve New York City with  
4 honor and dignity, and definitely violence against  
5 our officers or anyone else in the city is never  
6 acceptable. This hit especially close to home for me  
7 because Detective Holder, the follow-up--the five  
8 years he was in the NYPD served exclusively in my  
9 district, and was in East Harlem when he was killed.  
10 Our deepest sympathies and prayers are with Detective  
11 Holder's loved ones, and the entire NYPD family  
12 during this tragic time, and I would like to ask  
13 everyone for a moment of silence. [A moment of  
14 silence was observed] Thank you.

15 [background comments]

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
17 [shushing for quiet]

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Today, is also  
20 the third anniversary of Hurricane Sandy. When  
21 Hurricane Sandy made landfall in our city, it  
22 disrupted countless lives. Some--many are still  
23 rebuilding their homes, businesses, communities, and  
24 lives three years later, and it is our duty to remain  
25 focused on the goal of completely rebuilding New York

2 City in the months and years to come. And I want to  
3 thank particularly the Chair of the Recovery  
4 Committee and Mark Treyger for his advocacy. Based  
5 on our advocacy, I know that there's been a lot of  
6 improvements, but there's still a lot of work to get  
7 done. Definitely, we must not forget that we need to  
8 be diligent in that work moving forward.

9           Today, we're going to be voting on  
10 legislation to enhance reporting requirements  
11 relating to physical education in New York City  
12 schools. Physical education can help in the fight  
13 against obesity, and set the foundation for life long  
14 health and good exercise habits. It is absolutely  
15 critical that all children in city schools receive  
16 appropriate opportunities to participate in physical  
17 education activities. This bill will increase  
18 transparency in this area, and help ensure that our  
19 schools are in complete compliance with state  
20 regulations regarding physical education. Let's not  
21 forget there are requirements that every child must  
22 engage in some type of physical activity, and we as a  
23 city are now honoring that. This information is  
24 critical. I want to thank on the staff side Aysha  
25 Schaumburg, Joan Povolny (sp?), Jan Atwell, Terzah

2 Nasser and Lyle Frank and the lead sponsors Council  
3 Member Elizabeth Crowley who will say a few words  
4 about the bill.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you. I am  
6 pleased that we are voting on this physical education  
7 bill. I want to thank our Speaker Melissa Mark-  
8 Viverito for championing physical education in our  
9 schools, and Committee Chair Council Member Daniel  
10 Dromm for his leadership in our schools and on this  
11 bill. Today, too many of our children are being  
12 denied the basic physical education they deserve, the  
13 basic minimum standard that is set forth by the  
14 State. This bill is simply about fairness. As a  
15 public school parent, I remember being frustrated  
16 with the substitution of gym class for test prep.  
17 Too many parents have contacted me about their  
18 children not having a certified physical education  
19 teacher in their schools or that their children are  
20 not going to school with adequate space for physical  
21 education instruction. This comprehensive bill  
22 requires schools to report how frequently gym class  
23 is held. If it is taught by a certified physical  
24 education instructor, and information about the  
25 physical spaces classes are held in. Comprehensive

2 physical education during school days has been shown  
3 to improve health, focus and academic performance.  
4 Ultimately, this legislation will allow the Council  
5 to understand which schools are falling short and  
6 why. The study shows students in low-income  
7 neighborhoods are disproportionately affected by the  
8 lack of physical education. And as a result, we are  
9 seeing an increase in childhood and teen obesity  
10 rates. Physical education is a crucial step in  
11 combating this. I want to thank Comptroller Scott  
12 Stringer for recently issue the report *Dropping the*  
13 *Ball*, which showed hundreds of thousands of our  
14 students not getting the basics, as well as the  
15 American Heart Association, which recently released  
16 the report showing that 60% of our students in our  
17 schools are not getting the basic standard that the  
18 State sets. I also want to thank the Physical  
19 Education for all known as Phys Ed for All Coalition  
20 as well as the New York Lawyers for Public Interest.  
21 And again, the American Heart Association. I want to  
22 thank Aysha Schaumburg and Jeff Mailman for their  
23 work, Jeff from my team. Aysha who is the Committee  
24 Counsel, and I also want to recognize my other sister  
25 who was a nursing student who brought this to my

2 attention and a study that she had one. And, it was  
3 that three years ago that I started the work on this,  
4 and we would not be voting on it today, if it was not  
5 for the leadership of our Speaker and again Council  
6 Member Dromm. Thank you.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,  
8 Council Member. Additionally, we're voting on two  
9 bills to enhance the data sharing and transparency of  
10 the Citi Bike Program. Citi Bike has been a popular  
11 transportation solution that is environmentally  
12 friendly and encourages physical activity. Indeed,  
13 the program will be expanding to twice its current  
14 size by 2017. The city is proud to encourage this  
15 expansion, and would increase data sharing and  
16 transparency, will be able to further facilitate  
17 growth in a physically responsible and efficient  
18 manner. The first bill would require Citi Bike to  
19 provide the Department of Transportation with  
20 financial data including revenues generated,  
21 information on deficits or profits, and the amount of  
22 revenue that was allocated to DOT. The second bill  
23 would require the Department of Transportation to  
24 compile a report on Citi Bike usage data quarter  
25 beginning January 1st of 2016. With these two bills,

2 we'll have a good idea of what the needs of both the  
3 city and the Citi Bike program are as we move forward  
4 and expand this service to more and more New Yorkers  
5 in the years to come. On the staff side I definitely  
6 want to thank Kelly Taylor, Gafar Yaloff, Jonathan  
7 Massarano, Russell Murphy, Terzah Nasser, and Lyle  
8 Frank. The lead sponsors of those bills are Council  
9 Members Ydanis Rodriguez and Council Member Brad  
10 Lander, both who are not here at the moment. So I  
11 want to thank them for their advocacy.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
13 [shushing for quiet]

14 SHELDON EDWARDS: Finally, we are voting  
15 on a revised plan to help facilitate the construction  
16 of the New York Wheel in Staten Island. This is a  
17 project that will become one of New York City's  
18 landmark attractions in the years to come, and  
19 today's modification will allow for better  
20 infrastructure and facilities to make that plan a  
21 reality. [applause] Council Member Rose--there she  
22 is. She's coming back to her chair--is the sponsor  
23 of this legislation and if she could say a few words.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Whee, the Wheel.  
25 Thank you, Madam Chair. (laughs) I mean Madam

2 Speaker. I'd like to thank the Speaker for really  
3 enduring this laborious process that we went through  
4 to come to today's outcome. I'd like to thank Chair  
5 Greenfield and Chair Richards for revisiting this  
6 process, and going through such a federal hearing.  
7 I'd like to thank Raju Mann and Ami Levitan for all  
8 of the background work that they did, making this  
9 wheel a reality for Staten Island and New York City.  
10 This afternoon, we will vote on the proposed changes  
11 to the New York Wheel, changes driven primarily by  
12 the analysis of the soil beneath the corner of the  
13 site, which reduce the overall blueprint of the  
14 Wheel. While these changes have given us some  
15 initial challenges, they have also presented us with  
16 the opportunity to revisit the impact that this  
17 project would have on Staten Island and on the city  
18 as a whole. I am pleased to say that throughout this  
19 process, we maintained a positive working  
20 relationship of mutual respect for the benefit of all  
21 Staten Islanders, and for that I'm appreciative. I've  
22 been in conversation with the developers and the  
23 administration to ensure that these changes do not  
24 adversely impact Staten Islanders. And, because of  
25 this process and these conversations, I can give



2 these--I can give these modifications my full  
3 support. All of the points of agreement that I  
4 fought for in the 2013 ULURP are positively reflected  
5 in these changes. With the ongoing oversight and  
6 diligence this project will benefit all Staten  
7 Islanders, and I encourage my colleagues to vote aye.  
8 In plans we're voting on today and current agreements  
9 with the administration, we have all of the benefits  
10 to the surrounding area that were previously secure.  
11 In addition, my--my constituents will be getting a  
12 new park that will be even more accessible than it as  
13 in the previous plan with added ramps and paths and  
14 improved playground equipment, and we will still have  
15 a dedicated community meeting space. We have  
16 adequate parking, and this project will be even more  
17 environmentally sustainable than the previous plan  
18 because it will have a naturally ventilated garage  
19 instead of the mechanically ventilated garage that  
20 was planned originally. I'm working with the  
21 developers on a STEM program that we can bring into  
22 the local schools that will use the Wheel to teach  
23 students about science and technology. And I'm  
24 really proud of the fact that we were able to secure  
25 a free ride for all New York City students on the

2 Wheel in the first year of its operation. As a  
3 strong proponent of economic development in Staten  
4 Island, I give these design modifications my full  
5 support, and I look forward to the possibilities that  
6 that the New York Wheel will bring to Staten Island  
7 and New York City. Thank you.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,  
9 Council Member. Today, also as we celebrated earlier  
10 during the ceremonials, the Council's first ever  
11 Foster Youth Shadow Day, and we are honored to be  
12 joined by foster youth, and foster youth that I'm  
13 mentoring today is Sheldon Edwards who has been doing  
14 a great job to stand in for me as Speaker.  
15 [applause] All right. So he's from Coney Island,  
16 Mark Treyger. So, you know, he's a constituents of  
17 yours. So we're obviously very honored to have you  
18 all here with us. This is really great, and we  
19 really welcome you for--welcome you always into this  
20 chamber and look forward to the partnership moving  
21 forward. So good luck in all your endeavors and  
22 thank you for being with us here today.

23 Additionally, we want to welcome  
24 delegates. As Council Member Koo already indicated  
25 are visiting us from the Seoul Metropolitan Council.

2 We're proud and honored to have civic leaders from  
3 city governments from all over the world visit our  
4 City Council every year, and we thank you for joining  
5 us. We also want to welcome--and Council Member Van  
6 Bramer has been working closely with them--20 art  
7 students who are upstairs visiting from Amsterdam  
8 School of the Arts led by Gainwell Trapman (sp?),  
9 Artistic Director, the learning of arts advocacy in  
10 the United States and in New York City. So we have a  
11 great group [applause] from both--from both  
12 countries. So thank you for that, and finally, I  
13 definitely want to wish the New York Mets the best of  
14 luck tomorrow (applause/cheers) in game three.  
15 They're coming home, you know, so we know it's--it's  
16 looking a little bleak right now but, you know,  
17 they're New Yorkers. They're scrappy. We're going  
18 to make it happen, right? I'm excited I'll be there  
19 to watch that game and the first game here in New  
20 York, and definitely they're not going to let  
21 anything get them down, and if history is a  
22 predictor, most of us remember the message of 1986.  
23 I was a big fan at that time--

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

25 [shushing for quiet]

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --and came from a  
3 zero to two start to win the World Series. There is  
4 history here. So let's cheer them on and bring the  
5 championship home. Let's go Mets. (applause/cheers)  
6 And with that, I end communication from the Speaker.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: You've got to  
8 believe. Yes. We welcome you from Amsterdam and from  
9 Seoul. Any discussion of General Orders? Seeing  
10 none, Report of Special Committees.

11 CLERK: None.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of  
13 Standing Committees.

14 CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
15 Education, Intro 655-B, Department of Education  
16 Report on Physical Education.

17 SHELDON EDWARDS: Amended and coupled on  
18 General Orders.

19 CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
20 Finance, Preconsidered Reso 888, Organization  
21 Funding.

22 SHELDON EDWARDS: Coupled on General  
23 Orders.

24 CLERK: Preconsidered M 344 and Reso 893  
25 Transfer of city funds.

2 SHELDON EDWARDS: Coupled on General  
3 Orders.

4 CLERK: Preconsidered LU 295 and Reso  
5 894--

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
7 [shushing for quiet]

8 CLERK: --through Preconsidered LU 298  
9 and Reso 897 on page 3.

10 SHELDON EDWARDS: Coupled on General  
11 Orders.

12 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Land  
13 Use, LU 288 and Reso 898 Special Permit.

14 SHELDON EDWARDS: Coupled on General  
15 Orders.

16 CLERK: (coughs) Excuse me. LU 289 and  
17 Reso 899, Hamilton Plaza.

18 SHELDON EDWARDS: Approved with  
19 modifications and Coupled on General Orders.

20 CLERK: LU 293 and Reso 900 Property Tax  
21 Exemption.

22 SHELDON EDWARDS: Coupled on General  
23 Orders.

24 CLERK: LU 294 and Reso 901, UDAAP  
25 Brooklyn.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

54

2 SHELTON EDWARDS: Coupled on General  
3 Orders.

4 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Rules,  
5 Privileges and Elections, Preconsidered M 343 and  
6 Reso 902 approving the reappointment of Orlando  
7 Marin, Planning Commission.

8 SHELTON EDWARDS: Coupled on General  
9 Orders.

10 CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
11 Transportation, Intro 210-A Bike Share Usage Data.

12 SHELTON EDWARDS: Amended and Coupled on  
13 General Orders.

14 CLERK: Intro 225-A, Bike Share Financial  
15 Reporting.

16 SHELTON EDWARDS: Amended and Coupled on  
17 General Orders.

18 CLERK: On the General Order Calendar,  
19 Resolution appointing various persons Commission of  
20 Deeds.

21 SHELTON EDWARDS: Coupled on General  
22 Orders.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] I  
24 think you can read that.

25

2 SHELDON EDWARDS: At this time, I ask for  
3 a roll call on all items on the Coupled General  
4 Orders of the Calendar.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] Yes.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the  
7 Chambers, please. Quiet in the Chambers.

8 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down, please.  
9 Keep it down.

10 CLERK: Arroyo.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: [off mic] Aye.

12 CLERK: Barron.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to  
14 explain my vote.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. I just  
17 want to say I want to commend the sponsors of the  
18 bills that are here, and particularly the bill  
19 relating to physical education reporting because it's  
20 such a critical area. I did have an opportunity to  
21 be a principal at a school, and I know that it's a  
22 strain in terms of staffing to have a phys ed teacher  
23 assigned, but it's something that's very important.  
24 So I made that sacrifice, and I'm sure that as we go  
25 forward, we can look to see how we can give schools

2 the funding that they need so that they can have phys  
3 ed teachers without having it be a detriment to the  
4 rest of the staffing. I vote aye on all. Thank you.

5 CLERK: Chin.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: May I have  
7 permission to explain my vote?

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: First I want to  
10 welcome all of the foster youth advocates who are  
11 here today--

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
13 [shushing for quiet]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: --especially the  
15 ones foster youth advocate that's following me today,  
16 Kayla, and I really admire her for her courage. And  
17 I really had a great time talking with her, and  
18 really discussing and hearing all of the suggestions  
19 for these youth advocates. And I also want to  
20 congratulate Council Member Rose on the Big Wheel in  
21 Staten Island. (laughter) Originally, they were  
22 coming to Governors Island, but they ended up in  
23 Staten Island. That's great. So I vote aye on all.  
24 Thank you.

25 CLERK: Cornegy.



2 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I vote aye on  
3 all.

4 CLERK: Crowley.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [off mic] Aye  
6 on all.

7 CLERK: Cumbo.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission to  
9 explain my vote?

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I want to  
12 congratulate Council Member Debbie Rose. Today is  
13 certainly a historical day for her. I know how  
14 diligently she has been working to make an economic  
15 development impact in the North Shore of Staten  
16 Island. This is going to be a huge part of your  
17 legacy. It is going to benefit all of Staten Island  
18 and it's going to attract people from all over the  
19 world to find out how dynamic and incredible Staten  
20 Island really is. So I am so glad and so proud of  
21 you, and I just want to continue to work with you  
22 because this is going to have the type of impact that  
23 we as council members like to have in our districts.  
24 So congratulations. The best is yet to come, and I  
25 vote aye.

2 CLERK: Deutsch.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.

4 CLERK: Dromm.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Permission to  
6 explain my vote.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you very  
9 much. I, too, want to compliment Council Member  
10 Debbie Rose for the hard work that she has done on  
11 this economic development piece for her district.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
13 [shushing for quiet]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: We love you,  
15 Debbie, and this is great news for you. So I also  
16 want to take the opportunity to congratulate Council  
17 Member Elizabeth Crowley for the work that she's done  
18 on physical education. Actually, we've already begun  
19 to see the results of that because this Council  
20 included in the budget past additional resources and  
21 funds for physical education teachers and programs in  
22 our public school system. And this piece of  
23 legislation that we're passing today will continue to  
24 shine the light on what the needs of our public  
25 school system are. And once we get those facts,

2 numbers and figures then we can begin to figure out  
3 what type of plan we need to move forward. So  
4 congratulations Council Member Crowley. I vote aye  
5 on all items.

6 CLERK: Espinal.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I vote aye on  
8 all.

9 CLERK: Eugene.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye on  
11 all.

12 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: I vote  
14 aye on all.

15 CLERK: Garodnick.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

17 CLERK: Gentile.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: With  
19 congratulations to Staten Island's Debbie Rose, I  
20 vote aye on all.

21 CLERK: Gibson.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I vote aye on  
23 all.

24 CLERK: Greenfield.

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: May I explain  
3 my vote?

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you,  
6 Madam Public Advocate. First, I want to welcome my  
7 two foster youth staffers for the day--

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
9 [shushing for quiet]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: -Rihanna  
11 Hayes sitting to my right who is a up and coming sous  
12 chef, and Shakka Penette (sic) who is sitting to my  
13 left who will be well known for his pastry delicacies  
14 in the future as a pastry chef. Both resident  
15 Brooklynites. It's great to have them here with me  
16 today. I do want to congratulate Council Members  
17 Crowley, Lander and Rodriguez on their important  
18 legislation. I especially want to thank Council  
19 Member Rose for the real perseverance in fighting for  
20 her constituency and making sure that this deal with  
21 the New York Wheel would be the best possible deal  
22 for her community and her constituents and all of  
23 Staten Island. I think under great challenges she's  
24 done exceptionally well. So thank you, Council Member  
25 Rose. And I also would like to encourage folks to

2 vote for Orlando Marin into the City Planning  
3 Commission. As my role as Chair of the Land Use  
4 Committee, I met with him. He is very well  
5 qualified. He's been doing a very good job, and was  
6 referred to us by Bronx Borough President Ruben Diaz,  
7 Jr. And finally, I do want to wish a bittersweet  
8 farewell to my trusted staffer Juliani Deshan (sp?)  
9 who unfortunately for me is moving onto greener  
10 pastures. He has accepted a position with my friend,  
11 Lieutenant Governor Kathy Hochul as her Downstate  
12 Director. He literally would spend 18 to 20 hours a  
13 day with me in the course of my work, which certainly  
14 doesn't lend itself well for long-term employment,  
15 but I am grateful for that time, and the effort that  
16 he was with me. I'm very proud of him, and I wish him  
17 continued success, and I vote aye on all.

18 (applause/cheers)

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the  
20 Chambers. Continue with roll call.

21 CLERK: Johnson.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Permission to  
23 explain my vote.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, sir.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I want to  
3 congratulate Council Member Rose and Crowley for this  
4 very important and exciting piece of legislation  
5 today on physical education. And I also want to  
6 congratulate Council Member Rose. When we started  
7 hearing the words "wheel" today--I guess this says  
8 more about me than anyone else--but the Tina Turner  
9 song Proud Mary Big Wheel Keep on Turning--

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: (laughs)

11 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: --started going  
12 through my mind. So congratulations, Debbie, on this  
13 very exciting development in your project, and with  
14 that--[background comments]

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: It's aye on all.  
17 Thank you.

18 CLERK: Kallos.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye on all.

20 CLERK: King.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Congratulations to  
22 all the Council Members who had their legislation  
23 passed today, and I vote aye on all.

24 CLERK: Koo.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

2 CLERK: Koslowitz.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: [off mic]

4 Here.

5 CLERK: Lancman.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.

7 CLERK: Lander. Levin.

8 [background comments]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

10 CLERK: Levine. Maisel.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

13 [shushing for quiet]

14 CLERK: Mealy. Menchaca.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Here.

16 Presente. (laughs)

17 CLERK: Mendez.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.

19 CLERK: Miller.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.

21 CLERK: Palma.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Here.

23 CLERK: Reynoso. Richards.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

25 CLERK: Rodriguez.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

64

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [off mic]

3 Here.

4 CLERK: Rose.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [off mic] Here.

6 CLERK: Rosenthal.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [off mic]

8 Here.

9 CLERK: Torres.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Here.

11 CLERK: Treyger.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

13 CLERK: Ulrich. Vacca.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.

15 CLERK: Vallone.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

17 CLERK: Williams.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [off mic] Here.

19 CLERK: Wills.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: [off mic] Present.

21 CLERK: Matteo. Van Bramer.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

23 CLERK: Speaker Mark Viverito.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] Here.

25 CLERK: Thank you.



2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [on mic] Here.

3 CLERK: Thank you.

4 FOSTER YOUTH FEMALE: Congratulations to  
5 all the Council Members who had their legislation  
6 passed today, and I vote aye on all.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

8 CLERK: Lancman.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: [off mic] Aye on  
10 all.

11 CLERK: Levin.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Madam Speaker, I  
13 just want to take this opportunity to introduce my  
14 Foster Youth that is shadowing me today, Ivan Mendez,  
15 is an incredibly intelligent, bright young man who  
16 has matriculated at Saint Lawrence University, and  
17 he--I'm thrilled to be able to get to know him today,  
18 and I expect wonderful things from him in the future.  
19 And so, Ivan, take it away.

20 IVAN MENDEZ: I vote aye on all.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [off mic] Good  
22 Job.

23 IVAN MENDEZ: (laughs)

24 CLERK: Levine.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: With  
3 congratulations to our sponsors, Council Members  
4 Rose, Crowley, Rodriguez, and Lander, I am happy to  
5 vote aye on all.

6 CLERK: Maisel

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: [off mic] I vote  
8 aye.

9 CLERK: Menchaca.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to--  
11 permission to explain my vote, please.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you. So,  
14 I've also had the pleasure of having our wonderful  
15 amazing young folks here and get--got to meet Rosie.  
16 Rosie is an emerging artist in our community from  
17 Brooklyn, Bed-Stuy, and in the short time that I've  
18 gotten to meet her (laughter) and the work that she's  
19 doing, just in the work for advocacy for the foster  
20 care system, we've already designed so many new ways  
21 for a participatory model for allowing youthful  
22 voices to change the system. And so, thank you for  
23 your courage. Thank you for all of your courage, and  
24 we'll continue to work together, and know that your

2 family is here at the City Council, every one of us,  
3 and with that, I--I give it over to--to Rosie.

4 ROSIE: I just want to say thank you for  
5 having all the youth here, and having us experience  
6 this wonderful, wonderful thing, and I vote aye on  
7 all.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you.

10 CLERK: Mendez.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote aye.

12 CLERK: Miller.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Congratulations  
14 to today's sponsors and I vote aye on all.

15 CLERK: Palma.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Permission to  
17 explain my vote.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: I just want to  
20 congratulate Council Member Rose for her success in  
21 her community with the Wheel, and thank Council  
22 Member Levin and Eugene for putting together Youth  
23 Shadow Day. I think it's been an amazing opportunity  
24 for us to continue to stay humble to the work that we  
25 do.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
3 [shushing for quiet]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: I am sitting with  
5 Destiny Brownley and, you know, an amazing young  
6 woman, a senior in high school, and I know she's  
7 going to go far. I just want you to know that we're  
8 proud for you to be here with us today, but for the  
9 rest of the youth as well. Destiny.

10 DESTINY BROWNLEY: I vote aye.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

12 CLERK: Reynoso.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I vote aye on  
14 all.

15 CLERK: Richards.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Permission to  
17 explain my vote.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: First, I want  
20 to acknowledge my shadow mentee today, Rihanna  
21 Marley, who has some relationship with Bob Marley.  
22 We're trying to--still trying to figure that out.  
23 She is 15 years old, and she will actually be  
24 graduating high school this year. So she is much  
25 smarter than me, (applause) and she is going to study

2 radiology or law in college. So I wanted to  
3 congratulate her on that, and I also wanted to  
4 congratulate Council Member Debbie Rose for not only  
5 getting the largest Ferris Wheel in Staten Island in  
6 the world, but managing to help Staten Island reach  
7 higher heights (background comments) through local  
8 hiring and MWBE agreements with the developers. It's  
9 a pleasure to work with you on this. I will now turn  
10 it over to Ms. Marley who is a Buffalo soldier.

11 RIHANNA MARLEY: I vote aye on all.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

13 CLERK: Rose.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Permission to  
15 explain my vote.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes. [shushing  
17 for quiet]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I would really like  
19 to commend Council Member Richards for his moving and  
20 poignant eulogy yesterday for Detective Holder. And  
21 I'd like to congratulate Council Members Crowley and  
22 Rodriguez, and I really want to give all of my  
23 colleagues a big thank you for supporting a wheelie,  
24 wheelie, wheelie big wheel. Thank you.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: (laughs)

2 CLERK: Rosenthal.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye on all,  
4 but can I explain my vote very quickly?

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I want to  
7 count--echo the other council members in support and  
8 congratulation to Council Member Rose for her big  
9 wheel. That was a big battle that happened sort of  
10 before I got here but--

11 COUNCIL MEMBER: [off mic] It's a wheelie  
12 big wheel.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: It's a  
14 wheelie--yeah, can you wait for your turn to do that?

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: (laughing)

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: But it is a--a  
17 very large wheel.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
19 [shushing for quiet]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: But I can't  
21 want to come visit and, of course, I'll visit Coney  
22 Island first 'cause I owe him a visit, too. But, and  
23 also to Council Member Crowley on her leadership for  
24 making sure our kids get physical education in  
25 school. Thank you so much for that. Council Member

2 Levine, next year not just the General Welfare  
3 Committee--I know you were sleeping during this--but  
4 really all of us. Okay, I didn't say that. I was  
5 joking. He was yawning, but what an incredible  
6 experience for young people, and I look forward to  
7 joining you. Thank you so much, and Donovan, I heard  
8 that you knocked it out of the ballpark yesterday at  
9 our own NYPD Police Officer Holder's funeral, and I  
10 want to thank you for speaking so eloquently on  
11 behalf of the Council. I appreciate that. Thank  
12 you.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. How  
14 do you vote?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Well, hang on  
16 one second. Who's your Shadow Council Member? Ivan?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Yep.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: [off mic]

19 [background comments)

20 IVAN MENDEZ: I vote aye on all.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

22 CLERK: Torres.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Yes. Permission  
24 to explain my vote?

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I just want to  
3 acknowledge my Shadow Council Member Alondra Castillo  
4 who was just accepted to Hunter College for Nursing.  
5 (applause/cheers) (background comments)

6 ALONDRA CASTILLO: I vote aye on all.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

8 CLERK: Treyger.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to  
10 explain my vote.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I'd like to  
13 first actually thank the Speaker, some of my  
14 colleagues in the Council and Council staff that a  
15 year ago on this day volunteered their time and  
16 efforts to help rebuild a Sandy damage Coney Island  
17 home of Marjorie Batts (sic) and we partnered with  
18 Habitat for Humanity. And I'm proud to report that  
19 Marjorie is back home today in Coney Island in her  
20 house. (applause) And I want to say that the  
21 Speaker and this Council has--and this committee that  
22 we have has been so supportive on behalf of all Sandy  
23 victims and have a lot more work to do, but I believe  
24 that we have--we have the right team and the right  
25 support system here in this Council. I'm very



2 thankful for that. I want to congratulate also all  
3 my colleagues on passing their bills and to Council  
4 Member Debbie Rose congratulations on the big Wheel.  
5 But, I remind my colleagues respectfully there is  
6 only one wonder wheel in New York City (laughter) and  
7 it is in Coney Island. I vote aye on all. Thank  
8 you.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: (laughs)  
10 Represent.

11 CLERK: Ulrich.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Permission not to  
13 explain my vote.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes. (laughs)

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I vote aye on  
16 all. Let's go Mets.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, yes.

18 CLERK: Williams.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I be  
20 excused to explain my vote?

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, sir.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I want to  
23 congratulate Council Members Crowley, Rodriguez, and  
24 especially Council Member Rose, and wheel be waiting  
25 for it to be completed. Get it? Wheel? All right.

2 (laughter) But I did also just want to give a shout  
3 out and congratulations to Julian Deshan(sp?).  
4 Before he was taken by Council Member Greenfield, he  
5 was a magnificent intern in my office, and he got it  
6 in his head that he wanted to make money and not work  
7 for fee any more, and went over to the councilman's  
8 office. But he had done fantastic work in my office,  
9 and I--I'm sure he's doing fantastic work for  
10 Councilman Greenfield. I'm just so proud of what  
11 he'd doing and how he's growing, and I just wanted to  
12 say congratulations and with that, I vote aye on all.

13 CLERK: Matteo.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: [off mic] Aye.

15 CLERK: Van Bramer.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: He voted on  
17 everything didn't he?

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Van Bramer.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Yeah, he's still  
20 here.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: I vote aye on  
22 all.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

24 CLERK: Speaker Mark Viverito.

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: So I have  
3 introduced or before I introduce Sheldon again, and I  
4 know everybody is joking with Debbie, but  
5 congratulations. I think many of us had big wheels  
6 growing up (laughter) but this is a very big, big  
7 wheel. (laughs) So, I introduced Sheldon earlier as  
8 part of the Foster Youth Advocacy Day. I'm very  
9 excited that he's here. He can talk. I would like  
10 him to just maybe talk a little bit. Just quickly  
11 introduce himself. His age. Where he's going to  
12 school, and he was telling me a little earlier about  
13 what he wants to do once he graduates. Do you want  
14 to say a few words? Tell them about your experience.

15 SHELDON EDWARDS: My name is Sheldon  
16 Edwards. I go to Brooklyn High School of Leadership  
17 and Community Service. When I graduate this year in  
18 June I want to go to college either FIT or S-I--or  
19 CSI. Those are my hopes.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] Yes,  
21 you have high hopes. (sic)

22 SHELDON EDWARDS: And a major in fashion  
23 and minor in PR, and I'm just thankful that we were  
24 able to come here. I'm thankful for the Council

2 Members especially Ms. Viverito for having me. Thank  
3 you all. (applause)

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: How are we  
5 voting? Are we voting?

6 SHELDON EDWARDS: Oh, we vote aye on all.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: There you go.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All items on  
9 today's General Order Calendar were adopted by a vote  
10 of 45 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and 0  
11 abstentions. The Revised Land Use Call-Ups were  
12 adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative, 0 in the  
13 negative. There are no resolutions to day.  
14 Introduction and Reading of Bills.

15 SHELDON EDWARDS: All those are referred  
16 to committee as indicated on the agenda.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. We  
18 are immediately going to general discussion beginning  
19 with Council Member Richards. We're still in  
20 session. Quiet in the Chambers.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Well, I'm hurt.  
22 Okay. Today I would like to draw my colleagues'  
23 attention to Intro No. 2--977--

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
25 [shushing for quiet]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --a bill that  
3 would ban smoking--

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it  
5 down please.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --in multiple  
7 dwellings that are financed in any way by the  
8 taxpayers of New York City and I just want to add  
9 that there are already smoke-free ordinances that  
10 exist in Phoenix, Los Angeles, San Diego. Most  
11 recently in Albany's housing. We ban smoking in a  
12 number of shared public spaces in hospitals and  
13 restaurants and parks and at the workplace. But we  
14 shouldn't stop there. We the city should fight for  
15 clean breathable air, not only where people work but  
16 where they rest their head and sleep at night. Many  
17 have asked me why would government infringe--

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
19 [shushing for quiet]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --on my  
21 personal space? My answer to this is I believe that  
22 this body and the city has a responsibility to ensure  
23 that a mother and her newborn child can breathe clean  
24 air in the comfort of their own home. I believe that  
25 our grad school scholars should be able to do their

2 homework at night, and dream of how to change the  
3 world without the distraction of bringing the--  
4 breathing in their neighbor's second hand smoke. I  
5 also believe that we ought to protect our seniors who  
6 are aging, and have more vulnerable respiratory  
7 systems rather than permit someone the freedom to  
8 negatively affect the health of their neighbors. The  
9 truth is that when one neighbor chooses to smoke,  
10 everyone else in the vicinity is susceptible to their  
11 fumes. The Mayor has set an ambitious goal of  
12 creating 200,000 units of affordable housing. As  
13 much as I am an advocate these buildings be green,  
14 safe and affordable, I urge my colleagues to demand  
15 that the tenants of these homes are able to breathe  
16 the cleanest and freshest air. And I just want to  
17 add that there are ten community boards--

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
19 [shushing for quiet]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --in Queens  
21 who've passed smoke-free resolutions, and we hope to  
22 get the other boroughs on board. And I'll end with  
23 this, fresh air should not be a luxury for some, but  
24 it is a human right, and should be a luxury for all.  
25 I would like to thank my staff Durrell Burney, and I

2 know I'm joined today by Phil. I'm going to mess his  
3 last name up, Connigsburg (sp?) who is an advocate, a  
4 community advocate for the Queens Tobacco Control  
5 Coalition. And I would like to thank the staff of  
6 the Council working on this as well. (bell) I urge  
7 my colleagues to sign on. Thank you.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
9 Council Member Levine.

10 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet please.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, Madam  
12 Public Advocate. I'd like to call (coughs) my  
13 colleagues' attention to--(coughs) excuse me--two  
14 items, which I'm pleased to be introducing with  
15 Council Member Williams that will advance foreign  
16 language learning in New York. First is Intro 979,  
17 which would require the Department of Ed to report on  
18 the number of children who are receiving foreign  
19 language education. Perhaps Council Member Williams  
20 will tell us more about that in a moment. Second is  
21 Resolution No. 890 that supports a state bill  
22 introduced by State Senator Parker and Assembly  
23 Member Rozic that would provide financial incentives  
24 to districts increasing foreign language education,  
25 and financial incentives to college students who

2 pursue bilingual education as a career. This is the  
3 most multi-lingual city on earth, and every one of  
4 our children here should receive the gift of learning  
5 a second or a third language. This will help them  
6 professionally, help them academically. Helps  
7 improve self-esteem, and it promotes cross-cultural  
8 understanding in a way that nothing else does. But  
9 today, only 5% of the children in our elementary  
10 schools are receiving any form of foreign language  
11 education. An even lower number are getting the kind  
12 of immersion that we know that children need to  
13 become bilingual. We have a schools chancellor who  
14 is incredibly passionate about this issue and spoke--  
15 spoken about it repeatedly. And we want to make sure  
16 that the policies are implemented to bring this gift  
17 to every single child in New York City. Thank you.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

19 Council Member Williams.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you very  
21 much. Thank you Council Member Levine for pointing  
22 out Intro 979. I want to thank him for his  
23 partnership. It's basically a reporting bill so we  
24 can find out what point on which it's being taught  
25 and where. I was shocked to learn that only 5% of



2 students were getting this. When I was younger, I  
3 remember being in Spanish class and then beginning to  
4 take French. And I don't know what happened between  
5 then and now. My grandmother actually spoke Creole  
6 in Grenada, and I wish that that language was passed  
7 down to me. It would have helped me in my district  
8 as I was running to the Haitian voters who spoke  
9 Creole. Luckily, a little bit of French that I  
10 remembered helped out, but not--it's important that  
11 people keep their culture. It's important that our  
12 students get a sense of self in the world by learning  
13 about other cultures, and that begins with language.  
14 And lastly, it's important as we note how students  
15 are doing in other parts of the globe speaking two,  
16 three, four languages, that our students have the  
17 same access. And we know that in areas that have  
18 traditional problems with education, I can tell you  
19 there is probably even less than 5%. We want to make  
20 sure that all of our students have the proper access  
21 to what's happening in my district. They speak Urdu,  
22 Arabic, Creole and Hebrew. I do want to thank  
23 Council Member Levine and the Education Chair Dromm,  
24 and the Chancellor Farina for her leadership on these  
25 issues, and we want to push it further. Lastly, I

2 know we're counting on the Mayor on the item, too.

3 (sic) But I'm very proud that the New York Nix did  
4 me proud in their opening game yesterday. Thank you.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council--

6 [shushing for quiet] Council Member King.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Thank you, Madam

8 Public Advocate. As we conclude the month of  
9 October, and we recognize domestic violence as  
10 equally important, breast cancer--Breast Cancer  
11 Awareness Month, having a sister who passed away from  
12 breast cancer, is something that we all should always  
13 remember and give our time and energy and support,  
14 and put whatever finances that we can to make sure  
15 that we rid all humanity of this deadly disease. So  
16 I want to say to each and every one of you, and  
17 especially all the ladies in pink today, you look  
18 simply marvelous, and thank you for doing what you do  
19 to continue advocate against breast cancer, and all  
20 against domestic violence. Also, I'd like to add  
21 just a reminder to the BLAC members that there will  
22 be a committee meeting right after the Stated  
23 Meeting. And I'm so grateful today that I was joined  
24 by Kathleen Rando (sp?), who has done a marvelous job  
25 in advertising and recruiting for foster care parents

2 to make sure they have quality parents that are  
3 taking care of our children who are caught up in the  
4 foster care system. So with that all being said, I  
5 would like to turn it over to my Council Member for  
6 the Day, Kathleen.

7 KATHLEEN RANDO: Hi. My takeaway from  
8 today was basically not just letting our kids age out  
9 to nobody, and thinking that independent living going  
10 to be something that they're going to be good at  
11 because they're not because how are they going to be  
12 able to afford housing when they don't even have a  
13 high school diploma? So my thought on that was to  
14 find more permanency for them, and to just make sure  
15 that they can prosper and be the adults that we want  
16 them to be. Thank you.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Thank  
18 you for telling your story. Council Member Cumbo.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [off mic] Than  
20 you. [on mic] I want to recognize today Anna  
21 Sanchez and Julio Almetto (sp?) that spent a large  
22 part of the day with me today. They participated in  
23 our Foster Youth Shadow Day. They went on a tour, a  
24 roundtable discussion. They even went on lunch with  
25 us, but what I thought was so impressive about the

2 day with them is that they shared many of the  
3 challenges that they face on a day-to-day basis.  
4 From multiple foster homes to the challenges of couch  
5 surfing, foster parents who are not mentally sound to  
6 assume the responsibility of their wellbeing. Living  
7 in long awaited NYCHA housing and the finding out  
8 that that in that dynamic they still don't have the  
9 security and the safety that they need. Nor do they  
10 have the family or the support system that they need  
11 to navigate their NYCHA housing system. Aging out at  
12 the age of 21 with no commitment from the city to  
13 housing, employment, a stipend or any permanency in  
14 their life. Which brings my attention to the  
15 horrific incident by a South Carolina teen who was  
16 brutally assaulted by Deputy Ben Fields who was then  
17 terminated. That is an appropriate first response to  
18 a very serious crime, but serious criminal action  
19 needs to be a part of addressing this egregious  
20 crime. All to find out that this young woman was  
21 recently placed in our foster care system after the  
22 loss of her mother. It's no coincidence today that  
23 we are recognizing those dynamic young people from  
24 our foster care agency, and seeing the brutality that  
25 so much of them face when we don't have a camera or a

2 cell phone to capture it. What we saw that  
3 particular day highlights what so many of our young  
4 people face. This young woman we also learned had  
5 just recently lost her mother, and what do we have to  
6 do as a city is that we have to shine a light on  
7 these egregious acts. And this particular tragic  
8 incident that we saw in South Carolina makes me feel  
9 even more vulnerable as an African-American woman to  
10 see that I could be disregarded and brutalized so  
11 easily without any uproar [bell] except for the fact  
12 that a cell phone was able to capture it all. I  
13 encourage all people in positions of power to raise  
14 their voice, and to make sure that criminal action is  
15 pursued because we must set an example that this--

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
17 Council Member, please bring your comments to a  
18 close.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: --type of behavior  
20 will not be tolerated in our society.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Than you.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member  
24 Gibson.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you very  
3 much, Madam Public Advocate, and I certainly want to  
4 join Council Member Andy King as we close the month  
5 of October in thanking all of the members of this  
6 Council for being so aggressive and proactive in  
7 standing up for all victims of domestic violence,  
8 standing against efforts to make sure we focus on  
9 love and not abuse. And also Breast Cancer Awareness  
10 Month. On a personal level, having family members  
11 who have died of breast cancer--

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
13 [shushing for quiet]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: --at young ages, I  
15 certainly want to thank my local community leaders,  
16 my PSA7, my NYPD Domestic Violence Officers, and my  
17 transit district cops who stood with me day after day  
18 at train stations each and every morning giving out  
19 literature on breast cancer awareness and domestic  
20 violence as well as all of the walks that we  
21 participated in this month. I, too, share my  
22 thoughts and sincerest prayers to the family of first  
23 grade detective, Randolph Holder and the PSA5 family,  
24 and the entire NYPD at this time of mourning. I also  
25 want to recognize Council Member Donovan Richards who

2 really rocked yesterday. He provide an incredible  
3 message of encouragement and motivation, prayer and  
4 comfort for families in need. And certainly, I want  
5 to thank Council Member Levin and Eugene for Foster  
6 Youth Shadow Day. I am so honored here to introduce  
7 my shadow Ms. Angie Ramlaken (sp?) who is a senior at  
8 a high school in the Bronx. She also know sign  
9 language, and wants to be a registered nurse. And  
10 now, I will turn this over to Ms. Angie.

11 ANGIE ROMLAKEN: I want to thank Council  
12 Members Levin, Eugene and the Speaker for having us  
13 today. It's a pleasure to be the change for the  
14 future in the foster care system. I look forward to  
15 having another moment like this if possible. Thank  
16 you.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member  
20 Chin.

21 FOSTER YOUTH SPEAKING FOR COUNCIL MEMBER

22 CHIN: Thank you, Madam Public Advocate. Good  
23 afternoon. I want to draw my colleagues' attention  
24 to Intro 971, legislation that I am introducing with  
25 Council Member Van Bramer and Lander to support joint

2 living work quarters for artist or commonly know as  
3 JLWQAs. For those of you who don't know what they  
4 are, JLWQAs are units in manufacturing zone areas  
5 approved for residential use reserved especially for  
6 artists certified by the Department of Cultural  
7 Affairs, DCLA. Right now, we know very little about  
8 the status of the unit in the city except that when  
9 landlords want to convert a JLWQA to non-restricted  
10 residential use, mostly likely as luxury units and  
11 landlords--landlords claim difficult--difficulty in  
12 finding certified artists to fill them. Intro 971  
13 will ensure a clear process for landlords seeking  
14 tenants for the JLWQA give certified artists an easy  
15 process to look for available work and living spaces  
16 allow the city to keep track of these units, and  
17 encourage more artists to certify and work in New  
18 York City. I want to thank Jennifer Wilcox from the  
19 Legislature Division for her work on the bill, and I  
20 ask my fellow council members to sign onto Intro 971.  
21 Thank you.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. I am  
23 now calling on Council Member Rose. Council Member  
24 Rose, life is like a big wheel. It keeps on turning.



2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: (laughs) I love  
3 all the wheel analogies. I could do this all day.  
4 But my colleagues, I--I speak to you today to  
5 encourage you to support two bills that I'm co-prime  
6 sponsor on with Council Member Johnson and several of  
7 my other colleagues. Intro 973, which will establish  
8 an Office of Comprehensive Community Health Planning  
9 and Interagency Coordinating Council on Health and  
10 Intro 974, which will create a health facilities map.  
11 Both of these bills are very important to me and are  
12 designed to give advocates and lawmakers the tools  
13 they need to assess and identify community healthcare  
14 needs. So that resources and personnel can be  
15 effectively allocated, and where unnecessary unmet  
16 needs identified so that they can be addressed  
17 through policy or legislation. These bills will go a  
18 long way towards helping us address New York City's  
19 unequal and often inaccessible healthcare system. It  
20 will also make community organizations' members and  
21 leaders true partners in the healthcare planning  
22 process, which will help bring transparency to the  
23 process and also a buy-in into the outcomes of the  
24 planning process. Living a borough that lacks and  
25 HHC facility and that has dearth of healthcare

2 services, I am really excited to introduce this  
3 community focused model of addressing pressing  
4 healthcare needs, and I urge all of you to joint me  
5 in supporting this important legislation. Thank you.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
7 Council Member Koo.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, Madam  
9 Public Advocate--Public Advocate. First, I want to  
10 congratulate Council Member Debbie Rose and Elizabeth  
11 Crowley for their very important legislations.  
12 Second, I want to apologize for mentioning the names  
13 of our visitors. They are Mr. Cho Wan Ji Koo (sp?)  
14 and Kwan Jo Ang (sp?), Mr. Ken Ki Yung (sp?) and  
15 finally Mr. Li Jo Su (sp?). They are the visitors  
16 from Seoul Metropolitan Council. Thank you very  
17 much.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
19 Council Member Greenfield.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you,  
21 Madam Public Advocate. First of all, I want to  
22 recognize the extraordinary strength and leadership  
23 that was exhibited by our Speaker with the most  
24 recent tragedy with the passing of Detective Randolph  
25 Holder. I want to thank her for really reaching out

2 and leading and being so inclusive, and we're  
3 incredibly grateful for that. I want to thank all of  
4 my colleagues, of course, especially our Public  
5 Safety Chair Vanessa Gibson for attending the funeral  
6 yesterday. And certainly, I want to acknowledge the  
7 powerful work of Donovan Richards. I asked him how  
8 he became such a great speaker. He told me he  
9 started speaking in church at the age of nine. And  
10 so, it certainly showed yesterday. Thank you,  
11 Council Member Richards. I want to turn it over to  
12 our Youth Foster staffers. They would like to use a  
13 few seconds to advocate on behalf of the issues that  
14 are near and dear to them in the foster youth  
15 community, and first we have Shakka Panette. (sp?)

16 SHAKKA PANETTE: Hi, I just wanted to say  
17 that this means a lot to me. I've been in care since  
18 I was--before I was nine months old, and to know that  
19 everyone is actually going to--they are actually  
20 listening to us and hearing out, and going to do  
21 something. It's not really about me any more. I've  
22 always wanted to help the next generation so they  
23 don't have to go through what I had to go through for  
24 these past 20 years.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Than you very  
3 much. Now, I'm going to turn it over to Rihanna  
4 Hayes.

5 RIHANNA HAYES: Greetings and  
6 salutations, men of the court and women of the court.  
7 I just wanted to leave with you this question: When  
8 did you stop needing your family? And I wanted to  
9 say support systems are what's important to the youth  
10 right now. We need--we need to have support systems.  
11 We need to have permanency for the kids and I feel  
12 like we'll get. It's just we need to fight to get  
13 where we need to be. Thank you for having me. This  
14 was a pleasure, and I just want to say it was--I hope  
15 we continue to do this. This is something that I--I  
16 really look forward to doing every year. So thank  
17 you.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you  
20 very much.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Okay, thank you.

22 [applause]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you for  
24 the time.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member  
3 Steve Levin.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I'm going to ask  
5 my Shadow for the Day, Ivan Mendez to say a few  
6 words.

7 IVAN MENDEZ: Yes. So I just basically  
8 want to say thank you to everyone that helped  
9 organize this day, and giving us this platform to  
10 basically talk about our personal experiences, and  
11 just using that as a means to bring about change.  
12 Today has been huge and an amazing experience. And  
13 words can't describe just how appreciative I am, and  
14 I sure-and I'm sure everybody else is for having this  
15 platform. So thank you very much.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
17 [applause] Closing--we're--closing remarks from the  
18 Speaker--Speaker Melissa Mark Viverito, any closing  
19 remarks?

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: No, again. All  
21 the young people have spoken very powerfully, and  
22 your experiences will help us, and we look forward to  
23 seeing you and others next year here in the City  
24 Council, and with that, we're adjourned.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: So let me just  
3 thank all of our guests for visiting with us today.  
4 Let us congratulate all of the foster care advocates  
5 for your voice and for telling your story.  
6 Congratulations to Council Member Rose, and to  
7 Council Member Richards for your sterling voice  
8 yesterday. Let's go next and let us continue to pray  
9 for Detective Holder, Moore, Liu and Ramos. Rest in  
10 peace. We stand adjourned.

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 2, 2015