CITY COUNCIL CITY OF NEW YORK ----- Х TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES Of the COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS -----Х October 1, 2015 Start: 1:27 p.m. Recess: 4:19 p.m. HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall B E F O R E: BEN KALLOS Chairperson COUNCIL MEMBERS: David G. Greenfield Mark Levine Ritchie J. Torres Steven Matteo World Wide Dictation 545 Saw Mill River Road - Suite 2C, Ardsley, NY 10502

1

Phone: 914-964-8500 * 800-442-5993 * Fax: 914-964-8470 www.WorldWideDictation.com

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Henry Berger Special to the Mayor NYC Office of the Mayor

Winette Saunders Deputy Commissioner Department of Correction

Eric Contreras Executive Director of Social Studies NYC Department of Education

Lora-Lynn Byfield Senior Director of Communications NYC Department of Education

Michael J. Ryan Commissioner Board of Elections

Amy Loprest Assistant Executive Director Campaign Finance Board

James Harkness (sp?) Live On New York

Ellen Yoshiuchi National Kidney Foundation

Iris Resto TRIO Manhattan Ira Kofferman Live On New York

Talia Werber Policy and Research Manager Citizens Union in the City of New York

Prudence Katz Research and Policy Manager Common Cause New York

Kate Doran Election Specialist League of Women Voters of the City of New York

Amanda Seelman (sp?) Student at New York Civil Liberties Union Legislative Advocacy Clinic at new York Law School

Sarah Kerr Staff Attorney Prisoner's Rights Project

Penny Mentz Assistant District Attorney, Retired Member, Big Apple Coffee Party

David Pechefsky New York City Site Director Generation Citizen

Jonathan Reese Member, Big Apple Coffee Party

3

[sound check, pause, sound check] [gavel]

4 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Good morning to the 5 full room today for this hearing on the Committee of 6 Governmental Operations. I'm Ben Kallos, Chair of 7 the committee. You can Tweet me at Ben Kallos, and 8 we're joined today by Council Member Costa 9 Constantinides and have already been joined by Council Member Ritchie Torres. Today, we'll be 10 11 discussing five pieces of legislation, three 12 introductions, two resolutions related to the 13 promotion of absentee voting, voter registration and 14 voter registration forms handed out by certain city 15 agencies. I want to thank our Committee Analyst 16 Laurie Wenn for her amazing work, and I'd like 17 welcome back David Seitzer our previous counsel, and 18 note that once you are Gov Ops Counsel it is hard to 19 leave.

According to the New York City Campaign Finance Board only 20% of eligible New York City voters cast their ballots in the 2014 general election, which was at historic low. According to the United States Election Project New York State had slightly better, but still a dismal 29% of eligible

COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 5
 voters casting ballots last year, ranking the state
 near the bottom in the nation for voter
 participation. It's clear we are in the midst of a
 crisis of civic engagement, and the legislation being
 discussed today seeks to address this in several
 ways.

Introduction 628, which I sponsored, will 8 9 improve access to voter registration materials among our city's graduating high school seniors by 10 11 requiring the Department of Education and the BOE to provide students with registration materials in 12 13 appropriate language and to track and report efficacy 14 of distributing registration materials. Those forms 15 are currently just handed out in bulk in English with 16 diplomas, and they do not make it back to the voter 17 registration system. A report by Rock the vote and 18 CIRCLE found that young voters are more diverse, and 19 the best thing that we can do to assist those voters 20 and prospective voters and get them to turn out is by getting to them while they're still in school. 21 We have--we are registering all of our kids for the 2.2 23 draft, which has not happened in decades as they graduate our schools, and as they turn into teens in 24 our schools. But we're not doing the same for 25

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 2 registration, which happens every single year, and 3 sometimes multiple times a year.

4 Along the topic of voter registration 5 there are two ways to become an organ donor. One is when you get a driver's license, but in a city where 6 7 most people don't have driver's licenses, including 8 most of my staff, the best way is through voter 9 registration, and that's a bill introduced by Council Member Costa Constantinides, Introduction 796, which 10 11 would add assistance with the voter registration 12 form. As previously noted, we have been joined by Council Member Ritchie Torres. 13

14 In addition, we also have Resolution 695 15 sponsored by Council Member Helen Rosenthal, and 16 Resolution 848. One item that we've been advocating 17 for, for years at least personally, and I'm glad to 18 have Helen's resolution on point is 16 and 17 voter--19 year-old voter registration. You can already 20 register to vote at 17. You just have to be turning 21 18 before December 31st of the year you register. 2.2 And so, the system will mark somebody as pre-reg. 23 Whether we change that from 17 to 16 for registration would have no impact on the system. The system is 24 already built to accommodate it. The only change 25

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 7 2 would be that we'd have more time to get to the high 3 school students to get them registered while they are 4 in our schools.

With Resolution 848, which I sponsored, 5 it would allow--it calls on the state to allow online 6 7 and same-day registration. Last, but certainly not 8 least, is an issue of extreme importance, which is 9 enfranchisement. Intro 464 sponsored by Council Member Wills would require the Department of 10 11 Correction to implement a program to assist eligible jailed individuals to vote by absentee ballot. After 12 13 the absentee ballot applications have been submitted and DOC receives the requested ballots, the agency is 14 15 to distribute the ballots and provide assistance in 16 completing them upon request. DOC is also required 17 to transmit completed applications and ballots the 18 New York City Board of Elections it requested. This 19 is actually already, a lot of this is already in the 20 State Elect Law and, in fact, it specifically 21 provides for absentee voting from jail. So this 2.2 would just make sure that as we address a lot of the 23 prison reform that our Council has bee doing, that we're able to assist those people. And I just want 24 to thank our Committee Analyst Laurie Wenn for her 25

COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 8
 particular advocacy on this issue, and to her
 passion. And this time I'd just like to offer
 Council Member Constantinides a chance to make some
 opening remarks unless he'd like to wait for his
 panel on this bill.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you, Chair Kallos. It is always a pleasure to be 8 9 here, and this whole package of bills to improve voter participation and enfranchisement in the city 10 11 is--I know it's been your life's work something that 12 you have--we've worked on together for a long time so 13 I'm--I'm proud to see all these great things, and 14 proud to say you're my friend, (sic) and thank you 15 for your leadership. There are over 10,000 people in 16 the city--the City of New York Metropolitan Area and 17 120,000 total in the United States waiting for a 18 heart, a lung, a kidney or pancreas. We have 19 consistently had one of the lowest organ donation 20 rates in the country ranking 48 our of 50 on Donate 21 Life America's 2013 report card, and it's only gotten 2.2 worse. According to Live On New York, formerly the 23 New York Organ Donor Network, we are now 50 out of 50 on the national list. According to the Department of 24 Health and Human Services, 21 people die everyday 25

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 9
2	because they are unable to get an organ in time.
3	Tens of thousands of people are forced to spend their
4	years of lives wondering if today is the day that
5	they will get the phone call that saves their life,
6	or that today will be the day that they become one of
7	those 21 victims of this crisis. This is in spite of
8	the creation of the New York State Donor Life
9	Registry in 2006 that allows New Yorkers to legally
10	consent to organ donation without requiring
11	additional permission from the donor's family or
12	caregiver upon the donor's death.
13	Last year, Council Member Kallos expanded
14	a number of agencies that hadthat had to
15	participate in the Voter Registration Program with
16	agency representatives working with constituents must
17	provide them with voter registration cards. The
18	agencies must then process the cards that they
19	receive back. My bill, Intro 796 amends this law and
20	directs agencies to also provide assistance to any
21	one who requiresinquires about the organ donation
22	card now attached to voter registration forms. By
23	signing up to be an organ donor, you can save up to
24	eight lives, and saveand save or heal up to 100
25	more through tissue donation. Again, I want to thank

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 10 2 Chairman Kallos for your leadership. I want to thank 3 the Administration. I want to thank Live On New York for all of your wonderful work, and all of our 4 advocates who are here today to tell your stories. 5 And I look forward to hearing from all of you. 6 Thank 7 you. 8 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Thank you very much, 9 Council Member for your partnership on election issues going back as far as both of us have been 10 11 active. So, thank you for your career commitment to 12 expanding the franchise and as well as saving lives. 13 That is a rare thing to be able to be working on, and 14 thank you for your leadership on that. I'd like to 15 now call up the first panel of the Administration. 16 Henry Berger from City Hall representing the 17 Administration. Laura Lynn Byfield, New York City 18 Department of Education; Eric Contreras, New York

19 City Department of Education as well as Winette 20 Saunders from the Department of Corrections. [pause, 21 background comments] If you could please all four of 22 you raise your right--turn on your mics and then 23 raise your right hand. Do you affirm to tell the 24 truth, the whole truth, nothing but the truth in your

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 11
2	testimony before this committee, and to respond
3	honestly to Council Member questions?
4	PANEL MEMBER: I do.
5	PANEL MEMBER: Of course.
6	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Thank you.
7	HENRY BERGER: Good morning, Chairman
8	KallosChair Kallos, Council Member Constantinides.
9	As you know, I share your passion on these issues.
10	My name is Henry Berger. I am Special Counsel to the
11	Mayor. I am joined by Deputy Commissioner Winette
12	Saunders from the Department of Correction, and Eric
13	Contreras and Lora Lynn Byfield from the New York
14	City Department of Education. Thank you for the
15	opportunity to testify before you today on the three
16	bills. (1) promoting absentee voting among jailed
17	individuals; (2) tracking the efficacy of
18	distributing voter registration materials to students
19	and providing students with registration materials in
20	appropriate languages; and (3) providing assistance
21	for individuals signing up to be an organ donor.
22	It's part of the agency based voter registration
23	program.
24	Voting and civic participation are
25	essential to a health democracy. The Administration

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 12
2	shares your concern regarding New York City's
3	extremely low voter participation rates. Not only is
4	the number of registered voters among eligible
5	citizens appalling low, but the number of registered
6	voters who actually go out and vote is only a
7	fraction of where it should be. Unfortunately, we
8	all know that voter turnout among young people is
9	even worse than the abysmal voter rate turnouts of
10	other adults. Mayor de Blasio is deeply committed to
11	reducing barriers to voting participation to make it
12	easy to register to vote and to get out to vote. The
13	Mayor's Office is working with other city agencies
14	and the Board of Elections in the City of New York to
15	make registration easier and more accessible, and
16	make voting more efficient. To operationalize our
17	committee we have created a working group that
18	consists of me, the Mayor's Office of Operations, the
19	Community Assistance Unit and the Mayor's Office of
20	City Legislative Affairs. As one example of the
21	efforts of the working group, his work with the New
22	York City Technology Development Corp to develop and
23	online voting registration pilot, which is being
24	tested at DCAS. It is not fully electronic because
25	the State Board of Elections still requires an ink

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS signature for voter registration, and has thus far 2 3 declined to accept electronic signatures.

As you know, City Charter Section 1074-A, 4 which was enacted as Local Law 29 of 2000 requires 5 certain city agencies and their contractors to assist 6 7 and implement the program of distribution of voter 8 registration amongst the clients who are applying 9 for, renewing or seeking recertification of services. Last year the Council amended this section to add 10 11 seven additional agencies to the program consisting of this Administration's commitment to reducing 12 13 barriers to voter participation and to increase 14 compliance with existing laws, the Mayor issued 15 Directive 1 in 2014, which requires the now 16 designated 24 agencies to develop plans to ensure 17 compliance with Local Law 29, and to submit semi-18 annual reports regarding implementation.

19 Las fall, the original 17 participate--20 participating agencies each designated a primary coordinator for voter registration and submitted 21 plans to comply with the law and the directive. Over 2.2 23 the last year, the agencies have received in-person and online training for frontline workers from the 24 Campaign Finance Board; have received an online 25

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 14
2	tracking tool to capture activity at dispersed sites,
3	which we created, obtained access to signage
4	developed by the Campaign Finance Board; received a
5	website button to electronically link to voter
6	registration for their home pages; and received
7	instructions on security registration forms from the
8	City Board of Elections. We have also begun
9	discussions with the Mayor's Office of Technology and
10	Innovation to explore how best to leverage technology
11	in these efforts. The first 17 agencies submitted
12	their first reports on July 15 of this year. The
13	reports were reviewed by the working group with
14	recommendations going back to the agencies when
15	needed. They were summarized and compiled in report
16	to the Council submitted on August 15, 2015, and the
17	next report is due to us on January 15 of 2016.
18	We are now in the process of integrating
19	the seven new agencies designated in the expansion of
20	legislation into the program. The Mayor's Office of
21	Operations has met with the seven new agencies.
22	Their implementations were due yesterday. Their
23	implementation plans were due yesterday with a start
24	date of no later than December 2015, and the working
25	group is following up with the agencies to ensure
	l

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 15
2	that the plans are complete. The working group has
3	also met with voting advocates throughout the past
4	year. I will meet them again in a couple of weeks.
5	We are in the process of securing translation of the
6	voter legislation forms, a voter registration guide,
7	and a voting FAQ prepared by the Campaign Finance
8	Board so that they will be available in all languages
9	required by EO 120 and by the DOE. Those are Arabic,
10	Creole, Russian, French and Urdu, as well as
11	languages the Board of Elections uses, Chinese,
12	Spanish, Korean and Bengali. Thus, we are
13	aggressively pursuing ways to make it easier for NYC
14	residents to vote. We strive to make it as easy and
15	simple as possible. We firmly believe that
16	exercising the right to vote for elected officials is
17	the most effective way for people to make their
18	voices heard in representative government. We are
19	hopeful that our efforts are making real and lasting
20	changes with respect to voter participation.
21	And with that, I'd like to address the
22	specific pieces of the legislation that are before
23	you. First, on Intro 628. The Administration
24	applauds the City Council in its efforts to increase
25	civic participation among our young people. As the

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 16
2	committee is aware and in accordance with the Young
3	Adult Voter Registration Act, which we refer to YAVRA
4	enacted in 2004, the DOE provides voter registration
5	forms to every graduating senior, and to every high
6	school for placement in their respective central
7	offices. The registration forms are delivered to
8	schools along with a memo to school leaders, which
9	outlines the provisions of YAVRA, explains how the
10	registration form should be distributed, and
11	encourages students to registerto return their
12	registration forms to become active voters. In the
13	weeks before graduation, notice is also included in
14	the Chancellor's weekly newsletter to principals
15	regarding the requirements if YAVRA. In addition to
16	the distribution of voter registration forms, the
17	importance of voting is consistent and pervasive
18	content streamed throughout the grades K through 12,
19	New York City Social Studies Curriculum, and the New
20	York State Social Studies framework.
21	Intro 628 of amends this law to require
22	the City Board of Elections to assign a code to each
23	geographic school district and create voter
24	registration materials and include the relevant
25	geographic codes. Voter registration forms that

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 17
2	include the codes will then be distributed to
3	students at the same time and the same manner as it
4	delivers to departments.(sic) Further, the DOE would
5	need registration forms in any language authorized by
6	the State or City Board of Elections that the DOE
7	deems appropriate for students at each school. The
8	DOE would then issue reports by borough and school as
9	to the number of students who are 17 and 18 at each
10	school, and the manner in which the materials were
11	distributed. The City Board of Elections would be
12	required to add to its annual report in a detailed
13	description by geographic school district how the
14	forms were distributed, how many were distributed,
15	and what languages they were distributed and how many
16	were completed and returned to the Board.
17	While the Administration appreciates the
18	spirit of the bill, it has a number of concerns with
19	the legal and practical implications of these
20	requirements. As an initial matter, the City has
21	serious concerns about placing affirmative
22	operational mandates upon the City Board of
23	Elections, which performs a state function when it
24	administers voter registration. The bill's new
25	obligation to created many different codes of

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 18
2	registration forms and then track the distribution
3	and return of these forms in the Board's annual
4	report may well place an undue burden uponand undue
5	burden upon the appropriate exercise of this state
6	function. Moreover, we find this bill as it relates
7	to coding school districts to be overly burdensome,
8	and essentially impractical. The city is divided
9	into 32 geographic districts. New York has over
10	70,000 seniors who attend more than 550 high schools,
11	public charter high schools, and District 79 programs
12	located throughout the five boroughs. Printing 32
13	district forms in what will eventually be 10
14	different languages with a total of 320 different
15	forms for 70,000 students and ensuring that the right
16	form s went to the right schools would be a huge
17	waste of paper and financial and operational
18	resources. The City would need to spend tens if not
19	hundreds of thousands of dollars to implement a
20	flawed system to find out merely whether schools are
21	or are not registering high school seniors to vote.
22	Additionally, assuming that our plots
23	will be ten or more schools in each geographical
24	district all using the same code, it will be
25	functionally impossible to identify or target the

1COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS192schools that are in need or more oversight. The bill3would likely create many more problems procedurally--4procedurally, logistically and legally than it would5solve.

We are also concerned about the 6 7 effectiveness of the current program. Delivering the voter registration forms to students at the same time 8 9 as receiving their diplomas is a misguided attempt to highlight the importance of voting. Giving voter 10 11 registration forms to students as they walk out the 12 door rather than making it part of a broader 13 discussion of civic rights and responsibilities does not seem to be the best way to register voters and 14 15 integrate students [bell] into our civil society. Ιt is unlikely that students are going to think about 16 17 voting on the day of their high school graduation, 18 which is one of the most important moments in their 19 It is just very bad timing. It is more lives. 20 effective to provide voter registration at a more appropriate times--time, excuse me, during the school 21 2.2 year.

Last year the DOE worked with the City
Council--some City Council members on a pilot program
led by Council Member Rosenthal. Council Member

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 20 2 Torres was very involved in that. I know he was here 3 earlier. As the committee may be aware, the pilot 4 program included a day of civic engagement activities culminating in a classroom voter registration drive 5 for our 17 and 18-year-old students. Fifteen Council 6 7 Members and 26 schools participated, and we are looking forward to continuing our partnership in the 8 9 current school year, and hope more schools will join this important program. 10

11 Because each high school is different, it is important that the DOE and the high schools are 12 13 provided with the flexibility to develop their own 14 programs and implementation plan. The present law 15 already provides the flexibility in Subdivision B, 16 and we've asked and urged the Council Members to 17 continue and expand these voluntary efforts by 18 considering whether to afford greater flexibility in 19 the graduation day mandate of present Subdivision C, 20 while ensuring that DOE has the necessary discretion to determine the appropriate means of incorporating 21 voter registration with the educational mission. 2.2 The 23 Administration strongly support school based voter registration programs, and looks forward to working 24 collaboratively with the Council Members on these 25

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 21
2	programs as I outlined above. In short, we look
3	forward to working with the Council to find a more
4	targeted solution in educating students about the
5	importance of voting. And Mr. Contreras and Ms.
6	Byfield are available with me to answer questions on
7	this Intro.
8	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: [off mic] The intro
9	basically provides no funding. (sic)
10	HENRY BERGER: Intro 465, which requires
11	the DOC to implement and administer a program and
12	distribution and submission of absentee ballot
13	applications, and subsequently receive absentee
14	ballots for eligible inmates who are in the New York
15	City Jails, the Administration generally supports
16	this bill, though there may need to be a few
17	technical amendments to ensure that absentee ballot
18	applications are made available only to those who may
19	submit them under the Election Law. I'm going to
20	leave it to Deputy Commissioner Saunders to speak to
21	their specific concerns about the bill.
22	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: [off mic] An updated
23	version is June next year.
24	HENRY BERGER: This is always fun, isn't
25	it, Mr. Chairman. Intro 796 would require the staff

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 22
2	of the 24 agencies to currently participate in agency
3	based voter registration programs to provide
4	assistance with respect to the section of the form
5	allowing individuals to register to become organ or
6	tissue donors if such assistance is requested or if
7	assistance is normally provided with the agency's own
8	forms. The value of this important program cannot be
9	overestimated, and the Administration is supportive
10	of this bill. We areI will ask Commissioner
11	Saunders to speak on theon her intro and then we
12	will be available to answer any questions.
13	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS: So good
14	morning. Good morning Chairman Kallos and members of
15	the Committee on Government Operations. My name is
16	Winette Saunders
17	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: [interposing] If I
18	canif I can interrupt for just a moment
19	LORA-LYNN BYFIELD: Sure.
20	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS:I'd just like to
21	recognize we've been joined by Council Member Mark
22	Levine, a member of this committee as well as the
23	Minority Leader of the City Council who is also a
24	member of this committee and has perfect attendance.
25	That is rare amongst us. We've also been joined by
I	I

1COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS232Council Member Ruben Wills, who is the sponsor of3legislation. I'd like to give him a moment to4provide and opening statement.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Sorry to interrupt you. I do apologize for being late this morning, and 6 7 Mr. Chair I would ask that you just give me the break 8 down of the panel makeup because I did not have that 9 when I came in. And is anybody cold in here? It seems like it. I'm cold? Is anybody else cold? 10 11 Maybe I'm having flashes. It's gold. Sergeant-at-12 Arms could we get some heat turned up a little bit or 13 turned on. Um, thank, Ben Kallos, the Chair. You have been pushing some tremendous things, and the 14 15 voter rights is something that we applaud you for 16 leading on this issue. Including among the 17 legislation that we've already discussed is Intro 18 464, a bill that will require the Department of 19 Corrections to promote absentee ballot voting among 20 jailed individuals. In New York State any jailed 21 individual awaiting upon an alleged offense or convicted of a misdemeanor is eligible to vote. 2.2 Our 23 city's jail population is largely made up of men and women of color who lie in wait for months even years 24 before they are tried simply because they are mostly 25

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 24
2	poor and unable to post bail. Their hardship is
3	worsened by the loss of their ability to vote at the
4	polls, and their confinement hampers their ability to
5	obtain absentee ballots without proper assistance.
6	During this hearing we hope to learn from the
7	Administration, DOC and the City Board of Elections
8	what efforts are being undertaken to make voting
9	accessible to those in the city's custody. Whether
10	deliberate or unintentional voter disenfranchisement
11	infringes on an individual's right to cast a ballot,
12	and that right must be preserved in all settings
13	including in our correctional facilities. The
14	Council has a responsibility to ensure that their
15	right to exercise this basic liberty is not being
16	trampled on because of negligence. In this country
17	one is innocent until proven guilty and must be
18	afforded due process. Intro 464 would that principle
19	by requiring the department to encourage and to
20	facilitate absentee voting. I ask my colleagues to
21	support this bill, and I look forward to the
22	testimony we are about to hear. And again, thank you
23	Chair, for your leadership on this issue.
24	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Thank you. You may
25	now continue.

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS: Okay. 3 Good morning. Good morning Chairman Kallos and 4 members of the Committee on Government Operations. My name is Winette Saunders. I am the Deputy 5 Commissioner of Youthful Offender Programming at the 6 7 New York City Department of Correction. I'm testifying before you today to discuss the 8 9 department's policy related to voter registration, absentee ballots and specifically Intro 464, which 10 11 would require the department's implementation and administration of a program for the distribution and 12 13 submission of absentee ballot applications. The New 14 York City Department of Correction strongly advocates 15 for all inmates to be educated on their rights to vote and be given every opportunity to register 16 17 and/or vote. To that end, the department has worked 18 diligently to ensure that all inmates are aware of 19 these efforts. If any of their incarceration or on 20 their right to vote, and the absentee ballot process 21 that may be available. Pursuant to Local Law 29 of 2000, the Department of Correction provides for the 2.2 23 comprehensive distribution of voter registration materials to inmates, individuals visiting inmates 24 and departmental staff. Voter registration forms 25

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 26
2	obtained from the New York City Board of Elections
3	are offered in several languages including English,
4	Spanish, Chinese and Korean. DOC uses a number of
5	avenues to ensure department wide availability of
6	voter registration information throughout the year
7	including posting information of flyers and posters
8	and distributing voter applications in congregate
9	areas such as facilities, law libraries, social
10	service areas, ministerial areas, barber shops,
11	beauty shops and visit areas. In addition, the
12	Inmate Handbook provided to each inmate upon entry
13	into the department's custody contains a section
14	dedicated to the topic of voting. This section
15	explains who may vote, the voter registration and
16	absentee ballot process. The handbook also informs
17	inmates how to obtain and mail back their voter
18	registration forms and absentee ballot forms and/or
19	applications. The department provides all materials
20	year round in all facilities including the Benjamin
21	Ward Visit Center. In addition, voter rights
22	awareness events are held before major general and
23	primary elections, around National Voter Registration
24	Day and during Voter Awareness Month. Voter rights
25	awareness events are conducted in collaboration with
	I

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 27
2	partner agencies. During these events, inmates are
3	able to submit voter registration cards and absentee
4	ballot applications, which are then delivered to the
5	Board of Elections. These events are significant
6	efforts, which is why we partner with outside groups.
7	To effectively canvass all facilities requires
8	considerable staffing and training. During the last
9	election event, a group of 80 volunteers and DOC
10	staff were assigned within 10 departmental
11	facilities. Housing by housing area, the group made
12	announcements and assisted inmates as needed.
13	Absentee ballot applications were widely distributed
14	as part of these effortefforts. Furthermore, the
15	department issues teletypes, which were read to all
16	staff at roll calls to inform all staff of voting
17	information, the applications and registration forms
18	and are placed in facility areas and related
19	application deadlines.
20	As mentioned earlier, the department
21	certainly recognizes the critical importance of the
22	right to vote, and the need for everyone not only to
23	be informed of their right to vote, but also to be
24	provided with the means to do so. The department has
25	taken steps to ensure that inmates have access to

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 28
2	voter information throughout the year, and not simply
3	leading up to an election. Currently, the department
4	provides voter information throughout the year, and
5	makes special efforts to ensure inmate accessibility
6	to voter registration forms, absentee ballot
7	applications, and assistance completing such forms
8	and applications prior to elections.
9	This legislation would require the
10	department to provide such information and assistance
11	within a set timeframe and would require the
12	department within five days after receipt of an
13	absentee ballot application or absentee ballot
14	transmitted to the City Board of Elections.
15	Currently, absentee ballot applications and absentee
16	ballots are considered privileged mail, and are
17	mailed by inmates in the same manner as they would
18	any other piece of mail. We believe this procedure
19	complies with the requirements of the bill, and there
20	would be no need to change these procedures. The
21	department's efforts to encourage voting are
22	exemplary.
23	DOC has served as a presenter of the New
24	York City Campaign Finance Board's Annual Local Law
25	29 training that focuses on how to raise awareness of

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 29
2	voting rights for New York City residents. DOC has
3	been selected because of the innovative and
4	collaborative practices we utilize to raise awareness
5	for this unique population. Thank you for the
6	opportunity to testify here today, and I'm happy to
7	answer any questions you may have.
8	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Thank you, and that
9	concludes the testimony from this panel?
10	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS: Yes.
11	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: So I'd like to now
12	recognize our Council Member Wills followed by
13	Council Member Constantinides if they have any
14	questions for this panel.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Good morning.
16	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS: Good
17	morning. In your testimony you said thatwell,
18	let's first go into the first testimony. You said
19	that the giving out of theum, if I heard you
20	correctly. Giving out of the voter registrations
21	during the certificate of completion or your high
22	school diploma was misguided?
23	HENRY BERGER: Yes.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Um, and then you
25	said that it should be part of a broader discussion

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 30 2 as far as I'm assuming civic engagement or civics classes in the schools. Is that what you meant by 3 4 that? 5 HENRY BERGER: Yes. I believe that giving out the voter registration forms literally as the 6 7 students are walking out the door is not an effective way to get students to register to vote. 8 9 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Uh-huh. HENRY BERGER: I mean one of the 10 11 questions is are they going to be good citizens and 12 put in the garbage can or is it just going to end up 13 on the floor? There's got to be a better way to do 14 it. You don't wait 'til literally as they're walking 15 out the door. 16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Right. 17 HENRY BERGER: And I think we have to 18 create programs, and I think one of the benefits of 19 this bill is that it's--it's--it's forced us to 20 start internal discussions and say how can we make it 21 work? Because our goal is to get the students 2.2 registered. 23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Right. HENRY BERGER: And the current program, 24 which may have been well-intentioned back in 2004 I 25

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 31
2	think when it was created or even earlier just
3	doesn't seem to be working. We're distributing, you
4	know, to the schools somewhere over 70,000, um, voter
5	registration forms each year, and the return rate is-
6	-is essentially non-existent. And so, waiting 'til
7	then doesn't work, and if we're going to look at that
8	section of the Administrative Code and say, you know,
9	how do we make it work, we ought to look at it and
10	say this doesn't work. What can work? And what we
11	would like to do is we'll work with the Department of
12	Law because there are constraints on our relationship
13	with the Department of Education. With the
14	Department of Education, with the Council to come up
15	with a program that actually gets the students to
16	register and gets them involved in the entire
17	process. Because it just isn't working now, and we
18	recognize that.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: The, um, the
20	second part of your testimony you said that the
21	Department of Corrections works diligently and
22	comprehensively to make sure that the requirements
23	are undertaken and that you brought up Law 29 of
24	2000. Do you have stats to show how many absentee
25	

COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS
 ballots were filled out before and after and the
 trending after that?

32

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS: Well, what 5 I do have is how many people were spoken to for each event that we had, and how many were collected during 6 7 that time frame. As you may be aware, when the 8 individuals fill out absentee ballot applications the 9 absentee ballot is actually mailed back to the individual if they're in our custody. So whatever 10 11 address is placed on the application is mailed back to that address. So we don't necessarily have our 12 hands on the ballot itself, but we have the absentee 13 14 ballot applications and which we distribute.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: So the absentee 16 ballot applications you have the amount that were 17 distributed to the people, but we don't know how many 18 went back out to the City Board of Elections. So we 19 don't really have an effective number? 20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS:

[interposing] We know how many absentee ballot application went along with voter registration forms, but you don't know if the City Board of Election has approved those applications and submitted

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 33 2 applications, I mean ballots back to those 3 individuals. 4 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: So then--then those individuals may not have been able to vote? 5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS: 6 We 7 wouldn't know because that is the decision that the Board of Elections makes. They receive the 8 9 applications and then they make the decision whether or not that application is approved. Then the 10 11 application--then the actual ballot if someone is approved is mailed back to the address the individual 12 13 placed on the application. 14 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: And, if the 15 address was still--and the person is still in custody, would it be mailed back there? 16 17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS: It would be mailed back to the individual. 18 19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Now, you said that 20 the applications are effectively handled through this 21 Jail Mail system. DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS: 2.2 So--23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: [interposing] That's what they call it, Jail Mail, right? 24 25

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 34
2	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS: Yes and so
3	what happens is there's two ways this is done. Um,
4	if while we're doing the Voter Rights Awareness
5	Forum, and someone chooses to give it to us, we will
6	take it from them and deliver to the City Board of
7	Elections. But some people choose to take the
8	information and ponder on it later, and then mail it
9	on their own.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: And you are aware
11	that most inmates don't trust the Jail Mail system?
12	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS: I'm aware
13	that they don't trust a lot of different things that
14	are within the Department of Correction, and so that
15	is also the reason why we get a small number of
16	people responding. That's why we have to rely on
17	volunteers so that they can be more trusting, and
18	actually fill out the forms.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Okay. So that is a
20	problem in that posting (sic) area
21	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS:
22	[interposing] I just think
23	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS:for that same
24	trust or the confidence that inmates have is a part
25	of the problem?
	I

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS: I just 3 think that the--the actual relationship between, um, 4 the actual uniform or someone who has a shield with 5 the population sometimes there's distrust, and not 6 because of the mail system, just because of society.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Okay. The, um--I've spoken to a few corrections officers and, um, I 8 9 appreciate the, um, explanation of the outreach that you explained in your testimony. But the 10 11 conversations I've had were actually corrections 12 officer saying that they're not really concerned 13 about the inmates, um, being able to vote or 14 explaining to them or anything else. This is not 15 something that they are really interested in doing. They more secure--they're more worried about their 16 17 security and making sure that the jail is run. So 18 with that type of mentality and--and I'm speaking to 19 six or seven people, and, you know six or seven 20 people out of that six or seven are saying that, it 21 seems like that would something pervasive. So if that is true, doesn't that bring into question how 2.2 23 they're getting it done and the low number. And, you know, we're worried about it because these people do 24 have a fundamental right to make sure they can vote. 25

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 36
2	And if we see problems going on with confidence in
3	the Jail Mail system, with maybe the attitude of the
4	correction officers and everything like that,
5	wouldn't it bewouldn't it be more beneficial for us
6	to examine it and work together to try to make sure
7	we come up with a process that would be more
8	beneficial to these people?
9	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS: So I would
10	say that there are 10,000 individuals that work for
11	the Department of Correction. So I wouldn't say the
12	six or seven people
13	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: [interposing] But
14	that's thee reason I'm saying that.
15	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS:
16	[interposing] I know.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS:I don't have
18	the resources to make sure all of this is right.
19	(sic)
20	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS:
21	[interposing] It doesn't really reflect everyone's
22	attitudes, but I will say that department and the
23	leadership of the department, um, feels very strongly
24	about this, um, issue, and this is why we do the
25	efforts that I've described to you every time there
I	

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 37
2	are opportunities, and this is why we do it not only
3	leading up to elections, but this is why it's
4	available on any given day in every facility and
5	visit areas including our headquarters.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Does the CFB, um,
7	distribute the Voter's Guide?
8	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS: Um, we
9	work very closely with the Campaign Finance Board,
10	and we actuallythey actually partner with us in
11	some of our events. And sometimes we have along with
12	the required materials, we would have Voter Guides.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: SometimesWhat
14	I'm asking does that something that every inmate who
15	gets an absentee ballot do the receive the CFB Voting
16	Guide.
17	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS: No.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: No. What
19	information is given to them to let them know about
20	the candidates or who they should vote for?
21	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS: So we've
22	learned that we need to really do extensive training
23	especially when we, you know, collaborate with
24	partners, and we usually do a half day training. And
25	the training consists of the Bronx Defenders as well

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 38
2	as Legal Aid as well as the Campaign Finance Board
3	and we give people an opportunity to really
4	understand because we find that if we give a lot of
5	paper to individuals it becomes overwhelming. S o
6	it's really about having those one-on-one
7	discussions, having the broader discussion, having
8	the educational forum, and then giving people
9	opportunities to ask specific questions. But we get
10	very detailed about who is running where. There are
11	a lot of questions about, you know, what does this
12	role entail. It'sit's very extensive.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: You said you give
14	themare theyyou don'tyou find out that they get
15	a lot of paper
16	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS:
17	[interposing] Well, they're getting voter
18	registration forms. They're getting the Inmate
19	Handbook upon entry into the department. They're
20	getting voter registration forms. They're getting a
21	flyer. They're gettingone sheet. Pretty much we
22	could try to keep it very simple so people can
23	understand the process, and try not to overwhelm
24	everyone who are in attendance.
25	

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 39
2	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: So the Jail Mail
3	system, the lack of confidence or the inmates in the
4	Jail Mail system and the fact that every inmate does
5	not get a CFB Voter Guide, but as you're testifying
6	does get some type of education on the candidates.
7	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS: Yes.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: But those two
9	things don't bring any pause to you to say that maybe
10	we should
11	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS:
12	[interposing] We could include the CFB
13	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS:think about the
14	process? (sic)
15	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS:Voter
16	Guide and we can include that in the materials that
17	are distributed, but then we'd have to ensure that we
18	would be able to get them on a regular basis.
19	Because, as I mentioned, they are in the facility on
20	any given day not just during election periods.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: I do appreciate
22	your testimony. Mr. Chair, thank you for allowing me
23	to go first. I do haveas you know, I do have
24	another committee to attend. Thank you very much,
25	sir.
	I

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 40
2	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: My pleasure. Thank
3	you. Council Member Constantinides.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank
5	you, Chairman Kallos. I just want to thank the
6	Administration for your good testimony on Intro 796.
7	I'm really looking forward toI appreciate your
8	support and look forward to working with you to make
9	this a reality and I also was remiss in my opening
10	statement. Um, you know, the omission of voter
11	organ donation to IDNYC has helped register thousands
12	of New Yorkers. So that's been a hugely positive
13	step. So I want to thank the Administration for that
14	as well.
15	HENRY BERGER: It's so much easier to say
16	yes than to say no, isn't it. [laughter]
17	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Thank you Council
18	Member Constantinides. I think one piece that we
19	should disclose in the interest of fullfull public
20	disclosure is that when Costa Constantinides and I
21	worked on expanding the franchise we actually worked
22	very closely with Henry Berger at a group called
23	Democratic Lawyers Council where I will say at least
24	myself I learned a lot about my election law and a
25	lot of the work that we do here out of Mr. Berger's

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 41
2	tutelage and mentorship. So just thank you for your
3	leadership on that and mentoring hundreds if not
4	thousands of lawyers to care about elections and
5	election law. Additionally, during your testimony,
6	you indicatedyou made reference to Directive 1 and
7	I also want to thank you and the Administration for
8	your support and action and actual implementation of
9	Local Law 63 of 2014, which expanded the agency based
10	registration and the fact that the Local Law 1 Report
11	that has come out, and that you're actually moving
12	forward. Whereas, previously the agency based
13	registration had been ignored and then with regard to
14	Introduction 508, which we heard with relation to
15	electronic voter registration it's great to hear that
16	the Administration is moving forward in a pilot with
17	DCAS. So thank you for all of that, and then it's
18	also helpful that we're all standing with feet
19	planted in a firm reality of the fact that Young
20	Adult Voter Registration Act was created, but so far
21	it doesn't seem to be working. And as we're able to
22	actually approach the problem where everyone agrees
23	instead of just saying oh, no, of course it's
24	working, it's fine, but there's room for improvement.
25	I just appreciate that opportunity to work together,

COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS
 and happy for the Council perhaps join into the
 working group that you've discussed.

4 With regard to the YAVRA implementation at the public schools, and I think most of my 5 questions will actually be directed to the public 6 7 schools. So I imagine that Eric Contreras should 8 probably grab the mic because I don't think any of my 9 questions are really for Mr. Berger, though he is welcome to respond. My legislation seeks to make a 10 11 change require the DOE to determine languages. What 12 languages are the voter registration forms currently distributed in? 13

14 ERIC CONTRERAS: So, I'm going to defer 15 two questions regarding the operational side of it to 16 my colleague Lora-Lynn. Um, instructional questions 17 as Executive Director of Social Studies I will take.

HENRY BERGER: Okay, but let me start 18 19 with that. At the moment, the law requires that they 20 be distributed only English and that's the current 21 practice. Um, one of the pieces you missed and one 2.2 the projects we're working on now it's expanding the 23 languages in which all voter registration maters are available and we hope by the end of the year to have 24 them in up to 10 languages. Um, at that point, we're 25

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 43
2	going to have to work with the schools to make them
3	available. Um, we've worked with Board of Elections,
4	which has been amazingly cooperative on this and once
5	we get the translations done and approved, they're
6	going to make them available in PDFfillable PDF
7	forms online, which means any school can access voter
8	registration materials in any of 10 languages. Um,
9	and that's going to be a big change. Um, you know,
10	fortunately through our education system, um, there's
11	a smaller need for other languages and sometimes with
12	other populations and other demographics, but to have
13	them available in 10 languages, have them available
14	online and have them available as PDFs as fillable
15	PDFs we think will make a difference. Meanwhile, the
16	schools will have to determine and will be able to
17	request printed forms in languages that they deem
18	appropriate. And that's going to have to beYou
19	know, the principal is going to have to do that on a
20	school-by-school basis because the demographics of
21	each school are just so different. There are 550
22	schools and they really change from school to school.
23	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: According to the
24	legislation Introduction 628, everything you just
25	said is prescribed by the bill. So I guess the

COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS
 question is does the Administration support
 legislation that would actually enact the very
 practices that you are working on.

HENRY BERGER: We didn't have any 5 problems with that section of the bill. There were 6 7 other sections of the bill that we thought imposed 8 burdens that may have been improper and, in fact, 9 unworkable. They don't get the information that you need. Coding by district doesn't tell you what's 10 11 schools are working and what schools aren't working. 12 And that's what our problem was with the bill. But 13 we're working on making the language accessibility an 14 overarching principle in all the voter registration 15 stuff we do, and we're going to do that whether 16 there's legislation or not.

ERIC CONTRERAS: So, but--but to be clear so you do support the language access component of the legislation that would alter YAVRA from just distributing 100,000 English voter registration forms to including them in other languages as the schools may request.

HENRY BERGER: We support the program.
We're just not sure that legislation is necessary if
it's happening.

2 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: I--I think that's 3 just a question of what the next administration does, 4 and that is I think the familiar refrain at hearings 5 of why legislate when we can just do it administratively. The other piece, which was not 6 7 touched on, is the Young Adult Voter Registration 8 Act, YAVRA had a Section C, which we've amended, but 9 previously it just said that voter registration forms had to be made available in high schools. Does the 10 11 Department of Education have any data on how many schools actually have them available for students? 12

13 HENRY BERGER: The forms are distributed 14 and are available in all of the schools. Um, we do 15 not have statistics on what the distribution is on graduation day. But as I said, you know, since that's 16 17 such an imperfect program, in our mind, at least in 18 my mind I think that's less of a concern. They're 19 distributed to every school. They're available in 20 every school all 550 plus high schools. The question 21 is once you get them there, and once you put them out 2.2 on a desk, how do you incentivize the students to 23 participate in the program? And that's what's not working there. I think that's what we have to work 24 25 on going forward.

46

2 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: So as the law is 3 currently written--written the forms have to be 4 available. When my office did a survey of the schools, um, and this was actually a priority coming 5 to office in 2012, we called a bunch of high schools 6 7 in the city and then did a pilot to personally distribute about 750 voter registration forms 8 9 ourselves to the high schools that didn't actually have them, didn't know how to get them. And when we 10 11 called and said can we drop off some voter 12 registration forms, they said of course. We would 13 love it, but we don't have any record and DOE has not 14 shared any records relating to their permanent apps 15 oar anything showing that they're actually delivering 16 the voter registration forms to the schools ahead of 17 the diploma component. But actually just having them 18 in the buildings available for kids to register. 19 HENRY BERGER: Well, current--I don't 20 know what was happening back in 2012, but I can tell you currently we are getting from the City Board of 21 2.2 Elections a 100,000 forms each year--23 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: [interposing] Uh-

24 huh.

2 HENRY BERGER: -- and they are being 3 distributed to all 550 plus high schools around the 4 city with instructions on how to use them, and with a follow-up from the chancellor in--in her newsletter 5 to the principals immediately prior to graduation. 6 7 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: So, just to make 8 sure we just establish where we're coming from, and 9 I'll direct my Legislative Director to--Do they already have them? Perfect. So you should have 10 11 copies of everything we referred to and we'll enter 12 this into the record. Um, in 2012, the Good 13 Governments Groups Brennan Center, DMOs, Asian-14 Americans Legal Defense and Educational Funds, 15 Citizens Union, New York Public Interest Rights Group and the Women's City Club wrote to Chancellor Van 16 17 Walcott inquiring about the compliance with the Young 18 Adult Voter Registration Act, and on May 18th they 19 received a response that was less than responsive. 20 Just mandating that they were continuing to obey the 21 law, but not providing any metrics. We're an oversight body, and these organization hope to create 2.2 23 some oversight and transparency. Are we any closer to--the legislation contemplates have codes so that 24 we can actually check what's going on whether it's 32 25

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 48
2	codes. Maybe you have a number of codes you'd like
3	to have so we can actually measure what's happening.
4	But without measurement, we can't have
5	accountability.
6	HENRY BERGER: I can't speak to 2012 and
7	I won't speak to 2012.
8	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Okay.
9	HENRY BERGER: I can tell you that we're
10	doing the distributions now, and the problem is the
11	program that exists doesn't work.
12	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Sure.
13	HENRY BERGER: So we have to sit down and
14	just come up with a program that works, but the
15	coding provisions having 32 codes in addition to the
16	administrative problems doesn't give you any
17	information. If you've got 10 or 12 or 15 or 20
18	schools in a district, you know, if one or two of
19	them are working and one or two of them aren't
20	working having a district live vote work,
21	implementing 550 codes, um, would be totally
22	unworkable. Um, you know, II'm not sure what the
23	answer to that is, but I do know that the current
24	program isn't working. You know, we've got to come
25	

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 2 up with something to get the students involved 3 because that's the important piece. 4 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: So I--I hope that when the Board of Elections come up, they will 5 perhaps have a different point of view on the matter. 6 7 I can just share that coding is something that we do, 8 and if I send most of these people in this room and 9 many of them are actually on my mailing list an email, I can code that email and I can tell whether

10 11 or not they read the email, whether or not they 12 clicked something on the email. I can even tell in 13 some cases how far they read in my email. So I quess 14 one piece is that the technology will surprise you. But with regard to 2014--15

16 HENRY BERGER: Excuse me, Mr. Chair, if I 17 can interrupt.

> CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Yes.

18

19 HENRY BERGER: We're not dealing with 20 We're dealing with paper voter registration emails. 21 forms.

2.2 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Got you. 23 HENRY BERGER: And stockpiling, organizing, controlling 320 different forms for 550 24 different high schools, you know, is just--I'm not 25

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 50
2	sure what the budget items on that are, but we're
3	well into six figures on it. If we're going to do it
4	including staffing as well as printing, and, you
5	know, that doesn't solve the problem. The problem we
6	have isn't in the distribution of the forms. The
7	problem we have is that the students aren't filling
8	them out, and the reason they're not filling them out
9	is because the program isn't designed to work.
10	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: So, Speaking to the
11	program, um, in April of 2014, I reached out to
12	Department of Education and asked them to start
13	working with us on a voter registration pilot in the
14	schools, and I just want to make sure that you have
15	that email. The Department of Education responded
16	with we're doing voter registration in schools, and
17	we're just fine. You can read the letter if you want
18	me to actually read it into the record, too. That
19	was followed by us asking a number of questions. Can
20	send any existing documents that outline the official
21	workflow or policies and procedures? How many
22	graduating seniors are there this year? How many are
23	eligible to register? How do you determine who needs
24	voter registration forms? How many have been order?
25	How many distributed? And so on and so forth, and
	I

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 51
2	thatthat's been un-responded to under this
3	Administration. Um, following that, Chair Dromm and
4	I sent an additional, um, letter directly to the
5	Chancellor requesting follow-up on these items with a
6	proposed pilot for doing voter registration in the
7	classroom in 2014, which also did not get a response.
8	And so, when 100,000 forms were order in 2014 after
9	they weren't ordered in 2013, we gave up and said
10	thank you. But can you speak to any of his and DOE's
11	unwillingness to share any information or respond
12	with regards to this committee's inquiries.
13	HENRY BERGER: Yeah, I'm sure the Chair
14	is aware that there arethat there are serious
15	limitations on what we can legislate in terms of
16	pedagogical issues, and requiring something to be
17	done in the classroom is actually, um, an issue that
18	has to be dealt with, with the State Department of
19	Education and not through us because we did not
20	control pedagogy under the current structure. We
21	would love that to be different, but that's not the
22	way it is. There are statists now because, you know,
23	the program isn't working, and we're not going to
24	collect statistics on a non-functional program.
25	Let's put together something that works, but let's
l	

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 52
2	concentrate on making the program work, and not
3	spending more time creating reports. At some point,
4	we're going to end up spending all our time doing
5	reports rather than, you know, actually getting
6	actually getting the work done. But, you know, look,
7	we're saying we have to move forward on this.
8	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Yes.
9	HENRY BERGER: We're not working now.
10	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: II guess the big
11	question is will DOE commit under oath to responding
12	to these more than year-old letters seeking
13	information and seeking to partner. Because I know
14	that you're interested. I know the Mayor is
15	interested. You've mentioned the Law Department.
16	You have not mentioned the ability to work with DOE.
17	I have them at the table, and I need something.
18	HENRY BERGER: On behalf of the
19	Administration we're not going to commit to that.
20	We're not going to respond to letters, which talk
21	about a non-functioning program. We've got to work
22	to create a program that works.
23	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: So the letters speak
24	to a pilot and so we've since then in 2015 I was able
25	to work with Helen Rosenthal, Campaign Finance Board,

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 53
2	The Progressive Caucus, which sponsored it, and we
3	were able to roll it out in 15 schools. We were able
4	to register in 2012 seniors, but I guess the question
5	is will DOE respond to our initial request from 2014
6	around the pilot, and how can we work with the
7	existing pilot that is happening. And does DOE have
8	an answer for why they would work with on council
9	member, but not two other council members on the same
10	pilot?
11	HENRY BERGER: Well, I'm not sure what
12	you're talking about two other council members on the
13	same pilot. Council members went out, um, to schools
14	in their districts and worked with the principals.
15	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Right, and that
16	HENRY BERGER: [interposing] This
17	Administration isn't fond of pilot programs. They
18	want to put together programs that work system wide,
19	and that's what we're looking to do.
20	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: [interposing] And
21	that
22	HENRY BERGER: We're hoping the council
23	members will continue to work with the schools in
24	their districts because it's an important
25	

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 54 relationship at a lot of different levels. 2 You know, 3 some of what council member done--has done.

CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: So, I've been doing 4 voter registration in my schools in my district since 5 2012 since before I was an elected official. Um, but 6 7 I can tell you is Council Dromm, Chair of the Education Committee and I as Chair of Governmental 8 9 Operations have reached out to the Chancellor, have asked to do a systematic program, as you're speaking, 10 11 but the answer we continue to get is do a pilot. Do it on your own. Do it in the schools. Do it under 12 13 Council initiatives. So I really if, Mr. Berger, you'd let the DOE respond, I'd like to hear from them 14 15 while they're here what's the story.

16 HENRY BERGER: I'm responding on behalf 17 of the Administration and that's the response we 18 have. We've got to move forward on this, Council 19 Member. We have to move forward on it, you know.

20 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Sure. So in terms 21 of moving forward, we have legislation. The 2.2 legislation changes the availability component to 23 the--a mandatory distribution during the school year, not at the end. Section 2 and 3 speak to that. 24 Section 3 specifically speaks to handing it out 25

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 55
2	during graduation. But Section 1 specifically would
3	mandate that the forms be distributed during the
4	school at which point it's handed over to DOE to do
5	their pedagogy and figure out how they want to do it,
6	but within the bounds of or law we are improving it
7	from just making it available, to actually a
8	distribution requirement.
9	HENRY BERGER: Well, that's not what
10	Section 1 says. It says distribute the materials
11	published by the City Board of Elections relating to,
12	and Sectionyou know, we can parse this, but this
13	other section says distribute. They're being
14	distributed, but unfortunately being distributed at a
15	time when it's not effective. Yeah, we can pick and
16	choose little pieces that we do this differently, we
17	should do that differently. It's not going to work
18	unless we come up with a comprehensive program that
19	works, and we have to do that within the constraints
20	of the State Education Law
21	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: [interposing] Uh-
22	huh.
23	HENRY BERGER:um, you know, within the
24	constraints of the State Election Law where, you
25	know, the City Board of Elections is not the City
I	

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 56
2	Board of Elections. It's the Board of Election in
3	the City of New York, not of the City of New York.
4	We've got to work around all of that, and we're
5	working on it. But, you know, there are so many
6	other issues where we're so constrained where state
7	legislation would make our lives so much easier. And
8	we haven't spoken direction to the resolutions you
9	proposed, but let me just suggest that some of the
10	things that you want to do, and that we want to do
11	would be so much easier if the State Board would
12	allow us to use electronic poll books. If you've
13	ever had a discussion with the State Board about
14	electronic poll books, which opens up a whole range
15	of possibilities, part of the response we get is
16	well, we don't see a problem. So we're not going to
17	do anything. It would change the way we do it.
18	Electronic signatures, there's an Electronic
19	Signature Act in the State Law. The State Board
20	won't let us use electronic signatures. I mean these
21	are the kind of things that would change the entire
22	system.
23	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: II agree and this
24	is advocacy that you, myself and Constantinides have
25	

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 57 2 been working on for almost a decade. Actually, a decade now. So, I--3 HENRY BERGER: [interposing] It's come up 4 even before that, Mr. Chair. 5 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Yes, um, yes, 6 7 absolutely. I--with it in terms of if you have 8 suggestions on change the legislation to specifically 9 state the registration forms are saying that it must be not on the last day of school or not say that 10 11 Section 1 of the--the proposed legislation will be 12 more constructive, we're open to that. I'd like to 13 go to Council Member Wills who had a second round of 14 questions. 15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Mr. Berger, I 16 appreciate your testimony and as we all know your 17 authenticity is unparalleled and unquestioned. Ι 18 just can't get past that the Chair is asking about 19 the programs and you keep saying that we need to do 20 something that's comprehensive and something that will work. But when does that conversation and that 21 2.2 work begin? If DOE is unwilling to answer a simple 23 letter, you know, DOE is not the greatest, most cooperative agency in the city. But if they're 24 25 unwilling to answer letter and two letters from the

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 58
2	Chair asking about something that is so important
3	especially when they're looking at our new Americans
4	or our immigrant population spiking in schools, where
5	do we begin the conversation? When does this work
6	actually get done so that we can move forward and
7	have a comprehensive plan that does work? Because I
8	understand what you're saying, but when do we begin
9	to do it? Um, I don'tis itis it your position
10	that thisthis Administration is asking us to go get
11	this done Upstate? You have to explain that a little
12	clearer to me.
13	HENRY BERGER: I think we're asking a lot
14	of things, but the council members' letters and this
15	legislation have already started the conversations
16	internally.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Uh-huh.
18	HENRY BERGER: The process has begun.
19	It's not a simple process. We're going to do what we
20	can within the constraints of the law, or else we're
21	going to continue to advocate for changes in the law.
22	But there are things we believe we can do within the
23	constraints of the law. We've begun those
24	discussions. They're legally difficult discussions
25	because of the State Education Law or whatever, but

1COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS592we're trying to work though those. Will we have an3answer tomorrow? No. Is it going to take a little4bit of time? You know, but, you know, there's still5a bit of a bureaucracy here, and we have to work this6through.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Right.

7

8 HENRY BERGER: But the letters and this 9 legislation have provoked a response internally. We've begun the work, and we're going to--we're going 10 11 to continue to work. And when we have something 12 where, you know, we feel we have a direction and a 13 package, we're going to come to the chair and tell 14 the members and try to work through how we--how we do 15 it. Does it require charter changes? Does it 16 require an Administration Code change? Doe is require an Executive Order? Does it require a 17 18 directive--legislation? How do we get it done? Um, 19 we're not there yet. We started the process. The 20 discussions have started. There are conflicting 21 needs, conflicting wants, conflicting demands, and 2.2 we've got to reconcile those. Um, you know, there 23 are a lot of--there are a lot of actors in this, you know. You've been here long enough you'll 24 understand, you know, how city government works. 25

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 60
2	It's huge and it's complex, and we've got towe've
3	got to get all the pieces put together. It's great
4	to have a piece of legislation. It's great to have a
5	program, but it's got to work. It's got to be
6	implemented. It's got to be implementable. It's got
7	to be implemented, and we've got to know it's
8	working. At the moment, we don't have that, but we
9	started trying to change that, and we're hoping we
10	can work with all of you to really make it move
11	forward. You know, it's that, you knowit's not
12	that you're not provoking any response at all.
13	You're not provoking any response that you've seen
14	yet, but you will see.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: You all right with
16	that?
17	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: [off mic] I'm fine.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: You fine? [laughs]
19	Sure you are. All right, thank you very much.
20	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: In the interest of
21	transparency will the Administration work with the
22	Council as it moves forward to let us know as you're
23	moving forward instead of just saying trust us.
24	We're working on it, and we'll get back to you?
25	

2 HENRY BERGER: I think our IGO unit 3 always works with the Council and we're going to 4 continue to work with the Council, of course. But we're not going to come to you, um, until we have 5 something to come to you with. At the moment there 6 7 are lots of ideas floating out there. We know what 8 the goal is. There are lots of pieces to how we get 9 to that goal, and until we can reconcile some of those issues, we really can, you know, sit down and 10 11 say well maybe this and maybe that and maybe the 12 other thing. We've got to get our people on the same 13 page, and when we do that, of course, we're going to 14 be working with you. You're a legislative body. 15 You're the ones that make a lot of this happen. Um, 16 sometimes you do it behind the scenes, and sometimes 17 you do it by being a bit provocative and getting us 18 moving, and we appreciate that. We understand that 19 role, and it makes a difference, but we're going to 20 move forward on this, and you're going to be part of 21 it. 2.2 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Thank you and I'm

kind of a transparency person. So the more we can do on public the better. And as we're doing it, I think the more we're able to do our own tracking will help

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 62
2	us get where we need to go. Just one piece I wanted
3	to note. This has been entered into the record, and
4	unfortunately, the Commissioner couldn't join us, but
5	Commissioner Kellner did send a letter in support of
6	Introduction 628 fromin his role as the State Board
7	of Elections Co-Chair, which he signed it and he
8	says, quote, "Currently, high school students must
9	complete participation in government classes prior to
10	graduation in which voter registration and voter
11	participation should be focus points of successful
12	curriculum. The proposal's key tracking components
13	provided for in the proposal will serve to identify
14	program success or where there might be remaining
15	room for improvement." Can that be addressed?
16	[pause]
17	HENRY BERGER: Well, um, well, I don't
18	disagree with anything he's saying, except that I
19	don't think that he's dealing with some of the
20	details that we're dealing with here. You know,
21	Commissioner Kellner is a special individual, and
22	he's devoted his life to election law, I have a lot
23	of respect for him. You know, we'll pass him the
24	record. You know, we'll take a loot at his comments,
25	but, you know
I	

2 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: To the extent that 3 there's already a pedagogical requirement for quote, 4 unquote "participation in government" can the DOE use 5 that for doing voter and civic education?

HENRY BERGER: Yeah, yeah. I think my 6 7 testimony actually spoke to that. It's--it's part of 8 their ongoing program, but it's part of the pedagogy. 9 The isn't imposing upon the additional requirement of making voter registration, you know, the active voter 10 11 registration part of that, and that's--you know, 12 that's where the conflict comes in. You know, the 13 State Department of Education deals with the pedagogy. That's part of their piece, and yes it's 14 15 wonderful. I'm glad it's there. The question is 16 what does it really mean and how do you build on it? 17 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: I'd love to 18 recognize Council Member Wills for questions. 19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Thank you. I just 20 wanted to quickly go back to Deputy Commissioner 21 Saunders. Did I pronounce it right? 2.2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS: Yes, you 23 did. Yes. COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Okay, great. 24 Um, 25 with the--I only have like two or three questions and

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 64
2	then I'm done. With thethe legislation that we are
3	discussing, we are obviously voting for Intro 464.
4	Could you just bullet point to me the issues that you
5	have with the legislation really quickly? Because
6	this is something that both of these pieces is
7	something that is very important not only to the
8	progressive but to the BLA Caucus. So we wanted to
9	make sure we have everything in order when we start
10	to you. And I'm particularly interested in the data
11	that's tracked. Um, I know you said that you really
12	can't do it or you haven't done it because it goes
13	back to the City Board of Elections. I'm just trying
14	to figure out
15	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS:
16	[interposing] Okay.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS:you know,
18	there's so many laws in this. So
19	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS:
20	[interposing] Sure.
21	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS:if you can speak
22	to that. (sic)
23	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS: Sure. So
24	to your point about what iswhat are some of the
25	
I	I

COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS
 issues that we have with the introduction of this
 bill.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Uh-huh.

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS: One is we rely on volunteers to assist with this because as you 6 7 mentioned, sometimes what I might say to someone in 8 our custody because I have a shield may not be 9 trustworthy. So we definitely rely on advocates, and our partners to assist us with getting the message 10 11 out to the population because we just feel that this 12 collaborative approach gets the message out and 13 people understand that we're all on the same page. So we do it together as a team. So that's one. We need 14 15 partners. And we don't have the staff to actually do that work. So we have to rely on partners, and when 16 17 you rely on partners and volunteers, it is not going 18 to be something that is as consistent as you would 19 So for example our last event we got 80 like. 20 volunteers. For National Voters Registration day, 21 which was September 22nd of this year a couple days 2.2 we got 25 volunteers, but we reached out to over 100. 23 So it all is right now contingent on the availability of volunteers and some program staff that is limited. 24 25 So that's one.

2 Two, you--when you raise awareness about 3 voter registration, we provide voter registration 4 forms and applications, the absentee ballot applications. The absentee ballot applications are 5 approved by the City Board of Elections and that is 6 7 then forwarded to the individual who filled it out. So if the individual is still in custody--you know 8 9 our population is guite transient. 10

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Right.

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS: So if the 12 person is still in custody depending on the address 13 the person placed on that ballot that is where that 14 ballot is going to end up being mailed to. So that 15 is the point at which we don't have the ability to track. We don't know where it went, and we don't 16 17 know if that person is still in our custody at the 18 point at which it's being mailed. And we don't know 19 how many people have been approved by the City Board 20 of Election. We know how many people filled it out 21 during those events, but remember, people take the 2.2 material and fill it out at their leisure, and on 23 every given day they can fill out the--any of the documents because they're available in many different 24 25 places in all of our facilities.

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 67 2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Uh-huh. 3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS: So that's 4 the problem with the tracking. 5 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Okay. So, um, with your volunteers that means because it's--there 6 may be inconsistency. I'm not saying that there is a 7 8 huge inconsistency, um, that means we don't have 9 anyone monitoring, um, the voter registration or absentees that are going out, correct? 10 11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS: We--no 12 because--13 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: [interposing] Like I just want to--I just want to understand. 14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS: 15 Okav. 16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: I just want to 17 because we want to make sure that when we come to you 18 the bills are strengthened and we can have a dialogue 19 that can make sure the bills are done. We don't just 20 want to do something and say we have the power to do 21 it. Deal with it. That would be the worst thing, but personnel or staffing levels to deal with this 2.2 23 issue is something that would be--DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS: 24 Τn 25 addition, it's a private decision. So sometimes

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 68
2	people take advantage when you're discussing it with
3	them, and you can provide the assistance, but other
4	people want to think about it.
5	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Right.
6	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SAUNDERS: And other
7	people will take advantage of it outside of the
8	events. So if II'm an individual in custody and I
9	decide that I don't want to go to the event, but I
10	want to go to the law library later and get a copy of
11	it and mail it out, I wouldn't know or my staff
12	wouldn't know that it was mailed out or done.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Thank you very
14	much. Thank you Mr. Chair.
15	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Well, thank you. So
16	just in wrapping up, wewe have a system. It's
17	mandated by law. Um, I think the consensus is that
18	it's not working. I think having support around
19	tracking and administrating and just getting to the
20	bottom of what is and isn't work in the current
21	program is something that we must do under the law
22	and I'm hoping that we can count on your commitment
23	for that.
24	HENRY BERGER: [off mic] You can, yes.
25	[sic]

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 69
2	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Thank you.
3	HENRY BERGER: [on mic] I look forward
4	to working with you on it.
5	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: With regard to doing
6	things administratively versus the law, if we're able
7	to work together on a program that actually does work
8	and where we can legislate for a program that will
9	actually get the kids registered where you do need
10	this body. And we would be willing to work with you
11	and removing the requirement that we hand it to them
12	with the diploma as long as we're actually able to
13	show that doingremoving the requirement won't
14	actually hurt voter registration. Isdoes that
15	sound like a sensible compromise?
16	HENRY BERGER: It's the direction I think
17	we're going in.
18	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Fair enough and then
19	the other key pieces are it seems that we're agreed
20	that we want to get the voter registrations forms
21	into the hands of the kids before they graduate.
22	That's correct? [pause]
23	HENRY BERGER: I think it's more than
24	getting them into the hands of the kids. I mean, you
25	know, I think that's part of the issue. You know, I
I	

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 70
2	think for the program to work, there's got to be more
3	than just handing somebody a piece of paper.
4	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Right.
5	HENRY BERGER: And that's what we're
6	trying to work through now.
7	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: And in terms of
8	that, part of it is also to make sure that we have
9	coding. Whenever we can do that it's not burdensome,
10	but actually gives us valuable reporting data. So
11	that we know that when we hand it to somebody that
12	that person is eligible, and that once that person is
13	eligible, they are able to participate or not, and we
14	understand what's happening there.
15	HENRY BERGER: We have lots of issues
16	with coding. We expressed it in the bill that came
17	up last year. I know the City Board of Elections is
18	going to speak to that issue also. There are just a
19	lot of concerns about coding, and if it doesn't give
20	you usable information, and it imposes huge burdens
21	the question is why are we doing it. So, we'll argue
22	about coding with you on an ongoing basis I think.
23	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Honestly, if we pass
24	Introduction 508 with online registration and the
25	fact that young people tend to prefer online, we'll

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 71
2	actually be able to have data on everyone down to the
3	person. So hopefully, if we're able to pass
4	Introduction 508, and the DCAS pilot moves forward,
5	in stead of fighting over coding we can just everyone
6	registered and then pop that information into open
7	data.
8	HENRY BERGER: That's a brave ne world,
9	and I'm hoping somebody in Albany will listen to us
10	at some point.
11	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Thank you very much
12	to this panel, and I do hope that DOE that you were
13	not able to provide any answers will please respond
14	to our letters. I'd like to call up the next panel,
15	the Board of Elections as well as the Campaign
16	Finance Board. Mike Ryan and Amy Loprest. I want to
17	thank both of them for their partnership and working
18	on Young Adult Voter Registration. I also want to
19	thank Mike Ryan for really taking a lead on embracing
20	technology. When a city agency especially one that
21	you take on that did not have a positive reputation
22	and the organization starts to turn around and
23	employees feel empowered to propose new ideas and new
24	projects and they start things like electronic tablet
25	based pulse site locating that takes three to five

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 72
2	seconds even with people who are not technologically
3	savvy. And we are able to get voter registration
4	forsorryelection results almost immediately. I
5	think we're headed in the right direction, and I just
6	want to thank both agencies for working with us on
7	YAVRA. Ifwhowho would like to go first?
8	MICHAEL RYAN: [off mic] Well, my name
9	is Michael Ryan.
10	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: All right. I'm
11	sorry. [pause, background comments] Gotcha. Please
12	raise your right hand. Do you affirm to tell the
13	truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in
14	your testimony before the committee, and to respond
15	honestly to Council Member questions?
16	MICHAEL RYAN: [off mic] I do. [pause]
17	Okay, thank you. So they said what do we do with
18	them. We process them like every other voter
19	registration form. Um, so if someone is incarcerated
20	and they direct us tothey want an absentee ballot,
21	say, we will forward it to whatever address they tell
22	us. If it happens to be an address on Hayden (sic)
23	Street, we'll send it there. If it's an address, um,
24	you at a home address where they want a family member
25	to take custody of it for them and deliver it to
	I

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 73
2	them. Or, if they expect to have their term of
3	incarceration expire, but the time election day rolls
4	around, and they're going to be able to fill it out
5	themselves once they get home, we'll do it any way,
6	um, that they want us to. Um, and the same for voter
7	registration forms. We process them the same way
8	that we process any other voter registration form.
9	It's done by a bipartisan team that reviews
10	eligibility. There are certain things that people
11	need to provide to us, the last four digits of their
12	Social Security Number, a driver's license or a non-
13	driver identification number. The forms have to be
14	signed. If the forms come to us and are incomplete,
15	it is our part of our process to send out a missing
16	information notice. And again, that missing
17	information notice will be sent to wherever the
18	address is that is placed on the form. Um, with
19	respect to the absentee ballots, um, and we went into
20	this more with respect to primaries than we do with
21	generals. Sometimes people might think that they're
22	registered in a particular party, and they are, in
23	fact, not and they're registered in a different party
24	or they're a blank or an independent. And they ask
25	for an absentee ballot to vote in a particular

COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS
 contest. Those have to be rejected and they get a
 notice in that regard.

4 The good thing about what we have done in terms of transitioning to that -- a ballot on demand 5 system in addition to the reduction in paper waste is 6 the system will only generate an absentee ballot on a 7 8 specific voter. So when we get the request in and we 9 put the information in we say Ruben Will needs an absentee ballot, it will only generate if the voter 10 11 that's requesting the absentee ballot is, in fact, 12 eligible to vote in that contest that they reside in 13 that district or that they're in the properly 14 registered party in the case of a--in the case of a 15 primary. So, 464 would change essentially nothing on 16 the part of the City Board of Elections except 17 perhaps increase volume. But I don't see even if 18 there was full 100% compliance in this process 19 amongst the Department of Corrections and all of the 20 person incarcerated at the time of the given election 21 event, I don't see that volume being so stressful as 2.2 to prevent us from processing the elections if--23 processing the forms in the event that we receive them in a timely enough manner to process them for 24 various--for various election events. 25

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

2 With respect to Intro 628, I believe that 3 the issues associated with coding and tracking have been covered in prior testimony, and I believe that 4 they were covered again today. Those issues were 5 true then. They're true now, and I believe that we 6 7 are working--I know that we are working very closely with the Administration to overcome a lot of the 8 9 difficulties. You know, I think it's a significant point to remind everyone that Executive Order 1 of 10 11 2014 was not only Executive Order 1 of that year, it 12 was also a matter that was negotiated quite 13 extensively between the Administration and the 14 Council. And we're in the process now of bearing the 15 fruits of those efforts. It is the election process, the registration process all of it is very 16 17 cumbersome, and everything interrelates to something 18 else. So every one thing that you're trying to fix 19 has a trickle down effect on other things within the 20 process. But I can tell you that we are moving 21 towards, and I think Chair Kallos said it 2.2 appropriately when we talk about electronic 23 registration as opposed to online registration. Because those two things while similar are different. 24 Until there is a change in the state law with respect 25

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 76
2	to the wet signature, we call the wet signature, the
3	ink signature, that allows an electronic form of a
4	signature to be accepted from an agency other than
5	the New York State Department of Motor Vehicles, we
6	will be in the position that we're in presently,
7	which is establishing system that allows people to
8	do the manual data entry on their own. Print up the
9	form, sign it and mail it back to us. Under the
10	present system, what we will be doing when we get
11	those forms is scanning them into the system. All
12	right, so we'll have an electronic queue that says
13	somebody filled something out online. We'll then get
14	the paper. We'll can it in. All the data entry has
15	been done. That is a significant savings for us
16	because it allows us to stop doing the manual data
17	entry. And to use our staff to actually prepare for
18	elections as opposed to, you know, constant data
19	entry. But more importantly, and I'llI'll point to
20	an ethnically specific name, Costa Constantinides.
21	Your name would be more likely to be mis-entered in
22	the system than Mike Ryan. I mean that's just the
23	practical reality of life. So, when somebody has a
24	specific name with a more complex spelling and
25	they're filling out their own information, and we're

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 77
2	getting it electronically, that increases accuracy,
3	decreases the number of rejections. Increases the
4	accuracy of the poll books, decreases the number of
5	missing information or improper information notices
6	that are sent out. So all those things are positive
7	steps in the right direction. And we are working and
8	DCAS, the Department of Citywide Administrative
9	Services has been doing some electronic transmission
10	of data through the agencies. So we're using that
11	process to deal with the agencies on that, but also
12	to expand that to make it more available to the
13	general voting public. And I think that that more
14	than the paper distribution of electronic voterof
15	voter registration forms is going to be something
16	that has the potential to raise voter registration
17	amongst people. I have a 20-year-old daughter.
18	She's at Hofstra University, and if I hand her a pen
19	and tell her to fill out a form, she looks at me like
20	I'm crazy. Because they're used to doing everything
21	on an app, and with two thumbs, right? So the more
22	that we can make this information available and the
23	efforts that were made with Executive Order 1, and
24	the efforts that have been put forth by the
25	Administration and by the City Board of Elections to

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 78
2	get all of that stuff done is the foundation on which
3	we can build the next steps of the process.
4	So also I think the National Student
5	Voter Registration Day that was done by Council
6	Member Rosenthal last year and others, I participated
7	in. Others participated in it. Through our efforts
8	it's moved up this year into the earlier part of the
9	year. So that whatever registrations we do will be
10	in time for the presidential primary for those
11	eligible voters. So all of these things rather than
12	looking at one thing in a vacuum, taking it all
13	together and putting it together into ainto a total
14	package I think makesmakes a big difference.
15	With respect to Intro 796 that again is
16	an Administration agency issue not a City Board of
17	Elections issue. With respect towhat is it? Which
18	is reswhich is the res? Res number notnot 695.
19	My letter is missing thethe other number. The
20	resolution requiring same day voter registration.
21	The Board or Commissioners takes no positions with
22	respect to that, but I can tell you as a practical
23	matter this resolution is dead on arrival unless
24	there is a component of electronic poll books.
25	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: [off mic] Of what?

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

2 MICHAEL RYAN: Electronic poll books. 3 Unless we can interactively interface with our system 4 on an election day assuming that the State Legislature resolves its issues on this matter, if we 5 can't interface, say there's no electronic poll book 6 7 component, there is no same day voter registration. That's just a fact. Now, the good news is and 8 9 Council Member Kallos mentioned the Tablets earlier. Yep, the good news is with respect tot he Tablets we 10 11 have placed on the Tablets--we will be certainly across the board for November the link to our voter 12 13 database and an app that allows it to be placed right onto the Tablet. So in the event that this issue is 14 15 ever resolved, the Tablets are ready to go. And with 16 respect to 695, again that is an Administration 17 issue, not a City Board of Elections issue. So I 18 wrapped it up as quick as I could. 19 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Um, and in the--20 MICHAEL RYAN: [interposing] And I'm 21 certainly available for any questions if anyone has 2.2 them. 23 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: You got it. AMY LOPREST: Okay. You have my written 24 testimony so I'm not going to read all of it, in the 25

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 80
2	interest of time, but Igood morning, Chair Kallos
3	and members of the Government Operations Committee.
4	I am Amy Loprest, Executive Director of the New York
5	City Campaign Finance Board, and that is the New York
6	Campaign Finance Board[laughs]the creature of New
7	York City government. I would like to thank this
8	committee for the opportunity to testify on the bills
9	under consideration today. As you know, the CFB
10	works to register voters and promote civic engagement
11	through the NYC Votes Campaign. Our Voter Assistant
12	Unit served as the lead coordinator in New York City
13	on National Voter Registration Day. While we're
14	still processing our final tally from NVRD
15	MICHAEL RYAN: [coughs]
16	AMY LOPREST:we registered over 3,000
17	new voters to date. Under both Local Law 29 and
18	Direct 1, we also work with the city agencies to
19	provide voter registration opportunities in their
20	public spaces. Turning to the bills under
21	consideration today, the CFB currently provides
22	training to Local Law 29 agencies on how to provide
23	voter registration forms in their offices and assist
24	voters in fill out thesethese out. Um, Intro 796
25	would increase the current requirements s that
I	

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 81
2	agencies would also assist voters to fill out the
3	optional section to donate their organs and tissues.
4	If the bill passes, the CFB will modify its training
5	to reflect these additional requirements. We urge
6	the City Council to work with the Administration
7	before implementing any changes for conducting voter
8	registration because there are a lot of complexities
9	in that work, and we work very closely with those
10	agencies and the Administration, and we encourage the
11	City Council to do the same.
12	The CFB supports Intro 464, which will
13	require the Department of Corrections to administer a
14	program distributing absentee ballot applications and
15	absentee ballot to jailed individuals. As you know,
16	the Department of Corrections is a covered
17	legislation agency under Local Law 29 and has a
18	longstanding commitment to increasing the number of
19	registrations at the sites they oversee. Because of
20	this commitment, they served as a model for the other
21	agencies and shared best practices at our trainings
22	that we administer to agency staff. We believe that
23	spending time in a corrections facility should not be
24	an additional barrier to exercising one's right to
25	vote. We urge the City Council to work with the DOE

1COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS822to ensure that any program designed included in this3bill fits into the opportune needs but also act to4effectively promoting absentee voting.

But we found that the confusion of voting 5 rights does not end when people leave a correction 6 7 facility. This topic came up at our last Voter 8 Advisory Committee meeting. There's a lot of 9 confusion around when someone on parole or probation can register or vote. We urge you to extend your 10 11 efforts to ensuring that the Department of Probation 12 continues to educate people on probation on this 13 issues as they reenter society. Intro 628 would add 14 a tracking ability by requiring the Department of 15 Education to distribute coder registration forms to 16 city students, which would allow us to optimize 17 efforts to get young people engaged in the political 18 process early. Amending Local Law 34 to add new 19 coded forms for the Department of Education would 20 allow us to track registration activity. We currently do this with Code 9 forms for city agencies 21 and Code D forms for CUNY schools. These new 2.2 23 opportunities for data collection and reporting will highlight areas of success as well as pointing to 24 place where more could be done. This level of 25

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 83
2	accountability will ensure that we commit to creating
3	the civic culture that welcomes young voters into the
4	fold. While all these bill will help create
5	registration and voting opportunities at the City
6	level, we need action from the state in order to
7	fundamentally overhaul our outdated voter
8	registration system that still mostly relies on pen
9	and paper.
10	The CFB supports Resolutions 695 and 848
11	to call upon Albany to pass pre-registration for 16
12	and 17-year-olds, expand online registration and
13	amend the State Constitution to allow for same day
14	registration. But we ask the City Council to go even
15	further and pass a resolution calling on the Assembly
16	and Senate to pass the Voter Empowerment Act. The
17	Voter Empowerment Act encompasses the measures in
18	Resolution 695 and 848 and additionally includes
19	automatic registration at the DMV and government
20	agencies unless voters opt out. This is the most
21	comprehensive voter registration pending in Albany.
22	On National Voter Registration Day, NYC Votes was
23	able to register 3,000 new voters in one day, a
24	fantastic number, but we could registered nearly one
25	million citizens who weren't registered practically

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 84
2	overnight with the Voter Empowerment Act. It is long
3	past time we discarded the paperthe pen and paper
4	registration system we currently use, and bring voter
5	registration into the 21st Century. This why NYC
6	Votes had made the Voter Empowerment Act as part of
7	its agenda. For the past two years, we have brought
8	concerned citizens to Albany to tell their
9	legislatures why voter reforms matter to them.
10	However, we have seen little momentum on this issue.
11	We're working to make ato make voting reform a top
12	priority in 2016. In addition to bringing citizen
13	volunteers to Albany on May 3rd, we are collecting
14	petition signatures to support the Voter Empowerment
15	Act, Early Voting and the Voter Friendly Ballot Act.
16	We ask that everyone here today sign our petition to
17	send a message to our state legislatures and we ask
18	that the City Council members get the constituents
19	involved by asking them to sign these petitions or to
20	get on the bus to Albany with us in May. Again, I
21	thank you for the opportunity to testify today and
22	I'm happy to answer any questions.
23	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Thank you for being
24	here, and to sense you are able to bring written
25	testimony that is generally preferred. With regard

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 85
2	to codes, you put out an amazing annual report every
3	year where you pretty much tell us everything that
4	you're doing, which is pretty great and I appreciate
5	that. [coughs] You processed a number of Code 9
6	forms. You have them broken down by borough. You
7	have them broken down by different items with
8	compliance with Directive 1, Local 69 and Local Law
9	Local Law 69 and Local Law 29. You're able to give
10	us breakdowns by agency. What are the costs involved
11	in that? How many codes do you currently have, and
12	what is your capacity for codes.
13	MICHAEL RYAN: We have the regular voter
14	registration form, which doesn't have a code. We
15	have Code D, which is CUNY and then we have Code 9,
16	which is the Local Law 2963 Directive 1 or Executive
17	Order 1 all that rolled into one. Um, and
18	essentially, you know, the capacity is the capacity
19	of the system. I mean, you know, computers can track
20	anything you want them to track as long as they're
21	programmed to do so. Thethe problem that we had
22	with getting too specific on the tracking is it comes
23	back to an issue of potential voter identification.
24	Now, it may be more sensitive with respect to some of
25	the social services agencies because of the types of

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 86
2	services that they're given. Or, if you had a form
3	that was tracking somebody back to the Department of
4	Corrections that could be revealed either advertently
5	or inadvertently by the system. We certainly don't
6	want to do that. So we try to steer clear of that
7	minefield of getting too specific with respect to the
8	identification on the form. We think that that
9	tracking can be done on the school side as opposed to
10	on theon the City Board of Elections side. So if
11	we gave out the numbers of the forms that are
12	distributed whether electronically or by paper, and
13	then the different agencies track them themselves.
14	And then those numbers were reconciled with what we
15	actually received back, then that give you the whole
16	picture.
17	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: So what you
18	contemplate is a unique identifier, serial number, if
19	you will, on each form and then just let the agencies
20	hand them out, and then you would match them up based
21	on
22	MICHAEL RYAN: But we don't handle them
23	any differently. It's just that we're able to
24	identify them after the fact.
25	

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

2 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: So you could just 3 put a barcode or serial number on each and every form 4 and then if you said okay barcodes 1 through 100 are 5 going to go to this public school, that--that's the 6 same for you as having a Code 9 or Code D.

87

MICHAEL RYAN: Yes, that--that is 7 potential use of the technology, but we are--we have 8 been working closely with the Administration to try 9 to determine what we should reasonably do. So as 10 11 we're sitting here today, clearly I'm not--much like 12 Mr. Berger, I'm not committing to a particular 13 solution for a particular problem. Clearly the 14 technology for tracking exists. The question is more 15 fundamental than that. Does it comply with state 16 law, and does it potential reveal the identity of the 17 voters. And those are things that we have to be very sensitive to. 18

19 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: I--I just want to 20 applaud you for your embrace of technology, digging 21 deep to understand it, and it's good to know that 22 technologically speaking it doesn't seem like coding 23 32 let alone each every day--each and ever forum 24 would be a barrier. So thank you. I'd like to now

COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 1 88 2 call on Council Member Constantinides followed by 3 Council Member Wills. 4 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you, Chairman Kallos. My question is directed to the 5 Campaign Finance Board. I just want to clarify your 6 7 statement. 8 MICHAEL RYAN: [coughs] 9 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: In the 10 Administration's testimony they state and I quote, 11 "The value of this important program cannot be overestimated, and the Administration--Administration 12 13 is supportive of the bill." And then in your 14 testimony you're saying, "Well, we should work with 15 thee Administration before implementing any changes." 16 And then you're talking about its complexity. 17 AMY LOPREST: Yes. 18 CHAIRPERSON CABRERA: CONSTANTINIDES: So 19 I mean does the Campaign Finance Board not share the 20 Administration's view that this is an important 21 program and it's something that we should move 2.2 forward on? I'm just trying to get some clarity 23 there. AMY LOPREST: Well, because we wrote out 24 testimony before we heard the -- the Administration 25

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 89
2	testimony, we didn't know that they were going to say
3	that they had no problem with the administrative
4	complexity. We were just anticipating that there
5	might be some. Um, weas we said, we do the
6	training. We right now train on every line on the
7	form, and we'll amend out training to, you know,
8	obviously include information about how to fill out
9	those parts of the form that deal with organ donation
10	and tissue donation.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Okay
12	great. I mean that's something
13	AMY LOPREST: [interposing] Yes.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: That's
15	something that's going to save lives.
16	AMY LOPREST: Yes.
17	COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: So we
18	want to make sure that we get that done. So I
19	appreciate that. Thank you.
20	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Council Member
21	Wills.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Yes, good
23	afternoon. I just have a couple of questions. The
24	Chair just presented to me the agency base vote, the
25	registration form and it shows that the BOE passively
I	

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 90
2	gave out 20,000 to DOC, and at that time they had
3	11,000 people they were serving, not that filled out
4	the application. But when it comes back to how of
5	these came back to DOE, it was zero. Now, other than
6	theit was explained to me that there's a
7	possibility that when they had these voter
8	registration events that they may not have come under
9	that guise. But I think there's a real problem with-
10	-and it looks like it falls within the DOE or maybe
11	they need assistance from BOE, I mean DOC and then
12	you have assistance from DOE in some of the measures.
13	So what I need to know is a few of the questions
14	would be does the Board facilitated the efforts by
15	the department to provide the detainthe detainees
16	with voter registration forms, and absentee ballot
17	forms? Throughout the entire process how active is
18	the DOE in how the DOC do these things?
19	MICHAEL RYAN: Well, the DOC operation is
20	wholly contained on Rikers Island. I can tell you
21	that nobody from the City Board of Elections since
22	I've been there as the Executive Directors in two
23	years has visited Rikers Island to participated in
24	any of those efforts. What we simply do is stockpile
25	

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 91 2 Code 9 forms and the Department of Corrections is a 3 Code 9 agency. 4 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Uh-huh. 5 MICHAEL RYAN: So we stockpile those forms and on a regular basis we get calls from 6 7 various agencies at different intervals to replenish their stock of voter registration forms. So we have 8 9 absolutely no interactive role with how the agencies themselves are disseminating the information. 10 We 11 provide them the access to the voter registration 12 forms, and then if those voter registration forms 13 are, in fact, returned either by the individual or by 14 the agency, we process them accordingly. 15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Okay, so--16 AMY LOPREST: [interposing] Council 17 Member Wills, can I--can I--18 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Sure. 19 AMY LOPREST: [laughs] Because we do it I 20 mean as part of our mandate to work with the Local 21 R29 (sic) agencies, we do--do work with the 2.2 Department of Corrections, and in addition--23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: [interposing] This is for CFB? 24 25

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

2 AMY LOPREST: Yes, for CFB, yes. For 3 CFB. That's right.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: I just wanted make 5 sure of that.

AMY LOPREST: So that we do--you know, 6 7 our NYC Vote staff works with the Department of 8 Correcters--Corrections not only in training, not 9 only in training, but also in participating in those other events that the officer spoke about at the 10 11 Department of Corrections in getting, um, individuals 12 registered and informing them about their rights, 13 both to register and also to get absentee ballots. 14 So, um, I'm not sure how--again someone on my staff 15 might know more about how they track back, and also 16 why they've distributed to many, and comes back as 17 zero. But I know that they do those registration 18 events, and our staff is part of helping train the 19 people who do those events, and also participating in 20 those events.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Okay. So that sounds like something that maybe offline we could have a discussion--

AMY LOPREST: [interposing] Yes.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS

2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: --with both 3 agencies. The CFB I asked earlier to DOC if the CFB 4 actually gave a Voter's Guide because you have 5 incredible Voter's Guides, to every person that requested the absentee ballot or voter registration. 6 7 And they told me no. So I wanted to find out what are doing--what can we do in the future to make sure 8 9 that happens? 10 AMY LOPREST: Well, as you know, when we 11 produce the Voter Guide, we actually consider when we 12 do the distribution of, you know, the guides to determine which election districts people are in, we 13 14 consider the population at Rikers as part of that 15 election--that council district. Um, when--COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: [interposing] I'm 16 17 sorry. Repeat that. AMY LOPREST: When we--when we--we do 18 19 consider the people--the population of Rikers to be--I can't remember which council district it is off the 20 top of my head to be part of that council district 21 when we prepare the Voter Guide. She's right that we 2.2 23 haven't done both distributions at Rikers, although we do bring samples when we participated in these 24 voter registration events. What we can do in the 25

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 94
2	future is providebecause so many peopleso many of
3	the inmate population are from different districts
4	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: [interposing]
5	Right.
6	AMY LOPREST:you can vote where you
7	live. And we can work with the Department of
8	Corrections to provide both distribution of the Voter
9	Guide from thein the languages and in thefrom the
10	districts that they would like, and deliver them to
11	Rikers that they're available to the inmates there.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Great. That would
13	be great. And to bothboth agencies, who provide
14	the training to DOC personnel, and the processes of
15	voter registration, absentee ballots and education as
16	far as candidates or anything else?
17	AMY LOPREST: IweI mean that's part
18	of our mandate under Local Law 29. We train
19	obviously not ever single employee I mean as we do
20	with all the city agencies that are covered. We do
21	trainings and they do train the trainer events. So
22	that we teach the trainers how toto train their
23	the line staff that may be involved. We also have an
24	online training program. It's not really a video.
25	
I	

1COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS952It's more of an online presentation that, um, staff3can view on site.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Is there a certain segment of staff, supervisors or anything else that 5 have to manage that as a mandatory requirement. 6 7 Would they be trained in these processes, or is it 8 just, you know, they just pick and choose who or how 9 many they have? Because the Deputy Commissioner did say that it would be an impediment on them as far as 10 11 staffing. But if your agency trained--I'm trying to 12 figure out how many people or what segment of their 13 personnel does your agency--or is it mandatory-mandated to train those individuals so we can make 14 15 sure that this is being done?

16 AMY LOPREST: Well, I don't have the 17 exact answer to your question, but I do--Local Law 29 18 requires that the agencies covered provide voter 19 registration and information and materials to the-their constituencies. And I'm not sure--it doesn't 20 21 really specifically say which level of staff needs to 2.2 be trained and which level of staff. It's a margin--23 a general statement, but we can look into that, and I don't know. The Department of Corrections would be 24

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 96 2 better at answering what level of staff they've had 3 trained.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Okay, I just see that there's a definite correlation to the civic 5 engagement in the DOE. It sucks, right. The classes 6 7 are horrible. [coughing] Because if it did, we wouldn't have some of the young people coming out and 8 9 not thinking of civic engagement or participation is something that is important in the community. And 10 11 then if you have a--a constituency that is on Rikers 12 Island, and it's not really being something that is 13 thoroughly spoken about or have a real robust program to it, then it's just basically the City Board of 14 15 Elections giving out applications and nothing coming 16 back. So we want to make sure that that disconnect 17 is not being--happening in both places.

18 AMY LOPREST: And this is one of the reasons why we support the Voter Empowerment Act 19 20 because, you know, it's--again, it's all of this work 21 and of these efforts it's great, but if everyone was 2.2 automatically registered, then you wouldn't have to 23 worry about that. And so, I mean that--I mean it's-it's a great idea that's been automatic registration 24 25 has been adopted in a number of states. And it is,

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 97 2 you know, the wave of the future doing things more 3 electronically, making it more automatic. Making it 4 easier for citizens to vote is a really high 5 priority. COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: And the last 6 7 question. So, for the Board--the City Board of 8 Elections, and I've been a fan of what you've been 9 doing. MICHAEL RYAN: Thank you. 10 11 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: I just wanted to 12 ask that if there's no really no way to track from 13 the Department of Corrections, if there's no way to track what comes back to you from Rikers Island, then 14 15 we're going to really not being able to track how 16 many of these, um, ballots are rejected because of 17 any type of errors or anything like that. So then we 18 can't really say that it's being something that's--we 19 can't even say what's not being done correctly at 20 that point. 21 MICHAEL RYAN: Right and I think it does go back to what we discussed earlier. It's that 2.2 23 tension between people's privacy--COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: [interposing] 24 25 Right.

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 98 2 MICHAEL RYAN: -- and the -- the sacrosanct 3 nature of the -- the voting process, and then our 4 desire to improve the system. COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Uh-huh. 5 MICHAEL RYAN: Clearly I think most 6 7 people who have spent time at Rikers Island wouldn't 8 necessarily want that advertised. So if we put an 9 agency specific code on the form that tracks it to the Department of Corrections then de factor you know 10 11 that person spent time in jail. And that might 12 create other impediments, unintended impediments to 13 their ability to be productive members of society as 14 well. So it's--it really is, you know, a kind of a 15 push-pull under the circumstances. But as we 16 discussed, technology can track anything you wanted 17 to track. I think we have to make a fundamental 18 decision whether it's proper to do it or not. 19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Okay. Thank you 20 very much. I--the sergeant-of-arms has worked 21 diligently to give us some heat. So when you guys 2.2 feel a little warmer, you should thank him. 23 MICHAEL RYAN: [laughs] 24 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Thank you, Mr. 25 Chair.

1	
1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 99
2	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: So I just want to
3	wrap before we get to the next panel. And the next
4	panel actually has some time constraints. So I'm
5	just going to try to go quickly. So with regard to
6	the reporting that's currently being done with all
7	those coded forms for Directive 1, Local Law 63 and
8	Local Law 29 reporting, is that happening at the City
9	Board of Elections or is that happening at the
10	Administration level?
11	MICHAEL RYAN: Well, we track it.
12	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Okay.
13	MICHAEL RYAN: We do our own tracking and
14	we process the forms with those codes, and then the
15	my understanding is the Administration has their own
16	separate, um, tracking of what they're doing. So
17	that they can monitor the progress of each individual
18	agency.
19	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: With regard toso
20	it seems like you're fine with us doing tracking. We
21	can actually do it even more fine grained as long as
22	you protect privacy. The second piece is as part of
23	our bill, we're asking you to provide some of the
24	reporting. So does that need to be modified to say
25	

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 100 2 provide the tracking information, and/or what do we 3 need to do in order to--4 MICHAEL RYAN: [interposing] As we had--CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: -- or is it fine as 5 is? 6 7 MICHAEL RYAN: As we had said in other testimony on a similar issue, from an administrative 8 9 perspective [coughs] we're just not comfortable with being the police agency for city agencies. And we 10 think that the individual commissioners in those 11 12 agencies can effectively police their staff. And I think with the directive that's coming from the 13 14 Administration that that will happen as the various 15 systems improve, and they pay attention to it. Ι 16 just don't like to be in the position. I don't think 17 it's appropriate for the City Board of Elections or 18 the administrative agency to be a position of 19 policing mayoral agencies. 20 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: So I guess we might want to make a subtle change in saying that BOE shall 21 2.2 be responsible for tracking because that's something 23 you already do--MICHAEL RYAN: [interposing] Right. 24 25

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 101 2 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: -- and that 3 information would be presented to another city 4 agency--5 MICHAEL RYAN: [interposing] Right. CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: --which would be--6 7 MICHAEL RYAN: [interposing] I'm very comfortable with our information being used to 8 reconcile information--9 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: [interposing] 10 Perfect. 11 MICHAEL RYAN: --collected by--collected 12 13 by another agency, but not necessarily that we're 14 saying this agency is performing or that agency is 15 under performing. 16 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: And if--in terms of 17 non-profits, if a non-profit comes to you, are they 18 able to ask you-- If a non-profit doing voter 19 registration--is doing voter registration, are they 20 able to get a tracking code? 21 MICHAEL RYAN: Not individually. You know, the only other--like I said, the only other one 2.2 23 we have is the -- is the Code D. Um, again for the-for the same reasons. Non-profits could have a 24 specific mission, and if they're a soup kitchen, you 25

1COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS1022know, you might not want people to know that you're3having financial difficulty, and you're not able to4purchase your own food and you have to go to a soup5kitchen, although they're necessary. So we're very6sensitive to those things.

7 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: I'd like to acknowledge we've been joined by Council Member David 8 9 Greenfield, and I want to thank both agencies for your positive testimony today, and I'll excuse this 10 11 panel, if that's all right. David, are you good. 12 Okay, thank you very much to this panel. So, um, the 13 next panel I will share includes a member who has 14 known me for 20 years, and has to get on a train in 15 the next 15 minutes. So we will--we--we generally 16 will let the good government groups go after 17 government. But we're going to ask the advocates on 18 behalf of organ donation to please come up starting 19 with James Harkness (sp?) from Live On New York. 20 Ellen Yoshiuchi from the National Kidney Foundation 21 and Iris Resto from Trio Manhattan. [background 2.2 noise, pause]

CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: If you can grab a
seat we need to do the two-minute clock, if we can,
and if you bring the gentleman a witness slip, please

1COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS1032and we'll call you. If Ellen Yoshiuchi could begin3with your testimony, and you'll be on a two-minute4clock. Thank you.

5 ELLEN YOSHIUCHI: Thank you, Chairman Kallos and thank you also to Councilman 6 7 Constantinides for creating this initiative. I am 8 here on behalf of the National Kidney Foundation to 9 wholeheartedly support this legislation. As a matter of fact, as we speak, the National Kidney Foundation 10 11 is writing guidelines, which will be sent to all of 12 our offices throughout the country urging their staff to reach out to the councils in their cities to see 13 14 if they can replicate this effort. So we are 15 wholeheartedly in support of this. Why is this so important to us? As Councilman Constantinides 16 pointed out, the list is long. There are over 17 18 122,000 people waiting for organs as we speak, and 19 that increases as we speak because every ten minutes 20 another person is added to that list. Of that 21 122,000 people, 101,000 are waiting for kidneys, and 2.2 of the 101,000 people waiting for kidneys, 8,000 of 23 them are our fellow New Yorkers. There are 8,000 New York City residents waiting for a kidney. Think 24 about that in terms of the Macy's Thanksgiving Day 25

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 104
2	Parade. That's about the same number of marchers in
3	the parade. So as you're watching that parade for a
4	couple of hours, all of those people going by, think
5	of them as waiting on a transplant list. The cost of
6	transplant is less than half of the cost of dialysis.
7	Dialysis costs about \$70,000 per year, and that is
8	17%, yes, I said 17% of the Medicare Budget. That
9	does not include the co-morbidities attached to
10	kidney disease. Most people who have kidney disease
11	will eventually develop anemia, osteoporosis, and
12	cardiovascular disease in addition to which they are
13	probably on dialysis [bell] because they have either
14	diabetes or hypertension or both. So there are many
15	ancillary costs to the actual dialysis care.
16	Transplant on the other hand once you are
17	transplanted requires anti-rejection medication. It
18	used to cost about \$30,000 a year. It is going down
19	simply because we are better diagnosing. In the
20	beginning we gave large amounts of anti-rejection
21	medication. We've learned from the research that we
22	don't need to do that. So the amount of medication
23	that people have to take and the cost is therefore
24	much lower than it used to be.

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 105 2 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: We have the clocks 3 so that we can give everyone a chance to go and also 4 because of your time restraints. So if you wish to continue we can, but otherwise if we can go to the 5 6 next person. It's up to. 7 ELLEN YOSHIUCHI: No, I'm almost done, Mr. Kallos. 8 9 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Okay. ELLEN YOSHIUCHI: Thank you. 10 So 11 obviously, as I sad, we're totally in support of this 12 legislation for many reasons, not just the cost, but 13 the cost to patients and their families. Certainly, 14 last but not least I am a transplant recipient 15 myself. I have a degenerative eye disorder and was losing my sight. I had a successful cornea 16 17 transplant in my left ear--in my left eye four years 18 ago and in my right eye three years ago. If it were 19 not for the people who signed that donor card, I 20 would be ale to talk to you today, but I would not be 21 able to see you. Thank you. 2.2 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Thank you. 23 JAMES HARKNESS: How are you? So I'm going to try to abbreviate my statement given the 24 time constraints. As we've noted, just 25% of New 25

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 106
2	Yorkers are registered as organ donors. The national
3	average is over 50%. This, in part, is contributing
4	to a troubling fact: Every 18 hours someone in New
5	York dies waiting for an organ transplant. Despite
6	the survey's statistic, progress is being made. The
7	number of registered organ donors in New York States
8	is up 58% over the last $4-1/2$ years. Over the same
9	period in Down State New York registered organ donors
10	have increased 76%. The important driver of the
11	notable progress in the additionis the addition of
12	new organ donor enrollment portals. Two examples:
13	Voter registration and IDNYC stand out. In 2009,
14	organ donor was added to the registration forms in
15	New York. The impact has been strong. Voter
16	registration has accounted for 170,000 enrollments
17	over six years. This year IDNYC was introduced with
18	the organ donor option included on the form. The
19	result, in just eight months IDNYC has accounted for
20	46,000 organ donor enrollments or 30% of all Down
21	State enrollments in 2015. New organ enrollment
22	portals are clearly impactful. However, a key
23	ingredient to the success of a new portal is active
24	prompting and support. That is just adding the organ
25	donor question to a form is unlikely to produce the

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 107
2	strongest results. Instead, when those delivered in
3	their respective form actively call out the organ
4	donor enrollment option, and provide support, organ
5	donor increase. In fact, organ donor enrollment via
6	voter registration was not particularly successful
7	until 2012 when Live On New York began, among other
8	things work with NYC Votes and other groups promoting
9	voter registration to ensure optimal attention to the
10	organ donor enrollment option. Since 2012, voter
11	registration [bell] has delivered over 10% of all
12	organ donor enrollment Down State. Similarly, Live
13	On New York believes that one reasonone of the
14	reasons behind the success of IDNYC as an organ donor
15	enrollment portal is the training of Live On New
16	Yorkis the training that Live On New York provided
17	and the active role IDNYC appears to be taking as it
18	relates to the organ donor enrollment question. And
19	so, as a resultI'll just shorten my statement and
20	simply say that we are in complete support of the
21	legislation 796 introduced by Council Member
22	Constantinides and we're deeply appreciative of it,
23	and we believe it will deliver results. I'll also
24	mention very quickly, if I could, that although 796
25	is our focus, we also support the efforts related to
ļ	

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 108
2	some of the other bills being considered today. And
3	ask that the committee consider, for example with
4	regard to Bill 628 and Resolution 695 that organ
5	donation materials be included along with the voter
6	registration materials. Again, remembering that the
7	voter registration form includes the organ donor
8	enrollment question that begs the need then for organ
9	donor enrollment information to be included as well
10	as the voter registration information.
11	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Thank you to the
12	panel. We've added Ira Kofferman from Live On New
13	York to the panel. Thank you for filling out this
14	slip. You may begin.
15	IRA KOFFERMAN: Good morning and thank
16	you for Live On New York and to all of you for
17	allowing me this time. I'm not a transplant
18	recipient. I still have my native heart, lungs,
19	kidneys and all of those other organs that modern
20	science can use for further work, and I hop that even
21	though they are still mine I have registered to be an
22	organ donor so that one day I will willingly give
23	them to someone who needs. I'm the lucky spouse of
24	someone who was the beneficiary of someone's good
25	wishes and commitment to life. Someone who thought

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 109
2	of life as an endless circle, whose generosity and
3	selflessness has given Glenda, my spouse, and me 17
4	more years of togetherness with friends, family,
5	grandchildren and colleagues such as I have here
6	today, and whom Councilperson Constantinides
7	understands this point of view directly. How
8	appropriate that this new measure from council person
9	Constantinides and his colleagues is linked to voter
10	registration. On the one hand the city is giving
11	help to people so they have the opportunity to
12	exercise the most fundamental right available in
13	America, the right to vote, the privilege to vote,
14	the obligation to vote. And so it is with
15	registering to be an organ donor, the ability to save
16	lives, to reaffirm the faith of doing one of the most
17	helpful, most altruistic, most beneficial acts that a
18	person can possibly do. How wonderful that the
19	people who work in these city agencies going about
20	their daily business will provide support to people
21	who want to register to vote and now have the
22	opportunity to register to become an organ donor. I
23	wholeheartedly support Council person Constantinides'
24	and his team with the proposal, and I'm ready to
25	

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 110 provide direct assistance to him at these agencies if 2 3 asked. Thank you so very much. 4 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Thank you. [bell] IRIS RESTO: [off mic] My name is Iris 5 I was on dialysis for five years. I am now 6 Resto. 7 an eight-year--8 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Is your mic on? And 9 if you could speak into the mic. It should be red. IRA KOFFERMAN: Oh, it's on. 10 11 IRIS RESTO: Okay. I'll start over. My name is Iris Resto. I was on dialysis for five 12 13 I am now an eight-year kidney recipient. years. I 14 am now able to do many things that I couldn't do when 15 I was on dialysis. My kidney transplant changed my 16 entire life, not only my life, but my entire family as well. We are able to go on cruises, vacation. I 17 18 do a lot of volunteer work. I work at a high school. 19 Before I had my kidney transplant, I was weak and did 20 not feel well. I am so grateful to have received a 21 kidney transplant. I am here today representing the 2.2 New York Chapter of Transplant Recipients 23 International Organization. Like me, members of this organization have had a second chance at life because 24 of the kindness of a stranger. Unfortunately, now 25

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 111
2	every patient waiting for a life saving transplant
3	gets a second chance. I am her on behalf of TRIO
4	Manhattan and myself to support Council Member
5	Constantinides Resolution 796 because implementing
6	this very process of assisting customers who need
7	clarification about organ and tissue donation has the
8	potential to increase enrollments and the donor
9	registry, and ultimately save more lives. Thank you.
10	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Thank you. I'd like
11	to recognize Council Member Constantinides for any
12	questions he may have. No clock.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: First, I
14	want to thank each and every one of you for your
15	advocacy. You know, everydayit's not often you get
16	to say that your work saves lives. Um, but you, each
17	and every one of you, your work does save lives. So
18	thank you for all your advocacy. As you know, 16
19	years ago, my wife was able to get a kidney
20	transplant from her mother, and 15 years ago because
21	someone filled out an organ donation form, my wife
22	was able to receive a pancreas. So I know all too
23	well, you know, what it is like to wait for that
24	phone call. You know, she has described in detail
25	what it was like waiting. Is that call going to come

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 112
2	today. I know that you know about that, what it feel
3	like, and all of your advocacy makes a real
4	difference. So I really appreciate each and every
5	one of you. That's really, you know, I guess my
6	question is really why do you thinkYou've heard
7	from the Administration that they're supportive of
8	the bill. You know, and I definitely appreciate
9	Councilman Kallos having this hearing today. Um, but
10	what do you think the difference isI mean we talked
11	about it a little bit in your testimony, but having
12	someone having that discussion, explaining. Because
13	I remember when I brought up this topic someone said
14	to me, but Councilman, don't you understand if I'm an
15	organ donor then they're not going to take care of me
16	in the hospitals? What are some of the impediments
17	that you hear when you're there? I think that
18	education is such an important component to this.
19	JAMES HARKNESS: Organ donation is a
20	tough subject. It's one where people have to face
21	their own mortality. So, therefore, it's not a
22	subject that people seek out. So, simply because of
23	the nature of the subject, people need to have the
24	subject brought to them. They need to be prompted
25	and they need to be supported as they consider the

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 113
2	subject. So, we've seen as I mentioned in my
3	testimony direct evidence that in programs where
4	there's prompting and there's support, we see better
5	results. And at the very least three programs and we
6	hope that with a program like this that there's some
7	training component, too. And you can at least avoid
8	what we see in some other areas where people are
9	actually dissuaded from enrolling. And that's
10	because there's just a general lack of knowledge and
11	understanding on organ donation and myths and
12	misconceptions thatthat we need to eliminate. So
13	at the very least we hope to eliminate people
14	dissuading others based on myths and misconceptions,
15	but on the positive side we hope that prompting and
16	support will encourage people to take that important
17	step and register.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I really
19	feel that having a conversation in the City of New
20	York on why organ donor is so important, and what you
21	can do to save some else's life is tantamount. As
22	you said, clearing up those misconceptions to
23	understand what organ donation is and what it's not

25 work and again thank you, Chairman Kallos.

24

is such an important piece. So I appreciate your

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 114
2	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Thank you very much.
3	I just want to note that this was the earliest we
4	could hear it. We introduced this in the last week
5	of may. We hit budget hearings, which was June, July
6	and August are off. This was previously scheduled
7	through September 21st. This was our first hearing
8	coming back from summer recess. So I don't think you
9	can do better than hearing a bill immediately after
10	introduction at your immediate next hearing. So,
11	thank you. We have an amazing champion in Costa.
12	I'm honored and privileged to be a co-sponsor, and I
13	will excuse this panel under the caveat that at least
14	one of you go to DC to continue advocacy on a
15	national level. Thank you very much.
16	IRIS RESTO: Thank you.
17	IRA KOFFERMAN: Thank you very much.
18	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Back to our
19	regularly scheduled programming, I'd like to call up
20	Talia Weber from Citizens Union; Prudence Katz from
21	Common Cause New York; Kate Doran from the League of
22	Women Voters; and Amanda Seelman (sp?) from New York
23	CityNew York Civil Liberties Union, Legislative
24	Advocacy Clinic at New York Law School. I will note
25	that Citizens Union has a perfect attendance at the

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 115 2 Government Operations Committee. Though that was attributed to one other person, we will excuse that 3 4 person for maternity leave, but I hope to have her back as soon as possible. And we will continue on, 5 and just by a show of hands does anyone want the two-6 7 minute clock, or would you prefer more time to go 8 through your testimony? It's up to you. Okay, we're 9 cool with the two-minute clock. So, we'll do the two-minute clock. 10

11 TALIA WERBER: Good--good morning, Chair Kallos or afternoon, Chair Kallos, and members of the 12 13 Government Operations Committee. My name is Talia 14 Werber and I'm the Policy and Research Manager for 15 Citizens Union in the City of New York, which is a 16 non-partisan good government group dedicated to 17 making democracy work for all New Yorkers. We want 18 to thank you for holding this hearing today, and for 19 all of your proactive work to address voter 20 registration rates in the city. I'll just speak to the particular bills and Citizens Union's position on 21 them. First of all, with respect to Intro 638 and 2.2 23 Resolution 695 addressing voter registration for young adults in New York, we wholeheartedly support 24 both pieces of legislation, and are excited about the 25

COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS
 possibility to strengthen voter registration
 materials. (sic)

116

4 With respect to the other provisions, Intro 464 and 786 we are supportive of the intention 5 of both pieces, but are concerned about some of the 6 7 particulars especially the provisions related to the existence of individuals registering to vote. We're 8 9 concerned that there's opportunity for partisan influence when government employees are offering that 10 11 assistance. So we are hoping that there's a way to look at the bills and ensure that that can be worked 12 13 on. And then lastly--oh, and with--with Intro 796 with respect to those who just spoke about organ 14 15 donation, we do appreciate that concern, but our 16 concern that the bill itself just is a restatement of 17 already existing legislation so, um, we--of local law 18 that is already on the books. So we'd like to talk a 19 little bit more about the particulars of that bill. 20 And then lastly, Resolution 848, which Citizens Union [bell] has advocated in support of online legislation 21 2.2 at the state level. So, we support the resolution. 23 Thank you.

24

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 117 PRUDENCE KATZ: So Talia and I have to 2 3 book it so that's just why we're advocating for the 4 two-minute. I apologize --5 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: [interposing] No, explanations. 6 7 PRUDENCE KATZ: --to the other people on 8 this panel. 9 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: When will Reinvent Albany come back to testify, too? 10 11 PRUDENCE KATZ: I'm not sure. I'm not--12 they're going to testify at the Tech Committee later 13 so you can maybe swing by and say hi. Um, good nor--14 oh, excuse me. Good morning. My name is Prudence 15 Katz. I'm the Research and Policy Manager at Common 16 Cause New York. As many of you know, New York State 17 currently has the dubious distinction of holding the Bronze behind Texas and Indiana for the worst voter 18 19 turnout in the nation. And New York City did its 20 part in getting us towards this record low. Many of 21 you already know that only about a fourth of the city's four million registered voters voted and cast 2.2 23 a ballot in the 2014 election. As the CFB put in a recent report, this problem is larger than a passing 24 one. It's cynicism or waning commitment to civic 25

1 COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 118 2 values. Low voter participation has reached crisis 3 levels. So a large component of this crisis can be 4 attributed to an inflexible and outdate electoral 5 administration system that creates a headache out of the voter registration process. So we thank the 6 7 Council for bringing some of these voting admin bills 8 up for consideration.

9 In relation to Intro 464, it's disturbing to think of an individual losing the right to vote 10 11 simply because they're being held in jail while waiting trial. Distributing absentee ballots and 12 13 providing assistance in filling out these ballots is 14 a simple way for people to maintain their tie to 15 society while the government does its part in 16 maintaining the jailed individual's civil rights. We 17 are strongly in support of this bill. And about the 18 earlier DOC testimony, absentee ballots not--often 19 are not processed in a timely manner and mandating 20 the DOC process the absentee ballots in a swift yet 21 reasonable timeframe is imperative for the vote to be 2.2 counted. And so we glad to see that requirement in 23 the law, and we are glad to see that the law is delineating what the DOC says that they are already 24 25 doing, but it's good to have that mandated. [bell]

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 119
2	I'm just going to zip through this a little bit. So
3	in Intro 628, we also know that young people are the
4	least likely to vote between the ages of 18 and 30.
5	Um, but the Council, the Department of Education and
6	the Administration has the power to turn the
7	statistic around by continuing to engage students.
8	Engaging students in school is very effective, as we
9	also know, and we support what this bill sets out to
10	do, and particularly welcome the reporting
11	requirements, which would encourage more active
12	school participation because it will be creating
13	useful benchmarks.
14	The CFB already mentioned this in their
15	testimony, but I wanted to speak earlier to what
16	Henry Berger spoke to about the Administration's
17	worries about undue burden. Already, there are
18	coding requirements for the 22 city agencies that
19	distribute ballots. There's coding requirements for
20	ballots that are distributed via CUNY. I was just
21	like quickly looking at some statistics generated by
22	the City Board of Elections, and there are thousands
23	of ballots thatOh, it's not important there.
24	Anyway, there are thousands of ballots that are
25	distributed via Code D, which is CUNY. And there's

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 120
2	Code 9, which is the agencies, and then there's
3	othersthere's regular code. So, we don't see how
4	it would be super hard to create another coding
5	system. We hope that the Administration and the City
6	Board of Elections can work with the Council in
7	figuring out how to make this bill workable. We
8	could potentially see some kind of compromise where
9	there's a code for school. It's a Code S, and then
10	it could be broken down by borough just to start
11	with. But to say that there's no reason to create
12	the codes is unreasonable because we don't know how
13	well we're doing until we have benchmarks. So we're
14	strongly in support of having codes.
15	And then the resolution on New York State
16	bills, we are totally in favor of Resolution 695, and
17	Resolution 848. I'm going to speak a little bit to
18	848. Currently, people can only register online to
19	vote with the DMV only if the already possess a New
20	York State license. But it should be as easy to
21	register to vote online as filing in your Social
22	Security when prompted by Turbo Tax, which I find
23	pretty easy to do. Expanding online voter
24	registration will allow
25	

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 121
2	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: [interposing] You
3	asked for a two-minute time limit.
4	PRUDENCE KATZ:I knowwill allow any
5	potential voter to register and vote on the same day.
6	She asked for it. Will dramatically increase voter
7	turnout, as it already does in other states that have
8	same-day voter registration. Thank you.
9	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: You got it. II
10	bring my laptop just for thingsI actually have the
11	page pulled up. So we had last year in the 2014
12	report, 125,413 voter registration forms, 44,343 from
13	the DMV, 24,076 from agencies; 4,119 from Code 9; and
14	6,983 from Code D. And as the City Board of
15	Elections testified, they could actually put a
16	tracker on every single form. So we're not even
17	talking about 32. We're talking about hundreds of
18	thousands. But, thank you.
19	KATE DORAN: Oh, you're ready for me.
20	Um, good afternoon. My name is Kate Doran. I serve
21	as the Election Specialist on the Board of the League
22	of Women Voters of the City of New York. Um, the
23	League has testified many times before this committee
24	that we strongly support online voter registration.
25	It is more accurate, more secure, and less expensive

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 122
2	than paper registration. It has the potential for
3	shortening lines and increasing voter satisfaction at
4	the polls because of the greater accuracy of the poll
5	book. We urge the various city and state legislator
6	and election administrators to come together and
7	solve the recognized challenge of the wet signature.
8	We also encourage the City Council and the City Board
9	of Elections to explore the possibilities of linking
10	with the New York City Municipal ID Card for the
11	electronic transfer of voter registrations and wet
12	signatures. The extremely successful DMV/BOE
13	interface is now established protocols that could
14	possibly be replicated to create a similar Municipal
15	ID Card/BOE interface. I don't have a Municipal ID
16	Card yet, but I've seen them. They look very much
17	like a driver's license. They have a code. They a
18	photograph. They have a signature. Seems like a
19	good thing to take a look at. Furthermore, and this
20	is no trivial matter. Voter registration ten days
21	prior to election day is the standard in the New York
22	State Constitution. Currently, New York State
23	demands voter registrations not later than 25 days
24	prior to election day. Years and years of reliance
25	on the annual paper registration processes have

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 123
2	resulted in disenfranchiseddisenfranchisement of
3	eligible voters in clear violation of Constitutional
4	mandates. Online voter registration offers a path
5	towards compliance with our New York State
6	Constitution. The League also supports same-day
7	voter registration as a proven method of increasing
8	voter participation with the understanding [bell]
9	that poll sites will have to have electronic devices
10	often referred to as electronic poll books. With
11	access to online registration, election
12	administrators should waste no time in pressing the
13	legislatorsthe legislatures to support and provide
14	fundingfunding for electronic poll books.
15	Accordingly, wewe support City Council Resolution
16	848 calling for amendments and changes to New York
17	State election law. The League supports Resolution
18	No. 695 calling on the New York State Legislature to
19	pass and the Governor to sign the laws, the bills,
20	rather, allowing 16 and 17-year-olds to pre-register
21	to vote. Attached to my testimony and incorporate is
22	a memorandum from out State League from April, which
23	I will not read into the record now.
24	Now, lastly, the City League cannot
25	unreserved support Intro No. 628, a local law in

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 124
2	relation to approving the only adults' access to
3	voter registration materials by requiring various
4	actions be taken by the New York City Board of
5	Elections and the New York City Department of
6	Education. We are not troubled by coding and
7	tracking provisions as the DOE is, and we don't
8	believe that assigning a code to a geographical
9	school district will compromise anyone's voter
10	privacy. We do believe, however, that this local law
11	is only marginally better than what we have now,
12	Local Law 29 and others, and its generic Code 9
13	requirements. We wereI was very pleased to hear
14	Henry Berger's characterizations because this is the
15	sort of thing we've been saying amongst ourselves,
16	and I didn't want to be so stern about it, but he did
17	the job for us. [laughs] Intro 628 is only
18	marginally better than Local Law 29 because such data
19	as you collect may perhaps be more specific. The
20	City Board of Elections currently distributes, as you
21	know, 100,000 hard copy voter registration forms to
22	the DOE every year. If these forms were coded to
23	identify particular schools rather than the generic
24	nine, we might know how effective this distribution
25	effort really is, and we suspect not effective at all

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 125
2	as Mr. Berger has said. So before Local Law 29 and
3	with the resolution is that it does not call for
4	voter education. We understand that we're notthe
5	city is not pedapedagogical standard. Students
6	need to know the importance, meaning and the value of
7	being a voting citizen. Earlier this year, as you
8	know, there was student registrationvoter
9	registration day. The League of Women Voters
10	participated. New York City Votes created a great
11	little curriculum tool, and we have [laughs] Helen
12	Rosenthal was to be recognized. We understand that
13	there were over 2,000 students registered in various
14	high schools on that day, and this initiative should
15	be an annual event. And if you willcould find any
16	way to mandate it, we would be in full throttle (sic)
17	support.
18	Lastly, is it not inconsistent of the

Council to require the City Board of Elections to provide voter registration forms--I'm quoting here-either in printed form or in a form that's suitable for printing? At the same time you make a strong statement in Resolution 848 about the advantages of online registration. Admittedly, we're not at a point where high school students can register on

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 126
2	their phones unless they happen to have driver's
3	license or a non-driver ID. But what about
4	collaboration on the student voter registration day
5	with the Department of Motor Vehicles? Could you get
6	someone to come down from the DMV and talk to these
7	seniors? They might want to have a driver's license.
8	They might be interested in a non-driver ID and then
9	they could talk to them about registering to vote at
10	the same time. So, as we all know, young adults
11	typically ignore or reject paper transactions, and
12	Henry Berger described very graphically what happens
13	to all of those forms if they're distributed. So
14	since we have the DMV model, and the City Board of
15	Elections like said I think we should be trying to
16	more with it. So thank you very much for inviting us
17	here, and I'm grateful for everything that you're
18	doing to try to enfranchise every eligible citizen.
19	Good afternoon. Thank you for giving the
20	opportunity to talk to you today about an issue of
21	great concern. My name is Amanda Seelman and I'm a
22	student at the New York Civil Liberties Union
23	Legislative Advocacy Clinic at new York Law School.
24	The NYCLU is a state affiliate of the American Civil
25	Liberties Union is a not-for-profit, non-artisan

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 127
2	organization with eight offices across the state, and
3	nearly 50,000 members. Securing and protecting the
4	rights of all New Yorkers to vote is a core part of
5	the NYCLU's mission. I am here today in support of
6	Intro 628, which promises to enhance youth voter
7	participation. Passing this amendment will help
8	ensure that high school students are provided with
9	the necessary voter registration and appropriate
10	languages during the school year. It will improve
11	tracking procedures to identify weak spots in current
12	young voter registration outreach. The Department of
13	Education and City Board of Elections will now be
14	required to track and report on the efficacy of
15	distributing registration materials to students.
16	Until now, there has been no mechanism to monitor
17	voter registration, but happens as a result of the
18	Department of Education's outreach to students. This
19	is a key missing metric between young people are an
20	important voting constituency and they are often left
21	out on election day. According to the U.S. Census,
22	the proportion of young people registered to vote is
23	46.7%, the lowest it has been in the past 40 years.
24	In addition, New York City residents between 18 and
25	30-year-olds have the lowest voter turnout of any age

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 128
2	or socio-economic group in the city. These startling
3	statistics demonstrate that youth are not taking
4	advantage of their fundamental right to vote. One
5	reason for this is that the process to register can
6	be complicated and inaccessible to teens. Providing
7	registration information to public schools will help
8	break down the accessibility barrier by meeting teens
9	in a familiar location where they have access to
10	trusting adults to answer any questions and guide
11	them through the process. Adding the tracking
12	mechanism will provide an important measure of
13	collectiveness (sic) [bell] of this program.
14	Ultimately, this bill can increase youth
15	registration, subsequently improving the electoral
16	process and the quality of life in the city. Thank
17	you.
18	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Thank you very much.
19	I also want to thank the panelists for the advocacy
20	that I mentioned from April 16, 2012 letter that all
21	the different groups from this panel had sent out,
22	and thank you for coming. We'd love to have more of
23	the clinic coming by. We have lots of hearings, and
24	it's grateful to have you. Does anyone have
25	questions for this panel? So, thank you very much.

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 129
2	You're excused. Before I call the next panel
3	actually, I'll call them so that you can come up, and
4	then I'll go to Council Member Rosenthal for an
5	opening statement. David Pechefsky from Generation
6	Citizen; Jonathan Reese from Big Apple Coffee Party;
7	Penny Mentz from Big Apple Coffee Party; Sarah Care
8	from the Legal Aid Society; Deala Shabas (sp?) from
9	100 Black Men; and Suwumba Subuquay (sp?), if you are
10	still here. We will need five chairs for this
11	panel, and we'll recognize Council Member Rosenthal,
12	and thank you for your leadership and partner in
13	taking Student Voter Registration Day to 12 members,
14	22 schools, and then turning it into a City Council
15	initiative. We're lucky to have you on the team.
16	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you,
17	Council Member Kallos and II really just want to
18	start by commending you for holding hearing and
19	pulling together this package of bills and
20	resolutions that will help move the ball forward to
21	engaging young people and other of our citizens who
22	are otherwise disengaged from voting. So I think
23	it's a very clever hearing, and you're always having
24	your eyes on the prize with this one. Also because I
25	am clearly speaking to the converted, I'm not sure,

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 130
2	I'm not sure I need to read exactly from my opening
3	statement. And rather, I'd like to use the
4	opportunity to thank a number of people by name and a
5	number of groups that were instrumental in making
6	Student Voter Registration Day so successful. The
7	Campaign Finance Board and New York City Votes put
8	their heart and muscle into this, and I want to thank
9	them for that. Henry Berger from the Mayor's Office;
10	Eric whose last name I just forgot from the
11	Department of Education who is responsible for
12	writing the curriculum is to be commended. And then
13	to all my colleagues on the Council who voted to
14	support funding Student Voter Registration Day for
15	Fiscal Year 16. I think the measures that we're
16	putting into effect this year will be ones that can
17	be replicated so we may not need additional funding.
18	The groups who supported us as volunteers last year,
19	the League of Women Voters, the Next Gen Voting, all
20	the names thatI don't know if Big Apple Coffee was
21	involved. You are in spirit always. So it's always
22	a great group, and the Asian Coalition, the New York
23	Asian Coalition was the most instrumental group in
24	finding organizations to help out on Student Voter
25	Registration Day. But we couldn't do it without

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 131
2	everyone's support, and I really want to thank you
3	all for that. And specifically, as it has to do with
4	this resolution, I want to thank Assembly Member or
5	State Senator Kavanagh, and Assembly Member Cartucci
6	for having Is it the other way around, they demoted
7	Kavanagh?
8	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: No, they promoted
9	him.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: They promoted
11	him. Okay, well, you know, that's how I feel. Um,
12	for their leadership in the state and urge my
13	colleagues to support our resolution to get 16 and
14	17-year-olds given the ability to pre-register to
15	vote. We could definitely then bring them in to the
16	fold on Student Voter Registration Day. So thank you
17	so much for giving me the opportunity to talk, but
18	more importantly for pulling together this hearing,
19	Council Member Kallos.
20	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Thank you. If the
21	Legal Aid Society could start us off, followed by
22	Generation Citizen.
23	Hi. Thank you Chair Kallos and Council
24	Members. My name is Sarah Kerr. I'm a staff
25	attorney with the Prisoner's Rights Project of the
	I

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 132
2	Legal Aid Society, and I'm here to testify for the
3	Legal Aid Society in favor of the bills andoh, um,
4	464 and 628 and both resolutions. Thank you for the
5	opportunity to testify on these important efforts to
6	improve access to voting rights for all New Yorkers.
7	At the Legal Aid Society we are dedicated to ensuring
8	that no New Yorkers are denied access to justice
9	because of poverty. We represent people individually
10	in criminal and civil cases and work on legislative
11	and administrative policy reform as well. My unit
12	the Prisoner's Rights Project advocates for all New
13	York City in our city jails to improve the humanity
14	of our jails, and to improve the successful reentry
15	of our citizens after incarceration. We endorse the
16	proposed legislation, which will help to engage our
17	clients in exercising their civil rights for the
18	voting process making them part of the critical
19	policy discussions relevant to their communities
20	and/or cities. We fully support the measure for
21	registration and absentee voting from the city jails.
22	It adds to the city's current efforts to reform our
23	city jails by improving educational and other
24	programming creating connections to community and
25	decreasing violence and the use of solitary
l	

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 133
2	confinement. It sends a clear message of inclusion
3	on community and value of participation. I'd like to
4	note that Legal Aid has participated in the past with
5	registration efforts on Rikers Island and in the
6	other jails, and we will do so in the future, of
7	course. 0628, which is the Department of Education
8	providing voter materials and tracking efficacy,
9	these efforts will include all public schools, and we
10	hope it will include District 79. It talks about
11	the bill talks about geographical districts, and I'm
12	not sure if District 79 is [bell] a geographical
13	district. It operates the Island Academy at Rikers
14	Island with Passages Academy School, which includes
15	students in secure and non-secure detention, and it
16	should be included in these efforts. And a note
17	about this bill. I think it's been addressed
18	somewhat earlier. It should not be limited to
19	seniors or graduating students. I think District 79
20	in particular probably has a lot of individuals who
21	will not be approaching those goals at the same time
22	they're approaching their eligibility vote, but they
23	should not be excluded from the voting process or
24	disenfranchised due to theirdue to difficulties
25	they've had or interruptions they've had in their

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 134
2	education. We are in favor of the pre-registration
3	of 16 and 17-year-old. It will improve the ease of
4	voter registration, and encourage youth and all New
5	Yorkers to participate in the electricalthe
6	electoral process. Each person's vote no matter
7	their race, gender, religion or sexual orientation no
8	matter how privileged or disadvantaged counts
9	equally, but it can only be counted when cast. The
10	same-day registration will eliminate the
11	disenfranchisement of individuals who fail to meet
12	deadlines or who have recently moved or experiencing
13	a transition that interfered with the ability to
14	register or to provide a permanent address.
15	Specifically, our civil clients who experience
16	homelessness need to be included in the
17	enfranchisement process. So Legal Aid endorses the
18	proposed legislation and resolutions, which will help
19	to engage our clients in exercising their civil
20	rights through the voting process making them part of
21	critical policy discussions relevant to their
22	communities and/or city. Thank you.
23	PENNY MENTZ: All right. Good afternoon.
24	My name is Penny Mentz. I'm a retired Assistant
25	District Attorney. I'm not speaking for the

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 135
2	Assistant DistrictI mean the District Attorney's
3	Office, obviously. I'm here as aas a private
4	citizen and as a Member of the Big Apple Coffee
5	Party. I was listening to the testimony that was
6	given earlier, and I was disturbed by the attitude of
7	both the person from the governmentfrom the Mayor's
8	Office and the person from the Department of
9	Corrections. They were saying we're doing everything
10	we can and, you know, what more do you want from us?
11	Andand what I would offer is that there needs to be
12	a change in motivation both of theof the government
13	agencies, and of the voters to get them to vote. And
14	in order to motivate voters you have to motivate the
15	Department of Corrections to change the culture
16	among, you know, the officials that are working
17	there. But she also mentioned that they don't trust
18	anyone with a shield. But there are people in the
19	prisons who are working there that don'twho are
20	civilians, civilian workers. And I would suggest
21	that they be the people who take over the program so
22	that therethere will be a culture of motivating the
23	prisoners to register and vote. And I just wanted to
24	end by saying that there arethere are five
25	rationales for incarcerating people which is like

-	
1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 136
2	protect society, retribution, reformation, deterrence
3	and just to hold somebody, you know, in prepre-
4	trial because, you know, because otherwise they won't
5	show up for [bell] One of those, reformation by
6	getting to take part in the electoral process it will
7	have some impact onon one of the reasons to hold
8	people in jail in the first place. So, you know, I
9	very much support these bills.
10	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Thank you.
11	DAVID PECHEFSKY: Thanks. So thanks for-
12	-is it on? Yeah, Yeah, it is on. Okay. Thanks very
13	much Council Member Kallos for having this hearing.
14	I'm David Pechefsky, New York City Site Director for
15	Generation Citizen. As you know, we provide awe're
16	working throughout the five boroughs in schools to
17	provide an action civics curriculum. I'm here to
18	testify for high school and New York school students.
19	I'm here to testify in support of 628 and of 695, the
20	bills that pertain directly the young population that
21	we work with. I think or I would say, you know, as
22	some of your council members alluded to that there
23	needs to be a long hand efforts such as these that
24	make voting easier. There also needs to be civic
25	education that explains to people why they are

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 137
2	voting. You know, so we think that the initiative,
3	you know, spearheaded by Council Member Rosenthal and
4	yourself and the other members putting money in on
5	the Youth Voter Registration Initiative is excellent.
6	You know, so we're doing both those things in
7	combination with devotion of resources and
8	legislation is the way to go. And, you know, on the
9	issue ofclearly there needs to be some tracking.
10	We wouldwe would love to be able to say, okay, the
11	impact of our program we could see it. You know,
12	it's something that we wrestle with, and it sounds
13	like there is a path to some kind of tracking. I
14	won't weigh into, you know, to work in progress. I
15	won't weigh into the details, but clearly that needs
16	to happen, and it seems like there is a path for some
17	kind of tracking. So we can see what the impact of
18	these efforts are. So thank you very much for your
19	work and also to members of the committee I look
20	forward to working with you in the future. Thank
21	you.
22	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Thank you.
23	JONATHAN REESE: Okay, thank you. Thank
24	you, Council Member Kallos for bringing these issues
25	forward and all that you're doing to try and get

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 138
2	people more engaged in the Democratic process. I'm
3	Jonathan Reese. I'm also a member of the Big Apple
4	Coffee Party. We would specifically like toI'd
5	specifically like to speak to the, um, to the
6	Resolution 464 on the right to vote for people in
7	jail. There are unfortunately all too many people in
8	jail awaiting trial, and I personally urge you to
9	address that situation in more comprehensive ways.
10	But in the meantime, the least we can do is to make
11	sure that the people who have a right to vote in that
12	circumstance are able to. And so clearly we
13	appreciate this effort to make that actually happen.
14	As, Sally was saying it also gives them a message
15	that they are still valued members of our society
16	despite theirtheir circumstances. I also have a
17	short message from Sally Swisher, who is another one
18	of our members not able to be here. She says, I'm a
19	citizen of the City and State of New York in the
20	United States. I live by the results of the
21	elections and abide by the laws passed and other
22	actions taken by those who are elected. I understand
23	that to be representing democracy, but if a citizen
24	if a citizen is unable to vote at his or her normal
25	polling place because he or she is being held in the

1	COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENTAL OPERATIONS 139						
2	criminal justice system, it seems clear to me that						
3	the system should provide that system with the						
4	absentee ballot, and make sure that he or she has						
5	every opportunity to vote. I want the society I live						
6	in to be ruled by the people, all of the people. It						
7	is the people's law I want to obey, and that law						
8	should come from all of us even those accused of						
9	crimes. Thank you.						
10	CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Thank you very much						
11	for your patience. This is actually one of our						
12	shortest hearings, and thank you for coming out in						
13	support of the two bills, which really do a lot to						
14	get more people registered and voting. Thank you. I						
15	hereby adjourn this meeting of the Governmental						
16	Operations Committee. [gavel]						
17							
18							
19							
20							
21							
22							
23							
24							
25							

1	COMMITTEE	ON	GOVERNMENTAL	OPERATIONS	140
2					
3					
4					
5					
6					
7					
8					
9					
10					
11					
12					
13					
14					
15					
16					
17					
18					
19					
20					
21					
22					
23					
24					
25					
	1				

CERTIFICATE

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date October 4, 2015