

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

August 13, 2015
Start: 2:31 p.m.
Recess: 3:42 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Melissa Mark-Viverito
Speaker

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- Margaret S. Chin
- Rosie Mendez
- Corey D. Johnson
- Daniel R. Garodnick
- Ben Kallos
- Helen K. Rosenthal
- Mark Levine
- Inez E. Dickens
- Ydanis A. Rodriguez
- Andy L. King
- James Vacca
- Fernando Cabrera
- Ritchie J. Torres
- Vanessa L. Gibson
- Maria Del Carmen Arroyo
- Annabel Palma
- Paul A. Vallone
- Peter A. Koo
- Julissa Ferreras

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Costa G. Constantinides
Mark S. Weprin
Rory I. Lancman
Daniel Dromm
James G. Van Bramer
I. Daneek Miller
Ruben Wills
Karen Koslowitz
Elizabeth S. Crowley
Donovan J. Richards
Eric A. Ulrich
Stephen T. Levin
Antonio Reynoso
Laurie A. Cumbo
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Carlos Menchaca
Bradford S. Lander
Mathieu Eugene
Darlene Mealy
Inez D. Barron
Vincent J. Gentile
David G. Greenfield
Jumaane D. Williams
Alan N. Maisel
Mark Treyger
Chaim M. Deutsch
Deborah L. Rose
Steven Matteo
Vincent M. Ignizio

Joseph Potasnik
New York Board of Rabbis and the Chaplain of the
Fire Department of the City of New York

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 3

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
3 chambers. Everyone please have their seat. Everyone
4 have their seat. All rise for the pledge. I pledge
5 allegiance to the flag of the United States of
6 America and to the Republic for which it stands, one
7 nation under God, indivisible with liberty and
8 justice for all. Please be seated. Roll call.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Arroyo?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Here.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron? Cabrera? Chin?
12 Cohen? Constantinides?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy? Crowley?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Here.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Present.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yes.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Dickens?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Here.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene?
COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland?
COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: Garodnick?
COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: Gentile?
COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson?
COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy?
COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: Greenfield?
COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: Johnson?
COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos?
COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: King?
COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Koo?
CHAIRPERSON KOO: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz?
COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman?

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Lander?

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Levin?

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Levine?

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel?

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Mealy? Menchaca?

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.

COUNCIL CLERK: Mendez?

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Miller?

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Palma? Reynoso?

Richards?

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez? Rose?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Torres?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger?

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich? Vacca?

CHAIRPERSON VACCA: Yes.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Vallone?

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here, and
Jimmy's here too.

COUNCIL CLERK: Williams?

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.

COUNCIL CLERK: Wills?

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Present.

COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo? Van Bramer?
Speaker Mark-Viverito?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All rise for the
invocation delivered by Rabbi Joseph Potasnik from
the New York Board of Rabbis and the Chaplain of the
Fire Department of the City of New York representing
the great Manhattan Borough of Manhattan and beyond.
All rise.

JOSEPH POTASNIK: Thank you, Public
Advocate. Firstly, let me give a shout out to the New
York City Youth Council that is here.

[applause]

1
2 JOSEPH POTASNIK: Please know that one
3 day you'll be sitting down here and we'll be up
4 there. Please make it in the distant future.
5 Secondly, I just want to take a moment to recognize
6 my New York City Councilman Steve Levin who recently
7 got married, and I think Steve will learn something
8 that we all learned in law school, that marriage is
9 defined as the loss of liberty in the pursuit of
10 happiness. Thank you. Some years ago, a member of
11 the Norwegian Parliament named Jornsens [sp?]
12 infuriated his constituents by voting for a
13 particular measure. Many of them protested in front
14 of his house, pelted rocks at his windows and then
15 left singing the Norwegian National Anthem. What
16 they didn't realize was Jornsens had written the
17 national anthem. The lesson is that there is a time
18 when people may reject you for a particular position
19 you've taken, but ultimately they will respect you
20 when you are a person of principle. Let us all
21 remember two words in our vocabulary. One is united,
22 the other is untied. Interestingly, both are spelled
23 with the exact same letters. The only difference is
24 where you place the "I." In life, when you only
25 speak of "I" rather than "we" a relationship easily

1
2 becomes untied, but where the "we" takes precedence,
3 that relationship will remain united. So, may we
4 always see each other as people of different faiths,
5 different faces, different philosophies, but there
6 comes that moment when we have to learn to sing that
7 national anthem as members of one family. Amen.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Let us all say
9 amen.

10 COUNCIL MEMBERS: Amen.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.
12 I want to thank Rabbi Potasnik. Quiet in the
13 chambers, please. Quiet in the chambers. Quiet in
14 the chambers. I know call upon for a motion to
15 spread the invocation. Council Member Garodnick?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you very
17 much, Madam Public Advocate. I take great pleasure
18 in welcoming Rabbi Joseph Potasnik to the Council's
19 Stated Meeting today. An influential leader in our
20 community, Rabbi Potasnik, the Executive Vice
21 President for the New York Board of Rabbis has spent
22 43 years in service to congregation Mount Sinai, and
23 in that time he's come to be known as America's Rabbi
24 due to his unyielding faith and strength in times of
25 trouble. So many New Yorkers enjoy hearing his words

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

of wisdom, clear, accessible, and always timely. We count on him for his sound guidance, a quick joke and his warm personal style. He's currently, however, tied with Mayor de Blasio as the most high profile Boston Red Socks fan in New York City, but as a man of faith and integrity I expect that he will not use his spiritual influence in their favor, no matter how much they may need it. Rabbi Potasnik brings together people from all walks of life and unites them to a common purpose, to help make this city a better place for all who live in it. We are so glad to have Rabbi Potasnik here in these chambers, and I proudly move to spread his invocation in full upon the record.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. I also refer to Rabbi Potasnik as my Rabbi. Adoption of minutes, Council Member Koslowitz?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Motion that the minutes of the Stated Meeting of June 26th, 2015 be adopted as printed.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Messages and papers from the Mayor.

COUNCIL CLERK: None.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 10

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication

3 from city, county and borough offices?

4 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and

6 communications?

7 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call-ups?

9 COUNCIL CLERK: M30 to M332. Excuse me,

10 M330 to M3.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Roll call.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Arroyo?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron? Cabrera? Chin?

15 Cohen?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Constantinides?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Crowley?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yes.

COUNCIL CLERK: Dickens?

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm?

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal?

COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene?

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland?

COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Garodnick?

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Gentile? Gibson?

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I vote aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Greenfield?

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Johnson?

COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos?

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: King?

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye, and permission

to vote on all General Orders and Call-ups?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I vote aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Koo?

CHAIRPERSON KOO: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman?

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Lander?

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Levin?

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Levine?

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel?

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Menchaca?

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I vote aye on
all Land Use called items. Permission to vote on
General Orders?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I vote aye on all General Order items and also welcome the Youth Coro [sic] Council Members.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Mendez?

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Miller?

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I vote aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Palma? Reynoso?

Richards?

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Rose?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Torres?

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Permission to vote on all General Orders?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger?

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Vacca?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

CHAIRPERSON VACCA: Aye, and I ask permission to vote on all calendar items?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON VACCA: I vote aye on all. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone?

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Williams?

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Wills?

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Consent to vote on all Land Use Call-ups and calendar orders?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Thank you. I vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo?

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito?

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Today's Land Use Call-ups were adopted by a vote of 39 in the affirmative and 0 in the negative. Quiet in the

1 chambers, please. And now we'll hear from the
2 Speaker, Melissa Mark-Viverito. Quiet in the
3 chambers.
4

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madam
6 Public Advocate. So good afternoon to all my
7 colleagues. I want to ask if people could stand just
8 for a moment. I want to recognize the passing of
9 Sergeant Frank Musella [sp?], a sanitation worker who
10 tragically died in the line of duty last month. Our
11 thoughts and prayers are with Sergeant Musella's
12 friends and family during this difficult time. I
13 would like to say a moment--ask for a moment of
14 silence on his behalf. Thank you, my colleagues.
15 Always have to deeply remember our civil servants and
16 what they do on behalf of this great city each and
17 every day. Here with us today as has been alluded to
18 by different people of the rabbi and some of our
19 colleagues, here with us today in the New York City
20 Youth Council, which is the first ever body of Junior
21 Council Members representing districts across the
22 city of New York. This is run in partnership with
23 the Coro [sp?] New York Leadership Center. The New
24 York City Youth Council is a training program for
25 young people to build their leadership skills, learn

1 about how New York City government works, and the
2 issue in Council districts to represent the ideas and
3 concerns of young people. Each of these young people
4 live in the district that they represent, and they'll
5 be having opportunities to interact with the Council
6 Members that represent those district who they are
7 their constituents. They may be young people, but
8 their voice is important none the less, and they'll
9 be learning a little bit about how government works.
10 I had the opportunity to interact with some of them
11 last week and it was really wonderful. So, we are
12 excited to have you all here today. I think they
13 stood before, but if you could stand again and we
14 could all give them a warm welcome.

15 [applause]

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And if Council
17 Members have not yet their youth Council Member,
18 their young Council Member, please take time and a
19 moment to do that as I will shortly. So moving on to
20 the agenda for today. Today, we're voting on
21 legislation to make animal service facilities in New
22 York City safer, animal service facilities or animal
23 hospitals, kennels, pounds, veterinary clinics, and
24 pet shops where animals are sheltered on a 24-hour
25

1 basis. In recent years there have been a number of
2 fires in these facilities resulting in the deaths of
3 trapped animals, but with a simple sprinkler system,
4 such deaths can be prevented. Under Proposed Intro
5 Number 145A, animal service facilities will be
6 required to install automatic sprinkler systems or
7 provide 24-hour in-person supervision. There is an
8 exception to this requirement for animal service
9 facilities that are or will be in operation on or
10 before December 31st, 2016 and that are equipped with
11 an automated smoke detection system. This is a
12 common sense bill that will prevent needless death of
13 pets and other animals in our city. I thank Council
14 Member Johnson for sponsoring this legislation, and
15 he will say a few words.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam
18 Speaker. Today, the City Council will vote on a bill
19 that animal rights advocates have been pushing since
20 1998. Introduction 145 will put common sense
21 regulations in place to make sure that the lives of
22 our animals are treated with respect and care. It
23 will save untold lives by mandating that fire
24 sprinklers exist in every new establishment that
25 houses animals. When I say that this bill will save

1 lives that is a fact not speculation. Every few
2 years there's another incident in which animals
3 perish in ways that could have been prevented. In
4 2002, over 200 pets lost their lives in one Manhattan
5 fire. In 2008, dozens of animals perished in the
6 Bronx at a fire, and two years later more animals
7 died at another fire at a Queens's site. These
8 tragedies demonstrate that every pet shop and every
9 borough across the city is vulnerable as long as it
10 does not have fire sprinklers. This is why we've been
11 pushing for this bill 1998, because it is grounded in
12 a tragic reality that plays out far too often. We
13 have fought hard for this bill out of respect to our
14 fire fighters as well. Time and again they have
15 bravely into blazing pet shops in order to save the
16 lives of animals that live there. We can greatly
17 diminish the risk that these men and women face if we
18 take this simple act of requiring business owners do
19 the right thing and to install fire sprinklers.
20 Statistics bear out the need for this law. They tell
21 us that establishments with fire sprinklers are 50 to
22 75 percent less likely to experience serious damages
23 when compared to those without them. With data like
24 that and with lives on the line, we must act now. If
25

1 we take this important step we'll prevent unnecessary
2 loss of life and we'll prevent unnecessary danger to
3 our fire fighters. If we do not take this action,
4 however, we'll only have ourselves to blame the next
5 time a fire claims a life that would have been saved
6 by a simpler sprinkler. I want to thank all the
7 advocates and elected officials who got us to this
8 point today. Today's vote would not have been
9 possible without the efforts of extraordinary groups
10 like the ASPCA, the Mayor's Alliance for Animals, the
11 Humane Society, and NYCLAS [sp?]. I want to thank
12 them for all that they do on behalf of animals in our
13 city. I also want to recognize Louis Sheldon-Brown
14 [sp?], my Legislative Director who's away on a much
15 needed vacation, so he's not here for this, and Jen
16 Wilcox, the Counsel to the Committee on Housing and
17 Buildings for her tremendous work. I don't know where
18 she is, but she worked very, very hard on this, and I
19 also want to thank Matt Gewalb [sp?], Laura Popa
20 [sp?] and Rob Newman. Thank you very much, Madam
21 Speaker, and I ask my colleagues to vote in favor of
22 this legislation.
23

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
25 Council Member Johnson. And before we go any further

1 I do want to make sure that we also remember the 12
2 lives that have been loss to Legionnaire's disease,
3 and as we take action steps today to work
4 collectively as a state and as a city to prevent such
5 an outbreak in the future. I hope everyone does keep
6 those individuals, those families and those afflicted
7 in their thoughts and prayers. Next, we have two
8 bills regarding gas station's signage. Last session,
9 the City Council passed legislation to assure that
10 gas prices are accurately displayed on advertisements
11 and road signs. Building on these consumer
12 protections we will pass two bills that clarify the
13 responsibilities of gas station operators when
14 advertising the sale of petroleum products. The
15 first bill, Intro 287A sponsored by Council Member
16 Arroyo requires that if gas stations choose to post
17 advertisements, they must at a minimum post the price
18 inclusive of all taxes for the lowest grade gas
19 offered for sale. Additionally, the bill would also
20 allow gas stations to use LED signs to advertise the
21 price of gas to drivers on the road. These signs are
22 more attractive for some gas station operators and
23 they provide clear information for consumers. the
24 second bill, Intro 586A sponsored by Council Member
25

1
2 Espinal would ensure that if gas stations charge
3 different prices for cash purchases and credit
4 purchases, the price for each form of payment must be
5 clearly stated in all advertising. I would ask, like
6 to ask Council Member Arroyo and then Council Member
7 Espinal to say a few words.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Thank you, Madam
9 Speaker. Good afternoon, everyone. I want to thank
10 Council Member and Chairman Espinal for co-sponsoring
11 Intro 287A with Council Member Koo and brining this
12 bill to the floor through his committee. And I need
13 to thank the staff that worked on this bill. We've
14 been tweaking it for some time, and I want to say a
15 special thank you to Committee Counsel and Deputy
16 Director of Government Affairs Division Rachel
17 Cordero [sp?] who was on it consistently and was able
18 to bring us to this place today. She was so diligent
19 and so thoughtful in the process. I want to thank the
20 current Committee Counsel and Analyst, Lebahni Ramon
21 [sp?] and Israel Martinez. Izzy, way to go. And for
22 their work in bringing us here today. The Mayor's
23 Office Reggie Thomas, and you know, while it seems
24 simple on the face of it, this is a multilayered
25 issue as it relates to important gas station sign

1 requirements and really clarifies the requirements
2 our gas station owners have to inform the public
3 without overburdening them, especially the small
4 business owners, and to eliminate putting owners in
5 conflict with our zoning regulations in their attempt
6 to adhere to the Administrative Code. Our goal has
7 always been to work with all sides to hear the
8 concerns, to make the legislation better, stronger,
9 and more importantly, clearer for everyone who has to
10 deal with it to comply with it. I want to urge my
11 colleagues to vote in favor, and I want to take a
12 moment to introduce Tatanya [sp?] Maria Privera
13 [sp?], my New York Youth Council Member. Where are
14 you? I haven't had a chance to meet you. Everyone
15 wave and say hi to Tatanya. Thank you, Madam
16 Speaker.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Thank you, Madam
19 Speaker. I'm going to talk on Intro 586. Last
20 session, the previous council passed a law that
21 requires all gas stations to erect road signs that
22 state the price per gallon for each grade of gasoline
23 and every form of payment. For example, cash,
24 credit, or debit. It was the intent to inform the
25 consumer what they will pay at the pump, but as a

1 result of this law, many gas stations would have been
2 left with no choice but to erect signs the size of
3 billboards. It would have been unworkable for
4 smaller gas stations in an area with zoning
5 restrictions for larger signs. It's clear at the
6 time the Council's intent was to protect the
7 consumer, however, in retrospect, we have seen that
8 in practice the law was complicated and convoluted
9 which made it impossible for DCA to create a standard
10 for gas stations to comply with. Today, my bill will
11 successfully clarify and simplify this burdensome
12 regulation by being more flexible and requiring that
13 gas stations at minimum post different price points
14 for regular gasoline instead of every grade, allowing
15 gas station owners to keep and rearrange their
16 current signs and not forcing them to spend thousands
17 of dollars to upgrade. It would also create more
18 transparency at the pump by giving the consumer the
19 different price points for regular gasoline and an
20 overall idea of what to expect to pay for other
21 grades of gasoline when using different forms of
22 payments. I want to thank the Speaker, and I want to
23 thank the Committee Staff for all the hard work.
24 It's something we've been working on for months. As
25

1
2 simple as it might sound, it was very complicated to
3 strike that balance where the consumer is protects
4 and the small business owner is not hurt. So, thank
5 you for all your work.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
7 Council Member. Additionally, I want to mention that
8 today Council Member Ritchie Torres and I are
9 introducing a resolution calling upon Congress to
10 eliminate the Medicaid reimbursement cap for Puerto
11 Rico. Puerto Rico's facing an economic crisis and
12 healthcare costs pay a big role. Lifting this cap,
13 which is not placed on any states would go a long way
14 to help. We all know the deep connection between New
15 York City and Puerto Rico, but Puerto Ricans are also
16 American citizens, and Congress has a responsibility
17 to act. Puerto Ricans, as US citizens, who buy into
18 the system and pay the same Medicare taxes, yet the
19 island receives less healthcare funding than any of
20 the 50 states. And why is the health of Puerto
21 Ricans worth less than that of other Americans. The
22 situation is beyond shameful, and it gets worse.
23 Puerto Rico is currently facing one of the greatest
24 fiscal and economic crisis in modern history and the
25 austerity measures necessary for its fiscal wellbeing

1 are sure to take a toll on public health services.
2 Puerto Rican families deserve access to affordable
3 high quality healthcare. This is not a privilege. It
4 is a right for every US citizen. Puerto Rican
5 community has contributed greatly to this nation's
6 society, culture, armed forces, and beyond. We
7 cannot abandon them now at this time of need, and we
8 must act now to save Puerto Rico's healthcare system,
9 and I want to thank Council Member Torres for his
10 leadership. Next, we have a package of bills to
11 protect tenants in rent regulated units from
12 harassment and intimidation by landlords who want
13 them to accept buy-out offers. Buy-outs refer to the
14 practice of landlords offering tenants money to
15 vacate their units. While the offering of a buy-out
16 is legal, a tenant has the right to refuse the offer
17 and landlords must respect that decisions. The three
18 bills sponsored by Council Member Garodnick, Council
19 Member Williams and myself will do the following: Ban
20 landlords from threatening tenants, contacting
21 tenants repeatedly at odd hours, contacting tenants
22 at their place of employment without permission, and
23 falsifying or misrepresenting information. Ban
24 landlords from contacting tenants about additional
25

1
2 buy-out offers within 180 days of being informed in
3 writing that the tenant is not interested in hearing
4 additional offers. Require that landlords inform
5 tenants of their rights from presenting a buy-out
6 offer. New Yorkers have the right to be free of all
7 forms of harassment. No one should feel pressured,
8 intimidated or coerced to accept a buy-out offer they
9 don't want to take. These laws will protect tenants
10 and keep the process of buyout offers fair and
11 honest. And I would like Council Member Garodnick
12 and then Council Member Williams to say a few words.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you very
14 much, Madam Speaker. I want to thank you and Chairs
15 Williams and Espinal for their advocacy on these
16 bills. You know, from Stuyvesant Town to every
17 corner of New York City landlords have always felt a
18 compulsion to try to move rent stabilized tenants out
19 of their units in order to drive out rent. Not all
20 of them have acted on those instincts, but it is
21 obvious that lower rent units are less desirable for
22 a landlord's bottom line, and those who are most
23 determined to get tenants out have resorted to some
24 of the most unscrupulous behaviors around, breaking
25 locks, turning off heat or hot water, starving a

1 building of repairs, or even filing frivolous
2 lawsuits. It has prompted this council to take
3 action in recent years. In our first term, Speaker
4 Mark-Viverito and I authored a bill giving a right to
5 tenants to sue for harassment. Last year, Chair
6 Williams, Council Member Torres and I formed a
7 coalition to fight back against predatory equity in
8 housing, and this Council has even funded an
9 initiative stabilizing NYC in each of the last two
10 years to train tenants to coordinate their efforts to
11 organize and respond to abuse. One type of abuse has
12 taken a more unusual form. Some building owners have
13 taken a step of offering tenants in lower rent
14 apartments financial incentives to convince them that
15 it is in their interest to leave their homes. And
16 while that practice may sound innocent enough, it
17 frequently is not. In recent year, landlords have
18 increasingly retained the services of what is known
19 as tenant relocation specialists, agents of the
20 landlord who make buy-out offers to tenants. Too
21 often these tenant relocation specialists intimidate,
22 threaten and otherwise harass tenants using any means
23 necessary to get them to accept the buy-out offers
24 that are on the table. We have heard reports of
25

1
2 their knocking on doors at all hours of the night,
3 following people to work, and even contacting family
4 members to get them to convince you that the buy-out
5 offer is good enough for you to leave your home. We
6 already have a word for these kind of tactics. It's
7 called harassment, plain and simple. So, we are
8 expanding the definition of harassment to include the
9 worst tactics used by tenant relocation specialists
10 as they try to induce tenants to leave their
11 regulated units. Threatening, intimidating,
12 initiating communication with such frequency at
13 unusual hours or at a place of work, or knowingly
14 falsifying information provided to a tenant, that's
15 harassment, and that's no longer going to fly with
16 the action that we are taking today. So, again,
17 Madam Speaker, thanks to you and to Chairs Espinal
18 and Williams. I believe that these bills taken
19 together represent a significant step forward in
20 creating a more fair environment for tenants of this
21 city, and I thank you.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I'd like to
23 also thank the Speaker, Melissa Mark-Viverito, my
24 colleague Dan Garodnick and Chair Espinal for their
25 leadership in pushing these legislations package

1 forward. Obviously, this is not aimed at all
2 landlords and all property owners, but there are too
3 many unscrupulous owners, particularly of rent
4 stabilized building who will do anything to have a
5 tenant vacate their apartment, including hiring a
6 tenant relocater to get the job done. In New York
7 City there has been a history of owners offering
8 tenants money to vacate their apartments. In recent
9 years, however, there have been complaints from
10 tenants that buy-outs have become a form of
11 harassment as my colleague has just talked about.
12 The issues arise most frequently when building owners
13 have hired these tenant relocation specialists, many
14 of whom receive a fee for each vacancy, to try to
15 convince tenants, many of whom are rent regulated, to
16 leave their apartments. Tenants don't deserve to be
17 intimidated out of their homes and should be informed
18 of their rights to refuse buy-out offers. Often
19 times, this is happening in areas that are gentrified
20 or gentrifying, or speculated to be gentrified. And
21 if you have never experienced this, you can imagine
22 being incessantly asked about getting money for your
23 apartment. If you pack onto that that you might be a
24 senior citizen, you might not understand the English
25

1 language as well as the person who is incessantly
2 asking you, or you may not understand how the laws
3 work and may actually believe that you must accept
4 the buy-out and leave your home. There are also
5 people who believe that, 5-10,000, 15,000 dollars
6 sounds like a lot of money, particularly if you are
7 in dire straits, but you quickly learn that it goes
8 nowhere when you cannot find an apartment for 1,000,
9 1,200 or 1,300 or 1,400 dollars. And we know that
10 this is, as was mentioned, just becomes a form of
11 harassment. My bill specifically says that the offers
12 must be made in writing. It must explain that the
13 tenant has a right to refuse the buy-out and that the
14 landlord would then have to cease for some time
15 before they suggest another buy-out. If the tenant
16 wants to continue discussion, they have to put in
17 writing asking that they continue the conversations
18 or a judge who has had a case in the courtroom can
19 say that these two parties are now having this
20 discussion. I think together this package really gets
21 to something that many people are silently often
22 times dealing with and many people unfortunately lose
23 their homes, and it's not just bad for the person who
24 is losing their home, but for that entire community
25

1 who may eventually be using an affordable unit that
2 will never be returned. So, as Chair of the Housing
3 and Buildings Committee, I'm very proud of this
4 package. We'll combat such egregious tenant
5 harassment behavior along with other legislations
6 from Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito and Dan Garodnick.
7 It will also contribute the Mayor's affordable
8 housing goal, which has so far financed the creation,
9 preservation of more than 20,000 affordable units,
10 but we can't get to the goal of 200,000 if we lose
11 units to harassment. I would once again like to
12 thank Speaker, Chair Espinal, Council Member
13 Garodnick, as well as my staff, Nick Smith, my
14 Committee Staff who assembled the hearing and this
15 legislation, Jen Wilcox [sp?], Guiermo Patino [sp?],
16 Jose Conde [sp?], and Sarah Gasselum [sp?]. I'd also
17 like to thank the great Matt Gewalb and Jeff Baker
18 for their hard work.

19
20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
21 Council Member. And finally, we're going to be
22 voting on legislation to regulate cooling towers as
23 part of the city's response to their recent outbreak
24 of Legionnaire's Disease. Public health officials
25 with whom we are working closely have indicated that

1
2 this outbreak is linked to cooling towers in the
3 South Bronx. The city currently does not have a
4 registry of these towers or any firm requirements for
5 maintaining, testing or cleaning them. This bill will
6 change that by doing four important things. First of
7 all, require that all cooling towers in the city be
8 registered with the Department of Buildings so we
9 know how many there are and where they are. Second,
10 the law will require that building owners develop and
11 implement a maintenance program for their cooling
12 towers. This program would have to comply with the
13 most recent professional engineering standards.
14 Third, owners would have to test the water in the
15 cooling towers on a quarterly basis, and if those
16 tests show microbes such as the bacteria that can
17 cause Legionnaire's Disease, the owner would have to
18 let the city know and then clean and disinfect the
19 system in accordance with standards set by the
20 Department of Health and Mental Hygiene. Owners that
21 fail to do so would face substantial penalties.
22 Fourth, the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene
23 will collaborate with the Department of Buildings
24 would provide an annual report on compliance with
25 this law as well recommendations for expanding these

1 requirements to other kinds of equipment that may be
2 a source of disease-causing bacteria. We're in the
3 midst of an emergency in New York City and this
4 legislation is the proper course of action to deal
5 with a crisis of this magnitude, but I also have to
6 recognize the tremendous work of our partners in
7 government and give my sincere thanks to Mayor de
8 Blasio, Governor Cuomo, City Department of Health and
9 Mental Hygiene Commissioner Mary Bassett, and New
10 York State Health Commissioner Howard Zucker [sp?].
11 Thanks to collaboration and a focus on finding real
12 solutions, our city and state government are taking
13 very real action in response to this situation. I
14 also want to give recognition the Council's
15 Legislative Staff who have been working around the
16 clock on this bill and others. Their commitment and
17 hard work are the reason we're able to come together
18 in times of need and quickly deliver a quality
19 response to the issues we are facing. I want to
20 thank the staff that worked on all of these bills,
21 Jennifer Wilcox, Guigero Patino [sp?], Jose Conde
22 [sp?], Sarah Gastelum [sp?], Rachel Cordero [sp?],
23 Labani Raham [sp?], Ed Atkin [sp?], Jeff Baker, Matt
24 Gewalb. And with that, I'd like to call on my
25

1
2 colleagues who are cosponsoring this legislation with
3 me to say a few words, and we can start off with
4 Council Member Gibson followed by Council Member
5 Johnson and then Council Member Williams.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you very
7 much. Thank you, Madam Speaker and good afternoon.
8 Thank you, Madam Public Advocate. Good afternoon,
9 ladies and gentleman, too all of my colleagues. As I
10 rise to speak on this very important legislation that
11 we will soon be voting on, I first and foremost want
12 to express my sincere thoughts and prayers to all the
13 families who have been impacted by this devastating
14 outbreak of Legionnaire's Disease in our city. We
15 pray for those 12 families who have lost their loved
16 ones and we continue to pray for those who remain
17 hospitalized, fighting to get stronger and healed
18 from this illness. My colleagues, today is a
19 significant step of progress in our fight against
20 this recent outbreak and our efforts to prevent an
21 outbreak of this magnitude from every occurring in
22 our city. They systems that filter the air that we
23 breathe must be properly maintained, and this
24 legislation will ensure that all of our building
25 owners are working to expeditiously remediate any

1
2 problem they may find in their cooling towers. I
3 truly believe that this bill put forth today is a
4 comprehensive piece of legislation that answers a
5 call to action that we have all been making over the
6 past several weeks. Since it became clear that this
7 outbreak just ask the one recently last year in Co-Op
8 City was related to legionella growth in cooling
9 towers. This outbreak requires immediate coordinated
10 and legislative action to put in place long term
11 solutions and a plan to address the inspections, the
12 maintenance and cleaning of all cooling towers as we
13 move forward. This legislation that we put forth
14 today addresses the main four elements that I believe
15 are truly necessary to fight Legionnaire's Disease on
16 a local level. We will identify all cooling towers in
17 this city and maintain a registry within the
18 Department of Buildings. We will require the
19 quarterly maintenance and cleaning of all cooling
20 towers. We will require quarterly inspections of all
21 of these cleaning towers by a qualified independent
22 third party. And when a problem is found, we will
23 require the immediate remediation and proof that that
24 remediation has been completed. As of now, there are
25 121 people that have contracted the Legionnaire's

1 Disease, and sadly, 12 people have lost their lives.
2 We cannot and will not lose sight of the reason for
3 this legislation and the people, our fellow brothers
4 and sisters, who are behind those numbers. My
5 sincere thanks to everyone for the incredible
6 leadership starting with our Speaker of the Council,
7 Melissa Mark-Viverito, our Mayor, Bill de Blasio, to
8 all of my City Council colleagues, all of colleagues
9 in the Bronx delegation. Thank you for supporting
10 such a worthy and important measure. Thank you to the
11 amazing Health Commissioner Doctor Mary Bassett and
12 DOHMH for their aggressive efforts during this
13 critical time. To all of our city agencies who have
14 been partners with us, in addition to DOHMH, HHC,
15 NYPD, FDNY, Office of Emergency Management, DEP, DOB,
16 and the Mayor's Office. I also extend my sincere
17 thanks to the Bronx Borough President Ruben Diaz,
18 Junior and his entire team for their commitment
19 during this time. We are grateful and appreciate all
20 of the partnership and support of all of our state
21 elected officials, our governor and Centers for
22 Disease Control. The last several weeks have been
23 extremely challenging for us in the Bronx, in the
24 district that I represent, and I am thankful for the
25

1
2 outpouring of thoughts, prayers and all of the
3 support along the way. Every outreach effort, town
4 hall, conference call, daily briefing, discussions
5 with residents in the community has been a collective
6 effort to raise the level of awareness and educate
7 the public on Legionnaire's Disease. We have come a
8 long way from the day that this outbreak struck the
9 Bronx, and I want to applaud my staff in the district
10 office and my Communications Director, Dana Wax
11 [sp?], for their tireless work, and I also recognize
12 the Mayor's Community Affairs Unit, our Commissioner
13 Margo Carrion [sp?], our Bronx Director, Elvin Garcia
14 [sp?], for helping us as we coordinated a number of
15 very important and informative town halls in the
16 community. As the Speaker alluded, thank you to the
17 very best City Council Staff, Matt Gewalb, Jennifer
18 Wilcox, Guiermo Patino, Ed Atkins, Ramon Martinez,
19 Jose Conde [sp?], Jeff Baker. Thank you all for
20 working around the clock to get this bill forward.
21 We, as a city, will push forward in an aggressive way
22 and in the spirit of those lives we have lost, we
23 take bold action today to prevent any outbreak from
24 occurring again. My heartfelt thanks and appreciation
25 once again to our Speaker and all of my colleagues

1
2 for supporting this legislation, and I am proud to
3 have been a partner in this process along the way and
4 look forward to all of the work ahead, and I also
5 recognize my fellow co-sponsors Chair of Health,
6 Council Member Corey Johnson and Housing Chair
7 Council Member Jumaane Williams. Thank you, Madam
8 Public Advocate, for your work, your leadership, your
9 presence, participation, and thank you once again to
10 our Speaker. Thank you.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam
12 Speaker. Thank you, Council Member Gibson. I too
13 want to echo my condolences and thoughts to the
14 families that lost a loved one and the individuals
15 who are recovering from Legionnaire's Disease. I
16 believe that the Speaker and Council Member Gibson
17 laid out pretty well what this legislation seeks to
18 accomplish today. So, I am not going to repeat that.
19 I would like to speak a little bit on the public
20 health impact and how I think our city did during
21 this time. In a city of over eight million people
22 these things happen. That is not to diminish the
23 lives that have been lost and the people that have
24 gotten sick, but public health outbreaks happen.
25 Less than a year ago we saw an Ebola scare in our

1
2 city. Earlier this year, we saw a small outbreak of
3 whooping cough in Midwood and in Williamsburg.

4 Earlier this year we saw cases of tuberculosis in
5 Sunset Park, and in each instance, the Department of
6 Health and Mental Hygiene coordinated with other city
7 agencies put their disease detectives on the case and
8 went right to the root cause of how to deal with the
9 outbreak. We know what to do in times of crisis.

10 This situation has been slightly different. The
11 Legionnaire's outbreak has been larger than we
12 expected. On average each year, there are about 200
13 people that are infected with Legionnaire's in New
14 York City, that's over the course of a year. This
15 was a very high number in a small period of time, but
16 our city's Department of Health and Mental Hygiene in
17 coordination with the State Health Department has
18 done an incredible job at getting to the root of all
19 this, but the measure of city government and the
20 measure of us as a legislative body is what do we do
21 in these times to ensure that future outbreaks are
22 less likely to occur and that less lives are lost.

23 That is what this legislation seeks to accomplish, to
24 get qualitative and quantitative data on where these
25 cooling towers exist and how quickly they can be

1
2 remediated in the future. So, I'm very proud that in
3 this very difficult time the City Council has acted
4 in a swift and thorough way, and I look forward to
5 seeing this legislation put into practice so that we
6 actually can ensure that in the future less lives are
7 lost. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I too first
9 want to say condolences and keep our prayers with the
10 families of the 12 New Yorkers who lost their lives
11 and the people who are still currently sick. Thank
12 you to the Speaker for her leadership and Council
13 Member Johnson, of course, Council Member Vanessa
14 Gibson for her leadership for the people in the
15 Bronx. Obviously, we've learned in recent weeks,
16 without proper maintenance, cooling towers can accrue
17 an overgrowth of legionella causing what has proven
18 to be a fatal outcome for far too many New Yorkers
19 and can grow and become--cause many people to become
20 sick with a breakout like we have seen. I think this
21 bill today is a great representation of government
22 responding quickly and effectively and decisively
23 when faced with a crisis, and I hope that New Yorkers
24 are paying attention and are proud of what the city
25 is doing and what government is doing, and I'm also

1
2 thankful that no one else has gotten sick since
3 August 3rd, which also says to me that our city
4 officials were on the ground doing what they needed
5 to do to reach that benchmark. I'm also thankful
6 that other levels of government joined in, and I'm
7 also more thankful that we are now giving a united
8 voice to New Yorkers which they deserve. We should
9 proud that we were able to prevent people from
10 panicking. We were able to make sure that it would
11 cease as soon as possible, and with this legislation
12 we now have a template for which to follow in case we
13 are faced with this again, and believe that this
14 template will be spread hopefully across the state as
15 a great way to deal with this issue. And we have to
16 keep in mind again that this is an issue we have not
17 faced previously, and I believe we are now showing
18 that we can face things as they come. So, I just
19 want to say thank you again and look forward to
20 voting on this legislation.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
22 Council Member. And today, we are saying goodbye to
23 our Assistant General Counsel, Jeremy Lofker [sp?].
24 Jeremy has been with the Council since May of 2013.
25 He has worked with Council Members and staff on a

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

wide range of ethics matters including conflicts of interest issues and transparency resolutions as well as litigation and transactions. And of course, everyone knows Jeremy for his great work as the Council's Anti-discrimination and Harassment Trainer. We love doing those every year. So, with that, thank you so much for all your support and all your work, Jeremy, and good luck in your future endeavors.

[applause]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And with that, end of communication from the Speaker.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Thank you, Jeremy. Discussion of General Orders? Seeing none. Report of Special Committees?

COUNCIL CLERK: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of Standing Committees?

COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee on Consumer Affairs, Intro 287A gas station price displays.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on General Orders.

COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 586A, gas price advertising.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on General Orders.

COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 682A.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on General Orders.

COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee on Finance, Pre-considered Reso 817, organization funding.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on General Orders.

COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee on Housing and Buildings, Intro 145A, animal service facilities.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on General Orders.

COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 700A, disclosures regarding by-out offers.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on General Orders.

COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 757A, harassment related to buy-out offers.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on General Orders.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 44

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Pre-considered Intro 866,
3 regulation of cooling towers.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on General
5 Orders with a message of necessity.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee on
7 Land Use, Pre-considered LU 270 and Reso 819, school
8 building.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
10 General Orders.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Pre-considered LU 271 and
12 Reso 820 through Pre-considered LU 273 and Reso 822,
13 school facility Council District 25.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Give me one
15 second. Coupled on General Orders.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 257 and Reso 823
17 through LU 259 and Reso 825, sidewalk cafes.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
19 General Orders.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 260 and Reso 826
21 through LU 263 and Reso 829, West Side Federation for
22 Senior and Supportive Housing.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
24 General Orders.

25

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 45

2 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 264 and Reso 830 and
3 LU 265 and Reso 831, zoning amendments.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
5 General Orders.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 266 and Reso 832,
7 zoning amendment.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on General
9 Orders.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 267 and Reso 833 and
11 LU 268 and Reso 834, Melrose Commons.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
13 General Orders.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 269 and Reso 835, UDAP
15 Manhattan.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
17 General Orders.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: On the General Order
19 Calendar, Resolution appointing various persons,
20 Commissioner of Deeds.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on General
22 Orders, and at this time I ask for a roll call on all
23 items on the Coupled General Order Calendar.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
25 chambers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COUNCIL CLERK: Arroyo?
COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen?
COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Constantinides?
COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy?
COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye on all.
COUNCIL CLERK: Crowley?
COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye on all.
COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo?
COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye on all.
COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch?
COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye on all.
COUNCIL CLERK: Dickens?
COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm?
COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal?
COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene?
COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.
COUNCIL CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland?
COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COUNCIL CLERK: Garodnick?

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson?

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to quickly explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Madam Public Advocate. I want to congratulate all of our colleagues for passing important legislation today. Thank you to Council Members Johnson, Arroyo, Espinal, Garodnick, Williams, and the Speaker. Thank you so much for protecting our animals and our pets, our tenants, and for those of us drivers, our gas cards. I vote aye on all. Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Greenfield?

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you. I vote aye on all. I congratulate my colleagues and I think Jeremy Plothker [sp?] for this outstanding service here at the New York City Council.

COUNCIL CLERK: Johnson.

COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I vote aye on all. I also want to thank Jeremy Plothker and thank Zack Kern [sp?], my Youth Council Member for being here today. Aye on all.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos?

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Permission to explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you to my colleagues for your leadership in this Legionnaire's outbreak, and a warm and special thank you to Jeremy Plothker for all of your service to the Council for the years and keeping us all out of trouble. I vote aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Koo?

CHAIRPERSON KOO: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye on all, and I wish Jeremy lots of good luck.

COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman? Lander?

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Levin?

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very much to Jeremy for making sure that I always filled out my disclosure forms and that we all did in keeping with the laws of the city. I vote aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Levine?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Also want to congratulate Jeremy and wish you best of luck in your new life as a real estate mogul. Don't forget the little people. And I vote aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel?

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Mealy?

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Mendez?

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Permission to explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote aye on everything, and I vote no on Pre-considered LU 270 and Resolution 819. This is a school siting and unfortunately I cannot vote for this because the School Construction Authority has not done what I believe is its due diligence to try to keep an 1898 historic wall in place while they build another building. Thank you very much.

COUNCIL CLERK: Miller?

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I vote aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso?

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye on all.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COUNCIL CLERK: Richards?

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS:

Congratulations, Jeremy and thank you for harassing us every Stated to get those disclosure forms signed, every Stated, and I also would just like to say thank you to two interns who are leaving me this summer, after this summer, Carole Saylee [sp?] and Olive Picqua [sp?]. Thank you for your hard work this summer. We really appreciate it. God bless you guys on your journey as you're going to do greater things, and I vote aye on all. Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Rose?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I want to say good luck, Jeremy. I think you're going to miss us as much as we miss you. I know we made your day. I want to say and acknowledge my New York City Council Youth Member, Isaac, who is a wonderful intern and I know he's going to be a great City Council Youth Member, and I vote aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I vote aye on all. I want to congratulate my colleagues on their hard work, hard and successful work, and had I known

1
2 that Jeremy was going to become a real estate mogul,
3 I would have been nicer to him this whole time.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to
6 explain my vote?

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I'd like to
9 commend all my colleagues on their bills today and
10 certainly commend our Speaker and her staff that
11 worked very swiftly and diligently on legislation to
12 address the Legionnaire's outbreak. I want to
13 commend, give a big shout out to Council Member
14 Gibson who has been a very fierce advocate for her
15 district in this time. The bill certainly increases
16 accountability for both the property owners as well
17 as the government. I just want to note this, I think
18 we need to also examine the manufacturer's role of
19 these cooling towers, because there have been reports
20 where some people have been trying to clean these
21 cooling towers, and yet, this disease still showed
22 up, and if that is the case and they've been
23 following industry guidelines, then the manufacturers
24 need to update and modify their guidelines in light
25 of the outbreak here in the South Bronx. With that,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

I again commend my colleagues and all the leadership to get these bills passed enacted, and I vote aye on all. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich?

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Yes.

COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone?

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Williams?

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I be excused to explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: First, I just want to say thank you and congratulate to my Youth Council Member, Ariana Brown [sic], who's up there some place. Congratulations. And wish Jeremy Plothker great luck in his new endeavors. I'm voting aye on all with the exception of Intro 145A, which I'm voting no. I wanted to explain it before I get all the calls and possible protests. One, I do think it's a great bill. I congratulate Council Member Johnson. I'm glad we had the hearing in my committee. It also shows that the City Council does care about animals, our furry and non-furry friends. My main

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

concern is there is one small subset in there of small business owners who are unaffiliated with national chains who will be hit with possible 9,000 dollars within a year. I hope we could have expended that just a little bit to give them some more time. I, myself, am a former small business owner. Although my business did fail, I did get a lot of experience, and I also have one of these in my district. I do think it's a great bill, a needed bill, just for that small subset my hope is that we would have just a little bit more time to give them, to do what actually needs to be done I'm glad will be done, but for that reason I'll be voting no, and aye on all the rest.

COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo?

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: I'm voting no on 682, 757 and 700. Congratulations to Jeremy. Aye on the rest.

COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito?

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: While the clerks are tallying the vote, I urge all of my colleagues to join me in cosponsoring Intro 875, 876. These bills would help to make pedestrians safer by developing a

1 pilot program to install green light arrow turn
2 signals in the most dangerous intersections for
3 pedestrians and to increase reporting of pedestrian
4 injuries and deaths resulting from automobile's
5 unlawful failure to yield. And while New York City
6 has made great progress over the last year in
7 reducing the number of pedestrian deaths, we still
8 have work ahead of us and these bills are common
9 sense measures that will go a long way in preventing
10 avoidable tragedies by increasing the number of
11 protected left turn signals at large intersections
12 and taking a closer look at locations with chronic
13 right-of-way violations. We can make Vision Zero a
14 reality. I urge my colleagues to join me in
15 cosponsoring 875, 876. Are there results yet? Thank
16 you. Thank you. All items on today's General Order
17 Calendar were adopted by a vote of 42 in the
18 affirmative, 0 negative and 0 abstentions with the
19 exception of LU's 270 and Reso 819, which was adopted
20 by a vote of 41 in the affirmative, 1 negative and 0
21 abstentions and Intro 145A which was adopted by a
22 vote of 41 in the affirmative, 1 negative and 0
23 abstentions, and the revised Land Use Call-ups were
24 adopted by a vote of 41 in the affirmative, 1
25

1 negative and 0--excuse me. The revised Land Use
2 Call-ups were adopted by a vote of 42 in the
3 affirmative, 0 negative, and Intro 682 which is
4 adopted by a vote of 41 in the affirmative, 1
5 negative, and Intro 700A which was adopted by a vote
6 of 41 in the affirmative, 1 negative, and Intro 757A
7 which was adopted by a vote of 41 in the affirmative
8 and 1 negative and 0 abstentions. Introduction and
9 reading of bills.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All bills are
12 referred to committees as indicated on the agenda.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We do not have any
14 resolutions, and so we're going to immediately go to
15 General Discussion beginning with Council Member Inez
16 Dickens.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Thank you,
18 Madam Public Advocate. Diabetes is a disease that can
19 lead to serious health problems and death if not
20 properly taken care of. According to the CDC report
21 of 2014, 29.1 million or 9.3 percent of the US
22 population has diabetes, and blacks, Latinos and
23 children and older adults are more likely to develop
24 the disease. Still, with all the information and
25 advocacy available, diabetes is the seventh leading

1
2 cause of death in the United States and is linked to
3 heart disease, blindness, kidney failure, and lower
4 extremity amputations. Something must be done to
5 bring awareness and prevent that this awful epidemic
6 continues to spread. I urge my colleagues to sign
7 onto Intro 870 that will create a task force to
8 evaluate the epidemic in the City of New York and
9 will prove a comprehensive and strategic way to
10 reduce this epidemic. I want to extend my condolences
11 to the family of the 12 persons who have died as a
12 result of Legionnaire's Disease. I want to extend my
13 thanks and assistance to Council Member Gibson and
14 the entire Bronx delegation, including the Bronx
15 Borough President for working so diligently and
16 responding to this difficult health challenge.
17 Jeremy, I know that everybody has said thank you. I
18 extend that I'm very pleased that you're moving on,
19 however, whoever's going to take your place to bring
20 these disclosure forms, they might have their hand in
21 a cast next. Hopefully, I can meet my Youth Council
22 Member also. Thank you.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Quiet
24 in the chambers. We're still in session. Council
25 Member Rosenthal?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you.

Colleagues, on the 25th anniversary of the passage of the ADA, it disappoints me to say that while disability rights are civil rights, for far too long our city has looked the other way when it comes to accommodating people with disabilities. If you had joined us on the steps of City Hall this morning, you would have experienced the first outdoor press conference that was fully accessible for people with mobility disabilities and hearing loss or deafness. Technology has come a long way. Because of the hearing induction loops, those with T-coil hearing aids could clearly hear the speakers. For those with little or no hearing, the cart [sic] system put the words on the screen and two American Sign Language interpreters signed the entire press event. Representatives from 15 advocacy organizations and school attended and spoke. There were two especially powerful moments. Jerry Bergman [sp?], a staunch advocate for people with hearing loss, spoke about not only not being able to go to movies without subtitles, not being able to go to most Broadway shows, the Apple Store, or out to dinner with his wife, because the white noise drowns out

1 conversation. Student leaders, secondly, student
2 leaders representing CUNY's ADA Committee spoke on
3 behalf of 9,000 CUNY students with disabilities. In
4 fact, one in five people ages 18 to 45 are hard of
5 hearing and the percentage goes up as people age.
6 Today, Council Member Torres and I are introducing
7 three bills to enable people with disabilities to
8 participate in civic life. I urge you to look at
9 Intros 883, 882 and 881 and sign on as co-sponsors.
10 Thank you.

11
12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
13 Council Member Williams?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.
15 Today, I just want to take a moment to thank many of
16 my interns for their service this summer. I'm going
17 to ask all of them to please stand up, all of my
18 interns that will be leaving please stand up. I want
19 to thank Josh Wallman [sp?], Hassine Ishrik [sp?],
20 Simone Hylet [sp?], Timothy Grumster [sp?], Dinaysha
21 Guadalupe [sp?], Timon Atalli [sp?], Ian David
22 Becker, Edward Archer, and Dylan Paisley [sp?]. I
23 just want to say thank you guys so much for all the
24 work that you did this summer, and I wish you the
25 best of luck. Thank you.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Best of luck,
3 gentleman. Council Member Levine?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, Madam
5 Public Advocate. I want to call my colleagues
6 attentions to two items. First, is Intro 868 which
7 would require the city's Department of Information
8 Technology and Telecommunications to create a plan to
9 modernize our 911 system which today relies on
10 traditional voice calls only, and we want to see it
11 upgraded to so-called IP and internet protocol system
12 which would allow New Yorkers to contact emergency
13 services via text and send videos and photos if
14 appropriate. There are many circumstances where
15 texting is a safer way to contact emergency services,
16 particularly in the case domestic violence incidents,
17 and for this reason, jurisdictions around the state
18 and country have already upgraded to these more
19 advanced systems. And there are many cases where
20 having a photo or a video can also aid emergency
21 responders and investigators later. Secondly, I want
22 to call colleague's attention to--excuse me, Intro--
23 the clock is ticking--eight something, which calls on
24 city's Department of Transportation to create a plan
25 for supporting the growth of car sharing services by

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

coming to an agreement on how they can have dedicated parking spots on our city. This is an effort to give New Yorkers--thank you. 873, thank you Council Member Kallos. This is an effort to give New Yorkers an alternative to private car ownership. One of these little car shares, they're very small, they're half the size of a normal car, could replace dozens of privately owned vehicles, relieving congestion, relieving pollution. This is an environmentally friendly measure and we want to facilitate the growth of New York City by giving a resolution to the challenges of parking of these car-share vehicles. Thank you very much.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: That was Intro 873. Council Member Kallos?

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I rise to recognize two of my summer interns who are here with us today on their last day with my office, Danielle Segal [sp?] and Piper Sharon [sp?]. Danielle's a senior at Stuyvesant High School and has previously interned with the Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer and the American Cancer Society. Piper Sharon is a resident of my district, volunteered with on my then longshot City Council campaign. She's a

1 graduate of my Alma Mater, Bronx Science. Also,
2 interned with Senator Chuck Schumer and was a
3 finalist in the New York City Campaign Finance for
4 its 2015 Youth Poet Laureate Slam. She's currently
5 attending Johns Hopkins University. Piper and
6 Danielle have been an important part of our
7 Constituent Services Team throughout the summer and
8 have helped with hundreds if not thousands of people
9 in my district. Thank you for all of your hard work
10 this summer. We look forward to great things that
11 you will accomplish.

12
13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Congratulations
14 and good luck. Council Member Cornegy?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Thank you, Madam
16 Public Advocate. I would like to briefly speak on a
17 bill introducing in continuing effort to ensure that
18 city government's interactions with small businesses
19 are supportive and not punitive. I've joined with
20 Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer to develop
21 Intro 867. This bill would expand the list of
22 violations that a storefront business can address by
23 correcting the problem rather than incurring a fine,
24 improvise the language services that are needed to
25 document these cures, even if they're not fluent in

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

English. This is an important update to ensure that immigrant businesses are able to avoid fines and future violations. I hope that you will join us by signing on as co-sponsors, all of my colleagues. I'd also just like to thank my interns, which I believe are the finest group of interns in City Council, Ariana Matthew [sp?], Ola Gemi [sp?], Rah Shinae [sp?], Sydney Tilea [sp?], Valusca Anzexy [sp?], and I'd like to also welcome my Youth Council Representative Imani Voys [sp?]. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

Council Member Koo?

CHAIRPERSON KOO: Thank you, Madam

Advocate. I want to welcome all my summer interns, George, Jason and Marco, and also Stephanie, because they have done tremendous service to our office. And I also want to welcome all the Youth Council Members. Finally, I want to thank all my colleagues and especially our Speaker for doing wonderful work for our city. Have a wonderful summer everyone. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member

Dromm?

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you very
3 much. I'd like to ask my fellow colleagues to sign
4 on to Intro 871 to modernize our city's building code
5 around gender-neutral, single occupant bathrooms.
6 Most New Yorkers take their unfettered access to
7 bathrooms for granted, yet, every single day
8 transgender and gender-nonconforming individuals must
9 grapple with the fact that choices may lead to
10 harassment or worse. First, this bill would require
11 all single-occupancy bathrooms open to the public to
12 be updated with gender neutral signage. Second, in
13 the long term, the measure would update the city's
14 codes to allow building owners the choice to
15 designate additional gender-neutral bathrooms. This
16 legislation is similar to laws in cities across the
17 country from Washington, D.C. to West Hollywood that
18 have shown how simple and cost effective steps to
19 facilitate restroom access can help provide safe
20 spaces for all people. I encourage you to help New
21 York City better respond to the needs of our
22 transgender population and support Intro 871. I'd
23 also like to thank my interns, Jimmy Rivera, Errol
24 Baja [sp?], and Brian Ellacot [sp?], and also Stacey
25 Erickson [sp?] who's leaving today, and I would also

1
2 like to thank and to welcome a group of social
3 studies teachers who have joined us today from the
4 Department of Education. Thank you very, very much.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. We
6 welcome the teachers. And our last speaker is
7 Council Member Helen Rosenthal.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you so
9 much for giving me a second pass. So, in the spirit
10 of Jumaane Williams, I really want to thank my
11 interns who frankly, Council Member Cornegy, are
12 better than yours. Mark, Doug, Sonya, Anisa [sp?],
13 and Isaac have been amazing in City Council. They--I
14 pay them with my appreciation, but I do want to give
15 a special shout out to Eddie Friedman [sp?] who made
16 the presser this morning so successful for people
17 with disabilities. He is a champion. He is going to
18 go on to do great work in whatever field he chooses,
19 and I just want everyone to know how much I
20 appreciate the hours that you've put in. Thank you
21 very much.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And I apologize.
23 Council Member Levine?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you so
25 much, Madam Public Advocate. When my brain was

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

straining to figure out the Intro number 873, somehow I forgot to acknowledge my wonderful Youth Council Member from the Seventh District, Diana Mendoza [sp?]. Diana, could you stand up? She is an amazing leader. Keep an eye on her. She's going far. She may be sitting on this floor one day, and I can't wait to work with you, Diana. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Congratulations.

And for closing remarks, the Speaker of the City Council, Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito. Quiet in the chamber.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Well, thank you

to all my colleagues. Again, I continue to wish everyone as the summer's nearing an end, but continue to enjoy yourselves to the end of the summer. I thank everyone for their work. And Jeremy, again, thank you for everything and good luck in your future endeavors, and with that we are in session--we end the session.

[gavel]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date August 15, 2015