CITY COUNCIL CITY OF NEW YORK ----- Х TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES Of the COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFARE ----- Х OCTOBER 14, 2015 Start: 10:17 A.M. Recess: 12:52 P.M. HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL B E F O R E: STEPHEN LEVIN CHAIRPERSON COUNCIL MEMBERS: COREY JOHNSON CARLOS MENCHACA ANNABEL PALMA DONOVAN RICHARDS World Wide Dictation 545 Saw Mill River Road - Suite 2C, Ardsley, NY 10502

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

JACQUELINE DUDLEY HRA-HASA

DANIEL TIETZ HRA-HASA

DR. ALVIN PONDER HIV/AIDS COMMITTEE OF THE NATIONAL ACTION NETWORK

CHRIS MANN THE PARTNERSHIP OF THE HOMELESS

JEZWAH HARRIS NEW YORK LAW SCHOOL

MARCELO MAIA ACT UP

TASSY CAROLY VILLAGE CARE

JAMES EDSTROM

MICHAEL CZACKES GMHC

JAMES LISTER VOCAL NY

JENNIFER FLYNN VOCAL NY

ANTHONY WILLIAMS CHAIRMAN, HIV ADVISORY COMMITTEE AT CARE FOR THE HOMELESS

JOSEPHINE PEREZ TRANS JUSTICE

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

CLARENCE HENDERSON BOOM HEALTH

2	Good morning everybody. I am Council
3	Member Stephen Levin, Chair of the Council's
4	Committee on General Welfare. Today we are going to
5	be hearing 2 bills related to the HIV/AIDS service
6	administration, otherwise known as HASA. Int. No.
7	684 and Int. No. 935. I would like to thank the
8	administration for for being here today, advocates
9	and HASA clients who have come to testify. I would
10	like to recognize my colleagues; Council Member Corey
11	Johnson of Manhattan, Council Member Donovan Richards
12	of Queens and Council Member Annabel Palma of the
13	Bronx and welcome back to Council Member Palma.
14	Int. No. 684 a local law to amend the
15	administrative code of the City of New York in
16	relations to provision of services of people living
17	with HIV and AIDS is known as "HASA for all". This
18	legislation sponsored by Council Member Johnson along
19	with myself and Council Members Palma, Dromm and
20	Menchaca, Mendez, Torres and Van Bramer would expand
21	the services provided by HASA to individuals with HIV
22	infection. Currently only those individuals with
23	symptomatic HIV/AIDS may qualify for HASA services.
24	This legislation would remove that requirement and
25	allow any income eligible persons with HIV to access

2 HASA's critical services and I will ask my colleague Council Member Johnson to speak further on this 3 4 legislation. Advocates have been consistently 5 calling for the implementation of HASA for all and at a hearing this past June we heard testimony from many 6 7 about the need for this legislation. At that hearing the Committee also heard from advocates about the 8 needs for some procedural improvements to HASA 9 programs including the increase need for information 10 and transparency at the agency and the need for more 11 12 consistent meetings of the HASA advisory board. In response to those suggestions, I've introduced along 13 with Council Member Johnson a bill that seeks to 14 15 update some of HASA procedural requirements. 16 Int. No. 935 would require the HRA

17 commissioner to consult with the HASA advisory board 18 before updating both HASA policy and procedures manual and it's client bill of rights. Which are 19 20 both required to be updated annually. To address the lack of consistent meeting of the board this bill 21 2.2 would also empower the Chairperson or 5 members of 23 the advisory board to call a meeting and would require the board to produce annual reports. The 24 25 bill would additionally increase the transparency of

2 HASA work by requiring the existing quarterly 3 reports, the bill of rights and annual reports of the 4 advisory board to be posted on HRA's website for all 5 the public to see.

HASA provides a central services to low 6 7 income New Yorkers living with symptomatic HIV and Those services should be expanded to all 8 AIDS. income eligible New Yorkers with HIV infections so 9 that no one have to choose between remaining homeless 10 and forgoing a central medical treatment. There has 11 12 been ongoing progress in the city and state around 13 services for people living with HIV and AIDS 14 including the implementation of 30% rent cap and want 15 to commend HRA and this administration for that and 16 the Governors and the epidemic recommendations. We 17 hope to continue the trend with this legislation that 18 we are hearing today.

19 The Committee looks forward to hearing 20 from the administration regarding their stance on the 21 legislation and from the advocates and clients 22 regarding any suggestion for potential ways to 23 improve the bill. I would like to thank our 24 Committee staff for their work to prepare for today's 25 hearing, Council Andrea Vasquez (sic), Policy Analyst

2 Tonya Cyrus, and Finance Analyst Dohime Sompora
3 (sic). I'd like to ask my colleague, Council Member
4 Corey Johnson to give some additional opening
5 remarks.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you Chair 7 Levin, good morning. Thank you for holding this hearing to build on the conversation this committee 8 began in June and your commitment to HASA. 9 I also want to thank Council Member Palma who was the 10 initial sponsor of the HASA for all bill and was 11 12 caring this bill 8 years ago when this campaign 13 began. She was a key person in this struggle so I 14 really want to recognize her and thank her for her 15 leadership.

16 We are here because we care deeply about 17 HASA and it's mission. We believe that HASA needs to 18 be strong, well-funded and responsive to the people it services. And expanded to serve even more New 19 20 Yorkers who desperately need it. For many New Yorkers, HASA is the difference between life and 21 2.2 death. For those with a AIDS diagnoses or a 23 symptomatic HIV infections, it provides crucial case management and assistant with housing, food, 24 transportation and access to healthcare. 25

Unfortunately eligibility for the program is currently tied under New York City local law to a New York State AIDS institute definition of HIV related illness. A definition that has not changed since the mid 1990's and is now out of date and is no longer used by the AIDS institute for any purpose.

HASA regulation require those who receive 8 benefits to have an AIDS diagnoses or a symptomatic 9 HIV infection, meaning a t-cell count of 200 or less 10 or 2 optimistic infections. This is outdated and it 11 12 needs to change. I am grateful for the great steps 13 that the City and State have taken very recently to actualize this commitment in ensuring that all low 14 15 income HIV positive New Yorkers could have access to 16 critical housing, nutritional, transportation and other important services. A single plan of access 17 18 for all low income individuals living with HIV and AIDS in every county was a key tenant of Governor 19 20 Cuomo (sic) blueprint to end AIDS modeled off of success of HASA and this City must continue to lead 21 2.2 by expanding it rolls. In New York City 1,000's upon 23 1,000's of people living with HIV including currently 800 or more who resided in New York City shelters. 24 Every single night remain medically ineligible for 25

2 publicly funded HIV specific non-sheltered housing assistance, case management and transportation 3 allowance that are provided for persons with 4 5 symptomatic HIV infection through HASA. Homeless people with A-symptomatic HIV infection are often 6 7 forced into the hopstince choice of initiating treatment and remaining homeless or delaying 8 treatment until they qualify for rental assistance or 9 supportive housing. The bottom line is this, housing 10 is healthcare. When HIV positive people have 11 12 adequate housing we see that they end up with 13 increased rates of viral suppression and reduced 14 mortality in their communities see lower HIV 15 infection rates. On the other side of that coin, we 16 have seen that homelessness has a direct and 17 staggering impact on people's health. A large body of research demonstrates that homelessness and 18 unstable housing are strongly associated with greater 19 20 HIV risk and inadequate HIV healthcare, poor health outcomes and early deaths. A 2005 New York City 21 2.2 study found the rate of new HIV diagnosis among 23 homeless persons is 16 times the rate for general population. And death rate due to HIV and AIDS, 5 to 24 7 times higher among homeless people with HIV and 25

2 AIDS. For people living with HIV, lack of stable housing poses barriers to engagement and care and 3 treatment success at each point in the HIV care 4 5 continuum. With homelessness being one of the 6 primary drivers of the spread of HIV and the 7 progression of the virus into AID if passed this legislation will have a direct impact on the dual 8 crisis of HIV and AIDS in homelessness particularly 9 among LGBT youth of color. HASA for all is the 10 compassionate course of action, but it really is the 11 12 most cost effective course as well. Expanding HASA 13 will not only save lives, it will also save money in 14 the long run. Keeping people housed and connected to 15 healthcare will generate significate savings in 16 public spending for emergency room visits and 17 avoidable healthcare services. Savings that more 18 than offset the investment in these benefits. The same can be said for the nutritional services that 19 20 HASA provides which allow for caloric intake that a person needs to take certain medications and stay 21 2.2 healthy. HASA has involved in the 30 years since its 23 creation. I want to thank one of my predecessors on the Council, former State Senator and Council Member 24 25 Tom Dwayne (sic) for being the man that lead the

2 charge to create HASA and has always been a vital safety net for at risk populations but has not always 3 been the most welcoming of invariance. During June's 4 5 hearing many advocates testified about reforms that 6 can help open the agency to clients an ease 7 enrollment and access services for many more. It is fitting that reforms help navigate the case manager 8 process will also be heard today. I'd like to thank 9 all the advocates who are here today fighting for our 10 most vulnerable New Yorkers. I also want to commend 11 12 the current leadership at HRA, Commissioner Banks and 13 Dan Teeths (sic) who are here today, who have 14 embraced these goals and have been amazing to work 15 with. Last year they announced an agreement on the 16 30% rent cap and hopefully this year we together can ensure that 1,000's of more New Yorkers receive these 17 critical services. I want to say that as a the 18 openly HIV positive member of this body and I believe 19 20 the only HIV positive elected official in the State of New York, I am incredibly fortunate to have a 21 2.2 steady income, good health insurance, access to a 23 metro card on a monthly basis, the ability to each healthy food and it's what every person with HIV and 24 AIDS deserves in New York City. I take this 25

2 responsibility seriously and advocating for others 3 who may not have the same access to the benefits that 4 I have.

5 And lastly, I want to thank Chair Levin 6 for taking this issue very seriously for working with 7 me on getting this hearing set up today. I want to thank the General Welfare Committee staff, 8 particularly Andrea Vasquez (sic) who spent an 9 enormous amount of time in drafting this legislation 10 and to my legislative director, Louis Sholden Brown 11 12 who started working on this the very first day that I 13 took office. Thank you Chair Levin.

14 CHAIR LEVIN: Thank you very much 15 Council Member Johnson we've also been joined by 16 Council Member Carlos Menchaca of Brooklyn. And with 17 that I will ask from HRA Dan Tietz, Chief Special 18 Services Officer and Jacqueline Dudley, Deputy Commissioner for HASA to begin their testimony but 19 20 before that I need to ask you to raise your hand please. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole 21 2.2 truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony 23 before this committee and to respond honestly to 24 council members questions?

25

{unisom Yes}

CHAIR LEVIN: Thank you, you many begin. DANIEL TIETZ: Good morning, thank you Chairman Levin and members of the General Welfare Committee for giving us the opportunity to testify today.

13

7 DANIEL TIETZ: I'm Daniel Tietz, I'm the Chief Special Services Officer for HRA. Joining me 8 today is Jacqueline Dudley, Deputy Commissioner for 9 the HIV/AIDS Services Administration. Thank you for 10 this opportunity. I just want to say to Council 11 12 Member Johnson, it was very nice of you to mention 13 Tom Dwayne. You're doing a great job following Tom 14 Dwayne in this roll. I think it a very sweet.

15 We are here to discuss the provisions, 16 the provision of benefits and services for New York 17 City residents with HIV and more specifically to 18 testify in regards to Int. No. 684, also known as HASA for All. This introduction would allow the City 19 20 to expand existing HASA benefits eligibility to New Yorkers with HIV, but do not have AIDS or clinically 21 2.2 symptomatic HIV consistent with current HASA 23 eligibility requirements. We also address Int. No. 935 relating to the HIV/AIDS Services Administration 24

1 COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFARE 14 2 Advisory Board, data reporting, public comment and other non-substantive technical amendments. 3 4 HASA is arguably the world's largest and 5 most comprehensive government program serving people 6 with HIV and AIDS, HASA provides services and support 7 to one of New York City's most vulnerable communities, namely those with clinically symptomatic 8 HIV illness or AIDS. But we know that there are 9 additional low-income New Yorkers with HIV who are 10 not clinically symptomatic consistent with current 11 12 eligibility requirements, but who would benefit from HASA services. 13 14 Much has changed since the early 1980s 15 when a then unknown epidemic was rapidly spreading 16 across the City, State and nation. At the time, there were no effective treatments and people did not 17 18 live long after they became ill. New York City was among the first municipalities to respond and proudly 19 20 provided a range of critical services to those affected by HIV and Aids. HRA's crisis workers were 21 2.2 proving emergency benefits and support services, as 23 well as burial assistance, when many service 24 organizations were reluctant to engage people with HIV. 25

2	Today's epidemic is very different from
3	that of the 1980s or even the 1990s. What we have
4	learned since then is when people are provided
5	treatment, comprehensive benefits and case management
6	they are able to experience a higher quality of life
7	and live near-to-normal lifespans.
8	But much remains to be done and we are
9	working with key stakeholders to end New York State's
10	epidemic, which is mostly concentrated in New York
11	City. Indeed, almost 80% of New Yorkers diagnosed
12	with HIV in the State live in the 5 Boroughs.
13	As this Committee is well aware, there is
14	no cure for HIV and it remains a disease marked by
15	poverty and continued stigma and discrimination. As
16	such, HASA services are essential to ensuring that
17	low-income New Yorkers with HIV obtain the benefits
18	and services they need to remain healthy and live
19	independent lives.
20	Although HASA presently serves only those
21	with clinical or symptomatic HIV and Aids, and their
22	families, we are also focused on preventing new HIV
23	infections. HIV transmission does not occur in
24	isolation and although anyone of any age, race,
25	religion, sex, gender or sexual orientation can be at
1	

2 risk, those at greatest risk include: individuals without access to culturally competent care, free 3 4 condoms, clean syringes and new prevention tools, 5 such as pre-exposure prophylaxis or non-occupational post-exposure prophylaxis. Individuals without 6 medical insurance and related healthcare supports. 7 Those who lack access to HIV and STI testing and 8 screening and who experience delays or barriers in 9 moving from a positive HIV test to linkage and 10 engagement in treatment. Individuals with a history 11 12 of incarceration. Those with status undocumented 13 migrants. Men who have sex with men, particularly 14 young black and Hispanic or Latino MSM. Transgender 15 individuals, especially transgender women. Women of 16 color. Those who use injection drugs, but don't have access to clean syringes and sero-discordant couples. 17 18 Likewise, mitigating poverty, preventing homelessness and ensuring stable and affordable 19 20 housing, addressing food insecurity, unemployment and underemployment, and ensuring access to treatment for 21

22 substance use disorders and mental health care are 23 vital to both averting new HIV cases and ensuring 24 consistent engagement in care and services for all 25 low income New Yorker with HIV.

2	In May 2015, Governor Cuomo released the
3	Ending the Epidemic Task Force's `Blueprint', which
4	is a consensus document the content of which was
5	agreed by all Task Force members, including me a
6	other participating City officials. The
7	Administration fully supports the Blueprint's goals
8	and concepts and we are working closely with our
9	State partners to ensure the plan is implemented.
10	The task force went beyond it's initial
11	charge and included additional recommendations to
12	ensure universal access to HIV prevention, treatment,
13	care and support. There so-called "getting to Zero"
14	recommendations address key social, legislative and
15	structural barriers and envision a place where there
16	are zero new infections, zero AIDS deaths and where
17	HIV discrimination is a thing of the past. In the
18	getting to zero recommendations, the first such
19	recommendation is most directly relevant to HRA and
20	Int. No. 684, under consideration today.
21	GTZ recommendation 1: Single point of
22	entry within all local Social Services Districts
23	across New York State to essential benefits and
24	services for low-income person with HIV and AIDS.
25	

2 This recommendation seeks to create in 3 other Social Service Districts a version of HASA, which is the single point of entry in New York City 4 for such benefits and services for person with 5 clinical or symptomatic HIV or AIDS. Under GTZ 6 7 recommendation 1, HASA would expand to all low-income New Yorkers with HIV, and not only those with 8 clinical or symptomatic HIV and AIDS who are 9 presently eligible. As with the other Blueprint 10 recommendations we are committed to working closely 11 12 with our New York State partners, as well as 13 advocates, providers and people with HIV to determine 14 how best to act on this recommendation. Int. No. 684 tracking GTZ recommendation 15 16 1 from the Governor's Blueprint, Int. No. 684 would 17 require HRA to expand, pardon me, would require HRA 18 expand HASA eligibility to include person with HIV who may otherwise not qualify simply for not being 19 20 sick enough. 21 As previously mentioned, every day the

22 As previously mentioned, every day the 22 comprehensive services provided by HASA are helping 23 New Yorkers with clinically symptomatic HIV and Aids 24 to live a better quality of life and to live near-to 25 normal lifespans. Further, by ensuring that clients

2 are not choosing between healthcare and housing or food we are improving public health and decreasing 3 4 transmission rates through continued attachment to the continuum of care. We agree with the Council 5 that extending HASA benefits would have a similar 6 7 positive outcome for low-income New Yorkers with asymptomatic HIV, and their families and we therefore 8 support the goals and concepts outlined in Int. No. 9 10 684.

19

11 The costs associated with Int. No. 684 12 would require significant resources from both the 13 City and State in order to expand HASA to all low-14 income New Yorkers with HIV. We will continue to 15 work with our New York State partners to seek 16 sufficient funding to expand HASA services to all New 17 Yorkers with HIV. Likewise, we look forward to 18 working with members of this committee and the entire City Council as the budget process begins in Albany 19 20 to ensure adequate State funding to allow us to 21 extend these lifesaving benefits to every eligible 2.2 New Yorker in need of such support. Given the 23 consideration of these matters in upcoming, in the upcoming State budget process, we appreciate the 24

2 provision in Int. No. 684 that links implementation 3 to action by the State to provide sufficient funding.

4 Int. No. 935 relates to the expanded function of the HASA Advisory Board, data reporting 5 and other non-substantive technical amendments. We 6 7 are proud of our new reforms and initiatives at HRA and although it's very early, we believe our reform 8 measures will achieve great success. As such, we 9 want our policies and data to be clearly understood 10 and available on HRA's website. It is a goal that is 11 12 consistent with the Mayor's focus on a accessible government. 13

14 To this end, shortly after Commissioner 15 Banks was appointed, HRA created several workgroups 16 that include a mix of providers, advocates and HRA leadership to discuss service challenges, barriers 17 18 and policy issues, as well as potential solutions. Among these workgroups in the HASA workgroup, which 19 20 has met several times since last summer. That would be summer of 2014. This workgroup facilitates 21 2.2 advocates and providers brining HASA related policy 23 and practice concerns directly to the program and HRA's leadership to that we can collaboratively 24 develop sensible solutions. It is an effective 25

2 approach to understanding and responding to the 3 community's needs and making policy and service 4 improvements in HASA. The workgroup presently meets 5 quarterly and will be meeting again tomorrow.

HASA also maintains an Advisory Board in 6 7 accordance with Local Law 49 of 1997. The Advisory Board consists of 11 individuals with five members 8 appointed by the Council and 6 appointed by the 9 Mayor, including the chairperson. At least 6 of the 10 appointees are required to be eligible for HASA 11 12 services. The board meets quarterly to advise the 13 Commissioner on access and the provision of benefits 14 and services to person with clinical, symptomatic HIV 15 and AIDS.

In short, HASA's senior team routinely meets with advocates, academic, elected officials, key stakeholders and clients to ensure that we are providing high quality comprehensive services and we take their recommendations and proposals for improving service delivery, policies and procedures very seriously.

Allowing the Advisory Board additional opportunities to meet and develop robust recommendations to the commissioner is a concept that

2 we support. However, the bill creates some ambiguity as to whether the Board must meet quarterly and as 3 additional times upon the request of 5 members, or 4 whether the request of such members serves as an 5 alternative to the board's chairperson convening the 6 7 already required quarterly meeting. We suggest revising the language to provided that a simply 8 majority may override the chair person in the event 9 that the chair declines to call a meeting. 10 We welcome working with you on modified language to 11 12 accomplish the goal of the legislation without 13 inadvertently impeding the ability of the Advisory 14 Board to work collaboratively.

15 As previously mentioned, we agree that 16 data reporting, revision to the HASA Bill of Rights 17 and revisions to policies and procedures should be 18 transparent, available on HRA's website and subject to public comment. We suggest, however, that the 19 proposed requirements regarding prior public review 20 of policy changes be modified so as not to slow 21 2.2 reform efforts. Under CAPA, we are already required 23 to hold hearing when considering changes to policies that affect a client's rights and procedures. 24 But as presently drafted, this bill would require more by 25

mandating hearings that will likely serve little purpose. For example, had the proposed provision been in place last year, it would have limited our ability to expeditiously implement the 30% rent cap as required by state law. We stand ready to work with the Council on modifications to accomplish our mutual transparency.

9 At these hearing we also like to take the 10 opportunity to discuss agency reforms. As with all 11 program areas at HRA, during the past 21 months we 12 have been determining and implementing reforms and 13 new initiatives within HASA to better service our 14 clients and ensure the best use of our staff and 15 resources.

As mentioned above, we instituted a HASA 16 17 workgroup, which presently meets quarterly and 18 includes a mix of providers, advocates and HRA leadership to discuss services challenges, barriers 19 and policy issues, as well as potential solutions. 20 Arguably of particular relevance to HASA, we also 21 2.2 have a LGBTQI working group that meets quarterly and 23 is meeting as we speak. But we've also instituted additional reforms and below are several of these as 24 they relate to HASA and our clients. 25 We've

1	COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFARE 24
2	implemented a new cultural competency training
3	developed by our Office of LGBTQI affairs.
4	Approximately 1,200 employees have been trained to
5	date, including 269 in HASA, I should note HASA has
6	about 1200 staff, 825 in FIA and 105 in MICSA, which
7	is the Medicaid division at HRA. With a goal of
8	training HRA employees in the coming year. We
9	expeditiously implemented to the 30% rent cap, which
10	was first approved in the Sate's FY 2014-15 budget.
11	We are now providing HASA clients with access to
12	vocational services and supports to better prepare
13	them for the workplace. We are consolidating
14	securing and managing HASA emergency housing under a
15	single master contractor to more efficiently manage
16	this housing and the payments to multiple providers.
17	We are working with key stakeholders to act on the
18	Governor's blueprint recommendations, including
19	expansion of HASA to all low income New Yorkers with
20	HIV and not only those with clinical or symptomatic
21	HIV and AIDS who are presently eligible. We are
22	continuing to consult with the HASA advisory board in
23	effort to improve HASA services.
24	I would like to close with an interview,
25	with an overview summary of HASA services. For
I	

2 further detail concerning the program and series 3 within HASA, I refer this Committee to my June 24, 4 2015 testimony which can be found on the HRA website.

HASA services include assistance in 5 6 applying for public benefits and services, such as: 7 Medicaid, Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program benefits, cash assistance, emergency transitional 8 housing, non-emergency housing, rental assistance, 9 homecare and homemaking services, mental health and 10 substance using screening and treatment referrals, 11 12 employment and vocational services, transportation 13 assistance and SSI and SSD applications and appeals.

14 HASA clients are assigned a caseworker at 15 one of our HASA centers, which are located in all 16 five Boroughs. Caseworkers work face to face with clients on applying for cash assistance, Medicaid and 17 18 SNAP and if eligible for HASA, can receive same day assistance. Caseworkers assist clients by 19 identifying their needs and creating individualized 20 services plans to secure the necessary benefits and 21 2.2 supports specific to addressing their needs and 23 enhancing their well-being, taking into account the complexities of their illness. In addition to 24 25 securing the public benefits noted above, HASA

2 caseworkers also refer and link clients to community 3 based organizations and providers for a host of 4 health, mental health, substance use and housing 5 resources.

Taken together, this investment in HASA's 6 7 target benefits and services recognizes that peeving disease progression and relieving poverty saves 8 lives, averts costs and advances health and wellness 9 to only for individual clients, but also by helping 10 11 to limit the further transmission of HIV. 12 HASA is mandated to provide timely 13 delivery of benefits and services, as well as 14 emergency housing, to all homeless HASA clients. Let 15 me provide a brief snapshot of our current clients. 16 As of October 6, 2015, HASA provides 17 services to 42,809 individuals, which includes 32,072 18 clients and 10,737 associated case members. A few data points regarding HASA's 19 20 current clients as of July 2015. The median age is 50 with 50% age 50 or older. A third are female. More 21 than 95% receive Medicaid and SNAP benefits. 2.2 24.18

receive federal SSI benefits and another 8.9% receive
SSD benefits. 4.9% receive both SSI and SSD. 84.7%
receive cash assistance, including some who are also

1	COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFARE 27
2	receiving SSI or SSD and for whom CA helps to cover
3	housing cost and 4.4% of clients have earned income.
4	Now I'd like to focus on a few key
5	services, including housing assistance, medical
6	assistance and financial assistance.
7	As of September 19, 2015, HASA's
8	contracted supportive housing portfolio consists of
9	5,678 units of which 5,420 are occupied. HASA spends
10	\$134 million annually for these units. There are
11	2,672 scattered-site units available, including NY,
12	NY III and non-NY,NY III of which 95% are occupied.
13	The average annual cost per unit is \$23,957. HASA
14	has 2,181 permanent congregate units, including both
15	NY,NY III and non-NY,NY III, of which 96% are
16	occupied. The average annual cost per unit is
17	\$22,200. Of HASA's 825 transitional units, 96% are
18	occupied. The average annual cost per unit is
19	\$25,160.
20	In addition to supportive housing units,
21	HASA is expecting to spend about \$33 million this
22	year for clients residing in emergency housing. As
23	of October 3, 2015 of the 2,224 units available, HASA
24	clients occupied 1,923 units, an occupancy rate of
25	86%.
I	

The vast majority of HASA clients, over 19,000, live in private market apartment, with most receiving rental assistance subsidies to allow them to live independently.

Financial assistance, currently, there
are 26,786 HASA clients receiving cash assistance,
which also include transportation and emergency
grants and 30,022 HASA clients receiving SNAP
benefits. Thank you again for this opportunity to
testify. I'm happy to answer any questions.

12 CHAIR LEVIN: Thank you very much Mr. 13 Tietz, I will turn it over to my colleague actually 14 first for the questions. First can I have Corey 15 Johnson.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you Chair 17 Thank you Dan for the very comprehensive Levin. 18 helpful testimony and you know I should have said this in my opening statement but anytime I have had a 19 20 constitute or any New Yorker that has an issue or problem navigating our sometimes complicated 21 2.2 bureaucracy I have gone to you and you've have been 23 incredibly helpful and thoughtful and I really appreciate our ability to work well together. I 24 think some of the statistics that you rattled off 25

1	COMMITTEE	ON	GENERAL	WELFARE

2 are, I don't think shocking is the right word but I 3 don't know if people would necessarily understand that the median age for these benefits is 50 years 4 And I think some people would that's a surprise 5 old. 6 to a lot of folks and when you go through and you talk about nearly 85% of ... of folks that are enrolled 7 in HASA receive cash assistance, many folks 95% 8 receive Medicaid or SNAP benefits. We're talking 9 10 about New Yorkers that are poor. That are defiantly poor and so now what's not in here is what is the 11 12 income eligibility guidelines for HASA, typically 13 what is the average person, what's their average 14 income if their enrolled in HASA? 15 DANIEL TIETZ: Well the vast majority 16 gets public assistance so it's attached to the public 17 assistance level. There are a smaller number as you 18 heard have earned income you can earn a (inaudible) There are under state law you can, you can 19 income. 20 ignore have of their income for a period of time, if

29

21 it's earned income. So it's quite low, so it's 22 actually at the public assistant level.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHSNON: And what is
24 that. Do you know what that number is?

2	DANIEL TIETZ: You know it's complicated
3	as you mentioned, so it turns you know in HASA of
4	course it turns on an equation budgeting you don't
5	have don't have David Sonta (sic) here today who
6	could do this way better then I can. But it turns on
7	an equation that includes your rent, so your
8	assistance the, your eligibility is a mix of both
9	your income and you cost.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Ok. So
11	DANIEL TIETZ: It's quite low, I mean
12	there's no doubting that (inaudible).
13	COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: So I really
14	appreciate that you said that the administration
15	supports the goals of my legislation of the Int. No.
16	684 and you and I have the opportunity over these
17	past many months to work together in trying to
18	understand what that would mean for the City of New
19	York. I know that today you're not in the position
20	to be able to talk about the exact cost associated
21	with being able to implement HASA for all. One key
22	question I have though is how would this affect case
23	management for HASA which is a part of the initial
24	law.
25	

2	DANIEL TIETZ: Well obviously you would
3	have to add staff without a doubt you know if you add
4	numbers were adding Staff. Under current law there
5	those ratios are set. High and local Law 49, this
6	administration has staffed up in the time we been in
7	office to to meet those requirements so we would
8	adhere to those as long as they're there.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Do you have any
10	since of how how many additional staff you would
11	have to hire, a range?
12	DANIEL TIETZ: I don't.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Ok.
14	DANIEL TIETZ: I mean I can certainly get
15	you a number, you know we've have looked at with our
16	colleagues at DOHMH to try and figure out what the
17	numbers would be. It's just in terms of the to the
18	course it turns on. If the case worker and and the
19	supervisor ratio turn on client numbers in local Law
20	49, so working with DOHMH on the likely number, we
21	become eligible then we back into the staff members.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: And
23	approximately do you have a since of how many
24	individuals are currently living in the near, I know
25	

2	you're not from DHS but how many people currently
3	living in the shelter system are infected with HIV?
4	DANIEL TIETZ: So I know that DOHMH has a
5	done a match which would get you part way there
6	right. So at any one point in time DOHMH can do a,
7	cause I understand a confidential match of course
8	that would have some limitation because they're going
9	to know from reporting those folks who tested
10	positive you know in the five Boroughs. You're not
11	going to know, so say somebody relocates to New York
12	City they might not know that person so they've not
13	gotten care or services in New York City, they may
14	not know those folks. But I I can get you a number,
15	I don't, I want to say that it's in the several
16	hundreds it's it's not a giant number.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: And do you have
18	any since currently how many New Yorkers are denied
19	HASA services because they currently do not meet the
20	medical criteria?
21	DANIEL TIETZ: I don't believe that we
22	track that number.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Ok.
24	DANIEL TIETZ: No.
25	COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Ok.
	1

1 2 DANIEL TIETZ: So essentially you're saying if someone comes. 3 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Someone comes. 4 DANIEL TIETZ: 108th avenue and wants 5 services, I don't think we actually, I don't think we 6 7 know the number that. COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I think ... I think 8 it would be helpful to know that number. Just to give 9 us a since of how many people potentially have the 10 need but currently don't meet that medical. 11 12 DANIEL TIETZ: Yeah, let me see what we 13 can do. 14 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Ok. Do you have 15 the current average moving expense for a HASA client, 16 you know the cost related to when a HASA client needs 17 to actually make a move and get into a new apartment. 18 JACQULINE DUDLEY: I would think that average moving is, I guess it will depend upon 19 20 obviously the size of the apartment and would have to obviously get a truck, you're talking about moving or 21

2.2 getting a new apartment as well?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Moving. 24 JACQULINE DUDLEY: Just moving what we do is we ask the client to get three estimates for 25

1 COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFARE 34 2 moving expenses and we take the lowest estimate from a licensed moving company and I think it normally 3 ranges about \$500. \$500 to \$600 just for the 4 physical move. 5 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Ok. 6 Then in the 7 housing assistance numbers that you rattled off, you said that HASA contracted supportive housing 8 portfolio consist of 5,678 units of which all but 258 9 are unoccupied. The 258 that current, that currently 10 are not occupied are people waiting are they on a 11 12 list to get in? DANIEL TIETZ: Oh no it's... it's that's 13 14 almost holy turnover. 15 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Oh it's almost 16 open. 17 DANIEL TIETZ: Yeah it just, it's just 18 some turn so there's you know our effort with all of our units is to keep them filled, some of that is 19 20 just transition. 21 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: And I'd just to point out which I'm sure you know, we know but it's 2.2 23 important to say that the scattered sight units average annual cost about \$24,000 annually. The 24 permanent concrete units \$22,000 annually per person. 25

1	COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFARE 35
2	The transitional unit \$25,000 annually, that is much
3	less then we pay for someone to be in the shelter in
4	New York City. And the other cost associated with
5	medical concerns, so it's what I said in my opening
6	which is, which is I think both the compassionate and
7	the cost effective way to handle this special
8	population.
9	DANIEL TIETZ: Absolutely.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I thank you Mr.
11	Chair.
12	CHAIR LEVIN: Thank you Council Member
13	Johnson. I have a few questions then I'll turn it
14	over to my colleague Council Member Menchaca. I
15	might be jumping all over the place a little bit but.
16	How many more, how many more clients in HRA's
17	destination would be brought into HASA if HASA for
18	All were implemented?
19	DANIEL TIETZ: Were working with our
20	colleagues at the DOHMH to estimate that number, I
21	don't have a number that I can share today.
22	CHAIR LEVIN: Ok. Do you have a sense of
23	in terms of the cost what the cost to be over all and
24	how that could be, how that would be distributed
25	between the City and the State?

2	DANIEL TIETZ: Well obviously you know
3	that cost return on the number so we're working on
4	that as well and you know we as I noted in the
5	testimony you know we're working very closely with
6	our partners in State (inaudible) DOH on how the cost
7	would be covered. You know it's substantial portion
8	of the cost is also you know on the DOHMH side and
9	solely the HRA some of that of course Medicaid cost
10	the whole host of cost in there, that were working
11	with our (inaudible) to both figure out those numbers
12	and determine how there split.
13	CHAIR LEVIN: We implemented with the
13 14	CHAIR LEVIN: We implemented with the state 30% rent cap, can you tell us on how that's
14	state 30% rent cap, can you tell us on how that's
14 15	state 30% rent cap, can you tell us on how that's spend going in terms of implementation, have there
14 15 16	state 30% rent cap, can you tell us on how that's spend going in terms of implementation, have there been any unexpected challenges that HRA has
14 15 16 17	state 30% rent cap, can you tell us on how that's spend going in terms of implementation, have there been any unexpected challenges that HRA has encountered?
14 15 16 17 18	state 30% rent cap, can you tell us on how that's spend going in terms of implementation, have there been any unexpected challenges that HRA has encountered? DANIEL TIETZ: I think the roll out went
14 15 16 17 18 19	state 30% rent cap, can you tell us on how that's spend going in terms of implementation, have there been any unexpected challenges that HRA has encountered? DANIEL TIETZ: I think the roll out went exceedingly well. We we very quickly moved to
14 15 16 17 18 19 20	<pre>state 30% rent cap, can you tell us on how that's spend going in terms of implementation, have there been any unexpected challenges that HRA has encountered? DANIEL TIETZ: I think the roll out went exceedingly well. We we very quickly moved to implement the rent cap such step by last July they</pre>

that the State began to pay it share in July so we

36

25 quickly implemented it. I'd say.
2 CHAIR LEVIN: City went retroactive from 3 the date it implemented?

DANIEL TIETZ: Yes, that's right. I think 4 you know if there's a challenge in there, it's that, 5 6 I'd say there's two things; One of course is that the 7 State share (inaudible). It's an appropriation at 9 million dollars annually at present. So it's not a 8 new entitlement, presage, so work to be some number 9 10 (inaudible) more clients you know the State share ends at 9 million. And that's the cost that split 11 12 between City and State at 71% paid by the city, 29% paid by the state. And then fortunately we don't, I 13 14 don't believe that we collect their 9 million dollars 15 first. So... so it really is 71/29 split. I think the 16 other challenge that we recognize is that as crafted in State law, some of the folks with in particular 17 18 with higher SSD benefits may not qualify for the rent They many have more then... then \$376 left over 19 cap. 20 at the end of the month when you do the budgeting in HASA and hence wouldn't then qualify for the rent cap 21 2.2 because they have to be in receipt of public 23 assistance at not nearly TAL's in receipt of public 24 assistance and they couldn't be in receipt of public

2 assistance if they have more than \$376 left over at 3 the end of the month. So that's a problem.

38

4 CHAIR LEVIN: And how many, how many 5 individuals?

6 DANIEL TIETZ: I knew you were going to 7 ask that now, I was just about answer it. And our estimate is right around 800 folks that we know of 8 who are in receipt of HASA benefits who look 9 like they would be eligible for the rent cap. 10 Ιf would could do something about that budgeting issue. 11 12 We're talking with our colleagues at OTDA, I don't 13 think that we have a great fix yet, I think that just 14 at the least would probably take State regulatory 15 change but could even arguably take a State 16 legislative change. So we're not done pressing on 17 that.

18 CHAIR LEVIN: That would just insist to 19 increase left over amount would take, may take 20 legislation?

DANIEL TIETZ: I think it's from OTDA from the State's prospective that would produce a host of other challenges because of course if he were to do that for this population, if he were to just

1 COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFARE 39 2 adjust the public assistance number you'd have to 3 adjust for all. 4 CHAIR LEVIN: Across the board. 5 DANIEL TIETZ: Right. CHAIR LEVIN: Not just for HASA. 6 7 DANIEL TIETZ: So that I think they're some other potential approaches for this, I mean one 8 but put that offering up you know all of our idea's 9 10 here, I would just say that ... that we certainly have reported to them how best to do this. 11 12 So the percent, so the CHAIR LEVIN: 13 percentage then of HASA clients that are subject to a 14 30% rent cap would be the percentage of clients that 15 are qualifying for or that receive public assistant 16 which is 80, excuse me 84.7 % is that right or? 17 DANIEL TIETZ: It's about 8,600 who I 18 receipted of the, of the rent cap now. Remember if you're on public assistant, so if your only income is 19 20 public assistance then you have no need of the rent cap, cause we're already covering the cost of you're 21 2.2 in your in a private market apartment, we're already 23 covering the cost of your apartment. This is for 24 folk who got income of some sort.

CHAIR LEVIN: I see.

2 DANIEL TIETZ: So SSI, SSD, earned 3 income.

4 COUNCIL LEVIN: I see. So I want to ask 5 a little bit about the rental assistance level. 6 There are three levels; standard enhanced and above 7 enhanced. Can you, can you explain a little bit 8 about who's qualifying for standard, who qualifies 9 for enhanced and who qualifies for above enhanced and 10 the breakdown of how that goes?

40

DANIEL TIETZ: We're going to give that 11 12 our best, when I said earlier that budgeting is complicated you know I'm we're actually I should know 13 we're about to issue, you know we have a monthly fact 14 15 sheet, it gets posed on the website. It's a little 16 delayed because we got frustrated with our numbers. 17 And so there's a revised one that about to be posted 18 for July that actually breaks this out cause I think we were at previously see little apples and oranges 19 20 on... on assistance type versus housing type and we sorted that better then we had previously so, it 21 2.2 speaking of transparency is not far more transparent, 23 but I'm going to let Jackie do the answer your 24 question.

2 JACQUELINE: Ok, we're going to give it 3 our best shot. I've indicated earlier it's really has a lot to do with your rent and your housing. For 4 5 the most part but vast majority our clients receive retro assistance at the above enhanced level. No as 6 7 you probably know under State regulations for a single person it's \$215 for a single person, but 8 there's also a regulation that for a person living 9 10 with HIV related illness they can get an increase up to \$480 but for our purposes the only clients who you 11 12 normally get shelter allowance at that lower level, is people who are living perhaps sharing an apartment 13 14 or perhaps living in a (inaudible) apartment or 15 something like, some other subsidized housing 16 program. For clients who are living in private market apartments where as you know that the rents 17 18 are very high in the City of New York right now. Normally in order to keep them housed we're having to 19 20 pay shelter allowance at far above the \$480 which is mandated by the state. So therefore, those with 21 2.2 clients who are getting, if we having to contribute 23 to their more than \$480 per month for a single client, then that's when we're, they're going to be 24 above enhanced. 25

4

11

2 CHAIR LEVIN: That's above enhanced. So3 above \$480 is above enhanced?

JACQULINE DUDLEY: Exactly.

5 CHAIR LEVIN: So because like I live in 6 Greenpoint, I was listening to the radio the other 7 day and somebody called in, he said I got an 8 apartment, I live in Greenpoint now, apartment is 800 9 square feet. Which is you know big but it's not like 10 huge.

JACQULINE DUDLEY: Right.

12 CHAIR LEVIN: And ... and their' paying and they got a deal for \$3000 a month. So in the 13 14 neighborhood like Greenpoint which is not like 15 generally considered a very expensive neighborhood. 16 So then... so then is there a maximum rent level that 17 above enhanced can hit because if a client you know 18 is, I mean and that an indication of where rents are everywhere, there's nowhere, there's nowhere in New 19 20 York City right now where your able to get like a one 21 bedroom apartment for like \$800 a month, I don't that 2.2 really exist that much anymore. I mean I don't maybe 23 it does but it's not a lot of them. And... and so like \$480 if you got a 30% rent cap and or your receiving 24 public assistance you know \$480 is just not going to 25

2 cover it like anywhere. You know so is there a 3 maximum, is like is there a you know if somebody 4 wants to live in Greenpoint, Williamsburg or Bedsti 5 or Fort Green, is there an ability for HASA to cover 6 significantly higher like \$1500, \$1800, something 7 like that.

DANIEL TIETZ: So we have guidelines and 8 they generally tap out around \$1100 a month for a 9 But we also have in HASA a case by case 10 single. 11 financial analysis which essentially affords us the 12 flexibility to go higher. The current median in HASA is around \$1050 or \$1100 and it's that low for a few 13 14 reasons; one is that some folks have been in their 15 apartments for a very long time and they come in at 16 some low number and they potential a (inaudible) unit 17 and they get whatever increase, there are some number 18 who live in (inaudible)so the number you know ends up being that low for those, for those reasons. 19 20 Obviously you know when someone is having to find an 21 apartment today, you know it much much more 2.2 difficult. There's you know, frankly there's also a 23 good number of clients who have roommate's situations or have family who have unemployment so then the rent 24 is split, you know the family member are making 25

1	COMMITTEE	ON	GENERAL	WELFARE

2	contribution to the rent, we're paying you know
3	whatever we're paying it could be a far smaller
4	number \$600 or \$800 for their portion of the rent.
5	So we actually have the flexibly to go higher and you
6	know look at each individual circumstance. The
7	numbers I mentioned by the way are for singles. I
8	didn't you know they are obviously a different set of
9	number for families, so two person, three person,
10	four person.

11 CHAIR LEVIN: I'm going to turn it over to 12 my colleague Carlos Menchaca for questions.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: 13 Thank you Chair 14 and I want to just applaud for the leadership of both 15 Chair Levin and Chair Johnson, just listening to them 16 every time talk about it both here as a Chair but 17 also in the halls of our City Council and progress 18 cockas and any time we talk about this issue, it 19 elevates it even further every time. So I just want 20 to say thank you to Council Member Johnson, Chair Johnson and also extend a thank to the team. You and 21 2.2 Erin and Commissioner Banks have just done an 23 extraordinary job of working with us in the City 24 Council to really push the mule forward. Not just in victories that we have already celebrated but in what 25

2 we're working on now and so in that theme I'd like to go further in Council Member or Chair Levin's 3 questions about really understanding the cost of this 4 5 and I hear that you're working on it, so tell us how 6 you're working on and I want to understand the 7 strategy of how you're going to come to this number in the first place of folks that are at the, at the 8 understanding the number and understanding the cost. 9 In so I understand that you don't have that number 10 today, but can you tell us about how you're getting 11 12 to that number. Give us the strategy about how and I mean I can only image how complicated this is but I 13 think it's going to be important for us to understand 14 15 how you're doing that.

16 DANIEL TIETZ: Sure, so you know 17 obviously a chunk of this isn't really directly for 18 HRA because you know we don't have the confidential registry of people with HIV in New York City that's 19 20 held by DOHMH. And I'm not a status ion but I can give you some on how. So we can do some data match 21 2.2 and figure out so who has HIV in New York City that 23 are already known to us for some purpose or another. We also have DOH has data of with regards to deaths, 24 so there's the in and out right so the fact that 25

2 someone would have been diagnosed here and reported 15 years ago doesn't necessarily mean that their 3 still here. So this is some sorting of a list both 4 5 DOH and DOHMH with regards to how many move-ins, how many move-outs, estimated regards to death or who 6 7 haven't spent have a viral load which also needs to get reported, haven't had one of those done some 8 lengthy period of time, then the presumption is they 9 no longer live here or they died. So we've, there's, 10 there are estimates or ranges that we're working on 11 12 with DOHMH to try and figure out well how many, could be have HIV not AIDS, not currently eligible, not 13 14 known to us who are still in New York City, could 15 conceivably come for services, were the services open 16 to them and what come for services were they open to 17 them and then what service would they need. So what 18 all would be expected to get to them. I think that there are some differences so we ... we note that the 19 median age for example is 50 that's not striking if 20 you look at the epidemic across the Country, It's an 21 2.2 aging epidemic. There's some good news in that right 23 and that they made it to 50 in and above because 24 their engaged in treatment but we expected that the 25 newer crowd would be much younger, much healthier,

1	COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFARE 47
2	some significance number could be employed and then
3	wouldn't necessarily be income eligible so we have to
4	make some estimates in regards to poverty. So you
5	see the complications both in terms of that.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And this is, I
7	think this is really helpful and important this is a
8	multi-agency requires multi-agencies corruption DOHMH
9	who have a Department of Homeless Services as well
10	and in so data from DHS so are these, are these
11	already channels that are open and your your?
12	DANIEL TIETZ: Yes.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Yes.
14	DANIEL TIETZ: Yes.
15	DANIEL TIETZ: Ok good. Now and so this
16	is all leading to the catapult capture of full New
17	Yorkers and really underscoring the HASA for All
18	component. What I want to understand now and this
19	kind of next set of questions is where are immigrant
20	community comes in, we are prepared to move this
21	conversation forward on so many levels under HASA,
22	under Healthcare, Chair Johnson and I are really,
23	kind of really trying to understand and unpack how
24	the immigrant community can can get connected. Can
25	you tell us the barriers that you're seeing right now

2 with our immigrant community both on the documented 3 status and undocumented status for a program like 4 this?

JACOULINE DUDLEY: I think one of the 5 barriers I think, one of the good things about the 6 7 HASA program is that we are able to provide access to certain benefits including cash assistance and 8 Medicaid to people who are immigrants, who may be 9 undocumented. We have our process by which if their 10 able to just show evidence that they have made 11 12 themselves known and contacted in anyway, US, CIS we 13 can then make them eligible for Medicaid and cash 14 assistance so that ... that is. 15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: So there's a 16 few, there's a few elements of ... of the overall HRA 17 package of services for clients. 18 JACQULINE DUDLEY: Exactly. COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: But when we talk 19 20 about HASA there is, I think there's a... a reality that HASA as a program, as an initiative is not open 21 2.2 to our undocumented immigrants in New York City. 23 JACQULINE DUDLEY: I don't.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: So I want you25 to tease that out for us a little bit.

1 COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFARE 49 2 JACQULINE DUDLEY: The HASA is not open 3 to. 4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: To our immigrant community, so our undocumented New Yorkers. 5 6 JACQULINE DUDLEY: Oh yes, there is no, 7 you don't have to be a documented immigrant in order to receive HASA services, that is not the case. 8 Ιf 9 you come. 10 COUNCI MEMBER MENCHACA: So tell us a little bit about that. 11 12 JACQULINE DUDLEY: If you were to come to service line and ask for admission to the HASA 13 program, now keep in mind the HASA program itself 14 15 just to be eligible for intensive case management and 16 linkages to other CBOs Community Based Organizations 17 who may be able to help you with things of that 18 nature, there is no financial eligibilities requirements for that at all. Anyone who meets the 19 20 medical requirements who come to us can be eligible for intensive case management. Now the tricky park 21 2.2 obviously comes when that person also needs to apply 23 for benefits and they're certain benefits that particularly like, SNAP that's purely federal, that's 24 obviously problematic for a person who are 25

2 undocumented and then cases like that we try to assist them with linkages to other community programs 3 that can assist them. But we certainly have language 4 translation services available to them, we have 5 6 posters in center and various languages that would 7 notify a person entering into our center that if you need interpretation services and it's in I think at 8 least 18 to 22 languages, those are printed on the 9 posters notifying the person coming into the center 10 that if you need translation services let somebody 11 12 know, we can help with that. We have telephonic 13 interrupter services for this that can assist. And we 14 can again upon any notification upon proof that they 15 have made themselves known to USCS they can be 16 eligible for shelter allowance and Medicaid and the 17 medial care obviously is what's really important. 18 One of the things that's really important for a person coming into the HASA program. 19 20 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Great and I guess I can just end there and know that we are very 21 2.2 interested in this piece. As we get closer to the 23 reality of HASA for All, I really want that to be not just a name but an actual experience for all New 24

Yorkers and we're working on pieces where that don't

2 fit do to our federal or lack of leadership on the federal level but for the city in so we're breeding 3 this concept of HASA for All and the complicated and 4 5 unfair system but I think this is going to be an 6 important thing as we continue to work with you, that 7 to make it, to make it actually wat it say's which isn't HASA, it HASA for All, which is why I'm 8 supporting this piece of legislation but also 9 supporting you at the State level when we have to 10 make some very kind of clear demands from our State. 11 12 Wherever we can to change the percentages because 13 there not fair right now of contributions to this 14 program. So I'll end there and really kind of think 15 about what that's how we can make that ... make that 16 helpful and it's not just about language we know that 17 now, this is not just about having something in their 18 language this is about cultural competency with our immigrant community as well. I am so hoping that ... 19 that we can, we can continue to push that forward. 20 21 CHAIR LEVIN: Thank you very much Council 2.2 Member Menchaca. Council Member Johnson. 23 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I just wanted to 24 add I'm really grateful that Council Member Menchaca raised all these points related to immigrant access. 25

2 You know the Mayor unveiled last week an immigrant access plan for not health insurance but getting 3 4 people into medical care and we have to ensure that why as Chair of the Immigration Committee, Council 5 Member Menchaca and I have been working very closely 6 7 together on ensuring that whenever we talk about the expansion of programs we're talking about how it 8 relates to undocumented immigrant and documented 9 immigrants and also when we talk about HASA for All 10 we need to do the same thing. So I'm really grateful 11 12 that you Dan talked about that specific population in 13 your testimony and Chairman Menchaca (sic) and I are 14 working very closely together whenever we're seeing 15 an expansion of services on how to include everyone 16 and ensure that everyone is covered by that. So I'm 17 really grateful that he raised these really important 18 points today.

19 CHAIR LEVIN: Thank you Council Member 20 Johnson. Mr. Tietz and Deputy Commissioner I wanted 21 to ask about the current status of with regards to 22 other expanded rental subsidy programs that have 23 taken affect over the last year or so. We've seen an 24 increase in the link program and number of different 25 interactions and other expanded rental subsidies that

1	COMMITTEE	ON	GENERAL	WELFARE	

2	HRA have undertaken whether it City FEPS (sic) and
3	Expanded FEPS as well. I what are you seeing on the
4	ground in terms of are you seeing landlords reluctant
5	to take HASA because their holding out for links or
6	anything like that? Is there anything that you're,
7	that you're seeing or that you're hearing from
8	providers you know if their seeing that.
9	DANIEL TIETZ: No, we explicitly mask the
10	(inaudible) the broker payment so as long as for
11	example LINK is paying the current you know 15% of an
12	annual rent then we're doing the same at HASA, so
13	it's not to disadvantage the HASA program with
14	regards to apartment finding. I would say that the
15	as you know in in LINKS in City FEPS and in FEPS
16	there at the section 8 rates. So there $isn't$
17	flexibility with regards to the amount of the rent,
18	so that's set.
19	CHAIR LEVIN: Set at.
20	DANIEL TIETZ: At the section 8 rate.
21	CHAIR LEVIN: Which is?
22	DANIEL TIETZ: Well it varies so.
23	CHAIL LEVIN: Maximum.
24	

5

25

2 DANIEL TIETZ: I don't know the maximum, 3 but the... the for a family of three I think it's 4 \$1550.

CHAIR LEVIN: Right.

DANIEL TIETZ: If I recall. Where as in 6 7 HASA we have the case by case financial analyst and the freedom to do flexible. So you know I think the 8 HASA program versus the LINK is well known to many 9 landlords, they know who we are as you know it's 10 confidential we don't you know there's nothing that 11 12 goes a landlord that says HASA, it says HRA. But you 13 know there are many brokers and landlords who you 14 know worked with our staff for a long time, are familiar with it. We haven't' seen a disadvantage 15 16 because of the other programs.

17 CHAIR LEVIN: Do you have any instances 18 or any documented instances of landlords turning down a client because based on the HASA program and if 19 20 that does happen what recourse does either a client or social services provider have to pursue that? 21 2.2 DANIEL TIETZ: So as you well know that 23 sort of discrimination in New York City is illegal and we take that very seriously. So we have 24

antidotal reports from clients and as was mentioned

2 in our June testimony we taken genuine steps to make sure the staff are aware to report when a client 3 comes to them with a, we're frankly interested in 4 taking cases. We have since the June hearing worked 5 with our colleagues the City Commission on Human 6 7 Rights we're about to issue a flyer for all the staff that can be given to all of our clients regards to 8 source of income discrimination, how to report it 9 both to us and to the City Commission on Human 10 Rights. We're creating poster that will go up into 11 12 centers very soon with the same messaging around 13 sorts of income discrimination, so we're taking genuine action to make sure that both our staff and 14 15 our clients know that it's illegal and what they can 16 do to report it if they feel that they been 17 discriminated against.

55

18 CHAIR LEVIN: We have anecdotally heard 19 some concerns that... that there's not as an optimal 20 level of coordination between HASA HRA staff and not 21 for profit providers that are working with clients. 22 Can you explain how the coordination, what's... what's 23 the kind of nuts and bolts coordination between a 24 client HASA case worker and not for profit provider

2 that's helping them with their housing and other 3 related services?

4 DANIEL TIETZ: I'm not sure I understand 5 how you mean coordination?

CHAIR LEVIN: The level of communication, 6 7 we had heard that there were on some specific instances that their receiving, that clients are 8 basically receiving contradictory advise or that 9 there's, that there's, that there's, that the level 10 of communication between an HASA caseworker and not 11 12 for profit provider are, it's just not optimal that 13 there's, that they don't have the kind of you know coordinated kind of set, set communication between 14 15 again the HASA caseworker and the not for profit 16 provider. I was wandering how, what's the 17 relationship between the caseworkers and the not for 18 profit providers?

DANIEL TIETZ: Well I can give you a general answer, certainly if you, if you are provider specific instances please tell us I have (inaudible) were always happy as it come to Member Johnson noted to take a particular instances and I think that especially useful in terms of training and oversight and to degree just be disciplined with regards to

2 employees. So you know in addition to the ... the LGBTTY cultural competency training that were doing 3 right now we're also working on a broader customer 4 5 service training after for all HRA staff including HASA. But I would think the general answer is that 6 7 our case management, our case workers were in the business of benefits and services, public benefits 8 and services. And then we refer clients to other 9 providers for everything else. So if they need 10 psychosocial case managing, mental health services or 11 12 substance abuse treatment what have you, we refer 13 folks. The degree which clients choose to follow up and engage with some other provider of course up to 14 15 them. We do our best to make those connections for 16 people and to refer them to other providers but I 17 think it's that there are individual instances in 18 which there is some lack of communication or ... or if there are instances in which a not for profit 19 20 provider thought that a HASA caseworker supervisor 21 had given core information as regards to public 2.2 benefits or services, please we love to know that 23 because it in that way we can then take some action to correct. 24

57

2	COUNCIL LEVIN: I want to ask a couple of
3	questions around Int. No. 935 which is the bill that
4	I'm sponsoring. Do you know that last time that the
5	policy and procedure manual was updated?
6	DANIEL TIETZ: There are often updates to
7	the you know to a section or two or three you know
8	for example last June/July we decided that that
9	folks didn't single HASA clients didn't need to
10	reside in studio's alone, which had been the previous
11	policy and we said that you know one bedrooms were
12	fine we don't have an opinion it's really largely
13	about the cost. So if the cost within the guideline
14	or acceptable under the case by case financial
15	analyst, the size of the unit wasn't our concern. So
16	those kinds of things happen with regularity, I'm not
17	sure what.
18	CHAIR LEVIN: And that's, and that's
19	would that, would that be like official change to the

58

19 would that, would that be like official change to the 20 policy and procedures or is that a, is that a in 21 terms of a manual itself or is that just a internal 22 policy change.

23 DANIEL TIETZ: Yes that's a policy24 change.

2 CHAIR LEVIN: In terms of the manual 3 itself is it, do you know when the last time that's been updated? And what the process now for how that 4 updated, do you, do mentioned you referenced in your 5 6 testimony that ... that there is a ... a public response of 7 some of kind that's... that's called for in terms of some of the things that the bill is calling for and 8 you mentioned that there may some redundancy in terms 9 of that, so in terms of the in the process of 10 updating currently policy and procedure manual, is 11 12 that, does that have to go to a public process, is 13 there a group of public input in that case when it's 14 an official change to the what's in writing? 15 DANIEL TIETZ: Well certainly the HASA 16 advisory board is there for this purpose which to 17 have that back and forth more informally since, since 18 the summer of 14 we also have HASA workgroups and we share so we, we you know have a lot of back and forth 19 20 with a community and providers on changes in policy.

You know there's the KAPPA lays out the instances in which we have to do a KAPPA hearing for some more substantial changes on and I think our as I said in our testimony we're happy to have a back and forth with you and Council about the language in the bill

1 COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFARE 60 2 with regards to what outta fit in which basket whether it a KAPPA type hearing or something other 3 than that. 4 CHAIR LEVIN: So some changes don't 5 require that a KAPPA hearing. 6 7 DANIEL TIETZ: No. CHAIR LEVIN: What's the, I'm sorry 8 what's the cut off there, is there is that, is that 9 to be determined by HRA legal staff is that? 10 DANIEL TIETZ: Yes, we would absolutely 11 have the Office of Legal Affairs as well as City's 12 13 Law Department way in. 14 CHAIR LEVIN: Ok. Do you know when the 15 last time a policy a update to a policy procedure 16 that required a public hearing? 17 DANIEL TIETZ: Yes the 30% rent cap I 18 think we did a, we did a KAPPA hearing on the rent 19 cap. 20 CHAIR LEVIN: Oh rent cap. Do you know when the last time the bill of rights patients, I'm 21 2.2 sorry the client bill of rights was updated> 23 DANIEL TIETZ: I don't know when, when a last approved version was, but we are working on one 24 now, so we've been both HRA broader set of clients 25

2 rights and responsibilities as well the one for HASA3 are being worked on as we speak.

4 CHAIR LEVIN: So in terms of the advisory board I do appreciate the ... the HRA being proactive 5 6 convening the working group that might be able be 7 possibly more flexible or than... than the advisory board but obviously the advisory board is 8 mandated by law and ... and is mandated to ... to meet 9 quarterly, is that, is that happening when ... when ... 10 when you guys came in was the HASA advisory board 11 12 meeting quarterly and if not why not and is it 13 meeting quarterly now and if not why not.

14 DANIEL TIETZ: So let me start with the 15 last question, yes it's meeting quarterly now and I 16 think I acknowledged in my embarrassingly in my June 17 testimony that it was my confusion with regards to 18 meeting previously. So I had mistakenly understood that because the majority of the terms had expired as 19 20 of the end of last administration that then there was there there and was told earlier this year, oh yes 21 2.2 there is, so the essentially that folks continue 23 until their replaced and so as I understand from Joanne Page who is and was the Chair that they were 24 meeting up previously even thought I wasn't aware of 25

2 that and you know obviously were there to be helpful, were there to attend but we don't drive that train 3 4 the Chair of the Advisory Board decides when the 5 meeting are and you know and ... and shares them. So were there if will some since as staff and but yes 6 7 we, we've now been meeting quarterly since earlier this year and had a meeting just in the last, just 8 before I went away on vacation. So in September and 9 10 it's meeting quarterly.

62

11 CHAIR LEVIN: So... so what basically what 12 you're saying is that the advisory boards meeting 13 schedule is not driven by HRA at all, it's driven by 14 the.

DANIEL TIETZ: No the Advisory Board it's the Chair and the board decides you know the that. In these you know last several meetings you know we've hosted those at HRA my assistants helps to arrange the space and time what have you but it's upon their request.

CHAIR LEVIN: And then what's the relationship between the advisory board and HASA, if the advisory board say takes the majority vote to take a position on something obviously it's within

2 the name of the board of the advisory board but what ... what does, what does HRA then do with the advise? 3 4 DANIEL TIETZ: Well certainly you know 5 Jackie, you Sam (inaudible)who's here as Assistant Deputy Commissioner of HASA, others of HASA staff 6 7 attend meetings you know were there to answer questions and to have a back and forth regards to the 8 advisory board agenda items and to be helpful in any 9 which way we can. At least in the time that I've ... 10 I've... I've been here at HRA, there have been no you 11 12 know particular recommendation from their advisory 13 board to do or not do something or another, I think 14 more an understanding of the reforms that we've ... 15 we've had at HRA. It's a back and forth with regards 16 to you know what's ... what's being reformed, what's not 17 being reformed. I know that the, that (inaudible) 18 Chair has been particularly interested in the idea of expanding HASA as we discussed here today and what 19 20 that would mean for HRA going forward, what would it mean for HASA services going forward etc., but I 21 2.2 don't, there haven't been, there haven't been both if 23 you will a that I can recall of the advisory board to act or not act in some policy way in the last several 24 25 meetings.

2	CHAIR LEVIN: Does HRA have a standing
3	commitment to the board to provide meeting space?
4	DANIEL TIETZ: Oh sure.
5	CHAIR LEVIN: So anytime at any of the
6	meeting whether it's a quarterly meeting or if there
7	was to be a meeting that would be convened by an
8	additional meeting convened by the Chair or the
9	majority vote the members that that they can meet at
10	HRA.
11	DANIEL TIETZ: Yes.
12	CHAIR LEVIN: I want to turn it over to
13	my colleague Council Member Menchaca for additional
14	questions.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you
16	Chair. I just to underscore that conversation about
17	the advisory board and how it's making steps to, your
18	making step to move that conversation forward time
19	and time again when I go back to district I'm working
20	with agencies those relations are so important and
21	going back to the board itself and the constitutes
22	that are a part of that conversation understanding
23	how they feel about their relationship with HRA and
24	the board is important and not until they feel
25	satisfied and and I think there's a lot of good

2 request here that are good and fair. Will ... will turn the tide in conversations with communications or turn 3 4 the way communication happens with their constitutes 5 so I just want to continue to applaud that kind of 6 work and ... and hopefully as we get more feedback and 7 reports that things are just better with them. Now there's some testimony that I been going through 8 that's about to come up next and one thing just 9 popped up with Harlem United and their MRT funding 10 with AIDS Institute and the Pilot Project. Are you 11 12 familiar with the Pilot Project that Harlem United and AIDS Institute put together? 13 14 DANIEL TIETZ: Yes a little bit. 15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: A little bit 16 So they're going to present and we should make ok. 17 sure that staff stay to hear that, I don't want take 18 the thunder away from their testimony but how would HRA take this data that's coming out and can we see 19 20 you adopting this as data or can we see HRA start funding some pilot projects as we discuss the bill, 21 2.2 as we discuss their conversations with State as proof 23 of concept as to what we're talking about, is that 24 something that HRA can do?

65

23

24

25

2 DANIEL TIETZ: We would certainly be 3 interested in seeing whatever results they have and ... and... and work with our not for profit partners and 4 5 State agencies partners to come up with something similar at ... HRA I don't, we have no objections. 6 7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Ok and that's just helpful I think for a lot of folks are ... are non-8 profits and our folks on the ground often take that 9 extra step so it's risk and I think there sometimes 10 divide with government in your just proven that it's 11 12 not, which is great, so I'd like to kind of see that ... 13 that conversation happen in a productive way and for 14 you to come and adopt some of these, some of these 15 finding, make them your own and really allow that to 16 be tool in conversations with the State along with us 17 as well. So good, I'm glad to hear that. Thanks 18 then. CHAIR LEVIN: Thank you Council Member 19 20 Menchaca. Just a couple more questions and then I'll let you guys go. And we look forward to hearing 21 2.2 testimony from everybody that's been patiently

waiting for their turn. How is it determined whether

a client is in need of emergency, whether a client is

in need of emergency housing, excuse me, how to

1	COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFARE 67
2	determine whether a client in need of emergency
3	housing is placed in a commercial SRO, hotel versus a
4	transitional congregate facility?
5	JACQULINE DUDLEY: Certainly the
6	transitional housing model is preferable because it
7	provides on-site support of services but
8	unfortunately we don't have enough of those available
9	and we do have a mandate to house a client present as
10	homeless on the day he or she request housing so in
11	the event that there aren't sufficient number
12	transitional beds available and but we have more
13	clients that needs housing then they'll be referred
14	to commercial SRO. Have we are actively trying to
15	secure additional transitional housing beds try to
16	reduce our alliance on commercial SRO's.
17	DANIEL TIETZ: I would just add in a
18	related vain that you know in particular with the 30%
19	rent cap one of our goals is then that folks who are
20	for example in Scatter site, I would say in
21	particular Scatter site many a little less so in
22	(inaudible)it depends on their status and their need
23	today versus maybe when they first enter Scatter site
24	or Congregant but it well as in transitional folks
25	who got some opportunity to move on to say a private

2	market apartment using our rental assistance or the
3	rent cap if they got some earned to under income what
4	have you. We're trying to do that musical chairs in
5	a way which frees up more transitional or supportive
6	housing beds for those who really need them now and
7	then that way we also then can you know avoid putting
8	folks in commercial SRO's versus transitional.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Deputy
10	Commissioner you just mentioned that it's it's
11	preferably to to place clients in a congregate
12	setting and that's logical that Social Service is
13	onsite Social Services are going to me more
14	accessible and therefore better in some way or if you
15	want to qualify better then then then what can be
16	provided in scatter site. I that necessarily so, is
17	that something that you see just in practice that
18	it's generally that's the case and if so how can, how
19	is there a way to change that equation? I mean, I
20	I met with a very impressive provider that last week
21	that has congregate and scatter site and sometimes
22	you have the you know like a not the same not for
23	profit is proving the services in both settings. Do
24	we, is there, is there, are we looking at way to
25	bring Social Services available in a scatter site
I	

1 COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFARE 69 2 setting up to the level of congregate or is not, is that not necessarily the case? How would you 3 characterize? 4 JACQULINE DUDLEY: I would honestly 5 comparing commercial SRO's to transitional housing. 6 7 CHAIR LEVIN: Ok. JACOULINE DUDLEY: With commercial SRO's 8 are normally for profit entities that are not run by, 9 run by a not for profit and there are no services 10 11 provided at all. 12 CHAIR LEVIN: Oh ok. So 13 JACQULINE DUDLEY: There are linkages to 14 CBO's but no on-site services at all. 15 CHAIR LEVIN: So you're in the SRO's there aren't, there aren't. 16 17 JACQULINE DUDLEY: No on-site supportive 18 services that all, which is why we're trying to reduce our unreliance upon those. 19 20 CHAIR LEVIN: But those, but... but if a client is placed in a, in a SRO for profit SRO, 21 2.2 they're still, they still have relationship with the 23 social services provider right through HASA, is that? JACQULINE DUDLEY: Yes, they still have 24 25 HASA case manager.

2

3

21

CHAIR LEVIN: An HRA HASA case manager. JACQULINE DUDLEY: Right.

4 CHAIR LEVIN: But they don't have the... 5 the... the ancillary services, the (inaudible)?

6 JACQULINE DUDLEY: Well we require, we 7 require all of SRO operators to have linkages with community based organizations so there are community 8 based organizations that regularly have relationships 9 with the residence in the SRO's. And from our 10 prospective from our primary goal to try to get them 11 12 out and try to get them whatever support services or 13 whatever additional help or support that they need to 14 try and get them into more permanent housing 15 settings. That's what we look to the CBO's to help 16 us to do with and because and one of the reason we do 17 prefer the transitional model is that they do have 18 the on-site support services and one of their mandates is to try to transition them into permanent 19 20 housing I think within 180 days.

CHAIR LEVIN: Ok.

DANIEL TIETZ: We should also just note that the folks who, our obligation of course is to house those who are homeless the same day that they come. You know folks have a choice about whether

2 they wish to be engaged in the other services in to which we would refer them. So we might think that 3 4 they... they would benefits from subsidies services and 5 treatment so that they may benefits from a mental 6 referral. Whether they choose to engage it or not is 7 entirely up to them. And our case workers will believe me press the issue with within they meet with 8 them but at the end of the day folks get to make a 9 choice about which services their engaged in and will 10 11 house them either way.

12 So but every SRO has... has CHAIR LEVIN: 13 a CBO that their affiliated with through HASA and 14 does every SRO client place, SRO client have like do 15 they have like a... the have like a HASA case obviously 16 but do they have a case with that not for profit? 17 Like if I went, if you went over like the not for profit do they have like a, like a, like literally a 18 case open for each HASA client that been in the SRO 19 20 that there that not for profit is affiliated with? 21 DANIEL TIETZ: That's the intention but 2.2 again I mean they have a. 23 CHAIR LEVIN: Voluntary. 24 DANIEL TIETZ: That's right... right... 25 right.

2 CHAIR LEVIN: But ok and how many of 3 those contracts are there in terms of those... those 4 CBO?

5 JACOULINE DUDLEY: There not contracts 6 necessarily, there just linkages where they'll 7 provide at the convenient base organization with access to come in and try to screen and access, you 8 know who may benefit from their services. And they 9 get it completely voluntary and it's sometimes it's 10 not a cart type of situation, they may take certain 11 12 and services and they may decline others from the 13 CBO, but at least if they choose that they do get involved in some small way at least that's a door in, 14 15 you know but that's the way to ... to engage the client 16 and maybe come back later on and peak all for an 17 additional services.

18 CHAIR LEVIN: And if the client is seeking 19 the services there readily available, they don't have 20 to, if there should be no reason why a client seeking 21 services wouldn't be able to get the services. 22 JACQULINE DUDLEY: No I... I HASA clients 23 for the most part have an access to a variety of 24 community based organizations often who are coming to

us repeatedly asking us for help in recruiting and
1 COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFARE 73 2 getting them referrals so if we, if there are clients out there who need assistance and who are looking you 3 know, there are no shortages of programs who be more 4 5 than willing to help them. CHAIR LEVIN: Last question is ... is there 6 7 an update on when the master emergency housing RFP will be issued? 8 DANIEL TIETZ: It was. 9 10 CHAIR LEVIN: Ok sorry. DANIEL TIETZ: And it was closed. So 11 12 there, we're reviewing the proposals now. 13 CHAIR LEVIN: And what's the size of that 14 overall RFP? 15 DANIEL TIETZ: I don't recall off hand. 16 I can get it to you. 17 CHAIR LEVIN: Ok. Ok, well thank you 18 both very much for your testimony, I we look forward to hearing more news in the coming weeks, we very 19 20 much appreciate your cander and your willingness to work with us under these two pieces of legislation 21 2.2 and we are hopeful that the next time we meet that we 23 will be discussing how, how the implementation of HASA for All is going. But thank you very much for 24 25

2 your time and will... will call the first panel for 3 testimony. Thank you very much.

DANIEL TIETZ: Thank you Chairman Levin. 4 CHAIR LEVIN: Jezwah Harris from New York 5 Law School, Dr. Alvin Ponder, HIV/AIDS Committee of 6 7 the National Action Network, Chris Mann, Partnership for the Homeless and Michael Czakes from GMAC. Will 8 take a 3 minute break. So sorry 3 minute test, were 9 going to keep testimony to 3 minutes. Will also take 10 a 3 minute break. Just for reference here we have to 11 12 clear the room by 1:00 p.m. so that's why we're going 13 to be on 3 minute talk for testimony. 14 [pause] 15 CHAIR LEVIN: Ok whoever wants to begin. 16 Please turn on the, see your red light. 17 DR. ALVIN PONDER: I'm Dr. Alvin Ponder, 18 Chair of HIV/AIDS Committee with the New York City Chapter of National Action Network. The HIV/AIDS 19 Committee of the New York City Chapter of the 20 21 National Action Network (NAN) lead by the Reverend Al 2.2 Sharpton respectfully submits testimony regarding the 23 expansion of benefits to poor people with HIV in New York City. The NAN HIV/AIDS committee is a health 24 25 related advocacy group that strongly urges the

2 adoption and the signing into law bill number 684. Which of course in aimed at reducing the scorch of 3 HIV. Governor Andrew Cuomo's plan to end the AIDS 4 5 epidemic in New York State by the end of the year 2020 is a worthy formal for improving the lives of 6 African American and Latino New Yorkers and community 7 disportionaly affected by HIV and AIDS. New York 8 State has developed a blueprint to work towards the 9 goal to end the HIV epidemic over the next five years 10 by decreasing the number of new infections from the 11 12 current approximately 3,000 to below 750 new HIV 13 infections annually such that it is below the 14 epidemic level. Statistically this would be the end 15 of HIV in Harlem; statistically this would be end of 16 HIV in the South Bronx. Many opponents of this 17 excellent plan argue that it's enhanced housing would 18 leave the poor to swap good health for HIV in order to secure the housing benefits of this bill. 19 In 20 other words option will entice the poor to trade good health for better dwellings. The poor is not stupid 21 2.2 enough to hasten the end of their own lives simply 23 because taxpayers underwrite the cost of treating their lives. There is no evidence that New York City 24 or state policies around housing has every 25

2 contributed to people getting infected with HIV. New York has many kinds of support for people with HIV 3 infection and the general Medicaid population. 4 The fact that bill number 684 exist at all is an 5 indication that others of us realize that HIV is a 6 7 community problem and that community resources must be employed to solve this problem. We are indeed the 8 keepers of our brothers and sisters are kindred in 9 10 need. As we embrace them with expanded care we contribute the health and wellness of the total 11 12 community. The passage into law of bill 684 then is a must for those of us who are proud to claim New 13 14 York as our home, it is in support of this pride that 15 I stand before this august body in the name of the 16 HIV/AIDS Committee of the New York City chapter of 17 the National Action Network, as the Chair and as the 18 member of the Health and Human Services Committee of Bronx Community Board #10. It is in support of this 19 20 pride that I respectfully ask that the Speaker Melissa Viverito and the New York City Council and 21 2.2 Mayor Bill De Blasio strike a blow with the adoption 23 and signing of bill 684. Thank you for the 24 opportunity for me to advocate for my brothers and 25 sisters.

2 CHAIR LEVIN: Thank you so much for your3 testimony. Thank you.

MICHAEL CZACKES: Good morning, I can go 4 next. My name is Michael Czaczkes and I am the 5 Director of Policy and Public Affairs at the Gay 6 7 Men's Health Crisis. GMHC is the world's first AIDS service organization based here in New York City 8 providing a wide range of comprehensive services, 9 including a hot meals, benefits enrollment, 10 11 healthcare advocacy, case management, legal 12 assistance, HIV counseling and testing. In 2014, we 13 served more than 9,000 clients from throughout the 14 five Boroughs.

15 In addition to direct services, we also 16 provide public policy advocacy which is why I'm here 17 today. We will look back at our 2008 City policy 18 agenda which shows support for the expansion of benefits from the HIV/AIDS service administration 19 20 known as HASA. Since then, we have continually fought to expand benefits to allow more New Yorkers 21 2.2 to qualify for housing, nutrition, and transportation 23 benefits because we know that housing is key to ending HIV and AIDS in New York. Today this effort is 24 known as HASA for All something we fully support. 25

2	The problem is that current HASA
3	regulations require those who receive benefits to
4	have an AIDS diagnosis or symptomatic HIV infection,
5	mean that a whole group of people who are HIV
6	positive do not meet the medical requirements and
7	cannot receive benefits. While these regulations
8	have remained unchanged, we have seen treatments
9	reducing the number of people who progress from HIV
10	positive to AIDS, so even a larger donut hole of
11	people who cannot access these services
12	In turn, we've have heard stories
13	throughout the years of New Yorkers stopping their
14	treatments in order to become sick enough to qualify
15	for HASA. Sadly, these stories are not surprising
16	given the cost of housing from the Rockaway in
17	Council Member Richards district to North Brooklyn in
18	Council Member Levin district. Those affected by HIV
19	and AIDS in New York City must be part of the current
20	dialogue on city's affordable housing shortage.
21	GMHC, along with members of Governor
22	Cuomo's Ending the Epidemic Task Force, know that in
23	order to achieve and maintain viral suppression,
24	which is the clearest indicator that appropriate
25	medical care is being provided, a person with HIV

2 needs a host of non-medical resources. Persons with HIV who lacks jobs, housing, financial resources, and 3 4 adequate insurance are less likely to achieve improved health outcomes. To answer a question asked 5 earlier about the number of people who are out there 6 7 who are not on HASA because they are not eligible. There are estimates 10,000 to 15,000 people according 8 to the Governor's End the AIDS Blueprint that was 9 released a little while ago. 10

79

In addition in closing in addition to 11 12 HASA for All, Int. No. 935, from Council Member Levin creates a new advisory board with a membership that 13 14 include people with clinical symptomatic HIV illness. 15 In general, we believe participation is essential in 16 public policy decision making and delivery. And that 17 this board will give those living with HIV and AIDS a 18 more direct voice regarding the provision of benefits and services. Thank you to Chairman Levin and the 19 20 Committee on General Welfare for hosting today's hearing. 21 2.2 CHAIR LEVIN: Thank you very much Mr.

24

23

Czackes.

2 CHRIS MANN: On behalf of the Partnership
3 for the Homeless, thank you for the opportunity to
4 testify in favor of the proposed legislation.

80

5 CHAIR LEVIN: Speak a little bit closer 6 to the mic.

7 CHRIS MANN: Sure, my name is Chris Mann and I am a health advocate at the Partnership. 8 Ιn that role, I have worked extensively with low income, 9 10 HIV positive individuals providing health education to promote increased health outcomes. Despite the 11 12 value of these services, finding a permanent place to live is often the first priority of our clients and 13 at the Partnership, and at the Partnership for 14 15 Homeless we believe in housing first model. When it 16 comes to connecting a client with housing, their HASA eligibility is one of the main factors that will 17 18 determine the difficulty they experience finding a It's clear that HIV and homelessness are 19 home. 20 deeply connected issues. Studies indicate that as many as half of individual with HIV and AIDS are at 21 2.2 risk for homelessness. Furthermore, homeless people 23 experience HIV infection at ten times the rate of the 24 general population.

2	Housing status is one the strongest
3	predictors of health outcomes for people living with
4	HIV and AIDS. In particular there is a need for
5	permanent housing and not just shelter. If a client
6	is HIV positive and not eligible for HASA, the
7	likelihood that they will find permanent housing
8	within a reasonable timeframe is greatly diminished.
9	For many, this means longer stays in the city's
10	shelters where their health often deteriorates due to
11	poor sanitation and other adverse conditions.
12	One of the main issues created by life in
13	the shelter or on the street is its effect on
14	treatment adherence. One client reported that
15	finding a confidential space to take his medications
16	was always an issue in the shelter. This made it
17	nearly impossible for him to develop a consistent
18	routine, which would not be an issue if he had
19	permanent housing. Lack of adherence leads to higher
20	viral, leads to a higher viral load and a higher risk
21	of transmission.
22	Housing status is a discussion that I
23	have with all my clients. In one such discussion
24	with a client who was HIV positive but not HASA
25	eligible, I asked him where he was staying. He
I	

2 stated I'm a gay man in the age of grinder, I can always find a place to sleep, implying he was having 3 sex in exchange for a roof over his head. His 4 5 response highlights one of the many negative consequences of denying HASA to individual who are 6 7 HIV positive but are not yet considered sick enough to be eligible. This behavior is risky, particularly 8 for someone who is living with a compromised immune 9 By expanding HASA benefits to all low income 10 system. people living with HIV, people like my client will 11 12 have a much better chance at securing permanent housing. By having a permanent place to live, he 13 would no longer have to choose between sleeping with 14 15 a stranger and having nowhere to sleep at all. 16 Thank you again for this opportunity to testify and I welcome any questions you might have. 17 18 CHAIR LEVIN: Thank you for your testimony. 19 20 JEZWAH HARRIS: Thank you for giving me the opportunity to talk to you today about an issue 21 2.2 of great concern to me both personally and 23 professionally. 24 My name is Jezwah Harris and I represent New York Law School's Legislative Advocacy Clinic and 25

T	COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFARE 83
2	myself. I have some experience in this issue on
3	multiple levels. I am a student attorney, a
4	registered nurse and a HASA client. So I have, I have
5	a little skin in the game as you will.
6	I think thank Council Member Johnson for
7	his leadership on this issue and all the other
8	Council Members who are working to address an
9	underserved demographic in New York City's HIV
10	positive population and to confronting the lack of
11	transparency on the part of the HASA division of the
12	New York City's HRA.
13	Many of you may be familiar with Governor
14	Cuomo Blueprint for Ending AIDS. New York City has
15	accomplished only a 3% greater decrease in the rate
16	of new HIV infections than the State of New York.
17	This is inadequate progress for a city that has an
18	entire agency devoted to serving symptomatic HIV and
19	AIDS clients. We can and must do better.
20	One barrier to real progress is that the
21	City of New York is only serving the symptomatic
22	population. If we are to reach the goals set by
23	Governor Cuomo earlier this year we must reach a
24	broader population, reach them earlier, and provide
25	all necessary supports. We must get all HIV positive

individuals into available services immediately after
testing positive and we must assist in the adoption
of HIV PrEP or Pre-exposure Prophylactic Therapy
among high risk populations. We have to keep
patients on anti-retroviral treatment, we have to
keep the compliant to achieve a substantial reduction
in new HIV infections.

The World Health Organization and the 9 Centers for Disease Control are now in agreement and 10 recommend that anyone who test HIV positive should be 11 12 treated immediately because early treatment keeps 13 those with the, with the virus healthier and reduces 14 the risk of transmitting the virus. Early and 15 preventative treatment can reduce the transmission of 16 HIV up to 99% with up to 94% of those on treatment 17 reaching undetectable sanguineous viral loads.

18 Frankly there is a lot of work for New York City to do, and it can start with the Council. 19 20 Two major hurdles with ART initiation and compliance are a single point of access and stable housing, both 21 2.2 of which HASA should provide for all current HIV 23 positive person and those who are diagnosed in the future. The single point of entry is crucial because 24 it gives those in need of both medical and social 25

2 services a fixed point to the referred to by the diagnosing healthcare provider or collaborating 3 allied health professionals. The HASA client 4 referral numbers from June of 2015 show that 5 approximately 50% of all HASA clients are self-6 7 referred. New York should be sending the newly diagnosed to HASA not leaving the patient to conduct 8 a search for available help. The single point 9 10 approach provides us an opportunity. It will be a place where those at high risk can seek assistance 11 12 with other services such as Medicaid or other 13 government programs.

14 On the housing side, the Council can 15 start by addressing transparency issues at HASA that 16 make it difficult to navigate for clients. HASA 17 currently has programs in place for both ongoing and 18 emergency housing. These programs take two primary forms as either a HASA units leased or privately 19 20 rented market rate apartments. HASA spends an average of \$1958 per month on 5701 leased units, 21 2.2 whereas the 23,000 clients with privately rented 23 units receive between \$480 and \$1100 in rental assistance per month. However, HASA does not make 24 the criteria to get the \$1100 available to clients 25

2 and the approval process is arbitrary and shrouded in 3 mystery, meaning people can be receiving vastly 4 different supports for no obvious or justified 5 reason.

86

The lack of stable housing access not 6 7 only forces HIV positive people out of their homes, but given the current demographic makeup of the newly 8 infected, it also has a population transfer effect. 9 This effect appears to be racially discriminatory and 10 forces people to the outer boroughs where there are 11 12 fewer, far fewer supports available. Even though a 13 good number of these clients should qualify for the 14 30% income rent cap that was enacted last year, it is 15 not currently being applied to all HASA qualified 16 participants as the state law intends.

I want the Council to understand the positive impact that HASA will have, HASA for All will have and the greater transparency it will have on the currently marginalized and underserved HIV positive population.

Today I ask for your support for both the HASA for All bill and the Division of AIDS Service bill. Thank you for your time today.

2 CHAIR LEVIN: Thank you very much for 3 It was very thoughtful and we will your testimony. make sure that we will take your recommendation into 4 account as we move forward with these two pieces of 5 6 legislation I want to thank this panel you're your 7 thoughtful testimony for being here today and for your advocacy. I believe strongly that the... the 8 reason why we are at the state that we are at today 9 is because of advocacy from communities and 10 compliance who and providers who have fought the good 11 12 fight for a number of years and we are in a position 13 today to be able to act on that but we wouldn't be 14 doing so if it wasn't for the years of advocacy that 15 went into it so, thank you very much for you're 16 testimony thank you. 17 CHRIS MANN: Thank you. CHAIR LEVIN: Call the next panel Marcelo 18 Maia, James Edstrom, Kathy Kenlis, Village Care and 19 20 James Lister, Vocal NYC, Vocal NY, sorry. 21 [pause] 2.2 CHAIR LEVIN: I apologize if I got 23 anybody's name wrong. You have the opportunity to 24 correct the record. Anyone wants to begin, go ahead. 25

2	JAMES LISTER: Thank you James Lister
3	from Vocal New York. I'm testifying for both of them
4	actually but I'm going to concentrate on 684.
5	Personally being a HASA client and testing positive
6	in 1989 this would have helped me a great deal.
7	Because of the current situation the policy resulted
8	in my bankruptcy, isolation and disintegration of my
9	quality of life. In 89 I tested positive, in 1992 I
10	had my lowest t-cell count but I still didn't qualify
11	and in 2002 I finally had the two
12	(inaudible)infections that would qualify me for HASA.
13	By that time I was pretty bankrupt, I had to isolate
14	myself not spending money on anything because I was
15	determined not to be homeless and because I lived in
16	in my own apartment versus losing my apartment going
17	through the system, I was not protected by the 30 $\%$
18	rent cap until of course now. The we know the
19	temporary and emergency housing is more expensive.
20	We know that temporary and emergency housing is sub-
21	standard. So therein lays a very obvious decision to
22	keep people out of temporary emergency housing
23	because of both of those reasons we keep them in
24	their own home. The the policy of imposing the
25	budget of 276 on clients is unrealistic. Having

2 lived on that for quite a while and while I was grateful for it ... it contributed to the disintegration 3 4 of my quality of life and also to my isolation. I do want to speak about HASA case workers because I've 5 6 had several or many I guess. One did not speak 7 English and I don't speak anything but English and she also didn't know that Wednesday followed Tuesday. 8 Another was a drunk. (inaudible) two of mine had been 9 so empathetic and knowledge that I ... I mourned the day 10 that they moved on to something else because I knew 11 12 that my chances of getting a replacement just like them was going to be next to nothing. I also think 13 14 that it's important that the eligibility rules and 15 what benefits are visual for people who are HIV 16 positive even though they may not qualify for HASA 17 benefits, need to be placed in where HIV positive 18 people congregate, where they can get information like GMAC that would be a place that I would say that 19 20 they you know would know that it exist. Because I really didn't know, you know I was not involved in 21 2.2 other everything. I really didn't know that was even 23 an option for me. So I will thank you. 24 CHAIR LEVIN: You could keep going if you

25 have a little bit more.

2 JAMES LISTER: No that's all right.
3 CHAIR LEVIN: Thank you very much for
4 your testimony.

5 TASSY CAROLY: Good afternoon my name is 6 Tassy Caroly, I'm a case manager for a non-profit 7 Village Care. So as a case manager the my firsthand experience with clients especially a lot of them that 8 are in shelters that are a-symptomatic you know their 9 taking their medication and they feel like their, 10 their kind of left on the waist side and providing 11 12 medical case management the biggest thing is housing. 13 So a lot of them feel like you know what, I'm not 14 going to take my medication anymore and I'm going to 15 try you know make my make me sick, make myself sick 16 so I will probably do risky behaviors you know, go 17 into sex trafficking and do all these things just to 18 have my voice heard for HASA. So I think that's the main point when it comes to housing, it equals 19 20 health, your healthcare because a lot clients in order for them to for us to meet them half way they 21 2.2 want to be stable and housing is a big component in 23 New York City that affects clients. Also I wanted to talk about clients that do have HASA, it's hard for 24 us as the case managers that are helping to provide 25

2 medical case management making sure they go to their appointments it's the linkage is very hard so 3 sometimes you know a lot of the clients will say I 4 haven't heard from my HASA worker, I'm trying to 5 6 reach my HASA worker and then me as the case manager 7 is trying to you know collaborate with the HASA worker. And they don't answer phone calls, so now 8 were doing the medical park and the housing part as 9 well and it would be nice for us to kind of link 10 together. If I'm doing the medical they should be 11 12 able to do the housing and we can meet halfway and I 13 think that's the hardest part in terms of 14 collaboration, I'm not sure if you know a lot of them 15 say the language barrier like she was saying the 16 language barrier or they don't know who the CBO are 17 that are working with client that are receiving 18 services and what we do. So I think a lot of those things are a big factor in actually providing quality 19 20 care.

21 CHAIR LEVIN: Thank you. So just to 22 follow up I mean when I ask, I was asking Mr. Tietz 23 and Deputy Commissioner about this and I think that 24 there is an opportunity for greater collaboration 25 between case managers within the not for profit

1	COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFARE 92
2	organizations and and HASA so that there's that
3	that that's something you know that can always be
4	improved but we what I'd like to see from HRA is some
5	concrete steps that they can, that they can instigate
6	or you know start on where we can see some greater
7	collaboration of communications.
8	TASSY CAROLY: I agree.
9	CHAIR LEVIN: Do you think that as a case
10	manager you think that could be helpful?
11	TASSY CAROLY: Yes that's a big barrier,
12	big barrier.
13	MARCELO MAIA: Hi, Thank you New York
14	City Council Member Stephen Levin, Chair of the
15	Committee on General Welfare and Council Member Corey
16	Johnson, Chair of the committee on Health and the New
17	York City Council Members here present for scheduling
18	this hearing on HASA and for this opportunity. My
19	name is Marcelo Maia, I am facilitate the ACT UP New
20	York HASA Group.
21	Our Mission is to address HASA policies
22	that impact clients, to update the Rental Assistance
23	Program grant to reflect local real estate market
24	values and other issues affecting People Living with
25	HIV and AIDS.
I	

The Group is spearheaded by HASA clients, representatives of major community based organizations working with people living with HIV and housing are also members and receive notes from our meetings.

7 On the hearing of June 24, 2015, we distributed a list with 42 issues and 12 proposals to 8 This time, we would like to focus on 9 improve HASA. the proposals which are now totaling 17. Again do to 10 11 time constrains I'll read the identified as 12 priorities and they include, they include the changes 13 on HASA eligibility criteria which we endorse and 14 HASA advisory board, which we support.

15 Proposed is first is the rental 16 assistance grant that must be updated to reflect the 17 real estate rental market values of the neighborhood 18 of client residence. We argue that the HUD guidelines limit of \$1,100 for a 1 bedroom are too low and have 19 20 not been updated since 2002, while New York City rents is skyrocketed. Because of that, clients with 21 2.2 permanent housing are losing their homes and stay on 23 SRO's are much longer. We understand that even though those are guidelines, they represent the 24 actual limit for clients looking for housing. 25

As recommended by to the Task Force to end the AIDS epidemic in New York State. Update the rental assistance rates provide through the program to provide rental assistance in line with the market rental rates in localities.

7 After 20 years of republican mayors, HASA needs the structural and philosophical reforms. HASA 8 eligibility must be grant to all people living with 9 HIV who need housing. This proposal is being 10 addressed and by the proposed amendment to Local Law 11 12 49. Case workers must be certified by HASA and 13 evaluated by clients. HASA to establish a program 14 that will assist clients who need it, to get a GED or 15 access CUNY to finish or have a college degree. HASA 16 CAB to update then displays the Client Bill of Rights 17 and the list of client's entitlements in every 18 center, in every center. I'll just read the conclusion, my time is up. 19 We understand that permanent housing is 20

fundamental if people living with HIV are to be tested, connected and remain in care, you start treatment, suppress viral replication, achieve maintain an undetectable viral load and stop HIV transmissions. It is also known that New York Task

1	COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFARE 95
2	Force to End the AIDS Epidemic has recommended that
3	HASA like services be extended throughout New York
4	State. We must not replicate a model which that has
5	known problems before we correct them. We will work
6	on transforming the concept of permanent housing into
7	that of a home for people living with HIV and AIDS in
8	New York. Thank You.
9	CHAIR LEVIN: Thank you Mr. Maia.
10	JAMES EDSTROM: Thank you Mr. Maia.
11	JAMES: Ok My name is James Edstrom, I'm
12	a HASA client and I'd like say right off the back
13	that HASA is the most abusive agency the City has.
14	I'm not going to beat around the bush here ok. In
15	HASA the minute were diagnosed with AIDS were under
16	house arrest. That's what it comes down to. We're
17	required to have case workers, we're required all
18	these things that are required of us and if we don't
19	do it, we're subject to eviction. I am currently in
20	Supreme Court with HASA providers St. Nick's Alliance
21	where abuse is including; rape, breaking rent
22	stabilization laws, harassment, living with rats and
23	mic, abuses by landlord and case workers and breaking
24	the Americans with disabilities act which states
25	equal or better housing. Most of the HRA's providers

2 break these laws and the HRA refuses to do anything about it even when proven. These housing contracts 3 4 the City signs with these providers are illegal. 5 There are already rules in place for the HRA for people living with AIDS. They mean nothing to the 6 7 HRA and the HASA staff. There are no safeguards in place to protect us. There is assistance for us to 8 complain, there is no system for us to complain and 9 call a provider into the HRA but the provider can 10 call us in for any little thing called the step 11 12 Step one, step two, step three then an process. 13 eviction. When you are called to one of these step 14 meetings, even when you prove you are right, the HRA 15 sides with the provider. This is wrong. After I 16 begged for almost three years for the HRA to do 17 something about the abuses, they ignored. When I 18 finally had it I was forced to go public in the New York Daily News and say I have AIDS and tell about 19 20 the abuses. At the same time I filed a lawsuit against the provider in Supreme Court. This did not 21 2.2 even make the HRA or the provider do the right thing 23 and fix the abuses. In fact it outraged the HRA and St. Nicks Alliance and abuses became worse. 24 Μv 25 lawyer informed the HRA and St. Nicks Alliance that

2 since we were now in a lawsuit all actions against me was to stop as required by law. It did not. 3 I not only complained about the abuse for the landlord. 4 Ι complained about the drugs in the building in St. 5 Nicks Alliance not only refused to address the drug 6 7 problems, they refused to give the videos to the police of the drug deals I witnessed. If anyone 8 recently read the story of the big heroin bust in 9 Brooklyn a few weeks ago, the woman accused of money 10 laundering for the drug operation was the St. Nick 11 12 Alliance property manager, Hedy Cadello (sic). Her 13 son ran the operation. St. Nicks operates or owns 14 around 80 buildings in Brooklyn. The HRA knowing 15 there was ongoing lawsuit still allowed St. Nick 16 Alliance to follow step one against me and when I 17 attended with my lawyer and proved all the 18 allegations were false the HRA still ruled against My lawyer once again informed the HRA that since 19 me. 20 there was an ongoing lawsuit against St. Nicks 21 Alliance it could not allow any more step meeting. 2.2 Shortly after the HRA called me into a step two 23 meeting for false charges. Once again my lawyer and I went to this meeting, at the meeting we proved we 24 were living with mice and rats, we proved we were 25

2 being abused and we proved St. Nicks Alliance forged my lease agreement. Their testimony from their own 3 4 HRA employee who was at the lease signing and she said the leases were forged that I never agreed to 5 6 certain things like meeting with case workers and 7 still the HRA ruled against me. There were eight people from the HRA and HASA in that room against one 8 person, me. Some HASA facts and I know my time is 9 When you go to HASA, when you got HIV and AIDS 10 up. you are labeled as drug addict and an alcoholic even 11 12 though you are not. This is a fact. I called Robert 13 Doua (sic), I got him on the phone, the former 14 Commissioner, he said they do the that in order to 15 get federal funding. I had several phone calls for 16 former Deputy Commissioner Frank Lipton (sic), they 17 admit that we are labeled as a drug addict and 18 alcoholic who's been in rehab in order to get extra federal funding. This done to all of us in the HASA 19 20 system. HASA system is broken, HASA needs to be fixed. I support this bill but it need to go a lot 21 2.2 lot further because we are being abused by HASA and 23 nobody would do anything about it. Thank you. 24 CHAIR LEVIN: Thank you very much sir for 25 your testimony and thank to this panel for your

2 testimony. We a, again we greatly appreciate the feedback that get particularly from clients where 3 4 were able to understand and get a greater insight 5 into the reality, you know what's happening on the 6 ground and we appreciate that very much as that is 7 helps us as a governmental body to look towards additional reforms, things can always be better. 8 There is always room for improvement, nothing is in a 9 you know perfect state even if we implement HASA for 10 All there's still going to be improvements that need 11 12 to happen within the system so we greatly appreciate your testimony. Thank you very much. New panel 13 14 Reginald Brown, Vocal NY, Ivan Perez, Vocal GMHC, I'm 15 sorry Anthony Williams, Care for the Homeless, Annie 16 Soriano, Friends House.

17 REGINALD BROWN: Good afternoon Chair and 18 all that are present. First I'd like to say thank 19 you so much for following up on the fact that even 20 though I'm on the HASA advisory board I had not been 21 notified. I've now been notified so I will be dually 22 attending the meeting. And I can say that if no 23 recommendations have been made because.

24 CHAIR LEVIN: I'm sorry can you identify 25 yourself.

2 REGINALD BROWN: Oh, I'm sorry I always 3 I'm Reginald Brown, Vocal New York and as I do that. 4 said I at my previous testimony in June I said that I 5 was on the HASA advisory board and I didn't know 6 anything about meetings, well thanks to the testimony 7 I now know that I am on the board, I've been informed of a meeting, I was not able to attend that one 8 meeting and if no recommendations have been made is 9 because I've not been in that meeting because I have 10 a list of (inaudible) not only from Vocal New York 11 12 but from Act Up and some other members of the 13 community to have things that need to be done. I'd 14 like to read also I'm here to support the Int. No. 684 because HASA for All is a no brainer. The point 15 16 is if you are sick you need healthcare and we point 17 is that we want to keep people healthy if they are 18 not sick. But I'd like to read a personal testimony from a friend of mine who cannot be here and this is 19 20 what activist do, they speak up for those who can't speak for themselves. Hello my name is Judith Gore, 21 2.2 my journey with HASA is been riddled with more 23 negativity then should be at Greenwood Center in 24 Brooklyn. Regretfully I am now homeless with no 25 fault of my own. I have not abused the system, I

2 have not... not in arears on rent nor have I abused property. In short, my landlord sold his building 3 where I have been living for nearly seven years. 4 The new landlord not renting to HASA clients or low 5 6 income or middle income. I mean that's a flagrant 7 violation right there. The building is in Brooklyn only had three units in it and I was the last tenant 8 standing because I hadn't found a new apartment. 9 Camba (sic), Camba is a housing provider a service 10 organization diligently searched for, searched for a 11 12 place for me. I readily understood that I could not and would not stay there long enough to recognize 13 that I had a right to appeal to housing court to show 14 15 cause to get a little more time in housing court that 16 I thankfully got to extensions. Final eviction date was September 3rd even though I could have shown 17 18 because maybe to get a few more days, however, the HASA caseworker supervision kept needling me. 19 I kept 20 getting different pre-eviction housing dates from my case worker and filed with the legal until I relented 21 2.2 at my case workers assistance that it was mandatory. 23 I moved out, put my stuff in storage and under the insurance that it would be temporary housing for me 24 that day. I set at the HASA office the day I moved 25

2 out all of my stuff in storage, keys now properly in the new landlord hands and sat in the HASA office 3 with my luggage for immediate move 10:00 a.m. to 4:30 4 p.m. September 14th. Staff was told that I should 5 not have been moved and I should not have told that I 6 7 moved because there was no place for me. My case worker Ms. Negron and Supervisor further reiterated 8 to me that (inaudible) of no temporary housing for me. 9 I was then asked to, I will, I will be brief. I did 10 not have anywhere to go even though I had resided in 11 12 New York since 1984 and I've been employed by the New York City Department of Youth and Employment. 13 He is 14 now currently couch surfing cause he has no family 15 here so this is someone who is been gainfully 16 employed you know (inaudible) but the landlord who bought the building said he does not I mean I guess 17 18 we can get that on record or something. He does not, he or she does not rent to HASA or low income people. 19 20 So he's now couch surfing, he ... what he's my age so this should not happen. HASA for All is a very good 21 2.2 idea but as previously said that it's a lot of stuff 23 that needs to be done. I'm a HASA client, thanks to HASA I'm still here. I'm... I'm... I'm virally 24 suppressed but even with that if we're going make 25

1 COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFARE 103 2 this HASA for All these things need to be done and the cultural in the HASA needs to be, needs to be 3 4 humane, they need to treat us like people and I am on 5 under house arrest. I have a case manager in 6 supportive of housing comes to me twice a week. She 7 happen to call me when I was out of town and she, this is a new case worker and she said, well I'm 8 going to have a meeting with you the next day, I said 9 well excuse me I can't do it cause I'm out of town, 10 what do you mean you're out of town, what (inaudible) 11 12 yeah I'm out of town, I said well where are you going 13 to come back, I said I'm not going to come back for a 14 visit that you said I have to have to a mandatory 15 visit week that's on you. So I said I'm not leaving 16 my Las Vegas to come back and (inaudible) I sent a 17 letter, sent a very nice letter to St. Nicks saying 18 that you know first of all she needs to identify herself and tell me that she's a new case worker and 19 20 not just tell me she on it making appointment but like I said the way that they treat us is like, is 21 2.2 like house arrest. I'm going away again so I've now 23 written down everything I'm going in but the point is I'm not on parole and I'm not on probation, I'm a 24 25 grown man. Thank you.

2 CHAIR LEVIN: Great that's an important 3 point.

REGINALD BROWN: Oh St. Nicks Alliance is 4 the provider the same provider and I've been denied a 5 6 pet because they say that I have a pet and I only 7 realized that the ADA says I can have a pet, guess what I'm going to get a pet. Because ... because the pet 8 is a psychological thing to be that brings me more 9 comfort than having her come to me twice a month and 10 11 ask me the same bloody questions.

12 CHAIR LEVIN: Do you want a pet? You 13 should be able to have a pet.

14 REGINALD BROWN: Absolutely thank you. 15 CHAIR LEVIN: And also I mean that... 16 that's the issue of... of the your encountering of... of 17 you know being able to go away and be able to go on 18 vacation and that's important, that's a vacation is 19 as important mental health as having a pet.

20 REGINALD BROWN: And I am aware that if I 21 go away for more than 30 days I'm supposed to let you 22 know. Ok I can deal with that, but I've not been on 23 vacation in forever and I needed this time to heal 24 and get some spiritual healing which I now have and 25 I'm ready to come back and keep butt and take names.

2	CHAIR LEVIN: And just one other
3	suggestion is with, within the advisory board setting
4	I mean it's important that that you know that's
5	there's a forum where you can bring that and it's
6	official and that it has minutes and that the
7	recommendations are posted online, that's why we're
8	doing 935 so.
9	REGINALD BROWN: Thank you.
10	CHAIR LEVIN: Please please stay with it
11	and and make sure that that board is is doing the
12	job that it's intended to do. Thank you.
13	IVAN PEREZ: Hello my name is Ivan Perez,
14	I'm a local member and a GMHC client. I hear a lot
15	about HASA when we talk about HASA sounds health.
16	Unfortunately it's doesn't work for everybody like
17	myself. Being an HIV is hard to go through the day.
18	Got to deal with the stress and depressed. HASA
19	won't take me because I'm not sick enough and I don't
20	want to to the point. But that's why I need help,
21	that's why I need HASA and that's why we need HASA
22	for All yesterday.
23	ANNIE SORIANO: My name is Annie Soriano
24	and I am the Executive Director of Friends House in
25	

1 COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFARE 106 2 Rosehill, we are a permanent supportive housing 3 provider for HASA clients. I'd like to thank the City Council's 4 General Welfare Committee for giving us this 5 opportunity to testify today about HASA as well as 6 7 legislation that would expand the benefits that HASA provides to include financially qualified HIV 8 positive people. 9 10 I am here today to testify in support of Council Member Johnson's proposed legislation. 11 This 12 bill goes beyond the idea of qualifying more people 13 for HASA services. This expansion is beyond the lab criteria and the medical definitions of a still 14 15 epidemic virus. This epidemic is fueled by poverty, addiction, mental illness and homelessness. 16 It's 17 never just AIDS. It's also never just housing. The 18 lack of stability for these most vulnerable New Yorkers presents barrier after barrier of being able 19 20 to initiate treatment, have basic food and shelter and support that would allow them to live their lives 21 2.2 as independently and as healthy as possible. 23 There is currently a lack of housing 24 particularly among our city's low income, marginalized residents who have HIV and AIDS. 25 We

2 have long known as the Council Member reports that housing is healthcare. Among the interventions that 3 effectively address complex and intersecting health 4 and social conditions, as well as health disparities; 5 6 housing is the first priority. Housing is the key to 7 helping people diagnosed with HIV to access healthcare, remain in treatment and prevent further 8 transmission. Beyond housing, there is a definitive 9 need to have access for everyone in this community to 10 services regardless of their CD 4 count or symptoms. 11 12 Diminishing barriers and enhancing access to services provides a return on investment for public health. 13 14 The total cost of funding this program expansion is 15 only short term expenditure; it's a long term 16 investment rather than a cost. The investment is not only with our people but also a financial long term 17 18 savings. Parallel with our State's commitment and initiative to end AIDS, this expansion will 19 20 invariably reduce the medical cost of life time of HIV/AIDS related care by reducing new infections. 21 Ιt 2.2 will reduce the enormous financial costs of emergency 23 room visits, hospital stays and will stop sacrificing the health of our clients. 24

107

2	We have learned lessons from the past and
3	the current state of our City being the epicenter of
4	this disease. The disconnection from HIV care is a
5	battle of poverty. By expanding eligibility for
6	services, together, we will be able to provide
7	stability for low income people diagnosed with HIV in
8	ensuring the best possible long term wellness and an
9	increase in self-sufficiency before they get to sick.
10	Thank you.
11	CHAIR LEVIN: Thank you very much Ms.
12	Soriano.
13	ANTHONY WILLIAMS: Good afternoon ladies
14	and gentleman of the General Welfare Committee and
15	especially you Mr. Levin for giving me the
16	opportunity to speak today. This is a very important
17	issue to me. My name is Anthony Williams, I've been
18	living with HIV since 2007. I also serve now as the
19	Chairman of HIV advisory committee for Care for the
20	Homeless and an advocate for Vocal New York. Why is
21	it important to me for one simple reason when you say
22	access for AIDS or services for all New Yorkers, you
23	must stop and think about what you said. That sounds
24	good as you say it but you haven't really thought
25	about it because you have things that are in place
2 that are not doing services to the ones that are already here. So now if you expand the services you 3 got to make sure that the services going to work. 4 In 5 order for it to work you know when I became the Chairman of the HIV committee for Care for the 6 7 Homeless, one of the first things I said was you'll got 30 sights why we only providing services for six. 8 So I took that upon myself to make it my goal that 9 10 whatever services we got at over here in Queens, whatever services we got up here in Manhattan, I want 11 12 it to go to every center that you have. Well that's the only way you going to have transparent system 13 14 that you know that everybody are being fair. Here at HASA we're not having a fair shot. It's for those 15 16 that can and those that can't. It's no in between it's either you can or can't. I been they sit here 17 18 and tell you a beautiful story, talking about 180 days they going to this, they award this big 19 20 monstrous contract to these people that's only expanding their contract every year but they're not 21 2.2 providing any service. They need more accountability 23 on those that they give contracts. How can you 24 increase somebody's contract because they say they 25 got a case worker? The city is already paying for a

1	COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFARE 110
2	case worker, already paying. Every HASA client has a
3	case manager through the city. Why do I need to go
4	to a shelter for you to tell me I got to go see a
5	case manager for what? Somebody that you created a
6	job for not a service that they're going to provide
7	for me or any other clients. They just got a job.
8	They coming in anything that they put forth can't
9	nothing happen unless they go to HASA. HASA got to
10	approve every move that you make, so why are we
11	paying you, why you stagnating my progress. I found
12	the apartment myself, on my own, which they're paying
13	for a case manager and now they don't want to process
14	it. I would like to thank you Committee Members but
15	I would urge encourage you for bill 684, think about
16	it and bill 935, approve those bills, they are bills
17	that are in best interest of the public but in after
18	all when you approve, make sure you have the
19	transparency (inaudible). Thank you.
20	CHAIR LEVIN: Thank you and you know it's
21	this committee intention to continue to have
22	oversight hearings on HASA as an overall program so
23	that we're just not stopping with the passage of
24	these two pieces of legislation. We intend on… on
25	taking the long term approach of oversight and making

1	COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFARE 111
2	sure that the services that are supposed to be
3	getting to clients are in fact getting to clients and
4	in an effective way and that no client is denied or
5	lack services if he or she intends intends to get
6	those services. So thank you very much for your
7	testimony. We look forward to working with all of
8	you. Thank you very much to this panel. Council
9	Member Johnson you have anything you want to add?
10	Final panel, Jennifer Flynn, Vocal New York, Clarence
11	Henderson, Boom Health and Jose Perez, Trans Justice.
12	JOSEPHINE PEREZ: I'm sorry I'm Josephine
13	Perez.
14	CHAIR LEVIN: My apologies Josephine I
15	just read it (inaudible). Whoever want to begin
16	testifying go ahead.
17	CLARENCE HENDERSON: Hello, hi my name is
18	Clarence Henderson. I've been living with, I have a
19	AIDS diagnoses since 1991. I work with Boom Health
20	as an Outreach Specialist in Prevention Department.
21	I belong to many organizations, many advocacy things
22	but I advocate to a lot of organizations but I'm not
23	here to carry water for any of them. Ok I'm here to
24	express my point of view as a person that's out in
25	the field every day. Ok that see the enormity of the
I	

2 numbers and the needs for HASA for All. However, there is a accountability that needs to be recognized 3 because it has to fiscally feasible to happen. 4 This also will involve the accountability of those 5 documented and undocumented people who are must be 6 7 willing to advance a pass the citizenship in order to obtain those benefits. The need for expanded 8 services from HASA in my view, should be towards 9 utility security. If it can be attached to the 10 housing plan as it exist now because there are people 11 12 who still have to pay Con Edison. If there can be 13 something in place to ensure that their lights don't 14 go off and they don't wind up living in a house of 15 wax because they drop the ball on giving it's payment 16 to Con Edison for whatever reason ok. That should 17 not happen because sometimes they can't get out that 18 whole ok. And sometimes their living in a house of wax and candles and things like that for extended 19 20 attached period of time. There should be an educational priority status giving to people who are 21 2.2 undetectable and have been undetectable that are 23 coherent and compliant and want to advance their living state of dignity for a while. My mentor who's 24 had AIDS, a AIDS diagnoses and is coherent and 25

I COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFAR	1	COMMITTEE	ON	GENERAL	WELFARE
-------------------------------	---	-----------	----	---------	---------

2 compliant and undetectable recently went to for to 3 get his blood work and his blood work came in as undetermined for his diagnoses. This is comparable 4 to what was called a false positive and the onset of 5 6 living the HIV and AIDS experience but he far along 7 in that. Perhaps this is an anomaly or perhaps this is better things to come. These things in place to 8 advance a person that wants to (inaudible) academic 9 or work and make money should be in place. 10 Thank 11 you.

12 Good after noon my name JENNIFER FLYNN: 13 is Jennifer Flynn and I'm the Executive Director of 14 Vocal New York and thank you so much for this 15 opportunity to testify and thank you for keeping HASA 16 on the agenda and I just want to say thank you also 17 for your leadership in introducing these two very 18 important bills. Vocal is a membership organization lead by primarily low income people living with AIDS. 19 20 Most of them have been homeless or are currently homeless. We also convene a trade association of 21 2.2 nonprofit housing providers that are actually the 23 solution to homelessness and that contract with HASA. 24 Our organization again whole heartily supports Int. No. 684 we also whole heartily support any efforts to 25

1 COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFARE 114 2 increase accountability and ... and from HASA and therefore support Int. No. 935. We're also here 3 4 respectfully requesting support from the City Council 5 to help offset the decades and now it has been decades of cuts to HASA contracts and the 6 7 dramatically the unforeseen cost associated with dramatically rising rent. In Brooklyn last year 8 alone rent's went up an average of 10% and I'd love 9 to see a show of hands of people in the room who got 10 a 10% salary increase last year, very few of us did. 11 12 What we need is we need 3 million dollars from City 13 Council to keep the doors open of these programs that 14 have been providing housing to formally homeless 15 people living with AIDS. The Council has a long 16 history of initiatives to fill in the gaps in funding 17 to get us closer to the end of AIDS. The Council 18 funded the New York City Community of Color HIV/AIDS initiative then the Injection Drug Users Help 19 20 Alliance and this year because of the dramatic increase in homelessness, we need some support from 21 2.2 the council to address homelessness among people with 23 AIDS. And I can't sit here and not echo the comments from our individual members. HASA needs to make sure 24 that all of their staff is trained in the new 25

2 approach that this administration is advancing when it comes to welfare. The new approach that ... that 3 4 believes that this is actually a safety net. Our 5 members report miss information, rude behavior, lack of clarity from all levels of HASA workers and HASA 6 7 just needs to do better and I know that HRA said you know give us the names, give us specific examples and 8 we will start to compile those but it is widely you, 9 if you go to any welfare center and ask any person 10 walking in or out how they were treated, if they got 11 12 full information, they will almost across the board 13 tell you know or I was not told about that particular 14 benefit, so there's something needs to happen there. 15 We need better training at HASA, so I thank you again 16 so much for your leadership. 17 CHAIR LEVIN: Just to follow up on that

18 point, I agree that it's not really necessary just 19 about a particular case worker at a particular time 20 working for you know that's what were continuing to 21 find, it's... it's more making sure that we have 22 systematic accountability and standards across the 23 board for HASA (inaudible). 24 JOSEPHINE PEREZ: Ok can you hear me.

25

CHAIR LEVIN: Yes.

115

2 JOSEPHINE PEREZ: Hello my name is 3 Josephine Fantasia Perez, I am a transgender woman. 4 I represent, I'm here to represent for Trans Justice 5 on the Transgender Community Club of United States of America. Right, I'm an activist, a rallier, 6 7 protester, I've been in a lot conferences. Some of you'll may know me, some of you'll may not. I'm just 8 tired of the not enough being done for the 9 transgender community. We need better services, more 10 grants and funding's, more money for places to better 11 12 service us transgender people all over the United 13 States of America. Not just in New York City. You 14 know we need legislative to work big and hard on 15 transgender not being homeless in the street. Not 16 having drug and alcohol addiction can a lot of 17 transgender the reason why they go to drugs and 18 alcohol addiction is because of lack of services and support. We need jobs, food, education, we need 19 20 programs to be educated and trained and lack of knowledge and understanding. Also, I also suffer 21 2.2 mental development disorder, mental disability and I 23 also suffer mental so people with severe mental illness do count and the HIV book of all walks of 24 life. Which is gay, lesbian, bi-sexual and 25

2 heterosexual to. A lot of HIV programs say they can't take you in because of you not suitable for 3 4 the program or because they can't cater to your 5 mental illness, bull shit. This is where the grants 6 and funding, what are they doing with grants and 7 funding and money when they get it. How are they providing it for transgender people right? 8 So we need to find out and people need to go visit these 9 programs and find out if there, if you'll give grants 10 and bills pass a bill on us and give grants and 11 12 funding for the HIV transgender community, it needs 13 to be provided right and well you know and provided right you know like for services because I don't feel 14 15 that we should have to suffer without housing right 16 programs, no type of activities, trips for fun, no type of gatherings for one another. They cancelled 17 18 support groups, transgender support groups because of lack of funding's and grants. It's not fair to us, 19 20 we need to support one another as a transgender community cause some people can't understand our 21 2.2 issues so we have a transgender women support group, 23 transgender men support group for women and men that can't understand our issues that are having sex with 24 25 gay, lesbian and bi-sexuals. Same thing with

1 COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFARE 118 2 transgender who are negative, if you look at the rate of transgender population throughout the United 3 States of America that are HIV positive today, it's a 4 huge and high rate. People may not think it exists 5 6 but look of how many transgender get tested and 7 become HIV positive. So people that are negative need to be provided services that are transgender to 8 because they end up becoming HIV positive. We are 9 not supposed to be targeted as prostitutes or 10 targeted as drug and alcohol users, junkies, 11 12 whatever. We need the proper services we need, school, jobs, education and proper HIV and mental 13 14 health services throughout the United States of 15 America. I stand for Trans Justice and I stand when 16 our mean when I mean I stand for them. I live at 454 Lexington Avenue between Thompson and Truth Housing 17 18 Works and they are a very great women transitional 19 housing program. They have took transgender women 20 into their program. They have advocated on my behalf with HASA to extend my stay. Nanete Laco (sic) and 21 2.2 Barry Simmons (sic). They're a very great 23 transitional housing program and some SROs I didn't feel comfortable in because the lack of roaches and 24 rats and crap on the floor in the building smells and 25

1	СОМ	MITTEE	ON	GENEI	RAL WELF	ARE				119
2	all	types	and	I'm	sanitar	v as	a	person	living	healthy

2	all types and I in sanitary as a person living hearting
3	with HIV you know because some people are not able to
4	take care of their own self with HIV. So we do not
5	want to in end the world with AIDS and HIV, we want
6	to prevent people from catching HIV and AIDS and we
7	want to keep people from good viral low suppression
8	undetectable so we can live a long a long time. I
9	don't want legislative to think that they build TTHP
10	transgender transitional housing program just so I
11	can die, you know they need more TTHP programs.
12	Transgender housing programs throughout the United
13	States of America for all HIV programs and any other
14	programs, mental health to.

15 CHAIR LEVIN: Thank you very much, Thank 16 you Josephine. Council Member Johnson.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Josephine I want to thank you for being here, that's amazing testimony 18 19 to give without any prepared remarks so your 20 fantasize and it's great to have activist like you here who are out there in the community on the front 21 line and I know that you being here today, your 2.2 23 speaking on behalf of a lot of trans people that aren't able to be here. So I really appreciate that 24 fact that you are so open and honest about your own 25

2 status and about your own struggles with addition and mental health issues, so thank you. You know as I 3 think any Annie Soriano and other people have 4 testified that HIV and AIDS the epidemic that 5 6 continues to rage on in our city and nationally is 7 really and epidemic fueled by poverty, addiction, mental health issues and homelessness and that's what 8 I think you testified about today, that's what Vocal 9 is all about and it's why we like working with all of 10 you and I feel very excited and hopeful that in the 11 12 next little while were going to have hopefully good news to announce on both of these bills, Council 13 Levin and I, Chair Levin and I are working hard to 14 15 see some of this through. So I want to thank the 16 Chair for hearing these two bills today and I look 17 forward to working with all of you that testified to 18 make sure they become a reality. Thank you for your activism and your testimony today. 19 20 JOSEPHINE PEREZ: Thank you. CHAIR LEVIN: Thank you Council Member 21 2.2 Johnson, thank you very much to this panel for your

23 thoughtful testimony and thank you to everybody 24 that's here continuing to advocate and as I said 25 before the next hearing on HASA that we want to have

1	COMMITTEE ON GENERAL WELFARE 121
2	is discussing the input, how the implementation of
3	HASA for All is going, so hopefully will be there in
4	a couple of months, so with that does any other
5	person want to testify today? Seeing none this
6	hearing is adjourned.
7	[gavel]
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

CERTIFICATE

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date October 29, 2015