CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

----- X

July 20, 2015 Start: 9:58 a.m. Recess: 11:06 a.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway, Committee Room

16th Floor

B E F O R E: Donovan J. Richards

Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Daniel R. Garodnick Jumaane D. Williams Antonio Reynoso Ritchie J. Torres Vincent J. Gentile Ruben Wills

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Oliver Stumm Rin Tin Tin

Jerry Johnson Fox Rothschild

Welsey Wolfe Morris Adjmi Architects

Nilus Klingel Department of City Planning

Michael Marrella
Department of City Planning

Amy Peterson Housing and Recovery

Melanie Meyers Hospital for Special Surgery

Lisa Goldstein Hospital for Special Surgery

Barry Schneider

Judith Schneider

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Alrighty, good morning. Alrighty. So, first we'll start off by giving the gold star, and the gold star today goes to Dan Garodnick who showed up first. So, we'll continue that tradition. Alrighty. This morning we've been joined by Committee Members. I'll first go through the Committee Members, Council Member Ritchie Torres, Council Member Antonio Reynoso, Council Member Dan Garodnick, and we're also joined by our esteemed Land Use Chair, David Greenfield, Council Member Greenfield and also Council Member Margret Chin who has an item or several items on the agenda today. So, we'll start off today going through four items on the public agenda today, two sidewalk cafés which were scheduled for public hearings today, Land Use Numbers 247 and Land Use Number 248 were withdrawn last week and therefore subject to a motion to file. So, we'll move on to the first agenda item, which is Land Use item Number 449, Rin Tin Tin, and this application is in Council Member Margaret Chin's district. And we'll go on to call up the first panel on this issue, Mr. Oliver

Stumm who is representing Rin Tin Tin.

application is to continue to maintain and operate an

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 4
unenclosed sidewalk café at 14 Spring Street. You may
begin, Mr. Oliver. You can just hit your mic.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

OLIVER STUMM: One, two, yeah. is Oliver Stumm. I'm the owner of 14 Spring Street Café LLC, DBA Rin Tin Tin. Dear Council Member Chin: I'm contacting you in regards to our application for renewal of our sidewalk café permit. I would like to assure you that we will focus on any concerns that the community and your office might have. To control any noise issues, I've instructed my staff and management to keep music levels to background only, closing windows as appropriate as well as encouraging any patrons outside to be considerate of our neighbors. I've put clear signage up to our service station as pictured in my letter here. I would like to point out that -- sorry. I would like to provide you with my personal phone number and email address so your office and the Community Board can direct any issues directly to me. I will be as responsive as possible to any issues or concerns. I would like to point out that three bars surrounding my establishment contribute considerably to the noise levels on the sidewalk with patrons outside. I would also like to point out that a review of the 311

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 5
service requests over the last two years regarding
noise complaints to my establishment yielded a total
of one complaint for loud talking and two unfounded
complaints. Never the less, my team will endeavor to
be as responsible neighbors in managing noise
emitting or surrounding our establishment and be
responsive to any issues and suggestions your office
may have. Thank you.

2.1

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you. And we'll go to Council Member Margaret Chin.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Good morning to the members of the Zoning Committee and congratulations to Council Member Richards on chairing this esteemed committee. Rin Tin Tin's located at 14 Spring Street. It's a sidewalk café in my district up for renewal. Now, the local Community Board and neighbors who reside within the vicinity of the café have reported quality of life concern that have occurred over the past two years. These involve multiple noise concerns and violations of operating hours. My office has also been sent photos of multiple customers occupying more than what is allowed at one table. It is only most recently in the past few months that these conditions have

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 6
improved. The Community Board has taken note of this
given the decreased amount of complaints from
neighbors. In discussion with my staff, the
applicant has agreed to provide this contact
information directly to the local Community Board and
our office in order to address any immediate problem
in the future. I hope the applicant will continue to
work with the Community Board, my office and
neighbors living in the area in good faith. The
applicant has signed an agreement letter with our
office, and with this in place, I have no objection
to his renewal application. Thank you, Chair.

2.1

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you, Council
Member Chin. Alrighty, are there any questions from
my colleagues? Okay, anyone else here to testify on
this issue? If not, we'll close this particular item
and move onto the next agenda item. Thank you.

Alright, next on our agenda is Land Use Number 250
Great Jones Street. This application is in Council
Member Chin's district as well, and it's to allow
residential use in an existing building on 41 Great
Jones Street. And now, we'll call up speakers on this
item. I believe this is--oh, Mr. Jerry Johnson from
Great Jones Street, Wesley Wolfe from Great Jones

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 7

Holding and Rafaela Petresil [sp?], I think I said it right, 41 Great Jones Street Holding as well.

Alrighty, you may begin. State your name for the

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

record.

Good morning, Chair JERRY JOHNSON: Richards, Chair Greenfield, Council Members, and Council Member Chin and Committee Members. My name is Jerry Johnson. I'm with the firm of Fox Rothschild. We represent 41 Great Jones Holding, LLC, the applicant for this action that's before you today. The subject property, 41 Great Jones Street, is located on the south side of the street, approximately mid-way between Lafayette and Bowery Streets, directly across from the historic Fire Engine Company 33. The site is wholly located within an M15B zoning district and within the NoHo Historic District extension. The application seeks a special permit under 74711 to permit residential use in this M15B district where such use is not otherwise permitted. The application will facilitate the renovation and enlargement of the existing five story and solid [sic] commercial building that date back to the late 1800's. The pros will entail the addition of a penthouse floor, restoration of the front and

within the building and also a broader perspective of

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

to seek out MWBE's for the construction of the

24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2.1

project. With me today is the architect and a representative of the applicant to answer any questions.

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you so much and pleasure to see you again. I'm very happy that you guys worked out the local hiring portion of this. Can you just go into some of the green building amenities that this building will have as well?

WESLEY WOLFE: My name is Wesley Wolfe with Morris Adjmi Architects. In terms of green building, a lot of the existing structure of the building is being re-used as much as possible. The historic facades, of course, are being restored. It will be brought up to, you know, standards of modern efficient systems throughout, you know, energy efficient windows and all that. Any other specifics on the--

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: [interposing]

You'll be using HVAC system. What sort of system are
your heating and cooling system?

WESLEY WOLFE: Yeah, the heating and cooling system will be a VRV system, which is similar to a Mitsubishi-type split system. They're very, very efficient, and they're very, very quiet as well.

They allow zoning for each room, so they don't need to be running in spaces where someone's not occupying

4 the space.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Great. We will go to Council Member Margaret Chin who has a statement on Great Jones Street. Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Chair. Good morning. I'm Council Member Margaret Chin representing District One Lower Manhattan. Before us today is a request for special permit by 41 Great Jones Street in my district. They're seeking a special permit to allow for residential use in their building in exchange for an agreement with Landmarks to maintain and preserve their facades. Under the current zoning, because NoHo is a manufacturing district, the only permissible residential use in that space is joint live/work [sic] quarters for artists or interim multiple dwelling units. past few years we have seen a number of these 74711 special permits application come to the Council, and I have previously expressed my concern about the number of these applications. These applications all together have amount to what is essentially a spot zoning of the area. I have said before and I will

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 12

say it again, I do not believe that this is the
appropriate way to address an area where the zoning
no longer matches the neighborhood. I believe it is
time for City Planning to cease accepting these
special permit application and instead work with us
to begin seriously thinking about rezoning the
neighborhoods so that the zoning is more
appropriately in line with the uses that are there.
But, we should do it comprehensibly and in a way that
will allow us to protect and preserve affordable
housing units and joint live/work quarters for
artists that currently exist. In considering this
particular application and whether to ask for its
disapproval or not I have weighted a number of
factors, which I think are relevant. One major point
was that 41 Great Jones was once home to three
tenants. My office does believe after consulting with
the New York State Homes and Community Renewal and
the Loft [sic] Board that at least two of those units
are legalized loft units that are still rent
stabilized and subject to regulation by the New York
State Homes and Community Renewal. This is something
that I believe the applicant has disputed, and short
of a tenant challenging this matter in court, I'm not

comfortable with the frequency and circumstances of

community. However, I have to examine this case in

the context of the individual circumstance, and in

this particular case, I concluded that it does not

these applications and the broader impact on our

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

13

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

committee to vote yes on this. Thank you.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you, Council Member Chin. Any other questions from my colleagues? We'll go to Council Member Antonio Reynoso.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Just want to make sure we have on the record this piece-mealing of moving districts from manufacturing to residential, our huge concern overall in the City of New York, and this is what we get towards the tail end of that conversion happening and DCA's inaction when it comes to really seeing something that's meaningful in regards to manufacturing. Unfortunately we've gotten to the point where it no longer makes sense in this community to have manufacturing in this area, but we could have stopped it before it got there. DCA never took any action, but now that we're here, you know, we're getting folks that are converting into marketrate residential and from places that used to provide jobs. So, just wanted to make sure it was on the record. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you. Any other questions from my colleagues? Council Member Greenfield?

Member Greenfield. Thank you for testifying, and I

_

just want to put on the record as well that,

Margaret, we certainly will be looking at your area
and also just to echo what Council Member Reynoso
said, we'll also be looking at manufacturing district
opportunities and what's happening to manufacturing
districts across the city. Alrighty, thank you. Are
there any others here to testify on this issue?

Okay, you are now relieved. We'll close this, the
hearing.

JERRY JOHNSON: Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Alright, no one else here to testify on this issue? Okay, great.

Then we'll move onto the next hearing, which is Land Use Number 252, and this is the special regulations for neighborhood recovery. This application was submitted by the Mayor's Office of Housing Recovery, HPD and the Department of City Planning for a zoning text amendment to simplify the process of elevating and reconstructing single and two family homes in hurricane Sandy impacted areas and portions of Southern Brooklyn, Southern Queens and Staten Island. And obviously, this issue is very important to me as a representative of the Rock Aways. So, I'm very happy to see we're moving along on this issue. So we

2 are joined today by Nulus [sp?] Klingel. Did I get
3 it right?

AMY PETERSON: Nilus.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Nilus Klingel from the Department of City Planning. Michael Marrella from the Department of City Planning, and my good friend Amy Peterson from Housing and Recovery. So, we will now begin.

AMY PETERSON: Great.

MICHAEL MARRELLA: Thank you. morning, Council Members, Chair Richards, Chair Greenfield. Thank you for the opportunity to speak with you this morning. I'm Michael Marrella. I'm the Director of Waterfront and Open Space Planning at the Department of City Planning, and today we bring before you the special regulations for neighborhood recovery, which is a text amendment that the Department of City Planning has developed in coordination with the Mayor's Office of Housing Recovery and the Department of Housing Preservation and Development who jointly administer the Build it Back Program. The special regulations are intended to expedite recovery from hurricane Sandy by removing obstacles which are preventing home owners from

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

making their homes flood resilient. Ensuring that homeowners in the flood plain become safer is a major policy goal of the city in helping to protect communities from steep increases in flood insurance and from structural damage and economic harm during future storms. The special regulations for neighborhood recovery is providing urgently needed zoning relief to otherwise--that would otherwise impede recovery work. The Housing Recovery Office and HPD have been invaluable in identifying problems which we have designed the special regulations for Neighborhood Recovery to address. The text amendment has received robust support during the public review process. And I'll now turn it over to Amy Peterson from the Mayor's Office to go into further detail about the challenges.

AMY PETERSON: Great. Thank you for having us here today to present on this. We're very excited. This week's a big week for us, hopefully. The Build it Back Program is responsible for helping the neighborhoods that were hurt by hurricane Sandy recover and a big part of that is both elevating and rebuilding homes that were substantially damaged during the storm. We have been slowed in that

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

process due to zoning regulations. Basically, we have been required to find documentation about what a house looked like in the 60's to show that it was zoning non-compliant. And so, this has proved to be a big barrier for these home owners. Many of these neighborhoods don't have that documentation. who may have had that documentation may have lost that documentation during the storm, and so it's really both slowed our process and discouraged people from moving forward to elevate and rebuild their homes. A couple examples: In Gerritsen Beach where you have in this slide the yellow highlighted areas, we weren't able to show that these yellow highlighted areas existed when the zoning changes were put into place. It probably did, but we just couldn't find that documentation. So, under the current zoning regulations we would have to work with the homeowner to actually cut those areas off of their home before we could elevate their home. It's incredibly important for these communities to be able to elevate their homes. It's something that these people would not be doing but for hurricane Sandy and definitely need to do to prevent damage moving forward, and we shouldn't have to do the cost or the difficulty of

making changes to these homes. So, there's a couple of examples. There's also just kind of a little corner in the back of a house that we're hoping to finish next week and could get full sign off this week if this zoning amendment passes. We are planning to elevate and rebuild probably about 2,000 homes. The passage this week of this zoning text amendment will dramatically speed that process. It will also encourage home owners who were not planning to participate to participate and will really work well for these communities. So, thank you for

inviting us here. I have testimony that I'm also

turning in, and I'll turn it over the Nilus.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2.1

NILUS KLINGEL: Good morning. Just want to add a little context here that the Department of City Planning has approached the issue of flood resilience and zoning. Previously, there was a 2013 text amendment which the Department developed and the City Council adopted in October of 2013, which saw to remove a lot of the zoning obstacles, which we expected homes in these beachfront neighborhoods in the flood zone we'd encounter. These rules were designed, however, with the expectation that non-compliances and non-conformances which are structural

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

or use related aspects of the property, which don't
comply or conform with the current zoning rules would
be able to be documented to show that their
grandfathered status stemmed from a period of time
prior to the zoning changes that disallowed that use
or that physical aspect of the home. This is very
hard to do in these neighborhoods for the three
reasons depicted here, but one is that the housing
stock in these neighborhoods is considerably older
than you'd find in the rest of the city, also
generally more informal in terms of its initial
development. Two, since 1961 when the zoning
resolution, today's zoning resolution came to effect,
the zoning that has been placed on these
neighborhoods has expected a muchimposed a much
higher standard on the development of these homes
than you would otherwise find being the character of
these neighborhoods. And then the third issue is
that as Amy mentioned is documenting the
grandfathered status of these aspects of the home is
very difficult whether it's because the home has
turned overturned hands of ownership so many times,
documentation didn't make it from owner to another,
or the city's documentation or third-party

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

documentation on which we rely such as maps from the Sanborn Atlas Company are inconsistent and impossible to prove non-compliance off of. So, basically, this text amendment is going to do three main things. It's going to simplify the process for documenting these non-compliances and non-conformances. going to remove a few disincentives that have been keeping homeowners from pursuing elevation or rebuild pipeline options from Build it Back, and third is going to be that it's going to offer a new zoning envelope in the case of from the ground up rebuilds in the flood zone, which is more contextual. want to note that this text amendment is not supposed to supersede in terms of long term planning goals for these neighborhoods. It's temporary recovery oriented text amendment, which will only be in effect for five years. After--during that time, homeowners, whether they're in Build it back or they're private, can obtain building permits and plan approval from the Department of Buildings. After the expiration five years from adoption, there's a grace period of two years to complete construction based on those permits. I will just briefly run through some of the eligibility criteria. First, to be able to utilize

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 24 these provisions, your home had to exist on the date of hurricane Sandy, has to be located in a targeted area we're calling Neighborhood Recovery Areas, which Department of City Planning has designated and has to be coming out of this process as a fully--a single or two-family home that's in full compliance with the flood resilient construction standards in the Department of Buildings building code. neighborhood recovery areas were designated around areas that had severe widespread degree of substantial damage from hurricane Sandy as well as other issues which the Department identified, including a lack of documentation of grandfathered aspects of the home. In addition, we were also looking for prevalence of substandard lots that the zoning resolution would consider to be too small for These tend to indicate presence development today. of problem with the structure in terms of zoning compliance or conformance. So in Staten Island there are areas out designated in Community Boards Two and The New York State by-out areas are excluded. Three. In Brooklyn, the neighborhoods of Seagate, Brighton Beach, Sheepshead Bay, Gerritsen Beach, and Canarsi are included neighborhood recovery areas, and in

today will become grandfathered from this point into

perpetuity. And then all of the aspects of that home

can be elevated to the flood resilient construction

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

elevation. In the case of rebuilds, the problem is a little different. The zoning that was developed in these neighborhoods is largely designed for a 40 x 100 lot and breaks down when you get into these small lots. This is a 20 x 100 lot shown here which is often called a candlestick house. These homes are very difficult to provide a rational layout in and also are poor contributors to neighborhood character. So what we're proposing is that for rebuilds a slight adjustments to the zoning envelope which will allow greater side yard reductions in exchange for height yard reductions as well as clarification of certain ways that front yard regulations apply. We'll yield a much more livable, rational and aesthetically pleasant zoning envelope in terms of neighborhood character. You can see here how preferable this zoning envelope would be. This zoning envelope is also going to be incorporated into a permanent version of the 2013 flood text amendment that will be coming through in 2016 and will be able to utilize permanently and across the entire flood zone. last note with regard to conformance issues. going to provide a pathway for homes that were existing two-family homes, but which don't have a

4

5

7

9

10

15

16

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

1 27 certificate of occupancies, to go to the Board of 2 Standards and Appeals and have this second dwelling unit legalized and then it can be elevated or rebuilt in compliance with flood standards. And then for homes and manufacturing districts, which really 6 applies mainly to Meadowmere, we are now allowing 8 single two-family homes in manufacturing districts to elevate or rebuild. Previously, this was not allowed. If something happened to a home in a 11 manufacturing district had to be rebuilt as a 12 manufacturing use. And with this text amendment we'll achieve these three goals which I explained and 13 most importantly expedite what's been sort of a 14 beleaguered recovery process from hurricane Sandy. I'd be glad to take any questions you have about the specific provisions. 17

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you so much, and I want to thank you for your hard work. we've been joined by Council Member Ruben Wills from Queens as well. So, I have a few questions. Amy, you mentioned that obviously you anticipate 2,000 homes will benefit from this text amendment. How soon can we anticipate all 2,000 of these homes to be done?

AMY PETERSON: immediately.

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: And so and I
know I'm going to be jumping around a little bit.
So, do you guys have enough contracts so when you're
ready to go? And obviously we passed this. Are we
confident that they are

AMY PETERSON: [interposing] Yeah, so what we've been working on is exactly the questions you're asking, which is how do we get all this work done and when do we get it all done. And so a big part of that is we just brought on new CM's for each of the boroughs, the three major impacted boroughs.

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: DM's [sic]?

AMY PETERSON: Construction management

15 firms.

2.1

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Okay, okay.

AMY PETERSON: So, Tishman in Queens, SLS in Staten Island and Lyro [sp?] in Brooklyn. And they have—are going to have assigned to them over 2,000 projects total, focusing mostly on elevations and trying to attack this more on a neighborhood basis and also dealing with attached homes, which are very complicated.

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: And how will local

_ _

25 | hiring look?

2.1

AMY PETERSON: They have a set goal of 20 percent for local hires within that, and we're currently putting people—they're hiring people directly for their staff through Sandy Recovery Workforce One. We are giving out vouchers for preapprenticeship training through Sandy Recovery Workforce One and have given out about 40 so far, I think, and they have a goal of 20 percent local hires.

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Okay. So, I know they're—and I'm very happy obviously. Meadowmere is in this, and I know there are two areas, Rosedale, which is just a little I guess north or south of Meadowmere, and also Manhattan Beach are not included in this text amendment. So, when do we anticipate a second text amendment happening to ensure that although they are a minimal amount of homes that would be affected by the text amendment that we can still help these home owners in this area?

NILUS KLINGEL: Yeah, the analysis that we did on those two neighborhoods in the development of this text amendment indicated that they didn't have the same sort of widespread recovery issues. We did identify several other issues that could create

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 31
2	hindrances to proactive long term resilient retrofits
3	going forward. And so those are going to be taken up
4	on a permanent basis throughout the flood zone in a
5	text amendment that will have that broad
6	applicability. We're expecting it to be referred out
7	by the City Planning Commission in early 2016, as
8	early as possible.
9	CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Okay. And so, at
10	this moment, would they have to go to the BSA if
11	AMY PETERSON: [interposing] If there's
12	homes that face this specific issue we'll take them
13	to the BSA, and we have a shortened process for the
14	BSA.
15	CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Okay, good.
16	AMY PETERSON: And so being able to get
17	through a small number isn't a issue. It's the
18	CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: [interposing] And
19	they're free for the homeowner?
20	AMY PETERSON: It's completely free for
21	the homeowners.
22	CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Okay, good. And
23	what do we see? So, obviously we're going to be able

to raise homes. So how do you see this playing out

2.1

2 in terms of flood insurance? Will this help to lower
3 flood insurance?

AMY PETERSON: Yeah, so it's very timely that we're getting ready to elevate these homes now because the new information on flood insurance has come out recently, and flood insurance will be much lower for people who elevate their homes. And so we're hoping that people who are eligible for it will be moved forward with elevation.

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: So, something very interested that we mentioned and just food for thought, I don't know if we'll have the answer. So, obviously a lot of homeowners lost their paperwork during Sandy. Have we thought of making, you know, their particular documents—is there an electronic file somewhere in the long term being built out so that in the case of another event? We know that obviously we're going to see more storms, more frequent storms as we move along. So, is there some sort of system being put in place for homeowners? And I'm not saying we'll be able to get every home owner in New York City in this particular system, but that should be a goal. Have you guys thought of making, going electronic with some of these things?

2.1

which are approved by the Department of Buildings
under these regulations will be included in the
Building Information System at DOB and will be
electronically accessible into the future and can be
sued as a point of reference should those noncompliances need to be rebuilt in the future. Does
that answer your question?

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Well, I'm just saying all around. So, other homes who obviously are not going to go through this text amendment who are in these particular areas, all of those particular files are in the Department of Buildings systems already. So if another storm hit, we would be able to just go back for reference?

MICHAEL MARRELLA: A lot of that information is within the Department of Building's electronic systems, but we'll speak with them to your point.

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Okay, so I would like to follow up on that.

NILUS KLINGEL: Additionally, the relief that will be made permanent in the flood text two as we call it in early 2016 will relax things like side

3

4

5

6

7 8

9

10

11 12

13

14

16

15

17

18 19

20

2.1

22

24

23

25

actually decrease the likelihood that a home would have a non-compliance, and we'd have an easier time retrofitting in the future. CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Okay. Great, okay.

yards through this new zoning envelope and will

Thank you so much, and I appreciate all your hard work and very happy that we finally have reached Is there any question from my colleagues? None, alrighty. So, this portion of the hearing is closed. Anyone else here to speak on this issue, testify on this issue? Alrighty, seeing none others, we close this hearing. Alrighty, thank you so much Build it Back, thank you. Alrighty, next on our agenda is an item in Council Member Kallos' district, Land Use Number 251, the Hospital for Special Surgery. Application is submitted by the Hospital for Special Surgery for the grant of a special permit in connection with a proposed five-story penthouse expansion for the hospital, and we'll call speakers in this particular order, Melanie Meyers from the Hospital for Special Surgery, also Lisa Goldstein from the Hospital for Special Surgery.

MELANIE MEYERS: Good morning. My name is Melanie Meyers. I'm an attorney with Fried,

Frank, Harris, Shriver, and Jacobson representing the Hospital for Special Surgery on the action before

4 you.

1

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: IS your mic on?

MELANIE MEYERS: I thought it was on.

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Just pull it a

little closer. It'll light up when it's on.

MELANIE MEYERS: Yeah, there we go. I'll speak louder. The action before you is a request for a special permit under section 74682 of the zoning resolution which will allow for an increase in the lot coverage of the hospital's main campus building by 2,820 square feet. It's a small action. It will result in an enlargement of less than 8,000 square feet in the hospital's main campus, however, it's a critical action to allow for HSS to expand and grow. It is--will add to the existing building over property that is owned by the hospital in an area that is currently used by the hospital for support services. So, we think it's the right project and the right location, and we were very pleased to receive the unanimous approval of the Community Board as well as the Borough President and City Planning. So, what I'd like to do is have Lisa Goldstein from

1

3

4

5

J

6

7

8

9

10

1112

13

14

15 16

17

18

19

20

22

23

24

25

the hospital describe the project, describe the need and discuss a little bit our conversations with the local Council Member.

LISA GOLDSTEIN: Thank you. So, I'll just start by telling you a little bit about Hospital for Special Surgery. We are located between East 70 and 71st Street on the Upper East Side. world renowned specialty hospital recognized as a leading institution orthopedics and rheumatology, and we don't just care for patients we also do research. We're a teaching hospital. We're affiliated and connected with New York Presbyterian Hospital, and we also have Cornell as our neighbors. So we're one of the hospitals on the Upper East Side that's sort of integrated into that group of hospitals. The main campus is located in Community Board Eight in Manhattan, and we're here because Hospital for Special Surgery is currently operating at capacity, and to accommodate the present demand and to maintain our ability to recruit the most qualified positions and to meet the needs of the community, HSS needs to grow both in terms of staff and physical plant. expansion would add three operating rooms and essential storage and operating support. Basically,

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

tucked into an area between HSS and New York
Presbyterian Hospital that is currently used for
hospital support activities. While the expansion is
small and will allow HSS to accommodate 2,500
surgeries per year, which if you look at on daily
basis comes to less than 10 surgeries a day. As you
can see from the area map, which we'll go to the next
slide, this is an area surrounded by community
facility uses. It's mostly Hospital for Special
Surgery, New York Presbyterian, and up the street
would be Cornell. We're proposing a 7,930 square
foot addition to the south side of the west wing
campus located along former East 70^{th} Street. Is it
next or is it[off mic]. East 70^{th} Street is not
part of the city street network. HSS owns the area
in front of its campus and New York Presbyterian owns
the remainder of that former street. Because the
former street is now in private ownership, a number
of structures and buildings already exist on the
former street bed, limiting views along the corridor.
So what we're showing is what you see actually as you
look from New York Avenue now down East $70^{\rm th}$, the
former East 70^{th} Street, and what you see is a few
things. You see the 17-story Star Pavilion. You see

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

the above grade pedestrian connection between HSS and New York Presbyterian, and you see a service ramp at the eastern-most end of street. Next slide. project itself will begin at the third floor. You can put it up there. And extends to the fifth floor with some mechanical space above it. A section shows this generally as you can see. To put the project in perspective, existing conditions, this is a view of the project from Roosevelt Island. This is the same view of the proposed project once it's built, and it sort of gets totally integrated into Roosevelt--into the--I'm sorry, from Roosevelt Island you can see it gets integrated into the building. The proposal allows for operating rooms in our support areas to be located in an optimal way, which is adjacent to our existing operating suite on the fourth floor with pre-op space located on the story below, and storage and support located on the story above, which makes it important that we do it in that particular location. It's very efficient for us. It make a lot of sense, and we make use of the existing facility that we already have. As far as the construction of this addition and the staging of it, all of our staging is going to be done east of the Hospital for

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

Special Surgery drop-off, which is actually located underneath our driveway. All of this will be done in coordination with New York Hospital and give the location of this project and our desire to avoid disruption as much as possible, we will be delivering the steel and conducting steel erection on the weekends to avoid conflicts. We have agreed to keep the Council Member and the local Community Board apprised of construction start and significant construction activities and to work with the Council Member's office in the even that concerns regarding this construction project or any construction project arise in the future. We have been meeting with Council Member Kallos and are pleased to confirm that a number of commitments have been made during the course of our discussions. The East River Esplanade [sic] is a wonderful resource, which happens to be right at our front door, and there's a great opportunity to improve the esplanade in a manner that is consistent with and complements the improvements proposed by Rockefeller University to the south. has committed to make numerous esplanade improvements in the area between East 70^{th} and East 72^{nd} Street and to maintain those fixtures on a permanent basis.

1 SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 40 We've also agreed to work with the Council Member, 2 3 the Parks Department and the Community Board to refine the design. HSS confirms its previous 4 commitment to make additional improvements to the 5 esplanade between East 72nd Street and East 78th 6 Street. When the River Building, which is a building 7 8 that we previously had approved, is constructed, and 9 then to restore any improvements that have been 10 disturbed by the River Building's construction. In 11 addition, HSS will install, that is subject to DOT 12 and Parks approval, standard sound barriers between East 70th and East 71st Street. We will designate an 13 HSS director or senior director to the board of the 14 East River Conservancy, and right now, our senior 15 director of Foundation and Government Affairs will be 16 that person, the initial member of this group. 17 will make a 20,000 dollar contribution to the 18 conservancy in furtherance, once a business plan is 19 fully developed, and we have delivered a letter to 20 Council Member Kallos setting fort these commitments 2.1 along with the commitments regarding construction 22 In conclusion, I would like to thank notification. 23 Council Member Kallos for working with us on this 24

project, thank the Subcommittee for considering this

2.1

2 important project, and obviously invite questions
3 from the Subcommittee.

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you so much for following up on many of Council Member Kallos' issues and obviously it shows in your commitment today in which you said. With that being said, we'll go to questions. We'll go to Council Member Dan Garodnick first.

much, Mr. Chairman, and I know that this project has been carefully considered by the Community Board and the local Council Member, and I also support it, and I think that this is going to be a great addition.

You know, you noted that it will bring 10 additional surgeries today each day, as if that would be a point that would be appealing. We'd be happy for you all to do many more surgeries per day.

LISA GOLDSTEIN: So would we.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Because we want you to be successful and there are people who, you know, want to get surgeries at the hospital for special surgery who sometimes even have to wait a little bit, and we want you all to be as successful as possible. One question for you about the

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

disruption point, because you noted that you're going 2 to do steal deliveries on weekends. You're right 3 4 next door to New York Presbyterian. How will you 5 deal with that dynamic? You know, obviously these are not residents. It's not a residential area. 6 in a situation like that it wouldn't be a surprise 7 8 that there might be some activity over the weekend,

9 but you do have, you know, sick people right in your

10 own hospital and also across the way. So, tell us

11 how you're going to deal with that?

> LISA GOLDSTEIN: Luckily, we've had a lot of experience with this in the past as we built many things in that location as have they. We coordinate those things when we deliver the steel, and we do the best that we can to make sure that we notify patients that it's happening, that when possible we move patients away from any windows that the crane may be near, which the weekends will actually allow us to do more efficiently, and we also provide headphones and earplugs and other things to patients for the short period of time that they may hear some additional noise. But again, weekends are the quieter times for all the hospitals in that area, and so that's sort of the agreed upon time for us to do that. But safety is

2.1

first for us, so we do what's necessary to make sure our patients and their patients are safe.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay. Thank you, and we thank you for the esplanade improvements, and also as somebody who represents a good part of Community Board Eight, but not the specific location where the hospital sits, I will note that a 33 to zero approval of the development project is pretty darn good with that Community Board. So, I will take that to heart and thank you for your time, and best of luck with this.

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you, Council Member Garodnick. And I notice certainly the question he raised was something I raised in our meeting a few weeks ago. So, how often are you guys going to meet? Or is it as needed in terms with New York Hospital and perhaps the community? Well, community is not really there, but with New York Hospital certainly. What's the plan?

LISA GOLDSTEIN: When we have a project going on, we meet as frequently as we need to, but the communication that we have is a minimum once a week, and then if we have to meet, we do. We have formal meetings where we discuss all the projects

LISA GOLDSTEIN: New York Presbyterian.

_

Presbyterian, okay. Let me ask you a question. One of the issues that we've had in the Council, Council Member Garodnick has raised it, is that we are unhappy about this relatively new practice where individuals who are coming in and are in emergency rooms and are getting surgery are being recorded generally without their knowledge, and this is actually being used in television productions. We believe that New York Presbyterian is one of the hospitals that actually engages in this practice. That's something that concerns us quite frankly. Is this a practice that you engage in at the Hospital of Special Surgery and do you condone this practice?

Pres--although HSS is affiliated with New York

Presbyterian Hospital, we in fact, do not have an

emergency room. We are not involved in any of those

activities. You will not see anything on the screen

from Hospital for Special Surgery and we have no

plans to do anything of that--that has anything to do

with that. I know what you're speaking about and I

know that New York Presbyterian will have to speak

LISA GOLDSTEIN: So, although New York

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 46 for themselves, but Hospital for Special Surgery does not engage in that.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: So when you say you're affiliated, can you describe the affiliation?

LISA GOLDSTEIN: Yes.

2.1

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Is it a partnership or do they have any management over you, or how does that work exactly?

LISA GOLDSTEIN: So technically, Hospital for Special Surgery is a completely independent hospital. I'm the Chief Operating Officer. We have a President and CEO and we have a totally independent board. We are connected to them by a bridge that goes back and forth because we are a specialty hospital and they do provide some of the medical treatment and care that we receive. Our doctors are privileged on their staff. Cornell University Medical School is the medical school for all of those hospitals. So, our physicians have privileges at New York Presbyterian and some of theirs have privileges at ours. Just like in community hospitals you have docs who have privileges in many places, and our physicians are professors at Cornell University.

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13 14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

currently backed up? Are you not able to reach capacity? Are you over capacity? What's the status right now that requires you to do this?

LISA GOLDSTEIN: So, our operating rooms,

we have 36 operating rooms in the hospital and we do a combination of 30,000 surgeries both inpatient and outpatient. It's about 50/50, and our operating rooms run at anywhere from 80 to 92 percent occupancy, which is much higher than most hospitals in the city, and sometimes when you have emergencies you need to get them, it gets very hard as you get up to that level of occupancy to do so. In addition, we have patients who come in to see doctors who have to wait periods of time, which they certainly probably find unreasonable and we feel are unreasonable because we just don't have the capacity to take people in. So, if you call a doctor's office you could wait anywhere from a month to three months in order to get an appointment for something like a hip or knee replacement and we would like to be able to reduce that waiting time.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: So what would the reduction be based on your analysis by adding these suites?

2.1

LISA GOLDSTEIN: I'm really not going to sit here and tell you that I know exactly what that would be, and it really would depend on what physicians requested additional block time or OR time in order to do that, but it's likely that we would be able to reduce that waiting time by some amount.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Okay. And then finally, what's the total square footage of the appendage, attachment, new building, whatever you're calling it?

LISA GOLDSTEIN: its 7,930 square feet.

It's on three stories, which is why the lot coverage increases the 2,820.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Got it. Excellent. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Okay. Another question from Council Member Garodnick, and the we've been joined by Council Member Kallos who has a statement.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you, Mr.

Chairman. I just wanted to follow up since the Land

Use Chairman, Council Member Greenfield, had the good

sense to ask the question of you, and I appreciate

that, on the subject of filming for entertainment

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 50			
2	purposes. I just wanted to clarify your comments,			
3	because they sounded exactly right, but when you said			
4	that the Hospital for Special Surgery is not involve			
5	in these activities			
6	LISA GOLDSTEIN: We haven't filwe have			
7	not nor do we have plans to film for entertainment,			
8	period.			
9	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Are you			
10	committed to say that you will not film for			
11	entertainment purposes?			
12	LISA GOLDSTEIN: I can commit so long as			
13	I'm there.			
14	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Okay, that's			
15	fair enough to me. I appreciate it. And we thank			
16	you for that, because we have asked all private			
17	hospitals in New York City to answer that			
18	LISA GOLDSTEIN: [interposing] I saw the-			
19	_			
20	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: question, and			
21	we're going to be doing a report card, and it sounds			
22	like the Hospital for Special Surgery is going to			
23	come out right on top of that report card. So we			
24	thank you.			

LISA GOLDSTEIN: Yep.

our city to do what you do. I just want to thank you

for all that you do and for your commitment to the

24

SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES

2.1

community to participating in the community to providing community benefits and having a long history of doing so, and for all the work we have done together and will be doing together, and I just urge my colleagues to vote yes on the application.

LISA GOLDSTEIN: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Well, that was easy. Alrighty, with that being said, thank you for testifying. If there's anyone else here who'd like to testify on this issue, we will call you now. Come up now. Did you fill out slips? Did everyone fill out slips on this issue? Okay. Alright, if you can just state your name and your affiliation.

BARRY SCHNEIDER: Yes, certainly. Good morning, Mr. Chairman, members of the Zoning and Franchise Committee. My name is Barry Schneider and my wife Judy [sic] and I are pleased to be here to support the Hospital for Special Surgeries application for special permit to allow the expansion of its west wing. Judy and I are longtime residents of the Upper East Side community where the hospital is located. I have served over 20 years as a member of Community Board Eight and as President of the East 60 [sic] Neighborhood Association. Further, I am

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 53				
2	currently Chairman of the Community Advisory Board of				
3	Wyle [sic] Cornell Medical Center. I'm very famili				
4	with the hospital and its great work. In fact, I am				
5	walking example of the extraordinary clinical care				
6	that HSS provides to thousands of patients each year				
7	having had both of my hips replaced several years				
8	ago. You might say I'm joined at the hip with the				
9	hospital, then you might not say that. For many				
10	years I've been also honored [sic] to serve as the				
11	community representative on the hospital's				
12	institutional review board which reviews all research				
13	projects involving hearings to ensure that they meet				
14	the highest ethical standards. I understand the				
15	hospital has experienced an enormous demand for				
16	services and that the need is growing. I have				
17	nothing but respect and admiration for the				
18	institution and whole heartedly support its desire to				
19	expand to add three new inpatient operating rooms to				
20	enable 2,500 additional inpatient surgeries a year.				
21	Thank you for listening to me this morning.				
22	CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you. Ms.?				
23	Great, and if you can just state your name and				

affiliation for the record?

2	JUDITH SCHNEIDER: Good morning. My name			
3	is Judith Schneider, and I'm a resident of the			
4	community. Good morning Chair and Council Members.			
5	I am Judy Schneider and I want to echo Barry's			
6	comments. Like Barry I have been an involved member			
7	of the hospital's community for many years. I am			
8	currently a board member of Friends of St.			
9	Catherine's Park and the East 60's Neighborhood			
10	Association. Until recently served as a Community			
11	Board Eight member, a position I held for over 20			
12	years. I have also been a HSS patient and have			
13	experience firsthand the exceptional care provided b			
14	its physicians and therapists. Barry and I have also			
15	referred many friends to the hospital, and the			
16	feedback we have received from each and every one of			
17	them has been glowing. The Upper East Side community			
18	and all of New York City are very fortunate to be			
19	home to a world renowned institution like			
20	CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: [interposing] You			

JUDITH SCHNEIDER: HSS. I am also pleased to be here today to lend my support to the hospital's application for a special permit to enable the

25 expansion of the west wing to add three new operating

may proceed.

21

22

23

listening to me this morning.

2.1

rooms so that the growing number of patients from New York City and beyond seeking care at HSS can benefit from the great work of its physicians and surgeons. In closing, I just want to add that this addition is not intrusive to the neighborhood, since it extends over the HSS sidewalk on the part of the street that is not a public thoroughfare. Thank you for

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Thank you, Mr. and Mrs. Schneider, and obviously, you guys look like you're doing well, and I guess you guys got a free commercial like on Channel 74 in the City Council's channel today. So, thank you for your testimony, and you are living proof of the good work they are doing. Thank you.

BARRY SCHNEIDER: Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Alrighty, are there any others here to testify on this issue? If not, this particular portion of the hearing is closed, and I think we are now ready to vote on these items.

Alrighty. So I'm going to call a vote to couple the following items for approval today, Land Use Number 247, a motion to file Salaam Bombay Café, Land Use Number 240, motion to file The Fourth, Land Use 249

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES 56					
2	on Rin Tin Tin, Land Use 250 regarding 41 Great					
3	Jones, Land Use item Number 251, the Hospital for					
4	Special Surgery, and Land Use Number 252, special					
5	regulations for neighborhood recovery. Now with the					
6	being said, Counsel we'll ask you to call the roll.					
7	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair Richards?					
8	CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: I vote aye on all.					
9	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member					
10	Garodnick?					
11	COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.					
12	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member					
13	Reynoso?					
14	COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I vote aye.					
15	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member					
16	Torres?					
17	COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye.					
18	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Motions to file Land					
19	Use Numbers 247 and 248 are approved with 4 votes in					
20	the affirmative, 0 in the negative and 0 abstentions.					
21	Land Use Numbers 249, 250, 251 and 252 are approved					
22	and referred to the Full Land Use Committee by a vote					
23	of 4 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and 0					

abstentions.

1	SUBCOMMITTEE ON ZONING AND FRANCHISES	57
2	CHAIRPERSON RICHARDS: Alrighty,	I would
3	like to thank my colleagues and all the Land	d Use
4	staff. With that being said, this hearing	is closed.
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date ____July 22, 2015___