

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

----- X

OCTOBER 22, 2015
Start: 11:36 A.M.
Recess: 12:06 P.M.

HELD AT: COMMITTEE ROOM - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: CHAIRPERSON
DAVID GREENFIELD

COUNCIL MEMBERS:
MARIA DEL CARMEN ARROYO
INEZ BARRON
ANDREW COHEN
VINCENT GENTILE
DANIEL GARODNICK
BEN KALLOS
PETER KOO
BRAD LANDER
STEPHEN LEVIN
DARLENE MEALY
ROSIE MENDEZ
ANNABEL PALMA
ANTONIO REYNOSO
DONOVAN RICHARDS
YADANIS RODRIGUEZ
MARK TREYGER
JUMAANE WILLIAMS

2 CHAIR GREENFIELD: Good morning my name
3 is David Greenfield, I'm the Council Member for the
4 44th Council District in Brooklyn and privileged to
5 serve as the Chair of the Land Use Committee. I want
6 to welcome my esteemed colleagues who are members of
7 the Committee who are joining us today. I want to
8 recognize that Council Member Andy Cohen for coming
9 earliest today, thank you very much. Also want to
10 recognize Council Member Gentile, Palma, Garodnick,
11 Mealy, Mendez, Koo, Landers, Levin, Barron, Reynoso
12 and Treyger. I want to thank all of you for prompt
13 attendance. You will see on the table before you
14 several items (inaudible 1:04) committee first. You
15 will see agenda prepared by the Committee staff
16 containing those matters to which we've had a hearing
17 and have been reviewed and fully vetted by the Sub-
18 Committee's, those are the matters in which we will
19 be acting on today. I'd also like to take the
20 opportunity to thank our Sub-Committee Chairs. Chair
21 (inaudible 1:18), Chair Koo and a special thanks to
22 Planning Sub-Committee substitute even though he's
23 making a lot a noise during my hearing, I would thank
24 him none the less, Chair Andy Cohen and we wish his
25 speedy recovery to Chair Inez Dickens.

2 Also before you we have the joint reports
3 of the Land Use Committee and applicable Sub-
4 Committees for each item you're voting on today with
5 the proposed resolution for each item with the
6 Committee is voting on today is to approve each of
7 the resolutions before you for presentation and vote
8 by the full Council. The resolutions reflect the
9 recommendations of the applicable Sub-Committee. We
10 have four items of which we are voting to approve
11 today.

12 The first is LU#288. The New York Wheel,
13 the application is a modification to special permit
14 approved in 2013 for the construction of the New York
15 Wheel and approximately 624 foot tall observation
16 wheel in Staten Island. The modification to the site
17 plan includes changes to the configuration of the
18 parking sign, railroad decking, the open space plan
19 and reduction in size of the terminal building. This
20 application is in Council Member Rose's district.

21 Second item is LU#289 Hamilton Plaza.
22 Hamilton Plaza associates is applying for
23 modification to a strictly declaration of facilitate
24 change for the use a physical cultural establishment
25 on the 3rd floor and construction of the (inaudible

2 2:23) floor. This application is in Council Member
3 Lander's district. We will be voting to approve this
4 item with modifications.

5 LU#293, Home Street Homes, HPD is seeking
6 approval for their two year tax exemption under
7 article 11 of the private housing finance law. Co-
8 terms with the regulatory agreement to facilitate the
9 continue the affordability of the Home Street Homes
10 housing development, approximately 102 units of
11 housing. This application is in Council Arroyo's
12 district.

13 Finally LU#294 the LPC Warehouse, HPD is
14 seeking approval for UDAPT designation, project
15 approval and disposition of City owned land at 337
16 Berry Street 99-101 South 5th Street to facilitate
17 the development of 11th story mixed use building
18 under the extremely low and low income affordability
19 program. With 55 units of affordable housing and
20 ground floor commercial and community facility space
21 and this application is in Council Member Reynoso's
22 district.

23 Sub-Committees have all recommended
24 approval of these items as have the local Council
25 Members.

2 Any Council Members have any statements
3 they'd like to make or questions on the applications?
4 Council Member Reynoso.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you Chair
6 and also I want to thank Chair Cohen for a very good
7 hearing and I just want to say in this application
8 HPD had a very loose process, had very lacked a lot
9 of communication as to how we should be moving
10 forward when it comes to transparency in democratic
11 and fair process that many more then one bitter can
12 apply or make an attempt to replace an older bitter,
13 I don't want to get into the details about what
14 happens but it seems like especially in communities
15 like mine, Latino communities so I want to be very
16 clear that we they play by different rules. If this
17 were to happen in another community I just don't see
18 it happening the exact same way and you know I have
19 two use my political chips to say the least is to put
20 as much press on HPD to start doing things the right
21 way. All I'm asking for is the same process every
22 single time for every single application. And it
23 doesn't happen in Williamsburg. But that doesn't
24 mean that the community has to suffer without
25 affordable housing. The not for profit doesn't need

2 to suffer for the ill's or I guess mistakes of HPD.
3 I also want to say that this is a part of a 2005
4 greenpoint when is been rezoning in which we were
5 promised 1,400 units of affordable housing or
6 probably more and Steve you probably could confirm
7 this for me and we have .2% of those units have been
8 built in 10 years and it is unacceptable and we need
9 to get things done. So to not delay further that
10 lack of affordable housing that needs to be built in
11 my district, I'm going to support the project but
12 hope HPD fixes it process. Thank you.

13 CHAIR GREENFIELD: Thank you Council
14 Member Reynoso. Council Member Rose, make some
15 remarks.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you Chair
17 Greenfield and I want to thank Chair Richards for
18 hosting the Sub-Committee on Zoning and Franchises
19 which we got a chance to sort of revisit the change
20 in the plans as you know Committee Members that the
21 changes in the plan were pretty much GO technical
22 were a result of the GO technical analyst of the soil
23 and while you know it presented us with some
24 challenges. We were really able to revisit the
25 impact that the project was going to have on the

2 district and the City as a whole and we were able to
3 as we've always been to maintain our positive working
4 relationship with mutual respect and always enlight
5 of how it will benefit the community as well as
6 tourism in New York City. We overcame the
7 challenges, we worked together and I really want to
8 say that I truly believe that this is the best
9 project that we were able to come up with and I fully
10 support this... this application with modifications and
11 I really look forward to all of you visiting the
12 Wheel, we have made arrangements that every student
13 in New York City would have the opportunity to ride
14 it free and so at least once right Rich? At least
15 once. So in the first year, Staten Island students
16 have the benefit of many more rides, so with the
17 changes that are being submitted today and all of the
18 collaborative work we've done, I can fully support
19 this project. Thank you.

20 CHAIR GREENFIELD: Thank you Council
21 Member Rose and I want to congratulate you, I know
22 this was a lot of hard work and many years in the
23 making and there certainly were challenges in the
24 modifications but you've made this into a better
25 project but I'm sure it will be a major boom to your

1 COMMITTEE ON LAND USE 8

2 district and to Staten Island and the City of New
3 York as well, so congratulations on that. Any other
4 questions or comments from members? Hearing none, I
5 will ask the Clerk to call the roll on a vote to
6 approve LU#288, 293 and 294 and approve with
7 modifications LU#289.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Wayne Martin, Committee
9 Clerk, roll call vote, Committee on Land Use. Chair
10 Greenfield.

11 CHAIR GREENFIELD: I on all.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Council Member
14 Rose I... I may congratulation, I may visit I don't
15 know about riding the wheel but I may visit the
16 wheel. I vote I on all.

17 CHAIR GREENFIELD: Are you afraid of
18 height Council Member Gentile?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: (inaudible)

20 CHAIR GREENFIELD: 600, I hear you. Fair
21 enough.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: I

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Arroyo.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: I.

1 COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

9

2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gradonick.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER GRADONICK: Congrats and
4 I.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Chair may I
7 explain my vote?

8 CHAIR GREEFIELD: Council Member Mealy to
9 explain her vote.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I just want to
11 congratulate all my colleagues but I just want to say
12 I concur with Council Member Reynoso regards to HPD.
13 It always happens in certain areas and not other
14 areas and I hope they rectify that ASAP because
15 everyone needs affordable housing. I have land just
16 as well that they all of sudden has forgotten for
17 years now. With that, I'm glad you have permanent
18 affordable housing, that's what majority of our
19 housing being built today should be, so I salute you
20 on that and I vote I on all. Thank you.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote I.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO. I

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander.

1 COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

10

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request
3 permission to explain my vote?

4 CHAIR GREENFIELD: Council Member Lander
5 to explain his vote.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you I just
7 want to thank Members of the Zoning and Franchise
8 Sub-Committee for hearing Hamilton Plaza and
9 apologize for not being able to be at that hearing.
10 We worked productively with the applicant who agreed
11 to modify their proposal thanks to the staff for
12 helping us get that done and I vote I on all.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I on all.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Richards.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Permission to
19 explain my vote?

20 CHAIR GREENFIELD: Council Member
21 Richards to explain his vote.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Well thank you
23 Chairman and I want to congratulate Council Member
24 Rose on what I think is... is a forward moving plan on

25

2 having the largest Ferris Wheel in the world I think
3 right?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Observation

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I'm sorry,
6 observation, what is it observation wheel in Staten
7 Island and I want to also congratulate the
8 development team who were work very closely with her
9 on particular goals that will benefit the community
10 and Staten Island as a whole so, I want to say
11 congratulations and congratulations to Council
12 Member, I'm blinking right now, Brad Lander as well
13 on Hamilton Plaza, Congratulations. I vote I.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to
16 explain my vote?

17 CHAIR GREENFIELD: Council Member Barron
18 to explain her vote.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote I on all
20 but I want to commend my colleagues as he talks
21 about the fact that you got to have transparency and
22 additional to know that this is in fact an affordable
23 project because it's 30% of the AMI which is about
24 \$23,000 up to 60% of the AMI, so it's affordable to
25 the people who live there, so that they would not be

2 priced out of their own neighborhood where they
3 sacrificed and had such a lack of services and not an
4 opportunity to have upgrading in their housing. So I
5 vote I on all.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cohen.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Permission to
8 explain my vote?

9 CHAIR GREENFIELD: Council Member Cohen
10 to explain his vote.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I to vote I on all
12 but I did just want to acknowledge the hard that
13 Council Member Reynoso did at the Committee level to
14 make sure that this project is as good as it can be,
15 so I think that's worthy of noting and I vote I.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I vote I.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Reynoso.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I want to thank
20 everybody from the Sub-Committee that really
21 supported me and was able to push this project
22 through, I want to just let HPD know that they got to
23 get their stuff together especially when it comes to
24 my district and I want to vote I on all.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Treyger.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to
3 explain my vote?

4 COMMITTEE CLERK TREYGER: Council Member
5 Treyger to explain your vote.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I defiantly want
7 to give kudos to the I guess intern Chair Andy Cohen
8 who did a very good job to facilitate a very
9 informative hearing and to Council Member Reynoso who
10 had very I think appropriate strong line of
11 questioning to HPD about the process and I appreciate
12 your leadership in making sure that your community
13 still gets the housing it needs but certainly we need
14 to do a lot more to improve the process as well. So
15 I thought... I thought you were spot on and to Council
16 Member Rose and congratulations but I would urge
17 people after you ride the Staten Island Wheel, come
18 back to Coney Island Wonder Wheel as well. Thank you
19 very much.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I explain
22 my vote?

23 CHAIR GREENFIELD: Council Member
24 Williams to explain your vote.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you Mr.
3 Chair. I vote I on all. I do want to congratulate
4 all of my colleagues and I know Council Member
5 Reynoso you put a lot of work in. I do have a
6 concern often when we have a 100% low income
7 projects, particularly if they're not additional
8 services provided there. I think it's great that we
9 have one of the highest amounts of housing units for
10 homeless or formerly homeless individuals but without
11 the services in these communities we would only be
12 addressing the high needs and I do think we have to
13 have some, we have to provide the ability for people
14 with low income to live in many places across the
15 city and so I'm a fan of a mix usage to bring the
16 benefits that comes as well but I think it's great
17 and particularly the AMI's that you have but that's
18 just my one concern and hopefully we can think about
19 those things as we move forward.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: By a vote of 18 in the
23 affirmative, 0 in negative and no abstentions all
24 items have been adopted.

2 CHAIR GREENFIELD: Thank you we're going
3 to keep the vote open for 15 minutes until 12:05 p.m.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Committee on Land Use
5 stands at 18 in the affirmative, 0 in negative and no
6 abstentions.

7 CHAIR GREENFIELD: Thank you to the Land
8 Use Committee for the meeting of October 22nd, 2015
9 is hereby adjourned.

10 {gavel}

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date <INSERT TRANSCRIPTION DATE>